

Teachers' Hidden Curriculum and its Role in Promoting Citizenship Values Among Primary School Students in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

Huda R. Alsaeed¹, Samah Zakaria Mohammed², Sabah A. Elsayed³, Mamdouh Mosaad Helali⁴

¹*Imam Abdulrahman Bin Faisal University, College of education*

hralsaeed@iau.edu.sa

²*Banha University*

Samah_zak@yahoo.com

³*Associate Professor, Curriculum and Instruction Department, College of Education, Suez University, Suez, Egypt,*

ElsayedSabah1978@gmail.com

⁴*Imam Abdulrahman Bin Faisal University*

Email: mhilaly@iau.edu.sa

Abstract:

The aim of this study is to examine the extent to which primary school teachers in the Eastern Region of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia practice the hidden curriculum with their students. The study also aims to identify the role of these teachers' practices in promoting citizenship values in primary school students in the Saudi community, and to provide suggestions based on the results. The researcher used a mixed approach method, with the necessary data collected by applying a questionnaire to a stratified random sample of primary school principals. Furthermore, personal interviews were conducted with a sample of primary school teachers to identify their practices of the hidden curriculum with students, which reflected behaviors that enhance citizenship values in primary school students. The study team prepared its tools, and its psychometric properties were verified before applying them to the sample. The study population consisted of all teachers and school principals of public primary schools in the Eastern Region of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. The results identified the most common practices of the hidden curriculum that teachers apply with their students. The results of the study also revealed that there are statistically significant differences in school principals' estimation of teachers' practices of the hidden curriculum according to the variable "years of experience", in favor of principals with more than 10 years of experience, while there are no statistically significant differences in school principals' estimation of the teacher's practices of the hidden curriculum according to the "gender" variable.

Key Words: Hidden Curriculum, Citizenship values, Estimation, Primary, Eastern Region, Principals, governmental

Introduction:

The hidden curriculum is one of the most important factors that influence students as it functions through sending hidden messages of the concepts, trends and tendencies that shape students' future behaviors. These messages make students adopt specific attitudes that may be

consistent with the official curriculum or may contradict it, depending on the educational institution's mission and the prevailing pattern within it. It also depends on the quality of management practices as well as the quality of the other components of the educational process. The hidden curriculum contains educational content in

a silent and hidden way. This content has a strong impact on the educational process components, especially on students in the primary stage.

Gordon (1982) emphasized that the hidden curriculum plays an important and major role in the educational process as it provides students with additional and enriching experiences in the cognitive, intellectual, moral, and social fields. The hidden curriculum's role in the educational process may overpower the roles played by the official curriculum. This requires researchers to apply more effort to observe the hidden practices that teachers carry out in school (Wafsa, 2010). The real test for identifying the impacts of the hidden curriculum on students and its other negative or positive outcomes emerges through direct and indirect monitoring of the changes that appear in the students' different behaviors and practices.

Theoretical Framework and Previous Studies:

Students acquire a lot of concepts, information, and facts within the school through both the intended written and planned curriculum, and the unintended curriculum. The unintended curriculum has several other names such as the hidden curriculum, the silent curriculum, the disguised curriculum, the implicit curriculum, the covered curriculum, the informal curriculum, the invisible curriculum, the unintentional curriculum, the unexpected curriculum, and the deep curriculum. It has played a major role in analyzing, designing, and planning of curricula (Al Wakeel & Al-Mufti 2017; Alajamy, 2020).

Anderson (2001) mentioned that there are three historical ways to present the term "hidden curriculum" that have emerged during the past fifty years. The first way is establishing certain ideas in students' minds to preserve rights, knowledge and private practices while teaching the formal curriculum. The second way is the use of this term to indicate temporal and spatial impact wherever the educational process takes place in an environment that controls activities and learning. The third way is the social normalization that students face during the period of education to

help them cope with the requirements of the educational institution and its formal systems.

Mahafdeh (1993) defines the hidden curriculum as "the religious and social values and standards and as all the knowledge and behavioral skills that teachers teach implicitly". The hidden curriculum is characterized by its dependency on the nature of educational situations, and by it not being planned. The outcomes of the hidden curriculum can be positive or negative. It has discretionary goals to be achieved and it changes depending on the time, place, and learners (Al-Khatib, 2004).

While studying the hidden curriculum, some researchers primarily focus on the teacher-student relationship, where the teacher's behavior has the greatest impact in stimulating the hidden education (Al-Sharrah, 2004). Other researchers, focus on the belief that teachers' educational practice is one of the most impactful factors in the hidden curriculum as they have a variety of ideological and intellectual attitudes that are fed to students in the classroom. Some researchers highlight the hidden curriculum issue through the importance of regulations, standards, values, and norms imposed by the school on students, while others emphasize the role of the school and classroom environment, including furniture and physical environment, in deepening the values and concepts of the hidden curriculum among students. The hidden curriculum has three important dimensions, the first of which deals with its meaning, i.e., any content that is taught in the school and results in intended concepts because of the interaction between the teacher and the student through the classroom environment that constitutes the basic structure of the school. The second dimension deals with the hidden curriculum components. It is based on several processes that occur in the classroom or in the school in general, and these include values and attitudes to maintain discipline and acquire attitudes and skills. The third dimension is concerned with a set of hidden values fed to students starting from the secondary outcomes of unintended or accidental learning and ending with more profound learning outcomes in the functional, historical, and socio-educational aspects.

Alajamy (2020) stated that the hidden curriculum can be addressed through four concepts, the first is the unofficial expectations or outcomes that have not been announced. The second is the unplanned outcomes or the unintended educational aids. The third is the implicit message received from the prevailing system in the school and the components of the educational process which generates unplanned results. The fourth is that students learn from their understanding of what is intended to be studied. The hidden curriculum consists of six elements: classroom arrangement, school benefits, academic schedule, learner's culture and its relationship to the prevailing culture, teachers' backgrounds, and textbook bias in addition to the teacher-student relationship in school (Al-Qusayr, 2012).

