International ResearchScape Journal

Volume 8 Article 3

2023

Veterinary Medicine and the COVID-19 Pandemic: An International, Interdisciplinary Study of a GlobalWicked Problem

Daniella Fedak-Lengel Bowling Green State University, dfedakl@bgsu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.bgsu.edu/irj

Part of the African Languages and Societies Commons, Feminist, Gender, and Sexuality Studies Commons, and the International and Area Studies Commons

How does access to this work benefit you? Let us know!

Recommended Citation

Fedak-Lengel, Daniella (2023) "Veterinary Medicine and the COVID-19 Pandemic: An International, Interdisciplinary Study of a GlobalWicked Problem," *International ResearchScape Journal*: Vol. 8, Article 3. DOI: https://doi.org/10.25035/irj.08.01.03

Available at: https://scholarworks.bgsu.edu/irj/vol8/iss1/3

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at ScholarWorks@BGSU. It has been accepted for inclusion in International ResearchScape Journal by an authorized editor of ScholarWorks@BGSU.

Veterinary Medicine and the COVID-19 Pandemic: An International, Interdisciplinary Study of a Global Wicked Problem

Daniella Fedak-Lengel

Abstract: Building on field research in Costa Rica and Belize, this study analyzes environmental and endangered animal protection policies, rights, and practices in Central America, and assesses impacts of veterinary science and conservation biology on animal welfare concerns. Informed by the recent surge in awareness regarding the spread of zoonotic diseases, given COVID-19, the study analyzes *Manis javanica* and the impact of illegal trafficking of this critically endangered animal. The project theorizes if awareness of zoonotic disease transmission, especially during a global pandemic, could be key to reducing sales, legal or illegal, of wild animals in order to mitigate zoonotic infection spread. Given nearly sixty percent of all emerging infectious diseases are zoonotic in nature, and seventy-one percent of those zoonotic diseases originate in wildlife, the project argues the current global pandemic could be instrumental in raising awareness of and encouraging policy development on reduction of illegal trafficking of critically endangered species.

Keywords: COVID-19 pandemic, illegal trafficking of critically endangered species, *Manis javanica*, zoonotic infection spread

Daniella Fedak-Lengel

B.S. Biological Sciences and Spanish Minor, Honors College, Bowling Green State University e-mail: dfedakl@bgsu.edu; daniellafedaklengel@gmail.com

Author acknowledgements:

The author wishes to thank Honors Thesis Faculty Advisors, Dr. Amilcar Challu and Dr. Justin Donhauser, and Honors Thesis Committee Member, Dr. Eileen Underwood

© The Author(s), under exclusive license / creative commons

International ResearchScape Journal

ISSN: 2372-1774

n entirely new vocabulary was introduced to the world in January 2020. The attention to what was originally identified by the World Health Organization China Country Office (cited in Lawrence, 21) as "cases of pneumonia of unknown etiology" (Lu, Stratton, and Tang), or unknown cause, was called, first "novel coronavirus infection pneumonia," then SARS-nCov, SARS-CoV-2, and COVID-19. These terms were followed by others, previously unused among people outside science and medicine—PPE, R-nought, Hydroxychloroquine, and others not used frequently, such as quarantine, contact tracing, social distancing, and flattening the curve, and a new awareness of geography—first of Wuhan in the Hubei Province of China and then of Bergamo, Italy, in the northern Lombardy region.

It also reminded the world of other things in the not-too-distant past—diseases of the past few decades, such as Avian flu/SARS, Mad Cow Disease, Ebola, Middle East Respiratory Syndrome or MERS (few people knew early on in 2020 that this, too, started with a coronavirus, MERS-CoV), and of many centuries ago, such as the "Black Death" (circa 1342-1356) and the Great Plague of London in 1665. All of these had a common thread—a connection to non-human animals.

This thread—the connection of non-human animals to deadly diseases in humans—is one of the foci of this study which addresses the current, crucial topic of zoonotic disease spread. The awareness of zoonosis has never been so critical as it is today—during the ongoing global pandemic. "In the last 30 or 40 years, there have been zoonotic outbreaks at a much frequent pace than before, many of those have been related to wildlife trade" (Millan 32). "Zoonotic diseases today account for around sixty percent of all emerging infectious diseases, and seventy-one percent of these originate in wildlife" (Anand & Batra para. 1). Who had heard of the pangolin before SARS-CoV-2? While many people had some idea that "aviary flu" had something to do with birds and that Zika was spread by mosquitoes, beyond that, there was very little knowledge or awareness of zoonotic diseases…not only are non-human animals dying at unprecedented rates, but, given the current deadly COVID-19 pandemic, humans are dying at unprecedented rates, possibly due to the transmission of diseases from non-human animals to humans.

Tackling "Wicked Problems"

Informed by field research in Belize and Costa Rica, this study analyzes the impact of veterinary science and biological research and practice, particularly conservation biology, on the COVID-19 Pandemic. The study is part of an emerging interdisciplinary research program analyzing national and international policies on endangered animals and conservation, veterinary biology policy

history, illegal trade and law enforcement, the intrinsic value of these animals, and zoonosis. The study centers on the following research question:

RQ: Can the COVID-19 pandemic help to raise awareness of zoonotic disease spread and, if so, can this awareness help to reduce instances of illegal wildlife trafficking?

A subset of mail artists The above research question is one of many that must be asked about the COVID-19 pandemic, which many researchers (Auld, Bernstein, Cashore and Levin; Cohen & Cromwell; Pourdehnad, Starr, Koerwer, Scott, & McCloskey; Schiefloe) have labeled a "wicked" problem. David Kerr and Namino Glantz characterize a wicked problem as one that "persists in perpetuity because of incomplete information, multiple (often selfish) stakeholder interests, a large economic burden, and a ripple effect whereby every action triggers a reaction with other wicked problems." They argue "COVID-19 is also a classic wicked problem, as evidenced by the unanticipated and disproportionate effect of the virus on minority racial and ethnic populations and individuals who have experienced health disparities" (873).

Addressing a wicked problem requires interdisciplinarity. Thus this literature review spans a range of disciplines including veterinary science, immunology of infectious diseases, conservation biology, policy on endangered animals and conservation, policy history, illegal trade and law enforcement, and the biological, immunological, epidemiological, and ecological properties of viral, bacterial, and protozoan diseases of animals and humans, including vectors from certain pathogens. All of these interdisciplinary areas of study are needed to investigate "wicked" problems through multi-faceted and collaborative research, advocacy, and action.

Following the work of wildlife veterinarians (see, for instance, Cattet), this study argues that an interdisciplinary, collaborative effort is needed as well as an increased "mutual understanding between fields with respect to the other's training and experience in addressing animal welfare issues" (33). For instance, in "Falling Through the Cracks: Shortcomings in the Collaboration Between Biologists and Veterinarians and Their Consequences for Wildlife," Marc Cattet, DVM, Ph.D. argues, "Although biologists and veterinarians have shown considerable success in working together to address wildlife-related issues, including disease, chemical immobilization, reproductive biology, and conservation biology, examples of shared efforts to evaluate and ensure the welfare of study animals are mostly absent" (33). An interdisciplinary, collaborative effort is needed as well as an increased "mutual understanding between fields with respect to the other's training and experience in addressing animal welfare issues. In effect, each assumes that the final word on animal welfare rests with the other. The reality is, however, that neither field contains the knowledge and skills

required to address animal welfare concerns alone" (Cattet 33).

