

Vth CONFERENCE OF THE INTERNATIONAL SOCIETY FOR THE STUDY OF EUROPEAN  
IDEAS

IV

95

Dominant Culture as a Foreign Culture. Dominant Group(s) in the Eyes of  
Minorities

Dr Janusz L. Mucha

The Invention of a Mission: the brief establishment of a Portuguese  
Catholic minority in renaissance Ethiopia

Manuel JoÆo Ramos

Dept. Antropologia Social,  
Instituto Superior de Ci^ncias do Trabalho e da Empresa,  
Avenida das Forças Armadas, 1600 - Lisboa,  
tel: 351-1-7935000  
fax: 351-1-7964710

Keywords: Ethiopia; Minorities; Portuguese

I hereby give permission to publish this paper in the proceedings of the  
1996 ISSEI Conference

(Manuel JoÆo Ramos)

25 September 1996

The Invention of a Mission: the brief establishment of a Portuguese  
Catholic minority in renaissance Ethiopia

Like many concepts in the social sciences, the notion of cultural minority entails some degree of fallacious labeling. In the Ethiopian context - and in the specific case here presented - that is particularly true. In a way, many Ethiopian cultural minorities, being demographically not that minor, have had historically strong pretensions to become cultural majorities(1). Ethiopians like to think of themselves as a minority within the African context, and thus as part of a Christian, historical, and literate, cultural dominant group; the monophysite Ethiopians thought and think of themselves as a minority within Christianity; the Jesuit (referred to in this article) were to some extent a minority in Portuguese ecclesiastical and political life during the counter-reformation years (dominated by

Dominican views); the Portuguese were a minority within the catholic community in Ethiopia...

The problem under consideration in this workshop must then be considered within the general framework of social empowerment and domination problems: frequently, a dominated cultural minority is simply defined by the fact that it isn't yet or is no more a dominant cultural minority in a given context.

A year ago, in August 1995, the roof and all the stone arches of an imposing church, which stood on a deserted small peninsula that enters the lake Tana in central Ethiopia, collapsed. With it were brought down the walls and every standing masonry work. Now, under the rubble of tons of cut stones, lie a quantity of decorative stone reliefs of portuguese and goese style of the early seventeenth century. Buried underneath lie also almost four whole centuries of abandon and oblivion that have besides touched the rest of the compound - the church actually adjoins a equally damaged royal palace of which only a tower still stands. Why, we could ask, would a fervently christian power like the Ethiopian ruling ethnical group show such an evident and, in some ways, exceptional neglect towards a once major religious and political monument?

To answer this question is to shed some light onto one and a half centuries of a sometimes intense relationship between the Christian Ethiopians and the renaissance Portuguese involved in the project and movement of what the latter called the "Discoveries" - i.e. the early stages of European world expansion. In general terms, the documentation show us that, partially due to the ideological conditions that embodied this expansion, the limits of the will of mutual understanding between culturally different communities could not be overcome; eventually, these limits caused such grave mutual mis-understandings that they quickened the cessation of that relationship.

It is true that, for a number of political, military, economic and even demographic conditions, the Portuguese overseas expansion in the Indian ocean was exhausted by the end of the sixteenth century(2). The Red Sea became inaccessible to the portuguese ships and diplomatic and strategic interest in Ethiopia dwindled considerably. But the community of portuguese migrants, their descendants - and the many catholic converts, some of mixed Portuguese-Ethiopian blood(3) -, was active and seemed to have had social importance, at least until the end of the reign of the emperor (or Negusa Negast) Susinyus (who died in 1632) - Susinyus was, in fact, the sovereign to whom the now derelict palace compound once belonged(4). Churches, palaces, castles, bridges, and civil constructions of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries testify of the relevance of portuguese influence, even in castles of sovereigns who, like the Negus Fasilidas, were demonstrably hostile towards the catholic minority.

