

Permeability and Protest in Lane 49: Entangling Materialities of Place with Housing Activism in Shanghai

Harriet Larrington-Spencer , Alison Browne , and Saska Petrova 

Department of Geography, University of Manchester, Manchester, UK;
harriet.larrington-spencer@manchester.ac.uk

Abstract: Since China's implementation of a neo-liberal housing regime, housing activism has boomed. Whilst activism is ultimately in place, as increasingly recognised within protest work, there is limited reflection upon how permeable material histories are entangled with the *throwntogetherness* of place as a site for protest. Employing ethnography over three months, this article follows the emergence, organisation and implementation of housing activism in Lane 49, a public housing community in downtown Shanghai. Utilising feminist geography and feminist political theorisations of material permeability this article contributes to Chinese geographies of protest, providing a local epistemology of housing activism which demonstrates the importance of drawing materiality into understandings of activist tactics. The article also contributes to radical geographies of protest by deconstructing the idea of public protest in a public place and thus offering opportunities to demonstrate how, through blurring public-private binaries, protest can emerge and survive in authoritative governance regimes.

自从中国实行新自由主义住房制度以来，住房行动主义蓬勃发展。尽管行动主义不断体现在抗议活动中并最终得以实现，人们却鲜少反思具有渗透性的物质历史如何被卷入作为抗议地点的“丢在一起”的地方。经过三个多月的民族志，本文探寻了上海市中心的一个公共住房社区49号巷中住房行动主义的产生、组织和执行。透过女性主义地理学和女性主义政治理论对物质渗透性的解释视角，本文提供了一种对住房行动主义的地方性的认识论，证明了将物质性纳入理解行动者策略的重要性，从而对中国抗议地理学作出贡献。此外，通过解构在公共场所进行公共抗议的观点，并说明通过模糊公/私的二元划分，抗议如何在权威治理体制中出现并生存，本文也为抗议激进地理学作出贡献。

Keywords: housing activism, permeability, place, materiality, China

Introduction

Between 1978 and 2017 China's urban population grew from 17.92% to 58.52% of the national population (Xiao et al. 2018). Facing significant urban housing shortages, reforms since "opening-up" in 1978 have included developing a private housing market. This has changed cities' spatial landscapes, most notably through *chaiqian*, or demolition. *Chaiqian* occurs as land values rise and low density housing is demolished and replaced by higher density construction with former residents often relocated to urban peripheries (Shao 2013). By 2004, 70% of alleyway housing in Shanghai, constituting 80% of pre-1980 housing, had gone

(Shao 2013). One of the most visible outcomes of *chaiqian* has been improved housing for millions of urban residents (Shao 2013), with universal electrification and sanitation (Poon 2015; UNICEF and WHO 2015). However, statistics miss low income urban residents often excluded from accessing mainstream infrastructures (Iossifova 2015a), and whilst *chaiqian* has been extensive, a degree of coexistence between old and new, articulating growing inequalities, remains (Iossifova 2015a).

As China's housing market has privatised, housing activism has grown (Hess 2010; Hsing 2010; Yip 2019). Although housing activism is not officially recorded, Yip (2019) uses news reports on housing activism as a proxy measure and demonstrates growing levels of contention since 2003. Whilst existing literature on housing protest predominantly focuses upon activism in private housing and resistance to *chaiqian*, as a result of relocation to underdeveloped urban peripheries (Hsing 2010; Shao 2013), this article identifies a further example in which a public housing community in Shanghai seeks to pressure the city government into fulfilling promises of upgrading housing.

Utilising work from feminist geography and feminist political ecology on permeable materiality and from material geographies on the vibrancy of matter, the empirical analysis is attuned to tracing permeabilities—understood as the movement of one substance through another and extended beyond material to include ideological, audio/visual, and sociocultural to name some (Kaika 2004)—across socio-materialities of public housing and the broader politics of China's urban regeneration. By doing so this paper contributes to protest work in/on China by providing a local epistemology of urban housing activism (Ma 2007), which “constructs critical knowledge through the experience of urban inhabitants, embedded in existing regulatory practices and institutional settings” (Shin 2013:1168).

Such epistemologies facilitate movement beyond descriptive empiricism (Ma 2007) and so are critical of the pursuit of goals such as social justice and environmental protection (Chatterton and Pickerill 2010; Loftus 2012; Ma 2007). The aim of this local epistemology is not to provide an exact blueprint for housing activism in urban China, but rather contribute to wider understandings of housing activism within China by demonstrating how people utilise materialities of their everyday life and utilise and subvert the histories and realities of these materialities within both their organisation and implementation of contention. By doing so this paper adds nuance to literature on housing activism tactics in China, where the current understandings are often, according to Gui (2017), reduced to “rightful resistance” (O'Brien and Li 2006) in which activists utilise state ideology to legitimise their own claims.

An empirical focus upon Lane 49 and the entanglement of the Lane's materiality with activism also contributes more broadly to calls within radical geographies of protest to bring back “place” (Oslender 2004; Pile and Keith 1997; Routledge 2017), as well as to recognise the importance of materialities of place for protest (Routledge 2017). Utilising a feminist geography and feminist political ecology lens to theorise the permeability of materiality, the paper also builds upon literature of protest and place (Endres and Senda-Cook 2011; Nagar 2019; Salmenkari 2009; Shin 2018) and particularly of Routledge (2017), contradicting popular

notions that visible and accountable protest occur only in “public” space. Instead it highlights how public-private boundaries and their inherent permeability can be utilised within protest to enact contention as safely as possible within high-risk authoritarian regimes. Whilst such protests can be considered less radical due to potential lower visibility, their implementation in a context with potential high costs for those participating means they are intrinsically radical.

The article begins by drawing on literature of protest and place, outlining recent developments in recognising protest as inherently in place before locating a less developed body of protest work on the entanglement of materiality with the construction of place, and thus the entanglement of such materiality with protest. This is followed by contextualising protest and housing activism within China and highlighting the importance of theorising protest and place and the permeability of materialities in place. After introducing Lane 49 and the ethnographic strategy, the following three empirical sections, based upon the case-study of Lane 49, will demonstrate how permeable infrastructural material history is entangled within protest-in-place, from emergence, to organisation, to implementation. This threefold nature is motivated by Oslender (2004:958) who contends protest work should look beyond only contention and towards its foundations or “soils”.

