

THE UNIVERSITY of EDINBURGH

Edinburgh Research Explorer

The suppressive potential of a gene drive in populations of invasive social wasps is currently limited

Citation for published version:

Meiborg, AB, Faber, N, Taylor, BA, Harpur, BA & Gorjanc, G 2022 'The suppressive potential of a gene drive in populations of invasive social wasps is currently limited' bioRxiv, pp. 1-15. https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.06.27.497711

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):

10.1101/2022.06.27.497711

Link:

Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version: Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The University of Édinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



The suppressive potential of a gene drive in populations of invasive social wasps is currently limited

Adriaan B. Meiborg^{a,b,,M}, Nicky R. Faber^{a,c}, Benjamin A. Taylor^d, Brock A. Harpur^d, and Gregor Gorjanc^a

^aHighlanderLab, The Roslin Institute and Royal (Dick) School of Veterinary Studies, The University of Edinburgh, Easter Bush Campus, Midlothian EH25 9RG, United Kingdom

^bDevelopmental Biology Unit, European Molecular Biology Laboratory, Meyerhofstraße 1, 69117 Heidelberg, Germany

^cLaboratory of Genetics, Department of Plant Sciences, Wageningen University & Research, Droevendaalsesteeg 1, 6708 PB Wageningen, The Netherlands Department of Entomology, Purdue University, West Lafayette, IN 47907, United States of America

Social insects are very successful invasive species, and the continued increase of global trade and transportation has exacer-2 bated this problem. The yellow-legged hornet, Vespa velutina 3 nigrithorax (henceforth Asian hornet), is drastically expanding 4 its range in Western Europe. As an apex insect predator, this 5 hornet poses a serious threat to the honey bee industry and en-6 demic pollinators. Current suppression methods have proven 7 too inefficient and expensive to limit its spread. Gene drives 8 might be an effective tool to control this species, but their use has not yet been thoroughly investigated in social insects. Here, we 10 built a model that matches the hornet's life history and modelled 11 the effect of different gene drive scenarios on an established in-12 vasive population. To test the broader applicability and sensitiv-13 ity of the model, we also incorporated the invasive European pa-14 per wasp Polistes dominula. We find that although a gene drive 15 can spread through a social wasp population, it can only do so 16 under stringent gene drive-specific conditions. The main issue 17 is that the large number of offspring that social wasp colonies 18 produce guarantees that, even with very limited formation of 19 resistance alleles, such alleles will quickly spread and rescue the 20 population. Furthermore, we find that only a gene drive target-21 ing female fertility is promising for population control due to 22 the haplodiploidy of social insects. Nevertheless, continued im-23 provements in gene drive technology may make it a promising 24 method for the control of invasive social insects. 25

26 Gene drive | wasps | Modelling | Genetic biocontrol | Vespa velutina | Polistes 27 dominula

Correspondence: y.meiborg@gmail.com 28

Introduction 29

Invasive species represent a global issue that has worsened 30 with increased global trade and transportation (1, 2). Sup-31 pression of these invasive species is often prohibitively ex-32 pensive, labour intensive, and largely ineffective (1). One 33 such species currently invasive in Europe is the yellow-34 legged hornet Vespa velutina nigrithorax, hereafter called the 35 Asian hornet. This insect was introduced to France from 36 Southern China in 2004(3, 4) and quickly spread to the whole 37 of France, most of the Atlantic coast, Northern Italy, Bel-38 gium, parts of the United Kingdom, and parts of Germany, 39 where the northernmost finding was made in 2020(5, 6). This 40 spread is in accordance with previous modelling of suitable 41 environments (7, 8). Modelling also showed that there are 42 many more areas in Europe suitable for the Asian hornet to 43

invade (8).

44 The Asian hornet likely has a serious impact on commercial 45 bee colonies (9-11) and potentially on other pollinators such 46 as wild bees and syrphids (5, 11). Up to two thirds of its diet 47 consists of honey bees (11), and the annual loss for France's 48 honey and pollination industry in 2015 was estimated at 53.3 49 million euros (8). The invasion probably started with only a 50 single fertilised queen (3), which underscores the great inva-51 sive potential of the Asian hornet. Indeed, one queen pro-52 duces on average 300 gynes that all have the potential to start 53 a new nest the next year (12). On top of this great reproduc-54 tive potential, controlling the Asian hornet through conven-55 tional means is difficult; the nests are high up in trees, and 56 thus hard to find, and they are also hazardous to approach. 57 Bait trapping with food or chemicals is currently the most re-58 liable control method, though it is only partially effective and 59 is not species-specific (13). These inadequacies highlight the 60 need to find an effective strategy to control the Asian hornet 61 before it spreads to other suitable regions. 62

Over the last decade, gene drives have emerged as a poten-63 tial tool to control invasive populations for which other mea-64 sures are ineffective (14–18). A gene drive is a genetic el-65 ement that spreads through a population over generations at 66 a super-Mendelian rate. For population control, it is engi-67 neered to impose a fitness cost once it is prevalent. For ex-68 ample, a gene drive may disrupt a haplo-sufficient female fer-69 tility gene. Haplo-sufficient means that a single functioning 70 copy of the gene is enough for a female to be fully fertile. At 71 first, the gene drive is present mostly in a heterozygous state 72 due to matings with wildtype individuals. Once it reaches 73 a higher frequency, matings between gene drive individuals 74 will occur more frequently and offspring will be homozygous 75 for the gene drive, with female offspring thus being infer-76 tile. This way, population fecundity declines through the re-77 duced fertility of homozygous individuals (15). Gene drives 78 have been demonstrated to work in yeast (19), fruit flies (20), 79 mosquitoes (21, 22), and mice to a lesser extent (23, 24). The 80 field has recently focused on improving safety and contain-81 ment which would make gene drives controlled enough for 82 release in the wild (25). A range of gene drives have been de-83 signed to be less invasive by nature, or to mitigate risks to an 84 extent. Some stop spreading after a certain number of gener-85 ations and are thus self-limiting (26-28), some require high 86

⁸⁷ introduction frequencies (29–31), some can stop or remove a

gene drive that is already present in a population (32, 33), and

⁸⁹ some target locally fixed alleles so that the gene drive cannot

⁹⁰ spread in non-target populations (34). With the advance of

⁹¹ such containable gene drives, we can start to consider gene

⁹² drive technology as a potential tool for controlling invasive

⁹³ social insects like the Asian hornet.

