

Effectiveness of Achieving Goals: Program for Enforcement of Restrictions on Community Activities

Sarah Sambiran¹, Florence D. J. Lengkong¹, Joorie M. Ruru¹

Email: sarahsambiran@unsrat.ac.id

¹Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Sam Ratulangi University, Manado, Indonesia

Received: September 8, 2022

Received in Revised: September 26, 2022

Accepted: October 4, 2022

Abstract

The implementation of restrictions on community activities as a government program that is implemented nationally in suppressing the spread of Covid 19. Restrictions are carried out on work, school, worship activities and social interaction with the community. This study uses a qualitative design in understanding the effectiveness of the program through the achievement of objectives. Data were obtained by conducting direct interviews and using google forms, making direct observations in community activities. Data collection is also done by means of a narrative review of journals and other related documents. The data collected is then compiled, analyzed, and presented to get a systematic picture so that research results and conclusions can be obtained on the object of the problem being studied. The research findings are that the effectiveness of achieving program objectives by implementing restrictions on community activities is carried out by work units that have personnel with educational and knowledge backgrounds who understand the program's objectives, can coordinate vertically and horizontally with other work units, and are able to implement collaborative governance.

Keywords: Program Effectiveness, Achieving Goals, Restrictions, Public Activities

Introduction

One of the actions taken by the government in an effort to deal with Covid 19 is to impose restrictions on community activities. The development of community activities is in accordance with the Instruction of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 14 of 2021 which is then followed by the Instruction of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 15 of 2021. These two policies are carried out in 2021 which are carried out on a micro basis. However, in 2022, due to the ongoing Covid-19 pandemic, the government again issued a policy through the Instruction of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 3 of 2022 and the Instruction of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 4 of 2022 which are the basis for the policy for the Implementation of Level 3, Level 2 and Level Restrictions on Community Activities. Level 1 Covid-19 in the Java and Bali Regions and at the village and sub-district levels to control the spread of Covid-19 in Sumatra, Nusa Tenggara, Kalimantan, Sulawesi, Maluku and Papua.

The implementation of Restrictions on Community Activities, abbreviated as PPKM, is carried out with the aim that the community will be able to carry out activities and be productive but comply with health protocols so that economic recovery for the community, blood and state can occur. Some of the rules regarding Emergency PPKM include restrictions on teaching and learning activities, non-essential and essential sectors, eating and drinking activities in public places, places of worship, transportation, and other activities that cause crowds (Minister of Home Affairs, 2021). The implementation of Community Activity Restrictions focuses on workplaces or offices, teaching and learning activities, restaurants or places to eat, malls or

shopping centers and places of worship. Meanwhile, essential sectors and construction activities are allowed to continue with strict health protocols. This is the goal of implementing the Implementation of Community Activity Restrictions (PPKM) during the Covid 19 pandemic.

The implementation of restrictions on community activities, as the existing policy, is admittedly not running smoothly. Many problems that occur and are found in the field. People who are given space for limited activities do not comply with health protocols such as not wearing masks, not keeping their distance, not washing their hands and holding crowds of residents such as events (Katuuk et al., 2021). As a result, there has been a spike in the number of COVID-19 cases, because there are still a lot of people who ignore this regulation. Likewise, there are officers who are less assertive in carrying out their duties (Sofyan et al., 2021).

With regard to efforts to prevent Covid 19, the North Minahasa Regency Government has stipulated the North Minahasa Regent Regulation Number 45 of 2020 concerning the application of discipline and law enforcement of health protocols as an effort to prevent and control the 2019 corona virus. in the form of a mask that covers the nose and mouth to the chin, if you have to leave the house or interact with other people whose health status is not known, wash your hands regularly with soap and running water for at least 20 seconds, limit physical interaction, increase endurance by applying clean and healthy living behavior, avoiding or delaying the holding of gathering events that are not important. As for sanctions for individuals, business actors, managers, organizers or persons in charge of public places and facilities who violate obligations, as well as sanctions for violations of the application of health protocols in the form of verbal warnings or written warnings, social work, administrative fines of as much as for individuals who organize events like or grief, for business actors, managers, temporary cessation of business operations and business revocation (Katuuk, et al. 2021). Likewise, the implementation of the implementation of restrictions on community activities (PPKM) as instructed by the Minister of Home Affairs.

