- 1 Title: Growth of anaerobic methane oxidizing archaea and sulfate reducing bacteria in a high
- 2 pressure membrane-capsule bioreactor
- 3
- 4 Running title: High pressure activity and growth of ANME and SRB
- 5
- 6 Peer H.A. Timmers^a#, Jarno Gieteling^b, H.C Aura Widjaja-Greefkes^a, Caroline M. Plugge^a,
- 7 Alfons J.M. Stams^{a,c} Piet N.L. Lens^d and Roel J.W. Meulepas^{b,d,e}
- 8
- ^aWageningen University, Laboratory of Microbiology, Dreijenplein 10, 6703 HB
- 10 Wageningen, the Netherlands
- ^bWageningen University, Sub-department of Environmental Technology, Bornse Weilanden
- 12 9, 6708 WG Wageningen, the Netherlands
- 13 ^cCEB-Centre of Biological Engineering, University of Minho, Campus de Gualtar, 4710-057
- 14 Braga, Portugal
- ^dIHE: Pollution Prevention and Control Core, UNESCO-IHE, Westvest 7, 2611 AX Delft,
- 16 The Netherlands
- ^eWetsus, centre of excellence for sustainable water technology, Agora 1, 8934 CJ
- 18 Leeuwarden, the Netherlands
- 19 #Corresponding author. Mailing address: Wageningen University, Laboratory of
- 20 Microbiology, Dreijenplein 10, 6703HB Wageningen, Phone: +31 317483739. Fax: +31 317
- 21 483829. Email: peer.timmers@wur.nl

22 ABSTRACT

Anaerobic methane oxidizing communities of archaea (ANME) and sulfate reducing bacteria 23 (SRB) grow slowly, which limits physiological studies. High methane partial pressure was 24 25 previously successfully applied to stimulate growth, but it is not clear how different ANME subtypes and associated sulfate reducing bacteria (SRB) are affected by it. Here, we report 26 27 growth of ANME/SRB in a membrane-capsule bioreactor inoculated with Eckernförde Bay 28 sediment that combines high pressure incubation (10.1 MPa methane) and thorough mixing (100 rpm) with complete cell retention by a 0.2 µm membrane. Results were compared to 29 30 previously obtained data from an ambient-pressure (0.101 MPa methane) bioreactor 31 inoculated with the same sediment. Labelled-methane oxidation rates were not higher at 10.1 32 MPa, likely because measurements were done at ambient pressure. The subtype ANME-2a/b 33 was abundant in both reactors, but subtype ANME-2c was only enriched at 10.1 MPa. SRB at 34 10.1 MPa mainly belonged to the SEEP-SRB2, Eel-1 group and Desulforomonadales and not 35 to the typically found SEEP-SRB1. Increase of ANME-2a/b occurred in parallel with increase of SEEP-SRB2 which was previously only found associated with ANME-2c. Our results 36 37 imply that the syntrophic association is flexible and that methane pressure and sulfide 38 concentration influence growth of different ANME-SRB consortia.

We also studied the effect of elevated methane pressure on methane production and oxidation by a mixture of methanogenic and sulfate-reducing sludge. Here, methane oxidation rates decreased and were not coupled to sulfide production, indicating trace methane oxidation during net methanogenesis and not anaerobic methane oxidation, even at high methane partial pressure.

44

45 Keywords Anaerobic methane oxidation – methanotrophs - high pressure - AOM - TMO -

46 ANME

47 INTRODUCTION

| 48 | Anaerobic oxidation of methane (AOM) coupled to sulfate reduction (SR) is a process |
|----|---|
| 49 | influenced by the CH ₄ partial pressure. The SR rate of sediment from Hydrate Ridge was |
| 50 | significantly higher at elevated CH_4 partial pressure (1, 2). Between 0 and 0.15 MPa, there is |
| 51 | a positive linear correlation between the CH ₄ partial pressure and the AOM and SR rates of an |
| 52 | anaerobic methanotrophic enrichment obtained from Eckernförde Bay sediment (3). The |
| 53 | methane-dependent sulfide production by microbial mats from the Black Sea increased 10 to |
| 54 | 15-fold after increasing the methane partial pressure from 0.2 to 10.0 MPa (4). The affinity |
| 55 | constant (K _m) for methane of anaerobic methanotrophs from Gulf of Cádiz sediment is around |
| 56 | 37 mM which is equivalent to 3 MPa CH_4 (5). Because of the more negative Gibbs free |
| 57 | energy change (ΔG) at elevated CH ₄ partial pressures, growth of the anaerobic methanotrophs |
| 58 | might be faster when the CH ₄ partial pressure is increased (Fig. S1). Bioreactor studies with |
| 59 | high methane pressure have been performed (4, 5), but it is not clear how the different ANME |
| 60 | subtypes and associated SRB are affected by the methane pressure. This information would |
| 61 | contribute to the understanding of the process of AOM coupled to SR and would help in |
| 62 | further attempts to cultivate the responsible organisms. |
| 63 | In this study, we investigated the effect of the CH ₄ partial pressure on methane oxidation and |
| 64 | methane production rates in Eckernförde Bay sediment from the Baltic Sea. We also studied |
| 65 | the effect of long-term (240-days) incubation under a high methane pressure (10.1 MPa CH ₄) |
| 66 | on the activity of this sediment ('reactor HP-1'). These results, together with the results of |
| 67 | microbial community analysis, were compared with data from a bioreactor at ambient |
| 68 | pressure ('reactor AP') (6, 7) inoculated with the same sediment as reactor HP-1 and with the |
| 69 | original Eckernförde Bay sediment (EB). We also investigated the effect of the CH ₄ partial |
| 70 | pressure on methane oxidation and methane production rates in mixed methanogenic and |
| 71 | sulfate-reducing granular sludge, both in short and long-term incubation ('reactor HP-2'). |

AEM Accepts published online ahead of print

This was done to evaluate the capacity of methanogenic and sulfate reducing communities to
perform methane oxidation under favorable conditions. A summary of the experimental set-up
is given in Fig.1.

75

76 MATERIALS AND METHODS

77 Origin of the inocula. The samples of the Eckernförde Bay sediment used for the initial 78 activity assays and to inoculate reactor HP-1 were taken at Eckernförde Bay (Baltic Sea) at 79 station B (water depth 28 m; position 54°31'15N, 10°01'28E) during a cruise of the German 80 research vessel Littorina in June 2005. This sampling site has been described by Treude et al. 81 (8). Sediment samples were taken with a small multicore sampler based on the construction 82 described previously (9). The cores had a length of 50 cm and reached 30-40 cm into the 83 sediment bed. Immediately after sampling, the content of the cores was mixed in a large 84 bottle, which was made anoxic by replacing the headspace by anoxic artificial seawater. Back 85 in the laboratory, the sediment was homogenized and transferred into 1L bottles in an anoxic chamber. The 1-L bottles were closed with butyl rubber stoppers and the headspace was 86 87 replaced by CH_4 (0.15 MPa). 88 The mixed sludge used for the initial activity assays and to inoculate reactor HP-2 was 89 sampled at two full-scale mesophilic UASB reactors: a methanogenic reactor treating

90 wastewater from paper mills (Industriewater Eerbeek, Eerbeek, the Netherlands, June 2005)

91 and a sulfate-reducing reactor fed with ethanol (Emmtec, Emmen, the Netherlands, May

92 2006). The two sludge types were crushed by pressing them sequentially through needles with

diameters of 1.2, 0.8 and 0.5 mm, mixed and transferred into anaerobic bottles.

94 The bottles with sediment and sludge were stored in the dark at 4°C until the experiments 95 were started.

97 Medium preparation. The basal marine medium used for the incubations with Eckernförde 98 sediment was made as described previously (10). The basal fresh water medium used for the 99 incubations with mixed sludge was made according to Meulepas *et al.* (11). Both media were 100 minimal media and did not contain any carbon source and no other electron acceptor than 101 sulfate. The media were boiled, cooled down under a nitrogen (N₂) flow and transferred into 102 stock bottles with a N₂ headspace until use. The final pH of the media was 7.2. The phosphate 103 provided buffering capacity to maintain a neutral pH value.