Literature Review

Protest, Place, and Materiality

Historically, social movements have been understood using resource mobilisation or identity theory (Routledge 1992, 1993), with little analysis of place and questioning of “why do particular movements *emerge* where they do?” (Routledge 1992:590). Whilst academic protest work became more location-specific in the 1980s, the initial focus was largely on the relational and networked becoming of social movements within territorial-bound, but simultaneously terrain-blind, contexts (Agnew 1994; Routledge 1992, 2017). With growing reassertions on the importance of space within critical social theory by Foucault (1986), Soja (1989) and Lefebvre (1991), came increasing recognition of the absence of space and place within geographical work and an increasing body of literature developed around analysing the spatial geographies of social movements (Agnew 1987; Miller 2000; Oslender 2004; Pile and Keith 1997; Routledge 1993; Slater 1998). Such spatial understandings have been critical in demonstrating how the production of space and economic, cultural and political processes are entangled with the development and implementation of social movements and contestations (Agnew 1987; Miller 2000; Oslender 2004; Pile and Keith 1997; Routledge 1993; Slater 1998). Spatiality has been important not only for understanding how social movements are constituted, but also how the spatial can become the object of struggle, particularly as sites of oppression can become sites of resistance (Miller 2000; Pile and Keith 1997).

Whilst the spatial turn in human geography and the social sciences has “flavoured” social movement research (Martin and Miller 2003:143), very few studies analyse spatialities of protest (Martin and Miller 2003; Oslender 2004). Such a

spatialised analysis involves, according to Oslender (2004:958), moving beyond the structures of movements and the strategies and politics that are employed within them, towards examining the “soils” of resistance or the “pre-existing people, cultures, and places ... from which a social movement emerges” that shape the movement itself.

This is consistent with place as *throwntogether* (Massey 2005:141); where human and nonhuman, material and immaterial, come together as “articulations within the wider power-geometries of space” (Massey 2005:130). Such constellations mean that place is subjectively experienced (Agnew 1987; Massey 2005; Oslender 2004). Place is also open and permeable, produced through “the comings and goings of human beings and other organisms to and from them” (Ingold 2008:1808). Since the critiques by Martin and Miller (2003) and Oslender (2004) on the sparsity of work on spatialities of social movements, empirical work of protest and place has developed (Routledge 2017). Such work includes how space-specific conditions shape contention (Miller 2000) and how the rhetorical deployment of place is utilised within protest (Endres and Senda-Cook 2011; Salmenkari 2009).

More recently, the entanglement of materiality is recognised within protests through how “activists use their physical and built landscape to shape their protests” (Routledge 2017: 24). Oslender (2004:977) exemplifies this by highlighting how, in the social movements of black communities on Columbia’s Pacific Coast, streams and rivers are used as an “aquatic street network” supporting communication across geographically dispersed communities. Routledge (2017) demonstrates such entanglement of materialities of place with protest through both the organisation of the 1990 democracy protests against Panchayat rule in Kathmandu and Palestinian resistance to Israeli land seizures. In Kathmandu households would switch off lights during the evening curfew to communicate their support to the rebels and signal to the Panchayat Regime that there was contention within the populous. In Palestine, Palestinians, faced with legal apparatus of the Israeli state to justify land seizures, remained steadfast within their homes so that “staying in one’s home becomes the act of resistance in the face of erasure” (Routledge 2017:39).

These two examples by Routledge (2017) are particularly thought-provoking as a commonly perceived private space—the home—is the location of public protest. In Kathmandu, whilst the materiality of lighting is within the home, it is outside the home that protest became visible. In Palestine, it is through physical presence within their homes that Palestinians are contesting the authority of the Israeli State. This is interesting as not only do they demonstrate how the materiality of home can be utilised in visible protest at times of restricted citizen freedom, they also contest the typical associations of activism and protest with “the public, the explicit” (Pink 2012:4). For example, Mitchell’s (2003) work on the right to the city maintains that real contention occurs when activists, bursting with frustrations, move out onto the streets. Private spaces such as—although not exclusively—the home are more often associated with everyday and hidden acts of resistance (Scott 1989). Scott (1989) developed accounts of hidden resistance to contend with documentation of open and visible forms of political action, such as

street demonstrations, that dominate perceptions of activism and which for some people and in some places are impossible (Scott 1989).

Whilst we recognise the importance of Scott's (1989) work on everyday acts of resistance and their relevance under authoritarian regimes such as in China, we also recognise an assumption in his work. This is that publicly visible acts of resistance for which participants can be held to account occur in public spaces whilst everyday acts of resistance, where participation is often unknown by oppressors, occur in private spaces. However, this binary precludes public acts of resistance which are intentionally based within the everyday (such as the protest of Lane 49). In the context of housing activism and protest in China, breaking down the public-private binary of protest and conceptualising "home" and "everyday life" as a space of protest more fully connects citizens to wider political contestations.

Permeable Materiality

This binary of protest as public and hidden resistance as private is reminiscent of the public-private dualism that has haunted geography, in which indoor spaces and particularly the home have been Othered, considered too subjective, feminine and unscientific for study (Blunt and Dowling 2006; Domosh 1998; Rose 1993). This dualism is credited to masculinist histories of geography and the distinction between mind and body, with body and other elements associated with it, including home, deemed feminine and thus subjugated (Blunt and Dowling 2006; Domosh 1998). Failing to recognise this dualism renders homes as apolitical spaces where academia does not belong (Longhurst 2001:124). Feminist geographers have worked to counter such renderings.

Kaika (2004) observes that since enlightenment the materiality of the "modern home"—walls, doors, windows, roofs—have been perceived as working not only to keep out natural elements, but also external politics, social process and relations. The home is conceived of as an impermeable place, distinct and separate from the world around it (Kaika 2004). This impermeability is mirrored within much work on Chinese urbanism which documents a transition toward enclave urbanism through the privatised housing regime (Douglass et al. 2013; Wissink et al. 2012). Chinese cities, according to Douglass et al. (2013:167), are now "patchworks of mono-functional and mono-cultural enclaves, demarcated by walls and gates" and private enclaves as "protect[ing] the pristine sensory living environment" (Pow 2017:265).

This construction of home as separate and private is contradicted by feminist geographers and feminist political ecologists who demonstrate that despite being designed to be devoid of nature, nature flows in and through homes (Day Biehler 2009; Day Biehler and Simon 2011; Kaika 2004). For example, Day Biehler (2009) highlight cockroaches as nature within urban public housing in the US and Kaika (2004) demonstrates how nature selectively flows through the home using systems of pipes and cables. Such permeability of built materiality is also observed in health geographies. For example, 50% of the 2003 heat stroke fatalities in France were in homes (Fouillet et al. 2006), 80% of heat strokes in New York occur within the home (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention 2013), and acute

rheumatic fever in New Zealand is associated with exposure to cold and damp within the home (Oliver et al. 2017).