We should keep in mind that, as eloquent as is the state of total abandon of the earlier mentioned church and palace in the Gorgora peninsula on lake Tana, so the fact that the presence of this minority, and the affairs of the Jesuits, is passed in almost complete silence in contemporary Ethiopian texts like the royal chronicle of Susinyus(5), express a strong intention of obscuring part of the memories of this emperor's times. It is, then, through the eyes of the portuguese migrants and travellers, and specifically in the letters and accounts of the Jesuit missionaries, that we must rely to try to reconstruct the history and purpose of this relationship(6). We shouldn't never-the-less forget that the vision they expressed of the Coptic Christians served, more than anything, to self-legitimize their own presence and identity as a specific group within Ethiopian society.

It seems certain that the Portuguese Catholic exerted a visible degree of influence in Ethiopian affairs: as military aides of the Copts against Somali and Galla-Oromo invaders, as artisans, masons and architects

participating in an important monumental building effort, unparalleled in Ethiopia since the times of Za'ra la'qob (7). On another level, the coming of the Jesuits to Ethiopia, which occurred some fifty years after the entrance of the first portuguese groups in the country, had a central inspiring objective: they attained at the conversion of the Coptic emperor to the catholic faith, the sovereign identified in Europe with the legendary king Prester John. Through intense politicking, that was finally achieved with his public baptism in 1625(8).

This ephemeral success of the Jesuit missionaries implied the (intended) forceful conversion of the Copts, and the simultaneous interdiction, in a Susinyus' imperial decree, of the age-old liturgical monophysite practices and doctrines(9). According to Jesuit accounts, Susinyus adopted Catholicism and died a baptized catholic. But, by then, the country was plunged in a raging civil and religious war that was brought to a close shortly after the expulsion of the Jesuits from Ethiopia and Eritreia. In 1634, the (documented) presence of the Catholic minority came to a sudden and abrupt end(10).

In Susinyus' royal chronicle, the absence of information concerning the Portuguese and Jesuit influence in his court (and the various religious disputes), might be, in some way, explained by the assumption that this chronicle was rewritten during his successor's reign - Fasilidas. This was now a time of very strong and negative reaction against the catholic community and the Jesuit missionary group. It was this reaction, exemplified in the persecution, killing and exile of the Catholic converts and the Jesuit missionaries(11), that would also account for the ostentatious abandon of the "catholic" Susinyus' palace compound in Gorgora, the one that included the presently destroyed catholic church(12).

It is now established that it was the erosion of the relation between emperor Susinyus and the monophysite clergy (plus the feudal class), and

his need to transcend the resistance of some sectors of Ethiopian society towards his rise to power (which he usurped from the appointed heir to the previous Negus), that resulted in his conversion to the catholic faith(13). But the political intentions behind the conversion to Catholicism - as a means to reduce the controlling power of the traditional Coptic clergy - seemed to have been largely misunderstood by the portuguese Jesuits, whose missionary zeal consequently led them to disregard and to try to suppress essential traits of the Coptic Ethiopian faith and culture(14). This action backfired and eventually resulted in the persecutions against the Catholic.

The reasons for Susinyus' actions and options, enigmatic and desperate as they seemed - in the context of Ethiopian politics -, don't concern us here. Instead, let us focus our attention in the motives that led to the equally strange obsession, on the part of the Jesuits - with the Vatican and some portuguese court circles behind them -, to convert the Ethiopian Copts to Catholicism. These motives were based in the essentially same ideological frame that, in the early sixteenth century, had directed the Portuguese to Ethiopia, in the first place.

So, to understand the way this catholic minority - through the words of the Jesuit missionaries - envisioned and categorized Ethiopian society, and particularly the Coptic dominant group, we must take into account the Portuguese, and also generally European, religious, political and cultural expectations towards the sought after "kingdom of the Prester John".

