



# University of Dundee

# Breaking free from the crystal lattice

Haubrich, Kevin; Spiteri, Valentina; Farnaby, William; Sobott, Frank; Ciulli, Alessio

Published in: Current Opinion in Structural Biology

DOI: 10.1016/j.sbi.2023.102534

Publication date: 2023

Licence: CC BY

Document Version Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Link to publication in Discovery Research Portal

*Citation for published version (APA):* Haubrich, K., Spiteri, V., Farnaby, W., Sobott, F., & Ciulli, A. (2023). Breaking free from the crystal lattice: Structural biology in solution to study protein degraders. *Current Opinion in Structural Biology*, *79*, [102534]. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbi.2023.102534

#### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in Discovery Research Portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from Discovery Research Portal for the purpose of private study or research.

- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain.
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal.

#### Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



Available online at www.sciencedirect.com

**ScienceDirect** 

# Breaking free from the crystal lattice: Structural biology in solution to study protein degraders



Kevin Haubrich<sup>1,a</sup>, Valentina A. Spiteri<sup>1,a</sup>, William Farnaby<sup>1</sup>, Frank Sobott<sup>2</sup> and Alessio Ciulli<sup>1</sup>

#### Abstract

Structural biology offers a versatile arsenal of techniques and methods to investigate the structure and conformational dynamics of proteins and their assemblies. The growing field of targeted protein degradation centres on the premise of developing small molecules, termed degraders, to induce proximity between an E3 ligase and a protein of interest to be signalled for degradation. This new drug modality brings with it new opportunities and challenges to structural biologists. Here we discuss how several structural biology techniques, including nuclear magnetic resonance, cryo-electron microscopy, structural mass spectrometry and small angle scattering, have been explored to complement X-ray crystallography in studying degraders and their ternary complexes. Together the studies covered in this review make a case for the invaluable perspectives that integrative structural biology techniques in solution can bring to understanding ternary complexes and designing degraders.

#### Addresses

<sup>1</sup> Centre for Targeted Protein Degradation & Division of Biological Chemistry and Drug Discovery, School of Life Sciences, University of Dundee, Dundee, UK

<sup>2</sup> School of Molecular and Cellular Biology & Astbury Centre for Structural Molecular Biology, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK

Corresponding author: Ciulli, Alessio (a.ciulli@dundee.ac.uk)

(Haubrich K.),
(Spiteri V.A.),
(Farnaby W.),
(Sobott F.),

(Ciulli A.)

<sup>a</sup> These authors contributed equally.

#### Current Opinion in Structural Biology 2023, 79:102534

This review comes from a themed issue on New Concepts in Drug Discovery (2023)

Edited by Andrew R. Leach and Alison E. Ondrus

For a complete overview see the Issue and the Editorial

Available online xxx

#### https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbi.2023.102534

0959-440X/© 2023 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons. org/licenses/by/4.0/).

# Introduction

Small-molecule degraders such as Proteolysis targeting chimeras (PROTACs) and molecular glues work by forming a ternary complex with an E3 ligase and a neosubstrate. Within such complexes, degraders either introduce de novo, or stabilize existing transient, protein-protein interactions (PPIs). This results in targeted ubiquitination and subsequent degradation of the neo-substrate (Figure 1) [1-3]. Designing drugs with the guidance of structural data has been the mainstay of pharmaceutical research for decades, with crystal structures offering a "view" into how to rationally design and optimise compounds. Targeted protein degradation (TPD) presents new challenges and opportunities for structure-based drug design, as it necessitates a departure from solely optimising binary protein/ligand interactions and requires additional insights into the ternary complex structure, dynamics and PPIs [4].

While protein interactions and protein complexes have been studied by the established structural techniques of X-ray crystallography and cryo-Electron Microscopy (EM), these studies can be limited to more stable systems and made more challenging due to the often dynamic nature of PPIs, both in terms of the lifetime of the complex as well as conformational flexibility [5,6]. This is especially problematic for ternary complexes induced by degraders, as they may involve weak, transient interactions that get enhanced by the forced proximity of the proteins. Nevertheless, key studies successfully demonstrated structure-based have PROTAC design driven by high resolution ternary structures solved by X-ray crystallography [4,7-9]. A potential limitation of using static X-ray structures to describe dynamic systems is that crystals can act as a filter that capture a single state, from an ensemble of states that exist in solution. This homogeneity is important for solving high resolution crystal structures, where conformationally heterogeneous parts of a structure do not yield interpretable electron density. However, it can be difficult to ascertain whether the crystallisable conformer fully reflects the dominant or





PROTACs and molecular glues: (a) Structures of a typical PROTAC (MZ1) and molecular glue (thalidomide). PROTACs are bivalent degraders featuring a separate E3 ligase binding and protein of interest binding moiety, while glues are monovalent binders. (b) Both types of degraders share a similar mechanism of degradation where the degrader induces the formation of a ternary complex between E3 ligase and protein of interest, which then leads to ubiquitination and proteasomal degradation of the POI. However, the two degraders differ in the mode of ternary complex formation, as glues have no detectable affinity to one of the proteins, meaning only one binary complex can form as an intermediate (c). PROTACs have binary affinities to both proteins, so that two different binary complexes exist in equilibrium with the ternary complex (d).

functional conformation(s) in solution [10,11]. This caveat is supported by recent molecular dynamics simulations, which showed that the conformational landscape of degrader ternary complexes may be much more diverse than the poses observed in crystal structures [10,12]. This can lead to cases where the crystal structures of ternary complexes with different degraders bound may appear very similar, but their global attributes, including both binding affinities [11] and functional consequences to missense surface mutations [13] can differ significantly.

