

# UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### 'Supermaids'

Hyper-resilient Subjects in Neoliberal Migration Governance

Chee, L.

Publication date 2019 Document Version Final published version

### Link to publication

#### Citation for published version (APA):

Chee, L. (2019). *'Supermaids': Hyper-resilient Subjects in Neoliberal Migration Governance*. (IMI working papers; No. 153). International Migration Institute. https://www.migrationinstitute.org/publications/2018supermaids2019-hyper-resilient-subjects-in-neoliberal-migration-governance

#### **General rights**

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

#### **Disclaimer/Complaints regulations**

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.



# **Working Papers**

Paper 153, September 2019

# 'Supermaids':

# Hyper-resilient Subjects in Neoliberal Migration Governance

Liberty Chee

This paper is published by the International Migration Institute (IMI). IMI does not have an institutional view and does not aim to present one. The views expressed in this document are those of its independent author.

# **The IMI Working Papers Series**

The IMI working paper series presents current research in the field of international migration. The series was initiated by the International Migration Institute (IMI) since its foundation at the University in Oxford in 2006. The papers in this series (1) analyse migration as part of broader global change, (2) contribute to new theoretical approaches, and (3) advance understanding of the multi-level forces driving migration and experiences of migration.

# Abstract

Resilience is a concept in world politics that emerged, in part, as a way to respond to the impossibility of guaranteeing security in an era of complexity. Absent a central authority that provides security, risk is devolved to the individual, and those who cannot secure themselves are enjoined to constantly adapt to the unknown. Where control over complex systems is now thought to be impossible, the path to managing risks is through self-control. This paper demonstrates how such a subject is produced, and indeed whose production, I argue, is crucial to the functioning of a global labor market that is governed 'without government.' Migrant domestic workers acutely instantiate the kind of human subjectivity called forth by neoliberalism – a 'resilient subject.' The paper describes how this ideal worker is produced through resilience training in various stages of the migration trajectory – during recruitment, training prior to deployment and while on their overseas residency. This paper demonstrates how managing the insecurities of migrant domestic work means working on the 'self' rather than addressing gaps in legal or regulatory mechanisms. In resilience training, the worker becomes the necessary component of neoliberalism as a governmental rationality, one that is enjoined to transform risk into opportunity. This paper draws from an eight-month multi-sited ethnography in the major migrant domestic worker sending and receiving in Southeast Asia – notably the Philippines, Indonesia, Singapore and Malaysia.

**Keywords:** Resilience, migrant domestic workers, neoliberal migration governance, social reproduction, migration industry, Southeast Asia

Author: Liberty Chee (University of Amsterdam), <u>l.l.chee@uva.nl</u> or <u>libertychee@gmail.com</u>

Earlier versions of this paper have been presented at the following: Global Labour Migration Conference, International Institute of Social History. June 20, 2019 Early Career Researchers Workshop, World International Studies Committee, University of Economics in Prague. September 10, 2018.

Acknowledgments: This paper acknowledges funding from the RIGHTS Project (ERC Starting Grant ERC-2017-StG-760043)

# Contents

Intro	oduction	4
1	The Resilient Subject and Neoliberal Governance	5
2	How to Make a 'Successful' Migrant	8
3	Resilience Training	12
4	Conclusion	16
5	References	18

"If you're just thinking about the money then your mentality is just a worker, not a manager. So you have to learn to lead yourself. Don't be a candle. If the wax runs out you have nothing else...If you have the right mentality then you can survive."

- Pre-departure trainer, Jakarta

# Introduction

His business being human capital export, Pak Surono<sup>1</sup> has a clear understanding of the value of the Indonesian workers he deploys to households in the Gulf. Their job is "to make people happy in that house...make them more health[y]." He compares them to doctors and nurses even though their official job title is that of a maid. Interestingly, Surono also cautions his recruits to "not become like a candle. You make other people see each other, but you burn yourself." The candle metaphor is repeated by a trainer in the one-day info-session which Indonesian migrant workers must attend before they leave the country, the PAP.<sup>2</sup> As he scribbles 'mental' on the whiteboard, the trainer claims that what makes the Indonesian migrant worker or TKI<sup>3</sup> successful is her mentality. The correct mentality for surviving the whole migration trajectory is if one did not simply think about receiving one's wages because that would make one a mere worker. The right mentality is one of a manager, where one learns to lead oneself. "Don't be a candle. If the wax runs out you have nothing else."

While cooking, cleaning and caring for dependents is certainly still performed unremunerated by many women around the world, there now exists a category of workers whose paid services are sought-after in all world regions. According to the International Labour Organization (ILO), high-income countries account for 9.1 of the estimated 11.5 million migrant domestic workers worldwide. The biggest receiving regions are Southeast Asia and the Pacific; Northern, Southern and Western Europe; and the Arab States respectively (ILO 2015). Because they work in private homes, and the fact that domestic work is not normally included in labour laws (Torriente 2017), stories of abuse and exploitation are common in this sector. Which is why Pak Surono thinks that it is part of his job to make sure that the TKI he deploys to the Gulf have what it takes to survive the whole migration cycle. Being *siap mental* or mentally ready is very clearly a desired outcome of training and pre-departure orientations prior to deployment overseas (Prusinski 2017). This mentality enjoins workers about to ship out to be resilient – ready to face the uncertainties of work overseas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Not his real name.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Pembekalan Akhir Pemberangkatan or pre-departure briefing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Tenaga Kerja Indonesia

The paper describes how this ideal worker is produced through what I call 'resilience training' in various stages of migration – during recruitment, training prior to deployment and while on their overseas residency. Training consists of developing a 'strong mind', professionalism and self-esteem, all of which demonstrate how managing the insecurities of migrant domestic work means working on the 'self' rather than addressing gaps in national regional and transnational regulatory mechanisms. There is the ILO's Convention on Domestic Work, a norm-setting instrument that entered into force in 2013. Its purview remains limited, however, having only been ratified by 24 states, none of which is a major destination country. This means that tens of thousands of workers, most of whom are women, work in 'zones of indistinction (Agamben 1998, 6)', where the law ceases to apply. I argue that migrant domestic workers acutely instantiate the kind of human subjectivity called forth by neoliberalism – a 'resilient subject' able to thrive in spaces where sovereign states' juridical power cedes governmental rationality to the market or the private sphere. This paper demonstrates how such a subject is produced, and indeed whose production is crucial to the functioning of a global labour market that is governed 'without government (Rosenau 1995).'

I draw from eight months of fieldwork in major migrant origin and destination countries in Southeast Asia – notably the Philippines, Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore. I interviewed 70 government officials, recruiters, and representatives from non-governmental organizations. I also accessed and performed participant observation in 24 recruitment agencies, 3 industry associations and 6 training centers. This case is important because this market model – that of temporary, contractual domestic worker migration mediated by recruitment or placement agencies originated from the region, a model which has since diffused to sending and receiving countries in South Asia, East Asia, Africa and the Middle East. Skills and language training prior to departure is a market innovation that has also been taken up in other regions (Awumbila et al. 2018; Liang 2011).