In their recent article, in the Lancet, titled, "Diabetes, like COVID-19, is a wicked problem," David Kerr and Namino Glantz characterize a wicked problem as one that "persists in perpetuity because of incomplete information, multiple (often selfish) stakeholder interests, a large economic burden, and a ripple effect whereby every action triggers a reaction with other wicked problems."

By contrast, "Tame problems can be solved by having engineers, clinicians, and scientists develop guidelines, algorithms, and systems that achieve easily measured outcomes that matter to these same stakeholders." Kerr and Glantz argue "COVID-19 is also a classic wicked problem, as evidenced by the unanticipated and disproportionate effect of the virus on minority racial and ethnic populations and individuals who have experienced health disparities" (873).

I argue that studying the pandemic is even more wicked, in an interdisciplinary sense, because it draws in even more areas of study including but not limited to history, given its links to the pandemics from the Justinian plague to the 14th century Bubonic plague to the 1918 so-called "Spanish flu." Kerr and Glantz note "As the COVID-19 example shows, there is no single, correct, definite answer to a wicked problem" (874). There are also issues emerging during the pandemic that extend far beyond science and medicine. These include ethnonationalism and racism. Given the racism that has emerged in pandemics in history, and in the present, it also needs study from medical humanities, from economics and global trade, from ethnicity and cultural studies, and from journalism and media literacy—due to its "fake news" disinformation and misinformation; and from political science, given the way COVID-19 has been politicized.

Addressing the "wicked" problem of the COVID-19 pandemic relates to an even more "wicked" problem of climate change, or what many scientists and environmental sustainability advocates and activists argue should be widely named the "extinction crisis" (Center for Biological Diversity). What should be called the extinction crisis is certainly a wicked problem. For instance, at the thirty year anniversary of the U.S. Endangered Species Act (ESA), Scott, Goble and Davis, wrote "It has been thirty years since the ESA was signed into law on December 28, 1973, and the task of conserving at-risk species is more complex than ever" (4).

Elsewhere (Fedak-Lengel), I have expanded my analysis on the philosophical foundation of this study, which centers on the question posed by my professor of Philosophy, Dr. Justin Donhauser: "Is there any good reason to take measures to protect endangered species that have no value for anything we care about?" (237). There are several environmental philosophers who are asking this and related questions concerning the valuation of species in terms of value of individual

organisms that construct the species population, the worth of individuals in a given species population is grounded in the representational goals of those specific organisms, and species preservationist ethics (see, for instance, Adams; Agar; Brown & Shogren; Callicott; Courchamp, Angulo, Rivalan, Hall, Signoret, et al.; Davidson; Donhauser; Douglas & Alie; Hall, Milner-Gulland, & Courchamp; Maguire & Justus; McCord; Sandler). Their research focuses on reasons to protect these species and the definitions of intrinsic value, specifically reasons as to why species obtain intrinsic value as well as alternate perspectives surrounding the topic. [Endnote 1]

One of the most important scholars in this area is Ian Smith who, in his book, The Intrinsic Value of Endangered Species, defines the concept of intrinsic value, which can be defined as an artefact, entity, or individual must have value regardless of whether it is useful as a means to promote other ends or goals (see, also, Lau). It has been argued throughout history that living beings have intrinsic value, and it has also been argued that anything with intrinsic value should be protected on the basis of morality and innate human obligation. Although this value assessment applies to a wide range of subjects, this paper focuses on endangered species. Protection for endangered species has always been noted as controversial, due to the fact that 99% of currently threatened species are at risk from human activities, primarily those driving habitat loss, introduction of exotic species, and the climate catastrophe.

Exploitative Trafficking

The most horrifying contrast to the intrinsic value of endangered species is monetary value placed upon them in the illegal sales of them. In April 2020 the United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime estimated that the illegal wildlife trade is worth as high as \$23 billion (USD) annually. Given the financial crises that many people throughout the world experienced during the COVID-19 pandemic, that figure is likely to rise substantially as more people have turned to illegal activities to survive.

In addition to exacerbating the extinction crisis, the illegal wildlife trade is additionally problematic as it leads not only to the elimination of endangered species and reduction of global biodiversity, but also increases organized crime and corruption, harms legal economic practices, and, as evidenced by the COVID-19 pandemic, can threatens humans' health through the increased possibility of zoonotic disease spread to humans.

Several scientific researchers have invited the world to learn lessons from the COVID-19 as it relates to "probable animal origin" of the severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2, or SARS-CoV-2, the virus that causes COVID-19 (Decaro and Lorusso 1). In their article, "Novel Human Coronavirus (SARS-

CoV-2): A Lesson from Animal Coronaviruses," in Veterinary Microbiology, Nicola Decaro and Alessia Lorusso note that "A number of human coronaviruses that originated in animals have emerged in less than two decades" (1).

Elsewhere (Abdul-Aziz, Fedak-Lengel and Lengel), with particular focus on the Middle East and North Africa, we have taken an interdisciplinary stance, among others, on the negative impact of illegal animal trafficking. In "Drivers for Animal Welfare Policies in the Middle East," Aidaros argues, "while nonhuman creation is subjugated to human needs, the proper human role is that of conscientious steward and not exploiter" (84).

Veterinary Science Denial

Scientific advances have been publicly denied all throughout history, and science denial is even more prevalent in the age of technology, specifically through use of the internet and web browsing. Infinite information that is readily available through search engines can pose serious risk on the credibility of scientific discoveries. Many sources available contain inaccurate or unreliable content, which makes it more difficult to differentiate between authentic advancements and misconceptions, and with increasing information, there comes increasing and strong biases. Scientific approach poses threats to mindsets that are stuck in mythic modes of thinking, which makes it extremely difficult to create mass agreement on certain controversial issues, such as the onset and eradication plans of COVID-19.

Citing experts from the American Veterinary Medical Association, the Federation of Veterinarisns of Europe, the Australian Veterinary Association, among others (See Duan, Kluger, and Lengyel), Jordan argues, a small, but very vocal "subset of veterinarians routinely denounces scientific veterinary medicine as worthless or actively harmful, and promotes alternative approaches for diagnosing and treating disease" (par. 10). The problem with this subset is that they "not only rely on untested, unproven, or demonstrably useless methods such as homeopathy, energy medicine, esoteric diets, herbal remedies, and many others, but they promote these by claiming the vaccines, medicine, foods, and other interventions developed and supported by scientific research cause disease more than prevent or treat it" (par. 10). A broader problem with veterinary science denial is that it contributes to broader concerns about dis- and misinformation, which has risen substantially during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Methodology: Veterinary Science Field Research in Belize

Complex problems require what is called "triangulated" methodological approach Bekhet and Zauszniewski methodological triangulation as an approach that "involves using more than one kind of method to study a phenomenon. It has been found to be beneficial in providing confirmation of findings, more comprehensive data, increased validity and enhanced understanding of studied phenomena (40). This study is part of a larger research program analyzing wildlife conservation policy priorities (including social, political, and environmental policy priorities) in the Americas, and the effectiveness of these national policies, in coordination with international organizations such as the United Nations Environmental Program, and policies and conventions, such as the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES). n addition to the policy analysis, case study and extensive literature review, it was the field research in Belize that made the greatest impact on my learning about endangered and critically endangered animals, and the widespread problem of illegal trafficking of these animals.

