THE CHARACTERS AND OBSTACLES OF ISLAMIC MODERATION PRACTICE

Ahmad Bustomi
Insitut Agama Islam Negeri Metro,
ahmadbustomi@metrouniv.ac.id
Ahmad Bahaudin
Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Fatah Palembang,
ahmadbahauddinam_uin@radenfatah.ac.id

Abstract: This article can give explanation about Islamic moderation values as good way to make Indonesia which has the biggest Islam Follower in the world becomes trend setter of the world. This article come due to the danger of radicalism which stronger in 212 movement. For more specific it will be more docuse onto character and the obstacle in practice. This research is library research and Data collected method uses deskriptiv-interpretation. Data consist of primer data and secondary data. The result of this research show first, Character of Islamic Moderation consist of six character: Base on divinity (Rububiyah), Base on prophetic guidance, Compatible with human fitrah, Without conflict, Consistent, Universal and comprehensive. Second, Obstacles of moderation practice (Islam Washatiyyah) consist of Foolishness, Fanaticism of faction (Ta'asub) snd Exaggeration.
Keyword: Moderation Practice, moderate character, religious moderation obstacle.

Abstrak: Artikel ni memberikan penjelasan tentang nilai-nilai moderasi Islam sebagai jalan terbaik untuk membuat Indonesia yang memiliki pemeluk agama Islam terbesar di dunia menjadi pusat perhatian dunia. Tulisan ini hadir dikarenakan bahaya radikalisme yang semakin menguat pasca Gerakan demonstrasi 212. Lebih spesifik lagi akan menjadi lebih difokuskan terhadap karakteristik moderasi islam dan hambatan-hambatan moderasi Islam dalam praksisnya. Penelitian ini adalah penelitian kepustakaan dan metode pengumpulan datanya adalah interpretasi deskriptif. Data terdiri dari data primer dan data sekunder. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa pertama, Karakter moderasi islam terdiri dari enam karakter, yaitu Berasaskan Ketuhanan (Rububiyah), Berlandaskan petunjuk kenabian, kompatibel dengan fitrah manusia, terhindar dari pertentangan, konsisten, bermuatan universal dan komprehensip. Kedua, hambatan dari praktik moderasi (Islam Washatiyyah) adalahKebodohan, fanatisme golongan, sikap berlebih-lebihan.
Kata Kunci: Praktek moderasi, Karakter moderat, Hambatan moderasi Beragama.

Introduction

Radicalism become a giant news for about a decade even Jastin Arimbi, the Film's director, made film by the title 212: The Power of Love. On the article which examines this movie show that the medium of film is used to legitimize accusations of blasphemy made against Ahok through a singular interpretation of events, which represent Islam as a peaceful and tolerant religion. Subsequently, the film obscures select facts and issues to conceal the connection between the 212 movement and electoral politics in Jakarta. It does so by framing those issues apolitically in the context of increased Islamization in Indonesia (Akmaliah, 2020). Indonesia as a big country and has variant culture, religion, language and accent exactly becomes an easy place to through religion issues or tribe issues.

Besides that film which find a moment (Ahok issue), actually the issue in this country which relate to horizontal or vertical conflict are not really surprising. This country has an ancient problem about this issue. Borobudur temple and Prambanan Temple become evidence "a silent witness" that religion confilct existed in the past. Besides, Confilct in poso, between muslims and christians, also conflict Syiah in East Java, two cases which are occure in Indonesia still has potential into conflict and needed a wisdom from everyone in order to the potential can be erased to creat incredible Indonesia without religion conflict (Yunus., 2014). According the history, Indonesia needs a formula onto prevent that condition come back. Islam as mayority religion in this country has a massive role to cover it.