Creating a realistic life history model for a population is one 94 of the first steps in determining if a gene drive might be an 95 effective control agent (35). A previous study has modelled a 96 gene drive causing male sterility in another haplodiploid so-97 cial hymenopteran, the common wasp Vespula vulgaris, that 98 99 is invasive in New Zealand (36). This type of gene drive was shown to be only mildly promising, because there was 100 a trade-off between the spread and the impact of the gene 101 drive. Namely, if the gene drive causes complete male steril-102 ity, it is unlikely to spread, whereas if the gene drive causes 103 incomplete male sterility, it is unable to impact the fertil-104 ity sufficiently for population control (36). Therefore, this 105 specific gene drive design works similarly to sterile insect 106 technology: a powerful, but only temporary method. There-107 fore, other gene drive designs are needed to control such 108 populations more efficiently (37). For example, three recent 109 modelling studies showed that gene drives can work in hap-110 lodiploid species under specific conditions (38–40). 111

In this study, we model several gene drive strategies to inves-112 tigate the potential of gene drive technology to control Asian 113 hornet populations. We look into both gene drive parameters 114 and life history traits to find the most important factors that 115 could affect the success of gene drives to control these in-116 vasive populations. We developed a model that can be easily 117 adapted to other social haplodiploid insects, as the Asian hor-118 net is not the only invasive social hymenopteran. Indeed, this 119 group of insects, which is comprised of wasps, bees, and ants, 120 contains many successful invasive species (41). We demon-121 strate the flexibility of the model by modelling a second inva-122 sive social hymenopteran, Polistes dominula, hereafter called 123 the European paper wasp. This paper wasp is a widespread 124 invasive species with a very different biology than the Asian 125 hornet. It has much smaller colonies, and queens are almost 126 exclusively monogamous (42). Modelling two species across 127 the social wasp spectrum showed how life history influences 128 gene drive efficiency. Our results show that gene drives can 129 be used to contain an invasive population of either species, 130 but only when the gene drive achieves extremely high effi-131 ciency. This is the case because high per-colony offspring 132 numbers allow every possible resistance allele to subsist in 133 the population once they arise, limiting the success of gene 134 drives that generate resistance alleles. Consequently, species 135 with lower numbers of offspring require a slightly less strin-136 gent gene drive efficiency. Therefore, we need significant 137 advances in gene drive technology, especially lower rates of 138 non-homologous end-joining and more efficient cutting rates, 139 before this technology can control populations of invasive so-140 cial wasps. 141

Material and Methods

The model is an individual-based, stochastic, year-by-year 143 model with two main parts: 1) a realistic model of a so-144 cial wasp population based on their life history and 2) 145 the implementation of a gene drive (see figure 1). The 146 model was built using R version 4.1.2 (43). We use Al-147 phaSimR package version 1.0.1 (44). This package is 148 designed for animal and plant breeding studies, but also 149 serves as an excellent tool for modeling population ge-150 netics studies. The model can be found on GitHub at 151 https://github.com/HighlanderLab/ymeiborg_hornet_gd. 152

142

A. Model structure. The structure of our model mimics the 153 life cycle of a typical haplodiploid social wasp. Throughout 154 the model, we only track female numbers and genotypes, as 155 males only live for a short amount of time for mating pur-156 poses and little is known about their survival. We initiate the 157 model with an equal number of females and males, of which 158 the females (queens) represent the starting population size. 159 Since we initiate the model with mated queens, each male is 160 assigned as a mate for a queen. In the scenario of releasing 161 females with gene drive, these are added as well. In the sce-162 nario of releasing males with a gene drive, these are added 163 in the mating step in the first generation of the model. De-164 pending on the chosen number of generations to model, the 165 following steps are repeated: 166

1. Offspring generation. First, offspring are generated 167 for each successfully mated queen. This is the point 168 at which gene drive dynamics, such as homing or re-169 sistance allele formation, take place in the queen's 170 germline as described in section B. Haploid male off-171 spring are produced by the queen from unfertilised 172 eggs, while diploid female offspring originate from fer-173 tilised eggs. For each female that has mated more than 174 once, the total number of offspring is divided randomly 175 over the multiple mates. We assume an equal number 176 of female and male offspring. Previous findings re-177 port a 3:1 male to female ratio in invasive populations 178 (45), but this is likely a result of overproducing infertile 179 diploid males under inbreeding (46), as non-Fisherian 180 sex ratios are unlikely to persist at a population level 181 (47, 48). The number of female and male offspring are 182 used as averages for a Poisson distribution for each sex 183 so there is natural variation in the number of female 184 and male offspring from each queen. 185

For Asian hornets, on average, one queen produces around 300 females (12) and we assume the same number for males. European paper wasp nests are much less productive, with a single nest producing ~20 offspring of each sex (49).

2. **Mating**. We have implemented random mating between males and females, except we impose the fitness costs of having a gene drive here. Both males and females with a gene drive in their genome have a certain probability of being removed from the mating pool. We assumed full dominance for the fitness cost, 196

A Model structure



Fig. 1. Overview of the demographic model. For a specific explanation of the model, see the Material and Methods.

so both heterozygous or homozygous individuals areequally affected.

Next, as polyandry is shared by many social hy-199 menoptera (50, 51), we have included it in the model. 200 For both females and males, the model takes the mean 201 number of matings, the minimum number of matings, 202 the maximum number of matings, and based on these 203 values generates a random number of matings from a 204 truncated Poisson distribution. For males, the mating 205 frequencies from (52) include a high frequency of non-206 mating males, so we have not zero-truncated their mat-207 ing rate distribution. 208

The Asian hornet queen is polyandrous and is able to 209 attract mates at great distances (53), so for mating rate 210 we use a zero- and max-truncated Poisson distribution 211 with a mean of 3.275 and a maximum of 4 (3). Male 212 Asian hornet mating rates are unknown, so we used a 213 max-truncated Poisson distribution with a mean of 0.9 21 and a maximum of 2 based on mating frequencies for 215 Vespula maculifrons (52). Mating rates for European 216 paper wasp females are estimated to fall between 1 and 217 1.1 (54, 55), and as such were modeled using a zero-218 and max-truncated Poisson distribution with a mean of 219 0.2 and a maximum of 2. There is no accurate data that 220 capture total male reproductive output in P. dominula 221

either, so we used the rates reported in *V. malicifrons* 2222 (52) instead. 223

After mates have been randomly selected this way, we 224 remove pairings of which one or both individuals are 225 infertile due to the gene drive. We thus assume that nei-226 ther female or male knows whether their mate is fertile 227 until the offspring generation, at which point it is too 228 late to find a new mate. This assumption is in line with 229 the observation that hymenopteran females are largely 230 unable to discriminate against infertile but otherwise 231 healthy diploid males (46). 232

Mortality. Population size is regulated using a Poisson distribution around a logistic function, which ensures a maximum population growth rate and carrying capacity (56):

$$N_t = Poisson\left(\frac{K}{1 + \frac{K - N_{t-1}}{N_{t-1}} * r_{max}^{-1}}\right),$$
 (1)

where N_t is the number of females in generation t, ²³⁷ N_{t-1} the number of females in generation t-1, K ²³⁸ is the carrying capacity, and r_{max} is the maximum growth rate. Note that the maximum growth rate r_{max} ²⁴⁰ is calculated using $\frac{ln(R_0)}{T}$ with R_0 being the intrinsic ²⁴¹

242	growth rate observed by (56) , T being the generation
243	time of 1 year.

