University of Nebraska - Lincoln

DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

8-2-2022

Status of Customer Relationship Management Activities in University Libraries of Pakistan

Mir Bahader
Army Burn Hall College for Boys Abbottabad, Pakistan, mirbahaderktk@yahoo.com

Status of Customer Relationship Management Activities in University Libraries of Pakistan

Mir Bahader

Army Burn Hall College for Boys Abbottabad, Pakistan.
Corresponding Email:mirbahaderktk@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

The study purpose is to assess the current status of customer relationship management (CRM) activities (customer satisfaction activities and communications strategies & practices) in academic libraries in Pakistan and also focused on CRM activities that correlate with universities' demographic variables (types, locations, and category). This study adopted a correlational research design with a survey method based on quantitative data collection. A structured questionnaire was distributed among all head/in-charge librarians of universities/DAIs in Pakistan. This study found that majority of the customer satisfaction activities were in the "planning" stage while few activities were "currently doing" by the libraries. Similarly, the majority of communication strategies and practices were "currently in practice" by the academic libraries.The overall mean of customer satisfaction activities were not correlated with types, locations, and categories of academic libraries in Pakistan but few facets were found significant. Furthermore, communication strategies and practices have no statistically significant mean variation with university demographic variables (types, locations, and categories) except for a few statements. This study is a helpful and positive approach for academic libraries, especially those engaged in customer relationship management execution. These findings will boost customer pleasure, loyalty, and positive image of the library. The findings will also make a substantial contribution to current knowledge and serve as a source for

library professionals in establishing customer-friendly and customer-centered approaches in Pakistani academic libraries.

1. Introduction

Libraries are organizations focused on their customers' needs (users). The library customer is the focal point of library and information services in today's technology environment (Greenberg, 2007). The development of library policies and the design of services have been influenced by customer pleasure and satisfaction. The library-customer relationship is an important measure of library and information service effectiveness (Abubakar & Chollom, 2017). Business organization behavior is more targeted, to maximize customer happiness; growing revenue, and establishing their confidence. Libraries are non-profit, service-oriented organizations tasked to be required with delivering the right information to the right customer at the right time and in the right way in reference services (Ranganathan, 2017).

Customers' satisfaction is one of the fundamental components of academic libraries. Without addressing user demands and facilitating customer happiness, they will not stay very long. Strong customer-focused strategies encourage customers to remain loyal, and academic libraries utilize that loyalty to attract potential users (Aburayya et al., 2020). Customer satisfaction has a beneficial and fruitful effect on the success of academic libraries' business. Having a huge user base indicates that academic libraries have a competitive advantage over their competitors. One of the main factors driving revenue growth is customers' returns for more purchases as a result of their pleasure (Nuseir & Madanat, 2015).

Literature indicated that most of the studies conducted in Pakistani libraries on user satisfaction concerning library resources and services. The surveys of Saeed and Ramzan (2003) at the Lahore University of Management Sciences library, Rehman et al., (2009) at the Punjab university library Lahore, and Taufiq et al., (2020) on public libraries in Lahore, Pakistan were undertaken to find out users satisfaction with library resources and services respectively.

Moreover, very few studies have been conducted in academic libraries in Pakistan from the perspective of customer relationship management (CRM). The study by Bahader *et al.* (2018, 2022), on user relationship management (URM) and library leaders' attitude toward user care in university libraries of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Islamabad, concluded that the majority of academic libraries contact users through face to face, ask a librarian services and email while coordinate new members with orientation programs. Moreover, head librarians tried to fulfill the information needs of every user; they are concerned about their users and are eager to assist them. Head librarians greet and educate users about the proper use of the library's services, protect each user's personal information, and maintain a long-term relationship with users. According to a study by Bahader et al. (2020) titled "user relationship management (URM) in university libraries of Pakistan: head librarians' perceptions", head librarians perceived that user relationship management (URM) plays a crucial role in resolving users' complaints and problems, improving service quality, creating a user-friendly environment, marketing library products, and services, enhancing the library's public image, getting user feedback, creating a conducive environment for learning and user-centered approach.

The examination of the literature found that the academic libraries in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Islamabad investigated medium of contact with users', URM mechanism in libraries, and head librarians' attitude towards user care. Furthermore, head librarians perceptions about the

importance of URM in Pakistani academic library environment were also explored. To keep customers happy, delighted, and loyal, libraries must build strong and customized one-to-one relationships with them. Despite the fact that the library-customer relationship is an important area of research and development, there is still significant research gap in the literature of academic libraries in Pakistan regarding customer relationship management (CRM) activities contain customer satisfaction and customer communication activities, strategies and practices. So there is a dire need to fill this gap through a comprehensive study. Therefore, this study focuses on to find out the current status of customer satisfaction and customer communication activities, strategies and practices in context of customer relationship management (CRM) in university libraries of Pakistan. Moreover it also concentrates on customer satisfaction activities and customer communication strategies that correlate with universities' demographic variables (types, locations, and category) respectively.