The implementation of Community Activity Restrictions which is a national work program and is carried out to remote villages/kelurahan must be carried out properly, precisely, efficiently and effectively. Economic recovery and the return of society to its activities are the hopes of all of us (Handiwardoyo, 2020). So that the spread of the Covid-19 pandemic can be controlled so that people can return to normal activities. Efforts to achieve policy objectives are part of the study of the effectiveness of government programs in government science. The government as the executor and the community as the target group are expected to be able to jointly achieve the goal of effective implementation of the restriction on community activities.

In its implementation in North Minahasa Regency, the government has also involved the community, religious leaders, traditional leaders, community leaders, and other community elements (Katuuk et al. 2021) but with still finding problems in health protocol violations and disobedience to the community and business actors on the contents of the policy for the Implementation of Restrictions on Community Activities made the Covid 19 pandemic experience a spike. And North Minahasa Regency in 2021 was in the spotlight in terms of a spike in cases with the village cluster and family cluster as well as the determination of three sub-districts in the red zone category (<https://minut.go.id> 2021/06).

Talawaan District as a crossing area that connects North Minahasa Regency and Manado City which has twelve villages with a population of 11,474 people has an obligation to limit its activities during the Covid 19 pandemic. In reality, the Government and Society in Talawaan District, North Minahasa Regency have been temporarily implementing the Implementation of Community Activity Restrictions (PPKM) but from looking at current community activities it seems that everything related to compliance with health protocols in teaching and learning

activities, non-essential and essential sectors, eating and drinking activities in public places, places of worship, transportation, and other activities that cause crowds are ignored.

Until now, no research has been found in the literature study that specifically relates to the effectiveness of the program for the Enforcement of Restrictions on Community Activities in Talawaan District, North Minahasa Regency. Meanwhile, the findings of Sofyan et al (2021); Mawuntu, et al (2021); Marwiyah & Salvira (2021); Yakhamid & Zaki (2021) explained that the program for the effective implementation of Community Activity Restrictions could reduce the spike in Covid 19 cases. In addition, it will also become a medium for gradual economic recovery.

Therefore, it is important to identify the effectiveness of the Program for Enforcement of Restrictions on Community Activities in Talawaan District, North Minahasa Regency in teaching and learning activities, non-essential and essential sectors, eating and drinking activities in public places, places of worship, transportation, and other community activities. The results of this study are the basis for implementing policies to limit community activities in teaching and learning activities, non-essential and essential sectors, eating and drinking activities in public places, places of worship, transportation, and other social activities.

Paying attention to the object of research that is the focus of the problem, namely the effectiveness of the program for the Enforcement of Restrictions on Community Activities in Talawaan District, North Minahasa Regency in teaching and learning activities, non-essential and essential sectors, eating and drinking activities in public places, places of worship, transportation, and other community activities. considered urgent because until now the economy and community activities have not been able to run properly due to the Covid 19 pandemic. Various studies that seek to find solutions to the problem of handling Covid 19, but are not specifically carried out in relation to the effectiveness of the program for the Enforcement of Restrictions on Community Activities in the District Talawaan of North Minahasa Regency in teaching and learning activities, non-essential and essential sectors, eating and drinking activities in public places, places of worship, transportation, and other community activities. This void of scientific research objects is used by researchers as the basis for the urgency of this research.

Literature Review

Maluegha et al (2018) suggest that the effectiveness of program implementation is related to the arrangement of the implementing organization. So that the program in its implementation becomes effective when there is a clear arrangement of the organization. However, it should also be noted that in an organization that is viewed as a system, there are sub-systems that are interconnected and mutually support each other to achieve goals effectively (Rewah et al., 2020). The Covid-19 pandemic cannot be resolved by the government alone, but requires the participation of the community to jointly support any policy or program. Public obedience to the contents of policies and programs carried out will help the government in suppressing the rate of Covid 19 cases (Katuuk et al., 2021). This obedience from the community is seen as part of the system in a state organization in supporting the achievement of government programs effectively so that the handling of the Covid-19 outbreak can be achieved.