Al-Qusayr (2012) believes that the hidden curriculum has two main sources, the first related to the school, such as the teacher, the explicit school curriculum, teaching methods, teaching aids and techniques, assessments, and the school environment. The second source is a non-school source such as social, cultural, and economic factors and the teacher's role in instilling values in students

Although there are some differences between the hidden curriculum and the formal curriculum, it is important to integrate their roles to achieve better learning outcomes. This confirms the teacher's role in achieving that integration, as the automatic transfer of the teacher's behaviors to students stresses that teachers' adoption of positive social relations with their students leads to promoting students' desire to comply with behaviors that the teacher practices (Aspelien, 2019). Therefore, the teacher is morally responsible to optimally deal with the hidden curriculum, adopt its advantages, and consolidate various values and approaches to achieve the integration with the formal curriculum (Semper & Blascom, 2018). The teacher is the fundamental person for formulating and employing the hidden curriculum in all situations of the educational process that occur inside and outside the school. They are responsible for instilling the desired values among students in order to serve the formal curriculum (Altamimi, 2020).

Citizenship is described to be an individual's feeling of being an important part of their homeland, for which they feel loyalty and belonging, thereby having respect for its laws and a desire to preserve its wealth (Ali, 1998). Al-Harbi (2010) also describes it as an individual's positive attitude towards their homeland, with which they feel a sense of association and pride. Altala (2010) explains citizenship to be an individual's sense of connection with their homeland, one which they were born in and feel a sense of unity with, being prepared to defend it if it faces any form of external threats.

Some believe that the citizenship values consist of four elements that are progressive in strength; namely, cognitive elements, which mean awareness of what is worthy of desire; emotional elements, which deal with the individual feelings towards it positively or negatively; behavioral elements, which are considered a standard of behavior; and finally, motivational elements, which mean that values constitute motives for achievement and performance (Aksiea, 2000).

Citizenship has many manifestations, the most important of which are love and loyalty to the homeland; carrying out all duties towards the homeland to the fullest willingly; preserving the mother tongue of the homeland; the official dress; voluntarily practicing all forms of charitable and voluntary work; adhering to the customs and traditions of the community; and finally, cohesion and integration within the same family (Al-Tahat & Al-Qaoud, 1995).

Several studies highlighted the hidden curriculum of teachers' practices in classrooms and school. Murtada and Oraikat (2020) identified the extent to which social studies teachers employ the hidden curriculum in the classroom in relation to the variable of experience. The study adapted the descriptive approach and applied a direct observation card to a sample size of 18 female social studies teachers in the schools of the Kasbat Ajloun region in Jordan. The study found several results, the most important of which was that the mean of the extent of female social studies teachers' employment of the hidden curriculum in the classroom is moderate, and that there were no statistically significant differences between the means of teachers' estimates on the observation

card due to variable number of years of experience. The study of Sari and Dogonay (2009) also identified the role of the hidden curriculum in making students acquire the value of human dignity and the functions that the hidden curriculum serves in the educational process. Sari and Dogonay's study used a descriptive approach, conducting personal interviews, and applying an observation card to a sample size of 2,254 students and teachers in the city of Adna in Turkey. The study concluded that the different aspects of the hidden curriculum have many associated and interrelated links. The study also found that the behaviors of students are basically a reflection of the undemocratic practices of teachers.. The study of Abu Ismail and Al-Khawalidah (2015) identified aspects related to the hidden curriculum in e-learning compared to the hidden curriculum in traditional education, and the criticisms directed at e-learning based on the hidden curriculum. Abu Ismail and Al-Khawalidah's study used a descriptive analytical approach. The study had a number of findings, the most important of which is the existence of real differences between the hidden curriculum in e-learning and traditional education. In addition, the study concluded that the hidden curriculum in e-learning has many negative and positive psychological effects.

The research of Al-Qusayr (2012) aimed to identify the components of the hidden curriculum within schools and identified differences between the average scores of students in schools with a positive hidden curriculum and the average scores of students in schools with a negative hidden curriculum in terms of moral and aesthetic values, using a descriptive analytical approach. The study applied three questionnaires to 120 students, and found a number of results, the most important of which is the presence of statistically significant differences between students of schools with a positive hidden curriculum and students of schools with a negative hidden curriculum.

Al Balushi and El-Shara (2021) identified the extent of awareness of primary-stage students in Jordan with the practices of teachers in the light of the hidden curriculum. The study used a descriptive approach, and a questionnaire was distributed to a random sample of 533 male and female students in the primary stage. The study

concluded that there are no statistically significant differences in the extent of students' awareness of teachers' practices in the light of the hidden curriculum attributed to the variable student's grade.

The study of Al-Ahmadi (2015) measured the effectiveness of a proposed program in developing the concept of the hidden curriculum, analyzing it, and employing it among middle school female teachers. The program was applied to a group of 35 female middle school teachers in Tabuk, Saudi Arabia. The results of the study showed a remarkable improvement among female teachers in the concept of the hidden curriculum and their ability to analyze and employ it in the educational process, which indicates the effectiveness of the proposed program.

Regarding the impact of the hidden curriculum and the moral or sensory implications on students, their attitudes, tendencies and behavior, a number of studies have emphasized that the hidden curriculum contributes positively to building students' character through enriched and accumulated human experiences (Alsubaie, 2015; Barthes, 2018; Fidan & Tuncel, 2018).

Some other studies dealt with citizenship values from various angles. The study of Al-Moamni (2019) identified citizenship values among secondary school students in Jordan. The study used a descriptive approach, and a questionnaire was distributed to 200 secondary school students. The study concluded that there were no statistically significant differences in citizenship values among students attributed to variables of gender and academic specialization.

The study of Al-Wadaai (2019) identified the role of forensic sciences teachers in promoting citizenship values in secondary school students in Asir, Saudi Arabia. The study adapted a descriptive approach, and a questionnaire was distributed to 55 male and female teachers of forensic sciences. The study recommended the necessity of implementing a number of counseling programs for teachers at all stages of public education as these programs may help in strengthening citizenship values and the intellectual concepts related to it. This, according to the study, will contribute to achieving the

initiatives of the Ministry of Education and consequently achieving the Kingdom's Vision 2030. This also helps foster teachers' interests in developing values, tendencies, emotional attitudes, skills, and social participation, in addition to their role in developing knowledge and learning for students, to promote citizenship values.