Then, using the maximum possible population size in
this generation and total number of female offspring,
we calculate the mortality rate:

$$P_{mortality} = 1 - \frac{N_t}{\text{female offspring}}.$$
 (2)

Each female thus has a probability of dying. The surviving females become queens and generate the offspring for the next generation. Male population numbers are not monitored, as they only live for a short amount of time and little is known about their survival.

B. Gene drive implementation. Although AlphaSimR 252 was designed to model large numbers of loci for quantita-253 tive genetics in plant and animal breeding, the framework is 254 perfect for tracking the single locus of a gene drive. Each 255 individual is modelled with a single gene drive locus and in-256 heritance is random following Mendelian laws. We have im-257 plemented a basic homing gene drive which copies itself to 258 the other chromosome in the germ line and has four potential 259 alleles: wildtype (WT), gene drive (GD), resistance (RE), and 260 non-functional (NF). We model diploid females and haploid 261 males, so there is no gene drive activity in the male genome. 262 Like Prowse et al. (2017)(37), we account for a probability 263 of cutting (P_{cut}) of 0.95, a probability of non-homologous 264 end-joining (P_{NHEJ}) , and a probability that non-functional 265 repair occurs (P_{NFR}) of 0.67, which is the probability of 266 a frame-shift occurring within the targeted gene. We evalu-267 ate the sensitivity of results to the default probability of cut-268 ting (P_{cut}) and probability of non-homologous end-joining 269 (P_{NHEJ}) . We also model a fitness cost of carrying the gene 270 drive abstracted as a certain probability of mortality before 271 mating (P_{mort}) . We conservatively assume that the fitness 272 cost of carrying the gene drive has complete dominance, that 273 is, it is equally deleterious for homo-, hemi-, and heterozy-274 gotes. 275

C. Modelled scenarios. To show two sides of the social 276 wasp spectrum, we do all our modelling for two species of 277 invasive social wasps that have distinct life histories. The 278 first species we model is the Asian hornet, which is an ex-279 tremely successful invasive species, probably due to its abil-280 ity to produce many new queens each generation. Females of 281 this species are also very polyandrous. The second species is 282 the European paper wasp, which has a more modest number 283 of offspring and females are less polyandrous. 284

We first focus on which type of homing gene drive might work best for social wasps. We test a neutral gene drive and gene drives that cause female, male, and both-sex infertility. We test all of these gene drives with or without polyandry in both species. In these scenarios, we model current standard gene drive efficiencies: $P_{cut} = 0.95$ and $P_{NHEJ} = 0.02$, keeping P_{mort} at 0, as in (37).

Next, we vary the parameters of the gene drive to find the space in which a gene drive works in our species. First, we

vary P_{cut} and P_{NHEJ} together, second we vary P_{mort} and 294 P_{NHEJ} together, and third we vary P_{cut} and P_{mort} together. 295 Finally, we vary life history parameters of the wasps using 296 "optimal", "intermediate", and "realistic" gene drive param-297 eters, to evaluate how these parameters influence gene drive 298 performance. The optimal gene drive scenario uses P_{cut} = 299 1, $P_{NHEJ} = 0$, and $P_{mort} = 0$. The intermediate gene drive 300 scenario uses $P_{cut} = 0.97$, $P_{NHEJ} = 0$, and $P_{mort} = 0.1$. 301 The realistic gene drive scenario uses $P_{cut} = 0.95$, P_{NHEJ} 302 = 0.02, and $P_{mort} = 0.1$. 303

For each model, except figure 2 and S2, we ran 10 replicates to get an estimate of the variance of the results. For figures 2 and S2, we ran 100 repetitions because the male gene drive release showed a lot of variation.

308

Results

The spread of the gene drive depends heavily on its design. In 309 the following paragraph we describe the frequencies of wild-310 type and gene drive alleles shown in figure 2, while popula-311 tion sizes for the same scenarios are available in figure S1. A 312 neutral gene drive spreads quickly through the female Asian 313 hornet population, but does not reach complete fixation as re-314 sistance alleles and non-functional alleles appear (figure 2A). 315 These resistance alleles and non-functional alleles are then 316 subject to random drift. Female carriers are much more ef-317 fective in spreading the gene drive (figure 2A-top row) than 318 male carriers (figure 2A-bottom row). More often than not, 319 the gene drive introduced by males goes extinct (in 83 out 320 of 100 replicates), particularly when coupled with male in-321 fertility (extinction in all 100 replicates). In the cases it does 322 spread, the spread is slower and less consistent compared to 323 an introduction through females. 324

Gene drives designed for population suppression show sim-325 ilar dynamics. When the gene drive targets fertility, we see 326 that targeting male fertility prevented spread of the gene drive 327 through the population. The spread stops immediately when 328 the gene drive is introduced via males. This effect persists 329 when targeting female fertility at the same time. A gene drive 330 targeting female fertility spreads rapidly through the popula-331 tion, but also leads to a rapid increase of resistance alleles in 332 the population, which overtake the gene drive. 333

The spread of the gene drives does not differ much between 334 the European paper wasp (figure 2B) and the Asian hornet 335 (figure 2A). As in the Asian hornet, targeting male fertility 336 prevents the gene drive from spreading, including when cou-337 pled to female infertility. Targeting female fertility remains 338 more effective. European paper wasp males are more suc-339 cessful at introducing a gene drive (11 out of 100 replicates 340 failed to spread the gene drive) than the Asian hornet males, 341 but females remain more effective nonetheless. 342

To untangle the effects of polyandry and reproduction rate on the spread of the gene drive, we modeled the Asian hornet without polyandry, and the European paper wasp with polyandry (figure S2). In the latter case the female can mate with up to 4 males. Comparing figures 2 and S2 the effect can mostly be seen when males are used to release the gene drive. The top rows (female release) of figure 2A and B and 343



Fig. 2. Frequencies of wildtype (WT), gene drive (GD), resistance (RE), and non-functional (NF) alleles in a female Asian hornet population (**A**) and a female European paper wasp population (**B**) by gene drive strategy and release carriers (females or males). The different strategies (neutral, male infertility, female infertility, and both-sex infertility) determine how the gene drive operates. In the neutral strategy there is no fitness cost to having the gene drive, whereas in the infertility strategies, the designated sex cannot reproduce when homo- or hemizygous for the gene drive.

figure S2A and B do not differ in any discernible way. The 350 bottom rows (male release) of figure 2A and B and figure S2A 351 and B are different, for the neutral and female infertility gene 352 drive. When polyandry is introduced in the European pa-353 per wasp (figure S3B), the gene drive spreads more reliably 354 when released by male carriers. Conversely, the variability 355 in the spread of the gene drive increases when polyandry is 356 removed from the Asian hornet (figure S2A). However, al-357 though gene drive spread via male carriers becomes more re-358 liable when species are polyandrous, release via female car-359 riers clearly remains the more reliable option. 360

