

The *Amicus Curiae* in
International Criminal
Justice

Sarah Williams
Hannah Woolaver
and
Emma Palmer

• H A R T •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

HART PUBLISHING
Bloomsbury Publishing Plc
Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, UK
1385 Broadway, New York, NY 10018, USA
29 Earlsfort Terrace, Dublin 2, Ireland

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are
trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc
First published in Great Britain 2020

First published in hardback, 2020
Paperback edition, 2021

Copyright © The Authors severally 2020

The Authors have asserted their right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be
identified as Authors of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by
any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information
storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or
damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it
can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown
Copyright ©. All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is
Parliamentary Copyright ©. This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government
Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>) except
where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European
Union, <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2021.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Williams, Sarah (Writer on law), author. | Woolaver, Hannah, author. |
Palmer, Emma (Writer on law), author.

Title: *The amicus curiae* in international criminal justice / Sarah Williams,
Hannah Woolaver, Emma Palmer.

Description: Chicago : Hart Publishing, an imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing, 2020. |
Series: Studies in international and comparative criminal law; volume 18 |
Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019044119 (print) | LCCN 2019044120 (ebook) |
ISBN 9781509913329 (hardback) | ISBN 9781509913336 (Epub)

Subjects: LCSH: *Amicus curiae* | Criminal justice, Administration of—International
cooperation. | International criminal courts. | Criminal procedure (International law)

Classification: LCC KZ7235 .W55 2020 (print) | LCC KZ7235 (ebook) | DDC 345/.05—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019044119>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019044120>

ISBN: HB: 978-1-50991-332-9
PB: 978-1-50995-470-4
ePDF: 978-1-50991-334-3
ePub: 978-1-50991-333-6

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon

To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk. Here you will find
extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

Table of Contents

Foreword	v
Acknowledgements	vii
Table of Abbreviations	xv
Table of Cases and Decisions	xix
Table of Treaties, Legislation and Selected Primary Materials	xlix
1. International Criminal Tribunals, Legitimacy and the <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	1
I. Introduction	1
II. Why International Criminal Tribunals? And Which Ones?	3
III. Legitimacy in International Criminal Justice	5
IV. Legitimacy and the <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	17
V. Method and Chapter Overview	22
2. The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> in Comparative Perspective	25
I. Adopting a Functional Approach	25
II. Standing to Bring a Claim	27
A. Standing Rules in International and Regional Institutions	27
B. Standing at the National Level	29
III. Joinder of Claims and Cases	30
IV. Intervention	31
A. Intervention at the International Level	31
i. Intervention as of Right	31
ii. Intervention as a Matter of Discretion	31
iii. Status and Rights of Interveners	35
iv. Participation in Advisory Proceedings	35
B. Intervention in National Level Systems	36
1. Intervention as of Right	36
ii. Intervention as a Matter of Discretion	37
C. Rights Attached to Intervention	41
D. Intervention in Criminal Proceedings	42
V. The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> : A Friend of the Court	45
A. The Traditional <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Model	45
B. Transplantation and Adaptation of the Traditional <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	46
C. The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> in Civil Law Jurisdictions	49
D. The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> in Criminal Proceedings	52

x *Table of Contents*

E.	The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> in International Institutions	54
i.	Closed Institutions: The ICJ and ITLOS.....	54
ii.	A Conflicted Position: The WTO.....	58
iii.	Open Institutions: Investor-State Investment Arbitration Panels and Regional Human Rights Tribunals.....	60
F.	Impact of the <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	67
VI.	Relevance of Comparative Practice to International Criminal Tribunals.....	72
3.	The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> in International Criminal Tribunals: An Introduction	75
I.	Overview	75
II.	Standing in International Criminal Tribunals.....	75
A.	Standing to Initiate an Investigation	75
B.	Joinder	78
C.	Intervention	78
III.	History of <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Participation in International Criminal Tribunals	79
A.	Post WWII Institutions.....	79
B.	ICTY, the ICTR and the SCSL.....	80
C.	International Criminal Court.....	81
D.	STL and ECCC.....	84
E.	Other Hybrid and Internationalised Courts.....	86
F.	Conclusion	89
IV.	The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Prosecutor and the Prosecutor as <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	90
A.	The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Prosecutor.....	90
B.	The Prosecutor as <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	91
V.	Limits on <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Participation.....	93
A.	Core Judicial Competence.....	93
B.	Defence Rights: The Counterbalance to Participation.....	96
VI.	The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> and Other Mechanisms for Expertise, Representation and Communication	97
A.	Participation of Victims	98
i.	Overview	98
ii.	Victim Participation at the ICC	99
iii.	Victim Participation – The ECCC and STL	100
iv.	Conclusion: Victim Participation and the <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	102
B.	Representation in Reparations Proceedings at the ICC.....	103
C.	Expert Witnesses.....	104
i.	Appointing Expert Witnesses	104
ii.	Who is an Expert Witness?.....	106
iii.	Expert Witnesses and the <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	107
D.	Institutional Actors.....	109
VII.	Conclusion	111