It is also important to achieve the government's goal in suppressing the spread of Covid 19 through a coordination process (Tuerah et al., 2022). Because through coordination, all implementing organizations from the central, regional, sub-district and village levels will easily jointly and sustainably carry out every government program, including the program to impose restrictions on community activities (PPKM). Sofyan, et al (2021); Mawuntu, et al (2021); Marwiyah & Salvira (2021); Yakhamid & Zaki (2021) explained that the effective

implementation of the Community Activity Restriction (PPKM) program could suppress the surge in Covid 19 cases.

The Instruction of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 15 of 2021 as the first basis for the implementation of restrictions on Covid-19 emergency community activities in the Java and Bali Regions. However, with the Covid-19 pandemic still continuing, it will also be treated in areas outside Java and Bali. Instructions of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 3 of 2022 and Instructions of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 4 of 2022 which are the basis for the policy for the Implementation of Restrictions on Community Activities Level 3, Level 2 and Level 1 Covid-19 in the Java and Bali Region and at the village and sub-district level to control the spread Covid-19 in Sumatra, Nusa Tenggara, Kalimantan, Sulawesi, Maluku and Papua. Through these two policies, including the community, business actors are given the opportunity to carry out business activities while still being guided by the rules.

Makmur (2011) suggests that the perception of effectiveness actually comes from one of the criteria of administrative science that develops naturally into various activities of human life to achieve the goals they want. Because the problem of effectiveness exists in all aspects of human life with its various attributes. So that in understanding and interpreting the concept of effectiveness, it will be closely related to various aspects and problems of human life.

The word "effectiveness" actually comes from the word "effect", which is defined as the occurrence of the desired effect or result in an action (Liang Gie in Pioh & Londa, 2016). Siagian (2001) provides an understanding of effectiveness related to the implementation of a job, namely completion on time that has been set. This means whether the implementation of a task is of good value or not, especially answering the question of how to carry it out and how much it costs. Furthermore, it is explained that effectiveness is the utilization of resources, facilities and infrastructure in a certain amount that is consciously determined beforehand. To produce a number of goods for the services it carries out. Effectiveness shows success in terms of whether or not the targets have been achieved. Meanwhile Abdurahmat (2008) effectiveness is the utilization of resources, facilities and infrastructure in a certain amount to produce a number of jobs on time. It can be concluded that effectiveness is related to the implementation of all main tasks, achievement of goals, accuracy, time and active participation of members and is a link between stated goals and results and shows the degree of conformity between stated goals and results achieved.

Effectiveness is a measure of the success or failure of achieving the goals of an organization in achieving its goals. If an organization achieves its goals, then the organization has been running effectively (Mardiasmo, 2016). Effectiveness indicators describe the range of effects and impacts of program outputs in achieving program objectives. The greater the contribution of the output produced to the achievement of the specified goals or targets, the more effective the work process of an organizational unit (Marwiyah & Salvira, 2021). In connection with the implementation of the program in Sutrisno (2007:125-126) and also described by Katuuk et al. (2021) put forward indicators, namely (1) understanding of the program which is seen to what extent the community can understand program activities; (2). Right on target as seen from what is desired is achieved or becomes a reality; (3). The achievement of the objectives as measured by the achievement of the objectives of the activities that have been carried out.

Muasaroh (2010) explains that the effectiveness of a program can be seen from aspects of tasks or functions, aspects of plans or programs, aspects of provisions and regulations, and aspects of goals or ideal conditions. However, related to the concept of effectiveness, Makmur (2011) suggests aactivity criteria, namely the accuracy of timing, accuracy of cost calculations, accuracy in measurement, accuracy in making choices, accuracy in thinking, accuracy in carrying out orders, accuracy in determining goals and targeting accuracy.

Methods

In this study, researchers used a qualitative design (Moleong, 2012; Sugiono, 2020). The qualitative approach is characterized by research objectives that seek to understand the symptoms related to the effectiveness of the program to impose restrictions on community activities in Talawaan District, North Minahasa Regency. Research data was obtained by conducting direct interviews with the community (farmers, traders, and students) and with government leaders and employees (sub-districts and villages). Data collection is also carried out by direct observation of the implementation of the program to impose restrictions on community social activities in rural communities, in learning activities at school, in work activities in government offices and in religious activities. Data collection is also done by conducting a narrative review of journals and other related documents. The data collected is then compiled, analyzed, and presented to obtain a systematic picture of the implementation of the program's effectiveness in imposing restrictions on community activities. The data structure that has been completed is then explored more deeply so that research results and conclusions are obtained on the object of the problem being studied.

