# **Systematic Review**

DOI: https://dx.doi.org/10.18203/2320-6012.ijrms20214717

# Determinants of stress on resident physicians: systematic review and meta-synthesis

# Ricky Cik Kohar, Junita Maja Pertiwi, Finny Warouw\*

Department of Neurology, Sam Ratulangi University, Manado, North Sulawesi, Indonesia

Received: 7 October 2021 Accepted: 01 November 2021

# \*Correspondence: Dr. Finny Warouw,

E-mail: rckohar@gmail.com

**Copyright:** © the author(s), publisher and licensee Medip Academy. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License, which permits unrestricted non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

# ABSTRACT

Stress/burnout on resident physicians is common. Various determinants can be related to resident stress. This systematic review was conducted to determine how situational, personal, or professional determinants influence resident stress. We identified an English and Indonesia articles using online database including PubMed, Wiley Online Library, Google Scholar, Garba Rujukan Digital (GARUDA), and manually searching bibliographies of the included studies from January 01, 2001 until April 30, 2021. Three main search terms included are resident physician, determinant, and stress/burnout. Study selection included was peer-reviewed literatures of observational studies that discuss about stress determinants on residents from various year of training and medical specialties. Methodological quality of studies was assessed using Newcastle-Ottawa Scale adopted for cross-sectional studies. Data extraction conducted by 3 authors. All pooled synthesis were summarized based on narrative methods. Fifty-three crosssectional, 1 prospective, and 1 combination of cross-sectional and longitudinal studies meet our inclusion criteria (n=29.031). Fifty-one percent are male, and the average age of the participants was 29 years old. The most stress/burnout validated tool used are Maslach Burnout Inventory. The average quality of study was moderate for cross-sectional studies. The main identified determinant was situational, the second was personal, and the latter was professional. The most stressor identified was 'excessive working time per week, includes night shift, on-call, work on day off, and rotation more than 24 hours.' Stress/burnout on residents closely related mainly to situational, followed by personal, and less by professional determinants. There was needed for an intervention to the educational program from institution in the future for better accomplishment.

Keywords: Determinant, Resident physician, Stress, Burnout

# **INTRODUCTION**

Residency training is an advanced professional program for medical doctor with independent and supervised learning methods to become a specialist doctor. It includes integration between theory and practice. In professional education, there must be an integration between health care services and educational processes. In this process, participant called resident physicians or residents, tend to be prone to stress/burnout. Residency training has been characterized as a period of sacrifice in personal life including family, social, physical, mental, spiritual, and financial. When stress/burnout exceeds a critical level, it can turn into manifestation that result in physical, neurobehavioral, neuropsychiatric disorder, even the negative effect on work like drop out, alcohol and drug abuse, also medical errors that will harm the patients. Stress itself has been dubbed the "health epidemic of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century" by the world health organization.<sup>1</sup> The resident service committee of the association of program directors in internal medicine divided determinants of stress as situational, personal and professional.<sup>2</sup> The situational stress determinant include: (1) inordinate, inflexible time, fatigue, and sleep deprivation (2) excessive workload (3) burdensome clerical and administrative responsibilities (4) insufficient allied health personnel (5) too many difficult patients, and (6) inadequate learning environment. The personal stress determinant include: (1) family problems, (2) financial problems (3) isolation; problems of relocating (4) lack of leisure time (5) psychosocial problems, and (6) inadequate coping skills. The professional stress determinant include: (1) responsibility for patient care (2) supervision of more junior residents and students; (3) difficult patients and difficult patient problems (4) information overload, and (5) career planning. The aimed of this research is to determine how situational, personal, and professional determinants influence resident's stress/burnout.

# LITERATURE REVIEW

This systematic review evaluated with the guidelines of preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analysis (PRISMA). The collection of study articles by searching through database PubMed, Wiley Online Library, Google Scholar, GARUDA, and manually searching bibliographies from January 01, 2001 until April 30, 2021. The search strategy included combination of 3 main key terms based on population, exposure and outcome (PEO) criteria: resident physician, determinant, and resident physician. The final keywords utilized from database indexes or independently without indexes included: (resident or residency or medical residency or medical resident or medical resident physician or resident doctor or resident physician or trainee physician or trainee resident doctor or postgraduate trainee doctor or postgraduate residency training or postgraduate medical resident or residency training or internship residency) and (determinant or factor or cause or etiology or stressor or predictor or predisposition or risk or risk factor or association) and (stress or burnout or burnout syndrome). Studies were eligible for inclusion if they met the following criteria: (1) peer-reviewed observational studies (2) resident physician from various year of training and medical specialties (3) determinants of stress include situational, personal and professional (4) outcome of stress/burnout measured by validated tools (5) articles in English and Indonesia languages, and (6) publication from January 01, 2001 until April 30, 2021. We excluded grey literatures to avoid non-peer-reviewed articles. Literatures that passed filtering underwent methodological quality assessment before data extraction and data synthesis. Selection of studies carried out in two steps. First, we conducted a title and abstract screening. Second, the literature that corresponds to the research question will be collected and then filtered for full-text articles. Duplicate articles will be excluded. Quality appraisal was conducted based on Newcastle-Ottawa Scale adopted for cross-sectional studies, provides score from 0 to 10, with score of 0 to 4 as unsatisfactory study, score of 5 to 6 as satisfactory study, score of 7 to 8 as good study, and score of 9 to 10 as very good study. Low quality studies are included but with some consideration. Extracted data includes author name and year of publication, country of origin, study design, research time

conducted, sample size with response rate, resident physician characteristics such as age, gender, medical specialty, year of training; measurement of outcome with validated tools, and determinants of stress identified. Afterward, we summarized the results with narrative methods in order to answer the research question.

# **STUDY SELECTION**

Overall, the full-text articles assessed for eligibility was 125 articles. Full-text articles then excluded with a consideration were 70 articles. The final included studies for narrative synthesis were 55 articles (Figure 1).



