The Influence of Duality and Poe's Notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' on the Genesis of Detective Fiction in the Nineteenth-Century

Stephanie Craighill

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of

Edinburgh Napier University, for the award of Master of Arts by Research

(MARes)

September 2010

EDINBURGH NAPIER UNIVERSITY

<u>Acknowledgements</u>

Although this thesis has been an individual piece of work a number of people have contributed to the final effort in their own special way. I must express my appreciation to my supervisors Professor Linda Dryden and Dr Anne Schwan, who have guided and reassured me through every stage of my research. My deepest gratitude goes to my 'Bi-Part Soul' support team – Robert, Mum, Dad, Rebecca and Bonnie for their 'creative and resolvent' encouragement and their unfailing belief in me.

Abstract

This thesis examines the meaning, origin and influence of Edgar Allan Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul', and the associated theme of duality, in selected texts of nineteenth-century detective fiction. Poe's detective opus, 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841), 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842) and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844), features the eccentric and complex Monsieur C. Auguste Dupin and establishes Poe as a significant pioneer in the cultural genesis of the detective genre. Poe's idea of a 'double' detective with a 'Bi-Part Soul', who is both 'creative and resolvent' but also exhibits a 'diseased intelligence', provides a compelling psychological 'blueprint' for subsequent fictional detectives.

The meaning of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and how it relates to Poe's divergent philosophical beliefs of Transcendental Idealism and Materialism are evaluated before establishing a strong connection between the 'Bi-Part Soul' and a more general notion of duality, manifested in the literary motifs of doubling, the divided self and the *doppelgänger*. This is followed by a discussion of the origins of the 'Bi-Part Soul'. The thesis argues that its derivation can be found in Aristotle's (384 – 322 BC) bipartite psychology which reflects the same split between the rational and irrational human virtues. The explication of the tropes which evolve from 'The Bi-Part Soul' are explored in a Case Study focusing on 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841).

The presence and influence of 'The Bi-Part Soul' and duality in British nineteenth-century fiction, which acts as a prologue to the conception of the detective genre, are examined in the context of the Newgate novel and Sensation fiction (1830 – 1868), Charles Dickens' *Bleak House* (1853), Wilkie Collins' *The Moonstone* (1868) and Robert Louis Stevenson's *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* (1886). Dupin's 'Bi-

Part' psychological mould is traced throughout the fictional detectives in these texts and culminates in an analysis of Arthur Conan Doyle's *fin-de-siècle* Sherlock Holmes. This dissertation suggests that Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' established an enduring and influential model for subsequent writers of detective fiction and continues to shape the culture of the genre to this day.

Table of Contents

Introduction

The author, poet and critic Edgar Allan Poe (1809 -1849) is widely acknowledged as a significant progenitor of the detective fiction genre. Poe's relatively limited opus of detective fiction, confined to just three short tales, featuring his detective, Monsieur C. Auguste Dupin and including 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841), 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842) and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) 'influenced the later course of detective fiction' and established not only plot conventions but, also, narrative themes which remain evident in the genre today (Rzepka, 2005: 74). The pre-eminence of Poe's work is best summarised by Howard Haycraft, who was one of the first critics to reclaim Poe and argues that, 'These three early attempts, totalling only a few thousand words, established once and for all the mould and pattern for thousands upon thousands of works of police fiction which have followed' (1941).

Poe, in his trilogy of 'ratiocination',[1] constructed an enduring formula for the detective genre. Using the detective story and his protagonist as a vehicle for social commentary and philosophical debate, Poe introduced the 'old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul' to describe the dual psyche of his 'creative and resolvent', 'double' detective: one half rational, reasoned and scientific and the other half irrational, creative and poetic ('Murders': 146). Poe's 'poet-mathematician', Dupin, created a lasting schismatic psychological blueprint for subsequent fictional detectives whose mind and methods relied upon the creative use of reason ('Purloined': 293). The profound influence of Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' on the emerging genre of detective fiction in the nineteenth century is not reflected in the level of academic attention it has received.

---

[1] When writing to a correspondent in 1846 Poe refers to the narratives in his detective trilogy as 'tales of ratiocination'. This term was used by St. Thomas Aquinas to describe an 'inferential process' which enables 'the knowledge of intelligible truth by advancing from one thing to another' and expertly defines the deductive methods of Poe's Dupin (Honderich, 2005: 782).

The exact meaning, origin and impact of Poe's concept have not been dealt with in a sustained fashion but this study will offer a comprehensive and focused examination of Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul'.

At this point, it is important to acknowledge that although this study endorses Poe's involvement in establishing a distinct detective genre it, also, recognises the significance of counter-arguments which have been raised by contemporary critics such as Maurizio Ascari, Charles Rzepka and Heather Worthington. Chapter 1 will review this critical perspective which challenges the author-centric view of Poe's role as the pioneer of the detective genre, asserting a more complex cultural process which draws on elements from literary predecessors, such as the Gothic novel. Because I regard every literary tradition as an organic process I agree, in part, with this assertion but with the added stipulation that this does not negate Poe's role as a significant influence on the cultural genesis of the detective genre. This point of view will be developed in Chapter 4.

Chapter 1 introduces Poe, the man, and his contribution to detective fiction, both in terms of practical plot dynamics and the philosophical framework which he established. This opening Chapter evaluates divergent theories proposed by John G. Cawelti, George N. Dove, Jerold J. Abrams and Haycraft assessing the format and themes inherent in the classical detective formula which they attribute to Poe. This Chapter will, also, explore the meaning of Poe's discordant philosophical beliefs of Materialism typically associated with Karl Marx (1818 – 1883) and Friedrich Engels (1820 – 1895) and Transcendental Idealism, established by Immanuel Kant (1724-1804), which place divergent emphasis on the importance of matter and spirit. Whilst Materialism prescribes that knowledge is objective, physical, logical and independent of experience,

Idealism posits that knowledge is based on experience, subjective and spiritual. It is revealed that in Dupin's creative and logical 'Bi-Part Soul', Poe was able to achieve a resolution between these opposing philosophical schools of thought.

This initial Chapter provides a context for Chapter 2 which represents a detailed enquiry into the meaning and origin of Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul'. It reviews the occasions Poe explicitly cites the term in his oeuvre but will focus on the most well-known and significant reference which features in the first tale in his detective trilogy, 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841), when the narrator comments:

> Observing him in these moods, I often dwelt meditatively upon the old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul, and amused myself with the fancy of *a double* Dupin – the creative and resolvent. Let it not be supposed, from what I have said, that I am detailing any mystery, or penning any romance. What I have described in the Frenchman, was merely the result of an excited or perhaps diseased intelligence ('Murders': 146).

Chapter 2 engages expansively with the full implications of the terms 'double', 'creative and resolvent' and 'diseased intelligence'. The relationship between Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and the more general concept of the 'double' or duality, as asserted by Leroy Panek, is established and consolidated. Karl Miller's definition of duality is made use of in this Chapter and themes relating to the double are defined and examined. These include the divided self both good and bad and public and private, the rhetorical device of doubling which uses repetition and reversal of formal plot techniques and characters to achieve dramatic balance and unity of effect, and the motif of the *doppelgänger*, or evil twin, coined by Jean Paul Richter. In this study, these themes

receive considerable attention and it will be demonstrated how the 'Bi-Part Soul' and the related notion of duality are manifested throughout Poe's detective trilogy and, conversely, how Poe's work helped to shape a preoccupation with 'the double' in subsequent detective fiction.

Chapter 2, also, considers the enigma of the origin of Poe's 'old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul' which has been the focus of some debate over the last century ('Murders': 146). Scholars have proposed a number of theories to explain the genesis of this notion, yet opinion remains uncertain, prompting twenty-first century academics such as George Stade and Stuart & Susan Levine to acknowledge that 'No one seems to be able to explain exactly what Poe means by 'the old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul'' (Levine & Levine, 2000: 130; Stade, 2007: 94). In this Chapter I argue that Poe's concept derives from Aristotle's (384 – 322 BC) ancient philosophy of the bipartite psychology. My approach builds on the previous work of critics, such as Danforth Ross, and the crime writer, Dorothy L. Sayers, who have already established a general connection between Poe's work and Aristotelian theory but who have not commented on Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and its parallels with Aristotle's bipartite psychology.

Poe's critical essays and tales reveal that he directly references Aristotle on a number of occasions and examines the Greek philosopher's ideas throughout his canon. Specifically, Poe's critical essay on the theory of artistic composition, 'The Poetic Principle' (1850), replicates the notions explored by Aristotle in his treatise which assesses the structure and effect of an art form, *Poetics* (350 BC). Chapter 2 elaborates on Sayers' argument that the influence of Aristotle's *Poetics* extends beyond merely its connection with Poe's 'The Poetic Principle' and that it establishes an inherent framework of principles which can be applied to Poe's detective fiction but, also, to the

entire detective fiction genre. This contention is illustrated by examining the imperatives shared by Aristotle's *Poetics* and Poe in the detective narrative: the technique of red herrings or false inferences, a logical and contained plot structure and the unity of effect.

Chapter 2 will culminate in my argument that when Poe refers to the 'old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul' in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) he is citing Aristotle's bipartite psychology. At the core of Aristotle's ethical theory is the assertion that the soul can be divided into two parts, the rational and the irrational, which he refers to as the bipartite psychology. This bipartic division is reflected in Poe's 'Bi-Part' detective Dupin, 'the creative and resolvent', 'poet mathematician' whose method of detection relies equally on the facets of the imagination and reason ('Purloined': 293). This study will show that Poe's detective personifies the virtues associated with the rational and irrational components of Aristotle's bipartite psychology and, consequently, Dupin is the embodiment of this theory.

What follows, in Chapter 3, is a detailed Case Study of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) and an overview of 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842) and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844), which reveals how the 'Bi-Part Soul' and duality are profoundly present throughout Poe's detective trilogy. Pertinent questions raised by Howard Haycraft and Joseph Wood Krutch which speculate on what prompted Poe's move into a new mode of detective writing are examined. Recurrent and pervading themes such as the art of analysis and deduction, the metaphor of game playing, the 'Bi-Part Soul, the trope of duality and the related motifs of the *doppelgänger*, the divided self and doubling are analysed.

This Chapter engages in a thorough psychological examination of Dupin, his 'Bi-Part Soul' and his complex relationships with the core characters in Poe's detective trilogy: the narrator, the victims and the criminals. Evidence is presented which suggests the detective represents a symbolic double for each of these characters, as they share numerous common attributes. The effect and implications of Poe's systematic use of doubling are discussed. Through doubling Poe is able to achieve his, and likewise Aristotle's, imperative of the unity of effect, created in the aesthetic design which is accomplished by the dramatic balance of opposing formal plot elements. The repercussions of Poe's use of doubling, predominantly, the moral ambiguities associated with his mirroring the detective's mind with that of the criminal will be explored. This analysis will touch on the Poststructuralist debate which focused on Poe's third tale in his trilogy, 'The Purloined Letter' (1844). John T. Irwin's Chapter, 'Lacan, Derrida, and Johnson on 'The Purloined Letter'' (1996) is used as a framework for discussion on the varying structural stances taken by Jacques Lacan, Jacques Derrida and Barbara Johnson.

Chapter 4 presents an overview of the literary and socio-economic events in nineteenth-century Britain, and to a lesser extent continental Europe, which led to the conception of a distinct genre of detective fiction firmly established by Arthur Conan Doyle in the exploits of his master sleuth Sherlock Holmes. Ostensibly, this penultimate Chapter bridges the gap between Poe's Dupin trilogy, conceived in the 1840s, and the next sustained use of a detective role in Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes. The consistent presence of duality and the paradigms associated with Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' will be examined using a range of texts, such as Charles Dickens' *Bleak House* (1853), Wilkie Collins' *The Moonstone* (1868) and Robert Louis Stevenson's *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* (1886).

Chapter 4, firstly, reviews the history of policing in Europe and the dual role of prominent police figures at the time such as the French Eugène François Vidocq, who started out life as a criminal before, ultimately, leading the Sûreté Nationale and the British 'thief takers' who were both criminals and agents of the law. Chapter 1 touched upon alternate theories of the genesis of the detective narrative, but Chapter 4 expands on arguments made by Maurizo Ascari, Charles Rzepka and Heather Worthington who advocate the cultural significance of a number of literary sources in the conception of the genre, such as Gothic texts, biographical accounts of the real-life duality of policing individuals such as Vidoq in his '*Memoirs* (1829) and Daniel Defoe's description of the life of the eponymous 'thief taker' in his *The True and Genuine Account of the Life and Actions of the Late Jonathan Wild* (1725), as well as, 'Blackwood's *Tales of Terror*', the 'penny dreadful' and the Newgate novels and Sensation fiction of the eighteen-thirties through to the eighteen-sixties.

The remainder of Chapter 4 focuses on the two sub-genres, the Newgate novel and Sensation fiction, which respectively represent a means to articulate social anxieties associated with the extreme changes brought about as a consequence of the Industrial Revolution. The attributes relating to each sub-genre and how they differ are illustrated by a brief discussion of two key texts: Charles Dickens' *Bleak House* (1853) and Wilkie Collins' *The Moonstone* (1868). These novels are forerunners of the detective genre and each feature a detective figure, Dickens' Mr Bucket and Collins' Sergeant Cuff, who resemble their literary precursor Poe's Dupin. Evidence suggests that Dickens and Collins were directly influenced by Poe and this Chapter demonstrates how the notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and the trope of duality were ever-present in the literature which spanned the decades between Poe's Dupin trilogy and Conan Doyle's *fin-de-siècle*

Sherlock Holmes. The last section of this Chapter comments upon the significance of Robert Louis Stevenson's Gothic novella, *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* (1886), which some critics have referred to as an embryonic detective tale that firmly establishes the concept of human bifurcation in nineteenth-century British literature. The contribution of these three texts to the emerging genre of detective fiction could have been examined extensively had the scope of this study permitted it.

The final Chapter, Chapter 5, consolidates the themes explored throughout this thesis. It analyses how Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and duality culminate in Arthur Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes oeuvre. Ultimately, Conan Doyle's indebtedness to Poe is revealed in the resurrection of his protagonist in Sherlock Holmes, who is created in Dupin's 'Bi-Part' mould. The likeness between the 'creative and resolvent' mind and methods of both analytical fictive detectives will be explored using textual evidence from each opus ('Murders': 146). It will be shown how the similarities extend beyond the pervading influence of Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' in Conan Doyle's detective fiction. The Holmes canon displays an identical connectedness between the psychology of the detective and the criminal which was so apparent in the Dupin tales; Holmes mirrors his criminal adversary, Professor Moriarty. Thus, this Chapter continues the prominent theme of doubling in the embryonic detective narrative and posits that the Holmes stories represent the symbolic double of Poe's Dupin trilogy. This idea is explored firstly in a general context and then exemplified by the dominance of duality and the 'Bi-Part Soul' in the first three Holmes novellas published before the turn of the century: *A Study in Scarlet* (1887), *The Sign of Four* (1890) and *The Hound of the Baskervilles* (1902).

This study presents a comprehensive evaluation of the meaning, origin, presence and influence of Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and the associated theme of duality in nineteenth-century literature. It focuses on the fiction which acts as a prologue to the conception of a distinct genre of detective fiction and demonstrates how ideas relating to the 'Bi-Part Soul' are persistently replicated and explored throughout this literary period, climaxing in Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes. The Holmes narratives reveal the significant authority of Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and this concept, therefore, plays an instrumental role in defining the genre. The anomalies associated with Poe's 'double' Dupin who possesses a 'Bi-Part Soul' and a 'diseased intelligence', have shaped a blueprint for subsequent multifaceted fictional detectives ('Murders': 146). Dupin's 'Bi-Part Soul' could convincingly be traced throughout the dual psychologies of the detective protagonists who have followed Holmes and through to the present day. From the maladjusted hardboiled Noir detectives of the nineteen-twenties and thirties such as Dashiell Hammett's Sam Spade and Raymond Chandler's Philip Marlowe, and through to the contemporary complex anti-heroes of modern fiction, including Henning Mankell's Kurt Wallander and Ian Rankin's John Rebus, Dupin has created a compelling psychosomatic template for complex protagonists throughout detective fiction.

Chapter 1

Edgar Allan Poe: A Pioneer of Detective Fiction

The life of the American author, poet, editor and literary critic, Edgar Allan Poe (1809 - 1849), has developed into a complex legend which depicts a 'disturbed and tormented man, like so many of his characters, often driven to the perilous brink of madness' (Galloway, 2003: xxxii). Poe began life in Boston, born to theatre people but was orphaned only two years later (Rzepka, 2005: 73). The tragedy that blighted his childhood years continued throughout Poe's life which was characterised by a series of professional obstacles, peer criticism and personal tragedies - namely the death of his young bride Virginia Clem in 1847 – which, reputedly, resulted in periods of alcohol and drug abuse, hard gambling, considerable debt and episodes of insanity (Galloway, 2003: xliv). Despite the precarious nature of Poe's private and professional life, today, the influence of his work on the literary world remains undisputed.

Poe's career began in 1836 as the editor of *The Southern Literary Messenger* of Richmond and he went on to preside over and contribute towards *Burton's Gentleman's Magazine* (1839–1840), *Graham's Magazine* (1841–1842) and *Evening Mirror* (1844). Throughout his professional life Poe wrote and published macabre short tales and poetry which were anthologised in *Tales of the Grotesque and Arabesque* (1840) and *The Raven and Other Poems* (1845). He, also, wrote numerous critical essays which include 'The Poetic Principal' (1850) and 'The Philosophy of Composition' (1846) but

his oeuvre contains only one novel, *The Narrative of Arthur Gordon Pym* (1838).[2] However, most significant to this study is Poe's detective trilogy which includes 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841), 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842) and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) and in these short tales he is thought to have 'invented' the detective narrative (Rapatzikou, 2003: xi – xvii; Priestman, 2003: 2). Later in this Chapter, and in Chapter 4, I will complicate this narrative by presenting a less author-centric perspective of the cultural development of detective fiction.

Poe 'avidly followed cultural developments in the capitals of Europe' and was 'thus familiar with Dickens and De Quincey...but also Vidoq and Cuvier'; his work, therefore, reveals a resounding debt to the nineteenth-century 'literary models' of 'the parent country' and conversely, Poe's influence was felt in European literature of the same period (Rzepka, 2005: 72).[3] However, in nineteenth-century America the significance of Poe's opus was not readily acknowledged. The hostile criticism and debate, which had tainted Poe's working life, climaxed after his death in 1849, when Reverend Rufus Wilmot Griswold, Poe's long-standing professional critic and nemesis, published a scathing obituary in the *New York Tribune*, two days after Poe's death, under the synonym 'Ludwig' where he states that 'few will be grieved' by Poe's death and depicts the poet as an unsavoury character who 'walked the streets, in madness or melancholy, with lips moving in indistinct curses' (Vines, 1996: 519). This, now famous, character assassination ensured that discussion in America of Poe's already under-rated work was confined to his questionable moral character and conduct (Harvey, 1998: 44).

---

[2] 'The Poetic Principle' is a critical essay, on the composition of art, which was published one year after Poe's death in 1850 and is examined in Chapter 2. It is interesting to note that 'The Philosophy of Composition' (1846) represents an address of the method in which the poem 'The Raven' (1845) was crafted.
[3] Chapters 4 & 5 explore the relationship between British nineteenth-century fiction and Poe's detective narratives.

Although almost a century passed before American critics accepted the value of Poe's work, his nineteenth-century European contemporaries were far more shrewd, stimulated, in the main, by Charles Baudelaire[4] who translated Poe's canon and wrote much admired critical essays on his work (Peeples, 2007: 1). In fact, the French writer Paul Valéry suggests that had it not been for Baudelaire, Poe's literature 'would be completely forgotten' (Vines, 1996: 518). Whether it is due to Baudelaire or not, scholarly opinion would suggest that Poe's work helped to influence the course of European literature: the Symbolist school, the Black Humorists, the grotesque tradition, science fiction and, of course, most pertinent to this study, the genre of detective fiction (Galloway, xx: 2003; Harvey, 1998: 52; Davidson, 1957: ix).

It is important to acknowledge that, although it is widely recognised that Poe is the pioneer of the detective story, recent literary criticism, such as the work of Maurizio Ascari, has proposed counter-arguments of the genesis of the genre, suggesting that revenge tragedies, urban mysteries and Gothic narratives were instrumental in forming the roots of the genre (Ascari: 2007). Charles Rzepka and Heather Worthington assert that the tropes which pervade the dark literary tradition of the Gothic, in novels which include Anne Radcliffe's *The Mysteries of Udolpho* (1794), William Godwin's *Caleb Williams* (1794) and Charles Brockden Brown's *Edgar Huntly* (1799), gave birth to the secrets and mysteries of the detective novel (Rzepka, 2005: 54; Worthington, 2010: 13 &17). The pre-eminence of eighteenth-century texts such as Voltaire's *Zadig* (1747) and Eugène François Vidocq's later text *Memoirs* (1829) have, also, been debated (Haycraft, 1941; James, 2006: 63; Joswick, 2005: 238). In addition, Worthington and

---

[4] Charles Baudelaire (1821 – 1867) was a controversial nineteenth-century French poet, translator and literary critic. He is best known for his dark poetry collections *The Flowers of Evil* (1857) and *Little Prose Poems* (1868).

Lyn Pykett determines that the themes explored in the detective narrative are derived from ideas initiated in the popular Victorian crime fiction of the Newgate novel, the 'penny dreadful', Sensation fiction and 'Blackwood's *Tales of Terror'* (2010:17; 2003: 19).[5] However, a wealth of scholars recognise that it was Poe who was the grand inaugurator of the genre (Haycraft, 1941; James, 2006: 63; Joswick, 2005: 238). Brander Matthews concedes the significance of mystery tales, for example Horace Walpole's Gothic text *Castle of Otranto* (1764), but asserts that 'the history of the detective-story begins with the publication of the 'Murders in the Rue Morgue'' (Matthews, 2007: 73). Poe's relatively limited catalogue of detective fiction, confined to just three short tales 'of ratiocination', featuring his detective, Monsieur C. Auguste Dupin 'influenced the later course of detective fiction' and established not only plot conventions, but, also, narrative themes, such as duality and the 'Bi-Part Soul', which remain evident in the genre today and will be examined extensively throughout this study (Rzepka, 2005: 74).

Poe's embryonic launch of the detective plot, in the 1840s, marked a significant change in narrative focus, with 'love giving place to deductions...the interest of the story moved from the heart to the head...from the drama to the solution' (Irwin, 1998: 28). As John T. Irwin surmises, 'analysis' became the 'key element not adventure' (1998: 28). It was this focus on reason in the pursuit of truth, which distinguishes the detective narrative from its Gothic predecessors. The 'self-reflexive' nature of Poe's detective plot, whereby the form relies exclusively on the examination of the process of its composition, effectively analysing the act of analysis, has been referred to by literary critics using a variety of different terms: the 'anti-detective story', the 'deconstructive mystery', the 'ethical romance', the 'postmodern mystery', 'the 'ontological detective

---

[5] See Chapter 4 for a detailed examination of the Newgate novel, Sensation fiction and 'Blackwood's *Tales of Terror'* (1830 – 1868).

story', the 'metaphysical detective story' and, most recognisably, the analytic detective story (Merivale & Sweeney, 1998: 3). This mode of writing, which concentrates on the 'deductive solution of a mystery' rather than the exploits of adventure, went on to influence numerous authors across subsequent centuries, such as Arthur Conan Doyle, G. K Chesterton, Jorge Luis Borges and Vladimir Nabokov (Irwin, 1998: 27; Merivale & Sweeney, 1998: 83).

Conan Doyle, detective fiction's most renowned author, honours Poe when he asks, 'Where was the detective story until Poe breathed life into it?' and goes on to state that each tale in Poe's detective opus formed 'a root from which a whole literature has developed' (in Paul, 1991: 33). Ultimately, Conan Doyle revealed his debt to Poe by resurrecting the American writer's protagonist Monsieur Dupin in the form of Sherlock Holmes (Joswick, 2005: 238; Kayman, 2003: 42). 'Golden Age' detective writer Dorothy L. Sayers emphasises Poe's contribution when she states that in his tales 'the general principles of the detective story were laid down forever' (Joswick, 2005: 238). [6]

1. The Classical Detective Formula: Poe's 'Blueprint'

The thematic conventions which have evolved to define the detective tale can, largely, be attributed to Poe, with the majority of detective fiction conforming to a formula which he pioneered. Poe played an instrumental role in forging the classic 'Whodunit'

---

[6] The 'Golden Age of Detective Fiction' refers to the period which spanned the inter-war years of the 1920s and 1930s and introduced an abundance of detective fiction including Agatha Christie's literary icons, Hercule Poirot and Miss Marple, Dorothy L. Sayers' Lord Peter Wimsey and Margery Louise Allingham's Albert Campion (Rzepka, 2005: 151). The novels of this period generally adhered to a coherent formula, which has been described as the 'clue-puzzle', whereby the narrative presents multiple suspects and a variety of 'red-herrings' with the guilty being exposed through a process of rational deduction (Knight, 2003: 79). Opinion is divided on the literary significance of detective books published during this period. The 'Golden Age' has been dismissed by some as a 'museum piece movement' and 'ludicrously artificial' (O'Connor, 2008b: 50; Knight, 2003: 82). In direct contrast, however, a number of critics believe that the term 'Golden Age' is misleading as it conjures up 'romantic associations' which contradict 'the social and personal unease' evident in the narratives of the time (Knight, 2003: 77).

plot, initiating narrative techniques, which have been persistently replicated in subsequent detective fiction, such as 'red-herrings', introduced to mislead the reader; the presence of a 'loyal but rather pedestrian associate to chronicle the successes of the brilliant sleuth'; 'the dull and lacklustre mental faculties of the police...and the brilliance of the private detective'; mainstay plot formulas such as the 'locked-room problem' and the 'hidden-object problem' and most critically his eccentric and complex protagonist, Dupin, who personifies a literary blueprint for fictional detectives who followed (Paul, 1991: 33; Scaggs, 2005: 19; Irwin, 2006: 184).[7] Indeed, Howard Haycraft and Robert Lowndes, 'have traced to Poe's tales thirty-two techniques of plot, setting, and characterization that are now standard conventions of detective fiction' (Joswick, 2005: 238). Critics have proposed numerous and varied theoretical models to describe the plot characteristics conceived by Poe but what resonates throughout is the overwhelming consensus that, in his Dupin trilogy, Poe established an unchanging framework for the detective literary form.

