THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

Edinburgh Research Explorer

'Our poetry never lacks clearness if read in Gaelic'

Citation for published version:
Mathis, KL & Thomson, E 2022, ''Our poetry never lacks clearness if read in Gaelic': Demystifying Gaelic and Anglo-Highland women's writing in the Celtic Revival', *Scottish Literary Review*, vol. 14, no. 1, pp. 1-41. <https://muse.jhu.edu/article/857663>

Link:
Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version:
Peer reviewed version

Published In:
Scottish Literary Review

Publisher Rights Statement:
This article has been accepted for publication in Scottish Literary Review, published by the Association for Scottish Literature [https://asls.org.uk/publications/periodicals/slr/]. The Version of Record Mathis, Kate Louise, and Eleanor Thomson. "'Our poetry never lacks clearness if read in Gaelic': Demystifying Gaelic and Anglo-Highland Women's Writing in the Celtic Revival." Scottish Literary Review 14, no. 1 (2022): 1-41. muse.jhu.edu/article/857663. is available online at: https://www.muse.jhu.edu/article/857663.

Please do not cite from this pre-print version without crediting the authors; we are happy to accept requests for accurate page numbers &c if the published version is not accessible via institutional access.

General rights
Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy
The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Download date: 27. Oct. 2022

KATE LOUISE MATHIS | ELEANOR THOMSON

'Our poetry never lacks clearness if read in Gaelic': Demystifying Gaelic and Anglo-Highland women's writing in the Celtic Revival[1]

Abstract

At the turn of the Twentieth Century, the awkward juxtaposition of Gaelic literary culture and the Celtic Revival in Scotland encompassed the popular marketization of the Scottish Gàidhealtachd, its oral tradition, and its language by non-speakers of Gaelic, many of whom referred uncritically to native Gaels ('Celts') in the problematic terminology crystallized by James MacPherson's Ossianic poetry in the 1760s. Complexly, many anglophone Revivalists were linked closely to native-speaking Gaels' contemporary networks that focused on language revitalization and increasing recognition for Gaelic literature distinct from MacPherson's legacy, while its impact – adjacent to the older Ossianic tradition that MacPherson had reshaped – continued to infuse Gaelic authors' work and the language of their defence of Gàidhealtachd communities' advancing decline. Both sides' perspective is represented in periodicals such as *The Celtic Magazine* (1876-1888), *The Celtic Review* (1904-1916), and *An Deo-Ghrèine* (1905-1923), whose contributors, including many women, provide valuable insight to the social, cultural, economic, and political status of Gaels and Gaelic in *fin-de-siècle* Scotland and, simultaneously, to their often discordant interpretation by anglophone Revivalists. This article will contrast and contextualize the work of several women whose writing both embodies and interrogates this dichotomy, chiefly Catrìona NicGhille-Bhàin Ghrannd (Katherine Whyte Grant, 1845-1928), author and advocate for Gaelic education, and anglophone poet Alice MacDonell (1854–1938), typical of 'Anglo-Highland' Revivalists of impeccable Gaelic heritage who no longer spoke the language. Initially, it will engage with the multivalent terminology applied to these writers and their work, and the complications of their recovery against MacPherson's plangent influence.

The mists that pervaded James MacPherson's (Seumas Bàn MacMhuirich, 1736-1796) Ossianic landscapes cling to his poems' legacy in anglophone literature that anticipates the Scottish Gàidhealtachd through the (blurred) lens of 'vague, misty, cloudy romanticism', observed by Somhairle MacGill-Eain (Sorley MacLean, 1911-1996) as the defining quality of the Celtic Revival that most undermined critical appreciation of *bona fide* Gaelic literature.[2] While the concept of Gaelic Romanticism has since been recognised as 'latent, and occasionally overt', in its own right and in conversation with MacPherson's renown,[3] and while Ossian's mists themselves may constitute an aerial phenomenon imbued by 'a hugely influential body of atmospheric thought',[4] MacGill-Eain's vehemence concurs with the opinion of many Gaelic writers contemporary to the Celtic Revival.[5] In 1904, for example, Catrìona NicGhille-Bhàin Ghrannd (Katherine Whyte Grant, 1845-1928) criticized the difficulty of acknowledging imagery common to Gaelic literature that arose from its authors' engagement with fundamental aspects of the Highland climate, independent of the (anglophone) Ossianic fog presumed to have infused it:

> Our poetry is accused of being shadowy and indistinct – misty in fact – but we could not leave out these perpetual features of a humid clime if remaining true to Nature. Our poetry never lacks clearness if read in Gaelic.[6]

Two decades prior to Grannd's complaint, Argyllshire-born ethnologist John Gregorson Campbell (Iain Gregarach Caimbeul, 1836-1891) had expressed hope that the vagueness inherent to this anglophone gaze was beginning to lift:

> However it arose, or wherever it came from, there was a mist-like cloud overhanging the Highlands, and Gaelic was in neglect, *which is gradually wearing away*. It is a matter of much satisfaction that these vapours and clouds, when they disappear, will show a language through which the rays of human knowledge will receive much access of strength.[7]

In fact, these 'vapours' coalesced in the 1890s, prolonging the occlusion of Gaelic literature observed by Grannd and complicating critical depictions of its authors' language and literary culture further still, in modern as well as contemporary scholarship. As this article will discuss, MacPherson's Ossianic mists clung stealthily to the perception of the Gàidhealtachd and its literature during the Revival, by native speakers of Gaelic as well as non-Gaels, and continue to infuse, often without foundation, the language of modern scholarship about the Revival, its authors' ongoing recovery, and critical perception of their work. The problem is initially semantic: recognizing what, exactly, constitutes 'Celtic', in which context(s), and for whom, and to what extent, displacing its older linguistic designation (i.e. relative to a family of languages and, by extension, their speakers' culture), the term became linked inextricably to the phenomenon of MacPherson's Ossian and the 'Ossianized', increasingly anglicized Gàidhealtachd that its legacy created. With honourable exceptions, modern anglophone criticism of the Revival tends to overlook the easily bewildering range of meaning that 'Celtic' may encompass in contemporary texts, applied by speakers of Gaelic describing themselves, their language, or their literature, and/or by anglophone writers whose understanding of the Gàidhealtachd, its language, and its literature is shaped wholly or partly by MacPherson's influence. Its protean nature, in fact, discourages firm definition, even during the Revival itself, and this discussion does not claim one,[8] but recommends, initially, that recognizing this complexity and, where possible, acknowledging its nuances enables greater precision in textual analysis of contemporary authors' work and aids understanding of the palimpsest of Gaelic, 'Celtic' (and Scottish) literary identities in the *fin-de-siècle*.[9] The following discussion, focusing on women writers active in the later Eighteenth, Nineteenth, and early Twentieth Centuries (defined more fully by each section), will discuss the influence of MacPherson's Ossian on their work, both during and anticipating the Revival, and, in certain examples, the occurrence of terminology that engages clearly or obliquely with the concept of 'Celtic'. Initially, it turns to MacPherson, and an author who engaged semi-perceptively with Ossian's critical reception (at MacPherson's most unfashionable time), but who also, as distinct persona 'Fiona Macleod', created an Ossianized 'Celtic' fiction that sparked a controversy among Gaelic and anglophone readers of comparable sensation to MacPherson's own.

While the centenary of MacPherson's death in 1896 passed publicly unremarked, even in Scotland – in stark contrast to the recognition he had once received worldwide – *The Poems of Ossian*, a collected edition introduced by noted critic William Sharp (1855-1905), was published by Edinburgh-based polymath Patrick Geddes (1854-1932) as the latest instalment of his series 'The Celtic Library'.[10] Murdo Macdonald identifies this collection and Sharp's prefatory essay as a rare, remarkable antidote to MacPherson's contemporary 'exclu[sion] from academic consideration', fifty years prior to his first 'proper scholarly assessment' by Derick Thomson,[11] and 'a timely reminder that the roots of the Celtic revival of the 1890s lay well over a century earlier in the work of James MacPherson'.[12] Yet more remarkable (in 1896) is the authority that Sharp, who lacked Gaelic (see below), confers on 'our leading specialists' in the thorny matter of Ossian's ultimate origin, all of whom are Gaels, chiefly John Gregorson Campbell, John Francis Campbell of Islay (Iain Òg Ìle, 1821-1885), and Alexander Carmichael (Alasdair MacGilleMhìcheil, 1832-1912).[13] Sharp's terminology is also precise: referring primarily to 'Gaelic' and 'Gaels' (implied as contemporary speakers of Gaelic in Scotland), he reserves 'Celts' for the population contemporary to Ossian's bygone world (implied,

more dimly, as speakers of an older Celtic language).[14] He is explicit, moreover, in recognising the 'verbal art' of the Gàidhealtachd as literature (not 'mythology'), whether preserved by the oral tradition or in manuscript.[15]

Ultimately, however, Sharp disregards the status of Gaelic as a living language. His preface concludes that waning Gàidhealtachd communities' cultural revival is 'only possible through discovery by others and advocacy in [English]',[16] yet his differentiation of 'Celts' as Ossian's departed generation coincides awkwardly with its usage by prominent contemporary Gaels to identify fellow speakers of the living language. In 1901, discussing public reception of the latest novel by Sharp's complex alter-ego 'Fiona Macleod' (before official revelation of their co-existence), the academic Elizabeth Catherine 'Ella' Carmichael (1870-1928), daughter of Alexander and founding editor of *The Celtic Review*,[17] observes that she has yet to meet:

> any Celt who did like them[;] they do not seem to take among the race they are supposed to represent – but Sassanachs like them and think she is just the Celtic thing.[18]

For Ella and her correspondent Father Allan MacDonald of Eriskay (1859-1905), both native speakers, those 'Celts' unsympathetic to Macleod's novels, distinct from Sharp's 'Celts', are fellow speakers of Gaelic (i.e. their own contemporaries, not Ossian's fictional comrades), yet the nuance of this significant discrepancy escapes critical recognition without appropriate context. Moreover, the novels of 'Fiona Macleod' presented anglophone readers, Ella's 'Sassanachs', with an equally dichotomous version of the Scottish Gàidhealtachd, popularized as a 'Celtic' (i.e. bygone, Ossianized) landscape unencumbered by living Gaelic communities' contemporary reality, a 'Celtic' Gàidhealtachd recognised incompletely by modern critics as a creation of non-Gaelic writers.[19] As Priscilla Scott has observed, this 'Celtic' landscape, marketed by those who 'used the loosely applied designation "Celtic" to imply a *Gaelic* authenticity' where, linguistically, none was deserved,[20] established the terrain of the so-called 'Celtic' Revival, typically distinct from adjacent efforts to reinvigorate the Gaelic language and mocked, if not denounced, by many Gaelic speakers. As this article will explore, women made significant contributions in both respects, as authors and as audiences for others' work, including MacPherson's. In a literary sense,[21] however, as Grannd complained, the 'Celtic Revival' resurrected little bar the occluding, anglophone gaze with which MacPherson's Ossianic mists had shrouded the realities of Gaelic literature, while the connection between those cultural phenomena, clearly remarked by at least some *fin-de-siècle* Scottish authors, remains largely indistinct to modern criticism. Lauded by anglophone audiences as 'High Priestess of the Celtic Renascence',[22] contemporary Gaels observed 'Fiona Macleod' as 'just another MacPherson's Ossian', rejecting 'the "false authenticity" that Sharp's writing [as Macleod] offered to a non-Gaelic public'.[23]

While, beneath such clouds, anglophone Revival-era audiences may be excused limited appreciation of the semantic range of 'Celt' and 'Celtic' and its inherently linguistic dimension, similar misapprehension by modern anglophone criticism of the Celtic Revival in Scotland, not least its typical erasure of Gaelic (and/or cursory interchange of Gaelic for 'Celtic' in its fictional sense), remains unhelpfully common.[24] So, too, is the shaping of the wider field of Scottish literary criticism by 'commentators with little or no knowledge of the [Gaelic] language and cultural context',[25] by whom the elasticity of terminology that characterizes contemporary Revival-era discourse is usually unrecognised – perpetuating, for example, decontextualized description of Gaelic literature as 'Celtic myth'.[26] The reception of Ossian during the Revival, including by Gaels and specifically by women writers, deserves particular attention, with its linguistic nuance fully acknowledged and in light of important additions to Ossianic scholarship in the context of the Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Gàidhealtachd,[27] extending recognition of MacPherson's initial popularity as a 'defining moment in the engagement between Gaelic and anglophone culture'.[28] His, and Ossian's, enduring influence in the Celtic Revival should be acknowledged in similar terms.

