Students' Coping Strategies with Speaking Anxiety in Online Learning Setting

Devia Anggraini
ndeviara@gmail.com

Sidik Indra Nugraha
sidik.indranugraha@staff.unsika.ac.id

Yuna Tresna Wahyuna
yuna.tresna@fkip.unsika.ac.id

Universitas Singaperbangsa Karawang

ABSTRACT

Anxiety is popular topic to discuss. Yet, studies focusing on situations which lead students to feel anxious in online EFL speaking classroom remain scarce. Therefore, this study is aimed to: (1) figure out situation causing students' anxiety in an EFL speaking classroom; and (2) find out strategies that students use to cope with speaking anxiety. Nine second-year high school students were interviewed to explore the issue. The interview data were analysed using thematic analysis. The result indicated several situations in which students feel anxious when speaking English. These included: speaking in front of big and formal audience, worry of being misunderstood, lack of confidence, and worry of being asked all of sudden. Furthermore, students also used similar strategies to research finding by Kondo & Ying-Ling (2004) even speaking class during online learning setting. There were three strategies mainly used by the students, i.e. preparation, relaxation and positive thinking.

Key words*:* Speaking Anxiety; Coping Anxiety; Online Learning

INTRODUCTION

When COVID-19 outbreak started in March 2020, the earth is forced to shut down. Leaving the house was forbidden, even students were not allowed to go to school. Government and school began to create a new virtual learning environment, so students can still safely learn from home. In Indonesia, there are many ways to do virtual learning. Most school used different platform, namely WhatsApp, Zoom Conference, Google Meet, Google Classroom, etc.

Online learning may be the best and safest option to both teacher and students. By doing online class, students can get many advantages. Students can save their time as they do not need to do preparation for online class (Arribathi et al., 2021). However, the method of online learning still triggers some debate among practitioner, parents, students and educational activist. students can also feel great anxiety. Not only because of the pandemic, but also the sudden transition makes many students anxious (Russel, 2020). Learning second language is already a great challenge for many students. Having an online learning setting can make the

challenge even harder). Students learning motivation tend to decreased during COVID-19 outbreak (Arribathi et al., 2021). The same study also showed many students were worried that they would perform worse.

In COVID-19 outbreak, the class environment is changed drastically. Students are no longer do presentation face-to-face, in contrary, they do it in online platform. In this setting, students may also feel anxious because of the pandemic and they have to study at home (Russel, 2020). This may contribute to greater anxiety, as they have to speak English through virtual conference platform. With less time to interact with peers and teacher, they also have smaller chance to practice their speaking skill.

Although anxiety is commonly experienced, being anxious can badly influence students' performance. Anxiety not only affects students' psychology. Students can lose confident and doubt their efficacy. In a long term, this can prevent them from improving their skills, urge them to skip classes and proven to lower their academic achievement. Students usually have five strategies to cope with their anxiety (Kondo & Ying-Ling, 2004). The strategies are preparation, relaxation, positive thinking, peer seeking and resignation.

In this study, researcher will seek whether these five strategies are applied by students when they speak in online learning environment. Thus, this study is conducted to examine how students' cope with their anxiety in online learning situation. There are two question that underlie this study: (1) What are situations that lead student experience speaking anxiety?; (2) How do students cope with speaking anxiety in online learning setting?

LITERATURE REVIEW

Previous Related Study

Speaking is an important language skill to master in order to have an effective foreign language communication and it is needed to be taught since the very beginning of language learning (Safargalina, 2018) Indeed, speaking should be considered as important skill as it is mainly used to interact in a real-life situation. However, even in face-to-face setting many language teachers still miss the opportunity to teach effective speaking skills for students. One of the factors that influence someone's speaking ability is good input and output (Safargalina, 2018). In other words, very minimum input that students get will harden them to speak well as the language acquisition is poorly happening. Also, a poor practice will harden students to have good communication in English.