John G. Cawelti posits that the formula of a classic detective story encompasses four distinct narrative themes which have emerged from motifs and concepts established by Poe. According to Cawelti the four core concerns in a tale of detection are:

(1) 'defining and developing a particular kind of situation or situations' thus presenting the mystery of an unsolved crime,

(2) describing 'a pattern of action or development of this situation'. This relates to a six point process: the 'introduction of the detective; the crime and the clues;

---

[7] The 'locked-room problem' refers to a crime which is committed in apparently impossible circumstances, in a room where the windows and doors are locked from the inside. We see this plot formula in its embryonic form in Poe's 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) but it is a common motif in numerous detective narratives such as Conan Doyle's *The Valley of Fear* (1915) and the Agatha Christie Miss Marple accounts. The 'hidden object' problem describes the mystery of recovering a concealed item and this formula represents the basis for Poe's third tale in his trilogy 'The Purloined Letter' (1844).

investigation; announcement of the solution; explanation of the solution;

dénouement',

(3) exploring 'a certain group of characters and the relations between them'.

Cawelti refers to four main character roles '(*a*) the victim; *(b)* the criminal; *(c)*

the detective and *(d)* those threatened by the crime but incapable of solving it',

(4) selecting a 'setting or type of setting appropriate to the characters and action'.

This tends to involve an isolated location such as a locked room, a country house

situated on a remote moor or a suburban villa (Cawelti, 1976: 80; James, 2006:

63).

George N. Dove, however, suggests that 'the conventional structure' of the detective

narrative as 'defined by Poe in the Dupin stories is based on seven standard steps:

Problem, First Analysis, Complication, Period of Confusion, Dawning Light, Solution

and Explanation' which, it could be argued, is similar, in essence, to Cawelti's 'six

point formula' of detection (Cawelti, 1976: 80; James, 2006: 63).

Jerold J. Abrams counters Dove when he notes that there are eight elements in the

classical detective formula which have emerged from the Dupin trilogy. Point (1) is

particularly relevant to this study, as the 'duality of mind', which Abrams refers to, is

intrinsic to the psychology of the fictional detective and was explored in Poe's 'Bi-Part'

Dupin. The dual psychology of the literary detective, its origin and influence, will be

discussed at length throughout this investigation. Abrams refers to the deductive

process as:

(1) an examination of the detective's special powers of reason, often involving a

certain duality of mind and sometimes a study of games,

(2) a crime, almost always a murder,

(3) an examination of the crime scene and the gathering of clues by the detective,

(4) interviews of suspects by the detective and his partner (if he has one),

(5) a portrayal of the relations among clues, suspects, and the crime as a labyrinth,

(6) a contemplative study of the case with a focus on the arrangement of clues, often through chemically induced meditation,

(7) the solving of the case and

(8) the capture of the criminal, sometimes through an elaborate trap (Abrams, 2007: 111).

The mid-twentieth century critic Howard Haycraft also emphasises Poe's 'prophetic and embracing...contributions to the internal structure of the genre' and argues that two concepts, founded by Poe, form the basis of the detective tale:

(1) the solvability of a case varies in proportion to its outré character, and

(2) the famous dictum-by-inference (as first phrased by Dorothy Sayers) that 'when you have eliminated all the possibilities, then, whatever remains, however improbable, must be the truth' (Haycraft, 1941).

Sayers' Golden Age contemporary, Willard Huntington Wright, best recognised by his pseudonym S. S. Van Dine, chronicled the exploits of his fictional detective, Philo Vance, using plot techniques highly reminiscent of Poe's Dupin trilogy. Van Dine's *The Greene Murder Case* (1928)

embodies most of the conventions instituted by Poe in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' – the transcendent detective, the slightly stupid narrator, the

unimaginative police, the locked room ... plus the Gothic elements of the mysterious house, the deranged family and the suggestions of madness and perverseness (Dove, 1989: 63).

It was not only Van Dine's literary work that was influenced by Poe but in his critical study, 'Twenty Rules for Writing Detective Stories' (1928), Van Dine demonstrates the profound authority of Poe's work in establishing the 'definite laws' of the 'intellectual game' that is the art of detective writing. Among these are that the solution must be 'determined by logical deductions' and 'the means of detecting... must be rational and scientific' (Van Dine, 1928).

In my opinion, Cawelti's formula represents the most comprehensive and relevant approach to the fictional deductive process and can be applied to the structure and content of most detective fiction. However, whether you ascribe to Calwelti's, Abrams', Haycraft's or Dove's supposition of the principal components of the detective fiction formula, what cannot be questioned is the significance of Poe's work in the emergence of that formula. Haycraft best summarises Poe's prevailing contribution in establishing an embryonic model of thematic conventions for subsequent fiction, when he asserts that 'nothing really primary has been added to the framework of the detective story or to its internals since Poe completed his trilogy. Manners, styles, specific devices may change – but the great principles remain where Poe laid them down and left them' (Haycraft, 1941). This contention is supported by a plethora of more recent scholars (James, 2006: 63; Joswick, 2005: 238, Rzepka, 2005, 74; Priestman, 2003: 2).

2. A Philosophical Framework for Detective Fiction

Poe's opus not only shaped a template for ensuing literature of the detective genre in relation to plot dynamics and conventions but, also, it provided a compelling philosophical mould for subsequent publications. Even Poe's most vehement critic, Griswold, recognized that 'Every genuine author...leaves in his works...traces of his personal character' and in Poe's work he saw a 'singular harmony' (Harvey, 1998: 44). The twentieth-century critic, Edward H. Davidson, concurs with this premise when he acknowledges that Poe's detective fiction was 'moral, philosophical, and as autobiographical as Poe ever became' (Joswick, 2005: 239). It is reasonable, therefore, to suggest that to fully understand Poe's work demands that we examine his core beliefs and values (Galloway, xxxii).

The paradoxical nature of Poe's published work is representative of Poe the man, revealing 'two personalities, the *creative* Poe, who writes 'The Raven', and the *theoretical* Poe, who writes 'The Philosophy of Composition'', which discusses the method which he used to construct this poem (Herzogenrath, 1999: 16). Poe's philosophical and moral beliefs were as complex and contradictory as the man himself. In a letter to the poet Thomas Holley Chivers, in 1844, Poe argues that 'his faith is closely related to two philosophies traditionally opposed to one another, transcendental idealism and materialism' (in Hovey, 1996: 347). These conflicting philosophical stances will be examined in detail in the next part of this Chapter, but a rather succinct definition of these intricate perspectives would be that Materialist theory reduces mind to body, the physical, whilst Idealism elevates the material world to the spiritual.

2.1 Idealism and Materialism

Today, the paradigm of the nature versus culture dichotomy, which is essentially what the Materialism versus Idealism debate equates to, is commonplace and it is widely acknowledged that the two are largely interdependent (Biersack, 1999: 6). But, at the time, the fundamental antinomy of Materialist and Idealist theory meant that Poe's coalescence of these two contrasting philosophical perspectives was remarkable. Both Materialist and Idealist schools of thought examine the relationship between spirit and matter, but the core distinction between the theories is determined by which element is considered to be the more significant (Mao, 1992: 576). Idealist theory proposes that the 'mind makes up the world'; matter is, therefore, a derivative of and dependent on the spirit (Rockmore, 2004: 13, Mao, 1992: 576). Conversely, Materialist theory asserts the independent existence of matter separate from the human consciousness, and the spirit, as a result, is regarded as subsidiary to and a product of matter (Mao, 1992: 86). Materialism, therefore, posits that 'objective realities exist apart from perception', whereas Idealism presupposes that thought and reality cannot be separated (Feuer, 1948: 71). As a result, Materialism is objective, physical, logical and *a priori*[8], whereas Idealism is governed by the internal thinking self and is metaphysical, spiritual and *a posteriori*[9] (Chapin Jones, 1943: 35).

Classical Idealist theory originated in the work of Plato and Socrates in 480 BC and has been examined by philosophers throughout history who have demonstrated varying degrees of dogmatism, from the Irish George Berkeley (1685-1753) who denies outright the existence of matter to the more balanced stance of the French philosopher René Descartes (1595 – 1650), who merely questions its existence. However, it was in the

---

[8] '*A priori*' is a term used in philosophy to refer to a type of knowledge which is independent of experience.
[9] '*A posteriori*' is a term used in philosophy to refer to a type of knowledge which is dependent on experience.

work of the eighteenth-century philosopher Immanuel Kant (1724-1804) that this theoretical approach was firmly consolidated. Kant led the German Idealist movement and initiated the philosophical perspective of Transcendental Idealism which Poe, in his letter to Thomas Holley Chivers, states that he ascribes to. In this theory, Kant does not contest the existence of synthetic *a priori* knowledge but rather he posits that 'nature is derived from the laws of the possibility of experience' and, therefore, reliant on subjective, *a posteriori* understanding (Kant, 1783; Westphal, 2005: 82). Although Kant recognises the existence of matter, he emphasises that its existence is solely dependent upon personal interpretation, based on experience. Kant inspired multiple versions of Idealist theology during the late eighteenth century and early nineteenth century fronted by Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel (1770 – 1831), Friedrich Wilhelm Joseph Schelling (1775 – 1854) and Johann Gottlieb Fichte (1762 – 1814), amongst others. These theories share the same core principle, the supremacy of spirit over matter (Rockmore, 2007: 20).

Materialism, also, can be traced back to ancient Greece in the work of Anaxagoras (500-428 BC), who proposed scientific theories for the order of the universe (Weber, 1925: 53). The revival of Materialist theory by Karl Marx (1818 – 1883) and Friedrich Engels (1820 – 1895) in the nineteenth century was, predominantly, a reaction to Hegel's Idealism (Arthur, 1970: 40). To fully appreciate the theoretical position of these two philosophies they must be situated in their social context. Both Idealism and Materialism are inextricably linked to class structures and the technological advances which were indicative of the time (Mao, 1992: 85). The Industrial Revolution during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries saw advances in technology and science, the development of new markets, economic and urban growth, and, consequently, the formation of a distinct class structure and the development of new

scientific perspectives which were contrary to the superstitions that previously prevailed (Russell, 2009: 121). Labour was divided into mental and manual and this occupational hierarchy was reflected by political orientation and philosophical allegiance (Mao, 1992: 86). The consciousness of the dominant, capitalist, exploiting classes endorsed Idealist values, whereas the oppressed, proletarian classes promoted Materialist views, with Marx and Communism being the voice for the suppressed and, hence, Materialism.

The amalgamation of the scientific logic of Materialism and the creative consciousness of Transcendental Idealism is demonstrated by Poe in his detective Dupin, who is described in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) as possessing a 'Bi-Part Soul' which is both 'creative and resolvent' ('Murders': 146). But how was Poe able to rationalize a unity between these fundamentally discordant perspectives? Contemporary scholars have criticised Poe for his inability to differentiate between 'matter (truth) and manner (beauty)' but Poe justifies his reconciliation of these divergent modes in 'Letter to Mr. ____' (1831), the foreword to his third volume of poetry, and in his definition of 'The Poetic Principle' (1850) (Winters, 2007: 240; Hovey, 1996: 349). In these, Poe examines the three core issues which concern him, 'Pure Intellect, Taste, and the Moral Sense': science or physics being the field of 'Pure Intellect', metaphysics or the knowledge of the mind, being the field of 'Moral Sense' and poetry being the field of 'Taste' (Galloway, 2003, xxiv; Hovey, 1996: 350). According to Poe, the latter, 'Taste', was the most fundamental as 'it could hold communication with both intellect and morality' (Galloway, 2003: xxiv). Poe's ideal was a fusion of the 'two modes of intelligence', the rational and the imagination, 'seeking to establish an "objective" science of beauty' and 'the closest he came to this ideal was in the creation of the master detective Dupin' (Hamilton Buckley, 1981: 145; Galloway, 2003: xxii). Ultimately, in his detective fiction, Poe 'brought together the

fields of physics and metaphysics – and hence materialism and idealism' (Joswick, 2005: 350).

Evidently, Poe used his detective trilogy as a medium for moral and philosophical expression (Joswick, 2005: 238). In doing so, Poe's detective fiction was driven by prevalent contemporaneous issues, such as philosophical debate, and, consequently, it is representative of society at the time. Subsequently, Poe made a significant contribution to initiating another bastion of the detective genre: the concept of detective fiction as a vehicle of social commentary, reflecting the current state of humanity. The notion of the detective narrative as a literary means for social debate has translated across the centuries and remains prominent in the detective fiction of modern times.

It is, therefore, apparent that Poe's influence transcends the merely practical aspects of plot conventions and can be analysed at a more profound level. In his personal life, Poe endorsed the unity of the divergent principles of fact and the imagination, proposing the authority of a combined 'poetic intellect' and this imperative permeates his creative work (Galloway, 2003: xxii). The following Chapter will examine in detail how Poe's detective Dupin and his 'Bi-Part Soul', which is both 'poet and mathematician', embodies the diametrically opposing beliefs of Transcendental Idealism and Materialism and how, ultimately, in Dupin, Poe has been able to achieve his philosophical model of perfection ('Murders': 146; 'Purloined': 293). The influence of Poe's notion of 'The Bi-Part Soul' and the associated motif of duality extends throughout the detective genre and Chapter 2 will explore the meaning and origin of these defining concepts. What Poe meant exactly by the 'old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul' and from where it derives has not been adequately determined or explored (Stade, 2007: 94). This study will represent an extensive examination of Poe's concept of the

'Bi-Part Soul', enhancing knowledge in an area of great literary value, which until now has lacked significant critical attention.

Chapter 2

The Meaning and Origin of the 'Bi-Part Soul'

Despite being the focus of 'over a century of commentary', the origins of Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' still remain unknown (Stade, 2007: 94). A definitive theory has never been established. My argument is that Poe's 'old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul' can be attributed to Aristotle's (384 – 322 BC)[10] philosophy of the bipartite psychology ('Murders': 141). This Chapter will begin by examining the meaning of Poe's concept of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and how it relates to a more general notion of duality, which will then be followed by an overview of academic debate on the derivation of Poe's idea. I will then proceed to substantiate my assertion of the genesis of Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul', firstly, by establishing a causal link between the ideas explored in Aristotelian theory, specifically his *Poetics* (350 BC), and Poe's work, predominantly 'The Poetic Principle'(1850) and his Dupin trilogy, and, secondly, by discussing the implicit unity between Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and Aristotle's bi-partite psychology which, also, describes a division of the soul into rational and irrational virtues.

1. The 'Bi-Part Soul' and Duality

The notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' is cited twice directly in Poe's work, but the idea was also examined, although not explicitly, in texts such as 'William Wilson' (1839) and

---

[10] Aristotle (384 – 322 BC): the ancient Greek philosopher and writer on psychology, nature, logic, physics, metaphysics and ethics.

'The Fall of the House of Usher' (1839) (Mabbott et al., 2000: 85). The 'Bi-Part Soul' is first referred to in 'Lionizing' (1835), a short satire of the 'assumption of scholarship', when Poe mentions the concept in relation to another character, Aestheticus Ethix: 'He spoke of fire, unity, and atoms; bi-part and pre-existent soul; affinity and discord; primitive intelligence and homoomeria' ('Lionizing': 12; Hobson Quinn, 1998: 218). 'Homoomeria' refers to the term 'homoeomery' which was ascribed by Aristotle to the philosophical contentions of Anaxagoras (500-428 BC) and describes the idea that 'the part' and 'the whole' are the same (Reesor, 1983: 100). It is relevant to note that Poe's first citation of the 'Bi-Part Soul' is mentioned in the same sentence as a word used by Aristotle that refers to a divided unity. However, the most significant occasion where the 'Bi-Part Soul' directly appears in Poe's opus is in his first detective tale 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) when the narrator describes the detective Dupin: 'Observing him in these moods, I often dwelt meditatively upon the old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul and amused myself with the fancy of a double Dupin – the creative and the resolvent' ('Murders': 146). The narrator attributes the detective's dual psyche to 'merely the result of an excited, or perhaps a diseased intelligence' ('Murders': 146). This statement introduces three important concepts: firstly, the idea of the 'Bi-Part Soul' which is both 'creative' and 'resolvent'; secondly, the notion of a 'double' Dupin and, lastly, the detective's 'diseased intelligence'. Each of these concerns will now be discussed.

Leroy Panek suggests that the 'Bi-Part Soul' refers to the 'essential duality of genius' (1987: 81). A generalised association between the 'Bi-Part Soul' and the concept of duality in detective fiction can be maintained; a premise which is supported by Jerold J. Abrams when he asserts that 'The metaphor of the 'Bi-Part Soul' immediately leads to the principle of duality' (Abrams, 1999: 16). Tropes relating to the double pervade

Poe's work, which has prompted scholars to assert that 'Chief among his themes is duplicity itself...The doubleness of experience' and that duality is the 'most characteristic and persistent of Poe's obsessive fantasies' (Hoffman, 1972: 121; Quinn, 1957: 197). The Gothic inflections of the detective narrative and the innate characteristics of the detective plot which destabilise the nature of identity, uncovering secrets and hidden criminal selves, mean that bifurcation represents a central theme in, not only Poe's work, but the detective genre that he was instrumental in pioneering. Linking Poe's concept of the 'Bi-Part Soul' with a broader notion of duality and the theme of the double is made even more legitimate given the context in which the idea of the 'Bi-Part Soul' is first introduced in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841). Indeed, it was whilst the narrator 'dwelt meditatively upon the old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul' that he considered the concept of a '*double* Dupin' ('Murders': 146).

Poe's explicit reference to the 'double' directly intertwines with the theme of duality which resonates throughout the Gothic novel and the Romantic Movement in nineteenth-century fiction; this paradigm is evident in texts such as Johann Wolfgang von Goethe's *Faust* (1808 & 1832), Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein* (1818) and James Hogg's *The Private Memoirs of a Justified Sinner* (1824). Karl Miller refers to duality as a 'double life' and relates the concept to the 'multiple identity' manifested in literary devices which include the *doppelgänger*, the divided self and doubling (1985: 21). The term *doppelgänger* has been credited to the German Romantic novelist Jean Paul Richter with a literal translation of the 'double goer' (Miller: 1985: 21). This motif has been extensively examined by scholars and has been defined using numerous but vague classifications which include the 'fictional double', the 'evil twin', the 'alter ego', the 'antithetical self', the 'fragmentation of self into dual' and the 'twin soul' amongst others (Miller, 1985: 21; Pizer, 1998: 2; Herdman, 1990: 14). Most significant to this

study is John Herdman's definition of the 'twin soul' which is analogous to Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' (1990: 14). Most interpretations share the common understanding that the term *doppelgänger* is concerned with the unstable nature of identity and that it tends to relate to a divided self with a good/evil division or a divergence in the portrayal of the public/private persona (Dryden, 2003: 43 & 71). When the narrator in Poe's 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) comments on Dupin's 'Bi-Part Soul' he attributes it to the detective's 'diseased intelligence' ('Murders': 146). This reference implies that Dupin, who as a detective and agent of justice should represent a moral arbiter, also conceals an infected psychology and thus his split psyche can be related to the motif of the divided self and an intrinsic division in human nature between good and evil. Chapters 4 and 5 of this study will reveal how the theme of duality which relates to Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' is embedded in the tropes of the Gothic, Newgate, Sensation and, ultimately, Detective fiction of the nineteenth century in the work of Edgar Allan Poe, Charles Dickens, Wilkie Collins, Robert Louis Stevenson and Arthur Conan Doyle.

Aside from the *doppelgänger* motif and the concept of the divided self, duality is manifested in Poe's detective trilogy in the systematic use of the narrative technique of 'doubling' (Irwin, 1996: 5). Doubling is a rhetorical device which employs repetition, contrast, reversal, duplication and mirroring of plot themes, structure and characterisation and it represents a 'standard element of the analytic detective story' (Irwin, 1996: 5). This technique operates throughout Poe's trilogy, most powerfully, in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844), in the narrator-detective and criminal-detective dynamics, the antithetical representation of opposing paradigms and the dual narrative format. Through the use of doubling Poe is able to achieve 'dramatic balance' and 'aesthetic pleasure in the extraordinary unity of

the tale's formal motifs and plot' (Van Dover, 1994: 93; Lemay, 1982: 171). This Chapter will explore the motivation behind Poe's imperative of the symbolic unity of effect and subsequent Chapters will demonstrate how the intrinsic doubling of plot structures are expressed in Poe's and Conan Doyle's detective narratives (Irwin, 1996: 5).

The 'Bi-Part Soul' describes the binary split between the opposing factions of Dupin's psychology. One half is 'resolvent' or rational, reasoned, scientific and logical whilst the other is 'creative' or irrational, poetic and imaginative ('Murders': 146). In the same way that Poe champions both Transcendental Idealism and Materialism, he also values the combined use of these disparate aspects of his detective's psyche. Indeed, in 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) the importance of a marriage between these faculties, which tend to bifurcate, is emphasised when Dupin remarks 'As poet *and* mathematician, he would reason well; as mere mathematician he could not have reasoned at all' ('Purloined': 293). The detective's methods are, therefore, 'both artistic and scientific' and rely on the coupling of 'the abandonment of the self-destructive romantic artist and the self control of the conscious' (McCracken, 1998: 52; Danesi, 2004: 214). The brilliance of Poe's Dupin and his deductive methods can be attributed to his 'Bi-Part Soul', which permits the imagination to operate within the restrictions of logic. As a result, Poe's detective trilogy crafts 'a new epistemological synthesis' which combines 'the exactness of mathematical science with the speculative potential of philosophy and poetry' (Kayman, 2003: 45). The dual nature of Poe's personal philosophical beliefs are manifested in his detective with 'the creative and resolvent' Dupin exemplifying Poe's ideal blend of the 'two modes of intelligence', discussed in Chapter 1: reason and the imagination (Hamilton Buckley, 1981: 145; Galloway, 2003: xxii). Together, the disparate modes of the 'Bi-Part Soul' facilitate the creative use of

reason and, ultimately, the concept represents a union between Poe's opposing beliefs, Materialism and Transcendental Idealism; it is indicative of Poe, the man, and of the detective fiction genre which he played such a fundamental role in creating.

The detective plot reveals an inherent conflict in the 'tension between the logic of deduction and the chaos, irrational, uncontrollable nature of the violence the plot attempts to contain' (Gomel, 2003: 68). This contention is resolved by the fictional detective who functions as a 'rationalist of the irrational' and seeks to counter and tame 'chance, chaos, disorder, the irrational and the sublime' (Gomel, 2003: 69). The intrinsic motivation of the detective narrative is to apply reason to the irrational and thus the core principle of the genre demonstrates an indebtedness to the dual imperatives associated with the disparate attributes of the 'Bi-Part Soul'. Consequently, it can be argued that Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' exemplifies the overriding objective of the detective plot.

It can be concluded that the metaphor of the 'Bi-Part Soul' is fundamentally important for a number of reasons: it is synonymous with Poe's philosophical beliefs, it is clearly linked to a more general principle of duality, or the theme 'of the double', which permeates throughout the detective genre, and it has created a psychosomatic model for subsequent fictional detectives (Lehman, 2001: 94).

2. Academic Debate on the Origin of the 'Bi-Part Soul'

The 'Bi-Part Soul' does not appear in the *Oxford English Dictionary* but 'bipartite', from which it is almost certainly derived, does and can be defined as 'consisting of two parts'. This definition presents an inadequate explanation of the origins of Poe's notion

of the 'Bi-Part Soul'. Likewise, *The Edgar Allan Poe Society of Baltimore* cites the doctrine as a phrase 'first used or coined by Poe' which again fails to clarify what it means or what inspired the author to use it (Pollin, 1974).

Many theories have been proposed to explain what Poe meant by 'the old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul' and from where it derived. However, academic opinion on the matter still remains ambiguous. George Stade, when discussing the origins of this notion, states that Poe's 'annotators are not of much help...Poe's own essays, letters, and marginalia are also of little help: None of them discusses the Bi-Part Soul' (2007: 94). Similarly, Stuart and Susan Levine state that 'No one seems to be able to explain exactly what Poe means by the 'old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul'', suggesting that 'Poe borrowed the concept from an as-yet-unlocated passage in his reading' and adding that they 'have searched likely places most diligently' (2000: 130). It has, also, been suggested that Poe's 'Bi-Part Soul' corresponds with a growing awareness in the nineteenth century of the division of the consciousness and, as such, is 'an anticipatory apology for psychoanalysis' (Rzepka, 2005: 42; Stade, 2007: 94). Less specific approaches to the 'Bi-Part Soul' explain it as merely a 'metaphor' or associate it with the generalised 'doctrine of duality' or 'a rivalry between soul parts' (Herzogenrath; 1999: 19; Miller; 1985: 157). Over a century of conjecture has failed to determine exactly what motivated Poe's concept of the 'Bi-Part Soul', but my hypothesis is that its roots can be found two thousand years before Poe first cites it, in 384 – 322 BC, in the work of the Greek philosopher Aristotle.

3. Aristotle and Poe

The revival of Aristotelian studies, in the early-to-mid nineteenth century, was determined by a number of influencing factors. There was a broad re-awakening of interest in Greek philosophy, at the time, which can largely be attributed to 'a growing appreciation of German Idealist theory' driven by Hegel (Copleston, 2003: 163). A new edition of Aristotle's work was published in Berlin, in 1831, and it was this which 'gave the impetus to Aristotelian studies' (Hamburger, 1965: xi). A lack of sufficient print systems in nineteenth-century America promoted a 'Transatlantic Reprint Culture', which meant European literature and critical opinion dominated American culture at the time (Hartmann, 2008:108). This was reinforced due to the trend, which developed in the early-to-mid nineteenth century, for American students to spend time studying in Germany. German thought, therefore, infiltrated American civilisation and this meant that the German revival of Greek philosophy was strongly reflected in the American literature and critical thought of the time (MacKinnon, 1985: 286). An abundance of translations of Aristotle's work, from Greek into Latin, French or English, were published throughout the nineteenth century in America. In Europe, Aristotle's theories were the focus of deliberation in periodicals, examined in the critical works of Coleridge (1722 – 1834) and Schlegel (1772 – 1829) and referred to frequently in the English and French literature of the nineteenth century (Pritchard, 1934: 81).

