



2022

Splendors of the Serenissima in a Digital Age: The Master of the Murano Gradual Reconsidered

Stephanie Azzarello

University of Cambridge, sa727@cam.ac.uk

Bryan C. Keene

Riverside City College, bryan.keene@rcc.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://repository.upenn.edu/mss_sims



Part of the [Ancient, Medieval, Renaissance and Baroque Art and Architecture Commons](#), [Italian Language and Literature Commons](#), [Medieval Studies Commons](#), and the [Renaissance Studies Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Azzarello, Stephanie and Keene, Bryan C. (2022) "Splendors of the Serenissima in a Digital Age: The Master of the Murano Gradual Reconsidered," *Manuscript Studies*: Vol. 6: Iss. 2, Article 2.

Available at: https://repository.upenn.edu/mss_sims/vol6/iss2/2

This paper is posted at ScholarlyCommons. https://repository.upenn.edu/mss_sims/vol6/iss2/2
For more information, please contact repository@pobox.upenn.edu.

Splendors of the Serenissima in a Digital Age: The Master of the Murano Gradual Reconsidered

Abstract

The Master of the Murano Gradual is one of the most enigmatic illuminators working in early fifteenth-century Venice. The eponymous choir books were commissioned by the Camaldolese monastery of San Mattia a Murano and today comprise a single intact volume in the Kupferstichkabinett in Berlin (MS 78 F.1) and about fifty historiated initials dispersed in twenty-five public and private collections in Europe and the United States. The fragmentary nature of the overall corpus is a central challenge to studying the artist and to understanding the contours of the workshop. This article provides a reassessment of the corpus of work attributed to the Murano Master—including an appendix with provenances of the whereabouts of the series—and makes a case for future collaborations that can build upon digitization efforts that make the fragments available online and upon recent technical analysis into the pigments used by the illuminators. The methodological approach of the authors has been twofold. Firstly, to study each of the fragments and manuscripts in person, and to locate digital assets for as many works as possible with the aim of creating an eventual website or online repository for scholars to consult. Secondly, to investigate codicological features of the individual fragments that have been hitherto overlooked, including the measurement of musical stave heights or blind-ruled lines for song, and the possible relationship between decorated and filigree letters to over one-hundred cuttings with decorated letters that have also been associated with the San Mattia series. Finally, the study also clarifies the dating of the Murano choir books, which were most likely produced in the 1420s.

Keywords

Venetian renaissance art, Camaldolese order, fragmentology, Italian manuscript illumination, manuscript studies

MANUSCRIPT STUDIES

A Journal of the Schoenberg Institute for Manuscript Studies

VOLUME 6, NUMBER 2

(Fall 2021)

Manuscript Studies (ISSN 2381-5329) is published semiannually
by the University of Pennsylvania Press



The Schoenberg Institute
for Manuscript Studies

UNIVERSITY of PENNSYLVANIA LIBRARIES

MANUSCRIPT STUDIES

VOLUME 6, NUMBER 2

(Fall 2021)

ISSN 2381-5329

Copyright © 2021 University of Pennsylvania Libraries
and University of Pennsylvania Press. All rights reserved.

Published by the University of Pennsylvania Press,
3905 Spruce Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104.

Printed in the U.S.A. on acid-free paper.

Manuscript Studies brings together scholarship from around the world and across disciplines related to the study of premodern manuscript books and documents, with a special emphasis on the role of digital technologies in advancing manuscript research. Articles for submission should be prepared according to the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 16th edition, and follow the style guidelines found at <http://mss.pennpress.org>.

None of the contents of this journal may be reproduced without prior written consent of the University of Pennsylvania Press. Authorization to photocopy is granted by the University of Pennsylvania Press for libraries or other users registered with Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that all required fees are verified with CCC and paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. This consent does not extend to other kinds of copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, for database retrieval, or for resale.

2021 SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION:

Single issues: \$30

Print and online subscriptions: Individuals: \$40; Institutions: \$94; Full-time Students: \$30

International subscribers, please add \$19 per year for shipping.

Online-only subscriptions: Individuals: \$32; Institutions: \$82

Please direct all subscription orders, inquiries, requests for single issues, address changes, and other business communications to Penn Press Journals, 3905 Spruce Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104. Phone: 215-573-1295. Fax: 215-746-3636. Email: journals@pobox.upenn.edu. Prepayment is required. Orders may be charged to MasterCard, Visa, and American Express credit cards. Checks and money orders should be made payable to "University of Pennsylvania Press" and sent to the address printed directly above.

One-year subscriptions are valid January 1 through December 31. Subscriptions received after October 31 in any year become effective the following January 1. Subscribers joining midyear receive immediately copies of all issues of *Manuscript Studies* already in print for that year.

Postmaster: send address changes to Penn Press Journals, 3905 Spruce Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104.

Visit *Manuscript Studies* on the web at mss.pennpress.org.

Splendors of the Serenissima in a Digital Age: The Master of the Murano Gradual Reconsidered

STEPHANIE AZZARELLO (SHE/HER)

University of Cambridge

BRYAN C. KEENE (HE/ÉL/THEY/ELLE)

Riverside City College, formerly Getty Museum

ONE OF THE MOST enigmatic Italian illuminators of the fifteenth century is the so-called Master of the Murano Gradual.¹ The eponymous choir book (Berlin, Kupferstichkabinett, MS 78 F.1)

We wish to thank colleagues at each of the institutions listed in the Appendices for providing access to the manuscripts, leaves, and cuttings, and for digital images of the reverse sides. We thank the two peer reviewers, whose comments helped us hone the arguments. We are grateful to all those at the Schoenberg Institute for Manuscript Studies for their careful review of this article. On behalf of Bryan: I acknowledge that my workplace and home are located on the traditional, ancestral, and unceded territories of the Tongva, Cahuilla, Payómkawichum, and numerous other Indigenous peoples of the past, present, and emerging; I offer gratitude to the members of these communities and commit to living in harmony with the environment around me.

1 Scholarship on the Master of the Murano Gradual often involves references to the illuminator Belbello da Pavia, at times comparing or conflating the oeuvres of the two artists, as will be discussed in this article. See Mirella Levi D'Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection of Illuminations 1: The Lombard School* (Florence: Olschki, 1970), 3–56; Edith Kirsch, “Initial *D* from a Choir Book,” in *Medieval and Renaissance Miniatures from the National Gallery*, ed. Gary Vikan (Washington, DC: The National Gallery, 1975), 70–74; Serena Padovani, “Su Belbello da Pavia e sul miniatore di San Michele a Murano,” *Paragone* 29 (1978): 25–35; Francis Russell,

contains the sung portions of the Mass for use at the Camaldolese church of San Mattia a Murano in the Venetian lagoon. The volume is heavily decorated: there are forty-eight historiated initials (forty-two of which contain prophets) and six decorated letters. The manuscript has not been digitized, and only six of the illuminations have been reproduced, often in black and white with a single color reproduction of the only full-page miniature.² A *fenestra* (or window) label on the binding indicates that this gradual was the fourth in the set for San Mattia.³ The original series of songbooks survives in a dispersed and fragmentary condition as follows:

“A Gothic Miniature from Murano,” *Burlington Magazine* 122, no. 923 (1980): 117–18; Antonio Cadei, *Studi di miniatura lombarda: Giovannino de Grassi e Belbello da Pavia* (Rome: Viella, 1984); Sandrina Bandera Bistoletti, “Maestro di San Michele a Murano,” in *Arte in Lombardia tra gotico e rinascimento*, ed. Miklós Boskovits (Milan: Fabri Editori, 1988), 104–9; Sandra Hindman, *Medieval and Renaissance Miniature Painting* (Akron, OH: Bruce Ferrini, 1988), 28–29, 110–11; Gennaro Toscano, “Per Belbello in Laguna,” *Arte Veneta* 52 (1998): 6–27; Tiziana Franco, “Attorno a un corale di Capodistria e al Maestro di San Michele a Murano,” *Hortus artium medievalium* 4 (1998): 161–68; Pia Palladino, *Treasures of a Lost Art: Italian Manuscript Painting of the Middle Ages and Renaissance* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2003), 125–26; Fabrizio Lollini, “Maestro di San Michele a Murano,” in *Dizionario biografico dei miniatori italiani: Secoli IX–XVI*, ed. Milvia Bollati (Milan: Sylvestre Bonnard, 2004), 699–701; Bryan C. Keene and Stephanie Azzarello, “Uno splendido enigma: Il Maestro del Graduale di Murano,” *Alumina: Pagine Miniature* 64 (2019): 14–21; Stephanie Azzarello, “Reassembling the Sacred: The Master of the Murano Gradual and the Illuminated Choir Books of the Camaldolese House of San Matti di Murano,” unpublished Ph.D. diss., University of Cambridge, 2020.

2 Padovani, “Su Belbello da Pavia,” 25–35; Franco, “Attorno a un corale di Capodistria,” 161–68.

3 The *fenestra* label reads: *Gr[aduale] a Paca usq[ue] ad vigesi[m]am t[er]ciam d[omini]cam S[acnti] Math[ee] IIII*. The illuminator under consideration is alternatively referred to as the Master of the San Mattia a Murano Gradual or the Master of the San Michele a Murano Gradual. These different naming conventions for the same artist arose from the conflation of choir books produced for two Camaldolese houses on the island. This confusion has arisen since little attention has been given to the *fenestra* label on the Berlin volume. The Camaldolese church of San Michele housed choir books decorated by illuminators from the famous Santa Maria degli Angeli workshop in Florence, which included Don Silvestro dei Gheraducci, Don Simone Camaldolese, and Don Lorenzo Monaco. For the San Michele volumes, see Gaudenz Freuler, “Presenze artistiche toscane a Venezia alla fine del Trecento: Lo scriptorium dei camaldolesi e dei domenicani,” in *La pittura nel veneto: Il trecento*, vol. 2, ed. Mauro Lucco (Milan: Electa, 1992), 480–502; Gaudenz Freuler, “Gradual (Sanctorale) from Santa

- The Berlin volume containing chants of the *temporale* portion of the liturgical year (those related to the life of Christ) from Easter Sunday until the twenty-third Sunday after Pentecost;
- Dispersed cuttings of over fifty known historiated initials by the Murano Master(s) in twenty-six collections across Europe, Russia, and the United States that likely formed part of multiple volumes, including the *sanctorale* feasts (those commemorating the lives of saints), a hymnal, and an antiphony for services of the Divine Office (Appendix A);⁴ and
- A second *temporale* volume, from the first Sunday in Advent to the second Sunday in Lent, presently in the Biblioteca Nazionale Braidense in Milan (MS AB. XVIII. 28), contains sixteen historiated initials and seven decorated letters by Cristoforo Cortese (active from about 1390 to 1445).⁵

Together, the Berlin and Milan Graduals, as they are conventionally called, complete the *temporale* chants for the liturgical year; the manuscripts have the same dimensions (60 × 42 cm), number of musical staves per page (6), and stave heights (4 cm, with 3.5 cm between each). Based on the *fenestra* label inscription, the graduals would have been accompanied by at least two

Maria degli Angeli” and “Gradual for San Michele a Murano,” in *Painting and Illumination in Early Renaissance Florence, 1300–1450*, ed. Laurence B. Kanter, Barbara D. Boehm, Carl B. Strehlke, Gaudenz Freuler, Christa C. Mayer Thurman, and Pia Palladino (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1994), 131–54, 155–76.