The study of Omar (2019) highlighted the role of the teacher in instilling and developing citizenship values and loyalty to the homeland among students. The researcher used an inductive and analytical approach for the theoretical study. The study concluded that teachers' roles in developing and strengthening the concept of loyalty and belonging may be weak due to the presence of some shortcomings from them, and due to their feeling that they lack the appreciation they deserve financially and morally, the lack of training and rehabilitation, and that the school environment does not contribute to instilling citizenship values in students throughout all the educational stages.

In light of the differing results of the various studies that dealt with teachers' practices in classrooms and schools, the impacts of these practices on the various aspects of students' values, the change in current circumstances and events after the COVID-19 pandemic, the increase in the periods in which teachers communicate with students, especially after switching to distance education, the implementation of the three semesters system in the Kingdom in 2019, and the blended education, it is expected that teachers' practices, especially through social media, will have different impacts on citizenship values among primary school students through the hidden curriculum. This prompted researchers to examine the hidden curriculum of the teachers' practices and its role in promoting the citizenship values in primary school students. Hence, the research problem can be identified in the main question: What is the role of the hidden curriculum of teachers in promoting the citizenship values in primary school students? The following sub-questions are derived from the main question:

- What is the extent to which primary school teachers in the Eastern Region of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia practice the hidden curriculum with

their students to promote citizenship values from the point of view of their school principals?

- What are the statistically significant differences in teachers' practices of the hidden curriculum with their students according to the study variables (gender and years of experience)?

- What are the obstacles, from primary school teachers' point of view, that prevent the implementation of the hidden curriculum to promote citizenship values in primary school students?

- What are the requirements, from primary school teachers' point of view, that contribute to implementing the hidden curriculum to promote citizenship values for primary school students?

Objectives of the current study:

- Identifying the extent to which the hidden curriculum in teachers' practices is related to citizenship values.

- Identifying obstacles that prevent the implementation of the hidden curriculum by teachers to promote citizenship values in primary school students.

- Identifying the requirements that contribute to the implementation of the hidden curriculum of teachers to promote citizenship values in primary school students.

Significance of the current study:

The current study is important as it addresses the following spheres:

- The extent to which teachers practice the hidden curriculum with students in classrooms.

- The promotion of citizenship values in primary school students, as this is an appropriate stage for values to be instilled in students.

- The promotion of citizenship values in students through teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum in the classrooms, which can benefit educators in terms of doing so.

- Urging officials to focus on the importance of preparing primary school teachers and emphasizing their role in instilling citizenship values in primary school students.

- Giving opportunities for researchers to conduct more research and studies in the field of using the hidden curriculum by teachers and its relationship to other variables.

Study limits:

The objective limits of the current study included both the hidden curriculum of teachers and its role in promoting citizenship values in primary school students, in addition to the extent of teachers' practices of the hidden curriculum in the primary stage. The study was conducted during the second semester of the 2021/2022 school year. The study population consisted of teachers and principals of public schools at the primary stage.

Methodology:

The researcher used a mixed-methods approach, due to its relevance to the subject of the study.

Research tools: The researcher used two tools to collect data, namely questionnaires that were distributed to primary school principals, and

personal interview forms that were distributed to teachers according to the following:

A. The questionnaire, which was prepared by the research team, was prepared to identify the extent of teachers' practices of the hidden curriculum with their students from the point of view of school principals for the primary stage. The research team prepared the study tool and measured its psychometric properties. The questionnaire was presented to ten specialized reviewers to verify its integrity and the final form of the questionnaire consisted of 33 statements.

The internal consistency of the questionnaire was also calculated using the Pearson coefficient, after they were applied to a pilot sample of 30 principals of primary schools. The correlation coefficients ranged between 0.81 and 0.92, which is acceptable and indicates the consistency of each dimension of the questionnaire in the total degree of the questionnaire. The validity and reliability coefficients of the questionnaire were achieved, and their applicability was confirmed. Table 1 shows correlation coefficients between each dimension of the questionnaire and the questionnaire as a whole:

Dimension	Personality characteristics	Citizenship values	Democracy principles	Participation in community services	Maintaining public properties	Rights and duties
Coefficient	0.91	0.87	0.85	0.92	0.87	0.81

Table 2 shows Alpha Cronbach's stability coefficient of the questionnaire and its sub-dimensions:

Questionnaire dimensions	Number of statements	Alpha Cronbach's values

The first dimension	6	0.91
The second dimension	8	0.79
The third dimension	4	0.70
The fourth dimension	7	0.86
The fifth dimension	5	0.68
The sixth dimension	3	0.66
The total stability coefficient	33	0.92

It is clear from Table 2 that the questionnaire has a high stability coefficient and that it has valid results.

Table 3 shows the values of the responses to the statements of the questionnaire according to the five-point Likert scale and the mean:

Level of practicing the hidden curriculum to promote citizenship values	Mean
Low level	$1 \geq 2.33$
Average level	$2.34 \geq 3.67$
High level	$3.68 \geq 5$

B. In addition, the research team used a personal interview form that contained two questions. The interviews were applied to a sample of primary school teachers to identify obstacles and requirements that promote teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum with their students, and they were also used to develop citizenship values in primary school students in the Saudi community.

Research Population: the research population was 4,914 overall. It consisted of 500 principals (205 male and 295 female), which represents all principals of public primary schools in the Eastern Region of Saudi Arabia. Also included were all

primary school teachers in the Eastern region in Saudi Arabia, totalling 4,414 (2,156 males, and 2,258 females). The population number is calculated according to the statistics of the Education Department in the Eastern Region in March 2022.

Research sample: A stratified random sample of 54 primary school principals in the Eastern Region in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, and an intentional sample of 12 primary school teachers 12 in the Eastern Region schools of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia were selected. Table 4 illustrates the data of the research sample.

Category	School Principals (Questionnaire)	Teachers (Personal Interview)

Experience	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total
<10	11	14	25	3	3	6
>10	15	14	29	3	3	6
Total	26	28	54	6	6	12

It is clear from Table 4 that the number female school principals in the study was greater than the number of the males, and that most of school principals in the research sample have more than 10 years of experience.

