

Indo-Aryan -(a)uartanna in the Kikkuli treatise

Kloekhorst, A.; Lubotsky, A.; Fellner, H.; Malzahn, M.; Peyrot, M.

Citation

Kloekhorst, A., & Lubotsky, A. (2021). Indo-Aryan -(a)uartanna in the Kikkuli treatise. In H. Fellner, M. Malzahn, & M. Peyrot (Eds.), *lyuke wmer ra: Indo-European studies in honor of Georges-Jean Pinault* (pp. 331-336). Ann Arbor, New York: Beech Stave Press. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3480048

Version:	Publisher's Version
License:	Licensed under Article 25fa Copyright Act/Law (Amendment Taverne)
Downloaded from:	https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3480048

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

lyuke wmer ra

Indo-European Studies in Honor of

Georges-Jean Pinault

edited by

Hannes A. Fellner Melanie Malzahn Michaël Peyrot



Offprint from Hannes A. Fellner, Melanie Malzahn, and Michaël Peyrot, Lyuke wmer ra: Indo-European Studies in Honor of Georges-Jean Pinault. Copyright © 2021 by Beech Stave Press, Inc. All rights reserved.

© 2021 Beech Stave Press, Inc. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Typeset with LATEX using the Galliard typeface designed by Matthew Carter and Greek Old Face by Ralph Hancock. The typeface on the cover is Bourgogne by Steve Peter.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

ISBN 978-0-9895142-9-3 (alk. paper)

Printed in the United States of America

23 22 21 3 2 I

Table of Contents

LYUKE WMER RA



Prefaceix
Bibliography of Georges-Jean Pinaultxi
List of Contributorsxxix
Douglas Q. Adams, The dual endings of the verb in Tocharian B
and their Proto-Indo-European background
Émilie Aussant, The Vyākaraņic descriptive model
and the French grammars of Sanskrit12
Nalini Balbir, À propos d'un lapidaire prakrit
Alain Blanc, L'histoire compliquée de l'adjectif grec à daupós
Václav Blažek, A hypothetical Tocharian contribution to Chinese
astronomical terminology
Joel P. Brereton, How the Gāyatrī became the Gāyatrī
Gerd Carling, Flat mirror or well-shaped disc? Tocharian A tāpaki (B tapākye)
and A <i>mukär*</i>
Adam Alvah Catt, A newly identified Tocharian fragment of the Tridandisūtra90
Ching Chao-jung, He sat down on the grass under a Nyagrodha tree:
On the Kuchean word <i>atiyo</i> * $\sim atiya$ * in Kumtura mural painting captions 101
Éric Dieu, Accentuation récessive et accentuation columnale en grec ancien,
avec quelques considérations sur la loi de limitation
Hannes A. Fellner, Polar life in the Tarim Basin
José Luis García Ramón, The development of the labiovelars in Greek:
Sound change, areal diffusion, and the myth of the three phases
Romain Garnier, The PIE word for 'name'152
Laura Grestenberger, The <i>in</i> -group: Indo-Iranian <i>in</i> -stems and their
Indo-European relatives 164
Olav Hackstein, On Latin arbor and why tree is grammatically feminine
in PIE

Table of Contents

Carmen Spiers, La malédiction de l'observateur (upadrastár-)
dans l'Atharvaveda487
Brent Vine, biass biitam, valetudinem vitam: On alliteration
in Italic curse texts 501
Michael Weiss, Barley in Anatolian, Tocharian, and elsewhere:
A fine-grained analysis
Jens Wilkens and Hans Nugteren, Notes on Old Uyghur lexicography
and etymology527
Kazuhiko Yoshida, The Hittite 3 pl. preterites in -ar revisited 538
Peter Zieme, Das letzte Blatt der Sängimer Einleitung zum
Maitrisimit nom bitig und ein tocharisches Wort
Stefan Zimmer, Le suffixe gaulois *- <i>ēto</i> 554
Index Verborum