4 Literature on the cuttings is vast and includes numerous auction and dealer catalogues. See Appendix A for sources related to individual pieces, and see also Hindman, *Medieval and Renaissance Miniature Painting*, 28–29, 110–11; Lollini, “Maestro di San Michele a Murano,” 699–701; Milvia Bollati, “The Dream of St. Romuald (cutting), Master of San Michele Murano,” in *Beyond Words: Illuminated Manuscripts in Boston Collections*, ed. Jeffrey Hamburger, William Stoneman, Anne-Marie Eze, Lisa Fagin Davis, and Nancy Netzer (Boston: McMullen Museum of Art, 2016), 52–53; Azzarello, “Reassembling the Sacred”; Stella Panayotova, “Master of the Murano Gradual,” in *The Burke Collection of Italian Manuscript Paintings*, ed. Sandra Hindman and Federica Toniolo (London: Ad Ilissvm, 2021), 389.

5 For a summary of the artist’s career and partial bibliography, see Susy Marcon, “Cortese, Cristoforo,” in *Dizionario biografico dei miniatori italiani: Secoli IX–XVI*, ed. Milvia Bollati (Milan: Sylvestre Bonnard, 2004), 176–80.

additional volumes, which can be partially reconstructed from the group of dispersed cuttings.

This article provides new insights into the corpus of the Master of the Murano Gradual, informed by the authors' close observation of all known surviving fragments, as well as some promising technical analysis of the workshop's materials and the first assessment of the complicated provenance histories of the cuttings.⁶ Our aims are threefold: first, to clarify the chronology of the artist's career and the timeframe of the Murano commission, which scholars have dated from the 1420s to the late 1460s; second, to provide a comprehensive list of the fragments from the dispersed choir books, a resource that is lacking in present literature, especially as many new works continue to come to light; and third, to discuss the potential for digitally reconstructing the dispersed choir books and the benefits of using technology in this collaborative endeavor, as such a project naturally reveals the benefits and limitations of virtually reuniting dismembered manuscripts. Notwithstanding the limited access to images of the Berlin Gradual, many of the codices and cuttings that will be addressed in this study have been digitized (if at varying quality), and several are available for consultation and comparison online through the International Image Interoperability Framework (IIIF). The authors have embraced virtual messaging and meeting platforms to simultaneously study many of the manuscripts and cuttings discussed below on multiple occasions, thereby creating a real-time method for international collaboration even before the COVID-19 pandemic necessitated an increase in digital approaches to collaborative research.

6 Bryan C. Keene began a study of Venetian choir books of the Quattrocento for his exhibition *Renaissance Splendors of the Northern Italian Courts* (at the Getty Museum in 2015 and online in partnership with seven Italian museums and libraries), and Stephanie Azzarello's dissertation is the first monograph on the Master of the Murano Gradual with a reconstruction of the mysterious artist's oeuvre. See Keene and Azzarello, "Uno splendido enigma," 14–21; Bryan C. Keene, "Renaissance Splendors of the Northern Italian Courts: A Virtual Exhibition," *Rivista di storia della miniatura* 19 (2015): 196–98; Azzarello, "Reassembling the Sacred." For an in-depth discussion of the cutting with *The Beirut Miracle* from the Murano Gradual, see Stephanie Azzarello, "Iconoclasm and Anti-Semitic Imagery in a Fifteenth-Century Venetian Choir Book," *IKON* 11 (2018): 103–12.

The Camaldolese Context and the Dispersal of the San Mattia Choir Books

The Camaldolese Order was founded by Saint Romuald (ca. 952–1027) in about 1012 in Camaldoli, near Arezzo in central Italy.⁷ Saint Romuald believed that the Benedictine order had moved away from its traditional aspiration of uniting both aspects of monastic life: eremitical (isolated) and cenobitic (communal). He sought to bring their monastic life back into the spiritual balance originally envisioned by Saint Benedict.⁸ In a cutting from the San Mattia volumes, the saint dreams of a ladder topped by God the Father upon which angels climb and descend and which is witnessed by men and women in white garments, a reference throughout the scene to the habit of the order (fig. 1). Across the series of cuttings, figures in white robes or garments create continued visual references to the order's dress.

Over the course of the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, a triangulated relationship developed between the Camaldolese houses of Santa Maria degli Angeli in Florence and of San Mattia and San Michele in Murano. Of the many Camaldolese establishments throughout the Italian peninsula, Santa Maria degli Angeli was most famous for its scriptorium, a fact celebrated by Giorgio Vasari (1511–74). It is very likely that the Venetian houses wanted their manuscripts to mirror a set made for use by their Florentine brothers. Mirella Levi D'Ancona and Gaudenz Freuler worked to reassemble a pair of choir books illuminated in Florence for the church of San Michele

7 Cécile Caby, "Les Camaldules et leurs bibliothèques des origines à l'enquête de la Congrégation de l'Index," in Cécile Caby and Samuele Megli, *Congregazione Camaldolese dell'ordine di San Benedetto* (Vatican City: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2014), 5–56; Cécile Caby, *De l'éremitisme rural au monachisme urbain: Les Camaldules en Italie à la fin du Moyen Âge* (Rome: École française de Rome, 1999). For a history of the artistic culture of the Camaldolese, see Roberta Melis, "Lorenzo Monaco, Santa Maria degli Angeli and the Camaldolese Visual Culture," in *Lorenzo Monaco: A Bridge from Giotto's Heritage to the Renaissance*, ed. Angelo Tartuferi and Daniela Parenti (Florence: Giunti, 2006), 33–38; George Bent, *Monastic Art in Lorenzo Monaco's Florence: Painting and Patronage in Santa Maria degli Angeli, 1300–1450* (Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 2006).

8 Peter-Damien Belisle, "Primitive Romualdian/Camaldolese Spirituality," *Cistercian Studies Quarterly* 31, no. 4 (1996), 413–29 (at 417).



FIGURE 1. *Initial O (?)*: *The Dream of Saint Romuald* and reverse, Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. Boston, Museum of Fine Arts, 1973.692.

in Isola adjacent to Murano that were dismembered in the nineteenth century during the Napoleonic invasion of Italy.⁹ According to Freuler, and accepted by others, the Santa Maria degli Angeli artists heavily influenced

9 The lavish Florentine choir books were begun in the late Trecento with some of the volumes possessing dates such as folio 28r from Corale 1 dated 1396; and folios 161v and 207 of Corale 2 date 1370/71, and folio 3 of Corale 3 is dated 1409. Additionally, during the research for the reconstruction, Levi D’Ancona found copious documents concerning the choir books in the Archivio di Stato di Firenze, including payment records that have allowed her to construct a timeline of their production. Unfortunately, no such records or documents exist for the San Mattia choir books; thus, any attempts at dating them have relied on a comparative method with contemporary works. Freuler, “Presenze artistiche toscane,” 480–502; Mirella Levi d’Ancona, *The Choir Books of Santa Maria degli Angeli in Florence*, 2 vols. (Florence: Centro Di, 1993–94); Freuler, “Gradual (Sanctorale) from Santa Maria degli Angeli” and “Gradual for San Michele a Murano,” 131–54, 155–76.



FIGURE 2. Initial T: *A Bishop Dedicating a Church* and decorated letter O, Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. London, The British Library, Courtesy of the British Library Board, MS Add. 60630, fol. 10.

the Murano Master, as traces of their style are evident in the eponymous gradual by the Venetian illuminator. A large cutting from the San Mattia series showing *A Bishop Dedicating a Church* (fig. 2), for example, is framed by a prismatic band of blue, white, and orange triangles or diamonds, a pattern found throughout the Florentine volumes (as seen in a large cutting designed by Lorenzo Monaco for Santa Maria degli Angeli and completed by followers of Fra Angelico, fig. 3).¹⁰

Several cuttings by the Murano Master demonstrate the illuminator's impressive capacity for rendering three-dimensionality on a two-dimensional surface. This spatial quality was found in the Santa Maria degli Angeli illuminations—especially those by Lorenzo Monaco—but the Murano Master developed it further, seen especially in the way figures fill the letterforms.

10 Similar comparisons can be made between the scenes of Christ's Resurrection in the Berlin Gradual (fol. 1v) and a leaf assigned to Don Silvestro in the Musée Condé at Chantilly (leaf from Gradual 2; Inv. No. 2).



FIGURE 3. *Initial V: The Ascension* from the Santa Maria degli Angeli choir books, designed about 1410 by Lorenzo Monaco, completed about 1431 by Zanobi di Benedetto Strozzi and Battista di Biagio Sanguini. Los Angeles, Getty Museum, MS 78 (2003.104).



FIGURE 4. Initial *M*: *The Crucifixion of Saint Andrew* and ruled reverse, Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. St. Louis, St. Louis Art Museum, 36:1953.

Take the initial *M* in *The Crucifixion of Saint Andrew*, for example (fig. 4): the Murano Master applied a pale red pigment as a base and used darker tones for shading around the edges of the leaves, creating the illusion that they are peeling off both the initial and the parchment. The Murano Master also used paint to enhance the three-dimensional quality of the landscapes in the San Mattia illuminations. In the initial *O* in *The Dream of Saint Romuald*, the artist applied varying degrees of shading along the edges of the craggy mountainous background to create the illusion of grooves within the natural landscape (see fig. 1). The mountains and hills appear to rise off the parchment in a manner similar to the Murano Master's approach for rendering the faces of figures in his oeuvre. Lastly, in the initial with Saint Margaret (Appendix A, no. 28), the Murano Master used the dragon to form part of the bar of the letter itself—another testament to the artist's creativity.

The provenance of the San Mattia choir books and cuttings reveals a history of dispersal beginning in the late eighteenth century, during the dissolution of many Italian churches and monasteries. Alexander, tenth Duke of Hamilton (1767–1852), owned the Berlin Gradual, which he must

have acquired while living in the Veneto in the late 1790s and early 1800s. The volume was purchased by the Kupferstichkabinett in 1888, auctioned by the German government in 1898, then reacquired by the state library in 1903.¹¹ The Milan Gradual was recorded at the Palazzo Brera in 1810 but without additional evidence for how it arrived there.¹² At least sixteen of the initials from the remaining dispersed volumes were sold at Sotheby's, London, in 1838 in the public sale of William Young Ottley (1771–1836), who likely acquired them during his travels in Italy in the 1790s (he mentions acquiring them from Murano; Appendix B). Four of the cuttings, arguably the most impressive given their subject matter and catalogue descriptions, were acquired by the Reverend John Fuller Russell (1813–1884). The whereabouts of only two of those are known: the Fitzwilliam *Death of the Virgin* and the British Library *Dedication of a Church* (see Appendix A, nos. 2 and 8); the scenes of *The Annunciation* and *The Presentation* have not been located. A certain “Tindall” purchased three from the Ottley sale, each of which can be identified with the cuttings once in the Holford collection (Appendix A, nos. 10, 18, and 38). The two cuttings in the Cluny Museum in Paris were bequeathed in 1843 by its founder, Alexandre Du Sommerard (1779–1832), and were inventoried in 1847 as part of the collection (Appendix A, nos. 19–20). Peter Kidd has determined that fifteen historiated initials were sold by Boerner in Leipzig on 13 November 1908—the present location of eight of these remains unknown.¹³ The largest repository of the San Mattia fragments today is the Wildenstein Collection at the Musée Marmottan in Paris, which has an impressive leaf showing *The Mission to the Apostles* (sometimes identified as *Pentecost*) and thirteen historiated or figural initials (eleven of

11 Godfrey Evans, “Alexander, 10th Duke of Hamilton (1767–1852) as Patron and Collector,” Ph.D. diss., University of Edinburgh (2008), 12–19.

12 Giordana Mariani Canova, “Cristoforo Cortese, Graduale,” in *Arte in Lombardia tra Gotico e Rinascimento*, ed. Miklós Boskovits (Milan: Fabbri Editori, 1988), 232–39.

