

2017

Immune Profiles Vary Seasonally, But Are Not Significantly Related To Migration Distance Or Natal Dispersal, In A Migratory Songbird

Tosha R. Kelly
Western University

Heather L. MacGillivray
Western University

Keith A. Hobson
Western University

Scott A. MacDougall-Shackleton
Western University

Elizabeth A. MacDougall-Shackleton
The University of Western Ontario, emacdoug@uwo.ca

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/biologypub>



Part of the [Biology Commons](#)

Citation of this paper:

Kelly, Tosha R.; MacGillivray, Heather L.; Hobson, Keith A.; MacDougall-Shackleton, Scott A.; and MacDougall-Shackleton, Elizabeth A., "Immune Profiles Vary Seasonally, But Are Not Significantly Related To Migration Distance Or Natal Dispersal, In A Migratory Songbird" (2017). *Biology Publications*. 137.
<https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/biologypub/137>

1 **Immune profiles vary seasonally, but are not significantly related to migration**
2 **distance or natal dispersal, in a migratory songbird**

3

4 Tosha R. Kelly¹, Heather L. MacGillivray¹, Keith A. Hobson¹, Scott A. MacDougall-
5 Shackleton² and Elizabeth A. MacDougall-Shackleton*¹

6

7 ¹Biology, University of Western Ontario, London, Ontario, Canada N6A 5B7

8 ²Psychology, University of Western Ontario, London, Ontario, Canada N6A 5C2

9

10 Number of Figures: 1

11 Abbreviated title: Seasonal and movement-related immune variation

12

13 *Correspondence to:

14 Elizabeth A. MacDougall-Shackleton, Department of Biology, University of Western

15 Ontario, 1151 Richmond Street, London, Ontario, Canada N6A 5B7. Telephone:

16 (519) 661-2111 x81206. Email: emacdoug@uwo.ca

17

18 Grant Sponsor: Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada

19 (NSERC) to EAM-S; grant # 293123-2012RGPIN.

20

21 T.R. Kelly and H.L. MacGillivray contributed equally and share the first authorship of

22 this article.

23

24 A central tenet of ecoimmunology is that an organism's environment shapes its
25 optimal investment in immunity. For example, the benefits of acquired (relatively
26 pathogen-specific) versus innate (non-specific) immune defences are thought to vary
27 with the risk of encountering familiar versus unfamiliar pathogens. Because pathogen
28 communities vary geographically, individuals that travel farther during seasonal
29 migration or natal dispersal are predicted to have higher exposure to novel pathogens,
30 and lower exposure to familiar pathogens, potentially favoring investment in innate
31 immunity. During the breeding season, migratory animals' exposure to familiar
32 pathogens should increase, potentially favoring investment in acquired immunity. We
33 hypothesized that song sparrows *Melospiza melodia* adjust their constitutive immune
34 profiles in response to risk of encountering novel versus familiar pathogens. We
35 predicted that individuals migrating longer distances (inferred from stable hydrogen
36 isotope analysis of claws) and less philopatric individuals (inferred from
37 microsatellite assignment testing) would rely more heavily on acquired than innate
38 defences. We also predicted that reliance on acquired defences would increase
39 throughout the early breeding season. Consistent with trade-offs between acquired and
40 innate defences, levels of immunoglobulin Y (acquired) varied negatively with
41 macrophage phagocytosis activity (innate). Levels of acquired relative to innate
42 immunity did not vary significantly with migration distance or philopatry, but
43 increased throughout the early breeding season. Macrophage phagocytosis was not
44 significantly repeatable between years. Song sparrows appear to shift from innate
45 defences immediately after migration, to acquired defences with increasing time at the
46 breeding grounds. These patterns highlight the plasticity of constitutive immune
47 defences in migratory animals.

- 48 **Keywords:** constitutive immunity, deuterium, dispersal, migration, stable isotopes,
49 trade-offs

50 Parasites are taxonomically widespread and geographically ubiquitous (Schmid-
51 Hempel 2011). Because few organisms can successfully avoid exposure to parasites,
52 being able to resist, eliminate or tolerate infection is a key component of host fitness.
53 As a result, multicellular organisms have evolved diverse anti-parasitic defences.
54 However, immune defences are costly to develop, maintain and deploy (Klasing 2004,
55 Lee 2006). Thus, trade-offs between immunity and other life history traits, and even
56 trade-offs within the immune system itself, are inevitable. The idea that infectious
57 disease risk shapes the optimal immune profiles of host species and individuals is a
58 central principle of ecoimmunology (Sheldon and Verhulst 1996, Møller and Erritzøe
59 1998, Nelson et al. 2002).

60 In vertebrate animals, immune defences can be broadly categorized as
61 constitutive or induced and, independently, as innate or acquired (Schmid-Hempel
62 and Ebert 2003, Buehler et al. 2008a). Along the constitutive-induced axis,
63 constitutive defences provide a baseline level of expression of protective cells and
64 molecules, and additional induced defences can be activated in response to infection
65 or other immune challenges. Along the innate-acquired axis, innate defences provide
66 nonspecific protection against a broad array of pathogens, whereas acquired defences
67 use immune memory to generate a recognition system of antigen-specific responses
68 (Janeway et al. 2005; Buehler et al. 2008a; Demas et al. 2011). The initial
69 development of acquired defences is relatively costly and slow, but once in place,
70 such defences act rapidly and efficiently upon repeat exposure to a specific pathogen.
71 Thus, innate and acquired defences differ in their relative effectiveness against novel
72 versus familiar pathogens: innate defences comprise a first line of protection against
73 novel pathogens, whereas acquired defences are most effective when re-encountering
74 familiar pathogens (Lee 2006). The relative risk of encountering new versus familiar

75 pathogens should thus affect the optimal balance between innate versus acquired
76 immune defences. For example, species and populations with longer development,
77 lifespans and generation time invest more in acquired immune defences, relative to
78 those with shorter development and generation time (Lee 2006; Martin et al. 2006,
79 2007).