Indo-Aryan °(*a*)*uartanna* in the Kikkuli treatise

ALEXANDER LUBOTSKY ヴ ALWIN KLOEKHORST

I. As is well known, the Middle Hittite treatise on horse training composed by Kikkuli, "the horse trainer from the land of Mittanni,"¹ contains many technical terms from his native language, Hurrian, several of which are generally explained as in fact being loanwords from Indo-Aryan.² Especially the compounds containing Indo-Aryan numerals have attracted a lot of attention, because they clearly demonstrate the Indo-Aryan provenance of these loanwords. The first members of these terms, *aikauartanna*,³ *tierauartanna* (glossed in Hittite as 'three turns/rounds'),⁴ *panzauartanna* (glossed in Hittite as 'five turns/rounds'),⁵ *šattauartanna* (glossed in Hittite as 'seven turns/rounds'),⁶ and *năuartanna*,⁷ can be directly connected with the Sanskrit numerals *éka*- 'one' (< **aika*-),⁸ *trí*- 'three', *páñca*- 'five', *saptá*- 'seven', and

⁵pa-an-za-ua-ar-ta-an-na (KBo 3.2 obv.¹ 58, glossed as "uuahnuar 5").

¹KUB 1.13 i 1–2: UMMA ^mKIKKULI ^{LÚ}ĀŠ[Š]UŠŠANNI ŠA KUR ^{URU}MITTANNI.

²We use the term Indo-Aryan for the Indo-Iranian language which shows typical non-Iranian traits, even though the term is unfortunate because the Indo-Aryans of the Mittanni most probably were never in India.

³*a-i-ka-ua-ar-ta-an-na* (KB0 3.5 i 17, 21). Note that Kammenhuber (1961:80 with n. 20) cites the form of KB0 3.5 i 21 as *a-i-ka ua-ar-ta-an-na*, i.e. with a word space between *aika* and *uartanna*. On the hand copy of this texts there indeed seems to be a word space present (FEAT/AARTAN), but if we compare this to the photograph of this tablet as available on Hetkonk (IPAT/AARTAN); note that the two pieces on each side of the break join directly), it is clear that in fact no space is there: we can thus safely read *a-i-ka-ua-ar-ta-an-na* here as well.

⁺ti-e-ra-ua-an-ta-an-na (KBo 3.2 obv.[!] 65, glossed as "uuahnuuar 3"), ti-e-ru[-ur-t]a-an-na (KBo 3.2 lower edge 2, glossed as "uuahn[uuar 3]"), ti-e-ra-u-ur-ta-an</br>
(KBo 3.5 iii 37), ti-e-ru-u-ur-ta-an-na (KBo 3.5 iii
17), ti-e</br>17), ti-e-ua-ar-ta-an-na (KUB 1.11 + iv 35, glossed as "3 μahnuu[auar]").

⁶ša-at-ta-ua-ar-ta-an-na (KB0 3.2 obv.¹ 18, rev.¹ 8, both glossed as "uualmuuar 7"), ša-at-(ta-)ua-ar-ta-anna (KUB 1.11+ ii 43, glossed as "7 uual¹muuar").

⁷*na-a-ua-ar-ta-an-na* (KBo 3.2 obv.¹ 36), *na-ua-ar-ta-an-ni* (KBo 3.2 rev.¹ 24). According to Kammenhuber 1961:138 n. 63, the latter form "flektiert... als heth. Dativ auf *-i.*"

⁸It can be demonstrated that the monophthongization of **ai* to *e* must at least be posterior to compilation of the Atharva-Veda and maybe even later (cf. Lubotsky 2012). The single spelling of *k* in Hitt. *aikauartanna* does not, as stated by Starke (1995:63 n. 146), represent a voiced [g]: it rather represents a short voiceless stop [k] (note that Hittite had long stops as well), which can be directly equated with the **k* of Indo-Aryan **aika-*.

náva- 'nine'.⁹ Although this connection is no doubt correct, a few remarks are in order.