Research Questions

The following research questions are addressed in this study:

- What is the current status of customer satisfaction activities in context of customer relationship management (CRM) in academic libraries in Pakistan?

- What is the current status of communication strategies and practices in context of customer relationship management (CRM) in academic libraries in Pakistan?

Hypotheses

To find the significant correlations between customer relationship management (CRM) activities and the academic universities of Pakistan variable, it was hypothesized. For statistical tests, the following null hypotheses were developed:

H01: There is no statistically significant difference between customer satisfaction activities in context of customer relationship management (CRM) and types of universities.

H02: There is no statistically significant difference between customer satisfaction activities in context of customer relationship management (CRM) and geographical location universities.

H03: There is no statistically significant difference between customer satisfaction activities in context of customer relationship management (CRM) and categories of universities.

H04: There is no statistically significant difference between communication strategies and practices of CRM and types of universities.

H05: There is no statistically significant difference between communication strategies and practices in context of customer relationship management (CRM) and geographical location universities.

H06: There is no statistically significant difference between communication strategies and practices in context of customer relationship management (CRM) and categories of universities.

2. Review of Literature

Customer Relationship Management (CRM)

Customer Relationship Management (CRM) is a process, approach, or strategy for understanding more about a customer's needs and habits to build a closer relationship with them. CRM is a process of studying, analyzing, and learning about the requirements and expectations of customers (Bahader et al., 2021). It is a business strategy that strives to comprehend, predict, and manage the demands of an organization's existing and potential consumers. CRM refers to the processes that aim to connect a company's customer-focused information systems and track dealings with individual customers across the relationship life cycle to better address individual customers' needs (Palmer, 2005). CRM is a word used in the information industry to describe the methodology, software, and, usually internet capabilities that assist organizations in managing

customer relationships in an organized manner. CRM is primarily concerned with Long-term value creation for the customer and the organization, customer satisfaction is given top importance and measuring the overall return on investment (ROI) on the services provided to customers.

Customer Relationship Management (CRM) Activities in Libraries: International Perspective

The concept of customer relationship and customer-centered approach was not new for libraries. To satisfy the growing needs and preferences of the customer, academic libraries must change processes, business, facilities, services, culture, structure, and networks as per customer lifestyle. Ranganathan (1931) presented five laws for library science and presented a shop analogy for library professionals to render the operation more accessible with a business perspective and appeals to all types of libraries to recognize that they are businesses. He stated while the reputation of a shop depends heavily on resourcefulness, personal awareness of the items in the store, and a sense of eagerness to support the shop's customers, the quality of the library service depends heavily on the library staff's head and heart. He claimed that users want the same quality as customers and libraries to have now to establish the new shop methods.

Broady-Preston *et al.* (2006) conducted a study on the university library of Malta 2003-2004 and the University of Coventry, Lanchester library, 2005-2006, and customer relationships management (CRM) was studied between the library employees and their users. The findings have shown that CRM is a valuable tool for assessing university libraries' perceived interest. In the new business world, librarians not only have to recognize and satisfy their users ' expectations but also engage effectively with their users if the academic libraries have the true market value. For CRM to succeed, good communication techniques are necessary. A study was carried out by Umar (2010), to examine the application of customer relationship management in

selected university libraries in the North Western States of Nigeria and concluded that current awareness services, information, and referral service, Internet services, and exhibition and displays were the major information services provided by the selected university libraries. It was discovered that personal contacts, complaint boxes, notice boards, and newsletters were the common form of media used to connect with customers, and inverters, TV, and e-mail was only used in Kashim Ibrahim Library while mobile phone, website, webpage, and telephone (landline) respectively were not used in the university libraries studied. It was found that there is no significant difference in the type of CRM strategies adopted by university libraries to determine their customer satisfaction. This study concludes that the application of customer relationship management (CRM) in selected university libraries has a significant influence on information service delivery. This study recommended the need to step up efforts to attract and maintain the client base of university libraries through the provision of quality information services, recruitment of skilled library personnel, regular communications, continuous monitoring of customer needs, and the use of short Message Service (SMS) facilities. Saludin and Tan (2010), the study recommended that problems of user satisfaction will be overcome by offering the requisite preparation for each advanced skill and by recruiting more trained staff; efficient communication with staff and users through the regular organization of communication workshops in which employees may be introduced and trained with the latest skills required and uptrend concerns relevant to the needs and satisfaction of the users. The workshop should concentrate on topics like courtesy, friendliness, preparation, responsiveness, and so on. According to Wang's (2012) study, ICT settings and related amenities in libraries should be accessible and fulfil user demands. The results of this study demonstrate that only academic libraries make use of information technology like databases and data mining as well as