13 Peter Kidd, “Missing Initials from the Murano Gradual,” *Medieval Manuscripts Provenance: Weekly Notes and Observations*, 2 May 2020, <https://mssprovenance.blogspot.com/2020/05/missing-initials-from-murano-gradual.html>. In an email dated 7 September 2017, Peter Kidd also suggested that an initial *A* with Saint Peter (or a Pope-Saint) attributed to Belbello da Pavia from the Vladimir Simkhovitch sale (Sotheby's London, 7 July 1960, lot 76) in fact may have come from the San Mattia choir books. Simkhovitch owned at least two of the San Mattia cuttings, those in Cleveland and St. Louis (see Appendix A, nos. 5 and 37).

these were once part of the collection of Édouard Kann, which was dispersed in 1927).¹⁴ The words *Inclitus pater rector* on the leaf with *The Mission to the Apostles* indicates that the page was from a hymnal, containing hymns at times together with a Psalter of Psalm texts sung at the canonical hours of the day.¹⁵ This important but overlooked point indicates that the original San Mattia a Murano series also included volumes for the Divine Office. The liturgical content of the reverse sides of the Wildenstein holdings has been neither photographed nor published (all the items appear to be matted to card or parchment and are tightly framed in the museum vitrines), allowing for the possibility that some of these may have been part of the gradual or antiphony.¹⁶ Additionally, Christopher de Hamel suggested that four decorated letters may be related to the parent manuscript(s).¹⁷ This group of cuttings now amounts to nearly 150 decorated letters in at least ten collections, but their association with the Murano manuscripts does not seem likely, as will be explored further below (Appendix C).

Distinguishing the Master(s) of the Murano Gradual from Peer Illuminators

For ninety years, a layer of confusion has surrounded the identity of the Murano Master, who is better characterized as a master and a workshop of assistants, as we will propose in this article. The chronological span of the

14 Levi D'Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 3–56. For the Kann collection, see Amédée Boinet, *La collection de miniatures de M. Édouard Kann* (Paris: Beaux Arts, 1926), nos. 31–32, plates 27–28. Peter Kidd suggests that Édouard Kann likely refers to Édouard Gustave Kann (1873–1927) rather than another relative also called Édouard Kann (1880–1962). See Peter Kidd, “The Dispersal of the Miniatures of Édouard Kann,” *Medieval Manuscripts Provenance: Weekly Notes and Observations*, 22 November 2020, <https://mssprovenance.blogspot.com/2020/11/the-dispersal-of-miniatures-of-edouard.html>.

15 *Antiphonale Romanum, Liber Hymnarius* (Solesmes: Abbaye Saint-Pierre de Solesmes, 1983), 293–94.

16 Stephanie Azzarello, “Reassembling the Sacred,” 35, no. 84; ch. 4, sec. I.

17 Sotheby's London, *Western Manuscripts and Miniatures*, 5 December 1994, lot 3. For additional consideration, see Keene and Azzarello, “Uno splendido enigma,” 14–21; Margherita Zibordi, “La raccolta di ritagli e fogli miniati del Museo Correr di Venezia: Un primo esame,” *Bolletino d'Arte* 39–40 (2018): 217–34.

shop's activity has been established through associations with two well-documented illuminators: Giovanni Belbello da Pavia (active from about 1430 to 1473), whose style is as idiosyncratic as that of the Murano Master, and Cristoforo Cortese, who contributed to the Camaldolese project in Murano, as mentioned above. In 1930, Pietro Toesca deduced similarities between the Berlin Gradual and cuttings from the dispersed choral volumes, and he noted affinities with Venetian illumination.¹⁸ Studying the fragments from the Wildenstein Collection in 1950, Mirella Levi D'Ancona attributed the painting style to Belbello da Pavia, but these are now accepted as part of the core of the Murano Master's output (with the exception of two initials; see Appendix A).¹⁹ The lingering conundrum is that art historians continue to compare and at times conflate the oeuvres of Belbello and the Murano Master(s), though scholars presently agree that each was a unique personality.²⁰ It is entirely possible that these two illuminators worked together, as their painting styles share certain stylistic features, including the use of numerous layers to render a figure's draped body or expressive facial features (sometimes showing the teeth), a vibrant color palette and application of *colori cangianti* for textiles or floral motifs, and the use of gold in all its forms (as burnished leaf at times with painted detail, as shell gold, and as the chemically synthesized golden pigment *aurum musicum*, known as mosaic gold). The reader can see these features in figures 5–6 and can explore them even more closely using the IIF online interface.²¹

A few features emerge as possible distinguishing characteristics of each illuminator: the cutting with Saint Blaise assigned to the Murano Master and hailing from a dispersed volume of the San Mattia gradual (fig. 5) contains foliate designs with white or yellow eyelash-like strokes, as well as penwork in lead white (which has darkened over time), whereas the scrolling vines and letterform on a leaf with a Young Christ Blessing attributed

18 Pietro Toesca, *Monumenti e studi per la storia della miniatura italiana: La collezione di Ulrico Hoepli* (Milan: Hoepli, 1930), 93–94.

19 Levi D'Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 38–53, plates 4–12 and 14.

20 See Lollini, "Maestro di San Michele a Murano," 699–701.

21 The Getty Museum's collection of manuscripts can be accessed at <http://www.getty.edu/art/manuscripts/>.



FIGURE 5. *Initial G: Saint Blaise and decorated letter D (reverse), Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. Los Angeles, J. Paul Getty Museum, MS 73 (2003.87), recto and verso.*

to Belbello (fig. 6) include larger color fields with modulated values and scalloped patterning within the foliate initial. These distinctions can be seen as well in the decorated letters on the reverse of each, a factor that also aids in disassociating De Hamel's group of initials from the Murano series due to the dissimilar decorative treatments and shapes of those letterforms. Another observable difference is that Belbello often rendered halos in a more ovular way than the Murano Master, who embellished nimbuses with black or red ink or at times burnished the gold and added script-like decoration (possibly emulating Arabic, Armenian, or Hebrew).²²

²² For a discussion of script-like embellishments, sometimes referred to as pseudo-scripts, see Alicia Walker, "Meaningful Mingling: Classicizing Imagery and Islamicizing Script in a Byzantine Bowl," *Art Bulletin* 90, no. 1 (2008): 32–53; Alicia Walker, "Pseudo-Arabic 'Inscriptions' and the Pilgrim's Path at Hosios Loukas," in *Viewing Inscriptions in the Late Antique and Medieval World*, ed. Antony Eastmond (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), 99–123.



FIGURE 6. Initial A: Young Christ Blessing and decorated letter V (reverse) from Antiphonal P of San Giorgio Maggiore, Belbello da Pavia, about 1467–70. Los Angeles, Getty Museum, MS 96 (2005.29), recto and verso.

From the aforementioned contrasting features, scholars have constructed a robust artistic personality for the Master of the Murano Gradual. Certain hallmarks of this hand or workshop include the colorful rendering of voluminous fabrics produced using a linear hatching pattern (as in the cuttings with Saints Michael and Lawrence; figs. 7–8), the sculptural quality with which the artist painted faces so that they appear to rise off the surface of the parchment (such as Saint Jerome or the unidentified Bishop Saint; figs. 9–10), and figures and narrative scenes that maximize the space within a foliate initial letter (seen in *The Crucifixion of Saint Andrew* and *The Dormition of the Virgin*; figs. 4 and 11). The Master of the Murano Gradual often layered flesh tones with brown, white, and yellow over a pinkish-red ground, creating a bronzed complexion at times accented with warm orange and red tones. The artist's astounding ability to convey the inner psychological and emotional states of his figures was achieved through this use of heavy modeling and attention to physiognomic details, such as eyebrows and lips. All



FIGURE 7. *Initial B: Saint Michael Transfixing Satan*, Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. New York, Morgan Library & Museum, MS M 1129.



FIGURE 8. *Initial C: Saint Lawrence and reverse*, Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. Washington, DC, National Gallery of Art, inv. B-14, 842.



FIGURE 9. *Saint Jerome Extracting a Thorn from a Lion's Paw* and ruled reverse, Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. Los Angeles, J. Paul Getty Museum, MS 106 (2010.21), recto and verso.



FIGURE 10. *Initial I: A Bishop-Saint* and reverse, Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. Plzen, Západočeské Muzeum, Inv. 2972.



FIGURE 11. Initial G: *The Dormition of the Virgin* and reverse, Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, Marlay Cutting It. 18.

these qualities contribute to the whimsical and elegant qualities of the Murano Master's work.

Essential to sorting out the possible relationship between the Master of the Murano Gradual and Belbello are eight manuscripts that have hitherto been attributed to Belbello, at times with mention of the Murano Master as being a stylistic peer or potential collaborator. Remarkably, the majority of these codices are dated or datable, as well as digitized or partially available online. One manuscript at the heart of the debate is the famous Visconti Hours (Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Banco Rari 397 and Landau Finlay 22).²³ The devotional text was illuminated in two phases: about 1390s by Salomone and Giovannino de' Grassi for Duke Gian Galeazzo Visconti (r. 1395–1402) and then from about 1412 to about 1430 by additional hands under the patronage of Duke Filippo Maria Visconti (r. 1412–47). Antonio

23 Millard Meiss and E. W. Kirsch, *The Visconti Hours* (New York: George Braziller, 1972); *Il libro d'ore Visconti, Banco Rari 397, Landau Finlay 22, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale di Firenze, edizione in facsimile* (Modena: Panini, 2003); Milvia Bollati, ed., *Il libro d'ore Visconti: Commentario al codice* (Modena: Panini, 2003); Milvia Bollati, "Il libro d'ore Visconti: Qualche suggerimento per una rilettura," in *Storie di artisti, storie di libri: L'editore che inseguiva la bellezza (scritti in onore di Franco Cosimo Panini)* (Rome: Donzelli, 2008), 313–17; Marco Rossi, "Milano 1400," in *Arte lombarda dai Visconti agli Sforza*, ed. Mauro Natale and Serena Romano (Milan: Skira, 2015), 111–55, 156–57.

Cadei suggested that a team of anonymous illuminators worked with Belbello on the second campaign, and Cadei christened them after outstanding miniatures: the Maestro del Genesi, the Maestro di Mosè, and the Maestro del Battesimo di Cristo (also known as the Maestro del *De natura deorum*).²⁴ By contrast, Serena Padovani put forward a groundbreaking argument suggesting that Belbello and the Murano Master were distinct personalities who worked closely together on that project and that each had prolific careers of their own.²⁵ A portion of the manuscript can be studied online through a digital surrogate, and facsimile editions range from limited to complete reproductions of the volumes.²⁶ The borders of the manuscript are filled with life: human and angelic figures, animals and insects, and elaborate foliage. These features were common in manuscripts from Lombardy at the time and find holdovers in the works of Belbello and the Murano Master elsewhere. Several of the illuminations in the Visconti Hours feature prismatic Gothicizing architecture and vast landscapes that at times display vegetation rendered in gold to create a shimmering aesthetic effect, an approach used by both artists. The example of the Visconti Hours provides a glimpse of the debates surrounding early Quattrocento Venetian manuscript studies, and of the challenge inherent in sorting out the hands of illuminators or workshops that employed many of the same visual strategies and effects. In line with current scholarship, both campaigns of the Visconti Hours should be viewed as collaborative undertakings by consortia of illuminators.

The remaining manuscripts under consideration span the 1420s to early 1460s, and several were commissioned by patrons of significant rank. Roughly contemporaneous with the Visconti Hours is a copy of Cicero's *De Oratore* (Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Ott. Lat. 2057) that

24 Antonio Cadei, *Belbello, miniatore lombardo: Artisti del libro alla corte dei Visconti* (Rome: Bulzoni, 1976).

25 Padovani referred to the Murano Master as the "Miniature di San Michele a Murano," although scholars now accept that the eponymous choir book was produced for San Mattia. Serena Padovani, "Su Belbello da Pavia e sul 'Miniature di San Michele a Murano,'" *Paragone: Arte* 29, no. 339 (1978): 24–34.