104

105 Effect of the CH₄ partial pressure on the initial activity. The effect of the CH₄ partial 106 pressure on the CH₄ oxidation and methane production rate of both the Eckernförde Bay 107 sediment and the mixed sludge was assessed in triplicate incubations with 0.02 gram volatile 108 suspended solids (g_{VSS}) at atmospheric (0.101 MPa) and elevated (10.1 MPa) methane 109 pressure (Fig. 1, experiment 1). These tests were performed in glass tubes (18 ml), sealed with 110 a butyl rubber stopper and capped at one side and equipped with a piston at the opposite side 111 (De Glasinstrumentenmakerij, Wageningen, the Netherlands)(11). The glass tubes were filled 112 with sediment or mixed sludge and filled with 9 ml marine medium or freshwater medium, 113 respectively. Then, tubes were closed and flushed with N_2 . After removing the N_2 gas with a syringe and needle, 3 ml¹³CH₄ (purity 5.5) was added. The glass tubes were incubated 114 115 statically at 20°C in a non-pressurized incubator or in a 2.0 L pressure vessel (Parr, Moline, 116 IL, USA) filled with 1.8 L water. The vessel was pressurized with N₂ gas. The pH, liquid 117 volume, gas volume and gas composition in the tubes were measured weekly. To do so, the 118 pressure vessel had to be depressurized. Both pressurization and depressurization were done 119 gradually over a period of two hours. 120

| 121 | Effect of long-term high-pressure incubation. Two high-pressure vessels (Parr, Moline, |
|-----|---|
| 122 | USA) were controlled at 20 $(\pm 1)^{\circ}$ C and equipped with a stirrer controlled at 100 rpm (Fig. 1, |
| 123 | experiment 2). One vessel was filled with 1.8 L marine medium and inoculated with 25 |
| 124 | membrane capsules, each containing 0.038 (\pm 0.003) g _{VSS} Eckernförde Bay sediment (reactor |
| 125 | HP-1). The other vessel was filled with 0.5 L fresh water medium and inoculated with 25 |
| 126 | membrane capsules, each containing 0.072 (\pm 0.006) g _{VSS} mixed sludge (reactor HP-2). The |
| 127 | membrane capsules were cylindrically shaped, 14 mm in diameter, 20 mm long and had a |
| 128 | membrane surface of 840 mm ² . The polysulfone membranes (Triqua BV, Wageningen, the |
| 129 | Netherlands) had a pore size of 0.2 μm to retain microorganisms. The filled capsules were |
| 130 | slightly lighter than water, which made them float when the stirrer was turned off. During |
| 131 | inoculation, the lid of the vessel was removed in an anaerobic glove box containing 90% $N_{\rm 2}$ |
| 132 | and 10% H ₂ . Afterwards, the high-pressure vessel was connected to a bottle with pressurized |
| 133 | CH ₄ (purity 5.5). The vessel was flushed with approximately 10 L CH ₄ (the gas entered the |
| 134 | vessel at the bottom to remove any dissolved gas) and subsequently slowly pressurized to 10.1 |
| 135 | MPa. At four time points (at 60, 110, 160 and 240 days), the pressure was gradually released |
| 136 | and the vessel was opened in an anaerobic glove box to replace the medium and to sample |
| 137 | two membrane capsules per reactor. Subsequently, the vessel was closed, flushed and |
| 138 | pressurized again with CH_4 gas as described above. The high-pressure vessels were equipped |
| 139 | with sampling ports for liquid phase sampling just before depressurization for sulfide |
| 140 | determination. For activity determination, the sampled membrane capsules were incubated in |
| 141 | 25-ml serum bottles at ambient pressure, closed with butyl rubber stoppers and filled with 20 |
| 142 | ml medium. The 5 ml headspace was filled with pure 13 C-labeled CH ₄ (0.13 MPa). The serum |
| 143 | bottles were incubated at 20°C in orbital shakers (100 rpm). For around 30 days, weekly the |
| 144 | pH, liquid and gas volume, pressure, gas composition and sulfide concentration in the serum |
| 145 | bottles was measured. After these assays, the two membrane capsules per sampling point were |
| | |

frozen at -20°C for subsequent DNA extraction for molecular analysis. From the last sampling
point at 240 days, only one membrane capsule was taken.

148

149 **Geochemical analyses.** Total dissolved sulfide species (H_2S , HS^- and S^{2-}) were measured

150 photometrically using a standard kit (LCK 653) and a photo spectrometer (Xion 500) both

151 from Hach Lange (Dusseldorf, Germany).

152 Gas composition was measured on a gas chromatograph-mass spectrometer (GC-MS) from

153 Interscience (Breda, The Netherlands). The system was composed of a Trace GC equipped

154 with a GS-GasPro column (30m by 0.32 mm; J&W Scientific, Folsom, CA), and a Ion-Trap

155 MS. Helium was the carrier gas at a flow rate of 1.7mL min⁻¹. The column temperature was

156 30°C. The fractions of ${}^{13}CH_4$, ${}^{12}CH_4$, ${}^{13}CO_2$ and ${}^{12}CO_2$ were derived from the mass spectrum

157 as described (12), with a retention time for CH_4 at 1.6 min in the gas chromatogram and 1.8 158 min for CO_2 .

159 The pressure in the bottles and tubes was determined using a portable membrane pressure

160 unit, WAL 0–0.4 MPa absolute (WalMess- und Regelsysteme, Oldenburg, Germany).

161 The pH was checked by means of pH paper (Macherey-Nagel, Dűren, Germany).

162

163 **Calculations.** For explanation on calculations of total ¹³CO₂, ¹²CO₂, ¹³CH₄ and ¹²CH₄, see

164 supplementary information and Table S1.

165

166 **DNA extraction.** DNA was extracted from the membrane capsules using the Fast DNA Kit

167 for Soil (MP Biomedicals, Ohio, USA) according to the manufacturer's protocol with two 45-

168 second beat beating steps using a Fastprep Instrument (MP Biomedicals, Ohio, USA). In

169 parallel, DNA was extracted from stored samples of reactor AP and from the original

170 Eckernförde bay sediment (EB) (Fig. 1, experiment 0).

| 171 | Clone library construction. Extracted DNA from the last sampling point at 240 days was |
|-----|---|
| 172 | used for clone library construction. To amplify almost full-length bacterial 16S rRNA genes |
| 173 | for cloning, primers 27F (5'-AGAGTTTGATCCTGGCTCAG-3') and 1492R (5'- |
| 174 | GYTACCTTGTTACGACTT-3') (13) were used. The archaeal 16S rRNA genes were |
| 175 | amplified using primers A109f (ACKGCTCAGTAACACGT) (14) and universal reverse |
| 176 | primer 1492R. PCR amplification was done with the GoTaq Polymerase kit (Promega, |
| 177 | Madison, Wisconsin, USA) using a G-Storm cycler (G-storm, Essex, UK) with a pre- |
| 178 | denaturing step of 2 min at 95°C followed by 35 cycles of 95°C for 30 s, 52°C for 40 s and |
| 179 | 72°C for 1.5 min. Lastly, a post-elongation step of 5 min at 72°C was done. PCR products |
| 180 | were pooled and purified using the PCR Clean & Concentrator kit (Zymo Research |
| 181 | Corporation, Irvine, CA, USA) and were ligated into a pGEM-T Easy plasmid vector (pGEM- |
| 182 | T Easy Vector System I, Promega, Madison, Wisconsin, USA) and transformed into E. coli |
| 183 | XL1-Blue Competent Cells (Stratagene/Agilent Technologies Santa Clara, CA, USA). Both |
| 184 | ligation and transformation were performed according to the manufacturer's instructions. |
| 185 | |
| 186 | DGGE analysis. Extracted DNA from the membrane capsules at every sampling point was |
| 187 | used for DGGE analysis, as well as DNA from reactor AP and from EB. The V3 region of the |
| 188 | archaeal 16S rRNA sequences was amplified with primers GC-ARC344f (5'- |
| 189 | ACGGGGGYGCAGCAGGCGCGA-3') and ARC519r (5'-GWATTACCGCGG CKGCTG- |
| 190 | 3') (15) using the GoTaq Polymerase kit (Promega, Madison, Wisconsin, USA). PCR |
| 191 | reactions were performed in a G-Storm cycler (G-storm, Essex, UK) with a pre-denaturing |
| 192 | step of 5 min at 94°C followed by 10 cycles of 94°C for 10 s, 61°C for 10 s (-0.5°C/cycle), |
| 193 | 72°C for 40 s and 25 cycles of 94°C for 10s, 56 °C for 20s, 72°C for 40 s and a post-elongation |
| 194 | step of 30 min at 72°C. Bacterial 16S rRNA V6-V8 regions were amplified using Phire Hot |

197 and R-1401 (5'- CGGTGTGTACAAGACCC-3') (16). Bacterial amplicons were produced

- 198 with a G-Storm cycler (G-storm, Essex, UK) using a pre-denaturing step of 30 s at 98°C
- 199 followed by 35 cycles of 98°C for 10 s, 56°C for 10 s, 72°C for 30 s and a post-elongation step
- 200 of 1 min at 72°C. Forward primers had a GC clamp of 40 bp attached to the 5' end as used by
- 201 Yu et al. (15). DGGE analysis was performed as previously described (17, 18) in a Dcode
- system (Biorad, Germany) at 60°C for 16 hours with a denaturing gradient of 30-60% for
- 203 bacterial profiles and a 40-60% denaturing gradient for archaeal profiles, as recommended
- 204 (15).

To clarify which of the most intense DGGE bands correspond to an OTU found in the clone library, clones were subjected to PCR-DGGE after cell lysis, using the same primer pairs that were used for previous DGGE profiling. One clone of every OTU was loaded on a DGGE gel parallel to the last sample (240 days) of reactor HP-1. Clones that corresponded to bands of the DGGE pattern of reactor HP-1 were annotated as such using the Bionumerics software V4.61 (Applied Maths NV, Belgium).

211

212 Phylogenetic analysis. For the archaeal and bacterial clone library, 75 and 82 picked white

213 colonies were sent for sequencing respectively, with the primer pair SP6 (5'-

214 ATTTAGGTGACACTATAGAA-3') and T7 (5'- TAATACGACTCACTATAGGG-3') to

- 215 GATC Biotech (Konstanz, Germany). All reverse and forward sequenced overlapping reads
- 216 were trimmed of vector and bad quality sequences, and were assembled into contiguous reads
- 217 using the DNA baser software (Heracle BioSoft S.R.L., Pitesti, Romania). After assembly,
- 218 possible chimeras were removed using the Greengenes Bellerophon Chimera check
- 219 (http://greengenes.lbl.gov) (18). Whole 16S rRNA sequences were checked with BlastN (20).