Within literature on China, material impermeability is strongly contested by Iossifova (2015b) and Yip (2012) who both demonstrate that whilst gated communities insinuate impermeability, they are highly permeable. For example, in a survey of gated communities in Shanghai, Yip (2012) found that less than one third had controlled access. In work also based in Shanghai, Iossifova (2015b) observed urban borderlands as diverse and active spaces produced by, and in turn producing, life within enclaves through relational comings and goings. There is also inherent permeability in the built infrastructures of housing and particularly housing from the socialist transition period, of which Lane 49 is part. During this period the Chinese Communist Party's (CCP) "production first, livelihood second" housing regime meant housing was considered an unproductive resource (Zhou and Logan 2008). As a result, socialist public housing was constructed quickly, cheaply and using poor quality materials (Song 2018; Urban 2012).

In addition to deconstructing impermeability of homes to material elements, feminist geographers have positioned homes as "transect[ing] public and political worlds" (Brickell 2012:226) resulting in home as a multi-scalar nexus of power and identity (Blunt and Dowling 2006:22). Political economies of life outside the home are replayed and reproduced within the everyday of the home (Elias and Roberts 2016) and thus permeate the presupposed material boundaries. Whilst such permeability is not unique to China, the design or redevelopment of material housing infrastructures to reconfigure public-private boundaries and expand state control into the home is more specific to communist regimes (Li 2015; Wang 1995). This involved developing an environment of mutual surveillance between neighbours, intended to regulate behaviour through reporting, but also self-policing (Li 2015). To achieve this, housing constructed prior to 1949 was converted to public housing and subdivided with one family assigned one room rather than one residence (Messana 2016). Kitchen and bathroom facilities were shared with all households (Li 2015). As urban populations increased, new housing was constructed. This was standardised Danwei units, often with shared cooking, bathing and toilet facilities (Bray 2005). Continued ideological, sociocultural and political permeation into urban Chinese homes include the one child policy, the current two child policy, and hygiene reforms (Li et al. 2015; Rogaski 2004).

Recognising the permeability embodied in material architectures and the influence that these permeabilities seek to affect upon bodies resonates with renewed encounters with materiality in geography (Anderson and Tolia-Kelly 2004). This renewed encounter seeks to recognise the agency of materiality (Latour 1992) and that "things ... are themselves historical products of material, representational and symbolic practices" (Bakker and Bridge 2006:18). Like place (Massey 2005), materialities are always in process and engagements with materials are shaped ontologically, through various knowledges, memories, histories and discourses that come before such encounters (Cook and Tolia-Kelly 2010). These engagements are "constitutive and mutually defining" (Grosz 1998:242), with "an active force in constituting bodies" (Grosz 1998:250–251).

Protests, Activism, and Infrastructural Materiality

Housing activism, as well as urban activism more broadly, in China has a very different context to non-authoritarian countries, as collective forms of action are illegal and organisations that mobilise citizens against the state are largely absent (Cai 2010; Selden and Perry 2010). However, space for contention can exist (Cai 2010; Fu 2017). Indeed the drive to protest is escalating with urbanisation, increased education, and growing awareness of uneven socio-environmental injustices (Lora-Wainwright 2017; Ong and Han 2019). According to data from China's Public Security Ministry, the number of "mass incidents"—with the scope of what constitutes a mass incident remaining undefined—have grown from 10,000 to 87,000, 1994–2005 (Hess 2010). However, whilst this space exists, there are implications upon forms of activism. For example, whilst Chinese citizens have little role in shaping "government", the party-state does provide space for resistance (Cai 2010). Formally this is through petitions and appeals *xinfang*, in which citizens who believe their rights are being violated by local government can petition to higher authorities (Cai 2010). However, *xinfang* is often ineffectual as leverage is facilitated by social networks and reciprocal relationships or *guanxi* (Cai 2010; Chen 2012). In response, civil society can, according to Fu (2017:501), "pry open spaces for unconventional contention", although they must be inventive in order to reduce personal costs. In Fu's (2017) work this is achieved through disguised collective action, in which activists train individuals to challenge authorities, thereby enabling contention whilst lowering the risks of collective organisation.

Despite risk, citizens do attempt disruptive and collective forms of contention. They often do so through "trouble-making" within a grey area (Chen 2012:110). This grey area results from ambiguity regarding boundaries of acceptable activism, generally considered a form of government repression through associated citizen self-policing (Chen 2012; Fu 2017). However, citizens can exploit this by undertaking undesirable but tolerable activities; meaning they are disruptive but not formally outlawed and less likely to be repressed harshly (Chen 2012; Gui 2017). Citizens also implement tactics of rightful resistance which invoke nationalist and communist values (O'Brien and Li 2006). However, Gui (2017) argues that Chinese protest is too often reduced to this. Despite efforts by citizens to ensure that activism is "safe", instances remain where participants in non-regime threatening activism are detained (Cai 2010) and whilst violent repression is uncommon, Article 290 of Criminal Law—disruption of social order—is commonly invoked (Cai 2010).

Whilst there are different reasons for contention within housing activism, this section will discuss *chaiqian* and nail households *dingzihu* due to opportunities to explore the entanglement of place and materiality. *Dingzihu* or "nail households" are households that have been resisting processes of *chaiqian*. They are named because whilst housing around them has been razed and the landscape is largely barren, *dingzihu* remain, sticking stubbornly out of the ground (Hess 2010:908). There is a limited but developing body of literature on nail households (Gui 2017; Li et al. 2019). This includes work seeking to understand which households become nail households, under what conditions and using which tactics (Hess

2010; Li et al. 2019), as well as analysis of strategies used by authorities, including community “thought work” (Deng 2017), to resolve conflicts (Wu et al. 2019).

So far this scholarship reflects little upon how material infrastructures of nail houses are entangled with protest. For example, Ho (2013:143) contrasts “the forgotten nail houses and the bustling construction for progress and profit”. However, discussion of the material presence of nail houses and the capacity of materiality to in itself be protest is fleeting. For example, there is little recognition of how this materiality protests by acting on bodies, such as in other material protest work (see Endres and Senda-Cook 2011:263).