## 1 The Resilient Subject and Neoliberal Governance

'Resilience' is a concept in world politics that emerged, in part, as a way to respond to the impossibility of guaranteeing security in an era of complexity, where sources of 'threat' can no longer simply be managed at the sovereign border (Walker and Cooper 2011; Coaffee and Wood 2006). For instance, faced with *forces majeures*, those who are vulnerable to severe weather patterns must practice constant vigilance and disaster preparedness (Evans and Reid 2013; Aradau and Van Munster 2007). In sustainable development discourse, survival strategies of households demonstrate agency in response to reduction in social welfare spending (Cooper 2015, 135). Because a central authority that provides security is absent, risk is devolved to the individual, and those who cannot secure themselves are enjoined to constantly adapt to the unknown (Joseph 2013). Thus, the individual must learn to be

resilient through training (O'Malley 2010; Duffield 2012; Howell 2015), to learn to bend but not break (Bourbeau 2018, 27). Here, agency is reconceived not as the capacity to control the (knowable) environment but as the capacity to internally adapt to permanent crisis (Schmidt 2015). To be resilient in neoliberal times means abandoning the old 'neurotic subject' of a risk society, i.e. one that governs itself through its anxieties (Lentzos and Rose 2009, 247), in favor of a new model that embraces risk-filled environments as an opportunity to excel (O'Malley 2013, 191).

At the macro-level, resilience is also understood to be a byproduct of biopolitical governance (Collier and Lakoff 2015), where the business of cultivating a productive population, understood by Foucault as a living mass of biological beings (Foucault 1997, 253), means understanding how the latter is embedded in interlinked systems that support life. Biopolitics, in this Foucauldian sense, is "characterized by a power whose function was perhaps no longer to kill, but to invest life through and through (Foucault 1978, 139)." In contradistinction to sovereign power's right to 'take life' or 'let live', biopolitics invests in making others live. International Relations has not sufficiently attended to this procreative aspect of biopolitics, and discussions curiously omit a vital stage in human existence. While there is talk of the 'biohuman' (Reid 2016, 283), the 'informationalized life' of molecular and digital revolutions (Dillon and Lobo-Guerrero 2009), and how biopolitics reconfigures human security to improve lives by converting threats to risks (De Larrinaga and Doucet 2008), there is usually no mention of where biological beings come from in the first place, let alone discussing those crucial early years where every single human must be fed, bathed and cared for in order to survive. Similarly, when ecological, life-giving systems are envisioned to be resilient to external shocks, the activities mentioned above, and the people who perform them, are not normally counted. When households and communities are expected to bounce back from calamities or civil strife, putting lives back together means relying on women's unremunerated care work (Drolet et al. 2015; Tanyag 2018; Elson 2012; Krause 2018). That the concept of resilience has migrated from psychology to governance discourse risks accepting social catastrophes as a natural feature of social life, or worse, as a technique of government (McFalls and Pandolfi 2017, 228).

The demand for migrant domestic work in all world regions is symptomatic of what has been called a crisis of social reproduction, where neoliberal policies have gutted national welfare systems and converted social safety-nets into private enterprise (Bakker and Gill 2004; Fudge 2012; Kofman 2012). Households have borne the cost of this large-scale shift as the primary societal unit that attends to the well-being of people (Esping-Andersen 2000; Roberts 2016; Stenning et al. 2010; Montgomerie and Tepe-Belfrage 2017). The ILO estimates that of the 11.5 million migrant domestic workers around the world today, 80 percent are in high-income countries. Over half are in Arab states (27.4 percent), North America (5 percent) and northern, southern and Western Europe (19.2 percent). The other big receiving regions are Southeast Asia and the Pacific (19.4%) and East Asia (9.5%), with

smaller distributions in South, Central and West Asia, Eastern Europe, North and Sub-Saharan Africa, and Latin America and the Caribbean (ILO 2016).

On top of ageing populations and economies that increasingly require dual-income households to sustain the lives of families, neoliberal policies have created a demand for reproductive labour sourced from abroad. This demand has now created a truly global labour market, where workers, most of whom are women, travel thousands of miles to prepare meals, scrub toilets and change nappies (Parreñas 2015; Yeates 2012; Lutz 2008; Williams 2012; Ehrenreich and Hochschild 2003). This market is deregulated in the formal sense, as market forces are supposed to determine their supply and demand. The highly insecure work conditions of this global workforce makes available a hyper-flexible "reserve of low-cost suppliers of reproductive services (Waldby and Cooper 2008, 60)." Given the lack of formal mechanisms to regulate these migrations, and indeed the sheer complexity of sourcing a worker from a small village in rural Indonesia to work in a household in Dubai for example, a certain type of worker is required.

The resilient subject is excluded from regimes of security, exempt from rights and privileges accorded by juridical and normative systems in a hierarchical, biopolitically partitioned global society. She is different from Agamben's *homo sacer* as she is enjoined to accept being in these zones of indistinction as an opportunity to excel. This subject is imagined to be able to reach her full potential when exposed to danger, what Reid calls the 'biohuman (Reid 2012).' Her agency involves treating herself as an enterprise (Joseph 2013) and to be permanently adaptable (Schmidt 2015). The resilient subject is enjoined to anticipate sources of threat, to be constantly on the look-out for sources of danger. To be resilient means "putting on 'mental armor' or, alternatively, learning to help the body's natural stress-management mechanisms (Duffield 2012, 486)." Where control over complex systems is now thought to be impossible, the path to managing risks is through self-control (Walker and Cooper 2011, 147).

In the following sections I discuss how the domestic worker in my regional case is enjoined to be resilient –during recruitment screening, while undergoing pre-deployment training and orientation and while they are serving their contract in the receiving country. Recruiters screen for workers who will most likely succeed in the migration trajectory. Success means completing the duration of the employment contract, which usually lasts two years. Apart from practical and linguistic skills, which can be learned, desirable traits are a seeming contradictory mix of superhuman endurance and malleability. Often, the former takes the form of caring responsibilities for children, parents and relatives left behind in the home country. The responsibility manifests most concretely in enduring what may be unendurable to fulfil the strictly economic ethos of neoliberal migration – the financialization of human capital in the form of remittances. Malleability is attributed to the capacity to adjust, using newly-acquired cognitive skills that serve to underline strength – in mind and even in

body. Unlike the characterization of the neoliberal subject as "resilient, humble, and disempowered being that lives a life of permanent ignorance and insecurity (Chandler and Reid 2016, 3)", I posit that resilience training is both productive and repressive. In other words, the same sets of practices that create the kind of subjectivity that neoliberal migration governance needs to function may also be 'empowering.' That is, they generate capacities that may be used for unintended purposes.

## **2** How to Make a 'Successful' Migrant

What I call 'resilience training' aims to make domestic worker migration risk-proof, much in the same way as the money they send back home are also resilient (Ratha and Sirkeci 2010; The World Bank Migration and Remittances Team Development Prospects Group 2015). To be resilient often takes the language of 'success'. Nobody wants a migrant to fail, and in producing a formula for success, keeps the migrant optimistic despite being told, at nearly all stages of the migration trajectory, what a dangerous, sometimes fatal venture she is about to embark on. Successful migrants are those who will complete their employment contract without trouble, i.e. that they do not turn into a 'welfare case.' This would incur costs to a number of different actors – the employer, the recruiters, and the migrant herself, if she incurred debts to be able to migrate (Holliday 2012; Eeelens and Speckmann 1990). Further, becoming a welfare case incurs administrative costs to the migration bureaucracy of the sending country, but also the receiving country. A pre-departure orientation seminar (PDOS) instructor in Manila says that the primary aim of the seminar is to make sure the worker finishes her contract, without which she would not be able to pay back her creditors – either her recruitment agency or petty financiers.