220 Sequences were aligned using the SINA online alignment tool version 1.2.11 (21).

221 Phylogenetic trees were constructed after merging aligned sequences with the Silva SSU Ref

database release 111 (22) using the ARB software package version 5.3-org-8209 (23).

223 Phylogenetic trees were calculated by the ARB neighbor-joining algorithm.

224

225 Quantitative real-time PCR. Extracted DNA from the membrane capsules at every sampling 226 point was used for qPCR analysis, as well as DNA from reactor AP and from EB. The DNA 227 concentration was determined with the Qubit 2.0 fluorometer (Thermo Fisher Scientific, MA, 228 USA). Amplifications were done in triplicate in a BioRad CFX96™ system (Bio-Rad 229 Laboratories, Hercules, CA, USA) in a final volume of 25 µl using iTaq Universal SYBR 230 Green Supermix (Bio-Rad Laboratories, Hercules, CA, USA), 5 ng of template DNA and 231 primers with optimal concentrations and annealing temperatures for highest efficiency and 232 specificity (Table S2), all according to the manufacturer's recommendations. New primer sets 233 were designed using the ARB software package version 5.3-org-8209 (23). Triplicate standard curves were obtained with 10- fold serial dilutions ranged from $2x10^5$ to $2x10^{-2}$ 234 235 copies per µl of plasmids containing 16S rRNA archaeal inserts of ANME-2a/b and ANME-236 2c and bacterial inserts of SEEP-SRB2 and Eel-1 group. The efficiency of the reactions was up to 100% and the R² of the standard curves were up to 0.999. All used primers were 237 238 extensively tested for specificity with cloned archaeal inserts of ANME-1, ANME-2a/b, 239 ANME-2c, Methanococcoides and Methanosarcinales and bacterial inserts of SEEP-SRB1, 240 SEEP-SRB-2, Eel-1 group, Desulforomonadales, Desulfosarcina and Myxococcales and with 241 genomic DNA of Methanosarcina mazei TMA (DSM-9195) and Desulfovibrio sp. G11 242 (DSM-7057). PCR conditions consisted of a pre-denaturing step for 5 min at 95°C, followed 243 by 5 touch-down cycles of 95°C for 30s, annealing at 60°C for 30s with a decrement per cycle 244 to reach the optimized annealing temperature (temperatures are shown in Table S2), and

| 245 | extension at 72°C (times are shown in Table S2). This was followed by 40 cycles of |
|---|--|
| 246 | denaturing at 95°C for 15s, 30s of annealing and extension at 72°C. PCR products were |
| 247 | checked for specificity by a melting curve analysis (72-95°C) after each amplification step |
| 248 | and gel electrophoresis. Quantification of specific archaeal and bacterial groups was |
| 249 | expressed as total 16S rRNA gene copies per ng DNA extracted from the capsules per g_{vss} . |
| 250 | |
| 251 | Nucleotide sequences. Nucleotide sequence data reported are available in the |
| 252 | DDJB/EMBL/GenBank databases under the accession numbers HF922229 to HF922386. |
| 253 | |
| 254 | RESULTS |
| 255 | |
| 256 | Effect of the CH ₄ partial pressure on the initial activity. The results of the initial activity |
| 257 | experiment (Fig.1, experiment 1) are shown in Table 1 which presents the effect of an |
| 258 | elevated ${}^{13}CH_4$ partial pressure on the oxidation of ${}^{13}CH_4$ to ${}^{13}CO_2$ and the ${}^{12}CH_4$ production |
| 259 | of Eckernförde Bay sediment and mixed sludge. In both incubations with Eckernförde Bay |
| 260 | sediment and mixed sludge, we observed ${}^{12}CH_4$ production and ${}^{13}CO_2$ production. Since no |
| 261 | other carbon source than ${}^{13}CH_4$ was added, the ${}^{12}CH_4$ must have been produced from |
| 262 | endogenous organic matter. At 0.101 MPa CH4, both Eckernförde Bay sediment and mixed |
| 263 | |
| | sludge showed 13 CO ₂ production during net methanogenesis. At 10.1 MPa, the Eckernförde |
| 264 | sludge showed 13 CO ₂ production during net methanogenesis. At 10.1 MPa, the Eckernförde Bay sediment showed no methane production and 4 times higher oxidation rates of 13 CH ₄ to |
| 264 265 | sludge showed 13 CO ₂ production during net methanogenesis. At 10.1 MPa, the Eckernförde Bay sediment showed no methane production and 4 times higher oxidation rates of 13 CH ₄ to 13 CO ₂ than at 0.101 MPa. The oxidation of 13 CH ₄ to 13 CO ₂ by the mixed sludge was |
| 264 265 266 | sludge showed ¹³ CO ₂ production during net methanogenesis. At 10.1 MPa, the Eckernförde Bay sediment showed no methane production and 4 times higher oxidation rates of ¹³ CH ₄ to ¹³ CO ₂ than at 0.101 MPa. The oxidation of ¹³ CH ₄ to ¹³ CO ₂ by the mixed sludge was approximately 2 times higher at 10.1 MPa CH ₄ than at 0.1 MPa CH ₄ but still showed net |
| 264265266267 | sludge showed ¹³ CO ₂ production during net methanogenesis. At 10.1 MPa, the Eckernförde Bay sediment showed no methane production and 4 times higher oxidation rates of ¹³ CH ₄ to ¹³ CO ₂ than at 0.101 MPa. The oxidation of ¹³ CH ₄ to ¹³ CO ₂ by the mixed sludge was approximately 2 times higher at 10.1 MPa CH ₄ than at 0.1 MPa CH ₄ but still showed net methane production. |

| 269 | Effect of long-term high-pressure incubation. The long-term effects of an elevated methane |
|-----|---|
| 270 | partial pressure were tested in reactors with either Eckernförde Bay sediment or mixed sludge |
| 271 | (Fig.1, experiment 2). At 10.1 MPa CH ₄ , the methane oxidation rate in reactor HP-1 increased |
| 272 | from 0.006 mmol g_{VSS}^{-1} day ⁻¹ to 0.024 mmol g_{VSS}^{-1} day ⁻¹ during the 240-day incubation (Fig. |
| 273 | 2A and Table S3). The 12 CO ₂ production rate on the other hand decreased, likely because the |
| 274 | available endogenous organic matter was depleted. After 240 days, ¹³ CO ₂ production was |
| 275 | faster than the endogenous ${}^{12}\text{CO}_2$ production. Initially the SR rate by reactor HP-1 also |
| 276 | decreased, but from day 110 onwards the SR rate was correlated to the methane oxidation |
| 277 | rate. During long-term incubation of the mixed sludge, methane oxidation and sulfide |
| 278 | production in reactor HP-2 did not increase, nor were they coupled during the 160-day |
| 279 | incubation at 10.1 MPa CH ₄ . The total CO ₂ and sulfide production rates decreased during the |
| 280 | reactor run (Fig 2B and Table S3). |
| 281 | |

282 Microbial community of Eckernförde Bay sediment reactor. An archaeal clone library of a 283 sample taken from reactor HP-1 at 240 days of incubation shows that the total of 75 284 sequences are dominated by different clades of ANME archaea (Fig. 3 and Table S4). The 285 highest percentage of ANME clones belonged to the ANME-2a/b group (56% of all 286 sequences), followed by ANME-2c (18.6%) and ANME-1b (4%). Other clones with relatively 287 high frequency in the clone library cluster with the Miscellaneous Crenarchaeotal Group 15 288 (MCG-15) (9.3%) and the Marine benthic group D (MBG-D) (8%). Archaeal DGGE profiling 289 of membrane capsule DNA from reactor HP-1 at all sampling points was done to see initial 290 community changes. Afterwards, PCR-DGGE of cloned inserts with known composition 291 revealed that bands belonging to ANME-2a/b and ANME-2c were increasing in intensity 292 (Fig. S2). qPCR analysis of the same samples with specific 16S rRNA primers for ANME-293 2a/b, ANME-2c and total Archaea are shown in Fig 4. A significant increase (2-tailed t-test

| 294 | with unequal variance p<0.05) of both ANME-2a/b and ANME-2c 16S rRNA gene copies at |
|-----|--|
| 295 | 110 days of incubation is observed, confirming initial DGGE results. The increase of ANME |
| 296 | continued throughout reactor run and coincided with an increase of AOM and SR rates (Fig. |
| 297 | 2A and Table S3). The ANME-2a/b clade comprised a major fraction of total Archaea |
| 298 | whereas ANME-2c abundance was much lower during reactor operation (Fig. 4). However, |
| 299 | ANME-2c 16S rRNA gene copies showed a faster increase than ANME-2a/b between 160 |
| 300 | and 240 days. |
| 301 | A bacterial clone library of reactor HP-1 at 240 days of incubation of 82 sequences shows a |
| 302 | high bacterial diversity (Fig. 5 and Table S4). All but two sequences within the clone library |
| 303 | showed 97% or less similarity to known cultivated members. From the Deltaproteobacteria, |
| 304 | the most common phylotypes recovered belonged to the methane-seep associated 'Eel-1' |
| 305 | (6.2% of all sequences) and 'Eel-2' (13.6%) clades as described by Orphan et al. (24) of |
| 306 | which the Eel-2 clade clusters within the SEEP-SRB2 group. We also found sequences that |
| 307 | are affiliated with the order Desulforomonadales (7.4%). Members of the |
| 308 | Desulfobacteriaceae were least abundant and only 2.5% belonged to the |
| 309 | Desulfosarcinales/Desulfococcus cluster SEEP-SRB1. Some sequences found belonged to the |
| 310 | Myxococcales group. The remaining bacterial phyloptypes were very diverse and many |
| 311 | groups are also found previously in AOM sediments and reactor systems. Some are only |
| 312 | represented by one phylotype derived from the clone library (Table S4). |
| 313 | qPCR analysis results of membrane capsule DNA from reactor HP-1 at all sampling points |
| 314 | with 16S rRNA primers for total Bacteria, specific primers for SEEP-SRB2 and the newly |
| 315 | designed specific primers for Eel-1 are shown in Fig. 6. An 8-fold increase of SEEP-SRB2 |
| 316 | 16S rRNA gene copies was observed at 160 days of incubation and Eel-1 16S rRNA gene |
| 317 | copies increased 4-fold. The abundance of Eel-1 decreased slightly in parallel with total |
| 318 | Bacteria after 160 days of incubation whereas SEEP-SRB2 continued to slightly increase. |