Results and Discussion

Talawaan District is located in North Minahasa Regency, North Sulawesi Province, which borders Manado City and Sam Ratulangi Airport. The people in Talawaan Sub-district have various professions ranging from farmers, civil servants/private, traders who in their daily work have high mobility in meeting their daily needs. Wilaya Talawaan District which has 11 villages but the population in the pattern of social interaction looks like urban society. This is because Talawaan District is a crossing area for the people of Manado City and North Minahasa Regency.

When the Covid-19 pandemic occurred, the Talawaan District as part of the North Minahasa Regency also imposed restrictions on community activities. The implementation of this program is to foster public compliance with the implementation of the Covid-19 prevention health protocol. This is in accordance with the Instruction of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 14 of 2021 with the target of all people in various professions. In relation to the existence of the Talawaan District community with a total of 20,496 (<https://minutkab.bps.go.id/>) who work as farmers, civil servants/private sectors, traders and students, they are required to comply with the program to enforce restrictions on community activities (PPKM).

In order to implement the program for the effective implementation of restrictions on community activities, it is necessary to achieve the goals correctly and well. Effectiveness is related to the achievement of goals which Makmur (2011) describes as part of the study of administrative science in assessing various activities of human life. However, Abdurahmat (2008) emphasizes the use of various resources in carrying out main tasks in order to achieve goals. Organizationally it is seen as a measure of the success or failure of achieving goals (Mardiasmo, 2016). So related to the implementation of the program (Sutrisno, 2007; Katuuk et al. 2021; Muasaroh 2010) suggested the achievement of goals as measured by the achievement of the objectives of the activities that have been carried out as indicators of effectiveness. Meanwhile, Makmur (2011) refers to the criteria of accuracy in determining goals and targeting accuracy.

The implementation of the program to effectively enforce restrictions on community activities begins with the establishment of a task force at the sub-district and village levels within the Talawaan District, North Minahasa Regency. This task force has the responsibility so that the program for implementing restrictions on community activities can run effectively and well.

The sub-district level task force is in coordination with the sub-district government work together with the Polsek, Koramil and Puskesmas to supervise and educate the public to comply with all regulations relating to the implementation of daily activity restrictions. Likewise, the task force in the village which is under the coordination of the work of the village head is to supervise and educate the village community regarding the restrictions on activities during the Covid 19 pandemic. The sub-district level task force also together with the village-level task force carry out these tasks.

As implementers at the sub-district and village levels, it was found that each member of the task force had a good understanding of all the rules contained in the Instruction of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 14 of 2021 and other policies related to restrictions on community activities. The task force personnel clearly understand the tasks that are based on the background because they have been equipped with knowledge and understanding of the contents of the rules to be implemented and the task force personnel are civil servants, members of the police and TNI and village officials who have the lowest level of education are high school graduates. This data shows that efforts to achieve the effectiveness of implementing a program have a real relationship with the background knowledge, experience and education of each implementer. Therefore, it is very important to pay attention to aspects of knowledge, experience and education level of each implementer so that each program implemented can be achieved properly and effectively.

Implementers who are task forces at the sub-district and village levels who have knowledge, experience and level of education will be able to understand the objectives of the program to enforce restrictions on community activities. So that when carrying out supervision and providing education to the public in accordance with the contents of the policy in question. Conformity between the content of the policy and the tasks performed will make it easier for the community to comply. The people in Talawaan Sub-district already know the objectives and rules regarding the imposition of restrictions on community activities because the government through the task force has carried out socialization as part of the education process.

Apart from socialization activities, it turns out that the sub-district government, village government and task forces also collaborate with social organizations such as religious leaders to help disseminate the contents of policies related to the implementation of restrictions on community activities. The government also publishes using billboards in government offices and public places in the work area in relation to the imposition of restrictions on community activities. The various actions taken by the sub-district government, village government and task forces cannot be separated from the ability to understand the content of the policy as well as the main tasks and functions. In relation to the form of cooperation involving socio-religious organizations in achieving the goal of imposing restrictions on community activities, it raises aspects of coordination and collaboration.