A similar situation also occurs in Indonesian context. In Indonesia, teachers mainly focus on teaching writing and reading to students. It means, students are not able to develop their speaking and listening ability in the classroom properly. In addition, students do not have many exposures to speaking practice in and outside the class.

An English practice class mostly rely on teacher program. Students rarely have a chance to practice their language skill in home. This phenomenon may cause students to not able to communicate well in English. Thus, speaking becomes one of the hardest skills to learn. Many students may not like to speak foreign language. Research (Liu & Jackson, 2008) shows many students refuse to speak in English class due to anxiety.

As it is known, speaking, along with listening, are skills that mostly cause anxiety to students (Horwitz, Horwitz & Cope, 1986). Therefore, speaking anxiety is a problem that is experienced by many students all over the world, even before the online class setting occur. When students experienced speaking anxiety, it can affect their communication skill. Students may feel nervous, stammering, trembling, etc (Bashori et al., 2020). In more extreme situation, they cannot even convey their words well even though it is already hard to speak in normal situation. Anxiety is also proven to have negative correlation towards learning performance ((MacIntyre & Gardner, 1991; Sajedi, 2017).

Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety

There are numerous of reasons why students experience speaking anxiety in language learning. Even in speaking class context, students can experience, in-class and/or out-of-class anxiety. This may occur because they are lack of practice (Woodrow, 2006), afraid of making error, receiving negative judgement, not comfortable with the class atmosphere (Toubot et al., 2018), etc. The list can continue, however, mapping the trigger of speaking anxiety is important step to tackle speaking anxiety issue in the class.

Language anxiety is not really different from general anxiety. According to Horwitz, Horwitz, and Cope (1986), there are some main issues that provoke language anxiety, which are communication apprehension, test anxiety and fear of negative evaluation.

Communication apprehension happened because the lack of harmony between students and teachers (Toubot et al., 2018). Therefore, students are not willing to communicate in class, especially to their teachers. Another factor that causes CA is that students are hesitate to communicate because they think too much about making grammatical error. Teachers should let students talk without interrupting them while talking because of a mistake.

The second factor of language anxiety is test anxious. Horwitz, Horwitz, and Cope (1986) reported that students usually feel anxious when they make less than perfect. There is a burden that make them think that they have to perform very well in language class. If they do not do so, they will consider it as a failure and get anxious about it. This phenomenon is worse when they have to perform in oral test.

Another factor that may contribute to language anxiety is fear of negative evaluation. Many students are afraid that they will be the target of laughter from their peers when they make mistake (Toubot et al., 2018)This align with study by Cinkara (2016) which found that peer pressure is one of the factors that causes foreign language classroom anxiety. Many students are mostly scared to talk in L2, especially in answering teachers' question when they have no time to prepare the answer (Toubot et al., 2018). The fear of making mistakes is also become a factor of speaking anxiety (Toubot et al., 2018)

In addition to previous theory, factor that may cause to anxiety which is low self-confidence. This happened because the very limited interaction that occurs in class setting (Toubot et al., 2018). Practicing as an activity that may boost students' self-confidence in speaking English (Liu & Jackson, 2008). Research by Cinkara (2016) revealed some other factors that causes foreign language classroom anxiety, such as peer pressure, past experiences and lack of self-esteem. Bad past experience, such as not doing presentation well, may be a trigger for students when they do another presentation in the future.

More research revealed more causes of speaking anxiety, such as low self-efficacy (Liu & Jackson, 2008). Although anxiety is common, the same study also revealed that giving oral presentation and performing in front of mass audience are cause more stress and pressure for students. In short, we can conclude that language anxiety can be influenced by many factors such as communication apprehension, text anxiety, fear of negative evaluation, lack of self-confidence, peer pressure and bad past experience.