The often multivalent identities of contemporary authors would also benefit from more exacting scrutiny as the process of their recovery unfolds, or – for those already prominent in critical discussion, like 'Fiona Macleod' – from broader consideration of their literary identities in terms of its chosen language. This is especially significant in the recovery of Scottish women writers during or anticipating the Celtic Revival who were also bilingual, composing in Gaelic and in English and, where that bilingualism is apparent, often less visible publicly in one language than the other, sometimes by personal choice (a critical dimension acknowledged fruitfully for women who chose to write in Scots).[29] Similarly, the presence or absence of Gaelic may be critically significant, but is often underexplored. In the case of 'Fiona Macleod', Sharp presented native-speaking competence in the language as a fundamental aspect of the author's identity, alleged in her correspondence (also penned by Sharp) and reinforced by her novels' use of Gaelic words and fragments of dialogue.[30] In fact, as Scott observes, its presence owed little to Sharp's personal skill, but depended on phrases borrowed imperfectly from poet Màiri Nic Ealair's *Tourists Hand-Book of Gaelic and English Phrases for the Highlands* (c. 1882), an artifice easily apparent to contemporary Gaelic speakers.[31] In December 1905, for example, an anonymous correspondent to *The Oban Weekly News* observed:

> Chan eil e duilich fhaicinn nach eil eòlas mionaideach aice air a' Ghàidhlig agus nach eil i comasach aon chuid air a labhairt no sgrìobhadh gu h-eagarra no gu ceart. Tha i ri mearachdan thall 's a bhos a thaobh grammar agus cruth na cànain.
>
> *It is not difficult to see that [Macleod] does not have a detailed knowledge of Gaelic and that she is not capable of either speaking or writing it accurately or correctly. She makes mistakes all over with regard to grammar and syntax.*[32]

The illusion, however, remained invisible to readers who also 'lacked knowledge of the Gaelic language and Gaelic tradition, [by whom] 'Fiona MacLeod' was accepted as an authentic Gaelic and female voice",[33] and has received little attention from anglophone critics. While the mental fatigue occasioned by Sharp's decade-long co-existence with his 'other self' is well-documented, including by Elizabeth Sharp's tender, compassionate memoir of her husband's life and career,[34] tensions arising from Sharp's presentation of 'Fiona' as a Gaelic speaker merit further appraisal. As Murdo Macdonald has observed, Sharp's privately expressed animosity towards Symbolist artist John Duncan's (1866-1945) illustration 'Anima Celtica' (1895), modelled on Ella Carmichael, probably arose from Sharp's discomfort at the contrast it represented.[35] In Mark Williams's crisp summation: 'the threat posed by a real-life Gaelic-speaking young woman to a middle-aged man whose career depended on moonlighting as one can easily be imagined'.[36]

While the case of Sharp/Macleod is unusual, it emphasizes the importance of acknowledging actual, potential, or alleged competence in Gaelic in the recovery of Scottish women writers, both during and preceding the Revival. Additional distinction, moreover, is useful between those who acquired Gaelic wholly or partly as adults and, conversely, those descended from Gaelic-speaking families who no longer spoke it fluently themselves, but whose reputation depended on a genuine connection to the language and its literary culture. Both groups are represented amply in Revival-era networks and among contributors to periodicals, founded most often by native speakers of Gaelic (see below), such as *The Celtic Magazine* (1876-1888), *The Celtic Review* (1904-1916), and *An Deo-Ghrèine* (1905-1923).[37] Defined usefully by Priscilla Scott as 'Anglo-Highland' authors, the latter group are widely represented by a specific type of work:

> Within the small corpus of female-authored contributions, most were written by 'Anglo-Highland' women, that is to say women from Highland [i.e. Gàidhealtachd-based] families, often Highland gentry, who were not Gaelic-speakers, although they sometimes had a limited knowledge of the language. Their writing [in English] favoured romantic fictional

> tales set in the Highlands, non-fiction articles on aspects of Highland history relating to the area with which their own family was connected, as well as poetry on similar themes. In this way the Anglo-Highland women stressed their authentic Highland heritage, although no longer Gaelic-speaking, and they were more likely to be described [by contemporary critics] as 'Celtic' rather than 'Gaelic' with respect to their work and identity.[38]

While the contemporary designation of Anglo-Highland authors as 'Celtic' could be applied by anglophone or Gaelic-speaking critics, it was often the latter (see below), recalling Ella Carmichael's distinction between 'Celts' (fellow speakers of Gaelic) and 'Sassanachs', i.e. non-Gaelic audiences enchanted by the falsely constructed 'Celtic' Gàidhealtachd shaped initially by MacPherson's Ossian. As this article will explore, many Anglo-Highland Revival-era women are conspicuous for their attachment to MacPherson's poems, a phenomenon consistent with their popularity in anglophone women's literary networks in the Eighteenth Century,[39] and as a widely recognised catalyst for women writers undertaking the nascent 'Highland tour' of Gaelic Scotland.[40] Here, too, the extent of Ossianic influence on adopted Anglo-Highland identities during the Revival bears further inquiry, recognising its visible precedent in earlier writers' work and proposing continuity of critical engagement that observes the presence (or absence) of Gaelic among Scottish women writers consistently from the Eighteenth to early Twentieth Centuries.

As such, a notable precursor to Revival-era Anglo-Highlandism is poet Anne MacVicar Grant ('Mrs Grant of Laggan', 1755-1838), whose acquisition of Gaelic in adulthood has already received attention in the context of MacPherson's Ossian. Born in Glasgow but raised largely in North America, Grant established residence in the Highland parish of Laggan on her marriage and published several volumes of poetry, essays, and extensive correspondence on Highland subjects that 'capitaliz[ed] on the continued interest in Macpherson' in the early 1800s.[41] It is widely remarked, moreover, that Grant credited MacPherson's poetry as a singular, formative influence that increased her estimation of a landscape she found initially hostile.[42] In fact, closer attention to Grant's early engagement with Ossian reveals the opposite: that its influence is acknowledged as brief, with the starkness of contrast between reality and MacPherson's stylized impression of the Gàidhealtachd provoking Grant's unease:

> When I came [back] a few years after to Scotland, Ossian obtained a complete ascendant over my imagination, to a much greater extent than ever he has done since. Thus determined to like the Highlands […] it is not easy to say how much I was repelled and disappointed. In vain I tried to raise my mind to the tone of sublimity. The rocky divisions that rose with so much majesty *in description* seemed like enormous prison walls, confining caitiffs in the narrows glens. These, too, seemed like the dreary abodes of solitude and silence.[43]

Significantly, Grant connects this absence of sound or companionship to her initial lack of Gaelic, recognizing her gradual acquisition of the language as the factor that most influenced her adjustment to life among the predominantly Gaelic-speaking population of Laggan, described initially as 'wild mountaineers, whose language I did not understand, and to whose character, of consequence, I was a stranger'. In contrast, learning Gaelic 'in the fields, the garden, and the nursery' transformed her 'like a gifted seer, from whose eyes the unseen powers had suddenly removed the veil of separation' from her surroundings, as a result of which she pursued the 'language, the customs, the peculiar tone and sentiment, and manners of the [Highland] people' with 'proportionate eagerness'.[44] In other words, Grant's acquisition of Gaelic diffused the beclouding effect of MacPherson's Ossianic mist.

Subsequently, Grant's work represents itself as 'a trustworthy source of information about Gaelic culture and language',[45] and in anglophone circles it garnered praise for her promotion of Gaelic poetry to audiences outwith the Gàidhealtachd (not otherwise unjustifiably).[46] It should be noted, however, that Gaelic scholars have questioned the extent of her ultimate competence in the language, observing her tendency, regardless, to arrange 'translations from the Gaelic', alleged as literal, in a manner that misrepresents the metre, rhythm, but also content of selected items significantly.[47] On the basis of largely self-professed authority, therefore, not least her preferred choice of subject, Grant's work has much in common with those Revival-era authors whom Scott defines as 'Anglo-Highland', and her engagement with Gaelic culture and literature – specifically, with MacPherson's Ossian – may be approached fruitfully in these terms.[48] Grant remarks on MacPherson's legacy at regular intervals throughout her career, initially in appendix to her collection *Poems on Various Subjects* (1803), which includes loose renditions into English verse of several examples of the genuine Gaelic ballad tradition on which Ossian depended.[49] Unlike MacPherson, however, Grant is transparent about her sources, referring readers to the Gaelic texts 'already published in Gillies's and Macdonald's Collections'.[50] The appendix was prefaced by Grant's staunch defence of Ossian's authenticity, revived as a topic of interest in the wake of MacPherson's death in 1796. Her argument received praise but also negative reviews, which Grant rebuffed by reasserting her proficiency in Gaelic and rejecting the opinions of those who lacked equivalent skill:

> Let them live twenty years where I did; let them acquire the language, and know the people; and then, and not till then, I will suppose them qualified to decide this point.[51]

Notwithstanding the extent of her actual proficiency, it is Grant's self-declared competence that modern anglophone criticism has observed thus far, and that contemporary audiences accepted initially.[52] Her defence of MacPherson in 1803 may have secured her recognition two years later in the *Report of the Committee of the Highland Society of Scotland, Appointed to Inquire into the Nature and Authenticity of the Poems of Ossian* (1805), to the probable displacement of less prominent native-speaking Gaelic women.[53] With the exception of Charlotte Brooke (c. 1740-1793),[54] Grant is the only woman whose opinion on MacPherson is included directly,[55] implying precedence borrowed from contemporary authorities such as poet Maighread Fhriseil ('Mrs Fraser of Culbokie', fl. 1740s-1790s), locally celebrated collector of Ossianic ballads and teacher of Rev. Father Farquharson, compiler of the Douay manuscript.[56]

Grant's potentially disproportionate recognition as an authority on Gaelic literature is one of several contemporary examples that suggest the precarious status of native-speaking women's Gaelic scholarship to anglophone audiences prior to the Revival, chiefly those whose work is represented by non-Gaelic male authors with whom they shared material.[57] Several networks of female song collectors, for example, were active in the Gàidhealtachd, notably in Mull, in the later Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries. Inspired at least partly by the heightened interest in recovery of 'genuine' Ossianic ballads that MacPherson's notoriety provoked,[58] some of these women were related to established collectors of Gaelic poetry, such as Christina MacKenzie, daughter to Hector MacLean of Grulin, whom Samuel Johnson, during his infamous tour, had declared 'the only interpreter of Earse poetry that I could ever find.'[59] Alexander Campbell (1764-1824), editor of *Albyn's Anthology* (1816-18), refers to having consulted the combined collection of Christina and her father in 1815,[60] yet, while their acquaintance is observed by Campbell's introduction,[61] the items that he may have selected from it for publication are rarely identified as hers.[62] He does, however, identify items collected from Mrs Grey, Miss M. Pringle, Miss Breadalbane of Quinish, and several other 'young girls' or 'accomplished ladies' presumable as native speakers of Gaelic; in total, forty-seven contributions from Mull-based women alone are recognised in some regard by Campbell's anthology, including several provided by Margaret MacLean Clephane of Torloisk (1793-1830), later Marchioness of Northampton.[63] While one may suspect that Campbell's assiduous observation of his fidelity in printing the latter's contributions verbatim owes more to Margaret's status than respecting her authority on Gaelic literature ('exactly as her Ladyship

transmitted them to the present Editor'),[64] he referred nonetheless to Margaret, her sisters, and their mother as 'the accomplished ladies of Torloisk'.[65]

Margaret, her sisters Anna Jane (1798-1860) and Wilmina (1803-1863), and their mother Marianne Douglas MacLean Clephane (1765-1840) also shared Anne Grant's interest in Ossian and the phenomenon's implications for Gaelic poetry. Though less prominent than Grant, they were native speakers of Gaelic, but recognition of their knowledge by anglophone collectors is less consistent, including by the women's shared acquaintance Walter Scott (1771-1832), the sisters' unofficial guardian.[66] In contrast to his acknowledgement of Grant's influence on *Waverley* (1814),[67] Scott's debt to Margaret's translation of a Gaelic *coronach* (formal lament) influential to *The Lady of the Lake* (1810) was uncredited; accordingly, Scott receives unwarranted recognition by subsequent critics as personally competent in Gaelic.[68] It is unclear from their surviving correspondence if Margaret were concerned by her omission, though it was Scott – one of his mentors – to whom she complained that Campbell's presentation of her work had 'altogether spoilt' her contributions to *Albyn's Anthology*.[69] Both experiences, however, may have discouraged the sisters from seeking wider public recognition of their work, since their extensive personal collections, which include volumes of Gaelic verse, song, music, clan and local history tales, remained otherwise unpublished, while a comprehensive anthology *Songs Collected in the Western Isles of Scotland* (1808) was printed for only private circulation. It opens with the Ossianic epigraph *Aoibhneas a bhroin* ('The joy of grief'), and many of its Gaelic items are examples of the ballad tradition with which MacPherson's poems interact.[70] The sisters would have been well aware of the controversy anent their ultimate authenticity that his death had reignited and of its complex background in anglophone literary debate, following Johnson, which dismissed *en masse* the authority of Gaelic *seanchaidhean* (tradition-bearers) as an accurate medium for preserving knowledge of the past, or its literature.[71] In 1784, at the height of Ossian's initial scrutiny, geologist and antiquarian Barthélemy Faujas-de-St.-Fond (1741-1819), one of many visitors to the Gàidhealtachd seeking to investigate MacPherson's claims of his poems' antiquity, had urged their mother Marianne to publish her defence of the Gaelic oral tradition for a wider audience.[72] Whether the suggestion were entertained or attempted is unclear, but, unlike her daughters', Marianne's scholarship is visible briefly in the work of a male author who appears to have respected her learning and portrayed it clearly:

> She had attentively studied the language, poetry, and music of the Gàidhealtachd. Miss M^c^Lean assured me, in several conversations […] that to one acquainted with the language, the usages, and the manners of the country, it was difficult to conceive how the English writers, who were utter strangers to the Celtic tongue, should have so obstinately persisted in doubting the existence of the ancient poems of Ossian. […] No one is more capable of converting those who are incredulous upon this point than Miss M^c^Lean…[73]

The account also provides a valuable Eighteenth-Century example of a Gaelic-speaking woman applying 'Celtic' as a descriptor of language ('the Celtic tongue', i.e. Gaelic),[74] while the distinction asserted between speakers and non-speakers ('strangers to the Celtic tongue') may anticipate the application during the Revival, also by Gaels, of 'Celt' to fellow speakers of Gaelic (as above). As the following section will reiterate, however, it is also clear that *fin-de-siècle* audiences who lacked Gaelic were more likely to understand 'Celtic' and 'Celt' outwith that linguistic dimension, defining the landscape of a fictional Gàidhealtachd, created by non-Gaelic authors, whose long-departed inhabitants only once spoke the language of Ossian. Moreover, the conviction that those without Gaelic should have no authority debating the authenticity of Ossian or, by implication, the merits of Gaelic literature, which the MacLean-Clephanes appear to have shared, perhaps ironically, with Anne Grant, was reflected only faintly by Revival-era criticism and a corpus of literature dominated increasingly by 'Anglo-Highland' authors more likely to have lost their Gaelic. Many of the latter remained devoted to MacPherson's Ossian.