Two minor formal deviations can be resolved relatively easily. The compound *năuartanna* instead of **naua-uartanna* is likely to be due to haplology,¹⁰ whereas *šatta-uartanna* instead of **šapta*^o can be explained by assimilation of the cluster **-pt*-to *-tt-*,¹¹ either in the Indo-Aryan dialect from which this term derives or in the Hurrian language that borrowed it.

Nevertheless, there are two problems which, in our view, have not been sufficiently accounted for, namely, the origin of the second member of all these compounds, and the relationship between the Hittite spelling tier(a)- and Indo-Aryan tri- 'three'. Although these two issues may at first sight look unrelated, they may have the same source, as we shall presently see.

2. The first problem we will treat is the form and meaning of the second member of these compounds. There are essentially two different approaches to the meaning of the *°µartanna* compounds. One operates with the meaning 'one, three, five, etc. rounds' (Kammenhuber 1961), while the other favors the meaning 'one, three, five, etc. turns' (Starke 1995). For an overview of different viewpoints on this matter, cf. Raulwing 2006. Since the viewpoints strongly depend on the intricacies of horse training, of which we cannot form an independent judgment, we refrain from taking sides in this issue. For the following discussion it is nevertheless important to keep in mind that *°µartanna* must mean either 'round' or 'turn'.

As far as the etymological proposals for $^{\circ}\mu artanna$ are concerned, the literature up to 1964 has been summarized by Mayrhofer (1965), to which we refer the reader, and since that article no new insights have been proposed, as far as we know.¹² At first, $^{\circ}\mu artanna$ was usually taken at face value and compared to Sanskrit *vartana-*, a derivative in *-ana-* from the root *vrt-* 'to turn'. This Sanskrit neuter noun is attested only fairly late, however (the oldest attestation seems to be *Kātyāyana Śrautasūtra* 8.4.2, which is a late Vedic text), and has the meaning of an action noun, 'the act of rolling on, moving forward'. This does not seem suitable for the compounds in $^{\circ}\mu artanna$.

Another etymological proposal connected Skt. *vartani-* f. 'wheel edge' (RV), 'turning of the wheel, track, course, trail of the wind' (RV+), but this proposal was not generally accepted because of the formal difference between the *i*-stem in Sanskrit vs. the *a*-stem of *°uartanna*. In his 1965 article, Mayrhofer pointed to a few parallel cases in Indo-Iranian, where an *i*-stem simplex corresponds to an *a*-stem compound:

⁹Note that Hitt. z = [ts] and $\dot{s} = [s]$, cf. e.g. Klockhorst 2019.

¹⁰Thus already Kronasser 1956:223 ("nawartanna dissimiliert aus nava-vartana-").

¹¹Thus already, e.g., Kronasser 1956:223. The alternative view that **sapta-* would have been changed to *šatta*in analogy to the Hurrian word for 'seven', *šitta* (thus, e.g., Kammenhuber 1961:19–20, cf. also *HEG* 2.956), seems less likely to us: we would then expect a form ***šittauartanna*.

¹²Cf. the treatment in *HEG* 4.173-4.

Skt. *angúri*- (RV), *angúli*- (VS+) f. 'finger' vs. *daśāngulá*- n. 'length of ten fingers' (RV), or PIr. **Hanguri*- (> Oss. *angwyl3*, *angul3a* 'finger') vs. YAv. *zairimiiaŋura*m. 'turtle, i.e. whose toes are in a house'. Nevertheless, this phenomenon (*i*-stem simplex vs. *a*-stem compound) is very rare in Indo-Iranian,¹³ and the Rgvedic compound *dvi-vartaní*- 'having a double track' (10.61.20) shows that *vartaní*- did not necessarily change its stem in compounds with numerals. Furthermore, there are semantic problems: in Sanskrit, *vartaní*- clearly refers to the turning of the wheel and to the track it leaves behind, so that we then have to assume that Kikkuli used the word in the sense 'round' < 'track', which is possible, but is not supported by any evidence.