Five Strategies of Coping Anxiety

Students usually have five strategies to cope with their anxiety (Kondo & Ying-Ling, 2004). The strategies are preparation, relaxation, positive thinking, peer seeking and resignation. In preparation category, students will try their best to prepare their self before going to the class. Some preparation that may be done are; practicing English, paying attention to teacher, checking the dictionary. In addition, students may spend extra time to prepare the sentence order before they speak or do presentation (Abdurahman & Rizqi, 2021).

Another coping strategy that students may use is relaxation. This means students will try to calm their self with some self-calming method, such as taking a deep breath and do conscious or unconscious body and/or hand movement. Keeping mind to think positively is also another strategy that students use. They can do it by imagining them giving good presentation, giving self-affirmation word, and pray. Furthermore, students may also seek for peers' support. They tend to find other peers who might have same problem to them, ask them to assist them in learning, and try to relate their anxious experience to other. Last, they might just give up without doing anything.

In 2020, Abdurrahman & Rizqi (2020) tested the Kondo &Ying-Ling's theory in offline class setting. The study examined students' anxiety and coping strategies within oral presentation video. Similar findings were found. Result showed that students, indeed, use different strategies to cope with speaking anxiety. Students usually started by preparing what they have to do in class, like re-learn the learning material, do grammar and vocabulary checking, etc. Both Abdurrahman & Rizqi (2020 and Kondo & Ying-Ling (2004) believed that preparation stage is a very important step, especially to overcome students' lack of language skill. Based on Woodrow (2006) finding, students tend to regret their performance when they have only little practice. However, despite did in advanced preparation, many students still experience anxiety.

In coping with anxiety, students may unconsciously develop movement habit, such as touching hair and fixing scarf. When the anxiety cannot be managed, students may suddenly forget script vocabulary (Abdurahman & Rizqi, 2021), have grammar error, stutter, or twisted pronunciation. When this happened, some students also do clamming activities, such as taking deep breath. Keeping positive mind is also beneficial. Student usually try to not overthink their mistake and acknowledge that their peers are having the same problem.

METHOD

Design and Sample

This study employs qualitative approach. Qualitative research is usually used to debunk individuals' perspectives and experiences (Given, 2008). The method aligns with the aim of current research which explore students' experience in coping anxiety. Interview study is utilized as its research design as this study will use interview as its data collection method.

Nine second-year high school level students in West Java participate in this study. The reason behind this decision-making is because these students were taught by researcher while ago, so they have gained trust over the researcher. Besides, second-year students already have enough experiences of doing online class, yet they are not busy due to exam preparation like the third-year students. Participants were randomly chosen based on the recommendation of the English subject teacher. There was no limitation on who could join the interviewed besides has experienced online learning.

Instrument and Procedure

The participants were asked to join a semi-structured interview to give comments towards their feelings while giving online presentation and how they cope the anxiety. Semi-structured interview let participant to have no limitation in answering the question (Given, 2008), however, still has enough focus on the aim of each question. There are six main questions prepared. The interview was done in face-

to-face setting as the COVID-19 situations was much better and the students are currently doing offline class.

The aim of this study is to identify whether the Kondo & Ying-Ling's five strategies were also applied by students in online learning context. Therefore, Kondo & Ying-Ling's finding is adapted as interview guideline. Kondo & Ying-Ling's finding of categorization is easy to understand. Creating very simple questions may prevent students to get confused, therefore students can give more relevant answers. In addition, the research had gone three phases including measurement of language anxiety of students which make the research's methodology and finding more legit.

All interview questions are open-ended question. The reason is to let the students express themselves freely. However, the topic discussed are still related to anxiety and online learning. The same framework was also previously used by Abdurrahman & Rizqi (2020) to explore similar topic. One other question was also asked in the beginning of the interview session in order to gain more understanding of what situations that caused anxiety the most for students.