Gaelic and Anglo-Highland women's writing in the Celtic Revival

The impact of MacPherson on critical perception of Gaelic literature, including by women in Scotland, is apparent from the later Eighteenth Century.[75] As we have seen, however, acknowledgement of these women's work, including by modern critics, is complicated by their command of Gaelic, whether native, acquired, fluent, or partial, and by the visibility of their intellectual engagement with Gaelic culture, which may lack contemporary attribution or be presented imprecisely. In the Nineteenth Century, anticipating and partly influential to the Celtic Revival, both Gaelic and Anglo-Highland women's involvement with preserving, translating, and communicating the language and literature of the Gàidhealtachd diversifies. More likely apparent in its own right, women's agency in presenting their work increased, and several, including Ella Carmichael, gained recognition for promoting Gaelic culture as a subject of academic study and for their activism in seeking to halt its decline. This work, however, paralleled the rising popularity of the anglicised 'Celtic' Gàidhealtachd, in which, conversely, women writers including bilingual Gaels could also take part (see below). Adjacent to MacPherson's enduring legacy,[76] key publications produced by Gaelic scholars, often with facing-page Gaelic and English text, also stimulated anglophone interest in the oral tradition of the actual Gàidhealtachd (which authors like 'Fiona Macleod' would exploit).[77] The first instalment of *Carmina Gadelica* (1900), a collection of charms, hymns, and incantations compiled and translated by Alexander Carmichael, was especially significant; his wife Mary and daughter Ella were also involved in its production,[78] though the latter's input received underwhelming recognition.[79] Women such as Frances Tolmie (1840-1926), Lady Evelyn Stewart-Murray (1868-1940),[80] and Jessie Wallace were visibly active in observing, classifying, and translating oral tradition and Gaelic song, including for publication, outwith the community settings in which women's tradition-bearing had been longer recognised. Wallace, 'one of the few Scottish Gaelic scholars [of the Nineteenth Century] who have been women',[81] was the sister and 'devoted fellow worker' of John Gregorson Campbell, acknowledged for her contributions to his extensive collections and the editing of its partly posthumous publication.[82] Stewart-Murray, a daughter of John, 7th Duke of Atholl (1840-1917), learned Gaelic as a child from family servants.[83] The work of Wallace, Stewart-Murray, Tolmie, and later Margaret Fay Shaw (1903-2004), began to address and attempt to reverse the 'false standards' that the Ossianic controversy had 'introduced into the appreciation and criticism of popular oral literature' originating in the Gàidhealtachd,[84] including for anglophone readers.

Some activity in collection is also suggested for Josephine Mary (Josephina Màiri) MacDonell (1852-1915), credited by contemporary Gaelic historian Keith Norman MacDonald (1835-1913) as an informant whose access to family documents had enabled him to correct errors in the biography of Sileas na Ceapaich printed in popular anthology *Sar Obair nam Bard Gaelach* (1st edition 1841).[85] Josephine, an illustrator and clan historian in her own right, was the daughter of Angus, 22nd MacDonald of Keppoch (c. 1821-1855) and a direct descendant of Sìleas (Cicely MacDonald, c. 1660-c. 1729), one of the most prolific early modern Gaelic women poets, published initially in 1776 yet still current in the oral tradition.[86] MacDonald also credits Josephine with collecting a copy of one of Sìleas's poems from an informant in Fort Augustus, printing its Gaelic text without translation.[87] In 1907, moreover, Josephine is acknowledged by Andrew Lang (1844-1912) as the source for 'the Gaelic words and a literal translation' of a lament composed for 'Keppoch of Culloden' (Alasdair, 17th MacDonald of Keppoch, c. 1695-1746) by his clan bard.[88] Both attributions presume Josephine's competence in Gaelic, yet the extensive corpus of her younger sister Alice's (1854-1938) work, composed in English with occasional use of nominal Gaelic titles, lacks clear indication that Alice was also bilingual, despite her neighbouring introduction by MacDonald's survey as 'our famous and well-known clan bardess'.[89] In fact, MacDonald's description, which observes that Alice's work 'inherited poetic gifts of a high order' and 'maintains the reputation of her clan and family', ignores the significant contradiction that a direct descendant of thirteen ancestors celebrated for composing poetry in Gaelic should compose solely in English, and have displayed, in contrast, 'early promise of [her] bardic gift' by:

> running about the romantic Braes of Lochaber, listening to wonderful tales of battles and chivalry, weird romances, fairy tales, [and] Ossianic poetry

the latter of which, concludes MacDonald, pervades the 'intense patriotism and grand martial spirit' of her work.[90] Instead, distinguished even from her sister, Alice's supposedly formative influences and her work accord more closely with Scott's definition of typical 'Anglo-Highland' women's writing, including uncritical devotion to MacPherson's Ossian.[91] Her descent from native-speaking Gaelic poets, however, entitles Alice to MacDonald's attribution of her name in Gaelic (Ailis Sorcha Ni' Mhic 'ic Raonuill na Ceapaich'), acknowledging that descent with her clan's traditional patronymic: 'daughter to the sons of the sons of Raghnall of Keppoch'. On this basis, too, unlike their hostile reception of 'Fiona Macleod's' fictitious Gaelic identity, Gaels other than MacDonald were tolerant of Alice's work ('Miss MacDonell's poems show strongly her Gaelic inheritance'),[92] a circumstance unaffected by both sisters' removal from the Gàidhealtachd to London in the 1870s.[93] As Scott observes, at a time when the children of many established families were leaving the Gàidhealtachd and losing their language, 'there was not the same ideological difficulty from a Scottish Gaelic perspective' with Anglo-Highland authors, notably those, like Alice, of such close generational proximity to native speakers.[94]

Beyond tolerance, moreover, the impeccable nature of Alice's Gaelic heritage appeared to ensure a similar public role to native-speaking poets. Prior to 1893, she was appointed bardess to the Clan MacDonald Society, joining native-speaking Skye poet Màiri Mhòr nan Oran (Mary MacPherson, c. 1821-1898), for whom she composed a poem that claimed (in English) an otherwise inaccessible literary quality common to Gàidhealtachd poets:

> Tell her the spell we own,
> To Sassanach and Gall unknown,
> The charms of the Gaelic tone,
> Highland hearts blend.[95]

The description that accompanies Alice's portrait in a contemporary issue of *The Celtic Monthly* regards her appointment as bardess, once again, in terms of her family's undiminished reputation, specifically their descent from 'the gallant Keppoch who fell on the disastrous field of Culloden'.[96] A significant number of Alice's poems composed for the Society display the 'martial spirit' that MacDonald perceived as the influence of Ossian. In 1894, Alice was also appointed as honorary bard to the University of Edinburgh's newly formed Celtic Union, founded by Ella Carmichael in response to the exclusion of women members from its established Celtic Society.[97] On this occasion, Alice's counterpart was another Skye poet Niall MacLeòid (1843-1913), whose father Dòmhnall had also published poetry in Gaelic.[98] Given Carmichael's noted exasperation at the portrayal of Gaelic and the Gàidhealtachd by anglophone authors such as 'Fiona Macleod' ('just the Celtic thing'), and her prominent activism in promoting Gaelic language and culture (see below), her appointment of Alice appears to confirm that a clear distinction could be made between their work, despite its shared expression in English. Conversely, it may also imply that Alice had greater command of spoken Gaelic than her published work suggests, but chose not to use it in composition or, unlike her sister Josephine, was unable to do so.[99] Despite her greater similarity of style and content to 'Fiona Macleod's', however, Alice's use of 'Celt' and 'Celtic' is largely decoupled from even William Sharp's semi-informed designation of 'Celt' as a speaker of Gaelic contemporary to Ossian (as above). Her typical usage embraces, in contrast, MacPhersonian dimensions, observing the 'true Celt', for example, as one who possesses not competence in Gaelic but the 'restless, wandering spirit of [his] race', which Alice even claims to share ('the spirit that drives *us* all out to seek the flower of the world and its mysteries').[100] Similarly, unlike Ella Carmichael, Alice approaches MacPherson's Ossian from an anglophone perspective, closer to

Anne Grant's engagement a century beforehand with the 'sentiment' aroused by his poems that, for Grant, justified her vehemence in defending their ultimate authenticity,[101] yet also further from Grant's recognition of MacPherson's poems' multivalent interaction with genuine Gaelic tradition.[102]

Alice's longest published essay, printed by Ella Carmichael in *The Celtic Review*, demonstrates another aspect of MacPherson's Ossian also deserving of further inquiry: the extent to which his poems clouded Revival-era authors' and audiences' knowledge and opinion of characters from older Gaelic literature whom MacPherson had quietly reshaped. While his 'Fingal' has received considerable attention in this regard,[103] the Ossianised versions of early medieval Gaelic 'Ulster Cycle' characters Cú Chulainn, the sons of Uisliu, and Deirdre, whom MacPherson had blended with Fingal's formerly separate world, [104] remain underexplored and/or misrepresented by anglophone scholarship that presumes unwarranted similarity between their portrayal by MacPherson and their pre-Ossianic depictions.[105] As with 'Fiona Macleod's', much of Alice's work that refers to these characters displays MacPherson's influence and reproduces his poems' distinctive atmosphere, including – of course – its problematic mist. Her essay in *The Celtic Review*,[106] ostensibly a discussion of the medieval Deirdre,[107] reflects primarily the character's Ossianic incarnation as the frail heroine of MacPherson's sentimental poem *Dar-thula* (1762),[108] repeating his false etymology of her name as 'the blue-eyed one'.[109] While pointing her audience rather vaguely toward recent adaptations compiled by Alexander Carmichael and Anglo-Irish Revivalist Augusta Gregory (1852-1932)[110] – both of which, unsoundly, she treats as fact – Alice engages most earnestly with the emotion of Deirdre's truncated life, set amid real, if Ossianized locations in Argyll. Opening her essay with a 'vision' of its heroine enveloped in 'the mists of spirits departed', Alice concludes – also echoing MacPherson – by declaring that her poignant shadow continues to haunt the landscape of her former home:

> Do not the mists of the fair Deirdre still hover around far Glen Etive, giving a more mysterious glamour to its hills and its waters? […] Sweeter the bloom of the heather, and fresher its perfume; more pungent the smell of the wild bog myrtle, whiter the cotton grass, and greener the soft wet mosses for the memory of the fairest flower Glen Etive has ever seen.[111]

These mists evince the 'shadowy' indistinctness complained of by Grannd: heavy with the weight of MacPherson's legacy, obscuring clear perception of the Gaelic literature that otherwise underlies Alice's work. For an unsuspecting audience, including modern scholars, Alice's engagement with Deirdre, glazed lightly by semi-critical detail, occludes the character's utterly different depiction prior to MacPherson's *Dar-thula*, and misrepresents the context of both Carmichael's and Gregory's versions of her life (neither of which provide the insights to its oldest portrayal that Alice presumes, and conveys to her readers).[112] The mists that envelop Alice's Deirdre also belie Gregorson Campbell's hope in the early years of the Revival that the 'mist-like cloud overhanging the Highlands' is 'gradually wearing away'. Instead, for the majority of anglophone and Anglo-Highland authors, including Alice, they are enchanting – glamorizing – and their effect on the senses ever more potent (the world is 'sweeter... fresher... more pungent' beneath their veil). While their continued recovery and criticism need not assume that all Revival-era authors were influenced by MacPherson's amorphous legacy to the same extent, it must anticipate the likelihood of his influence, and recognise the possibility of multiple layers of deliberate or unconscious engagement with his poems.

Women's activism for Gaelic in the Celtic Revival

Acknowledging the complex nature of Revival-era women's writing must also include, as observed, recognition of their sometimes multivalent authorial and linguistic identities (not only for Sharp and 'Fiona Macleod'). The case of Alice MacDonell, however, illustrates the complications inherent to discussion of writers classified most easily as 'Anglo-Highland' – with regard to their favoured subjects, in Scott's useful

definition – for whom at least partial competence in Gaelic is suspected but unconfirmed, due to its absence from recoverable work. Moreover, beside Josephine MacDonell's more obvious grasp of the language, itself circumstantial, the usefulness of drawing critical distinctions between the sisters' work on this basis alone is limited, despite the fact that Josephine's favoured subject, clan history, also differs markedly from Alice's.[113] While the latter's, in fact, has most in common with 'Fiona Macleod's', Alice's otherwise close proximity to Gaelic and the distinction conferred by her literary heritage (recognised by peers who condemned 'Macleod's' assumed façade) make direct comparison of her work to 'Fiona's' equally unwise – critiquing their shared engagement with MacPherson, in fact, depends on recognising that distinction fully. Similarly, attempted differentiation between contemporary writers' work on linguistic grounds must also recognise that many fluent, native-speaking Gaelic authors, including the women whom this section will discuss, published less frequently in Gaelic than in English, including on topics of highest relevance to the Gàidhealtachd and the Gaelic language.[114] By the early 1900s, in awkward juxtaposition to the anglophone Revival that praised the 'twilight' beauty of their inevitable decline (see below), much of this work focused on advocacy for bolstering the retention of Gaelic by Gàidhealtachd communities, alongside reflections on changing Gaelic identities and developing scholarship on Gaelic literature and the oral tradition. Here, too, the spectre of Ossian lurked, addressed directly by writers more attentive to MacPherson's influence, including Catrìona NicGhille-Bhàin Ghrannd.