Recruiters and employment agents facilitate the migration of workers in what has been called the 'migration industry.' These non-state actors exercise important functions in regulating worker mobilities - from control of entry, recruitment, health checks, placement, labour market segmentation, financing, training and repatriation, among others (Gammeltoft-Hansen and Sorensen 2013; McCollum and Findlay 2018; Lindquist, Xiang, and Yeoh 2010; Holliday 2012; Martin 2017). The dominant model for domestic worker migration requires a recruiter at either end of the migration stream – one from the sending country and another in the receiving country. As businesses, they respond to forces of supply and demand, matching the needs of families which broadly comprise of the elderly). These are usually legitimate businesses, but are known to operate in legal grey zones – especially since domestic work is invisible to many regulatory systems worldwide (ILO 2013; Eeelens and Speckmann 1990; Spaan 1994a). This creates an environment that allows for non-payment of salaries, excessive recruitment fees, long work hours, no days off, and physical and/or psychological

abuse (Andersson 2014; Eeelens and Speckmann 1990; Spaan 1994b; Lim 2015; Kern and Müller-Böker 2015).

The migration industry also plays more complex roles, especially in regard to migrant domestic work. They reproduce racial stereotypes and gender norms necessary to commodify domestic work (Liang 2011; Loveband 2004; Hing, Lun, and Phann 2011; Elias and Louth 2016; Lyons 2005; England and Stiell 2008; Tyner 2004). Mr. Chong, a recruiter from Kuala Lumpur who sources from the Philippines, likens the relationship between employer and maid as a marriage, which is why his services include 'counselling' in cases where the relationship is not working out. His formula for success is when employers are "not too finicky" with "impossible expectations." On her part, the worker must be genuine in her dispensation of care. That is, she must convince her employers of the authenticity of her care can be a guarantee that her employers will not be too suspicious, and thus less likely to be strict: "You carry a child in your arm as a maid, if you don't have the warmth, you don't have that general liking for the child - the child will sense it. The child will reject you. But if you have those qualities, no child will reject you."

Recruiters like Mr. Chong and Pak Surono play a key role in selecting for workers' durability, trainability and marketability. This is evident from the first round of selections, where applicants are rejected for any hint of not fulfilling resilient traits. The administrator of a training centre in Manila coaches her student-trainees that the key to success is knowing oneself and others. "You have to learn to adjust. The proper way to deal with these people, to be adjusted, is to learn first about yourself." In Indonesia, adjusting oneself to the new environment and culture, as well as the characters of the house owner and family members are also listed as ideal traits of TKI in a checklist by governmentmandated examiners who assess their suitability before deployment. To adjust means managing one's emotions, to "avoid high emotional arousal" which means being "bad-tempered, sullen or gloomy." A Filipino bureaucrat says 'quality maids' do not make their employers lose their temper, that employers abuse workers "because they are not happy." In this regard what is being commodified is not only the worker's ability to produce positive emotions to be consumed by those in the household, but also to suppress negative emotions, especially homesickness. The latter are specifically addressed by both PDOS and PAP, as well as teachers in training centres. A trainer from a small centre that deploys primarily to the Gulf cautions her students - "Please don't cry in front of your employer. They will think you are homesick. Don't scare your employer by crying." To be resilient in this case means doing 'emotional labour', that is, to "induce or suppress feeling in order to sustain the outward countenance that produces the proper state of mind in others (Ehrenreich and Hochschild 2003, 7)."

The selection process weeds out those who are too prideful and may easily quit. The ultimate proof of endurance is normally tied to the worker's obligations to family left behind. This means that single women, especially young ones, are thought to be less reliable. They have no responsibilities, no mouths to feed and have no reason to stay in their job. Ms. Tuason, a big recruiter in Manila, has her screening skills put to test when she conducts 'pre-employment orientation seminars' (PEOS). The PEOS is an addition to the suite of information sessions required by the POEA. It is targeted at prospective migrant who are still at the stage of considering whether they want to migrate. The PEOS is different from the PDOS which happens after the training period and just before deployment overseas. Tuason says she does her best to dissuade her applicants:

(Translated from Tagalog): Do you know the work of the domestic helper? You will be the one to rise the earliest and the last to sleep. You will do everything – laundry, cooking, take care of children, wash the car, clean the house, iron, and so on. Can you do this job? You will be there for two years. You won't be going home. If you can't finish the contract you'll pay your employer \$2,200. Even if you jump up and down, you can't go home...so those who can't do this, don't bother to have me interview you.

Ms. Tuason says she does not like it when applicants are too proud. This generally means they are not afraid to show that they have education, which means speaking English. She rejects applicants who are *'maarte<sup>4</sup>'*, those who make requests about where they want to be deployed or what kind of employer they are assigned to. She recounts a moment where she rejected an applicant for being too *'pilosopo*,' talking back or reasoning. She says the applicant ought to "behave herself" and that "this attitude is not permitted over there." Ms. Tuason deploys workers to the Gulf.

Mr. Chong, the Kuala Lumpur agent, similarly says that "...if the person is too proud, then likely she will not last long." While interviewing a potential employer about what she would require in a maid, Mr. Chong's wife and business partner made a distinction between someone who may not be so smart, but will probably not mind being told what to do over and over, versus one who will show initiative (and therefore smarter), but will "feel sore" if "nagged." Another Manila recruiter says he can tell whether an applicant will be deployed or not from her attitude, "If they're scolded everyday they might go insane. They can't handle it...Not everyone can be a housemaid." In other words, the emotional labour required by domestic work means not only that negative emotions (such as homesickness) are managed, but also to reinforce the unequal relation between employer and employee.

Pre-departure briefings conducted by government officials in the Philippines and Indonesia discuss common themes – the importance of their employment contract, mental toughness, planning for the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Filipino for picky or choosy.

IMI Working Papers Series 2019, No. 153

future, dangers they may encounter during transit, and tips on how to cope with things as varied as possibly getting enlisted by drug traffickers to marital stresses. Sexuality becomes not only a matter of staying faithful to partners left behind, but more importantly, about not compromising the investment in one's health. "Overseas, there is a lot of AIDS." Those bound for the Middle East are told about different gender norms and what might happen when they are not followed. In a PAP, an Indonesian official tells his audience – "Avoid the male boss' face. In our culture it is good for men and women to smile at each other. In Saudi that is not good." All pre-departure briefings I observed broached the possibility of sexual assault, and what one might do to prevent it, how to defend oneself in case it does happen and what to do after the fact. The assumption is that knowing and thinking ahead decreases the likelihood of such events from happening, which puts the onus on the worker to protect herself:

(Translated from Bahasa): If your employer wants to rape you, it's better you die by trying to defend yourself rather than getting raped. When you're new to the Middle East, wear jeans under your robe because jeans are hard to take off. It's not going help if you scream. Men who do bad things are infected by their own wants and bad spirits.