Prester John, as the utopian-like description of his Indian kingdom in the early medieval letters clearly show(15), was a very potent image of a Christmimetic priestly king, intimately connected with the concept, common in western Europe, of the "king of the last days" or "Endkaiser", who would, in alliance with a western sovereign, emerge from the Orient to conquer Palestine and free Jerusalem from Muslim hands - this pious act

would be a prophetic sign of the end of the world and, simultaneously, of its apocalyptic renewal, with the coming of the New Heavenly Jerusalem(16).

In the course of five centuries and up to the seventeenth century, we can witness the transformation and eventual eclipse of the Christmimetic image of the Indian priestly king reigning over a perfect society. This derived, not only from an overall alteration of the limits of History (since the end of the world hadn't happened and the End-kaiser hadn't liberated Jerusalem), but from specific circumstances like the Mongol invasions of Muslim and European countries, the fall of Bizantium and the western European travel and expansion to the East.

The gradual dissolution of the Christmimetic character of Prester John, and the abandoning of the millenarian theme of the end of the times, coincided with a new location for his kingdom, initially proposed in late medieval travellers' and cosmographers' accounts: Ethiopia or Nubia(17). The acceptance of an identity between the Prester John of the Letter and the actual Christian (but monophysite) ruler of the Ethiopian kingdom meant that he was now spatially and conceptually separated from the Christian Indian followers of Saint Thomas and the area of the spice production, and that he was an heretical black African ruling over heretical black Africans.

This change in Prester John's characterization - becoming black, he was consequently considered a cursed descendant of the biblical Cush(18) -, came to imply, in seventeenth century Jesuit literature, a suggestive tint of an evil character of the imperial Ethiopian figure. This change still depended upon particular cosmographical co-ordinates: a weakened Christmimetism was initially allowed, in this east African region, by the underlining, both in maps and in travel accounts, of its proximity to the sources of the Nile (one of the four rivers that were supposed to flow from Eden), its oriental and mountainous location (by the Mountains of the

Moon, one of the hypothetical emplacements of the Earthly Paradise), and the ancient identification of Ethiopia as the "third India"(19).

To understand the consequences of this displacement, we must keep in mind not only the intimate relationship between time and space coordinates in medieval thought, but that geographical space was equally intelligible through a system of religious, ethical, cosmic and elemental coordinates(20).

As can be seen in medieval ecumenical maps, with the East at the top and West at the bottom, the oecumena is conceived in more or less strict analogy with the body of Christ - the head, in the extreme East, is where the earthly Paradise is located and is nearer the celestial sphere; Jerusalem is the navel of the world; the feet, in the West, are its lowest part(21). In this system, where moving westward signified to go down and to degenerate, and to go East was to physically and ethically ascend, North and South also had analogical significance, in terms of the right and left sides of Christ's body. Whereas the colder northern regions were thought to be populated with long living and temperate people, the more one travels south, in the direction of the torrid zone, the more degenerate, dissolute and, eventually monstrous, humanity was thought to be. Africa, and specially its western part, was thus, both in cartographical and in cosmographical European expressions, a land that harboured a cursed, degenerate population(22).

As is easily recognisable, the ideological background of the Iberian discoveries was highly ecumenical. To "discover" (or to "uncover") the world was to cast the light of true faith upon the darkness of ignorance and evil that subjected non-Christian humanity(23). In the portuguese case, travel around Africa was also conceptualized as a crusading project which meant to a large extent the penetration of the continent through its water courses(24); these were thought to be connected, in some unknown ways, to the sources of the Nile (through a central African lake), and

consequently to Prester John's kingdom - the west african rulers were often treated as his vassals. At the same time, envoys of the Portuguese king were sent by land to East Africa, with letters to "Preste João das Índias"(25).