Procedures of data collection for analysis:

The analysis of the research data was conducted through the following procedures:

- 1- Determining the reason for data collection, which is to identify the extent of teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum in the classroom, and its impact in promoting citizenship values in primary school students.
- 2- Selection of the sample – this was done according to two stages:
 - The first stage: selecting a sample of primary school principals to identify the extent of teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum in the classroom through their responses to the questionnaire statements prepared by the research team.
 - The second stage: selecting an intentional sample of primary school teachers to conduct a semi-structured interview with them to identify the role of teachers' practice of the hidden

- 3- Determining the appropriate study tool for each sample to achieve the goals of the study.
- 4- Applying the two study tools to the two study samples, after obtaining the relevant official approvals.
- 5- Entering the data obtained from the questionnaires using SPSS to conduct a quantitative analysis, and entering the data obtained from the personal interviews to conduct a qualitative analysis to get the research results.

Research results and discussion:

Table 5 represents results of each of the research questions, according to the following:

- 1. Results and interpretation of the first question:** What is the extent of primary school teachers who practice the hidden curriculum with their students to promote citizenship values from the point of view of their school principals?

Table 5 shows the results associated with the first question:

Table 5					
<i>Extent of primary school teachers who practice the hidden curriculum with their students to promote citizenship values from the point of view of their school principals</i>					
#	Order	Statement	Mean	Standard deviation	Degree of approval
The first dimension: Personality characteristics of the teacher					
1	2	The teacher ensures that they practice what they preach	3.98	1.090	High
2	4	The teacher is keen to set a good example for students	3.12	0.99	Average

3	5	The teacher encourages constructive dialogue among students	3.07	1.46	Average
4	3	The teacher encourages the students to do their homework wholeheartedly	3.59	0.71	Average
5	1	The teacher adheres to the official Saudi dress code inside and outside the school	4.39	1.05	High
6	6	The teacher reviews the kingdom's efforts with students and appreciates them	2.24	1.21	Weak
The total score of the first dimension: Personality characteristics as a whole			3.01	0.656	Average
The second dimension: Citizenship Values					
7	6	The teacher encourages students to adhere to school rules and regulations	3.13	1.30	Average
8	2	The teacher encourages students to buy and acquire Saudi products	2.312	1.08	Weak
9	3	The teacher urges students to visit the touristic and archaeological places in the country	2.311	0.86	Weak
10	7	The teacher encourages adherence to religious, national and patriotic principles and concepts	3.09	0.976	Average
11	8	The teacher presents examples and models of Arab championships in protecting the homeland and its stability.	2.24	1.15	Weak
12	5	The teacher highlights the dangers of blind imitation of some aspects of other cultures and asks students to avoid them	3.17	1.08	Average
13	1	The teacher encourages students to respect national symbols such as the Saudi flag and the Saudi currency	4.29	0.96	High
14	4	The teacher instills citizenship values in students and love of the homeland, loyalty to it, and the defense of its sanctities	3.29	0.96	Average
The total score of the dimension: Citizenship Values as a whole			2.98	0.68	Average
The third dimension: Democracy principles					
15	2	The teacher encourages students to avoid racial or sectarian discrimination	2.72	1.22	Average
16	1	The teacher encourages students to respect others and their feelings	2.76	1.08	Average
17	3	The teacher is tolerant of students who disagree with their point of view	2.50	1.08	Average

18	4	The teacher educates students about the importance of respecting the freedom of thought and beliefs of other people	2.44	1.11	Average
The total score of the third dimension: Democracy as a whole			2.61	0.79	Average
The fourth dimension: Participation Community in community services					
19	2	The teacher urges students to participate in national and religious events and activities	2.83	1.18	Average
20	7	The teacher encourages students to participate in voluntary and charitable work	1.74	0.92	Weak
21	4	The teacher participates in preparing cultural programs to serve the community of the school	1.80	1.09	Weak
22	3	The teacher educates students through continuous seminars and meetings	2.67	1.06	Average
23	6	The teacher directs students to donate to poor families from their personal expenses	1.74	1.18	Weak
24	5	The teacher develops initiative among students to do voluntary work to serve the community	1.74	1.09	Weak
25	1	The teacher stresses the importance of the unity of community classes and categories	2.96	1.4	Average
Total score of the fourth dimension: Participation Community in community services as a whole			2.21	0.58	Weak
The fifth dimension: Maintaining public properties					
26	2	The teacher encourages students to preserve and maintain public property	2.41	1.17	Average
27	1	The teacher cares about the cleanliness and aesthetic look of the school environment	2.52	1.48	Average
28	4	The teacher organizes competitions in the school to encourage students to protect the environment and public property	1.94	0.98	Weak
29	5	The teacher participates in school campaigns to clean public parks and repair various public facilities	1.89	0.69	Weak
30	3	The teacher promotes environmental awareness among students to preserve the local and school environment from any damage	2.11	1.06	Weak
The total score of fifth dimension: Maintaining public properties as a whole			2.17	0.57	Weak
The sixth dimension: Rights and duties					

31	1	The teacher promotes respect for laws, legislation, and general rules of conduct in students	2.19	1.15	Weak
32	2	The teacher explains to the students the meaning of duty, its performance, and how to adhere to their rights and the principles of social justice	2.15	1.2	Weak
33	3	The teacher stresses that the dignity of the citizen is a result of their commitment to their duties	1.93	1.2	Weak
The total score of sixth dimension: Rights and duties as a whole			2.09	0.88	weak
The general mean for the questionnaire as a whole			2.51	0.5	Average

According to table 5 the total score for the teacher's personality dimension demonstrated in primary classes for practicing the hidden curriculum to promote citizenship values was average, with a mean of 3.01. The statements of this dimension came mostly with an average score and the mean for them ranged between 2.24–4.39. The item “The teacher adheres to the official Saudi dress code inside and outside the school” came in the firstly in terms of order, followed by “The teacher ensures that they practice what they preach”, as the degree of approval was high for each of them. This result is consistent with the results of the study of Murtada and Oraikat (2020). The item “The teacher reviews the kingdom's efforts with students and appreciates them” came with a weak degree of approval, and this result is consistent with the study of Alotayby (2016) and Ahmed (2014). This low score may be attributed to primary grade teachers not recognizing the important role of the “hidden curriculum” in the educational process. It also may be attributed to their failure to realize that the teacher's characteristics within the classroom, as well as their personality and the ways of dealing with students during the learning process – as an important part of the hidden curriculum, but not inclusive of all its components – affects students' performance and behavior and even more, affects their acquisition of values, habits, and attitudes, including the values of citizenship. It is important to educate teachers about the hidden curriculum and how to use it positively in developing the values of citizenship, and this was explained in the study of Ibrahim (2003). The teacher-preparation process in the 21st century is not limited to the development of teachers' knowledge and skills

required by their functional tasks; rather, it requires focusing on developing teachers' perceptions towards the overall components of the educational process, including the formation of their ideas, the development of their values, and having awareness of their role in preserving the values and identity of the community.