3. It seems therefore better to return to the first solution, albeit in an improved fashion. As mentioned above, Sanskrit *vartana-* is attested only late and does not have a suitable meaning, but if we assume that the °*µartanna* compounds contain the noun \bar{a} -vartana-, with the preverb \bar{a} , both problems disappear.

The oldest attestation of \bar{a} -vártana- is RV 10.19.4–5, in a hymn where cows are asked to come home:

yán niyấnam nyáyanam, samjñấnam yát parấyaṇam | āvártanam nivártanam, yó gopấ ápi tám huve || yá udấnad vyáyanam, yá udấnat parấyaṇam | āvártanam nivártanam, ápi gopấ ní vartatām ||

'Also the one who is the cowherd—I call him to the journeying back, the coming back, the bringing to agreement, and the going away, to the turning here and the turning back.

He who has managed the dispersal, who has managed the going away, the turning here, and the turning back—let the cowherd also turn back.' (Jamison and Brereton 2014)

The expression $\bar{a}v \dot{a}rtanam$ niv $\dot{a}rtanam$ 'turning back, turning home' is repeated (sometimes with slight variations) in RV-Khila 3.15.8; $\dot{S}S$ 6.77.2 = PS 19.16.2, TS 3.3.10.1, SāmavidhānaBr. 2.5.9, TBr. 3.7.9.8. The action noun $\bar{a}v \dot{a}rtana$ - is a productive derivative of a very frequent Vedic combination \bar{a} - \sqrt{vrt} - 'to turn, turn back, return'. Because of the productivity of the suffix -ana-, we cannot ascertain the age of $\bar{a}v \dot{a}rtana$ -, but nothing precludes it from being of Proto-Indo-Iranian date. Also in some of the Iranian languages, $*\bar{a}-\sqrt{vart}$ - shows the meaning 'to return', cf. Buddh. Sogd. ''w'rt, Man. Sogd. ''wrt / $\bar{a}wart$ / 'to (re)turn' (cf. also Man.Sogd. ''wrt nwrtyy / $\bar{a}wart-niwart\bar{e}$ / 'to go to and fro'), Khwar. m|'wrd- 'to turn back, return', so at least the meaning seems to be well established for Indo-Iranian.

¹³Apart from the word for 'finger', most other examples given by Wackernagel (1905:118f.), Debrunner (1954:140), and Debrunner (1957:37) concern post-Vedic forms or those only mentioned by the grammarians (e.g., Pāṇini 5.4.102 *tryañjala-* 'three handfuls' vs. ŚBr.+ *añjali-* m. 'open hands folded together'). The situation with Skt. *syoná-* /*s_iyona-*/ 'pleasant, agreeable' (< *su-yoná-*), YAv. *hu-iiaona-* 'comfortable' vs. Skt. *yóni-* m. 'seat, place, home, residence, womb, lap', YAv. *yaona-* m. 'way, course' is too complicated to serve as a good illustration of the phenomenon.

4. We would expect that in the compounds with **aika-*, **panča-*, **sapta-*, and **naua-*, the final -*a* of the numerals would fuse with the initial \bar{a} - of * $\bar{a}uartana$ -, yielding forms with a long *- \bar{a} -. However, in the attested forms, no vowel length of the *- \bar{a} -seems to be expressed in writing. We may therefore assume that at some moment in the process of the borrowing of these compounds into Hurrian vowel length was lost.¹⁴ The result is, however, that in these forms there is no formal way to distinguish between the interpretations *°*uartana-* and *°*uartana-*. This is not the case for the compound with **tri-*, however. Thus far, it was difficult to explain why an Indo-Aryan compound **tri-uartana-* or **tri-uartani-* would end up in Hittite as *tierauartanna*, with an -*a*- before the u.¹⁵ With our identification of the second part of the compound as reflecting Indo-Aryan *°*ūuartana-*, this problem vanishes.

