



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

[Review of: M. Schreiner (1983) *Gesammelte schriften: islamitische und jüdisch-islamitische studien*]

Schippers, A.

Publication date

1990

Document Version

Final published version

Published in

Bibliotheca Orientalis

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Schippers, A. (1990). [Review of: M. Schreiner (1983) *Gesammelte schriften: islamitische und jüdisch-islamitische studien*]. *Bibliotheca Orientalis*, 47, 836-838.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

Martin SCHREINER, *Gesammelte Schriften. Islamische und jüdisch-islamische Studien*, herausg. und eingel. von Moshe Perlmann, Hildesheim, Zürich, New York, Georg Olms, 1983 (22 cm., xxii + 674 pp.) = *Collectanea* XI. ISBN 3-487-07383-8. DM 178,-.

The collection of the most important writings of Martin Schreiner (1863-1926) has been undertaken by Moshe Perlmann (b. 1905), a former professor of Arabic at the University of California, Los Angeles.

Martin [Mordechai Zvi] Schreiner was born into a poor family in Nagyvarad, Hungary. His father, a teacher of Hebrew, died when Martin Schreiner was still young. During 1882-87 he studied at the Rabbinical Seminary and the University of Budapest, where he came under the influence of Ignaz Goldziher. Schreiner served as a rabbi in Csurgo between 1887-92 and during 1892-4 as an instructor of the Jewish Teacher's Training Institute in Budapest. From 1894-1902 he was professor at the *Lehranstalt fuer die Wissenschaft des Judentums* in Berlin. Becoming mentally ill in 1902, he entered a sanatorium. He was to spend the rest of his life there.

His last publication (*Die jüngsten Urteile über das Judentum kritisch untersucht*, Berlin 1902) was directed against the Jew baiting of Paul de Lagarde (who was as a scholar of Semitic languages editor of Ḥarīzī's *Tahkemoni*; and as a German anti-Semitic nationalist inventor of the Madagascar plan), Ed. V. Hartmann, Ed. Meyer and Houston Chamberlain. Schreiner countered 'the conscious and unconscious endeavour [of the Christologian historiography] to glorify the Indo-Germanian race' which can be traced in the works of the above mentioned. It is part of the debate entailed by Adolf von Harnack's lectures on *Das Wesen des Christentums*, which was reviewed earlier by Leo Baeck (1901; *MGWJ* 45, NF9) and later on countered by Baeck's book *das Wesen des Judentums* (1905, 1921).

The *Gesammelte Schriften* contain articles, which, although written long ago, have still not lost their value. Of particular interest are his comments about Moses ibn Ezra's *Kitāb al-Muḥādarah wa-l-Mudhākarah*, and religious polemics. Moshe Perlmann added at the end of the *Gesammelte Schriften* a list of publications by Schreiner (taken from an earlier published bibliography by J.H. Schmelczler) and an appendix in which misprints, mistakes etc. are corrected, partly based on the author's own notes; numerous passages from manuscripts are identified with those occurring in printed editions which have appeared since the original publication of his articles; and bibliographical information is supplied based on articles in the latest *Encyclopedia of Islam* and *Encyclopedia Judaica*.

In his introduction Moshe Perlmann tries to paint a picture of the life and intellectual development of Martin Schreiner. Among his teachers were Wilhelm Bacher (1850-1913), Aggada and Medieval exegesis specialist; David Kaufmann (1852-1899), scholar in Medieval Arab and Jewish philosophy; and Ignaz Goldziher (1850-1921), a famous scholar of Islamic studies, who was only appointed professor in 1904.

Schreiner was interested in the links between Arab and Jewish studies, especially in the field of medieval Arab and Jewish philosophy and theology. Since much of his material was still in unedited manuscripts, he had to copy lengthy excerpts which he later used for various publications. At the Jewish Teacher's Training Institute (1891-93) he prepared a text book. In Berlin where he settled in 1894, he met several people of the orthodox (Hildesheimer) seminar, and was also in touch with the Nestor of Jewish scholarship, Moritz Steinschneider (1816-1907). At the "Lehranstalt für die Wissenschaft des Judentums" in Berlin Schreiner had among his pupils Leo Baeck (1873-1956), later to be the leading rabbi in Germany, who reviewed Schreiner's *Der Kalām in der jüdische Literatur* (1895; rev. *Jüdische Chronik* 2, 1895/96, pp. 90-91).