Regarding the results of the second dimension “Citizenship values”, it is clear from table 5 that the total score of this dimension is average, as the mean was 2.98. This result agrees with the study of Al-Zobi (2017). Most of this dimension statements scored average as the means ranged between 2.24–4.29. The item “The teacher encourages students to respect national symbols such as the Saudi flag and the Saudi currency” comes with a high degree of approval, with a mean of 4.29. This result is consistent with the results of the study conducted by Al-Khiat (2020), which proved that the educational contents deduced from the Saudi national anthem have a major role in consolidating national identity, from the point of view of the sample members of public education teachers in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. This is attributed to the efforts of schools in general and teachers to strengthen the national identity of students and their citizenship values. In addition, schools instill loyalty in students by including the salutation of the Saudi flag at the beginning of the school day. The least important item in score in the second dimension was “The teacher presents examples and models of Arab championships in protecting the homeland and its stability” as it came with a weak degree of approval, with a mean of 2.24. This may be attributed to teachers' insufficient class time to present hidden

curriculum activities to enhance the values of citizenship in students. One of the essential needs of teacher and student is to have enough time to conduct the lesson, giving students all the information needed and the opportunity to interact, discuss, understand, and implement enriching and promotional activities that develop values of citizenship in them. The above results may also be attributed, as confirmed by the study of Al-Zobi (2017), to the difference in teacher perceptions of the concepts of citizenship values and in their awareness of the importance of promoting these values in students, in addition to their role in developing and maintaining the country. Additionally, Al-Zobi attributes this to the large curricula, which do not allow teachers to address students' awareness of this dimension, and the teachers' lack of interest of these issues, as well as their lack of unawareness of their importance in building the personality of the student who belongs to the nation.

Regarding the results of the third dimension "Democracy Principles", table 5 shows that the total responses to the dimension were average, as the mean was 2.61. The statements of this dimension were all average, and the mean ranged between 2.44–2.76. The most important statement was "The teacher encourages students to respect others and their feelings", with an average degree of approval, and the least important statement was "The teacher educates students about the importance of respecting the freedom of thought and beliefs of other people", also with an average degree of approval. This may be attributed to the diversity of teachers' ideologies and cultural backgrounds, which may be an obstacle to their promotion of the hidden curriculum in general, and it prevents using it for developing citizenship values in students. This result is consistent with the study of Sharra (2004), as he stressed that the teacher's behavior has the greatest impact in stimulating hidden education, and that teachers' educational practice is one of the most influential factors in the hidden curriculum. Teachers have a variety of ideological and intellectual attitudes, which are imparted to students in the classroom. Therefore, the hidden curriculum must be monitored by the regulations, standards, values, and norms that the school imposes on its members.

Regarding the results of the fourth dimension "Participation Community in community services", table 5 shows that the total responses to the dimension came with a weak score, as the mean stood at 2.21, and most of the statements of this dimension came mostly with a weak score, as the mean ranged between 1.74–2.96. The most important statements are "The teacher stresses the importance of the unity of community classes and categories" and "The teacher urges students to participate in national and religious events and activities", with an average approval degree for each. The least important statement was "The teacher encourages students to participate in voluntary and charitable work", with a weak degree of approval. This may be attributed to the weak relationship between the school and the community, and between the school and the family. This may also be attributed to the preoccupation of parents, although they must recognize and instill the importance of participating in national events. These results differ with the results of the study of Altahat and AlQaoud (1995), which emphasized the importance of voluntarily charitable work in all its forms while adhering to the customs and traditions of the community. These findings however are consistent with the results of the study of Al-Qusayr (2012), which states that hidden curriculum has two main sources the first of which is related to school such as the teacher, the explicit school curriculum, teaching method and techniques, assessment, and school climate. The second source is a non-school source such as societal, cultural, and economic factors that must also be considered. The study of Altamimi (2020) emphasized that the teacher is the main pillar in formulating and employing the hidden curriculum in all situations of the educational process that occur inside and outside the school. Altamimi also stressed that teachers have a great role in instilling the desired values among students.

Regarding results of the fifth dimension "Maintaining public properties" in table 5 shows that the total score of the responses to the dimension were weak, as the mean was 2.17. Most of the statements of this dimension were weak, with a mean that ranged between 1.89–2.52. The statement "The teacher cares about the cleanliness and aesthetic look of the school environment"

ranked first, followed by the statement “The teacher encourages students to preserve and maintain public property” – the degree of approval was average for each of them. This result is consistent with the results of the study of Ali (1998) and the study of Al-Harbi (2010). The least important statement of the dimension was “The teacher participates in school campaigns to clean public parks and repair various public facilities” as it came with a weak degree of approval. This result is consistent with the results of the study of Al-Tahat and Al-Qaoud (1995), which emphasized that practicing charitable and voluntary work, in all its forms, is one of the manifestations of citizenship values. This result may be attributed to the fact that many primary school teachers realize the importance of the hidden curriculum in the educational process, and the role of teachers in promoting the value of preserving and maintaining public property through their personal practices in front of students. The low score for the statement regarding teacher’s participation in school campaigns to clean public parks and maintain their various facilities may be attributed to the nature of the climate and the high temperatures in the kingdom, which may limit teachers’ participation with students outside the school. Teachers do not want to be exposed to direct sunlight and to its consequences on health. Therefore, teachers prefer to direct students to the importance of participating in this, if possible, outside the school day, in the residential neighborhoods in which they live and under the supervision of their parents. This encourages them to develop positive attitudes towards the community and increases their citizenship values. The study of Omar (2019) clarified the importance of emphasizing the role of the teacher in instilling and promoting citizenship values in students, preserving the values and identity of the community.