A reading of nail households also demonstrates, like Routledge (2017), how home is entangled with protest by providing a “private” materiality from which protest is publicly contended, thus blurring public-private boundaries. For example, Hess (2010) discusses Shanghai’s Pan Yang, who threw Molotov cocktails from her home’s roof at bulldozers set to demolish it and Chengdu’s Tang Fuzhen, who set herself on fire on the roof of her home. Both protestors used their home’s materiality; the height of the roof and its very nature as a nail household, to publicly enact their contention. Furthermore, the height of nail houses themselves, which supports visibility, is the legacy of a housing regime in which unofficial upwards construction was tolerated to combat overcrowding (Shin 2013). Whilst the case-study used in this paper is not of nail households, what this existing literature shows is that materiality of homes *is* being utilised within China’s housing activism. This paper, through an account of Lane 49’s activism, will add complexity and depth of understanding to housing activism by demonstrating the entanglement of infrastructural histories.

Approaching Lane 49

Lane 49 is a small community in downtown Shanghai, where the built landscape is rapidly transforming with factories disappearing, replaced by shopping and business districts, office blocks and modern apartments. Within this landscape, Lane 49 is an island, a cluster of nine residential buildings. These buildings are all products of the Socialist housing regime; six apartment buildings constructed in the 1970s and three republican-era houses converted to apartments during the 1950s/60s. Subsequently, permeability, as discussed previously, is embodied within their material infrastructures.

Engaging with Lane 49’s residents began after the primary researcher noticed the Lane one evening. Their ability to freely access the Lane further exemplifies the permeability of gated communities, for whilst it had both gate and security guards the researcher could walk straight in. On their first visit they met Zhang Shushu, a native Shanghai resident who explained that Lane 49 is old public housing with shared kitchen and bathroom facilities. After this first meeting, they were invited to return the next morning and the next, until no invitation was needed and it was expected they would join for morning tea, 8am–10am Monday–Friday, with a “core” group of six retired neighbours. They are Dajie and Dage, a married couple in their 50s who live in a 1970s apartment with a private kitchen and shared bathroom; Zhang Ayi and Zhang Shushu, a married couple in

their 70s living together with their son, daughter-in-law, and granddaughter in pre-1949 housing; Zhejiang Jie who is in her late 40s and lives with her husband and 22-year-old son in pre-1949 housing; and finally, Waan Laoshi, a retired teacher who lives alone in a 1970s apartment and has a private kitchen and private bathroom. All names have been changed to protect the identity of participants.

This was not a case-study by design and initially joining morning tea provided the primary researcher with company and Chinese language practice. However, one morning as they arrived slightly later than usual, they were met with banners, signs, music, and over 20 residents congregating by the gate. Whilst the atmosphere seemed jovial, residents were commencing their version of housing activism. In 2016 an agreement was reached with administrative authorities on the Lane's redevelopment. The vision was complete demolition and the construction of 22-storey apartment blocks; all with private kitchens and bathrooms. Registered households would be compensated with a new apartment. However, by summer 2018 government authorities ceased communicating and inquiries by residents met silence. From June to August 2018 morning tea and Lane 49's protest overlapped. As this continued the protest dynamics were slowly revealed. The protest related to inadequacies in energy and water provisioning, as well as the shared facilities. The wider project of which this paper is part explores transforming water and energy demand in urban China. Given the significance of this issue to residents, they implored for their case to become part of the project. A decision was made across the wider project team to shift from "casual" relationship to include those who wished to participate.

Upon discussion with the neighbours, it was ascertained that methods used with other households—namely visits, diaries and interviews—were inappropriate. This was partly because residents were reluctant to allow visitors into their homes, attributed to the violation of home during the cultural revolution (Bray 2005; Liu 2017) and feelings of shame over living conditions, as well as fears that interviews would formalise our morning tea. Instead the primary researcher would attend morning tea and the protest and have discussions without it becoming "formal". Data within this paper are thus largely based upon observant participation within Lane 49 and an ethnography—"the process of learning through exposure or involvement" (Schensul et al. 1999:91)—of protest within the Lane. Such ethnographic work on the geographies of social movement and activism is essential in order to establish the soils of resistance from which protest emerges, as well as which shape how protest is implemented (Oslender 2004). The core group of neighbours also completed water and energy consumption diaries which are a simple method to understand everyday routines (Sayer 2005).

Living, Organising, and Contesting through Permeabilities

This section discusses how place and materiality, and particularly how embodied permeability within Lane 49's built infrastructure, is entangled with contention amongst residents. It first discusses how lived experiences of permeable infrastructures galvanise shared identities as the urban "left behind; a perceived injustice

motivating residents' protest. It then explores how residents subvert permeability, utilising it to facilitate protest organisation. Finally, it captures how residents implement protest utilising material permeabilities embodied within the Lane's socialist history.

Lived Experiences of Permeability

Throughout the ethnography, Lane 49's residents would often discuss the permeability of housing infrastructures, and particularly roofs, windows, and brickwork. Infrastructural permeability was considered particularly significant in pre-1949 housing. In her diary Zhejiang Jie talks about how troublesome water leaking through her roof is when it rains. This was commonly reflected within discussions and particularly with those who live on the top floor. Holes are also identified in brickwork and windows: "Windows are broken; there are draughts, cracks in the bricks. Families that can't afford AC heating will wear many layers" (Dage, 7 August 2018). Permeabilities not only enable intrusion of the elements, but also pests and vermin. And the material decay is not only limited to outer infrastructures. Residents also discussed how inner walls are disintegrating and water will leak from bathrooms above them and rise through the floor during heavy rainfall and localised flooding within the Lane.

Embodied within these permeable structures is the legacy of socially permeable shared facilities. Most households share bathing, toilet and kitchen facilities. In the pre-1949 houses, five to eight households share, whilst in post-1949 buildings two households share. Whilst the total number of people sharing depends upon household numbers, in the pre-1949 buildings a dozen people can share one toilet. Whilst shared kitchens are unfailingly discussed as problematic by residents, due to lack of space for residents to simultaneously cook or install extractor fans, shared toilets and bathing facilities cause most strife.

High numbers of people sharing facilities means queues and when the shower and toilet are in the same room, the wait is longer. Difficulties in having to wait and the associated indignities, particularly for older people, are summarised by Mrs Wu: "The biggest problem is the one toilet. We have to wait. It's undignified for older people as we struggle with waiting long periods of time" (Mrs Wu, 2 July 2018). In her diary Zhejiang Jie noted that with "more than a dozen people sharing one bathroom, you have to be fast so that you don't affect others". However, Mrs Wu contended that older people could not use facilities as quickly as younger residents, and this created tensions. The shared facilities were also perceived as causing isolation by driving out younger residents: "Since my children moved out I feel lonely. This is common for older people. Young people can't bear these conditions" (Mrs Huang, 2 July 2018). Lived experiences of shared facilities are also made difficult by poor quality water and energy provisioning infrastructures. Low water pressure and an electricity system vulnerable to tripping means added time and inconvenience, particularly during peak hours.

