



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

Edinburgh Research Explorer

## Seeing through the hedge

**Citation for published version:**

Li, J, Zhang, Y, Rusham, M, Milne, RI, Wang, Y, Wu, D, Jia, S, Tao, T & Mao, K 2021, 'Seeing through the hedge: Phylogenomics of Thuja (Cupressaceae) reveals prominent incomplete lineage sorting and ancient introgression for Tertiary relict flora', *Cladistics*. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cla.12491>

**Digital Object Identifier (DOI):**

[10.1111/cla.12491](https://doi.org/10.1111/cla.12491)

**Link:**

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

**Document Version:**

Peer reviewed version

**Published In:**

Cladistics

**General rights**

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

**Take down policy**

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact [openaccess@ed.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@ed.ac.uk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



1 **Seeing through the hedge: Phylogenomics of *Thuja* (Cupressaceae) reveals prominent**  
2 **incomplete lineage sorting and ancient introgression for Tertiary relict flora**

3

4 Jialiang Li<sup>1#</sup>, Yujiao Zhang<sup>1#</sup>, Markus Ruhsam<sup>2</sup>, Richard Ian Milne<sup>3</sup>, Yi Wang<sup>1</sup>, Dayu  
5 Wu<sup>1</sup>, Shiyu Jia<sup>1</sup>, Tongzhou Tao<sup>1</sup>, Kangshan Mao<sup>1,4\*</sup>

6

7 <sup>1</sup>Key Laboratory of Bio-Resource and Eco-Environment of Ministry of Education, College  
8 of Life Sciences, State Key Laboratory of Hydraulics and Mountain River Engineering,  
9 Sichuan University, Chengdu 610065, Sichuan, P.R. China;

10 <sup>2</sup>Royal Botanic Garden Edinburgh, 20A Inverleith Row, Edinburgh EH3 5LR, UK;

11 <sup>3</sup>Institute of Molecular Plant Sciences, The University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh EH9 3JH,  
12 UK;

13 <sup>4</sup>College of Science, Tibet University, 850012 Lhasa, Xizang Autonomous Region, China

14

15 \* Author for correspondence:

16 Kangshan Mao, Tel: +8613608091356; Email: maokangshan@163.com,  
17 maokangshan@scu.edu.cn

18 # Jialiang Li and Yujiao Zhang contributed equally to this work.

19

20 **Running heads:** Biogeographic history of *Thuja*

21 **Abstract**

22 The Eastern Asia (EA) - North America (NA) disjunction is a well-known biogeographic  
23 pattern of the Tertiary relict flora; however, few studies have investigated the evolutionary  
24 history of this disjunction using a phylogenomic approach. Here, we used 2,369 single copy  
25 nuclear genes and nearly full plastomes to reconstruct the evolutionary history of the small  
26 Tertiary relict genus *Thuja*, which consists of five disjunctly distributed species. The  
27 nuclear species tree strongly supported an EA clade *T. standishii*-*T. sutchuenensis* and a  
28 “disjunct clade”, where western NA species *T. plicata* is sister to an EA-eastern NA disjunct  
29 *T. occidentalis*-*T. koraiensis* group. Our results suggested that the observed topological  
30 discordance among the gene trees as well as the cytonuclear discordance is mainly due to  
31 incomplete lineage sorting, probably facilitated by the fast diversification of *Thuja* around  
32 the Early Miocene and the large effective population sizes of ancestral lineages.  
33 Furthermore, ~20% of the *T. sutchuenensis* nuclear genome is derived from an unknown  
34 ancestral lineage of *Thuja*, which might explain the close resemblance of its cone  
35 morphology to that of an ancient fossil species. Overall, our study demonstrates that single  
36 genes may not resolve interspecific relationships for disjunct taxa, and that more reliable  
37 results will come from hundreds or thousands of loci, revealing a more complex  
38 evolutionary history. This will steadily improve our understanding of their origin and  
39 evolution.

40

41 **Keywords:** *Thuja*, disjunct distribution, eastern Asia, North America, incomplete lineage  
42 sorting, ghost introgression

43 **1. Introduction**

44 The eastern Asia (EA) and eastern North America (ENA) disjunction is one of the most  
45 well-known biogeographic patterns in the northern hemisphere, and the high level of  
46 similarity between these floras has been known since the time of Linnaeus (Gray, 1859;  
47 Graham, 1966; Davidse, 1983). Understanding the origin and evolution of this disjunction  
48 pattern has been a long-standing focus in biogeography and botany (Tiffney, 1985b; Wen,  
49 1999; Donoghue et al., 2001; Milne and Abbott, 2002; Donoghue and Smith, 2004). This  
50 biogeographic disjunction is generally represented by relict lineages that were widely  
51 distributed in the Northern Hemisphere during the early to mid-Tertiary (Tiffney, 1985a;  
52 Tiffney and Manchester, 2001; Milne and Abbott, 2002). A commonly accepted  
53 explanation for the EA-ENA disjunct distribution is that members of a formerly widespread  
54 flora became extinct in western North America (WNA) and Europe due to a cooling climate  
55 and large-scale geological changes (orogenesis), while their congeners survived in both EA  
56 and ENA (Manchester, 1999; Wen, 1999; Wen et al., 2010). However, some studies have  
57 suggested that this intercontinental disjunction is unlikely to have been initiated by a single  
58 historical event (Tiffney, 1985b; Wang and Ran, 2014), and that more complex processes  
59 such as speciation, extinction, vicariance, and dispersal might have contributed to its origin  
60 (Wen, 1999; Wen et al., 2010; Feng et al., 2020; Zhang et al., 2021).

61 Large areas in ENA, WNA, EA, and Europe served as important refugia for a once more  
62 widespread Tertiary flora during cold periods (Milne and Abbott, 2002; Milne, 2006). If a  
63 formerly widespread taxon survived in multiple refugia, isolated at a similar time, it might  
64 undergo a radiative speciation event. Therefore, the relationships among extant lineages  
65 from different regions could be a result of random processes such as stochastic sorting of  
66 ancestral variation (Maddison and Knowles, 2006). This process is especially likely in  
67 lineages with large ancestral population sizes (Leache and Rannala, 2011; Wang et al.,  
68 2018), which could generate more complex evolutionary histories than a simple bifurcating

69 tree (Pease et al., 2016). Incomplete lineage sorting (ILS) can therefore be expected in  
70 formerly widespread Tertiary relict species, which now have an EA-ENA disjunction. Thus,  
71 it is possible that this remarkable biogeographic pattern is also partly the result of a random  
72 process during speciation.

73 Reconstruction of a robust phylogeny is required in order to understand the origin of  
74 biogeographic patterns. Until recently, biogeographic studies had to rely on often poorly  
75 resolved phylogenies of disjunct taxa due to the limited number of available molecular  
76 markers (Wen, 1999; Chan et al., 2020; Feng et al., 2020). So far, only a few phylogenies  
77 of disjunct taxa have been published which are based on hundreds or thousands of loci,  
78 e.g., *Picea* (Shao et al., 2019), *Acer* (Li et al., 2019), *Nyssa* (Zhou et al., 2020), *Corylus*  
79 (*Zhao et al., 2020*), and *Tsuga* (Feng et al., 2020). These phylogenomic studies showed that  
80 the disjunct taxa have more complex evolutionary histories than previously thought.  
81 Furthermore, both ILS and hybridization, which are the two great challenges in  
82 phylogenetic inference that contribute to gene tree heterogeneity (Dalquen et al., 2017;  
83 Morales-Briones et al., 2018), are commonly seen in some intercontinental disjunct  
84 lineages (Peng and Wang, 2008; Shao et al., 2019). Therefore, genome wide data are  
85 needed to resolve the phylogenetic relationships of disjunct taxa and reconstruct their  
86 complex evolutionary and biogeographic history.

87 The genus *Thuja* L. (Cupressaceae) provides an excellent opportunity to study the origin  
88 and evolution of intercontinental disjunct patterns with a complex history. *Thuja* is also  
89 well known for its hedging plants. The most widely cultivated species of this genus is *Thuja*  
90 *occidentalis* with hundreds of cultivars of varying stature, habit, foliage form and colour  
91 (Eckenwalder, 2009). *Thuja* comprises only five extant species which are disjunctly  
92 distributed in North America and eastern Asia (Fu et al., 1999). The three Asian species, *T.*  
93 *sutchuenensis* Franch., *T. koraiensis* Nakai and *T. standishii* (Gord.) Carr. are restricted to  
94 southwestern China, northeastern China plus the Korean Peninsula, and Japan, respectively,

95 and the two North American species, *T. occidentalis* L. and *T. plicata* D. Don, occur widely  
96 in eastern and western North America, respectively (Farjon, 2005). Even though there are  
97 only five species in *Thuja*, the interspecific relationships have been controversial. Based  
98 on fossil and extant seed cones, McIver and Basinger (1989) reconstructed the evolutionary  
99 history of *Thuja* and showed that *T. sutchuenensis* was more related to an ancestor similar  
100 to *T. ehrenswaerdii* (Heer) Schweitzer, while the other four species clustered together.  
101 Based on nuclear DNA ITS sequences, Li and Xiang (2005) proposed an EA origin of  
102 *Thuja* and reported two major clades. One clade contained (*T. occidentalis* (*T. standishii*,  
103 *T. sutchuenensis*)) while the other clade consisted of the two remaining species, *T. plicata*  
104 and *T. koraiensis*. Using both plastid and nuclear markers, Peng and Wang (2008) found  
105 considerable discordance among the plastid and nuclear gene trees, indicating the  
106 possibility of reticulate evolution in *Thuja*. Adelalu et al. (2020) inferred the interspecific  
107 phylogeny of *Thuja* using complete plastid genomes and obtained a different result with a  
108 (*T. standishii*, *T. koraiensis*) clade which was sister to a (*T. plicata*, (*T. occidentalis*, *T.*  
109 *sutchuenensis*)) clade. Overall, previous studies suggested that *Thuja* had a complex  
110 evolutionary history, and resolving the phylogenetic uncertainty among *Thuja* species and  
111 inferring their biogeographical history are challenging using limited data.

112 Here, we use more than 2,369 single copy nuclear loci and nearly full plastomes to  
113 reconstruct the evolutionary history of the intercontinental disjunct genus *Thuja*. Our goals  
114 are to (i) resolve the interspecific relationships within *Thuja*; (ii) reveal the contribution of  
115 hybridization and ILS to its complex evolutionary history; and (iii) understand the origin  
116 and evolution of the intercontinental disjunct pattern within *Thuja*.

117

## 118 **Materials and Methods**

### 119 ***Taxon Sampling and Target Enrichment Sequencing***

120 We used targeted enrichment methods to capture, sequence the nuclear exome and the

121 nearly complete plastid genome to perform phylogenetic inferences for the genus *Thuja*  
122 (see Supplementary Materials for details). Thirteen individuals covering all currently  
123 recognized species in *Thuja*, plus one *Thujopsis dolabrata* individual as an outgroup, were  
124 sampled for target enrichment sequencing (Table S1). Total genomic DNA was extracted  
125 from silica-dried leaf tissue or herbarium material using the CTAB method (Doyle and  
126 Doyle, 1987), hybridized following the NimbleGen SeqCap EZ Library LR User's guide  
127 (Roche NimbleGen, Madison, Wisconsin), and sequenced on an Illumina HiSeq X Ten  
128 platform producing 150 bp paired end reads. Raw reads were filtered using the software  
129 Trimmomatic v 0.36 (Bolger et al., 2014) with the parameters set as  
130 "ILLUMINACLIP:TruSeq3-PE.fa:2:30:10 LEADING:3 TRAILING:3  
131 SLIDINGWINDOW:4:15 MINLEN:36".

132

### 133 ***Single-copy Orthologues Identification***

134 Transcriptome assemblies of all five *Thuja* species plus one *Thujopsis dolabrata* accession  
135 were used to obtain single copy genes (SCGs, see Supplementary Materials). Contigs were  
136 assembled with default parameters using Trinity v 2.8.4 (Grabherr et al., 2011). Only the  
137 longest transcript was retained for each gene, and redundant contigs were further removed  
138 by CD-HIT. We used TransDecoder v 5.5.0 (Haas et al., 2013) to predict protein coding  
139 sequences. Peptide sequences of these six species were used in OrthoFinder v 2.3.11  
140 (Emms and Kelly, 2015; Emms and Kelly, 2019) to perform the orthogroup search. Only  
141 single-copy orthologues with a minimum of 300 bp present in all individuals were selected  
142 for subsequent analyses. This resulted in 5,786 single-copy nuclear genes in total.