80 Even within a population, the relative risk of encountering novel vs familiar
81 pathogens is likely to vary both across individuals and throughout the annual cycle.
82 Pathogen communities vary geographically (Pagenkopp et al. 2008), suggesting that
83 individuals engaging in long-distance movements such as seasonal migration and
84 natal dispersal are likely to encounter new pathogens (Møller and Erritzøe 1998,
85 Møller et al. 2004, Fincher and Thornhill 2008). Individual variation in migration
86 distance and natal dispersal could thus influence the optimal balance between innate
87 and acquired immune defence. Similarly, for migratory animals, the relative risk of
88 encountering unfamiliar pathogens versus re-encountering familiar pathogens is likely
89 to decrease with increasing time spent in a particular area (for example, on the
90 breeding grounds). This may promote a seasonal transition from innate to acquired
91 defences throughout the early breeding season.

92 Here, we test the hypothesis that the immune phenotype of migratory song
93 sparrows (*Melospiza melodia*) reflects individual and seasonal variation in the risk of
94 encountering familiar versus unfamiliar pathogens. Individuals in the study population
95 vary markedly in latitudinal migration distance, as inferred from stable hydrogen
96 isotope analysis (Kelly et al. 2016, Lymburner et al. 2016), and in natal philopatry, as
97 inferred from genetic assignment tests (Kelly et al. 2016). Migration distance varies
98 consistently among individuals across years in this study system (repeatability =
99 0.41), and is associated with natal dispersal such that individuals that migrate longer

100 distances are also more likely to have immigrated from outside the local breeding
101 population (Kelly et al. 2016). We predicted that longer-distance migrants and
102 dispersing individuals would rely more heavily on innate immune defences, reflecting
103 their increased exposure to novel pathogens. Conversely, shorter-distance migrants
104 and philopatric individuals should rely more heavily on acquired defences, reflecting
105 their increased exposure to familiar pathogens. We also predicted that the balance
106 between innate and acquired immune function would vary seasonally. Specifically,
107 we predicted a shift from innate defences to acquired defences as the early breeding
108 season progressed, reflecting seasonal changes in the relative risk of encountering
109 new versus familiar pathogens.

110 Seasonal variation in immune profiles could reflect factors other than an
111 increasing familiarity of pathogens as the breeding season progresses. First, associated
112 with maternal transfer of immunity to offspring, levels of circulating
113 immunoglobulins increase in female birds prior to egg-laying (Saino et al. 2001).
114 Because individual lay date was not known for most females in our study, we could
115 not control statistically for variation in breeding phenology relative to sampling date.
116 Instead, we tested for sex-specific effects of date on immune profiles, to assess
117 whether seasonal shifts in immunity might reflect maternal antibody allocation.
118 Second, tradeoffs between migratory flight and immune defence (e.g. Nebel et al.
119 2012) could generate seasonal shifts in immunity, as recovering body reserves after
120 migration allows more energy to be invested into adaptive or innate immune defence.
121 To assess this possibility, we included size-corrected mass (a proxy for energy
122 reserves) as a covariate in models predicting immunity.

123

124

125 **Methods**

126 a) Study site and field methods

127 Study subjects were 100 song sparrows breeding on land owned by the Queen's
128 University Biological Station, at a site near Newboro, Ontario, Canada (44.633°N,
129 76.330°W). We captured subjects in seed-baited Potter traps between 15 April – 14
130 May, 2013 (N = 54) and 14 April – 9 May, 2014 (N = 60, including 14 individuals
131 captured in both years). Capture dates corresponded to shortly after spring migration
132 (first return to the breeding grounds: 3 April and 1 April in 2013 and 2014
133 respectively) through early nesting (first egg date: 14 May and 8 May in 2013 and
134 2014 respectively). We ran traps between 07:00 – 10:30 each day, checking each trap
135 at least once per hour.

136 We collected up to 200 μ L of blood for immune and genetic analyses, by
137 brachial venepuncture the first time each bird was captured. We collected blood
138 samples using sterile techniques (Millet et al. 2007), and to minimize effects of
139 handling stress on immune response (Buehler et al. 2008b), we sampled within 8 min
140 of researchers approaching the trap. We measured mass to the nearest 0.1 g using a
141 spring-loaded scale, measured tarsus length and unflattened wing length to the nearest
142 0.1 mm using dial calipers, and determined sex based on the presence (male) or
143 absence (female) of a cloacal protuberance. We used previous years' banding records
144 to categorize birds to age class (i.e. second-year, hereafter SY, or after-second-year,
145 hereafter ASY; see Kelly et al. 2016 for details). We clipped a sample of claw tissue
146 for stable-isotope analysis of overwinter latitude (details below), outfitted the bird
147 with a numbered USFWS aluminum leg band and a unique combination of three
148 colored plastic leg bands if not already banded, and released the bird at the site of
149 capture. All subjects were re-captured or re-sighted later in the season, suggesting that

150 all were resident breeders. Animal procedures were approved by the Animal Use
151 Subcommittee at the University of Western Ontario (protocol 2008-054).

152

153 b) Immune assays

154 *Overview and timing:*

155 We tested multiple measures of constitutive (baseline) immunity, including both
156 cellular and complement-mediated innate defences and an acquired defence. All
157 agents were approved by the Biosafety Committee at the University of Western
158 Ontario (protocol BIO-UWO-0133). Immune assays included whole-blood- as well as
159 plasma-based measures. Whole-blood-based assays (macrophage phagocytosis;
160 details below) were conducted in the field, and initiated within 40 minutes of
161 sampling. To ensure sterility under field conditions, we conducted these assays in a
162 Plexiglass dead-air box equipped with a HEPA filtration system (Kubli and
163 MacDougall-Shackleton 2014). We assayed macrophage phagocytosis activity against
164 the gram-negative bacteria *Escherichia coli* in 2013 and 2014. For plasma-based
165 assays (hemagglutination and immunoglobulin Y assays; see below), we kept the
166 remainder of the blood sample cool on ice for several hours, then isolated plasma by
167 centrifugation and stored it at -20°C until laboratory analysis. Plasma-based analyses
168 were run in 2013 only.