Ghrannd's work, alongside several other women's, appeared in newspapers and periodicals whose rising circulation, within and outwith the Gàidhealtachd and among the Gaelic diaspora, characterized the closing decades of the Nineteenth Century. Production, circulation, and popularity of printed Gaelic literature increased sharply with the evolution of the periodical press,[115] accelerated by the expansion of Gaelic and Highland Societies in Scotland as well as London.[116] The establishment of The Gaelic Society of Inverness (1872) heralded the beginning of a dedicated academic Gaelic press, with its volumes of published transactions providing a regular, curated home for discussion of all matters Gaelic. Its first editorial observed that, prior to this time, the work of such societies was usually confined to magazines and weekly newspapers and that 'even these, after being read once, run the risk of never being seen again.'[117] The Society's membership, however, and that of most Highland and Gaelic societies including An Comunn Gàidhealach (founded 1891),[118] was not exclusive to native-speaking Gaels; many 'Anglo-Highland' members had limited Gaelic or none, meaning that use of English was commonplace at meetings. The volumes of their proceedings also included regular use of English as well as Gaelic: while editors hoped to appeal to those most concerned with raising the condition of native-speaking inhabitants of the Gàidhealtachd, they remained conscious of their significant anglophone, largely Lowland-based readership, whose subscriptions were also essential. These members' tastes could be influenced by fascination with the 'Celtic fantasy' of 'Fiona Macleod' as much, if not more, than support for Gaelic,[119] but were viewed by some as potential learners of the language and, most significantly, as strategic allies. Identifying three main groups among the membership of An Comunn Gàidhealach in 1912, its former president Margaret Burnley Campbell (1857-1938) addressed herself initially to those who were neither native speakers nor even, like herself, fluent 'Anglo-Highland' learners of traceable Gaelic heritage:

> In the first place, there are those who, though not speakers of Gaelic, and sometimes not even of Highland descent, yet love the Highlands of Scotland with its beautiful scenery, its splendid sport and its historical and antiquarian associations, and realize, perhaps only in an abstract kind of way, that the old language of the people is worthy of study, although they themselves may have neither time nor inclination to devote to it. The Comunn extends a warm welcome to these sympathetic adherents who, although their interest at present may be rather superficial, will, it is hoped, with better opportunities for knowledge, become keener partisans, but who in the meanwhile are often useful to the movement in

> unexpected ways and who help especially to quench any embers of prejudice that may be found to smoulder among their various and often very extended circles of acquaintance.[120]

Anticipating similarly wide readership, these newly founded spaces broadened further in the closing decades of the Nineteenth Century, populated by other publications such as *The Celtic Magazine* (founded 1876), *The Celtic Monthly: A magazine for Highlanders* (founded 1892), and An Comunn Gàidhealach's journal *An Deo-Ghrèine* ('The sun-beam', founded 1905), all of which included content in English as well as Gaelic. These publications interacted with a rising movement that engaged with the political, economic, cultural, and social situation of contemporary Gaels and the realities of Highland life. As such, they claimed some autonomy from the anglophone literature that characterized the 'Celtic' Revival,[121] advocating directly for the preservation of the Gaelic language by means of improved education and, more widely, for economic and social advancement of the Gaelic cause. Most editors adhered to a form of conservative cultural nationalism that sought to promote and protect Gaelic and its literary traditions, while avoiding overtly politicised comment (a model established in the 1870s by John Murdoch's support for the Crofter's Cause in his newspaper *The Highlander*).[122] In 1892, *The Celtic Monthly* outlined its ambitions:

> The Magazine will deal in the main with subjects and interests of Celtic importance, but matters of general interest, although not peculiarly Celtic, will receive due recognition. While, therefore, we appeal to those who are Celts, or of Celtic extraction, we trust also that the variety of interesting matter in our columns will be sufficient to secure the support of all who desire a readable literary journal.[123]

Its use of 'Celt' is comparable to Ella Carmichael's, i.e. a speaker of Gaelic (as above), while 'of Celtic extraction' suggests the generation of Alice MacDonell who were losing or had lost their parents' language; matters 'of Celtic importance', therefore, suggest items of foremost interest to the social, cultural, and political context of Gaelic, balanced by 'matters of general interest'. The range of content promised by *The Celtic Review* (founded 1904), however, while hopeful that interests of 'the Gael' would be prominent, acknowledged that its readership could well include fans of 'Fiona Macleod's' fictionalized Gàidhealtachd, differentiated as 'Celtic' literature rather than 'Gaelic':

> The Review which is inaugurated with this number will be devoted to fostering and encouraging interest in Celtic, and especially in Gaelic, literature and learning. These words are taken in their widest meaning, and the scope of the Magazine will embrace everything which touches the Gael, except matters of current politics and religion…[124]

Often distinct from her private correspondence, as editor of *The Celtic Review* Ella Carmichael, similar to Margaret Burnley Campbell, exemplifies the pragmatism that, as Scott observes, might well be required to safeguard commercial success, '[taking] precedence over ideological preferences' when 'attract[ing] a broad readership' was essential for continued publication. In another private letter, reflecting on the balance of *The Celtic Review*'s inaugural issue, she remarked: 'if I overdo the Gaelic [it] will never pay its expenses'.[125] Fostering inclusivity for non-Gaelic-speaking audience members at their public events, such as the Celtic Union's annual Mòd in 1906, Carmichael and her colleagues also staged *tableaux vivants* that combined Gaelic narrative with Ossianic scenes, a performance reviewed with enthusiasm by *The Oban Times* (in English) and the following issue of *An Deo-Ghrèine*.[126] It is clear, therefore, that uncoupling Gaelic literary culture from MacPherson's pervasive legacy is difficult, despite its leading members' well-founded suspicions of spurious anglophone reshaping of Gàidhealtachd tradition, while some were as susceptible to Ossianic reverie as anglophone authors or used its language, perhaps unconsciously, to soften native speakers' apprehension that, despite renewed efforts, Gaelic might not be saved:

> It is the duty of every Highlander to do his best to uphold the language, not only as a true and faithful servant, but also in order that, if the heroic language of a heroic people be doomed to die, its last days may be its best.[127]

As Wilson McLeod observes, characterizing Gaelic as 'the heroic language of a heroic people' had 'obvious Ossianic overtones', as did 'the prospect of its glorious death' (otherwise 'by no means a prospectus for language revival').[128]

At least ostensibly, however, the most significant force driving the production of this critically engaged literary scene was the revitalisation of Gaelic, and the encouragement of the production of new materials and ideas necessary for its development by the widest possible audience. The content and ambitions of its publications, however, were complicated by the Gaelic movement's shifting cultural and political landscape, as it also became imbued with descendant ideologies of the broader Scottish cultural renaissance, captivated by reimagined concepts of *fin-de-siècle* nationalism and nationhood.[129] Moreover, as McLeod observes, 'many of those involved did not aim at any fundamental change in the social role of Gaelic in the Gàidhealtachd', but simply to 'celebrate the language in certain narrowly defined cultural contexts and prevent it from dying out' completely.[130] In consequence, the Gaelic literary scene of the late 1890s and early 1900s may be seen as self-conscious and politically confused, especially when serial publications' adherence to strictly defined cultural boundaries could fluctuate with changing personnel. For example, under one editorship *An Deo-Ghrèine* denounced the patronage of a British princess as antithetical to the manifesto of its parent institution An Comunn Gàidhealach, yet revered that same patronage under a new editor only the following year.[131] Moreover, since contemporary discourse relied on an 'authentic' traditional history to call upon in condemnation, popular literary themes such as the 'sleeping hero' could be turned to satire (see below), while 'genuine' Gaelic histories, fragments, tales, and scholarly inquiries were presented in English as often as Gaelic (i.e. aside from the typical presence of English noted above).

Several Gaelic writers, including women, comment directly on *fin-de-siècle* Gaelic literature in light of these complex dichotomies, anticipating, too, the often-over-simplified gap between Gaels, non-Gaels, and their respective support for the Gaelic language movement and for Gaelic (and/or 'Celtic') literature. Catrìona NicGhille-Bhàin Ghrannd, for example, was a prominent Gaelic writer and educator whose literary career took many forms, including the translation into Gaelic of influential works of European literature, such as Friedrich Schiller's *Wilhelm Tell*.[132] Translation was a fundamental tool of language revival, enriching the amount of material available to Gaelic audiences, including learners, and convenient for use in Gaelic educational settings.[133] Its prevalence, however, was widely criticised, including by Irish-language activists such as Patrick Pearse (Pádraic Mac Piarais, 1879-1916), who regarded translation as a distraction from the ultimate goal of cultivating rich, original, and arguably 'authentic' modern literature in Gaelic.[134] It is also clear that members of Gaelic communities in Scotland could perceive revitalization of the Gaelic language in terms of its 'authentic' cultural value. By 1911, for example, Grannd had published a significant collection of original prose tales and poetry in Gaelic alongside translations of popular English hymns and the poems of Alfred Tennyson (1809-1892). *The Celtic Review* responded favourably, saying of Grannd:

> here is a Highland gentle-woman writing simply and tenderly of a life which is her own life, and of a race which is her own race.[135]

The implication that fellow Gaels could suspect Gaelic as well as anglophone authors like 'Fiona Macleod' of presenting an imagined picture of contemporary life in the Gàidhealtachd is striking, and deserving of further attention. Perhaps the perceived simplicity of Grannd's work was itself a deliberate attempt to avoid replicating the 'misty' imprecision that she dispelled so firmly in 1904 ('our poetry never lacks clearness if read in Gaelic').[136] Regardless, her writing provides an important example of a native-speaking Gaelic author navigating contemporary tensions between languages; between native-speakers and outsiders (including,

perhaps, Anglo-Highland writers such as Alice MacDonell); and the problematic space identified by Derick Thomson between authentic and 'bogus' Gaelic literature (i.e. that which imitated MacPherson's Ossian deliberately).[137]

Grannd was also sensitive to potential criticism of her use of commonly deployed Gaelic revivalist motifs such as the 'sleeping hero', which informed her 1908 play *Dùsgadh na Féinne* (*The Awakening of the Fèinn*).[138] Writing to Calum MacPhàrlain (1853-1913), founding editor of *An Deo-Ghrèine* and another active voice in the language movement, she claimed:

> There is but little [in it] that is original. It is more of a gathering of little rhymes, to begin with […] and then the old story of the waiting Féinne. Your complaint of the want of an outstanding leader, such as Dr Douglas Hyde, put that part into my head.[139]

MacPhàrlain, a regular correspondent of Grannd's, was an outspoken participant in the Gaelic language movement in Scotland, looking frequently to prominent figures such as Hyde (1860-1949), co-founder of the Gaelic League, for the kind of leadership that he believed was lacking at home. Grannd's allegory of the 'sleeping hero', a Gaelic tradition that Fionn mac Cumhaill would awaken when called to defend his land, shares this motif with MacPhàrlain's overtly propagandist play *Am Mosgladh Mòr (The Great Awakening)* (1914-15), ostensibly for children, which 'exhorted young Gaels to awaken from the greedy slumber of English' and, like Fionn, to 'fight the cause of Gaelic'.[140] Both plays also dwell on another tendency common to revivalist Gaelic literature: portraying language death as a process of sustained assault. Grannd made use of this motif in a series of essays, 'Na Cunnartan a tha 'Bagradh na Gaidhlig' ('*The Dangers that threaten Gaelic*'), which appeared in three instalments of *An Deo-Ghrèine* from October to December 1905. The stated ambitions of Grannd's essays ran parallel with MacPhàrlain's editorial objectives:

> 'S a maoidheadh a labhairt a chur air cùl; na meadhonan a tha ri 'n gnàthachadh gu a cumail beò; agus dleasnas nan Gàidheal d' a taobh aig an àm so.[141]
>
> *To set forth the dangers that threaten the existence of Gaelic as a spoken language, the means to be adopted for its preservation, and the duty of Highlanders under the circumstances.*

Her opening instalment echoes *Am Mosgladh Mòr*, urging (all) Gaels' rejection of their current apathy:

> Am bheil sinne, Gàidheil na h-Alba, dol a leigeadh leis a' Ghàidhlig dol a dhìth? Am bheil i ri bhi air a tasgadh suas ann an leabhraichean fuara, agus air a cunntas am measg nan cumhachdach a dh' eug? […] Tha 'n t-àm againn ar maol-snèimh a thilgeadh air cùl, agus trusadh ris mu 'm bi e tuilleadh 's anmoch; oir, mur dean sinn sin gu h-ealamh, gheibh ar sean mhàthair bàs. Ma gheibh, coiricheamaid sinn féin.[142]
>
> *Are we, the Gaels of Scotland, going to let Gaelic go? Is it to be stored up in cold books, and counted among the mighty who have died? […] It's time for us to cast aside our indifference and pick her up before it's too late; for, if we do not do so quickly, our aged mother will die. If so, we have only ourselves to blame.*