143

### 144 ***Assembly of Captured Sequence, Alignment and Filtering***

145 We used HybPiper v 1.3.1 (Johnson et al., 2016) to assemble SCGs from capture sequenced  
146 quality-filtered reads. The sequences of the above identified 5,786 SCGs from each species

147 were used as target input file for HybPiper. The software MAFFT v 7.429 (Kato and  
148 Standley, 2013) was used to align amino acid (AA) sequences, and the corresponding  
149 codon alignments were converted from the AA alignments using PAL2NAL v 14.0  
150 (Suyama et al., 2006). Aligned loci with more than 20% missing data as well as individual  
151 DNA sequences with less than 300 bp or more than 50% gaps were removed. Only the  
152 filtered alignments which contained all individuals were retained.

153 Because recombination within loci might bias the inference of the species tree using  
154 coalescent methods (Morales-Briones et al., 2020), we further removed alignments  
155 showing a signal of recombination in the analyses using the coalescent model (i.e.,  
156 ASTRAL, MP-EST, and BPP; see below). We used PhiPack v 1.1 (Bruen et al., 2006) to  
157 calculate the pairwise homoplasy index  $\Phi$  for recombination, and a  $P$ -value of less than  
158 0.05 was treated as significant.

159

### 160 ***Phylogeny Reconstruction of Nuclear Genes***

161 We used a one-individual per species as well as a multi-individual per species data set to  
162 perform our analyses. The one individual dataset only included SCGs assembled from  
163 RNA-seq (five *Thuja* species plus one *Thujopsis* species ; six individuals/samples in total),  
164 while the multi-individual dataset included the sequences from the one individual dataset  
165 plus the SCGs from the HybPiper assembly, which sampled three to four accessions per  
166 species in *Thuja* and two individuals in *Thujopsis* (20 samples in total). The two data sets  
167 were used in different analyses, and if not stated otherwise, the one-individual dataset was  
168 adopted for most analyses.

169 Both maximum parsimony (MP) and maximum likelihood (ML) methods were used to  
170 reconstruct the phylogeny of *Thuja* based on concatenation approach. For the former, the  
171 SCGs were concatenated into a supermatrix, and the PAUP\* v4.0a (Wilgenbusch and  
172 Swofford, 2003) was used to reconstruct a MP tree. Node supports were assessed by 1000



173 bootstrap replications. For the ML method, the best partitioning scheme for each codon  
174 position in each gene was established with the software ModelFinder (Kalyaanamoorthy  
175 et al., 2017), which was then used to reconstruct a ML tree in IQ-TREE v 2.0.4 (Nguyen  
176 et al., 2015). We used the ultrafast bootstrap approximation method (Hoang et al., 2018) to  
177 assess branch supports by resampling partitions and then sites within resampled partitions  
178 with 1,000 replicates (-p -B 1000 --sampling GENESITE; Gadagkar et al., 2005).

179 We further used the coalescent-based approach to estimate the species tree. Gene trees  
180 for each SCGs were generated via IQ-TREE with 1,000 ultrafast bootstraps and  
181 ModelFinder (Kalyaanamoorthy et al., 2017) implemented in IQ-TREE was used to select  
182 the best-fitting substitution model (-B 1000 -m MFP). We used ASTRAL v 5.6.3 (Zhang et  
183 al., 2018) to infer the species trees for both data before and after removal of recombinant  
184 loci from multi-individual dataset (Rabiee et al., 2019), measuring branch supports as local  
185 posterior probabilities (LPP; Sayyari and Mirarab, 2016).

186

### 187 ***Phylogeny Reconstruction of Plastid Genomes***

188 We used the GetOrganelle v 1.7.4.1 (Jin et al., 2020) to get contigs for plastid genomes  
189 using six plastomes of *Thuja* and *Thujopsis* from NCBI GenBank (Qu et al., 2017; Adelalu  
190 et al., 2019; Adelalu et al., 2020) (Table S1) as the seed. Bowtie2 v 2.4.2 (Langmead and  
191 Salzberg, 2012) was used to map quality-filtered reads to the seed and recruit plastid-  
192 associated reads, and *de novo* assemblies were performed in SPAdes v 3.13.0 (Bankevich  
193 et al., 2012). Because tens of contigs were assembled for some individuals (Table S5), we  
194 reordered the assembled contigs in BWA-MEM algorithm v 0.7.17 (Li and Durbin, 2009)  
195 and extracted the consensus sequences in Geneious v 11.0.3 (Kearse et al., 2012) using the  
196 complete plastome of *T. plicata* (GenBank: KY290451; Adelalu et al., 2019) as the  
197 reference. The reordered contigs were aligned in MAFFT v 7.429 (Katoh and Standley,  
198 2013). The graph-based clustering method performed in the software Divvier v 1.01 (Ali

199 et al., 2019) was used to address uncertainties and errors in the multiple sequence  
200 alignments. Comparing to other programs, Divvier can keep more informative sites and  
201 have a maximum number of true positive (Ali et al., 2019). The MP method was conducted  
202 in PAUP\* v4.0a (Wilgenbusch and Swofford, 2003) with 1000 bootstrap replications, and  
203 the ML method was performed in IQ-TREE with 1000 ultrafast bootstraps. Two individuals  
204 (“*T. occidentalis* 5” and “*T. standishii* 4”; Table S1) downloaded from NCBI did not cluster  
205 with other individuals of the same species, which might due to hybridization,  
206 misidentification or other reasons. We removed the two samples for downstream analyses.  
207 Therefore, the final alignment of plastomes has 18 individuals from six species from the  
208 genera *Thuja* and *Thujopsis*, and each species contains 2–4 individuals (sequences). To  
209 measure concordance among individual sites for plastome data, we calculated the site  
210 concordance factors (sCF; Minh et al., 2020) implemented in IQ-TREE with 100 random  
211 quartets around each internal branch (--scf 100).

212

### 213 ***Species Network Analysis and Test of Hybridization***

214 We used PhyloNet v 3.8.2 (Wen et al., 2018) to reconstruct phylogenetic networks from  
215 gene trees under a maximum pseudo-likelihood based on the multi-individual dataset.  
216 PhyloNet is used to infer species phylogenies while accounting not only for ILS but also  
217 for processes such as hybridization, taking the possibility of missing taxa due to extinction  
218 or incomplete sampling into account. This is important for groups like the Tertiary relicts  
219 which have a substantial probability of extinction events. Due to computational restrictions,  
220 the maximum number of allowed reticulation events was set to 1, 2, and 3, with 100  
221 independent runs for each performed search to reach the global optimum of the likelihood  
222 (Cao et al., 2019). The optimum phylogenetic networks were visualized in Dendroscope  
223 (Huson and Scornavacca, 2012).

224 We then used the “CalcPopD” function in the R package “evobiR” v 1.3 (Blackmon and

225 Adams, 2015) to calculate Patterson’s  $D$  (Green et al., 2010; Durand et al., 2011) and the  
226 associated  $Z$ -scores for all possible four-taxon combinations in the same order as in the  
227 ASTRAL species tree using the multi-individual dataset. The jackknife method was used  
228 to calculate the statistical significance of Patterson’s  $D$  for each combination with 100  
229 replicates and a block size of 10,000 bp.

230

### 231 ***Concordance, ILS Simulations and Detecting the Anomaly Zone***

232 To test for concordance among gene trees and species trees, we first calculated the  
233 percentage of quartets of the internal branches using ASTRAL (Mirarab et al., 2014) with  
234 the parameter “-t 2”. Individual gene trees were then mapped to the species tree estimated  
235 in ASTRAL to count the number of gene trees supporting/conflicting each clade, and  
236 estimated the “Internode Certainty All (ICA)” scores for each internode, using the software  
237 *phyparts* v 0.01 (Smith et al., 2015). The ICA scores reflect the degree of certainty for a  
238 given internode by considering the frequency of the bipartition defined by the internode in  
239 a given set of trees in conjunction with that of all conflicting bipartitions in the same  
240 underlying tree set (Salichos et al., 2014). ICA values near to 1 represent a strong  
241 concordance for a given internode, while ICA value close to 0 indicate nearly equal  
242 supports of one or more conflicting bipartitions. Negative ICA values indicate that the  
243 conflicting bipartitions have higher frequencies. Finally, gene trees were converted to  
244 ultrametric trees using the R package “ape” v 5.4 (Paradis et al., 2004), and visualized in  
245 *DensiTree* v 2.2.5 (Bouckaert, 2010).

246 An anomaly zone is defined as a pair of internal branches in species trees that will  
247 generate gene trees that are discordant with the species tree more often than gene trees that  
248 are concordant (Degnan and Rosenberg, 2006). The anomaly zone is usually caused by  
249 rapid speciation events in combination with large effective population sizes (Linkem et al.,  
250 2016; Kapli et al., 2020). We calculated equation 4 from Degnan and Rosenberg (2006)

251 using the script provided by Linkem et al. (2016), to examine the anomaly zone in the  
252 ASTRAL species tree.

253 To evaluate ILS within *Thuja*, we used both DNA and protein sequences from the one-  
254 individual dataset. We conducted coalescent simulations to examine if ILS alone can  
255 explain the gene tree discordance and cytonuclear incongruence, using the pipelines of  
256 Mirarab et al. (2014) and Folk et al. (2017). We used MP-EST v 2.0 (Liu et al., 2010) to  
257 estimate species trees with branch lengths in coalescent units using both all and non-  
258 recombination loci. We first simulated gene trees in Dendropy v 4.4.0 (Sukumaran and  
259 Holder, 2010) using the “contained\_coalescent\_tree” function with the MP-EST trees as  
260 guide trees. A total of 100 simulations were performed, and each simulation produced the  
261 same number of estimated gene trees as did the observed gene tree in the one-individual  
262 dataset. We then calculated Robinson-Foulds (RF) distances between the species trees and  
263 each simulated or observed gene trees using the Python package ETE3 v 3.1.2 (Huerta-  
264 Cepas et al., 2016).

265 To infer if ILS is a source of cytonuclear discordance, we then simulated gene trees under  
266 the coalescence model of an organelle genome. We scaled branch lengths of the MP-EST  
267 trees by a factor two to account for organellar inheritance in monoecious plants (Rogalski  
268 et al., 2015) and generated 20,000 organellar gene trees under the coalescent model with  
269 Dendropy. If ILS is the main source of cytonuclear discordance, we can expect to find a  
270 high frequency of plastid-like topologies in the simulated data.

271

### 272 ***Molecular Dating and Multispecies Coalescent Analysis***

273 As there are only six species in the *Thuja-Thujaopsis* clade, few fossils can be used to  
274 calibrate node ages, which could result in a biased estimation of molecular dates (Linder  
275 et al., 2005; Wang and Mao, 2016). Therefore, we extended our sampling scheme to be  
276 able to include more calibration fossils. The extended sampling covered 16 Cupressaceae

277 species (Table S1). The single-copy genes were identified using the same pipeline as  
278 described above, and only the 1st and 2nd codon positions for nuclear genes were used in  
279 this analysis. We selected the three fossil calibration points used in Mao et al. (2012), plus  
280 one newly discovered fossil record of *Chamaecyparis* (Xu et al., 2018), and three  
281 secondary calibration points (Table S2). We conducted dating analyses using the program  
282 MCMCTree in PAML v 4.9i (Yang, 2007). The package BASEML was used to estimate  
283 the overall substitution rate under the GTR model (model=7). The divergence time between  
284 *Sequoiadendron giganteum* and *Thuja* was assumed as ~183 Ma (Mao et al., 2012), which  
285 resulted in a substitution rate per time unit (100 Ma) of 0.0225. Therefore, the parameter  
286 “rgene\_gamma” was set as “G(1, 44.38)”, and the parameter “sigma2\_gamma” was set as  
287 “G(1, 10, 1)”. We applied a burn in of 20,000,000, and sampled 50,000,000 generations  
288 with a sample frequency of every 2,000 generations. The effective sample size (ESS) for  
289 each parameter was verified by ESS >200 using Tracer v 1.7.1 to make sure that the MCMC  
290 have reached convergence (Rambaut et al., 2018).