# Figure 1: Literature selection process with PRISMA diagram.

# CHARACTERISTICS OF STUDY RESPONDENTS

Fifty-five studies included for synthesis with total 29.031 residents were participated. There are 26 studies with high response rate (≥50%) including 15.745 resident physicians (56.8%), 24 studies with lower response rate including 11.827 resident physicians, and 5 studies does not state response rate. Based on gender, revealed that the male gender was 51% and female gender was 49%. The average age of residents was 29 years old. There are 21 studies (38%) take samples from various medical specialties (multiple), and the remain 34 of the studies conduct on certain medical specialties (surgery and nonsurgery fields, 17 studies (30.9%), respectively. Of these 55 studies, all residents have shift work, night shift, and on-call schedule on their programs. The situational stress determinants identified in 52 studies (94.5%), the personal stress determinants identified in 39 studies (70.9%), and the professional stress determinants identified in 14 studies (25.4%) (Table 1).

# Table 1: Characteristics of studies, population, exposure and outcome.

| Author/Study<br>year                        | Country<br>of origin | Study<br>design                            | Research<br>time                         | Sample size<br>(response<br>rate, %) | Age<br>(mean)<br>(Years) | Gender<br>(male, %) | Medical<br>specialty | Year of<br>training | Validated outcome tools | Stress<br>determinants<br>identified      |
|---|----------------------|--|--|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|---------------------|-------------------------|---|
| Khalafallah et al, 2020 <sup>3</sup>        | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional                        | May 2020                                 | 111 (12.2)                           | Not stated               | 65.8                | Neurosurgery         | 1-7+                | aMBI                    | Situational                               |
| Eckleberry-Hunt<br>et al, 2006 <sup>4</sup> | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional                        | October-<br>November<br>2006             | 151 (38)                             | Not stated               | 51                  | Multiple             | 1-6                 | MBI                     | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Ogboghodo and<br>Edema, 2020 <sup>5</sup>   | Nigeria              | Cross-<br>sectional                        | November 15,<br>2019-January<br>15, 2020 | 448 (97)                             | 33.9±0.4                 | 62.3                | Multiple             | 1-2                 | MBI-HSS-MP              | Situational                               |
| Kemper and<br>Schwartz, 2020 <sup>6</sup>   | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional                        | Spring 2019                              | 1956 (66)                            | Not stated               | 30                  | Pediatrics           | Not stated          | MBI, PSS                | Situational                               |
| Ogundipe et al,<br>2014 <sup>7</sup>        | Nigeria              | Cross-<br>sectional                        | Not stated                               | 204 (74.5)                           | 33.44±4.5                | 58.3                | Multiple             | Not stated          | MBI                     | Personal                                  |
| Treluyer and<br>Touneux, 2021 <sup>8</sup>  | France               | Cross-<br>sectional                        | May 2020                                 | 340 (26.1)                           | 27                       | 16.2                | Pediatrics           | 1-4                 | MBI-HSS                 | Situational, personal                     |
| Panse et al, 2020 <sup>9</sup>              | India                | Cross-<br>sectional                        | March-April<br>2019                      | 185 (not stated)                     | Not stated               | 70.8                | Plastic surgery      | 1-3                 | aMBI                    | Situational                               |
| Somerson et al, 2020 <sup>10</sup>          | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional                        | September<br>2018                        | 203 (6)                              | Not stated               | 80                  | Orthopedics          | 1-5                 | MBI-HSS                 | Situational                               |
| Smeds et al, 2019 <sup>11</sup>             | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional                        | Spring 2018                              | 273 (42)                             | 31±3.0                   | 56                  | General surgery      | Not stated          | OLBI, PSS               | Personal                                  |
| Ferguson et al, 2020 <sup>12</sup>          | Canada               | Prospective                                | February 6-<br>March 7,<br>2018          | 144 (40.1)                           | Not stated               | 34.7                | Radiology            | 2-5                 | MBI-HSS                 | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Ringrose et al, 2009 <sup>13</sup>          | Netherlan<br>ds      | Cross-<br>sectional<br>and<br>interview    | February 1, 2007                         | 47 (81)                              | 30.3±3.3                 | 48.9                | Multiple             | 1-6                 | MBI                     | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Zis[1] et al, 2014 <sup>14</sup>            | Greece               | Cross-<br>sectional                        | 2012                                     | 263 (90.7)                           | 33.5±3.3                 | 53.6                | Multiple             | Not stated          | MBI                     | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Kemper et al, 2020 <sup>15</sup>            | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional<br>and<br>longitudinal | 2016<br>2017<br>2018                     | 1664 (61)<br>2153 (66)<br>2241 (61)  | 29                       | 28<br>27<br>29      | Pediatrics           | 1-3                 | MBI                     | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Golub et al, 2007 <sup>16</sup>             | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional                        | September<br>2005                        | 514 (50)                             | 31                       | 79                  | ENT                  | 2-5                 | MBI-HSS                 | Situational,<br>personal                  |

Continued.

International Journal of Research in Medical Sciences | December 2021 | Vol 9 | Issue 12 Page 3667