Poe was educated at the English and Classical School of Richmond, Virginia before, in 1826, going on to enrol in the School of Ancient and Modern Languages at the University of Virginia where amongst his contemporaries he was known for his 'remarkable attainments as a classical scholar' (Zimmerman, 2005: 32; Levine &

Levine, 2000: 4).[11] Poe's educational background, the increased availability of

classical texts, the re-awakening of interest in Greek philology and the subsequent

extent of critical debate meant that Poe would be well acquainted with the Aristotelian

corpus, a premise which is supported by the 'numerous references in his fiction, poetry

and criticism' to Aristotle's ideas (Frank & Magistrale, 1997: 24).

Poe directly refers to Aristotle a number of times throughout his work and was,

sometimes, derisive about the thrust of Aristotle's didactic arguments.[12] The Greek

philosopher is mentioned in Poe's short story 'Bon-Bon – A Tale' (1835) which is 'part

farce and part intellectual satire' (Frank & Magistrale, 1997: 47). Aristotle is also cited

in Poe's critical essay 'Letter to B___' (1836) which represents his first address of

poetic theory (Carlson, 1996: 280). In this account Poe rejects Aristotle's didacticism,

asserting that pleasure, not instruction should, ultimately, be derived from poetry:

'Aristotle, with singular assurance, has declared poetry as the most philosophical of all

writings...He seems to think that the end of poetry, is, or should be, instruction' ('B__':

331). Poe discusses the form and function of art further in 'Eureka – (An Essay on the

Material and Spiritual Universe)' (1848), among other writings in his 'Marginalia'[13] and

consolidates his argument in 'The Poetic Principle' (1850) which was not published

until a year after his death. Despite Poe disagreeing with Aristotle's didacticism, it will

be demonstrated how Poe's critical essay 'The Poetic Principle' and his detective

trilogy reveal a significant indebtedness to Aristotle's *Poetics* (350 BC).

---

[11] Although Poe was dismissed from this University within a year, due to excessive gambling and drinking, he excelled during the time that he studied.
[12] Didacticism is the belief that instruction and information, not pleasure, should, ultimately, be derived from art.
[13] Poe wrote a series of critical essays for several of the Northern magazines under the title of 'Marginalia'.

3.1 Aristotle's *Poetics* (350 BC) and Poe's 'The Poetic Principle' (1850)

Aristotle's *Poetics* and Poe's 'The Poetic Principle' both propose a framework to assess the structure and value of an artistic form. Aristotle's *Poetics* is the first comprehensive critical study of the theory behind the composition of art. It analyses the component elements of Tragedy, Poetry and Comedy and, as a result, represents 'the science of poetic', much like the methods employed by Poe's 'poet-mathematician' detective Dupin (Gaut & Lopes, 2005: 15; McKeon, 1982: 6; 'Purloined': 293). Aristotle, in his *Poetics*, proposes a 'theory of the structure and functioning of literary discourse' (Chatman, 1980: 18). The first sentence of this treatise embodies the Greek philosopher's intention: 'I propose to treat of Poetry in itself and of its various kinds, noting the essential quality of each; to inquire into the structure of the plot as requisite to a good poem' (*Poetics*: 1). Similarly, Poe in 'The Poetic Principle' defines a criterion to 'measure the merit' of an artistic work ('The Poetic Principle': 24). Poe's implicit reworking of the *Poetics* in his critical essay reveals the profound authority of Aristotle's ideas in shaping his work.

It is significant to note that Poe mentions Aristotle directly in 'The Poetic Principle' when he asserts that:

> Dividing the world of mind into its three most immediately obvious distinctions, we have the Pure Intellect, Taste and the Moral Sense. I place Taste in the middle, because it is just this position which in the mind it occupies. It holds intimate relations with either extreme; but from the Moral Sense is separated by so faint a difference that Aristotle has not failed to place some of its operations among the virtues themselves ('The Poetic Principle': 29).

As discussed in Chapter 1, Poe believed that poetry, or Taste, is able to unite the disparate faculties of the Pure Intellect and The Moral Sense or the imagination. Aristotle's ethical treatise, 'Nicomachean Ethics'[14] examines these virtues and Poe, therefore, cites the Greek philosopher as an advocate for his theory.

Aside from this explicit reference to Aristotle, Poe's 'The Poetic Principle' fundamentally agrees with Aristotle's *Poetics* on the desired extent and content of a dramatic plot. The Greek philosopher claims that the length should be of 'a certain magnitude' but stipulates that 'the beginning and the end must be capable of being brought within a single viewing' (*Poetics*: 15). Likewise, Poe states that the duration of plot should be restrained to 'the limit of a single sitting' (Poetic Principle: 7). The mutual imperative of a controlled plot reveals the dominant principle which connects Poe's 'The Poetic Principle' and Aristotle's *Poetics*, their shared emphasis on the artistic value of 'unity' (*Poetics*: 15; 'The Poetic Principle': 24). Both Poe and Aristotle endorse the self-containment of plot, where the action is focused in a central setting and each element of the narrative leads logically to the next (Asselineau, 1970: 30). Aristotle states that any successful plot requires 'unity' and should be 'an imitation of an action that is complete and whole' (*Poetics*: 14 & 15). Similarly, Poe stresses the 'important artistic element, totality, or unity, of effect' and 'totality of effect or impression' which derives from the '*close circumscription of place'* ('The Poetic Principle': 7 & 23). The plot structure and content approved by Aristotle in his *Poetics* is emulated not only in Poe's 'The Poetic Principle' but, also, in his Dupin triology.

---

[14] This treatise will be examined at a later stage in this Chapter.

3.2 Aristotle's *Poetics* (350 BC) and Poe's Detective Fiction

There is a fundamental association between the ideas established by Aristotle in his theory of artistic composition, *Poetics*, and the standard conventions at the heart of detective fiction. It has been claimed, by Dorothy L. Sayers, amongst others, that this seminal work implicitly lays the foundations for the plot and character of the detective narrative, which Poe played a fundamental role in pioneering. Like Aristotle, in his *Poetics*, Poe's detective fiction promotes that 'character comes in as subsidiary to the actions' (*Poetics*: 12). According to Aristotle 'The Plot, then, is the first principle, and, as it were, the soul of tragedy: Character holds the second place' (*Poetics*: 13). For Aristotle, character, therefore, exists to support the main thrust of the narrative. Danforth Ross posits that in this respect Poe is 'in accordance with Aristotle... In fact, Poe brings The *Poetics* to the short story ...Like Aristotle, he makes character subsidiary to the action. And, like Aristotle, he sees such element of the story as subsidiary to the action as a whole' (Ross, 1961: 8). Indeed, the character of Poe's detective Dupin has been criticised for being as 'thin as the paper he is printed on', embodying merely a tool for analysis (Irwin, 1998: 27). Consequently, it can be asserted that the narrative focus in Poe's embryonic detective tale reflects Aristotle's premise of the supremacy of plot over character.

Dorothy L. Sayers' lecture, 'Aristotle on Detective Fiction' (1935), represents a resounding endorsement of the authority of Aristotle's *Poetics* in defining the detective genre. At the core of this light hearted evaluation of the relationship between Aristotle's *Poetics* and the detective narrative is a reasoned and persuasive argument. Sayers claims that 'the *Poetics* remains the finest guide to the writing of detective fiction' and proposes 'a convincing argument that the principles of formal criticism which Aristotle propounds in his *Poetics* apply directly to the formal aspects of the

detective story – precisely the aspects which Poe invented' (Bargainnier, 1980: 14; Van Dover, 1997: 43). Ostensibly, Sayers' argument relates Aristotle's *Poetics* to the detective genre on the basis of two shared values: 'The Art of Framing Lies' and plot structure (Peirce, 1982: 351). The technique of 'Framing Lies' is analogous to the device of 'false inference' which Aristotle refers to in his *Poetics* and involves misleading the reader by presenting multiple plausible solutions, which drive bogus conclusions and have subsequently been labelled, in the detective genre, as 'red herrings'. Aristotle's *Poetics* professes that the accomplished art of framing lies enhances the value of a narrative and this notion is inherent to the detective plot (*Poetics*: 31).

The second common value Sayers examines in 'Aristotle on Detective Fiction' is that the *Poetics* and the detective genre share a mutual regard for the same narrative structure. As previously discussed, Aristotle in his *Poetics* sanctions the value of 'unity' which is achieved when a narrative emulates 'a single action, whole and complete, with a beginning, a middle and an end' or, using contemporary terminology, an 'incentive moment', a 'climax' and a 'resolution' (*Poetics*: 14 & 47; McManus, 2002). According to Aristotle, this 'cause and effect chain' is separated in the first instance by 'Complication' and, secondly, by 'Unravelling or Dénouement' (*Poetics*: 34; McManus, 2002). The narrative framework that Aristotle describes: incentive moment, complication, climax, dénouement and resolution reflects Dove's seven standard steps of the detective formula which are 'Problem, First Analysis, Complication, Period of Confusion, Dawning Light, Solution and Explanation' and Cawelti's six point theory of the same process, namely 'introduction of the detective; the crime and the clues; investigation; announcement of the solution; explanation of the solution; dénouement', as discussed in Chapter 1 (James, 2006: 63; Cawelti, 1976 : 80).

Detective fiction rigidly conforms to Aristotle's prescribed ideal narrative form, as the detective formula demands an inherent beginning (the crime), middle (the detection) and end ('discovery and execution of the murderer') (Bargainnier, 1980: 14).

Building on Sayers' work, in addition, the model narrative structure promoted by Aristotle in the *Poetics* proposes that a skilfully constructed plot is always accompanied by changes brought about by 'Reversal of the Situation, and Recognition scenes' (*Poetics*: 12). The Greek philosopher determines that 'Recognition...is a change from ignorance to knowledge' made possible through the 'process of reasoning' and this premise exemplifies the core intention of the detective story (*Poetics*: 31 & 20). 'Reversal of the Situation' is defined as 'a change by which the action veers round to its opposite' creating an 'opposite effect' and would today be recognised as a 'twist' (*Poetics*: 20). It was discussed in Part 1 of this Chapter how Poe employs the narrative technique of 'doubling' to achieve 'dramatic balance' in the symbolic unity of the formal characters and elements of his work (Van Dover, 1994: 93; Lemay, 1982: 171).[15] Eric W. Carlson relates Poe's use of 'doubling' to a 'revolving of reversals', which presents a likeness between disparate roles within the story, such as the criminal and the detective (Carlson, 1996: 446). The designing effect of Aristotle's 'Reversal of the Situation' or Poe's 'doubling' maintains order and accord between the opposing elements of the plot. Consequently, the result of doubling in Poe's detective fiction achieves another of Aristotle's imperatives, laid down in his *Poetics*, the value of 'rhythm...or harmony' brought about by the 'structural union of the parts' (*Poetics*: 16 & 1). It is important to clarify, however, that this 'union of the parts' does not extend to the story's protagonist. Aristotle clearly states that 'Unity of plot does not, as some people think, consist in the unity of hero' (*Poetics*: 16). Poe's 'Bi-Part' 'double Dupin',

---

[15] The notion of 'doubling' and how it is manifested in Poe's detective trilogy will be discussed in Chapter 3.

with his split psyche predisposed to both 'creative' and 'resolvent' efflorescence, therefore, represents another significant commonality between the attributes advocated by both Aristotle and Poe and suggests that the American author crafted his detective fiction from the premises laid down in Aristotle's *Poetics*.

Aristotle's *Poetics* and the detective genre, which Poe was instrumental in pioneering, demonstrate a reciprocal regard for the same narrative structure, content and characterisation. The influence of Aristotle's *Poetics* resonates throughout Poe's detective trilogy and the ensuing detective genre which he played a significant role in creating.

4. Aristotle's Bipartite Psychology and Poe's 'Bi-Part Soul'

Strong evidence has been presented to suggest that Poe's work was profoundly influenced by Aristotelian theory. This background provides the context for my argument that Poe's 'old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul' emerges from Aristotle's ancient philosophy of the bipartite psychology. The Greek philosopher wrote two seminal ethical treatises which examine the virtues of humankind: 'Nicomachean Ethics' which consists of ten books and 'Eudemian Ethics' made up of eight books. Broadly speaking, Aristotelian ethical theory posits that 'the soul may be divided into two parts – the rational and the irrational' ('Nicomanchean': 182). The rational component accounts for the 'intellectual virtues' which include 'analysis', 'reason', 'deduction', 'inference', 'induction', 'science' and 'investigation or calculation' ('Nicomanchean': 54, 182, 185, 186 & 197). In contrast, the irrational half is responsible for the 'moral virtues or vices' of the character which include 'lust, anger, fear, pride of strength, envy, delight, affection' among others ('Nicomanchean': 45;

Chamberlain, 1984: 149). Aristotle refers to the dual nature of the soul, which comprises of the rational and the irrational parts, as the bipartite psychology and this premise represents the core of Aristotle's ethical treatise: the 'Nicomachean Ethics' and the 'Eudemian Ethics' (Chamberlain, 1984: 149; Edel, 1995: 444).

As previously discussed, Poe's detective, Dupin, is described in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) as having a 'Bi-Part Soul' which is both reasoned and creative. Parallels can be drawn between what Poe presents as 'the old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul' and Aristotle's notion of the bipartite psychology; both refer to a 'bi-part' division of the soul and the theories are, therefore, intrinsically linked. However, this likeness operates at a more profound level; Aristotle's doctrine of the bipartite psychology describes the 'reason-emotion dualism' inherent in the soul and, consequently, establishes a distinction between the faculties associated with 'calculations and reflections' and the same dichotomy of reason and emotion is apparent in Poe's 'Bi-Part' detective (Kahn, 1998: 247; Knuuttila, 2004: 5). Dupin is referred to, in 'The Purloined Letter' (1844), as a 'poet-mathematician' and employs the use of Aristotle's intellectual virtues 'analysis', 'reason' and 'calculating power' in his process of 'deduction' ('Murders': 144; 'Purloined': 293). However, the detective professes that 'As poet and mathematician, he would reason well; as mere mathematician he could not have reasoned at all' thus acknowledging the significance of the moral virtues, cited by Aristotle in his ethical treatise, which are associated with the poet ('Purloined': 293). Consequently, Poe's Dupin demonstrates an indebtedness to Aristotle's bipartite psychology, as his methods recognise the imperative of the combined use of both aspects of his 'Bi-Part Soul', reason and imagination. This discussion of the meaning and origin of the 'Bi-Part Soul' provides a context to examine this notion and the

associated theme of duality in the following Case Study, which represents an extensive

analysis of Poe's detective trilogy.

Chapter 3

A Case Study: Duality and the 'Bi-Part Soul' in the Dupin Trilogy

Edgar Allan Poe's three short tales, 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841), 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842) and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844), feature his acutely intelligent protagonist, Monsieur C. Auguste Dupin, an influential character who went on to provide the inspiration for a genre of multifaceted fictional detectives. The beginning of this Chapter will present an overview of the themes and plot techniques which are introduced in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841), developed in Poe's trilogy and have endured through to the contemporary detective texts of today. This will be followed by a discussion of what prompted Poe to move from the Gothic to the Detective narrative, before providing a brief plot synopsis of 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842) and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844). However, the main focus of this Chapter will represent a detailed analysis of Poe's first detective tale 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) and demonstrates how the themes initiated in Poe's first tale in his detective trilogy are consistently developed and explored throughout the subsequent Dupin accounts.

1. The Dupin Trilogy: An Enduring Formula of Themes and Plot Conventions

'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) was first published in *Graham's Magazine* and was referred to by Poe as a tale of 'ratiocination' and posited that 'its theme was the exercise of ingenuity in detecting a murder' (Rzepka, 2005: 74; Hobson Quinn et al, 1998: 355). This embryonic detective narrative played a profound role in the

conception of the detective genre and the tale pioneered a formula of themes and conventions which have endured to the present day. Practical plot techniques such as 'red-herrings', the dynamics and structure of the narrative, the characterization of an amateur sleuth with a pedestrian companion to chronicle his successes, the locked room mystery formula and the isolated backdrop of a Gothic mansion have all been persistently replicated throughout detective fiction across the centuries (Paul, 1991: 33; Scaggs, 2005: 19; Irwin, 2006: 184). We recognise these features as inherent characteristics of the detective formula and they dominate Poe's 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841).

Aside from practical aspects of the plot, Poe contributed towards establishing ideas and themes which remain evident in the contemporary detective texts of today. The concept of detective fiction as a means for social commentary is notable throughout Poe's trilogy. 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) examines and reflects prevalent issues of the time such as the universal mistrust of the police, advances in forensic techniques, the dichotomy of science versus the supernatural and the Western subjugation of their Eastern colonies. In addition, Poe challenged the belief that science and romanticism were oppositional in his 'Bi-Part' creative and logical detective. The analogy of game playing is one that permeates throughout Poe's detective tales and the entire genre. The twists and turns of a detective mystery resemble the intricacies of a puzzle, a riddle or a game. Dénouement comes in the form of linking a chain of events or the pieces in a puzzle. In detective fiction the author and detective aim to outsmart the criminal and, ultimately, the reader. In 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) Dupin outwits the narrator, the criminals and the Prefect of the Parisian police. Poe, however, in his own game with the reader, lays down the rules during the preface of the tale and from that point on we are participants in the game. He misleads us with

ambiguous detail, purposefully withholds information and wrong foots us with 'red herrings', which, ultimately, result in his victory and our defeat. As John T. Irwin hypothesises the analytic detective story represents a 'battle of wits between writer and reader' and 'a contest to see if the reader can solve the mystery before the detective does' (Irwin, 1996: 191). Detective fiction as a game between the detective and the criminal and the author and the reader defines the detective narrative as a form.

Duality is manifold in the detective genre and is examined throughout *The Murders in the Rue Morgue'* (1841) (Delameter, 1997: 40; Herzogenrath, 1999: 20). The theme of the double is explored through the dynamics of the text in the dual nature of the plot structure and the core relationships which are developed during the narrative: Dupin and the narrator, Dupin and the criminals, Dupin and the victims, Dupin and the Prefect, the game player and his opponent and Poe and the reader. Most profoundly, the theme of the double manifests itself in Poe's 'Bi-Part' detective.

2. From 'Gothic terror' to 'the cool logic of the detective story'

The publication of *The Murders in the Rue Morgue'* revealed a striking shift in the nature of Poe's literary work. The year before Poe had published a collection of twenty-five of his short stories entitled *Tales of Grotesque and Arabesque* (1840). As discussed in Chapter 2 Poe valued aesthetic balance in his writing and this anthology represented a further attempt at achieving this 'symbolic unity', with two disparate 'literary modes: the grotesque designating the comic, burlesque, and satiric, and the arabesque the serious, poetic, terrifying and visionary' merging in this publication (Voloshin, 1996: 283). Critics, such as Howard Haycraft, questioned what led the 'human paradox', Poe, to forsake the Gothic terror and the morbid 'grotesquerie' of these tales 'for the cool

logic of the detective story' (1941). However, I would question the validity of this statement, as according to more recent critics, the detective narrative was formed as an extension to the Gothic novel and 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' with its graphic depictions of monstrous criminality and pervading foreboding is profoundly Gothic (Worthington, 2010: 17; Rzepka, 2005: 54). Consequently, it can be argued that Poe's detective fiction arises from the Gothic, a fiction of irrational emotion, which is stabilised by the rationale of the detective.

Joseph Wood Krutch, author of *Edgar Allan Poe: A Study in Genius* (1926), posits that 'Poe invented the detective story that he might not go mad' (in Haycraft, 1941). Events in Poe's life, leading up to 1841, including a number of professional setbacks, his wife's poor health and episodes of alcoholism, climaxed in his 'complete collapse and delirium' (Galloway, 2003). In 1841, George Rex Graham offered Poe a professional lifeline in the form of an editorial position at *Graham's Magazine*. Haycraft suggests that Poe, spurred by this opportunity, endeavoured to become 'the perfect reasoner, the embodiment of logic, the champion of mind over matter' (Haycraft, 1941). Consequently, Poe's departure into detective fiction enabled him to construct an 'absolute device of order' as an 'antidote' to 'counterbalance' and 'rationalise his own demons' (Lehman, 2001: 17). In effect, 'Dupin is Poe as Poe would like to see himself', an almost aspirational self (Lehman, 2001: 65). Ultimately, the change in 'the puppet', Poe's writing, 'reflects the change in the master' (Haycraft, 1941). Taking into consideration Poe's philosophical beliefs, what may appear to be a *transgression* into a new and incongruent type of writing, could be deemed a natural *progression*. As previously examined in Chapter 1, Poe valued the unity of the conflicting principles of Materialism and Idealism and, thus, the fields of physics and metaphysics. His detective trilogy personifies the resolution of these divergent beliefs,

with 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841), 'exemplifying...the physical type of detective story', 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842) focusing on the 'purely mental' process of reasoning and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) achieving a balance between the two methods of detection (Haycraft, 1941).

3. 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842) and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844): An Overview

The sequel to 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841), 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842), was published across three instalments in *Snowden's Ladies Companion.* The tale was a fictional account of the much publicised, ongoing investigation into the real-life murder of Mary Cecelia Rogers, in New York, on the 28th July, 1841. Poe transposed the New York setting to Paris, changed the victim's name to Marie Rogêt and used his 'fictive detective as a "pretence" for his own "rigorous analysis"' with the belief that his resolution would 'give renewed impetus' to the enquiry (Joswick, 2005: 241; Thoms, 140: 2002). 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842)*,* was, predominantly, received unfavourably by critics. Even a more recent critic like Rzepka notes that ''The Murders in the Rue Morgue' and 'The Purloined Letter' can be said to comprise the twin fountainheads of modern crime fiction' and 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842) is conspicuous by its absence (2005: 74).

'The Purloined Letter' (1844) was first published in the American Annual, *The Gift*, in 1844 and, unlike its predecessor, 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842), has been hailed as the 'best' of Poe's detective trilogy (Littell, 1845; Wadleigh Chandler, 1958: 531). In this tale, although the allegation that a crime has been committed is questionable, Dupin is charged with the task of retrieving a letter, which has been stolen from the

Queen by the Minister D___ with whom the detective is well acquainted with ('Purloined': 293). The importance of recovering this letter is that it provides evidence of the Queen's 'disloyalty to her husband, which the Minister has been using to blackmail her politically' (Kayman, 2003: 44). 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) has been deemed Poe's most complex and engaging detective tale and, as a result, has prompted much critical debate. John T. Irwin describes the tale as a 'parable of the art of analysis' and, as a result, the narrative forms a self-reflexive framework and represents the archetypal analytic detective story (1996: 3). However, the theme of examining the art of analysis was originally introduced in the first tale in Poe's detective trilogy, 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) and hence it deserves its place in the Poe canon.

'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) can be divided into two distinct parts thus formally introducing the recurrent theme of duality which permeates Poe's detective trilogy and detective fiction as a genre. In the first part of this dually structured narrative 'Poe sets forth the story's themes and presents an analogue for its structure' (Lemay, 1982: 168). In effect, Part One of the tale represents a decomposition of the process of analysis and provides a context for the mystery which follows.

4. Part One of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841): A Treatise on the Art of Analysis

Although Poe is quick to profess that he is not 'writing a treatise', Part One of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) is certainly reminiscent of a structured discourse on the art of analysis, illustrated using examples ('Murders': 141). This comprehensive examination of the process of analysis establishes Poe's intention from the start: that the method involved in deduction is what he values. By applying a rational method to a

creative process, from the outset, Poe makes clear the underlying philosophy of his notion of the 'creative and resolvent' 'Bi-Part Soul'. Poe demonstrated his regard for *process* over *effect* throughout his critical essays with 'Letter to B___' (1836), 'Eureka − (An Essay on the Material and Spiritual Universe)' (1848) and 'The Poetic Principle' (1850), all proposing a framework to assess the structure and value of an artistic form.

In this part of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) Poe describes the characteristics of the skilled analyst. He is 'preternatural' with an 'air of intuition' when he engages in the 'moral activity' of analysis ('Murders': 141). This language suggests a mystical quality and, as a result, introduces a prevalent dichotomy in detective fiction, that of the supernatural versus science. It is unclear throughout Poe's trilogy if his detective's superior analytical skills can be attributed to merely a proficiency in scientific reasoning or to a supernatural omnipotence. This dichotomy reflects the divergent values associated with Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul': the rationality of science and the irrationality of the supernatural. This dilemma is, also, indicative of nineteenth-century literature and reflects advances in the field of science which were superseding the previous dominance of religious thought (Noakes, 2004: 23; Rzepka, 2005: 114). Detective fiction since its conception has mirrored the society in which it was written, providing a vehicle for expression on the prevalent issues of the time. We see this notion in its infancy in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841).

Poe asserts that the analyst takes 'pleasure', the 'liveliest enjoyment', 'exults' and 'glories' in unravelling the 'enigmas', 'conundrums' and 'hieroglyphics' which a problem may present ('Murders': 141). This description resembles the technique and enjoyment associated with playing a game or solving a puzzle, which is a metaphor that continues throughout Poe's detective trilogy. He states that the process of analysis is

'invigorated by mathematical study' – yet Poe makes an important distinction – 'to calculate is not in itself to analyze' ('Murders': 142). He illustrates this point using the analogy of three games: chess, draughts and whist.

4.1 The Metaphor of 'Game Playing'

Chess is dismissed as a 'frivolous' game, whereby 'what is complex is mistaken...for what is profound' ('Murders': 142). This concept is, subsequently, applied to the incompetency of the methods of the Parisian police at a later stage in this tale. The variety of moves and pieces in chess means that it is highly convoluted, but victory is not achieved through skilful play but simply it is gained by those who 'concentrate' and are more 'attentive'; and defeat will be due to an 'oversight' ('Murders': 142). Nothing more than a retentive memory and an ability to 'proceed by the book' will ensure a victory in chess ('Murders': 142).