communication technology like telephone and web page. Jamali *et al.* (2013) evaluate and measure management relationship levels with users in e-libraries and concluded that library administrators in the public library Yazd University need to improve users' satisfaction through CRM activities. Siddiqui (2013) conducted a study on "CRM in university libraries in a present era" and concluded that in today's electronic environment, CRM is critical for libraries to compete effectively. The more efficiently you use your customer information to fulfill their needs, the more value and image your library will have. The successful librarianship route requires understanding the requirements and preferences of customers and to achieve customer satisfaction with CRM activities. Academic libraries use a variety of channels to interact with their users, according to Leligdon et al., (2015). These include physical channels, which include all face-to-face interactions, access services staff, subject liaison librarians, and library administration engaging at all physical outlets, whether in the library or at meetings and outreach events. They added that engagement happens across a range of printed and electronic channels, including departmental mailings, printed marketing brochures, and fliers, as well as calls, emails, web pages, virtual service desks, social media, and learning management systems. Edalatiyan *et al.* (2017), study depicted that the degree of understanding of librarians at Iranian university libraries with CRM is high and the need of implementing and using CRM practices is very reasonable. Stokić *et al*. (2019), the report found the possibilities for the application of the idea of CRM and digital technology in public libraries in developing countries and resulted that most librarians are acquainted with the CRM concept. However, libraries of Herzegovina, Serbia, Bosnia, and Montenegro were not utilizing CRM or smart technology to strengthen the relationship with customers. This study also measures users' satisfaction with public library products, services, and facilities. According to Nwachokor and Okeke's (2020) study, only two

out of the four customer relationship management (CRM) strategies were used by librarians in university libraries in Delta State, leaving much to be desired. In addition, CRM techniques should be in line with information technology, human resources, and procedure. Additionally, it was found that these academic libraries have not fully embraced the culture of customer orientation and probably do not provide their consumers with what they want.

Customer Relationship Management (CRM) in Libraries: Pakistani Perspective

By directly addressing customers' needs, enhancing service quality, and delivering value to library customers, CRM can help libraries achieve their goals of increasing the number of satisfied customers, increasing customer loyalty, and increasing overall productivity. According to Idrees (2007) users of the Dr. Muhammad Hamidullah Library: Islamic Research Institute were generally satisfied with the library's collection, services, and staff interaction, but were disappointed with the library's structure and classification system. Concerns about the security and non-professional employees were reasonably cooperative, although they needed some rectification and training. Orientation programs, proper marketing of library services, the implementation of URM services, increased library facilities, and the creation of a favorable learning atmosphere were all recommended in the study. As per the findings of the study of Bahader et al. (2018), there is no adequate implementation of user relationship management (URM) techniques in Khyber Pakhtunkwa and Islamabad university libraries; however, some communication practices such as face-to-face, email, new user orientations are in practices. The study recommended that it is necessary to establish a user relationship management (URM) awareness campaign in libraries so that all professionals are aware of its value. Libraries should employ new forms of communication, such as social media, electronic media, and print media, to maintain a close relationship with their users. To strengthen the URM mechanism and the

continual improvement of library service, an active feedback system should be implemented. University library infrastructure must be enhanced to accommodate URM programs. Bahader et al., (2020) concluded in their study that university head librarians perceived that CRM is beneficial to libraries as; it boosts library usage and enhances capacity utilization, it aids in the matching of users' tastes, preferences, and needs to the library's collection, enhance the library's user community's loyalty and contribution, increase user compliance and collaboration with the library personnel, encourage users to make comments and provide feedback for the improvement and growth of library services, creating a user-friendly and conducive learning environment, it gives excellent quality services to users, library management should provide to users with extra financial benefits, and it assists libraries in gaining user trust and loyalty, as well as brand image building. A study by Bahader et al., (2021) revealed that in Pakistan, university libraries are concentrating on satisfying users, emphasizing the need of retaining and increasing valuable users, understanding individual users' needs, striving to please them, providing tailored services to users, and strengthening emotional relationships with them. They are focusing on customers and implementing customer feedback/knowledge management methods, as well as attempting to change organizational culture to align with CRM systems. The information technology infrastructure is inadequate, and university libraries are unable to implement a complete CRM system. According to Bahader et al (2022) study, library leaders in KPK and Islamabad are optimistic about user care. They attempted to meet each user's information needs; they care about their users and are eager to assist them. Library leaders greet and educate users on how to use the library's services properly, protect each user's personal information, and promote the formation of library community friends. They maintain long-term relationships with users, provide personalized attention to users, solve user problems, and prioritize key users.