4. The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> in International Criminal Tribunals in Practice.....	112
I. Introduction	112
II. Who Can Participate as an <i>Amicus Curiae</i> ?	113
III. When Can an <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Participate?.....	114
A. ‘At any Time of Proceedings’	114
B. <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Practice Over the Life of an Institution	117
IV. How do <i>Amici Curiae</i> Participate?	118
A. Process for Admission of <i>Amici Curiae</i>	118
i. Invitations, Open Calls and Voluntary Applications.....	118
ii. Role of the Parties in the Approval Process	120
B. Modes of <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Participation.....	121
C. Managing <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Participation	122
D. Status, Rights and Responsibilities of the <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	124
i. Status and Rights of the <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	124
ii. Duties of the <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	126
V. Substantive Criteria for Admitting <i>Amici Curiae</i>	127
A. The General Criterion for Admission	127
B. Fair Trial	132
i. Trial Without Undue Delay	132
ii. Equality of Arms	133
C. Expeditious and Efficient Proceedings	136
D. Duplication	137
E. Timeliness	138
F. The Stage of Proceedings	138
G. The Impact of <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Participation on the Parties	141
H. Legal or Factual Submissions	142
I. Relevance.....	143
J. Nature, Novelty and Importance of the Issues Raised	144
K. Independence.....	146
L. Impartiality and the Presence or Absence of an Interest	148
M. Expertise and Experience	149
N. Availability of Alternative Avenues	152
O. Professionalism and Ethics	153
P. Representativeness and Plurality of Voices	153
Q. Background of the Judges	156
R. The Function an <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Will be Performing.....	158
VI. Impact of <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Submissions	159
A. Minimal Influence.....	159
B. Moderate Influence	160
C. Significant Influence	163
VII. Participation in ICC Reparations Proceedings.....	165
A. The Nature of Reparations Proceedings and Identifying the Parties.....	166

xii *Table of Contents*

B.	Institutional Participants.....	167
C.	Legal Basis for Participation by Other Actors: Article 75(3) or Rule 103?.....	170
D.	Differences in Practice in Reparations Phase	175
i.	Rates of Acceptance and Variations in Procedure.....	175
ii.	What Functions are <i>Amici Curiae</i> Performing?	176
iii.	Influence of Submissions in Reparations Proceedings.....	178
VIII.	Conclusions	178
5.	Civil Society Actors as <i>Amici Curiae</i>	180
I.	Introduction	180
II.	Overview of Civil Society Actors at International Criminal Tribunals	184
A.	Non-Governmental Organisations.....	184
B.	Academics	187
C.	International Organisations	191
D.	Individuals	193
III.	The Expertise Function and Civil Society Actors.....	194
A.	Legal or Factual Expertise?.....	196
B.	Identification of Expertise of Civil Society <i>Amici</i>	198
C.	Independence and Impartiality of Civil Society <i>Amici</i> in the Expertise Function	200
IV.	Representation of Interests by Civil Society as <i>Amici Curiae</i>	202
V.	The Communicative Function and Civil Society	207
VI.	Impact of Civil Society <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Submissions	212
VII.	Conclusion	215
6.	The <i>Amicus Curiae</i> and the Defence	218
I.	Introduction	218
II.	Overview of Defence <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Practice	220
III.	The Defence and the Provision of Expertise through the <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	224
IV.	The Use of the <i>Amicus Curiae</i> to Represent the Interests of the Defence.....	230
A.	Where the Accused has no Right to Participate	234
B.	Proceedings <i>in Absentia</i>	237
C.	Self-Representing Accused.....	240
V.	The Communicative Function and the Defence.....	248
VI.	Conclusion	252
7.	Representing State Interests.....	254
I.	Introduction	254
II.	Overview of State and International Organisation <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Practice	256

III. State and International Organisation <i>Amici</i> Providing Expertise	258
IV. The State or International Organisation <i>Amici</i> Representing an Interest	260
A. Representation of Nationals	260
B. Representing a <i>State</i> Interest.....	263
i. State Interests Arising in Trial Proceedings.....	263
ii. State Interests Arising in Related Proceedings	268
a. Jurisdiction and Admissibility	269
b. Cooperation and Non-cooperation Proceedings.....	273
c. Head of State Immunity.....	275
V. State <i>Amici</i> Performing a Communicative Function	276
VI. The Challenge of Engaging Reluctant or Resistant States.....	287
VII. Conclusion	289
8. Conclusion	292
<i>Annex A: Methodology for Data Collection and Analysis</i>	<i>300</i>
<i>Annex B: Table of Amicus Curiae Rules and Directions.....</i>	<i>311</i>
<i>Annex C: Practical Guidance.....</i>	<i>327</i>
<i>Bibliography</i>	<i>342</i>
<i>Index.....</i>	<i>353</i>