The methodology of this particular study builds on preliminary field research in Costa Rica and field research in Belize, as well as analysis of animal welfare and conservation policies, including translation of policies from Spanish to English, and a case study of zoonotic disease spread of endangered animals.

The field research occurred during a veterinary science study abroad program in San Ignacio, Cayo Belize, in the Central American and Caribbean region. I drew upon the knowledge I gained from what was a pilot field research project, which was a June to July 2016 two-week trip to Costa Rica. The in-field experience in Belize occurred at the Belize Wildlife and Referral Clinic through the University of Florida Department of Wildlife Ecology and Conservation program in Belize and the Wildlife Institute, whose mission is to support opportunities for veterinary study abroad, and the Belize Wildlife Conservation and Sustainable Development through Collaboration. These organizations collaborate with undergraduate and graduate students, veterinary medical professionals and educators, and the Government of Belize and other national and international wildlife health professionals to develop national guidelines concerning wildlife and human health, to support wildlife conservation animal health and welfare, and the veterinary profession in Belize through medical services, education, research, and collaboration.

The Belize Wildlife Referral Clinic broadened my knowledge about the vastly unknown world of the dangers of exotic pet trade and the importance of veterinary practice to assist in combating the malpractices associated with this phenomenon. For instance, in their article in the journal Biological Conservation, Auliya, et al. note, "[o]f the 10,272 currently recognized reptile species, the trade of fewer than 8% are regulated by the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) and the European Wildlife Trade Regulations (EWTR)" (103). However, Auliya, et al. report that "the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) Red List has assessed 45% of the world's reptile species and determined that at least 1390 species are threatened by 'biological resource use'. Of these, 355 species are intentionally targeted by collectors, including 194 non-CITES-listed species. Herein we review the global reptile pet trade, its impacts, and its contribution to the overharvesting of species and populations, in light of current international law" (103).

In order to preserve the endangered ecosystem that Belize is battling, due to poachers and the imposed economic value behind the endangered species present, the Wildlife Protection Act-Wildlife law in Belize. This law reduced the cases of poaching tremendously, however many cases are still observed. These policies have not been very effective in decreasing the amount of abductions and poachings.

Could Awareness of Zoonotic Disease Spread by *Manis javanica* Halt Traffickers?

Early on during the spread of SARS-CoV-2, in early February 2020, Lam et al., in their study, "Identification of 2019-nCoV related coronaviruses in Malayan pangolins in southern China," reported a possible "identification of 2019-nCoV related coronaviruses in pangolins (Manis javanica) seized in anti-smuggling operations in southern China" (1). The outbreak of the, at the time, very new, frightening disease was linked with a so-called "wet market" in Wuhan, China, that sold live, wild animals. It was certain types of animals that Lam et al. posited as "the source of zoonotic infection." The researchers argued, "Although bats are likely reservoir hosts for 2019-nCoV, the identity of any intermediate host facilitating transfer to humans is unknown" (1). They argued that "the identification of 2019-nCoV related coronaviruses in pangolins (Manis javanica) seized in anti-smuggling operations in southern China" could be a causal link to the human disease outbreak (1). They reported, "Metagenomic sequencing identified pangolin associated CoVs that belong to two sub-lineages of 2019-nCoV related coronaviruses, including one very closely related to 2019nCoV in the receptor-binding domain. The discovery of multiple lineages of pangolin coronavirus and their similarity to 2019-nCoV suggests that pangolins should be considered as possible intermediate hosts for this novel human virus and should be removed from wet markets to prevent zoonotic transmission" (1).

Others also highlighted *Manis javanica* as a possible origination of 2019nCoV-2 (Wu et al.). The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) argue: "The ongoing Covid crisis has brought renewed attention to the global problem of wildlife trafficking. The World Health Organization has determined that COVID-19, just like SARS, Ebola, Bird Flu, and MERS, originated from an animal" (1). OECD cited scientists including Lam et al. who "claim that smuggling of pangolins in South-East Asia could be one of the triggers of the current crisis, as these smuggled animals carried viruses closely related to coronavirus. In fact, pangolins are the most-commonly illegally trafficked animal in South East Asia, used both as food and in traditional medicine" (OECD 1). Previous research also analyzed Manis javanica, focusing on international trafficking and exploitation (Challender, Heinrich, Shepherd, and Katsis; Heinrich et al.; Ingram, Coad, Abernethy, Maisels, Stokes, Bobo, et al.; Liu et al.). Liu et al., for example, found that "viral metagenomics revealed sendai virus and coronavirus infections" in *Manis javanica* [Malayan pangolin] (12).

Other researchers have contested that the pangolin was the zoonotic link to the COVID-19 pandemic. Professor David Macdonald, Director of WildCRU which is part of the Department of Zoology at the University of Oxford, reported on that a research team sent by the World Health Organization to Wuhan from 14 January to 10 February 2021 to try to determine what animals were being sold in the so-called wet markets in Wuhan before they were closed in early January 2020. Macdonald's research team found that no pangolin or bat species were for sale in the any of the 17 shops in the Wuhan markets (Xiao et al.). Other researchers have also indicated that there is no blame to be placed on the pangolin (Frutos et al.; Xiao Xiao et al.). Nevertheless, the attention to pangolins and bats and possible links to the pandemic likely raised awareness about these animals and, in the case of pangolins, particularly *Manis javanica*, there is hope that there will be more commitment to protecting such endangered species, at least for the goal of reducing the risk of zoonotic disease spread, whether or not Manis javanica had any connection to SARS-CoV2 (Heighton and Gaubert; Thomson and Fletcher).

Awareness raising is of utmost importance because pangolins are "among the most extensively traded taxa in southeastern Asia mainly due to the perceived medicinal value of their scales and other body parts, putting them at risk of extinction" (Phuyal et al., 2023 1). Perhaps the most important work is communicating emerging scientific research to the public. Media organizations, such as the BBC, Reuters, Al Jazeera, among others, have done an impressive job of drawing attention to the pangolin, both in terms of its critically endangered

status, but also its links to SARS-CoV2 and the COVID-19 pandemic (Briggs). Similarly, civil society and non-governmental organizations such as the Iguana Specialist Group have played an important role in raising awareness about zoonosis (See, also, Anand and Batra; FUNCI; GVI) and to the threats to the pangolin (IUCN SSC Pangolin Specialist Group).