5. The remaining problem regarding *tierauartanna* is the relationship between the element that in Hittite is spelled *tier-* and the Indo-Aryan numeral **tri-*. According to *HEG* 4.373, the remarkable spelling of the Hittite form expresses the "Schwierigkeit, die anlautende Doppelkonsonanz /tr/ adäquat wiederzugeben." This can hardly be correct, however: an initial sequence [tri-] would in Hittite be spelled ***ta-ri-*, without any problems. Another solution is suggested by Benveniste (1962:86), referred to by Mayrhofer (1965:11 n. 2), who argues that the element spelled *ti-e-ra-* can be interpreted as /tera-/, which to his mind is reminiscent of the stem of the numeral '3' as attested in Hittite, *teri-* (gen.pl. *terijaš*, but cf. also derivatives like *terijan* adv. 'the third time'). He therefore proposes that /tera-/ be explained "par une adaptation à la forme hittite" (1962:87).

Although ingenious at first sight, this explanation cannot withstand scrutiny. First, the compounds in *°auartanna* are technical terms that belong to the vocabulary of Kikkuli, who was a native speaker of Hurrian. Also the scribe(s) who wrote down the physical tablets that contain these terms were very likely native speakers of Hurrian (cf. Kammenhuber 1961:42, who proposes that the tablets are produced as a team effort of "Kikkuli mit einem Stab von hurrischen Mitarbeiter"). This means that *tierauartanna* could hardly have undergone influence by the Hittite word for the numeral '3'.

Second, and more importantly, the Hurrian term is *tierauartanna*, not *terauar-tanna*. Although at the time that Benveniste formulated his explanation of *tierauar-tanna* it was still possible to interpret a spelling *ti-e-ra-* as representing *tera-* (or *tēra-*,

¹⁴This is confirmed by, e.g., the Indo-Aryan theonym *násatya-* that in the Šattiuazza treaty is rendered in cuneiform as ^{DINGIR.MEŠ}*na-ša-at-ti-ia-an-na* (e.g. Kammenhuber 1968:149), without any sign of the original length of the word's first vowel.

¹⁵It is true that not all attestations of this word show an *a* before the *µ*, but in these forms there is no *a* after the *µ* either: *ti-e-ru*[*-ur-t*]*a-an-na* (KBo 3.2 lower edge 2), *ti-e-ru-u-ur-ta-an-na* (KBo 3.5 iii 17). Since these forms are attested on tablets that also contain the form *tierayartanna*, with *-a-*, it is difficult to view them as *sprachwirklich*. Benveniste's proposal that the *-a-* in *tierayartanna* is "normalisée sur *panza- šatta- nawa-*" (1962:87) does not seem attractive to us.

as is sometimes encountered as well),¹⁶ it has nowadays become clear that the sign TI practically never had the value /te/ (for which the Hittite scribes used the sign TE). Since *tierauartanna* in all five of its attestations is spelled *ti-e-r*°, and not ***te-e-r*° or **te-r*°, it can be ruled out that this word started in [ter-]. The spelling *ti-e-r*° rather points to [tier-] or [tyer-].¹⁷ This contrasts with the Hittite numeral '3', which shows the consistent spelling *te-ri*-, and therefore must have had the shape [teri-].¹⁸ Benveniste's hypothesis that the initial part of *tierauartanna* was adapted from Hitt. *teri-* 'three' cannot therefore be upheld anymore.

6. To our mind, the form *tierauartanna* must go back to the Indo-Aryan preform of this word, which, on the basis of the discussion above, can now be assumed to have consisted of a compound of **tri-* + *° $\bar{a}\mu artana$. We propose that the development of the preform **tri-āuartana* to the attested form *tierauartanna* with an initial sequence /tiera-/ or /tyera-/ must have been due to phonological processes that took place either in the Indo-Aryan dialect to which the *° $\bar{a}\mu artana$ compounds originally belong, or in the prehistory of Mittanni-Hurrian as spoken by Kikkuli, or in the process of the transfer of this word from Indo-Aryan into Hurrian. One possible pathway of phonological development that might be envisaged is that in **triāuartana* the **i* had become consonantal because of the following * \bar{a} , **triā*°, and that this caused palatalization of the entire initial cluster, **t*^{*i*}*tynj*⁻. If then an anaptyctic *e* developed in the cluster **t*^{*i*}*tyry*⁻, with subsequent loss of the palatalization of the **r*, we would arrive at **t*^{*i*}*erā*⁻, spelled in Hittite as *ti-e-ra*⁻. Perhaps alternative pathways to get from **tri-āuartana* are possible as well.