To shine a light on what is unseen in crystal structures, orthogonal techniques should be explored to study the structure and conformational heterogeneity of macromolecular complexes in solution. Several alternative techniques have been employed to investigate transient and dynamic interactions across different fields, most

notably in the study of protein/RNA complexes [14–18]. These techniques include nuclear magnetic resonance spectroscopy (NMR), small angle scattering (SAXS) and structural mass spectrometry (MS). Individually, these techniques have their own limitations that may either render them unable to provide data of comparable atomic resolution to crystallography or cryo-EM, or restrict the size of system under study, Nonetheless, the techniques complement X-ray and cryo-EM as well as each other, and offer an integrative approach that can facilitate insights into the structure and dynamics of protein complexes. The purpose of this review is therefore to highlight the use of these techniques in the field of targeted protein degradation and make a case for the wider use of solution structural methods and integrative structural biology, as complementary approaches to crystallography for the study of ternary complexes.

## Nuclear magnetic resonance spectroscopy

NMR is the only solution technique capable of delivering atomic resolution structures [19]. Despite this, very few NMR studies of ternary complexes have been reported and NMR studies on PROTACs and molecular glues to date are largely limited to ligand-observed studies. Structural studies by NMR have recently given unique insights into the 'chameleonicity" of PROTACs, rationalising how PROTACs remain cell permeable despite their high molecular weight and bifunctional nature made of two binding ligands joined by a linker. Nuclear Overhauser Effect Spectroscopy (NOESY) based structural ensembles of PROTACs, in chloroform or water/ DMSO mixtures to mimic the hydrophobicity of different environments in the cytosol and cell membranes, demonstrated that some PROTACs can fold by stacking their ligase and neo-substrate binding moieties on top of each other, thereby shielding hydrophilic regions and allowing the PROTAC to cross cell membranes [20]. NMR is well-established as an extremely sensitive technique to detect even transient protein/ligand interactions. <sup>1</sup>H saturation transfer difference (STD) NMR was used to confirm the weak interaction of the molecular glue indisulam with the E3 ligase substrate receptor DCAF15 in the absence of a neo-substrate [21]. Competitive NMR with a <sup>19</sup>F-labelled probe was used to estimate affinities and cooperativity of ternary complex formation for VHL/Bromodomain recruiting and VHLhomodimerising PROTACs [22].

To our knowledge, the only study to date employing protein NMR on PROTAC-induced ternary complexes used <sup>1</sup>H/<sup>15</sup>N-HSQCs to investigate proximity induced PPIs in PROTAC-ternary complexes and relate to cooperativity [23]. This study looked at cIAP1-based BTK degraders that showed multiple poses in the crystal structure, each with limited contacts between the proteins. While constraints and contacts within the crystal lattice could have influenced or enforced the

state observed in the crystal, <sup>1</sup>H/<sup>15</sup>N-HSQC spectra of cIAP1<sup>Bir3</sup> in the ternary complex overlayed well with that of the binary cIAP1<sup>Bir3</sup>/degrader complex, consistent with no stable PPIs forming in solution. However, diffusion observed NMR (DOSY) still confirmed the formation of a ternary complex through an increase in the diffusion coefficient.

More studies of ternary complexes have likely been prevented by the size limitations of protein-observed NMR, historically making NMR studies of complexes exceeding 35 kDa difficult due to excessive line broadening and spectral crowding. However, over the past 20 years technical innovations such as Transverse relaxation optimized spectroscopy (TROSY), selective labelling and structure calculations relying on long distance restraints such as paramagnetic relaxation enhancement (PREs), pseudocontact shifts (PCS) or residual dipolar coupling (RDCs) rather than NOESYs have allowed NMR to largely overcome these limitations [16,24–26]. To date the largest protein structures solved *de novo* by NMR exceed 80 kDa (e.g., malate synthase G or Translocase Motor SecA) [27,28] and it has been shown to be capable of studying protein/protein interfaces and dynamics of complexes several hundred kilodaltons in size (e.g., 390 kDa RNP complex box C/D or even the 20S proteasome) [15,29]. This brings even the largest ternary complexes in range of NMR studies.

NMR could be useful in the TPD field to map or validate weak PPIs in solution using e.g., cross-saturation experiments or chemical shift perturbations in SEA-TROSYs even for large complexes [30,31]. Most NMR techniques require stable isotope labelling (most commonly <sup>15</sup>N, <sup>13</sup>C, <sup>2</sup>H), which can be costly and difficult to achieve in some expression systems. However, the reliance on specific labelling patterns also allows for detailed studies of specific, selectively labelled subcomponents in the context of the full complex, giving NMR unique capabilities for structural studies. For example, it would be possible to study the conformational ensemble of a PROTAC in the presence of its interacting proteins, if these are masked by deuteration, and thereby gaining insights into conformational selection upon complex formation.

# Structural mass spectrometry

Structural mass spectrometry (MS) refers to a collection of MS techniques that provide information on the higher-order structure of proteins and their complexes [32]. Native MS approaches including ion-mobility (IM)-MS are used to characterize stoichiometry, size, shape, and distribution of conformations and interactions (while retaining the native structure of the protein/protein complexes, by gentle ionisation methods such as nano-electrospray. On the other hand, labelling techniques such as hydrogen-deuterium exchange (HDX)-MS take advantage of the rapid exchange of deuterium with solvent exposed amide hydrogens in deuterated buffer. The exchange is then quenched, the protein rapidly digested and the peptides are analysed by MS. Mass analysis is used to determine increased mass due to deuterium uptake. For structural interpretation the peptides are mapped on a threedimensional model.