169

170 *Macrophage phagocytosis assay:*

171 As an indicator of *cellular innate* constitutive immunity, we measured *in vitro*
172 phagocytic activity of macrophages (Millet et al. 2007). We reconstituted
173 Bioparticles® of *E. coli* (E-2864) fluorescently labeled with BODIPY FL (Molecular
174 Probes), in sterile, tissue-grade PBS plus 2 mM sodium azide according to the

175 manufacturer's protocol. In the field, following Kubli and MacDougall-Shackleton
176 (2014) we diluted 10 μ L of whole blood in CO₂-independent media plus 4 mM L-
177 glutamine, 1% fetal bovine serum (FBS), and 1% penicillin-streptomycin (Invitrogen)
178 to a final volume of 200 μ L. A fresh dilution of Bioparticles® was prepared each
179 morning in cold, sterile media to a working concentration of 15,000 particles/ μ L.

180 We added 20 μ L of diluted blood and 76 μ L of bacterial suspension to each
181 well of an eight-chamber slide (Nunc Lab-Tek), preparing one slide of eight wells per
182 individual. Slides were incubated at 40.5°C for 15 min, placed on ice to end
183 phagocytosis, washed twice with 95 μ L cold sterile media, and then fixed with 100%
184 methanol. Slides were stored in a lightproof container and later examined under a
185 fluorescent microscope with an excitation/absorption spectrum of 505/513 nm. We
186 examined 400 adherent cells per slide (approximately 50 cells per well), and scored
187 phagocytic capacity as the proportion of macrophages containing at least one
188 fluorescent particle.

189

190 *Hemagglutination assay:*

191 As an indicator of *complement-mediated innate* constitutive immunity, we
192 estimated titers of natural antibodies by scoring the ability of plasma to agglutinate
193 rabbit red blood cells (RRBC; Matson et al. 2005). We prepared twofold serial
194 dilutions of freshly thawed plasma into PBS across a 96-well plate, using one column
195 of 12 wells and a total of 50 μ L plasma per bird. Two columns of each plate contained
196 chicken plasma (Sigma-Aldrich) as a positive control, and the remaining six columns
197 used song sparrow plasma. Each well contained a total volume of 25 μ L, with plasma
198 dilutions ranging from 1 (i.e., undiluted plasma, row 1) to 1:1024 in PBS (row 11).

199 Row 12 of each column contained 25 μ L PBS and no plasma, and served as a
200 negative control.

201 We added 25 μ L of 1% RRBC suspension (Rockland Immunochemicals) to
202 each well, covered plates and incubated them at 37°C for 90 min, and tilted plates at a
203 45° angle for 20 min. Plates were scanned at 300 dpi with a top-lit flatbed scanner
204 (Epson V600), and two independent observers each noted the weakest dilution of
205 plasma that was sufficient to induce agglutination. Thus, lower values reflect greater
206 agglutination ability. We then incubated plates at 20°C for 70 min and scanned again
207 to assess lysis of RRBC by plasma (Matson et al. 2005). However, similar to previous
208 findings in this species (Kubli and MacDougall-Shackleton 2014), we observed very
209 few instances of lysis, thus we report only the hemagglutination results below.

210

211 *Immunoglobulin Y (IgY):*

212 As a measure of *acquired* constitutive immunity, we assessed circulating
213 concentration of IgY, the functional equivalent of mammalian IgG and the major
214 constitutive antibody in birds (Warr et al. 1995). Following Bourgeon and Raclot
215 (2006) we measured IgY using an enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (ELISA).
216 First, to identify the appropriate plasma dilution for use in song sparrows, for each of
217 12 song sparrows we added 2 μ L plasma to 998 μ L of dilution solution, consisting of
218 0.1 M sodium carbonate and 0.1 M sodium bicarbonate solutions mixed to a pH of
219 9.6, in a flat bottom 96-well plate (Corning #3596). We then performed twofold serial
220 dilutions into dilution solution, for final dilutions ranging from 1:500 to 1:64 000.

221 The plate was covered and incubated for 1 h at 37°C, then for 24 h at 4°C. We
222 then washed the plate twice with 200 μ L of PBS-Tween solution (0.05% Tween

223 dissolved in PBS), added 100 μ L of 5% powdered milk dissolved in PBS-Tween
224 solution to each well, and incubated again for 1 h at 37°C. We again washed the plate
225 twice with PBS-Tween, then added 100 μ L of anti-chicken IgY (Sigma A9046)
226 diluted 1:250 in PBS-Tween solution to each well. We incubated the plate for 2 h at
227 37°C, washed each well again with PBS-Tween, and added 100 μ L of reveal solution
228 (0.0031% hydrogen peroxide in ABTS [2-2' azino-bis (3-ethyl-benzthiazoline-6-
229 sulphonic acid)]) to each well. The plate was incubated for a final time for 1 h at
230 37°C, then absorbance at 405 nm read immediately using a microplate reader (BIO-
231 RAD iMark).

232 We calculated the average absorbance (i.e. IgY level) for each dilution across
233 all 12 samples in the pilot procedure, and plotted average absorbance units as a
234 function of plasma concentration. Slope was maximal at a plasma dilution of 1:4000,
235 so the final analysis used plasma at this dilution rather than across a range of
236 dilutions. Final assays were conducted in duplicate for each individual (two wells of
237 1:4000 plasma in dilution solution) with two wells per plate serving as a negative
238 control (no plasma; dilution solution only). Conditions for the final assays were
239 otherwise as described above, and for each sample we estimated IgY concentration
240 based on average absorbance for the two duplicate wells.

241

242 c) Stable isotope analysis of overwinter latitude

243 We estimated the latitude at which each individual had overwintered using stable
244 isotope analysis of deuterium ($\delta^2\text{H}$) content of winter-grown claw tissue. Details of
245 this analysis are provided elsewhere (Kelly et al. 2016, Lymburner et al. 2016), but in
246 brief, we took advantage of a latitudinal gradient in the $\delta^2\text{H}$ content of growing-
247 season precipitation across North America. Amount-weighted values of $\delta^2\text{H}$ increase

248 with decreasing latitude, and because these isotopic patterns are transferred up the
249 food web to the consumer, the latitude at which metabolically inert tissues were
250 grown can be estimated (Wassenaar and Hobson 2000; Hobson et al. 2014).