Draughts, however, makes use of the 'higher powers of the reflective intellect' and an advantage is obtained by the superior acumen of the player ('Murders': 142). In this respect, Poe equates the draughts player to the analyst and, later in the narrative, to his detective Dupin. The proficient draughts player must 'throw himself into the spirit' of his rival, identifying with him ('Murders': 142). By doubling the thought processes of his opponent the expert draughts player will 'seduce' his adversary into 'error' or 'miscalculation' ('Murders': 142). In order to outwit his opponent he must think like his opponent. This idea is fundamentally important in detective fiction and is developed in the third tale in Poe's trilogy, 'The Purloined Letter' (1844), when Dupin refers to marbles, as a 'game of "odd and even"', where success lies in 'observation and admeasurement of the astuteness of his opponents' ('Purloined': 290). Doubling is thus inherent in Dupin's method of detection: in 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) locating the

stolen letter depends upon the detective 'doubling' or 'matching wits' with his 'opponent's thought processes' or, as Poe puts it, the 'identification of the reasoner's intellect with that of his opponent' (Irwin, 1998: 32; 'Purloined': 291). This deductive method, therefore, relies on the supposition that the detective is 'capable of re-enacting the thoughts and feelings of the criminal' and, consequently, implies that 'imaginatively and vicariously, he *is* the criminal', as the detective 'partakes wholly in the psychology of the crime' (Moldenhauer, 1968: 294; Hodgeson, 1992: 312). This theme of the detective doubling the criminal powerfully manifests itself throughout 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) and the rest of Poe's trilogy and will be examined extensively throughout this Chapter.

Whist is the third game analysed and it more resolutely makes use of the 'calculating powers' which are inherent to the faculty of analysis ('Murders': 142). This is a game where 'mind struggles with mind' to find an advantage ('Murders': 142). An analyst plays the game by doing more than adhering to the 'rule book' ('Murders': 141). He 'examines', 'considers', 'notes', 'judges' and 'recognises' the minutiae of his opponent, assessing changes in countenance or facial expression ('Murders': 143). This process is almost scientific in nature but requires more than mere logic to be successful. Poe declares that the analyst must be 'ingenious' but notes that the ingenious are not always adept at analysis, declaring that some intelligent people can border on 'idiocy' ('Murders': 144).

Poe then proceeds to clarify the distinction between ingenuity and analytical ability and the difference between fancy and the imagination. The 'ingenious are always fanciful', whereas the 'truly imaginative never otherwise than analytic' ('Murders': 144). This brings us back to Poe's initial argument, that 'to calculate is not in itself to analyze'

('Murders': 141). This imperative manifests itself throughout Poe's detective trilogy and culminates in 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) when Dupin refers to his opponent, Minister D___, as 'a poet-mathematician' who 'As poet and mathematician would reason well' but 'as mere mathematician...could not have reasoned at all' ('Purloined': 295). Poe, therefore, demonstrates a respect for the 'combining power' of the imagination and reason throughout his detective trilogy and this dichotomy reflects the unification of his polar philosophical beliefs of Idealism and Materialism and is personified in the 'Bi-Part Soul' of his detective ('Murders': 144).

5. Part Two of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841): The Mystery of an Unsolved Crime

Part One of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841), discussed above, provides a context to enhance the reader's understanding of the mystery which follows. This preface equips us with a psychological profile for the superior analyst, one which we can apply to Poe's detective. It, also, serves as a tool to exalt Dupin's methods in the reader's mind before he is introduced. Part Two of this dually structured tale opens with an account of the detective and setting through the eyes of the narrator. The use of a companion to chronicle the successes of a fictional detective has since become a mainstay of the genre. Today, this dynamic is most closely associated with Arthur Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes and Doctor Watson.[16] The narrator provides a device by which explication can be vocalised externally for the benefit of the reader but he, also, creates a distance between the reader and the superior insights of the analytical mind of the detective, meaning that the mystery can be maintained. Ostensibly the dual

---

[16] Chapter 5 deals with Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes oeuvre and examines the Holmes-Watson dynamic.

role of the narrator in Poe's detective trilogy is to 'simultaneously reveal and withhold information' with the intention to function as a 'foil to Dupin's abilities' (Brantlinger, 1982: 20; Hoppenstand, 1987: 111).

5.1 The Setting

'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' is set in Paris during the spring and summer of an unidentified year in the nineteenth century. The American Poe set his Dupin trilogy in Paris, an appropriate location as it was the city associated with 'universal Reason, after the French Enlightenment' and 'the home of Romanticism' – Poe's 'Bi-Part' hero is as 'much a proponent of poetry as he is of abstract logic' (Durham, 2005: 130). The ambiguous reference to the year '18__' means that from the outset Poe's detective narrative has an abstract and mysterious quality ('Murders': 144). Dupin is introduced to us as a man from aristocratic parentage and an exalted station who due to a 'variety of untoward events' has been reduced to poverty ('Murders': 144). This misfortune means that he has 'ceased to care' and that the 'energy of his character has succumbed', leaving books as his sole luxury ('Murders': 144). Indeed, Dupin is the very antithesis of the powerful agent of justice which the reader anticipates.

This diminished Dupin first encounters the anonymous narrator in a library looking for the same rare volume of a book. We are provided with little detail about the narrator, aside from the fact that he enjoys the same pursuits as Dupin but is of a marginally more affluent financial position than the detective. Consequently, the narrator is able to rent and furnish a 'time-eaten and grotesque mansion...tottering to its fall in a retired and desolate area' for the pair to inhabit ('Murders': 145). In this mansion the detective and the narrator live in 'seclusion', with 'no visitors', 'existing within themselves', 'alone' and undisturbed, a solitary lifestyle made possible because Dupin had 'ceased to know

or be known in Paris' ('Murders': 145). The elusive nature of the detective means that he is presented as almost an illusion or a figment of the reader's mind. The narrator and Dupin live together in solitary darkness like 'madmen', by day, drawing the shutters at first light to cosset their 'souls in dreams – reading, writing or conversing' and, by night, leaving the house to delight in the pursuit of 'quiet observation' ('Murders': 145). Part One of this narrative states that the 'combined use' of the faculties of reason and imagination are inherent to the skills of the analyst and the detective and narrator's dual existence, which indulges the imagination in 'reading, writing or conversing' and exercises reason in 'observation', makes use of both these qualities and, resultantly, both aspects of Dupin's 'creative and resolvent' 'Bi-Part Soul' ('Murders': 144).

5.2 The Detective & his 'Bi-Part Soul'

The narrator describes the detective and his aptitude for observation, using nouns which are comparable to those used in relation to the analyst in the first part of this tale: 'excitement', 'delight' and 'pleasure' ('Murders': 145). Consequently, it is apparent that Dupin exemplifies the characteristics associated with the skilled analyst. Like the whist player, Dupin states that men wear 'windows in their bosoms' and that he is able to read their most intimate thoughts ('Murders': 146). The detective demonstrates a propensity to read the narrator's mind and Dupin is described during these episodes as 'frigid and abstract, his eyes vacant', with his voice rising to 'a treble' that has a 'deliberateness' and 'distinction of the enunciation' ('Murders': 146). Although these physical changes and the detective's insight into the narrator's thoughts suggest a spiritual possession, Dupin's method is essentially scientific and uses the techniques associated with the skilled whist player. By examining precisely, accurately and at length, a series of events, reactions, movements, gestures and postures, the detective

retraces psychological 'steps' from their 'starting point' through to their manifest action and is, therefore, able to decipher his companion's thoughts ('Murders': 147 & 148).

The detective's complex polar psychology, which alternates between 'excitement' and 'delight' and 'vacant' and 'aloof', prompts the narrator to introduce the notion of a 'double Dupin' with a 'Bi-Part Soul' ('Murders': 144 & 146). He remarks:

> Observing him in these moods, I often dwelt meditatively upon the old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul, and amused myself with the fancy of a double Dupin – the creative and resolvent ('Murders': 146).

This is a powerful and important statement. It consolidates the idea of 'duality' or the theme of the double which pervades Poe's detective trilogy and, subsequently, goes on to be a defining trope of the detective genre (Abrams, 2007: 112; Lehman, 2001: 94). In addition, it builds on Poe's earlier comments in Part One of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) on the 'combining power' of reason and the imagination ('Murders': 144).

The narrator, however, dismisses the notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' as being either romantic or mysterious but rather he attributes it to an 'excited, or perhaps diseased intelligence' ('Murders': 146). The anti-heroic nature of the fictional detective, bordering on madness, became a bastion of the detective genre. Dupin's idiosyncratic psychology and the unique methods of detection which he pioneered have been replicated in numerous withdrawn and quirky detectives throughout literature. The Victorian era alone conceived a range of complex detective characters such as Charles Dickens' Mr Bucket in *Bleak House* (1853), Wilkie Collins' Sergeant Cuff in *The*

Moonstone (1868) and Conan Doyle's quintessential sleuth, Sherlock Holmes (See Chapter 4 & 5). Dupin has created a psychological mould for maladjusted and multifaceted protagonists in detective fiction across the centuries to the present day; from Conan Doyle's Holmes and his penchant for cocaine at the turn of the nineteenth-century and through to the contemporary hard-drinking, and troubled anti-heroes of modern fiction, including Henning Mankell's Kurt Wallander and Ian Rankin's John Rebus.

The ability Dupin has to recount 'precisely' the narrator's most intimate thoughts, the mysterious identity of the narrator, the interests they share, combined with their 'common temper' means that they could, in fact, be two halves of a singular whole ('Murders': 145). J. A. Leo Lemay argues that 'Dupin is a Doppelgänger for the narrator' and qualifies this statement by asserting that, 'Dupin, of course, is the *analyst*; and the narrator, who tells the tale, is the *creator*...the *analyst* is simply the reverse of the *creator*' (emphasis added) (1982: 169). Thus, it can be argued that the narrator personifies the 'creative half' of the detective's dual psychology and, consequently, exists purely as a component of Dupin's divided self (Rosenheim, 1989: 391). The symbolic unity of the divided self, comprising of the *creator* and the *analyst*, is represented in the artistic and reasoned attributes of the detective's 'Bi-Part Soul'.

The allegory of the divided self is just as prevalent in the third tale of Poe's detective trilogy, 'The Purloined Letter' (1844). In this narrative the *opponent*, the Minister D___, and the *reasoner*, Dupin, have the same dual psychology, with the Minister being referred to as a 'poet-mathematician' which mirrors the notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul', used to describe the 'creative and resolvent' Dupin in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841). In addition both characters are 'authorial figures', 'share the initial D and they

both purloin the letter' (Thoms, 2002: 142). The likeness between Dupin and the Minister has prompted conjecture that they are a 'divided self', with the Minister being Dupin's 'specular double' thus presupposing a 'unity' between the criminal and the detective (Boyd, 1983: 153; Irwin, 1998, 35; Kennedy: 1996: 547). This idea expands upon doubts which have been previously raised in relation to Dupin's ambiguous moral character; a detective whose method relies on mirroring the thought processes of the criminal and who possesses a 'diseased intelligence' ('Purloined': 291; 'Murders': 146). In establishing a connection between the criminal and the detective, 'Poe proceeds to destabilise what he has wrought by challenging the apparent opposition between *good* detective and *bad* criminal' and as a consequence creates a compelling and contradictory dynamic of 'interdependence' between the villain and the agent of justice (Thoms, 2002: 142). 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) presents Minister D___ and Dupin as symbolic doubles, who represent 'opposing sides of the same self' and in doing so embodies Poe's notion of a 'double Dupin' (Kennedy, 1996: 547; 'Murders': 141). The emblematic irony whereby the detective and the criminal and, therefore, the 'hunter and hunted' are one, reflects Poe's personal conflict with posturing as 'detective, the hunter' when he 'was too radically the criminal, the prey' (Staton, 1987: 52; Wood, 1989).

Lemay argues that Poe's 'Bi-Part Soul' could, in fact, refer to a 'good and evil split' within the psyche (1982, 169). The paradigm of the dual nature of mankind is reflected in Poe's representation of the detective as a *doppelgänger* of the criminal and has been examined extensively in fictional texts such as Robert Louis Stevenson's *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* (1886) (See Chapter 4). Stevenson's tale explores the bifurcation of the human soul, which contains both 'the criminal and the moral self' (Dryden, 2003: 79). This notion is exemplified by the lack of distinction between the criminal and detective in Poe's Dupin tales. It will be demonstrated at a later stage how

the commonality between the criminal and the detective is as perceptible in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) as it is in the final tale in Poe's trilogy.

Although Dupin undoubtedly shaped a template for subsequent detective protagonists, his character has attracted mixed critical opinion. Irwin rebukes Dupin for being 'as thin as the paper he is printed on' (Irwin, 1998: 27). David Leham describes the detective as 'an idealised stand-in for his creator, a *vehicle* for Poe's wholly imaginary victory over the disastrous circumstances of his life' (Leham, 65: 2001). Whilst Henry Thomson refers to Dupin as 'the personification of analysis, the *mouthpiece* of the logical activity' Michael Wood poses the question, 'Is Dupin's mind a *proof* to read' or 'an *example*, a *commentary*...on more abstract propositions?' (emphasis added) (Thomson, 1978: 86; Wood, 1989: 29). The language used by critics to describe Dupin, 'vehicle', 'mouthpiece', 'proof', 'example' and 'commentary', reduces Poe's detective to an almost abstract entity, whereby the character, Dupin, ceases to exist and instead he becomes solely an agent for the process of analysis. However, this study, by presenting the complex and multifaceted concept of the 'Bi-Part Soul', which describes the 'psychic chameleon' Dupin, significantly challenges this idea (Rzepka, 2005: 88).

5.3 Doubling and the Theme of Duality

As discussed in Chapter 2, like Aristotle, Poe valued the unity of plot or the 'totality of effect' ('The Poetic Principle': 24). It is this imperative which provides the answer to why the notion of doubling is so prevalent in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841). The result of the intrinsic doubling which operates throughout this tale is that Poe was able to achieve this symbolic unity of effect. Doubling allowed Poe to attain 'aesthetic pleasure in the extraordinary unity of the tale's formal motifs and plot' (Lemay, 1982: 171).

At three o'clock in the morning the inhabitants of Quartier St Roch are disturbed by shrieks coming from the fourth story of a house in the Rue Morgue which is known to be occupied by Madame L'Espanaye and her daughter. Neighbours rush to the scene as the cries stop and hear 'two or more rough voices, in angry contention' ('Murders': 149). The door to Madame L'Espanaye's apartment is locked from the inside but it is soon discovered that both women have been brutally murdered. By balancing and deciphering the incongruities of the conflicting accounts presented by the witnesses, we learn that Madame and Mademoiselle L'Espanaye lived 'a retired life', with no visitors, and the shutters were always closed ('Murders': 151). This characterisation is distinctly similar to that of Dupin and the narrator, who 'admitted no visitors', closed all their shutters and lived in 'seclusion' ('Murders': 145). Consequently, it can be argued that the victims, Madame and Mademoiselle L'Espanaye, are the symbolic double of the divided self which is Dupin and the narrator (Lemay, 1982: 171). It is, therefore, evident that doubling operates at multiple levels in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841). However, this 'emphatic double pattern' becomes increasingly more apparent and morally questionable, when Dupin and the narrator, as a divided self, double not only the victims but, also, the criminals (Lemay, 1982: 171; Staton, 1987: 52). The witness accounts in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) provide differing versions of the two voices that were heard in 'angry contention' behind the doors of the locked room but it is collectively agreed that one was 'gruff' and the other 'shrill' ('Murders': 152). The dual nature of the criminal voice parallels Dupin's polar pitch which is 'usually a rich tenor' but in the grip of analysis rises 'into a treble' ('Murders': 146). It can be concluded, therefore, that all six characters in this tale are symbolic doubles, 'The murderer and those murdered, the solver of the mystery and the teller of the tale are, symbolically, all one' (Lemay, 1982: 170).

With its dual plot structure and pervading motif of doubling, 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) 'is like a hall of mirrors in which possible reflections, projections and identifications cannot be stabilized' (Lee, 1989: 372). Poe establishes a connectedness between the pursued and the pursuer, the victim and the criminal and the narrator and the detective and, consequently, in his detective's 'Bi-Part Soul' presents and explores the moral ambiguities of the twin nature of the human consciousness.

Similar to 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) symbolic unity manifests itself as conspicuously in Poe's final tale in his trilogy, 'The Purloined Letter' (1844). This narrative could be viewed as purely an exercise in achieving the totality of effect. The 'abstract' nature of the tale, where all the main characters, excluding Dupin, are 'unnamed' or 'rendered as initials –'Minister D—' purloins the letter to blackmail this exalted 'personage' and hides it from 'Prefect G—' means that the plot is reduced, in effect, 'to an algebraic equation or geometric proof' or, as Poe suggests, 'a game of odd and even' (Rzepka, 2005: 75). The structure and content of 'The Purloined Letter' (1844), exemplifies the theme of game playing which permeates the Dupin trilogy. Poe's exploration of the idea of a 'rationally ordered and morally coherent universe' meant that he foreshadowed postmodernist thought and over a century after it was published, 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) was at the focus of French poststructuralist discussion (Hirsch, 1996: 410).

Poststructuralism, associated with critics such as Michel Foucault (1926-1984) and Jacques Derrida (1930 – 2004), is a weighty and complex theoretical formulation and the poststructuralist debate which focused on 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) is deserving of a thesis in itself. What follows represents an overview of the main contentions of this

debate and makes use of John T. Irwin's Chapter 'Lacan, Derrida, and Johnson on 'The Purloined Letter'' (1996). Three essays formed the centre of this discussion: Jacques Lacan's 'Seminar on the 'Purloined Letter'' (1956), Jacques Derrida's response to this Seminar 'The Purveyor of Truth' (1975) and Barbara Johnson's 'The Frame of Reference: Poe, Lacan, Derrida' (1977) which balanced the polar views of Lacan and Derrida (Hirsch, 1996: 410; Irwin: 1996: 3). Ostensibly, controversy was generated by differing opinions on the 'numerical/geometrical structure' of 'The Purloined Letter' (Irwin, 1996: 3). Lacan posits that the tale can be split into two scenes, each with a 'triangular structure' (Irwin, 1996: 5). Derrida, however, argues that the 'structure of the scenes are not triangular but quadrangular' (Irwin, 1996: 5). Derrida's main opposition, as Johnson observes, to Lacan's supposition of a triangular configuration of these two scenes, is that Lacan's theory attempts to 'ignore or absorb the uncanny effects of doubling', doubling being a 'standard element of the analytic detective story' and implicit in 'The Purloined Letter' (Irwin, 1996: 5). The prominence of the motif of the double, the theme of duality and the metaphor of the 'Bi-Part Soul' means that anything other than a biangular or quadrangular structure would seem unlikely.

The notion of doubling in the analytic detective story is further exemplified by the textual relationship between Poe's trilogy and Jorge Luis Borges' three detective stories, 'The Garden of the Forking Paths' (1941), 'Death and the Compass' (1942) and 'Ibn Hakkan al-Bokhari, Dead in His Labyrinth' (1951). Borges' tales were published a century after Poe's detective trilogy and were an explicit device for the 'antithetical doubling' of the original analytic detective canon, with the intention of exploring the numerical contentions of the 'triangular/quadrangular labyrinth' laid down in 'The Purloined Letter' (Irwin, 1995: 139).

Ultimately, Poe's third and final tale in the Dupin trilogy consolidated the analytic detective form as a 'game of odd and even', one-upmanship and the outwitting of one's opponent. This is epitomised by Dupin and the Minister, whether they are viewed as two parts of the same whole, striving to succeed in outwitting the other and the critical reflection which doubles this process, with Derrida and Lacan, in their analysis of this tale, attempting to surpass the other (Irwin, 1996: 5). 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) encouraged a preoccupation with 'reflection, repetition, and the blurring of boundaries' in subsequent detective fiction (Thoms, 2002: 142). It has been demonstrated that these themes were evident from the very start of Poe's detective trilogy and were established in the dual structure, character doubling and 'Bi-Part' detective of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841).

5.4 The Method in the Solution: 'When you have eliminated all the possibilities then whatever remains, however improbable, must be the truth'- Sherlock Holmes

In 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) Dupin notes that it is the 'outré' nature of the case which is confounding the government agents. Because the case deviates from 'the ordinary' the police are bewildered. They are overanalysing the peculiar aspects of the mystery and, consequently, the merely unusual has been mistaken for the impossible. However, Dupin claims that this is when reason functions best in the pursuit of truth. The solution lies in asking the question 'what has occurred that has never occurred before?' ('Murders': 159). The very features of the case which perplex the police are precisely the opposite for the analyst; they illuminate the truth. The detective divulges that it was in focusing on the peculiar elements of the case, the unusual nature of the shrill voice overheard in Madame L'Espanaye's chambers, that he was able to decipher the events which led to the crime. When reason eliminates all the possibilities what is left are the impossibilities and Dupin posits that these 'apparent

impossibilities must be proved to be not such in reality' ('Murders': 162). This famous 'dictum-by-inference', vocalised succinctly by Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes, has since become a mantra for the genre that 'when you have eliminated all the possibilities then whatever remains, however improbable, must be the truth' (Haycraft, 1941). The detective dispels the idea of coincidence, asserting that it contradicts the authority of the superior theory of probability. In the second tale in Poe's trilogy, 'The Mystery of Marie Rogêt' (1842), Dupin introduces the 'doctrine of chance' whereby chance is made a 'matter of absolute calculation' ('Mystery': 141). This principle is an extension of the notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and it relies upon the *rational* use of the *imagination* to predict the 'aesthetic necessity of design and pre-conceived effect' thus establishing a 'reciprocity' between the opposing principles of 'chance and calculation' (Joswick, 2005: 242).

The evidence suggests, however improbably, that an 'Ourang-Outang' from India, owned by a French sailor, was responsible for the murders. This literary representation of the criminal as an animal from colonial India can be examined using two critical perspectives; firstly the animal half of the criminal body could be symbolic of the beast within the divided self, reflecting the dual nature of humanity, both good and monstrous. This is a trope which is explored consistently throughout not only detective fiction but in fiction in its entirety. For example, this motif is examined with profound effect in Robert Louis Stevenson's Gothic novella *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* (1886). Secondly, representing the criminal as an Indian beast could be construed, in a political reading, as a Western author's problematic representation of the colonial other. The close association between the 'foreign body with the criminal body' in nineteenth-century literature reflects the colonial discourse of the nineteenth century (Thomas, 2004: 208). This 'culturally bound way of conceiving of the East as exotic,

cruel, sensual and barbaric' was symptomatic of the time and attempted to legitimise the Western subjugation of their Eastern colonies (Thompson, 1993: 69). These disparate readings of the portrayal of the criminal as a colonial animal may not be entirely mutually exclusive; at the time the West urgently needed to contain the supposedly more animalistic, barbaric other and, as a result, nineteenth-century fiction served as a vehicle to assuage these 'imperial anxieties' by constructing the Western self as rational and particularly 'human' (McLaughlin, 2000: 29). The colonial discourse deployed in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' reinforces the notion of detective fiction as a reflection of the socio-historical context in which it was written.

5.5 Dénouement

Dupin discloses that he has set a trap for the sailor by placing an advert in the newspaper stating that he has found the 'Ourang- Outang'. The dénouement, takes place when the sailor appears at Dupin's residence and corroborates the detective's deductions. The case is solved and Dupin has 'defeated' the 'blundering' Parisian police ('Murders': 166). The end of the tale comes full circle bringing us back to the analogy of game playing which was examined during the first part of the narrative. Dupin reproaches the Prefect of the Parisian police for being 'too cunning to be profound', which mirrors the game of chess where 'what is complex is mistaken for what is profound' ('Murders': 176 & 142). The detective, also, rebukes the Prefect's 'wisdom' for being 'all head and no body' which relates to the detective's earlier supposition that 'the ingenious are always fanciful, and the *truly* imaginative never otherwise than analytic' ('Murders': 176 & 144). The Prefect's reasoning is too 'fanciful' to be successful. It is through the combined use of both aspects of the 'Bi-Part Soul', the 'head' and the 'body' and their associated faculties of the imagination and reason, that the detective was able to outwit his opponent.

Dupin holds that truth is 'superficial'; it lies in what physically exists, but the Prefect's 'fanciful' mind has overcomplicated the case, consequently, rejecting the explicit evidence ('Murders': 156). The tale ends with a French phrase, '*de nier ce qui est, et d'expliquer ce qui n'est pas*', which describes the Prefect's flawed desire to 'deny what is and explain what is not' ('Murders': 176). The conclusion of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) represents the culmination of the ideas Poe has discussed throughout his tale. The tale contrasts the creative reasoning of Dupin's 'Bi-Part Soul', which is open to all possibilities, with the constrained and rigidly formulaic mind of the Prefect. Like Dupin, dénouement is achieved for Poe, when his theory is corroborated. Poe's intention was to demonstrate that successful reasoning relies on the unified use of the faculties associated with his divergent philosophical beliefs. In his detective fiction and through Dupin, Poe, therefore, was able to demonstrate how the dichotomy of Idealism and Materialism could reach an accomplished resolution in the form of his 'Bi-Part' detective.

Duality is implicit in the structure and characterisation of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841). It is visible in the tale's twin plot, the divided self which is the narrator and Dupin, the doubling of the criminals, victims and detective and most prominently the detective's 'creative and resolvent' 'Bi-Part Soul'. Dupin's dual psychology is associated with moral ambiguity and a blurring of boundaries which, consequently, has shaped a compelling psychosomatic template for a genre of multifaceted and complex detective protagonists. The following Chapter will examine the significance of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and duality in the British, nineteenth-century fiction which anticipates a distinct detective genre. The presence of Dupin's 'Bi-Part' mould will be illustrated by examining Charles Dickens' Mr Bucket and Wilkie Collins'

Sergeant Cuff, along with Robert Louis Stevenson's explication of the motif of the

double in his Gothic novella Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde (1886).