Non-neutral gene drives are not capable of fixing in any of the 361 modelled populations (figure 2 and S2). This is because re-362 sistance alleles rapidly spread through the population due to 363 the heavy selective pressure the gene drive introduces. This 364 way, these resistance alleles outcompete the gene drive, and 365 rescue the population. This is so much the case that non-366 neutral gene drive do not change the population sizes (fig-367 ure S1). Resistance alleles are formed when the DNA strand 368 is repaired with non-homologous end-joining after being cut 369 by the Cas9 protein. This method is error-prone and can in-370 sert viable mutations which decrease the affinity of the gRNA 371 for the target sequence. Probability of non-homologous end-372 joining (P_{NHEJ}) is not the only parameter inherent to the 373 gene drive that affects its efficiency. Different gRNA target 374 sites can have different probabilities of cutting the opposite 375 DNA (P_{cut}) . Gene drives have an inherent fitness cost when 376 present in a genome, here called the probability of heterozy-377 gous mortality (P_{mort}) . 378

We varied gene drive parameters and estimated which param-379 eters are critical and what values are required for a proper 380 population suppression. In both the Asian hornet and the Eu-381 ropean paper wasp, only absence of non-homologous end-382 joining $(P_{NHEJ} = 0)$ will make gene drive work reliably 383 (figure 3A-D). Nor will a cutting rate (P_{cut}) below 1 make 384 gene drive work reliably in the Asian hornet (figure 3A). 385 In the European paper wasp, a cutting rate of 0.97 is the 386 lowest workable value (figure 3B). Heterozygous mortality 387 (P_{mort}) affects both species nearly equally. Reliable sup-388 pression stops above a 0.275 (figure 3C and D) in both cases, 389 although the drop in reliability is steeper in the Asian hornet. 390 We also explored cutting rate against heterozygote mortal-391 ity in a gene drive in the absence of non-homologous end-392 joining (figure 3E and 3F). The European paper wasp has a 393 larger area of success than the Asian hornet. Estimates for 394 the European paper wasp have more noise, which could be 395 due to lower reproductive values. Based on these results we 396 have chosen three different gene drive conditions for further 397 analysis: optimal, intermediate, and realistic as shown on fig-398 ure 3. 399

To test the sensitivity of our model and results to the used biological parameters, we performed a sensitivity analysis for both modeled species (figure S3 and S4) with the three different gene drive conditions: optimal, intermediate, and realistic. Under realistic conditions, there is only a visible effect in the European paper regarding the number of offspring parameter. Only an extremely low mean number of progeny affects the spread of the gene drive (figure S4). The other parame-407 ters have no effect on the gene drive success in either species, 408 which is in line with figure 2. Resistance alleles prevent the 409 fixation of the gene drive and rescue the population. The in-410 termediate condition was between the optimal and realistic 411 conditions and showed that in the European paper wasp all 412 the tested parameters influence gene drive success, particu-413 larly the mean number of progeny. In the Asian hornet, there 414 is only a small effect visible for the mean number of progeny. 415 The gene drive is unable to suppress the population in any 416 of the other scenarios. Since this parameter differs the most 417 between the two species and it is critical for the spread of al-418 leles under drift, we evaluated a wide range of values in each 419 species, well beyond the biological limits in the two species 420 (figure S5). This sensitivity analysis showed a similar ef-421 fect of the number of progeny on gene drive success in both 422 species irrespective of their other biological parameter values 423 (figure S3 and S4). This indicates that under the intermediate 424 gene drive conditions the sheer number of progeny in Asian 425 hornets is a limiting factor for the capacity of gene drives to 426 suppress this invasive species. Under optimal conditions, the 427 gene drive is always successful, regardless of the biological 428 parameters. 429

430

Discussion

Invasive social hymenopterans, such as the Asian hornet, can 431 cause significant ecological and commercial damage in their 432 invasive ranges. Difficulties in the application of conven-433 tional methods for the control of invasive social hymenopter-434 ans have led to a surge of interest in the possibility of using 435 gene drive to suppress such invasive populations. In this pa-436 per we have modelled the efficacy of gene drives for popu-437 lation control of two invasive social wasps, the Asian hornet 438 (Vespa velutina nigrithorax) and the European paper wasp 439 (Polistes dominula) under a variety of gene drive and life his-440 tory parameters. We find that the fecundity of social insect 441 colonies represents a major limiting factor for the efficacy of 442 gene drives. As a result, gene drives can only suppress inva-443 sive wasp populations when gene drives operate with extreme 444 efficiency. Other life history traits that we examined were less 445 impactful. We also find that a gene drive targeting fertility is 446 only effective when targeting females. When a gene drive tar-447 geted male fertility or the fertility of both sexes, it could not 448 spread. Overall, our results indicate that, despite the poten-449 tial value of gene drive as a control agent for invasive social 450 insects, the current efficiency of gene drives is insufficient to 451 overcome the biological efficiency of social insect reproduc-452 tion. 453

We found that selection resulted in the rapid fixation of al-454 leles conferring resistance to drive, such that the gene drive 455 was never able to reach fixation under currently-realistic pa-456 rameters of gene drive efficiency. While there are propos-457 als that improve gene drive efficiency (for example 57), the 458 relatively high fecundity of female social insects raises the 459 bar for required gene drive efficiency. Due to the reversal of 460 longevity/fecundity trade-offs, reproductive females in social 461 hymenopteran species may reach levels of fecundity mag-462



Fig. 3. Heatmaps of the suppression rate in the Asian hornet (A & C) and the European paper wasp (B & D) using gene drives that have varying probabilities of nonhomologous end-joining (P(Non-homologous end-joining) or P_{NHEJ}) and cutting (P(Cutting) or P_{cut}) or mortality of gene drive heterozygotes (P(GD heterozygote mortality) or P_{mort}). Note that the model was run for 50 generations because in many intermediate cases 25 generations was not sufficient for the gene drive to suppress the population.

nitudes higher than those possible for non-social organisms 463 (58, 59). This fecundity reduces the effects of drift and there-464 fore the potential efficacy of gene drive: the more progeny 465 each gene drive carrier female produces, the more likely that 466 all possible allele combinations will be represented among 467 those progeny, thereby reducing the likelihood that any given 468 allele will be fixed by chance. For the same reason, the prob-469 ability that a novel resistance allele will be lost by drift before 470 being spread by positive selection is reduced when female fe-471 cundity is higher. 472

Our comparison of two different social wasps with very dif-473 ferent numbers of progeny demonstrates the importance of 474 fecundity. The parameter space in which the gene drive was 475 able to effectively suppress a population was larger for the 476 European paper wasp than for the Asian hornet. This differ-477 ence appears to have been driven by the lower mean progeny 478 sizes in the paper wasp. Notably, when we varied mean 479 progeny number for each species while keeping all other vari-480 ables equal, the rate of suppression was approximately equal 481 for the two species for any given number of progeny, suggest-482 ing that it is fecundity rather than other factors that drove the 483 difference in gene drive suppressing the population between 484 the species. 485