7. Although the exact phonological development of *tierauartanna* < $*tri-\bar{a}uartana$ must remain open for now, we do believe that our proposal that the second member of the compound was $*^{\circ}\bar{a}uartana$ brings a final solution to this form much closer. Furthermore, although we are not in the position to judge the respective merits of various proposals concerning the horse training program as described in the Kikkulitext, our analysis of the compounds *aikauartanna*, *tierauartanna*, etc., as containing Indo-Aryan $*^{\circ}\bar{a}uartana$ suggests that they had the meaning 'one/three/five/seven/ nine turns'.

Abbreviations

HEG = Tischler, Johann. 1977–2016. *Hethitisches etymologisches Glossar*. 4 vols. Innsbruck: Institut für Sprachen und Literaturen der Universität Innsbruck.

¹⁶Note that also in more modern times a reading *"těrauartanna"* can be found, cf. e.g. Starke 1995, Raulwing 2006, Puhvel 2007:73, *HEG* 3.318–20, 4.373.

¹⁷Thus already Kloekhorst 2008:878.

¹⁸This is supported by CLuw. tarri-, which goes back to PAnat. *téri-.

References

- Benveniste, Émile. 1962. *Hittite et indo-européen: Études comparatives*. Paris: Maisonneuve.
- Debrunner, Albert. 1954. *Altindische Grammatik*. Vol. 2, part 2, *Nominalsuffixe*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
 - ——. 1957. *Nachträge zu J. Wackernagel, Altindische Grammatik, Bd. II, 1*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
- Jamison, Stephanie W., and Joel P. Brereton. 2014. *The Rigveda: The Earliest Religious Poetry of India*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kammenhuber, Annelies. 1961. *Hippologia Hethitica*. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz. ——. 1968. *Die Arier im Vorderen Orient*. Heidelberg: Winter.
- Kloekhorst, Alwin. 2008. *Etymological Dictionary of the Hittite Inherited Lexicon*. Leiden: Brill.

- Kronasser, Heinz. 1956. Vergleichende Laut- und Formenlehre des Hethitischen. Heidelberg: Winter.
- Lubotsky, Alexander. 2012. "Dissimilatory loss of *i* in Sanskrit." In *The Sound of Indo-European 2: Papers on Indo-European Phonetics, phonemics and morphophonemics*, ed. Roman Sukač and Ondřej Šefčík, 177–81. Munich: Lincom.
- Mayrhofer, Manfred. 1965. "Zu den Zahlwortkomposita des Kikkuli-Textes." Indogermanische Forschungen 70:11-3.
- Puhvel, Jaan. 2007. *Hittite Etymological Dictionary*. Vol. 7, *Words Beginning with N*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Raulwing, Paul. 2006. "The Kikkuli text (CTH 284): Some interdisciplinary remarks on Hittite training texts for chariot horses in the second half of the 2nd millennium B.C." In Les équidés dans le monde méditerranéen antique: Actes du colloque organisé par l'École française d'Athènes, le Centre Camille Jullian, et l'UMR 5140 du CNRS, Athènes, 26-28 Novembre 2003, ed. Armelle Gardeisen, 61–75. Lattes: Éd. de l'Association pour le développement de l'archéologie en Languedoc-Rousillon.
- Starke, Frank. 1995. Ausbildung und Training von Streitwagenpferden: Eine hippologisch orientierte Interpretation des Kikkuli-Textes. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- Wackernagel, Jakob. 1905. Altindische Grammatik. Vol. 2, part 1, Einleitung zur Wortlehre, Nominalkomposition. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.