251 In the field, we clipped the distal 2.5 mm from each bird's back claw. Rates of
252 claw growth in white-throated sparrows (*Zonotrichia albicollis*), which are closely
253 related and ecologically similar to song sparrows, indicate that this sample should
254 correspond to tissue grown during the winter months (Kelly et al. 2016). Claw
255 samples were stored, cleaned of surface oils, and prepared as described elsewhere
256 (Kelly et al. 2016), then analyzed for nonexchangeable hydrogen at Environment
257 Canada's Stable Isotope Laboratory (Saskatoon, Canada), using online continuous-
258 flow isotope ratio mass spectrometry (CF-IRMS) on a Micromass Isoprime mass
259 spectrometer (Micro-mass UK, Manchester, UK) interfaced with a Eurovector
260 elemental analyzer (Milan, Italy). Isotopic measurements were performed on H₂ gas
261 derived from high-temperature (1350°C) flash pyrolysis of claw samples and keratin
262 standards.

263 To correct for the effects of H exchange with ambient water vapour, we
264 analyzed three Environment Canada keratin standards (caribou hoof standard, CBS: -
265 197‰; spectrum keratin, SPK: -121.6‰; kudu horn standard, KHS: -54.1‰) using
266 the comparative equilibrium method (Wassenaar and Hobson 2003). Based on within-
267 run replicate analyses of five of each keratin standard, the analytical precision was
268 estimated to be ± 2‰. We report non-exchangeable $\delta^2\text{H}$ values expressed in delta
269 notation of units per mil (‰) and normalized on the Vienna Standard Mean Ocean
270 Water- Standard Light Antarctic Precipitation (VSMOW-SLAP) scale.

271

272

273 d) Genetic analysis of philopatry

274 As part of a previous study, we inferred natal philopatry for all study subjects using
275 genetic assignment tests based on microsatellite genotypes (Kelly et al. 2016). We
276 collected blood for genetic analysis, extracted DNA, and genotyped birds at 12
277 microsatellite loci [Mme 1 and 12 (Jeffrey et al. 2001); Pdoμ 5 (Griffith et al. 1999);
278 and Sosp 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 13 and 14 (Sardell et al. 2010)] as detailed elsewhere
279 (Kelly et al. 2016).

280 As reported elsewhere (Kelly et al. 2016), we entered each bird's
281 microsatellite genotype into GeneClass2 (Piry et al. 2004) together with the genotypes
282 of an additional 308 song sparrows previously captured at our study site or at one of
283 ten other sites within 50 km. We inferred natal philopatry using the Lhome option,
284 which does not require that all potential source populations have been sampled.
285 Lhome ranges between 0 and 1, and represents the probability of an individual's
286 genotype occurring in the site from which it was sampled. Thus, higher values of
287 Lhome indicate relatively philopatric individuals, while lower values indicate
288 individuals more likely to have immigrated (dispersed) from outside the capture site.
289 Values of Lhome were arcsine-transformed for use in linear models predicting
290 immune response, to improve normality of model residuals (details below).

291

292 e) Data analysis

293 *Scaled mass*

294 As an estimate of relative energy reserves, we corrected mass for structural size (**wing**
295 **length**) using a scaled mass index (equation [2] in Peig and Green (2009)), based on
296 measurements from birds captured in April 2013 and 2014. **We tested for sex**
297 **differences in scaled mass using aov in base R, version 3.3.2 (R Core Team 2016).**

298 We tested for seasonal changes in scaled mass using a linear model regression (*lm* in
299 base R; scaled mass ~ capture date, coded as days since 1 April).

300

301 *Correlations between immune measures, repeatability, and PCA*

302 We used Pearson's correlation to investigate relationships between immune
303 measures. For the 14 individuals sampled in both years of the study, we also
304 calculated the repeatability of macrophage phagocytosis of *E. coli* based on among-
305 and within-individual components of variance (Lessells and Boag 1987) derived from
306 a one-way ANOVA. To reduce dimensionality within the 2013 immune dataset, we
307 zero-centered and scaled the three immune variables studied that year (macrophage
308 phagocytosis of *E. coli*; hemagglutination; IgY). We conducted a principal
309 components analysis (PCA) on the correlation matrix, and saved unrotated factor
310 scores, using *prcomp* in base R.

311

312 *Predictors of immune function*

313 We used *lm* in base R to construct linear models predicting immune PC scores
314 for the 2013 dataset. We first constructed a fully-saturated model including claw δ^2H
315 (interpreted as latitudinal migration distance), arcsine-transformed Lhome (interpreted
316 as natal philopatry), capture date (days since 1 April) and scaled mass (calculated as
317 described above; interpreted as energy reserves) as predictors of interest, along with
318 the potential nuisance variables of age class and sex. We confirmed normality of
319 residuals and fit to other model assumptions by visually inspecting residuals and Q-Q
320 plots, then used the *anova* command in base R to compare this fully-saturated model
321 to a nested model without age class and sex as predictors.

322 Some predictors of interest were correlated with one another (i.e., claw $\delta^2\text{H}$
323 and arcsine-transformed Lhome, Pearson's $r_{1,47} = -0.22$; date and scaled mass,
324 Pearson's $r_{1,47} = 0.36$). To assess the risk of bias due to collinear model terms, we
325 calculated variance inflation factors (VIFs) from a linear model with the predictors
326 claw $\delta^2\text{H}$, arcsine Lhome, date, and scaled mass, using *vif* in the R package *car* (Fox
327 and Weisberg 2011). VIFs for these variables ranged from 1.14 to 1.21, well below
328 the threshold of 5 that would suggest biasing of parameter estimates, so all four
329 variables were retained for analysis.

330 We used an information theoretic approach (Burnham and Anderson 2002) to
331 compare support for sixteen alternative models predicting immunity (i.e. one model
332 set for each retained immune PC). Each model comprised a different combination of
333 claw $\delta^2\text{H}$, Lhome, date, and scaled mass, and each model set included a null model
334 (e.g. $\text{PC1} \sim 1$). We compiled model-averaged parameter estimates from the full set of
335 AICc-ranked candidate models using the natural averaging method (Burnham and
336 Anderson 2002) implemented in *model.avg* in the R package MuMIn (Bartoń 2016).
337 As a complementary analysis to determine whether maternal antibody allocation
338 might underlie seasonal changes in immunity, we split the dataset by sex and
339 conducted model ranking and averaging as above, but separately for each sex.