291 We further employed the Bayesian program BPP v 4.2.9 (Flouri et al., 2018) to estimate  
292 coalescent processes within *Thuja* using the multi-individual dataset as an additional  
293 analysis of divergence times. Using a large data set of 2,369 loci for 20 individuals would  
294 increase the computational cost in BPP. Therefore, we only used the no-recombination loci  
295 for coalescent inference, which is more than sufficient to get a reliable inference.

296 Firstly, we used the multispecies coalescent (MSC) model to estimate relative node ages  
297 ( $\tau$ ) and nucleotide diversity ( $\theta$ ) based on a fixed species phylogeny inferred by ASTRAL.  
298 Secondly, we inferred cross-species gene flow in *Thuja* under the multispecies-coalescent-  
299 with-introgression (MSci) model (Flouri et al., 2020) performed in BPP based on the  
300 network inferred in PhyloNet when the reticulation event was set to 1. Using the MSci  
301 model, we can calculate the number, timings, and intensities of introgression events, as  
302 well as the current and ancestral genetic diversity. The full-likelihoods were calculated for

303 both the MSC and MSci models, and the likelihood ratio test (LRT) was used to compare  
304 them. For both models, the divergence time between *Thuja* and *Thujopsis* was calibrated  
305 based on the result of MCMCTree.

306 We also used MSC model performed in BPP to infer species divergence times and  
307 population size parameters for plastid DNA. As evidences of plastome recombination had  
308 been reported for some conifers (Marshall et al., 2001; Sullivan et al., 2017), different  
309 plastome fragments of *Thuja* could have experienced different evolutionary histories.  
310 Therefore, we first used the full sequences from the plastome alignment, by treating the  
311 plastome as a single locus, to measure the divergence times and the genetic diversities.  
312 Then, we divided the full plastome alignment into 68 plastome fragments with 2000 bp in  
313 length and 75 plastid coding genes to infer plastome coalescent processes respectively,  
314 assuming that each 2-kp plastome segment or coding gene experienced independent  
315 evolutionary history. The parameters were set the same as the above.

316

### 317 ***Ancestral Area Reconstruction***

318 We used the BioGeoBEARS v 1.1.1 packages (Matzke, 2013) as implemented in RASP v  
319 4.2 (Yu et al., 2020) to estimate the ancestral ranges and biogeographical history of *Thuja*.  
320 We assigned three geographic areas to the tips of the tree according to distributions of  
321 extant and fossil species: A, Asia; B, Western North America; C, Eastern North America  
322 plus Greenland (Table S3). We tested the three models (DIVALIKE, DEC, and  
323 BAYAREALIKE; Matzke, 2014) implemented in BioGeoBEARS, and the corrected  
324 Akaike Information Criterion (AICc) was used to select the best model. Because the  
325 founder event speciation (+*J* parameter) has been controversial (Ree and Sanmartín, 2018;  
326 Matzke, 2021), we made model comparisons by using the +*J* parameter or without it.  
327 According to the geological evidence (Tiffney and Manchester, 2001), the dispersal  
328 probability matrix (Table S3) was coded for four time periods, 0–4.7, 4.7–45, 45–60, 60–

329 65 Ma, following Zhou et al. (2020). To better represent the ancestral biogeographical  
330 ranges, four fossil species were further incorporated in our biogeographical analysis (see  
331 Supplementary Materials). We used the R function “Fossil.graft”  
332 (<https://github.com/evolucionario/fossilgraft>; Claramunt and Cracraft, 2015) to add the  
333 fossil species to the time-calibrated tree, as terminal tips. The relationships between fossil  
334 and extant species were based on the phylogenetic relationships and morphological  
335 similarities reconstructed in previous studies (McIver and Basinger, 1989; LePage, 2003;  
336 Cui et al., 2015).

337

## 338 **Results**

### 339 ***Gene assembly and filtering***

340 We first identified 5,786 single-copy genes (SCGs) using transcriptome data from five  
341 *Thuja* species and one *Thujopsis* accession (outgroup), where each species was represented  
342 by one individual (one-individual dataset). We then generated a multi-individual dataset  
343 (20 accessions, including 3 to 4 samples per *Thuja* species) by adding data from target  
344 enrichment sequencing. The number of quality-filtered reads per sample ranged from 13.05  
345 million to 53.45 million with an average of 33.58 million, and more than 4,000 genes were  
346 assembled into contigs with sequences >25% of the target length (Table S4). After filtering,  
347 the one-individual dataset consisted of 5,663 single-copy genes, while 2,969 of them were  
348 retained after removal of recombinant loci. The multi-individual dataset consisted of 2,369  
349 loci, and 1,145 of them were non-recombination loci.

350

### 351 ***Phylogenetic Inference***

352 Based on the all 2,369 loci from the multi-individual dataset, we used both MP and ML  
353 approaches to reconstruct species trees using PAUP and IQ-TREE based on a concatenated  
354 supermatrix. The two approaches supported the same interspecific relationships within

355 *Thuja* (Figures 1a, S1–S3). We further reconstruct an ASTRAL species tree based on the  
356 coalescent-based approach using both all loci and only non-recombination loci. In all  
357 analyses, *T. sutchuenensis* and *T. standishii* formed a well-supported clade [MP bootstrap  
358 percentage (BP)=79, ML BP=100, local posterior probabilities (LPP)=1; Figures 1a,  
359 S1–S4], here termed the “EA clade”. This clade was sister to a “disjunct clade”, with a  
360 strongly supported *T. koraiensis*-*T. occidentalis* (EA-ENA; BP=100, LPP=1)) relationship  
361 which in turn was sister to *T. plicata* (WNA; BP=100, LPP=1; Figures 1a, S1–S4).

362 The conflict analyses showed a high level of gene tree discordance within *Thuja*. The  
363 gene tree quartet supports for the alternatives with the species-level branches are  
364 comparable to those in the main topologies (Figure 1a). The ICA scores also showed high  
365 discordance among individual gene trees. Of the 2,369 gene trees, only 245 supported the  
366 sister relationship between *T. occidentalis* and *T. koraiensis* (ICA = 0.097), 175 supported  
367 *T. plicata* as sister to *T. occidentalis*-*T. koraiensis* (ICA = -0.099), and 279 supported *T.*  
368 *standishii* and *T. sutchuenensis* clustering together (ICA = 0.104; Figure 1a).

369

### 370 ***Plastid Phylogeny of Thuja***

371 The number of contigs assembled in GetOrganelle ranged from 1 to 17, and the assembled  
372 sizes range from 110,224 bp in “*T. plicata* 2” to 130,843 bp in “*T. occidentalis* 2” (Table  
373 S5). The final alignment contains 18 sequences (representing 6 species) with 131,017  
374 columns, containing 3,689 parsimony-informative sites, 208 singleton sites, and 127,120  
375 constant sites. The plastid phylogenies using both ML and MP methods differed from the  
376 nuclear analysis at one node: the WNA species *T. plicata* had a well-supported (ML BP=89,  
377 MP BP = 99; Figures 1b, S5–S6) sister relationship to *T. sutchuenensis*-*T. standishii* in the  
378 plastid tree, while a strongly supported (MP BP=100, ML BP=100, LPP=1) sister  
379 relationship to *T. occidentalis*-*T. koraiensis* was suggested in both the ASTRAL and the  
380 concatenated nuclear species trees. Most nodes represented high levels of concordances



381 between individual site and the plastid tree (gCF>60; Figure 1b). The plastomes of *T.*  
382 *plicata* showed chimeric DNA polymorphisms and a low site concordance factor. Only  
383 45.6% of decisive alignment sites supporting the branch containing *T. plicata* and *T.*  
384 *sutchuenensis-T. standishii* (sCF=45.6; Figure 1b), and 36.37% supporting *T. plicata* sister  
385 to *T. occidentalis-T. koraiensis* clade (Figure 1b).

386

### 387 ***Network Analysis and Gene Flow***

388 Up to three hybridization events among the clades of *Thuja* were examined in PhyloNet.  
389 One reticulation event, in which gene flow from a “ghost” ancestral *Thuja* lineage to the  
390 ancestors of *T. sutchuenensis*, was detected in all three examinations (Figures 2a–c and  
391 S7a–c), with *T. sutchuenensis* having an inheritance probability of ~4.9% from the that  
392 “ghost” lineage. None of the three possible networks supported introgression events  
393 between *T. plicata* and either *T. sutchuenensis* or *T. standishii* (Figures 2 and S7). In  
394 addition, the *D* statistics analysis, which tests for signals of gene flow, detected significant  
395 gene flow between *T. plicata* and *T. standishii*, but not between *T. plicata* and *T.*  
396 *sutchuenensis*. Taken overall, these results suggested that hybridization is unlikely to be  
397 the cause of the cytonuclear discordance. However, the *D*-statistics-based analyses also  
398 provided evidence of frequent gene flow in the genus *Thuja* (Figures 2d and S7d), which  
399 suggests that hybridization have contributed to a part of the phylogenetic discordance  
400 among nuclear gene trees.

401

### 402 ***Simulations of ILS and Tests of the Anomaly Zone***

403 We first inferred an MP-EST tree, which recovered identical topologies to the ASTRAL  
404 tree, based on all 5,663 loci from one-individual data set, and used it as a guide to simulate  
405 gene trees under ILS. A total of 100 simulations were performed, and each simulation  
406 generated the same number of gene trees as in the real data (5,663 gene trees). The

407 distributions of the Robinson-Foulds (RF) distances of the simulated and observed gene  
408 trees compared to the species tree from the one-individual dataset largely overlapped  
409 (Figures 3c, S6 and S7), suggesting that ILS can account for most of the gene tree  
410 discordance (Wang et al., 2018). We also used the dataset after removal of recombination  
411 loci and rerun the ILS simulation, which conducted a similar result as the all loci did  
412 (Figures S8–S10; Table S7). A pair of internodes on the ASTRAL species tree was in the  
413 anomaly zone (orange and blue nodes in Figures 3e and 8e), indicating that these nodes  
414 might have experienced rapid speciation events.

415 Of the 20,000 simulated plastid gene trees, the two most common topologies were  
416 consistent with the observed nuclear species tree (1468 trees, 7.34%), followed by the same  
417 topology as the observed plastid tree (928 trees, 4.64%; Tables S6 and S7). In total, 1,965  
418 trees contained a clade comprising *T. plicata*+*T. sutchuenensis*-*T. standishii*, with various  
419 tree topologies (Figures 3f and 8f). Reticulate evolution due to hybridization should not  
420 produce variation in the plastid tree topology, indicating that the inconsistency among  
421 organellar and species trees is likely to be due to the ILS.

422

### 423 ***Divergence Dating and Multispecies Coalescent Analysis***

424 According to the MCMCTree, the stem age of *Thuja* (divergence from *Thujopsis*) was  
425 estimated to be 62.68 million years ago [Ma; early Paleogene, 95% highest posterior  
426 density (HPD): 58.61–73.77 Ma; Figure 4], and the crown age was 23.96 Ma (95% HPD:  
427 19.39–29.43Ma), which corresponds to the Paleogene-Neogene boundary. Furthermore, *T.*  
428 *sutchuenensis* diverged from *T. standishii* about 20.05 Ma (95% HPD: 15.6–25.35 Ma),  
429 and the crown age of the clade containing *T. plicata* and *T. occidentalis*-*T. koraiensis* was  
430 estimated to be 22.09 Ma (95% HPD: 17.61–27.44 Ma). The EA-ENA disjunct pair *T.*  
431 *occidentalis* and *T. koraiensis* was estimated to be 19.55 Ma (95% HPD: 15.19–24.79 Ma;  
432 Figure 4).