Chapter 4

Duality and the 'Bi-Part Soul' in Nineteenth-Century British Fiction

Although nineteenth-century literature predates a definite classification of the detective narrative, this Chapter presents an overview of the literary and socio-economic events in Britain during this period which stimulated and shaped the evolution of the genre (Priestman, 2003: 2; Rzepka, 2005: 73). Opposing arguments that the roots of detective fiction can be found much earlier in the Gothic texts of the eighteenth-century will be discussed at a later stage in this section. This Chapter first provides a historical background of policing systems in Europe, demonstrating how the fiction of the time reflects the changes and issues associated with these structures. This is followed by a discussion of the evolution of the crime and detective narrative, examined using two prevalent sub-genres from the Victorian period: the Newgate novel and Sensation fiction. These provide a prologue for what is to come in the crime/detective narrative and a novel from each sub-genre illustrates their associated characteristics: Charles Dickens' *Bleak House* (1853) and Wilkie Collins' *The Moonstone* (1868). Themes initiated and explored by Poe such as the 'Bi-Part Soul' and the dual nature of mankind will be examined in these texts and the trope of the divided self is consolidated in a discussion of Robert Louis Stevenson's novella, *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* (1886).

1. A History of Policing in Europe

It is important to acknowledge that in Britain a state-funded and regulated police force or an official detective role did not exist until the nineteenth century. It is no surprise, therefore, that detective fiction in Britain did not exist until well into the nineteenth century. In France a state run policing structure was in operation from the seventeenth-century which by the nineteenth-century had a defined detective department lead by Eugène François Vidocq (1775 – 1857) (Worthington, 2010: 18). This could account for Poe setting his Dupin trilogy in France, a place associated with well -established policing and detection. Vidocq started out life as a criminal, became an informer in prison and went on to lead the Sûreté Nationale which was founded in 1812. The Sûreté, 'or security force, was conceived by Vidocq and was composed of ex-criminals like himself' who carried out detective work (Worthington, 2010: 18). The autobiographical account *Memoirs de Vidocq* (1828-9) chronicles the pursuits of the eponymous Chief of the Sûreté who was both 'criminal and agent of the law' (Worthington, 2010: 18).

It is evident that the first and most renowned real-life detective lived a dual life, originally, as pursued but, ultimately, as pursuer. As discussed in Chapter 3, Poe's Parisian fictional detective Dupin represents the *doppelgänger* of the thief Minister D___ in 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) and, also, in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' the detective personifies the symbolic double of the murderers. In his detective fiction, Poe uses repetition and reversal to examine the commonality between the detective and the criminal and, therefore, establishes a compelling dynamic of 'connectedness' between these polar functions (Thoms, 2002: 142). The theme of the divided self, both good and evil, permeates detective fiction and was almost certainly inspired by the

moral ambiguity at the core of real-life police work which is exemplified by the once

criminal, Chief of the Sûreté, Vidocq.

In Britain, the Metropolitan Police was established by Sir Robert Peel[17] in 1829 and it

was not until 1842 that a plain clothes detective force was created (Dempsey, 2009: 6).

Before this, with no state regulated police force in operation, it was left to private

groups of individuals, often criminals themselves, to carry out police work. The 'thief

takers' were 'men paid to track down criminals for a fee': the most renowned was the

'thief taker General of Great Britain', Jonathan Wilde, who was 'both thief and thief-

taker' and operated during the seventeen-twenties (Worthington, 2010: 17; Dempsey,

2009: 6; Wales, 2001: 68). Wilde was known for his dubious and corrupt practices and

was not averse to framing the innocent if the reward was substantial enough. In 1749 a

retired Magistrate at the Bow Street Court, Henry Fielding, [18] established an embryonic

police force which carried out 'official police work' connected to the court and who

were referred to as 'The Bow Street Runners' (Worthington, 2010: 17). Consequently,

Fielding founded the basis of the first British policing unit (Dempsey, 2009: 8). The

lack of a centralized police force up until 1829 meant that Britain's judicial system was

highly flawed and corrupt in nature. British Law was governed by 'an unregulated

system of quasi-criminal thief takers' who posed as 'shabby defenders' of the

constitution (Reitz, 2000: 190). The integrity of the criminal justice system was highly

questionable and the dubious nature of the judicial system permeated the fictional plots

and characters conceived at the time such as Charles Dickens' *Bleak House* (1853).

---

[17] Sir Robert Peel (1788 – 1850) was an eminent Conservative member of parliament serving as Prime
Minister during 1834.
[18] Henry Fielding (1707 – 1754) was the author of a number of farces, operas, comedies and contentious
satirical plays but was, also, a journalist, editor and legal campaigner. Most recognisably Fielding wrote
The History of Mr. Jonathan Wild the Great (1723) and *The History of Tom Jones, a Foundling (*1749).

2. The Roots of the Detective Narrative

The Victorian era was crucial in establishing the firm roots of a distinct genre of detective fiction. Some, such as Maurizio Ascari, have made counter arguments suggesting that revenge tragedies, urban mysteries and Gothic narratives influenced the formation of the detective novel long before the fiction of the nineteenth-century (2007). Retrospectively it is possible to identify the tropes now associated with the detective narrative in the 'secrets, hidden passages and decaying castles' of Gothic eighteenth-century texts such as Ann Radcliffe's *The Mysteries of Udolpho* (1794) (Worthington, 2010: 13). Charles Rzepka, amongst others, has cited Radcliffe's Gothic novel and its heroine Emily St Aubert as a 'detective story prototype' (2005: 10). In addition, supported by Heather Worthington, Rzepka asserts the pre-eminence of William Godwin's *Caleb Williams* (1794), or as it was initially entitled *Things as They Are,* as one of the first British 'detective' novels (Worthington, 2010: 17; Rzepka, 2005: 54). This 'quasi-Gothic' text features 'a murder, a cover up, and the framing and execution of two innocent people' with the protagonist, Caleb, initially representing the 'proto-detective' but, ultimately, the 'criminal' (Worthington, 2010: 17; Rzepka, 2005: 54). Williams determines that the crime was committed by the wealthy landowner Falkland and in this respect *Caleb Williams* (1794) represents a political comment on the corruption of the English aristocracy and a scathing attack on the flawed English judiciary system at the time. Williams' contradictory role of criminal and detective emulated the moral ambiguity of the 'thief takers' who represented British law and, in doing so, explored the duality of humankind. This theme evolved to define the detective genre.

In these early examples of the detective narrative it is clear that fact and fiction intertwine significantly. This notion is even more apparent in Daniel Defoe's semi-

biographical account *The True and Genuine Account of the Life and Actions of the Late Jonathan Wild* (1725). Worthington argues that a 'prototype' for the crime genre is evident even earlier than the Gothic texts of the late eighteenth century in this factual account of the life of the notorious 'thief taker' Jonathan Wilde (Worthington, 2010: 17). This text recounts the exploits of Wilde's 'dual career as simultaneously thief and quasi-detective' and makes use of a 'novelistic style and structure' (Worthington, 2010: 17). The tropes of the detective genre can, therefore, be traced to the biographical accounts of real-life policing individuals such as Jonathan Wilde and Vidocq and the Gothic novel but it will be demonstrated how popular magazines and periodicals were responsible for consolidating these ideas and forming a basis for the crime novel.

Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine was created in 1812 and featured morbid and grotesque, fictional short stories where criminal activity was pervasive. These narratives were referred to as 'Blackwood's *Tales of Terror'* and in these we can trace the ancestry of the themes which define the crime novel. In America, Britain's Gothic movement was reflected in the work of eighteenth century American author Charles Brockden Brown and American journals were being modelled on their British contemporaries (Hartmann, 2008: 108). Due to the economic crisis in early nineteenth-century America, the production, distribution and marketing of print material was inefficient and backward. Consequently, the market was flooded with reprints of British periodicals and fiction (Hartmann, 2008: 6). Best-selling European writers were easier to market and cheaper to produce, given the lack of international copyright laws at the time, therefore, 'America looked abroad, mainly to the parent country, for its best-sellers and literary models. Edgar Allan Poe was no exception to this rule, but he also paid attention to literary and scientific developments in France' (Rzepka, 2005: 72). This 'Transatlantic Reprint Culture' meant that British literature and critical opinion

significantly influenced and shaped American culture at the time (Hartmann, 2008: 6).

Notably, 'Blackwood's *Tales of Terror'* were reproduced in a number of American journals and Poe demonstrated his reading of this British work in his parody *How to Write a Blackwood Article* (1838) (Hartmann, 2008: 108; Worthington, 2010: 17). British fiction and criticism almost certainly influenced Poe and, conversely, his authority is profoundly demonstrated in British nineteenth-century fiction, principally in Conan Doyle's Holmes, who was made in the 'Bi-Part' mould of Poe's Dupin (See Chapter 5).

The 'penny dreadful' or 'shilling shockers' of the mid-to-late-nineteenth century continued the trend which was initiated by the macabre *'*Blackwood's *Tales of Terror'* (See the following part if this Chapter). Due to the widespread circulation and mass appeal of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, the criminal behaviour they explored was commercial and accessible and, as a result, soon found its way into the British nineteenth-century novel, firstly in the Newgate novel and then in Sensation fiction.

3. The Newgate Novel and Sensation Fiction (1830 -1868)

The majority of fiction in some way reflects the opinion and circumstance of the society in which it is written. As Kenneth Walder asserts 'every literary work inevitably draws from, as it also influences, its social environment; but...that novels in the nineteenth century saw themselves as particularly engaged with the events, circumstances, beliefs and attitudes of their time' (Walder, 2001: v). The Victorian era saw Britain strengthen its imperial, industrial, technological and economic position and was, therefore, a point in history associated with significant social and political change and the novel represented a means to evaluate and critique this shifting society. The 'social changes

associated with the Industrial Revolution; the unprecedented urban development, the transformation of the English economy from a rural to an industrial base' meant the novel 'adapted to the representation and exploration of social change' (Walder, 2001: v; Loughlin-Chow, 2002: 72). The Industrial Revolution gave rise to new 'problems of urban living', including a substantial increase in population and, consequently, a rise in poverty levels and criminal behaviour (Walder, 2001: v). Before 1829, when the Metropolitan Police were established, the lack of a sufficient and robust policing and judicial system to deal with this increase in criminal activity meant that the Victorian era was a time associated with universal anxiety and mistrust and these feelings are firmly embedded in the literature conceived during this period. This unease and suspicion only intensified when the detective branch of the police force was established in the eighteen-forties, thus creating 'A world in which everyone was potentially a criminal' where 'everyone became a detective or a suspect' (Pykett, 2003: 34).

Due to the great social and political unrest which characterises nineteenth-century Britain, it is widely thought that two sub-genres of crime literature emerged as a response to 'cultural anxieties and social and literary change at two key points in the Victorian period' (Pykett, 2003: 19). These literary forms were referred to as the Newgate novel, which was a literature of social change brought about as a consequence of the Industrial Revolution, and Sensation fiction, which evolved as a reaction to the formation of the detective branch of the Metropolitan Police in the eighteen-forties. Although the two sub-genres preceded a definitive classification of detective fiction, they were precursors to the development of a distinct detective genre and their influence cannot be overlooked.

Although both the Newgate and Sensation novel engendered controversy and fuelled fierce debate amongst critics, they were popular at different times of the century and each had their own distinguishing features. Newgate novels were the prevailing work of fiction in the eighteen-thirties and forties and 'were the principal literary expressions of early nineteenth-century British reform' and a response to 'social upheaval and unrest' (David, 2001: 173; Pykett, 2003: 21). These novels took their name and, at times, plot and characters, from the Newgate Calendar, which chronicled the current real-life crimes, trials and criminal biographies of the prisoners in London's Newgate Prison (Pykett, 2003: 20; Worthington: 2010, 13). Controversially, these novels positioned the criminal as the hero of the narrative which meant that this sub-genre was received with equal amounts of enthusiasm and disdain. Critics condemned the Newgate novel for either portraying a 'romanticised and glamorised' fiction of crime, as in the case of William Ainsworth's *Rookwood* (1834) and *Jack Sheppard* (1839), or depicting criminals as victims of circumstance or societal failings as in Edward Bulwer-Lytton's *Eugene Aram* (1832). Consequently, it was believed that the Newgate novel resulted, at best, in inciting 'sympathy' and, at worst, actually promoting vice (Pykett, 2003: 20; Harrison et al, 2006: 54).

The narrator in the Newgate novel ceased to represent a moral arbiter but instead was used as a tool 'to explore and share a criminal character's perspective' thus creating empathy with the morally dubious 'criminal-hero' (Grossman, 2002: 141). The protagonist's dual role as both villain and hero resembles Poe's doubling of the detective and criminal in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) (See Chapter 3). The motif of the divided self, prevalent in Poe's detective trilogy, is evident in the 'tangled psychology' of the Newgate protagonists who present a 'blurred vision of vice and virtue' (Grossman, 2002: 143). The duality of

mankind where both good and evil co-exist and intertwine is a prominent theme in Victorian fiction and is profoundly evident in the Newgate novel but, significantly, went on to shape the detective narrative.

Prominent Newgate authors of the time included Edward Bulwer, William Harrison Ainsworth, William Thackeray and, although a matter of dispute, Charles Dickens. Dickens strongly refuted critical claims of an association with the Newgate novel, declaring that his narratives were the very antithesis of the genre. Rather than glorifying vice Dickens claims in the Preface to *Oliver Twist* (1838) to show humankind 'in all their deformities, in all their wretchedness, in all the squalid misery of their lives; to show them as they really are' (in Harrison et al, 2006: 54). The 'notoriety' of the Newgate novel generated an abundance of discussion and controversy in 'both literary and social' contexts (Pykett, 2003: 20).

The proliferation of print forms and a growth in literacy levels, as a consequence of the Industrial Revolution, meant that social and literary hierarchies were in the midst of being re-established (Pykett, 2003: 31). This resulted in the propagation of new types of fiction such as the 'penny dreadful' and the 'shilling shocker' whose readership was in the main 'confined to the working class' (Pittard, 2010: 106). These tales, which featured crime and Gothic horror, 'were descendants of *The Newgate Calendar*' and likewise this mode of writing 'apparently turned its readers to crime' by glorifying criminal behaviour (Pittard, 2010: 106).

Some critics believed that the Newgate novel and the 'penny dreadful' 'imported the literature of the streets...to the drawing room' (Pykett, 2003: 32). It is, therefore, unsurprising that when the Sensation novel was conceived in the eighteen-sixties, which

actually placed crime at the heart of the middle and upper class family home, it was met with outrage. As Christopher Pittard states, 'The sensation novel marked the shift of crime narratives from the public space of the streets and slums to the private realm of the family home' and, therefore, explores the criminal behaviour of respectable society, uncovering their hidden secrets (Pittard, 2010: 107). This premise is supported by Lyn Pykett who acknowledges that, 'The sensation novel did not depict the criminal underworld but rather it explored the dark underside of respectable society' where 'the family is the locus of the crime' (Pykett, 2003: 34). The authors and plots of the Sensation novel are prone to some overlap with the Newgate novel but 'One of the more important differences between sensation fiction and the Newgate novel is the shift of focus from crime to detection' (Pykett, 2003: 34). This change in narrative focus, and the move to the middle-class home as the location of the crime, may be in response to the conception of the plain clothes detective department of The Metropolitan Police in 1842 and a growing level of state surveillance which inspired mistrust that permeated all classes in society (Pykett, 2003: 44).

The term 'Sensation' was coined by Margaret Oliphant (1828 – 1897) in an essay which appeared in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* and was applied to the type of plot 'where a long train of carefully prepared hints, suggestions, and implications is laid down' with an intent to 'reveal some dreadful secret' (Rzepka, 2005: 11). It is significant to note that the format of the Sensation narrative, therefore, conforms to what we now recognise as the detective formula. Sensation fiction, similar to the Newgate novel, was established as a reaction to changes in legal structures and social feeling, and formed a 'means of articulating and managing universal suspicion on which modern urban society was founded' (Pykett, 200: 35). Subsequently, these novels were primarily 'concerned with proving innocence, than with proving guilt' (Thoms, 1998:

51). LeRoy Panek posits that the Sensation novel initiated the exploration of 'detective themes and detectives', in texts such as Mary Elizabeth Braddon's *Lady Audley's Secret* (1862) which discusses the 'nature of evidence' (Panek, 1987: 54 & 59). This book, like all Sensation novels, challenges Victorian preconceptions of perfect domesticity and raises questions on the unstable nature of identity and gender roles in an altering society.

Critics responded to the Sensation novel with the same contempt with which they regarded its earlier counterpart, the Newgate novel, condemning it for being both a 'cause and symptom of social corruption' (Pykett, 2003: 36). The novel's opponents extrapolated that the popularity of Sensation fiction was an indication of 'an emerging disease' within society (Deane, 2003: 68). Ultimately, what the Sensation novel did do was vocalise mounting anxieties over the growing surveillance power of the state and paved the way for the emergence of detective fiction which signified a means to manage and control these concerns (Worthington, 2010). The following examination of Charles Dickens' *Bleak House* (1853) and Wilkie Collins' *The Moonstone* (1868) reveals how the themes explored in Newgate and Sensation fiction form a basis for the conception of a distinct detective genre in the late nineteenth-century.

3.1 *Bleak House* by Charles Dickens (1853)

Although Dickens disputed his association with both the Newgate and Sensation novel, the influence his books have had on the evolution of the detective genre cannot be doubted. *Bleak House,* published in 1853, has been recognised as one of the first novels in which a detective plays a significant role. Dickens' novel has been cited as a social

criticism of the time and focuses predominantly on the English Chancery system,[19] powerfully demonstrating the heritage of a now established connection between detective fiction and social commentary. Dickens' satire of the arcane and dishonest justice system articulated the frustrations of Victorian society, at a time when the Chancery was on the brink of reform (Galloway, 1997). The dead and defective nature of the justice system, situated at the core of Victorian morality, contaminated society in its entirety, infecting *Bleak House* with 'corruption and disease' (Galloway, 1997). Doreen Roberts asserts that the 'Social blindness, ignorance, irresponsibility and disconnection' penetrating this narrative, vividly manifests itself in the ever present fog (2001: xiii). *Bleak House* was received by its Victorian audience 'as a campaigning work addressed to social and institutional problems' prevalent at the time (Roberts, 2001: xviii). Geoffrey Tillotson concurs with this premise when he states that 'Dickens took advantage of his place in time...his novels abound in topicalities' (1964: 893 & 891).

There is some evidence to suggest that Dickens may have been directly influenced by Poe's work; in 1844, when visiting Philadelphia, Dickens met twice with Poe and the pair corresponded regularly (Van Dover, 2005: 166; Barger, 2008: 546). Similar to detective fiction, social commentary permeates *Bleak House* and this novel also reflects the notion of duality and the divided self which Poe explored during his detective trilogy. The 'effect of division and discontinuity' in *Bleak House* is communicated by 'its double plot, double time-scheme and double narrative' (2001: vii). Dickens' unique structure of using two narrators allows the reader to contrast the main character Esther's subjective perception of 'private and domestic life' with the objective, anonymous, third person narrative exploring 'themes of economic interconnectedness and social criticism'

---

[19] Chancery or equity courts represented half of the nineteenth-century justice system and operated alongside the law courts.

(Galloway, 1997). Joseph I. Fradin eloquently refers to 'the double narrative technique' in *Bleak House* as 'the dialect between self and society, between Esher's subjective vision and the nervous chaos-without-meaning that is the third person world' (Fradin, 1966: 95). The division of the narrative reflects a 'tension' between Esther's idealism and the opposing realism portrayed by the third person narrator (Higbie, 1998: 112). This conflict relates to Poe's opposing philosophical beliefs of subjective Idealism and objective Materialism which is embodied by the notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' (See Chapter 1 & 2). The dual structure and content of *Bleak House* (1853) personifies the 'contradiction' in Victorian perspective on the role of society and the individual and the division between 'public and private worlds' (Roberts, 2001: v; Galloway, 1997). Doreen Roberts posits that the allure of the mystery plot for the Victorian novelist was that the form acted as a vehicle 'for contrasting a character's public face with his secret consciousness' (Roberts, 2001: xi). This polarity of the private and public self is a concept which Wilkie Collins went on to explore in his novel *The Moonstone* (1868) and, subsequently, became a common theme in the detective genre.

Ultimately, what allows critics to establish a firm connection between *Bleak House* and detective fiction is the presence of Mr Bucket, a detective who solves the murder of Mr Tulkinghorn. The 'composed, sure, confident' Mr Bucket who is 'steady looking' and 'sharp eyed' is distinctly similar to Poe's detective of 'ratiocination', Dupin (*Bleak House:* 1242 & 526).   Indeed, the influential periodical *Putnam's Monthly* critiqued Mr Bucket for being 'hardly better than a talking watch-dog – a creature without nerves, passions or emotions – whose sole aim is to do his duty' (1853: 560). The same evaluation was bestowed upon Poe's Dupin who was referred to by John T. Irwin as 'thin as the paper he is printed on' (Irwin, 1998: 27). In contrast, Irene Morra asserts that the brilliance of the literary detective is in his ability to 'distance' himself 'from the

social concerns of others' so that a 'greater objectivity of observation' can be achieved (2004: 153). Dissociation from the emotional context of a situation is a common character trait amongst the fictional detective, evident not only in Poe's Dupin but later in Collins' Sergeant Cuff and Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes (Morra, 2004: 154). Morra asserts that Conan Doyle's *A Study in Scarlet* (1887) 'expends a considerable amount of time both presenting and parodying the figure of Inspector Bucket' (2004: 154). The eccentricities of Mr Bucket are moulded by Dickens' 'power to make fantastic comic allegory out of the actions of a detective whose index finger is much in evidence' (Tillotson, 1964: 889). Mr Bucket and his 'finger are in much conference' during *Bleak House*, with engaging references to the workings of 'the finger' comically punctuating the text (*Bleak House:* 1221 &1258). The unusual characteristics of the nineteenth-century fictional detective laid the foundations for the conception of similarly unconventional and dysfunctional detectives throughout subsequent centuries.

Although *Bleak House* would technically not be classified as detective fiction, the universal suspicion which permeates the narrative means that each character performs the function of detective. This novel, therefore, has had a significant impact on shaping the detective novel, establishing themes now inherent to the genre. Dickens and his contemporary Wilkie Collins shared a strong friendship and professional relationship and, consequently, Collins' work was greatly indebted to Dickens' influence. The publication of Collins' *The Moonstone* (1868) built upon the detective tropes laid down by Poe in his detective trilogy (1841 – 1844) and by Dickens in *Bleak House* (1853) and, as a result, signified a momentous transition towards a distinct detective genre (Lonoff, 1980: 151).

3.2 *The Moonstone* by Wilkie Collins (1868)

Wilkie Collins in his novels *The Woman in White* (1859) and *The Moonstone* (1868) 'turned the Sensation novel towards something more like the real detective story' (Panek, 1987: 59). *The Moonstone* has been described by T.S. Eliot as 'The first, the longest, and the best of modern English detective novels' (in Panek, 1987: 58). It tells the story of the theft of a cursed sacred Indian diamond from the Verinder's family home and much like Victorian societal feeling at the time, each character embodies both detective and suspect (Pykett, 2003: 44). Collins' *The Moonstone* was, therefore, 'pioneering in the field' of detective fiction and has been referred to as a 'prototypical English detective novel' (Ashley, 1951: 60; Thomas, 2006: 66). Indeed, Nicholas Rance acknowledges Collins as the 'king of inventors' and 'the grand inaugurator of the vogue' (1991: 1).

J. K. Van Dover states that 'Collins was certainly influenced by Poe' and this premise is reinforced by the implicit unity between the tropes which dominate both Poe's Dupin trilogy and Collins' *The Moonstone* (Van Dover, 2005: 166). In this novel, Collins uses a variety of detective fiction 'stock devices', which Poe employed previously in his detective tales, such as 'multiple equally plausible suspects', 'red-herrings' or 'false scents' as they are described by Collins and the 'pseudo-epistolary technique' of presenting a collection of viewpoints and opinions which ultimately climaxes in the triumph of law and order (Panek, 1987: 61; Collins, 1986: 210; Ashley, 1951: 54). Aside from these shared practical dynamics of a detective plot, Charles Rzepka posits that Collins in *The Moonstone* explicates his 'interest in exploring what Poe called the detective's fragmented or 'Bi-Part Soul'' (2005: 104). Thus Collins' *The Moonstone* elaborates on Poe's 'psychological template' established in his detective tales and

develops ideas such as the 'Bi-Part Soul', the divided self, the doubling of the detective and the criminal, and the eccentricities of the fictional detective (Priestman, 2003: 3).

Sergeant Cuff has been hailed as the British archetype for literary detectives and his influence is evident in the personality construction of subsequent detective protagonists, such as Conan Doyle's Holmes. For example, Cuff's preoccupation with roses precedes Sherlock Holmes' interest in beekeeping (McCracken, 1998: 2; Reitz, 2004: 103). Cuff, also, has much in common with his literary predecessor, Poe's Dupin. Like Dupin, Cuff is a man of contradictions. He inspires confidence, yet is sly and cunning. He is self assured and firm but also 'tender' (*Moonstone:* 95). His manner is one of 'plain-speaking' but he is also described as a 'snake in the grass' (*Moonstone:* 152). He is a man of duty and honour, yet he is disposed to working 'the underground way' if the situation demands it (*Moonstone*: 177). Moral ambiguity defines the mind and methods of Collin's detective and this psychology resembles the 'diseased intelligence' of Poe's 'Bi-Part' 'double' Dupin ('Murders': 146).