The students were asked to join a semi-structured interview to give further comments towards their feelings while giving online presentation and how they cope the anxiety. Semi-structured interview let student to have no limitation in answering the question (Given, 2008; Williamson, 2018), however, still has enough focus on the aim of each question. There are six main questions prepared. As using semi-structured interview, few complementary questions may be asked to gather more information and elaborate them. The interview was done in face-to-face setting as the COVID-19 situations was much better and the students are currently doing offline class.

The interview phase took about four to six minutes for each student. Several audio recordings were taken for documentary to capture all the detail in students' statements. Before students committed the interview, students were asked to give their consent regarding the records.

Data Analysis

As the data has been collected, they were analyzed by thematic analysis. Clarke and Braun defined thematic analysis as "*method for identifying, analyzing, and interpreting patterns of meaning ('themes') within qualitative data*." (Clarke and Braun, 2017:297). It means the raw data gathered from interviewed was identified, analyzed and interpreted. This method is useful to analyze an extensive group of qualitative data (Nowell et al., 2017).

Data gathered from interview was firstly transcribed by researcher. The excessive data from transcript will reveal many information, such as students' behavior and habit (ex. "*Usually I look at my book... Oh, during presentation I look at the PowerPoint that has been made by my friend.*"). All the statements that related or

maybe related to the research topic were listed. In this step, omit statement that are not related to any topic or question were omitted. This step is advantageous to reduce confusion in reading big data.

Each statement that has similar meaning was marked in codes. Highlight color was used as it feels more comfortable to see. After, statements that are related to the first interview question were gathered in one table. Similar answers were put in the same category. Same goes to the second to sixth question. The same treatment was done to themes on second to sixth question based on the Kondo & Ying-Ling five strategies. Each theme has its own several sub-themes. These sub-themes are meant to group students' coping strategies which are similar. Through thematic analysis, we can recognize students' experience, views, perspectives, behavior and practices (Clarke and Braun, 2017). This step is also known as coding process.

Thematic analysis is not meant to serve long list of findings or interview statement. Therefore, statement that has been categorized need to be reconceptualized. The aim of this stage is to find the meaning and relationship between each statement, why is it important and how it is related to the topic.

The final product of thematic analysis is description. Summarized data were re-explained so it is readable and easy to understand. Therefore, readers do not have to analyzed the findings themselves. Having too many quotes or simply copy and paste the interview will make readers confused and overwhelmed.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Before we try to find the best strategies to help students coping their anxiety, we should identify what situations causes students' anxiety beforehand.

Causes of Students' Anxiety

The interview was begun by asking students to share when they mostly feel anxious in online class setting. All nine students were asked and shared their stories of anxiety which they have experienced. The analysis revealed four situations that the students found anxious when they spoke English, i.e. speaking in front of big and formal audience, worry of being misunderstood, lack of confident and worry of being asked all sudden.

Students feel anxious to speak in front of big and formal forum

Apparently, three students (Sandi, Aldo, Kamal, pseudonym) stated that they are afraid to speak in front of the audience. As stated by Sandi;

> Excerpt 2 (Aldo)
> Aldo: *"...and not only the audience is big, but also the event is quite formal"*

Previous research (Horwitz, 1995) indeed found that speaking second language in public provokes more anxiety than learning other aspects of the language. However, result found that not only the quantity of audience matters, the formality degree of the setting also makes the students feel anxious.

This may link with the facts that students are afraid to be the target of laughter if they make mistakes (Toubot et al., 2018), especially for students with low-level of confident. Students with low level-confidence are proven tends to get more anxious (Toubot et al., 2018, Woodrow (2006).

Students are afraid of being misunderstood

In the interview, Rika (pseudonym) revealed that he is afraid to make grammatical error. Research by Toubot, Seng & Abdullah (2018) which assessed 300 undergraduate students confirmed this theory. From 300 students, 46.3% of the share the same experience with Rika. Making grammatical error is usually linked to ambiguity in using the language, alongside with perfect pronunciation and correct language use (Thompson & Aslan, 2014). Siska (pseudonym) said;

> Excerpt 3 (Siska)
> *Siska: "Aaa… because I'm not confident with myself, my English skill is also bad."*

Afraid of being misunderstood is the main reason why students are really afraid to make grammatical error which prevent them to use a language freely. This is also experienced by Kamal. According to Kamal, he is not very confident with his vocabulary. He sometimes gets confused because he can't decide with verb to use.