Schreiner's Islamic studies continue Goldziher's research. They distinguished the trends and fashions of Islamic thought. Schreiner also traces the impact of these thoughts upon Jewish thinkers.

Many of Schreiner's writings deal with apologetics and religious polemics or descriptions of the Jewish settlements in the Arabic and Islamic world, including passages from al-Ya'qūbī's *Historiae*, Ibn Ḥazm's *Milal wa-l-Niḥal* [based on excerpts from the Leiden Ms. Warner 480 made by Goldziher], al-Birūnī's *Chronology* and others. One of the longer articles in this field is his ZDMG contribution entitled 'Zur Geschichte der Polemik zwischen Juden und Mohammedanern' (pp. 75-159).

There are also discussions about Jewish chronicles compared with possible Arabic sources such as Josef b. Isak Sambari's *Chronicle* on synagogues and Jewish life in Egypt in comparison with al-Maqrīzī's *History* on the same subject. Another article entitled 'contributions à l'histoire des juifs en Egypte' deals with a collection of *fatwā's* by Aḥmad ibn 'Abd al-Haqq [Ms. Landberg no. 928, Royal Library Berlin] and the partial edition of its Arabic text. The contents of this work are not very tolerant towards the Jews, which made Schreiner exclaim: 'On peut voir, par ce qui précède, que l'intolérance théologique et la haine des races ont toujours tenu le même langage. On croyait politique de contraindre la minorité par une douce oppression:

les époques ne diffèrent que par le dosage de l'oppression'. (p. 208 [213]).

Some articles are devoted to the study of the Hebrew language based on medieval Arabic and Judeo-Arabic sources, such as the article entitled 'Zur Geschichte der Aussprache des Hebräischen' (pp. 25-71).

Other articles are devoted to Islamic dogmatics and theologic movements in Islam, such as his article on 'Ash'arīthum' (pp. 160-198) and one on 'Geschichte der theologische Bewegungen im Islam' (pp. 366-502) with lengthy extracts taken from Arabic texts edited by his hand. Another subject was the influence of Islamic theologic thinking upon Judaism, which appeared as 'Der *Kalām* in der jüdischen Literatur' (pp. 280-346), and which consists of an impressive survey of medieval Jewish thinkers. Recent publications by Samuelson (1986)¹ and Smidt van Gelder (1986)² show that in the field of medieval religious philosophy such as the writings of the twelfth century author Ibn Da'ud (cf. his *Al-'Aqīdah al-raḥī'ah* or *Ha-Emunah ha-ramah*) Schreiner's writings have not lost their actuality. His article on Moses ibn Ezra's *Muḥādarah* is one of the first to realise the importance of this unique Judeo-Arabic Book of Poetics. It contains the first analysis of the book followed by many other scholarly achievements by Halper, Braun, Scheindlin, Halkin, Allony, Pagis, Dana, Montserrat Mas and others³.

Schreiner was involved in contemporary polemics with intolerant Christians and other enemies of Judaism. At the same time he studied the medieval polemics between Islam and Judaism. This brought him to the conclusion that the sufferings of the Jewish minorities in his time were not really so very different from those in the past.

Amsterdam/Leiden, 9/10/89

ARIE SCHIPPERS

OSMANEN-TURKIJE

~~Hedda REINDL, *Männer um Bayezid. Eine prosopographische Studie über die Epoche Sultan Bayezids II. (1481-1512). Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1983 (21 cm., VIII + 415 pp.) — Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, 75. ISBN 3 922968 22 8. Price: DM 98,-.*~~

~~This book is the published version of a doctoral dissertation presented at München University. The author is a pupil of the late Hans Joachim Kissling whose special~~

¹) Abraham Ibn Da'ud, *The Exalted Faith*, translation with commentary by Norbert M. Samuelson; translation edited by Gershom Weiss, London and Toronto Associated University Presses 1986.