433 The result of the likelihood ratio test strongly favored the MSci model over the MSC  
434 model [ $2(\ln L_1 - \ln L_0) = 152.24$ ;  $P$ -value $<0.001$ ; Figure 5], which supported a “ghost  
435 introgression” event. As both models yielded similar parameter estimates (Figure 5), we  
436 used the MSci estimates because of the higher likelihood of this model. The BPP analysis  
437 gave a  $\tau = 0.004633$  (Tables S8 and S9) for the stem age of *Thuja*, corresponding to 62.68  
438 Ma from the MCMCTree. The “ghost” ancestral *Thuja* lineage diverged from the common  
439 ancestor of all extant *Thuja* species about 54.82 Ma (95% HPD: 51.63–57.60 Ma;  
440  $\tau=0.004246$ ), and the estimate of the introgression event was dated to about 19.50 Ma (95%  
441 HPD: 18.70–20.28 Ma;  $\tau=0.001519$ ). BPP and MCMCTree yielded very similar results in  
442 terms of the crown age for *Thuja* and the divergence time between *T. sutchuenensis* and *T.*  
443 *standishii* (Figures 4 and 5). The main difference between the two analyses is the age  
444 estimates of the disjunct EA-ENA clade: the crown age inferred by BPP (~15 Ma; Figure  
445 5) was younger than the one inferred by MCMCTree (~22.09 Ma; Figure 4). Similarly, the  
446 divergence time of the EA-ENA disjunct *T. occidentalis*-*T. koraiensis* clade was estimated  
447 by BPP to have occurred about 14.82 Ma (95% HPD: 14.12–15.53 Ma; Figure 5b), which  
448 contrasts with the MCMCTree divergence age estimate of ~19.55 Ma (Figure 4).

449 The population size parameter ( $\theta$ ) of the extant species ranged from  $\theta=0.00192$  (95%  
450 HPD: 0.001812–0.002021; *T. plicata*) to 0.00492 (95% HPD: 0.004596–0.005265; *T.*  
451 *standishii*), with much higher estimates for the respective ancestral lineages, which was  
452 supported by the coalescent processes inferred by the plastomes (Figure S11). Specifically,  
453  $\theta$  of the ancestral population of the disjunct clade (*T. plicata* sister to *T. sutchuenensis*-*T.*  
454 *standishii*;  $\theta=0.0313$ , 95% HPD: 0.024183–0.038557) was about 10 times higher than the  
455 current population size estimate ( $\theta=0.00192$ –0.00295). The introgression probability was  
456 estimated to be 0.2 (95% HPD: 0.16–0.24; Figure 5), suggesting that ~20% of the nuclear  
457 genome of *T. sutchuenensis* is derived from a “ghost” basal *Thuja* lineage.

#### 458 ***Ancestral Area Reconstruction***

459 Without fossil taxa, model tests performed in BioGeoBEARS suggested that the DEC  
460 model was better than all other models (Tables S10 and S11). When including the fossil  
461 taxa, the DIVALIKE+*J* model was the best one among all six models, and the DEC model  
462 performed better than either the DIVALIKE or BAYAREALIKE model (Tables S12 and  
463 S13). From the DEC models, the distribution ranges of the most recent common ancestor  
464 (MRCA) of all living species of *Thuja* and the disjunct clade most likely occurred in East  
465 Asia + North America (ABC; Figures 6b and d). The results from the biogeographical  
466 analysis including the fossil species showed that the ancestral range of *Thuja* (comprising  
467 all fossil and living species) is likely to be the eastern North America (C; Figure 6c and d),  
468 suggesting a North American origin of the genus *Thuja*. Using the DIVALIKE+*J* model,  
469 the ancestor of extant *Thuja* species most likely originated in East Asia, and then dispersed  
470 to East Asia + western North America, with subsequent diversification due to vicariance  
471 (A->AB->A|B; Figure 6c).

472

## 473 **Discussion**

### 474 ***Thuja Phylogenomics and Discordance of Gene Trees***

475 We used more than 2,000 loci to estimate a species-level phylogeny of the Tertiary relict  
476 genus *Thuja*. Our analyses strongly supported the sister relationship of the EA-ENA  
477 disjunct species pair *T. occidentalis*-*T. koraiensis*, with a WNA *T. plicata* as sister to this  
478 clade (disjunct clade; Figure 1a). The remaining two EA species *T. standishii* and *T.*  
479 *sutchensis* were clustered in a separate clade (EA clade) which was sister to the disjunct  
480 clade. The EA clade was also recovered by previous phylogenies based on nrDNA ITS (Li  
481 and Xiang, 2005) and two different low-copy nuclear genes (Peng and Wang, 2008),  
482 however, with different disjunct clade topologies, where either a sister relationship between  
483 *T. plicata* and *T. koraiensis* (ITS and 4CL) or *T. plicata* and *T. occidentalis* (*LEAFY*) were  
484 supported. The main uncertainty in previous studies was the phylogenetic position of *T.*

485 *occidentalis*. The nrDNA ITS tree supported a sister relationship between *T. occidentalis*  
486 and *T. standishii*-*T. sutchensis* (Li and Xiang, 2005), and in the *LEAFY* gene tree (Peng  
487 and Wang, 2008), *T. occidentalis* is a sister species to *T. plicata*, while the basal position of  
488 *T. occidentalis* was supported in the *4CL* gene tree (Peng and Wang, 2008). None of the  
489 previous phylogenies supported the sister relationship of *T. occidentalis*-*T. koraiensis*,  
490 which indicates that using only a few loci cannot resolve the phylogenetic relationship  
491 within *Thuja*.

492 Our phylogenomic analyses showed that there was a very high level of discordance  
493 among individual gene trees and the species trees. Gene tree heterogeneity is commonly  
494 explained by deep coalescent processes such as incomplete lineage sorting (ILS) or  
495 hybridization (Olave et al., 2018). We first examined hybridization as a possible cause of  
496 discordance using a pseudo-likelihood approach performed in PhyloNet and the *D*-  
497 statistics test. A strong signal of interspecific gene flow between most *Thuja* lineages was  
498 detected (Figure 2), indicating that hybridization could have caused the gene tree and  
499 species tree discordance. However, both the PhyloNet and *D*-Statistic test detected little  
500 introgression in *T. occidentalis*, indicating that the uncertain placement of this species in  
501 previous studies (Li and Xiang, 2005; Peng and Wang, 2008) is unlikely to be explained  
502 by hybridization. The alternative explanation, ILS, is likely to apply to species that  
503 diverged during rapid speciation events and/or had large population sizes (Flouri et al.,  
504 2018). Our simulation analysis showed that the distribution of tree-to-tree distances of  
505 simulated and observed gene trees to the species tree largely overlapped, indicating that  
506 ILS alone could explain most of the gene tree discordance (Figures 3b–c, S8–S10). Testing  
507 for anomalous zones in the species tree highlighted two internodes which generated gene  
508 trees that are discordant with the species tree more often than gene trees that are concordant.  
509 Three species, *T. plicata*, *T. occidentalis* and *T. koraiensis*, were involved in this anomaly  
510 zone. Moreover, the multispecies coalescent analysis hinted at very high levels of DNA

511 polymorphism in the most recent common ancestor (MRCA) of these three species (Figure  
512 5), which might have contributed to incomplete lineage sorting. Therefore, the most likely  
513 explanation for the inconsistent placement of *T. occidentalis* inferred from different loci in  
514 previous studies is ILS, which might have also been facilitated by large ancestral  
515 population sizes.

516

### 517 ***Cytonuclear Discordance as further Evidence for ILS***

518 The reason for the inconsistent position of *T. plicata* in phylogenies based on nuclear and  
519 plastid data has long been debated. Peng and Wang (2008) found a high level of site  
520 discordance for the phylogenetic position of *T. plicata*. A total of 15 parsimony-informative  
521 sites were obtained from 5,099 bp plastid DNA alignment, and eight of them were shared  
522 between *T. plicata* and *T. sutchensis-T. standishii* clade, while six sites shared between  
523 *T. plicata* and the clade containing *T. koraiensis-T. occidentalis* (Peng and Wang, 2008).  
524 Our cpDNA phylogeny based on plastome alignment resolved *T. plicata* as sister to the *T.*  
525 *sutchensis-T. standishii* pair with a high level of individual site conflict (sCF=45.6;  
526 Figure 1b), and *T. plicata* has a chimeric plastome, confirming earlier results based on five  
527 cpDNA regions by Peng and Wang (2008).

528 In contrast, our nuclear analysis (ASTRAL tree) suggested a position of *T. plicata* as  
529 sister to the ENA-EA disjunct *T. occidentalis-T. koraiensis* group. Cytonuclear discordance  
530 could result from either ILS or hybridization (especially organellar introgression). However,  
531 only a few studies have provided evidence for ILS (Wang et al., 2018; Stull et al., 2020),  
532 suggesting that hybridization is the more common cause of cytonuclear discordance (Folk  
533 et al., 2017; Lee-Yaw et al., 2019; Li et al., 2020; Wang et al., 2021). The organelle genome  
534 is uniparentally inherited, therefore its effective population size is one-quarter in dioecious  
535 species and one half in monoecious species (like *Thuja*) of the nuclear autosomes (Rogalski  
536 et al., 2015). Haplotypes of plastid genes are therefore expected to have a higher rate of

537 genetic drift and a lower level of ILS compared to nuclear genes (Hamilton, 2009; Sloan  
538 et al., 2017).

539 Here, we tried to distinguish between hybridization and ILS, using a coalescent  
540 simulation under the model of an organellar gene tree. The simulations produced a large  
541 proportion of simulated organellar gene trees which were consistent with the observed  
542 plastid tree (4.64%, Tables S5 and S6). As relicts from the Tertiary, the ancestors of all  
543 living *Thuja* species were estimated to have large population sizes of either nuclear DNA  
544 (Figure 5) or plastid DNA (Figure S11), indicating that a phylogeny based on plastid genes  
545 might be greatly affected by the incomplete sorting of ancient polymorphism. Although a  
546 signature of hybridization was detected between *T. plicata* and *T. sutchuenensis*, ILS alone  
547 can explain the observed cytonuclear discordance, suggesting that the effect of ILS on the  
548 organellar phylogeny is greater than previously thought.

549

#### 550 ***“Ghost Introgression” into T. sutchuenensis***

551 The phylogenetic position of *T. sutchuenensis* has puzzled taxonomists for a long time. The  
552 southwestern China endemic *T. sutchuenensis* had been listed as being extinct in the wild  
553 until it was rediscovered in 1999 (Xiang et al., 2002). In a phylogeny of fossil and extant  
554 species based on seed cone morphology, *T. sutchuenensis* was grouped in a clade with *T.*  
555 *ehrenswaerdii*, a fossil species known from the Paleocene sediments of Greenland  
556 (Schweitzer, 1974); this clade was sister to all other *Thuja* (McIver and Basinger, 1989).  
557 However, molecular studies did not suggest an ancestral position of *T. sutchuenensis* (Li  
558 and Xiang, 2005; Peng and Wang, 2008; Adelalu et al., 2020). We reconstructed the  
559 reticular evolutionary history of *Thuja* in PhyloNet, allowing for the existence of missing  
560 taxa due to incomplete sampling and/or extinction. Our results suggested gene flow from  
561 an ancestral *Thuja* “ghost lineage” into *T. sutchuenensis* (Figures 2a–c), indicating that the  
562 ancestor-like characters of *T. sutchuenensis* are most likely derived from an extinct

563 ancestral lineage via introgression (“ghost lineage”). This is supported by the results of the  
564 BPP analysis which showed that ~20% (95% HPD: 16%–24%) of the nuclear genome of  
565 *T. sutchuenensis* (Figure 5b) was derived from an ancient lineage of *Thuja* that is now  
566 extinct. The analysis indicated that the “ghost lineage” originated in the late Paleocene  
567 approximately 57.44 Ma (95% HPD: 54.26–60.47 Ma; Figure 5), and then hybridized with  
568 the ancestor populations of *T. sutchuenensis* in the early Miocene (19.63–21.42 Ma; Figure  
569 5), when the global climate was still warm and humid. The effective population size of both  
570 the “ghost lineage” ( $\theta_{sl}=0.001062$ ; 95% HPD: 0.0053–0.01745; Figure 5b) and the  
571 ancestral population of *T. sutchuenensis* ( $\theta_{sr}=0.0185$ ; Figure 5b) were relatively large.  
572 Therefore, *T. sutchuenensis* was expected to have a wider distribution range in the past than  
573 today, which might have increased the chances of contact and interbreeding. It is possible  
574 that the genes coding for the unusual morphological traits of *T. sutchuenensis* were derived  
575 from this “ghost lineage”. This “ghost lineage” might be related to the fossil species *T.*  
576 *ehrenswaerdii*, which was found in the Paleocene sediments of Greenland (Schweitzer,  
577 1974).