Regarding the results of the sixth dimension “Rights and duties”, table 5 shows that all the statements of the dimension were at a weak degree, and at the level of the dimension, as the mean of the dimension was 2.09. The mean for all the statements ranged between 1.93–2.19. The statement “The teacher promotes respect for laws, legislation and general rules of conduct in students” came first, with a weak degree of approval. This result is consistent with the results

of the study of Al-Wadaai (2019), which emphasized the importance of the teacher’s role in promoting the values, tendencies, emotional attitudes, skills, and social participation of students. The statement “The teacher stresses that the dignity of the citizen is a result of their commitment to their duties” had a weak degree of approval. This result is consistent with the results of the study of Aksiea (2000) and Al-Tahat and Al-Qaoud (1995). The results of the study of Murtada and Oraikat (2020) suggested that the low agreement may be attributed to the fact that primary school teachers realize the importance of the hidden curriculum in the educational process, and the fact that employing it with students does not require great experiences from teachers.

As for the total response to the questionnaire overall, the average of the questionnaire was 2.51, which is an average response degree. This may be explained by the awareness of primary school teachers of the importance of the hidden curriculum, and its role in promoting citizenship values in students. However, teachers need more training to activate it and this what was confirmed by the study of Al-Ahmadi (2015), which implemented a training program to develop the hidden curriculum concept, analyze, and employ it among female teachers. Furthermore, encouraging the hidden curriculum through curricular and extra-curricular activities to promote citizenship values in students’ needs more support and involvement from the school administration. Parents also need to be involved in urging their children to participate in curricular and extracurricular activities that promote citizenship values and their awareness of this. This was confirmed by the results of the study of Al Balushi and El-Shara (2021). Moreover, the results of the questionnaire show the importance of the teacher’s role in instilling and developing citizenship values in students in a non-forceful manner, through ways that include preserving the mother tongue, commitment to the official dress code, willingly practicing charitable and voluntary work in all its forms and adhering to the customs and traditions of the community (Al-Tahat & Al-Qaoud, 1995). This in fact even heightens students’ desire to comply and follow suit (Aspelien, 2019). The teacher is the main foundation in formulating and

employing the hidden curriculum in the educational process inside and outside the school (Altamimi, 2020).

Table 6 shows the extent of primary school teachers who practice the hidden curriculum with their students to promote citizenship values from the point of view of their school principals, according to the six dimensions of the questionnaire:

#	Order	Statements	Mean	Standard Deviation	Degree of Approval
1	1	Personality characteristics of the teacher in primary classes	3.01	0.656	Average
2	2	The teacher sets a good example for the students	2.98	0.68	Average
3	3	Citizenship and loyalty	2.61	0.79	Average
4	4	Participation in community services	2.21	0.58	weak
5	5	The teacher adheres to the official Saudi dress code inside and outside the school	2.17	0.57	weak
6	6	Preserving and maintaining public property	2.09	0.88	weak
The general mean for the questionnaire as a whole			2.51	0.50	Average

Table 6 clearly shows the most important dimensions related to primary school teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum with their students. To promote the citizenship values in students from the point of view of their principals came with an average degree of approval. The most important dimension was found to be "the personality characteristics of the teacher in primary classes"; followed by "the teacher's sets a good example for students"; then the "citizenship and loyalty" dimension. The dimensions of "participation in community services" and "the teacher's commitment to the official Saudi dress code inside and outside the school" had a weak degree of approval. The least important dimension, which also had a weak degree of approval, was found to be "preserving and maintaining public property". In general, the

mean of all the statements of the questionnaire as a whole was average.

2. The results and interpretation of the second question: What are the statistically significant differences between teachers' practices of the hidden curriculum with their students according to the research variables (gender and years of experience)?

Table 7 shows the results of the Mann-Whitney test for the difference between the two groups in terms of the experience variable (more than 10 years and from 5 to 10 years).

Dimensions	Years of experience	Sample size (n)	Mean Rank	Sum of Ranks	Mann-Whitney U	Sig. (2-tailed)
Personality characteristics	Less than 10 years	25	13.96	349.00	349	0.00
	10 years or above	29	39.17	1136.00		
Citizenship values	Less than 10 years	25	13.60	340.00	340	0.00
	10 years or above	29	39.48	1145.00		
Democracy	Less than 10 years	25	13.00	325.00	325	0.00
	10 years or above	29	40.00	1160.00		
Participation in community services	Less than 10 years	25	13.20	330.00	330	0.00
	10 years or above	29	39.83	1155.00		
Preserving and maintaining public property	Less than 10 years	25	13.20	330.00	330	0.00
	10 years or above	29	39.83	1155.00		
Rights and duties	Less than 10 years	25	13.20	330.00	330	0.00
	10 years or above	29	39.83	1155.00		
Questionnaire as a whole	Less than 10 years	25	13.00	325.00	325	0.00
	10 years or above	29	40.00	1160.00		

Table 7 results show that there are statistically significant differences in school principals' estimation of the teacher's practice of the hidden

curriculum according to the variable years of experience in favor of principals with more than 10 years of experience in all dimensions of the

questionnaire and in the questionnaire as a whole. This is attributed to the fact school principals see that experience has a great role in teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum. The degree of appreciation for principals increases with the increase in years of experience, and this is expected, as the experience of principals can enable them to understand the behaviors practiced by teachers for extra-curricular activities that promote citizenship values in students, enabling teachers to prepare and follow up on these activities. This result differs with the results of the study of Murtada and Oraikat (2020) in that there are no differences between the means of appreciation of social studies teachers of the

hidden curriculum in the classroom due to the variable number of years of experience. This result may be attributed to the gender of the study sample as it was applied to female teachers only, whereas the current study was applied to male and female managers.

Table 8 shows the results of the Mann-Whitney test for the difference between the two groups in terms of the gender variable (male and female) and the impact of it on school principals in terms of their estimation of teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum to develop citizenship values.