Besides grammatical error, one student shares his perturbation about English phonetics which are very different from Indonesian makes him worry in speaking English. Many English phonetics do not exist in Indonesian, therefore Eri (pseudonym) find it troublesome. Amel (pseudonym) has similar experience as she feels anxious to speak English because she is afraid to mispronounce words. Once again, this finding resonates the theory of how being misunderstood scares students.

Students are not confident with their own skills

Both Rika and Siska also has trouble in speaking English because she is not confident with her skills which she thinks is not good. Rika explain;

> Excerpt 4 (Rika)
> *Rika: "Usually, English has tenses. I'm still confused how to use it… There are also verbs. I'm still don't know (how to use it), I haven't memorized them all."*

Result (Woodrow, 2006) found that lack of confidence is indeed one of the causes of language anxiety. Another data (Liu & Jackson, 2008) revealed several reasons why students hesitate to communicate in target language, including low English proficiency. When students have low-proficiency in language, they have low confidents which eventually will affects their language anxiety.

Most students in Indonesia poorly exposed to chance to improve their active speaking skill. Someone's speaking ability is influenced by good input and output (Safargalina, 2018). In other words, very minimum input that students get has an impact which make them harder to speak well as the language acquisition is poorly happening. Also, a poor practice will harden students to have good communication in English.

Students are afraid of being asked all sudden

Being asked by the teacher, as felt by Victor (pseudonym), also makes students anxious too. This condition will be worse if the students get asked all sudden. Students may not mentally prepared when they get asked all sudden. More than half (58,3%) students examined by Woodrow (2006) also shared the same experience.

Students Ways to Cope with Anxiety

After researcher has better understanding of which situations mostly cause anxiety, researcher continue to identify students' strategies in overcoming their anxiety in online class. Researcher wants to clarify whether Kondo's & Ying-Ling (2004) coping strategies are also applied by students in speaking class in online setting.

Students have to do more preparation before class

Preparation seems pretty important for students. Most students always prepare themselves before they have online presentation. The strategies they used are check the grammatical and pronunciation, learn the material thoroughly, ask help from friend and try to be relaxed. As we have discussed earlier, students seem really care about grammatical and pronunciation error, thus they really pay attention in preparing them. In preparing her speech, Rika will type the sentence in Google Translate first and listen to it later.

> Excerpt 5 (Rika)
> Rika: "I write the sentence in Google Translate first and listen to it later (to check the pronunciation."

Aldo has different approach in preparing her presentation. He believes understanding the material thoroughly makes him less anxious. Speaking of understanding the material, Amel also makes sure to memorize the material thoroughly before she gives presentation. Making a small guidance note is also a good tip that was shared by Eri. Kamal likes to combine two previous strategies.

Just like Rika, he makes a note in Indonesian first, then he translates it to English with the help of Google Translate. After the presentation material ready, he will memorize it. Student loves to practices her speaking in mirror and she believes the technique is more effective for her.

Students always try to relax themselves

When anxiety kicks in, many students prefer to keep going and try to relax themselves. Abdurrahman & Rizqi (2020) found similar approach used by their participant. Daniel (pseudonym), Rika, Siska and Amel rely on drinking water to help them relax and gain more focus.

On the other hand, three other students prefer to distract themselves by playing with something. Sandi usually play with his hands, Kamal will use anything close to him to get him relax, while Victor likes to play with his pen or hold a book to help him reduce the anxiety. Interestingly, distracting mind with other things is also used by participants in Abdurrahman & Rizqi (2020) research. Cinkara (2006) also found the similar result. Cinkara's research participants unconsciously show constant peculiar body and hand movement. These deviant gestures can be anything, such as finger-taping, touching book, playing with pen, etc.