The control of domestic worker sexuality relates to all kinds of 'dangers' that she supposedly poses to the social fabric of the host society (Chang and Groves 2000). Financial desperation might make her vulnerable to prostitution, even trafficking (Mahdavi and Sargent 2011). Relationships with local or other migrant men risk the possibility of pregnancy, which may become grounds for dismissal, where policy explicitly prohibits such an occurrence (Ullah 2010). Apart from miscegenation, there is of also the threat of the maid possibly seducing the male employer, breaking up families (Constable 1997). This is why there is concerted effort not only to hire older, married women but also to de-emphasize their sexual identities. This means having them cut their hair short and prohibiting them from wearing revealing clothes or make-up. Conforming to dominant gender norms, these practices seek to control female sexuality while leaving undisturbed male sexual privilege (Moukarbel 2009).

In sum, the successful migrant is one who has been pre-selected and trained to endure the working and social environment that provides little protection from hyper-exploitation, long enough to finish her contract. She has family left behind for whom to endure and send remittances. She is somehow able to produce positive emotions for consumption and repress negative feelings and pride at the same time. As such, her market value is less about performing chores as her emotional labour. While providing caring work to the family she serves, her sexuality is curtailed to ostensibly prevent social problems, including the possibility of her own pregnancy. Even as her labour here functions to invest in the life of the household and the general well-being of the host population, the domestic worker is enjoined to underwrite her own security through resilience.

## **3** Resilience Training

The death of Filipino domestic worker Flor Contemplacion in 1995 was a landmark case in Philippine migration governance, leading to legislation and regulatory reforms. She was found guilty of committing the murder of fellow Filipino Delia Maga and the latter's ward, Nicholas Wang, and was sentenced with the death penalty in host country Singapore. Her death triggered a political crisis, calling into question the legitimacy of the sitting government, and led to the resignation of the labour department secretary. Shortly after her death, the Philippines' Department of Labour and Employment (DOLE) required basic housework training (Guevarra 2006, 528). Training was supposed to solve what was thought to be causing tensions between workers and employers - lack of knowledge about how to use modern household appliances (Battistella 2004, 270). The 'Supermaids' programme, which was launched in 2006, further sought to professionalize domestic work (Guevarra 2014). An employer was not only acquiring someone who would cook and clean, but someone who could provide value-added services - such as performing first-aid treatment, effective communication, among others (Lagman 2017, 2). This would then justify the other major policy change - the minimum salary requirement of \$400 US dollars. The Technical Education and Skills Development Authority (TESDA) developed the curriculum Household Services NC II – which nominally detailed a 218-hour coursework. Core competencies include cleaning different parts of the house, washing and ironing, preparing meals and providing food and beverage service. Other competencies include 'soft skills' - such as managing relations with 'clients and customers' - who are employers and other members of the household. TESDA has since outsourced the conduct of these classes to the private sector, creating a new cottage industry providing training courses to workers who, after completing coursework, are expected to pass a final assessment in order to acquire a national certificate (NC). TESDA has since also developed a separate course for care work - Caregiving NC II, which takes 786 hours to complete. Training centres may be owned and operated by recruitment agencies, and as standalone businesses. Indonesia also has a similar rationale and institutional set-up as training centres in the Philippines. Prospective migrants are expected to complete training at a government-licensed 'balai latihan kerja' or vocational training centre. The number of hours for completion also depends on the requirements of receiving countries, with Taiwan having the longest at 600 hours. Training prior to departure is now a norm for newer domestic worker sending countries not only in Southeast Asia, but in South Asia and Africa (Busza et al. 2017; CEDEC 2012).

A representative from an Indonesian migration industry association has called training 'insurance.' Proper training is supposed to achieve a number of things, one of which is to make the worker less likely to disrupt the labour supply chain. Physical abuse is more likely due to incompetence on the part of the worker, according to an official from TESDA. If employers are not 'happy' with the worker's performance, then employers "will have a negative attitude." The worker's unwillingness to continue work, that is, failing to complete her contract, would mean the businesses which invested in IMI Working Papers Series 2019, No. 153

her migration trajectory, most notably her recruitment agency, would not be able to get a return on their investment. This is especially so when the worker pays nothing for her training and her agency bears the costs not only of her language and skills acquisition but weeks, even months of board and lodging. This model is more the norm in Indonesia than in the Philippines where workers sometimes pay for their training up front. This is so because training centres may be stand-alone businesses that only offer such services and have no direct affiliation with the recruitment agency. To be sure, what is being insured is not the worker herself, but the smooth functioning of the intricate value-chain that is created once the worker presents herself available to the demand for her labour overseas.

The training centres I visited in Manila and the suburbs of Jakarta are organized like schools, complete with an administrator, teachers and classes to attend. Classes are broadly divided into skills and language. At the end of the training period, 'students' take an exam or assessment, which certifies that they have successfully completed the requirement. While training centres do emphasize hierarchy and surveillance (Killias 2009), which means conditioning workers to the right mind-set of 'servitude (Rudnyckyj 2004; Chin 1998)', the difference with other types of learning institutions is only a matter of degree. The same norms and practices in disciplinary institutions, not only in schools but also military barracks, may be observed. The day is regimented and structured, with set times for classes, having meals and rest. In the big training centres in Indonesia, students were given t-shirt uniforms to wear. These ones also required that their students stay in dormitories within the compound, which meant that they were subjected to this training regime for the length of their stay, the longest of which is officially 600 hours or roughly three months for those bound for Taiwan. A Kuala Lumpur agent describes the difference between training centres in the Philippines and Indonesia thus:

Oh, the good thing we found out with Indonesia, unlike [the] Philippines is, you can lock the girls up, you know, which makes investment in training a better thing...So there is no running away, no changing of mind, no backing out. And this is good you know, because you can't afford to invest in training...You can do many things. That's why they are able to finance them one hundred percent. But in the Philippines, you can't even keep them for twenty-four hours. Can you imagine? They will file a complaint with the POEA that you refused to let them out.

All the Indonesian training centres I visited had a visitation policy for family members. But since many of the trainees hailed from far away provinces, it was not always easy to come visit. The centres were in compounds with high walls and guards at the gates. The biggest of them could house a maximum of 1,500 trainees at a time. The smallest, the one which deployed to the Gulf, only had a padlocked gate to keep people in (or out). The training centres I visited in the Philippines were much smaller operations with only a few dozen trainees at a time. These were administered like schools as well, although trainees were able to come and go freely. This is probably because these trainees paid their fees up front, unlike their Indonesian counterparts, who, if they changed their mind mid-way

through training, would mean a loss of invested money on the part of the recruiter, and a loss of future income.

One TKI I met in Indonesia had been in the training centre for seven months, which far exceeded the maximum three months (or 600 hours for those bound for Taiwan). For some reason she could not be matched with an employer in any of the target receiving countries. That meant of course that she had already incurred seven months' worth of debt in board and lodging. These conditions test the legal fiction of modern employment contracts today – that the worker freely enters the exchange as an independent entity. This is why migrant domestic work has been characterized as 'modern slavery' (Mantouvalou 2015), 'contract slavery' (Jureidini and Moukarbel 2004), with workers categorized as 'unfree labour' (Strauss and McGrath 2017). Periods of involuntary immobility, that is, of not being able to leave a specific space, may also be experienced.