13

.... 320 remained at a constant 2.5% of total Bacteria. From the qPCR results, we also calculated the 321 ratios of ANME-2a/b and ANME-2c over Eel-1 and SEEP-SRB2 copy numbers. We observed 322 that only ANME-2a/b and SEEP-SRB2 were detected in a constant ratio of around 1:2 323 throughout reactor operation and in EB (Fig. 6C). In reactor AP, much more ANME-2a/b 324 copies were detected as compared to SEEP-SRB2. The Eel-1 copies did not show a constant 325 ratio with any ANME subtype. We could not analyze *Desulforomonadales* within the reactor 326 as we were not able to design specific primers for this clade. 327 328 Microbial community of mixed sludge reactor. Microbial community analysis of the mixed 329 sludge reactor HP-2 was restricted to archaeal and bacterial DGGE analysis (Fig. S2 and S3) 330 as no increase in methane oxidation was observed. On both the archaeal and bacterial DGGE 331 profile, we did not see any community changes during reactor run.

332

333 DISCUSSION

334 Activity of Eckernförde Bay sediment. Our initial activity experiments showed that the 335 Eckernförde Bay sediment performed trace methane oxidation (TMO) during net 336 methanogenesis at 0.101 MPa CH₄ and net anaerobic oxidation of methane (AOM) at 10.1 MPa CH₄ without methane production (Table 1). Because the ${}^{13}CO_2$ production rate was also 337 338 4 times higher at 10.1 MPa CH_4 as compared to 0.101 MPa CH_4 , we expect that the AOM 339 activity of Eckernförde Bay sediment is stimulated by the higher methane partial pressure, 340 although the sediment originates from relative shallow waters of 28 m depth (8). The AOM 341 activity in reactor HP-1 did however not increase faster than the reported AOM activity of the 342 same Eckernförde Bay sediment in reactor AP at 0.101 MPa CH₄. In reactor HP-1, the AOM

| 343 | rate increased from 0.006 to 0.025 mmol g_{VSS}^{-1} d ⁻¹ over 240 days (Fig 2A and Table S3) and |
|-----|--|
| 344 | in reactor AP, the AOM rate increased from 0.003 to 0.55 mmol g_{VSS}^{-1} day ⁻¹ in 842 days (7). |
| 345 | Despite the good mixing of reactor HP-1, the increase of the AOM rate could have been |
| 346 | limited by the larger diffusion distances. In reactor HP-1 the biomass was present in |
| 347 | membrane capsules with a diameter of 14 mm, whereas reactor AP was a membrane |
| 348 | bioreactor (MBR) where the biomass was present as 0.1-mm flocks that were directly in |
| 349 | contact with the bioreactor medium (7). In reactor HP-1 at day 240, the average methane flux |
| 350 | though the membranes was 0.11 $\mu mol~cm^{-2}~d^{-1}~(=0.025~mmol~g_{VSS}^{-1}~d^{-1}$ * 0.038 g_{VSS} / 8.8 |
| 351 | cm ²). At this flux the Δ [CH ₄]/ Δ x is 16 mM cm ⁻¹ , according to Fick's first law of diffusion |
| 352 | (CH ₄ flux = - $\partial D_{\text{methane}} \Delta [CH_4] / \Delta x$). At 10.1 MPa CH ₄ and 20°C, the CH ₄ concentration in the |
| 353 | bulk liquid was approximately 152 mM. The average CH ₄ concentration near the |
| 354 | microorganisms was therefore only marginally lower than in the bulk liquid and cannot |
| 355 | explain the slow activity increase. |
| 356 | A more plausible explanation for the slow activity increase could be related to the method of |
| 357 | measuring activity of the high pressure reactor samples. Sampled membrane capsules were |
| 358 | incubated in 25-ml serum bottles at ambient pressure, using 0.13 MPa of pure ¹³ C-labeled |
| 359 | CH ₄ (Fig.1, experiment 2). Activity measurement at ambient pressure previously showed |
| 360 | decreased AOM activity as compared to high pressure measurements (25) but also the |
| 361 | microorganisms could have adapted to the higher pressure and will be less active when |
| 362 | incubated at ambient pressure as shown for true piezophiles (26). Indeed, the doubling times |
| 363 | calculated from the exponential increase in AOM rate in both reactors was 3.8 months |
| 364 | (R^2 =0.98, N=12) for reactor AP and 3.9 months (R^2 =0.90, N=15) for reactor HP-1. The |
| 365 | doubling time calculated from qPCR analysis was 0.97 months for ANME-2a/b, 0.75 months |
| 366 | for ANME-2c and 0.96 months for SEEP-SRB2. This indicates that high methane partial |
| | |

367 pressure had a positive effect on the AOM mediating microorganisms which was not reflected368 in AOM activity measurements.

A less likely explanation could be that reactor HP-1 was operated in fed-batch mode. Here,
sulfide and bicarbonate accumulated until the medium was replaced. Sulfide levels during the
first (days 0-60) and the last (days 160-240) incubation periods reached 2.7 mM (Table 2).
This could have been limiting the overall activity of the AOM mediating microorganisms as
2.4 (±0.1) mM sulfide was found to completely inhibit AOM and SR in reactor AP (7). In
reactor AP, sulfide levels were below 1.5 mM in the first 800 days of the reactor run, reaching

only 1.9 mM in the last 7 day period.

376

377 Microbial community of Eckernförde Bay sediment reactor. Increase in 16S rRNA gene 378 copies of ANME-2c archaea was only observed in the high pressure reactor HP-1. In the 379 ambient pressure reactor AP, only ANME2a/2b was present (6), which was verified by DGGE 380 and qPCR (Fig. 4). ANME-2a/b also showed growth at high pressure, indicating that both 381 phylotypes could grow at high methane partial pressure. Previous studies showed 382 predominance of ANME-2c archaea at high methane partial pressure (27), in interior of 383 hydrates (28), and showed a transition of ANME-2a/b to ANME-2c sequence abundance with 384 increasing sediment depth and sulfide concentration (29). Also, ANME-2a/b archaea seem to 385 exist in sediments with little or no free sulfide (30). Because ANME-2c archaea were not 386 present in reactor AP at atmospheric pressure and lower sulfide concentration, it is likely that 387 these methanotrophs do not grow at low methane pressure and that they have higher sulfide 388 tolerance. This could have resulted in higher growth rates than for ANME-2a/b. Indeed, 389 ANME-2c showed faster growth at the end of the run of reactor HP-1 as compared to 390 ANME2a/2b (Fig 4) and a shorter doubling time of 0.75 months vs. 0.97 months in the 391 exponential phase. An eventual predominance of ANME-2c in reactor HP-1 after prolonged

| 392 | incubation time is therefore plausible. ANME-1b archaea were the least abundant |
|-----|--|
| 393 | methanotrophs in both AOM-SR reactors, which could be explained by the continuous high |
| 394 | sulfate and low sulfide concentrations that seems to preferentially select for ANME-2 archaea. |
| 395 | Several studies showed a dominance of ANME-1 archaea in sulfate-depleted environments |
| 396 | (31) together with elevated sulfide levels (30) and it was suggested that ANME-1 could |
| 397 | perform AOM independent of sulfate reducing bacteria (32-34) or even perform |
| 398 | methanogenesis (35). |
| 399 | Archaeal DGGE bands that were intense throughout incubation of reactor HP-1 belong to the |
| 400 | MCG-15 and MBG-D (Fig. S2). The MBG-D represent 8% of our clone library sequences |
| 401 | and have been found in many cold marine (deep sea) sediments (36, 37, 38), and were |
| 402 | consistently found in bioreactors (7, 39). These archaea are related to the sulfur reducing |
| 403 | order Thermoplasmatales, and appear to include methanogens named "Methanoplasmatales" |
| 404 | (40). The MCG that were present until the end of the reactor run are abundant in marine deep |
| 405 | subsurface sediments (41). One hypothesis is that MCG archaea are heterotrophic anaerobes |
| 406 | (42) and carbon-isotopic signatures and polar lipid analysis also indicated an organic carbon |
| 407 | metabolism in sediments dominated by MCG sequences (43). Recently, it was found with |
| 408 | single cell genomic sequencing that the MCG and MBG-D archaea could play a role in |
| 409 | protein degradation (44). The batch mode of operation of our reactor implies long retention |
| 410 | time of products of endogenous activity that could function as potential new substrates. This |
| 411 | may have led to less selective enrichment and could explain the richness in archaeal diversity |
| 412 | in our reactor. |
| 413 | Deltaproteobacteria of the Eel-1 and the SEEP-SRB2 clade were present during run of |
| 414 | reactor HP-1 as qPCR and clone library results showed. Eel-1 members are closely related to |
| 415 | the marine sulfate reducer Desulfobacterium anilini (45). Most members of the SEEP-SRB2 |
| 416 | are related to Dissulfuribacter thermophilus (92% similarity) and Desulfobulbus propionicus |

| 417 | DSM 2032 (89% similarity), both sulfur disproportionating bacteria (46, 47). |
|-----|---|
| 418 | Desulforomonadales related sequences were equally abundant in the clone library as the Eel-1 |
| 419 | and clustered closely to the Pelobacter genus. Pelobacter is distinguished from |
| 420 | Desulforomonas species by being able to ferment specific hydrocarbons and being unable to |
| 421 | reduce Fe(III) and/or elemental sulfur (48). Both the SEEP-SRB2 and the Eel-1 group had |
| 422 | increased in 16S rRNA gene copies at 160 days but Eel-1 decreased in abundance with reactor |
| 423 | time, in parallel with total Bacteria (Fig 6). The Eel-1 group was previously hypothesized to |
| 424 | be <i>in situ</i> directly or indirectly involved in AOM (24). We however found that only growth of |
| 425 | SEEP-SRB2 coincided with growth of ANME-2a/b with a stable ratio of around 1:2 (Fig. |
| 426 | 6C), excluding at least the direct involvement of Eel-1 members in AOM. This finding, |
| 427 | together with the observed similar doubling times, could indicate that ANME2a/2b is growing |
| 428 | in consortia with SEEP-SRB2, which to our knowledge has not been shown before. ANME- |
| 429 | 2c archaea could have been paired with the other most abundant Desulforomonadales. This |
| 430 | SRB group was previously found in AOM mediating enrichments (27) and in cold seep |
| 431 | sediment (29, 49). However, as with the Eel-1 group, abundance is not an indication for the |
| 432 | involvement in AOM-SR. It could be that ANME-2c is actually forming consortia with |
| 433 | SEEP-SRB2 as well, but a strong correlation was not found because ANME-2c copies were |
| 434 | very low at the start of the reactor run and increased most between 160 and 240 days. A |
| 435 | stronger correlation between ANME-2c and SEEP-SRB2 may have been found if the reactor |
| 436 | would have been monitored longer. |
| 437 | Only 2.5% of the sequences in the clone library of reactor HP-1 belong to the SEEP-SRB1 |
| 438 | branch. In previous research on different AOM sediments, cloning results show a co- |
| 439 | occurrence of ANME-2 archaea and SEEP-SRB1. In contrast, when there is presence of |
| 440 | ANME-1 archaea, the Eel-1 and SEEP-SRB2 group seem to be more abundant (Table 3). |
| 441 | With microscopy techniques, other researchers recently found ANME-2c to be associated |

with SEEP-SRB2 (50), or other ANME-2 partners such as *Desulfobulbus* spp. related SRB
(51, 52), and unidentified bacteria (32). Other ANME types besides ANME-2 were also found
to aggregate with SEEP-SRB1 (53, 54). Recently, a novel bacterial partner named 'HotSeep1' was found in thermophilic AOM (55) and ANME-1a was even found at 90°C in absence of
SRB (56).

447 Our findings clearly indicate that the syntrophic relationship between different types of 448 ANME and SRB is flexible and dependent on environmental factors. It was suggested before 449 that syntrophy in AOM depends on the metabolism or ecological niche of the SRB (50, 52) 450 and nitrate was suggested as the basis for niche differentiation between some groups of SRB 451 (57). Uncultivated SRB belonging to SEEP-SRB2 are dominating seep habitats and are 452 believed to be able to use non-methane hydrocarbons (50, 57). We observed growth of SEEP-453 SRB2 in reactor HP-1, indicating that this clade is indeed involved in AOM and does not need 454 other non-methane hydrocarbons for growth. More likely, environmental parameters such as 455 methane partial pressure and sulfide concentration play a key role in growth of SEEP-SRB2 456 and ANME-2c. This could explain the lack of ANME-2c and SEEP-SRB2 in reactor AP at 457 ambient methane pressure and low sulfide levels and the lack of SEEP-SRB1 at high pressure 458 and increased sulfide levels in reactor HP-1. Further studies are however needed to clarify 459 which environmental parameters are crucial and which mechanism underlies the syntrophic 460 interaction between ANME and SRB. A continuous flow bioreactor which mimics in situ 461 conditions with little disturbance, already showed differential growth dynamics between 462 ANME-1 and ANME-2 populations dependent on altering pore water flow rates (58). Similar 463 studies where only the methane partial pressure or sulfide concentration is the varying factor 464 could also give more insight into the differential growth and activity of ANME-2a/b and 465 ANME-2c phylotypes and the associated SRB.

| 466 | Activity and microbial community of mixed sludge. Our initial activity experiments |
|-----|--|
| 467 | showed that mixed sludge performs TMO during net methanogenesis at both 0.101 MPa CH_4 |
| 468 | and 10.1 MPa CH ₄ (Table 1). Where reactor HP-1 showed increasing AOM activity during |
| 469 | long term incubation, reactor HP-2 did not. The total CO ₂ and sulfide production decreased |
| 470 | during the reactor run as endogenous substrates became depleted. Microbial analysis was |
| 471 | restricted to DGGE profiling which did not show major community changes as observed in |
| 472 | the HP reactor performing net AOM (Fig S2 and S3). This demonstrates that even at 10.1 |
| 473 | MPa CH ₄ , the anaerobic community in granular sludge was not able to utilize the available |
| 474 | energy for AOM coupled to SR during 160 days of incubation or that it does not have the |
| 475 | metabolic flexibility to do so. This is in agreement with previous findings that granular sludge |
| 476 | mediates TMO during net methanogenesis (10, 59), which results in much higher ${}^{13}CO_2$ |
| 477 | production rates from ${}^{13}CH_4$ than the reported carbon back flux (60). In contrast, Eckernförde |
| 478 | Bay sediment showed a clear uncoupling between the methane oxidation and the endogenous |
| 479 | methanogenic activity and a coupling of 13 CO ₂ and sulfide production after 120 days of |
| 480 | incubation. The production of $^{12}\text{CO}_2$ dropped to around 37 µmol g ⁻¹ d ⁻¹ when AOM started to |
| 481 | occur and kept on decreasing whereas the sludge reactor never reached less than 90 $\mu mol~g^{\text{-1}}$ |
| 482 | d^{-1} ¹² CO ₂ production during the 160 days of reactor run. According to Hoehler <i>et al.</i> , 1994, the |
| 483 | hydrogen concentration must be low enough for AOM to occur (61). Assuming that ${}^{12}CO_2$ |
| 484 | production coincides with hydrogen production from organic matter degradation in anoxic |
| 485 | sludge (62), then the hydrogen concentration was probably low enough in the Eckernförde |
| 486 | Bay sediment reactor at 110 days, but too high in the mixed sludge reactor. If we would have |
| 487 | allowed $^{12}\text{CO}_2$ production to drop as low as 37 $\mu\text{mol}\ g^{\text{-1}}\ d^{\text{-1}}$ in the sludge reactor, it maybe |
| 488 | could have allowed AOM to occur. It was shown recently that in anaerobic digestion of a |
| 489 | diverse mixture of samples, the chemical oxygen demand also drastically drops in the first |
| 490 | 150 days of reactor incubation and reaches steady state at around 160 days (63). Long term |
| | |

- 491 incubation is therefore indispensable to distinguish between labeled-methane oxidation during
- 492 net methanogenesis (TMO) or net anaerobic methane oxidation (AOM).
- 493

494 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 495 We want to thank all anonymous reviewers for their criticism and useful suggestions. We
- 496 want to thank Victoria Orphan and Tina Treude for fruitful discussions. This work was
- 497 supported in part by the EET program of the Dutch ministries of Economic affairs, Education,
- 498 culture and science and Environment and special planning through the Anaerobic Methane
- 499 Oxidation for Sulfate Reduction project. This research is also supported by the Dutch
- 500 Technology Foundation STW, which is part of the Netherlands Organization for Scientific
- 501 Research (NWO), and which is partly funded by the Ministry of Economic Affairs. Research
- 502 of AJMS is supported by ERC grant (project 323009) and the Gravitation grant (project
- 503 024.002.002) of the Netherlands Ministry of Education, Culture and Science and the
- 504 Netherlands Science Foundation (NWO).