Islam's teachings and Islam's understandings sometimes has difference result. Therefore needed bolding of Islamic teachings spesifically about tolerance to solve and prevent conflict in this country. According alex P. Schmid there are three level in radicalition, that are mikro level, meso level and makro level. First, makro level is individual level, that are about identity, integration fail, lonely feeling, marginalization, discrimination, deprivation, bullying, stigmation and rejection, commonly combined with moral angry and vengeance. Second, radical environment – social environment support or even as radical subyek- which the fungtion as meeting point to terrorist or radical community. Usually a community which feel underestimated, hearted, paintfull due to injstice. This forum can influence other people spesifically to young generation onto form terorist organization. Third, goverment role and society in this country or society in overseas. Radicalization of public opinion and pholitics party, relation of minority-minority, the minimum of job opportunity and economic research, social and pholitics. Those will be go to the understanding and the movement of radical and even terror action (Schmid, 2013). One of some institution ables to support goverment to prevent terror action is Islam teachings.

Islam come to jahiliyah people to fix the attitude. Rasulullah Shallallahu 'Alaihi Wasallam said that:

"Actually i delegated only to polish attitude up." (HR Al-Baihaqi from Abu Hurairah Radhiyallahu 'Anhu).

Furthermore, Rasuluallah statement actually opposite with Radicalism concept. Therefore, this article come to describe how Islamic concept about

moderation as one of some interpretation of that Hadits. This Islamic Moderation Values hopefully can be made as guidance how to be good citizen. It needed a certain explain about character and obstacle must be explored in order to help society understand moderation easily.

Study about Modeeration actually has done by some researcher such as Prasojo [1], Imam Mustofa [2], Dzuhayatin [3] and Mohd Noor [4] but all of those research focuse on field research meanwhile this research focus on library research. On the other hand the article of Yogi Febriandi [5] describes about Aceh's public space that is formed by religious identity but this discourse describe about how to interact in public (Indonesian country) as multy anything by Islamic values, other research such as Nunu Burhanudin [6], Abdullah Aly [7] and Fachry Aidulsyah [8] mostly explain about religious conflict, social violence and and other radicalism movement on the other hand this article explain how the the good way to minimize those condition through moderation and want to describe characteristic and the obstacles in it. Hopefully, this discourse can give explanation about Islamic moderation values as good way to make Indonesia which has the biggest Islam Follower in the world becomes trend setter of the world.

This research is library research. there are four character of library research, included: 1) research face directly to text or number data and does not to direct data from the field *eye witness* such as story, people or thing, 2) the nature of library data is *Ready mode*), 3) library data usually second sorch 4) library data is not limited by space and time because its are death data which saved by note [9]. Data collected method uses *deskriptiv-interpretation*. This method were painting and describing focus object, afterward interpreted as an effort open the message either by explicit and by implicit in reality (Hadits) in order to the

---

[1] Zaenuddin Hudi Prasojo, Elmansyah Elmansyah, and Muhammed Sahrin Haji Masri, "Moderate Islam and the Social Construction of Multi-Ethnic Communities," *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 9, no. 2 (December 25, 2019): 217–39, https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v9i2.217-239.

[2] Imam Mustofa et al., "Reading Types of Islamic Fundamentalism in Lampung Province: (A Study on Doctrine and Movement of Islamism at Lampung University)," *Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies* 7, no. 2 (2019): 267–300, https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v7i2.5719.

[3] Siti Ruhaini Dzuhayatin, "Islamism and Nationalism among Niqabis Women in Egypt and Indonesia," *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 10, no. 1 (June 1, 2020): 49–77, https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v10i1.49-77.

[4] Mohd Roslan Mohd Nor and Muhammad Khalis Ibrahim, "Conflicts of Religious Education in a Secular State: A Study on Turkey⇔s Imam-Hatip School," *Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies* 8, no. 1 (2020): 107–30, https://doi.org/10.21043/QIJIS.V8I1.5849.

[5] Yogi Febriandi and Yaser Amri, "Stuck In Sharia Space The Experiences of Christian Students in Langsa, Aceh," *Al-Jami'ah* 59, no. 1 (2021): 33–56, https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2021.591.33-56.

[6] Nunu Burhanuddin, Ahmad Ali Nurdin, and Muhammad Irfan Helmy, "Religious Conflict and Regional Autonomy in Church Establishment and Islamic Clothing in West Pasaman and Dharmasraya West Sumatera," *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 9, no. 2 (2019): 189–216, https://doi.org/10.18326/IJIMS.V9I2.189-216.