The alliance between Prester John and a western sovereign (now the portuguese king), that had come down from the medieval Letter, was to be kept alive in the Portuguese-Ethiopian diplomatic epistolary, and in Portuguese strategic military writings: the conquest of the Holy Land, and the destruction of the Muslim world are frequently suggested or proposed in the documentation(26). But, by the first half of the sixteenth century, the Ethiopian Negus was publicly and oficialy contacted and the discrepancies between the Ethiopian reality and the magnificent kingdom described in the Letter were highlighted by Portuguese writers(27).

Hereticism, poverty, evil ways and uncivilised, improper customs, jewish and arabic influences were to be held as definitive proofs of the inadequacy of the identification between the self-styled author of the Letter and this African ruler. This inadequacy became manifest when portuguese troops had to be sent inland to rescue the Negus' weak armies from defeat at the hands of the Somali invaders(28).

Specially in the writings of the Jesuit missionaries, for whom the conversion of the Ethiopian ruler and the search for the sources of the Nile were two interrelated obsessive goals, it is clear that the Ethiopian reality posed a difficult conceptual problem: like other travellers before, they retained the designation of "Prester John" as the valid title of the Negus; they confronted Ethiopian social and physical reality having the medieval Letter in their minds, and were eager to convert Ethiopia so it would conform to the Indian model.

Partly Christian but heretical, African but in some important ways Asiatic (with Semitic kingship structures, with Semitic language and writing systems), degenerate but visibly "civilized" since the Aksumite period,

Ethiopia was, in the end, to be declared a true monstrosity, by the Jesuit writers(29).

In this context, it is interesting to note that, in their attempts to convert the Ethiopian sovereign to Catholicism, the Jesuit missionaries seemed to have followed the narrative model of the early accounts, inspired by Syrian religious literature, that depicted the Christian conversion of India(30).

These stories elaborate on the close relationship between the patriarch of India and the king, or the king's son, who is ordained a deacon. Here, references are made to a celestial palace given by Saint Thomas to the Indian sovereign, Gundafor. This same motive reappears in the twelfth century Letter, where it is said that Prester John's and Gundafor's palaces are identical(31).

Curiously enough, but by no means coincidentally, Pero Pais, the Jesuit who managed the conversion of the Negus Susinyus to Catholicism was the same who designed and presided over the construction of the palace and church on lake Tana - which is, incidentally, the source of the Blue Nile.

In Jesuit writings, the connexion between the mythical Indian king and the real Ethiopian king was now being suggested by an analogy, not with the final but with the initial part of the Indian king's reign, before his conversion by Saint Thomas (supposedly the first patriarch of India), and therefore prior to the establishment of his Christmimetic quality and of his character of "king of the last days". Thus, by a structural correspondence with its early stages - through the palace, the patriarchy, the conversion and the source of the Nile -, the Prester John's cycle was, thus, about to end.

The analysis of the portuguese Catholic minority's views of the Copts gives us a curious historical example of how ethnocentric ideology can express itself. Starting with a medieval millenarian elaboration of a

semi-divine, Christlike, hypothetical ally, the later invention of a mirrored "black Prester John", in need of conversion, was used to help justify two consecutive failures: the failure of the Portuguese crusading projects of the sixteenth century, and that of a Jesuit mission, a century after. Since a diplomatic and military alliance had lost purpose, a western style political and religious model was then tentatively introduced to, and rejected by, Ethiopian society. For the persecuted Portuguese of the early seventeenth century, that eventually implied a demonizing of the Copts and a final clear refusal of any identity between the figure of the Negus and the legendary Prester John of the Indies(32). In conclusion: the difficulties the spiritual leaders of the Catholic minority had in understanding the main flux of the dominant Coptic culture in Ethiopia derived from their overwhelming expectations in the issues of Catholic ecumenism and political domination, tainted with racism and cultural intransigence. That this intransigence could work both ways is now very visible in the catholic ruins of the Gorgora peninsula on lake Tana.