Our results indicate that, in social wasps, a driving element 486 that targets fertility can only successfully spread if its effects 487 are female-specific. Gene drives targeting fertility either in 488 males or in both sexes were never successful in our mod-489 elling, because haploid males are unable to act as asymp-490 tomatic carriers of the gene drive. Our results therefore in-491 dicate that any successful attempt to control invasive hap-492 lodiploid species using fitness-targeting gene drives will nec-493 essarily target females rather than males, in line with the 494 findings of a previous modeling study (39). This fact may 495 represent a significant impediment to the biological control 496 of invasive haplodiploids using gene drives, since the rate of 497 formation of resistance alleles is expected to be substantially 498 higher in females than in males (60). 499

High fecundity and haplodiploidy represent two significant 500 challenges to the potential efficacy of gene drive as a control 501 agent for invasive social wasps. A third challenge is the risk 502 that the gene drive could spread to other wasp species by hy-503 bridization: rates of inter-specific hybridization appear to be 504 significantly higher among hymenopterans than other arthro-505 pods (61), and the introgression of a driving allele into na-506 tive wasp species is a meaningful risk given that social wasps 507 perform important ecosystem services in their native ranges 508 (62). Thus, even if the technical efficiency of drive can be 509 optimised to the point that it is a viable option for the control 510 of invasive wasps, gene drive's safety as a control agent may 511 remain a significant concern. 512

We found that a neutral gene drive could spread much more reliably than one targeting fertility. In theory, a gene drive without any directly detrimental phenotypic effects can still contribute to biocontrol, if the gene drive leaves affected individuals vulnerable to further control measures. For example, a gene drive that disrupts resistance to a specific pesticide could allow that pesticide to be used as a control measure once the gene drive has reached high frequency or become fixed (40). However, such an approach requires targeted management techniques, which are not currently available for invasive social hymenopterans excepting a few ant species (63, 64). As such, direct targeting of female fertility is likely to remain the most promising route for managing invasive social hymenopterans using gene drive. 520

Despite the challenges presented by haplodiploidy and high 527 fecundity, we found that a gene drive targeting female fer-528 tility could spread to a significant frequency (~0.75) within 529 social wasp populations before being negated by the spread 530 of resistance alleles. Even at these high frequencies, however, 531 we found no impact of gene drive on population size, because 532 the high fecundity of individual reproductive females allowed 533 the population to remain at carrying capacity even while the 534 driving allele was present at high frequencies. Anything short 535 of complete fixation of the gene drive was insufficient to sup-536 press an invasive population. Combined with the rapid gen-537 eration of resistance alleles in a short number of generations, 538 this result indicates that a homing gene drive would be inef-530 fective at suppressing invasive social wasp populations over 540 both long and short timescales. 541

Like any model, ours includes assumptions and simplifica-542 tions. Parameterisation of the model proved difficult due to a 543 relative paucity of life history data for vespid wasps, despite 544 the ecological importance of this group (62). For example, 545 we assume that female mating rates are zero-truncated, such 546 that females never fail to find at least one male with whom 547 to mate. This assumption may become unrealistic for very 548 small population sizes, but empirical data that would allow 549 us to accurately model this effect are lacking. For this rea-550 son, we instead used estimates from several closely related 551 species as described in our methods. Other potential limita-552 tions of our model include the lack of any spatial component, 553 including a complete lack of immigration and emigration, the 554 assumption of perfect admixture without mate choice, and the 555 high heterozygous mortality. 556

Conclusions

We have modeled the spread of a homing gene drive un-558 der a variety of conditions of life history and drive efficacy 559 through populations of two invasive social wasps: the Asian 560 hornet and the European paper wasp. We find that, due to 561 large progeny numbers produced by reproductive females in 562 these species, a homing allele can only reach fixation under 563 extremely efficient drive conditions. These findings, together 564 with limitations imposed by haplodiploidy and potential for 565 inter-specific hybridization, highlight the difficulty of apply-566 ing genetic biocontrol measures to social hymenopterans. We 567 conclude that until it is possible to develop gene drives with 568 much higher efficiency of spread and much lower rates of re-569 sistance allele formation, more conventional approaches such 570 as nest destruction and bait trapping will remain the best 571 methods for the control of invasive social wasps. 572

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study was conceived of by all authors. Analyses were performed by ABM and NF. The manuscript was written by all authors.

557

573

574

575

C Modelled scenarios

ABM acknowledges funding from the European Molecular Biology Laboratory. NF acknowledges funding from the Graduate School for Production Ecology &

Resource Conservation call 2020. BAT acknowledges funding from the USDA
 APHIS Farm Bill and a Human Frontiers in Science Program Postdoctoral fellow ship. BAH acknowledges funding from the USDA APHIS Farm Bill. GG acknowl edges the BBSRC Institute Strategic Programme funding to The Roslin Institute
 (BBS/E/D/30002275). For the purpose of open access, the authors have applied a

582 (BBS/E/D/30002275). For the purpose of open access, the authors have applied a CC BY public copyright licence to any Author Accepted Manuscript version arising

583 from this submission.

