

University of Nebraska Medical Center DigitalCommons@UNMC

### Student Systematic Reviews: Occupational Therapy

**Occupational Therapy** 

2022

### Physical Activity for ADL Performance in Older Adults with Dementia: A Systematic Review

Clancy Hesseltine University of Nebraska Medical Center

Josiah Heun University of Nebraska Medical Center

Murphy Porter University of Nebraska Medical Center

Sam Wyrick University of Nebraska Medical Center

Stacy Smallfield University of Nebraska Medical Center

See next page for additional authors

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.unmc.edu/cahp\_ot\_sysrev

Part of the Occupational Therapy Commons

#### **Recommended Citation**

Hesseltine, Clancy; Heun, Josiah; Porter, Murphy; Wyrick, Sam; Smallfield, Stacy; and Whitlow, Molly, "Physical Activity for ADL Performance in Older Adults with Dementia: A Systematic Review" (2022). *Student Systematic Reviews: Occupational Therapy.* 1. https://digitalcommons.unmc.edu/cahp\_ot\_sysrev/1

This Abstract is brought to you for free and open access by the Occupational Therapy at DigitalCommons@UNMC. It has been accepted for inclusion in Student Systematic Reviews: Occupational Therapy by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@UNMC. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@unmc.edu.

#### Authors

Clancy Hesseltine, Josiah Heun, Murphy Porter, Sam Wyrick, Stacy Smallfield, and Molly Whitlow

This abstract is available at DigitalCommons@UNMC: https://digitalcommons.unmc.edu/cahp\_ot\_sysrev/1

### Physical Activity for ADL Performance in Older Adults with Dementia: A Systematic Review

Students: Clancy Hesseltine Josiah Heun Murphy Porter Sam Wyrick

Faculty: Stacy Smallfield, DrOT, MSOT, OTR/L, BCG, FAOTA Molly Whitlow, PhD, MPH



## Background

- 5.8 million US adults live with dementia. (CDC, 2019)
- Exercise may slow cognitive decline in dementia. (Ahlskog, 2011)

# Does physical exercise maintain or improve ADL performance for adults with dementia?



## Method: Search Strategy

CINAHL, PubMed, Cochrane Library, and Scopus

- Key terms:
  - Dementia
  - Adult
  - Physical Activity
  - Exercise
  - Activities of daily living
  - ADLs





## **Method: Criteria**

### **Inclusion Criteria:**

- Published between 2012-2022
- Dementia diagnosis
- Age > 18
- English language
- Physical exercise as intervention
- ADL as outcome

### Exclusion Criteria:

- Review contained ≥ 50% of the studies of another review
- Systematic reviews of systematic reviews





Reason for record exclusion Not a systematic review n = 280No outcomes related to ADLs n = 12 No exercise as intervention n = 8Dementia not studied n = 4A systematic review of systematic reviews n = 1 More than 50% of RCTs were identical to another systematic review (the larger study was kept) n=1

### Results







GENERAL **IMPROVEMENT** IN ADLS WITH LOW INTENSITY EXERCISE FOUR STUDIES HAD POSITIVE OUTCOMES RELATED TO ADL PERFORMANCE THREE STUDIES HAD MIXED OUTCOMES RELATED TO ADL PERFORMANCE



### **Discussion: Findings**

#### Strong evidence: routine use

- Improve or maintain ADL performance
- Low-intensity
- Long duration
- Less frequent
- Longer intervention period

#### Moderate evidence: routine use

- Shorter duration
- More frequent exercises

#### Low evidence: case-by-case use

- High-intensity
- Shorter interventions

Exercise Factors	Low- intensity duration (yoga, Tai Chi, walking)	High-intensity (strength training, dancing, brisk walking)
Short duration ≤30 minutes		
Long duration >30 minutes		
Less frequent ≤ 3 times a week		
More frequent >3 times a week		
Length ≤ 8-week duration		
Length >8-week		

## **Discussion: Limitations**

- Small sample size in some RCTs
- Lack of detail in methods and interventions used
- Non-English language articles were excluded
- High attrition rates
- Elevated risk of performance bias
- Heterogeneity in the compared studies
- No information on the specific ADLs improved



### **Discussion: Future Research**

Exercise frequency, duration, & intensity Interactions between exercise characteristics

Exercise based on severity of dementia

Homogeneity across studies



## **Bottom Line for OT**

Bottom line for occupational therapy

- Physical activity intervention can maintain or improve ADL performance
- The most supported exercise characteristics:
  - Low-intensity (yoga, Tai Chi, walking)
  - Long duration (duration >30 mins per session)
  - Less frequent (exercise sessions  $\leq 3$  a week)
  - Longer intervention exercises (intervention period > 8-week)
- Exercise choice increases long-term adherence (Collado-Mateo, 2021)

## References

Ahlskog, J. E., Geda, Y. E., Graff-Radford, N. R., & Petersen, R. C. (2011). Physical exercise as a preventive or disease-modifying treatment of dementia and brain aging. *Mayo Clinic Proceedings*, *86*(9), 876–884. <u>https://doi.org/10.4065/mcp.2011.0252</u>