505 **REFERENCES**

- Nauhaus K, Boetius A, Kruger M, Widdel F. 2002. In vitro demonstration of anaerobic oxidation of methane coupled to sulphate reduction in sediment from a marine gas hydrate area. Environ. Microbiol. 4:296-305.
- 509 2. Krüger M, Wolters H, Gehre M, Joye SB, Richnow HH. 2008. Tracing the slow
 510 growth of anaerobic methane-oxidizing communities by N-15-labelling techniques.
 511 FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. 63:401-411.
- Meulepas RJW, Jagersma CG, Khadem AF, Buisman CJN, Stams AJM, Lens
 PNL. 2009. Effect of environmental conditions on sulfate reduction with methane as
 electron donor by an Eckernforde Bay enrichment. Environ. Sci. Technol. 43:6553 6559.
- 516 4. Deusner C, Meyer V, Ferdelman TG. 2010. High-pressure systems for gas-phase
 517 free continuous incubation of enriched marine microbial communities performing
 518 anaerobic oxidation of methane. Biotechnol. Bioeng. 105:524-533.
- 5. Zhang Y, Henriet JP, Bursens J, Boon N. 2010. Stimulation of in vitro anaerobic
 oxidation of methane rate in a continuous high-pressure bioreactor. Bioresource
 Technology 101:3132-3138.
- 522 6. Jagersma GC, Meulepas RJW, Heikamp-de Jong I, Gieteling J, Klimiuk A,
 523 Schouten S, Damste JSS, Lens PNL, Stams AJM. 2009. Microbial diversity and
 524 community structure of a highly active anaerobic methane-oxidizing sulfate-reducing
 525 enrichment. Environ. Microbiol. 11:3223-3232.
- Meulepas RJW, Jagersma CG, Gieteling J, Buisman CJN, Stams AJM, Lens
 PNL. 2009. Enrichment of anaerobic methanotrophs in sulfate-reducing membrane
 bioreactors. Biotechnol. Bioeng. 104:458-470.
- 529 8. Treude T, Kruger M, Boetius A, Jorgensen BB. 2005. Environmental control on
 530 anaerobic oxidation of methane in the gassy sediments of Eckernforde Bay (German
 531 Baltic). Limnol. Oceanogr. 50:1771-1786.
- 532 9. Barnett PRO, Watson J, Connelly D. 1984. A multiple corer for taking virtually
 533 undisturbed samples from shelf, bathyal and abyssal sediments. Oceanologica Acta.
 534 7:399-408
- Meulepas RJW, Jagersma CG, Khadem AF, Stams AJM, Lens PNL. 2010. Effect
 of methanogenic substrates on anaerobic oxidation of methane and sulfate reduction
 by an anaerobic methanotrophic enrichment. Appl. Microbiol. 87:1499-1506.
- Meulepas RJ, Jagersma CG, Zhang Y, Petrillo M, Cai H, Buisman CJ, Stams AJ,
 Lens PN. 2010. Trace methane oxidation and the methane dependency of sulfate
 reduction in anaerobic granular sludge. FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. 72:261-271.
- 541 12. Shigematsu T, Tang YQ, Kobayashi T, Kawaguchi H, Morimura S, Kida K.
 542 2004. Effect of dilution rate on metabolic pathway shift between aceticlastic and nonaceticlastic methanogenesis in chemostat cultivation. Appl. Environ. Microbiol.
 544 70:4048-4052.
- Lane DJ. 1991. 16S/23S rRNA sequencing, p 115-175. *In* Stackebrandt E and
 Goodfellow M (ed), Nucleic acid techniques in bacterial systematics. Wiley & Sons,
 Chichester, United Kingdom.
- 548 14. Grosskopf R, Janssen PH, Liesack W. 1998. Diversity and structure of the
 549 methanogenic community in anoxic rice paddy soil microcosms as examined by
 550 cultivation and direct 16S rRNA gene sequence retrieval. Appl. Environ. Microbiol.
 551 64:960-969.
- 552 15. Yu ZT, Garcia-Gonzalez R, Schanbacher FL, Morrison M. 2008. Evaluations of
 553 different hypervariable regions of archaeal 16S rRNA genes in profiling of

| 554 | | methanogens denaturing by Archaea-specific PCR and gradient gel electrophoresis. |
|-----|-----|---|
| 555 | | Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 74:889-893. |
| 556 | 16. | Nubel U, Engelen B, Felske A, Snaidr J, Wieshuber A, Amann RI, Ludwig W, |
| 557 | | Backhaus H. 1996. Sequence heterogeneities of genes encoding 16S rRNAs in |
| 558 | | Paenibacillus polymyxa detected by temperature gradient gel electrophoresis. J. |
| 559 | | Bacteriol. 178:5636-5643. |
| 560 | 17. | Martin R, Heilig GHJ, Zoetendal EG, Smidt H, Rodriguez JM. 2007. Diversity of |
| 561 | | the Lactobacillus group in breast milk and vagina of healthy women and potential role |
| 562 | | in the colonization of the infant gut. J. Appl. Microbiol. 103 :2638-2644. |
| 563 | 18. | Muyzer G, Dewaal EC, Uitterlinden AG. 1993. Profiling of complex microbial- |
| 564 | | populations by denaturing gradient gel-electrophoresis analysis of polymerase chain |
| 565 | | reaction-amplified genes-coding for 16S ribosomal-RNA. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. |
| 566 | | 59: 695-700. |
| 567 | 19. | DeSantis TZ, Hugenholtz P, Larsen N, Rojas M, Brodie EL, Keller K, Huber T, |
| 568 | | Dalevi D, Hu P, Andersen GL. 2006. Greengenes, a chimera-checked 16S rRNA |
| 569 | | gene database and workbench compatible with ARB. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. |
| 570 | | 72: 5069-5072. |
| 571 | 20. | Altschul SF, Madden TL, Schaffer AA, Zhang JH, Zhang Z, Miller W, Lipman |
| 572 | | DJ. 1997. Gapped BLAST and PSI-BLAST: a new generation of protein database |
| 573 | | search programs. Nucleic Acids Res. 25:3389-3402. |
| 574 | 21. | Pruesse E, Peplies J, Glockner FO. 2012. SINA: Accurate high-throughput multiple |
| 575 | | sequence alignment of ribosomal RNA genes. Bioinformatics 28:1823-1829. |
| 576 | 22. | Quast C, Pruesse E, Yilmaz P, Gerken J, Schweer T, Yarza P, Peplies J, |
| 577 | | Glockner FO. 2013. The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: improved |
| 578 | | data processing and web-based tools. Nucleic Acids Res. 41: D590-D596. |
| 579 | 23. | Ludwig W, Strunk O, Westram R, Richter L, Meier H, Yadhukumar, Buchner |
| 580 | | A, Lai T, Steppi S, Jobb G, Forster W, Brettske I, Gerber S, Ginhart AW, Gross |
| 581 | | O, Grumann S, Hermann S, Jost R, Konig A, Liss T, Lussmann R, May M, |
| 582 | | Nonhoff B, Reichel B, Strehlow R, Stamatakis A, Stuckmann N, Vilbig A, Lenke |
| 583 | | M, Ludwig T, Bode A, Schleifer KH. 2004. ARB: a software environment for |
| 584 | | sequence data. Nucleic Acids Res. 32:1363-1371. |
| 585 | 24. | Orphan VJ, Hinrichs KU, Ussler W, Paull CK, Taylor LT, Sylva SP, Hayes JM, |
| 586 | | Delong EF. 2001. Comparative analysis of methane-oxidizing archaea and sulfate- |
| 587 | | reducing bacteria in anoxic marine sediments. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 67:1922- |
| 588 | | 1934. |
| 589 | 25. | Bowles MW, Samarkin VA, Joye SB. 2011. Improved measurement of microbial |
| 590 | | activity in deep-sea sediments at in situ pressure and methane concentration. Limnol. |
| 591 | | Oceanogr.:Methods 9:499-506 |
| 592 | 26. | Vossmeyer A, Deusner C, Kato C, Inagaki F, Ferdelman TG. 2012. Substrate- |
| 593 | | specific pressure-dependence of microbial sulfate reduction in deep-sea cold seep |
| 594 | | sediments of the Japan Trench. Front. Microbiol. 3:253. |
| 595 | 27. | Schreiber L, Holler T, Knittel K, Meyerdierks A, Amann R. 2010. Identification of |
| 596 | | the dominant sulfate-reducing bacterial partner of anaerobic methanotrophs of the |
| 597 | | ANME-2 clade. Environ. Microbiol. 12:2327-2340. |
| 598 | 28. | Mills HJ, Martinez RJ, Story S, Sobecky PA. 2005. Characterization of microbial |
| 599 | | community structure in Gulf of Mexico gas hydrates: Comparative analysis of DNA- |
| 600 | | and RNA-derived clone libraries. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 71:3235-3247. |
| 601 | 29. | Roalkvam I, Jorgensen SL, Chen YF, Stokke R, Dahle H, Hocking WP, Lanzen |
| 602 | | A, Haflidason H, Steen IH. 2011. New insight into stratification of anaerobic |
| | | mathematranhs in cold scon sodiments EEMS Microbiol Ecol 78.222 242 |