Dimensions	Gender	Sample size (n)	Mean Rank	Sum of Ranks	Mann-Whitney U	Sig. (2-tailed)
Personality characteristics	Male	26	27.38	712	361	0.96
	Female	28	27.61	773		
Citizenship values	Male	26	27.46	714	363	0.99
	Female	28	27.54	771		
Democracy	Male	26	27.73	721	358	0.92
	Female	28	27.29	764		
Participation in community services	Male	26	27.27	709	358	0.92
	Female	28	27.71	776		
Preserving and maintaining public property	Male	26	27.44	713.5	362.5	0.98
	Female	28	27.55	771.5		
Rights and duties	Male	26	27.19	707	356	0.89
	Female	28	27.79	778		
Questionnaire as a whole	Male	26	27.50	715	364	1.00
	Female	28	27.50	770		

Table 8 results shows that there are no differences in the school principals' estimation of the teacher's practice of the hidden curriculum according to the gender variable in all dimensions of the questionnaire and in the questionnaire as a whole. This may be explained by the fact that all school principals, males, and females, conduct the same administrative work with a high degree of efficiency. This also may be attributed to the fact that school principals are selected according to years of experience and competence in addition to their scientific qualifications. Besides, all principals receive professional training courses specialized in administrative work, approved by the Ministry of Education in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. Furthermore, these results may be explained by the fact that all male and female teachers have the same degree of interest in using the hidden curriculum to promote citizenship values among their students as a demonstration of their sense of national belonging. In addition, the programs for preparing male and female teachers in all colleges of education in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia are largely similar. Therefore, there are no fundamental differences in these programs and most teachers and principals in public schools in the kingdom are graduates of public colleges of education in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, and have obtained the same educational programs, where there are no differences in the education given to males and females.

The results of the personal interviews with the sample of teachers:

Personal interviews were conducted to obtain answers to the third and fourth questions of the study. The personal interviews included two questions, the first for the obstacles that prevent teachers from activating the hidden curriculum in promoting the citizenship values in primary school students and the second question was about the requirements that enhance the teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum with their students to promote and develop citizenship values in primary school students. The personal interviews were conducted on 12 male and female teachers in the primary stage. The symbol "T" was given to teachers, each teacher was given a number from 1 to 12, and the results of the personal interviews came according to the following:

3. Results of the third question and their interpretation: What are the obstacles that prevent the implementation of the hidden curriculum of teachers in promoting citizenship values in primary school students from the point of view of primary school teachers?

The participants in the personal interviews stated that teachers face several obstacles that prevent them from activating the hidden curriculum in promoting citizenship values on primary school students, the most important of which are:

a) Obstacles related to students:

- Students' non-commitment to educational rules and regulations within the school (T1, T3).
- The lack of role models for students in adhering to morals, laws, and regulations within society in general, and the educational environment.
- The weak cooperation between the school and family in deepening citizenship values in students, perhaps due to the preoccupation of parents.

b) Obstacles related to teachers:

- Teachers do not believe in the importance of the hidden curriculum as they consider it having a weak impact on students.
- Teachers' diverse ideologies and cultural backgrounds, which may be an obstacle to their promotion of the hidden curriculum in general and its use in developing the citizenship values in students.
- Teachers ignoring the critical thinking skills of students, and not training students on them, perhaps due to the short class time and the length of the curriculum.

c) Obstacles related to the curriculum:

- The lack of sufficient curricular activities that promote citizenship values in students within the curricula.
- The lack of extracurricular activities that contribute to promoting citizenship values in students, which may be attributed to the low school budget allocated to support the conduct of such activities.
- The weakness of integrating extracurricular activities in textbooks with the aim of promoting the use of the hidden curriculum to develop citizenship values in students.

4. The results of the fourth question and their interpretation: What are the requirements that

contribute to the implementation of the hidden curriculum for teachers to promote citizenship values for primary school students, from the point of view of primary school teachers?

Participants in the personal interviews presented several suggestions and requirements that promote teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum with their students to develop citizenship values in primary school students, as follows:

(a) Student-related requirements:

- Teaching students how to abide by laws, morals, school, and community systems.
- The willingness of students to participate in activities that enhance their citizenship values.

(b) Teacher-related requirements:

- Teachers must focus on the higher levels of education, such as analysis, evaluation, and assessment to accustom students to critique what is presented to them.
- Teachers must adhere to laws, morals, and regulations, and they must avoid bias and be moderate in their words and actions.
- Training teachers to design educational activities in various disciplines to promote citizenship values in students.
- Teachers must encourage creativity and innovative ideas in students.
- Teachers must adapt the storytelling approach in explaining the lesson, as this has an influential role in promoting citizenship values in students, especially in the primary stage.
- Linking the students' previous experiences to the topic of the lesson.

(c) Family-related requirements:

- Activating communication between the school and the family to promote the use of the hidden curriculum in promoting citizenship values in students.
- The family should refrain from using cruelty and violence in dealing with students.
- The family must be eager to listen well to their children and respect their points of view as well as their freedom of expression.

(d) School-related requirements:

- Schools must focus on teaching students on skills that develop their abilities and, skills related to lowering criticism and increasing respect for others.
- Schools must focus on the involvement of the family in making decisions related to educational skills that contribute to achieving citizenship values in students.
- Schools must stress the promotion of citizenship values and preserving the national culture in students.
- Schools must develop a guide for teachers that explains how to positively use and employ the hidden curriculum.

5. Recommendations and suggestions that enhance teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum with their students to promote citizenship in primary school students:

This study suggests the following:

- Teachers must focus on their personal characteristics and become good role models for students, especially primary-stage students, to promote citizenship values within them.
- Teacher must encourage students to abide by school regulations and systems and they must advise students to avoid blind imitation of some other cultural manifestations; teacher should encourage students to buy and acquire Saudi products, and to respect Saudi characters and symbols.
- The teacher must promote democracy values in their colleagues and students.
- Students must be encouraged to participate in community services.
- Students must be enlightened and informed of their rights and duties, and that respecting the homeland stems from commitment to perform duties, adherence to the principles of social justice, and respect for national laws and legislation.

The most important recommendations of this study:

- Conducting comparative research to identify the extent of the commitment of public education teachers in the different stages (primary, intermediate, secondary) in using the hidden

curriculum to promote citizenship values in students.

- Conducting research to identify the extent of students' commitment to national values resulting from teachers' practice of the hidden curriculum in primary schools by observing their national behaviors in the school.