Today libraries are facing huge challenges in their existence and trying to change their lifestyle and culture. They are in motion to shift products from a centered approach to a user-centric approach. This study tries to dig out the status of CRM activities containing customer satisfaction activities and communication strategies and practices in academic libraries of Pakistan.

3. Methods and Procedures

This study investigated the status of CRM activities in Pakistani academic libraries and applied a cross-sectional survey research design. A quantitative research approach was used in this study to collect data from the respondents.

Instruments for Data Collection

The structured questionnaire was used for the data collection. The questionnaire consisting two parts and part first exist demographic data relating to types of University (public and private); category of university (General, Agriculture/Veterinary Sciences, Engineering & Technology, Medical Sciences, Business Education, Computer Science & IT); and geographical locations (Punjab Province, Sindh Province, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province, Islamabad Capital Territory Region, Baluchistan Province, Azad Jammu & Kashmir Region) respectively. The second part of the questionnaire cover 23 attributes of CRM activities. It includes 13facets of activities regarding customer satisfaction and 10 facets of customer communication practices. The questionnaire was developed following a thorough assessment of the literature, a review by a panel of ten experts from the faculty of library and information science, faculty of management sciences, and professional's librarians working in the position of customer services department. Pilot testing was conducted to enhance the reliability and validity of the instrument contents. After a panel of expert review and pilot testing the revised questionnaire was modified. They also described some technical terms used in the questionnaire which needed to be described in

popular language. They advised to change some phrases, replaced some words with popular words, grammar correction, duplication of statements, spelling errors, and the full name of abbreviations. The perceived core value scale, which has 23 facets, was then subjected to reliability analysis. Cronbach's Alpha revealed that the questionnaire had acceptable reliability, with a score of 0.94.

Population

The population of the study was 193 universities and degree-awarding intuitions, both public and private recognized by Higher Education Commission (HEC), Pakistan. It was determined to perform a census of all of the population's head/in-charge librarians at universities and degree-awarding institutes.

Data Collection and Analysis

Data was collected through an online survey using respondents' email, whatsApp, and other social media groups. The instrument was sent to all head/in-charge librarians at universities and degree-awarding institutes along with a cover letter via email and whatsApp. The researcher used respondents' email and watsApp and phone calls as reminders to improve the response rate of the questionnaire. As a result, 73% of the completed questionnaires were received, which was considered an acceptable response rate for data analysis. These questionnaires were verified for completeness and then analyzed using SPSS (version 22). The data were analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics.

4. Findings

Demographic Information

Out of 140 population, 91(65%) belonged to public sector and 49(35%) to private sector universities/DAIs respectively. In addition, universities/DAIs that belong to general category are 74(52.9%), agriculture/veterinary sciences are 8(5.7%), engineering and technology are

27(19.3%), medical sciences are 21(15%), business education are 7(5%), and computer science & IT are 3(2.1%). Geographical area of the university/DAIs shown that majority of the respondents belonged to Punjab province i.e. 44(31.4%) followed by 35(25%) of Sindh, 32(22.9%) of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, 18(12.9%) of Islamabad Capital Territory, 6(4.3%) of Baluchistan, and 5(3.6%) universities/DAIs and details is given in the Table 1.

Table 1
Demographic Variables of Universities/DAIs (N=140)

Variables	Percentage (%)
Types	
Public sector	65
Private sector	35
Category	
General	52.9
Agriculture/Veterinary Sciences	5.7
Engineering & Technology	19.3
Medical Sciences	15.0
Business Education	5.0
Computer Science & IT	2.1
Geographical Locations	
Punjab Province	31.4
Sindh Province	25.0
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province	22.9
Islamabad Capital Territory Region	12.9
Baluchistan Province	4.3
Azad Jammu & Kashmir Region	3.6

Customer Satisfaction Activities (RQ1)

Data is shown in (Table 02) that customer satisfaction activities that were "currently doing" rank wise with percentage are "special favor to users for book lending" (69.3**%**), "enhance library timings on users' request" (60.0 **%**), "immediately acquisition of books on the users' demand" (58.6 **%**), "provision of conducive learning environment" (57.1 **%**), and "manage library tours" (38.6 **%**) respectively. In addition, customer satisfaction activities that were "planning to do"

score rank wise with percentage are "best library user award" (52.1**%**), "best users of the week/month/year" (48.6**%**), "updating library website as per users' requirements" (37.1**%**), "user's gift system" (34.3**%**), and "users involvement in library planning " (33.6**%**) respectively. The three activities that are "neither doing nor planning" are "present flowers to new members", present welcome cards to new members, and occasional messages/wishes on Eids, Independence Day, Pakistan Day, and Birth Day simultaneously.