Grannd's use of allegorical motif does not obscure the fragile position she discerns for Gaelic: the language is suffering at the hands of many enemies, one of whom is its current speakers, sleep-walking in their indifference to its survival. Her series of essays was printed exclusively in Gaelic, making explicit that Grannd addressed Gaels directly and did not appeal to the anglophone world for help, but only to speakers of Gaelic. Her reference to the 'cold books' that store the language, already, 'among the mighty who have

died', could allude to periodicals such as the *Transactions*, or else to the work of 'Celtic twilight' authors such as 'Fiona Macleod', but also, perhaps, to MacPherson's Ossian, whose ideology could be deployed almost tactically to soften the prospect of language death (as above). Her challenge to reject such texts' inclement influence may also observe internal conflict within the Gaelic movement as it faced competing assaults by actual language decline on the one hand and the better-marketed anglophone 'revival' of the Gàidhealtachd on the other. One called for improved provision for Gaelic education and the socio-economic condition of living Gaels; while the other, deferring to 'Ossianic' antiquity, celebrated the glories of a bygone culture that, it implied, had long-since waned (e.g. 'Fiona Macleod's' review of *Carmina Gadelica* as 'a wonderful elegy for a more or less dead culture' that showed few signs of independent restoration).[143]

In notable contrast to Grannd, Sheila MacDonald, writing in English in a subsequent instalment of *An Deo-Ghrèine*, defends anglophone writing about the Gàidhealtachd from dismissal as merely 'sentimental tommy rot'.[144] Her argument relies heavily on observing the useful popularity of Ossian, remarking that, in her opinion, the need for wider education in Gaelic should embrace MacPherson's enduring legacy as 'the vehicle with which [children's] young minds should be opened up to begin with'.[145] Gaelic education had dominated Grannd's essays too, indicating the high number of English-only schools in the Lowlands and the lack of provision for Gaelic education in the Gàidhealtachd, set against the ability, effectiveness, and willingness of Highland school boards to provide comprehensive education in Gaelic after the Education (Scotland) Act of 1872.[146] Although, like Alice MacDonell's, the extent of MacDonald's command of Gaelic is unclear, her contrast to Grannd's vehemence typifies the conflation of ideologies seemingly innate within the Gaelic language movement and the wider arena of the 'Celtic' vs. 'Gaelic' Revivals. The latter defined Gaelic education as intrinsic to the preservation and future of the language, while the former, conscious of its literature's significant attraction in English translation to non-Gaels, defined it as the means to create and thereby perpetuate anglophone 'Celtic' literature (set presumably in a Gàidhealtachd devoid of Gaelic speakers). Grannd's opinions on the use of English in Highland schools, however, were in no way 'indistinct': ''S i 'Bheurla a' cheud nàmhaid a bheirear am follais' ('*English is the first enemy to be exposed*').[147]

Though both essays were written by women, the only potentially gendered issue raised with regard to preserving Gaelic is Grannd's suggestion that intermarriage between Gaels and Lowlanders was another factor of concern. In contrast, Ella Carmichael's contribution to the first issue of *An Deo-Ghrèine*, 'Some Things Women Can Do [for Gaelic]', is largely domestic in its focus, observing the responsibility of parents, in particular mothers, to foster and encourage their children's use of Gaelic in the home: to 'talk to them [in it], to sing to them and to tell them stories.'[148] Carmichael is practical about the spheres of influence that women have and the circles in which they tended to operate; she is equally concerned with the appointment of Gaelic-speaking teachers to Highland Schools. Priscilla Scott's detailed discussion of women's roles in the Gaelic movement considers some lively correspondence between Carmichael and Calum MacPhàrlain, when Carmichael was approached to curate a 'women's corner' of *An Deo-Ghrèine*. She replied:

> What sort of things do you want in [it]? Fashions? If so I'm off! If you want to tell them that the women & their own efforts can keep Gaelic alive and honoured, I could do that and shall, if you can permit, try to give you something on the subject.[149]

Unlike Sheila MacDonald and similar to Grannd, Carmichael advocates for promoting education in Gaelic, recognising the need for local and regional Gaelic societies with an emphasis on collegiality between institutions, expressing concern for the bias of Highland school boards; and paying heed to political, social, and economic aspects of modern living that were contributing to the language's decline. While the mission statement of *The Celtic Review* ('devoted to fostering and encouraging interest in *Celtic*, and especially in Gaelic, literature'), denotes greater consideration than Grannd's for its anglophone readership and much

greater tolerance for the anglophone Revival's 'soft focus' gaze on the Gàidhealtachd,[150] Carmichael's position in private correspondence errs on the side of fellow Gaels.

As much as Alice MacDonell's Anglo-Highland Ossianism, Gaelic women's contributions to periodical literature attest to the complexities inherent to recovery and classification of Revival-era Gaelic writing – including in English – which this article, too, has sought to acknowledge and suggest more nuanced ways with which to engage. Few of these, in fact, are new, but have received much less critical attention than popular perception of Gaelic literature as 'Celtic mythology', which James MacPherson's legacy foments but is otherwise largely a product of the Revival itself.[151] Several forms of potential reflection are anticipated by Gaelic women whom this article has discussed, chiefly Catrìona NicGhille-Bhàin Ghrannd, whose work displays keen critical engagement with the difficulties and awkwardness of reversing systematic language decline, but also of the challenges of writing in Gaelic at a time of cultural, social, and political tension between parallel 'Celtic' and 'Gaelic' revival movements. Equally complex, from the later Eighteenth Century, is the recovery of women authors visibly or potentially bilingual in Gaelic and English, recognising the contrast between native-speakers' experience and anglophone learners', exemplified by the MacLean Clephanes and Anne Grant, which may also have influenced the women's differing contemporary recognition as authorities on Gaelic literature. The experience of learners of Gaelic during the Revival is also remarked on, including by Margaret Burnley Campbell, herself a learner and another contributor in the early years of *An Deo-Ghréine*. Like Grannd and Ella Carmichael, Campbell's essay 'The Difficulties I Encountered in Learning Gaelic' considers the dual existence of the anglophone 'Celtic' world with the Gaelic language movement, to which new speakers added further shade. As Campbell observes, the learner's position in contemporary debate remains ambiguous, since their liminality made ideological exclusivity in linguistic activists' manifestos harder to achieve.[152] As, however, her summary of typical membership to An Comunn Gàidhealach observes (as above), learners' support for the movement could be vital, while the label applied equally to those, like herself, from 'Anglo-Highland' families as well as non-Gaels. Even Grannd's essay related a story about a bilingual Gael who had come to the language on the basis of MacPherson's Ossian, learning to write in Gaelic and later winning prizes for their work.[153]

It seems appropriate that Grannd concludes her essays on 'Na Cunnartan' with the Gaelic proverb 'An Fheinn air a h-Uilinn' ('*The Fianna on their elbows*'), implying that there was still a considerable way to go in re-awakening the Gaels' traditional heroes to salvage their culture and literature demystified of Ossianic fog. Neither Grannd's essays nor her wider corpus of work reject anglophone interest in the Gàidhealtachd definitively, but, like the current discussion, advise caution in approaching the murky middle ground that characterizes typically ambiguous attitudes towards the Gaelic language, its speakers, and its literature during the Celtic Revival, including by Gaels. Thereby, it is hoped, further recovery of the writers who shaped and critiqued its contemporary landscape may proceed in clearer light.

Acknowledgements

The authors are grateful to Glenda Norquay, Scott Lyall, Valentina Bold, Michael Dempster, and Rhona Brown for recommending complementary discussion of *fin-de-siecle* women's writing in Scots; to Kirsteen McCue and Leith Davis for several references on Eighteenth-Century women's writing; and to Sìm Innes, Sheila Kidd, Peter Mackay, Murdo Macdonald, David Mandić, and Rhys Kaminksi-Jones, and the anonymous reviewer for invaluable feedback that informed our revisions. As the discussion reflects, we are greatly indebted to our colleague Priscilla Scott and her significant recovery of women's writing and activism for Gaelic and Gaelic literature; the ongoing work of Abigail Burnyeat and Domhnall Uilleam Stiùbhart on Ella, Mary Frances, and Alexander Carmichael is also acknowledged with gratitude. Warm thanks also to Charlotte Lauder, Lois Burke, and Gemma King for inviting us to contribute to the symposium from which this special issue derives, and to all participants in its round-table discussion, especially Michael Shaw.

[1] Unless otherwise stated, translations from Gaelic in this article are Thomson's.
[2] 'Realism in Gaelic Poetry', in William Gillies (ed.), *Ris a' Bhruthaich: The Criticism and Prose Writings of Sorley MacLean* (Stornoway: Acair, 1985), pp. 15-47, at 20.
[3] Thomas Owen Clancy, 'Gaelic Literature and Scottish Romanticism', in Murray Pittock (ed.), *The Edinburgh Companion to Scottish Romanticism* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2011), pp. 49-60; Donald Meek, 'The Sublime Gael: The impact of MacPherson's Ossian on literary creativity and cultural perception in Gaelic Scotland', in Howard Gaskill (ed.), *The reception of Ossian in Europe* (London: Thoemmes, 2004), pp. 40-66.
[4] Rhys Kaminski-Jones, 'Floating in the breath of the people: Ossianic mist, cultural health, and the creation of Celtic atmosphere, 1760-1815', *Romanticism* 27.2 (2021), pp. 135-48, at 135.
[5] See also, on MacGill-Eain, Peter Mackay, '"From Optik to Haptik": Celticism, Symbols and Stones in the 1930s', in Charles Ferrall and Dougal McNeill (eds), *British Literature in Transition, 1920-1940: Futility and Anarchy* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018), pp. 275-90.
[6] 'The Influence of Scenery and Climate on the Music and Poetry of the Highlands', *Caledonian Medical Journal* 5 (1902-1904), pp. 103-41, at 109 (original emphasis), cited in Priscilla Scott, '"With heart and voice ever devoted to the cause": Women in the Gaelic Movement, 1886-1914', unpublished PhD dissertation (University of Edinburgh, 2013), < https://era.ed.ac.uk/handle/1842/9913> [accessed December 30 2021], p. 163.
[7] *Waifs and strays of Celtic tradition (Argyllshire Series, No. IV): The Fians; or stories, poems, and traditions of Fionn and his warrior band* (London: David Nutt, 1891), p. ix (emphasis added).
[8] For reasons of space, it will not engage directly with the adjacent development of 'Celtic Studies' as an academic discipline, except in the case of Ella Carmichael. For widening contemporary inclusion of the subject in university curricula and its description as 'Celtic', see John Koch, 'Celtic Studies', in Alan Deyermond (ed.), *A century of British medieval studies* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), pp. 235-61, and Donald Meek, '"Beachdan Ura a Inbhir Nis/New Opinions from Inverness": Alexander MacBain (1855-1907) and the foundation of Celtic Studies in Scotland', *Proceedings of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland* 131 (2002), pp. 23-39.
[9] Revival-era critics of Scottish literature, such as William Power (1873-1951), engaged with MacPherson's legacy in somewhat different terms, attempting to 'defuse the destructive division of Scotland into two entirely alien cultures' by harmonizing consideration of Gaelic and Scottish literature outwith the Nineteenth-Century binary of 'Caledonian Celt' versus 'Lowland Saxon'. See Cairns Craig, 'The criticism of Scottish literature: Tradition, decline and renovation', in Ian Brown et al. (eds), *The Edinburgh History of Scottish Literature volume 3: Modern Transformations: New Identities (from 1918)* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 42-52, at 49-50.
[10] *The Poems of Ossian, translated by James MacPherson, with notes, and with an introduction by William Sharp* (Edinburgh: Patrick Geddes & Colleagues, 1896); the selection, rearranged by Sharp, otherwise followed the text of Hugh Campbell's 1822 edition, quietly omitting the numerous insults that Campbell's preface casts at Scottish Gaels in contrast to their 'civilized' Irish brethren.
[11] Petra Johana Poncarová, 'Derick Thomson and the Ossian Controversy', *Anglica* 29.3 (2020), pp. 125-33.
[12] *Patrick Geddes's intellectual origins* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2020), pp. 76-77. Michael Shaw observes the collection's publication as an example of 'Geddes's wider interest in distributing literature about the lives of such figures as Fionn and Ossian', but MacPherson's influence is unexplored; *The Fin-de-Siècle Scottish Revival: Romance, Decadence and Celtic Identity* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2020), p. 155 (cf. p. 39).
[13] *Poems of Ossian*, pp. ix-xxiv.
[14] While more precise than the majority of his anglophone contemporaries', Sharp's definitions – explored at greater length in a separate essay, 'Celtic', published in *The Divine Adventure* (1900) – remain problematic. See William F. O'Halloran, *The life and letters of William Sharp and 'Fiona Macleod', volume 3: 1900-1905* (Cambridge: Open Book Publishers, 2020), <https://doi.org/10.11647/OBP.0221>, pp. 19-27 [accessed December 29 2021], and Kate Louise Mathis, 'The Outcome of Ossian: James MacPherson's legacy in the Scottish Celtic Revival', in Brecht de Groote and Rhys Kaminski-Jones (eds), *Unknown Tongues: Romanticism's Minor and Marginal Languages* (forthcoming).
[15] *Poems of Ossian*, e.g. pp. xviii-xx. 'Verbal art', describing the 'vast, complex, fluid, processual oral culture' that underlay the gradual codification of a Scottish Gaelic literary corpus in the later 1700s, is borrowed from Domhnall Uilleam Stiùbhart, 'Gaelic Enlightenment to global Gaelosphere: Gaelic literature, 1750-1800', in Leith Davis and Janet Sorensen (eds), *The International Companion to Scottish Literature of the Long Eighteenth Century* (Glasgow: Scottish Literature International, 2021), pp. 149-69, at 149.
[16] The assumption, convenient to Sharp's lack of Gaelic, reflects his conviction that the decline of Celtic-language communities, including the Scottish Gàidhealtachd, is inevitable; Macdonald, *Patrick Geddes*, p. 80.
[17] Scott, '"With heart and voice", esp. pp. 33-42, 109, 166-69, 173-74; William Gillies, 'Elizabeth (Ella) Catherine Carmichael Watson (*c.* 1871–1928)', in John H. Burnett et al. (eds), *The University Portraits*. Second Series (Edinburgh, 1986), pp. 204-06.
[18] Dated January 2 1901, now in the Canna House Archive; cited by Scott, '"With heart and voice"', p. 172. 'Race' is used in its contemporary sense, closest to modern designation of ethnic identity; it was often synonymous with 'Gaelic',