[7] Abdullah Aly and Muhammad Thoyibi, "Violence in Online Media and Its Implication to Islamic Education of Indonesia," *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 10, no. 1 (June 1, 2020): 177–98, https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v10i1.177-198.

[8] Fachri Aidulsyah and Yuji Mizuno, "The Entanglement between Anti-Liberalism and Conservatism: The Insists and Miumi Effect within the "212 Movement" in Indonesia," *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 14, no. 1 (June 1, 2020): 1–25, https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2020.14.1.1-25.

[9] Haikal Ashari, "Radikalisme Dan Fundamentalisme Dalam Islam: Sejarah, Paham Dan Gerakannya Serta Tafsir Atas Ayat-Ayat Perang," *Jurnal Intizar* 25, no. 2 (2019): 101–6.

message can be accepted and understanded clearly (Kaelan, 2010). Data consist of primary data and secondary data. Primary data taken from rectors book by the title Moderasi beragama which actually this book is result of Forum Pimpinan Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam Negeri. Secondary data taken from book by the title Moderasi islam di Indonesia, journal article, electronic news and books.

Result and Discussion

A. Islamic Moderation

Islam exactly becomes stimulator and supporter of good relationship between people of different religious and ethnic backgrounds. Indeed, the Al-Qur'an and the deeds of Prophet Muhammad have provided good examples of building good relations between different communities [10]. It means moderation in Islam is not a new thing. A history about Rasulullah full of moderation values. Moderation in islam is washatiyah. Wasatiyyah concept in Islam seen in specific level of balancing between dialectic concepts and which has relation such as reason and wahyu, material and soul, right and responsibility, individualism and socialism, coercion and sincerity, textuality and reality, continuity and moving, reality in the past and occasion in the future [11]. Islam is religion which very moderate, it is not exaggerate in every aspect (all, 2019). Moderation is an extreamly important for Indonesia as a giant country who has variant tribe, religion, culture, language.

So, Islam as a majority religion also has important role with other religion such as article by the title Muslim Minority In Yogyakarta: Between Social Relationship And Religious Motivation shows that the relationship between Muslim families and nonMuslim families in Banjarsari is established based upon a variety of ways which fall into the following points: (1) building relationship in the field of social field, (2) integrating the field of art and culture for the sake of building togetherness amid the society [12].

B. Character of Islamic Moderation

Maimun and Mohammad Kosim in book by the title Islamic moderation in Indonesia describe that Character of Islamic Moderation consist of six character (Kosim, 2019):

1. Base on divinity (Rububiyah)

Moderation building in Islam base on Wahyu (Qur'an and Hadits). In Islam, everything always come according Wahyu as a source for all activities of muslim. Therefore, Islamic moderation also can not avoid from Wahyu. Because of that condition exactly characters of moderation will similar such

---

[10] Mohd Roslan Mohd Nor, Issa Khan, and Mohammad Elius, "Analysing the Conceptual Framework of Religious Freedom Andinterreligious Relationship in Islam," *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 8, no. 2 (2018), https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v8i2.309-334.

[11] Abu Amar, "Pendidikan Islam Wasathiyah Ke-Indonesia-An," *Al-Insyiroh: Jurnal Studi Keislaman* 2, no. 1 (March 2018): 18–37, https://doi.org/10.35309/alinsyiroh.v2i1.3330.

[12] Idi Warsah et al., "Muslim Minority in Yogyakarta: Between Social Relationship and Religious Motivation," *Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies* 7, no. 2 (2019): 367–98, https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v7i2.6873.

as god character. God is wise, fear, perfect, knows everything either appear or disappear. In this case, especialy of moderation in islam becomes special due to base on divinity (Kosim, Moderasi Islam di Indonesia, 2019). Commonly moderation only base on humanity because the focuse only for human interest. On the other hand, muslim always focuse on god willing.

2. Base on prophetic guidance

Almost all of Prophet teachings showed Islamic moderation teaching (Kosim, Moderasi Islam di Indonesia, 2019). For example, when conflict between clan in Makkah about who has capacity and right to touch and move hajar aswad stone, whereas all of tribe leader want to be luxurious leader which has has occasion to be number one and the only one moving Hajar Aswad Stone. Finally in this case Muhammad becomes the choosen one who believed to give solution in that occure. And Muhammad gives solution by spread turban out and put the hajar aswad on it and every leader hold every edges and then moves the hajar aswad together.

Prophet is the best person but never worship excessively. He takes a fasting but still breaks fast, he is zuhud but still takes a job, it means he takes a middle way (moderate).

3. Compatible with human *fitrah*

One of characteristic in Islam is always convinient with human fitrah (Kosim, Moderasi Islam di Indonesia, 2019). Fitrah actually basic talent from god. That is asset for human to run their life in the world and for preparation face afterlife. Sometimes people call it instinct. Before we born in the world, islam states that people has history how god ask to people

4. Without conflict

Islamic moderation is teaching which relate with human fitrah (Kosim, Moderasi Islam di Indonesia, 2019). Therefore there is no contradiction in it. Furthermore people can not contrapose between moderation with religious concept. Actually moderation is a part of Islamic teaching. This concept is perfect and without weaknesses because teaching which come from Islam is perfect teaching. Teaching which come from islam means base on Wahyu (Qur'an and Hadits), and if come from Wahyu so there is no fault and there is no occasion to be denied.

5. Consistent

Islamic moderation concept difficult to be opposed meanwhile it is a consistent concept, it means becomes eternal and relevant teaching in everywhere and every time, such as Islamic Sharia also has the same character (Kosim, Moderasi Islam di Indonesia, 2019). As people know that Islam also has character "suitability" for every era and it is proved. Slavery in Prophet Muhammad era growth massively in every single part of the world. In the west there is Romawi empire with long slavery history. Besides in east there is Persia by similar condition such as Romawi. And Arab by location in the middle between Romawi and Persia also has condition such as two empire. Even the slave in that era can be bought depend on demand of rich man because slave came from variant countries. Islam comes erase slavery

concept and relevant until now. This teaching always becomes guidance of muslim for fight slavery in every corner of the world.

6. Universal and comprehensive

Islamic moderation concept comprise every aspect of life, either worldly, religious, social. Economic, politic, culture knowledge, etcetera without exception (Kosim, Moderasi Islam di Indonesia, 2019). This concept is not parts. It should be holistic because this concept depend on Islam characteristic. It means because Islam has character universality and comprehensive therefore Islamic moderation also has this character.

7. Wise, balance and without over doing

Two of Islamic moderation character wise and balance onto face daily activities (Kosim, Moderasi Islam di Indonesia, 2019). Balance between *hablum minallah and hablum minannas*. Balance between worldly activities and afterlife activities. Balance in every thing. It does not over to full fill their need and does not ignore their need. Wasatiyyah is balance to care onto the continuity and the changing by keep the permanent and can not be changed (thawabit) as an opposite of the thing which can change (mutaghayyirat) (Faelasup, 2021). Moderation is like a bridge of worldly actions and afterlife actions. Therefore, modern economic development and advancement in technology and science has taken aggressive way onto give destructive impact to environment of human and animals (Henry, 2020). it is will not happen if we implement moderation values in daily life.

Tuhan Yang Maha Tinggi memberikan kelonggaran sehubungan dengan milik-Nya hak sendiri, terutama dalam hal ibadah, yang tidak memerlukan dukungan yudisial, tetapi berkaitan dengan hak dan kewajiban sipil, ruang lingkup fleksibilitas itu agak terbatas dan seringkali bergantung pada intervensi yudisial dan persetujuan pihak swasta yang terlibat [13].

C. Obstacles of Islamiic Moderation Practice (Islam Washatiyyah)

Except characteristic of moderation, in practice of Islam Washatiyyah also has several obstacles. In society there are some obstacles to implement Islamic moderation such as:

1. Foolishness

The meaning of foolishness is they do not have knowledge, specifically about religious knowledge. Furthermore, double foolishness (al-jahlul Murakkab) (Kosim, Moderasi Islam di Indonesia, 2019). Many messages from Al-qur'an and Hadits about how important knowledge for human as an individu or as a member of society and about how bad people condition without knowledge. By knowledge people will get Kingliness such ac the purpose of education Accord Ghazali that:

"…result from knowledge is to close onto Allah, God of Universe,

---

[13] Muhammad Faiz, "Konsep Tasawuf Said Nursi: Implementasi Nilai-Nilai Moderasi Islam," *Millah* 19, no. 2 (February 2020): 199–224, https://doi.org/10.20885/millah.vol19.iss2.art2.

and equal with angels in afterlife. Moreover in the world we will get kingliness, the statement will be followed by kings and get the honor naturally…[14],[15].

2. Fanaticism of faction (Ta'asub)

Fanatic is a nature or an attitude looking their self and their faction is the best meanwhile the position of other individual or other faction is not his faction (Kosim, Moderasi Islam di Indonesia, 2019). Fanatic can be occurred in every aspect of human life such as in understanding, thought, certain thariqah even fanatic to entertainer or sport idol. In Islam actually fanatic is not an old issue. Story killed Ali bin Abi Thalib "Muhammad's Nephew" by Abdurrahman bin Muljam. He thinks that he has the best believe, understanding on the other hand Ali and Muawiyah are disobey people whom eligible to be killed. Amin said that make our self free from fanatism of mazhab. In order to creat Fiqih Al-Taysir, it can not commitment to one certain mazhab into all of Fiqih, eventhought at the time of the mazhab make harder or their Dalil is weaker than other Mazhab [16].

Fanatic will be stronger if apathetical atmosphere grows massively in society. Ideally, society give more attention for fanatic attitude in their environment. In this case, person who expert in religion should give contribution to handle it because they have ability and capacity to push and even erase fanatism in the world. The expert person has to speak up in society because if they just silent, it means a part of support fanatism to grow massively.

3. Exaggeration

Exaggeration in this situation is exaggeration into run religious activities, whereas exaggerate to do religious teaching is digression (Kosim, Moderasi Islam di Indonesia, 2019). This condition is occurred actually because the limitation of religious knowledge. People who understand many aspect in religion tend to more flexible and dynamic onto reacting, saying and doing anything which relate with religion. In article amin even said that make it easier in problem which becomes global in society [17].

People tend to exaggerate not only in worship rite but also exaggerate onto react holy day other religion outside their self. It is hard to make a harmony such as the harmony instead in liberal country such as Australia [18].

---

[14] Pemikiran Pendidikan Al-ghazali, " لواكن ب ي ن � بعد ب ي الن � لاكان لاغ ز ي لا "} VII, no. 2 (2016).

[15] Muhammad Jafar Sodiq, "Pemikiran Pendidikan Al-Ghazali," *LITERASI (Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan)* 7, no. 2 (2017), https://doi.org/10.21927/literasi.2016.7(2).136-152.

[16] 2014 Amin, "PRINSIP DAN FENOMENA MODERASI ISLAM DALAM TRADISIHUKUM ISLAM Moderat Islam, Its Principle and Issues in Islamic Law Tradition," *Al-Qalam* 20 (2014): 23–32.

[17] Amin.

[18] Syamsul Arifin et al., "Minority Muslims and Freedom of Religion: Learning from Australian Muslims' Experiences," *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 9, no. 2 (n.d.): 295–326, https://doi.org/10.18326/IJIMS.V9I2.295-326.

Conclution

According the research, firstly the characters of islamic moderation are base on divinity (rububiyah), base on prophetic guidance, compatible with human fitrah, without conflict, consistent, universal/comprehensive, wise, balance and without over doing. Secondly, the obstacles of islamiic moderation practice are foolishness, fanaticism of faction (ta'asub) and exaggeration.

Acknowledgment

Author Contributions Statement

This article was carried out by a collaborative team. Ahmad Bustomi as a main author and Ahmad Bahaudin as a second author.

References

Aidulsyah, Fachri, and Yuji Mizuno. "The Entanglement between Anti-Liberalism and Conservatism: The Insists and Miumi Effect within the "212 Movement" in Indonesia." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 14, no. 1 (June 1, 2020): 1–25. https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2020.14.1.1-25.

Al-ghazali, Pemikiran Pendidikan. "{ لوكان ب ي ن � بعد ب ي الن � لاكان لاغز ي لا }" VII, no. 2 (2016).

Aly, Abdullah, and Muhammad Thoyibi. "Violence in Online Media and Its Implication to Islamic Education of Indonesia." *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 10, no. 1 (June 1, 2020): 177–98. https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v10i1.177-198.

Amar, Abu. "Pendidikan Islam Wasathiyah Ke-Indonesia-An." *Al-Insyiroh: Jurnal Studi Keislaman* 2, no. 1 (March 2018): 18–37. https://doi.org/10.35309/alinsyiroh.v2i1.3330.

Amin, 2014. "PRINSIP DAN FENOMENA MODERASI ISLAM DALAM TRADISIHUKUM ISLAM Moderat Islam, Its Principle and Issues in Islamic Law Tradition." *Al-Qalam* 20 (2014): 23–32.

Arifin, Syamsul, Hasnan Bachtiar, Ahmad Nur Fuad, Tongat, and Wahyudi. "Minority Muslims and Freedom of Religion: Learning from Australian Muslims' Experiences." *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 9, no. 2 (n.d.): 295–326. https://doi.org/10.18326/IJIMS.V9I2.295-326.

Ashari, Haikal. "Radikalisme Dan Fundamentalisme Dalam Islam: Sejarah, Paham Dan Gerakannya Serta Tafsir Atas Ayat-Ayat Perang." *Jurnal Intizar* 25, no. 2 (2019): 101–6.

Burhanuddin, Nunu, Ahmad Ali Nurdin, and Muhammad Irfan Helmy. "Religious Conflict and Regional Autonomy in Church Establishment and Islamic Clothing in West Pasaman and Dharmasraya West Sumatera." *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 9, no. 2 (2019): 189–216. https://doi.org/10.18326/IJIMS.V9I2.189-216.

Dzuhayatin, Siti Ruhaini. "Islamism and Nationalism among Niqabis Women in Egypt and Indonesia." *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 10, no. 1 (June 1, 2020): 49–77. https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v10i1.49-77.

Faiz, Muhammad. "Konsep Tasawuf Said Nursi: Implementasi Nilai-Nilai Moderasi Islam." *Millah* 19, no. 2 (February 2020): 199–224. https://doi.org/10.20885/millah.vol19.iss2.art2.

Febriandi, Yogi, and Yaser Amri. "Stuck In Sharia Space The Experiences of Christian Students in Langsa, Aceh." *Al-Jami'ah* 59, no. 1 (2021): 33–56. https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2021.591.33-56.

Mohd Nor, Mohd Roslan, and Muhammad Khalis Ibrahim. "Conflicts of Religious Education in a Secular State: A Study on Turkey⇔s Imam-Hatip School." *Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies* 8, no. 1 (2020): 107–30. https://doi.org/10.21043/QIJIS.V8I1.5849.

Mustofa, Imam, Enizar, Muhktar Hadi, and Dedi Irwansyah. "Reading Types of Islamic Fundamentalism in Lampung Province: (A Study on Doctrine and Movement of Islamism at Lampung University)." *Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies* 7, no. 2 (2019): 267–300. https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v7i2.5719.

Nor, Mohd Roslan Mohd, Issa Khan, and Mohammad Elius. "Analysing the Conceptual Framework of Religious Freedom Andinterreligious Relationship in Islam." *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 8, no. 2 (2018). https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v8i2.309-334.

Prasojo, Zaenuddin Hudi, Elmansyah Elmansyah, and Muhammed Sahrin Haji Masri. "Moderate Islam and the Social Construction of Multi-Ethnic Communities." *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 9, no. 2 (December 25, 2019): 217–39. https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v9i2.217-239.

Sodiq, Muhammad Jafar. "Pemikiran Pendidikan Al-Ghazali." *LITERASI (Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan)* 7, no. 2 (2017). https://doi.org/10.21927/literasi.2016.7(2).136-152.

Warsah, Idi, Yusron Masduki, Imron, Mirzon Daheri, and Ruly Morganna. "Muslim Minority in Yogyakarta: Between Social Relationship and Religious Motivation." *Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies* 7, no. 2 (2019): 367–98. https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v7i2.6873.