Several studies have investigated degrader ternary complexes by MS. The first of these studies by Zorba et al. (2018) focused on understanding the role of cooperativity in cereblon-recruiting degraders targeting BTK [33]. The study utilised HDX-MS and despite comprehensive experiments, Zorba et al. were not able to identify any interacting residues. This may have been due to the use of a truncated cereblon construct [33]. Later, a study by Eron et al. (2021) utilised a longer cereblon construct (only missing Nterminal residues 1-39) and demonstrated that the BRD4 (BD1) degrader CFT-1297 was able to induce HDX-MS protection of several residues at the BD1cereblon interface, which corresponds to its binding site [34]. However, in a similar experiment with a different degrader, dBET6, HDX-MS protection at the same interface could not be detected, suggesting a lack of stable, highly populated ternary complex interfaces found in solution in this case. Both studies focussed on cereblon and suggest a more complex conformational landscape for cereblon-recruiting degraders. Indeed, Watson et al. (2022) recently used HDX-MS and cryo-EM to investigate the allosteric effect of molecular glue binding to cereblon that results in a "closed" versus "open" conformation of cereblon. They found that the addition of the ligand resulted in reduced solvent exposure, relative to the apo state, at the interface of the Lon and the thalidomide binding domain (TBD), consistent with a transition from an open to a closed conformation. A dramatic change in protection was observed at the "sensor loop" in the TBD. This data, together with extensive cryo-EM structural investigations (vide infra), shone light into an allosteric mechanism by which ligand binding induces the sensor loop to detach from the helical bundle in cereblon and adopt an upright beta-hairpin arrangement. The detachment allows the TBD to become untethered and interact with the Lon domain of cereblon, resulting in the closed conformation that favours neo-substrate recruitment.

In another study, Dixon et al. (2022) [11] used HDX-MS with VHL-recruiting PROTAC degraders of SMARCA2/4 to show clear and significant protection of residues at the protein-protein interface, consistent with previously determined ternary complex cocrystal structures [7]. This HDX-MS data was fed into *in silico* docking studies and improved the ability to predict ternary complexes, demonstrating the utility of this method for enriching computational techniques [11]. In a departure from HDX-MS, Beveridge et al. (2020) showed that native mass spectrometry can effectively predict degrader efficacy [35]. A clear correlation was observed between a higher fraction of ternary complex observed in the MS spectra and favourable thermodynamic and kinetic parameters such as increased cooperativity and longer half-lives of the ternary complex, as determined in a previous study using surface-plasmon resonance (SPR) and fluorescence polarization (FP) binding assays [36]. In their study, Beveridge et al. focussed predominantly on the well-characterised BRD:MZ1/AT1:VCB systems [4,36] (Figure 1a). It would be interesting to uncover if similar correlations could be observed using native-MS for other systems. Finally, a study by Song et al. (2021) used ionmobility MS to show that BRD4:MZ1:VCB was able to populate a distribution of several distinct conformations [37], some of which had not been observed crystallographically [4]. Ion mobility resolves conformational states as ions travel through the drift tube, with more compact structures travelling faster than those with a larger crosssectional area. Moreover, the study employed gas-phase fragmentation methods such as collision induced dissociation (CID) and electron capture dissociation (ECD) to allow for the mapping of ligand interaction sites. Using CID, it was observed that the more compact ternary complexes have protein-protein interactions that allow a binary VCB:BRD4 complex to persist when MZ1 is eliminated. This implies the significance of those PPIs in stabilising the ternary complexes. It should be noted that the VCB:BRD4 binary complexes have not been observed in solution in the absence of MZ1 [4].

Together these articles demonstrate how structural MS techniques can augment our understanding of ternary complexes and provide information on the whole conformational landscape (via IM-MS). Through HDX-MS we can gather information on the protein-protein interface which can help us understand systems that suffer from an absence of X-ray/EM data.

### Small angle X-ray scattering

Small Angle X-ray scattering (SAXS) is a highthroughput, in solution technique that requires minimal sample preparation after the protein has been purified, with most physiologically relevant buffers being suitable. SAXS is one of the few techniques that can be used to examine highly flexible proteins and for systems within a wide range of sizes 1-1000 nm [38]. Moreover, where sample availability may be limiting, a good scattering curve can be obtained from dilute solutions. The main caveat for SAXS is that the data obtained is low resolution and often needs to be supplemented by data obtained via higher resolution methods, e.g., existing structures of sub-complexes. It can also be challenging to interpret heterogeneous distributions unless there is prior knowledge of the system. So far, this technique has not been widely exploited by the TPD community, however its use can augment in silico searches as