Like Poe's detective, Cuff is both canny and sharp; however their most notable difference is that, ultimately, Cuff's judgement is flawed. The detective is certain that Rachel Verinder has stolen the Moonstone, indeed, he professes, 'I don't suspect...I know' (*Moonstone*: 173). However, later, as the narrative unfolds it transpires that Cuff 'completely mistook [his] case' and 'made a mess of it'. [20] He acknowledges that it is 'only in books that the officers of the detective force are superior to the weakness of

---

[20] Collin's *The Moonstone* (1886) reflects the real-life criminal investigations associated with the Road Hill Murder in 1860. Detective Inspector Jonathan Whicher was called upon to investigate the brutal murder of the three year old Francis Saville Kent in a prosperous family home in rural England. With little evidence Whicher arrested the boy's sister, Constance Kent. Charges were later dropped in this high profile case and, as a result, Whicher's career suffered. Kate Summerscale's recent acclaimed novel *The Suspicions of Mr Whicher* (2008) chronicled these events.

making a mistake' (*Moonstone*: 491). The intrinsic weakness and complex nature of the human soul forms the crux of the narrative of *The Moonstone*. Indeed, this notion is exemplified by the Moonstone itself, a multi-sided diamond with a 'flaw' at its heart (Rzepka, 2005: 104). This 'humanisation' of the detective relies 'less on the beauty of the mathematical problem and much more on the intangible human element' (Watt, 1971: 137). As Ian P. Watt surmises, 'the best heroes of English detective fiction have been, like Sergeant Cuff, fallible' (Watt, 1971: 137). Cuff's limitations and failings, along with Poe's Dupin's multifaceted psychology, were instrumental in inciting a new direction for emerging detective protagonists: those who exhibit anti-heroic traits and, as a result, add a captivating dimension to the persona of the detective.

The colonial discourse indicative of nineteenth-century British fiction is, to some extent, evident in *The Moonstone* through the portrayal of the superiority of the Empire's mother nation and the criminality perceived to be evident in India under British rule. However, the prevailing theme in this novel is the supremacy of science. Nineteenth-century scientific advances which contradicted the previous dominance of religious thought were manifested in texts such as Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein* (1818) and later in the forensic science techniques of Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes. The publication of Charles Darwin's *On the Origin of Species* (1859) 'saw Christianity discredited by evolutionary theory' and the 'foundations of religion undermined by the evidence of Charles Darwin' thus adding fuel to the supernatural versus science debate (Stevenson, 1993: 12; Thomas, 2006: 68). In Poe's tales the objectivity and rationality connected with scientific theory and the spiritualism and irrationality relating to the supernatural is clearly linked to Poe's personal philosophical beliefs of Materialism and Idealism and his associated concept of the 'creative and resolvent' 'Bi-Part Soul' (See Chapter 1). The manifestation of the theme of science versus the supernatural reflects the core

principles of Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul'. In *The Moonstone*, it is the man of science, Ezra Jennings, not the detective, Sergeant Cuff, whose methods are responsible for uncovering who stole the diamond. Cuff's technique is merely 'rational' whereas Jennings' more successful modus operandi is analogous to 'the scientific artist' and, as a result, reflects Dupin's method of the creative use of reason in the pursuit of truth (Herbert, 2003: 37). Through Jennings' scientific experiment, which endorses the combined use of both sides of the 'Bi-Part Soul', it is revealed that Franklin Blake whilst under the influence of a chemical stimulant was unconsciously responsible for the crime (Herbert, 2003: 37). In *The Moonstone,* therefore, Collins 'appropriates the prophetic scientism of Edgar Allan Poe's Dupin stories and anticipates the mixture of the legal with the medical-scientific that Arthur Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes is renowned for' (Thomas, 2006: 68). It has been demonstrated that scientific thinking is intrinsic to the methods of Poe's Dupin and in Chapter 5 the influence of science in Holmes' deductive techniques will be examined.

Jennings' methods expose the 'Bi-Part division' between Blake's 'conscious will and his unconscious desires' which embodies the motif of the divided self so prominent in Poe's detective trilogy and nineteenth-century fiction in its entirety (Rzepka, 2005: 105). After Cuff fails to implicate the true perpetrator of the crime, Blake uses his own detective skills to uncover the mystery behind the disappearance of the diamond. Gabriel Betteridge, *The Moonstone's* butler and prime narrator, describes Blake as a man who passes 'his life in a state of perpetual contradiction with himself' and this contradiction is perhaps best epitomised by Blake's ironic 'dual role as both investigator and instrument of the diamond's disappearance' (*Moonstone*: 77; Rpezka, 2005: 103). Blake, the 'criminal-hero', reflects Poe's Dupin who represents the symbolic double of

the criminals in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) and 'The Purloined Letter' (1844) and, also, the literary heroes and policing figures of the nineteenth century. [21]

Godfrey Ablewhite, the real villain of the narrative, allows Collins to explore further the concept of Poe's philosophy of the 'double' and, also, to develop Dickens' notion of the opposing nature of the private and public self. Like the diamond with its many facets and flawed heart, Godfrey is a man whose 'life had two sides to it', that of a respectable gentleman and, conversely, that 'of a man of pleasure' (*Moonstone*: 506). The polarity of Godfrey's private and public identity is exemplified when his murdered body is found with its 'face disguised' (*Moonstone*: 501). This allegorical representation of the duality of human nature defines the very essence of detective fiction. The appeal of this genre is that it strips away the respectable facade and exposes the dark and sinister private secrets of the human soul. The division of the public and private persona is illustrated to profound effect in Robert Louis Stevenson's *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* (1886). Any exploration of the duality of humanity in Victorian fiction could not be done justice without examining Stevenson's Gothic novella which consolidates the motif of the divided self who is both private and public, savage and respectable, evil and good.

4. *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* by Robert Louis Stevenson (1886)

Critics are divided as to whether this urban Gothic novella can be broadly classified as belonging to a distinct genre. It has been argued that *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* (1886) is not a 'mystery story, a detective story or movie' but that this novella is

---

[21] See the Case Study in Chapter 3 on 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' which details the doubling of the detective and the criminal.

more akin to a skilfully constructed poem than any type of prose (in Davison, 2007: 137). David Hirsch, however, shrewdly argues in his essay *'Frankenstein,* Detective Fiction and *Jekyll and Hyde'* that Stevenson's short story has 'two main generic threads, namely gothic and detective fiction' (in Davison, 2007: 140). This premise is supported by John G. Cawelti, when he suggests that the detective genre 'descended from the gothic tale' and that 'gothic is incipient in detective fiction' (Davison, 2007: 141). Although it could be deemed mildly contentious to label *Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* a detective narrative, what cannot be underestimated is the impact that this nineteenth-century Gothic tale had in shaping the genre.

The compelling psychological notion of the 'spectre of the double', the 'homo duplex', the 'polar twins' intrinsic in the human mind was one that fascinated the literary writers of the Victorian era (Gish, 2007; *Jekyll and Mr Hyde*: 121). The multiplicity and pathological dissociation of the consciousness influenced great works by Fyodor Dostoevsky,[22] Poe and Charles Baudelaire (Gish, 2007). The psychological concept of the 'duality of purpose' was firmly established by Stevenson in *Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* and, subsequently, had a resounding effect on the evolution of the detective genre in both the twentieth and twenty-first centuries (*Jekyll & Mr Hyde*: 140).

Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde explores the dark and sinister depths of the human soul, encapsulating the 'thorough and primitive duality of man' (*Jekyll & Hyde*: 120). It describes the 'perennial war' which exists at the core of nature and manifests itself in 'good and evil, higher and lower, spirit and matter, soul and body' (*Jekyll & Hyde*: 119; Garret, 2003: 104). The polarities of the human psychology are examined in this tale

---

[22] The renowned Russian writer Fyodor Dostoevsky (1821-1881) authored the deeply psychological and existentialist novel *Crime and Punishment* (1866) which examined the relationship between criminality and madness.

using the allegory of a 'transforming draught' which incites a transition from the respectable Dr Jekyll into Mr Hyde, a man who rouses feelings of 'disgust, loathing and fear'(*Jekyll & Hyde*: 38). Consequently, this novella eloquently consolidates the motif of the divided self, so evident in nineteenth-century fiction, which was simultaneously criminal and reputable, and explores the disparity between the public and private persona. It is Mr Utterson, Jekyll's lawyer and friend, who investigates this dichotomy by assuming the role of detective. Utterson, exclaims, 'If he be Mr Hyde...I shall be Mr Seek' (*Jekyll & Hyde*: 34). Coupled with the acknowledgment in the title that this Gothic novella is indeed a 'Case', it would not be unreasonable to suggest that *Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* represents an embryonic detective narrative.

Contemporary detective fiction and the Noir genre have certainly been inspired by the concept of human duality which defines Stevenson's Gothic novella. Ian Rankin acknowledges that his 'first two Inspector Rebus novels borrowed heavily from Stevenson', using *Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* as a template (Rankin, 2008: 11). [23] This connection is starkly apparent in the title of Rankin's second Rebus novel, *Hide and Seek* (1991) and his first book *Knots and Crosses* (1987) makes 'several references to Stevenson's Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde' (Priestman, 2003: 183). Carole Barrowman addresses the importance of Stevenson's text in the conception of the Noir genre when she asserts: 'Like every noir writer since then, Stevenson situates evil in the heart of man, and then places that man in the heart of a city' (2004).

Detective fiction as a genre explores the dual nature of mankind. This is demonstrated by the multifaceted psychology of the detective and the complex nature of the characters portrayed in detective fiction. Panek asserts that the idea of psychological

---

[23] Ian Rankin is the UK's best selling detective writer and is widely known for his Inspector John Rebus series.

polarity is inherent in the appeal of this genre and uses a fictional detective legend to affirm this: 'Holmes attracts readers because of the dualism Doyle consciously manufactured for his characters' (1987: 93). It is evident that the concept of the duality of the consciousness is a crucial component in the detective genre and it is one that was strongly established in the Victorian era and consolidated in Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes.

Chapter 5

Duality and the 'Bi-Part Soul' in Arthur Conan Doyle's

Sherlock Holmes

In this Chapter it will be demonstrated how the ideas which dominate Poe's detective trilogy and the British Newgate and Sensation fiction of the nineteenth-century culminate in the investigations of Arthur Conan Doyle's detective Sherlock Holmes when a discrete genre of detective fiction was conceived. It is shown how Poe acted as progenitor to Conan Doyle's detective fiction by examining the plot formula and narrative tropes that they share. Conan Doyle's indebtedness to Poe is most profoundly manifested in the literary incarnation of Poe's Dupin in Conan Doyle's Holmes. It is established how the multifaceted and complex Dupin and Holmes share the same 'Bi-Part' mind and method and that the dichotomies relating to Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' such as romance and logic, imagination and reason, Idealism and Materialism and the supernatural and science are strongly manifested in Conan Doyle's Holmes opus. The paradigms of the *doppelgänger* motif, the symbolic doubling of the detective with both the narrator and the criminal, the duality of person both evil and good and private and public which dominate Poe's Dupin trilogy are explored in relation to the Holmes novellas and short stories. This background supports my contention that the Holmes narratives represent the symbolic double of the Dupin tales and this argument will be discussed first in a general context and then in relation to the first three Holmes novellas which were published before the turn of the century: *A Study in Scarlet* (1887), *The Sign of Four* (1890) and *The Hound of the Baskervilles* (1902).

Sherlock Holmes, perhaps, literature's greatest detective institution was the creation of the Edinburgh born physician and author Arthur Conan Doyle (1859 – 1930). The exploits of Conan Doyle's detective were published over four decades (1887 – 1927) but set mostly in *fin-de-siècle* London. Dr. Watson, Holmes' loyal companion, chronicled the sleuth's criminal investigations in four novellas: *A Study in Scarlet* (1887), *The Sign of Four* (1890), *The Hound of the Baskervilles* (1902), *The Valley of Fear* (1915) and a repertoire of short stories: 'The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes' (1892), 'The Memoirs of Sherlock Holmes' (1894), 'The Return of Sherlock Holmes' (1904), 'His Last Bow' (1917) and 'The Case Book of Sherlock Holmes' (1927) (Forshaw, 2007: 10). As previously discussed the late nineteenth century was a time of great social and political unrest and 'the rigour of logic and the demands of science which filtered through' the Holmes narratives, were a welcome means of reassurance and escapism for the readers at the time (Kayman, 2003: 48). However, the popularity of the Holmes opus still endures over a hundred years after it was first published and has been re-interpreted widely throughout the decades for stage and screen.

1. The Doubling of Dupin and Holmes

Edgar Allan Poe established his detective, Dupin, throughout a series of three short stories spanning the mid nineteenth-century and it is no coincidence that the psychosomatic profile of Conan Doyle's Holmes resembles that of his literary precursor (Atkinson, 1999: 52). Indeed, Holmes has been referred to as the 'resurrection of' and 'successor to' Poe's protagonist with Dupin providing a 'major source of inspiration' and a 'literary model' for the mind and methods of Conan Doyle's Holmes (Kayman, 2003: 42; Grella, 1970: 69; Delamater, 1997: 70; Fisher, 2004: 450 & 632). Conan

Doyle explicitly acknowledges the authority of the Dupin tales in shaping his Holmes oeuvre, when at a press conference in New York, on the 2nd October 1894, the author is asked, 'Now, weren't you influenced by Edgar Allan Poe when you wrote 'Sherlock Holmes'', to which Conan Doyle replies, 'Oh immensely! His detective is the best detective in fiction...Dupin is unrivalled' (Redmond, 1988: 29; Wadsworth Smith, 2006: 31). Poe's Dupin is, also, directly mentioned in *A Study in Scarlet* (See Part 2). Ultimately, Conan Doyle recognises the pre-eminence of the Dupin trilogy when he acknowledges that Poe 'was the father of the detective tale' (in Fisher, 2004: 632).

The likeness between the two fictional detectives could be extensively examined and supported by each opus; both Dupin and Holmes are withdrawn loners, use the same forensic science techniques for detection, live with a companion who functions as a narrator, display an emotional dissociation from their criminal investigations and exhibit contempt for the efforts of the police. Dupin's use of 'analysis', 'superior acumen' and 'intuitive perception' in solving crimes is reflected in Holmes' 'Science of Deduction' ('Murders': 144 & 146; *Four*: 23). Dupin's predilection for 'seclusion' and 'darkness' is mirrored in Holmes' need for 'seclusion and solitude' and Dupin's contradictory character, which alternates between 'excitement' and 'delight' and 'vacant' and 'aloof', draws explicit comparisons with Holmes' dual psyche which rotates between 'excellent spirits' and the 'blackest depression' ('Murders': 144 & 146; *Hound*: 27; 'Murders': 146 & 145; *Four*: 23).

Holmes' inherent dualism is summarised by Iain Sinclair and Ed Glinert who state that:

> Holmes is the classically divided man that the age required: alchemist and
> rigorous experimenter, furious walker and definitive slacker, athlete and dope

fiend. He could, as the mood took him, be Trappist or motormouth ... Holmes is

forever lurching between incompatible polarities (2001: xi).

The contradictory nature of Holmes' psychology thus resembles Poe's Dupin's split

psyche. As discussed earlier, the 'Bi-Part Soul' was first introduced by Poe in 'The

Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) and was later developed in 'The Purloined Letter'

(1844) and it describes Dupin's intrinsic dualism, whereby there is a 'double' Dupin

both 'creative and resolvent' who is 'a poet-mathematician' (McCrackin, 1998: 52;

Danesi, 2004: 214; 'Murders': 146; 'Purloined': 293). This philosophical concept is

one that has undoubtedly inspired and influenced Conan Doyle's work and is strongly

evident in the themes, structure and characters of the Sherlock Holmes novellas and

short stories. As John G. Cawelti notes Dupin's 'synthesis of the poet's intuitive insight

with the scientist's power of inductive reasoning...was essentially the same combination

of qualities that Doyle built in to Sherlock Holmes', a contention supported by George

Grella who asserts that Holmes is 'endowed with the Dupinesque dual temperament'

(1976: 93; 1970: 35). Similarly, Jerold Abrams suggests that Holmes' mind has 'two

selves contained within it, each with a distinctive character', one 'is dreamy and

creative imagination, and the other is high energy and logic' (2007: 112). He relates

this dual psychology to 'Poe's double Dupin' affirming that both fictional detectives

have a 'bipart mind' (Abrams, 2007:112).

In the same way that Poe's detective advocates the 'combining power' of the

imagination and reason and endorses the 'creative' use of 'calculating power', Holmes

is referred to as 'a calculating machine' and a 'scientific detective' and, like Dupin, he

acknowledges that this technique relies on 'the scientific use of the imagination'

('Murders': 144; *Four*: 21 &11; *Hound*: 35). Holmes' interest in the violin, plays,

pottery, philosophy and the arts contrasts with his passion for scientific knowledge, laboratory experimentation and forensic techniques. Holmes, therefore, like Dupin, is as much a proponent of creativity as he is of reason and exhibits 'a romantic personality possessed by the scientific spirit' (Grella, 1970: 35). Consequently, in keeping with the theme of duality which permeates detective fiction from its roots, it can be posited that Holmes represents Dupin's symbolic double, with the polar mind of Conan Doyle's detective conforming to Dupin's 'Bi-Part' psychological blueprint.

Doubling is as evident in Conan Doyle's detective accounts as it is Poe's Dupin trilogy. Although Doctor Watson is significantly more developed as a character than the anonymous narrator in Poe's detective tales, he is still merely 'invented to invent Holmes' (Sinclair & Glinert, 2001: xi). The same logic as J. A. Leo Lemay applies to Dupin as a 'Doppelgänger for the narrator' can be applied to the Holmes-Watson dynamic (1982: 169). Respectively, Holmes 'is the *analyst*; and the narrator who tells the tale, is the *creator*...the *analyst* is simply the reverse of the *creator*' (emphasis added) (Lemay, 1982: 169) (See Chapter 3). Watson could, therefore, like Poe's narrator, be deemed the creative component of the detective's divided self, who is both 'creative and resolvent' ('Murders': 146). Cawelti supports this contention stating that 'From the beginning Holmes was a double figure, first in himself as the mixture of scientist and poet and even more significantly in the double figure of Sherlock Holmes-Doctor Watson' (2004: 343).

Conan Doyle's implicit doubling of Poe's detective trilogy extends further; like Dupin who doubles the criminals in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' and the thief Minister D___ in 'The Purloined Letter', Holmes represents a *doppelgänger* for his arch nemesis, the criminal mastermind Professor Moriarty (Cawelti, 2004: 343). Moriarty only

directly appears in two of the sixty Holmes accounts; in the short story 'The Final Problem' (1893) and the novella *The Valley of Fear* (1915), though he is mentioned in a selection of the other narratives. In these two accounts we learn that Moriarty shares a number of common characteristics with Holmes. He is of similar physical appearance, has a 'phenomenal mathematical faculty', 'is a genius, a philosopher, an abstract thinker' and a 'scientific criminal' ('Problem': 228 & 229; *Fear*: 174; Canton, 1997: 3). Moriarty conforms to the same 'Bi-Part' mould as the detectives Holmes and Dupin; he is both reasoned and artistic.

In 'The Final Problem' Holmes refers to Moriarty as 'the organiser of half that is evil' ('Problem': 229). This statement can be interpreted on two different levels. Firstly, Moriarty could characterize an 'inversion of the values embodied by Holmes' and, as a result, the criminal represents the detective's *doppelgänger* who is equipped with an identical skill set but motivated by an evil purpose (Van Dover, 1994: 93). Secondly, 'the half that is evil' could be construed as an acknowledgement by Holmes that he is, in fact, a divided self and, consequently, Moriarty signifies the unsavoury half of the detective's dual psychology. Moriarty, therefore, like Minister D___ in Poe's 'The Purloined Letter' (1844), personifies the evil faction of the detective's soul and thus Holmes and Moriarty, and Poe's Dupin and Minister D____, are analogous with the divided self of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde, explored in Stevenson's Gothic novella. This argument can be supported by the detective's polar temperament and seems more fitting, given the context of the criminal-heroes conceived in the Newgate, Sensation and Gothic fiction which predated Conan Doyle's work and, also, the dual role of real-life policing figures at the turn of the nineteenth century (See Chapter 4).

Whether it is accepted that Holmes and Moriarty are a divided self or that they represent two separate individuals with divergent good and evil intentions, the symbolic unity of effect remains the same due to the 'dramatic balance in the union of these opposites' (Van Dover, 1994: 93). Essentially, at the core of detective fiction is the battle between the forces of good and evil and this is exemplified by the interconnectedness between criminal and detective. It has been demonstrated throughout this study that Poe, like Aristotle, values the imperative of symbolic unity in his writing (See Chapter 2). Yet again, in Conan Doyle's opus, we see an indebtedness to the work of his literary predecessor. It is emphasized in Poe's 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) that an 'identification of the reasoner's intellect with that of his opponent' is required if the detective is to outwit his criminal adversary ('Purloined': 291). Consequently, what is most compelling about the narrative device of doubling the detective and criminal is that the criminal mastermind is an equal match for the brilliant sleuth and in Minister D___ and Professor Moriarty, Dupin and Holmes, respectively, meet a rival with the same skill set and, as a result, the game is made all the more gripping.

The doubling of the detective and the narrator and the detective and the criminal permeates Poe's Dupin trilogy and is mirrored in the relationship between the core characters of the Holmes opus. Ultimately, the evidence suggests a strong connection between the characters and their dynamics in the Holmes accounts with those in the Dupin tales which would support the contention that Conan Doyle's detective narratives represent the symbolic double of Poe's detective trilogy. What follows is a textual analysis of Conan Doyle's first three Holmes novellas which demonstrates the synergy between the themes and ideas explored in Poe's trilogy and Conan Doyle's oeuvre. It will be shown how the creative and logical virtues associated with Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' are manifested in the extensive textual exploration of the disparate

faculties of art and logic, imagination and reason, science and the supernatural. The 'Bi-Part' mind and methods of Conan Doyle's Holmes are, also, examined further. It is revealed how the more general theme of the double is profoundly evident in Conan Doyle's first three Holmes novellas in their dual geographical setting and plot structure, the constructed contrast between the British and the colonial identity, the forces of good and evil and the dichotomy between the private and the public self.

2. *A Study in Scarlet* **(1887)**

The novella *A Study in Scarlet* (1887), was first published in '*Beeton's Christmas Annual* for a mere twenty-five pounds' and introduces Conan Doyle's iconic detective, Holmes (Davies, 1999: vii). Conan Doyle pointedly refers to the likeness his protagonist has to his predecessor, Poe's Dupin, when Holmes' assistant and friend Watson states: 'You remind me of Edgar Allan Poe's Dupin', a likeness that Holmes is quick to challenge when he counters, 'Dupin was a very inferior fellow...very showy and superficial...by no means such a phenomenon as Poe appeared to imagine' (*Scarlet*: 25). This can be read as a meta-statement on behalf of the author Conan Doyle, light-heartedly disputing an association with Poe's detective, but the influence that Poe's earlier texts have had on shaping the tropes and characters which permeate Conan Doyle's works cannot be questioned.

Panek suggests that *A Study in Scarlet* 'flirts' with 'Poe's romantic and metaphysical notion of the Bi-Part Soul' (Panek, 1987: 93). However, it could be said that Conan Doyle's first Holmes novella embodies this concept to a much more significant extent, using it as a basis to determine not only the personality of his detective but also the configuration of the entire novella. Richard Sugg asserts that 'The psychology of

[Conan Doyle's] fascinating protagonist...is everywhere ramified in the details and structure of the text' (1992: 342). The 'dramatic psychological paradigm' of the plot is presented by a distinct split in the text's narrative (Sugg, 1992: 341). The first part of the novella details the crime, a murder and the mystery of a wedding ring found at the scene. Holmes, using the same methods as Poe's Dupin, reason, logic and analysis, is able to identify the perpetrator of the crime, Jefferson Hope. The second part of the tale is set in America and moves back in time to explore the rationale behind the motives of the criminal, who killed to avenge a love that was cruelly taken from him. The dual nature of the plot, with its stark contrast between Holmes' clinical approach to detection, exhibited in the first part of the text, and the romantic and poetic resonance of the latter half of the novella, explicitly draws on Poe's 'creative and resolvent' notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul'. Ironically, it is through logic and reason, that a crime motivated by passion is ultimately solved.

The structure of *A Study in Scarlet* has been criticised for presenting two 'disconnected parts' (Sugg, 1992: 336). However, conversely, the 'split unity' of the plot has been identified as a crucial literary device in nineteenth-century fiction and emulates Poe's imperative of the totality of effect which is achieved in the aesthetic balance of the antithetical double. The dual structure of *A Study in Scarlet* has, also, been identified as an important 'moment of transition, after which plot will typically be situated in either urban or frontier spaces, each of which will gain its own individual generic identity' (Sugg, 1992: 336; Redmond, 2001: 31). Although this novella anticipates the colonial discourse which dominates Conan Doyle's later works, *A Study in Scarlet* does depict a wildly fantastical and inaccurate portrayal of the Mormon faith and reflects the universal Victorian suspicion of that which did not conform to Western norms (James, 2007: 194). The dual nature of the plot with its two distinct time frames, urban and

frontier settings, British and American locations and scientific and romantic qualities, provide a sympathetic backdrop for this novella's multifaceted 'Bi-Part' protagonist, Holmes.

As discussed earlier, the eccentric and complex 'consulting detective', Holmes, was 'consciously manufactured' to reflect the incompatible polarities of the human mind (*Scarlet*: 23; Panek, 1987: 93). The detective's split personality manifests itself in the 'energetic fit' associated with working on a case, which is 'superseded' by the apathy, speculatively attributed by Watson to Holmes' use of narcotics, which follows its resolution (*Scarlet*: 17). Holmes' technique of 'observation and deduction', using reason, in the systematic 'unravelling' of the crime, is referred to as the 'Science of Deduction and Analysis' and is strongly reminiscent of the methods of Poe's detective of 'ratiocination', Dupin (*Scarlet*: 22 & 23). The introduction of science into the methods of the fictional detective emulates the rise of forensic techniques in Victorian criminal investigations. *A Study in Scarlet* sees Holmes creating a reliable test for the presence of blood at a crime scene, mirroring advances recently made in this field at the time (Wagner, 2006: 172).

However, Holmes' 'passion for definite and exact knowledge' is contradicted by his appreciation of the arts, for example Chopin, which reflects Poe's concept of the 'Bi-Part' 'poet-mathematician' (*Scarlet*: 12; 'Purloined': 293) Indeed, Watson comments on the complex nature of his companion when he considers the 'many-sidedness' of Holmes' mind (*Scarlet*: 44). This representation of the detective parallels with Poe's 'double Dupin' and is emblematic of the ensuing psychological nuances of Holmes' complex psyche, as his character develops across the short stories and novellas which follow *A Study in Scarlet* ('Murders': 146).