Apart from knowing what kind of vegetables go into the preparation of a Taiwanese *popiah*, some basic Cantonese vocabulary or understanding the gender norms of Arab society, the period of training help shape the right kind of subjectivity or understanding of the self that would allow one to function in the host country, often under extreme duress. This would include what can be a contradictory mix of submission, resistance and even martyrdom (Rudnyckyj 2004; Killias 2009; Bautista 2015; Awumbila et al. 2018; Groves and Chang 1999; Ueno 2009). In the Philippine case, for example, Julius Bautista argues that the Philippines' Overseas Filipino Workers (OFWs), are encouraged to draw from the suffering Christ as a way to perform patriotism and piousness. In concrete terms this means understanding that good employees do not complain, are self-effacing and humble (Bautista 2015, 431). Being tasked with the title *bagong bayani* (new hero), means sending remittances home to save the nation (Encinas-Franco 2013). In Indonesia TKI are also constructed as *pahlawan devisa negara* or national remittance heroines (Killias 2018, 118).

It is clear that the worker's capacity to manage her internal states is an important skill to acquire all throughout the migration trajectory (Rodriguez and Schwenken 2013; Lan 2016; Deshingkar et al. 2018). Training matters in desired outcomes – for example, between worker identities in Taiwan and Japan (Lan 2016). The 'end product' for the Taiwanese market are 'deferential surrogates', reflecting the demand for daughters' filial piety to the household. Japan, on the other hand, requires training for 'professional others'. The administrator of a training centre in Manila tells her students that there is dignity in care work:

(Translated from Tagalog) I don't want to hear the word *lang* (only)...labour is honour. When you are interviewed don't say you're only a maid in Taiwan. No. Remove the word only. That's demeaning. You can be a caretaker with dignity. Why? That's one reason you are here. You will be trained to become an efficient and dignified caretaker. 'Ma'am they look down on us.' That's why we will raise your status.

Another emphasizes the importance of being valued:

There has to be a measure of respect for your work. You can only be respected if you know what your work is. Your competence comes there, your training. They have to be able to identify you with something. They have to get to know you, your background. Why are you valuable in their lives?

In Kuala Lumpur, Mr. Chong's training centre has a module on professionalism which works on student-trainees' self-esteem. One is less likely to be abused, he says, if one has good self-esteem. There is then a deep ambivalence between what pre-departure briefings caution workers to do and the kind of ideal domestic worker demanded by markets. On the one hand, they are enjoined to mentally prepare themselves to respond to the challenges ahead, and to believe themselves to be capable of making it all the way through the migration trajectory. And on the other, training requires passivity and fatalism, inculcating attitudes that "effectively reduced their autonomy and capacity to resist (Killias 2009, 166)." This ambivalence may be the intended effect anyway: a capable worker equipped with mental tools to internally adapt to external stresses but unable to address he latter's causes.

Training ends in being able to successfully pass the examination or assessment, and workers are given a certificate. As such, completion of training is understood to be an achievement. A 'quality' domestic worker receives the stamp of approval from relevant government bureaus of the migrant-sending country, usually after completion of training courses and before deployment. The Philippines' TESDA does so through its accreditation system of training centres, trainers and assessors. The latter usually visit training centres to evaluate the performance of student-trainees. In coordination with recruitment agencies, TESDA also develops curricula standards and assessment materials. Indonesia's *Badan Nasional Sertifikasi Profesi*<sup>5</sup> (BNSP) similarly develops training standards and examination forms. Its affiliate, the *Lembaga Sertifikasi Profesi*<sup>6</sup> (LSP), conducts the examination at training centres and issues certificates.

Apart from the standard core competencies which include knowing the specifics of cleaning different rooms in the household and preparing hot and cold meals, TESDA's Household Service NCII also includes sections on how to "participate in workplace communication", "work in a team environment", "practice career professionalism", "maintain effective relationships with clients/customers" and "manage own performance". Notably, this course excludes care work, unlike its equivalent in Indonesia. LSP's final examination for household workers has one hundred questions. The first fifty are about household and care work. The second section are about communication and attitude. Indicators to assess the latter include adjusting oneself to the environment, understanding the character of people in the household, "showing self-discovery, talents

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> National Agency for Professional Certification

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Professional Certification Institution

and potential", "avoiding high emotional arousal (be bad-tempered, sullen, gloomy)" and "doing the household chores with pleasure", among others.

From these instruments of evaluation - which were developed by state institutions, migration industry players and employers' demands - the ideal worker possesses not only the knowledge of what kind of cleaning chemical is appropriate to remove stains from different types of textiles and flooring, but most importantly, the appropriate soft skills. While the examination materials can be highly technical, the conduct of training itself, and the examination process, emphasize attitudinal aspects required of a workforce whose core function is to produce positive emotions in the household. 'Discipline' in this case is not the kind found on the factory floor, where the body's productive forces is expected to meld into the 'body-tool' or the 'body-machine' (Foucault 1977, 153). While outright coercion can be a component of the domestic worker's environment, for example by confiscating her passport or literally locking her indoors, her ability to regulate her own emotions is crucial in order to continue providing a 'multi-task wonder woman' to be consumed by care recipients and other members of household. The demand for a 'quality maid' has opened the possibility for upskilling, and hence, the diversification of the industry to include training centres. Migrant domestic work is increasingly being organised on an industrial scale, to cater to an ever-increasing demand from globalising markets.

# 4 Conclusion

Interestingly, resilience is also a new 'technique of the self' in military training, an ideal trait of the 21<sup>st</sup> century soldier (O'Malley 2010). In Foucauldian terms the 'training' of a soldier is no longer simply limited to his physical abilities (discipline), where bodies are drilled and practised to function as a unit (Foucault 1977, 168), but to inculcate resilience as a 'set of cognitive skills' that anyone could master in principle. In high-risk and complex environments, soldiers are trained to face uncertainty by developing mental tools. The US Army Master Resilience Trainer course developed in the University of Pennsylvania highlights the following core competencies: self-awareness, self-regulation, optimism, mental agility, character strengths and connection (Reivich, Seligman, and McBride 2011, 27). Like the modern soldier, migrant domestic workers are enjoined to equip themselves with mental toughness to survive repeat deployments not just to one but multiple destination countries (Wickramasekara 2011; Parreñas 2010; Piper 2010).

A PAP instructor, who is also a low-level bureaucrat, tells the TKI not to rely too much on others. "Protection is not by the recruitment agency, the embassy, BNP2TKI. The protection should come from you. The only people who can help you are yourself and god. You have to learn to protect yourself. Everything must start from ourselves. Protection starts from ourselves." Resilience consist in more than anticipating coming to possible harm, but internally marshalling resources to keep going. This may mean tapping into one's spirituality, but also entails knowing oneself, as in Penn's soldier training "relying on one's strengths to overcome challenges and meet goals (Reivich, Seligman, and McBride 2011, 27)." In resilience training, the worker becomes the necessary component of neoliberalism as a governmental rationality, one that is enjoined to transform risk into opportunity and who, while doing so, provides security to the household she serves.