578 Until recently, gene flow from extinct taxa could only be detected via extraction of DNA  
579 from fossils, which has only been possible in a few groups such as hominids (Green et al.,  
580 2010; Prüfer et al., 2014) and mammoths (van der Valk et al., 2021). In recent years, due  
581 to the development of new molecular methods (Wang et al., 2018; Kuhlwilm et al., 2019),  
582 a growing number of taxa such as *Phylloscopus* (Zhang et al., 2019), *Canis*  
583 (Gopalakrishnan et al., 2018; Wang et al., 2020), *Pan* (Kuhlwilm et al., 2019), *Picea* (Ru  
584 et al., 2018) and *Oxyria* (Luo et al., 2017), have been reported to show “ghost introgression”  
585 using genomic data. It is therefore likely that “ghost introgression” is more common than  
586 previously thought and may have played an important role in shaping the evolution of  
587 extant species (Taylor and Larson, 2019; Zhang et al., 2019). Because Tertiary relict floras  
588 are characterized by once extensive distributions subsequently contracted due to climate



589 change leading to local and regional extinctions (Milne and Abbott, 2002; Milne, 2006), it  
590 is likely that some of the extant species coexisted with now-extinct lineages for a long time  
591 during their evolutionary histories. These floras are hence strong candidates for “ghost  
592 introgression” and the possibility should be tested in future biogeographic analysis of  
593 Tertiary relict floras.

594

### 595 ***Biogeographic history of Thuja points to ILS***

596 The discovery of two unambiguous *Thuja* fossils with reproductive organs, i.e., *T. polaris*  
597 and *T. ehrenswaerdii* (Schweitzer, 1974; McIver and Basinger, 1989), from the Paleocene  
598 in the Canadian Arctic, suggests that the genus *Thuja* might have originated in higher  
599 latitudes of North America. We included these two fossil species in our biogeographic  
600 analysis which suggested that *Thuja* diverged from *Thujopsis* around 62.68 Ma and that  
601 this genus originated in North America. An even earlier fossil from the late Cretaceous  
602 discovered in Alaska (LePage, 2003) further supports an origin in northern North America.  
603 After the Paleocene, climatic optima during the early and middle Eocene (Zachos et al.,  
604 2008) supported the development of a circumboreal flora with warm temperate to tropical  
605 elements (Azuma et al., 2001; Milne, 2006). The ancestral populations of *Thuja* probably  
606 dispersed to large parts of East Asia and North America during this time period. The rich  
607 fossil record of *Thuja* from the late Cretaceous to the Pleistocene in the Northern  
608 Hemisphere further supports the hypothesis that this genus once had a wider distribution  
609 (LePage, 2003; Taberlet and Luikart, 2008; Cui et al., 2015).

610 The crown age of extant *Thuja* species was estimated to be 23.96 Ma (95% HPD:  
611 19.39–29.43 Ma; Figure 6) and its ancestral area was inferred to be widespread in East  
612 Asia and North America (Figure 6). This suggests that *Thuja* has experienced further  
613 diversification in the higher latitudes of the Northern Hemisphere during the late Paleogene  
614 or early Neogene, when it might have formed two separate clades. One clade (EA clade)

615 occurred in eastern Asia where it diversified into two lineages (*T. standishii* and *T.*  
616 *sutchuenensis*) approximately 20.05 Ma (95% HPD: 15.6–25.35 Ma; Figure 5). An arid  
617 belt located in northern China constitutes an important barrier that impedes migration  
618 between northeastern and southeastern Asia (Milne and Abbott, 2002) and has been in  
619 existence from the Eocene on (Tiffney and Manchester, 2001; Guo et al., 2008). *Thuja*  
620 *standishii* and *T. sutchuenensis* occur on either side of that belt, and so it might have  
621 facilitated their divergence during the early Miocene

622 The other clade (disjunct clade) includes three species (*T. occidentalis*, *T. plicata* and  
623 *T. koraiensis*) that occur in ENA, WNA and EA, respectively, with a strongly supported  
624 EA-ENA disjunct sister species relationship of *T. occidentalis*-*T. koraiensis* (Figure 1a).  
625 Like the MRCA of *Thuja*, the ancestors of this clade had a widespread range across North  
626 America and Asia. While many EA-ENA disjunct pairs arose via extinction of widespread  
627 ancestors in WNA and Europe due to climatic cooling (Tiffney, 1985b; Tiffney, 1985a;  
628 Wen, 1999; Zhang et al., 2021), the *T. occidentalis*-*T. koraiensis* pair has an extant sister  
629 taxon in WNA (*T. plicata*). The EA-ENA disjunction may therefore reflect the sequence of  
630 diversification within this clade. Our results also indicated that the MRCA of this disjunct  
631 clade might have experienced a rapid radiation within a narrow time window of less than  
632 one million years that gave rise to the three species (Figure 5). Moreover, coalescent  
633 analysis indicates that the MRCA of the disjunct clade had a very large ancestral population  
634 size (Figure 5). Therefore, the close relationship of the EA-ENA disjunct pair might be the  
635 result of stochastic processes after a radiative speciation event in a relatively short time  
636 period (~0.8 Ma; Figure 5). Consistent with this, our coalescent analyses suggested that  
637 ILS is prominent in *Thuja* (Figure 3), especially within the disjunct clade, which also forms  
638 an anomaly zone (Figure 3e). The diversification of this clade occurred around (14.71–)  
639 15.60–22.09 (–27.44) Ma depending on analysis method (Figures 4 and 5b), roughly  
640 corresponding to the Mid-Miocene Climatic Optimum (Zachos et al., 2008). This clade's

641 MRCA was likely widespread across North America and East Asia, and the Mid-Miocene  
642 Climatic Optimum might have facilitated the diversification due to new ecological niches  
643 on different continents, which in turn facilitated the rapid speciation of the disjunct clade.  
644 Alternatively, progressive cooling of the global climate from ~15 Ma onwards (Zachos et  
645 al., 2001; Milne and Abbott, 2002), might have forced speciation via formation of  
646 geographical/climatic barriers that separated EA, ENA and WNA (Azani et al., 2019). Both  
647 mechanisms might have contributed to this speciation event, separating one large  
648 continuous population into three smaller ones within a short timescale. This would allow  
649 for ILS, and therefore it is possible that the EA-ENA species pair, *T. occidentalis* and *T.*  
650 *koraiensis*, by chance became fixed for a similar set of genetic variation compared to the  
651 WNA species *T. plicata*, resulting in the EA-ENA disjunction.

652

### 653 **Conclusion**

654 Summarizing, we used more than 2,000 loci and integrated fossilized taxa in our analysis  
655 to reconstruct the evolutionary history of the small Tertiary relict genus *Thuja* which is well  
656 known for its EA-ENA disjunction. The most common ancestor of the genus diversified  
657 into five living species in a short time period of ca. 3.5 million years according to  
658 multispecies coalescent analysis, with the three members of the disjunct clade diversifying  
659 over a narrow time window of just ~0.8 million years. Multispecies coalescent and  
660 simulation studies revealed that ancient lineages of *Thuja* had large population sizes, which  
661 might have contributed, together with rapid divergence, to ILS, especially in the disjunct  
662 clade. This could be the underlying cause for much of the conflict among gene trees and  
663 the cytonuclear discordance which have puzzled systematists of this genus for a long time.  
664 However, “ghost introgression” from extinct species might also have contributed to the  
665 discordance among gene trees and could have left a signature in the morphology of *T.*  
666 *sutchuenensis*: we found that ~20% of the nuclear genome of *T. sutchuenensis* is derived

667 from a “ghost lineage” ancestral to *Thuja*, which might explain the close resemblance of  
668 its cone morphology to that of an ancient fossil species. Overall, our study revealed a  
669 complex evolutionary history of a small and disjunct Tertiary relict genus, involving ILS,  
670 hybridization and extinction. It also demonstrates that phylogenies based on a few genes  
671 might not be able to resolve the biogeographic history of disjunct taxa accurately. Genomic  
672 data are therefore needed to reveal the complex history of intercontinental disjunct taxa.

673

#### 674 **Acknowledgements**

675 We thank Prof. Yuanwen Duan for assistances with sample collection. We thank Royal  
676 Botanic Garden Edinburgh for providing dried herbarium and living materials. This study  
677 is financially supported by National Science Foundation of China (grant No. U20A2080,  
678 31622015) and Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities (SCU2020D003,  
679 SCU2021D006). The Royal Botanic Garden Edinburgh is supported by the Scottish  
680 Government’s Rural and Environment Science and Analytical Services Division.

681

#### 682 **Conflict of Interest**

683 The authors declared that they have no conflicts of interest to this work.

684

#### 685 **Author contributions**

686 K.M. and J.L. conceived the research; M.R., J.L. and T.T. collected samples; J.L., Y.W.,  
687 D.W., S.J. and Y.Z. collected and analyzed the data; J.L, M.R., R.M. and K.M. wrote the  
688 manuscript; K.M., and M.R. revised the manuscript.

689

#### 690 **Data Availability Statement**

691 Data available from the Dryad Digital Repository:

692 <http://dx.doi.org/10.5061/dryad.44j0zpcd8>.

693 Scripts available from [https://github.com/lijl459/Phylogenomics\\_for\\_Thuja](https://github.com/lijl459/Phylogenomics_for_Thuja).

694

695

696 **Reference**

697

- 698 Adelalu, K. F., Qu, X.-J., Sun, Y.-X., Deng, T., Sun, H., Wang, H.-C. 2019. Characterization  
699 of the complete plastome of western red cedar, *Thuja plicata* (Cupressaceae).  
700 *Conserv. Genet. Resour.* 11, 79–81.
- 701 Adelalu, K. F., Zhang, X., Qu, X., Landis, J. B., Shen, J., Sun, Y., Meng, A., Sun, H., Wang,  
702 H. 2020. Plastome Phylogenomic and Biogeographical Study on *Thuja*  
703 (Cupressaceae). *Biomed Res. Int.* 2020, 8426287.
- 704 Ali, R. H., Bogusz, M., Whelan, S. 2019. Identifying Clusters of High Confidence  
705 Homologies in Multiple Sequence Alignments. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 36, 2340–2351.
- 706 Azani, N., Bruneau, A., Wojciechowski, M. F., Zarre, S. 2019. Miocene climate change as  
707 a driving force for multiple origins of annual species in *Astragalus* (Fabaceae,  
708 Papilionoideae). *Mol. Phylogen. Evol.* 137, 210–221.
- 709 Azuma, H., García-Franco, J. G., Rico-Gray, V., Thien, L. B. 2001. Molecular phylogeny  
710 of the Magnoliaceae: the biogeography of tropical and temperate disjunctions. *Am.*  
711 *J. Bot.* 88, 2275–2285.
- 712 Bankevich, A., Nurk, S., Antipov, D., Gurevich, A. A., Dvorkin, M., Kulikov, A. S., Lesin,  
713 V. M., Nikolenko, S. I., Pham, S., Prjibelski, A. D., *et al.* 2012. SPAdes: A New  
714 Genome Assembly Algorithm and Its Applications to Single-Cell Sequencing. *J.*  
715 *Comput. Biol.* 19, 455–477.
- 716 Blackmon, H., Adams, R. A. 2015. EvobiR: Tools for comparative analyses and teaching  
717 evolutionary biology. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.30938>
- 718 Bolger, A. M., Lohse, M., Usadel, B. 2014. Trimmomatic: a flexible trimmer for Illumina  
719 sequence data. *Bioinformatics* 30, 2114–2120.
- 720 Bouckaert, R. R. 2010. DensiTree: making sense of sets of phylogenetic trees.  
721 *Bioinformatics* 26, 1372–1373.
- 722 Bruen, T. C., Philippe, H., Bryant, D. 2006. A Simple and Robust Statistical Test for  
723 Detecting the Presence of Recombination. *Genetics* 172, 2665.
- 724 Cao, Z., Liu, X., Ogilvie, H. A., Yan, Z., Nakhleh, L. 2019. Practical Aspects of  
725 Phylogenetic Network Analysis Using PhyloNet. *bioRxiv*, 746362.
- 726 Chan, K. O., Hutter, C. R., Wood, P. L., Jr., Grismer, L. L., Brown, R. M. 2020. Target-  
727 capture phylogenomics provide insights on gene and species tree discordances in Old  
728 World treefrogs (Anura: Rhacophoridae). *Proc. R. Soc. B-Biol. Sci.* 287, 20202102.
- 729 Claramunt, S., Cracraft, J. 2015. A new time tree reveals Earth history’s imprint on the

730 evolution of modern birds. *Sci. Adv.* 1, e1501005.