| 604 | 30. | Biddle JF, Cardman Z, Mendlovitz H, Albert DB, Lloyd KG, Boetius A, Teske A. |
|------------|-----|--|
| 605 | | 2012. Anaerobic oxidation of methane at different temperature regimes in Guaymas |
| 606 | | Basin hydrothermal sediments. ISME J. 6:1018-1031. |
| 607 | 31. | Vigneron A, Cruaud P, Pignet P, Caprais JC, Cambon-Bonavita MA, Godfroy A, |
| 608 | | Toffin L. 2013. Archaeal and anaerobic methane oxidizer communities in the Sonora |
| 609 | | Margin cold seeps, Guaymas Basin (Gulf of California). ISME J. 7:1595-1608. |
| 610 | 32. | Orphan VJ, House CH, Hinrichs KU, McKeegan KD, DeLong EF. 2002. Multiple |
| 611 | | archaeal groups mediate methane oxidation in anoxic cold seep sediments. P. Natl. |
| 612 | | Acad. Sci. USA 99: 7663-7668. |
| 613 | 33. | Maignien L, Parkes RJ, Cragg B, Niemann H, Knittel K, Coulon S, |
| 614 | | Akhmetzhanov A, Boon N. 2013. Anaerobic oxidation of methane in hypersaline |
| 615 | | cold seep sediments. FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. 83:214-231. |
| 616 | 34. | Pachiadaki MG, Kallionaki A, Dahlmann A, De Lange GJ, Kormas KA. 2011. |
| 617 | | Diversity and Spatial Distribution of Prokaryotic Communities Along A Sediment |
| 618 | | Vertical Profile of A Deep-Sea Mud Volcano. Microbial. Ecol. 62:655-668. |
| 619 | 35. | Lloyd KG, Alperin MJ, Teske A. 2011. Environmental evidence for net methane |
| 620 | | production and oxidation in putative ANaerobic MEthanotrophic (ANME) archaea. |
| 621 | | Environ. Microbiol. 13:2548-2564. |
| 622 | 36. | Kendall MM, Wardlaw GD, Tang CF, Bonin AS, Liu YT, Valentine DL. 2007. |
| 623 | | Diversity of Archaea in marine sediments from Skan Bay, Alaska, including cultivated |
| 624 | | methanogens, and description of Methanogenium boonei sp nov. Appl. Environ. |
| 625 | | Microbiol. 73: 407-414. |
| 626 | 37. | Vetriani C, Tran HV, Kerkhof LJ. 2003. Fingerprinting microbial assemblages from |
| 627 | | the oxic/anoxic chemocline of the Black Sea. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 69:6481- |
| 628 | | 6488. |
| 629 | 38. | Orphan VJ, Hinrichs KU, Ussler W, Paull CK, Taylor LT, Sylva SP, Hayes JM, |
| 630 | | DeLong EF. 2001. Comparative analysis of methane-oxidizing archaea and sulfate- |
| 631 | | reducing bacteria in anoxic marine sediments. Environ. Microbiol. 67 :1922-1934. |
| 632 | 39. | Zhang Y, Maignien L, Zhao XX, Wang FP, Boon N. 2011. Enrichment of a |
| 633 | | microbial community performing anaerobic oxidation of methane in a continuous |
| 634 | 10 | high-pressure bioreactor. BMC Microbiol. 11: 137 |
| 635 | 40. | Paul K, Nonoh O, Mikulski L, Brune A. 2012. "Methanoplasmatales," |
| 636 | | Thermoplasmatales-related archaea in temite guts and other environments, are the |
| 637 | 4.1 | seventh order of methanogens. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 78:8245-8253. |
| 638 | 41. | Inagaki F, Suzuki M, Takai K, Oida H, Sakamoto T, Aoki K, Nealson KH, |
| 639 | | Horikoshi K. 2003. Microbial communities associated with geological horizons in |
| 640 | | coastal subseafloor sediments from the Sea of Okhotsk. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. |
| 641 | 40 | 09 :/224-7235. |
| 642 | 42. | Teske A, Sorensen KB. 2008. Uncultured archaea in deep marine subsurface |
| 643 | 12 | sediments: nave we caught them all? ISME J. 2:3-18. |
| 044 645 | 43. | Diddle JF, Lipp JS, Lever MA, Lioyd KG, Sorensen KD, Anderson K, Fredricks |
| 043 646 | | HF, Elvert M, Keny IJ, Schrag DP, Sogin ML, Brenchey JE, Teske A, House |
| 640 647 | | CH, HINFICHS KU. 2006. Heterotrophic Archaea dominate sedimentary subsurface |
| 04/ 6/9 | 4.4 | COSYSTEMS ON FERU. F. INdii. ACdu. SCI. USA 103:3840-3831. Lloyd KC Schweiber I. Detenson DC Kieldson KU Lever MA Steer AD |
| 040 640 | 44. | Livyu NG, Schlehler L, reiersen DG, Njelusen NU, Lever MA, Sieen AD, Stanonouckog D. Dichton M. Kloindionst S. Lonk S. Schwamm A. Daulson |
| 049 650 | | Jurganean R 2013 Dradominant archaea in marine sedimente degrade detrited |
| 651 | | Jørgensen D. 2015. Fredominant archaea in marme sediments degrade delfildi protoine. Noture 406 ,215-218 |
| 0.51 | | proteins. matule 470:213-210. |

| 652 | 45. | Schnell S, Bak F, Pfennig N. 1989. Anaerobic degradation of aniline and |
|------------|-----|--|
| 653 | | dihydroxybenzenes by newly isolated sulfate-reducing bacteria and description of |
| 654 | | Desulfobacterium anilini. Arch. Microbiol. 152:556-563. |
| 655 | 46. | Slobodkina AL, Reysenbach AL, Slobodkina GB, Kolganova TV, Kostrikina NA, |
| 656 | | Bonch-Osmolovskava EA. 2013. Dissulfuribacter thermophilus gen. nov., sp. nov., a |
| 657 | | thermophilic, autotrophic, sulfur-disproportionating, deeply branching |
| 658 | | deltaproteobacterium from a deep-sea hydrothermal vent. Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol. |
| 659 | | 63: 1967-1971 |
| 660 | 47 | Lovley DR. Phillins E.IP. 1994 Novel Processes for Anaerobic Sulfate Production |
| 661 | .,. | from Elemental Sulfur by Sulfate-Reducing Bacteria Appl Environ Microbiol |
| 662 | | 60:2394-2399 |
| 663 | 48 | Evers S. Weizenegger M. Ludwig W. Schink B. Schleifer KH. 1993 The |
| 664 | 10. | nhylogenetic positions of <i>Pelobacter acetylenicus</i> and <i>Pelobacter propionicus</i> . Syst |
| 665 | | Appl Microbiol 16:216-218 |
| 666 | 49 | Orcutt RN Jove SR Kleindienst S Knittel K Ramette A Reitz A Samarkin V |
| 667 | чу. | Treude T Boetius A 2010 Impact of natural oil and higher hydrocarbons on |
| 668 | | microbial diversity distribution and activity in Gulf of Mexico cold-seen sediments |
| 669 | | Deen-Sea Res. Pt. II 57:2008-2021 |
| 670 | 50 | Kleindienst S Ramette A Amann R Knittel K 2012 Distribution and in situ |
| 671 | 50. | abundance of sulfate reducing bacteria in diverse marine hydrocarbon seen sediments |
| 672 | | Environ Microbiol 14.2689-2710 |
| 673 | 51 | Parnthaler A Dakas AF Brown CT Coffredi SK Embave T Ornhan VI 2008 |
| 67A | 51. | Diverse syntrophic partnerships from deep sea methane vents revealed by direct call |
| 675 | | capture and metagenomics P Natl Acad Sci USA 105 ,7052,7057 |
| 676 | 52 | Vignoron A. Crueud P. Pignot P. Conrois IC. Covet N. Combon Renevite MA |
| 677 | 52. | Codfroy A Toffin I 2013 Bacterial communities and syntrophic associations |
| 678 | | involved in an archic oxidation of methane process of the Sonora Margin cold seens |
| 670 | | Guaymas Basin Environ Microbiol doi: 10.1111/1462.2020.12324 |
| 680 | 53 | Knittel K Lesekenn T Beeting A Kort P Amenn P 2005 Diversity and |
| 681 | 55. | distribution of methanotrophic archaea at cold seens. Appl. Environ. Microbiol |
| 687 | | 71 • <i>A</i> 67 <i>A</i> 70 |
| 683 | 54 | /1.40/-4/2. Losakann T. Knittal K. Nadalig T. Fuchs R. Niamann H. Roatius A. Amann R. |
| 68/ | 54. | 2007 Diversity and abundance of aerobic and anaerobic methane ovidizers at the |
| 685 | | Haakon Moshy mud volcano. Barante Saa, Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 73 :3248,3362 |
| 686 | 55 | Holler T. Widdel F. Knittel K. Amann R. Kellermann MV. Hinrichs KU. Teske |
| 687 | 55. | A Bootius A Waganar C 2011 Thermorphilic anaerobic oxidation of mathana by |
| 688 | | marine microbial consortia ISME I 5:1046 1056 |
| 680 | 56 | Wankal SD Adams MM Johnston DT Hansal CM Java SR Circuis DD 2012 |
| 600 | 50. | Anaerobic methane oxidation in metalliferous hydrothermal sediments: influence on |
| 601 | | asrbon flux and decoupling from sulfate reduction. Environ Microbiol 14:2726-2740 |
| 607 | 57 | Croon Sayana A. Dakas AF. Dallaska NF. Ornhan VI. 2014. Nitrate based niche |
| 602 | 57. | differentiation by distinct sulfate reducing besteric involved in the operable ovidation |
| 604 | | of mothana ISME I 9:150 162 |
| 605 | 59 | Circuit DD Cozon AF DoLong FF 2005 Growth and population dynamics of |
| 695 | 58. | Gliguis F K, Cozeli AE, DeLong EF. 2005. Of own and population dynamics of |
| 607 | | anacione memane-oxidizing archaea and suffate-reducing bacteria in a continuous- flow bioreaster, Appl. Environ, Microbiol. 71 ,2725, 2722 |
| 609/ | 50 | Tow Dioreactor. Appl. Elivitori. Microbiol. 11:3/23-3/33. Zahndan A. I. Broak TD, 1080. Anagraphic methans avidation, accumance and |
| 600 | 59. | acology Appl Environ Microbiol 30 ,104 204 |
| 077 700 | 60 | COORSY. Appl. Elivitoli. Microbiol. 37:194-204. Hollon T. Waganan C. Niamann H. Daugnar C. Fandalman T.C. Daating A |
| 700 | 00. | Prunner P. Widdel F. 2011. Carbon and cultur healt flux during another mismakia |
| /01 | | Diamer D , where F . 2011. Carbon and suffer back flux during anaerobic microbial |