# Table 1

Technique	Resolution	Feasible system size limits	Is Flexibility an issue?	Protein requirements	Advantages	Disadvantages	References
X-ray Crystallography	Atomistic/high	Limited by flexibility	Yes	Moderate-high	Atomistic resolution allows protein-ligand and protein-protein interactions to be scrutinised. High throughput due to high degree of automatization Accessible to non-experts Still the gold standard for binary protein/ligand interactions and rigid systems	Crystallisation of the system is dependent on favourable crystal contacts that filter for a single conformation. Ternary complexes with inherent flexibility and/or lower cooperativity may be difficult to crystalise.	[4,7,10,62]
NMR	Atomistic/high	Up to 40 kDa for atomic resolution experiments. Up to 1 MDa with TROSY experiments and selective labelling.	No	Moderate-high	Atomistic resolution in solution that allows for the observation of dynamics. Gives insight to PROTAC conformations. Can map/ validate weak PPI. Labelling allows for the selective analysis of particular components in the system.	Isotope labelling can be challenging and expensive. Atomistic resolution can be challenging to achieve for big complexes. Low throughput for structure elucidation	[20–23]
Сгуо-ЕМ	Atomistic/high- moderate	38 kDa (theoretical) -5 MDa	Potentially makes data analysis complicated	Low	Can achieve good resolution on large protein complexes.	<ul> <li>Sample and grid optimisation can be challenging.</li> <li>High resolution for larger complexes may be difficult to achieve without crossing linking.</li> <li>Low contrast for small proteins.</li> <li>Heterogeneous conformer populations can be hard to interpret due to data being averaged.</li> </ul>	[21,44]
					Resolves conformational and constitutional heterogeneity	Low throughput	
SAXS	Low	1–1000 nm	No	Low	High throughput and can use most physiologically relevant buffers. Good scattering curve can also be obtained for dilute samples.	Resolution is low and may need to be supplemented by higher resolution data or other data on the system to help interpretation.	[11]

(continued on next page)

Current Opinion in Structural Biology 2023, 79:102534

www.sciencedirect.com

TechniqueResolutionFeasible system sizeIs Flexibility an issue?Protein requirementsAdvantagesDisadvantagesMative MS and IN- mSLow, collision100 Da - MDaNoLowNative MS gives informationOver resolutionMative MS and IN- mSDivision100 Da - MDaNoLowNative MS gives informationOver resolutionMative MS and IN- mSDivision100 Da - MDaNoLowNative MS gives informationOver resolutionMative MSDivisionIntersolutionOver the proportion of financy to termary species in the sample.Nondersate sample.Nondersate sample.DivisionHDX-MSModerate beptide level)LowLowLowConformers in the sample.Division of conformers in the sample.HDX-MSModerate beptide level)LowLowLowConformers in the complexes to residues in the complexes to residues in the complexes to residue sin the scharange of the time scale of the teneration.	Table 1. (continued)							
Native MS and IM- only         Low, collision cross-section         100 Da - MDa         No         Low         Native MS gives information on the proportion of binary to ternary species in the sample.         Very low resolution           only         only         to an the proportion of binary to ternary species in the sample.         Very low resolution           Analysis         No         No         Low, consistent the sample.         No           Analysis         No         Low         Low resolution of conformers in the sample.         Low resolution. Blind to residues in the complexes           HDX-MS         Moderate         Large systems will make usually         No         Low         Correction. Blind to residues in the complexes           HDX-MS         Insulty         analysis challenging.         Low         Correction. Blind to residues in the complexes         residues that show either protein and protein-ligand           HDX-MS         Insulty         Tow resolution.         complexes or no protein and protein-ligand         resolutes resultor or no protein and protein-ligand	Technique	Resolution	Feasible system size limits	Is Flexibility an issue?	Protein requirements	Advantages	Disadvantages	References
HDX-MS Moderate Large systems will make No Low Gives insight into which Low resolution. Blind to (usually analysis challenging. residues in the complexes residues that show either are implicated in protein- and protein and	Native MS and IM- MS	Low, collision cross-section only	100 Da - MDa	Ŷ	Low	Native MS gives information on the proportion of binary to ternary species in the sample. IM-MS provides further insight into the number and proportion of	Very low resolution	[35,37]
	SM-XOH	Moderate (usually peptide level)	Large systems will make analysis challenging.	2	Low	contormers in the sample. Gives insight into which residues in the complexes are implicated in protein- protein and protein-ligand interactions.	Low resolution. Blind to residues that show either complete exchange or no exchange at all on the time scale of the experiment	[11,33,34,44]

demonstrated by Dixon et al. (2022) [11]. In this study, SAXS data was used to validate molecular dynamics derived conformational ensembles of SMARCA2/ 4:ACBI1:VHL ternary complexes [7] by producing theoretical SAXS curves for each conformer in the ensemble. Additionally, it was recently shown that SAXS can be used as a structural screening tool, as SAXS is sensitive to changes in size and shape that allows for estimation of the relative proportion of ternary complex in solution and classification based on structural similarity [39]. We believe that there is significant scope for SAXS to be utilised to screen for ternary complexes in TPD due to its high-throughput and structural sensitivity.