731 Cui, Y. M., Sun, B., Wang, H. F., Ferguson, D. K., Wang, Y. F., Li, C. S., Yang, J., Ma, Q.  
732 W. 2015. Exploring the Formation of a Disjunctive Pattern between Eastern Asia and  
733 North America Based on Fossil Evidence from *Thuja* (Cupressaceae). *PLoS One* 10,  
734 e0138544. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0138544>

735 Dalquen, D. A., Zhu, T., Yang, Z. 2017. Maximum Likelihood Implementation of an  
736 Isolation-with-Migration Model for Three Species. *Syst. Biol.* 66, 379–398.

737 Davidse, G. 1983. Biogeographical relationships between temperate eastern Asia and  
738 temperate eastern North America: the twenty-ninth annual systematics symposium.  
739 *Ann. Mo. Bot. Gard.* 70, 421–422.

740 Degnan, J. H., Rosenberg, N. A. 2006. Discordance of Species Trees with Their Most  
741 Likely Gene Trees. *PLoS Genet.* 2, e68.  
742 <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pgen.0020068>

743 Donoghue, M. J., Bell, C. D., Li, J. H. 2001. Phylogenetic patterns in Northern Hemisphere  
744 plant geography. *Int. J. Plant Sci.* 162, S41–S52.

745 Donoghue, M. J., Smith, S. A. 2004. Patterns in the assembly of temperate forests around  
746 the Northern Hemisphere. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B-Biol. Sci.* 359, 1633–1644.

747 Doyle, J. J., Doyle, J. L. 1987. A rapid DNA isolation procedure for small quantities of  
748 fresh leaf tissue. *Phytochemical Bulletin* 19, 11–15.

749 Durand, E. Y., Patterson, N., Reich, D., Slatkin, M. 2011. Testing for Ancient Admixture  
750 between Closely Related Populations. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 28, 2239–2252.

751 Eckenwalder, J. E. 2009. *Conifers of the World: The Complete Reference*. Timber Press,  
752 Portland.

753 Emms, D. M., Kelly, S. 2015. OrthoFinder: solving fundamental biases in whole genome  
754 comparisons dramatically improves orthogroup inference accuracy. *Genome Biol.* 16,  
755 157.

756 Emms, D. M., Kelly, S. 2019. OrthoFinder: phylogenetic orthology inference for  
757 comparative genomics. *Genome Biol.* 20, 238.

758 Farjon, A. 2005. *Monograph of Cupressaceae and Sciadopitys*. Royal Botanic Gardens,  
759 Kew, London.

760 Feng, Y.-Y., Shen, T.-T., Shao, C.-C., Du, H., Ran, J.-H., Wang, X.-Q. 2020.  
761 Phylotranscriptomics reveals the complex evolutionary and biogeographic history of  
762 the genus *Tsuga* with an East Asian-North American disjunct distribution. *Mol.*  
763 *Phylog. Evol.* 157, 107066.

764 Flouri, T., Jiao, X., Rannala, B., Yang, Z. 2018. Species Tree Inference with BPP Using  
765 Genomic Sequences and the Multispecies Coalescent. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 35, 2585–  
766 2593.

767 Folk, R. A., Mandel, J. R., Freudenstein, J. V. 2017. Ancestral Gene Flow and Parallel  
768 Organellar Genome Capture Result in Extreme Phylogenomic Discord in a Lineage

769 of Angiosperms. *Syst. Biol.* 66, 320–337.

770 Fu, L., Yu, Y., Farjon, A. 1999. Cupressaceae. In: Wu, Z., Raven, P. (Eds.), *Flora of China*.  
771 Science Press, Beijing, pp. 62–77.

772 Gadagkar, S. R., Rosenberg, M. S., Kumar, S. 2005. Inferring species phylogenies from  
773 multiple genes: Concatenated sequence tree versus consensus gene tree. *J. Exp. Zool.*  
774 Part B 304B, 64–74.

775 Gopalakrishnan, S., Sinding, M.-H. S., Ramos-Madrigo, J., Niemann, J., Samaniego  
776 Castruita, J. A., Vieira, F. G., Carøe, C., Montero, M. d. M., Kuderna, L., Serres, A.,  
777 *et al.* 2018. Interspecific Gene Flow Shaped the Evolution of the Genus *Canis*. *Curr.*  
778 *Biol.* 28, 3441–3449.e3445.

779 Grabherr, M. G., Haas, B. J., Yassour, M., Levin, J. Z., Thompson, D. A., Amit, I., Adiconis,  
780 X., Fan, L., Raychowdhury, R., Zeng, Q., *et al.* 2011. Full-length transcriptome  
781 assembly from RNA-Seq data without a reference genome. *Nat. Biotechnol.* 29, 644–  
782 652.

783 Graham, A. 1966. *Plantae rariores camschatcenses: A translation of the dissertation of*  
784 *Jonas P. Halenius, 1750.* *Brittonia* 18, 131–139.

785 Gray, A. 1859. Diagnostic characters of new species of phanerogamous plants collected in  
786 Japan by Charles Wright, botanist of the U.S. North Pacific Exploring Expedition.  
787 *Mem. Am. Acad. Arts* 6, 377–452.

788 Green, R. E., Krause, J., Briggs, A. W., Maricic, T., Stenzel, U., Kircher, M., Patterson, N.,  
789 Li, H., Zhai, W., Fritz, M. H., *et al.* 2010. A draft sequence of the Neandertal genome.  
790 *Science* 328, 710–722.

791 Guo, Z. T., Sun, B., Zhang, Z. S., Peng, S. Z., Xiao, G. Q., Ge, J. Y., Hao, Q. Z., Qiao, Y.  
792 S., Liang, M. Y., Liu, J. F., *et al.* 2008. A major reorganization of Asian climate by  
793 the early Miocene. *Clim. Past.* 4, 153–174.

794 Haas, B. J., Papanicolaou, A., Yassour, M., Grabherr, M., Blood, P. D., Bowden, J., Couger,  
795 M. B., Eccles, D., Li, B., Lieber, M., *et al.* 2013. De novo transcript sequence  
796 reconstruction from RNA-seq using the Trinity platform for reference generation and  
797 analysis. *Nature Protocols* 8, 1494–1512.

798 Hamilton, M. 2009. *Population genetics.* John Wiley & Sons, Chichester.

799 Hoang, D. T., Chernomor, O., von Haeseler, A., Minh, B. Q., Vinh, L. S. 2018. UFBoot2:  
800 Improving the Ultrafast Bootstrap Approximation. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 35, 518–522.

801 Huerta-Cepas, J., Serra, F., Bork, P. 2016. ETE 3: Reconstruction, Analysis, and  
802 Visualization of Phylogenomic Data. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 33, 1635–1638.

803 Huson, D. H., Scornavacca, C. 2012. Dendroscope 3: an interactive tool for rooted  
804 phylogenetic trees and networks. *Syst. Biol.* 61, 1061–1067.

805 Jin, J.-J., Yu, W.-B., Yang, J.-B., Song, Y., dePamphilis, C. W., Yi, T.-S., Li, D.-Z. 2020.  
806 GetOrganelle: a fast and versatile toolkit for accurate de novo assembly of organelle  
807 genomes. *Genome Biol.* 21, 241.

808 Johnson, M. G., Gardner, E. M., Liu, Y., Medina, R., Goffinet, B., Shaw, A. J., Zerega, N.  
809 J. C., Wickett, N. J. 2016. HybPiper: Extracting coding sequence and introns for  
810 phylogenetics from high-throughput sequencing reads using target enrichment. Appl.  
811 Plant Sci. 4, 1600016.

812 Kalyaanamoorthy, S., Minh, B. Q., Wong, T. K. F., von Haeseler, A., Jermiin, L. S. 2017.  
813 ModelFinder: fast model selection for accurate phylogenetic estimates. Nat. Methods  
814 14, 587–589.

815 Kapli, P., Yang, Z., Telford, M. J. 2020. Phylogenetic tree building in the genomic age. Nat.  
816 Rev. Genet. 21, 428–444.

817 Katoh, K., Standley, D. M. 2013. MAFFT multiple sequence alignment software version 7:  
818 improvements in performance and usability. Mol. Biol. Evol. 30, 772–780.

819 Kearse, M., Moir, R., Wilson, A., Stones-Havas, S., Cheung, M., Sturrock, S., Buxton, S.,  
820 Cooper, A., Markowitz, S., Duran, C., *et al.* 2012. Geneious Basic: An integrated and  
821 extendable desktop software platform for the organization and analysis of sequence  
822 data. Bioinformatics 28, 1647–1649.

823 Kuhlwilm, M., Han, S., Sousa, V. C., Excoffier, L., Marques-Bonet, T. 2019. Ancient  
824 admixture from an extinct ape lineage into bonobos. Nature Ecology & Evolution 3,  
825 957–965.

826 Langmead, B., Salzberg, S. L. 2012. Fast gapped-read alignment with Bowtie 2. Nat.  
827 Methods 9, 357–359.

828 Leache, A. D., Rannala, B. 2011. The accuracy of species tree estimation under simulation:  
829 a comparison of methods. Syst. Biol. 60, 126–137.

830 Lee-Yaw, J. A., Grassa, C. J., Joly, S., Andrew, R. L., Rieseberg, L. H. 2019. An evaluation  
831 of alternative explanations for widespread cytonuclear discordance in annual  
832 sunflowers (*Helianthus*). New Phytol. 221, 515–526.

833 LePage, B. A. 2003. A new species of *Thuja* (Cupressaceae) from the Late Cretaceous of  
834 Alaska: implications of being evergreen in a polar environment. Am. J. Bot. 90, 167–  
835 174.

836 Li, H., Durbin, R. 2009. Fast and accurate short read alignment with Burrows-Wheeler  
837 transform. Bioinformatics 25, 1754–1760.

838 Li, J., Milne, R. I., Ru, D., Miao, J., Tao, W., Zhang, L., Xu, J., Liu, J., Mao, K. 2020.  
839 Allopatric divergence and hybridization within *Cupressus chengiana* (Cupressaceae),  
840 a threatened conifer in the northern Hengduan Mountains of western China. Mol.  
841 Ecol. 29, 1250–1266.

842 Li, J., Stukel, M., Bussies, P., Skinner, K., Lemmon, A. R., Lemmon, E. M., Brown, K.,  
843 Bekmetjev, A., Swenson, N. G. 2019. Maple phylogeny and biogeography inferred  
844 from phylogenomic data. J. Syst. Evol. 57, 594–606.

845 Li, J. H., Xiang, Q. P. 2005. Phylogeny and biogeography of *Thuja* L. (Cupressaceae), an  
846 eastern Asian and North American disjunct genus. J. Integr. Plant Biol. 47, 651–659.