Permeability is one substance moving through another, expanded beyond material to the immaterial. This means that whilst Lane 49 is an island of aging housing within extensive urban development, their community is not cut off from

everyday life outside the Lane. Instead residents juxtapose their lived permeabilities with conditions outside of the Lane: "Everything outside our community is improving. We see this every time we leave our homes, watch television. From our windows we see new buildings being constructed. We're left behind" (Waan Laoshi, 19 July 2018). As elucidated by Waan Laoshi, it is not just the surrounding urban development that permeates the community, as knowledge also comes from additional sources. From researcher experiences of living in Shanghai it is difficult to switch on a television without being bombarded with signifiers of urban progression, either through soap operas in which households have independent kitchen and bathroom facilities, or in advertisements where such facilities pervade the background. Private kitchen and bathroom facilities are also actively promoted in commercial housing campaigns (Campanella 2008; Ren 2013; Tomba 2010).

Homes in Lane 49, in terms of their built infrastructures and shared facilities, are "incomparable" (Zhejiang Jie) to new homes being constructed in the area (Figure 1). And this incomparability is leading to the development of a "left behind" identity within Lane 49, a notion commonly reflected in language used by many residents. For example, Zhang Shushu said "We are the worst place in whole district", and Mrs Zhao explained that whilst the city external has moved on they, the residents of Lane 49, "have been left sitting". Residents locate their left behind-ness within government policy of a moderately prosperous society and the eradication of absolute poverty in China by 2020. Residents believe their permeable living conditions to be well below the standard of moderate prosperity and challenge the city government in their formal petition: "The question of Lane 49: how many years will Shanghai's government take to solve it? Will they let us drift with the tide, waiting to be exposed to the international metropolis of Shanghai in 2020?" (Extract from Lane 49's formal petition, 1 July 2018). This identity as "left behind" also intersects with their perceived loss of more dignified living conditions through the initial hope of redevelopment given by local government, followed by subsequent disappointment. Dage (Field notes, 7 August 18) described this let-down viscerally: "Like going from heaven to hell. Like having a bucket of cold water poured over my body". It is this loss of hope compounding the perceived injustice and degradation of their permeable material infrastructures of home that is spurring the residents to come together and enact contention in order to get the attention of Shanghai's government.

It is important to recognise that whilst Lane 49 consists of both Shanghainese residents, as well as urban migrants who work in blue-collar jobs, it is only the Shanghainese residents who participate. This is because urban migrants have no rights to the housing within the Lane and instead rent accommodation from those with rights. If the Lane were to be redeveloped, urban migrants would lose their apartments. This is significant because Lane 49 provides cheap rental accommodation within downtown Shanghai. More commonly, urban migrants are pushed to urban peripheries where rent is cheaper but services and transport links are poorer (Guo and Wang 2015; Logan et al. 2009). It would go against their own best interests for urban migrant residents of Lane 49 to participate in contesting for redevelopment. This stark difference in participation in the protest is a



Figure 1: Top: communal kitchen and bathroom, Lane 49; Bottom: private kitchen and bathroom, commercial apartment (source: authors' photos, 8 July 2018). [Colour figure can be viewed at wileyonlinelibrary.com]

strong example of Oslender's (2004) assertion on the subjectivity of place. For whilst Shanghainese residents perceived Lane 49 as a space of oppression and degradation, for blue collar urban migrants it provided the opportunity of low-cost rental accommodation in close proximity to places of work.

Utilising Permeabilities to Organise Protest

In the absence of organisations to mobilise citizens, collective action in China is often organised around "context-contingent factors" (Cai 2010:34). However, research rarely moves beyond the assumption that context-contingent factors

support organisation through opportunities that proximity of living offer in terms of ongoing interaction and communication. Recognising this, this section analyses the significance of Lane 49's "tea table" as a place of "throwntogetherness" (Massey 2005) and a site of protest, using the example of Mr Yang's letter. Focus is on the tea table due to privileged access during fieldwork. We begin with a brief description of the tea table, followed by an examination of how the tea table is entangled with the organisation of contention through Mr Yang's letter.

Outside one of the pre-1949 residential buildings, surrounded by seating and with direct communal kitchen access, is a table. Above the table is a canopy and the roof and sides are layered in metal and plastic to protect it from the elements. Above the table hangs a fan and, on the table, rests an extension cord which, when not in use, is wrapped in layers of plastic and fabric to protect it from the rain. Monday to Friday, 8am–10am this is the "tea table", a place for residents to come together, drink tea and talk. At other times it's another place, another *throwntogetherness*—a place for Zhang Ayi's granddaughter to do her homework or Mrs Li to rest her laundry basket.

One morning during the later stages of fieldwork Mr Yang stopped at the tea table, with his letter, after taking his dog for a walk. This event is recounted in the primary researcher's field diary:

I'm sitting with the neighbours drinking tea. It's hot, humid and we have two fans keeping us cool. Mr Yang joins us and after eating a baozi and washing his hands in the kitchen, he passes Zhejiang Jie a draft of a letter to be sent to the Inspector General as part of an anti-corruption campaign. The letter outlines the broken promises of Lane 49's redevelopment and names officials involved.

Dage stands and calls to Waan Laoshi to come down and join us and the neighbours drink their tea and pass the letter round, commenting and making suggestions. (Field diary, 17 August 2018)

This letter is particularly interesting as unlike other forms of petition it is only being signed by one person; Mr Yang. As it is being sent to the Inspector General, the perceived risks of contention are higher. One individual signing can therefore be understood as a disguised collective action (Fu 2017) in which risk is reduced by individual rather than group contention. However, whilst individually signed it is collectively edited.

The coming together of the tea table and its facilitation in the organisation of these activities involves an entanglement of Lane 49's materialities and permeabilities. Of particular importance are the extension cord and the communal kitchen. The extension cord powers the two fans, with both considered necessary by neighbours as without them it would be too hot and uncomfortable to consider sitting outside. The extension cord enables the neighbours to have a kettle on the table. According to Dage, without the kettle right on the table, there would be no tea because for tea you need just-boiled water. The wire for the extension cord climbs up the drainpipe, through Zhejiang Jie's window and is plugged in. Zhejiang Jie is not only making use of the permeability of her building, in this case a broken pane of glass through which the wire is fed, but also the political context

within which the management and maintenance of public housing is limited and where adaptations to infrastructure, unlike in more tightly regulated commercial housing, are more acceptable. Such adaptations can be understood as efforts by household dwellers to modify network configurations to improve everyday experiences (McFarlane 2011; Silver 2014; Simone 2008). The communal kitchen is also an integral part of the coming together of the tea table, providing a place that any neighbour can access in order to use the water facilities. During research, observations on uses included washing hands after eating breakfast, like Mr Yang, cooling off after going for a walk, washing fruit for the group, or simply going into the communal kitchen to wash out the teapot or fill up the kettle.

These permeabilities mean that rather than neighbours disappearing into private apartments, where they may have remained, they could do these activities using communal facilities and return to or remain at the tea table. The tea table also holds a permeable position within the Lane; it can be seen as a place to congregate and it can see out into the Lane, enabling calling to people to join. Enabled by these permeabilities it provides an ongoing constant; a known meeting place that can be accessed by residents of Lane 49 if they need to discuss and plan ongoing protest activities.

Staging Protest through Permeabilities

Prior to summer 2018 the residents of Lane 49 only participated in petition. However, residents like Cai (2010) and Chen (2012) found that this was unsuccessful in gaining resolution: "We contact government but get no reply. We ask the city government, who tell us to ask the community government. We ask the community government, who tell us that they don't have the authority" (Zhang Shushu, 2 July 2018). In order to gain the attention of officials who "can make a decision" (Zhang Shushu), residents in Lane 49 diverted their attention from only petitions to carrying out a visible protest every weekday morning. The residents utilise the materiality of place and its permeable histories within their protest to both "pry open" space for civic action (Fu 2017:501) as well as ensure that their actions remain within China's "grey area" of protest (Chen 2012). This section will begin with a brief outline of the protest, followed by a spatial analysis and a discussion of the entanglement of materiality.

At 9am every morning up to 30 residents of Lane 49 emerged from their homes carrying stools, signs, banners and a speaker, congregating at the gates of the Lane for 90 minutes. Their aim was to gain the attention of the city government, by their actions as well as through galvanising public support, and achieve the redevelopment of their homes that they were promised. Figure 2, originally drawn by a Zhejiang Jie to show all Lane 49's buildings is overlain to demonstrate the spatiality of protest activities. Outside the entrance gate, to the left (Figure 2A), a red banner, flanked by residents, is hung. The banner proclaims, "We believe in the government and the party that they won't let the people despair again". To the right of the gate (Figure 2B) residents place five large boards, each crammed with information on the decision to redevelop Lane 49 and then the



Figure 2: Lane 49 map overlain by spatialities of protest (source: drawn by Zhejiang Jie, 2 July 2018). [Colour figure can be viewed at wileyonlinelibrary.com]

failure to do so. Inside the entrance gate, on the right (Figure 2C), residents congregate in the shade. On spot D (Figure 2), a speaker is placed on a table.

Initial observation of Lane 49's protests easily identify deployment of rightful resistance (O'Brien and Li 2006). The red banner mirrors CCP propaganda and expresses belief in the party. Women congregating inside the gate hold small flags of China and a small repertoire of thoughtfully selected songs played on repeat during the protest. These include "Unity is Strength" and "Socialism is Good", both of which are popular CCP propaganda songs. However, this is not the only aspect of Lane 49's activities and their protest should not be reduced only to this. This section also introduces how place, materiality and permeability contribute to activism by helping classify protest as undesirable but still tolerable to authorities. The neighbours also invoke this rightful resistance within discussion, insisting that they are not questioning the authority of either the central party or state ideology, but rather that the failure to redevelop in line with the 2020 policy on the eradication of absolute poverty is indicative of corruption in lower and more local echelons of government: "We're not criticising the Party. It's that Party policies are not followed through by the governments at the city and local level" (Zhejiang Jie, 17 August 2020).

When petitions are ineffective and citizens begin adding degrees of "trouble-making" to their activism, they generally ensure they remain within the "grey

area" of undesired but tolerable activities (Chen 2012). This means ensuring protest does not violate Article 290 of criminal law. From Figure 2 it can be observed that protest is organised in a way that ensures both the flow of traffic, as well as the flow of pedestrians, is not disrupted. Protesting residents sit close to edges, against the wall and off the road. They also, as mentioned in the quote from the field diary below, do not accost passers-by: "The neighbours don't stand on the pavement. They will wait until they have enticed people to stop and look, either by signs or by the music" (Field diary, 29 July 2018). It is at this point, when pedestrians have shown their interest in the event that they will be approached by one of the residents, who will then start to explain their situation and what they are doing.

What Figure 2 also demonstrates is that these protest activities are largely happening in what is generally perceived as a "private space". Utilising the visual and audible permeability of the Lane helps their protest activities become public. They can be seen by foot, bicycle and vehicular traffic moving along the road in both directions. The banner catches the attention of people not present in their mobility, perhaps looking down at their phones, and the loud music draws in those from further away who have heard a commotion. As a result, their protest activities, like the nail households previously discussed and work by Routledge (2017) on protest in Palestine and Nepal, transcend any semblance of occurrence within either a public or a private space. Like this work, the activities of Lane 49 also demonstrate how, through this blurring of public and private, protestors ensure their contentious activities are as safe as possible, within the undesirable but tolerable category.

Concluding Remarks

Through China's implementation of a neo-liberal housing regime, inequalities in conditions of living have resulted in a boom housing activism, particularly in urban areas. Through the case study of Lane 49, a small community of public housing Shanghai, this article has produced a local epistemology (Ma 2007) of housing activism that, following Oslander's (2004) assertion that such work needs to attend to the foundations of discontent, analyses the emergence, organisation and implementation of contention. The first section demonstrates how permeable infrastructures, resulting from China's past socialist housing regime, have caused poor living conditions and the development of a shared identity as the urban "left-behind". It is this shared identity which galvanises action and cooperation between residents to protest. The second section demonstrates, through the tea table and Mr Yang's letter, how residents of Lane 49 not only suffer from the permeable materialities, but also subvert them within their everyday lives and create spaces within which to organise. The final section demonstrates how residents utilise the Lane's permeability to implement a form of protest that subverts public-private boundaries in order to remain within the grey area of acceptability to authorities.

Within this epistemology this article shows how the permeable material histories of Lane 49 are entangled with the *throwntogetherness* of place. This is important

considering that geographical proximity is considered significant in civic mobilisation in China (Cai 2010) and adds complexity to understandings of protest by introducing materiality-as-tactic in protest to existing work on tactics such as O'Brien and Li's (2006) rightful resistance narrative. Whilst such localised case studies may be considered futile considering the vast size of China's urban areas, it is important to remember that they offer opportunities to understand underlying processes of efforts that can contribute to social, as well as environmental, justice activities (Ma 2007). The case of Lane 49 is not supposed to provide a blueprint for housing activism within China or more broadly within authoritarian and restrictive governance regimes. Instead it demonstrates how, within authoritarian regimes, people can look to and subvert the materialities of their everyday life in order to create a form of activism that is both visible and meets their needs in terms of perceived safety.