Bibliography

- Richard N. Mack, Daniel Simberloff, W. Mark Lonsdale, Harry Evans, Michael Clout, and Fakhri A. Bazzaz. Biotic invasions: Causes, epidemiology, global consequences, and control. *Ecological Applications*, 10(3):689–710, 2000. doi: 10.1890/1051-0761(2000)010[0689: BICEGC]2.0.CO;2.
- Hanno Seebens, Tim M Blackburn, Ellie E Dyer, Piero Genovesi, Philip E Hulme, Jonathan M Jeschke, Shyama Pagad, Petr Pyšek, Marten Winter, Margarita Arianoutsou, et al. No saturation in the accumulation of alien species worldwide. *Nature communications*, 8(1):1–9, 2017.
- M. Arca, F. Mougel, T. Guillemaud, S. Dupas, O. Rome, A. Perrard, F. Muller, A. Fossoud, C. Capdevielle-Dulac, M. Torres-Leguizamon, X. X. Chen, J. L. Tan, C. Jung, C. Villemant, G. Arnold, and J.-F. Silvain. Reconstructing the invasion and the demographic history of the yellow-legged hornet, Vespa velutina, in Europe. *Biological Invasions*, 17(8):2357–2371, August 2015. doi: 10.1007/s10530-015-0880-9. Publisher: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Karine Monceau, Olivier Bonnard, and Denis Thiéry. Vespa velutina: a new invasive predator of honeybees in Europe. *Journal of Pest Science*, 87(1):1–16, March 2014. doi: 10.1007/s10340-013-0537-3. Publisher: Springer.
- Daniela Laurino, Simone Lioy, Luca Carisio, Aulo Manino, and Marco Porporato. Vespa velutina: An Alien Driver of Honey Bee Colony Losses. *Diversity*, 12(1):5–5, December 2019. doi: 10.3390/d12010005. Publisher: MDPI AG.
- Martin Husemann, Andreas Sterr, Swen Mack, and Rudolf Abraham. The northernmost record of the Asian hornet Vespa velutina nigrithorax (Hymenoptera, Vespidae). Evolutionary Systematics, 4(1):1–4, February 2020. doi: 10.3897/evolsyst.4.47358. Publisher: Pensoft Publishers.
- Claire Villemant, Morgane Barbet-Massin, Adrien Perrard, Franck Muller, Olivier Gargominy, Frédéric Jiguet, and Quentin Rome. Predicting the invasion risk by the alien bee-hawking Yellow-legged hornet Vespa velutina nigrithorax across Europe and other continents with niche models. *Biological Conservation*, 144(9):2142–2150, September 2011. doi: 10.1016/ j.biocon.2011.04.009. Publisher: Elsevier.
- Morgane Barbet-Massin, Jean Michel Salles, and Franck Courchamp. The economic cost of control of the invasive yellow-legged Asian hornet. *NeoBiota*, 55:11–25, 2020. doi: 10.3897/NEOBIOTA.55.38550. Publisher: Pensoft Publishers.
- D P Abrol and Others. Ecology, behaviour and management of social wasp vespa velutina smith (hymenoptera: Vespidae), attacking honeybee colonies. *Korean Journal of Apiculture*, 9(1):5–10, 1994.
- Moon Bo Choi, Stephen J Martin, and Jong Wook Lee. Distribution, spread, and impact of the invasive hornet vespa velutina in south korea. J. Asia. Pac. Entomol., 15(3):473–477, September 2012.
- Quentin Rome, Adrien Perrard, Franck Muller, Colin Fontaine, Adrien Quilès, Dario Zuccon, and Claire Villemant. Not just honeybees: predatory habits of vespa velutina (hymenoptera: Vespidae) in france. Ann. Soc. Entomol. Fr., 57(1):1–11, January 2021.
- Vespa Velutina, L E Frelon, and Asiatique Prédateur. Bilan des travaux (mnhn et irbi) sur l'invasion en france de. Proceedings of the Journée Scientifique Apicole–11 February, pages 3–12, 2011.
- Karine Monceau, Nevile Maher, Olivier Bonnard, and Denis Thiéry. Predation pressure dynamics study of the recently introduced honeybee killer vespa velutina: learning from the enemy. *Apidologie*, 44(2):209–221, March 2013.
- 14. Ethan Bier. Gene drives gaining speed. Nature Reviews Genetics, 23(1):5-22, 2022.
- Kevin M Esvelt, Andrea L Smidler, Flaminia Catteruccia, and George M Church. Concerning RNA-guided gene drives for the alteration of wild populations. *eLife*, 3:e03401, July 2014. ISSN 2050-084X. doi: 10.7554/eLife.03401.
- Jackson Champer, Anna Buchman, and Omar S. Akbari. Cheating evolution: engineering gene drives to manipulate the fate of wild populations. *Nature Reviews Genetics*, 17(3): 146–159, March 2016. ISSN 1471-0056, 1471-0064. doi: 10.1038/nrg.2015.34.
- Gus R. McFarlane, C. Bruce A. Whitelaw, and Simon G. Lillico. CRISPR-Based Gene Drives for Pest Control. *Trends in Biotechnology*, 36(2):130–133, February 2018. ISSN 01677799. doi: 10.1016/j.tibtech.2017.10.001.
- Bruce A. Hay, Georg Oberhofer, and Ming Guo. Engineering the Composition and Fate of Wild Populations with Gene Drive. *Annual Review of Entomology*, 66(1):annurev– ento–020117–043154, January 2021. ISSN 0066-4170, 1545-4487. doi: 10.1146/ annurev-ento-020117-043154.
- James E DiCarlo, Alejandro Chavez, Sven L Dietz, Kevin M Esvelt, and George M Church. Safeguarding CRISPR-Cas9 gene drives in yeast. *Nature Biotechnology*, 33(12):1250– 1255, December 2015. ISSN 1087-0156, 1546-1696. doi: 10.1038/nbt.3412.
- Valentino M. Gantz and Ethan Bier. The mutagenic chain reaction: A method for converting heterozygous to homozygous mutations. *Science*, 348(6233):442–444, 2015. doi: 10.1126/ science.aaa5945.
- Valentino M. Gantz, Nijole Jasinskiene, Olga Tatarenkova, Aniko Fazekas, Vanessa M. Macias, Ethan Bier, and Anthony A. James. Highly efficient Cas9-mediated gene drive for population modification of the malaria vector mosquito Anopheles stephensi. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 112(49):E6736–E6743, December 2015. ISSN 0027-8424, 1091-6490. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1521077112.
- Andrew Hammond, Roberto Galizi, Kyros Kyrou, Alekos Simoni, Carla Siniscalchi, Dimitris Katsanos, Matthew Gribble, Dean Baker, Eric Marois, Steven Russell, Austin Burt, Nikolai

Windbichler, Andrea Crisanti, and Tony Nolan. A CRISPR-Cas9 gene drive system targeting female reproduction in the malaria mosquito vector Anopheles gambiae. *Nature Biotechnology*, 34(1):78–83, January 2016. ISSN 1087-0156, 1546-1696. doi: 10.1038/nbt.3439.