- 847 Linder, H. P., Hardy, C. R., Rutschmann, F. 2005. Taxon sampling effects in molecular  
848 clock dating: An example from the African Restionaceae. *Mol. Phylogen. Evol.* 35,  
849 569–582.
- 850 Linkem, C. W., Minin, V. N., Leaché, A. D. 2016. Detecting the Anomaly Zone in Species  
851 Trees and Evidence for a Misleading Signal in Higher-Level Skink Phylogeny  
852 (Squamata: Scincidae). *Syst. Biol.* 65, 465–477.
- 853 Liu, L., Yu, L., Edwards, S. V. 2010. A maximum pseudo-likelihood approach for  
854 estimating species trees under the coalescent model. *BMC Evol. Biol.* 10, 302–319.
- 855 Luo, X., Hu, Q., Zhou, P., Zhang, D., Wang, Q., Abbott, R. J., Liu, J. 2017. Chasing ghosts:  
856 allopolyploid origin of *Oxyria sinensis* (Polygonaceae) from its only diploid  
857 congener and an unknown ancestor. *Mol. Ecol.* 26, 3037–3049.
- 858 Maddison, W. P., Knowles, L. L. 2006. Inferring Phylogeny Despite Incomplete Lineage  
859 Sorting. *Syst. Biol.* 55, 21–30.
- 860 Manchester, S. R. 1999. Biogeographical Relationships of North American Tertiary Floras.  
861 *Ann. Mo. Bot. Gard.* 86, 472–522.
- 862 Mao, K., Milne, R. I., Zhang, L., Peng, Y., Liu, J., Thomas, P., Mill, R. R., S. Renner, S.  
863 2012. Distribution of living Cupressaceae reflects the breakup of Pangea. *Natl. Acad.*  
864 *Sci. U. S. A.* 109, 7793.
- 865 Marshall, H. D., Newton, C., Ritland, K. 2001. Sequence-Repeat Polymorphisms Exhibit  
866 the Signature of Recombination in Lodgepole Pine Chloroplast DNA. *Mol. Biol.*  
867 *Evol.* 18, 2136–2138.
- 868 Matzke, N. J. 2013. Probabilistic historical biogeography: new models for founder-event  
869 speciation, imperfect detection, and fossils allow improved accuracy and model-  
870 testing. *Front. Biogeogr.* 5, 242–248.
- 871 Matzke, N. J. 2014. Model Selection in Historical Biogeography Reveals that Founder-  
872 Event Speciation Is a Crucial Process in Island Clades. *Syst. Biol.* 63, 951–970.
- 873 McIver, E., Basinger, J. 1989. The morphology and relationships of *Thuja polaris* sp. nov.  
874 (Cupressaceae) from the early Tertiary, Ellesmere Island, Arctic Canada. *Can. J. Plant*  
875 *Sci.* 67, 1903–1915.
- 876 Milne, R. I. 2006. Northern hemisphere plant disjunctions: A window on tertiary land  
877 bridges and climate change? *Ann. Bot.* 98, 465–472.
- 878 Milne, R. I., Abbott, R. J. 2002. The origin and evolution of tertiary relict floras. *Adv. Bot.*  
879 *Res.* Academic Press, pp. 281–314.
- 880 Minh, B. Q., Hahn, M. W., Lanfear, R. 2020. New Methods to Calculate Concordance  
881 Factors for Phylogenomic Datasets. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 37, 2727–2733.
- 882 Mirarab, S., Bayzid, M. S., Boussau, B., Warnow, T. 2014. Statistical binning enables an  
883 accurate coalescent-based estimation of the avian tree. *Science* 346, 1250463.
- 884 Morales-Briones, D. F., Kadereit, G., Tefarikis, D. T., Moore, M. J., Smith, S. A.,  
885 Brockington, S. F., Timoneda, A., Yim, W. C., Cushman, J. C., Yang, Y. 2020.

886 Disentangling Sources of Gene Tree Discordance in Phylogenomic Datasets: Testing  
887 Ancient Hybridizations in Amaranthaceae s.l. *Syst. Biol.* 70, 219–235.

888 Morales-Briones, D. F., Liston, A., Tank, D. C. 2018. Phylogenomic analyses reveal a deep  
889 history of hybridization and polyploidy in the Neotropical genus *Lachemilla*  
890 (Rosaceae). *New Phytol.* 218, 1668–1684.

891 Nguyen, L.-T., Schmidt, H. A., von Haeseler, A., Minh, B. Q. 2015. IQ-TREE: A Fast and  
892 Effective Stochastic Algorithm for Estimating Maximum-Likelihood Phylogenies.  
893 *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 32, 268–274.

894 Olave, M., Avila, L. J., Sites, J. W., Morando, M. 2018. Detecting hybridization by  
895 likelihood calculation of gene tree extra lineages given explicit models. *Methods*  
896 *Ecol. Evol.* 9, 121–133.

897 Paradis, E., Claude, J., Strimmer, K. 2004. APE: Analyses of Phylogenetics and Evolution  
898 in R language. *Bioinformatics* 20, 289–290.

899 Pease, J. B., Haak, D. C., Hahn, M. W., Moyle, L. C. 2016. Phylogenomics Reveals Three  
900 Sources of Adaptive Variation during a Rapid Radiation. *PLoS Biol.* 14, e1002379.

901 Peng, D., Wang, X.-Q. 2008. Reticulate evolution in *Thuja* inferred from multiple gene  
902 sequences: Implications for the study of biogeographical disjunction between eastern  
903 Asia and North America. *Mol. Phylogen. Evol.* 47, 1190–1202.

904 Prüfer, K., Racimo, F., Patterson, N., Jay, F., Sankararaman, S., Sawyer, S., Heinze, A.,  
905 Renaud, G., Sudmant, P. H., de Filippo, C., *et al.* 2014. The complete genome  
906 sequence of a Neanderthal from the Altai Mountains. *Nature* 505, 43–49.

907 Qu, X.-J., Wu, C.-S., Chaw, S.-M., Yi, T.-S. 2017. Insights into the Existence of Isomeric  
908 Plastomes in Cupressoideae (Cupressaceae). *Genome Biol. Evol.* 9, 1110–1119.

909 Rabiee, M., Sayyari, E., Mirarab, S. 2019. Multi-allele species reconstruction using  
910 ASTRAL. *Mol. Phylogen. Evol.* 130, 286–296.

911 Rambaut, A., Drummond, A. J., Xie, D., Baele, G., Suchard, M. A. 2018. Posterior  
912 Summarization in Bayesian Phylogenetics Using Tracer 1.7. *Syst. Biol.* 67, 901–904.

913 Ree, R. H., Sanmartín, I. 2018. Conceptual and statistical problems with the DEC+J model  
914 of founder-event speciation and its comparison with DEC via model selection. *J.*  
915 *Biogeogr.* 45, 741–749.

916 Rogalski, M., do Nascimento Vieira, L., Fraga, H. P., Guerra, M. P. 2015. Plastid genomics  
917 in horticultural species: importance and applications for plant population genetics,  
918 evolution, and biotechnology. *Front. Plant Sci.* 6, 586.

919 Ru, D., Sun, Y., Wang, D., Chen, Y., Wang, T., Hu, Q., Abbott, R. J., Liu, J. 2018. Population  
920 genomic analysis reveals that homoploid hybrid speciation can be a lengthy process.  
921 *Mol. Ecol.* 27, 4875–4887.

922 Salichos, L., Stamatakis, A., Rokas, A. 2014. Novel Information Theory-Based Measures  
923 for Quantifying Incongruence among Phylogenetic Trees. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 31, 1261–  
924 1271.

- 925 Sayyari, E., Mirarab, S. 2016. Fast Coalescent-Based Computation of Local Branch  
926 Support from Quartet Frequencies. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 33, 1654–1668.
- 927 Schweitzer, H. 1974. Die Tertiären Koniferen Spitzbergens. *Palaeontogr. Abt. B-*  
928 *Palaophytol.* 149, 1–89.
- 929 Shao, C. C., Shen, T. T., Jin, W. T., Mao, H. J., Ran, J. H., Wang, X. Q. 2019.  
930 Phylotranscriptomics resolves interspecific relationships and indicates multiple  
931 historical out-of-North America dispersals through the Bering Land Bridge for the  
932 genus *Picea* (Pinaceae). *Mol. Phylogen. Evol.* 141, 106610.
- 933 Sloan, D. B., Havird, J. C., Sharbrough, J. 2017. The on-again, off-again relationship  
934 between mitochondrial genomes and species boundaries. *Mol. Ecol.* 26, 2212–2236.
- 935 Smith, S. A., Moore, M. J., Brown, J. W., Yang, Y. 2015. Analysis of phylogenomic datasets  
936 reveals conflict, concordance, and gene duplications with examples from animals and  
937 plants. *BMC Evol. Biol.* 15, 150.
- 938 Stull, G. W., Soltis, P. S., Soltis, D. E., Gitzendanner, M. A., Smith, S. A. 2020. Nuclear  
939 phylogenomic analyses of asterids conflict with plastome trees and support novel  
940 relationships among major lineages. *Am. J. Bot.* 107, 790–805.
- 941 Sukumaran, J., Holder, M. T. 2010. DendroPy: a Python library for phylogenetic computing.  
942 *Bioinformatics* 26, 1569–1571.
- 943 Sullivan, A. R., Schiffthaler, B., Thompson, S. L., Street, N. R., Wang, X.-R. 2017.  
944 Interspecific Plastome Recombination Reflects Ancient Reticulate Evolution in  
945 *Picea* (Pinaceae). *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 34, 1689–1701.
- 946 Suyama, M., Torrents, D., Bork, P. 2006. PAL2NAL: robust conversion of protein sequence  
947 alignments into the corresponding codon alignments. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 34, W609–  
948 W612.
- 949 Taberlet, P., Luikart, G. 2008. Non-invasive genetic sampling and individual identification.  
950 *Biol. J. Linn. Soc.* 68, 41–55.
- 951 Taylor, S. A., Larson, E. L. 2019. Insights from genomes into the evolutionary importance  
952 and prevalence of hybridization in nature. *Nature Ecology & Evolution* 3, 170–177.
- 953 Tiffney, B. H. 1985a. The Eocene North Atlantic land bridge: its importance in Tertiary and  
954 modern phytogeography of the northern hemisphere. *J. Arnold Arbor.* 66, 243–273.
- 955 Tiffney, B. H. 1985b. Perspectives on the origin of the floristic similarity between Eastern  
956 Asia and Eastern North America. *J. Arnold Arbor.* 66, 73–94.
- 957 Tiffney, B. H., Manchester, S. R. 2001. The use of geological and paleontological evidence  
958 in evaluating plant phylogeographic hypotheses in the Northern Hemisphere Tertiary.  
959 *Int. J. Plant Sci.* 162, S3–S17.
- 960 van der Valk, T., Pečnerová, P., Díez-del-Molino, D., Bergström, A., Oppenheimer, J.,  
961 Hartmann, S., Xenikoudakis, G., Thomas, J. A., Dehasque, M., Sağlıcan, E., *et al.*  
962 2021. Million-year-old DNA sheds light on the genomic history of mammoths.  
963 *Nature* 591, 265–269.