References:

- [1] Abu Ismail, A. A., & Al-Khawalidah, T. M. (2015). The Hidden Curriculum In E-Learning. *The Academia Journal of Social and Human Studies*, (13), 12–22.
- [2] Al-Ahmadi, M. M. H. (2015). The efficiency of a suggested program aiming at enabling middle school female teachers to develop, analyze and implement hidden curriculum. *Taibah University Journal of Educational Sciences*, 10(3), 301–311.
- [3] Aksiea, A. A. (2000). *The level of Acquiring some Palestinian Historical Concepts at Gaza Governorates and their relation to the National Affiliation*, (Unpublished Master dissertation Faculty of Education), The Islamic University – Gaza.
- [4] Al Balushi, J. G. R., & El-Shara, I. A. H. (2021). The Awareness Degree Among the Students of Basic Stage in Jordan of the Teachers Practices in the Light of Hidden Curriculum. *Journal of Educational and Psychology Sciences*, 29(2), 366–385. <https://doi.org/10.33976/IUGJEPS.29.2/2021/14>
- [5] Murtada, B. S. S., & Oraikat, M. M. (2020). The Social Studies Female Teachers' Implementation Degree of The Hidden Curriculum Inside the Class in Kasaba Ajloun Schools and its Relation to Experience Variable. *Journal of Educational and Psychology Sciences*, 28(5), 307–320.
- [6] Altamimi, M. A. S. (2020). The Awareness Level of Hidden Curriculum Among Field Education Students in College of Education, Hail University. *Journal of Educational and Psychological Research*, 17(66), 179–207.
- [7] Al-Harbi, A. R. (2010). *The National Affiliation and Its Relationship to Some Personality Variables Among a Sample of Secondary School Students in The Cities of Makah and Jeddah*. (Unpublished Master Dissertation). Faculty of Education, Umm Al-Qura University.
- [8] Sharra, Y. A. (2004). *The Hidden Curriculum*. Al-Qabas Print.
- [9] Al-Tahat, Z. & Al-Qaoud, I. (1995). The Role of Cultural Associations in Irbid In Fostering National Affiliation. *Mutah Journal for research and studies*, 10(5), 89–111.
- [10] Altala, A. A. (2010). The Psychological Adjustment and Its Relation to The National Affiliation Of Female Palestinian Prisoners Who Were Released From Israeli Prisons. *Journal of AlAzhar University in Gaza*, 12(9), 621–666.
- [11] Alajamy, G. M. (2020). The Hidden Curriculum and its Impact on the Educational Process in Kuwait. *The Egyptian Association for Reading and Literacy*. 49–80.
- [12] Ali, I. A. (1998). A proposed program in sociology for the development of social Affiliation among the students of the Faculty of Education. *Journal of Curriculum and Pedagogy*, (47).
- [13] Omar, K. A. (2019). Teacher's Role in Promoting National Affiliation and Loyalty: Theoretical inductive study. *Journal of Arts for Psychological and Educational Studies*, (1), 93–138.
- [14] Al-Qusayr, W. (2012). The hidden curriculum and its relationship to the moral values and the aesthetic values among the students of the basic fourth grade in the Syrian Arab Republic. *Al-Fatih Journal*, 8(50), 340–356.
- [15] Al-Khatib, M. (2004). *Work Paper titled The Hidden Curriculum and The Formal Curriculum. Seminar of The Hidden Curriculum and The Formal Curriculum*, Riyadh. KSA.
- [16] Mahafdeh, S. (1993). The Hidden Curriculum: Critical Review of the Literature. *Journal of Social Affairs*, 10(39), 181–187.
- [17] Al-Mousa, A. (2000). Hidden Curriculum: History, Concept, Philosophy, Components and Application. *Journal of Umm AL-Qura University for Educational and Psychological sciences*, 12(1), 97–114.

- [18] Al-Moamni, M. O. (2019). The Values of National Belonging Among High School Students in Jordan. *Journal of Education and Psychological Health*, 5(1), 61–79.
- [19] Al-Wadaai, M. A. (2019). The Role of the Forensic Science Teacher in Enhancing the National Belongingness of Secondary School Students in Asir Region. *Journal of King Khaled University for Educational Sciences*, 30(2), 59–81.
- [20] Watfa, A. A. (2010). The Silent Messages in School: An ideological reading in the class function of the hidden curriculum. *The Educational Journal*, (94).
- [21] Al-Wakeel, H., & Al-Mofti, M. A. (2017). *The foundations of curriculum construction and their organization*. Amman: Dar Al-Masiera.
- [22] Al-Khiat, A. M. (2020). Educational implications derived from the Saudi national anthem and its role in the consolidation of the national identity from the viewpoint of General Education Teachers in Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. *Journal of Educational and Psychological Sciences*, 4(16), 130–153.
- [23] Ahmed, D. M. (2014). Awareness of primary education teachers about the concept of citizenship: an analytical study. *Contemporary Education*, 31(97), 181–220.
- [24] Alotayby, H. (2016). *The Role of Art Educational Supervisors in Reinforcing Citizenship Values from The Teachers Point of View in The Primary Stage In Kuwait*. Unpublished Master Dissertation. Faculty of Educational sciences – AL Albayt University – Amman.
- [25] Ibrahim, M. A. (2003). *Teacher Formation System in the light of comprehensive Quality Standards*. Dar el Fikr for printing, publishing, and distribution, Amman.
- [26] Al-Zobi, I. (2017). *The role of social education teachers in the development of citizenship values among the students of basic education stage in Jordan from the point of view of the teachers and supervisors*. (Unpublished Master Dissertation). Faculty of Educational sciences – AL Albayt University – Amman.
- [27] Alsubaie, M. (2015). Hidden Curriculum as One of Current Issue of Curriculum. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 6(33), 125–128.
- [28] Anderson. Terry. (2001). The Hidden Curriculum in Distance Education: An Updated View. *Change*, 33(6).
- [29] Aspelin, J. (2019). Enhancing Pre-service Teachers' Socio-emotional Competence. *International Journal of Emotional Education*, 11(1), 153–168.
- [30] Barthes, A. (2018). The Hidden Curriculum of Sustainable Development- The Case of Curriculum Analysis in France. *Journal of Sustainability Education*, 18, 78–98.
- [31] Fidan, M. & Tuncel, M. (2018). Evaluation of Information Technologies Teachers' in-class Behaviors in the Context of Hidden Curriculum. *Journal of Education and Future*, 14, 31–56.
- [32] Sari, M. & Dixit, J. (2009). Hidden curriculum on gaining the value of respect for human dignity. *Educational sciences: Theory and practice*, 9(2), 925–940.
- [33] Semper, J. Blasco, M. (2018). Revealing the Hidden Curriculum in Higher Education. *Studies in Philosophy and Education*, 37(5), 481–495.