340

341 **Results**

342 *Scaled mass*

343 Following the recommendations of Peig and Green (2009), we used wing rather than
344 tarsus as the length (structural size) variable, because wing length had the stronger
345 correlation with mass on a log scale for our sample ($r_{\text{wing}} = 0.42$, $r_{\text{tarsus}} = 0.32$). We
346 calculated the scaling coefficient b_{SMA} to be 1.90; and set L_0 as the sample average

347 wing length (i.e., 64.2 mm). Scaled mass was greater in females (mean \pm SD = 22.91
348 g \pm 2.30) than males (21.37 g \pm 1.84; $F_{1,47} = 6.58$, $p = 0.014$), and increased with date
349 ($R^2 = 0.11$, $F_{1,47} = 7.13$, $p = 0.010$).

350

351 *Correlations between immune measures, repeatability, and PCA loadings*

352 For the three immune variables measured in 2013, macrophage phagocytosis
353 (a cellular innate defence) was negatively correlated to levels of IgY (an acquired
354 defence; $r_{52} = -0.29$, $p = 0.03$). Plasma agglutination, a complement-mediated innate
355 defence reflecting levels of natural antibody, was not significantly correlated with
356 macrophage phagocytosis ($r_{52} = 0.13$, $p = 0.36$) or with IgY ($r_{52} = -0.004$, $p = 0.98$).
357 Among the 14 individuals sampled in both 2013 and 2014, macrophage phagocytosis
358 was not significantly repeatable between years (ANOVA, $F_{1,13} = 0.43$, $s^2 = 0.0084$, s^2_A
359 = -0.0003, repeatability = -0.04, $p = 0.93$).

360 Principal component analysis of the 2013 dataset identified two components
361 with eigenvalues ≥ 1 (Table 1), which we retained for further analysis. Positive values
362 of immune PC1 were associated primarily with low macrophage activity against *E.*
363 *coli*, but high levels of IgY. Thus, we interpreted PC1 as investment in acquired, as
364 opposed to innate, constitutive defence. Positive values of immune PC2 were
365 associated primarily with low concentrations of plasma required to induce
366 agglutination, that is, with high levels of natural antibody. Neither PC1 nor PC2
367 differed between age classes (PC1: SY 0.28 ± 1.19 , ASY -0.38 ± 1.08 , $F_{1,47} = 3.70$, p
368 = 0.06; PC2: SY -0.10 ± 0.98 , ASY 0.09 ± 1.08 , $F_{1,47} = 0.41$, $p = 0.52$) or sexes
369 (PC1: females -0.08 ± 1.30 , males 0.18 ± 1.04 , $F_{1,47} = 0.59$, $p = 0.45$; PC2: females -
370 0.15 ± 1.23 , males 0.10 ± 0.69 , $F_{1,47} = 0.74$, $p = 0.39$); values are reported as means \pm
371 SD. Comparing fully-fitted models predicting immune PC1 and PC2 with and without

372 the nuisance variables of age class and sex confirmed that including these variables
373 did not improve model fit (ANOVA, PC1: $F = 0.32$, $p = 0.73$; PC2: $F = 0.39$, $p =$
374 0.68).

375

376 *Predictors of immune function*

377 Of the sixteen candidate models predicting immune PC1, models containing
378 date as a covariate were substantially better-ranked than models not containing date
379 (Table 2). Averaging across the full set of models predicting PC1 determined that this
380 immune component increased with date (Figure 1), but did not vary significantly with
381 claw $\delta^2\text{H}$ (interpreted as seasonal migration distance), L_{home} (interpreted as natal
382 philopatry), or scaled mass (interpreted as energy reserves; Table 3a; Figure 1). Sex-
383 specific analyses yielded qualitatively similar results; PC1 increased with date for
384 both males and females but did not vary significantly with claw $\delta^2\text{H}$, L_{home} , or
385 scaled mass (Figure 1; Supplementary Table 1).

386 Of the sixteen candidate models predicting immune PC2, the null model was
387 the top-ranked (Table 4) although several models had similar AICc values. Averaging
388 across the full set of models predicting PC2 confirmed that this immune component
389 did not vary significantly with claw $\delta^2\text{H}$, L_{home} , date or scaled mass (Table 3b).

390

391 **Discussion**

392 The pace of life hypothesis, when applied to ecoimmunology, posits that variation
393 among species and populations in the balance between different types of immunity
394 reflects position along a slow- versus fast-living axis. In particular, slow- versus fast-
395 living taxa differ in the extent to which individuals re-encounter pathogens to which
396 they have previously been exposed, and thus, the benefits of investing in acquired

397 immune defence (Lee 2006, Martin et al. 2006, 2007). We extended this logic to the
398 individual level, reasoning that stable individual variation in long-distance movements
399 (seasonal migration and natal dispersal), and in the case of migration, the recency of
400 such movements, should also influence exposure to novel versus familiar pathogens
401 and thus the optimal balance between innate and acquired defences. Consistent with
402 trade-offs within the immune system, measures of an innate defence (macrophage
403 phagocytosis) were negatively associated with a measure of acquired immunity (IgY).
404 However, individual variation in the balance between innate and acquired defence did
405 not vary significantly with migration distance or natal dispersal tendency. The
406 strongest predictor of this innate/acquired balance was date, consistent with
407 individuals shifting from primarily innate to primarily acquired defence throughout
408 the early breeding season (i.e., with increasing time at the breeding grounds and time
409 since spring migration).

410

411 *Correlations between, and repeatability of, immune measures*

412 The vertebrate immune system is complex, with multiple inter-related
413 components. Similar to previous findings from this study system (Kubli and
414 MacDougall-Shackleton 2014), not all the immune defences examined here were
415 positively correlated. Macrophage phagocytosis of *E. coli*, a cellular innate defence,
416 was negatively related to IgY level, a non-cellular acquired defence. This pattern is
417 consistent with trade-offs or compensatory relationships between different branches of
418 immunity (e.g. Martin et al. 2007; Wegner et al. 2007; Forsman et al. 2008).
419 However, inferring trade-offs is problematic without experimental manipulation, for
420 example as accomplished by Keil and colleagues (2001). Moreover, we measured
421 only one, non-cellular, component of acquired immunity (IgY). Thus, while we

422 interpret the negative relationship between IgY and macrophage phagocytosis as
423 reflecting a trade-off between acquired and innate defence, an alternative explanation
424 is the trade-off is instead between cellular and non-cellular defences. Undermining
425 this alternative, however, we found no relationship between macrophage phagocytosis
426 and the hemagglutination ability of plasma (a non-cellular innate defence). The
427 diversity of relationships we observed among even a handful of assays highlights the
428 risks of drawing far-reaching conclusions about ‘immunocompetence’ from studies --
429 including the current one-- that examine a limited number of immune parameters.

430 Our finding that macrophage phagocytosis was not significantly repeatable
431 among years highlights another danger in interpreting immune parameters as stable
432 indicators of ‘quality’. That is, we found no evidence for consistent individual
433 differences, at least in this measure of immunity. Power to detect among-individual
434 variation was likely constrained somewhat by sample size (N = 14 individuals with
435 measurements repeated in both years), and substantial within-individual variation was
436 likely enhanced by the long time interval (one year) between measurements.
437 However, even in captive experiments where environmental differences among
438 individuals are likely minimal and the interval between measurements relatively short,
439 immune measures have low repeatability (e.g. swelling response to
440 phytohemagglutinin in European starlings *Sturnus vulgaris* and zebra finches
441 *Taenopygia guttata*; Granbom et al. 2005, Love et al. 2008). Such results, combined
442 with variation in immune responses among and within seasons (e.g. this study;
443 Eikenaar and Hegemann 2016) highlight the remarkable plasticity of vertebrate
444 immunity, and suggest that immune measures should be interpreted as snapshots of
445 dynamic systems, not as stable traits.

446

447 *Predictors of immune function*

448 We hypothesized that song sparrows adaptively allocate resources to innate
449 versus acquired defences in response to their relative risk of encountering unfamiliar
450 versus familiar pathogens. We reasoned that this relative risk should vary among
451 individuals, reflecting variation in their overwinter latitude (migration distance) and
452 natal dispersal tendency. However, neither migration distance (inferred from claw
453 $\delta^2\text{H}$) nor natal dispersal (inferred from genetic assignment testing) reliably predicted
454 the balance between our measures of innate and acquired defence. At least three
455 factors, not mutually exclusive, may help to explain this lack of relationship.

456 First, as noted above, the vertebrate immune system is complex and we
457 measured only a small number of immune parameters. This undermines our ability to
458 draw definitive conclusions about individual variation in the overall balance between
459 general and pathogen-specific defences. In particular, cellular mechanisms of acquired
460 immunity developed during the first year of life may effectively ‘vaccinate’
461 individuals against pathogens encountered on the wintering grounds or on stopover
462 (Møller et al. 2004). Second, our assumption that long-distance movements (seasonal
463 migration, natal dispersal) increase the relative risk of encountering novel as opposed
464 to familiar pathogens, may be incorrect. However, at least one important class of
465 pathogens affecting migratory birds (haematozoan parasites) shows pronounced
466 geographic variation (Pagenkopp et al. 2008). Furthermore, migrant species harbour a
467 greater diversity of parasites than do resident species (Figuerola and Green 2000),
468 although comparable information at the individual level is lacking. Third, limitations
469 to phenotypic plasticity may constrain the ability of individuals to allocate resources
470 optimally to innate versus acquired pathways.

471 Whereas the balance between innate and acquired defences did not vary
472 predictably with individual variation in long-distance movement, we did observe a
473 shift towards increasing levels of acquired immunity (IgY) relative to innate immunity
474 (macrophage phagocytosis) as the breeding season progressed. Because we observed
475 this pattern in males as well as females, we think it unlikely that this seasonal trend is
476 driven exclusively by sex-specific changes in immunoglobulin levels as females
477 approach laying. Because models including size-corrected mass did not perform better
478 than models without this covariate, we also think it unlikely that our findings result
479 from a seasonal improvement in energetic condition. Instead, our findings are
480 consistent with adaptive allocation based on the relative risk of encountering new
481 versus familiar pathogens and thus, the relative benefits of general versus specific
482 immune defences. Novel pathogen encounters are likely to be highest during
483 migration then decrease with increasing time spent in a single location (in this case,
484 on the breeding grounds).

485 Similar to our findings, immunoglobulin concentrations increase throughout
486 the breeding season in great tits *Parus major* (Pap et al. 2010), and phagocytosis
487 activity decreases in captive red knots *Calidris canutus* (Buehler et al. 2008).
488 Mechanistically, such variation may be mediated by seasonal variation in sex
489 hormones and corticosterone (e.g. Evans et al. 2000, Casto et al. 2001, O'Neal and
490 Ketterson 2012). Indeed, previous work in this study population found that plasma
491 testosterone levels in males vary negatively with macrophage phagocytosis and also
492 increase between early April and early May (Kubli 2011). Baseline levels of plasma
493 corticosterone did not vary seasonally or predict measures of constitutive innate
494 immunity in that study (Kubli 2011). However, in house sparrows *Passer domesticus*,
495 sensitivity to corticosterone as assessed by glucocorticoid receptor binding in the

496 spleen peaks during the pre-laying period (Lattin et al. 2013). In light of the
497 immunoenhancing effects of short-term increases in glucocorticoids (Dhabhar and
498 McEwen 1999), this seasonal variation in sensitivity may represent an adaptation to
499 increased risk of parasitism and wounding during early breeding (Lattin et al. 2013).
500 Finally, we note that similar to our findings, Buehler et al. (2008a) detected no
501 seasonal change in plasma agglutination, a non-cellular component of innate
502 immunity. Thus, different components of immunity may respond differently to
503 specific immune risks associated with stages in the annual cycle.