### Cryo-electron microscopy

Although not a true solution technique as it relies on capturing the sample in a layer of vitrified ice, cryo-EM shares many of the desired properties of these techniques and crucially, unlike crystallography, retains information about conformational heterogeneity in solution. In addition, due to recent technological advancements it is now capable of delivering near atomicresolution structures of comparable quality to crystallography for systems of sufficient size [40-42]. In the TPD field, these capabilities have been used to obtain a 3.5 Å structure of the ternary complex of DDB1-DCAF15 and RBM39, induced by the molecular glue indisulam [21]. Another study published around the same time reported a 4.4 Å cryo-EM map of the DDB1-DCAF15/ RBM39 complex induced by the glue E7820, however the resolution of the cryo-EM maps were insufficient to reliably interpret E7820 binding, and required a separate co-crystal structure of DDB1-DCAF15:E7820:RBM39 to build an unambiguous model of the ternary complex [43]. Recently, a series of crvo-EM structures using iterative heterogeneous classification gave new insights into the conformational dynamics of cereblon apo-form and in the presence of molecular glues [44]. This highlights the ability of cryo-EM to resolve heterogeneous conformations in solution while maintaining high resolution, allowing for insights into heterogenous systems unobtainable by crystallography. For now, these additional capabilities come with increased costs in terms of the necessary equipment, expertise, and experiment time, as cryo-EM has not yet reached the level of automation, throughput and convenience found in crystallography. A significant factor here is that cryo-EM still suffers from limitations due to charge and surface effects, preferred particle orientations and the need for classification and averaging, all of which require careful and timeconsuming optimisation of the sample preparation and typically limit its applicability to complexes of considerable size and limited flexibility [45].

#### Bringing it all together in silico

Structural biology has long benefitted and will continue to advance from being able to model protein systems *in* 

silico. The potential impact of combining in silico modelling with experimental methods is more significant when it comes to solution structural biology techniques. These techniques often suffer from limited information content and may require combining multiple approaches [46]. This has led to the development of software packages for integrative modelling such as the Integrative Modeling Platform (IMP) or HADDOCK, that allow for refinement of structural models against sparse restraints obtained from diverse methods, including shape and distance restraints as well as interaction surfaces [47,48]. Although the TPD community has already shown an enthusiastic interest in utilising computational methods to develop a better understanding of the degrader's mode of action, and to create theoretical/predictive models to design more effectively potent and faster degraders, it has only started to recognize the power of integrative modelling [11,12,49-52].

# Conclusion

The ability to reliably generate high-resolution data with X-ray crystallography to rationally design drugs has revolutionized our methods to discover and optimize drug molecules. This has been possible due to the efforts of the X-ray crystallography community in developing tools ranging from automated pipelines for crystallization, data collection and processing to model building and data curation and visualisation. These not only allow for high-throughput structure determination, but also make crystallography accessible to the nonexpert [53-56]. Currently no other structural biology technique offers a comparable user experience, except for SAXS that benefits from highly automated beamlines, software pipelines and public repositories [57–59]. Although SAXS and alternative techniques can generate a wealth of information, analysis and interpretation of the data typically requires expert knowledge. From being able to solve high-resolution structures of multi-subunit complexes with cryo-EM, studying transient interactions by NMR or HDX-MS and characterizing conformational heterogeneity of proteins with native ion mobility mass spectrometry, these solution-based structural biology techniques offer unique insights into dynamic systems and transient interactions that may be invisible to X-ray crystallography (Table 1). However, for these techniques to be impactful continued efforts are necessary to make them more accessible to a non-expert user, increase throughput and allow for easy visualisation and interpretation of results. This is all the more true as these techniques are best used as part of an integrative approach that balances the strengths and weaknesses of different techniques and leverages previous knowledge through in silico modelling. While this review focused on techniques that have so far been successfully used in the TPD field, additional techniques are available that can be utilised as part of an integrative approach or to answer specific questions. For example small-angle neutron scattering (SANS) using contrast matching could be useful to study the position and conformation of individual subunits in the context of a larger complex [60]. Electron paramagnetic resonance (EPR)-based techniques such as DEER or RIDME measure the distance distribution between two paramagnetic labels and can thereby give direct insight into the conformational heterogeneity of a complex [61]. As the field grows it will be interesting to see methods for studying the structure and dynamics of ternary complexes evolve.

# **Declaration of competing interest**

The Ciulli laboratory receives or has received sponsored research support from Almirall, Amgen, Amphista Therapeutics, Boehringer Ingelheim, Eisai, Merck KGaA, Nurix Therapeutics, Ono Pharmaceutical and Tocris-Biotechne. A.C. is a scientific founder, shareholder, and advisor of Amphista Therapeutics, a company that is developing targeted protein degradation therapeutic platforms.

# Data availability

No data was used for the research described in the article.

# Acknowledgements

Research in the Ciulli laboratory on targeted protein degraders and PROTACs receives or has received funding from the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007-2013) as a Starting Grant (grant agreement No. ERC-2012-StG-311460 DrugE3CRLs to A.C.), and the Innovative Medicines Initiative 2 (IMI2) Joint Undertaking under grant agreement no. 875510 (EUbOPEN project). The IMI2 Join Undertaking receives support from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme, EFPIA companies and Associated Partners: KTH, OICR, Diamond and McGill.

### References

Papers of particular interest, published within the period of review, have been highlighted as:

- \* of special interest
- \*\* of outstanding interest
- 1. Cao S, Kang S, Mao H, Yao J, Gu L, Zheng N: Defining molecular glues with a dual-nanobody cannabidiol sensor. *Nat Commun* 2022, 13:815.
- 2. Maniaci C, Ciulli A: Bifunctional chemical probes inducing protein–protein interactions. *Curr Opin Chem Biol* 2019, **52**: 145–156.
- Pettersson M, Crews CM: PROteolysis TArgeting Chimeras (PROTACs) — past, present and future. Drug Discov Today Technol 2019, 31:15–27.
- Gadd MS, Testa A, Lucas X, Chan K-H, Chen W, Lamont DJ, Zengerle M, Ciulli A: Structural basis of PROTAC cooperative recognition for selective protein degradation. Nat Chem Biol 2017, 13:514–521.
- Deller MC, Rupp B: Crystallisation of Proteins and Macromolecular Complexes: Past, Present and Future. In *eLS*. Edited by. https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470015902.a0002718.pub2.
- 6. Glaeser RM: How good can cryo-EM become? Nat Methods 2016, 13:28–32.

