

# **VU Research Portal**

## Global Health security, multi-stakeholder collaboration, and pathogen sharing

dos Santos Ribeiro, Carolina

2022

document version Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Link to publication in VU Research Portal

citation for published version (APA) dos Santos Ribeiro, C. (2022). Global Health security, multi-stakeholder collaboration, and pathogen sharing: Building a New Microbial Commons. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

### Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address: vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

1. I	NTRO	DUCTION	13
1	.1	The attested importance of managing infectious diseases	15
1	.2	Setting the scene: Global Health security as a collaborative approach	18
1	.3	Sharing: the sine qua non of collaboration	18
1	.4	Collaboration and sharing: current state and open challenges	29
1	.5	Research Objective	33
2. 1	THEORI	ETICAL FRAMEWORK	35
2	2.1	Institutional Analysis and Development: a framework for analysing multi-stakeholder collaboration in the "commons"	37
2	2.2	Structured transparency in information flow	45
2	2.3	Research questions	47
2	2.4	In conclusion	47
3. I	RESEAR	CH DESIGN & METHODOLOGY	51
3	8.1	Methodology: an in-depth study of bounded systems	53
3	8.2	Research methods: a mixed approach	55
3	8.3	Validity	59
3	8.4	Thesis outline	63
		EWORK FOR MEASURING TIMELINESS IN THE OUTBREAK RESPONSE SONS LEARNED FROM THE MERS-COV EPIDEMIC	65
A	bstract	:	66
4	l.1	Introduction	67
4	.2	Methods	68
4	1.3	Results	70
4	1.4	Conclusion and Discussion	77
4	1.5	Acknowledgments	81
		TS TO TIMELY SHARING OF PATHOGEN SEQUENCE DATA: THE PROTOCOL MAY IMPOSE COSTS AND DELAYS	83
5	5.1	Introduction	84
5	5.2	Results	86
5	5.3	Discussion and conclusion	90
5	5.4	Acknowledgments	93

	NAGOYA PROTOCOL ON ACCESS TO GENETIC RESOURCES AND BENEFIT RING: BEST PRACTICES FOR USERS OF LACTIC ACID BACTERIA	95
Abstr	act	96
6.1	Introduction	97
6.2	Methods	99
6.3	Results	99
6.4	Discussion	103
6.5	Recommendations	105
6.6	Conclusion	106
DISE	/ OWNERSHIP RIGHTS OVER MICROORGANISMS AFFECT INFECTIOUS ASE CONTROL AND INNOVATION: A ROOT-CAUSE ANALYSIS OF RIERS TO DATA SHARING AS EXPERIENCED BY KEY OPINION LEADERS	109
Abstr	act	110
7.1	Introduction	111
7.2	Materials and methods	114
7.3	Results	117
7.4	Discussion	125
7.5	Conclusion	129
7.6	Acknowledgments	129
	RCOMING CHALLENGES FOR DESIGNING AND IMPLEMENTING THE HEALTH APPROACH: A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE	131
Abstr	act	132
8.1	Introduction	133
8.2	Materials and methods	134
8.3	Results	136
8.4	Discussion	151
8.5	Conclusion	155
8.6	Acknowledgements	155
	ARDS IMPROVED PROCESS EFFICIENCY IN VACCINE INNOVATION: THE CINE INNOVATION CYCLE AS A VALIDATED, CONCEPTUAL STAGE-GATE DEL	157
Abstr	act	158
9.1	Introduction	159
9.2	Methodology	161