504

505 **In conclusion, we found evidence for seasonal modulation, but not movement-**
506 **related variation, in the immune profiles of wild migratory birds. Our findings provide**
507 **partial, but not complete, support for the hypothesis that individuals adjust the balance**
508 **between specific and nonspecific immune defences based on the relative risk of**
509 **encountering novel versus familiar pathogens. Determining whether pathogen**
510 **communities show greater variation temporally (e.g., over the course of the breeding**
511 **season) or geographically (e.g., at scale of tens or hundreds of kilometres,**
512 **corresponding to typical distances for natal dispersal and seasonal migration**
513 **respectively) seems likely to cast light on this issue. Most conclusively, our findings**
514 **add to a growing body of research demonstrating the complexity of vertebrate**
515 **immunity and the risk of inferring “immunocompetence” either from a single measure**
516 **or at a single point in time.**

517

518 **Acknowledgements**

519 We thank the Queen’s University Biological Station, and the Advanced Facility for
520 Avian Research at the University of Western Ontario for logistical support. We also

521 thank Shawn Kubli for technical advice, Alannah Lymburner for field assistance,
522 Duncan MacDougall for field rescue, and Yanina Sarquis-Adamson for access to
523 microsatellite allele frequencies from surrounding populations. Chantel Gryba and
524 Geoff Koehler assisted with stable isotope measurements.
525

526 **Literature Cited**

- 527 Bartoń K. 2016. MuMIn: Multi-model inference. R package version 1.15.6.
528 <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=MuMIn>.
- 529 Bourgeon S, Raclot T. 2006. Corticosterone selectively decreases humoral immunity
530 in female eiders during incubation. *J Exp Biol* 209:4957-4965.
- 531 Buehler DM, Piersma T, Matson K, Tieleman BI. 2008a. Seasonal redistribution of
532 immune function in a migrant shorebird: annual-cycle effects override
533 adjustments to thermal regime. *Am Nat* 172:783-796.
- 534 Buehler DM, Bhola N, Barjaktarov D, Goymann W, Schwabl I, Tielman BI, Piersma
535 T. 2008b. Constitutive immune function responds more slowly to handling
536 stress than corticosterone in a shorebird. *Physiol Biochem Zool* 81:673-681.
- 537 Burnham KP, Anderson DR. 2002. Model selection and multimodel inference: a
538 practical information-theoretic approach. 2nd ed. New York, NY: Springer.
- 539 Casto JM, Nolan V, Ketterson ED. 2001. Steroid hormones and immune function:
540 Experimental studies in wild and captive dark-eyed juncos (*Junco hyemalis*).
541 *Am Nat* 157:408-420.
- 542 Demas GE, Zysling DA, Beechler BR, Muehlenbein MP, French SS. 2011. Beyond
543 phytohaemagglutinin: assessing vertebrate immune function across ecological
544 contexts. *J Anim Ecol* 80:710-730.
- 545 Dhabhar FS, McEwen BS. 1999. Enhancing versus suppressive effects of stress
546 hormones on skin immune function. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 86:1059-1064.
- 547 Eikenaar C, Hegemann A. 2016. Migratory common blackbirds have lower innate
548 immune function during autumn migration than resident conspecifics. *Biol Lett*
549 12: DOI 10.1098/rsbl.2016.0078.

550 Evans MR, Goldsmith AR, Norris, SRA. 2000. The effects of testosterone on
551 antibody production and plumage coloration in male house sparrows (*Passer*
552 *domesticus*). Behav Ecol Sociobiol 47:156-163.

553 Figuerola J, Green AJ. 2000. Haematozoan parasites and migratory behaviour in
554 waterfowl. Evol Ecol 14:143-153.

555 Fincher CL, Thornhill R. 2008. A parasite-driven wedge: infectious diseases may
556 explain language and other biodiversity. Oikos 117:1289-1297.

557 Forsman AM, Vogal LA, Sakaluk SK, Grindstaff JL, Thompson CF. 2008. Immune-
558 challenged house wren broods differ in the relative strengths of their responses
559 among different axes of the immune system. J Evol Biol 21:873-878.

560 Fox J, Weisberg S. 2011. An R companion to applied regression. 2nd ed. Thousand
561 Oaks, CA: Sage.

562 Granbom M, Råborg L, Smith HG. 2004. The spatial and temporal repeatability of
563 PHA-responses. Behav Ecol 16:497-498.

564 Griffith SC, Stewart IRK, Dawson DA, Owens IPF, Burke T. 1999. Contrasting levels
565 of extra-pair paternity in mainland and island populations of the house sparrow
566 (*Passer domesticus*): is there an “island effect”? Biol J Linn Soc 68:303-316.

567 Hobson KA, Van Wilgenburg SL, Faaborg J, Toms JD, Rengifo C, Llanes Sosa A,
568 Aubry Y, Brito Aguilar R. 2014. Connecting breeding and wintering grounds
569 of Neotropical migrant songbirds using stable hydrogen isotopes: a call for an
570 isotopic atlas of migratory connectivity. J Field Ornithol 85:237-257.

571 Janeway CA, Travers P, Walport M, Schlomick M. 2005. Immunobiology: the
572 immune system in health and disease. 6th edition. New York, NY: Garland.

573 Jeffrey KJ, Keller LF, Arcese P, Bruford MW. 2001. The development of
574 microsatellite loci in the song sparrow, *Melospiza melodia* (Aves) and
575 genotyping errors associated with good quality DNA. Mol Ecol Notes 1:11-13.

576 Keil D, Luebke RW, Pruett SB. 2001. Quantifying the relationship between multiple
577 immunological parameters and host resistance: probing the limits of
578 reductionism. J Immunol 167:4543-4552.

579 Kelly TR, MacGillivray HL, Sarquis-Adamson Y, Watson MJ, Hobson KA,
580 MacDougall-Shackleton EA. 2016. Seasonal migration distance varies with
581 natal dispersal and predicts parasitic infection in song sparrows. Behav Ecol
582 Sociobiol 70:1857-1866.