26 The manuscript is now divided into two volumes, one of which can be explored online at <https://teca.bncf.firenze.sbn.it/ImageViewer/servlet/ImageViewer?idr=TECA00000021184>.

was decorated in 1422 for Francesco Bossi, bishop of Como (d. 1435).²⁷ Next is a two-volume compendium of the *Acta sanctorum* (Milan, Biblioteca Nazionale Braidense, MS AF. XIV, 19 and 20), the first volume of which is dated 1431.²⁸ The Bible of Niccolò III d'Este (r. 1393–1441) (Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Barb. Lat. 613) was produced for the marquis of Ferrara from 1432 to 1433 and was completed by Jacopino d'Arezzo.²⁹ The illuminations in the Bible also suggest that multiple artists were involved, perhaps another instance of collaboration between the Murano Master and Belbello. The Missal of Barbara of Brandenburg-Gonzaga (Mantua, Archivio Storico Diocesano, Capitolo del Duomo) was completed in phases from 1442 to 1444 (at the behest of Gianlucido Gonzaga [1421–1448]), then from 1448 to 1450, and finally from 1460 to 1461 (under the patronage of Marchioness Barbara of Brandenburg-Gonzaga; following the last phase, Girolamo da Cremona took over and completed the commission).³⁰ The Hours of Bertrando de' Rossi (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Smith Lesouëf 22) features at least three other Lombard illuminators possibly working in the 1380s and completed with minor interventions (attributed to Belbello) possibly in the 1460s.³¹ Finally, the Marcello Hours (London, British Library, Add. MS 15114) was possibly completed in the 1460s.³²

27 The manuscript has been digitized and can be explored at https://spotlight.vatlib.it/it/latin-classics/catalog/Ott_lat_2057. See Cadei, *Belbello, miniatore lombardo*, 9–17; Antonio Cadei, *Studi di miniatura lombarda: Giovannino de' Grassi e Belbello da Pavia* (Rome: Viella, 1984), 30–39; Sandrina Bandera Bistoletti, “Maestro di San Michele a Murano,” in *Arte in Lombardia tra gotico e rinascimento*, ed. Miklós Boskovits (Milan: Fabri Editori, 1988), 104–9.

28 Maria Luisa Gengaro, “Contributo a Belbello da Pavia: In memoria di Guglielmo Pacchioni,” *Arte Lombarda*, vol. 15, no. 1 (1970): 45–48; Cadei, *Studi di miniatura lombarda*, 30–39.

29 The manuscript has been fully digitized and can be viewed at http://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Barb.lat.613.

30 Gisuppa Zanichelli and Giuse Pastore, *Messale di Barbara del Brandenburgo Gonzaga: Commentario all'edizione in facsimile* (Modena: Il Bulino, 2012); *Das Missale der Barbara von Brandenburg-Gonzaga (Diözese von Mantua, Archiv der Kathedrale) / Messale di Barbara del Brandenburgo-Gonzaga* (Modena: Il Bulino, 2012).

31 For a digital record of the manuscript, see <https://archivesetmanuscripts.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/cc1018291>.

32 Federico Zeri, “Belbello da Pavia: Un salterio,” *Paragone* 3 (1950): 50–52; Mariani Canova, “Cristoforo Cortese, Graduale,” 232–39.

The Brandenburg-Gonzaga Missal is the only manuscript from this group to which Belbello can be unequivocally associated, as testified by a number of archival documents, whereas the other manuscripts are attributed to him or to illuminators from his circle (including the Murano Master) based on connoisseurship. In fact, the dating of these additional codices has defined the career arc of the Master of the Murano Gradual, who is thought to have been active from about the 1420s to the 1440s (and occasionally as late as the 1470s), therefore contemporary with the Visconti Hours, *De Oratore*, and the Bible of Niccolò III, but prior to the Brandenburg-Gonzaga Missal and the two books of hours. By 1473, documents reveal that Belbello was in the Venetian lagoon undertaking a commission of choir books for the Church of San Giorgio Maggiore at the request of the Duke of Milan, Galeazzo Maria Sforza (r. 1466–76).³³ The letterforms of historiated and decorated initials in the San Giorgio Maggiore volumes are different enough from those in the San Mattia choir books (the Berlin and Milan volumes, as well as the fragments) to support the distinction between Belbello and the Murano Master; the variation does not seem to be a mere stylistic evolution of a single artist when one considers the consistency between Belbello's illuminations in the Brandenburg-Gonzaga Missal and the San Giorgio manuscripts.

Like the San Mattia choir books, the San Giorgio music manuscripts survive either as bound volumes on the Isola or in public collections as leaves and cuttings. In several instances, fragments from the Murano and San Giorgio volumes are found in the same collections (such as the Getty Museum, the Wildenstein Collection at the Musée Marmottan, the Morgan Library & Museum, and others). This situation, which is merely a reflection of later collecting history, further obfuscates the possibility of fully reassembling either set, especially in the absence of clear provenance. A primary example is the Wildenstein initial *R* with Saint Catherine of Alexandria, which is sometimes assigned to the Murano Master or to the San Mattia Gradual, but most likely came from the San Giorgio volumes and was painted by Belbello's workshop. In the Marmottan manuscript

33 Palladino, *Treasures of a Lost Art*, 114–22.

gallery, the cutting is displayed with the Murano group, whereas the San Giorgio fragments are located across the room.

Another artist to contend with in relation to the Murano Master's period of activity is Cristoforo Cortese, who worked on parchment and panel for over five decades (from 1390 to 1445).³⁴ At present, scholars have identified three signed works by him, as well as documents such as lease agreements, wills, and accounts that refer to him alternatively as *pictor* or as *miniator*.³⁵ The artistic dynamic between Cortese and the Murano Master is best seen by examining the choir books made for San Mattia. As mentioned above, the Milan Gradual has been attributed to Cortese, and the codicological evidence provided earlier suggests that it was part of the San Mattia series.³⁶ Additionally, Cortese had a pre-existing professional relationship with the Camaldolese at San Mattia. In 1391, he was commissioned to illuminate a registry book listing all the monastery's assets. It would not have been unusual for San Mattia to keep Cortese in their employ for additional commissions such as a choir book series.

Cortese's stylistic progression needs to be better assessed, given the sizable corpus attributed to him and the fact that his approach to painting appears to have changed significantly over time, but this task is beyond the scope of the present essay. Based on comparison of some of Cortese's datable works with the illuminations in the Milan Gradual, it is reasonable to suggest that this volume was likely produced during the late 1410s or early 1420s. Situating the volumes by the Murano Master within a 1420s date range accords with the stylistic analysis mentioned above and allows the

34 The bibliography on the artist is vast. In addition to Susy Marcon's entry in the 2004 *Dizionario biografico dei miniatori italiani*, see also Ileana Chiappini di Sorio, "Documenti per Cristoforo Cortese," *Arte Veneta* 17 (1963): 156–58; Simona Savini Branca, "Nota per Cristoforo Cortese," *Arte Veneta* 20 (1966): 230–33; Norman Land, "Cristoforo Cortese and an Important Antiphonary in the Bodleian Library, Oxford," *Burlington Magazine* 120, no. 906 (1978): 584–91, 593; Simona Cohen, "Cristoforo Cortese Reconsidered," *Arte Veneta* 39 (1985): 22–31; Mariani Canova, "Cristoforo Cortese, Graduale," 232–39.

35 Lyle Humphrey, "Cristoforo Cortese's Signed Frontispiece in the Museo Civico Amadeo Lia, La Spezia and the Mariiegola of the Scuola dei Milanesi of Venice," *Rivista di storia della miniatura* 12 (2008): 81–94.

36 See Canova, "Cristoforo Cortese, Graduale," 232–39; Azzarello, "Reassembling the Sacred."

possibility that some time may have transpired during the commission. Some visual parallels in page layout can be drawn between the Milan and Berlin Graduals, but the styles of the two illuminators and their shops are markedly distinct. The decorative program of the San Mattia volumes was likely modeled on the choir books produced for the church of San Michele in Isola from about 1392 to 1399 by Don Silvestro dei Gheraducci, Don Simone Camaldolese, Don Lorenzo Monaco, and others.³⁷ While the Murano Master maintained a sophisticated palette and approach to rendering figures throughout his oeuvre, Cortese's style is at once recognizable but variable, especially when comparing several works. The attribution of a large body of work of varying quality to Cortese has therefore distorted the perceived consistency of his output.³⁸

Technical analysis offers other ways to differentiate the working methods of these illuminators. Investigations undertaken at the Fitzwilliam Museum in Cambridge, in collaboration with the Getty Museum and the National Gallery of Art in Washington, D.C., have revealed the presence of smalt (cobalt oxide or cobalt carbonate) in certain but not all of the cuttings from the Murano Gradual.³⁹ Might this choice of pigment be indicative of the workshop in general or of an individual artist's hand? Continued study of the San Giorgio Maggiore choir books confirmed the same phenomenon: namely, that this blue material was employed by some but not all of those involved in the project (it was not used by Belbello in the two illuminations studied from Corale M of the series, nor was it used by Cristoforo Cortese in Corale N and Missal CXII).⁴⁰ Additionally, due to the flaking of gold and

37 See Freuler, "Presenze artistiche toscane," 480–502; Freuler, "Gradual (Sanctorale) from Santa Maria degli Angeli" and "Gradual for San Michele a Murano," 131–54, 155–76.

38 For the varying quality in Cortese's oeuvre, see especially discussions in Cohen, "Cristoforo Cortese Reconsidered," 22–31; Humphrey, "Cristoforo Cortese's Signed Frontispiece," 81–94.

39 "Illuminating Art's History," University of Cambridge Research, 19 February 2015, <https://www.cam.ac.uk/research/features/illuminating-arts-history>; Stella Panayotova, Paola Ricciardi, and Nancy Turner, "Case Study 37: Master of the Murano Gradual," in *The Art and Science of Illuminated Manuscripts: A Handbook*, ed. Stella Panayotova (London: Harvey Miller, 2020), 379–84; Paola Ricciardi and Catherine Schmidt Patterson, "Science of the Book," in Panayotova, *The Art and Science of Illuminated Manuscripts*, 35–72.

40 Paolo Ricciardi, Anna Mazzinghi, Stefano Legnaioli, Chiara Ruberto, and Lisa Castelli, "The Choir Books of San Giorgio Maggiore in Venice: Results of In-Depth Non-Invasive

pigments on the cutting with Saint George in the Wildenstein Collection (Appendix A, no. 23), a fairly elaborate underdrawing is visible. At present, a broader sample of references is needed, and yet much already has been learned about the group of cuttings in the past several years.

Brief mention should be made of the Maestro di San Nazario, named by Tiziana Franco for miniatures in an antiphonary in the Archive of the Cathedral of Capodistria (Koper), Slovenia (containing the *comunale* for the Divine Office and featuring six historiated initials).⁴¹ Franco suggested that the illuminator may have collaborated on the Berlin Gradual (possibly painting the prophet on fol. 108v) and may be the artist of a manuscript of Titus Livius's *Historiae* (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS Lat. 5734), dated 1418. The volume in Slovenia includes a decoration by a range of hands, and in fact the illuminations in the Titus Livius manuscript more closely resemble works by Cristoforo Cortese in terms of figure type, palette, and foliage design in the borders. The Maestro di San Nazario certainly constitutes another strand in the broader milieu of Venetian illumination of the early Quattrocento. Acknowledging the potential plurality of anonymous hands such as the Maestro di San Nazario and the varying styles apparent within the oeuvres of the Murano Master and Cortese reveals the Renaissance workshop in action and also sheds light on the fact that illuminators often worked together through collaborations or as consortia. Despite the relative stylistic consistency in illuminations attributed to the Murano Master, some variation does occur and may eventually reveal the work of distinct individuals within a single shop.