More widely, this article contributes to radical geographies of protest by utilising feminist geography and feminist political ecology in order to blur public-private binaries and demonstrate how important homes and private space can be within publicly visible contentious activities. This not only contributes to blurring binaries of public=protest and private=hidden resistance, but also offers opportunities to think about how contention and activism can be implemented within restrictive regimes in ways that are both visible and powerful, but simultaneously as safe for those involved as possible.

Acknowledgements

This research was funded through an NWDTC-ESRC PhD studentship. The authors are grateful to all the residents of Lane 49 and particularly Dajie, Dage, Zhang Aji, Zhang Shushu, Zhejiang Jie and Waan Laoshi.

References

- Agnew J (1987) *Place and Politics: The Geographical Mediation of State and Society*. London: Routledge
- Agnew J (1994) The territorial trap: The geographical assumptions of international relations theory. *Review of International Political Economy* 1(1):53–80
- Anderson B and Tolia-Kelly D (2004) Matter(s) in social and cultural geography. *Geoforum* 35(6):669–674
- Bakker K and Bridge G (2006) Material worlds? Resource geographies and the “matter of nature”. *Progress in Human Geography* 30(1):5–27
- Blunt A and Dowling R (2006) *Home*. New York: Routledge
- Bray D (2005) *Social Space and Governance in Urban China: The Danwei System from Origins to Reform*. Stanford: Stanford University Press
- Brickell K (2012) “Mapping” and “doing” critical geographies of home. *Progress in Human Geography* 36(2):225–244
- Cai Y (2010) *Collective Resistance in China: Why Popular Protests Succeed or Fail*. Stanford: Stanford University Press
- Campanella T J (2008) *The Concrete Dragon: China's Urban Revolution and What it Means for the World*. New York: Princeton Architectural Press
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (2013) Heat illness and deaths: New York City, 2000–2011. *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report* 62(31):617–621

- Chatterton P and Pickerill J (2010) Everyday activism and transitions towards post-capitalist worlds. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 35(4):475–490
- Chen X (2012) *Social Protest and Contentious Authoritarianism in China*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Cook I and Tolia-Kelly D P (2010) Material geographies. In D Hicks and M C Beaudry (eds) *The Oxford Handbook of Material Culture Studies* (pp 99–122). Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Day Biehler D (2009) Permeable homes: A historical political ecology of insects and pesticides in US public housing. *Geoforum* 40(6):1014–1023
- Day Biehler D and Simon G L (2011) The Great Indoors: Research frontiers on indoor environments as active political-ecological spaces. *Progress in Human Geography* 35(2):172–192
- Deng Y (2017) “Autonomous redevelopment”: Moving the masses to remove nail households. *Modern China* 43(5):494–522
- Domosh M (1998) Geography and gender: Home, again? *Progress in Human Geography* 22(2):276–283
- Douglass M, Wissink B and van Kempen R (2013) Enclave urbanism in China: Consequences and interpretations. *Urban Geography* 33(2):167–182
- Elias J and Roberts A (2016) Feminist global political economies of the everyday: From bananas to bingo. *Globalizations* 13(6):787–800
- Endres D and Senda-Cook S (2011) Location matters: The rhetoric of place in protest. *Quarterly Journal of Speech* 97(3):257–282
- Foucault M (1986) Of other spaces. *Diacritics* 16(1):22–27
- Fouillet A, Rey G, Laurent F, Pavillon G, Bellec S, Guihenneuc-Jouyau C, Clavel J, Jougla E and Hémon D (2006) Excess mortality related to the August 2003 heat wave in France. *International Archives of Occupational and Environmental Health* 80(1):16–24
- Fu D (2017) Disguised collective action in China. *Comparative Political Studies* 50(4):499–527
- Grosz E (1998) Bodies-cities. In H J Nast and S Pile (eds) *Places Through the Body* (pp 242–251). New York: Routledge
- Gui X (2017) The contention of nail residents: Process dynamics and outcomes. *Chinese Sociological Dialogue* 2(3/4):177–192
- Guo M and Wang Z (2015) Migrant housing in urban China: Based on residential segregation and social exclusion theory. *Open Journal of Business and Management* 3:281–286
- Hess S (2010) Nail-houses, land rights, and frames of injustice on China’s protest landscape. *Asian Survey* 50(5):908–926
- Ho C Y (2013) Exit or evict: Re-grounding rights in needs in China’s urban housing demolition. *Asian Anthropology* 12(2):141–155
- Hsing Y (2010) *The Great Urban Transformation: Politics of Land and Property in China*. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Ingold T (2008) Bindings against boundaries: Entanglements of life in an open world. *Environment and Planning A* 40(8):1796–1810
- Iossifova D (2015a) Everyday practices of sanitation under uneven urban development in contemporary Shanghai. *Environment and Urbanization* 27(2):541–554
- Iossifova D (2015b) Borderland urbanism: Seeing between enclaves. *Urban Geography* Routledge 36(1):90–108
- Kaika M (2004) Interrogating the geographies of the familiar: Domesticating nature and constructing the autonomy of the modern home. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 28(2):265–286
- Latour B (1992) Where are the missing masses? The sociology of a few mundane artefacts. In W E Bijker and J Law (eds) *Shaping Technology/Building Society: Studies in Sociotechnical Change* (pp 225–258). Cambridge: MIT Press
- Lefebvre H (1991) *The Production of Space*. Oxford: Blackwell
- Li B, Huikuri S, Zhang Y and Chen W (2015) Motivating intersectoral collaboration with the Hygienic City Campaign in Jingchang, China. *Environment and Urbanization* 27(1):285–302