²) T.A.M. Smidt van Gelder-Fontaine, *Een vergeten denker: Abraham ibn Daud, een onderzoek naar de bronnen en de structuur van "Ha-Emunah ha-Ramah"*, Amsterdam (dissertation of the University of Amsterdam) 1986, to reappear in 1990: T.A.M. Fontaine, *In Defence of Judaism: Abraham Ibn Daud, Sources and Structure of ha-Emunah ha-Ramah*, Assen/Maastricht (Van Gorcum) 1990.

³) E.g. Raymond P. Scheindlin, 'Rabbi Moshe Ibn Ezra on the Legitimacy of Poetry', in: *Medievalia et Humanistica*, N.S., 7 (1976), pp. 101-15; recent text editions and translations of the Arabic into Hebrew resp. Spanish of Moses ibn Ezra's *Kitāb al-Muḥādarah wa-l-Mudhākarah* are: by A.S. Halkin, *Sefer ha-'Iyyunim we-ha-Diyyunim*, Jerusalem 1975/5735, and by Montserrat Abumalhan Mas, Madrid (Consejo Superior) 1986 [I, II].

interests concerned this period. It is a sound piece of biographical and historical research which offers an insight into the lives and careers of 21 top-ranking Ottoman personalities. These include an Ottoman prince, a descendant of the House of Paleologus of Byzantine emperors, a ducal son from Herzegovina and sons-in-law of the Sultan. All were governors-general or provincial governors next to have held other high office in the government and the army and navy of the Ottoman Empire.

The exact criteria of selection are not stated. The author writes (pp. I-II) that she limited herself in the course of her research to the top-level of Ottoman statesmen who played an important role in the central government. Indeed not all that grand-viziers of the period are included. I surmise therefore that the choice Mrs Reindl made has been one of a practical nature. This is hardly a defect since now we have at the hand a most welcome addition to the small collection of biographical reference works available to the non-orientalist historians of the Ottoman Empire.

This volume, rich in historical data (also included in the many footnotes), can thus play the role of a bridge between the still more or less separated fields of orientalist and western historians of the Ottoman Empire and the Near East as a whole.

An historical sketch of the period is given (pp. 34-78), Ottoman institutions are discussed (pp. 25-33) and a most valuable discussion of the eight relevant Ottoman chronicles used for this compilation precedes the main body of the text. Mrs. Reindl demonstrates upon good argument that the *olim* Köprülü ms, ascribed by some to Rūhî, is in fact an Oruç text (pp. 12-15) (now in the collection of the *Yapı ve Kredi Bankası Halk Kütüphanesi* at Istanbul-Binbirdirek).

Lists of grand-viziers and beylerbeys of Rumelia and Anatolia conclude the work. No listings are given of other high officers of state nor did the author in any way wish to give us a chance to indicate the various interrelationships and family links of the persons dealt with (cf. p. II). This task then is left for the users of the book!

One would wish to have such a biographical lexicon, in Ottoman style but compiled according to modern critical philological and historical method like this one, on all the early Ottoman reigns. This one should be available in all scholarly libraries.

Leiden University, September 1989

ALEXANDER H. DE GROOT

* *

Hans Joachim KISSLING, *Dissertationes Orientales et Balcanicae Collectae*. I. *Das Derwischtum*. München, Dr. Dr. Rudolf Trofenik, 1986 (25 cm., VIII+458 pp., 1 dépliant, frontispiece) = *Beiträge zur Kenntnis Südosteuropas und des Nahen Orients*, 38, 1. ISBN 3 87828 164 1.

Le turcologue allemand, Hans Joachim Kissling, nous a quitté en 1985. Homme, il était passionné par ce qu'il appelait en allemand les «Männerbünde», c'est-à-dire les associations ou confréries; turcologue, il se dirigea tout naturellement vers les ordres mystiques musulmans, et y consacra une grande partie de ses recherches. Vingt cinq

articles qui constituent le fruit de ce travail se trouvent rassemblés dans le présent volume, paru en 1986 à Munich dans la célèbre collection «Beiträge zur Kenntnis Südosteuropas und des Nahen Orients» fondée par l'éditeur bien connu, Rudolf Trofenik.