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. (2019, August 20). *Minorities and Women Are at Greater Risk for Alzheimer's Disease*. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. https://www.cdc.gov/aging/publications/features/Alz-Greater-Risk.html

Collado-Mateo, D., Lavín-Pérez, A. M., Peñacoba, C., Del Coso, J., Leyton-Román, M., Luque-Casado, A., Gasque, P., Fernández-Del-Olmo, M. Á., & Amado-Alonso, D. (2021). Key factors associated with adherence to physical exercise in patients with chronic diseases and older adults: An umbrella review. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, *18*(4), 2023. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18042023</u>

Giebel, C. M., Sutcliffe, C., & Challis, D. (2015). Activities of daily living and quality of life across different stages of dementia: a UK study. *Aging & Mental Health*, 19(1), 63–71. https://doi.org/10.1080/13607863.2014.915920



Limitations	Articles
Small sample size in some examined RCTs included in the systematic reviews $\leq 25$ participants	(Brett, 2016), (Forbes, 2015), (Lewis, 2017)
Lack of detail, specifically in methods, intervention, and reporting adherence in included articles	(Karssemeijer, 2017)
Articles not written in English were excluded	(Brett, 2016), (Forbes, 2015), (Lewis, 2017), (Park, 2019), (Karssemeijer, 2017), (Yeh, 2021)
Some included articles had high attrition (drop out) rates	(Lewis, 2017)
Elevated risk of performance bias as blinding was not possible in some studies	(Forbes, 2015), (Lewis, 2017), (Yeh, 2021)
Heterogeneity in the compared studies features (intervention, duration, frequency, etc.)	(Forbes, 2015), (Karssemeijer, 2017)

Duration of exercise by intensity			
Types of Exercises	# of articles (row totals)	Short duration ≤30 minutes	Long duration >30 minutes
Low- intensity	5	(Brett, 2016). (Park, 2019)	(Brett, 2016), (Lewis, 2017), (Karssemeijer, 2017), (Yeh, 2021), (Park, 2019)
	0	None	None
	1	None	(Forbes, 2015)
	Column totals	2/2 supporting exercise	5/6 supporting exercise
High- intensity	5	(Karssemeijer, 2017), (Zhou, 2022)	(Forbes, 2015), (Karssemeijer, 2017) (Lewis, 2017), (Yeh, 2021), (Zhou, 2022)
	2	None	(Forbes, 2015), (Zhou, 2022)
	4	(Brett, 2016), (Forbes, 2015)	(Forbes, 2015), (Zhou, 2022), (Park, 2019)
	Column totals	2/4 supporting	3/6 articles supporting exercise; 1/6 article not supporting exercise; 2/6 articles with mixed findings (both have some supportive findings, some mixed findings, some findings that do not support)

Frequency of	of exercise by intensity		
Types of Exercises	# of articles	Less frequent $\leq 3$ times a week	More frequent >3 times a week
Low- intensity	6	(Brett, 2016), (Lewis, 2017), (Karssemeijer, 2017) (Park, 2019), (Yeh, 2021)	(Brett, 2016), (Forbes, 2015), (Karssemeijer, 2017), (Park, 2019)
	1	None	(Forbes, 2015)
	1	(Forbes, 2015)	(Forbes, 2015)
	Column totals	5/6 supporting exercise	3/4 articles supporting exercise; 0/4 article not supporting exercise; 1/4 articles with mixed findings (both have some supportive findings, some mixed findings, some findings that do not support)
High- intensity	5	(Lewis, 2017), (Karssemeijer, 2017), (Yeh, 2021)	(Lewis, 2017), (Forbes, 2015), (Zhou, 2022)
	2	None	(Forbes, 2015), (Zhou, 2022)
	2	(Forbes, 2015)	(Forbes, 2015), (Zhou, 2022)
	Column totals	3/4 supporting exercise	1/3 articles supporting exercise; 0/3 article not supporting exercise; 2/3 articles with mixed findings (both have some supportive findings, some mixed findings, some findings that do not support)

Length of exercise intervention period by intensity			
Types of Exercises	# of articles	Length $\leq$ 8-week duration	Length >8-week
Low- intensity	5	None	(Brett, 2016), (Lewis, 2017), (Karssemeijer, 2017), (Yeh, 2021), (Park, 2019)
	0	None	None
	1	None	(Forbes, 2015)
	Column totals	0/0 supporting exercise	5/6 supporting exercise
High- intensity	4	(Karssemeijer, 2017)	(Lewis, 2017), (Karssemeijer, 2017), (Yeh, 2021), (Zhou, 2022)
	1	None	(Zhou, 2022)
	3	None	(Forbes, 2015), (Park, 2019), (Zhou, 2022)
	Column totals	1/1 supporting exercise	3/6 articles supporting exercise; 2/6 article not supporting exercise; 1/6 articles with mixed findings (both have some supportive findings, some mixed findings, some findings that do not support)