- Hannah A. Grunwald, Valentino M. Gantz, Gunnar Poplawski, Xiang-Ru S. Xu, Ethan Bier, and Kimberly L. Cooper. Super-Mendelian inheritance mediated by CRISPR–Cas9 in the female mouse germline. *Nature*, 566(7742):105–109, February 2019. ISSN 0028-0836, 1476-4687. doi: 10.1038/s41586-019-0875-2.
- Chandran Pfitzner, Melissa A. White, Sandra G. Piltz, Michaela Scherer, Fatwa Adikusuma, James N. Hughes, and Paul Q. Thomas. Progress Toward Zygotic and Germline Gene Drives in Mice. *The CRISPR Journal*, 3(5):388–397, October 2020. ISSN 2573-1599, 2573-1602. doi: 10.1089/crispr.2020.0050.
- Kevin M. Esvelt and Neil J. Gemmell. Conservation demands safe gene drive. PLOS Biology, 15(11):e2003850, November 2017. ISSN 1545-7885. doi: 10.1371/journal.pbio. 2003850.
- Charleston Noble, John Min, Jason Olejarz, Joanna Buchthal, Alejandro Chavez, Andrea L. Smidler, Erika A. DeBenedictis, George M. Church, Martin A. Nowak, and Kevin M. Esvelt. Daisy-chain gene drives for the alteration of local populations. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 116(17):8275–8282, April 2019. ISSN 0027-8424, 1091-6490. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1716358116.
- John Min, Charleston Noble, Devora Najjar, and Kevin M. Esvelt. Daisy quorum drives for the genetic restoration of wild populations. preprint, Synthetic Biology, March 2017.
- John Min, Charleston Noble, Devora Najjar, and Kevin M. Esvelt. Daisyfield gene drive systems harness repeated genomic elements as a generational clock to limit spread. preprint, Synthetic Biology, February 2017.
- Jackson Champer, Isabel K. Kim, Samuel E. Champer, Andrew G. Clark, and Philipp W. Messer. Performance analysis of novel toxin-antidote CRISPR gene drive systems. *BMC Biology*, 18(1):27, December 2020. ISSN 1741-7007. doi: 10.1186/s12915-020-0761-2.
- Georg Oberhofer, Tobin Ivy, and Bruce A. Hay. Cleave and Rescue, a novel selfish genetic element and general strategy for gene drive. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 116(13):6250–6259, March 2019. ISSN 0027-8424, 1091-6490. doi: 10.1073/ pnas.1816928116.
- Sumit Dhole, Alun L. Lloyd, and Fred Gould. Tethered homing gene drives: A new design for spatially restricted population replacement and suppression. *Evolutionary Applications*, 12(8):1688–1702, September 2019. ISSN 1752-4571, 1752-4571. doi: 10.1111/eva.12827.
- 32. Xiang-Ru Shannon Xu, Emily A. Bulger, Valentino M. Gantz, Carissa Klanseck, Stephanie R. Heimler, Ankush Auradkar, Jared B. Bennett, Lauren Ashley Miller, Sarah Leahy, Sara Sanz Juste, Anna Buchman, Omar S. Akbari, John M. Marshall, and Ethan Bier. Active Genetic Neutralizing Elements for Halting or Deleting Gene Drives. *Molecular Cell*, 80(2):246–262.e4, October 2020. ISSN 10972765. doi: 10.1016/j.molcel.2020.09.003.
- Bing Wu, Liqun Luo, and Xiaojing J Gao. Cas9-triggered chain ablation of cas9 as a gene drive brake. *Nature Biotechnology*, 34(2):137–138, February 2016. ISSN 1087-0156, 1546-1696. doi: 10.1038/nbt.3444.
- Kevin P Oh, Aaron B Shiels, Laura Shiels, Dimitri V Blondel, Karl J Campbell, J Royden Saah, Alun L Lloyd, Paul Q Thomas, Fred Gould, Zaid Abdo, et al. Population genomics of invasive rodents on islands: Genetic consequences of colonization and prospects for localized synthetic gene drive. *Evolutionary Applications*, 14(5):1421–1435, 2021.
- Kym E. Wilkins, Thomas A.A. Prowse, Phillip Cassey, Paul Q. Thomas, and Joshua V. Ross. Pest demography critically determines the viability of synthetic gene drives for population control. *Mathematical Biosciences*, 305:160–169, November 2018. ISSN 00255564. doi: 10.1016/j.mbs.2018.09.005.
- Philip J. Lester, Mariana Bulgarella, James W. Baty, Peter K. Dearden, Joseph Guhlin, and John M. Kean. The potential for a CRISPR gene drive to eradicate or suppress globally invasive social wasps. *Scientific Reports*, 10(1):1–13, July 2020. ISSN 2045-2322. doi: 10.1038/s41598-020-69259-6. Number: 1 Publisher: Nature Publishing Group.
- Thomas A. A. Prowse, Phillip Cassey, Joshua V. Ross, Chandran Pfitzner, Talia A. Wittmann, and Paul Thomas. Dodging silver bullets: good crispr gene-drive design is critical for eradicating exotic vertebrates. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 284(1860):20170799, 2017. doi: 10.1098/rspb.2017.0799.
- Jun Li, Ofer Aidlin Harari, Anna-Louise Doss, Linda L. Walling, Peter W. Atkinson, Shai Morin, and Bruce E. Tabashnik. Can crispr gene drive work in pest and beneficial haplodiploid species? *Evolutionary Applications*, 13(9):2392–2403, 2020. doi: https://doi.org/ 10.1111/eva.13032.
- Yiran Liu and Jackson Champer. Modeling homing suppression gene drive in haplodiploid organisms. *bioRxiv*, 2021. doi: 10.1101/2021.10.12.464047.
- **N R Faber, A B Meiborg, G R McFarlane, G Gorjanc, and B A Harpur. A gene drive does not spread easily in populations of the honey bee parasite Varroa destructor. *Apidologie*, 2021. doi: 10.1007/s13592-021-00891-5.
- Cleo Bertelsmeier. Globalization and the anthropogenic spread of invasive social insects. Curr Opin Insect Sci, 46:16–23, August 2021.
- Philip T Starks, Stefano Turillazzi, and MJ West-Eberhard. Polistes paper wasps: emergence of a model genus. Annales Zoologici Fennici, 43(5-6):385–386, 2006.
- 43. R Core Team. R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing, 2018.
- R. Chris Gaynor, Gregor Gorjanc, and John M. Hickey. AlphaSimR: An R-package for Breeding Program Simulations. *bioRxiv*, page 2020.08.10.245167, August 2020. doi: 10. 1101/2020.08.10.245167. Publisher: Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Section: New Results.
- 45. Eric Darrouzet, Jérémy Gévar, Quentin Guignard, and Serge Aron. Production of early diploid males by European colonies of the invasive hornet Vespa velutina nigrithorax. *PLoS ONE*, 10(9), September 2015. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0136680. Publisher: Public Library of Science.
- 46. Brock A. Harpur, Mona Sobhani, and Amro Zayed. A review of the consequences of complementary sex determination and diploid male production on mating failures in the Hymenoptera. *Entomologia Experimentalis et Applicata*, 146(1):156–164, January 2013. doi: 10.1111/j.1570-7458.2012.01306.x. Publisher: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
- E Ranta, V Lummaa, V Kaitala, and J Merila. Spatial dynamics of adaptive sex ratios. *Ecol. Lett.*, 3(1):30–34, January 2000.
- 48. Andy Gardner and Laura Ross. Haplodiploidy, sex-ratio adjustment, and eusociality. Am.

Nat., 181(3):E60-7, March 2013.