- Farnaby W, Koegl M, Roy MJ, Whitworth C, Diers E, Trainor N, Zollman D, Steurer S, Karolyi-Oezguer J, Riedmueller C, et al.: BAF complex vulnerabilities in cancer demonstrated via structurebased PROTAC design. Nat Chem Biol 2019, 15:672–680.
- Testa A, Hughes SJ, Lucas X, Wright JE, Ciulli A: Structurebased design of a macrocyclic PROTAC. Angew Chem Int Ed Engl 2020, 59:1727–1734.
- Kofink C, Trainor N, Mair B, Wöhrle S, Wurm M, Mischerikow N, Bader G, Rumpel K, Gerstberger T, Cui Y, et al.: A selective and orally bioavailable VHL-recruiting PROTAC achieves SMARCA2 degradation in vivo. Nat Commun 2022, 13:5969.
- Nowak RP, DeAngelo SL, Buckley D, He Z, Donovan KA, An J, Safaee N, Jedrychowski MP, Ponthier CM, Ishoey M, et al.: Plasticity in binding confers selectivity in ligand-induced protein degradation. Nat Chem Biol 2018, 14:706–714.
- Dixon T, MacPherson D, Mostofian B, Dauzhenka T, Lotz S,
   \*\* McGee D, Shechter S, Shrestha UR, Wiewiora R, McDargh ZA, et al.: Predicting the structural basis of targeted protein degradation by integrating molecular dynamics simulations with structural mass spectrometry. Nat Commun 2022, 13: 5884.

This work demonstrates the utility of combining HDX-MS and SAXS with molecular dynamics methods to simulate degrader mediated ternary complexes and investigate conformational heterogeneity. This study makes a compelling case for further bridging the gap between in-solution structural biology and computational methods.

 Bai N, Miller SA, Andrianov GV, Yates M, Kirubakaran P, Karanicolas J: Rationalizing PROTAC-mediated ternary Complex Formation using Rosetta. J Chem Inf Model 2021, 61: 1368–1382.

This paper provided the first insights into the solution structure of ternary structures based on molecular dynamics simulations. It shows that in solution ternary complex are often more dynamic and sample a much wider conformational space than observed in the crystal structure. It has therefore sparked interest in applying solution techniques to degrader complexes.

- Hanzl A, Casement R, Imrichova H, Hughes SJ, Barone E, Testa A, Bauer S, Wright J, Brand M, Ciulli A, *et al.*: Functional E3 ligase hotspots and resistance mechanisms to smallmolecule degraders. *Nat Chem Biol* 2022, https://doi.org/ 10.1038/s41589-022-01177-2.
- Dimitrova-Paternoga L, Jagtap PKA, Chen PC, Hennig J: Integrative structural biology of protein-RNA complexes. Structure 2020, 28:6–28.
- Graziadei A, Gabel F, Kirkpatrick J, Carlomagno T: The guide sRNA sequence determines the activity level of box C/D RNPs. *Elife* 2020, 9, e50027.
- Lapinaite A, Simon B, Skjaerven L, Rakwalska-Bange M, Gabel F, Carlomagno T: The structure of the box C/D enzyme reveals regulation of RNA methylation. *Nature* 2013, 502:519–523.
- 17. Rout MP, Sali A: Principles for integrative structural biology studies. *Cell* 2019, 177:1384–1403.
- 18. Sali A: From integrative structural biology to cell biology. *J Biol Chem* 2021:296.
- Wüthrich K: Protein structure determination in solution by NMR spectroscopy. J Biol Chem 1990, 265:22059–22062.
- Atilaw Y, Poongavanam V, Svensson Nilsson C, Nguyen D,
   Giese A, Meibom D, Erdelyi M, Kihlberg J: Solution conformations shed light on PROTAC cell permeability. ACS Med Chem Lett 2021, 12:107–114.

The cell permeability of PROTACs, that usually far exceed the boundaries set by the rule of 5s, has been a controversial issue. This study used structural NMR studies in different solvents to experimentally elucidate the mechanism of PROTAC cell permeability and show 'chameleonicity'.

- Bussiere DE, Xie L, Srinivas H, Shu W, Burke A, Be C, Zhao J, Godbole A, King D, Karki RG, *et al.*: Structural basis of indisulam-mediated RBM39 recruitment to DCAF15 E3 ligase complex. Nat Chem Biol 2020, 16:15–23.
- 22. de Castro GV, Ciulli A: Estimating the cooperativity of PROTAC-induced ternary complexes using 19F NMR

displacement assay. RSC Medicinal Chemistry 2021, 12: 1765–1770.

 Schiemer J, Horst R, Meng Y, Montgomery JI, Xu Y, Feng X,
 Borzilleri K, Uccello DP, Leverett C, Brown S, et al.: Snapshots and ensembles of BTK and cIAP1 protein degrader ternary complexes. Nat Chem Biol 2021, 17:152–160.
 Application of protein-observed NMR on PROTAC-induced ternary

Application of protein-observed NMR on PROTAC-induced ternary complexes. NMR titrations and diffusion-observed NMR were used to confirm ternary complex formation and the presence of protein/protein interactions for a system with only limited PPI contacts observed in the crystal structure.