- 964 Wang, K., Lenstra, J. A., Liu, L., Hu, Q., Ma, T., Qiu, Q., Liu, J. 2018. Incomplete lineage  
965 sorting rather than hybridization explains the inconsistent phylogeny of the wisent.  
966 *Commun. Biol.* 1, 169.
- 967 Wang, M. S., Wang, S., Li, Y., Jhala, Y., Thakur, M., Otecko, N. O., Si, J. F., Chen, H. M.,  
968 Shapiro, B., Nielsen, R., *et al.* 2020. Ancient hybridization with an unknown  
969 population facilitated high altitude adaptation of canids. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 37, 2616–  
970 2629.
- 971 Wang, Q., Mao, K.-S. 2016. Puzzling rocks and complicated clocks: how to optimize  
972 molecular dating approaches in historical phytogeography. *New Phytol.* 209, 1353–  
973 1358.
- 974 Wang, X.-Q., Ran, J.-H. 2014. Evolution and biogeography of gymnosperms. *Mol.*  
975 *Phylogen. Evol.* 75, 24–40.
- 976 Wang, Z., Jiang, Y., Bi, H., Lu, Z., Ma, Y., Yang, X., Chen, N., Tian, B., Liu, B., Mao, X.,  
977 *et al.* 2021. Hybrid speciation via inheritance of alternate alleles of parental isolating  
978 genes. *Mol. Plant.* 14, 208–222.
- 979 Wen, D., Yu, Y., Zhu, J., Nakhleh, L. 2018. Inferring Phylogenetic Networks Using  
980 PhyloNet. *Syst. Biol.* 67, 735–740.
- 981 Wen, J. 1999. Evolution of eastern Asian and eastern North American disjunct distributions  
982 in flowering plants. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst.* 30, 421–455.
- 983 Wen, J., Ickert-Bond, S. M., Nie, Z.-L., Li, R. 2010. Timing and Modes of Evolution of  
984 Eastern Asian - North American Biogeographic Disjunctions in Seed Plants. In: Long,  
985 M., H., G., Z., Z. (Eds.), *Darwin's heritage today: Proceedings of the Darwin 200*  
986 *Beijing International Conference.* Higher Education Press, Beijing, pp. 252–269.
- 987 Wilgenbusch, J. C., Swofford, D. 2003. Inferring Evolutionary Trees with PAUP\*. *Current*  
988 *Protocols in Bioinformatics* 00, 6.4.1–6.4.28.
- 989 Xiang, Q.-P., Farjon, A., Li, Z.-Y., Fu, L.-K., Liu, Z.-Y. 2002. *Thuja sutchuenensis*: a  
990 rediscovered species of the Cupressaceae. *Bot. J. Linn. Soc.* 140, 93–94.
- 991 Xu, X.-H., Yang, L.-Y., Sun, B.-N., Yuan, J.-D., Dong, C., Wang, Y.-D. 2018. A new  
992 discovery of *Chamaecyparis* from the Lower Cretaceous of Inner Mongolia, North  
993 China and its significance. *Rev. Palaeobot. Palynol.* 257, 64–76.
- 994 Yang, Z. 2007. PAML 4: Phylogenetic Analysis by Maximum Likelihood. *Mol. Biol. Evol.*  
995 24, 1586–1591.
- 996 Yu, Y., Blair, C., He, X. 2020. RASP 4: Ancestral State Reconstruction Tool for Multiple  
997 Genes and Characters. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 37, 604–606.
- 998 Zachos, J., Pagani, M., Sloan, L., Thomas, E., Billups, K. 2001. Trends, Rhythms, and  
999 Aberrations in Global Climate 65 Ma to Present. *Science* 292, 686.
- 1000 Zachos, J. C., Dickens, G. R., Zeebe, R. E. 2008. An early Cenozoic perspective on  
1001 greenhouse warming and carbon-cycle dynamics. *Nature* 451, 279–283.
- 1002 Zhang, C., Rabiee, M., Sayyari, E., Mirarab, S. 2018. ASTRAL-III: polynomial time

1003 species tree reconstruction from partially resolved gene trees. BMC Bioinform. 19,  
1004 153.  
1005 Zhang, D., Tang, L., Cheng, Y., Hao, Y., Xiong, Y., Song, G., Qu, Y., Rheindt, F. E., Alström,  
1006 P., Jia, C., *et al.* 2019. “Ghost Introgression” As a Cause of Deep Mitochondrial  
1007 Divergence in a Bird Species Complex. Mol. Biol. Evol. 36, 2375–2386.  
1008 Zhang, Q., Ree, R. H., Salamin, N., Xing, Y., Silvestro, D. 2021. Fossil-Informed Models  
1009 Reveal a Boreotropical Origin and Divergent Evolutionary Trajectories in the Walnut  
1010 Family (Juglandaceae). Syst. Biol. <https://doi.org/10.1093/sysbio/syab030>  
1011 Zhao, T., Wang, G., Ma, Q., Liang, L., Yang, Z. 2020. Multilocus data reveal deep  
1012 phylogenetic relationships and intercontinental biogeography of the Eurasian-North  
1013 American genus *Corylus* (Betulaceae). Mol. Phylogen. Evol. 142, 106658.  
1014 Zhou, W., Xiang, Q.-Y., Wen, J. 2020. Phylogenomics, biogeography, and evolution of  
1015 morphology and ecological niche of the eastern Asian-eastern North American *Nyssa*  
1016 (*Nyssaceae*). J. Syst. Evol. 58, 571–603.

1017

## 1018 **Supporting Information**

1019 Additional supporting information may be found online in the Supporting Information  
1020 section.

1021 **Table S1** Sample information.

1022 **Table S2** Fossil calibrations for divergence time estimation.

1023 **Table S3** The dispersal probability matrix.

1024 **Table S4** Summary of gene recovery efficiency for assemblies via HybPiper.

1025 **Table S5** Information on plastid genome assemblies.

1026 **Table S6** All possible 105 topologies for *Thuja* with their frequencies in observed nuclear  
1027 gene trees, simulated nuclear gene trees, and simulated plastid trees based on all 5,663 loci  
1028 of the one-individual data set.

1029 **Table S7** All possible 105 topologies for *Thuja* with their frequencies in observed nuclear  
1030 gene trees, simulated nuclear gene trees, and simulated plastid trees based on 2,969 no-  
1031 recombination loci of the one-individual data set.

1032 **Table S8** Parameter estimates under multispecies coalescent model using the software BPP.

1033 **Table S9** Parameter estimates under multispecies-coalescent-with-introgression model

1034 using the software BPP.

1035 **Table S10** Result of model test performed in BioGeoBEARS including the +*J* parameter  
1036 using extant species only.

1037 **Table S11** Result of model test performed in BioGeoBEARS not including the +*J*  
1038 parameter using extant species only.

1039 **Table S12** Result of model test performed in BioGeoBEARS including the +*J* parameter  
1040 using both extant and fossil *Thuja* species.

1041 **Table S13** Result of model test performed in BioGeoBEARS not including the +*J*  
1042 parameter using both extant and fossil *Thuja* species.

1043

1044 **Figure S1** Concatenated tree inferred from PUAP using maximum parsimony method  
1045 based on all loci of the multi-individual dataset.

1046 **Figure S2** Concatenated tree inferred from IQ-TREE using maximum likelihood method  
1047 based on all loci of the multi-individual dataset.

1048 **Figure S3** Astral tree with branch lengths in coalescent unit based on all loci of the multi-  
1049 individual dataset.

1050 **Figure S4** Astral tree with branch lengths in coalescent unit based on non-recombinant loci  
1051 of the multi-individual dataset.

1052 **Figure S5** Maximum parsimony tree based on nearly complete plastid genomic alignment.

1053 **Figure S6** Maximum likelihood tree based on nearly complete plastid genomic alignment.

1054 **Figure S7** Species network analysis and test of hybridization based on 1,145 non-  
1055 recombination loci of the multi-individual dataset.

1056 **Figure S8** ILS simulations based on 2,969 non-recombination loci from the one-individual  
1057 data set.

1058 **Figure S9** (a) Distribution of Robinson-Foulds (RF) distances of the simulated (blue violin  
1059 plot) and true (orange numbers and points) gene trees to the species tree using protein

1060 sequences. Violin plots are from 100 replicated simulations (each containing 2,969 gene  
1061 trees). (b) A “cloudogram” of 2,969 gene trees using protein sequences for the one-  
1062 individual dataset. (c) An MP-EST tree with branch in coalescent unit based on protein  
1063 sequences.

1064 **Figure S10** Topology frequencies of simulated gene trees and observed gene trees based  
1065 on (a) DNA sequences, and (b) protein sequences.

1066 **Figure S11** Species and plastid trees inferred under multispecies coalescent model based  
1067 on (a) 1,145 nuclear CDS genes (non-recombinant loci of the multi-individual dataset), (b)  
1068 full plastome sequences, (c) 68 plastome fragments with 2000bp in length, (d) plastid CDS  
1069 genes, assuming that each 2-kp or coding gene experience independent evolutionary history.

1070

#### 1071 *Figure Legends*

1072 **Figure 1** Phylogenetic relationship within *Thuja* based on the multi-individual dataset. (a)  
1073 species tree inferred with ASTRAL based on 2,369 single copy nuclear genes, which had  
1074 the same species-level topologies as recovered from PAUP and IQ-TREE based on  
1075 maximum parsimony (MP) and maximum likelihood (ML) approaches, respectively. The  
1076 ‘internode certainty all scores’ are shown below the branches. Number of gene trees  
1077 concordant/conflicting with the shown node are depicted next to the nodes. Pie charts of  
1078 the nodes denote the proportion of gene trees that support the shown topology (blue),  
1079 support the main alternative topology (orange), and support the remaining alternatives  
1080 (grey). (b) Maximum likelihood tree inferred from IQ-TREE using the full plastome  
1081 sequence alignment. Pie charts of the nodes denote the site concordance factor averaged  
1082 over 100 quartets (sCF; blue), site discordance factor for alternative quartet 1 (sDF1;  
1083 orange), and site discordance factor for alternative quartet 2 (sDF2; grey). The MP/ML  
1084 bootstrap values (/ASTRAL local posterior probabilities) are shown above the branches.  
1085 The “\*” denotes the branch supported with 100% bootstrap values (and a local posterior

1086 probability of 1).

1087

1088 **Figure 2** (a-d) Phylogenetic networks inferred from PhyloNet pseudolikelihood analyses  
1089 with one (a), two (b), and three (c) hybridization events based on all loci of the multi-  
1090 individual dataset. The major and minor edges of hybrid nodes are shown as blue and  
1091 orange branches, respectively. (d) Patterson's  $D$  tests of all possible ten topologies within  
1092 *Thuja*. The arrows denote gene flow between distantly related populations. Patterson's  $D$   
1093 and  $Z$  scores are shown above and under the arrows, respectively. Tdo: *Thujopsis dolabrata*;  
1094 Toc: *T. occidentalis*, Tko: *T. koraiensis*; Tpl: *T. plicata*; Tst: *T. standishii*; Tsu: *T.*  
1095 *sutchuenensis*; and lnL: log-likelihood.

1096 **Figure 3** (a) Conflict among gene trees for the all loci of one-individual dataset. Numbers  
1097 above branches indicate the 'internode certainty all scores' of that node. The number of  
1098 gene trees which are in concordance/conflict with the shown node is stated next to the  
1099 nodes. Pie charts denote the proportion of gene trees that support the shown topology (blue),  
1100 support the main alternative topology (orange), or support the remaining alternatives (grey).  
1101 (b) Distributions of topology frequencies of observed and simulated gene trees based on  
1102 all 5,663 loci of one-individual dataset. (c) Distribution of Robinson-Foulds (RF) distances  
1103 of the simulated (blue violin plot) and true (orange numbers and points) gene trees to the  
1104 species tree. Violin plots are from 100 replicated simulations (each containing 5,663 gene  
1105 trees). (d) Coalescent model showing that *T. plicata* fixed a different plastid genome. (e)  
1106 An astral tree with branch length in coalescent units. The branch lengths are inferred from  
1107 the multi-individual dataset. The internodes that fall in the anomaly zone are marked in  
1108 blue and orange. (f) Concordance of simulated plastid gene trees and observed plastid  
1109 phylogeny. Numbers after nodes represent the number of genes trees which support the  
1110 shown clades.

1111 **Figure 4** A time calibrated phylogeny of five *Thuja* species and 11 other Cupressaceae



1112 species. The times were inferred by MCMCTree based on a concatenated set of 1811  
1113 nuclear single copy genes. The divergence times are shown behind the nodes, and the 95%  
1114 highest posterior densities are represented as light-grey bars.

1115 **Figure 5** Species trees of all five extant *Thuja* species and the outgroup *Thujopsis*  
1116 *dolabrata* including the parameter estimates based on (a) the multispecies coalescent model  
1117 and (b) the multispecies-coalescent-with-introgression model using the software BPP. The  
1118 absolute divergence times were calculated from the posterior mean branch lengths ( $\tau$ ) by  
1119 calibrating the stem age of *Thuja* to 62.68 Ma (as inferred by MCMCTree). The posterior  
1120 mean of population sizes ( $\theta$ ) and introgression probability ( $\phi$ ) are shown. All parameter  
1121 estimates are based on the multi-individual dataset after removal of recombinant loci, and  
1122 the 95% highest posterior densities for the divergence times are represented as light-grey  
1123 bars.

1124 **Figure 6** Ancestral area reconstructions of *Thuja*. (a) Biogeographic regions defined in this  
1125 study. A: eastern Asia; B: western North America; C: eastern North America. (b) Ancestral  
1126 ranges inferred from the species tree without fossil taxa based on the DEC model. (c)  
1127 Ancestral ranges inferred from the species tree including fossil taxa based on the  
1128 DIVALIKE+J model. (d) Ancestral ranges inferred from the species tree including fossil  
1129 taxa based on the DEC model.