Domestic worker migration also demonstrates how neoliberal market governance is perfectly aligned with the biopolitical partitioning of populations between those made to live and those allowed to die (Mavelli 2017). On the one hand, the work of cleaning, cooking and caring for dependents literally makes the host country's population 'live'. The latter fall under social reproduction (Bezanson and Luxton 2006), activities that nurture a new labour force, sustains the current one and cares for those who are no longer productive (the elderly). On the other hand, domestic workers literally bear the cost of the host population's productivity (Katz 2003), both by the gendered devaluation of this type of work, and through 'biopolitical racism' (Mavelli 2017, 491). The latter manifests in egregious acts of dehumanization, which, in turn, justify not only the violation of labour laws (where they exist) and employment norms, but also physical and psychological harm. In this scenario, the worker is enjoined to secure herself through resilience training. Resilience training consists of developing a set of cognitive skills to withstand employment conditions in zones of risk and danger, where the worker's security and well-being cannot be guaranteed. These skills are taught and acquired in all stages of migration, from recruitment, pre-deployment training and during their residency in the host country.

This paper demonstrated how the global labor market in domestic work exemplifies neoliberal governance through the production of resilient subjects. This process necessitates linking self-governing individuals employed in private households to large macro-social forces and actors. This case instantiates a specific kind of neoliberal governance, one without security guarantees of sovereign states but is nonetheless durable. The market model within which these processes take place has diffused from Southeast Asia to other world regions, the main features being the off-shoring of governance to recruitment agencies and other market intermediaries in both sending and receiving country, pre-departure orientations and training prior to deployment. As mentioned above, there is already evidence that the same kind of resilient subject is the desired 'end-product' in other labor markets, further study could make inter-country or regional comparisons of these processes

## **5** References

- Agamben, Giorgio. 1998. *Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Andersson, Ruben. 2014. Illegality, Inc: Clandestine Migration and the Business of Bordering Europe. Oakland, CA: University of California Press.
- Aradau, Claudia, and Rens Van Munster. 2007. "Governing Terrorism Through Risk: Taking Precautions, (Un)Knowing the Future." *European Journal of International Relations* 13 (1): 89– 115. https://doi.org/10.1177/1354066107074290.
- Awumbila, Mariama, Priya Deshingkar, Leander Kandilige, Joseph Kofi Teye, and Mary Setrana. 2018. "Please, Thank You and Sorry – Brokering Migration and Constructing Identities for Domestic Work in Ghana." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 0 (0): 1–17. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2018.1528097.
- Bakker, Isabella, and Stephen Gill. 2004. Power, Production and Social Reproduction. Human In/Security in the Global Political Economy. https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230522404.
- Battistella, Graziano. 2004. "Philippine Overseas Labour: From Export to Management." Asean Economic Bulletin 12 (2): 257–73. https://doi.org/10.1355/ae12-2j.
- Bautista, Julius. 2015. "Export-Quality Martyrs: Roman Catholicism and Transnational Labor in the Philippines." *Cultural Anthropology* 30 (3): 424–47. https://doi.org/10.14506/ca30.3.04.
- Bezanson, Kate, and Meg Luxton. 2006. Social Reproduction: Feminist Political Economy Challenges Neo-Liberalism. Montreal & Kingston, London, Ithaca: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Bourbeau, Philippe. 2018. "A Genealogy of Resilience." *International Political Sociology* 12 (1): 19–35. https://doi.org/10.1093/ips/olx026.
- Busza, Joanna, Sehin Teferra, Serawit Omer, and Cathy Zimmerman. 2017. "Learning from Returnee Ethiopian Migrant Domestic Workers: A Qualitative Assessment to Reduce the Risk of Human Trafficking." *Globalization and Health*. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12992-017-0293-x.
- CEDEC, Caritas Sri Lanka -. 2012. "Migration of Sri Lankan Women: Analysis of Causes & Post-Arrival Assistance." Luxembourg: Caritas. https://archive.nyu.edu/handle/2451/42296.
- Chandler, David, and Julian Reid. 2016. *The Neoliberal Subject: Resilience, Adaptation and Vulnerability*. London: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Chang, Kimberly A., and Julian Mc Allister Groves. 2000. "Neither 'saints' nor 'Prostitutes': Sexual

Discourse in the Filipina Domestic Worker Community in Hong Kong." *Women's Studies International Forum*. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-5395(99)00088-6.

- Chin, Christine. 1998. In Service and Servitude: Female Domestic Workers and the Malaysian "Modernity" Project. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Coaffee, Jon, and David Murakami Wood. 2006. "Security Is Coming Home: Rethinking Scale and Constructing Resilience in the Global Urban Response to Terrorist Risk." *International Relations*. https://doi.org/10.1177/0047117806069416.
- Collier, Stephen j., and Andrew Lakoff. 2015. Vital Systems Security: Reflexive Biopolitics and the Government of Emergency. Theory, Culture & Society. Vol. 32. https://doi.org/10.1177/0263276413510050.
- Constable, Nicole. 1997. "Sexuality and Discipline among Filipina Domestic Workers in Hong Kong." *American Ethnologist*. https://doi.org/10.1525/ae.1997.24.3.539.
- Cooper, Melinda. 2015. "Resilience and Uninsured Risk." *Resilience* 3293 (June): 1–4. https://doi.org/10.1080/21693293.2015.1022989.
- Deshingkar, Priya, C. R. Abrar, Mirza Taslima Sultana, Kazi Nurmohammad Hossainul Haque, and Md Selim Reza. 2018. "Producing Ideal Bangladeshi Migrants for Precarious Construction Work in Qatar." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 0 (0): 1–16. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2018.1528104.
- Dillon, Michael, and Luis Lobo-Guerrero. 2009. "The Biopolitical Imaginary of Species-Being." *Theory, Culture & Society* 26 (1): 1–23. https://doi.org/10.1177/0263276408099009.
- Drolet, Julie, Lena Dominelli, Margaret Alston, Robin Ersing, Golam Mathbor, and Haorui Wu. 2015. "Women Rebuilding Lives Post-Disaster: Innovative Community Practices for Building Resilience and Promoting Sustainable Development." *Gender and Development*. https://doi.org/10.1080/13552074.2015.1096040.
- Duffield, Mark. 2012. "Challenging Environments: Danger, Resilience and the Aid Industry." *Security Dialogue*. https://doi.org/10.1177/0967010612457975.
- Eeelens, Frank, and J.D. Speckmann. 1990. "Recruitment of Labor Migrants for the Middle East : The Sri Lankan Case." *International Migration Review* 24 (2): 297–322. http://www.jstor.org.ezproxyles.flo.org/stable/info/2546553?&Search=yes&searchText=migrati on&searchUri=/action/doBasicSearch?Query=migration+conditions+and+building+in+uae&am p;prq=Arab+Migration+Patterns+in+the+Gulf%2C+in+Arab+Migration+in+a+Globalizing+W.
- Ehrenreich, Barbara, and Arlie Russell Hochschild. 2003. Global Woman: Nannies, Maids, and Sex Workers in the New Economy. New York: Metropolitan Books.

https://doi.org/10.1177/026327640402100612.