- Michel E, Cucuzza S, Mittl PRE, Zerbe O, Plückthun A: Improved repeat protein stability by combined consensus and computational protein design. *Biochemistry* 2023, 62:318–329.
- 25. Tugarinov V, Kay LE: An isotope labeling strategy for methyl TROSY spectroscopy. J Biomol NMR 2004, 28:165–172.
- Bertelsen EB, Chang L, Gestwicki JE, Zuiderweg ERP: Solution conformation of wild-type E. coli Hsp70 (DnaK) chaperone complexed with ADP and substrate. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 2009, 106:8471–8476.
- Gelis I, Bonvin AMJJ, Keramisanou D, Koukaki M, Gouridis G, Karamanou S, Economou A, Kalodimos CG: Structural basis for signal-sequence recognition by the Translocase motor SecA as determined by NMR. *Cell* 2007, 131:756–769.
- Tugarinov V, Choy W-Y, Orekhov VY, Kay LE: Solution NMRderived global fold of a monomeric 82-kDa enzyme. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 2005, 102:622–627.
- 29. Sprangers R, Kay LE: Quantitative dynamics and binding studies of the 20S proteasome by NMR. *Nature* 2007, 445: 618–622.
- Pellecchia M, Meininger D, Shen AL, Jack R, Kasper CB: Sem DS: SEA-TROSY (solvent exposed amides with TROSY): a method to resolve the problem of spectral overlap in very large proteins. J Am Chem Soc 2001, 123:4633–4634.
- Takahashi H, Nakanishi T, Kami K, Arata Y, Shimada I: A novel NMR method for determining the interfaces of large protein-protein complexes. Nat Struct Biol 2000, 7:220–223.
- Konijnenberg A, Butterer A, Sobott F: Native ion mobility-mass spectrometry and related methods in structural biology. *Biochim Biophys Acta, Proteins Proteomics* 2013, 1834:1239–1256.
- Zorba A, Nguyen C, Xu Y, Starr J, Borzilleri K, Smith J, Zhu H, Farley KA, Ding W, Schiemer J, et al.: Delineating the role of cooperativity in the design of potent PROTACs for BTK. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 2018, 115:E7285–E7292.
- Eron SJ, Huang H, Agafonov RV, Fitzgerald ME, Patel J,
   Michael RE, Lee TD, Hart AA, Shaulsky J, Nasveschuk CG, et al.: Structural characterization of degrader-induced ternary complexes using hydrogen-deuterium exchange mass spectrometry and computational modeling: Implications for structure-based design. ACS Chem Biol 2021, 16:2228–2243.

By using HDX-MS and protein docking the authors were able to build a 3D model of ternary complexes for two cereblon recruiting degraders, dBET6 and CFT-1297. They demonstrate that the highest scoring models differ from publish crystal structures of dBET6-mediated ternary complexes. Moreover, they were able to demonstrate the significant conformational flexibility of the ternary complexes.

- Beveridge R, Kessler D, Rumpel K, Ettmayer P, Meinhart A, Clausen T: Native mass spectrometry can effectively predict PROTAC efficacy. ACS Cent Sci 2020, 6:1223–1230.
- Roy MJ, Winkler S, Hughes SJ, Whitworth C, Galant M, Farnaby W, Rumpel K, Ciulli A: SPR-measured dissociation kinetics of PROTAC ternary complexes influence target degradation rate. ACS Chem Biol 2019, 14:361–368.
- Song JH, Wagner ND, Yan J, Li J, Huang RYC, Balog AJ,
   \* Newitt JA, Chen G, Gross ML: Native mass spectrometry and gas-phase fragmentation provide rapid and in-depth topological characterization of a PROTAC ternary complex. *Cell Chem Biol* 2021, 28:1528–1538.e1524.

This study uses a combination of mass spectrometry methods including charge reduction, native MS, and gas-phase activation to analyse ternary complexes. Electron capture dissociation experiments

of the complexes promotes POI dissociation where collision-induced dissociation favoured the elimination of the PROTAC from within the complexes leaving a binary POI:VCB complex which is consistent with the strong protein-protein interactions that are observed in ternary complexes. The authors show the utility of these methods in screen for ternary complex formation and confirm the significance of the PPIs.

- Da Vela S, Svergun DI: Methods, development and applications of small-angle X-ray scattering to characterize biological macromolecules in solution. *Curr Res Struct Biol* 2020, 2: 164–170.
- Chen P-c, Masiewicz P, Rybin V, Svergun D, Hennig J: A general small-angle X-ray scattering-based screening protocol validated for protein-RNA interactions. ACS Comb Sci 2018, 20: 197–202.
- Nakane T, Kotecha A, Sente A, McMullan G, Masiulis S, Brown PMGE, Grigoras IT, Malinauskaite L, Malinauskas T, Miehling J, *et al.*: Single-particle cryo-EM at atomic resolution. *Nature* 2020, 587:152–156.
- Wu M, Lander GC, Herzik Jr MA: Sub-2 Angstrom resolution structure determination using single-particle cryo-EM at 200 keV. J Struct Biol X 2020, 4, 100020.
- Yip KM, Fischer N, Paknia E, Chari A, Stark H: Atomic-resolution protein structure determination by cryo-EM. Nature 2020, 587:157–161.