As we have seen, scholars often compare the work of the Murano Master to material created by better-known or better-documented individuals. Another approach is to draw intermedial associations, or connections across media. For example, the expressive quality of the Master of the Murano Gradual's saints has been compared to the frescoes by Giovanni da Modena in the Bolognini Chapel (also called the *Cappella dei Magi* for the cycle related to the story of the three kings) in the Church of San Petronio in

Analyses," *Heritage* 2 (2019): 1684–701.

41 Franco, "Attorno a un corale di Capodistria," 161–68.

Bologna, dated to about 1410.⁴² References to paintings by Michele Giambono, especially the Fano Polyptych of about 1422–25, have also been made concerning the Murano Master’s “Gothicizing tendencies” that draw upon Lombard and Venetian precedents.⁴³ In sum, while the Murano Master’s style has become increasingly clear to scholars, the artist’s origins, dates of activity, and movements throughout the Italian peninsula have not been clarified. Based on the evidence reviewed above, it seems prudent to narrow the chronological range of the San Mattia series to about 1420 to the early 1430s, as opposed to a fifty-year span, and to acknowledge that the illuminator was part of an active network of artists in northern Italy.

A Fragmentary Future: Collaborative Strategies and Digital Rewards

The reconstruction of the San Mattia choir books is beset by numerous challenges, foremost among which is the fragmentary state of the volumes. As mentioned at the start, the Berlin Gradual has received little direct study by scholars and is not available for digital consultation. The list of cuttings from the dispersed manuscripts continues to grow, including an initial with a saint in the Pushkin State Museum of Fine Art that has been overlooked in scholarship on the Murano volumes beyond the discovery in 2010 (fig. 12).⁴⁴ We know that several more illuminations have yet to be located based on the provenance research shared in Appendix A. The total number of known cuttings (fifty-one) is slightly more than the total historiated initials in the Berlin Gradual (forty-eight), a comparison that may indicate that the majority of the removed miniatures have been located (though it

42 Padovani, “Su Belbello da Pavia,” 24–34; Toscano, “Per Belbello in Laguna,” 10–15, figs. 7, 11, 13.

43 Gaudenz Freuler, “Master of San Michele a Murano,” in *The McCarthy Collection, volume 1: Italian and Byzantine Miniatures* (London: Paul Holberton, 2019), 244–46.

44 Ekaterina Zolotova, *Western European Book Miniatures of the 12th–17th Centuries: Catalogue of Illuminated Manuscripts in Moscow Libraries, Museums, and Private Collections* (Moscow: Severnyi Palomnik-Kuchkovo Pole, 2010), 111, 376.



FIGURE 12. *Initial M: A Saint*, Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. Moscow, Pushkin State Museum of Fine Arts, Inv. OF Arch. 25359.

should be noted that the present whereabouts of eleven remain unknown). To begin to reconstruct the series, one must be able to identify or hypothesize the liturgical content of each of the cuttings. This task can be straightforward when the iconography is clear, as in *The Birth of the Virgin*, or when the initial letter is identifiable (several are not, due to the way they were trimmed) and contains a recognizable figure such as Saint Blaise. When available, the text and musical notation on the reverse of the cuttings are especially helpful in revealing the identity of the scene or figure on the opposite side. This combination of evidence has allowed us to identify the original sequence of seventeen of the fifty-one cuttings (Appendix A, nos. 2, 3, 6, 9, 12, 13, 17, 18, 19, 23, 24, 25, 28, 29, 37, 38, and 50) and to hypothesize the placement of others (for example, either of the figures in Appendix A, nos. 30 and 31, likely represents Saint Paul, whose feast is commemorated on 29 June). In many instances the back is inaccessible, as several fragments have been pasted onto card or framed without documentation of the reverse. Multiple figures can only be identified as “A Bishop” or “A Female

Saint,” which is also how they are sometimes referred to in auction or collection catalogues. At the Sotheby’s sale of the Ottley collection in 1838, for example, lots 36 and 37 are listed as bishops, which could refer to several cuttings (see Appendix B). Scholars have identified the bearded figure in at least three cuttings as Saint Augustine (Appendix A, nos. 5, 11, and 29), but the best candidate for this saint is in the Wildenstein Collection (Appendix A, no. 29). A final point about the Ottley sale is that the identifiable illuminations were for feasts in March and between May and August, giving a sense of the seasonal volume(s) that was dismembered.

In addition to the geographical dispersion, there are stylistic and technical issues with which to contend. When the cuttings are examined as a whole, it becomes clear that there are stylistic variations, which are to be expected to a certain degree in such an undertaking. Cuttings in the Wildenstein Collection at the Musée Marmottan best reveal these differences. Additionally, hitherto unnoticed is the fact that in at least two instances the cuttings contain neither decoration nor music on the reverse: *The Crucifixion of Saint Andrew* and *Saint Jerome* feature lines drawn in silverpoint that indicate the space for chant between musical staves but which remain undrawn (see figs. 4 and 9). The measurement between these spaces is consistent with other cuttings from the set (4 cm).

Lastly, as mentioned earlier, in the Sotheby’s auction catalogue for 5 December 1994 Christopher de Hamel described four decorated letters in lot 3 as possibly pertaining to “the Murano Gradual,” by which he meant the San Mattia choir books.⁴⁵ Since that time, nearly 150 stylistically similar additional cuttings have come to light, usually at auction, but others have also been identified in museums, libraries, and private collections (see Appendix C). The largest groupings of these letters are the Museo Correr in Venice (46 cuttings), the Free Library of Philadelphia (27), the British Library (BL; 22), the Victoria & Albert Museum (V&A; 19), and the Art Institute of Chicago (12).⁴⁶ The cuttings in London entered their present

45 Sotheby’s London, *Western Manuscripts and Miniatures*, 5 December 1994, lot 3.

46 For the Correr cuttings, see Zibordi, “La raccolta di ritagli,” 217–34. For the British Library initials, see *British Museum Catalogue of Additions to the Manuscripts, 1854–1860* (London: British Museum, 1875), 630. Seven of the cuttings in the Victoria & Albert Museum were reproduced in Matthew Digby Wyatt and William Robert Tymms, *The Art of*

institutions in 1858 (BL), from the former collection of John Matthew Gutch (1776–1861), and by 1860 (V&A), giving a *terminus ante quem* for when the fragments were dispersed.⁴⁷ To date there has been little direct study and assessment of the set with the surviving initials on the backs of cuttings associated with the Murano Gradual.⁴⁸ Of the known fragments from the San Mattia choir books, five contain decorated letters on the reverse (listed in Appendix A), and these feature lead white penwork (at times tarnished) and the characteristic eyelash-like strokes on the foliate design. The decorated initial *I* on the cutting in Plzen (see fig. 10) shares some generic features with initials on a page in the British Library (Add. MS 22310, fol. 11; fig. 13), but the majority of these on the London page differ from the initial *D* on the reverse of a cutting in Los Angeles (see fig. 5). Across the British Library page, comparisons can also be made with decorated letters illuminated by Belbello, in the Brandenburg-Gonzaga Missal, as well as in the San Giorgio Maggiore choir books (either those in situ on the Isola di San Giorgio, in an antiphonary from the series at the Metropolitan Museum of Art, or as dispersed leaves in collections across Europe and America; see fig. 6).⁴⁹ A cherub within an initial *I* in the Victoria & Albert Museum does resemble similar figures in the Berlin Gradual (Kupferstichkabinett, MS 78 F.1, fols. 144, 159). Finally, a foliate border in an album at the Houghton Library was once part of a page from the Murano Gradual that contained *The Dormition of the Virgin* now in the Fitzwilliam Museum (fig. 14). Bryan C. Keene first demonstrated this relationship to Peter Kidd, who created a partial digital reconstruction.⁵⁰ The remaining

Illuminating (London: Day and Son, 1860), plates Fourteenth Century No. 27–28. For a discussion of a decorated letter possibly by Belbello in the Kupferstichkabinett in Berlin, see Beatrice Alai, *Le miniature italiane del Kupferstichkabinett di Berlino* (Florence: Polistampa, 2019), 71–78, 287–88.

47 For the British Library cuttings, see *British Museum Catalogue*, 630. For the V&A cuttings, see Wyatt and Tymms, *The Art of Illuminating*, plates 69–70.

48 See Keene and Azzarello, “Uno splendido enigma,” 14–21.

49 The Metropolitan Museum of Art houses an antiphonary from San Giorgio Maggiore (60.165), and it can be viewed at <https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/471898>.

50 We thank Peter Kidd for alerting us to this border and for following Bryan’s assessment that the fragment was once part of the same page as the Fitzwilliam cutting (email, March 2018). See also Peter Kidd, “A Rediscovered Border from the Murano Gradual,” *Medieval*



FIGURE 13. Page of decorated letters. London, The British Library, Courtesy of the British Library Board, Add. MS 22310, fol. 11.

fragments on the Houghton Library page were doubtless from the San Giorgio Maggiore choir books. Further study of the entire group of illuminations just mentioned is in order, and a combination of digitization and technical analysis may provide some answers to the lingering conundrum

Manuscripts Provenance: Weekly Notes and Observations, 12 September 2020, <https://mssprovenance.blogspot.com/2020/09/a-re-discovered-border-from-murano.html>.



FIGURE 14. Border decoration (rightmost foliate design), Master of the Murano Gradual, about 1420s. Boston, Harvard University, Houghton Library, MS Typ. 99S, fol. 1.

about the origin of these fragments. The presence of such a large number of these initials in the Museo Correr does seem to indicate a Venetian provenance for the series.

In addition to the need for further study of this material, digital technology affords many opportunities for virtual collaborations across vast distances and for reconstructing dismembered objects. The issue of geographical dispersion of cuttings can be remedied using the digitized collections, and more specifically in the case of the Murano cuttings, to be able to “reassemble” them virtually, thereby allowing us to see them as the monks would have, in liturgical order. Notably, the *Fragmentarium.ms* project, an online laboratory for medieval manuscript fragments, endeavors to become a robust, central clearing house for so-called fragmentology work.⁵¹ The use of social media has also proven to be a highly effective means for fragments to be “rediscovered” as leaves from the same disbound manuscript have been found in some instances because of a social media post.

The advancement of the field of digital humanities means that collaboration can take place from anywhere and involve scholars who are, much like these manuscript cuttings, located in diverse institutions all over the globe. These tools can greatly enhance our abilities to study objects and to collaborate with scholars worldwide, thus making future projects more accessible and inclusive of scholars from varied backgrounds. In many ways, the collaborative process of writing this article mirrors the one required to make the choir books under study. Using various digital modalities, we have been able to undertake the research necessary to study these objects together, no matter where they are around the world. This article was co-authored by two scholars who work on different continents thanks to technologies such as Google Docs and Skype, which have allowed us to contribute equally to this endeavor while both in situ and when studying each of the fragments under consideration in person.

In sum, this overall reassessment of the Master of the Murano Gradual’s career and corpus has clarified the following points. First, the illuminator appears to have employed a workshop of assistants or collaborators and to

51 <https://fragmentarium.ms>.

have possibly collaborated with Belbello da Pavia. This phenomenon is consistent with contemporary practices in the Veneto and can be corroborated by the variations in paint handling in the Berlin Gradual and across the set of cuttings from the rest of the San Mattia choir books. Second, the series of choral manuscripts was most likely undertaken in the 1420s to early 1430s, a dating that can be confirmed through comparisons with dated or datable manuscripts by Cristoforo Cortese—another contributor to the Murano project—or in codices hitherto assigned to Belbello but more likely the result of collaborations involving the Murano Master(s). Third, technical analysis reveals that some illuminators in the Veneto used mixtures of ultramarine and cobalt-containing smalt, while others did not, and these pigment choices may help to distinguish the hands of individual illuminators. And finally, some of the more than one hundred decorated letters that have been loosely connected to the San Mattia choir books may in fact have been part of the dispersed volumes, but the majority are stylistically dissimilar to initials found in the Berlin Gradual or on the backs of known fragments from the set. One goal of this study has been to use online technology and available resources to virtually reassemble the Murano choir books. Such an endeavor is ongoing through partnerships and collaborations dedicated to deepening an understanding of the splendors of the Serenissima.

Appendix A

List of known cuttings from the San Mattia a Murano choir books arranged alphabetically by current location; an asterisk (*) indicates that the fragment was part of an Antiphonary.

- 1 Boston, Museum of Fine Arts, 1973.692
Initial O (?): *The Dream of Saint Romuald*; on the reverse, two lines of fragmentary text (. . [. . .] // *tis et confēs. . . // ius sollemp. . .*) and three partial four-line musical staves (21 × 13.5 cm)

Provenance: About 1955–61, in the estate of Jacob Hirsch (dealer; New York, 1874–1955); 1961–67, probably owned by Frederick A. Stern (New York); 1967 acquired by Julius Böhler in Munich; purchased by John Goelet (New York) in 1967 from Böhler; gifted to the Museum of Fine Arts in 1973 by Goelet in honor of Hanns Swarzenski.

Source: Curatorial files; Milvia Bollati, “The Dream of St. Romuald (cutting), Master of San Michele Murano,” in *Beyond Words: Illuminated Manuscripts in Boston Collections*, ed. Jeffrey Hamburger, William Stoneman, Anne-Marie Eze, Lisa Fagin Davis, and Nancy Netzer (Boston: McMullen Museum of Art, 2016), 52–53.
- 2 Bratislava, Slovenská Národná Galerie, 03266
Initial D: *The Birth of Saint John the Baptist (De ventre matris meae)*, for the Feast of the Nativity of Saint John the Baptist on 24 June); on the reverse, two lines of fragmentary text (. . *sub te[gmento man]. . . // us sue pr[otexit me]. . .*) and two partial four-line musical staves (15 × 11.5 cm)

Provenance: Collection of William Young Ottley (1771–1836); sold 11 May 1838 at Sotheby’s, London (Ottley Sale), lot 32; prior to 1928, possibly in the collection of Marcell von Nemes (1866–1930), Budapest and Munich; sold 13–14 November 1928 in the Frederick Muller sale (Amsterdam); bought in 1967 by the Slovenská Národná Galerie from a private collection (Trnava).

Source: Olga Pujmanová, “Dvě Vyřiznuté Miniatury od Mistra Graduálu z Murana,” *Umění/Art*, 34 (1986): 69–73; Sandrina Bandera Bistoletti, “Maestro di San Michele a Murano,” in *Arte in Lombardia tra gotico e rinascimento*, ed. Miklós Boskovits (Milan: Fabri Editori, 1988), 104–9.
- 3 Cambridge, The Fitzwilliam Museum, Marlay Cutting It. 18
Initial G: *The Dormition of the Virgin* (for *Gaudeamus [omnes in domino]*, Introit for the Mass of the Assumption of the Virgin on 15 August); on the reverse, two lines of fragmentary text (continued from the reverse . . . *honor marie virginis // De cuius assumptione // gaudent angeli et collaudant filium dei. . .*) and two partial four-line musical staves (30.5 × 32 cm)

Provenance: Collection of William Young Ottley (1771–1836); sold 12 May 1838 at Sotheby's, London (Ottley Sale), lot 191, to Rev. John Fuller Russell (1813–1884); 1853, owned by Thomas Miller; bequeathed by Charles Brinsley Marlay (1831–1912) to the Fitzwilliam Museum.

Source: Paul Binski and Stella Panayotova, *The Cambridge Illuminations: Ten Centuries of Book Production in the Medieval West* (London: Harvey Miller, 2005), 150–52; Nigel Morgan, Stella Panayotova, and Suzanne Reynolds, *A Catalogue of Western Book Illumination in the Fitzwilliam Museum and the Cambridge Colleges, part 2: Italy and the Iberian Peninsula*, vol. 1 (London: Harvey Miller Publishers, 2012), 56–57; Stella Panayotova, Paola Ricciardi, and Nancy Turner, “Case Study 37: Master of the Murano Gradual,” in *The Art and Science of Illuminated Manuscripts: A Handbook*, ed. Stella Panayotova (London: Harvey Miller, 2020), 379–84.

- 4 Cambridge, University Library, Add. MS 4165 (10)
Initial D: A Female Saint; on the reverse, decorated initial *E* with one partial rubric and two lines of text (. . .*E*(?) // *um uer*) with two partial four-line musical staves (14.3 × 9.6 cm)

Provenance: Before 1891, owned by Edward Hailstone (d. 1891); sold 4 February 1891 at Sotheby's, London, part of lot 1465 or 1466, to Samuel Sanders (1837–1894); 1894, bequeathed to the University Library.

Source: Binski and Panayotova, *The Cambridge Illuminations*, 150–52.

- 5 Cleveland Museum of Art, 1954.257
Initial S: A Bishop-Saint (identified by the museum as Saint Augustine); on the reverse, three fragmentary lines of text ([. . .] // *ius. Ps. // isereatus nostri*) and two partial four-line musical staves (16.8 × 14.9 cm)

Provenance: Sold 13 November 1908 by Boerner, Leipzig, lot 15; owned by Vladimir G. Simkhovitch (1874–1959), New York; 1954, purchase from the J. H. Wade Fund.

Source: Cleveland Museum of Art website and curatorial files.

- 6 Florence, Private Collection
Initial I: Saint Matthew (for *Iustus ut palma florebit*, for the Introit of the Vigil of the Feast of Saint Matthew on 21 September); on the reverse, rubric (*In vigilia sancti Mathei introitus. . . // cetera re // quire in vigilia // cibato. Communio.*, the Introit for the Vigil of the Feast of Saint Matthew) and two partial four-line musical staves (17.8 × 10.3 cm)

Provenance: Sold 13 November 1908 at Boerner, Leipzig, lot 11; by 1988, Akron, OH, and London, Bruce Ferrini Rare Books and Sam Fogg Rare Books & Manuscripts, no. 14; sold to current owner by Sam Fogg (London).

Source: Sandra Hindman, *Medieval and Renaissance Miniature Painting* (Akron, OH, 1988), no. 13.

- 7 Geneva, Bibliothèque de Genève, Comites Latentes, MS 256
Initial V: Saint John the Evangelist (?); on the reverse, fragmentary text (unavailable) and one partial four-line musical stave (11.6 × 9.5 cm)
Provenance: Sold 26 November 1985 at Sotheby's, London, lot 14; sold 2 December 1986 at Sotheby's, London, lot 19.
Source: Sotheby's, London, *Western Manuscripts and Miniatures*, 2 December 1986, lot 19.
- 8 London, The British Library, Add. MS 60630, fol. 10
Initial T: A Camaldolese Bishop Dedicating a Church (for *Terribilis est locus iste*, the Introit for the Dedication of a Church); on the reverse, a partial rubric and a decorated initial *O* (for *Optimam par[t]em elegit sibi / [Mari]a. que non aufel[retu]r ab ea in eter[num]*) with four partial four-line musical staves (32.5 × 22.5 cm)
Provenance: Collection of William Young Ottley (1771–1836); sold 11 May 1838 at Sotheby's, London (Ottley Sale), lot 39 to Rev. John Fuller Russell (1813–1884); purchased from him by Samuel Sotheby (1771–1842) prior to 1842 (he also purchased lots 125, 136, 190, 199, 203, 205–9, 245, and 247 from the Ottley sale in 1838); purchased by Leopold de Rothschild (1845–1917); purchased by the British Library on 26 March 1979 as “The Ascott Album” (Add. MS 60630).
Source: British Library website.
- 9 London, McCarthy Collection
Initial G: The Birth of the Virgin (for *Gaudeamus omnes in Domino*, the Introit for the Mass of the Nativity of the Virgin on 9 September); on the reverse, two fragmentary lines of text (. . .*[assump]ta te gau[dent ange]lli et co[[laudant Filium Dei]*, which continues the chant from the proper recto) and three partial four-line musical staves (19.4 × 12.6 cm)
Provenance: Sold 13 November 1908 at Boerner, Leipzig, lot 19; Lausanne, private collection; 1998–2006, sold by Jörn Günther, Hamburg to current owner.
Source: Gaudenz Freuler, *The McCarthy Collection*, vol. 1: *Italian and Byzantine Miniatures* (London: Ad Ilissum, 2018), 244–46.
- 10 London, Private Collection
Initial D (or O?): A Female Saint; on the reverse, fragmentary text and two partial four-line musical staves (image and specific contents unpublished; framed and matted) (15.7 × 9.2 cm)
Provenance: Possibly collection of William Young Ottley (1771–1836); possibly sold 11 May 1838 at Sotheby's, London (Ottley Sale), perhaps lot 33 or 34; subsequently in the collection of Robert S. Holford (1808–1892) and Sir George Holford (1860–1926); sold 12 July 1927 at Sotheby's, London, lot 16 (sold with *Saint Helena Finding the True Cross*, see Appendix 1.18); Eric Korner (1893–1980) and his estate until 2009; sold 7 July 2009 at Sotheby's, London, lot 110.
Source: R. H. Benson, *The Holford Collection, Dorchester House* (Oxford, 1927), 3, no. 27 and plate 25 (as Siense); Sotheby's, London, *Western Manuscripts and Miniatures and the Korner Sale* (7 July 2009), lot 110.

- 11 London, Private Collection (different from above)
Initial S: A Bishop-Saint (previously published as Saint Augustine); on the reverse, two fragmentary lines of text (. . . *regnum*. . . // . . . *[homi]ni nego[tiatori]*. . . for *Simile est regnum caelorum*, the Gospel for Septuagesima) and one partial four-line musical stave (framed and matted) (13.5 × 11.8 cm)
Provenance: Until 1925, Paris, collection of Comte Paul Durrieu (1885–1925); sold 13 November 1908 at Boerner, Leipzig, lot 32; by 1988, Akron, OH, and London, Bruce Ferrini Rare Books and Sam Fogg Rare Books & Manuscripts, no. 13; 1994, Paris, Les Enluminures, no. 10.
Source: Hindman, *Medieval and Renaissance Miniature Painting*, no. 13; Sandra Hindman, *Les Enluminures: Moyen Age et Renaissance* (Paris: Les Enluminures, 1994), no. 10.
- 12 Los Angeles, Getty Museum, MS 73 (2003.87)
Initial G: Saint Blaise (for the Feast of Saint Blaise on 3 February); on the reverse, decorated initial *D* with two fragmentary lines of text and abbreviated rubrics (VII. // *Diffusa*. // . . . *ccc. co*) on two partial four-line musical staves (15.7 × 12 cm)
Provenance: Until 1983, unknown collection; sold 25 April 1983 at Sotheby's, London, lot 123 to Brisigotti Antiques Ltd.; by 1993, Galleria Nella Longari (Milan); until 2003, Dr. Jörn Günther (Hamburg), sold to Getty Museum.
Source: *Catalogue of Single Leaves and Miniatures from Western Illuminated Manuscripts*, Sotheby's, London, 25 April 1983, lot 123; Filippo Todini, *Una collezione di miniature italiane: dal Duecento al Cinquecento* (Milan: Studio Nella Longari, 1993), 1:44–49.
- 13 Los Angeles, Paul Getty Museum, MS 106 (2010.21)
Saint Jerome Extracting a Thorn from a Lion's Paw (for the Feast of Saint Jerome on 30 September); blank reverse with blind ruled musical staves (21 × 16.5 cm)
Provenance: Until 1955, Dr. Jacob Hirsch (1874–1955) and his estate; by 1972, Louis V. Randall (1893–1972; Canada); until 1975, by descent through the Randall family; until 2010, private sale, Christie's, London, to Getty Museum.
Source: Curatorial files.
- 14 Moscow, Pushkin State Museum of Fine Arts, Inv. OF Arch. 25359
Initial M: A Saint; on the reverse, fragmentary text, “. . . *tu cogno*. . .” on two partial four-line musical staves (11.3 × 8.5 cm)
Provenance: Until 1969, collection of Aleksei Alekseevich Sidorov (1891–1978), to Pushkin State Museum of Fine Arts.
Source: Ekaterina Zolotova, *Western European Book Miniatures of the 12th–17th Centuries: Catalogue of Illuminated Manuscripts in Moscow Libraries, Museums, and Private Collections* (Moscow: Severnyi Palomnik-Kuchkovo Pole, 2010), 111, 376.

- 15 New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.4
 * *Initial I: A Prophet*; on the reverse, three partial lines of text (. . . *ti me d[omi]ne de // In di // ulationis me. . .*, the first response for Matins on Palm Sunday) and musical staves (23.2 × 15.7 cm)
Provenance: Until 1953, Paris; gift of Robert Lehman, in the name of Mr. and Mrs. Goodhart, to Yale University in 1953.
Source: Pia Palladino, *Treasures of a Lost Art: Italian Manuscript Painting of the Middle Ages and Renaissance* (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2003), 125–26.
- 16 New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, 48.40
Initial O (or D?): *Two Saints and Two Bishops* (Saints Romuald, Benedict, Justus, and Clement); on the reverse, two fragmentary lines of text and rubric (. . . (?) *ia. Ps. // . . . [. . .]i dominum. . .*) and two partial four-line musical staves (60 × 47.5 cm)
Provenance: Until 1928, Marcell von Nemes, Budapest and Munich; his sale, Frederick Muller, Amsterdam, 13–14 November 1928, lot 98; (Mirella Levi D’Ancona records that the cutting was then sold by Mensing, Amsterdam on 22 November 1929 and became part of the collection of Arnold Mettler [1867–1945] and Elsa Mettler-Specker, St. Gall); until 1948 in the collection of Dr. Elizabeth de Cespel (New York).
Source: Francis Russell, “A Gothic Miniature from Murano,” *Burlington Magazine*, 122, no. 923 (1980): 117 n. 7; Mirella Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection of Illuminations 1: The Lombard School* (Florence: Leo Olschki, 1970), 53.
- 17 New York, The Morgan Library & Museum, MS M. 1129
Initial B: Archangel Michael Transfixing Satan (for *Benedicite dominum omnes angeli*, the Introit for the Feast of Saint Michael on 29 September); reverse inaccessible (framed and matted) (11.5 × 21.5 cm)
Provenance: About 1955–61, in the estate of Jacob Hirsch (1874–1955); before 1978, New York, Stern Collection; 2002, gift of Suzanne A. Rosenborg to Morgan Library & Museum
Source: Serena Padovani, “Su Belbello da Pavia e sul miniatore di San Michele a Murano,” *Paragone* 29 (1978): 25–35; Keene and Azzarello, “Uno splendido enigma,” 14–21.
- 18 New York, Private Collection
Initial N: Saint Helena Finding the True Cross (for *Nos autem gloriari oportet*, Mass of the Finding of the True Cross on 3 May); on the reverse, two fragmentary lines of text and two partial four-line musical staves (image and specific contents unpublished; framed and matted) (14.5 × 10.4 cm)
Provenance: Collection of William Young Ottley (1771–1836); sold 11 May 1838 at Sotheby’s, London (Ottley Sale), lot 38 to “Tindall”; in the collection of Robert S. Holford (1808–92) and Sir George Holford (1860–1926); sold 12 July 1927 at Sotheby’s, London,

lot 16; Eric Korner (1893–1980) and his estate until 2009; sold 7 July 2009 at Sotheby’s, London, lot 109.

Source: Benson, *The Holford Collection*, 3, no. 27 and pl. XXVI (as Siense); Sotheby’s, London, *Medieval Illuminated Miniatures*, lot 109.

- 19 Paris, Musée des Thermes, Cluny, Cl. 22712

Initial B: *The Holy House of Loreto* (Feast on 10 December); on the reverse, three fragmentary lines of text (. . . *exulta* // [blank] // [fragmentary]) and three partial four-line musical staves (21 × 11 cm)

Provenance: Bequeathed in 1843 to the Cluny Museum by its founder Alexandre Du Sommerard (1779–1832); inventoried in 1847 as part of the collection.

Source: Sandrina Bandera Bistoletti, “Maestro di San Michele a Murano,” in *Arte in Lombardia tra gotico e rinascimento*, ed. Miklós Boskovits (Milan: Fabri Editori, 1988), 104–9.

- 20 Paris, Musée des Thermes, Cluny, Cl. 22712

Initial N (?): *The Miracle of the Beirut Crucifix*; on the reverse, a decorated initial *G* (*Gloria*), three fragmentary lines of text and rubric (. . . *i cum dom* // XXIII. *Gloria et h[onor]* // . . . *domi[ni]*. *Com[pline]*) and three partial four-line musical staves (20.3 × 12.5 cm)

Provenance: Bequeathed in 1843 to the Cluny Museum by its founder Alexandre Du Sommerard (1779–1832); inventoried in 1847 as part of the collection.

Source: Sandrina Bandera Bistoletti, “Maestro di San Michele a Murano,” in *Arte in Lombardia tra gotico e rinascimento*, ed. Miklós Boskovits (Milan: Fabri Editori, 1988), 104–9; Stephanie Azzarello, “Iconoclasm and Anti-Semitic Imagery in a Fifteenth-Century Venetian Choir Book,” *IKON* 11 (2018): 103–12.

- 21 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6011

Initial S: *A Bishop Saint*; reverse inaccessible and unpublished (8.5 cm × 8.5 cm)

Provenance: Sold 13 November 1908 at Boerner, Leipzig, lot 40; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.

Source: Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 3–56.

- 22 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6022

Initial I (?): *An Apostle or Martyr Saint*; reverse inaccessible and unpublished (16 × 9.1 cm)

Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann collection, n. 32, 7; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.

Source: Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 45–47 (n. 8).

- 23 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6023
Initial P: Saint George (for *Protexisti me Deus*, Introit for the Feast of Saint George on 23 April); reverse inaccessible and unpublished (10.3 × 7.7 cm)
Provenance: 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.
Source: Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 49–50 (n. 14).
- 24 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6024
Initial G: Saint Mary Magdalene (for *Gaudeamus omnes*, for the Feast of Saint Mary Magdalene on 22 July); reverse inaccessible and unpublished (14 × 8.5 cm)
Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann collection, n. 32, 10; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.
Source: Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 51–53 (n. 17).
- 25 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6027
Initial E: Saint Stephen (for *Etenim sederunt principes. . .*, Feast of Saint Stephen on 26 December); reverse inaccessible and unpublished (14.5 × 8.8 cm)
Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann collection, n. 32, 8; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.
Source: Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 47 (n. 9).
- 26 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6030
The Mission to the Apostles with a four-line musical stave and the opening line, *Inclitus [pater rector. . .]* (from a Hymnal, Lauds for One Priest); reverse inaccessible and unpublished (54 × 36.5 cm)
Provenance: Collection of William Young Ottley (1771–1836); sold 11 May 1838 at Sotheby’s, London (Ottley Sale), lot 192, “Descent of the Holy Spirit. . .from Murano,” to Sotheby for £1.6s; 1898, T. M. Whitehead, London, 10 May, n. 77, “Descent of the Holy Ghost”; 1926, Rodolphe Kann; Édouard Kann, n. 31 (Boinet indicates the provenance from the Ottley Collection, but with n. 2395 instead of 192); 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.
Source: Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 38–43 (n. 4); Russell, “A Gothic Miniature,” 117–18.
- 27 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6031
Initial S: An Old Man in Prayer with a Youth Behind Him; reverse inaccessible and unpublished (9 × 8.3 cm)
Provenance: Possibly sold 13 November 1908 at Boerner, Leipzig, lot 40 (“Sienese XIV Cent.”); 1912, in the collection of Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.
Source: Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 51 (n. 16).

- 28 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6033
Initial G: Saint Margaret and the Dragon (for *Gaude virgo Margareta*, Feast of Saint Margaret on 20 July); reverse inaccessible and unpublished (14 × 10.7 cm)
Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann, n. 32, 9; 1946, Georges Wildenstein. (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.
Source: Levi D'Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 47–48 (n. 10).
- 29 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6034
Initial I: Saint Augustine (for *In medio ecclesiae*, Feast of Saint Augustine on 28 August); reverse inaccessible and unpublished (21.5 × 10 cm)
Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann, n. 32, 1; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984
Source: Levi D'Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 43 (n. 5).
- 30 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6035
Initial S: Saint Julian or Saint Paul?; reverse inaccessible and unpublished (16 × 13.5 cm)
Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann, n. 32, 3; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984
Source: Levi D'Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 43–45 (n.6).
- 31 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6036
Initial S: Saint Paul; reverse inaccessible and unpublished (15 × 13.5 cm)
Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann, n. 32, 4; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.
Source: Levi D'Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 45 (n. 7).
- 32 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6037
Initial (?): A Bishop Saint; reverse inaccessible and unpublished (13.5 × 10 cm)
Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann, n. 32, 5; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.
Source: Levi D'Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 48 (n. 11).
- 33 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6038
Initial M: A Bearded Saint with a Book; reverse inaccessible and unpublished (13.5 × 9.7 cm)
Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann, n. 32, 6; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.
Source: Levi D'Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 48–49 (n. 12).

- 34 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6039
Initial (?): *A Seated Evangelist*; reverse inaccessible and unpublished (21.5 × 3 cm)
Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann, n. 32, 2; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.
Source: Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 49 (n. 13).
- 35 Plzen, Západočeské Muzeum, Inv. 2972
Initial I: *A Bishop Saint (A Pope with a Church?)*; on the reverse, decorated initial (possibly an *I*) with two fragmentary lines of text ([Exa]ltatione[s] // (?)r cum.) and two partial four-line musical staves (16.1 × 10.1 cm)
Provenance: 1909, Leipzig, collection of K. W. Hiersemann (1854–1928).
Source: Olga Pujmanová, “Dvě Vyřiznuté Miniatury od Mistra Graduálu z Murana,” *Umění/Art*, 34 (1986): 69–73.
- 36 Stanford, The T. Robert and Katherine States Burke Collection of Manuscripts
Initial O: *Saint Romuald (?)* (possibly *Os justi meditabitur sapientiam*, the Introit for the Common of One Confessor); reverse inaccessible (pasted down, framed, and matted) (15 × 12.7 cm)
Provenance: Likely in the collection of William Young Ottley (1771–1836); sold 11 May 1838 at Sotheby’s, London (Ottley Sale), lot 33, sold to “Tindall”; Robert Stayner Holford (1808–1892); Sir George Holford (1860–1926); private collection, England; Christie’s, London, 12 June 2013, lot 11; Hamburg, Dr. Jörn Günther, 2014; purchased by the current owner from Les Enluminures in 2015.
Source: Sandra Hindman and Federica Toniolo, eds., *The Burke Collection of Italian Manuscript Paintings* (London: Ad Ilissvum, 2021), 389–97, entry by Stella Panayotova.
- 37 St. Louis, St. Louis Art Museum, 36:1953
Initial M: *The Crucifixion of Saint Andrew* (likely *Mibi autem nimis honorati*, the Introit for the Feast of Saint Andrew on 30 November); XXXXXIII on the reverse with blind-ruled musical staves (29.3 × 24.6 cm)
Provenance: Sold 13 November 1908 at Boerner, Leipzig, lot 8; prior to 1950, in the collection of Anton Hiersemann (Stuttgart, Germany); purchased by J. Rosenthal (Oxford and London) on 11 November 1950 at auction at Karl and Faber, Munich, Germany; 1952–53, owned by Vladimir G. Simkhovitch (New York, 1874–1959); sold April 1953 to St. Louis Art Museum by V. Simkhovitch.
Source: St. Louis Art Museum website.

- 38 Washington, DC, National Gallery of Art, Inv. B-14, 842
Initial D: Saint Lawrence (likely *Dispersit debit pauperibus*, the Introit for the Vigil of the Feast of Saint Lawrence on 10 August); on the reverse, one line of fragmentary text (*[Q]ui vult ven[ire]. . .*) and two partial four-line musical staves (14.9 × 12.5 cm)
Provenance: Until 1930, Vienna, Czeczowitzka collection; sold 12 May 1930 at Ball & Graupe, Berlin, lot 10 to E. Rosenthal (Berkley); sold 1937 by Maggs Bros. Ltd., London, lot 23; 1947 owned by L. J. Rosenwald (Jenkintown); 1948 acquired by the National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC.
Source: Maggs Bros., *Illuminated Miniatures and Original Drawings* (no. 642), 1937; Edith Kirsch, “Initial D from a Choir Book,” in *Medieval and Renaissance Miniatures from the National Gallery*, ed. Gary Vikan (Washington, DC: National Gallery of Art, 1975), 70–74.
- 39– Unknown Location (formerly Leipzig, Boerner, sold 13 November 1908)
- 46 Lot 5, initial S with a saint facing the viewer
 Lot 14, initial S with a bishop holding a book
 Lot 20, a bishop kneeling in prayer
 Lot 22, a bishop with a scourge in his right hand and a black-and-white crozier in his left hand
 Lot 27, initial S with two bishops, one in profile and the other facing the viewer
 Lot 42, three initials with saints
Source: C. G. Boerner, *Katalog einer kostbaren Sammlung zum Teil aus dem Nachlasses eines leipziger Patriziers. . .* (Leipzig, 1908).
- 47– Unknown Location (formerly London, Sotheby’s, 11 May 1838 [Ottley Sale], lot 31)
- 48 Two: *The Annunciation* and *The Presentation*, to Rev. John Fuller Russell (1813–84)
Source: Russell, “A Gothic Miniature,” 117–18.
- 49 Unknown Location (formerly London, Maggs Bros., 1951)
Initial O: Saint Peter or *Pope-Saint Clement* (?) (15 × 12.5 cm)
Provenance: 1951, Maggs Bros. Ltd., London, no. 6; private collection (unknown location).
Source: Maggs Bros., *Seven Centuries of Colour (14th to 20th Century): A Catalogue of Illuminated Mss. Miniatures and Printed Books Illustrated in Color*, no. 802 (London, 1951); Russell, “A Gothic Miniature,” 117–18.
- 50 Unknown Location (formerly Rauris, Austria, Zeileis Collection; ex-Holford Collection)
Initial E: Saints Philip and James (for *Exclamaverunt ad te. . .*, Feast of Saints Philip and James on 11 May); unpublished lines of music on the reverse (14 × 14.7 cm)
Provenance: 1926, Édouard Kann Collection (n. 31); sold 12 July 1927 at Sotheby’s, London; Holford Collection n. 16; until 2015, Rauris, Austria, Dr. Friedrich Georg Zeileis Collection.

50 *Source: La collection de miniatures de M. Édouard Kahn* (Paris: Les beaux arts, 1926), no. 31, pl. 27; Friedrich George Zeileis, “Più ridon le carte”: *Buchmalerei aus Mittelalter und Renaissance: Katalog einer Privatsammlung von illuminierten Einzelblättern* (Rauris [Austria]: Eigenverlag, 2009), 350–51.

51 Unknown Location (formerly Zurich, Koller Auktionen, 18 September 2015, lot 156; formerly Rauris, Austria, Zeileis Collection)
Initial I: A Prophet (20.6 × 11.3 cm)

Provenance: New York, Mortimer Brandt; sold 20 June 1955 at Sotheby’s, London, lot 32; until 1996, London, Sam Fogg; until 2015, Rauris, Austria, Dr. Friedrich Georg Zeileis Collection; sold 18 September 2015 at Zurich, Koller Auktionen, lot 156.

Source: Gaudenz Freuler, *Italienische Buchmalerei aus einer bedeutenden Privatsammlung* (Zurich: Koller, 2015), 112.

The following cuttings from the Wildenstein Collection are often discussed in relation to the San Mattia choir books, but they are more likely from the San Giorgio Maggiore music manuscripts:

1 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6020
Initial R: Saint Justina of Padua (likely by Belbello and workshop); reverse inaccessible and unpublished (12 × 17 cm)

Provenance: Possibly Church of San Giorgio Maggiore, Venice; 1926, Édouard Kann Collection, n. 32, 11; 1946, Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.

Source: Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 50–51 (n. 15, identified as Saint Catherine or Justina and attributed to Belbello).

2 Paris, Musée Marmottan, Wildenstein Collection, M6029
Initial O: Saints Cosmas and Damian (likely by Belbello and workshop); reverse inaccessible and unpublished (10.5 × 11.5 cm)

Provenance: Possibly Church of San Giorgio Maggiore, Venice; 1926, Édouard Kann Collection, n. 31; sold 12 July 1927 at Sotheby’s, London; Holford Collection, n. 16; Georges Wildenstein (Wildenstein & Co., New York); bequeathed to the Musée Marmottan in 1984.

Source: Levi D’Ancona, *The Wildenstein Collection*, 53 (n. 18, attributed to a follower of Belbello now referred to as the Master of the Antiphony M of San Giorgio Maggiore).

Appendix B

List of cuttings from the William Ottley Sale of Manuscripts, London, Sotheby's, 11–12 May 1838 (present location included in parentheses when known)

Lot 31, Two: The Annunciation and the Presentation in the Temple

Lot 32, Two: The Nativity of Saint John and Another by the same hand from Murano (present location of the former: Bratislava, Appendix A, no. 2)

Lot 33, Two: A Male and a Female Saint (likely London, private collection, and Stanford, T. Robert and Katherine States Burke Collection of Manuscripts, Appendix A, nos. 10 and 36)

Lot 34, Two: Female Saints

Lot 35, Two: Bishops (possibly New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, Appendix A, no. 16)

Lot 36, One: Bishop

Lot 37, One: Another

Lot 38, One: The Holy Women and Others at the Foot of the Cross (New York, private collection, Appendix A, no. 18)

Lot 39, One: A large letter *T* with a Bishop and Monks kneeling before a Church (London, British Library, Appendix A, no. 8)

The Miniature Paintings in the above nine lots are all by the same hand, from Murano.

Lot 191, One: The Death of the Madonna from Murano (Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, Appendix A, no. 3)

Lot 192, One: The Descent of the Holy Spirit, a large sheet, splendidly gilt and colored, in a border, containing in ten circular compartments, busts of Bishops and Monks, by the same hand (Paris, Musée Marmottan, Appendix A, no. 26)

Appendix C

List of cuttings with decorated letters or foliate borders that have been discussed in relation to the volumes of the San Mattia a Murano Gradual include the following (listed alphabetically by current location):

Austin, Harry Ransom Humanities Research Center, HRC leaf I.1 (initial *I*)

Boston, Houghton Library, Harvard University, MS Typ. 521, fol. 1 (initials *Q, G, I, N, G*) and MS Typ. 995, fol. 1 (decorated foliate border once part of a page with *The Dormition of the Virgin*, Appendix A, no. 3, as first suggested by Bryan C. Keene in 2018)

Chicago, The Art Institute of Chicago, twelve initials (listed in parentheses after the accession number): 1924.156 (*M*), 1924.159 (*S*), 1924.160 (*T*), 1924.161 (*C/O?*), 1925.60 (*M*), 1925.59 (*A*), 1925.58 (*G*), 1925.57 (*G*), 1925.61 (*G*), 1925.62 (*A*), 1925.63 (*Q*), 1925.64 (*C/O?*)

London, Bloomsbury Auctions (8 July 2015), initials *A, B, G*

London, Bradley Symonds, initials *G* and *G*

London, The British Library, Add. MS 22310, fol. 10, 1 and 3 (*S, S*), fol. 11, 1–18 (*S, S, B, E, A, I, S, P, S, I, G, A, Q, P, B, B, G, G, M, A*)

London, Christie's, 27–28 June 2006, lot 130, initial *G*

London, Sotheby's, 5 December 1994, lot 3, initials *A, D, E, T*

London, Victoria & Albert Museum, MS 1491, E. 448–1911 (*A*), MS 1492, E. 449–1911 (*Q*); MS 1493, E. 450–1911 (initial *I* with a cherubim), MS 1494, E. 451–1911 (initial *G?* with a dragon), MS 1495, E. 452–1911 (*G*), MS 1050 (2861) (*A*), MS 1056 (2854) (*E*), MS 1054 (2455) (*B*), MS 1069 (2842) (*E*), MS 1097 (4002) (*C*), MS 1064 (2840) (*D*), MS 1068 (2841) (*C*), MS 1053 (2854) (*A*), MS 1072 (2845) (*S*), MS 1048 (2849) (*A*), MS 1079 (2996) (*C*), MS 1077 (2994) (*B*), MS 1094 (3088) (*L*), MS 1052 (2853) (*G*)

Philadelphia, Free Library of Philadelphia, Lewis EM 12:4 (*Q*), Lewis EM 12:8 (*Q*), Lewis EM 12:9 (*P*), Lewis EM 12:10 (*S*), Lewis EM 12: 11 (back only), Lewis EM 12:12 (*T*), Lewis EM 12:14 (*Q*), Lewis EM 12:15 (*P*), Lewis EM 12:16 (*L*), Lewis EM 12:17 (*L*), Lewis EM 12:18 (*W*), Lewis EM 12:22 (*B*), Lewis EM 12:24 (*H*), Lewis EM 12:25 (*G*), Lewis EM 13:1 (*G*), Lewis EM 13:2 (*G*), Lewis EM 13:4 (*A*), Lewis EM 13:7 (*A*), Lewis EM 13:8 (*A*), Lewis EM 13:9 (*A*), Lewis EM 13:10 (*A*), Lewis EM 13:11 (*N*), Lewis EM 13:12 (*U*), Lewis EM 13:13 (*O*), Lewis EM 13:14 (*I*), Lewis EM 13:16 (*I*), Lewis EM 13:18 (*G*)

Rheims, Musée Historique Saint-Remi, 978.28405 (P), 978.28406 (V), 978.28407 (S),
978.28408 (M), 978.28409 (A), 978.28410 (M), 978.28411 (G), 978.28412 (N),
978.28413 (N), 978.28414 (G), 978.28415 (S), 978.28416 (P)

Venice, Museo Correr, Gabineto Disegni e Stampe, forty-six decorated letters, inv. Cl. II nn.
242245, 247266, 278279, 301308, 375377, 741751