Table 2
Frequency and Percentage of Respondents' about Customer Satisfaction Activities (N=140)

Rank	User Satisfaction Activities	1= In practice F (%)	2= In planning F (%)	3= Nor planning F (%)	4=Don't know F (%)	Conclusion
1	Special favour to users for book lending	**97(69.3)**	22(15.7)	20(14.3)	1(0.7)	In practice
2	Enhance library timings on users' request	**84(60.0)**	27(19.3)	27(19.3)	2(1.4)	In practice
3	Immediately acquisition of books on the users' demand	**82(58.6)**	40(28.6)	13(9.3)	5(3.6)	In practice
4	Provision of conducive learning environment	**80(57.1)**	45(32.1)	12(8.6)	3(2.1)	In practice
5	Manage library tours	**54(38.6)**	41(29.3)	39(27.9)	6(4.3)	In practice
6	Updating library website as per users' requirements	**52(37.1)**	52(37.1)	32(22.9)	4(2.9)	In practice
7	Users involvement in library planning	44(31.4)	**47(33.6)**	43(30.7)	6(4.3)	In planning
8	User's gift system	35(25.0)	**48(34.3)**	48(34.3)	9(6.4)	In planning
9	Best library user award	14(10.0)	**73(52.1)**	44(31.4)	9(6.4)	In planning
10	Best users of the week/month/year	10(7.1)	**68(48.6)**	56(40.0)	6(4.3)	In planning
11	Occasional messages/wishes on Eids, Independence Day, Pakistan Day, Birth Day	44(31.4)	46(32.9)	**47(33.6)**	3(2.1)	Nor doing and nor planning
12	Present welcome cards to new members	18(12.9)	49(35.0)	**66(47.1)**	7(5.0)	Nor doing and nor planning
13	Present flowers to new members	15(10.7)	41(29.3)	**76(54.3)**	8(5.7)	Nor doing and nor planning

Communication Strategies and Practices (RQ2)

Data in (Table 03) indicates that communication strategies and practices that were "currently doing" get the frequency and percentage and describe rank from highest to lowest are "face to face interaction" (84.3**%**), "orientation for new users" (75.0 **%**), "make telephone calls" (69.3 **%**), "coordination through E-mail" (66.4 **%**), "complaints/suggestions box" (61.4 **%**) and "establishment of users' help desk" (48.6 **%**) respectively. Furthermore, communication strategies and practices that were "planning to do" score rank wise with percentage are "use of electronic billboards for users' contact" (49.3**%**), "use of Social Media to enhance users' contact" (42.1**%**), and "library social network website" (37.1**%**) respectively.

Table 3
Frequency and Percentage of Respondents' Regarding Communication Strategies and Practices (N=140)

Rank	Communication Strategies & Practices	1= In practice F (%)	2= In planning F (%)	3=Nor planning F (%)	4=Don't know F (%)	Conclusion
1	Face to face interaction	**118(84.3)**	12(8.6)	9(6.4)	1(0.7)	In practice
2	Orientation for new users	**105(75.0)**	24(17.1)	6(4.3)	5(3.6)	In practice
3	Make telephone calls	**97(69.3)**	22(15.7)	18(12.9)	3(2.1)	In practice
4	Coordination through E-mail	**93(66.4)**	36(25.7)	9(6.4)	2(1.4)	In practice
5	Complaints/suggestions box	**86(61.4)**	41(29.3)	9(6.4)	4(2.9)	In practice
6	Establishment of users' help desk	**68(48.6)**	55(39.3)	14(10.0)	3(2.1)	In practice
7	Users engagement on copyright and book day	46(32.9)	**45(32.1)**	42(30.0)	7(5.0)	In planning
8	Library social network website	52(37.1)	**52(37.1)**	32(22.9)	4(2.9)	In planning
9	Use of Social Media to enhance users' contact	51(36.4)	**59(42.1)**	25(17.9)	5(3.6)	In planning
10	Use of electronic billboards for users' contact	18(12.9)	**69(49.3)**	45(32.1)	8(5.7)	In planning

Hypotheses Testing

Using inferential statistics, the correlations between the total mean scores of 23 statements of CRM activities and selected university categorization were investigated. Table 04 and 05 shows the outcomes of the null hypothesis.