This paper reports the first structure of apo-Cereblon as well as several structures of glue-bound cereblon obtained by iterative heterogeneous classification of single particle cryo-EM data. It observes the presence of an "open" and "closed" conformation of cereblon and that molecular glues drive the equilibrium towards the closed conformation. It thereby nicely shows the potential of cryo-EM to resolve conformational heterogeneity and inform degrader drug design.

- Faust TB, Yoon H, Nowak RP, Donovan KA, Li Z, Cai Q, Eleuteri NA, Zhang T, Gray NS, Fischer ES: Structural complementarity facilitates E7820-mediated degradation of RBM39 by DCAF15. Nat Chem Biol 2020, 16: 7–14.
- Watson ER, Novick SJ, Matyskiela ME, Chamberlain PP, de la
   Peña AH, Zhu J-Y, Tran E, Griffin PR, Wertz IE, Lander GC: Molecular glue CELMoD compounds are regulators of cereblon conformation. *Science* 2022, 378:549–553.
- Renaud J-P, Chari A, Ciferri C, Liu W-t, Rémigy H-W, Stark H, Wiesmann C: Cryo-EM in drug discovery: achievements, limitations and prospects. Nat Rev Drug Discov 2018, 17: 471–492.
- Russel D, Lasker K, Webb B, Velázquez-Muriel J, Tjioe E, Schneidman-Duhovny D, Peterson B, Sali A: Putting the pieces together: integrative modeling platform software for structure determination of macromolecular assemblies. *PLoS Biol* 2012, 10, e1001244.
- Webb B, Viswanath S, Bonomi M, Pellarin R, Greenberg CH, Saltzberg D, Sali A: Integrative structure modeling with the integrative modeling platform. *Protein Sci* 2018, 27: 245–258.
- Dominguez C, Boelens R, Bonvin AMJJ, HADDOCK: A Protein–Protein docking approach based on biochemical or biophysical information. J Am Chem Soc 2003, 125:1731–1737.

- Drummond ML, Williams CI: Silico modeling of PROTACmediated ternary complexes: validation and application. *J Chem Inf Model* 2019, 59:1634–1644.
- 50. Li F, Hu Q, Zhang X, Sun R, Liu Z, Wu S, Tian S, Ma X, Dai Z, Yang X, *et al.*: **DeepPROTACs is a deep learning-based targeted degradation predictor for PROTACs**. *Nat Commun* 2022, **13**:7133.
- Liao J, Nie X, Unarta IC, Ericksen SS, Tang W: Silico modeling and scoring of PROTAC-mediated ternary complex poses. J Med Chem 2022, 65:6116–6132.
- Zaidman D, Prilusky J, London N, PRosettaC: Rosetta based modeling of PROTAC mediated ternary complexes. J Chem Inf Model 2020, 60:4894–4903.
- 53. Burley SK, Bhikadiya C, Bi C, Bittrich S, Chen L, Crichlow GV, Christie CH, Dalenberg K, Di Costanzo L, Duarte JM, et al.: RCSB Protein Data Bank: powerful new tools for exploring 3D structures of biological macromolecules for basic and applied research and education in fundamental biology, biomedicine, biotechnology, bioengineering and energy sciences. Nucleic Acids Res 2021, 49:D437–D451.
- Delagenière S, Brenchereau P, Launer L, Ashton AW, Leal R, Veyrier S, Gabadinho J, Gordon EJ, Jones SD, Levik KE, *et al.*: ISPyB: an information management system for synchrotron macromolecular crystallography. *Bioinformatics* 2011, 27: 3186–3192.
- Winn MD, Ballard CC, Cowtan KD, Dodson EJ, Emsley P, Evans PR, Keegan RM, Krissinel EB, Leslie AG, McCoy A, et al.: Overview of the CCP4 suite and current developments. Acta Crystallogr D Biol Crystallogr 2011, 67:235–242.
- Svensson O, Malbet-Monaco S, Popov A, Nurizzo D, Bowler MW: Fully automatic characterization and data collection from crystals of biological macromolecules. Acta Crystallogr D 2015, 71:1757–1767.
- 57. De Maria Antolinos A, Pernot P, Brennich ME, Kieffer J, Bowler MW, Delageniere S, Ohlsson S, Malbet Monaco S, Ashton A, Franke D, *et al.*: ISPyB for BioSAXS, the gateway to user autonomy in solution scattering experiments. *Acta Crystallogr D* 2015, 71:76–85.
- Kikhney AG, Borges CR, Molodenskiy DS, Jeffries CM, Svergun DI: SASBDB: towards an automatically curated and validated repository for biological scattering data. Protein Sci 2020, 29:66–75.
- Manalastas-Cantos K, Konarev PV, Hajizadeh NR, Kikhney AG, Petoukhov MV, Molodenskiy DS, Panjkovich A, Mertens HDT, Gruzinov A, Borges C, *et al.*: ATSAS 3.0: expanded functionality and new tools for small-angle scattering data analysis. *J Appl Crystallogr* 2021, 54:343–355.
- Mahieu E, Gabel F: Biological small-angle neutron scattering: recent results and development. Acta Crystallogr D 2018, 74: 715–726.
- 61. Jeschke G: The contribution of modern EPR to structural biology. Emerg Top Life Sci 2018, 2:9–18.
- Petzold G, Fischer ES, Thomä NH: Structural basis of lenalidomide-induced CK1α degradation by the CRL4CRBN ubiquitin ligase. *Nature* 2016, 532:127–130.