#### Endnotes

(1) The Jewish community (the Falasha or Beta-Israel), like the tigrean and Eritreian Christians (frequently opposed to the Amharic group), the Muslin from Adar, and the Gala (Oromo) peoples have many times, in Ethiopian long history of civil and religious wars, shown this very pretension.

(2) See C. R. Boxer, *The Dutch Seaborne Empire, 1600-1800*, London 1965; J. CortesÆo, *Os Descobrimentos portugueses*, vol. VI, Lisboa, 1985 (1962); V. MagalhÆes Godinho, *Mito e mercadoria-Utopia e pr tica de navegar - S,culos XIII-XVIII*, Lisboa, 1990; A. Kammerer, *La Mer Rouge. L'Abyssinie et l'Arabie aux XVI et XVII siŠcles*, le Caire, 1947.

(3) Like some of their most militant Copt opponents, the Catholic converts had in the Imperial family and circles their most important leaders (specially Susinyus' brother, the overlord Si'la Kristos). In the early seventeenth century, they "probably surpassed a hundred thousand" (see M. Abir, *Ethiopia and the Red Sea*, London, 1980, p. 221); a century after, the famous empress Mentuab (Walatta Giyorgis) was renowned for her Portuguese- Ethiopian origin: "The Queen inherited the colour of her European ancestors; indeed, was whiter than most Portuguese. She was very vain of this her descent...", James Bruce, *Travels to Discover the Source of the Nile in the Years 1768-1773*, vol. II, Edinburgh, 1790, p. 611.

(4) On the building of the palace of Susinyus, see F. M. Esteves Pereira, *Chronica de Susenuys*, vol. II, Lisboa, 1892-1900, p. 239 seq.

(5) See Text and translation in: F. M. Esteves Pereira, *op. cit.*.

(6) It is, actually, through the reading of the chronicles of military achievements, the study of Ethiopian architecture of portuguese influence, and the analysis of the contemporary writings of the Jesuit missionaries - a special group with declared empowerment interests in the Ethiopian court -, that we can glimpse at the otherwise largely undocumented presence and evolution of a catholic minority in a country where the Coptic Christian majority ruled over an ethnically and religiously diverse population.

(7) E. Ullendorf, *The Ethiopians: Introduction to Country and People*, Oxford, 1973 (1960), p. 158.

(8) Baltazar Telles, *Histçria geral da Etiçpia a Alta ou Preste JoÆo*, Coimbra, pp. 321 seq.; Bruce, *Ibidem*, III, pp. 353-356; see also M. Abir, *Ibid.*, pp. 211 seq.

- (9) M. Abir, *Ibid.*, pp. 221-222; J.-B. Coulbeaux, *Histoire politique et religieuse de l'Abyssinie*, Paris, 1929, pp. 209-213.
- (10) Even if it is more than likely that some portuguese stayed on, as traders and masons, for it was only with Yohannes I, the grand-son of Susinyus, that the "Franks" - *ferenji*, i.e., the Portuguese - were forced to join the monophysite Church (see E. Ullendorf, *Ibid.*, p. 76).
- (11) J.-B. Coulbeaux, *Ibid.*, pp. 245-246; B. Telles, *Ibid.*, p. 352-366.
- (12) In fact, Fasilidas' own palace, in Gondar, closely ressembling a portuguese medieval castle, is itself decorated with stone pillaged from Susinyus palace in Gorgora (oral communication of J.J. Hespeler-Boulbee, 1996).
- (13) M. Abir, *Ibid.* pp. 204-207, 220-221.
- (14) M. Abir, *Ibid.*, pp. 224-226; F. P. Caraman, *The Lost Empire: the Story of the Jesuits in Ethiopia*, London, Chapter I.
- (15) See the compillation of the *Epistola Johannes Presbyter*, with inclusion of the latin versions of interpolations in: F. Zarncke, "Der Presbyter Johannes", *Abhandl. K"nig. S.,chs. Gesellschaft der Wissenschaften, Phil. Hist. Klasse, VII*, Leipzig, 1879, pp. 909-924.
- (16) M. Gosman, "Otto de Freising et le Pr"tre Jean", *Rev. Belge de Phil. et d'Hist.*, LXI, 1983, pp.270-284.
- (17) See the accounts of travellers such as Pero Tafur and Niccol" de' Conti (in: M. Longhena, (ed.), *Viaggi in Persia, India e Giava*, Milano, 1929), and Jourdan Catalan of Severac, *Mirabilia descripta - Wonders of the East*, (ed. H. Yule), London, 1863; on cartographical information on Ethiopia, see: Y. K. Fall, *L'Afrique ... la naissance de la Cartographie moderne*, Paris, 1982, p. 183; U. Knefelkamp, *Die Suche nach dem Reich des Priesterk"nigs Johannes*, Gelsenkirchen, 1986, p. 102.
- (18) Genesis, X, 10. Cf. Devisse, J, Mollat, M., *L'image du noir dans l'art occidental II*, 2 vols. Paris-Fribourg, 1978.
- (19) F. Medeiros, *L'Occident et l'Afrique (XIIIe. - XVe. siŠcle)*, Paris,

