

Women and International Human Rights in Modern Times

A Contemporary Casebook

Rosa Celorio

*Burnett Family Associate Dean and Professorial Lecturer for International
and Comparative Legal Studies, George Washington University Law School,
USA*

 **Edward Elgar**
PUBLISHING

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

© Rosa Celorio 2022

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by
Edward Elgar Publishing Limited
The Lypiatts
15 Lansdown Road
Cheltenham
Glos GL50 2JA
UK

Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc.
William Pratt House
9 Dewey Court
Northampton
Massachusetts 01060
USA

A catalogue record for this book
is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Control Number: 2021952861

This book is available electronically in the **Elgar**online
Law subject collection
<http://dx.doi.org/10.4337/9781800889392>

Printed on elemental chlorine free (ECF)
recycled paper containing 30% Post-Consumer Waste

ISBN 978 1 80088 938 5 (cased)
ISBN 978 1 80088 939 2 (eBook)

Printed and bound in the USA

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvii
1 Discrimination against women: doctrine, practice, and the path forward	1
I Introduction: Discrimination against women through the lens of international human rights law	1
II CEDAW and discrimination against women	3
A Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)	4
B Reflections and Questions	9
III CEDAW Committee: discrimination against women and state obligations	13
A The core obligations of State parties under Article 2 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women	13
B Reflections and Questions	15
IV Universal human rights treaties: the covenants and beyond	18
A International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	19
B International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	21
C Reflections and Questions	23
D <i>Sharon McIvor and Jacob Grismer</i>	24
E Reflections and Questions	26
V Discrimination on the basis of sex at the national level	27
A <i>United States v. Virginia</i>	28
B Reflections and Questions	30
VI Stereotypes and cultural patterns of behavior	32
A <i>Karen Tayag Vertido v. Philippines</i> (Excerpts)	33
B Reflections and Questions	35
VII Final comments: CEDAW in practice	37
2 Gender-based violence as a form of discrimination	38
I Introduction: The widespread nature of gender-based violence	38
II Gender-based violence as an international human rights issue	39

A	CEDAW Committee, General Recommendation No. 19, Violence against Women	39
B	Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women	41
C	Reflections and Questions	43
III	Gender-based violence against women	45
A	General Recommendation No. 35 on Gender-Based Violence against Women, Updating General Recommendation No. 19	45
B	Reflections and Questions	47
IV	Regional approaches to gender-based violence	49
A	Inter-American Convention on the Punishment, Prevention, and Eradication of Violence against Women (hereinafter “Convention of Belém do Pará”), 1994	49
B	African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa (hereinafter “Maputo Protocol”), 2003	51
C	Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence (hereinafter “Istanbul Convention”), 2011	54
D	Reflections and Questions	57
E	Practical exercise: Comparison of regional treaties on violence against women	59
V	Problem of femicide and extreme forms of gender-based violence	61
A	Report of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences, Rashida Manjoo	61
B	<i>González et al. v. Mexico</i> (“Cotton Field” case), Inter-American Court of Human Rights	63
C	Reflections and Questions	66
VI	Final comments: Gender-based violence, the “ <i>MeToo</i> movement,” and social protest	67
3	Intersectionality and the interconnectedness of discrimination: the case of indigenous women	69
I	Introduction: Intersectional forms of discrimination and the experience of indigenous women	69
II	Discrimination with a gender, indigenous women, intersectional, and intercultural perspective	71
A	Article 9, Inter-American Convention on the Punishment, Prevention, and Eradication of Violence against Women (“Convention of Belém do Pará”), 1994	71
B	Article 1, Inter-American Convention against all Forms of Discrimination and Intolerance	71
C	Report of the Special Rapporteur on indigenous peoples, Victoria Tauli Corpuz	72

D	Reflections and Questions	74
III	Intersectional discrimination against indigenous women: individual case examples	78
A	CEDAW Committee, <i>Cecilia Kell v. Canada</i>	78
B	<i>Valentina Rosendo Cantú</i> , Inter-American Court of Human Rights	80
C	Reflections and Questions	83
IV	Resolving the puzzle of intersectional equality	86
4	Sexual orientation and gender identity	87
I	Introduction: The evolution of gender equality	87
II	Sexual orientation and gender identity as prohibited factors of discrimination	89
A	<i>Karen Atala v. Chile</i> , Inter-American Court of Human Rights	89
B	<i>Bostock v. Clayton County</i> , United States Supreme Court	92
C	Reflections and Questions	95
III	The right to privacy	97
A	<i>Toonen v. Australia</i> , United Nations Human Rights Committee	98
B	<i>Martha Lucia Álvarez Giraldo</i> , Inter-American Commission on Human Rights	99
C	Reflections and Questions	101
IV	The right to gender identity and expression	103
A	<i>Christine Goodwin v. United Kingdom</i> , European Court of Human Rights	104
B	Reflections and Questions	105
V	Marriage equality	107
A	<i>Obergefell v. Hodges</i> , United States Supreme Court	107
B	Reflections and Questions	111
VI	Conclusions: What lies ahead for LGBTI issues and women's rights	112
5	Women and times of emergency: the case of COVID-19	114
I	Introduction: Times of emergency and their burdens on women	114
II	Discrimination and gender-based violence during COVID-19	116
A	United Nations Secretary General, Policy Brief: The Impact of COVID-19 on Women	117
B	Violence against women as the “shadow pandemic”	118
C	Reflections and Questions	119
III	State obligations during public emergencies: universal treaties	120
A	Article 4: States of Emergency, Human Rights Committee	120
B	Guidance Note on CEDAW and COVID-19, CEDAW Committee	122
C	Reflections and Questions	123
IV	Regional human rights protection systems and COVID-19	124

