



# Too good to be true : when overwhelming evidence fails to convince

Submitted by François CHAPEA... on Thu, 03/24/2016 - 16:01

Titre Too good to be true : when overwhelming evidence fails to convince

Type de publication Article de revue

Auteur Gunn, Lachlan [1], Chapeau-Blondeau, François [2], McDonnell, Mark [3], Davis, Bruce [4], Allison, Andrew [5], Abbott, Derek [6]

Pays Royaume-Uni

Editeur Royal Society

Ville Londres

Type Article scientifique dans une revue à comité de lecture

Année 2016

Langue Anglais

Date 23 Mars 2016

Numéro 2187

Pagination 1-15

Volume 472

Section 20150748

Titre de la revue Proceedings of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences

ISSN 1364-5021

Mots-clés Bayesian statistics [7], Cryptography [8], Systems theory [9]

Is it possible for a large sequence of measurements or observations, which support a hypothesis, to counterintuitively decrease our confidence? Can unanimous support be too good to be true? The assumption of independence is often made in good faith; however, rarely is consideration given to whether a systemic failure has occurred. Taking this into account can cause certainty in a hypothesis to decrease as the evidence for it becomes apparently stronger. We perform a probabilistic Bayesian analysis of this effect with examples based on (i) archaeological evidence, (ii) weighing of legal evidence and (iii) cryptographic primality testing. In this paper, we investigate the effects of small error rates in a set of measurements or observations. We find that even with very low systemic failure rates, high confidence is surprisingly difficult to achieve; in particular, we find that certain analyses of cryptographically important numerical tests are highly optimistic, underestimating their false-negative rate by as much as a factor of  $2^{80}$ .

URL de la notice <http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications/ua14548> [10]

DOI 10.1098/rspa.2015.0748 [11]

Lien vers le document <http://rspa.royalsocietypublishing.org/content/472/2187/20150748.article...> [12]

## **Liens**

- [1] [http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f\[author\]=24564](http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f[author]=24564)
- [2] <http://okina.univ-angers.fr/f.chapeau/publications>
- [3] [http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f\[author\]=24565](http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f[author]=24565)
- [4] [http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f\[author\]=24566](http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f[author]=24566)
- [5] [http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f\[author\]=24567](http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f[author]=24567)
- [6] [http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f\[author\]=1973](http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f[author]=1973)
- [7] [http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f\[keyword\]=20817](http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f[keyword]=20817)
- [8] [http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f\[keyword\]=20819](http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f[keyword]=20819)
- [9] [http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f\[keyword\]=20818](http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications?f[keyword]=20818)
- [10] <http://okina.univ-angers.fr/publications/ua14548>
- [11] <http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rspa.2015.0748>
- [12] <http://rspa.royalsocietypublishing.org/content/472/2187/20150748.article-info>

Publié sur *Okina* (<http://okina.univ-angers.fr>)