e.g. in Marjory Kennedy-Fraser's description of Gaelic oral culture as 'racial song-lore' specific to the Highlands (in John MacDonald [ed.], *Voices from the Hills* [Glasgow: An Comunn Gàidhealach, 1927], pp. 31-34).
[19] Discussed by Scott, '"With heart and voice"', p. 18, and *passim*.
[20] '"With heart and voice"', p. 171.
[21] This is not to overlook its significant, widely discussed artistic dimension, e.g. Murdo Macdonald, 'Anima Celtica: Embodying the Soul of the Nation in 1890s Edinburgh', in Tricia Cusack and Sighle Bhreathnach-Lynch (eds), *Art, Nation and Gender: Ethnic Landscapes, Myths and Mother-Figures* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003), pp. 29–37 and 'The Visual Dimension of *Carmina Gadelica*', in Domhnall Uilleam Stiùbhart (ed.), *The Life and Legacy of Alexander Carmichael* (Port of Ness: Islands Book Trust, 2008), pp. 135–45, and Elizabeth Cumming, *Hand, Heart and Soul: The Arts and Crafts Movement in Scotland* (Edinburgh: Birlinn, 2006).
[22] Headline to a discussion of Macleod's work in the *Dundee Advertiser* (4 June 1896), cited by Murray Pittock and Isla Jack, 'Patrick Geddes and the Celtic Revival', in Susan Manning (ed.), *The Edinburgh History of Scottish Literature volume 2: Enlightenment, Britain and Empire (1707-1918)* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 338-46, at 343.
[23] Scott, '"With heart and voice"', pp. 172-73.
[24] Such as Pittock and Jack, 'Patrick Geddes', and the otherwise meticulous Shaw, *Fin-de-Siècle Scottish Revival* (see also note 24, below).
[25] Poncarová, 'Derick Thomson', p. 125; see also Niall Mackenzie's candid review (*Scottish Gaelic Studies* 26 [2010], pp. 146-54) of Thomas M. Curley's *Samuel Johnson, the Ossian fraud, and the Celtic Revival in Great Britain and Ireland* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009). A similar lack of engagement by anglophone critics with Welsh-language Romanticism has received greater attention and partial redress, e.g. Rhys Kaminski-Jones, '[Review] Jeff Strabone, Poetry and British Nationalisms in the Bardic Eighteenth Century: Imagined Antiquities', *The Review of English Studies* 70 (September 2019), pp. 775-77, and Mary-Ann Constantine and Nigel Leask (eds), *Enlightenment Travel and British Identities: Thomas Pennant's Tours in Scotland and Wales* (Anthem Press: London & New York, 2017).
[26] E.g. Shaw's engaging discussion of the *Scottish National Pageant of Allegory, History and Myth* (1908), directed and christened by Geddes, which overlooks the nuance of 'Celtic mythology' as a contemporary term and reapplies it to the characters, like Cú Chulainn and Fionn mac Cumhaill, whom Geddes and his collaborator Sharp drew from Gaelic literary tradition; *Fin-de-Siècle Scottish Revival*, pp. 229-56.
[27] Nigel Leask, 'Fingalian topographies: Ossian and the Highland Tour, 1760-1805', *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 39.2 (2016), pp. 183-96, and *Stepping Westward: Writing the Highland Tour c. 1720-1830* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020), esp. pp. 61-96; see also John Bonehill, Anne Dulau Beveridge, and Nigel Leask (eds), *Old Ways, New Roads: Travels in Scotland, 1720-1832* (Edinburgh: Birlinn, 2021).
[28] 'The Ossianic revival, James Beattie and primitivism', in Manning (ed.), *Edinburgh History of Scottish Literature volume 2*, pp. 90-98, at p. 90. For Ossian's influence on Irish Gaelic and Anglo-Irish Revivalist literature, also more widely discussed, see Clare O'Halloran, 'Irish Re-Creations of the Gaelic Past: The Challenge of Macpherson's Ossian', *Past and Present* 124 (1989), 69-95, and Richard Barlow, 'Celticism, ballad transmission, and the schizoid voice: Ossianic fragments in Owenson, Yeats, Joyce, and Beckett', *Irish Studies Review* 27.4 (2019), pp. 473-92.
[29] E.g. Katherine Gordon, 'Introduction', in *Voices from their Ain Countrie: The poems of Marion Angus and Violet Jacob*, ed. Gordon (Glasgow: ASLS, 2006), pp. 1-54; Aimée Chalmers, *The Singin Lass: Selected work of Marion Angus* (Edinburgh: Polygon, 2006); Glenda Norquay, 'Finding a place: The voice of Lorna Moon', *Études écossaises* 9 (2004), pp. 91-103; and Alison Lumsden, '"To get leave to live": Negotiating regional identity in the literature of north-east Scotland', in Brown et al. (eds), *Edinburgh History of Scottish Literature volume 3*, pp. 95-106.
[30] Enticing publisher John Lane with her in-progress second novel, for example, 'Fiona' claimed to be 'busy collecting from the Gaelic-speaking islesmen many notes, legends, and so forth, for a volume which I think of calling "A Celtic Wreath"'; see William F. O'Halloran, *The life and letters of William Sharp and 'Fiona Macleod', volume 1: 1855-1894* (Cambridge: Open Book Publishers, 2018), <http://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctv8d5t68.15>, p. 577 [accessed April 17 2022]. Strikingly, similar claims occur in correspondence with Sharp's wife Elizabeth (e.g. *id.*, p. 572); see Mathis, 'Outcome of Ossian'.
[31] '"With heart and voice"', pp. 172-73, citing initially from Amy Murray's biography of Father Allan MacDonald, *Father Allan's Island* (Edinburgh & London: The Moray Press, 1936), p. 195.
[32] 'Cò i Fiona Nic'Leòid?' ['Who is Fiona Macleod?'], *The Oban Weekly News*, 13 Dec 1905; translation by Priscilla Scott, cited in '"With heart and voice"', pp. 173 and 256. Ironically, but with substantial pathos, the article was printed the day after William Sharp's death on December 12 and the day before its public confirmation, when his and Fiona's shared identity was revealed at Sharp's behest; see O'Halloran, *Life and letters of William Sharp and 'Fiona Macleod', volume 3*, pp. 397-98.
[33] '"With heart and voice"', p. 173.
[34] Elizabeth A. Sharp, *William Sharp (Fiona Macleod): A memoir* (New York: Duffield & Company, 1910), e.g. pp. 223, 282, 292, discussed by O'Halloran, *Life and letters of William Sharp and 'Fiona Macleod', volume 2: 1895-1899* (Cambridge: Open Book Publishers, 2020), <https://doi.org/10.11647/OBP.0196>, pp. 15, 357, 432 [accessed April 19, 2022].
[35] 'Anima Celtica', and 'Visual Dimension', pp. 142-43. See also Macdonald's discussion of Sharp's opinion, potentially related, that 'the renaissance of the Celt depend[ed] on an Anglophone guise'; *Patrick Geddes*, pp. 79-80 (also consistent with Sharp's review, as 'Fiona', of the first volume of Alexander Carmichael's *Carmina Gadelica* in 1900).
[36] *Ireland's Immortals* p. 380.

[37] In October 1907, the magazine's title was altered from *An Deo-Ghrèine* to *An Deo-Gréine* (not without controversy; see Scott, '"With heart and voice"', p. 39, note 56). Citations from articles published in the magazine retain the spelling appropriate to its date of appearance.
[38] Scott, '"With heart and voice"', pp. 144-45.
[39] Chiefly the circle of 'Bluestocking' Elizabeth Montagu (1718-1800), influential to *Fragments of ancient poetry* (1760) even prior to its publication; e.g. JoEllen DeLucia, *A Feminine Enlightenment: British Women Writers and the Philosophy of Progress, 1759-1820* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015), pp. 62-63.
[40] Leask, *Stepping Westward*, esp. pp. 88-92, 187-217.
[41] Leith Davis, 'Women, Oral Culture, and Book History in the Romantic-Era British Archipelago: Charlotte Brooke, Anne Grant, and Felicia Hemans', *Huntington Library Quarterly* 84.1 (Spring 2021), pp. 177-88, at 183.
[42] E.g. Leask, *Stepping Westward*, p. 87.
[43] *Essays on the Superstitions of the Highlanders of Scotland, vol. II* (London: Longman et al., 1811), p. 335 (emphasis added).
[44] Ibid., pp. 337, 338-39. Perkins's engagement with Grant's description situates it thoroughly in the longer-term context of her understanding and representation of Highland culture, but its analysis focuses primarily on Grant's acceptance of the Highland landscape (in Ossianic terms) rather than its language; *Women writers*, pp. 189-97.
[45] Davis, 'Women', p. 183.
[46] As Davis observes, Grant is on firmest ground with her defence of the longevity of Gaelic poetry transmitted solely via oral circulation; 'Women', p. 184. For her early promotion of Sìleas na Ceapaich, one of the best-represented women poets of the Eighteenth Century, see Kate L. Mathis, 'Gaelic women's poetry', in Leith Davis and Janet Sorensen (eds), *The International Companion to Scottish Literature of the Long Eighteenth Century* (Glasgow: Scottish Literature International, 2021), pp. 199-219, at 204-5.
[47] See, for example, Grant's presentation of a 'literally translated' verse from Sìleas na Ceapaich's lament for Alasdair Dubh, 10th MacDonald of Glengarry (d. 1721), observed with scepticism by Colm Ó Baoill: 'if the poem is, as seems unlikely, literally translated, Mrs Grant must have known a version considerably different from [any known copies]'; *Bàrdachd Shìlis na Ceapaich: Poems and songs by Sìleas MacDonald, c. 1600-c. 1729* (Edinburgh: The Scottish Gaelic Texts Society, 1972), p. 164. For Grant's text, see J. R. N. MacPhail (ed.), *Letters Concerning Highland Affairs in the 18th century by Mrs Grant of Laggan*, in *Wariston's Diary and other papers* (Edinburgh: T. & A. Constable for the Scottish History Society, 1896), pp. 251-330, at 316.
[48] It is possible, too, that Grant's parents may have spoken Gaelic in their youth, and probable that both derived from Gaelic-speaking families (based respectively in Craignish and Invernahyle, Argyllshire); MacPhail (ed.), *Letters*, p. 250.
[49] See Anja Gunderloch, 'The Heroic Ballads of Gaelic Scotland', in Sarah Dunnigan and Suzanne Gilbert (eds), *The Edinburgh Companion to Scottish Traditional Literatures* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2013), pp. 74–85. The dubious case of 'The Aged Bard's Wish' (*Miann a bhaird aosda*) is discussed by Derick Thomson, 'Bogus Gaelic literature, c.1750-c.1820', *Transactions of the Gaelic Society of Glasgow* 5 (1958), pp. 172-88, and Poncarová, 'Derick Thomson'.
[50] *Poems on Various Subjects* (Edinburgh: printed for the author by J. Moir, 1803), p. 371. Grant refers here to the second- and third-earliest printed anthologies of Gaelic poetry, i.e. Raonuill MacDhòmnuill (ed.), *Comh-chruinneachidh Orannaigh Gaidhealach, le Raonuill MacDhomnuill, ann 'n Eilean Eigg* (Duneidiunn: Clo-bhuailt ann le Walter Ruddiman, 1776), and John Gillies (ed.), *Sean Dain, agus Orain Ghaidhealach/A Collection of Ancient and Modern Gaelic Poems and Songs, Transmitted from Gentlemen in the Highlands of Scotland* (Perth: for the author, 1786). Gillies subscribed to *Poems on Various Subjects*, as did Rev. James McLagan (Seumas MacLathagain, 1728–1805), on whose extensive collection Gillies's anthology had drawn.
[51] 'Letter XIV, To Miss [Mary] Grant', in John P. Grant (ed.) *Memoir and correspondence of Mrs Grant of Laggan* (London: Longman et al., 1844), pp. 64-5.
[52] Including a number of prominent Gaels, such as Sir John MacPherson, 1st Baronet (1745-1821), whose father John (d. 1765) had been James MacPherson's close friend and author of an early defence of his work, *Critical Dissertations on the Origin, Antiquities, Language, Government, Manners, Religion of the Ancient Caledonians* (1768). See MacPhail (ed.), *Letters*, p. 292. Grant is also the probable source of the well-informed summary of the Ossian controversy published by her acquaintance Elizabeth Spence; *Letters from the North Highlands, During the Summer 1816* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown, 1817), pp. 152-8.
[53] Henry Mackenzie (ed.), *Report of the Committee of the Highland Society of Scotland, Appointed to Inquire into the Nature and Authenticity of the Poems of Ossian* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press for Archibald Constable & Co., 1805), pp. 49-50.
[54] Davis, 'Women', pp. 181-2.
[55] Elizabeth Montagu (as note 39, above), is referred to briefly as 'a zealous partizan of Ossian' (*Report*, p. 10), and Christian, wife to Mr Andrew Gallie, one of MacPherson's hosts on his tour of the Gàidhealtachd in 1761, confirms her husband's account of discussing MacPherson's work, although she 'was not then well acquainted with the[ir] Gaelic' (*Report*, p. 38). Two other women who appear to be Gaelic speakers, 'Janet McKenrick or Henderson' of Glenfalloch and Mary Cameron of Highbridge, are identified at second-hand by collectors Archibald Fletcher and Duncan Kennedy (pp. 272, 274), while another of Kennedy's informants, 'a lady by the name of Mackeich', is said to have had 'a poem on the death of Fraoch'. Her text, however, was omitted from the *Report* as too similar to Jerome Stone's copy of the same lament (p. 304).