Mean Variation between Customer Satisfaction Activities and Types of Universities (H_{01})

The independent sample t- test value .398, with significance level of .691, was lower than the criterion. It implies that there is no obvious relationship between customer satisfaction activities and university types. As a result, Ho1 was accepted as the null hypothesis. Conversely, significant mean difference were found among the facets "Best library user award" here P=.036< .05, where private sector university perform this activity better as compare public sector and "Immediately acquisition of books on the users' demand" hare p=.012<.05 where public sector university perform this activity good as compare to private sector respectively (Table 4).

Mean Variation between Customer Satisfaction Activities and Geographical Locations of Universities ($H0_2$)

Results of One-way ANOVA test revealed that (F values is F= .753 with significance level p=.585) and indicate that there is no statistically significant difference in the composite mean score of "customer satisfaction vdactivities" and it's sub-dimensions based on locations of universities (Islamabad, Punjab, Khyber PaKhtunkhwa, Sindh, Baluchistan, and Azad Jammu & Kashmir) where p-values are more than alpha-values (P>0.05). Thus the null $H_0$2 was accepted. Conversely, statement "User's gift system" here P=.027<.05 significant and by applied Tukey's post hoc (HDS) test shows that Sindh universities currently doing this activity while Islamabad and KPK universities are in planning to do stage(Table 4).

Mean Variation between Customer Satisfaction Activities and Categories of Universities (H_{03})

One-way ANOVA test shown that there was no statistically significant difference in the composite mean score of "customer satisfaction and loyalty activities" and it's sub-attributes based on category of universities (general, agriculture/veterinary, engineering & technology, medical, business education and computer sciences & IT) where F= 1.305 and significance value is p= .265 shows that alpha-values (P>0.05). Thus, accept the null hypothesis H_03.Conversely, statement "Immediately acquisition of books on the users' demand" here P=.000<.05, were significant and after Tukey's HDS test general and medical universities were currently perform this activity while agriculture/veterinary in planning to do position. Similarly, "Updating library website as per users' requirements" P= .031<.05 were significant and found that engineering& technology universities were doing this activitywhile general in planning to do stage (Table 4).

Table 4
Mean Variation of Customer Satisfaction Activities with Universities Demographic Variables (Types, Geographical Locations and Category)

Variables	Mean	Statistics	Sig.
Types of University		t= .398	.691
Public	2.0135		
Private	1.9843		
Geographical Locationsof Universities		F= .753	.585
Islamabad	1.9829		
Punjab	1.9685		
Khyber PaKhtunkhwa	2.0769		
Sindh	1.9560		
Baluchistan	1.9872		
Azad Jammu & Kashmir	2.2615		
Category of Universities		F= 1.305	.265
General	1.9761		
Agriculture/Veterinary	2.1442		
Engineering & Technology	2.1054		
Medical	1.8718		
Business Education	2.1758		
Computer Sciences & IT	1.8974		

* Significant at p < .05, Scale: 1=currently doing, 2=planning to do, 3=nor planning, 4=Don't know

Mean Variation between Communication Strategies and Practices and Types of Universities (H$_{04}$)

Results of independent sample t-test where t= -.312, p=. 756 indicates that no statistically significant mean difference about the overall communication strategies and practices and its all sub facets based on their types of universities where P>.05. As a result, the null H$_0$4 was approved (Table 5).

Mean Variation between Communication Strategies and Practices and Locations of Universities (H$_{05}$)

Results of One-way ANOVA test shown that there was no statistically significant difference in the overall mean score of "communication strategies and practices" and its sub-facets based on locations of universities shows F= .719 and P. .610 and thus accepted null hypothesis (H$_0$5).Conversely, statement "library social network website" here P=.032<.05, found significant and by used Tukey's HDS test Islamabad universities doing this communication practices while Baluchistan, and Azad Jammu & Kashmir (AJK) were in planning to do(Table 5).

Mean Variation between Communication Strategies and Practices and Categories of Universities (H$_{06}$)

One-way ANOVA test found that F= .911 and P= .476 and conclude that no statistically significant difference in the overall mean of "communication strategies and practices" and its sub-statements with respect to category of universities. As a result, null hypothesis H$_0$6 was accepted. Conversely, attribute "Coordination through E-mail" here P=.008<.05, were found significant and Tukey's HDS test indicated that medical universities doing this practices while engineering & technology were in planning stage respectively(Table 5).