| 702 | | oxidation of methane and coupled sulfate reduction. P. Natl. Acad. Sci. 108 :1484- |
|-----|-----|---|
| 703 | | 1490. |
| 704 | 61. | Hoehler TM, Alperin MJ, Albert DB, Martens CS. 1994. Field and laboratory |
| 705 | | studies of methane oxidation in an anoxic marine sediment – evidence for a |
| 706 | | methanogen-sulfate reducer consortium. Global Biogeochem. Cycles. 8:451-463. |
| 707 | 62. | Demeril B. 2014. Major pathway of methane formation from energy crops in |
| 708 | | agricultural biogas digesters. Critical Reviews in Environmental Science and |
| 709 | | Technology. 44:199-222. |
| 710 | 63. | Vanwonterghem I, Jensen PD, Dennis PG, Hugenholtz P, Rabaey K, Tyson GW. |
| 711 | | 2014. Deterministic processes guide long-term synchronised population dynamics in |
| 712 | | replicate anaerobic digesters. ISME J. 8:2015-2028. |
| 713 | 64. | Ku HH. 1966. Notes on Use of Propagation of Error Formulas. J. Res. N.B.SC. Eng. |
| 714 | | Inst. C 70:263-273. |
| 715 | 65. | Knittel K, Boetius A, Lemke A, Eilers H, Lochte K, Pfannkuche O, Linke P, |
| 716 | | Amann R. 2003. Activity, distribution, and diversity of sulfate reducers and other |
| 717 | | bacteria in sediments above gas hydrate (Cascadia margin, Oregon). Geomicrobiol. J. |
| 718 | | 20: 269-294. |
| 719 | 66. | Harrison BK, Zhang H, Berelson W, Orphan VJ. 2009. Variations in archaeal and |
| 720 | | bacterial diversity associated with the sulfate-methane transition zone in continental |
| 721 | | margin sediments (Santa Barbara Basin, California). Appl. Environ. Microbiol. |
| 722 | | 75: 1487-1499. |
| 723 | 67. | Lloyd KG, Lapham L, Teske A. 2006. Anaerobic methane-oxidizing community of |
| 724 | | ANME-1b archaea in hypersaline Gulf of Mexico sediments. Appl. Environ. |
| 725 | | Microbiol. 72: 7218-7230. |
| 726 | 68. | Teske A, Hinrichs KU, Edgcomb V, de Vera Gomez A, Kysela D, Sylva SP, Sogin |
| 727 | | ML, Jannasch HW. 2002. Microbial diversity of hydrothermal sediments in the |
| 728 | | Guaymas Basin: evidence for anaerobic methanotrophic communities. Appl. Environ. |
| 729 | | Microbiol. 68: 1994-2007. |
| 730 | | |

AEM Accepts published online ahead of print

- 731 **Fig. 1** Schematic representation of the different experiments performed in this study.
- Experiment 0 represents the study of reactor AP published previously (6,7) and the original
- 733 Eckernförde Bay sediment (EB) of which samples were stored and analyzed in this study.
- Experiment 1 and 2 were fully conducted in this study. The piston picture was modified with
- permission from ref. 11.

- **Fig. 2** The ¹³CO₂(\circ), ¹²CO₂(Δ), ¹²CH₄(x) and sulfide (\Box) production rates derived from the ambient pressure activity measurements with ¹³CH₄ of sampled capsules of reactor HP-1 (A)
- and reactor HP-2 (B) after different periods of incubation at 10.1 MPa 12 CH₄ and 20°C. Error
- bars represent standard deviations from independent measurements.

| 740 | Fig. 3 Phylogenetic tree of 16S rRNA gene sequences from an archaeal clone library |
|-----|--|
| 741 | constructed of a sample taken at 240 days of incubation of reactor HP-1. The tree was |
| 742 | constructed with the ARB neighbor-joining method with terminal filtering and jukes-cantor |
| 743 | correction using almost full length 16S rRNA sequences. Clones detected in this study are |
| 744 | indicated in bold. The numbers in parenthesis indicate the number of sequences found of each |
| 745 | phylotype. Closed circles represent bootstrap values >70% (1000 replicates). The scale bar |
| 746 | represents the percentage of changes per nucleotide position. |

- 747 Fig. 4 Absolute 16S rRNA gene abundance of ANME-2a/b and total Archaea (A) and
- ANME-2c (B) in reactor HP-1 sampled in duplicate (A and B) at 60, 110 and 160 days,
- except at 240 days. Results are compared to the ambient pressure reactor (AP) and the
- 750 Eckernförde bay sediment inoculum (EB). Standard deviations represent triplicate analysis.

| 752 | constructed of a sample taken at 240 days of incubation of reactor HP-1. The tree shows only |
|-----|--|
| 753 | the canonical sulfate-reducing bacterial phylotypes found. The tree was constructed with the |
| 754 | ARB neighbor-joining method with terminal filtering and jukes-cantor correction using |
| 755 | almost full length 16S rRNA sequences. Clones detected in this study are indicated in bold. |
| 756 | The numbers in parenthesis indicate the number of sequences found of each phylotype. |
| 757 | Closed circles represent bootstrap values >70% (1000 replicates). The tree outgroup |
| 758 | Clostridium was removed after tree construction. The scale bar represents the percentage of |
| 759 | changes per nucleotide position. |
| | |
| | |

Fig. 5 Phylogenetic tree of 16S rRNA gene sequences from a bacterial clone library

751

Fig. 6 Absolute 16S rRNA gene abundance of SEEP-SRB2 and Eel-1 group (A) and total *Bacteria* (B) with standard deviations representing triplicate analysis and the ratio of ANME2a/b and SEEP-SRB2 (C) with combined standard deviations calculated as described (64).
Reactor HP-1 was sampled in duplicate (A and B) at 60, 110, 160 days, except at 240 days
and was compared to the ambient pressure reactor (AP) and the Eckernförde bay sediment
inoculum (EB).

TABLE 1 Initial activity experiment with the ${}^{13}CO_2$, and ${}^{12}CH_4$ production rates by

Eckernförde Bay sediment and mixed sludge at 0.101 and 10.1 MPa ¹³CH₄^a

768 769

| | Eckernförde B | ay sediment | Mixed sludge | | | |
|-------------------------------|--|---|--|---|--|--|
| Production rates | 0.101 MPa ¹³ CH ₄ | 10.1 MPa ¹³ CH ₄ | 0.101 MPa ¹³ CH ₄ | 10.1 MPa ¹³ CH ₄ | | |
| | $(\mu mol g_{VSS}^{-1} da)$ | ny ⁻¹) | $(\mu mol g_{VSS}^{-1} day^{-1})$ | | | |
| ¹³ CO ₂ | 5.8 (±0.3) | 20.9 (±4.5) | 8.6 (±0.9) | 16.3 (±6.2) | | |
| ¹² CH ₄ | 8.5 (±1.4) | 0.0 (±0.1) | 47.1 (±1.9) | 36.6 (±7.3) | | |
| | | | | | | |

770

^a Standard deviations represent biological triplicates of 0.02 g VSS inoculum per glass tube

| 772 | TABLE 2 Sulfide concentration | in reactor HP-1 | inoculated with | h Eckernförde bay | sediment |
|-----|-------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------|
| | | | | 1 | |

| - |
|-----|
| 2.7 |
| 2.7 |
| 1.5 |
| 2.1 |
| 2.7 |
| |

| Sampling site | Eel River Basin | | Hydrate Ridge | Santa Barbara | Gulf of Mexico | Guaymas Basin | | Santa Barbara | | | Eckernförde Bay | | |
|---------------|-----------------|-------------|------------------|------------------|-------------------|---------------|-----------|------------------|-------------|-----|--------------------|---------------|----|
| | 0-4 cm | 20-22 cm | 4-7 cm | Beggiatoa Mat | 139 cm | 15-18 cm | Core A | Core C | 13-16 cm | HR | Isis | Reactor AP | |
| Reference | (24) | | (65, 53) | (66) | (67) | (| 58) | (24) | (2 | :7) | (6) | This research | |
| Archaea | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ANME-1 | ++ | ++ | + | + | + | + | + | - | - | - | - | - | + |
| ANME-2 | + | + | ++ | ++ | | | - | + | + | + | + | + | ++ |
| Bacteria | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| SEEP-SRB1 | + | + | + | ++ | + | | - | + | + | ++ | ++ | ++ | + |
| SEEP-SRB2 | + | + | - | + | - | ++ | + | - | - | - | - | + | ++ |
| SEEP-SRB3 | + | - | + | + | | | + | | - | | | | - |
| SEEP-SRB4 | | | | + | | | | + | | | | | - |
| Eel-1 | + | + | - | - | ++ | + | - | - | - | - | - | + | + |
| Eel-3 | + | - | - | l | | | | | + | | | | - |

| 776 | TABLE 3 An overview of archaeal and bacterial 16S rRNA genes detected in different studies on AOM mediating marine sediments | ,t |
|-----|--|----|
|-----|--|----|

778 ^b Symbols represent presence (+), dominance (++) or absence (-) of 16S rRNA gene sequences. HR = Hydrate ridge, Isis = Isis mud volcano

AEM Accepts published online ahead of print







10%