[56] See John Sinclair, *The poems of Ossian in the original Gaelic… together with a dissertation on the authenticity of the poems* (London: W. Bulmer and Co. for the Highland Society of London, 1806), pp. xlv–xlvii, and Patrick MacGregor, *The genuine remains of Ossian* (London: Smith, Elder, & Co. for the Highland Society of London, 1841), pp. 39-41. Mrs Fraser's collection was lost after its transit to America by her son Simon, who died as a prisoner during the Revolutionary Wars (1775-83); the Douay manuscript (c. 1745), also lost, was reported as another genuine collection of Gaelic heroic ballads predating MacPherson's renown
[57] For the greater visibility of Gaelic women's poetry and song in male-edited collections in the wake of the Ossian controversy, see Mathis, 'Gaelic women's poetry', esp. pp. 199-205.
[58] William Gillies, 'Some Eighteenth-century developments in Scottish Gaelic poetry', in Anders Ahlqvist and Pamela O'Neill (eds), *Language and power in the Celtic world* (Sydney: Celtic Studies Foundation, University of Sydney, 2011), pp. 61-97.
[59] Samuel Johnson and James Boswell, *A Journey to the Western Islands of Scotland and The Journal of a Tour to the Hebrides*, ed. P. Levi (London: Penguin, 1984), pp. 132, 353. Miss MacLean performed two Gaelic songs for her father's guests; see Ronald Black (ed.), *An Lasair: Anthology of 18th Century Scottish Gaelic Verse* (Edinburgh: Birlinn, 2001), p. 403, and Kate L. Mathis, '"Tha Mulad Air M'Inntinn" and Early Modern Gaelic Dialogue Verse', *Aiste* 5 (2019), pp. 50-139, at 95-6. For Hector MacLean's collection, see Colm Ó Baoill, 'Raghnall Dubh and Hector Maclean', *Scottish Gaelic Studies* 12.2 (1976), pp 209-20.
[60] Alexander Campbell, *A Slight sketch of a Journey made through parts of the Highlands and Hebrides, undertaken to collect materials for Albyn's Anthology, by the Editor, in Autumn 1815*, Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections La.III.577.
[61] Alexander Campbell (ed.), *Albyn's Anthology, 2 vols* (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1816-18), I, p. viii.
[62] In contrast, the work of Grant, another of Campbell's contributors, is credited explicitly; *Albyn's Anthology* I (1816), e.g. p. 43, and II (1818), p. 66. Most items, however, are Scots and English rather than Gaelic.
[63] Karen McAulay, 'The Accomplished Ladies of Torloisk', *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 44.1 (June 2013), pp. 57-78, at 75.
[64] *Albyn's Anthology,* II, pp. 60-1.
[65] Campbell, *A Slight sketch*, folio 11v. Margaret's contributions were given to Campbell by Christina MacKenzie, indicating that the women knew each other; as Karen McAulay observes, it is probable that most of the Mull women included by Campbell were acquainted, and may have been familiar with other contemporary women collectors such as Raasay-based Eliza Ross. See McAulay, 'Accomplished Ladies', p. 75, and Peter Cooke et al. (eds), *Original Highland airs collected at Raasay in 1812 by Elizabeth Jane Ross* (Glasgow: Musica Scotica Trust, 2016).
[66] Their connection to Scott is discussed by Keith Sanger, 'A letter from the Rev. Patrick MacDonald to Mrs Maclean Clephane', *Scottish Gaelic Studies* 26 (2010), pp. 1-12, at 2.
[67] Albeit prior to his acknowledgement of *Waverley's* authorship, while his private opinion of her work was also complex; see Perkins, *Women writers*, pp. 137-8.
[68] For example, '"Coronach of Sir Lachlan, Chief of MacLean", from the Gaelic by Sir Walter Scott'; J. P. MacLean, *A history of the Clan MacLean* (Cincinatti: Robert Clarke & Co., 1889), p. 420, after Walter Scott, *The Lady of the Lake: A poem* (Edinburgh: John Ballantyne and Co., 1810), p. 351. The Gaelic lament, which Margaret may have acquired from the local MacLeans' collections, was printed initially in the Eigg anthology, i.e. MacDhòmnuill, *Comh-chruinneachidh Orannaigh Gaidhealach*, pp. 85-9 ('Oran do Shir Lachluin Mac Ghilleoin triath Dhubhairt, le Eachunn bachdach Mac Gilleoin an t aos-dàna').
[69] National Library of Scotland [NLS], MS 3889, 'Letter from Lady Compton to Scott', 1818, p. 237 ('I am silly enough to be vexed that the Campbell of the songs has so cruelly mocked my fair [Allan] Moidart: It is altogether spoilt').
[70] The contents of this collection and the sisters' other manuscripts are described in detail by McAulay, 'Accomplished ladies', pp. 64-74.
[71] For Gaels' reaction to Johnson's tours and a useful summation of MacPherson's engagement with Gaelic tradition-bearers in the first wave of Ossianic controversy, see Ian Ross Simpson, 'Dr Johnson in the Gaeltacht, 1773', *Studies in Scottish Literature* 35.1 (2007), pp. 108-30.
[72] *Travels in England, Scotland, and the Hebrides* (London: James Ridgeway, 1799), p. 66. For St.-Fond and his many contemporaries, see Leask, *Stepping Westward*, esp. pp. 80-96.
[73] *Travels in England, Scotland, and the Hebrides*, p. 65.
[74] Recognition of Gaelic as a language belonging to the 'Celtic' family of Indo-European languages (alongside Irish, Manx, Welsh, Cornish, and Breton) was established definitively by Edward Lhuyd's *Archaeologia Britannica: An Account of the Languages, Histories and Customs of Great Britain* (1707). See John Lorne Campbell and Derick Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands, 1699-1700* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963), and Ian B. Stewart, 'The Mother Tongue: Historical study of the Celts and their language(s) in Eighteenth-Century Britain and Ireland', *Past and Present* 243 (2019), pp. 72-107, at 91-96.
[75] As poets and tradition-bearers, however, Gaelic women's literature is visible far sooner; see, for example, Colm Ó Baoill, '"Neither in nor Out": Scottish Gaelic Women Poets 1650–1750', in Sarah M. Dunnigan et al. (eds), *Woman and the Feminine in Medieval and Early Modern Scottish Writing* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), pp. 136–53, and Martin MacGregor, '"Surely one of the greatest poems ever made in Britain": The Lament for Griogair Ruadh

MacGregor of Glen Strae and its Historical background', in Edward J. Cowan and Douglas Gifford (eds), *The Polar Twins* (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1999), pp. 114–53.
[76] Reviewers of *Carmina Gadelica*, for example, situated its merits almost instinctively in terms of MacPherson's Ossian, e.g. 'nothing has appeared [since] in connection with the literature of the Highlands which can be in any sense compared with it'; *Caledonian Medical Journal*, January 1901, cited by Domhnall Uilleam Stiùbhart, 'Alexander Carmichael and Carmina Gadelica', in Stiùbhart (ed.), *Life and Legacy*, pp. 1-39, at 30.
[77] E.g. Macdonald, *Patrick Geddes*, pp. 81-2. Carmichael also contributed to Geddes's foundational journal *The Evergreen: A Northern Seasonal* (*id*., pp. 67-73).
[78] Stiùbhart, 'Alexander Carmichael', p. 30 ('*Carmina Gaelica* should be regarded as a collaborative enterprise').
[79] Scott, '"With heart and voice"', p. 167. Mary Frances MacBean (1837-1928), Carmichael's wife, to whom the collection was dedicated, contributed its distinctive initial letters; Macdonald, 'Visual dimension', p. 142.
[80] Sylvia Robertson and Anthony Dilworth (eds), *Tales from Highland Perthshire collected by Lady Evelyn Stewart Murray* (Edinburgh: Scottish Gaelic Texts Society, 2009). Murray was also a collector of the Perthshire dialect of Gaelic from its declining native speakers; see Jane Anderson, 'Murray, Lady Evelyn Stewart- (1868–1940), Gaelic folklorist and needlewoman', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* 23 <https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/40731> [accessed December 24 2021].
[81] Ronald Black (ed.), *The Gaelic Otherworld: John Gregorson Campbell's Superstitions of the Highlands of Scotland and Witchcraft and Second sight in the Highlands and Islands* (Edinburgh: Birlinn, 2008), p. 667.
[82] Alfred Nutt, 'Memoir of the late John Gregorson Campbell, Minister of Tiree', in John Gregorson Campbell (ed.), *Waifs and strays of Celtic tradition volume 5: Clan traditions and popular tales* (London: David Nutt, 1895), p. xvii.
[83] The Atholl family were prominent among Highland aristocracy who actively supported Gaelic, insisting that their children learn the language; this 'revivalist' practice may be observed in the latter half of the Nineteenth Century and exercised significant influence on membership of the language movement (discussed below). See Wilson McLeod, 'New speakers of Gaelic: A historical and policy perspective', in Marsaili MacLeod and Cassie Smith-Christmas (eds), *Gaelic in Contemporary Scotland: The Revitalisation of an Endangered Language* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2018), pp. 79-93, at 81. Stewart-Murray's sister Helen was an important, if reserved, member of An Comunn Gàidhealach; see Scott, '"With heart and voice"', e.g. pp. 36-7.
[84] Nutt, 'Memoir', p. xiii. For the markedly more problematic case of 'collector' Marjory Kennedy Fraser (1857-1930), see Virginia Blankenhorn, 'Songs of the Hebrides and the Critics', *Scottish Studies* 38 (2018), pp. 1-53, and Per Ahlander, *A life of song: The autobiography of Marjory Kennedy-Fraser* (Port of Ness: The Islands Book Trust, 2011).
[85] *MacDonald Bards from medieval times* (Edinburgh: Norman MacLeod, 1900), p. 92; John MacKenzie (ed.), *Sar Obair nam Bard Gaelach: The Beauties of Gaelic Poetry and Lives of the Highland bards* (Glasgow: MacGregor, Polson, & Co., 1841), p. 58.
[86] Mathis, 'Gaelic women's poetry', p. 202, and Ó Baoill, '"Neither in nor Out"', pp. 138-41.
[87] MacDonald, *MacDonald bards*, pp. 92-3.
[88] 'Communications and replies: The death of Keppoch', *Scottish Historical Review* 4, no. 15 (April 1907), pp. 355-58, at 355. Alasdair was the nephew of Sìleas na Ceapaich, son of her brother Coll, 16th of Keppoch (d. c. 1729).
[89] *MacDonald bards*, p. 82.
[90] *MacDonald bards*, p. 82.
[91] Shared also by MacDonald, author of *In Defence of Macpherson's 'Ossian'* (Oban: s.n., 1906), in which, with some irony, he reiterates the conviction of Anne Grant and the MacLean Clephanes that 'no one who is ignorant of the Gaelic language can possibly determine whether the Gaelic [poetry] was MacPherson's own composition or not' (p. 3).
[92] *The Celtic Review* Vol. 8 (1911-12), p. 362.
[93] Norman H. MacDonald, *The Clan Ranald of Lochaber: A history of the MacDonalds or MacDonells of Keppoch* (Edinburgh: for the author, 1972), p. 52. After Culloden, the family's home was Keppoch House in Kilmonivaig, Inverness-shire; Josephine MacDonell, *An historical record of the branch of 'Clann Domhnuill' called the MacDonells of Keppoch and Gargavach* (Glasgow: The Celtic Press, 1931), e.g., p. 121. The dates of Josephine's collecting activity, however, imply continued visits to the Highlands thereafter (as above).
[94] '"With heart and voice"', p. 170. This tolerance contrasts, for Scott, to the 'unstable ground in Irish Gaelic Revival circles, where opinion on the "Irishness" of Anglo-Irish writing and its usefulness […] was fiercely divided'.
[95] Alice C. MacDonell, *Lays of the Heather* (London: Elliot Stock, 1896), p. 154. 'Gall' indicates a Lowlander unconnected to the Gàidhealtachd.
[96] *The Celtic Monthly* Vol. I, no. 3 (February 1893), p. 72. It is also celebrated by an article devoted to Alice's work in another periodical: 'Gaelic Poets: The Bardess of Clan Donald', *People's Journal*, 7 July 1906.
[97] Scott, '"With heart and voice"', pp. 122-23.
[98] *Orain nuadh Ghaeleach* (1811). For Niall MacLeòid, see Meg Bateman, 'Niall MacLeòid, Bard of Skye and Edinburgh', in Christopher MacLachlan and Ronald Renton (eds), *Gael and Lowlander in Scottish Literature: Cross-currents in Scottish Writing in the Nineteenth Century* (Glasgow: ASLS, 2015), pp. 172-89.
[99] As MacDonald observes, her formal education took place in English or Lowland Scottish convent schools; *MacDonald bards*, p. 83. For the presence of Gaelic in the Scottish education system after 1882, see Sìm Innes and Kate Louise Mathis, 'Gaelic Tradition and the Celtic Revival in Children's Literature in Scottish Gaelic and English', in