Table 5

Mean Variation of Communication Strategies and Practices with Universities Demographic Variables (Types, Geographical Locations and Category)

Variables	Mean	Statistics	Sig.
Types of University		t= -.312	.756
Public	1.6747		
Private	1.7041		
Geographical Locationsof Universities		F= .719	.610
Islamabad	1.6278		
Punjab	1.6000		
Khyber PaKhtunkhwa	1.8031		
Sindh	1.6800		
Baluchistan	1.7167		
Azad Jammu & Kashmir	1.8800		
Category of Universities		F= .911	.476
General	1.6189		
Agriculture/Veterinary	1.6750		
Engineering & Technology	1.8667		
Medical	1.6571		
Business Education	1.7286		
Computer Sciences & IT	1.8000		

* Significant at p < .05, Scale: 1=currently doing, 2=Planning to do, 3=nor planning, 4=don't know

5. Discussions

A final look at the results (Table 02) revealed that some CRM activities related to customer satisfaction were "currently doing" in academic libraries of Pakistan. Customer satisfaction activities like special favor to users for book lending (more books will be issued to key customers mentioned in the rules) , enhancing library timings on users' request (user will give extra time at their request), immediately acquisition of books on the users' demand, and provision of a conducive learning environment were currently in practice. These results are coherent in some activities with studies of (Saludin and Tan (2010; Jamali *et al.*, 2013; Siddiqui, 2013; Leligdon *et al*., 2015; Stokić *et al*., 2018; Nwachokor and Okeke's, 2020) respectively. Furthermore, the best users of the week/month/year, best library user award, user's gift system, users involvement in library planning, updating library website as per users' requirements, and

manage library tours were in the "Planning to do" stage. In addition, Three CRM activities that are presenting flowers to new members, presenting welcome cards to new members, and occasional messages/wishes on Eids, Independence Day, Pakistan Day, and Birth Day related to customer satisfaction were not currently done or nor in the planning stage. As for as CRM activities linked to communication strategies and practices in academic libraries were majority "currently doing" stage which includes face-to-face interaction, orientation for new users, making telephone calls, coordination through E-mail, complaints/suggestions box, the establishment of users' help desk respectively (Table 03). These results are consistent with those of earlier studies (Broady-Preston *et al.* 2006; Umar, 2010; Aliu and Eneh, 2011; Wang, 2012; Jamali *et al.*, 2013; Leligdon *et al*., 2015) and so on. However, the use of electronic billboards for users' contact, the use of Social Media to enhance users' contact, the library social network website, and users' engagement on copyright and book day communication strategies and practices in academic libraries were in the "planning to do" stage. Results of (Table 04) indicates that There is no statistically significant difference between customer satisfaction and loyalty activities of CRM and types, geographic locations, and categories of universities were found where all significance value is greater than p values (P>.05) and accepted the null hypotheses H01, H02, and H03 respectively. In addition, the results of (Table 05) shows that there is no statistically significant difference between communication strategies and practices and types, locations, and category of academic libraries, where all significance values are more than P values (P>.05). Thus, null hypotheses H04, H05 and H06 were accepted respectively. However, few facets were significant concerning types, locations, and category of academic libraries.

6. Conclusions and Implications

The aim of this study is to measure current status of CRM activities in academic libraries of Pakistan. This is the first study in Pakistan to assess status of CRM activities in academic libraries. This research study found that majority of the customer satisfaction activities were in "planning" stage while few activities (special favour to users for book lending, enhance library timings on users' request, immediately acquisition of books on the users' demand, and provision of conducive learning environment) were "currently doing" by the libraries. Similarly, majority of communication strategies and practices (face to face interaction, orientation for new users, make telephone calls, coordination through E-mail, complaints/suggestions box, establishment of users' help desk) were "currently doing" to boost up relationship with customer. Overall mean of customer relationship management activities contain customer satisfaction and communication strategies and practices are not correlated with types, locations, and category of academic libraries of Pakistan but few facets were found significant.

This study is a helpful and positive approach for academic libraries, especially those engaged in customer relationship management execution. This project will boost user pleasure, loyalty, and the image of the library. The outcomes of this study will assist libraries in forming strong bonds with their customers by utilizing URM activities and tactics for mutual benefits throughout the customer life cycle. The findings will also make a substantial contribution to current knowledge and serve as a source for library professionals and Head/in-charge librarians in establishing user-friendly and user-centered techniques in Pakistani academic libraries. This study was limited to the responses of the head librarians of university libraries in Pakistan and did not reflect the perspectives of other stakeholders such as management, faculty, and students. This study addressed the current status of CRM activities and tactics in academic libraries,

meanwhile, qualitative studies can be embarked on to support the development of CRM models, programs, and software for academic libraries of Pakistan in conjunction with the HEC and other accreditation authorities.