Amel quite has completely different strategy to each other. She hides half of her face when she talks. She hides half of her face when she talks. This behavior is rarely used by students. At least, no recorded data has found students with similar habit. Somehow, she believes that it gives her more comfort.

Students try to maintain positive mindset

Based on the interview, researcher found out that all students always try to keep positive thoughts on their mind. According to Aslan & Thompson (2018), having positive mindset in language learning is very beneficial to help students diminish their language anxiety and making them more confidence in learning the language. Their mindsets are pretty simple, such as trying to be relaxed and keeping in mind that it is okay to make mistake, as mentioned earlier by Daniel;

> Except 6 (Daniel)
> Daniel: "Actually, I tell myself that's okay. I tell myself it's okay, we all are learning."

Kamal has quite similar mindset. He believes it is okay to make mistake, because the teacher will correct the students. It shows how teacher assistant means a lot to boost students confident. What also important for these students is to believe in yourself, as said by Aldo. Aldo believes that all the preparation and learning he have done will be wasted if he does not believe in his self. This can be another example of how important self-confidence in L2 speaking as mentioned before. Abdurrahman & Rizqi (2020) in their research, which examined similar topic in

offline situation, also found this belief on their participants. In contrary, Rika prefers to not think about it at all which apparently also happened to Amel as she just to try enjoy the speaking moment.

Students seek peer who experience the same

This strategy seems to be the least popular strategies used by students. Most of them really depend on themselves and never really look to others. However, Daniel is aware that everyone is struggling in speaking or presenting in foreign language. Interestingly, rather than seeking for peer who is also struggling, these students like to ask for assistant more. Sometimes they rely on other people to help them coping their anxiety, just like what happened to Student Kamal, Siska, Eri, and Amel who prefer to ask for help from their peers.

This finding is interesting as study also found that peer-pressure often become another cause of classroom anxiety. As previously explained before in Literature Review, students get anxious because they are afraid to be laugh at by their peers. Instead, current interview revealed the opposite. These students more likely to help each other to reduce their anxiety and study better in class. However, Cinkara (2016) argued that students tend to get anxious when they are with unknown peers. Current findings show familiar and close peers, in fact, can give additional support for students.

Speaking of asking for others' help, the rest of students prefer to not asked anybody. However, it shows that peers are not the only option they have when they need help. As mentioned by Daniel, he preferred to watch YouTube videos to help him with his public speaking instead. They also asked for help from people outside their school social circle. Daniel said that besides watching YouTube videos, he also asked his brothers sometimes. They became his partner in speaking.

Students decide to give up

Giving up seems like an initial thought that came to students' mind at first when they asked to do online presentation or was asked to speak in English. According to Kondo & Ying-Ling's finding, it is also another coping mechanism. However, the interview reveals quite shocking findings. Most of them never really give up. It happened to Victor, Daniel, and Rika. According to Rika, she always tries to keep in mind that she still has a long journey to go, that is why she does not want to give up. Victor has pretty much similar story. He always thinks that it is okay to make mistakes, because he believes that he is doing his best.

Interestingly, Kamal said sometimes he really cannot answer teacher's question. He will tell the teacher that he does not know the answer. However, he restated how the teacher will help him at the end. Other students can adapt this approach too.

Excerpt 7 (Kamal)

> *Kamal: "I think don't worry to make mistake because the teacher will correct you. Just say what you can say."*

To conclude, almost every student experience anxiety, but they never give up for many different reasons. Most of them believe that they have done the best, so giving up is not really a choice. However, Amel has completely different story. One day she intentionally skipped class because teacher gave students tasked to present something. This statement aligns with Horwitz, Horwitz & Cope (1986) claimed that extreme anxiety may urge students to skip class.