This real field fact contributes to the scientific development of government that achieving the goals of a program requires coordination between organizations both vertically and horizontally as well as internally and externally. However, it also requires collaboration between the government and social organizations in realizing better work and public services. Coordination between organizations has indeed been done a lot in the government's work process. Because with clear and precise coordination it will be easy for each work unit to carry out their duties and responsibilities and achieve goals.

Through vertical work coordination, such as what happened between the sub-district government and village government, it has been going on for a long time and in all work implementation processes. Concrete evidence is also seen in the government's work processes such as the central government, provincial regions, district/city areas as well as sub-districts

and villages/kelurahan. Various government programs can run ethically well coordinated at all levels of government. The vertical coordination between government organizations also shows the process of authority and responsibility. Good and clear coordination makes the implementation of authority appropriate. Every government organization will not take any action that goes beyond its authority. Likewise, the work accountability process can also be realized in accordance with the authority attached to the duties and positions.

Authority and responsibility that go together through good coordination. Thus avoiding the occurrence of vacancies or vacuum services to the community. The vacancy or vacuum of service to the community in the context of implementing the program to impose restrictions on community activities must be avoided so that the spread of Covid 19 can be suppressed and controlled. To be able to strengthen the achievement of goals through the work process of each organizational unit implementing the program to impose restrictions on community activities, horizontal work coordination has also been carried out. Horizontal work coordination occurs when the sub-district government, the Polsek and Koramil and the Puskesmas jointly support the work of the Covid 19 handling task force at the sub-district level.

Organizational work units that work together horizontally are the sub-district government as an extension of the district government through the regional secretary, the Sector Police (Polsek) as a work unit under the Resort Police (Polres), Military District Command (Koramil) as a work unit under the Regional Military Command (Kodim), and Puskesmas as a technical implementing unit under the Health Office. These organizational units work together horizontally to control the spread of Covid 19 in the implementation of the program to impose restrictions on community activities. These organizational units with different tasks and responsibilities as well as the organizational structure they have are able to understand the objectives of the program to enforce restrictions on community activities. So that through a clear division of labor, we can jointly implement the contents of the policy as contained in the Instruction of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 14 of 2021.

Collaborative work between the government and social organizations is also carried out in the implementation of programs to enforce restrictions on community activities in addition to coordination. The Talawaan District Government of North Minahasa Regency through the village level Covid 19 handling task force and the village government collaborated with social organizations, namely religious leaders in socializing the program to impose restrictions on community activities. Religious leaders functioned as extensions in carrying out government duties and task forces in educating the public. Education is carried out so that the public knows correctly all the things that must be obeyed in the limitation of community activities. The public needs to be educated so that there are no misunderstandings when monitoring is carried out by the Covid 19 task force.

This collaborative work action is part of the development of the collaborative governance concept (Rummery, 2006; Mizrahi & Abramson, 2000; Huxham, 2003; Frame et al., 2004; Brown, 2002; Brinkerhoff, 1999; Bouwen & Taillieu, 2004; Ansell, 2003; Ansell & Alison, 2018; Yunas & Nailufar, 2019). Collaborative governance is carried out to make community organizations part of the government in realizing good governance (Brown, 2002; Brinkerhoff, 1999; Bouwen & Taillieu, 2004). Because good governance is obliged to provide space for the community to be part of the process of administering government. Collaborative governance is also part of the government's way of delegating some non-vital authority to other parties (the community) to help realize quality public services (Rummery, 2006; Mizrahi & Abramson, 2000; Huxham, 2003).

Collaborative governance that is carried out can achieve the goal of limiting community activities. This finding means that effectiveness in relation to the aspect of achieving goals

requires real action in the form of collaborative governance. The application of collaborative governance does not always have to be formal (Ansell, 2003; Ansell & Alison 2018; Yunas & Nailufar 2019) but can also be done informally and not limited to a bureaucratic framework as was done between the village level Covid 19 task force and the government. village with socio-religious organizations.