A	Respecting democracy, rule of law, and human rights in the framework of the COVID-19 sanitary crisis: A toolkit for member states	125
B	Pandemic and human rights in the Americas	126
C	Reflections and Questions	127
D	Practical exercise: Analysis of COVID-19 restrictions with a human rights perspective	129
V	Women as leaders in times of crisis	129
A	COVID-19 and women's leadership: from an effective response to building back better	130
B	Inter-American Model Law on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Violence against Women in Political Life	131
C	Reflections and Questions	132
VI	Conclusions: The long-term effects of COVID-19 on the human rights of women	135
6	Due diligence in the contemporary world: the era of MeToo, non-state actors, and social protest	136
I	Introduction: The intricate nature of due diligence and state responsibility in the era of <i>MeToo</i>	136
II	Due diligence: prevention, investigation, sanction, and reparations	137
A	Report of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes, and consequences, Yakin Erturk, <i>The due diligence standard as a tool for the elimination of violence against women</i>	137
B	<i>Opuz v. Turkey</i> , European Court of Human Rights	139
C	Reflections and Questions	142
III	The <i>MeToo</i> movement: turning the invisible visible	143
A	Confronting Sexual Violence, Demanding Equality	143
B	Allison Page and Jacqueline Arcy, <i>#MeToo and the Politics of Collective Healing: Emotional Connection as Contestation</i>	145
C	Reflections and Questions	147
IV	Non-state actors and due diligence	150
A	Excerpts from <i>Jessica Lenahan (Gonzalez et al. v. United States)</i>	150
B	Reflections and Questions	152
V	Social protest to enforce due diligence	155
A	Paula Serafini, "A Rapist in Your Path", <i>Transnational Feminist Protest and Why (and How) Performance Matters</i>	155
B	Reflections and Questions	157
VI	Conclusions: The long road to guarantee effective due diligence in cases of gender-based violence	158

7	The challenging road to equality and the pursuit of non-discrimination	160
I	Introduction: Discrimination on the basis of sex and legal tendencies	160
II	Vulnerability and stereotypes	161
	A Lourdes Peroni and Alexandra Timmer, <i>Vulnerable Groups: The Promise of an Emerging Concept in European Human Rights Convention Law</i>	161
	B <i>Carvalho Pinto de Sousa Mourais v. Portugal</i> , European Court of Human Rights	164
	C <i>Gonzalez Lluy et. al v. Ecuador</i> , Inter-American Court of Human Rights	165
	D European Court of Human Rights, <i>BS v. Spain</i>	167
	E Reflections and Questions	169
III	Strict scrutiny	172
	A <i>María Eugenia Morales de Sierra v. Guatemala</i> , Inter-American Commission on Human Rights	172
	B <i>Konstantin Markin v. Russia</i> , European Court of Human Rights	173
	C Reflections and Questions	176
IV	Hate speech and gender ideology	177
	A Council of Europe, Commissioner for Human Rights, <i>Hate Speech Against Women Should be Specifically Tackled</i> (2014)	177
	B Tanya Katerí Hernández, <i>Hate Speech and the Language of Racism in Latin America: A Lens for Reconsidering Global Hate Speech Restrictions and Legislation Models</i>	178
	C Reflections and Questions	179
V	Conclusions: Towards the autonomy and leadership of women from a human rights perspective	182
8	Sexual and reproductive rights: a gender equality and international law approach	184
I	Introduction: Sexual and reproductive rights as women's rights	184
II	Accessibility, affordability, and quality of sexual and reproductive health services	185
	A Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development	185
	B Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment 22, <i>On the Right to sexual and reproductive health (article 12 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights)</i>	188
	C Reflections and Questions	190
III	The regulation of abortion	195
	A <i>Roe v. Wade</i> , 410 U.S. 113 (1973)	197
	B <i>VO v. France</i>	201