- Li C, Day J and Wang M (2019) More than opportunistic victims: The multiple profiles of Chinese urban nail households. *International Development Planning Review* 41(3):353–373
- Li J (2015) *Shanghai Homes: Palimpsests of Private Life*. New York: Columbia University Press
- Liu J (2017) *Gender, Sexuality, and Power in Chinese Companies: Beauties at Work*. London: Palgrave Macmillan
- Loftus A (2012) *Everyday Environmentalism: Creating an Urban Political Ecology*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press
- Logan J R, Fang Y and Zhang Z (2009) Access to housing in Urban China. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 33(4):914–935
- Longhurst R (2001) *Bodies: Exploring Fluid Boundaries*. London: Routledge
- Lora-Wainwright A (2017) *Resigned Activism: Living with Pollution in Rural China*. Cambridge: MIT Press
- Ma L J C (2007) From China's urban social space to social and environmental justice. *Eurasian Geography and Economics* 48(5):555–566
- Martin D and Miller B (2003) Space and contentious politics. *Mobilization* 8(2):143–156
- Massey D (2005) *For Space*. London: Sage
- McFarlane C (2011) The city as assemblage: Dwelling and urban space. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 29(4):649–671
- Messana P (2016) *Soviet Communal Living. An Oral History of the Kommunalka*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan
- Miller B A (2000) *Geography and Social Movements: Comparing Antinuclear Activism in the Boston Area*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press
- Mitchell D (2003) *The Right to the City: Social Justice and the Fight for Public Space*. New York: Guilford Press
- Nagar R (2019) Hungry translations: The world through radical vulnerability. *Antipode* 51(1): 3–24
- O'Brien K J and Li L (2006) *Rightful Resistance in Rural China*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Oliver J R, Piersie N, Stefanogiannis N, Jackson C and Baker M G (2017) Acute rheumatic fever and exposure to poor housing conditions in New Zealand: A descriptive study. *Journal of Paediatrics and Child Health* 53(4):358–364
- Ong L H and Han D (2019) What drives people to protest in an authoritarian country? Resources and rewards vs risks of protests in urban and rural China. *Political Studies* 67(1): 224–248
- Oslender U (2004) Fleshing out the geographies of social movements: Colombia's Pacific coast black communities and the "aquatic space". *Political Geography* 23(8):957–985
- Pile S and Keith M (eds) (1997) *Geographies of Resistance*. Abingdon: Routledge
- Pink S (2012) *Situating Everyday Life*. London: Sage
- Poon C Y J (2015) "Behind the Numbers: The Chinese Vision of Electrification." China Sustainability Project, Columbia University
- Pow C P (2017) Sensing visceral urban politics and metabolic exclusion in a Chinese neighbourhood. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 42(2):260–273
- Ren H (2013) *The Middle Class in Neoliberal China: Governing Risk, Life-Building, and Themed Spaces*. Abingdon: Routledge
- Rogaski R (2004) *Hygienic Modernity: Meanings of Health and Disease in Treaty-Port China*. Berkeley: University of California Press
- Rose G (1993) *Feminism and Geography: The Limits of Geographical Knowledge*. Cambridge: Polity
- Routledge P (1992) Putting politics in its place: Baliapal, India, as a terrain of resistance. *Political Geography* 11(6):588–611
- Routledge P (1993) *Terrains of Resistance: Nonviolent Social Movements and the Contestation of Place in India*. New York: Praeger
- Routledge P (2017) *Space Invaders: Radical Geographies of Protest*. London: Pluto
- Salmenkari T (2009) Geography of protest: Places of demonstration in Buenos Aires and Seoul. *Urban Geography* 30(3):239–260

- Sayer L C (2005) Gender, time, and inequality: Trends in women's and men's paid work, unpaid work, and free time. *Social Forces* 84(1):285–303
- Schensul S L, Schensul J J and LeCompte M D (1999) *Essential Ethnographic Methods: Observations, Interviews, and Questionnaires*. Oxford: AltaMira Press
- Scott J C (1989) Everyday forms of resistance. *Copenhagen Papers in East and Southeast Asian Studies* 4:33–62
- Selden M and Perry E J (2010) Reform, conflict, and resistance in contemporary China. In E J Perry and M Selden (eds) *Chinese Society: Change, Conflict, and Resistance* (3rd edn) (pp 1–30). Abingdon: Routledge
- Shao Q (2013) *Shanghai Gone: Domicide and Defiance in a Chinese Megacity*. Plymouth: Rowman and Littlefield
- Shin H B (2013) The right to the city and critical reflections on China's property rights activism. *Antipode* 45(5):1167–1189
- Shin H B (2018) Urban movements and the genealogy of urban rights discourses: The case of urban protesters against redevelopment and displacement in Seoul, South Korea. *Annals of the American Association of Geographers* 108(2):356–369
- Silver J (2014) Incremental infrastructures: Material improvisation and social collaboration across post-colonial Accra. *Urban Geography* 35(6):788–804
- Simone A (2008) The politics of the possible: Making urban life in Phnom Penh. *Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography* 29(2):186–204
- Slater D (1998) Rethinking the spatialities of social movements: Questions of (b)orders, culture, and politics in global times. In S E Alvarez, E Dagnino and A Escobar (eds) *Cultures of Politics, Politics of Cultures: Re-visioning Latin American Social Movements* (pp 380–401). Westview: Boulder
- Soja E (1989) *Postmodern Geographies: The Reassertion of Space in Critical Social Theory*. London: Verso
- Song K (2018) Political ideology and the production of architectural theories in Mao's China (1949–1976). *Architectural Histories* 6(1) <https://journal.eahn.org/articles/10.5334/ah.307/> (last accessed 2 September 2020)
- Tomba L (2010) The housing effect: The making of China's social distinctions. In C Li (ed) *China's Emerging Middle Class: Beyond Economic Transformation* (pp 193–216). Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press
- UNICEF and WHO (2015) "Progress on Sanitation and Drinking Water: 2015 Update and MDG Assessment." UNICEF and World Health Organization https://www.unicef.org/publications/index_82419.html (last accessed 2 September 2020)
- Urban F (2012) *Tower and Slab: Histories of Global Mass Housing*. Abingdon: Routledge
- Wang S (1995) The politics of private time: Changing leisure patters in urban China. In D S Davis, R Kraus, B Naughton and E J Perry (eds) *Urban Spaces in Contemporary China: The Potential for Autonomy and Community in Post-Mao China* (pp 149–172). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Wissink B, van Kempen R, Fang Y and Li S (2012) Living in Chinese enclave cities. *Urban Geography* 33(2):161–166
- Wu X, Li C and Wang M (2019) Negotiation and exchange in nail household conflict resolution: "Bargained authoritarianism" and "accident avoidance" in urban China. *Journal of Contemporary China* 29(125):667–679
- Xiao Y, Song Y and Wu X (2018) How far has China's urbanization gone? *Sustainability* 10 (8) <https://doi.org/10.3390/su10082953>
- Yip N M (2012) Walled without gates: Gated communities in Shanghai. *Urban Geography* 33(2):221–236
- Yip N M (2019) Housing activism in urban China: The quest for autonomy in neighbourhood governance. *Housing Studies* 34(10):1635–1653
- Zhou Y and Logan J R (2008) Growth on the edge: The new Chinese metropolis. In J R Logan (ed) *Urban China in Transition* (pp 140–160). Oxford: Blackwell