- Elias, Juanita, and Jonathon Louth. 2016. "Producing Migrant Domestic Work: Exploring the Everyday Political Economy of Malaysia's 'Maid Shortage." *Globalizations* 13 (6): 830–45. https://doi.org/10.1080/14747731.2016.1155340.
- Elson, Diane. 2012. "Social Reproduction in the Global Crisis: Rapid Recovery or Long-Lasting Depletion?" In *The Global Crisis and Transformative Social Change*, edited by Peter Utting, Shahra Razavi, and Rebecca Buchholz, 63–80. Basingstoke, Hampshire & New York: Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137002501\_4.
- Encinas-Franco, Jean. 2013. "The Language of Labor Export in Political Discourse: Modern-Day Heroism and Constructions of Overseas Filipino Workers (OFWs)." *Philippine Political Science Journal*. https://doi.org/10.1080/01154451.2013.789162.
- England, Kim, and Bernadette Stiell. 2008. "They Think You Are as Stupid as Your English Is: Constructing Domestic Workers in Toronto." *Feminisms in Geography: Rethinking Space, Places, and Knowledge* 29 (1994): 195–215.
- Esping-Andersen, Gosta. 2000. "The Sustainability of Welfare States into the Twenty-First Century." *International Journal of Health Services*. https://doi.org/10.2190/H6PN-9R5J-MD9X-P10T.
- Evans, Brad, and Julian Reid. 2013. "Dangerously Exposed: The Life and Death of the Resilient Subject." *Resilience* 1 (2): 83–98. https://doi.org/10.1080/21693293.2013.770703.

Foucault, Michel. 1977. Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison. London: Penguin Books.

- ------. 1978. The History of Sexuality: Volume I An Introduction. New York: Pantheon Books.
- ———. 1997. Society Must Be Defended: Lectures at the College de France, 1975-76. New York: Picador.
- Fudge, Judy. 2012. "The Privatization of the Costs of Social Reproduction: Some Recent Charter Cases" 1.
- Gammeltoft-Hansen, Thomas, and Ninna Nyberg Sorensen. 2013. *The Migration Industry and the Commercialization of International Migration*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Groves, Julian Mcallister, and Kimberly A. Chang. 1999. "Romancing Resistance and Resisting Romance - Ethnography and the Construction of Power in the Filipina Domestic Worker Community in Hong Kong." *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography*. https://doi.org/10.1177/089124199129023433.
- Guevarra, Anna Romina. 2006. "Managing 'vulnerabilities' and 'Empowering' Migrant Filipina Workers: The Philippines' Overseas Employment Program." Social Identities 12 (5): 523–41. https://doi.org/10.1080/13504630600920118.

—. 2014. "Supermaids: The Racial Branding of Global Filipino Care Labour." In *Migration and Care Labour: Theory, Policy and Politics*, 130–50. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

- Hing, Vutha, Pide Lun, and Dalis Phann. 2011. "Irregular Migration from Cambodia Characteristics, Challenges and Regulatory Approach." *Phillipine Journal of Development*.
- Holliday, Jenna K. 2012. "Turning the Table on the Exploitative Recruitment of Migrant Workers: The Cambodian Experience." Asian Journal of Social Science 40 (4): 464–85. https://doi.org/10.1163/15685314-12341249.
- Howell, Alison. 2015. "Resilience, War, and Austerity: The Ethics of Military Human Enhancement and the Politics of Data." *Security Dialogue* 46 (1): 15–31. https://doi.org/10.1177/0967010614551040.
- ILO. 2013. "Domestic Work Policy Brief 10: Formalizing Domestic Work." http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\_protect/---protrav/--travail/documents/publication/wcms\_559854.pdf.
- ———. 2015. "ILO Global Estimates on Migrant Workers: Results and Methodology, Special Focus on Migrant Domestic Workers." Geneva: ILO Labour Office.
  - 2016. "Migrant Domestic Workers Across the World: Global and Regional Estimates."
    Geneva: ILO. http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\_protect/---protrav/--migrant/documents/briefingnote/wcms\_490162.pdf.
- Joseph, Jonathan. 2013. "Resilience as Embedded Neoliberalism: A Governmentality Approach." *Resilience* 1 (1): 38–52. https://doi.org/10.1080/21693293.2013.765741.
- Jureidini, Ray, and Nayla Moukarbel. 2004. "Female Sri Lankan Domestic Workers in Lebanon: A Case of 'Contract Slavery'?" Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830410001699478.
- Katz, Cindi. 2003. "Vagabond Capitalism and the Necessity of Social Reproduction." *Antipode* 33 (4): 709–28. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8330.00207.
- Kern, Alice, and Ulrike Müller-Böker. 2015. "The Middle Space of Migration: A Case Study on Brokerage and Recruitment Agencies in Nepal." *Geoforum* 65: 158–69. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2015.07.024.
- Killias, Olivia. 2009. "The Politics of Bondage in the Recruitment, Training and Placement of Indonesian Migrant Domestic Workers." Sociologus 59 (2): 145–72. https://doi.org/10.3790/soc.59.2.145.
  - ——. 2018. Follow the Maid: Domestic Worker Migration in and from Indonesia. Copenhagen:

Nordic Institute of Asian Studies.

- Kofman, Eleonore. 2012. "Rethinking Care through Social Reproduction: Articulating Circuits of Migration." *Social Politics*. https://doi.org/10.1093/sp/jxr030.
- Krause, Jana. 2018. *Resilient Communities: Non-Violence and Civilian Agency in Communal War.* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Lagman, Eileen. 2017. "Moving Labor: Transnational Migrant Workers and Affective Literacies of Care." *Literacy in Composition Studies* 3 (3): 1–24. https://doi.org/10.21623/1.3.3.2.
- Lan, Pei-Chia. 2016. "Deferential Surrogates and Professional Others: Recruitment and Training of Migrant Care Workers in Taiwan and Japan." *Positions* 24 (1): 253–79.
- Larrinaga, Miguel De, and Marc G. Doucet. 2008. "Sovereign Power and the Biopolitics of Human Security." *Security Dialogue* 39 (5): 517–37. https://doi.org/10.1177/0967010608096148.
- Lentzos, Filippa, and Nikolas Rose. 2009. "Governing Insecurity: Contingency Planning, Protection, Resilience." *Economy and Society*. https://doi.org/10.1080/03085140902786611.
- Liang, Li Fang. 2011. "The Making of an 'ideal' Live-in Migrant Care Worker: Recruiting, Training, Matching and Disciplining." *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2011.554571.
- Lim, Anna. 2015. "Networked Mobility in the 'Migration Industry': Transnational Migration of Filipino Caregivers to Israel." Asian Women 31 (2): 85–118. https://doi.org/10.14431/aw.2015.06.31.2.85.
- Lindquist, Johan, Biao Xiang, and Brenda S A Yeoh. 2010. "Johan Lindquist, Biao Xiang and Brenda S.A. Yeoh," 7–19.
- Loveband, Anne. 2004. "Positioning the Product: Indonesian Migrant Women Workers in Taiwan." Journal of Contemporary Asia 34 (3): 336–48.
- Lutz, Helma. 2008. *Migration and Domestic Work: A European Perspective on a Global Theme*. Hampshire, UK & Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing.
- Lyons, Lenore T. 2005. "Embodying Transnationalism: The Making of the Indonesian Maid." In Corporeal Inscriptions: Representations of the Body in Cultural and Literary Texts and Practices, 171–85. Torun, Poland: Nicolas Copernicus University Press.
- Mahdavi, Pardis, and Christine Sargent. 2011. "Questioning the Discursive Construction of Trafficking and Forced Labor in the United Arab Emirates." *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies*. https://doi.org/10.2979/jmiddeastwomstud.7.3.6.