	C Reflections and Questions	202
IV	Maternal health, mortality, and morbidity	205
	A <i>Alyne Da Silva Pimentel Teixeira v. Brazil</i> , CEDAW Committee	205
	B Reflections and Questions	208
V	The right to life and assisted reproductive technologies	209
	A <i>Artavia Murillo v. Costa Rica</i> , Inter-American Court of Human Rights	210
	B Reflections and Questions	214
VI	Conclusions: Distance between the theory and the practical application of sexual and reproductive rights today	215
9	Economic, social, and cultural rights of women	217
I	Introduction: The economic autonomy and dignified life of women	217
II	The puzzle of progressive and immediate obligations: economic, social, and cultural rights	219
	A African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (Banjul Charter)	219
	B American Convention on Human Rights	220
	C Additional Protocol to the American Convention on Human Rights in the Area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Protocol of San Salvador)	220
	D European Social Charter	222
	E Reflections and Questions	223
	F Human Rights Committee, General Comment 16	227
	G Reflections and Questions	229
III	Decent and quality employment: the situation of women	231
	A <i>Ledbetter v. Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co.</i>	231
	B Maternity Protection Convention, 2000 (No. 183)	234
	C <i>Case of the Employees of the Fireworks Factory of Santo Antônio de Jesus v. Brazil</i>	236
	D Reflections and Questions	239
IV	Food, water security, and health	243
	A <i>Women's Rights and the Right to Food</i>	244
	B Guidelines on the Right to Water in Africa	246
	C Reflections and Questions	247
	Note: Human rights related to menstruation	250
V	Conclusions: Women and access to resources	251
10	Women, the environment, and climate change	252
I	Introduction: Examining environmental law issues with a gender and human rights lens	252
II	The right to a safe and healthy environment	254

A	Report of the Special Rapporteur on the issue of human rights obligations relating to the enjoyment of a safe, clean, healthy and sustainable environment, John H. Knox	255
B	The Environment and Human Rights, Inter-American Court of Human Rights	258
C	Reflections and Questions	260
III	The effects of climate change on women	264
A	Gender-Related Dimensions of Disaster Risk Reduction in the Context of Climate Change	266
B	Rosa Celorio, <i>Several Steps Forward, One Backward: Climate Change, Latin America, and Human Rights Resilience</i> , MARYLAND JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW	268
C	Reflections and Questions	270
IV	Conclusions: Advocacy on human rights, women, and the environment	275
11	Women and the regional human rights protection systems	277
I	Introduction: The relationship between the universal and regional human rights protection systems: the situation of women	277
II	Inter-American system of human rights	278
A	<i>Maria da Penha Maia Fernandez</i>	279
B	<i>Case of Guzmán Albarracín et al. v. Ecuador</i>	281
C	Reflections and Questions	283
III	European system of human rights	286
A	<i>MC v. Bulgaria</i> , European Court of Human Rights	287
B	Reflections and Questions	289
IV	African system of human rights	293
A	General Comment No. 2 on Article 14.1.a), (b), (c), and (f) and Article 14.2.a) and (c) of the Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa	294
B	<i>APDF and IHRDA v. Republic of Mali</i> , African Court of Human Rights	296
C	Reflections and Questions	297
D	Practical exercise: Democracy and human rights	299
V	Other regional human rights approaches	299
A	Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women in the ASEAN Region	300
B	Reflections and Questions	302
VI	Conclusions: Regional adaptation to the new problems faced by women	303
12	Women, culture, and religion	305
I	Introduction: Reconciling the rights of women, culture, and religion	305
II	The complex relationship between women and religion	306

A	Report of the Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief, Ahmed Shaheed, <i>Gender-based violence and discrimination in the name of religion or belief</i>	307
B	Reflections and Questions	309
C	Practical exercise: Religion and women	312
III	Religious wear from a human rights perspective	313
A	European Court of Human Rights, <i>Leyla Şahin v. Turkey</i>	313
B	<i>Matter of Sonia Yaker</i> , United Nations Human Rights Committee	316
C	Reflections and Questions	319
IV	Women and culture	320
A	Report of the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights, Farida Shaheed, <i>Enjoyment of cultural rights of women on an equal basis with men</i>	321
B	Reflections and Questions	323
V	Conclusions: Culture and religion as key to the human rights of women	324
13	The human rights of women in the digital world	326
I	Introduction: The gender digital divide	326
II	Violence against women online	327
A	Louise Arimatsu, <i>Silencing Women in the Digital Age</i>	327
B	Report of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences, Dubravka Šimonović, <i>Online violence against women and girls from a human rights perspective</i>	329
C	Reflections and Questions	333
III	Access to and use of technology	335
A	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, <i>Bridging the Digital Divide: Include, Upskill, and Innovate</i> (2018), pp. 22–24	335
B	Laura J. Dixon, Teresa Correa, Joseph Straubhaar, Laura Covarrubias, Dean Graber, Jeremiah Spence, Viviana Rojas, <i>Gendered Space: The Digital Divide between Male and Female Users in Internet Public Access Sites</i>	337
C	Reflections and Questions	339
IV	The right to privacy	341
A	Right to Privacy	341
B	<i>Copland v. United Kingdom</i>	344
C	Reflections and Questions	345
V	Conclusions: Technology as a facilitator to the exercise of women's rights	346
	<i>Index</i>	348