CONCLUSION

The current study found that students experience four main causes of anxiety: speaking in front of big and formal audience, worry of being misunderstood, lack of confident and worry of being asked all sudden. However, worry of being misunderstood is the one which experienced by most students. This finding resonates finding by another researcher Toubot, Seng & Abdullah (2018). In order to cope with these anxiety feelings, unintentionally students always come up with many different strategies. Kondo & Ying-Ling (2004) categories students' way of coping into five categories.

Based on the findings, students also apply similar strategies even in online setting context. However, not all strategies are used. Three specific strategies are more popular than the others, which are preparation, positive-thinking and relaxation. Although in online class setting, preparation seems to be the most popular and most important stage to do in doing L2 speaking. The other two (peer-seeking and resignation) are only experienced by one student respectively.

REFERENCES

Abdurahman, N. H., & Rizqi, M. A. (2021). Indonesian students' strategies to cope with foreign language anxiety. *TESOL Journal*, *12*(1). https://doi.org/10.1002/tesj.571

Arribathi, A. H., Suwarto, Miftakhu Rosyad, A., Budiarto, M., Supriyanti, D., & Mulyati. (2021). An Analysis of Student Learning Anxiety During the COVID-19 Pandemic: A Study in Higher Education. *Journal of Continuing Higher Education*, *69*(3). https://doi.org/10.1080/07377363.2020.1847971

Bashori, M., van Hout, R., Strik, H., & Cucchiarini, C. (2020). Web-based language learning and speaking anxiety. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*. https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2020.1770293

Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2017). Thematic analysis. *The Journal of Positive Psychology, 12:3*, 297-298, DOI: 10.1080/17439760.2016.1262613

Horwitz, E. K. (1995). Except affective reactions and the teaching and learning of foreign languages. *International Journal of Educational Research, 23(7), 573–579*. DOI:10.1016/0883-0355(96)80437-x

Horwitz, E. K., Horwitz, M. B., & Cope, J. (1986). Foreign language classroom anxiety. *The Modern Language Journal*. DOI: 10.1111/j.1540-4781.1986.tb05256.x

Kondo, D. S., & Ying-Ling, Y. (2004). Strategies for coping with language anxiety: The case of students of English in Japan. *ELT Journal*, *58*(3). https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/58.3.258

Liu, M., & Jackson, J. (2008). An exploration of Chinese EFL learners' unwillingness to communicate and foreign language anxiety. *Modern Language Journal*, *92*(1). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4781.2008.00687.x

MacIntyre, P. D., & Gardner, R. C. (1991). Methods and Results in the Study of Anxiety and Language Learning: A Review of the Literature. *Language Learning*, *41*(1). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-1770.1991.tb00677.x

Nowell, L. S., Norris, J. M., White, D. E., & Moules, N. J. (2017). Thematic Analysis: Striving to Meet the Trustworthiness Criteria. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, *16*(1). https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406917733847

Safargalina, A. (2018). Teaching Speaking in EFL Environments. In *The TESOL Encyclopedia of English Language Teaching*. https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118784235.eelt0699

Sajedi, R. (2017). EFL Learners' Anxiety and their Language Achievement. *International Journal of Mental Health and Addiction*, *15*(5). https://doi.org/10.1007/s11469-016-9685-z

Thompson, A. S., & Aslan, E. (2014). Multilingualism, perceived positive language interaction (PPLI), and learner beliefs: what do Turkish students believe? *International Journal of Multilingualism, 12(3), 259–275*. DOI:10.1080/14790718.2014.973413

Toubot, A. M., Hock Seng, G., & Binti Atan Abdullah, A. (2018). Examining Levels and Factors of Speaking Anxiety among EFL Libyan English Undergraduate Students. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, *7*(5). https://doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.7n.5p.47

Woodrow, L. (2006). Anxiety and speaking English as a second language. RELC Journal, 37(3), 308–328. https://doi.org/10.1177/0033688206071315