- Ellouise Leadbeater, Jonathan M Carruthers, Jonathan P Green, Neil S Rosser, and Jeremy Field. Nest inheritance is the missing source of direct fitness in a primitively eusocial insect. *Science*, 333(6044):874–876, 2011.
- W. O. H. Hughes, F. L. W. Ratnieks, and B. P. Oldroyd. Multiple paternity or multiple queens: two routes to greater intracolonial genetic diversity in the eusocial Hymenoptera. *Journal of Evolutionary Biology*, 21(4):1090–1095, July 2008. doi: 10.1111/j.1420-9101.2008.01532.x. Publisher: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
- Guiling Ding, Huanli Xu, Benjamin P Oldroyd, and Rosalyn S Gloag. Extreme polyandry aids the establishment of invasive populations of a social insect. *Heredity*, 119(5):381–387, 2017.
- Kenneth G. Ross. Laboratory Studies of the Mating Biology of the Eastern Yellowjacket, Vespula maculifrons (Hymenoptera: Vespidae). *Journal of the Kansas Entomological Soci*ety, 56(4):523–537, 1983. ISSN 0022-8567. Publisher: Kansas (Central States) Entomological Society.
- Ping Wen, Ya-Nan Cheng, Shi-Hao Dong, Zheng-Wei Wang, Ken Tan, and James C Nieh. The sex pheromone of a globally invasive honey bee predator, the asian eusocial hornet, vespa velutina. *Scientific reports*, 7(1):1–11, 2017.
- Robin J Southon, Emily F Bell, Peter Graystock, Christopher DR Wyatt, Andrew N Radford, and Seirian Sumner. High indirect fitness benefits for helpers across the nesting cycle in the tropical paper wasp polistes canadensis. *Molecular ecology*, 28(13):3271–3284, 2019.
- Joan Strassmann. The rarity of multiple mating by females in the social hymenoptera. Insectes sociaux, 48(1):1–13, 2001.
- Daniel N. Franklin, Mike A. Brown, Samik Datta, Andrew G. S. Cuthbertson, Giles E. Budge, and Matt J. Keeling. Invasion dynamics of Asian hornet, Vespa velutina (Hymenoptera: Vespidae): a case study of a commune in south-west France. *Applied Entomology and Zoology*, 52(2):221–229, May 2017. doi: 10.1007/s13355-016-0470-z. Publisher: Springer Tokyo.
- N. R. Faber, G. R. McFarlane, R. C. Gaynor, I. Pocrnic, C. B. A. Whitelaw, and G. Gorjanc. Novel combination of CRISPR-based gene drives eliminates resistance and localises spread. *Scientific Reports*, 11:3719, 2021. doi: 10.1038/s41598-021-83239-4.
- Pierre Blacher, Timothy J Huggins, and Andrew FG Bourke. Evolution of ageing, costs of reproduction and the fecundity-longevity trade-off in eusocial insects. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 284(1858):20170380, 2017.
- Alice Séguret, Abel Bernadou, and Robert J Paxton. Facultative social insects can provide insights into the reversal of the longevity/fecundity trade-off across the eusocial insects. *Current opinion in insect science*, 16:95–103, 2016.
- Jackson Champer, Jingxian Liu, Suh Yeon Oh, Riona Reeves, Anisha Luthra, Nathan Oakes, Andrew G Clark, and Philipp W Messer. Reducing resistance allele formation in crispr gene drive. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 115(21):5522–5527, 2018.
- Arthur Weyna, Lucille Bourouina, Nicolas Galtier, and Jonathan Romiguier. Detection of F1 Hybrids from Single-genome Data Reveals Frequent Hybridization in Hymenoptera and Particularly Ants. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, 39(4), 04 2022. ISSN 1537-1719. doi: 10.1093/molbev/msac071. msac071.
- Ryan E Brock, Alessandro Cini, and Seirian Sumner. Ecosystem services provided by aculeate wasps. *Biological Reviews*, 96(4):1645–1675, 2021.
- 63. Eiriki Sunamura, Shun Suzuki, Koji Nishisue, Hironori Sakamoto, Megumi Otsuka, Yosaburo Utsumi, Fumiaki Mochizuki, Takehiko Fukumoto, Yukio Ishikawa, Mamoru Terayama, et al. Combined use of a synthetic trail pheromone and insecticidal bait provides effective control of an invasive ant. *Pest management science*, 67(10):1230–1236, 2011.
- Grzegorz Buczkowski and Theresa C Wossler. Controlling invasive argentine ants, linepithema humile, in conservation areas using horizontal insecticide transfer. *Scientific reports*, 9(1):1–7, 2019.

C Modelled scenarios

Supplementary Material



Fig. S1. Female population size for Asian hornet (A) and European paper wasp (B) by gene drive strategy and release carriers (females or males). The different strategies (neutral, male infertility, female infertility, and both-sex infertility) determine how the gene drive operates. In the neutral strategy there is no fitness cost to having the gene drive, whereas in the infertility strategies, the designated sex cannot reproduce when homo- or hemizygous for the gene drive.



Fig. S2. Frequencies of wildtype (WT), gene drive (GD), resistance (RE), and non-functional (NF) alleles in a female Asian hornet population with no polyandry (A), and a female European paper wasp population with polyandry (B) by gene drive strategy and release carriers (females or males). The different strategies (neutral, male infertility, female infertility, and both-sex infertility) determine how the gene drive operates. In the neutral strategy there is no fitness cost to having the gene drive, whereas in the infertility strategies, the designated sex cannot reproduce when homo- or hemizygous for the gene drive.



Fig. S3. Sensitivity analysis for the biological parameters of the **Asian hornet**. **A** shows the suppression rate after the model has run for 25 generations. **B** shows the last viable generation over 25 years. The model was run under three different gene drive conditions: optimal, intermediate, and realistic. Under the realistic conditions the gene drive has a probability of non-homologous end-joining (P_{NHEJ}) of 0.02, a cutting rate (P_{cut}) of 0.95, and a heterozygous mortality (P_{mort}) of 0.1. Under the optimal conditions these values are all 0. Under the intermediate conditions the gene drive has a probability of non-homologous end-joining (P_{NHEJ}) of 0.15. Error bars represent the standard error of the mean.



Fig. S4. Sensitivity analysis for the biological parameters of the **European paper wasp A** shows the suppression rate after the model has run for 25 generations. **B** shows the last viable generation over 25 years. The model was run under three different gene drive conditions: optimal, intermediate, and realistic. Under the realistic conditions the gene drive has a probability of non-homologous end-joining (P_{NHEJ}) of 0.02, a cutting rate (P_{cut}) of 0.95, and a heterozygous mortality (P_{mort}) of 0.1. Under the optimal conditions these values are all 0. Under the intermediate conditions the gene drive has a probability of non-homologous end-joining (P_{NHEJ}) of 0.5. Error bars represent the standard error of the mean.



Fig. S5. Last viable generation over 25 years for **A** The Asian hornet, and **B** the European paper wasp with different numbers of offspring. The grey lines indicate the values we used for each species. The model was run under three different gene drive conditions: optimal, intermediate, and realistic. Under the realistic conditions the gene drive has a probability of non-homologous end-joining (P_{NHEJ}) of 0.02, a cutting rate (P_{cut}) of 0.95, and a heterozygous mortality (P_{mort}) of 0.1. Under the optimal conditions these values are all 0. Under the intermediate conditions the gene drive has a probability of non-homologous end-joining (P_{NHEJ}) of 0.97, and a heterozygous mortality (P_{mort}) of 0.15. Error bars represent the standard error of the mean.