1985, pp. 87-94.

(20) D. Lecoq, "Rome ou Jérusalem: cartographie médiévale entre l'influence antique et l'influence chrétienne", *C. F. C.*, CXXI, Dez. 1989, pp. 22 seq.

(21) This can be seen very clearly in the now lost Ebbensdorf ecumenical map of the early XIVth. century.

(22) F. Medeiros, *Ibid.*, pp. 163 seq.

(23) J. Barradas de Carvalho, *La Recherche de la Spécificité de la Renaissance portugaise*, Paris, vol. II, 1983, p. 529 seq.; see also W. G. Randles, "Sur l'Idée de Découverte", in: M. Mollat & P. Adam (eds.) *Aspects internationaux de la découverte océanique auX<sup>e</sup> et XVI<sup>e</sup> siècles*, Paris, 1966, pp. 3 seq.

(24) Randles, W. G., "Notes on the Genesis of the Discoveries", *Studia*, IV, Lisboa, 1960, pp. 20-27.

(25) On Pero da Covilhã's travels, see: F. M. Conde de Ficalho, *Viagens de Pero da Covilhã*, Lisboa, 1898.

(26) Cf. the *Carta das Novas que vieram a el rei nosso senhor do descobrimento do Preste João*, Lisboa, (1521); see also the *Comentarios de Afonso d'Albuquerque*, Lisboa, (1576), pp. IV, XVIII.

(27) See P. Francisco Alvares, *Verdadeira informação das terras do Preste João das Índias*, 1543. On the theological polemics derived from the presence of the Ethiopian ambassador Zaga Zaab in Portugal see: G. Besha, M.W. Aregay, *The Question of the Union of the Churches in Luso-Ethiopian Relations (1500-1632)*, Lisboa, 1964; A. J. Davis, "Background to the Zaga Zab Embassy: an Ethiopian Diplomatic Mission to Portugal (1527-1539)", *Studia*, n<sup>o</sup> 32, Jun. 1971, pp. 211-302.

(28) 1541-1543; cf. the narrative of these successes in the contemporary work of Miguel de Castanhoso, *O Tratado dos feitos de Cristovão da Gama em Etiópia*.

(29) P. Manuel Almeida, *Historia de Etiópia-a-Alta ou Abissia* (ms.

S.O.A.S., 11,966), p. XXXIV., in: C. F. Beckingham, G. W. B Huntingford  
(eds.), *Some Records of Ethiopia*, London, 1954.

(30) Namely the Syrian Acts of Thomas.

(31) F. Zarncke, *Ibid.*, p. 917.

(32) P. Jerônimo Lobo, *Itinerário e outros escritos inéditos* (ed. P. M.  
Gonçalves da Costa), Porto, 1971, pp. 786-789.