Mantouvalou, Virginia. 2015. "'Am I Free Now?' Overseas Domestic Workers in Slavery." Journal

of Law and Society. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-6478.2015.00714.x.

- Martin, Philip. 2017. *Merchants of Labor: Recruiters and International Labor Migration*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Mavelli, Luca. 2017. "Governing the Resilience of Neoliberalism through Biopolitics." *European Journal of International Relations* 23 (3): 489–512. https://doi.org/10.1177/1354066116676321.
- McCollum, David, and Allan Findlay. 2018. "Oiling the Wheels? Flexible Labour Markets and the Migration Industry." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 44 (4): 558–74. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2017.1315505.
- McFalls, Laurence, and Mariella Pandolfi. 2017. "Too-Late Liberalism: From Promised Prosperity to Permanent Austerity." In *Foucault and the Modern International: Silences and Legacies for the Study of Politics*, 219–35. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Montgomerie, Johnna, and Daniela Tepe-Belfrage. 2017. "Caring for Debts: How the Household Economy Exposes the Limits of Financialisation." *Critical Sociology*. https://doi.org/10.1177/0896920516664962.
- Moukarbel, Nayla. 2009. "Not Allowed to Love? Sri Lankan Maids in Lebanon." *Mobilities*. https://doi.org/10.1080/17450100903195409.
- O'Malley, Pat. 2010. "Resilient Subjects: Uncertainty, Warfare and Liberalism." *Economy and Society* 39 (4): 488–509. https://doi.org/10.1080/03085147.2010.510681.
- ——. 2013. "Uncertain Governance and Resilient Subjects in the Risk Society." *Oñati Socio-Legal Series*.
- Parreñas, Rhacel Salazar. 2010. "Homeward Bound: The Circular Migration of Entertainers between Japan and the Philippines." *Global Networks*. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-0374.2010.00288.x.
- ———. 2015. *Servants of Globalization: Migration and Domestic Work*. 2nd ed. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Piper, Nicola. 2010. "All Quiet on the Eastern Front?-Temporary Contract Migration in Asia Revisited from a Development Perspective." *Policy and Society* 29 (4): 399–411. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polsoc.2010.09.007.
- Prusinski, Ellen. 2017. "Becoming Siap Mental: Education for Transnational Labour Migration." *Ethnography and Education* 12 (3): 329–46. https://doi.org/10.1080/17457823.2016.1253025.
- Ratha, D, and I Sirkeci. 2010. "Remittances and the Global Financial Crisis." *World Bank Migration Letters*.
- Reid, Julian. 2012. "The Neoliberal Subject: Reslience and the Art of Living Dangerously." REVISTA

PLÉYADE.

- —. 2016. "The (Human) Subject of Security: Beyond the Biopolitics of Resilience." In *The Ashgate Research Companion to Modern Theory, Modern Power, World Politics*, 1–28.
- Reivich, Karen J., Martin E P Seligman, and Sharon McBride. 2011. "Master Resilience Training in the U.S. Army." *American Psychologist* 66 (1): 25–34. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0021897.
- Roberts, Adrienne. 2016. "Household Debt and the Financialization of Social Reproduction: Theorizing the UK Housing and Hunger Crises." *Research in Political Economy*. https://doi.org/10.1108/S0161-723020160000031009.
- Rodriguez, Robyn M., and Helen Schwenken. 2013. "Becoming a Migrant at Home: Subjectivation Processes in Migrant-Sending Countries Prior to Departure." *Population, Space and Place*. https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.1779.
- Rosenau, James N. 1995. "Governance in the Twenty-First Century." *Global Governance*. https://doi.org/10.1525/sp.2007.54.1.23.
- Rudnyckyj, D. 2004. "Technologies of Servitude: Governmentality and Indonesian Transnational Labour Migration." *Anthropological Quarterly* 77 (3): 407–34.
- Schmidt, Jessica. 2015. "Intuitively Neoliberal? Towards a Critical Understanding of Resilience Governance." *European Journal of International Relations* 21 (2): 402–26. https://doi.org/10.1177/1354066114537533.
- Spaan, Ernst. 1994a. "Taikongs and Calos: The Role of Middlemen and Brokers in Javanese International Migration." *International Migration Review* 28 (1): 93–113. https://doi.org/10.2307/2547027.
- ———. 1994b. "Taikongs and Calos: The Role of Middlemen and Brokers in Javanese International Migration." *International Migration Review* 28 (1): 93–113.
- Stenning, Alison, Adrian Smith, Alena Rochovská, and Dariusz Światek. 2010. Domesticating Neoliberalism: Spaces of Economic Practice and Social Reproduction in Post Socialist Cities. Domesticating Neoliberalism: Spaces of Economic Practice and Social Reproduction in Post Socialist Cities. https://doi.org/10.1002/9781444325409.
- Strauss, Kendra, and Siobhán McGrath. 2017. "Temporary Migration, Precarious Employment and Unfree Labour Relations: Exploring the 'Continuum of Exploitation' in Canada's Temporary Foreign Worker Program." *Geoforum*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2016.01.008.
- Tanyag, Maria. 2018. "Resilience, Female Altruism, and Bodily Autonomy: Disaster-Induced Displacement in Post-Haiyan Philippines." Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society. https://doi.org/10.1086/695318.

- The World Bank Migration and Remittances Team Development Prospects Group. 2015. "Migration and Remittances: Recent Developments and Outlook Special Topic: Financing for Development." *Migration and Development Brief*.
- Torriente, Anna. 2017. "Implementation of International Labour Standards for Domestic Workers." 9. ILO What Works Research Brief. Geneva. http://www.ilo.org/global/research/publications/whatworks/WCMS\_572156/lang--en/index.htm.
- Tyner, James A. 2004. Made in the Philippines. Gendered Discourses and the Making of Migrats.
- Ueno, Kayoko. 2009. "Strategies of Resistance among Filipina and Indonesian Domestic Workers in Singapore." *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal*. https://doi.org/10.1177/011719680901800403.
- Ullah, A. K.M.Ahsan. 2010. "Premarital Pregnancies among Migrant Workers: The Case of Domestic Helpers in Hong Kong." Asian Journal of Women's Studies. https://doi.org/10.1080/12259276.2010.11666083.
- Waldby, Catherine, and Melinda Cooper. 2008. "The Biopolitics of Reproduction Post-Fordist Biotechnology and Women?S Clinical Labour." *Australian Feminist Studies* 23 (55): 57–73. https://doi.org/10.1080/08164640701816223.
- Walker, Jeremy, and Melinda Cooper. 2011. "Genealogies of Resilience: From Systems Ecology to the Political Economy of Crisis Adaptation." *Security Dialogue* 42 (2): 143–60. https://doi.org/10.1177/0967010611399616.
- Wickramasekara, Piyasiri. 2011. "Circular Migration: A Triple Win or a Dead End." SSRN. https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.1834762.
- Williams, Fiona. 2012. "Converging Variations in Migrant Care Work in Europe." Journal of European Social Policy 22 (4): 363–76. https://doi.org/10.1177/0958928712449771.
- Yeates, Nicola. 2012. "Global Care Chains: A State-of-the-Art Review and Future Directions in Care Transnationalization Research." *Global Networks*. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-0374.2012.00344.x.