Conclusion

The program to impose restrictions on community activities is a program that must be carried out by all communities in various activities. The purpose of this program is to control the spread of Covid 19 and give the public the opportunity to carry out their activities regularly. In its implementation, a work unit called a Task Force is formed. This task force is given the authority and responsibility in terms of supervision and education related to the health protocol for handling Covid 19. In order to achieve the effectiveness of the objectives of the program being implemented, each work unit is equipped with personnel who have adequate educational background and knowledge. Each work unit also coordinates vertically and horizontally with other related work units and collaborates with social organizations. The embodiment of work collaboration in achieving the effectiveness of the objectives of the program to impose restrictions on community activities is part of the concept of collaborative governance. However, this applied collaborative governance is not carried out formally as is the case in the government bureaucratic process. The findings in this research scientifically that the effectiveness of a program in terms of achieving goals is related to the formation of work units that are given the authority and responsibility to carry out tasks as stated in the policy content, work coordination vertically and horizontally and collaborative governance. This study also recommends that there should be follow-up actions through the scientific research process to show the relationship between the level of education and work experience, coordination and collaborative governance both individually and jointly in relation to program effectiveness through achieving goals.

References

- Abdurahmat. (2008). *Efektivitas Organisasi Edisi Pertama*. Jakarta: Airlangga.
- Ansell, C. (2003). Community embeddedness and collaborative governance in the San Francisco Bay area. *Social movements and networks: Relational approaches to collective action*, 123-144.
- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of public administration research and theory*, 18(4), 543-571. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>
- Bouwen, R., & Taillieu, T. (2004). Multi-party collaboration as social learning for interdependence: Developing relational knowing for sustainable natural resource management. *Journal of community & applied social psychology*, 14(3), 137-153.
- Brinkerhoff, D. W. (1999). Exploring state–civil society collaboration: policy partnerships in developing countries. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 28(1_suppl), 59-86.
- Brown, A. J. (2002). Collaborative governance versus constitutional politics: decision rules for sustainability from Australia's South East Queensland forest agreement. *Environmental Science & Policy*, 5(1), 19-32.
- Frame, T. M., Gunton, T., & Day, J. C. (2004). The role of collaboration in environmental management: an evaluation of land and resource planning in British Columbia. *Journal of environmental planning and management*, 47(1), 59-82.

- Hadiwardoyo, W. (2020). Kerugian ekonomi nasional akibat pandemi Covid-19. *Baskara: Journal of Business and Entrepreneurship*, 2(2), 83-92.
- Huxham, C. (2003). Theorizing collaboration practice. *Public management review*, 5(3), 401-423.
- Katuuk, S., Sambiran, S., & Sampe, S. (2021). Efektivitas Pemerintah Daerah Dalam Penanganan Wabah Covid-19 Di Kabupaten Minahasa Utara. *GOVERNANCE*, 1(2).
- Makmur. (2011). *Efektivitas Kebijakan Kelembagaan Pengawasan*. Bandung: PT. Rafika Aditama.
- Maluegha, F., Sambiran, S., & Lopian, M. (2018). Efektivitas Kebijakan Restrukturisasi Organisasi Pemerintah Kecamatan Siau Barat Selatan Kabupaten Siau Tagulandang Biaro. *Jurnal Eksekutif*, 1(1).
- Mardiasmo. (2016). *Efisiensi dan Efektifitas*. Jakarta: Andy
- Marwiyah, S., & Salvira, D. P. (2021). Efektivitas Kebijakan Pemberlakuan Pembatasan Kegiatan Masyarakat (Ppkm) Dalam Perkembangan Wabah Virus Covid-19 Di Kota Probolinggo. *Journal of Innovation Research and Knowledge*, 1(7), 441-444.
- Mawuntu, P., Rares, J., & Plangiten, N. (2022). Efektivitas Kebijakan Pemberlakuan Pembatasan Kegiatan Masyarakat (Ppkm) Skala Mikro Dalam Penyebaran Covid-19 Di Desa Warembungan. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 8(113).
- Mizrabi, T., & Abramson, J. S. (2000). Collaboration between social workers and physicians: Perspectives on a shared case. *Social Work in Health Care*, 31(3), 1-24.
- Moleong, L. J. (2012). Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif Edisi Revisi (Ke-30). *Remaja Rosdakarya*.
- Muasaroh, L. (2010). *Aspek–Aspek Efektivitas*. Yogyakarta: Literatur Buku.
- Pioh, N. R., & Londa, V. (2016). *Aparat Desa: Efektivitas & Implementasi Kebijakan ADD*. Manado: Lembaga Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Pembelajaran Universitas Sam Ratulangi.