Innovative Collaboration and Cooperation Needed to Increase the Success of Animal Protection Laws and Policies

Various non-governmental organizations and governmental agencies are centrally involved in developing, implementing, and enforcing animal protection laws and policies. The first is the World Wildlife Fund (WWF) which provides assistance to communities to conserve their natural resources, transform policies into more sustainable ones, and protect the animals along with their habitats. Their local efforts can be reflected onto a global scale. One organization is the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN). It is a network of global government and civil society organizations that provides private, public, and non-governmental organizations information on how to balance human life and economic growth with conservation of wildlife.

Through my field research in Belize, I discovered an outstanding collaboration at the Belize Wildlife and Referral Clinic. There are similar collaborations throughout Central America and the Caribbean (Acha; Alleyne; Arambulo; Belize Forest Department; Casas Olascoaga, Rosenberg, and Astudillo; Góngora; Harbison; Nelson; Peery Wildlife Ecology & Conservation Lab; RUSVM). Still, much more needs to be done to address this and other "wicked" problems on a global scale, for instance, with continental collaboration between Central America and Europe (Altherr; Henle, Bauch, Auliya, Külvik, and Pe'er, et al.; Iguana Specialist Group), with other considerations, such as poverty as a reason for illegal animal trafficking (Duffy, St. John, Büscher & Brockington; Pangolin Specialist Group). Collaboration and cooperation is needed because, as Dr. Adrian Rabe (cited in Carbonaro), an epidemiologist at Imperial College London, notes, "It appears that consumption of certain animals may predispose our population to new viruses in the future. Our continued intrusion into virus environments and those sanctuaries is also one of the reasons why these pandemics have arisen. And we will probably need to protect those sanctuaries in the future" (para. 14). Rabe and others such, as Dr. Martin Beer, a virologist at the Federal Research Institute for Animal Health in Greifswald, Germany, highlight the fact that related viruses for SARS-CoV-2, the pangolin is a "likely intermediate host for the virus outbreak" (Beer, qtd. in Carbonaro para. 8).

In her study of anthropatriarchy and Hindu nationalism, Yamini Narayanan asks, "How can insights from feminist and animal geographies politicize spaces of

'sanctuary' and refuge for animals repatriated from incarceration, exploitation, and violence?" (195). Given that the COVID-19 pandemic is still current, it is highly likely that there is no more current undergraduate level research outside of this project on the integration of COVID-19 into endangered species protection policies.

More extensive and innovative types of collaboration and cooperation are needed to increase the success of anti-trafficking law and policy enforcement. There are, of course, numerous examples of scientific collaboration to support conservation and preservation of wildlife (Aguirre, Ostfeld, and Daszak; Auliya et al.; Böhm, et al.; Boyle and Bishop). For instance, Drs. Carlos Diez, Jafet Vélez-Valentin, and Antonio Mignucci, worked together to save endangered species in Puerto Rico. They began with 13 Puerto Rican Amazon Parrots, to 130 parrots released in 2017 (Guzman).

Such efforts are encouraging, however, many situations I learned about during my field research were not. For instance, during my time at the Belize Wildlife and Referral Clinic, my research cohort was shown numerous radiographs containing images of howler monkeys with bullets still inside their bodies. A common practice for obtaining howler and spider monkeys is to shoot the mother and steal the infant monkey for trafficking in the illegal animal market. As disturbing as this learning and awareness was during my study in Belize, I realized the importance of proper veterinary care, as well as the importance with public acknowledgment and advocacy. Following the field research in Belize and since the COVID-19 pandemic, I further realized that if more people could be aware of the harms involved with obtaining exotic animals, there may be a reduction in demand for the trafficking and possession of species at risk of extinction.

Directions for Future Research

This study, and the larger Honors Thesis project, was a life transforming experience. The field research in Belize opened my eyes to the widespread problem of illegal trafficking of endangered and critically endangered species. The field research in Belize Wildlife and Referral Clinic will guide my future career in veterinary medicine. It ignited a passion for future international field research. The analysis environmental and endangered animal protection policies, rights, and practices in Central America and the Caribbean, lead me to understand ways to combat the problem of animal trafficking, but also revealed that laws and policies may have limited impact on reducing trafficking. The impact of veterinary science and biological research and practice, particularly conservation biology, can have a positive impact on animal welfare concerns. Perhaps the increased awareness about the spread of zoonotic diseases, given the current global COVID-19, especially for critically endangered animals such as Manis javanica, may be the most powerful impact on reducing animal trafficking.

Ongoing research is needed to assess the need for new and innovative types of collaboration, particularly involving numerous scientific disciplines, law and policy makers, global trade, and technology experts, to analyze and find better practices to save endangered and critically endangered species. Collaboration in the area of public health campaigns and health communication, can also help to raise awareness of zoonotic disease transmission, especially during a global pandemic, which could be key to reducing the sale, legal or illegal, of wild animals in order to mitigate zoonotic infection spread. More research on infectious diseases COVID-19 pandemic could be instrumental in new awareness and policy development that can reduce illegal trafficking of endangered and critically endangered species.