Kohar RC et al. Int J Res Med Sci. 2021 Dec;9(12):3665-3675

| Author/Study<br>year                       | Country<br>of origin | Study<br>design     | Research<br>time                         | Sample size<br>(response<br>rate, %) | Age<br>(mean)<br>(Years)       | Gender<br>(male, %) | Medical<br>specialty | Year of<br>training | Validated outcome tools | Stress<br>determinants<br>identified      |
|--|----------------------|---------------------|--|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|---------------------|-------------------------|---|
| Ji et al, 2020 <sup>17</sup>               | China                | Cross-<br>sectional | October 1,<br>2018-January<br>31, 2019   | 380 (81.1)                           | 28.1±3.9                       | 20.8                | Pediatrics           | 1-5                 | MBI-HSS                 | Situational, personal                     |
| Bin Dahmash et al, 2019 <sup>18</sup>      | Saudi<br>Arabia      | Cross-<br>sectional | February<br>2019                         | 108 (49.7)                           | Not stated                     | 53.7                | Radiology            | 1-4                 | MBI-HSS                 | Situational, personal                     |
| Nimer et al, 2021 <sup>19</sup>            | Jordan               | Cross-<br>sectional | September-<br>October 2020               | 481 (95.8)                           | Not stated                     | 55.5                | Multiple             | 1-4                 | CBI                     | Situational, personal                     |
| Janko and Smeds,<br>2018 <sup>20</sup>     | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional | Not stated                               | 177 (34)                             | 32                             | 64                  | Vascular<br>surgery  | Not stated          | OLBI, PSS               | Situational, personal                     |
| Kijima et al,<br>2020 <sup>21</sup>        | Japan                | Cross-<br>sectional | July-<br>September<br>2014               | 97 (28.2)                            | 27.1                           | 64.9                | Multiple             | 1-2                 | MBI-GS                  | Situational,<br>personal                  |
| Zubairi and<br>Noordin, 2016 <sup>22</sup> | Pakistan             | Cross-<br>sectional | May 1-31,<br>2013                        | 82 (34)                              | Not stated                     | 54                  | Multiple             | 1-3                 | MBI                     | Situational                               |
| Attenello et al, 2018 <sup>23</sup>        | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional | June-<br>November<br>2015                | 346 (21)                             | 31                             | 78                  | Neurosurgery         | 1-7                 | MBI                     | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Takayesu et al, 2014 <sup>24</sup>         | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional | Fall 2011                                | 218 (75)                             | Not stated                     | 59                  | Emergency medicine   | 1-4                 | MBI                     | Situational, personal                     |
| Reed et al, 2020 <sup>25</sup>             | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional | Not stated                               | 182 (12)                             | Not stated                     | Not stated          | ENT                  | 1-5                 | MBI                     | Situational, personal                     |
| Nishimura et al,<br>2019 <sup>26</sup>     | Japan                | Cross-<br>sectional | April 2017<br>October 2017<br>March 2018 | 39 (51)<br>27 (36)<br>21 (28)        | 26±2.2<br>26.6±2.6<br>27.4±2.7 | 48.7<br>33.3<br>38  | Multiple             | 1-2                 | MBI                     | Situational                               |
| Geng et al, 2020 <sup>27</sup>             | China                | Cross-<br>sectional | June 2019                                | 563 (73.3)                           | Not stated                     | 39.3                | Multiple             | 1-3                 | MBI-HSS                 | Situational, personal                     |
| Lee et al, 2020 <sup>28</sup>              | Singapor<br>e        | Cross-<br>sectional | Not stated                               | 50 (64.9)                            | 30.7±3.0                       | 46                  | Psychiatry           | 1-5                 | OLBI                    | Situational, personal                     |
| Hassan et al,<br>2020 <sup>29</sup>        | Egypt                | Cross-<br>sectional | December<br>2016-Feb<br>2017             | 278 (89.4)                           | 26.5±1.35                      | 46.4                | Multiple             | 1 above             | HCJSSQ                  | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Ho and Kwek, 2021 <sup>30</sup>            | Singapor<br>e        | Cross-<br>sectional | Not stated                               | 44 (100)                             | 31.4±2.3                       | 90.9                | Orthopedics          | Not stated          | MBI                     | Situational, personal                     |
| Raftopulos et al,<br>2019 <sup>31</sup>    | Australia            | Cross-<br>sectional | July 2017                                | 60 (89.6)                            | Not stated                     | 66.7                | ENT                  | 1-5                 | MBI                     | Personal                                  |
| Ebrahimi and<br>Kargar, 2018 <sup>32</sup> | Iran                 | Cross-<br>sectional | 2015                                     | 311 (88.8)                           | Not stated                     | 55                  | Multiple             | 1-4                 | OSI-R                   | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |

International Journal of Research in Medical Sciences | December 2021 | Vol 9 | Issue 12 Continued. Page 3668

Kohar RC et al. Int J Res Med Sci. 2021 Dec;9(12):3665-3675

| Author/Study<br>year                         | Country<br>of origin | Study<br>design     | Research<br>time                     | Sample size<br>(response<br>rate, %) | Age<br>(mean)<br>(Years) | Gender<br>(male, %) | Medical<br>specialty | Year of<br>training | Validated outcome tools                   | Stress<br>determinants<br>identified      |
|--|----------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|---------------------|---|---|
| Choi et al, 2013 <sup>33</sup>               | South<br>Korea       | Cross-<br>sectional | April-<br>2020<br>July<br>2010       | 150 (13.1)                           | 29.9                     | 46.7                | Family medicine      | 1-3                 | KOSS-SF                                   | Situational                               |
| Maswadi et al,<br>2019 <sup>34</sup>         | Jordan               | Cross-<br>sectional | April-<br>2017<br>July-<br>2017      | 555 (84)                             | 30.0±3.0                 | 71.7                | Multiple             | 1-5                 | PSS                                       | Situational,<br>personal                  |
| Aldubai et al,<br>2019 <sup>35</sup>         | Saudi<br>Arabia      | Cross-<br>sectional | Not stated                           | 75 (71)                              | Not stated               | 45.3                | Family<br>medicine   | 1-4                 | MBI                                       | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Blanchard et al, 2010 <sup>36</sup>          | France               | Cross-<br>sectional | 2009                                 | 204 (60)                             | 28                       | 40                  | Oncology             | Not stated          | MBI                                       | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Charoentanyarak<br>et al, 2020 <sup>37</sup> | Thailand             | Cross-<br>sectional | February<br>2019                     | 149 (21)                             | 28.29±2.9                | 30.8                | Family medicine      | 1-3                 | MBI-HSS                                   | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Ramya et al,<br>2019 <sup>38</sup>           | India                | Cross-<br>sectional | June 1-<br>November 30,<br>2018      | 239 (58.2)                           | Not stated               | 57.6                | Multiple             | 1-3                 | PSS                                       | Situational                               |
| Alosaimi et al,<br>2015 <sup>39</sup>        | Saudi<br>Arabia      | Cross-<br>sectional | May-October 2012                     | 938 (25.9)                           | 28.4±3.0                 | 55.4                | Multiple             | 1-3                 | PSS                                       | Situational, personal                     |
| Grover et al,<br>2018 <sup>40</sup>          | India                | Cross-<br>sectional | April-<br>2017<br>May 2017           | 445 (27.6)                           | 28.93±3.0                | 69.2                | Multiple             | Not stated          | PSS, MBI                                  | Situational, personal                     |
| Sun et al, 2019 <sup>41</sup>                | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional | Not stated                           | 5.296 (36)                           | 32±3                     | 63                  | Anesthesiology       | 1-3                 | MBI-HSS                                   | Situational, personal                     |
| Kinslow et al, 2020 <sup>42</sup>            | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional | May-July<br>2020                     | 81 (not stated)                      | Not stated               | 50.6                | General surgery      | 1-6                 | Validated<br>questionnaire<br>against MBI | Situational                               |
| Block et al., 2013 <sup>43</sup>             | USA                  | Cross-<br>sectional | May-June<br>2011                     | 55 (72)                              | 29±3                     | 53                  | Internal medicine    | 1                   | MBI                                       | Situational                               |
| Zis et al, 2015 <sup>44</sup>                | Greece               | Cross-<br>sectional | October-<br>2014<br>November<br>2014 | 116 (88.5)                           | 34±3.6                   | 44.8                | Neurology            | Not stated          | MBI                                       | Situational, personal                     |
| Matsuo et al,<br>2021 <sup>45</sup>          | Japan                | Cross-<br>sectional | 2018-2019                            | 604 (12.7)                           | 27±2.8                   | 62.9                | Multiple             | 1-2                 | MBI-GS                                    | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |

International Journal of Research in Medical Sciences | December 2021 | Vol 9 | Issue 12 Page 3669

Kohar RC et al. Int J Res Med Sci. 2021 Dec;9(12):3665-3675

| Author/ Study<br>year                    | Country<br>of origin   | Study<br>design     | Research<br>time                     | Sample size<br>(response<br>rate, %)            | Age<br>(mean)<br>(Years) | Gender<br>(male, %) | Medical<br>specialty      | Year of<br>training | Validated outcome tools | Stress<br>determinants<br>identified      |
|--|--|---------------------|--------------------------------------|---|--------------------------|---------------------|---------------------------|---------------------|-------------------------|---|
| Marchalik et al,<br>2019 <sup>46</sup>   | USA<br>Europe<br>(Italy,<br>Portugal,<br>France,<br>Belgium) | Cross-<br>sectional | May 2018                             | 211 (20.9)<br>158 (45.2,<br>30.5, 12.5,<br>9.4) | Not stated               | 63                  | Urology                   | Not stated          | MBI                     | Situational,<br>personal                  |
| Ferguson et al,<br>2020 <sup>47</sup>    | Canada   | Cross-<br>sectional | 26 February<br>2019                  | 718 (41.1)                                      | 30.1±3.7                 | 40.8                | Multiple                  | 1-7                 | MBI-HSS                 | Situational,<br>personal,<br>professional |
| Huang et al, 2020 <sup>48</sup>          | China  | Cross-<br>sectional | June 2017                            | 318 (96.4)                                      | Not stated               | 44.3                | Multiple                  | 1-3                 | MBI-HSS                 | Situational, personal                     |
| Sahasrabuddhe et al, 2015 <sup>49</sup>  | India  | Cross-<br>sectional | Not stated                           | 273 (49.6)                                      | 26.5                     | 62                  | Multiple                  | 1-3                 | PSS                     | Situational                               |
| Castelo-Branco et al, 2006 <sup>50</sup> | Spain  | Cross-<br>sectional | October 2004                         | 109 (67)  | 27±2.3                   | 14                  | Obstetrics-<br>gynecology | Not stated          | MBI                     | Situational                               |
| Lue et al, 2010 <sup>51</sup>            | Taiwan   | Cross-<br>sectional | January<br>2007-<br>June<br>2007     | 555 (90)  | 29.3±2.5                 | 67.7                | Multiple                  | 1                   | CBI, CJSQ               | Situational, personal                     |
| Zhang et al, 2019 <sup>52</sup>          | China  | Cross-<br>sectional | August 2017                          | 159 (not<br>stated)                             | 27.3±6.2                 | 23.2                | Internal medicine         | 1-3                 | MBI                     | Situational                               |
| Marchalik et al, 2019 <sup>53</sup>      | USA  | Cross-<br>sectional | May 2018                             | 211 (20.9)                                      | Not stated               | 69                  | Urology                   | 1-4                 | MBI                     | Situational, personal                     |
| Jean et al, 2020 <sup>54</sup>           | USA-<br>Canada<br>and<br>Europe                              | Cross-<br>sectional | August-<br>2019<br>September<br>2019 | 797 (not<br>stated)                             | Not stated               | Not stated          | Neurosurgery              | Not stated          | MBI                     | Situational,<br>professional              |
| Burhamah et al,<br>2021 <sup>55</sup>    | Kuwait   | Cross-<br>sectional | January-<br>2020<br>February<br>2020 | 85 (not stated)                                 | Not stated               | 64.7                | Multiple<br>surgery       | 1-5                 | aMBI-HSS                | Situational                               |
| De Oliveira et al,<br>2013 <sup>56</sup> | USA  | Cross-<br>sectional | Not stated                           | 1508 (54)                                       | Not stated               | 57                  | Anesthesiology            | 1-4                 | MBI                     | Situational, personal                     |
| Lichstein et al,<br>2020 <sup>57</sup>   | USA  | Cross-<br>sectional | Not stated                           | 661 (58)  | Not stated               | 83                  | Orthopedics               | 1-5                 | aMBI                    | Situational, personal                     |

aMBI: abbreviated Maslach burnout inventory; CJSQ: Cooper's job stress questionnaire; CBI: Copenhagen burnout inventory; HCJSSQ: Hospital consultants' job stress and satisfaction questionnaire; KOSS-SF: Korean occupational stress scale-short form; MBI: Maslach burnout inventory; MBI-GS: Maslach burnout inventory-general survey; MBI-HSS: Maslach burnout inventory-human services survey for medical personnel; OLBI: Oldenburg burnout inventory; OSI-R: Occupational stress inventory-revised (Osipow); PSS: Perceived stress scale.