3. *The Sign of Four* (1890)

In his second short novel, Conan Doyle expands and examines concepts and themes introduced in *A Study in Scarlet*. *The Sign of Four* develops the notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul', which was explored in Conan Doyle's first Holmes narrative. The novella opens with the detective, in what appears to be a common ritual, extracting 'his hypodermic syringe' (*Four*: 7). Holmes' drug use, which is hinted at in *A Study in Scarlet*, adds an engaging and, perhaps, flawed dimension to a character that previously has been presented, predominantly, as solely an agent of justice. We learn that the detective craves the stimulus of a criminal case and is compelled to self-medicate, with cocaine and morphine, during periods of 'stagnation' in order to 'dull the routine of existence' (*Four*: 8; Rzepka, 2005: 130). Holmes' polar psychology which, Watson states, alternates between the conflicting states of 'excellent spirits' and 'fits of the blackest depression', 'bright humour' and 'black depression', 'flitting from gloom into the light' presents a compelling human enigma, in the mould of Poe's detective Dupin whose 'diseased intelligence' revolves between 'fantastic gloom' and 'wild fervour' (*Four*: 23 & 25; 'Murders', 144 & 146; Ackroyd, 2001: xvi).

The use of forensic science in detection, which Conan Doyle touched on in *A Study in Scarlet*, is firmly established during his second Holmes novella. *The Sign of Four* refers to Holmes' ability to analyse 'footprints' and fingerprints and distinguish between differing types of ashes from various tobaccos (*Four*: 10 & 11). Ultimately, these techniques are fundamental to solving the crime and are indicative of the scientific curiosities which were at the forefront of nineteenth-century thought (Rzepka, 2005: 114). *The Sign of Four*, whilst emphasising that Holmes is a 'scientific detective', also

develops the artistic and cultured facet of Holmes' personality, which was introduced in *A Study in Scarlet* (*Four*: 11). Holmes' interest in the German romantic novelist, Jean Paul Richter, is mentioned and Watson states that the detective is able to speak at length 'on miracle plays, on medieval pottery, on Stradivarius violins, on the Buddhism of Ceylon' (*Four*: 69 & 94). Yet, significantly, even Holmes' passion for the arts is pervaded by a scientific approach to acquiring knowledge; Watson notes that it is 'as though he had made a special study' of each subject (*Four*: 94). Consequently, in Conan Doyle's detective we see both aspects of Dupin's 'Bi-Part Soul' manifested in the artistic and scientific Holmes.

Similarly to *A Study in Scarlet*, *The Sign of Four* has a split structure, where the setting moves from England to 'some exotic place', thus raising 'questions about national identity' (Thomas, 2004: 220). Although the Victorian perception of the superiority of the British Empire's mother country and the subjugation of its colonies is present in *A Study in Scarlet*, 'the subplot of the Agra treasure within *The Sign of Four* is the most extensive treatment of colonial relations in Conan Doyle's oeuvre' (Thompson, 1993: 69). Comparisons can be made between this text and Wilkie Collins' nineteenth-century Sensation novel *The Moonstone* (1868), examined in Chapter 4, which investigates the theft of a precious Indian diamond. However, perhaps, more accurately, 'Doyle drew on Poe's composite minotaur-figure, the sailor and the orang-utan' from 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue', with Jonathan Small and his cannibalistic and savage companion Tonga mirroring their respective roles (Rzepka, 2005: 131). This represents a further example, aside from Poe's Minister D___ in 'The Purloined Letter' and Conan Doyle's Professor Moriarty, of the symbolic doubling of Poe and Conan Doyle's criminal characters. Tonga is portrayed as a 'savage', 'distorted creature', exhibiting the 'bestiality and cruelty' of an 'animal' (*Four*: 101 & 102). By the late nineteenth

century the West had 'colonised more than eighty per cent of the world' and the height of European Imperialism, therefore, corresponded with the emergence of the detective genre (Roy, 2008: x). As Pinaki Roy asserts 'The Sherlock Holmes canon is easily an assertion of not only the omnipotence of the Eurocentric detective but also its author's..."Orientalism" that associates everything evil and disorderly with the Afro-Asian nations' (Roy, 2008: xiii). The Holmes oeuvre, therefore, personifies the perceived nineteenth-century British role of 'policeman of civilisation, bringing order to the primitive worlds of what is called 'the orient'' (Thomas, 1992: 200). The colonial discourse and the use of forensic science, which characterise Conan Doyle's work, specifically *The Sign of Four*, reinforce the notion that detective fiction, from its conception and through to the present day, acts as a powerful vehicle of social commentary reflecting the socio-historical context in which it was written (Pykett, 2003: 19).

Ironically, it is within this labyrinth of 'robust patriotism and attenuated spiritualism' that Watson finds love in the character Miss Morstan (Ackroyd, 2001: xvi). *The Sign of Four* is, therefore, 'a romance in which the rationalist or scientific temper is confronted by fabulous or monstrous events...in which the great heart of the imperial city is disturbed by savage desires' (Ackroyd, 2001: xvii). In this novella romance and reason meet imperial and savage in harmonious discord, thus further emphasising the prominence of Poe's imperative of symbolic unity achieved through the 'dramatic balance in the union of these opposites' and his notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' in Conan Doyle's work (Van Dover, 1994: 93).

4. *The Hound of the Baskervilles* (1902)

Conan Doyle's third novella, *The Hound of the Baskervilles*, although, initially, serialised in the *Strand Magazine*, was first available in book form in 1902. This novella is distinctive from its predecessors as, although the setting does shift from the town to the countryside, Conan Doyle's emphasis moves away from colonial relations. Published just after the turn of a new century, this text masterfully merges the 'myths and superstitions of the past with the rationality and scientific boldness of the future' (Davies, 1999: x). The mid- nineteenth century saw the introduction of revolutionary Darwinian theories of evolution and was, therefore, characterised by extreme uncertainty (Rzepka, 2005: 114). Scientific thinking threatened the ardent Christian convictions which had previously formed the moral basis of Western society. The contradictory views of the time and the resultant social anxiety are reflected in *The Hound of the Baskervilles*, which presents a 'clever marriage between the rational and the irrational' (Davies, 1999: x). Conan Doyle's exploration of the opposing concepts of irrational superstition and rational science means that *The Hound of the Baskervilles* exemplifies Poe's notion of the 'Bi-Part Soul' which is both imaginative and reasoned.

The 'Jekyll and Hyde' allegory is implicit in this tale, which focuses on unravelling the 'connection between the man and the beast' (*Hound*: 129). A mysterious gigantic hound has been plaguing the Baskerville line, on Dartmoor, for generations and Holmes is engaged to investigate this 'benevolent or malevolent agency' (*Hound*: 39). The Gothic setting of Baskerville Hall and Conan Doyle's evocative descriptions of the 'melancholy moor' intensify the sinister and foreboding tone of this novella, providing a sympathetic backdrop for suspicions of the paranormal to flourish (*Hound*: 62). However, ultimately, reason is victorious and the hound is exposed as flesh and blood, but this tale raises significant questions about the duality of man and the opposing

nature of the private and public self. Aside from the explicit parallels between Stevenson's *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* (1886), *The Hound of the Baskervilles* can also be compared to the Sensation novels of the 1860s, such as Collins' *The Moonstone* (1868), which explore the dark underside of respectable society (Pykett, 2003: 32). *The Hound of the Baskervilles*, in stripping away the public facade of its characters, reveals the hidden secrets of the Barrymore family, Mrs Lyons and most significantly Stapleton, whose 'self-contained manner so cleverly concealed' his 'fiery soul' (*Hound*: 166). Holmes, who is 'trained to examine faces not their trimmings', sees beneath Stapleton's 'smiling face' and into his 'murderous heart' (*Hound*: 139). Ultimately, the diabolic presence in this tale cannot be attributed to the supernatural but, instead, as in Stevenson's *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde*, evil is situated in the heart of mankind and the real animal is not beast but human. This notion was a major preoccupation throughout Victorian literature. *The Hound of the Baskervilles* challenges Holmes to employ the 'scientific use of the imagination' to examine opposing concepts such as the supernatural versus science, the private self versus the public self, good versus evil and rational versus irrational (*Hound*: 35).

The ideas explored in Conan Doyle's Holmes canon reveal the profound authority of Poe's Dupin trilogy. The Holmes opus was instrumental in establishing a discrete genre of detective fiction and the prevalence of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and duality in Conan Doyle's detective fiction enforced and consolidated the enduring influence of the themes conceived by Poe.

Conclusion

This study has examined an area which, until now, has received relatively little academic attention: the meaning, origin, presence and influence of Edgar Allan Poe's philosophical concept of the 'Bi-Part Soul', in nineteenth-century British fiction. The binary split between the opposing factions of the psyche, one half rational, practical and reasoned whilst the other half is irrational, emotional and artistic, shaped an enduring template for themes and multifaceted protagonists in the emerging genre of detective fiction. The 'Bi-Part Soul' allowed Poe to achieve a resolution between his divergent philosophical beliefs of Transcendental Idealism and Materialism. Poe's concept is, also, clearly linked to a more general principle of duality, or the theme 'of the double' which is persistently manifested in British nineteenth-century texts in the related motifs of doubling, the divided self, both good and bad and private and public, and the *doppelgänger.*

The derivation of Poe's 'old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul' still remains undetermined but I have argued that the genesis of Poe's concept can be traced to Aristotle's ethical theory, the bipartite psychology, which describes an identical divide between humankind's rational and irrational virtues. This study has engaged with the enduring presence and influence of the 'Bi-Part Soul' and the associated paradigm of duality in British nineteenth-century literature, predominantly the work of Charles Dickens, Wilkie Collins, Robert Louis Stevenson and Arthur Conan Doyle. The fiction from this period acted as a prologue to the definitive conception of the detective genre, firmly established in Conan Doyle's *fin de siècle* Sherlock Holmes. It has been demonstrated how the acutely intelligent, but multifaceted, 'Bi-Part' Dupin has created a schismatic psychological model for proceeding fictional detectives, with nineteenth-century British

literature alone revealing an indebtedness in the form of Collins' Sergeant Cuff, Dickens' Mr Bucket and, most significantly, Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes. The findings of this study have considerable scope to inform future work. Ultimately, I believe that the 'diseased intelligence' of Poe's 'double' Dupin, and his 'Bi-Part' mould, could credibly be traced throughout the fictional detectives of the twentieth and twenty-first centuries ('Murders': 146).

The lasting influence of the metaphor of the 'Bi-Part Soul' on the detective genre can be illustrated by the dual nature of contemporary fictional detectives. Since its roots were formed in nineteenth-century literature, detective fiction has evolved to become an international preoccupation, with the presence of Poe's 'Bi-Part Soul' and duality still strongly apparent. The dysfunctional American Noir protagonists of the inter-war years, such as Dashiell Hammett's Sam Spade and Raymond Chandler's Philip Marlowe, are defined by psychological polarity, a notion which Poe explored almost a century before, in his Dupin trilogy. Later in the twentieth century, the Swedish born Henning Mankell (1948 -) received international acclaim for his Inspector Kurt Wallander series, which developed his protagonist across nine books published between 1991 and 1999. These novels, like Poe's work and the detective fiction which he helped to pioneer, are suffused with social commentary and focus on a complex anti-hero. Wallander drinks too much, struggles to sustain relationships with women, his father and his daughter, is disillusioned by his life and his police work, is morally ambiguous (he shot and killed a man) and has a 'split personality' (*The White Lioness:* 231). The latter reveals the prominence of bifurcation in contemporary fictional detectives and reflects the persona of Poe's nineteenth-century 'Bi-Part' Dupin.

In Britain, the prominence of duality in the detective narrative has continued. Notably, in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, detective fiction is Scotland's best known literary export. Given that the genesis of the detective genre has deep roots in Scotland, as it is the birth place of influential authors Robert Louis Stevenson and Arthur Conan Doyle, this enduring legacy is fitting and today an abundance of contemporary Scottish writers continue this long established tradition: Ian Rankin, Val McDermid, Lin Anderson, Denise Mina, Christopher Brookmyre, Alex Gray and Stuart MacBride to name but a few. The proliferation of crime and detective fiction in Scotland led to James Ellroy[24] coining the term 'Tartan Noir' to define the movement (Barrowman: 2004). 'Tartan Noir' began to flourish in the nineteen-seventies and its significant features mirror those which dominate Poe's Dupin tales, published more than a century before (Horsley, 2005: 99). 'Tartan Noir' is a genre which addresses questions of ethnicity and cultural identity in Post-Devolution Scotland; it is concerned with the duality of both place and person and the detective protagonist tends to exhibit 'anti-heroic' traits (Alibhai-Brown, 2005: 213; Clandfield, 2005: 211; Diemert, 2005: 178; Plain, 2001: 29; Rankin, 2003: 9). The influence of Poe's 'Bi-Part Soul' and duality in the context of this relatively new publishing movement would be an original and engaging area for further research.

Ian Rankin, dubbed by James Ellroy as 'The King of Tartan Noir', developed his protagonist Inspector John Rebus over seventeen bestselling novels (1987 – 2007). John Rebus is a damaged, divorced, hard drinking, perpetually smoking, ex SAS serviceman who is broken by a past that haunts him; a past that has left him recovering from a nervous breakdown, consumed by his job and with a catalogue of failed and

---

[24] James Ellroy writes 'dark, gritty monumental LA police procedurals...beginning with *Black Dahlia* (1987) and extending through the rest of his so-called 'L.A. Quartet' of *The Big Nowhere* (1988), *L.A. Confidential* (1990), and *White Jazz* (1992)' (Rzepka, 2005: 226).

dysfunctional relationships. He is described by Gill Templer, a character with whom he has a strained and tenuous affair, as 'complicated, fraught and screwed up' (*Knots & Crosses*: 190). Indeed, the word 'rebus' is defined as 'a clue puzzle', a term which directly relates to the metaphor of game playing which permeates Poe's trilogy. Rankin's protagonist is inherently as complex and problematic as the crimes he solves but also the criminals that he pursues. Like Poe's Dupin who doubles the criminals in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' (1841) and 'The Purloined Letter', in Rankin's novels the line between pursued and pursuer is often blurred, with Rebus empathising with his nemesis and sharing the same anti-heroic traits. *Knots and Crosses* (1987) describes Rebus' interconnectedness with the criminals he hunts: 'It was as if he saw himself there, time after time, the self that lurked behind his everyday consciousness. His Mister Hyde' (*Knots & Crosses*: 28). In this quotation, from Rankin's first Rebus novel, Robert Louis Stevenson's concept of the dual nature of humankind is explicitly manifested but, significantly, Poe's doubling of the detective and criminal is just as apparent.

The importance of Poe's concept of the 'Bi-Part Soul' is as perceptible in the embryonic detective narratives of the nineteenth century as it is in the contemporary texts of the twenty-first century. This thesis represents a detailed analysis of the meaning, origin and influence of the 'Bi-Part Soul' in the emerging genre of detective fiction, predominantly, in Victorian Britain. The ideas it discusses provide a strong foundation for further study in this area. Mankell's Wallander and Rankin's Rebus are just two of an abundance of literary detectives who replicate Dupin's 'Bi-Part' mould and, consequently, there is substantial scope to develop the notions examined in this study in the context of twentieth and twenty-first century detective fiction.

<u>Bibliography</u>

Primary Texts

Ainsworth, William Harrison. 2010. *Jack Sheppard*. London: Penguin.

Aristotle. 1997. *The Poetics of Aristotle*. Trans. Samuel H. Butcher. New York: Dover Publications.

Aristotle. 2009. *Nicomachean Ethics.* Trans. W. D. Ross. World Library Classics.

Braddon, Mary Elizabeth. 1997. *Lady Audley's Secret*. Stevenage: Wordsworth Editions.

Bulwer-Lytton, Edward. 2001. *Eugene Aram.* Boston: Adamant Media Corporation.

Christie, Agatha. 1986. *Miss Marple: The Complete Short Stories.* London: Berkley Trade.

Collins, Wilkie. 1986. *The Moonstone.* London: Penguin.

Collins, Wilkie. 2007. *The Woman in White*. London: Penguin.

Conan Doyle

Conan Doyle, Arthur. 1981. *A Study in Scarlet*. London: Penguin.

Conan Doyle, Arthur. 1982. *The Sign of the Four.* London: Penguin.

Conan Doyle, Arthur. 1994. *The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes*. London: Penguin.

Conan Doyle, Arthur. 1999. *The Hound of the Baskervilles and The Valley of Fear*. Stevenage: Wordsworth Editions.

Conan Doyle, Arthur. 2006. *The Case-Book of Sherlock Holmes*. London: Headline.

Conan Doyle, Arthur. 2008. *The Memoirs of Sherlock Holmes*. Charleston: Forgotten Books.

Dickens, Charles. 1978. *Bleak House*. Milton Keynes: Plain Label Books.

Dickens, Charles. 2003. *Oliver Twist.* London: Penguin.

Dickens, Charles. 2005. *The Mystery of Edwin Drood & Other Stories.* Stevenage: Wordsworth Editions.

Dostoyevsky, Fyodor. 1997. *Crime and Punishment*. London: Penguin.

Godwin, William. 2005. *Caleb Williams: Or, Things as They Are*. London: Penguin.

Hogg, James. 1997. *The Private Memoirs of a Justified Sinner*. Stevenage: Wordsworth Editions.

Mankell, Henning. 2009. *The White Lioness.* London: Vintage.

Poe

Poe, Edgar Allan. 1994. *The Narrative of Arthur Gordon Pym of Nantucket.* Oxford: Oxford Paperbacks.

Poe, Edgar Allan. 2003. *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings.* London: Penguin.

----'Letter to B___'. In *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings*. London: Penguin.

----'The Murders in the Rue Morgue'. In *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings*. London: Penguin.

----'The Purloined Letter'. In *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings*. London: Penguin.

----'The Philosophy of Composition'. In *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings*. London: Penguin.

----'The Poetic Principle'. In *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings*. London: Penguin.

----*The Raven*. In *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings*. London: Penguin.

----‘William Wilson’. In *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings*. London: Penguin.

Poe, Edgar Allan. 2004. *Tales of the Grotesque and Arabesque Vol. 1 & 2*. Montana: Kessinger Publishing Co.

Poe, Edgar Allan. 2008. ‘Lionizing’. In *The Works of Edgar Allan Poe, Volume 4 & 5*. Charleston: Forgotten Books.

Poe, Edgar Allan. 2009. *The Rationale of Verse, and The Poetic Principle*. Gloucester: Dodo Press.

Poe, Edgar Allan. 2010. ‘The Mystery of Marie Rogêt’. In *The Works of Edgar Allan Poe*. Charleston: Nabu Press.

Rankin, Ian. 1987. *Knots & Crosses.* London: Orion.

Rankin, Ian. 1990. *Hide & Seek*. London: Orion.

Shelley, Mary. 1992. *Frankenstein.* Stevenage: Wordsworth Editions.

Summerscale, Kate. 2008. *The Suspicions of Mr Whicher.* New York: Walker and Company.

Stevenson, Robert Louis. 2008. *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde.* Kilmarnock: Waverley Books Ltd.

Vidocq, Francois-Jules. 2003. *Memoirs of Vidocq: Master of Crime*. Oakland: AK Press.

Walpole, Horace. 1966. *Castle of Otranto*. In *Three Gothic Novels: The Castle of Otranto, Vathek, The Vampyre*. Dover Publications.

Secondary Texts

Abrams, Jerold J. 2007. *The Philosophy of Stanley Kubrick*. Kentucky: The University Press of Kentucky.

Anton, John P. and Anthony Preus, eds. 1983. *Essays in Ancient Greek Philosophy. Volume Two*. New York: State University of New York Press.

Armstrong, D. M. 1993. *A Materialist Theory of the Mind (International Library of Philosophy)*. New York: Routledge.

Alibhai-Brown, Yasmin. 2005. 'Putting the "Black" into "Tartan Noir"'. In *Race and Religion in the Postcolonial British Detective Story: Ten Essays*, ed. Julie H. Kim. North Carolina: McFarland & Co Inc. p. 213.

Ascari, Maurizio. 2007. *A Counter-History of Crime Fiction: Supernatural, Gothic, Sensational*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Asselineau, Roger. 1970. *Edgar Allan Poe*. Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press.

Atkinson, Michael. 1999. *The Secret Marriage of Sherlock Holmes and Other Eccentric Readings.* Michigan: University of Michigan Press.

Baker, William and Kenneth Womack, eds. 2002. *A Companion to the Victorian Novel*. Bucks: Greenwood Press.

Bargainnier, Earl F. 1980. *The Gentle Art of Murder: The Detective Fiction of Agatha Christie*. Ohio: Popular Press.

Barger, Andrew, ed. 2008. In *Edgar Allan Poe Annotated and Illustrated Entire Stories and Poem,* Edgar Allan Poe. Bottletree Classics.

Barker, Francis, Peter Hulme, and Margaret Iversen, eds. 1996. *Colonial Discourse/Postcolonial Theory*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Bourne Taylor, Jenny, ed. 2006. *The Cambridge Companion to Wilkie Collins*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bown, Nicola, Carolyn Burdett, and Pamela Thurschwell, eds. 2004. *The Victorian Supernatural*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Boyd, Michael. 1983. *Reflexive Novel: Fiction as Critique*. Pennsylvania: Bucknell University Press.

Bradford, Richard. 2007. *The Novel Now*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Budd, Louis J. and Edwin Harrison Cady, eds. 1993. *On Poe: The Best from American Literature*. North Carolina: Duke University Press.

Canton, Rolf J. 1997. *The Moriarty Principle: An Irregular Look at Sherlock Holmes*. Minnesota: Galde Press.

Carlson Eric W., ed. 1997. *A Companion to Poe Studies.* Bucks: Greenwood Press.

Cawelti, John G. 1976. *Adventure, Mystery, and Romance Formula Stories as Art and Popular Culture.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Cawelti, John G. 2004. *Mystery, Violence, and Popular Culture*. Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press.

Chatman, Seymour Benjamin. 1980. *Story and Discourse: Narrative Structure in Fiction and Film*. Cornell: Cornell University Press.

Clandfield, Peter. 2005. 'Putting the "Black" into "Tartan Noir"'. In *Race and Religion in the Postcolonial British Detective Story: Ten Essays*, ed. Julie H. Kim. North Carolina: McFarland & Co Inc. pp. 211 – 220.

Copleston, Frederick. 2003. *A History of Philosophy: Utilitarianism to Early Analytic Philosophy*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group.

Corrigan, Kevin. 2008. 'The Organisation of the Soul: Some Overlooked Aspects of Interpretation from Plato to late Antiquity'. In *Reading Ancient Texts, Aristotle and Neoplatonism: Essays in Honour of Denis O'Brien,* eds. Suzanne Stern-Gillet and Kevin Corrigan. Boston: Brill Academic Publishers. pp. 99 – 114.

Danesi, Marcel. 2004. *The Puzzle Instinct: The Meaning of Puzzles in Human Life.* Indiana: Indiana University Press.

David, Deirdre. 2001. *The Cambridge Companion to the Victorian Novel*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Davidson, Edward H. 1957. *Poe: A Critical Study.* Massachusetts: Belknap-Harvard University Press.

Davies, David S. 1999. 'Introduction'. In *The Hound of the Baskervilles and The Valley of Fear*, Arthur Conan Doyle. Stevenage: Wordsworth Edition.

Davison, Carol Margaret. 2007. 'A Battle of Wills: Solving *The Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde*'. In *Troubled Legacies*, ed. Allan Hepburn. Toronto: University of Toronto. pp. 135 – 163.

Deane, Bradley. 2003. *The Making of the Victorian Novelist: Anxieties of Authorship in the Mass Market*. New York: Routledge.

Delamater, Jerome H. 1997. *Theory and Practice of Classic Detective Fiction*. Bucks: Greenwood Publishing Group.

Demsey, John S., and Linda S. Forst. 2009. *An Introduction to Policing*. Florence: Delmar Cengage Learning.

Diemert, Brian. 2005. 'Ian Rankin and the God of Scots'. *In Race and Religion in the Postcolonial British Detective Story: Ten Essays*, ed. Julie H. Kim. North Carolina: McFarland & Co Inc. pp. 164 – 189.

Dove, George N. 1989. *Suspense in the Formula Story*. Ohio: Popular Press.

Dryden, Linda. 2003. *The Modern Gothic and Literary Doubles: Stevenson, Wilde and Wells*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Duncan, Paul. 2000. *Noir Fiction: Dark Highways.* Harpenden: Pocket Essentials.

Durham, Carolyn A. 2005. *Literary Globalism: Anglo-American Fiction Set in France*. Pennsylvania: Bucknell University Press.

Edel, Abraham. 1995. *Aristotle and His Philosophy*. New Jersey: Transaction Publishers

Engelhardt, Sandra. 2003. The Investigators of Crime in Literature

Forshaw, Barry. 2007. *The Rough Guide to Crime Fiction*. New York: Rough Guides.

Frank, Frederick S. and Tony Magistrale, eds. 1997. *The Poe Encyclopaedia*. Bucks: Greenwood.

Frank, Lucy, ed. 2007. *Representations of Death in Nineteenth-Century US Writing and Culture*. Surrey: Ashgate Publishing.

Galloway, David. 2003. 'Introduction and Notes to Edgar Allan Poe'. In *The Fall of the House of Usher and other Writings*. London: Penguin.

Garrett, Peter K. 2003. *Gothic Reflections: Narrative Force in Nineteenth-Century Fiction*. New York: Cornell University Press.

Gaut, Berys N. and Dominic Lopes. 2005. *The Routledge Companion to Aesthetics.* New York: Routledge.

Gomel, Elana. 2003. *Bloodscripts: Writing the Violent Subject.* Ohio: Ohio State University Press.

Gower, Barry. 2005. 'The Metaphysics of Science in the Romantic Era'. In *Science And Beliefs: From Natural Philosophy To Natural Science, 1700-1900 (Science, Technology and Culture, 1700-1945),* eds. David M. Knight and Matthew D. Eddy. Surrey: Ashgate Publishing. pp. 17 – 31.