Works Cited

- Acha, Jamet Pedro N. "De Conceptos a Programas—Tres Decenios de Progreso en Salud Publica Veterinaria y Salud Animal en America Latina y el Caribe" ["From Concepts to Programs—Three Decades of Progress in Veterinary Public Health and Animal Health in Latin America and the Caribbean"]. Boletin Oficina Sanitaria Panamericana [Pan American Sanitary Bureau Bulletin], vol. 90, pp. 506–31.
- Keesing Felicia, and Richard S. Ostfeld. "An Ecosystem Service of Biodiversity: The Protection of Human Health Against Infectious Disease." New Directions in Conservation Medicine: Applied Cases of Ecological Health, edited by A. Alonso Aguirre, Richard Ostfeld, and Peter Daszak. Oxford University Press, 2012, pp. 56–66.
- Alleyne, George A.O. "El Futuro de la Salud Public a Veterinaria en las Americas." A Quest for Equity, edited by Pan American Health Organization, 2002, pp. 508–13.
- Altherr, Sandra. "Stolen Wildlife—Why the EU Needs to Tackle Smuggling of Nationally Protected Species." Pro Wildlife. Munich, Germany (32 pp.), 2014.
- Altherr, Sandra, and Katharina Lameter. "The Rush for the Rare: Reptiles and Amphibians in the European Pet Trade." *Animals*, vol. 10, no. 11, 2020, doi.org/10.3390/ani10112085. Accessed 26 January 2023.
- Anand, Anupam, and Geeta Batra. "Programs Combating Illegal Wildlife Trade are Instrumental in Controlling and Preventing Pandemics." GEF Independent Evaluation Office (GEF IEO), 2020, eartheval.org/blog/programs-combating-illegal-wildlife-trade-are-instrumental-controlling-and-preventing-pandemics. Accessed 23 January 2023.
- Ar Gouilh, Meriadeg, Sébastien J. Puechmaille, Jean-Paul Gonzalez, Emma Teeling, Pattamaporn Kittayapong, and Jean-Claude Manuguerra. "SARS-Coronavirus Ancestor's Foot-Prints in South-East Asian Bat Colonies and the Refuge Theory." *Infection, Genetics and Evolution*, vol. 11, issue 7, 2011, pp. 1690–702.
- Arambulo, Primo. "International Programs and Veterinary Public Health in the Americas--Success, Challenges, and Possibilities." *Preventive Veterinary Medicine*, vol. 86, no. 3–4, 2008, pp. 208–215.
- Auliya, Mary, Sandra Altherr, Daniel Ariano-Sánchez, Ernst H.W. Baard, Carl Brown, Rafe M. Brown, and Thomas Ziegler, et al. "Trade in Live Reptiles, its Impact on Wild Populations, and the Role of the European Market." *Biological Conservation*, vol. 204, 2016, pp. 103–19.
- Böhm, Monika, Ben Collen, Jonathan E. M. Baillie, Philip Bowles, and Janice Chanson, et al. "The Conservation Status of the World's Reptiles." *Biological Conservation*, vol. 157, 2013, pp. 372–85, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.2012.07.015. Accessed 26 January 2023.
- Briggs, Helen. "Coronavirus: The Race to Find the Source in Wildlife." BBC News, 25 February 2020, www.bbc.com/news/science-environment-51496830. Accessed 14 December 2022.
- Brown, Gardner M., and Jason F. Shogren. "Economics of the Endangered Species Act." *The Journal of Economic Perspectives*, vol. 12, no. 3, 1998, pp. 3–20.
- Busuttil, Shaun. "The Last Resort: Turtle Conservation in Costa Rica." 2019. www.shaunbusuttil. com/stories/the-last-resort-turtle-conservation-in-costa-rica. Accessed 17 December 2022.

Carbonaro, Giulia. "Where did COVID-19 Come From? The 40-Year Gap in the Virus's Origins." *Europe*, vol. 23, no. 11, 05 December 2020, newseu.cgtn.com/news/2020-12-05/Where-did-COVID-19-come-from-The-40-year-gap-in-the-virus-s-origins-VXmYKfEpEY/index.html. Accessed 5 January 2023.

- Casas Olascoaga, Raúl, Felix Rosenberg, and V. M. Astudillo. "La Producción y la Salud Animal y sus Interrelaciones con la Salud Pública Veterinaria en América Latina y el Caribe." ["Animal Production and Animal Health and their Relationship with Veterinary Public Health in Latin America and the Caribbean"]. Revue Scientifique Et Technique, International Office of Epizootics, vol. 10, no. 4, 1992, pp. 11087–1100.
- Cattet, Michael. "Falling Through the Cracks: Shortcomings in the Collaboration Between Biologists and Veterinarians and their Consequences for Wildlife." *Institute of Laboratory Animal Resources (ILAR) Journal*, vol. 54, no. 1, 2013, pp. 33–40.
- Ceballos, Gerardo, Paul R. Ehrlich, Anthony D. Barnosky, Andres García, and Todd M. Palmer. "Accelerated Modern Human-Induced Species Losses: Entering the Sixth Mass Extinction." Scientific Advances, vol. 1, no. 1–5, 2015. Article e1400253.
- Center for Biological Diversity. "The Extinction Crisis." www.biologicaldiversity.org/programs/biodiversity/elements_of_biodiversity/extinction_crisis. Accessed 27 October 2022.
- Challender, Daniel W. S., Sarah Heinrich, Chris R. Shepherd, and Lydia K. D. Katsis. "International Trade and Trafficking in Pangolins, 1900-2019." Pangolins: Science, Society and Conservation, edited by Daniel W. S. Challender, Helen C. Nash, and Carly Waterman, Academic Press, London, 2020, pp. 259–76, doi: 10.1016/B978-0-12-815507-3.00016-2. Accessed 27 December 2022.
- Chessa, Frank. "Endangered Species and the Right to Die." *Environmental Ethics*, vol. 27, no.1, 2005, pp. 23–41, doi: 10.5840/enviroethics200527139. Accessed 23 December 2022.
- Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES).
 "Report on the Smuggling of Bahamian Rock Iguanas." Information Document SC65
 Inf. 4 for the 66th Meeting of the CITES Standing Committee, 7–11 July 2014, Geneva, Switzerland, https://typeset.io/pdf/trade-in-live-reptiles-its-impact-on-wild-populations-and-1pq7gwa68p.pdf. Accessed 30 January 2023.
- Courchamp, Frank, Elena Angulo, Philiipe Rivalan, Richard J. Hall, Laetititia Signoret, Leight Bull, and Yves Meinard. "Rarity Value and Species Extinction: The Anthropogenic Allee Effect." PLoS Biology, vol. 4, Article e415, 2006, doi:10.1371/journal.pbio.0040415. Accessed 26 January 2023.
- Davidson, Marc D. "On the Relation Between Ecosystem Services, Intrinsic Value, Existence Value and Economic Valuation." *Ecological Economics*, 95, November 2013, pp. 171–77, doi: 10.1016/j.ecolecon.2013.09.002. Accessed 6 December 2022.
- de Santiago Fernández, Laura. "El Maltrato Animal Desde un Punto de Vista Criminológico." 2013, file:///C:/Users/Admin/Downloads/Dialnet-ElMaltratoAnimalDesdeUnPuntoDeVistaCrimi nologico-5476723.pdf. Accessed 8 December 2022.
- Decaro, Nicola and Alessio Lorusso. "Novel Human Coronavirus (SARS-CoV-2): A Lesson from Animal Coronaviruses." *Veterinary Microbiology*, vol. 244, May 2020, doi.org/10.1016/j. vetmic.2020.108693. Accessed 26 April 2022.

- Donhauser, Justin. "Endangered Species and Intrinsic Value: A Virtue-Centered Approach." *Humanimalia*, vol. 10, no. 2, 2020, depauw.edu/humanimalia/issue%2020/pdfs/donhauser-smith.pdf. Accessed 26 November 2022.
- Douglas, Leo, and Kelvin Alie. "High-Value Natural Resources: Linking Wildlife Conservation to International Conflict, Insecurity, and Development Concerns." *Biological Conservation*, vol. 171, 2014, pp. 270–77, doi: 10.1016/j.biocon.2014.01.031. Accessed 26 November 2022.
- Duffy, Rosaleen, Freya A.V. St. John, Bram Büscher, and Don Brockington. "Toward a New Understanding of the Links Between Poverty and Illegal Wildlife Hunting." *Conservation Biology*, vol. 30, no. 1, February 2016, pp. 14–22, doi: 10.1111/cobi.12622. Accessed 5 January 2023.
- Ehrenberg, Felipe. "Testimonios de Latinoamérica." La Semana de Bellas Artes, vol. 42, 1978, Mail Art Chro-No-Logy, artpool.hu/MailArt/chrono/texts.html#1978. Accessed 16 January 2023.
- Fedak-Lengel, Daniella. "Neotropical Wildlife Rescue and Rehabilitation Field Research: Preliminary Findings." Presented at the Embracing Global Engagement Undergraduate and Graduate Conference, Bowling Green State University Center for Undergraduate Research and Scholarship, 16 October, 2019.
- Frutos, Roger, Jordi Serra-Cobo, Tianmu Chen, and Christian A. Devaux. "COVID-19: Time to Exonerate the Pangolin from the Transmission of SARS-CoV-2 to Humans." *Infection, Genetics and Evolution*, 84, article no. 104493, published online 5 August 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.meegid.2020.104493. Accessed 5 January 2023.
- Góngora, Victor. "Veterinary Services in Belize: Adapting Organisational Models to the Needs of Small Economies." *Revue Scientifique et Technique* (International Office of Epizootics), vol. 22, no. 2, 2003, pp. 463–71.
- Goyenechea, Alejandra, and Rosa Indenbaum. "Combating Wildlife Trafficking from Latin America to the United States." *Defenders of Wildlife Report*, 2015, www.defenders.org/sites/default/files/publications/combating-wildlife-traffickingfrom-latin-america-to-the-united-states-and-what-we-can-do-to-address-it.pdf. Accessed 28 November 2022.
- Groff, Katherine, and Mark Axelrod. "A Baseline Analysis of Transboundary Poaching Incentives in Chiquibul National Park, Belize." Conservation and Society, vol. 11, no. 3, 2013, pp. 277–90, http://www.conservationandsociety.org/article.asp?issn=09724923;year=2013;volume=11;issue=3;spage=277;epage=290;aulast=Groff. Accessed 5 November 2022.
- Hall, Richard J., E. J Milner-Gulland, and F. Courchamp. "Endangering the Endangered: The Effects of Perceived Rarity on Species Exploitation." *Conservation Letters*, vol. 1, 4 July 2008, pp. 75-81, doi: 10.1111/j.1755-263X.2008.00013.x. Accessed 17 December 2022.
- Han, Guan-Zhu. "Pangolins Harbor SARS-CoV-2-Related Coronaviruses." Trends in Microbiology, vol. 28, no, 7, 2020 July, pp. 515-17, Epub 6 April 2020, PMID: 32544437, PMCID: PMC7136945, doi: 10.1016/j.tim.2020.04.001. Accessed 8 November 2022.
- Heighton, Sean P., and Philippe Gaubert. "A Timely Systematic Review on Pangolin Research, Commercialization, and Popularization to Identify Knowledge Gaps and Produce Conservation Guidelines." Biological Conservation, vol. 256, April 2021, article 109042,

- https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.2021.109042. Accessed 25 January 2023.
- Heinrich, Sarah, Talla A. Whitman, Joshua V. Ross, Chris R. Shepherd, Daniel W.S. Challender and Phillip Cassey. "The Global Trafficking of Pangolins: A Comprehensive Summary of Seizures and Trafficking Routes from 2010-2015." *Traffic Report*, December 2017, http:// www.traffic.org/site/assets/files/1606/global-pangolin-assessment.pdf. Accessed 22 March 2022.
- Ingram, Daniel J., Lauren Coad, Katherine A. Abernethy, Fiona Maisels, Emma J. Stokes, Kadiri S. Bobo, et al. "Assessing Africa-Wide Pangolin Exploitation by Scaling Local Data." Conservation Letters, vol. 11, no. 2, 2018, e12389.
- IUCN SSC Pangolin Specialist Group. "Threats: Overexploitation." (no date), http://www.pangolinsg.org/pangolins/threats. Accessed 12 November 2022.
- Iguana Specialist Group. "Smuggled Bahamian Iguanas Found in UK." Iguana Specialist Group, 2014, https://www.iucn-isg.org/latest-news/smuggled-bahamian-iguanas-found-in-uk. Accessed 14 November 2022.
- Jansen, Ray, and Desire Dalton. "Temminck's Pangolin" In South African Animals at Risk of Extinction (no date), South African National Biodiversity Institute.
- Kassa, Saba, Claudia Baez-Camargo, Jacopo Costa, and Robert Lugolobi. "Determinants and Drivers of Wildlife Trafficking: A Qualitative Analysis in Uganda." *Journal of International Wildlife Law & Policy*, vol. 24, 2021, pp. 314–42.
- Kerr, David, and Namino Glantz. "Diabetes, Like COVID-19, is a Wicked Problem." Lancet Diabetes Endocrinology, vol. 8, no. 11, 2020, pp. 873–74, Epub 1 October 2020, PMID: 33010821, PMCID: PMC7529400, doi:10.1016/S2213-8587(20)30312-0. Accessed 5 November 2022.
- Lam, Tommy Tsan-Yuk, Marcus Ho-Hin Shum, Hua-Chen Zhu, Yi-Gang Tong, Xue-Bing Ni, Yun-Shi Liao, Wei Wei, William Yiu-Man Cheung, Wen-Juan Li, Lian-Feng Li, Gabriel M. Leung, Edward C. Holmes, Yan-Ling Hu, and Yi Guan. "Identifying SARS-CoV-2-Related Coronaviruses in Malayan Pangolins." *BioRxiv*, 13 February 2020, doi:10.1101/2020.02.13.945485, More recent publication in *Nature*, vol. 583, no. 7815, 2020 July, pp. 282–85, Epub 26 March 2020, doi:10.1038/s41586-020-2169-0. Accessed 12 November 2022.
- Lawrence, Susan V. "COVID-19 and China: A Chronology of Events" (December 2019-January 2020), report R46354, updated 13 May 2020. Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service, https://crsreports.congress.gov/product/pdf/r/r46354. Accessed 30 January 2023.
- Liu, Ping, Jing-Zhe Jiang, Xiu-Feng Wan, Yan Hua, Linmiao Li, Jiabin Zhou, Xiaohu Wang, Fanghui Hou, ing Chen, Jiejian Zou, and Jinping Chen. "Correction: Are Pangolins the Intermediate Host of the 2019 Novel Coronavirus (SARS-CoV-2)?" PLoS Pathology, vol. 16, no. 6, 9 June 2021, 9 e1009664. Erratum for: PLoS Pathology, vol. 14, no. 5, 14 May 2020, e1008421, PMID: 34106988, PMCID: PMC8189448, doi:10.1371/journal. ppat.1009664. Accessed 12 January 2023.
- Lo, Norva. "Intrinsic Values." Critical Thinking, https://philosophy.hku.hk/think/value/iv.php. Accessed 25 January 2023.
- Lu, Hongzhou, Charles W. Stratton, and Yi-Wei Tang. "Outbreak of Pneumonia of Unknown Etiology in Wuhan China: The Mystery and the Miracle." *Journal of Medical Virology*, 16

- January 2020, doi:10.1002/jmv.25678. Accessed 12 January 2023.
- Lueck, Dean, and Jeffery A. Michael. "Preemptive Habitat Destruction Under the Endangered Species Act." *The Journal of Law and Economics*, vol. XLVI, no, 1, 2003, pp. 27–60, http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/abs/10.1086/344670. Accessed 15 October 2022.
- Macdonald, David. "The Wet Market Sources of Covid-19: Bats and Pangolins Have an Alibi." University of Oxford News, 7 June 2021, https://www.ox.ac.uk/news/science-blog/wet-market-sources-covid-19-bats-and-pangolins-have-alibi. Accessed 4 January 2023.
- Maggi, Ricardo G., and Friederike Krämer. "A Review on the Occurrence of Companion Vector-Borne Diseases in Pet Animals in Latin America." *Parasites & Vectors*, vol. 12, no. 1, 2019.
- Málaga Cruz, Herman, and Pedro N. Acha Jamet. "La Función del Médico Veterinario en la Salud de la Comunidad en la América Latina" ["The Function of the Veterinary Physician in the Health of the Community in Latin America"]. Educación Médica y Salud (OPS), vol. 6, nos. 3/4, 1972 July, pp. 256–80.
- Ministry of National Planning and Economic Policy. "Costa Rica: Building a Shared Vision of Sustainable Development." Voluntary National Review of the Sustainable Development Goals, 2017 June, San José, Costa Rica: Ministry of National Planning and Economic Policy and MIDEPLAN.
- Mitchell, Meg Tyler, and Scott Pentzer. Costa Rica: A Global Studies Handbook. Santa Barbara, CA: ABC-CLIO, 2008.
- Morcatty, Thais Q., Kim Feddema, K. A. I. Nekaris, and Vincent Nijman. "Online Trade in Wildlife and the Lack of Response to COVID-19." *Environmental Research*, vol. 193, February 2021, 110439. doi:10.1016/j.envres.2020.110439. Accessed 15 January 2023.
- Nelson, S. Sunny, and Lisa Faust. "Protecting the Puerto Rican Parrot." Puerto Rican Parrot Recovery Program, Lincoln Park Zoo, 2021, https://www.lpzoo.org/science-project/protecting-the-puerto-rican-parrot. Accessed 16 January 2023.
- Van Noorloos, Femke. "Residential Tourism Causing Land Privatization and Alienation: New Pressures on Costa Rica's Coasts." Development, vol. 54, 2011, pp. 85–90.
- O'Neill, John. "The Varieties of Intrinsic Value." *The Monist*, vol. 75, no. 2, April 1992. doi:10.5840/monist19927527. Accessed 30 January 2023.
- Organizacion Panamericana de la Salud. Eliminacion de la Rabia Humana Transmitida por Perros en America Latina. Washington, DC: Programa de Salud Publica Veterinaria/OPS/OMS, 2004.
- Ortiz-Millan, Gustavo. "Bioethics, Globalization and Pandemics." *Global Bioethics*, vol. 33, no. 1, 2022, pp. 32–7, doi: 10.1080/11287462.2021.2011006. Accessed 17 January 2023.
- Pan American Health Organization. Elimination of Human Rabies Transmitted by Dogs in Latin America. Washington, DC: Veterinary Public Health Program / PAHO / WHO, 2004.
- Peery Wildlife Ecology & Conservation Lab. Sustainable Agriculture and Sloths in Costa Rica.

 Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin-Madison Department of Forest & Wildlife Ecology,
 2018, http://labs.russell.wisc.edu/peery/researchsloth-project. Accessed 17 January 2023.
- Perez, Arlenie, Chin-Ta Chuang, and Farok Afero. "Belize-Guatemala Territorial Dispute and its Implications for Conservation." *Tropical Conservation Science*, vol. 2, no. 1, 2009, pp. 11–24, doi:org/10.1177/194008290900200104. Accessed 19 January 2023.
- Petersen, Shannon. "Congress and Charismatic Megafauna: A Legislative History of the Endangered Species Act." *Environmental Law*, vol. 29, no. 2, 1999, pp. 463–91.

Pietersen, Darren W., Raymond Jansen, Jonathan Swart, Wendy Panaino, Antoinette Kotze, Paul Rankin and Bruno Nebe. "Temminck's Pangolin Smutsia Temminckii." Pangolins: Science, Society and Conservation, edited by Daniel W. S. Challender, Helen C. Nash, and Carly Waterman, Academic Press, London, 2020, pp. 175–93, doi: 10.1016/B978-0-12-815507-3.00016-2. Accessed 27 December 2022.

- Presidencia de la República de Costa Rica y Desarrollado por el Ministerio de Comunicaciónm[Presidency of the Republic of Costa Rica and Developed by the Ministry of Communication]. "Gobierno Celebra que Ley de Bienestar Animal ya Sea una Realidad para Costa Rica" ["Government Celebrates that the Animal Welfare Law is Already a Reality for Costa Rica], 2019, https://www.presidencia.go.cr/comunicados/2017/06/gobierno-celebra-que-ley-de-bienestar-animal-ya-sea-una-realidad-para-costa-rica. Accessed 30 December 2022.
- Rizzolo, Jessica Bell, Meredith L. Gore, Jonah Ratsimbazafy, and Andry Rajaonson. "Cultural Influences on Attitudes about the Causes and Consequences of Wildlife Poaching." *Crime Law and Social Change*, vol. 67, no. 4, 2017, pp. 415–37. SI, 4150437.
- Roberts, David L., and Julio Hernandez-Castro. "Bycatch and Illegal Wildlife Trade on the Dark Web." *Oryx*, vol. 51, no. 3, 2017, pp. 393–94, doi:10.1017/S0030605317000679. Accessed 18 January 2023.
- Rolston, Holmes. "Our Duties to Endangered Species." Mountain Scholar Home, Colorado State University Libraries, Fort Collins, Colorado, 1994, http://hdl.handle.net/10217/40514. Accessed 22 January 2023.
- Rosales, Sharo. "Análisis De La Violencia Machista Contra Las Mascotas. Sobre Un Gato Cobardemente Asesinado." informa-TICO, 5 August 2020, https://www.informa-tico.com/5-08-2020/gato-cobardemente-asesinado. Accessed 30 January 2023.
- Russow, Lilly-Marlene. "Why Do Species Matter?" Environmental Ethics, vol. 3, no. 2, 1981, doi:10.5840/enviroethics19813248. Accessed 15 January 2023.
- RUSVM. "Ross University School of Veterinary Medicine (St. Kitts & Nevis, Caribbean)

 Hosts ACACPMT Congress Addressing Tropical Diseases and Disaster Management."

 Business Wire, 2019, http://search.ebscohost.com.ezproxy.bgsu.edu/login.

 aspx?direct=true&db=bwh&AN=bizwire.bw6256543&site=ehost-live&scope=site.