583 Klasing KC. 2004. The costs of immunity. Acta Zool Sinica 50:961-969.

584 Kubli SP. 2011. Song complexity and stereotypy in the song sparrow (*Melospiza*
585 *melodia*) as indicators of constitutive immune function. MSc thesis, University
586 of Western Ontario, London, Ontario, Canada.

587 Kubli SP, MacDougall-Shackleton EA. 2014. Developmental timing of signals affects
588 information content: song complexity but not consistency reflects innate
589 immune strategy in male song sparrows. Am Nat 183:660–670.

590 Lattin CR, Waldron-Francis K, Romero LM. 2013. Intracellular glucocorticoid
591 receptors in spleen, but not in skin, vary seasonally in wild house sparrows
592 (*Passer domesticus*). Proc R Soc Lond B 280:20123033.

593 Lee KA. 2006. Linking immune defenses and life history at the levels of the
594 individual and the species. Integr Comp Biol 46:1000-1015.

595 Lessells CM, Boag PT. 1987. Unrepeatable repeatabilities - a common mistake. Auk
596 104:116-121.

597 Love OP, Salvante KG, Dale J, Williams TD. 2008. Sex-specific variability in the
598 immune system across life-history stages. *Am Nat* 172:E99-112.

599 Lymburner AH, Kelly TR, Hobson KA, MacDougall-Shackleton EA, MacDougall-
600 Shackleton SA. Testosterone, migration distance, and migratory timing in
601 song sparrows *Melospiza melodia*. *Horm Behav* 85:102-107.

602 Martin LB, Hasselquist D, Wikelski M. 2006. Investment in immune defense is linked
603 to pace of life in house sparrows. *Oecologia* 147:565-575.

604 Martin LB, Weil ZM, Nelson RJ. 2007. Immune defense and reproductive pace of life
605 in *Peromyscus* mice. *Ecology* 88:2516-2528.

606 Matson KD, Ricklefs RE, Klasing KC. 2005. A hemolysis-hemagglutination assay for
607 characterizing constitutive innate humoral immunity in wild and domestic
608 birds. *Dev Comp Immunol* 29:275-286.

609 Millet S, Bennett J, Lee KA, Hau M, Klasing KC. 2007. Quantifying and comparing
610 constitutive immunity across avian species. *Dev Comp Immunol* 31:188-201.

611 Møller AP, Erritzøe J. 1998. Host immune defence and migration in birds. *Evol Ecol*
612 12:945-953.

613 Møller AP, Martin-Vivaldi M, Soler J. 2004. Parasitism, host immune defence and
614 dispersal. *J Evol Biol* 17:603-612.

615 Nebel S, Bauchinger U, Buehler DM, Langlois LA, Boyles M, Gerson AR, Price ER,
616 McWilliams SR, Guglielmo CG. 2012. Constitutive immune function in
617 European starlings, *Sturnus vulgaris*, is decreased immediately after an
618 endurance flight in a wind tunnel. *J Exp Biol* 215:272-278.

619 Nelson RJ, Demas GE, Klein SL, Kriegsfeld LJ. 2002. Seasonal patterns of stress,
620 immune function, and disease. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.

621 O'Neal DM, Ketterson ED. 2012. Life-history evolution, hormones, and avian
622 immune function. In: Demas GE, Nelson RJ, editors. *Ecoimmunology*. New
623 York, NY: Oxford University Press. p 7-44.

624 Pagenkopp KM, Klicka J, Durrant KL, Garvin JC, Fleischer RC. 2008. Geographic
625 variation in malarial parasite lineages in the common yellowthroat (*Geothlypis*
626 *trichas*). *Conserv Genet* 9:1577-1588.

627 Peig J, Green AJ. 2009. New perspectives for estimating body condition from
628 mass/length data: the scaled mass index as an alternative method. *Oikos*
629 118:1883-1891.

630 Piry S, Alapetite A, Cornuet JM, Paetkau D, Baudouin L, Estoup A. 2004.
631 GENECLASS2: A software for genetic assignment and first-generation migrant
632 detection. *J Hered* 95:536-539.

633 R Core Team. 2016. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R
634 Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. [http://www.R-](http://www.R-project.org/)
635 [project.org/](http://www.R-project.org/).

636 Saino N, Martinelli R, Møller AP. 2001. Immunoglobulin plasma concentration in
637 relation to egg laying and mate ornamentation of female barn swallows
638 (*Hirundo rustica*). *J Evol Biol* 14:95-109.

639 Sardell RJ, Keller LF, Arcese P, Bucher T, Reid JM. 2010. Comprehensive paternity
640 assignment: genotype, spatial location and social status in song sparrows,
641 *Melospiza melodia*. *Mol Ecol* 19:4352-4364.

642 Schmid-Hempel P. 2011. *Evolutionary parasitology: the integrated study of*
643 *infections, immunity, ecology, and genetics*. New York, NY: Oxford University
644 Press.

645 Schmid-Hempel P, Ebert D. 2003. On the evolutionary ecology of specific immune
646 defence. *Trends Ecol Evol* 18:27-32.

647 Sheldon BC, Verhulst S. 1996. Ecological immunology: costly parasite defences and
648 trade-offs in evolutionary ecology. *Trends Ecol Evol* 11:317-321.

649 Warr GW, Magor KE, Higgins DA. 1995. IgY: clues to the origins of modern
650 antibodies. *Immunol Today* 16:392-298.

651 Wassenaar LI, Hobson KA. 2000. Stable-carbon and hydrogen isotope ratios reveal
652 breeding origins of red-winged blackbirds. *Ecol Appl* 10:911-916.

653 Wassenaar LI, Hobson KA. 2003. Comparative equilibrium and online technique for
654 determination of non-exchangeable hydrogen of keratins for use in animal
655 migration studies. *Isot Environ Healt S* 39:211-217.

656 Wegner KM, Kalbe M, Reusch TBH. 2007. Innate versus adaptive immunity in
657 sticklebacks: evidence for trade-offs from a selection experiment. *Evol Ecol*
658 21:473-483.

659

660 **Figure Legends**

661 **Figure 1:** Reliance on acquired over innate constitutive innate immune defence
662 (immune PC1) increased with date throughout the early breeding season in
663 song sparrows. Filled and open symbols denote males and females,
664 respectively.