# **CHARACTERISTICS OF STUDIES**

From 55 studies, it was found that the most researched countries studying about stress/burnout in residents was the United States with 17 studies (30.9%). Other countries include 4 studies in India and China, 3 studies in Saudi Arabia and Japan, 2 studies in Nigeria, France, Jordan, Singapore, and Canada; one study in Netherlands, Greece, Pakistan, Egypt, Australia, Iran, South Korea, Thailand, Spain, Taiwan, and Kuwait; also study with combine countries include 1 study of United States-Europe, and 1 study of United States-Canada-Europe. Most of the studies are cross-sectional study that surveys the samples through a questionnaire. There is 1

prospective study, and 1 study that combine of crosssectional and longitudinal study. All studies used a validated outcome measurement instruments for stress/burnout. The Maslach burnout inventory was the most used validated tool in 42 studies (76%), and perceived stress scale was the second most used in 8 studies (14.5%) (Table 1).

# **DETERMINANTS OF STRESS IDENTIFIED**

Reports of the identified and statistically significant stress determinants in resident physicians from each study. Assessment is caried out based on a higher weight such as sample size from each study (Table 2 and 3).

# Table 2: Stress determinants identified (more often to less often).

| Situational                                   | Personal                           | Professional                       |
|---|------------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| -Inordinate and inflexible time demands,      |                                    |                                    |
| fatigue, sleep deprivation                    |                                    |                                    |
| -Inadequate learning condition/ environment   | -Psychosocial problems             | -Responsibilities for patient care |
| -Excessive workload                           | -Lack of leisure time              | -Career planning                   |
| -Too many difficult patients (like alcohol,   | -Financial problems                | -Information overload              |
| drug abuse, AIDS, exposure to blood and       | -Family problems (spouse,          | -Supervision of more junior        |
| body fluid, high-risk areas)                  | significant other, children)       | residents and students             |
| -Insufficient and lack of support from allied | -Inadequate stress coping skills   | -Difficult patients and difficult  |
| health personnel (colleagues, nursing, social | (include coping with alcohol or    | patient problems (abusive, self-   |
| services, laboratory workers)                 | drug abuse)                        | injury, medical decision such as   |
| -Burdensome clerical and administrative       | -Isolation and relocation problems | do-not-resuscitate)                |
| responsibilities, and lack of support from    |                                    |                                    |
| these staff                                   |                                    |                                    |

## Table 3: Ten highest stressors identified in all determinants.

| S.<br>No. | Highest stressors identified   |
|-----------|--|
| 1         | Excessive working time per week, includes night shift, on-call, work on day off, and rotation more than 24 hours |
| 2         | Lack of support from family, spouse, friends, colleagues, supervisors, and institution                           |
| 3         | Sleep deprivation  |
| 4         | Less weekends, less day off per months   |
| 5         | Unsatisfactory balance between work and personal life  |
| 6         | Responsibilities between home, family, and work; conflict between family and work                                |
| 7         | Educational debts  |
| 8         | Making medical errors  |
| 9         | Rotation on high-risk areas  |
| 10        | Mistreatment (intimidation, discrimination, sexual abuse, verbal abuses, physical abuse                          |

#### **QUALITY ASSESSMENT OF STUDIES**

There were 2 studies (3.6%) as unsatisfactory studies (4 points), 23 studies (41.8%) as satisfactory studies (5 points), 17 studies (30.9%) as satisfactory studies (6 points), 10 studies (10.1%) as good studies, and 2 studies (3.6%) as good studies. Overall, there are 2 studies (3.6%) as low-quality studies, 40 studies (72.7%) as moderate-quality, as well as twelve studies (21.8%) as high-quality studies in these cross-sectional studies.

#### DISCUSSION

This systematic review and meta-synthesis of 55 studies on 29.031 participants was to determine the various determinants related to stress/burnout in resident physicians based on situational, personal and professional determinants. Situational determinant was known to occupy the most influence as a stressor on residents in this study, followed by personal determinant, and the latter was professional determinant.

Situational determinant due to time demands (more frequent to less frequent) includes: (1) Excessive working time, including night shift, on-call, working on holiday, and job rotation exceeding 24 hours as the highest stressor identified, (2) sleep deprivation, (3) poor sleep quality, (4) poor time management and deadline, (5) alteration on rotation and day off schedule during COVID-19 pandemic. It was stated in a study by Marchalik et al that residents who received 3-night shifts during holiday causes burnout.<sup>46</sup> Research such as by Treluyer et al stated that working time per week more than 60 hours is associated with burnout, and Somerson stated that working time per week more than 80 hours causes burnout.<sup>8</sup> The accreditation council for graduate medical education (ACGME) has determined: (1) limit the number of work hours of residents to 80 hours weekly, including in-house call, averaged over 4 weeks, (2) residents must be given 1 day out of 7 free from all clinic and educational responsibilities, averaged over four weeks, (3) residents cannot be scheduled for in-house call more than once every 3 nights, averaged over 4 weeks, (4) duty periods cannot last for more than 30 hours, (5) residents required to rest for 10 hours between period of duty. Long working hours will cause physical and emotional exhaustion with an impact on physical disorders, executive function, attention, memory, and may have a negative effect on work and personal relationship. Other disorders that can arise are insomnia, depression, mental disorders, and occupational consequences. The ACGME limits 80 hours as the upper limit to protect against the negative effects of chronic sleep deprivation, and limits 24 hours plus 6 hours to protect against the effects of acute sleep deprivation. Study such as by Alosaimi et al stated that 2 to 6 hours of sleep, and Sahasrabuddhe et al stated that sleep less than 6 hours per day as an effect on stress/burnout.<sup>39,49</sup> Sleep deprivation are known to cause neurobehavior, performance and physical disorders. Sleep deprivation itself has a definition of inadequate sleep quality and quantity. Geng et al, Choi et al and Ramya et al stated that poor sleep quality as a consequence of lack of sleep less than 6 hours per day.<sup>27,33,38</sup>

Situational determinant due to inadequate learning environment include: (1) Mistreatment like intimidation, discrimination, sexual, verbal and physical abuse from staff, institution, and patients, (2) work environment perceived as less collaborative but more competitive, (3) lack of autonomy, (4) lack of mentoring or poor balance between academic and health services, (5) residents who being underappreciated, feeling unfairly treated for their achievements and work; (6) less time allocated for studying, and (8) research time is not enough. The autonomy of resident physicians is needed to develop independency and become a competent specialist doctor. Supervision and autonomy must be balance to manage patients independently.