Les textes de H.J.K. sont, ou plus exactement semblent être, présentés par ordre chronologique, le premier ayant été publié en 1945/49 et le dernier en 1982. Mais on note deux exceptions à ce classement qui restent inexplicables (p. 307-310: «Betrachtungen über Männerbünde» datant de 1969, et p. 398-421: «Sultane, Mollas und Derwische im alten Osmanischen Reiche» paru en 1963). Afin de donner une idée de la production de H.J.K., on aurait pu également regrouper ses articles selon trois types: des études de légendes; des contributions à l'histoire de certains ordres de derviches; et enfin, des textes plus généraux et plus théoriques sur le phénomène confrérique. Il faut ajouter que l'ensemble des recherches de H.J.K. ont porté essentiellement sur ce que lui même appelait le «frühosmanische Reiche», c'est-à-dire sur les débuts de l'Empire ottoman. Il ne dépassa en effet dans ces travaux que très rarement le 17^{ème} siècle et resta dans le cadre de l'Empire ottoman en se concentrant parfois sur le Sud-Est européen.

Parmi les 'études de légendes', le lecteur trouvera dans ce volume trois textes dans lesquels H.J.K. rapprocha certains motifs légendaires trouvés notamment chez les Bektachis et chez les Mevlevis avec des légendes grecques, chrétiennes, etc. (cf. p. 1-21: «Eine bektâšitische Version der Legende der zwei Erzsündern» [une version bektâchie de la légende des deux pêcheurs], paru en 1945/49; p. 386-392: «Eine Mevlevî-Version der Legende vom verlängerten Holz» [Une version mevlevî de la légende du bois prolongé], paru en 1973; p. 393-397: «Eine Mevlevî-Version des Motivs vom Greis von Kreta» [Une version mevlevî du motif du vieillard de Crète], paru en 1974).

Pour la seconde catégorie de ses travaux touchant aux 'débuts de l'histoire de certains ordres de derviches', H.J.K. s'appuya essentiellement sur des *menâqibnâme*, sortes d'ouvrages hagiographiques, des fondateurs de ces ordres ou de certains de leurs successeurs. Il utilisa également des dictionnaires biographiques, comme ceux de Tašköprüzâde, de Nev'îzâde 'Atâ'î ou de Bursalı Mehmed Tâhir. H.J.K. toucha à l'histoire de quatre ordres de derviches: la Halvetiyye, l'une des confréries les plus répandues dans l'Empire ottoman et qui joua un rôle politique de premier plan à l'époque du sultan Bayezid II (1481-1512); la Shabaniyye, branche de la Halvetiyye; la Bayramiyye, issue aussi de la Halvetiyye mais ayant aussi une origine malamatie; et la Zeyniyye fondée par le Khorasanien, Zeyn ed-Dîn Havâfi (1356-1435). H.J.K. s'intéressa aussi ponctuellement à l'histoire des ordres de derviches dans le Sud-Est européen.

Sur la Halvetiyye, on trouvera dans ce volume, p. 123-179, le très précieux article intitulé «Aus der Geschichte des Chalvetiyye-Ordens» [De l'histoire de l'ordre des Halvetis] paru en 1953. Il s'agit bien entendu surtout de l'histoire de cet ordre en Anatolie et en Roumélie (la branche égyptienne de l'ordre n'est pas étudiée en détail) jusqu'à la fin du 16^{ème} siècle, car la principale source de l'auteur est le livre de cheikh Yûsuf Sinân efendi (mort en 1581): *Menâqib-i šerif ve tariqatnâme-i pîrân ve mešâyikh-i tariqat-i 'aliye-i Khalvetiyye*, publié en 1290/1873 à Istanbul.

En ce qui concerne la Shabaniyye, H.J.K. a étudié l'histoire du fondateur Shaban Veli et des débuts de l'ordre