 Accessed 5 January 2023.
- Sandler, Ronald. "Intrinsic Value, Ecology, and Conservation." Nature Education Knowledge, vol. 3, no. 10, article 4, 2012, www.nature.com/scitable/knowledge/library/intrinsic-value-ecology-and-conservation-25815400. Accessed 18 January 2023.
- Sandler, Ronald. "The Value of Species and the Ethical Foundations of Assisted Colonization." Society for Conservation Biology, vol. 10, no. 11, 2009.
- Sandler, Ronald. "The Ethics of Genetic Engineering and Gene Drives in Conservation." Conservation Biology: The Journal of the Society for Conservation Biology, vol. 34, no. 2, 2019, pp. 378–85, https://doi.org/10.1111/cobi.13407. Accessed 30 January 2023.
- Schneider, Maria Cristina, Maria Cristina Tirado, Shruthi Rereddy, Raymond Dugas, Maria Isabel Borda, Eduardo Alvarez Peralta, Sylvain Aldighieri, and Ottorino Cosivi. "Natural Disasters and Communicable Diseases in the Americas: Contribution of Veterinary Public Health."

- Veterinaria Italiana, vol. 48, no. 2, 2012, pp. 193-218.
- Schulte, Judith. "Working through Wicked Problems: Coronavirus and Implications for the Future." *Climate Focus*, 30 May 2020, www.climatefocus.com/blog/working-through-wicked-problems-coronavirus-and-implications-future. Accessed 10 January 2023.
- Scott, J. Michael, Dale D. Goble, and Frank W. Davis. "Introduction." *The Endangered Species Act at Thirty*, edited by J. Michael Scott, Dale D. Goble, and Frank W. Davis, Washington, DC: Island Press, 2005, pp. 3-15.
- Smith, Ian A. Intrinsic Value of Endangered Species. London: Routledge, 2018.
- Steele, James H. "Veterinary Survey in Mexico, Central America and Colombia: A Summary." Boletin De La Oficina Sanitaria Panamericana [Pan American Sanitary Bureau], vol. 25, no. 9, 1946, pp. 810–19, https://iris.paho.org/handle/10665.2/15024. Accessed 15 January 2023.
- Sund, Louise, and Johan Öhman. "Swedish Teachers' Ethical Reflections on a Study Visit to Central America." *Journal of Moral Education*, vol. 43, no. 3, 2014, pp. 316–31.
- Taylor, Martin, Kieran F. Suckling, and Jeffrey J. Rachlinski. "Effectiveness of the Endangered Species Act: A Quantitative Analysis." *BioScience*, vol. 55, no. 4, April 2005, pp. 360–67. https://doi.org/10.1641/0006-3568(2005)055[0360:TEOTES]2.0.CO;2. Accessed 16 January 2023.
- Thomas-Walters, Laura, Diogo Veríssimo, Erica Gadsby, David Roberts, and Robert J Smith. "Taking a More Nuanced Look at Behavior Change for Demand Reduction in the Illegal Wildlife Trade." *Conservation Science and Practice*, vol. 2, no. 9, 2020, Article e248.
- Rodriguez Goyes, David, and Ragnhild Sollund. "Animal Abuse, Biotechnology and Species Justice." *Theoretical Criminology*, vol. 22, no. 3, 2018, pp. 363–83, https://doi.org/10.1177/1362480618787179. Accessed 16 January 2023.
- Troumbis, Andreas Y., Spyridon Iosifidis, and Chrsitos Kalloniatis. "Uncovering Patterns of Public Perceptions Towards Biodiversity Crime Using Conservation Culturomics." *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 2022, doi:10.1007/s10611-022-10028-z. Accessed 18 January 2023.
- Troumbis, Andreas Y., and Yiannis Zevgolis. "Biodiversity Crime and Economic Crisis: Hidden Mechanisms of Misuse of Ecosystem Goods in Greece." *Land Use Policy,* vol. 99, December 2020, 105061, doi:10.1016/j.landusepol.2020.105061. Accessed 18 January 2023.
- United Nations. "Costa Rica: Taking Action for Sustainable Development." 2016. San Jose, Costa Rica: United Nations in partnership with the Minister of National Planning and Economic Policy of Costa Rica.
- Valero, Liz. "Costa Rica. Ley Contra el Maltrato Animal ¿Cómo Denunciar? [Law Against Animal Abuse, How to Report?]" *AnimaNaturalis*, 2017, https://www.animanaturalis.org/p/1705/costa-rica-ley-contra-el-maltrato-animal-como-denunciar. Accessed 18 January 2023.
- Weszler, Andrew E. "The Ethical Underpinnings of the Endangered Species Act." *Virginia Environmental Law Journal*, vol. 145, 1994, www.velj.org/the-ethical-underpinnings-of-the-endangered-species-act.html. Accessed 18 January 2023.
- Wildlife Conservation Program (WCP). "About the Wildlife Conservation Program." https://forest.gov.bz/programs/wildlife-management. Accessed 18 January 2023.
- Wilcove, David S., David Rothstein, Jason Dubow, Ali Phillips, and Elizabeth Losos. "Quantifying

Threats to Imperiled Species in the United States: Assessing the Relative Importance of Habitat Destruction, Alien Species, Pollution, Overexploitation, and Disease." *BioScience*, vol. 48, 1993, pp. 607–15.

- Wright, Joss. Darknet Usage in the Illegal Wildlife Trade: Tools and Guidance. Oxford Martin Programme on the Illegal Wildlife Trade, University of Oxford, 2019, doi:10.31235/osf.io/ fgr9d. Accessed 5 December 2022.
- Wu, Fan, Su Zhao, Bin Yu, Chen Yan-Mei, Wen Wang, W., and Zhi-Gang Song, et al. "A New Coronavirus Associated with Human Respiratory Disease in China' (Originally published as "Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 Isolate Wuhan-Hu-1, Complete Genome"). Nature, vol. 579, no. 7798, 2020, pp. 265–69. Accessed 11 December 2022.
- Xiao, Kangpeng, Junqiong Zhai, Yaoyu Feng, Niu Zhou, and Yongyi Shen, et al. "Isolation of SARS-CoV-2-Related Coronavirus from Malayan Pangolins." *Nature*, vol. 583, no. 7815, 2020 July, pp. 286–89, Epub 2020 May 7, Erratum in: *Nature*, vol. 600, no. 7887, 2021 December, E8-E10, PMID: 32380510, doi: 10.1038/s41586-020-2313-x. Accessed 28 December 2022.
- Xiao, Xiao, Chris Newman, Christina D. Buesching, David W. Macdonald, and Zhao-Min Zhou. "Animal Sales from Wuhan Wet Markets Immediately Prior to the COVID-19 Pandemic." Scientific Reports, vol. 11, article no. 11898, 7 June 2021, https://www.nature.com/articles/s41598-021-91470-2. Accessed 30 January 2023.
- Zhang, Zheng, Timothy C. Bonebrake, Shuang Xing, Caroline Dingle, Iris Ho, and Astrid A. Andersson. "Low Pangolin Consumption in Hong Kong Pre- and Post- the COVID-19 Outbreak: Conservation and Health Concerns Both Contribute to People's Attitudes." Global Ecology and Conservation, vol. 35, June 2022, e02107, doi:10.1016/j.gecco.2022. e02107. Accessed 16 January 2023.