Grossman, Jonathan H. 2003. *The Art of Alibi: English Law Courts and the Novel*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Fisher, Benjamin F. 2004. 'Introduction'. In *Essential Tales and Poems of Edgar Allan Poe*. Barnes & Noble Classics.

Fonseca, Tony. 2007. 'The Doppelgänger'. In *Icons of Horror and the Supernatural; Encyclopaedia of Our Worst Nightmares*, ed. S. T. Joshi. Bucks: Greenwood Press. pp.187 – 215.

Fortenbaugh, William W. 1983. 'On the Antecedents of Aristotle's Bipartite Psychology'. In *Essays in Ancient Greek Philosophy. Volume Two*, eds. John P. Anton and Anthony Preus. New York: State University of New York Press.   pp. 303 – 320.

Hamburger, Max. 1967. *Morals and Law: The Growth of Aristotle's Legal Theory*. Connecticut: Biblo-Moser.

Hamilton Buckley, Jerome. 1981. *The Victorian Temper: A Study in Literary Culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Harrison, Kimberly and Richard Fantina. 2006. *Victorian Sensations: Essays on a Scandalous Genre*. Ohio: Ohio State University Press.

Harvey, Ronald C. 1998. *The Critical History of Edgar Allan Poe's The Narrative of Arthur Gordon Pym: A Dialogue with Unreason*. New York: Routledge.

Hartmann, Jonathan. 2008. *The Marketing of Edgar Allan Poe.* New York: Routledge.

Haycraft, Howard. 1941. 'Murder for Pleasure'. Available at:

http://www.classiccrimefiction.com/howard-haycraft.htm. [Accessed 14th May 2009].

Haycraft, Howard. 1984. *Murder for Pleasure: The Life and Times of the Detective Story*. New York: Carroll & Graf Pub.

Hayes, Kevin J, ed. 2002. *The Cambridge Companion to Edgar Allan Poe.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hepburn, Allan. 2007. *Troubled Legacies*. Toronto: University of Toronto.

Herbert, Rosemary. 2003. *Whodunit? A Who's Who in Crime and Mystery Writing*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Herbrechter, Stefan and Ivan Callus, eds. 2009. *Cy-Borges: Memories of the Posthuman in the Work of Jorge Luis Borges.* Pennsylvania: Bucknell University Press.

Herdman, John. 1990. *The Double in Nineteenth-Century Fiction*. Basingstoke: Palgrave.

Herzogenrath, Bernd. 1999. *An Art of Desire. Reading Paul Auster*. Amsterdam: Rodopi.

Higbie, Robert. 1998. *Dickens and Imagination: Imagination in the Nineteenth Century.* Florida: University Press of Florida.

Hirsch, David H. 1996. 'Poe and Postmodernism'. In *A Companion to Poe Studies,* ed. Eric W. Carlson. Bucks: Greenwood Press.

Hobson, Quinn and Arthur Shawn Rosenheim, eds. 1998. *Edgar Allan Poe: A Critical Biography*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Hoffman, Daniel. 1972. *Poe, Poe, Poe, Poe, Poe, Poe, Poe*. New York: Doubleday.

Honderich, Ted, ed. 2005. *The Oxford Companion to Philosophy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hoppenstand, Gary. 1987. *In Search of the Paper Tiger: A Sociological Perspective of Myth, Formula, and the Mystery Genre in the Entertainment Print Mass Medium*. Ohio: Popular Press.

Horsley, Lee. 2005. *Twentieth-Century Crime Fiction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hovey, Kenneth Alan. 1996. 'Poe's Thought'. In *A Companion to Poe Studies,* ed. Eric W. Carlson. Bucks: Greenwood Press.

Hutchisson, James M. 2005. *Poe*. Mississippi: University Press of Mississippi.

Irwin, John T. 1995. 'Locked Rooms and Labyrinths in Poe and Borges'. In *The American Face of Edgar Allan Poe,* eds. Shawn Rosenheim & Stephen Rachman. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Irwin, John T. 1996. *The Mystery to a Solution*: *Borges, and the Analytic Detective Story.* Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Irwin, John T. 1998. 'Mysteries We Reread and Mysteries of Rereading: Poe, Borges, and the Analytic Story'. In *Detecting Texts: The Metaphysical Detective Story from Poe to Postmodernism*, eds. Patricia Merivale and Susan Elizabeth Sweeney. Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Irwin, John T. 2006. *Unless the Threat of Death Is Behind Them: Hard-Boiled Fiction and Film Noir.* Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

James, Louis. 2007. *The Victorian Novel*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

John, Juliet, ed. 1998. *Cult Criminals: The Newgate Novels (1830-47).* New York: Routledge.

Joshi, S. T. 2007. *Icons of Horror and the Supernatural; Encyclopaedia of Our Worst Nightmares.* Bucks: Greenwood Press.

Joswick, Thomas. 2005. 'Moods of Mind: The Tales of Detection, Crime and Punishment'. In *A Companion to Poe Studies*, ed. Eric W. Carlson. Bucks: Greenwood Press.

Kahn, Charles H. 1998. *Plato and the Socratic Dialogue: The Philosophical Use of a Literary Form.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Kant, Immanuel. 1783. 'Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics'. Available at:

http://philosophy.eserver.org/kant-prolegomena.txt. [Accessed 9th January 2010].

Kayman, Martin A. 2003. 'The Short Story from Poe to Chesterton'. In *The Cambridge Companion to Poe Studies*, ed. Martin Priestman. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. pp. 51 – 58.

Kim, Julie H., ed. 2005. *Race and Religion in the Postcolonial British Detective Story: Ten Essays*. North Carolina: McFarland & Co Inc.

Knight, Stephen. 2003. 'The Golden Age'. In *The Cambridge Companion to Crime Fiction,* ed. Martin Priestman. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. pp. 77 – 95.

Knuuttila, Simo. 2004. *Emotions in Ancient and Medieval Philosophy.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Lehman, David. 2001. *The Perfect Murder: A Study in Detection.* Michigan: University of Michigan Press.

Lee, Robert. 1989. *The Nineteenth-Century American Short Story.* Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Lee, Maurice S. 2010. 'Edgar Allan Poe (1809-1849)'. In *A Companion to Crime Fiction*, eds. Charles J. Rzepka and Lee Horsley. Massachusetts: Wiley-Blackwell. pp. 369 – 381.

Levine, Stuart and Susan Levine. 2000. In *Thirty-Two Stories*, by Edgar Allan Poe.

London: Hackett Publishing Company.

Loomba, Ania, 1998. *The New Critical Idiom: Colonialism/Postcolonialism*. New

York: Routledge.

Loughlin-Chow, M. Clare. 2002. 'The Sociological Contexts of Victorian Fiction'. In

A Companion to the Victorian Novel, eds. William Baker and Kenneth Womack.

Bucks: Greenwood Press. pp. 69 – 83.

MacKinnon, Barbara. 1985. *American Philosophy: a Historical Anthology*. New

York: State University of New York Press.

Mao, Zedong. 1992. *Mao's Road to Power: Pre-Marxist Period, 1912-20 v. 1:

Revolutionary Writings, 1912-49*, ed. Stuart R. Schram. New York: M.E Sharpe.

Marx, Karl and Friedrich Engels. 1970. *German Ideology, Part 1 and Selections from

Parts 2 and 3*, ed. Christopher John Arthur. New York: International Publishers.

Matthews, Brander. 2007. *Inquiries and Opinions.* Charleston: BiblioLife.

McCracken, Scott. 1998. *Pulp: Reading Popular Fiction.* Manchester: Manchester

University Press.

McKeon, Zahava Karl. 1982. *Novels and Arguments: Inventing Rhetorical Criticism*.

Chicago: University Of Chicago Press.

McLaughlin, Joseph. 2000. *Writing the Urban Jungle: Reading Empire in London
from Doyle to Eliot*. Virginia: University of Virginia Press.

McManus, Barbara F. 2002. 'Outline of Aristotle's Theory of Tragedy in the *Poetics'*.
Available at: http://www2.cnr.edu/home/bmcmanus/poetics.html. [Accessed 5th
January 2009].

McQuillan, Martin, ed. 2000. *The Narrative Reader*. New York: Routledge.

Merivale, Patricia and Susan Elizabeth Sweeney, eds. 1998. *Detecting Texts: The
Metaphysical Detective Story from Poe to Postmodernism.* Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania
Press.

Miller, Elizabeth Carolyn. 2007. 'At a Distance from the Scene of the Atrocity: Death
and Detachment in Poe's 'The Mystery of Marie Roget''. In *Representations of Death
in Nineteenth-Century US Writing and Culture*, ed. Lucy Frank. Aldershot: Ashgate
Publishing.

Miller, Karl. 1985. *Doubles: Studies in Literary History*. Oxford: Oxford University
Press.

Morra, Irene. 2004. 'Musical Detection and Novelistic Tradition'. In *The Idea of
Music in Victorian Fiction*, eds. Sophie Fuller et al. Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing.

Myerson, Joel, ed. 2000. *Transcendentalism: A Reader*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Mabbott, Thomas Ollive, Eleanor D. Kewer, and Maureen C. Mabbott, eds. 2000. *Tales and Sketches, vol. 1: 1831-1842* by Edgar Allan Poe. Illinois: University of Illinois Press.

Noakes, Richard. 2004. 'Spiritualism, Science and the Supernatural in mid-Victorian Britain'. In *The Victorian Supernatural*, eds. Nicola Bown, Carolyn Burdett, and Pamela Thurschwell. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. pp. 23 – 43.

Panek, LeRoy. 1987. *An Introduction to the Detective Story*. Ohio: Bowling Green University Popular Press.

Paul, Robert S. 1991. *Whatever Happened to Sherlock Holmes?: Detective Fiction, Popular Theology, and Society.* Illinois: Southern Illinois University Press.

Peeples, Scott. 2007. *The Afterlife of Edgar Allan Poe.* New York: Camden House.

Peirce, Charles S. 1982. *Writings of Charles S. Peirce: A Chronological Edition, Vol. 1 1857-1866*. Indiana: Indiana University Press.

Petrie, Duncan. 2004. *Contemporary Scottish Fictions: Film, Television and the Novel*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Phillips, Gene D. 2003. *Creatures of Darkness: Raymond Chandler, Detective Fiction and Film Noir.* Kentucky: University Press of Kentucky.

Pizer, John David. 1998. *Ego-Alter Ego: Double And/As Other in the Age of German Poetic Realism.* Carolina: University of North Carolina Press.

Plain, Gill. 2001. *Twentieth-Century Crime Fiction: Gender, Sexuality and the Body.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Pollin, Burton R. 1974. '*Poe, Creator of Words'.* Baltimore: The Edgar Allan Poe Society of Baltimore.

Pollin, Burton R. 1974. 'List of Single Words First Used or Coined by Poe'. In *Poe, Creator of Words.* Baltimore: The Edgar Allan Poe Society of Baltimore. Available at: http://www.eapoe.org/papers/PSBLCTRS/PL19741S.HTM. [Accessed: 7th January 2010].

Pittard, Christopher. 2010. 'From Sensation to the Strand'. In *A Companion to Crime Fiction,* eds. Charles J. Rzepka and Lee Horsley. New York: Wiley-Blackwell. pp.105 – 117.

Priestman, Martin, ed. 2003. *The Cambridge Companion to Crime Fiction.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Punter, David and Glennis Byron. 2004. *The Gothic.* Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Pykett, Lyn. 2003. 'The Newgate Novel and Sensation Fiction, 1830-1868'. In *The Cambridge Companion to Crime Fiction,* ed. Martin Priestman. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. pp.19 – 39.

Quinn, Arthur Hobson. 1997. *Edgar Allan Poe: A Critical Biography*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Quinn, Patrick Francis. 1957. *The French Face of Edgar Allan Poe*. Illinois: Southern Illinois University Press.

Rance, Nicholas. 1991. *Wilkie Collins and Other Sensation Novelists: Walking the Moral Hospital*. Madison: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press.

Rankin, Ian. 2003. 'Why Crime Fiction is Good for You'. In *The Writer's Handbook Guide to Crime Writing*, ed. Barry Turner. London: Macmillan. pp. 3 – 14.

Rankin, Ian. 2008. 'Jekyll and Hyde: an Appreciation'. In *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde*, by Robert Louis Stevenson. Kilmarnock: Waverley Books Ltd. pp. 9 – 13.

Rapatzikou, Tatiani. 2003. 'Chronology'. In *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings,* by Edgar Allan Poe. London: Penguin Books.

Reddy, Maureen T. 2003. 'Women Detectives'. In *The Cambridge Companion to Crime Fiction,* ed. Martin Priestman. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. pp. 191 – 208.

Redmond, Christopher. 1988. *Welcome to America, Mr. Sherlock Holmes: Victorian America Meets Arthur Conan Doyle*. Toronto: Simon & Pierre Pub Co Ltd.

Reesor, Margaret E. 1983. 'Anaxagoras and Epicurus'. In *Essays in Ancient Greek Philosophy. Volume Two,* eds. John P. Anton and Anthony Preus. New York: State University of New York. pp. 93 – 107.

Reitz, Caroline. 2004. *Detecting the Nation: Fictions of Detection and the Imperial Venture, 1788-1927.* Ohio: Ohio State University Press.

Roberts, Doreen. 2001. 'Introduction and Notes'. In *Bleak House,* by Charles Dickens. Stevenage: Wordsworth Editions Limited. pp. v – xix.

Rockmore, Tom. 2004. *On Foundationalism: A Strategy for Metaphysical Realism*. Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield.

Rockmore, Tom. 2004. *Kant and Idealism*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Rose, Brian A. 1996. *Jekyll and Hyde: Adapted Dramatizations of Cultural Anxiety*. Bucks: Greenwood Press.

Rosenheim, Shawn and Stephen Rachman, eds. 1995. *The American Face of Edgar Allan Poe.* Maryland: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Ross, Danforth. 1961. *The American Short Story - American Writers 14: University of Minnesota Pamphlets on American Writers*. Minnesota: University Of Minnesota Press.

Roy, Pinaki. 2008. *The Manichean Investigators: Postcolonial and Culture Rereading of the Sherlock Holmes and Byomkesh Bakshi Stories*. New Dehli: Sarup & Son.

Russell, Bertrand. 2009. *The Practice and Theory of Bolshevism*. Charleston: BiblioBazaar.

Rzepka, Charles J. 2005. *Detective Fiction*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Rzepka, Charles J. and Lee Horsley, eds. 2010. *A Companion to Crime Fiction*. New York: Wiley-Blackwell.

Sayers, Dorothy L. 1980. 'Aristotle on Detective Fiction'. In *Detective Fiction: A Collection of Critical Essays,* ed. Robin W. Winks. London: Prentice Hall Trade.

Scaggs, John. 2005. *Crime Fiction*. New York: Routledge.

Silverman, Kenneth. 1992. *Edgar A. Poe: Mournful and Never-ending Remembrance*. London: Harper Perennial.

Sinclair, Iain and Ed Glinert. 2001. 'Introduction'. In *A Study in Scarlet,* Arthur Conan Doyle. London: Penguin.

Sørensen, Bent. 'Love, Identity and Reason in the Tales of Edgar Allan Poe'.
Available: http://www.hum.aau.dk/~i12bent/Texts/poebook.pdf. [Accessed 15
December 2008].

Stade, George. 2007. *Literature, Moderns, Monsters, Popsters and Us*. Pari: Pari
Publishing.

Staton, Shirley F. 1987. *Literary Theories in Praxis*. Pennsylvania: University of
Pennsylvania Press.

Stern-Gillet, Suzanne and Kevin Corrigan, eds. 2008. *Reading Ancient Texts, Aristotle
and Neoplatonism: Essays in Honour of Denis O'Brien*. Boston: Brill Academic
Publishers.

Stevenson, Randall. 1993. *A Reader's Guide to the Twentieth-Century Novel in Britain*.
Kentucky: University of Kentucky.

Suchoff, David. 1994. *Critical Theory and the Novel: Mass Society and Cultural
Criticism in Dickens, Melville, and Kafka*. Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press.

Sugg, Richard P. 1992. *Jungian Literary Criticism*. Illinois: Northwestern University
Press.

Thoms, Peter. 1998. *Detection & its Designs: Narrative & Power in 19th-Century
Detective Fiction*. Ohio: Ohio University Press.

Thoms, Peter. 2002. 'Dupin and the Power of Detection'. In *The Cambridge Companion to Edgar Allan Poe,* ed. Kevin J. Hayes. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Thomas, Ronald R. 1992. *Dreams of Authority: Freud and the Fictions of the Unconscious.* New York: Cornell University Press.

Thomas, Ronald R. 2004. *Detective Fiction and the Rise of Forensic Science*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Thomas, Ronald R. 2006. 'The Moonstone, Detective Fiction and Forensic Science'. In *The Cambridge Companion to Wilkie Collins*, ed. Jenny Bourne Taylor. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Thompson, Jon. 1993. *Fiction, Crime, and Empire*. Illinois: University of Illinois Press.

Thomson, Henry Douglas. 1978. *Masters of Mystery: A Study of the Detective Story.* New York: Dover Publications.

Tillotson, Geoffrey. 1964. 'Critical Study'. In *Bleak House*, by Charles Dickens. New York: Signet Classics.

Turner, Barry, ed. 2003. *The Writer's Handbook Guide to Crime Writing*. Basingstoke: Macmillan.

Van Dover, J.K. 1994. *You Know My Method: Science of the Detective*. Ohio: Popular

Press.

Van Dover, J.K. 1997. *Isn't Justice Always Unfair?: Detectives In Southern Literature*.

Ohio: Popular Press.

Van Dover, J.K. 2005. *We Must Have Certainty: Four Essays On The Detective Story*.

Pennsylvania: Susquehanna University Press.

Vines, Lois D. 1996. 'Edgar Allan Poe: A Writer For the World'. In *A Companion to

Poe Studies,* ed. Eric W. Carlson. Bucks: Greenwood Press.

Voloshin, Beverley R. 1996. 'The Essays and "Marginalia": Poe's Literary Theory'.

In *A Companion to Poe Studies,* ed. Eric W. Carlson. Bucks: Greenwood Press.

Wadleigh Chandler, Frank. 1958. *The Literature of Roguery Volume I.* New York:

Burt Franklin.

Wagner, E. J. 2006. *The Science of Sherlock Holmes.* Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Walder, Dennis, ed. 2001. *The Nineteenth-Century Novel: Identities*. New York:

Routledge.

Wales, Tim. 2001. 'Thief takers and their client in later Stuart London'. In

Londinopolis, c.1500 - c.1750: Essays in the Cultural and Social History of Early

Modern London, eds. Paul Griffiths and Mark S.R. Jenner. Manchester: Manchester University Press. pp. 67 – 86.

Walton, Priscilla L. and Manina Jones. 1999. *Detective Agency: Women Rewriting the Hard-Boiled Tradition.* California: University of California Press.

Watt, Ian P. 1971. *The Victorian Novel: Modern Essays in Criticism.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Weber, Alfred. 1925. *History of Philosophy.* New York: Scribner's Sons.

Westphal, Kenneth R. 2005. *Kant's Transcendental Proof of Realism.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Winters, Yuor. 2007. *Defense of Reason.* Burrard Press.

Wood, Michael. 1989. 'Poe's Tales: the Art of the Impossible'. In *The Nineteenth-Century American Short Story,* ed. Robert Lee. Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Worthington, Heather. 2005. *The Rise of the Detective in Early Nineteenth-Century Popular Fiction*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Zimmerman, Brett. 2005. *Edgar Allan Poe: Rhetoric and Style*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Journals and Papers

Ashley, Robert P. 1951. 'Wilkie Collins and the Detective Story'. *Nineteenth-Century Fiction* 6 (1): 47 – 60.

Barrowman, Carole E. 2004. 'The Dark Threads of Tartan Noir'. *The Milwaukee Journal Sentinel.* Available at: http://www.carolebarrowman.com/the-dark-threads-of-tartan-noir/. [Accessed 12 June 2008].

Bellei, Sergio L. P. 1976. 'The Purloined Letter: A Theory of Perception'. *Poe Studies* IX (2): 40 – 42.

Biersack, Aletta. 1999. 'Introduction: From the "New Ecology" to the New Ecologies'. *American Anthropologist* 101 (1): 5 – 18.

Brantlinger, Patrick. 1982. 'What Is 'Sensational' About the 'Sensation Novel''. *Nineteenth-Century Fiction* 37 (1): 1 – 28.

Chamberlain, Charles. 1984. 'The Meaning of Prohairesis in Aristotle's Ethics', *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 114: 147 – 157.

Chapin Jones, Philip. 1943. 'Physics and Idealism'. *Philosophy of Science* 10 (1): 34 – 39.

Devine, Rachel, 'The thriller of suburbia'. *The Sunday Times*. 3rd May.

Feuer, Lewis S. 1948. 'Materialism, Idealism and Science'. *Philosophy of Science* 15 (1): 71 - 75.

Fradin Joseph I. 1966. 'Will and Society in Bleak House'. *PMLA* 81 (1): 95 – 109.

Frank, Lawrence. 1995. ''The Murders in the Rue Morgue': Edgar Allan Poe's Evolutionary Reverie', *Nineteenth-Century Literature* 50 (2): 168 – 188.

Galloway, Shirley. 1997. 'Bleak House: Public and Private Worlds'. Available at: http://www.cyberpat.com/shirlsite/essays/bleak.html. [Accessed 7th November 2008].

Garrett, Peter K. 1997. 'Double Plots and Dialogical Form in Victorian Fiction'. *Nineteenth-Century Fiction* 32 (1): 1 – 17.

Gish, Nancy K. 2007. 'Jekyll and Hyde: The Psychology of Dissociation'. *International Journal of Scottish Literature*. Available at: http://www.ijsl.stir.ac.uk/issue2/gish.htm. [Accessed 6th November 2008].

Grella, George. 1970. 'Murder and Manners: The Formal Detective Novel'. *NOVEL: A Forum on Fiction* 4 (1): 30 – 48.

Hodgson, John A. 1992. 'The Recoil of 'The Speckled Band': Detective Story and Detective Discourse'. *Poetics Today* 13 (2): 309 – 324.

Hull, Richard. 1990. ''The Purloined Letter': Poe's Detective Story vs. Panoptic Foucauldian theory'. *Style* 24 (2): 201 – 215.

Irwin, John T. 1986. 'Mysteries We Reread, Mysteries of Rereading: Poe, Borges and the Analytic Detective Story; Also Lacan, Derrida, and Johnson'. *Comparative Literature* 101 (5): 1168 – 1215.

Kennedy, J. Gerald. 1975. 'The Limits of Reason: Poe's Deluded Detectives'. *American Literature* 47 (2): 184 – 196.

Kennedy, J. Gerald. 1996. 'The Violence of Melancholy: Poe against Himself'. *American Literary History* 8 (3): 533 – 551.

Kemp, Peter. 2008. 'A writer needs as much trauma as she can take'. *The Sunday Times*. 17th August: 10 – 11.

Lonoff, Sue. 1980. 'Charles Dickens and Wilkie Collins'. *Nineteenth-Century Fiction* 35 (2): 150 – 170.

Lemay, J. A. Leo. 1982. 'The Psychology of 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue''. *American Literature* 54 (2): 165 – 188.

Moldenhauer, Joseph J. 1968. 'Murder as a Fine Art: Basic Connections between Poe's Aesthetics, Psychology, and Moral Vision'. *PMLA* 83 (2): 284 – 29.

O'Connor, Edmund. 2008a. 'Ian Rankin Interviewed'. *Chapman* 108: 27 – 34.

O'Connor, Edmund. 2008b. 'Tartan Noir: Invented Certainties in Mean Wynds', *Chapman* 108: 50 – 58.

Poquette, Ryan D. 2006. 'The Purloined Letter: Critical Essay on 'The Purloined Letter''. *Detroit: Gale*. Available at: http://www.enotes.com/purloined-letter/. [Accessed 9th October 2008].

Pritchard, John Paul. 1934. 'Aristotle's *Poetics* and Certain American Literary Critics'. *The Classical Weekly* 27 (11): 81 – 85.

Redmond, James. 2001. 'A Study in Sin: Religious Hypocrisy and Fanaticism (and out of) A Study in Scarlet'. *The Baker Street Journal* 54 (1): 31 – 37.

Reitz, Caroline. 2000. 'Bad Cop/Good Cop: Godwin, Mill and the Imperial Origins of the English Detective'. *NOVEL: A Forum on Fiction* 33 (2): 175 – 195.

Rosenheim, Shawn. 1989. 'The King of 'Secret Readers': Edgar Poe, Cryptography, and the Origins of the Detective Story'. *ELH* 56 (2): 375 – 400.

Stovall, Floyd. 1963. 'The Conscious Art of Edgar Allan Poe'. *College English* 24 (6): 417 – 421.

Summerscale, Kate. 2008. 'The prince of sleuths: The policeman investigating a horrific murder case in 1860 provided the template for the archetypal detective hero'. *The Guardian* 5th April. Available at:

www.guardian.co.uk/books/2008/apr/05/featuresreviews.guardianreview29. [Accessed 27th October 2008.]

Thomas, Ronald R. 1994. 'The Fingerprint of the Foreigner: Colonizing the Criminal Body in 1890s Detective Fiction and Criminal Anthropology'. *ELH* 61 (3): 655 – 683.

Wadsworth Smith, Edgar, ed. 2006. *The Baker Street Journal: an irregular quarterly of Sherlockian* (56-57).

Van Dine, S. S. 1928. 'Twenty rules for writing detective stories'. *American Magazine,* September.

1845. 'The Purloined Letter', *Littell's Living Age*, eds. Eliakim Littell and Robert S. Littell 190: 135 – 138.

1853. 'Characters in Bleak House'. *Putnam's Monthly* 2 (July – December): 558 – 648

2000. 'Secrets and lies: the impossible world of DI John Rebus'. *The Guardian.* Available at: http://www.guardian.co.uk/books/2000/apr/19/ianrankin. [Accessed 10th February 2009].