Sarah Dunnigan and Shu-Fang Lai (eds), *The Land of Story Books: Scottish Children's Literature in the Nineteenth Century* (Glasgow: Scottish Literature International, 2019), pp. 107-57, at 111-14.
[100] 'Deirdre: The highest type of Celtic womanhood [part ii]', *The Celtic Review* 9, no. 33 (August 1913), pp. 41-8, at 43 (emphasis added).
[101] Grant (ed.) *Memoir and correspondence*, p. 64.
[102] It is notable, in this regard, that Alice's mother Christina MacDonell (née McNab) had contributed examples of Gaelic-language Ossianic ballads to John Francis Campbell's collection *Leabhar na Feinne* (1872); see Colm Ó Baoill, *Màiri nighean Alasdair Ruaidh: Song-maker of Skye and Berneray* (Llandysul: Gwasg Gomer for the Scottish Gaelic Texts Society, 2014), p. 309.
[103] Most recently by Anja Gunderloch, 'Duncan Kennedy and his heroic ballads', in Sharon Arbuthnot and Geraldine Parsons (eds), *The Gaelic Finn tradition* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2012), pp. 179-94, and 'John Francis Campbell, William Robertson and the collection of fianaigheacht tales and ballads in nineteenth-century Scotland', in Sharon J. Arbuthnot, Síle Ní Mhurchú, and Geraldine Parsons (eds), *The Gaelic Finn tradition II* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2022), pp. 174-86.
[104] For Cú Chulainn, see most recently Amy Mulligan, 'Poetry, Sinew, and the Irish Performance of Lament: Keening a Hero's Body Back Together', *Philological Quarterly* 97.4 (2018), pp. 389-408; for Deirdre and the sons of Uisliu, see Kate L. Mathis, 'Mourning the Maic Uislenn: Blood, death and grief in Longes mac n-Uislenn and Oidheadh Chloinne hUisneach', *Scottish Gaelic Studies* 29 (2013), pp. 1-21, and 'Parallel wives: Deirdriu and Lúaine in Longes mac n-Uislenn and Tochmarc Lúaine ocus Aided Athairne', in Gregory Toner and Séamus Mac Mathúna (eds), *Ulidia 3* (Berlin: curach bhán, 2013), pp. 17-24.
[105] See Mathis, 'Outcome of Ossian'.
[106] 'Deirdre: The highest type of Celtic womanhood', *The Celtic Review* 8, no. 32 (May 1913), pp. 347-56 [part i]; *The Celtic Review* 9, no. 33 (August 1913), pp. 41-8 [part ii].
[107] The journal, under Carmichael's editorship, had previously included the work of pioneering women scholars in the field of medieval Gaelic literature, chiefly Eleanor Hull (1860-1935) and Winifred Faraday (1872-1948).
[108] Printed in *Fingal, an ancient poem in six books: together with several other poems, composed by Ossian the son of Fingal. Translated from the Galic [sic] language by James Macpherson* (London: T. Becket & P. A. De Hondt, 1762), pp. 155-72. *Dar-thula* is one of MacPherson's least faithful imitations of genuine Gaelic ballad; see Derick S. Thomson, *The Gaelic Sources of Macpherson's Ossian* (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1952), pp. 54-5, and Hector Maclean, *Ultonian hero ballads collected in the Highlands and Western Isles of Scotland* (Glasgow: Archibald Sinclair, 1892), pp. 34-57, 108-21.
[109] 'Sweet Dearshula, Darthula, the name they knew her by in Alba on account of her dark blue eyes'; 'Deirdre [part ii]', p. 41. In fact, it derives from an Old Irish verb *derdrethar*, one who 'resounds' or 'causes alarm'.
[110] Ibid., p. 47.
[111] Ibid., p. 48.
[112] Discussed by Innes and Mathis, 'Gaelic Tradition', pp. 126-31. For multiple examples of similar, inadvertent or deliberate obfuscation of medieval Gaelic literary characters by Revival-era writers, see Williams, *Ireland's immortals*.
[113] In print, Josephine is best represented by multiple attempts to correct 'official' clan histories of the Keppoch line that, in her view, disinherit her father and his heir, her eldest brother Donald (d. 1889), from the direct line of descent from 'Keppoch of Culloden'. See, for example, 'The Maidsear Mòr of Keppoch', *The Celtic Monthly* IX, no. 8 (May 1901), p. 156, and her posthumous book, *An historical record.*
[114] See, for example, Scott's discussion of noted Gaelic poet Màiri NicEalair (Mary MacKellar, 1836-1890); '"With heart and voice"', pp. 148-55.
[115] Sheila Kidd, 'Gaelic Periodicals in the Lowlands: Negotiating Change', in MacLachlan and Renton (eds), *Gael and Lowlander in Scottish literature*, pp. 143-58.
[116] The oldest, the Highland Society of Glasgow, formed in 1772, aiming to educate the children of wealthy Highlanders; see. Ronald Black, 'The Gaelic Academy: The Cultural Commitment of the Highland Society of Scotland', *Scottish Gaelic Studies* 14 (1986), pp. 1-38, and Liam A. Crouse, 'The establishment of Celtic societies', *History Scotland* (Sept.-Oct. 2013), pp. 24-31.
[117] Preface, *Transactions of the Gaelic Society of Glasgow*, Vol. I, 1887-1891 (1891).
[118] For discussion, see Wilson McLeod, *Gaelic in Scotland: Policies, movements, ideologies* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2021), pp. 59-65, and Scott, '"With heart and voice"',
[119] On the allure of 'Fiona Macleod's' 'Celtic fantasy', see Macdonald, *Patrick Geddes*, pp. 80-81.
[120] 'An Comunn – its membership', *An Deo-Greine* Vol. 7, no. 12 (Darna Mìos an Fhogharaidh, 1912), pp. 192-93, at 192. A descendant of Archibald Campbell, 2nd Earl of Argyll (d. 1513), a sense of family history and 'deep ancestral roots in Argyll' was 'a strong motivational ideal in [Mrs Campbell's] Gaelic activism'; Scott, '"With heart and voice"', p. 43.
[121] Chiefly Geddes's series *The Evergreen: A Northern Seasonal* (1895), contextualized by Shaw, *Fin-de-Siècle Scottish Revival*, e.g. pp. 1-2, 18-20, and discussed by Macdonald, *Patrick Geddes*, *passim*, esp. pp. 67-73. While Geddes's publication and his revivalism differed in fundamental ways, he was 'well aware of Gaelic as his father's native language', and several prominent Gaels, notably Alexander Carmichael, contributed to *The Evergreen* (*id.*, p. 80).
[122] See Calum Cameron White, 'The Highlander: The radical politics of John Murdoch', *Transactions of the Gaelic Society of Inverness* LXVIII (2015-17), pp. 129-71.

[123] John Mackay, 'Our Aims and Objects', *The Celtic Monthly: A Magazine for Highlanders,* Vol. 1, no. 1 (October 1892), p. 8.
[124] E[lizabeth] C[atherine] Carmichael, 'Introductory', *The Celtic Review* Vol. 1, no. 1 (July 1904), p. 1.
[125]Scott, '"With heart and voice"', p. 168, citing Carmichael's letter to Malcolm MacFarlane.
[126] Scott '"With heart and voice"', pp. 128-30, at 129. Carmichael had observed similar performances at events in Dublin that she was keen to imitate.
[127] John MacGregor, *Luinneagan Luaineach* (London: David Nutt, 1897), p. 9, cited in McLeod, *Gaelic in Scotland*, p. 59. Born in Lewis, MacGregor, a military surgeon and poet, was 'active in Gaelic circles in London, Edinburgh and Glasgow at the turn of the twentieth century' (*ibid.*); see further Wilson McLeod, '"Fanndaigeadh na Gàidhlig" aig Iain MacGriogair: Aisling molaidh don Ghàidhlig?', *Scottish Gaelic Studies* 24 (2008), pp. 419-40.
[128] *Gaelic in Scotland*, p. 59.
[129] Shaw, *Fin-de-Siècle Scottish Revival.*
[130] *Gaelic in Scotland*, p. 58.
[131] Malcolm MacPhàrlain, *An Deo-Ghréine* Vol. I, no. 4 (Jan 1906), p. 64 ('The Executive Council of An Comunn Gàidhealach honoured the Princess Louise by offering her the Presidentship of the Association. The Princess has accepted office. Some time ago the Comunn abolished all honorary offices, alleging that what was wanted was not figureheads, but workers. We presume the working president has now been found in the ranks of the alien: it seems there are none capable enough for the position or sufficiently deserving of honour in the native ranks'), vs. *An Deo-Ghréine* Vol. 2 (Oct. 1906-Sep. 1907), under the editorship of Rev. Malcolm MacLennan (e.g. p. 14, in which 'President: H.R.H. Princess Louise' heads the list of An Comunn's committee).
[132] K[atherine] W[hyte] G[rant], *Uilleam Tell* (Inverness-Oban: Northern Chronicle Office, 1893), discussed by Sìm Innes, 'Translated Drama in Gaelic in Scotland to c.1950', *International Journal of Scottish Theatre and Screen* 9 (2016), pp. 61-88, at 65-69.
[133] Innes and Mathis, 'Gaelic tradition', pp. 111-14.
[134] See Philip O' Leary, 'Unwise and Unlovable: Translation in the Early Years of the Gaelic Revival', *Proceedings of the Harvard Celtic Colloquium* 5 (1985), pp. 147-71.
[135] H. M[acDonald], 'Book Reviews: Aig Tigh na Beinne', *The Celtic Review* Vol. 7, no. 28 (1912), p. 377. For the use of 'race' in this way, see note 17, above.
[136] Grant, 'Influence of Scenery'.
[137] Thomson, 'Bogus Gaelic Literature'.
[138] Innes and Mathis, 'Gaelic Tradition', pp. 108-11, 115-16; see also Sìm Innes, 'Dùsgadh na Féinne (1908): Katherine Whyte-Grant's Scottish Gaelic kinderspiel', in Sharon J. Arbuthnot, Síle Ní Mhurchú, and Geraldine Parsons (eds), *The Gaelic Finn tradition II* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2022), pp. 197-210.
[139] NLS, 'Malcolm MacFarlane', Acc. 9763, Folio 43, 'Letter from K. W. Grant to M. MacFarlane, 29/01/1907'.
[140] Innes and Mathis, 'Gaelic Tradition', p. 120.
[141] Catrìona W. Grannd, 'Na Cunnartan a tha 'Bagradh na Gaidhlig', *An Deo-Ghréine* Vol. 1, no. 1 (Oct. 1905), pp. 10-12 [earran/part I]; Vol. 1, no. 2 (Nov. 1905), pp. 36-38 [earran II], and Vol. 1, no. 3 (Dec. 1905), pp. 45-47 [earran III]. Citation from part I, p. 10.
[142] Grannd, 'Na Cunnartan [earran I]', p. 10.
[143] Macdonald, *Patrick Geddes*, p. 80.
[144] Sheila MacDonald, 'The Gaelic Revival', *An Deo-Ghréine* Vol. 1, no. 5 (Feb. 1906), pp. 75-77, at 75.
[145] Ibid, p. 76. Similar arguments were made for the 'temporary' usefulness of English-language compendia of translations from medieval Gaelic, such as Augusta Gregory's *Cuchulain of Muirthemne* (1902); see Philip O'Leary, *The Prose Literature of the Gaelic Revival, 1881-1921: Ideology and Innovation* (Pennsylvania State University Press: Pennsylvania, 1994), pp. 224-27.
[146] Discussed by Innes and Mathis, 'Gaelic Tradition', pp. 111-14.
[147] Grannd, 'Na Cunnartan [earran I]', p. 11.
[148] E[lizabeth] C[atherine] Carmichael, 'Some Things Women Can Do', *An Deo-Ghréine* Vol. 1, no. 1 (Oct 1905), pp. 8-10.
[149] NLS, 'Malcolm MacFarlane', Acc. 9763, Folio 38, 'Letter from E. C. Carmichael to Malcolm MacFarlane, 06/06/1905'.
[150] Scott '"With heart and voice"', p. 208.
[151] Williams, *Ireland's immortals*.
[152] Mrs. Burnley Campbell, 'The Difficulties I Encountered in Learning Gaelic', *An Deo-Ghréine* Vol. 1, no. 3 (Dec, 1905), pp. 43-45, at 45. A more practical difficulty addressed by Mrs Campbell's essay was common to most learners, whatever the source of their interest in Gaelic: gaining sufficient exposure to the spoken language to achieve even partial fluency. See McLeod, 'New speakers', pp. 81-3.
[153] Grannd, 'Na Cunnartan [earran III]', p. 46.