References

Abubakar, Daniel, and Chollom, K. M. (2017). Relationship of user education, computer literacy and information and communication technology accessibility and use of e-resources by postgraduate students in Nigerian university libraries. *Library Philosophy & Practice 1555,* http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/*1555*

Aburayya, A., Marzouqi, A., Alawadhi, D., Abdouli, F., & Taryam, M. (2020). An empirical investigation of the effect of employees' customer orientation on customer loyalty through the mediating role of customer satisfaction and service quality. *Management Science Letters*, *10*(10), 2147-2158.

Bahader, M., Ali, J., Idrees, H., Ali, A., and Awan, R. (2018). User relationship management practices in the university libraries of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Islamabad. *International Journal of Industrial Management,* 4(1).

Bahader, M., Idrees, H., & Naveed, M. A. (2020). User relationship management in university libraries of Pakistan: head librarians' perceptions. *Pakistan Library and Information Science Journal*, *51*, 85-97.

Bahader, M., Idrees, H., & Naveed, M. A. (2021). Customer relationship management practices in university libraries of Pakistan. *Library Philosophy and Practice* (e-journal), 6039. https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac

Bahader, M. Naveed, M. A., Jan, R. Jan, T. & Hussain, M. (2022). Library leaders' attitude towards user care in university libraries of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Islamabad.

Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal). 6933

https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/6933

Broady-Preston, J., Felice, J., & Marshall, S. (2006). Building better customer relationships: case studies from Malta and the UK. *Library management*, 27(6/7), 430-445 doi: 10.1108/01435120610702422

Edalatiyan, Z., Sanatjoo, A., & Nowkarizi, M. (2017). Review of acquaintance and necessity of implementing strategy of customer relationship management from the perspective of human resources of academic libraries in Iran. *Library and Information Science Research (LISRJ)*, 7(1), 239-256.

Idrees, H. (2007). User Relationship Management in Dr .Muhammad Hamidullah Library: Islamic Research Institute. *Pakistan Library and Information Science Journal*, 38, 25-30.

Jamali, R., Moshabaki, A., Aramoon, H., & Alimohammadi, A. (2013).Customer relationship management in electronic environment. *The Electronic Library*, 31(1), 119-130, https://doi.org/10.1108/02640471311299173

Leligdon, L., Quinn, T., & Briggs, L. (2015). Strategic CRM: improving the business of academic libraries. *College & Undergraduate Libraries*, 22(3-4), 247-260. doi.org/10.1080/10691316.2015.1067662

Nuseir, M. T., & Madanat, H. (2015). 4Ps: A strategy to secure customers' loyalty via customer satisfaction. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, *7*(4); 78.

Nwachokor, I. M., & Okeke, I. F. (2020). Customer relationship management practices among

    librarians in academic libraries in Delta State. *Library Philosophy and Practice.* 4010.

    https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/4010

Palmer, R., Lindgreen, A and Vanhamme, J. (2005). Relationship marketing: schools of thought

    and future research directions. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning,* 23(3), 313-330.

Ranganathan, S.R. (2017). Five laws of library science. *Librarianship Studies.*

    https://www.librarianshipstudies.com/2017/09/five-laws-of-library-science.html

 Ranganathan, S. R. (1931). *The five laws of library science*. Madras Library Association.

Rehman, S., Mahmood, K., Arif, M., & Rafiq, M. (2009). Are users satisfied with library

    services: The case of Punjab University Library. *Pakistan Library and Information*

    Science Journal, 40(1), 22-28.

Saeed, H., & Ramzan, M. (2003). Student use of Lahore University of Management Sciences: A

    survey. *Pakistan Library Bulletin*, 34(1), 12-16.

Saludin, M. N., & Tan, P. K. (2010). The importance of customer satisfaction and customer

    complaint towards a better quality service using six sigma: An academic

    perspective. *Jurnal Teknologi*, 5:107-126

Siddiqui, J. A. (2013). Customer relationship management in university libraries in present era.

    Indian Journal of Library and Information Science, 7 (3), 13-15.

Stokić, A., Stojanović, D., Bogdanović, Z., Despotović-Zrakić, M., & Radenković, B. (2019). Enhancing the customer relationship management in public libraries: findings from three developing countries. *Library Hi Tech,* 37(2), 251-272. https://doi.org/10.1108/LHT-07-2017-0138

Taufiq, M., Rehman, S. U., & Ashiq, M. (2020). User satisfaction with resources and services of public libraries of Lahore, Pakistan. *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal). Retrieved from https://digitalcommons. unl. edu/libphilprac/4347*.

Umar, L. (2010). *Application of customer relationship management in information service delivery in university libraries in north western states of Nigeria.* [Master's Thesis, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria].

Wang, S. L. (2012). Development of a service framework for library users from customer relationship management perspective. *Intech*, 79-100.