9.5     Conclusion     18       9.6     Acknowledgements     18       10. SHARING PATHOGEN SEQUENCE DATA FOR GLOBAL SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH UNDER THE NAGOYA PROTOCOL TO THE CONVENTION ON BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY     18       Abstract     18       10.1     Tensions concerning the coverage of genetic sequence data under the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)     18       10.2     The disruptive complexity of Genetic Sequence Data (GSD)     18       10.3     Codifying multilateral compliance measures for upstream GSD     19       10.4     Other factors bearing on collaborative research under the CBD     19       10.5     Concluding observations     20       11. ACCESS AND BENEFIT-SHARING BY THE EUROPEAN VIRUS ARCHIVE IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19     20       Abstract     20       11.1     Introduction     20       11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12.6     BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&	9.3	Results	166
9.6     Acknowledgements     16       10. SHARING PATHOGEN SEQUENCE DATA FOR GLOBAL SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH UNDER THE NAGOYA PROTOCOL TO THE CONVENTION ON BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY     18       Abstract     18       10.1     Tensions concerning the coverage of genetic sequence data under the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)     18       10.2     The disruptive complexity of Genetic Sequence Data (GSD)     18       10.3     Codifying multilateral compliance measures for upstream GSD     19       10.4     Other factors bearing on collaborative research under the CBD     19       10.5     Concluding observations     20       11. ACCESS AND BENEFIT-SHARING BY THE EUROPEAN VIRUS ARCHIVE IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19     20       Abstract     20       11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12.6     BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     23       12.1     Introduction     23	9.4	Discussion	179
10. SHARING PATHOGEN SEQUENCE DATA FOR GLOBAL SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH UNDER THE NAGOYA PROTOCOL TO THE CONVENTION ON BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY     18       Abstract     18       10.1     Tensions concerning the coverage of genetic sequence data under the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)     18       10.2     The disruptive complexity of Genetic Sequence Data (GSD)     18       10.3     Codifying multilateral compliance measures for upstream GSD     19       10.4     Other factors bearing on collaborative research under the CBD     19       10.5     Concluding observations     20       11. ACCESS AND BENEFIT-SHARING BY THE EUROPEAN VIRUS ARCHIVE IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19     20       Abstract     20       11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12.6     BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     23       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barrier	9.5	Conclusion	182
UNDER THE NAGOYA PROTOCOL TO THE CONVENTION ON BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY     18       Abstract     18       10.1     Tensions concerning the coverage of genetic sequence data under the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)     18       10.2     The disruptive complexity of Genetic Sequence Data (GSD)     18       10.3     Codifying multilateral compliance measures for upstream GSD     19       10.4     Other factors bearing on collaborative research under the CBD     19       10.5     Concluding observations     20       11. ACCESS AND BENEFIT-SHARING BY THE EUROPEAN VIRUS ARCHIVE IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19     20       Abstract     20       11.1     Introduction     20       11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers     23       12.3     Discussion and conclusion     23	9.6	Acknowledgements	182
10.1     Tensions concerning the coverage of genetic sequence data under the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)     18       10.2     The disruptive complexity of Genetic Sequence Data (GSD)     18       10.3     Codifying multilateral compliance measures for upstream GSD     19       10.4     Other factors bearing on collaborative research under the CBD     19       10.5     Concluding observations     20       11. ACCESS AND BENEFIT-SHARING BY THE EUROPEAN VIRUS ARCHIVE IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19     20       Abstract     20       11.1     Introduction     20       11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12.     BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     22       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers     23       12.3     Discussion and conclusion     23	UND	ER THE NAGOYA PROTOCOL TO THE CONVENTION ON BIOLOGICAL	185
Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)     1       10.2     The disruptive complexity of Genetic Sequence Data (GSD)     18       10.3     Codifying multilateral compliance measures for upstream GSD     19       10.4     Other factors bearing on collaborative research under the CBD     19       10.5     Concluding observations     20       11. ACCESS AND BENEFIT-SHARING BY THE EUROPEAN VIRUS ARCHIVE IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19     20       Abstract     20       11.1     Introduction     20       11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12.     BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     22       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers     23       12.3     Discussion and conclusion     23	Abstra	ict	186
10.3     Codifying multilateral compliance measures for upstream GSD     19       10.4     Other factors bearing on collaborative research under the CBD     19       10.5     Concluding observations     20       11. ACCESS AND BENEFIT-SHARING BY THE EUROPEAN VIRUS ARCHIVE IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19     20       Abstract     20       11.1     Introduction     20       11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12.     BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     22       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers     23       12.3     Discussion and conclusion     23	10.1		187