Situational determinant due to workload can include: (1) High patients per resident ratio (high patient

admissions), (2) academic burdens, (3) residents who are often given work assignments; (4) resident involved in scut work, (5) multiple procedures, and (6) limited breaktime between their work. The scut work will impact on the lack of resident physicians in their professional development due to working that should not be really needed in their educational programs. The patient's workload is actually a major component of the educational programs. Either a small or an excessive number of patients will be a source of stress, as residents sacrifice time demands while getting sufficient knowledge in their educational program.

Situational determinant due to handling too many difficult patients can include: (1) Rotation in high-risk areas such as emergency room, intensive care unit, neonatal intensive care unit, or isolation room, (2) handling critically ill patients, (3) having an accidents or injury at work.

Situational determinant due to lack of health allied personnel and their support can include: (1) Conflicts between residents; (2) conflicts relationship with coworkers; (3) lack of human resources especially related to patient care; (4) low number of residents per supervisors. As a resident, they will work in time pressure, high-risk situations, and engage with teams from different backgrounds and perspectives. In health services, conflict that arise can come from any tasks, process, and relationship factors.

Situational determinant due to clerical and administrative responsibilities such as paperwork and used of prolonged medical records become a stressor for residents, with less benefit on their professional development.

**Personal determinant due to psychosocial problems can include:** (1) Lack of support from family, spouse, friends, colleagues, supervisors, and institution. Other problems are (2) dissatisfaction with the balance between work and personal life, (3) perfectionists, (4) neuroticism and emotional labile, (5) communication problems at work, (6) residents who have difficulty in making decisions or making wrong decisions, (7) anxiety, (8) emotional demands on patients and co-workers, (9) other social stressors outside of work, (10) psychosomatic problems, (11) low self-efficacy, and (12) pessimism.

**Personal determinant due to limited leisure time can include:** (1) Lack of weekends, lack of day off per months, (2) lack of time for self-care, exercise, and doing favourite activities, and (3) lack of time for family and homesick.

**Personal determinant due to financial problems can include:** High educational debt and low income. This also caused of residency training that not allowed residents to do moonlighting. Although financial problems as a source of stress, several studies stated that residents were not affected by financial problems. This may be due to their expectations of low salaries. Apart from this, it is necessary to propose a salary or increase the nominal salary for residents, as well as reduce the amount of educational costs to minimize educational debts.

*Personal determinant due to family problems can include:* (1) Responsibilities between home, family, and work; conflict between family and work, and (2) conflict with spouse or families.

*Personal determinant due to inadequate stress coping among residents include:* Difficulty accessing mental health services, and inadequate coping stress that may leads to physical, behavioural and neuropsychiatric disorders.

**Personal determinant due to isolation and relocation include:** (1) Less programmatic social events followed by residents, and (2) work location was far from family and friends. However, Takayesu et al stated that new location can be positively seen as enthusiasm and adventure toward new atmospheres and places.<sup>24</sup>

Professional determinant due to responsibilities of patient care include: (1) Residents who makes medical errors, (2) demands or complaints from patients, (3) competency. doing work outside Professional determinant due to career planning include: (1) lack exposure to patient cases, (2) regret or unhappy with career choice, (3) worried about career, and (4) not interested in work. Professional determinant due to information overload can include: (1) intellectual demands, (2) difficult to understand what is being studied, and (3) too much to be learn. The last two professional determinants are problems with patient or patient families, and supervise more junior residents and students.

There are several limitations in this study. First, the results may create risk of bias due to search for articles that cannot identify all the relevant studies according to the inclusion criteria. Second, we categorized any stressor items in each determinant based on our preferences with the basis of several other literature references. Third, most of the included studies were cross-sectional studies. which is cannot establish a definite causal relationship between determinant and stress/burnout. Fourth, our study also excluded languages other than English and Indonesia. Fifth, any included studies were not homogenous based on medical specialties and year of training. Sixth, studies about determinant tend to use selfreport questionnaire survey, which can risk a response, recall, and social desirability bias. Seventh, not all potential participants who experience stress/burnout will complete the questionnaire, or conversely, participants who complete the questionnaire may not really perceived stress/burnout, which can risk of selection bias. Eight, it is not possible for each study to control for all additional factors, which can lead to confounding bias. Ninth,

random sampling is described in only 4 studies. Tenth, the study did not proceed to meta-analysis due to inconsistent effect sizes across studies.

However, there are several strengths in our study. First, we included 55 studies relevant to stress/burnout outcome of resident physicians. Second, we include studies with the population limited to only resident physicians. Third, the number of 29.031 residents obtained from 55 studies such a large sample, and we revealed that there were 26 studies with a high participants response rate more than 50% (56.8%). Fourth, our study excluded grey literatures to avoid any low-quality studies. Fifth, the determinants identified have a statistical significance and are based on standardized metrics. Sixth, we only included studies with stress/burnout outcome that using validated tools. Seventh, the overall quality assessment of studies that we included was moderate for a cross-sectional study. Eight, our findings consider studies that deserve higher weight, for example a larger sample size.

# CONCLUSION

The finding of our systematic review summarized that the outcome of stress/burnout in resident physicians was strongly related to the situational determinants, secondly to the personal determinants, and the latter related to professional determinants. Stress/burnout are experienced by many resident physicians which may have impact on residents and patients on the health care services they provide. The results of the study we obtained support the need for an intervention in the educational program of the institutions to preventing stress/burnout of resident physicians in the future.

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Authors would like thank to department of neurology, Sam Ratulangi university, Manado, North Sulawesi, Indonesia for facilitating this research.

*Funding: No funding sources Conflict of interest: None declared Ethical approval: Not required* 

## REFERENCES

- 1. Fink G. Stress: concepts, definition and history. In: Reference Module in Neuroscience and Biobehavioral Psychology. Elsevier; 2017;1-9.
- 2. Levey RE. Sources of stress for residents and recommendations for programs to assist them. Academic Medicine. 2001;76(2):142-50.
- 3. Khalafallah AM, Lam S, Gami A, Dornbos DL, Sivakumar W, Johnson JN et al. A national survey on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic upon burnout and career satisfaction among neurosurgery residents. J Clin Neurosci. 2020;80:137-42.
- 4. Eckleberry-Hunt J, Lick D, Boura J, Hunt R, Balasubramaniam M, Mulhem E et al. An

exploratory study of resident burnout and wellness. Academic Med. 2009;84(2):269-77.

- Ogboghodo E, Edema O. Assessment of burnout amongst resident doctors in Benin City, Edo State, Nigeria. Niger Postgrad Med J. 2020;27(3):215.
- 6. Kemper KJ, Schwartz A. Bullying, discrimination, sexual harassment, and physical violence: common and associated with burnout in pediatric residents. Academic Pediatr. 2020;20(7):991-7.
- Ogundipe OA, Olagunju AT, Lasebikan VO, Coker AO. Burnout among doctors in residency training in a tertiary hospital. Asian J Psychiatry. 2014;10:27-32.
- Treluyer L, Tourneux P. Burnout among paediatric residents during the COVID-19 outbreak in France. Eur J Pediatr. 2021;180(2):627-33.
- Panse N, Panse S, Ravi S, Mankar H, Karanjkar A, Sahasrabudhe P. Burnout among plastic surgery residents in India: an observational study. Indian J Plast Surg. 2020;53(03):387-93.
- Somerson JS, Patton A, Ahmed AA, Ramey S, Holliday EB. Burnout among United States orthopaedic surgery residents. J Surg Education. 2020;77(4):961-8.
- 11. Smeds MR, Janko MR, Allen S, Amankwah K, Arnell T, Ansari P et al. Burnout and its relationship with perceived stress, self-efficacy, depression, social support, and programmatic factors in general surgery residents. Am J Surg. 2020;219(6):907-12.
- Ferguson C, Low G, Shiau G. Burnout in Canadian radiology residency: a national assessment of prevalence and underlying contributory factors. Can Assoc Radiol J. 2020;71(1):40-7.
- 13. Ringrose R, Houterman S, Koops W, Oei G. Burnout in medical residents: a questionnaire and interview study. Psychol Health Med. 2009;14(4):476-86.
- Zis P, Anagnostopoulos F, Sykioti P. Burnout in medical residents: a study based on the bob demands-resources model. Scientific World J. 2014;2014:1-10.
- 15. Kemper KJ, Schwartz A, Wilson PM, Mahan JD, Schubert CJ, Staples BB et al. Burnout in pediatric residents: three years of national survey data. Pediatrics. 2020;145:1.
- Golub JS, Weiss PS, Ramesh AK, Ossoff RH, Johns MM. Burnout in residents of otolaryngology-head and neck surgery: a national inquiry into the health of residency training. Academic Med. 2007;82(6):596-601.
- Ji L, Xiaowei Z, Ling K, Yao F, Qingkun S, Jun Z. Burnout level and job satisfaction in Chinese pediatrics residents: a web-based cross-sectional study. Medicine. 2020;99:8.
- Bin Dahmash A, Alorfi FK, Alharbi A, Aldayel A, Kamel AM, Almoaiqel M. Burnout phenomenon and its predictors in radiology residents. Academic Radiol. 2020;27(7):1033-9.
- 19. Nimer A, Naser S, Sultan N, Alasad RS, Rabadi A, Abu-Jubba M et al. Burnout syndrome during

residency training in Jordan: prevalence, risk factors, and implications. IJERPH. 2021;18(4):1557.

- 20. Janko MR, Smeds MR. Burnout, depression, perceived stress, and self-efficacy in vascular surgery trainees. J Vascular Surg. 2019;69(4):1233-42.
- 21. Kijima S, Tomihara K, Tagawa M. Effect of stress coping ability and working hours on burnout among residents. BMC Med Educ. 2020;20(1):219.
- 22. Zubairi AJ, Noordin S. Factors associated with burnout among residents in a developing country. Ann Med Surg. 2016;6:60-3.
- Attenello FJ, Buchanan IA, Wen T, Donoho DA, McCartney S, Cen SY et al. Factors associated with burnout among US neurosurgery residents: a nationwide survey. J Neurosurg. 2018;129(5):1349-63.
- Kimo Takayesu J, Ramoska EA, Clark TR, Hansoti B, Dougherty J, Freeman W et al. Factors associated with burnout during emergency medicine residency. Yarris L, editor. Acad Emerg Med. 2014;21(9):1031-5.
- Reed L, Mamidala M, Stocks R, Sheyn A. Factors correlating to burnout among otolaryngology residents. Ann Otol Rhinol Laryngol. 2020;129(6):599-604.
- Nishimura Y, Miyoshi T, Obika M, Ogawa H, Kataoka H, Otsuka F. Factors related to burnout in resident physicians in Japan. Int J Med Educ. 2019;10:129-35.
- 27. Geng H, Tan F, Deng Y, Lai L, Zhang J, Wu Z et al. High rate of burnout among residents under standardized residency training in a tertiary teaching hospital of middle China: results from a crosssectional survey. Medicine. 2020;99:27.
- 28. Lee YW, Kudva KG, Soh M, Chew QH, Sim K. Inter-relationships between burnout, personality and coping features in residents within an ACGME accredited psychiatry residency program. Asia Pac Psychiatry. 2020;e12413.
- 29. Hassan NM, Abu-Elenin MM, Elsallamy RM, Kabbash IA. Job stress among resident physicians in Tanta university hospitals, Egypt. Environ Sci Pollut Res. 2020;27(30):37557-64.
- 30. Ho S, Kwek E. Levels of burnout and its association with resilience and coping mechanisms among orthopaedic surgery residents: a single institution experience from Singapore. Singapore Med J. 2021.
- Raftopulos M, Wong EH, Stewart TE, Boustred RN, Harvey RJ, Sacks R. Occupational burnout among otolaryngology-head and neck surgery trainees in Australia. Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg. 2019;160(3):472-9.
- 32. Ebrahimi S, Kargar Z. Occupational stress among medical residents in educational hospitals. Ann of Occup Environ Med. 2018;30(1):51.
- 33. Choi S-M, Park YS, Yoo J-H, Kim G-Y. Occupational stress and physical symptoms among family medicine residents. Korean J Fam Med. 2013;34(1):49.

- Maswadi N, Khader YS, Abu Slaih A. Perceived stress among resident doctors in Jordanian teaching hospitals: cross-sectional study. JMIR Public Health Surveill. 2019;5:4.
- 35. Aldubai SamiAR, Aljohani A, Alghamdi A, Alghamdi K, Ganasegeran K, Yenbaawi A. Prevalence and associated factors of burnout among family medicine residents in Al Madina, Saudi Arabia. J Family Med Prim Care. 2019;8(2):657.
- 36. Blanchard P, Truchot D, Albiges-Sauvin L, Dewas S, Pointreau Y, Rodrigues M et al. Prevalence and causes of burnout amongst oncology residents: A comprehensive nationwide cross-sectional study. Euro J Cancer. 2010;46(15):2708-15.
- Charoentanyarak A, Anothaisintawee T, Kanhasing R, Poonpetcharat P. Prevalence of burnout and associated factors among family medicine residency in Thailand. J Med Education Curricular Development. 2020;7: 2382120520944920.
- Ramya S, Nisar A, Rajendra C, Muragesh A. Prevalence of stress among postgraduate junior residents in Bangalore, Karnataka, India. Int J Contemp Pediatr. 2019;6(3):1309.
- Alosaimi FD, Kazim SN, Almufleh AS, Aladwani BS, Alsubaie AS. Prevalence of stress and its determinants among residents in Saudi Arabia. SMJ. 2015;36(5):605-12.
- 40. Grover S, Sahoo S, Bhalla A, Avasthi A. Psychological problems and burnout among medical professionals of a tertiary care hospital of North India: a cross-sectional study. Indian J Psychiatry. 2018;60(2):175.
- 41. Sun H, Warner DO, Macario A, Zhou Y, Culley DJ, Keegan MT. Repeated cross-sectional surveys of burnout, distress, and depression among anesthesiology residents and first-year graduates. Anesthesiology. 2019;131(3):668-77.
- 42. Kinslow K, Sutherland M, McKenney M, Elkbuli A. Reported burnout among U.S. general surgery residents: a survey of the association of program directors in surgery members. Ann Med Surg. 2020;60:14-9.
- Block L, Wu AW, Feldman L, Yeh H-C, Desai SV. Residency schedule, burnout and patient care among first-year residents. Postgrad Med J. 201;89(1055):495-500.
- 44. Zis P, Artemiadis AK, Lykouri M, Xirou S, Roussopoulou A, Papageorgiou E et al. Residency training: determinants of burnout of neurology trainees in Attica, Greece. Neurology. 2015;85(11):e81-4.
- 45. Matsuo T, Takahashi O, Kitaoka K, Arioka H, Kobayashi D. Resident burnout and work environment. Intern Med. 2021;60(9):1369-76.
- 46. Marchalik D, Goldman C, Carvalho FL, Talso M, Lynch J, Esperto F et al. Resident burnout in USA

and European urology residents: an international concern. BJU Int. 2019;124(2):349-56.

- 47. Ferguson C, Low G, Shiau G. Resident physician burnout: insights from a Canadian multispecialty survey. Postgrad Med J. 2020;96(1136):331-8.
- 48. Huang L, Caspari JH, Sun X, Thai J, Li Y, Chen F et al. Risk and protective factors for burnout among physicians from standardized residency training programs in Shanghai: a cross-sectional study. BMC Health Serv Res. 2020;20(1):965.
- 49. Sahasrabuddhe AG, Suryawanshi SR, Bhandari S. Stress among doctors doing residency: a cross-sectional study at a tertiary care hospital in the city of Mumbai. 2015;6(1):4.
- Castelo-Branco C, Figueras F, Eixarch E, Quereda F, Cancelo M, González S et al. Stress symptoms and burnout in obstetric and gynaecology residents. Int J Obstetr Gynaecol. 2006;114(1):94-8.
- 51. Lue B-H, Chen H-J, Wang C-W, Cheng Y, Chen M-C. Stress, personal characteristics and burnout among first postgraduate year residents: a nationwide study in Taiwan. Med Teacher. 2010;32(5):400-7.
- 52. Zhang Y, Huang X, Li H, Zeng X, Shen T. Survey results of job status of residents in a standardized residency training program. BMC Med Educ. 2019;19(1):281.
- 53. Marchalik D, Brems J, Rodriguez A, Lynch JH, Padmore J, Stamatakis L et al. The impact of institutional factors on physician burnout: a national study of urology trainees. Urology. 2019;131:27-35.
- 54. Jean WC, Ironside NT, Felbaum DR, Syed HR. The impact of work-related factors on risk of resident burnout: a global neurosurgery pilot study. World Neurosurg. 2020;138:e345-53.
- 55. Burhamah W, AlKhayyat A, Oroszlányová M, Jafar H, AlKhayat A, Alabbad J. The predictors of depression and burnout among surgical residents: a cross-sectional study from Kuwait. Ann Med Surg. 2021;65:102337.
- 56. De Oliveira GS, Chang R, Fitzgerald PC, Almeida MD, Castro-Alves LS, Ahmad S et al. The prevalence of burnout and depression and their association with adherence to safety and practice standards: a survey of United States anesthesiology trainees. Anesthesia Analgesia. 2013;117(1):182-93.
- 57. Lichstein PM, He JK, Estok D, Prather JC, Dyer GS, Ponce BA et al. What is the prevalence of burnout, depression, and substance use among orthopaedic surgery residents and what are the risk factors? a collaborative orthopaedic educational research group survey study. Clin Orthop Relat Res. 2020;478(8):1709-18.

**Cite this article as:** Kohar RC, Pertiwi JM, Warouw F. Determinants of stress on resident physicians: systematic review and meta-synthesis. Int J Res Med Sci 2021;9:3665-75.