10.4     Other factors bearing on collaborative research under the CBD     19       10.5     Concluding observations     20       11. ACCESS AND BENEFIT-SHARING BY THE EUROPEAN VIRUS ARCHIVE IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19     20       Abstract     20       11.1     Introduction     20       11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12. BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     22       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers     23       12.3     Discussion and conclusion     23	10.2	The disruptive complexity of Genetic Sequence Data (GSD)	189
10.5Concluding observations2011. ACCESS AND BENEFIT-SHARING BY THE EUROPEAN VIRUS ARCHIVE IN RESPONSE TO COVID-1920Abstract2011.1Introduction2011.2The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA2111.3A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA2111.4EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing2211.5Acknowledgements2212.BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS2212.1Introduction2212.2Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers2312.3Discussion and conclusion23	10.3	Codifying multilateral compliance measures for upstream GSD	193
11. ACCESS AND BENEFIT-SHARING BY THE EUROPEAN VIRUS ARCHIVE IN RESPONSE TO COVID-19     20       Abstract     20       11.1     Introduction     20       11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12.     BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     22       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers     23       12.3     Discussion and conclusion     23	10.4	Other factors bearing on collaborative research under the CBD	199
RESPONSE TO COVID-19     20       Abstract     20       11.1     Introduction     20       11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12. BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     22       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers     23       12.3     Discussion and conclusion     23	10.5	Concluding observations	203
11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12. BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     22       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers     23       12.3     Discussion and conclusion     23			
11.2     The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA     21       11.3     A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA     21       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12. BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     22       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers     23       12.3     Discussion and conclusion     23	Abstra	int .	205
pathogen genetic resources based on EVA       11.4     EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing     22       11.5     Acknowledgements     22       12. BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS     22       12.1     Introduction     22       12.2     Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers     23       12.3     Discussion and conclusion     23			
benefit-sharing 22 11.5 Acknowledgements 22 12. BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: 22 TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS 22 12.1 Introduction 22 12.2 Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers 23 12.3 Discussion and conclusion 23	11.1	Introduction The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing	209
12. BLOCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS2212.1Introduction2212.2Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers2312.3Discussion and conclusion23	11.1 11.2	Introduction The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for	209 211
TECHNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS12.1Introduction2212.2Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers2312.3Discussion and conclusion23	11.1 11.2 11.3	Introduction The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and	209 217 218
12.2Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers2312.3Discussion and conclusion23	11.1 11.2 11.3 11.4	Introduction The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing	209 217 218 220
12.3 Discussion and conclusion 23	11.1 11.2 11.3 11.4 11.5 <b>12. BLC</b>	Introduction The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing Acknowledgements <b>DCKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&amp;D:</b>	209 211 218 220 221
	11.1 11.2 11.3 11.4 11.5 <b>12. BLC</b> TEC	Introduction The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing Acknowledgements CKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: HNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS	209 211 218 220 221 221
12.4 Acknowledgments 23	11.1 11.2 11.3 11.4 11.5 <b>12. BLC</b> 12.1	Introduction The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing Acknowledgements CKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: HNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS Introduction	208 209 211 218 220 221 220 221 225 226 230
	11.1 11.2 11.3 11.4 11.5 <b>12. BLC</b> 12.1 12.2	Introduction The COVID-19 pandemic case study—access and benefit-sharing practices within EVA A global multilateral access and benefit-sharing framework for pathogen genetic resources based on EVA EVA—a biobanking infrastructure committed to pathogen access and benefit-sharing Acknowledgements CKCHAIN-FACILITATED SHARING TO ADVANCE OUTBREAK R&D: HNOLOGY MAY HELP OVERCOME NON-TECHNOLOGICAL BARRIERS Introduction Results: Blockchain to overcome barriers	209 211 218 220 221 221 225

	BREAK-RELATED DATA SHARING AND COLLABORATION: CHALLENGES	239			
Abstra	ct	240			
13.1	Introduction	241			
13.2	Data sharing in a time of transition	242			
13.3	Practical tools to foster collaboration and enhance sharing	243			
13.4	Developing long-term policy and legal strategies	244			
13.5	Promoting outbreak-related data sharing	246			
13.6	Discussion	246			
14. DISC	14. DISCUSSION & CONCLUSION				
14.1	Understanding Context: How do contextual factors influence collaboration and sharing for Global Health security?	251			
14.2	Understanding barriers: How do dilemmas in actors' interactions result in barriers for collaboration and sharing to support Global Health security?	256			
14.3	Understanding solutions: How can strategies be applied to enhance collaboration and sharing to support Global Health security?	263			
14.4	Theoretical implications	271			
14.5	Validity	276			
14.6	Conclusion	277			
15. LIST	15. LIST OF SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIALS				
16. REFE	RENCES	285			
17. SUMMARY 18. ABOUT THE AUTHOR					
					19. LIST
20. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS					