University of Windsor Scholarship at UWindsor

Integrative Biology Publications

Department of Integrative Biology

4-1-2017

Costs of reproduction and carry-over effects in breeding albatrosses

Glenn T. Crossin Dalhousie University

Richard A. Phillips British Antarctic Survey

Christine R. Lattin *Tufts University*

L. Michael Romero *Tufts University*

Xavier Bordeleau Dalhousie University

See next page for additional authors

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/ibiopub

Part of the Integrative Biology Commons

Recommended Citation

Crossin, Glenn T.; Phillips, Richard A.; Lattin, Christine R.; Romero, L. Michael; Bordeleau, Xavier; Harris, Christopher M.; Love, Oliver P.; and Williams, Tony D.. (2017). Costs of reproduction and carry-over effects in breeding albatrosses. *Antarctic Science*, 29 (2), 155-164. https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/ibiopub/56

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Department of Integrative Biology at Scholarship at UWindsor. It has been accepted for inclusion in Integrative Biology Publications by an authorized administrator of Scholarship at UWindsor. For more information, please contact scholarship@uwindsor.ca.

Authors

Glenn T. Crossin, Richard A. Phillips, Christine R. Lattin, L. Michael Romero, Xavier Bordeleau, Christopher M. Harris, Oliver P. Love, and Tony D. Williams

1	Costs of reproduction and carryover effects in breeding albatrosses.
2	
3	
4	Glenn T. Crossin ^{1*} , Richard A. Phillips ² , Christine R. Lattin ³ , L. Michael Romero ³ , Xavier
5	Bordeleau ¹ , Christopher M. Harris ⁴ , Oliver P. Love ⁴ , and Tony D. Williams ⁵
6	
7	
8	¹ Department of Biology, Dalhousie University, Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada
9	² British Antarctic Survey, Natural Environment Research Council, High Cross, Madingley Road,
10	Cambridge, United Kingdom
11	³ Department of Biology, Tufts University, Medford, MA, 02155, United States
12	⁴ Department of Biological Sciences and Great Lakes Institute for Environmental Research,
13	University of Windsor, Windsor, Ontario, Canada
14	⁵ Department of Biological Sciences, Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada
15	
16	
17	
18	* Corresponding author: gtc@dal.ca
19	
20	
21	Running title: Costs of reproduction and carryover effects in albatrosses.

22 Abstract

23 We investigated the physiology of two closely related albatross species relative to their breeding 24 strategy: black-browed albatrosses (*Thalassarche melanophris*) breed annually, while grey-headed 25 albatrosses (*T. chrysostoma*) breed biennially. Via observations of breeding fate and blood samples 26 collected at the end of breeding in one season, and feather corticosterone levels sampled at the 27 beginning of the next breeding season, we found that in both species, some post-breeding 28 physiological parameters differed according to breeding outcome (successful, failed, deferred). 29 Correlations between post-breeding physiology and fCort, and links to future breeding decisions, 30 were examined. In black-browed albatrosses, post-breeding physiology and fCort were not 31 significantly correlated, but fCort independently predicted breeding decision the next year, which 32 we interpret as a possible migratory carryover effect. In grey-headed albatrosses, post-breeding 33 triglyceride levels were negatively correlated with fCort, but only in females, which we interpret 34 as a potential cost of reproduction. However, this potential cost didn't carry-over to future breeding 35 in the grey-headed albatrosses; none of the variables predicted future breeding decision. We 36 suggest that biennial breeding in the grey-headed albatrosses may have evolved as a strategy to 37 buffer against the apparent susceptibility of females to negative physiological costs of 38 reproduction. Future studies are needed to confirm this.

39

40 Keywords: testosterone; hematocrit; feather corticosterone; glucocorticoids; triglycerides;
41 migration

43 Introduction

44 There is considerable experimental evidence for costs of reproduction in birds, which 45 include both short-term costs associated with specific stages of the breeding cycle (e.g. incubation 46 or chick rearing; Monaghan et al. 1995, Monaghan et al. 1998), and longer-term costs that carry 47 over to affect future reproductive investment (Daan et al. 1996). Carryover effects have been 48 documented in several bird species, and influence traits such as the timing of breeding (Descamps 49 et al. 2011, Harrison et al. 2011), breeding deferral (Ebbinge and Spaans 1995, Crossin et al. 2012, 50 Crossin et al. 2013a) and breeding output (Ebbinge and Spaans 1995). The physiological 51 mechanisms that underlie these costs however, and whether they involve limitations in food 52 resource or energy, or some other non-resource based constraint arising from competing 53 physiological systems, are uncertain (Williams 2012). Previous studies have, however, proposed a 54 role for glucocorticoid hormones (Bortolotti et al. 2008, Crossin et al. 2013b), energy reserves 55 (Harrison et al. 2011), and hematocrit or aerobic capacity (Williams 2012, Crossin et al. 2013a) as 56 potential mediators of costs and carryover effects.

57 The role of the glucocorticoid hormones, specifically corticosterone and cortisol (called 58 hereafter "Cort"), and whether they have a positive or negative relationship with particular life-59 history traits, depends on whether they are expressed at baseline or stress-induced levels (Bonier 60 et al. 2009, Crossin et al. 2016). Given Cort's fundamental role in energy acquisition and 61 metabolism, Cort may be the key factor that explains individual variation in energy balance, body 62 condition, and the condition-dependence of breeding activity (Descamps et al. 2011). In birds and 63 mammals, an effective means of resolving such relationships involves the analysis of Cort in 64 keratin-based structures, including feathers (Bortolotti et al. 2008, Lattin et al. 2011). Cort 65 deposited into these structures from the general circulation is thought to provide an integrated 66 measure of hypothalamo-pituitary-adrenal axis (HPA) activity over time-scales relevant to lifehistory, e.g. transitions between non-breeding and breeding stages of the annual cycle. In birds,
measurement of feather Cort levels (fCort) has revealed links between previous breeding activity,
migration, and future reproductive investment, thus revealing carryover effects onto key traits,
including breeding decisions (whether to lay or defer), laying date, and egg sizes (Bortolotti *et al.*2008, Crossin *et al.* 2013b, Kouwenberg *et al.* 2013).

72 Other studies have suggested that variation in energy reserves (or condition) might also 73 mediate carryover effects (see review by Harrison et al. 2011; in this context, condition is 74 presumably linked to Cort as a metabolic regulator, although as noted above the dynamics between 75 Cort and condition in mediating carryover effects are poorly defined). Links between pre-breeding 76 condition and breeding investment have been demonstrated in birds (Harrison et al. 2011, 77 O'Connor *et al.* 2014), especially in capital breeders via modifications to laying date or breeding 78 success, via trade-offs between current reproduction and survival (Prop et al. 2003), and via clutch 79 size manipulations (Monaghan and Nager 1997). Harrison et al. (2011) note that low rates of pre-80 breeding energy intake can adversely affect reproductive traits in many birds and other species 81 (Ebbinge and Spaans 1995, Prop et al. 2003). Plasma triglycerides provide one method for 82 assessing individual condition, as these correlate with both energy intake and fattening rate in birds 83 (Guglielmo and Williams 2003). As with body mass, variation in triglyceride levels in pre-breeding 84 birds could signal a carryover effect with potential implications for subsequent investment 85 decisions (Hennin et al. 2015).

Although it seems intuitive that carryover effects could be generated by energy or nutrient limitation (Harrison *et al.* 2011), conceivably they could reflect deficiencies in other physiological currencies. In many migratory birds, hematocrit (red blood cell percentage) is up-regulated during migration to increase oxygen-transport capacity (Piersma *et al.* 1996), which is a key trait for sustaining high aerobic performance for long-distance flight. However, hematocrit can be impacted

91 negatively by reproductive processes, specifically by estradiol (E₂) secretion during egg 92 production, which can result in a debilitating reproductive anemia that can persist for up to a year 93 (Kalmbach et al. 2004; Crossin et al. 2013a). Low hematocrit could therefore indicate a potential 94 carryover effect in the form of reduced migratory performance and increased costs that ultimately 95 constrain future reproductive investment. By extension, variation in testosterone levels could also 96 be important as androgens are known to stimulate erythropoiesis, and affect breeding decisions in 97 birds (Crossin et al. 2012). Previous work has shown that sex steroid expression (progesterone, 98 testosterone) during the pre-breeding period can predict breeding decisions in albatrosses (Crossin 99 et al. 2012, Crossin et al. 2013a). Sex steroids and Cort also affected breeding output in marine 100 iguanas (Amblyrhynchus cristatus) and other reptiles (Vitousek et al. 2010).

101 Long-lived seabird species characterized by slow life-histories and single-egg clutches 102 (Jouventin and Dobson 2002) provide ideal model species for exploring the physiological costs of 103 reproduction and mechanisms involved in carryover effects. The congeneric black-browed 104 albatross (Thalassarche melanophris) and grey-headed albatross (T. chrysostoma) breed 105 sympatrically throughout much of their range in the sub-Antarctic, but display very different 106 reproductive life-histories. As in the majority of bird species worldwide, black-browed albatrosses 107 are annual breeders, although a small proportion breed in alternate years. In contrast, grey-headed 108 albatrosses generally breed biennially if successful, as do all the great albatrosses (Diomedea spp.) 109 and sooty albatrosses (*Phoebetria* spp.) (Tickell 2000). Sister species like the black-browed and 110 grey-headed albatrosses, with markedly different breeding strategies, therefore provide a good 111 contrast for exploring the potential physiological mechanisms underlying breeding frequency and 112 links to costs of reproduction and carryover effects.

Biennial breeding is often associated with life-histories characterized by long periods ofintensive bi-parental care. In wandering albatrosses and king penguins for example, birds usually

115 take a year or more to fledge their chicks, making it impossible, or at least impractical, for them to 116 initiate another breeding attempt whilst still rearing young from the previous season (but see 117 Weimerskirch et al. 2015). However, biennial grey-headed albatrosses rear their chicks in a single 118 summer, on a schedule that starts one week earlier and ends 2-4 weeks later than that of the 119 sympatric, annually-breeding black-browed albatrosses. Despite this, most grey-headed albatrosses 120 will not attempt to breed in the successive year as annual breeders generally do (although some 121 may if they fail breeding early in the previous year; Ryan et al. 2007), even though parental care is 122 not as prolonged as in some other biennial species. This begs the question: why don't grey-headed 123 albatrosses breed every year? It has been suggested that biennial breeding in grey-headed 124 albatrosses is the result of a) the short time available to adults to recover body condition and replace 125 flight feathers before the start of the following season (Ryan et al. 2007), which may either be 126 related to, or resulting in, b) a physiological cost of reproduction that carries over to negatively 127 affect future breeding effort (e.g. Crossin et al. 2013b).

128 In this study, we explore whether physiological costs link current to future reproduction, 129 which would suggest a physiological carryover effect (Crossin et al. 2013b) We do so by 130 comparing the annual and biennial breeding systems found within the genus Thalassarche. We 131 determined the breeding fate (successful, failed, or deferred breeding) of black-browed albatrosses 132 (annual) and grey-headed albatrosses (biennial) at the end of a breeding season, and sampled them 133 for indicators of their energetic (triglycerides), aerobic (hematocrit), and hormonal (testosterone) 134 condition. We then examined correlations between these indicators and Cort levels measured in 135 tail feathers grown during the subsequent nonbreeding period. Assuming that variation in fCort 136 levels indicate the "stress state" of non-breeding individuals after the breeding season, we then 137 predict relationships between fCort and 1) previous breeding fate, and 2) post-breeding 138 physiological condition of those individuals, as indicated by triglyceride, testosterone, and hematocrit levels. For example, if low triglyceride and low hematocrit levels correlated with high fCort in the breeding birds (successful and failed) but not in the non-breeding deferring birds, then this would suggest a cost of reproduction that carries over into winter. Finally, we predict that 3) fCort would itself carry over to affect future reproductive investment, e.g. the decision to breed, with high fCort indicative of deferred breeding in the following season. We discuss our results relative to hypotheses regarding the physiological costs of reproduction, and speculate on the evolution of annual versus biennial breeding strategies.

- 146
- 147 Methods
- 148 *Study site*

149 Fieldwork was conducted during austral summers 2008/09 and 2009/10 at Bird Island, 150 South Georgia (54°01'S, 38°02'W), a sub-Antarctic island group that is one of the most important 151 breeding sites, globally, for grey-headed and black-browed albatrosses. Individually banded 152 albatrosses of known age and breeding history in long-term monitoring colonies were sampled 153 (grey-headed albatrosses in Colonies B and E, and black-browed albatrosses in Colony J). All birds 154 had bred at least once previously. Research was approved by the Ethics Committee of the British 155 Antarctic Survey and carried out under permits issued by the Government of South Georgia and 156 South Sandwich Islands. Sampling protocols conformed to guidelines established by the Canadian 157 Committee on Animal Care (Simon Fraser University Animal Care Permit 897B-8).

158

159 *Study species*

The breeding and foraging ecology of grey-headed and black-browed albatrosses at Bird
Island is well studied (Prince 1985, Phillips *et al.* 2004, Crossin *et al.* 2012, Crossin *et al.* 2013a).
Both species are monogamous and lay a single egg. After a long incubation period, the single chick

163 is reared by both parents over the next 4-5 months. Grey-headed albatrosses (GHA) arrive at the 164 breeding colony in spring, usually around mid September, approximately a fortnight earlier, have 165 a slightly longer incubation period (72 vs. 68 days), and a longer chick-rearing period (141 vs. 116 166 days), which makes their breeding season ~45 days longer than black-browed albatrosses (BBA). 167 There is a degree of niche divergence partially mediated by differences in flight performance 168 (Phillips et al. 2004), and although the diets overlap, chicks of grey-headed albatrosses are fed 169 more squid, and those of black-browed albatrosses are fed more krill and fish. The lower energy 170 density of squid contributes to the slower growth rate and longer fledging period of grey-headed 171 albatross chicks. At South Georgia, approximately 80% of the breeding population of black-172 browed albatrosses returns to breed the following year, the absence of the remainder due principally 173 to either natural mortality or loss of partner (Croxall et al. 1998). In contrast, only ~1% of 174 successfully breeding grey-headed albatrosses will breed again the following year, 25-80% two 175 years later, and all but a small minority within three or four years, whereas those that fail in 176 incubation or early chick-rearing in one year will generally breed the next year (Ryan et al. 2007). 177 All of our analyses however examined the post-breeding physiology and fCort relative to breeding 178 activity in the very next year, not two or more years later.

179

180 Sampling design

A timeline of our sampling protocol is presented in Fig. 1. From 24 January to 6 February 2009, we sampled non-breeding (i.e. deferring) black-browed and grey-headed albatrosses at nests in their respective colonies. Daily monitoring records of the albatross colonies at Bird Island, maintained by the British Antarctic Survey, allowed us to know the breeding status of all individuals. Deferring albatrosses return to and spend time in the colony each year, despite not breeding, presumably to re-establish pair bonds (Tickell 2000). Deferring black-browed albatrosses 187 typically depart South Georgia for winter migration in early February (Phillips et al. 2005), so our 188 sampling plan aimed to capture these birds and deferring grey-headed albatrosses before their 189 departures (see Table 1 for numbers of birds sampled). From 30 March to 2 April, we sampled 190 successful and failed breeders before their out-migration in mid-April. Blood samples (2 ml) were 191 collected from the brachial vein using syringes with 25 gauge needles, and returned to the 192 laboratory where the plasma was separated by centrifugation and stored at -20 °C. In all cases, 193 blood was collected in less than 3 min from first approach to the bird. Ultimately, we sampled 125 194 albatrosses at the end of the 2008/09 season (BBA=62, GHA=63), 68 of which were resampled 195 when they subsequently returned to breed in the following season in 2009/10. Therefore, the 196 analyses conducted in this study were restricted to the 68 birds sampled in both 2008/09 and 197 2009/10 (BBA=50, GHA=18). Upon arrival at breeding colonies in 2009/10, a single rectrix was 198 collected from each bird. Specifically, we collected only the outer-most rectrix from the right side 199 of the bird, by cutting the feather with scissors at the base of the feather shaft (calamus). This was 200 done to ensure that we sampled newly moulted feathers, as the sequence of rectrix moult is from 201 outer to inner (Prince et al. 1993). These were stored in labeled bags and kept in the dark at 4 °C 202 until analysis of feather Cort.

203

204 Physiological assays

Plasma samples and known standards were assayed in duplicate for total triglyceride levels (Trig) using a commercial triglyceride kit (Glycerol Reagents A and B, Sigma), and measured using a Biotek 340i microplate reader. Additionally, multiple duplicates of a domestic hen (*Gallus domesticus*) plasma pool were also assayed to provide a mean intra-assay coefficient of variation was 7.1%. The inter-assay coefficient of variation was 6.7%. Hematocrit (Hct) was measured in fresh whole blood by centrifugation in microhematocrit
tubes (2 per individual) for 5 min at 10,000 g, and is reported as packed cell volume (%).

212 Testosterone (T) was measured by first extracting plasma samples in dichloromethane and 213 then quantifying hormone levels using a commercially available enzyme-linked immunosorbent 214 assay (Cayman Chemicals Kit 582701). For each species, an extracted plasma pool was found to 215 be parallel to the standard curve, and samples were assayed in triplicate at a 1:10 dilution. Samples 216 were assayed across 6 plates yielding inter and intra-assay coefficients of variation of 4.6% and 217 6.3%, respectively. Extraction efficiency was assessed by spiking 4 randomly-chosen samples for 218 each species with a known amount of testosterone standard immediately before extraction and 219 comparing measured hormone levels to their corresponding normally-assayed (unspiked) levels. 220 Average recovery was found to be 76.4% for black-browed albatrosses and 79.7% for grey-headed 221 albatrosses. Statistical analyses were run on values corrected for these extraction efficiencies.

222 Corticosterone measured in the feathers of the same birds upon their return to Bird Island 223 reflect plasma Cort levels in the weeks-months immediately after their departure from the breeding 224 colony when tail feathers are moulted and regrown (Prince et al. 1993, Catry et al. 2013, Bugoni 225 et al. 2015). To assay fCort, we used a standard radioimmunoassay as per Bortolotti et al. (2008), 226 modified by Lattin et al. (2011), and following the protocol detailed in Crossin et al. (2013b). We 227 determined the intra-assay coefficient of variation by measuring differences between duplicates, 228 and the inter-assay variation by measuring differences between standard samples (using two 229 standards: a known amount of Cort, and pulverized, homogenized feathers) (Romero and Fairhurst 230 2016). Intra-assay variation was 4.0%; inter-assay variation was 7.4%.

231

232 Statistical analyses

233 All blood variables were examined for correlations with the time required to collect the 234 blood sample and the date of collection. Due to known differences in life-history, behaviour, and 235 physiology, we ran models for each species separately. To test our first prediction that fCort levels 236 are related to previous breeding fate, we examined fCort, for each species separately (ANOVAs), 237 by sex and breeding fate (successful, failed, deferred) as categorical factors, along with their 238 interaction (sex*fate). We then ran similar models to describe the species' post-breeding 239 physiological state (Trig, T, Hct) at the end of the 2008/09 breeding season. To test our second 240 prediction of a relationship between end-of-breeding season physiological indicators and fCort, 241 Pearson's correlations by species and sex were examined. To test our third prediction that variation 242 in fCort carries over to affect future breeding decision by each species, we used backwards stepwise 243 generalized linear models with binomial response distributions to explore the variables most related 244 to future breeding decision (breed or defer), in the subsequent breeding season only (2009/10 245 season). Explanatory predictors included fCort, as well as bird sex, previous breeding status 246 (breeder or non-breeder), T, Trig, and Hct. We restricted this comparison to the 2009/10 year only 247 so that the physiological links from one season to breeding in the next could be compared between 248 species simultaneously and on identical time scales.

249

250 Results

As albatrosses were sampled in two different seasons (end of 2008/09 season for blood, and beginning of 2009/10 season for feathers), we explored whether any of the physiological variables correlated with sampling time or date. In 2008/09, there were no correlations between sampling time (number of seconds to collect the blood sample) or date with any of the blood parameter levels (Pearson's correlations with Trig, T, and Hct, all P>0.09). The end-of-season physiological results were determined for each species by ANOVA models examining differences by sex and breeding fate (Fig. 2). In the black-browed albatrosses (N=50), Trig and T levels of females, but not males, were significantly higher in deferring breeders than in successful or failed breeders (Trig sex*fate interaction β =0.142, P=0.004. T: sex*fate interaction β =53.42, P=0.008). Hct levels did not differ by sex, but were generally lower in deferring than in successful or failed black-browed albatrosses (sex β =-0.886, P=0.126; fate β =-1.030, P=0.010; sex*fate β =-0.418, P=0.163).

263 In the grey-headed albatrosses (N=18), Trig did not differ between sexes or among breeding 264 fates (sex ß=0.044, P=0.567; fate ß=-0.097, P=0.095; sex*fate ß=0.013, P=0.437). However, T was 265 significantly higher in deferring males than in successful and failed males, while females did not 266 differ among fates (sex β =-24.78, P=0.030; fate β =5.30, P=0.187; sex*fate β =-9.140, P=0.043). 267 Hct did not differ by sex, but was generally higher in successful and failed breeders than in 268 deferring breeders (sex β =-0.980, P=0.171; fate β =-1.540, P=0.001; sex*fate β =-0.345, P=0.625). 269 Finally, fCort did not differ among grey-headed sexes or fates (sex β =-0.476, P=0.151; fate 270 $\beta = 0.109$, P=748; sex*fate $\beta = -0.071$, P=0.897).

271 Contrary to our first prediction, fCort did not differ between the sexes or among breeding 272 fates in either species (BBA N=50: sex β =-0.584, P=0.070; fate β =0.034, P=0.778; sex*fate β =-273 0.056, P=0.925. GHA N=18: sex β =-0.476, P=0.151; fate β =0.109, P=748; sex*fate β =-0.071, 274 P=0.897). However, we found partial support for our second prediction in that fCort showed a 275 significant negative correlation with Trig levels in female grey-headed albatrosses (r=-0.703, N=12 276 P=0.011), but not in male grey-headed albatrosses (r=-0.202, N=15, P=0.471) or either black-277 browed albatross sex (females, r=-0.022, N=23 P=0.921; males, r=-0.314, N=21, P=0.116) (Fig. 278 3). The only other significant correlation in this set of analyses was a negative relationship between 279 T and Hct in female black-browed albatrosses (r=-0.577, N=30, P<0.001; data not shown).

Comparisons of generalized linear models examining future breeding decisions by blackbrowed albatrosses are presented in Table 2. The most parsimonious model identified via AICc selection identifies a significant effect of fCort on breeding decision, such that when fCort is high there is greater tendency to defer breeding (P=0.028; Table 3), which supports our third prediction that variation in fCort indicates a carryover effect to future reproduction. For grey-headed albatrosses, no variables were significant predictors of breeding decision, with the null model receiving the best support (Tables 2 and 3).

287

288 Discussion

289 As the tail feathers of albatrosses are moulted and re-grown after their departure from 290 breeding colonies (Prince et al. 1993, Catry et al. 2013), we predicted that variation in fCort levels 291 would reflect the state or condition of individuals after breeding and suggest a cost of reproduction 292 related to levels of breeding investment (e.g. successful, failed, deferred breeding). Working from 293 the assumption that feather Cort levels are a key link between current and future reproduction, we 294 found limited evidence with a link between post-breeding physiological state and fCort, and 295 between fCort and future breeding decision. However, these results are very species specific, which 296 we suggest may reflect the contrasting life-histories of black-browed and grey-headed albatrosses, 297 e.g. annual versus biennial breeding. For example, in the black-browed albatrosses fCort did not 298 correlate with any of the physiological parameters measured at the end of the breeding season, but 299 fCort nevertheless predicted future breeding decision. Conversely, in the grey-headed albatrosses 300 there was limited evidence for a link between post-breeding physiology and fCort, via a negative 301 correlated with circulating triglyceride levels. But despite this correlation, fCort did not predict 302 future breeding decision in the grey-headed albatrosses.

303 So what do our results suggest? For the black-browed albatrosses, the link between fCort 304 and future breeding investment, in the absence of any clear link to previous breeding investment, 305 might indicate that the more immediate experience of pelagic migration immediately after 306 departure from breeding colonies influences Cort deposition more so than previous breeding 307 activity does, and that it is winter experience itself that generates carryover effects onto future 308 breeding decisions. Certainly, this and many other recent studies support a role of fCort in 309 carryover effects and future breeding investment (Crossin et al. 2013, Kowenberg et al. 2013, 310 Fairhurst et al. 2015, Harms et al. 2015). For the grey-headed albatrosses, we observed the opposite 311 - post-breeding triglyceride levels showed a negative correlation with fCort (significant in females 312 and trending in males), but neither variable had any discernable affect on future breeding decision. 313 Why this might be for the grey-headed albatrosses we do not know, but it may that genetic 314 programming for biennial breeding provides an buffer against physiological carryover effects. 315 However, our sample of grey-headed albatrosses was low, which may limit our power to detect 316 physiological links between breeding states, and so interpretation of our results should be made 317 cautiously. Furthermore, concerning links to fCort, successful grey-headed albatrosses do not 318 necessarily complete tail moult in a year's time (Prince et al. 1993), which may have been the case 319 for some of the seven successful breeders that we resampled the following year. So our power to 320 detect a carryover effect might be low. However, we do not believe that this changes our general 321 conclusions about future breeding decisions by the grey-headed albatrosses.

With this caution in mind, we suggest that fundamental differences in breeding life-history can explain the patterns that we observed. Both species undertake long-distance migrations during the non-breeding period, lasting 6-16 months (Croxall *et al.* 2004, Phillips *et al.* 2005). In both species, there is a degree of condition dependence to breeding investment and decision making, which might reflect altered hypothalamus-pituitary-gonadal axis signaling in response to 327 conditions experienced during migration (Crossin et al. 2012, Crossin et al. 2013a). In a species 328 capable of breeding every year, like the black-browed albatross, the experiences and conditions 329 encountered during the winter are likely to influence Cort dynamics, and thus carry over to affect 330 pre-breeding condition in the spring. By then, previous breeding activity and its relative costs, if 331 any, might be overshadowed. In contrast to the black-browed albatrosses, a significant negative 332 correlation between end-of-season Trig levels and fCort was observed in the biennial grey-headed 333 albatrosses, which might reflect a physiological or energetic cost of reproduction, although we 334 acknowledge again that our samples size was small. However, it is not uncommon to observe 335 negative correlations between measures of body condition (e.g. body mass, Trig levels) and Cort 336 levels in birds (Love *et al.* 2004). The correlation between circulating Trig and fCort in our study 337 suggests a cost of reproduction, wherein some individuals were in poorer energetic condition 338 relative to others. But ultimately, neither Trig, fCort or any other post-breeding measure (T, Hct) 339 predicted the decisions of either male or female grey-headed albatrosses to breed in the very next 340 year. This raises intriguing questions about the physiological determinants of biennial breeding 341 strategies, which we discuss below.

342 A previous attempt to explain the biennial breeding pattern in albatrosses took a 343 comparative approach and examined how the duration of the breeding season and distance to 344 foraging grounds predicted the breeding frequency in 12 species (Jouventin and Dobson 2002). 345 The authors hypothesized that the length of the rearing period for some albatrosses is simply too 346 long and energetically demanding for adults to recover sufficient body condition to breed again in 347 a consecutive year. In support of this, the analysis showed that across all 12 species, those species 348 with the longest rearing periods were generally biennial breeders. However, we would argue that 349 it is perhaps less obvious how the comparatively small difference in breeding season duration 350 would lead to energetic shortfalls that cannot be restored during the ~4 months of marine foraging before the next breeding attempt, unless there is a significant effect on post-breeding moult
dynamics (Rohwer *et al.* 2011) – a topic that should be explored in future studies.

353 The second hypothesis addressed by Jouventin and Dobson (2002) to explain the breeding 354 patterns of albatrosses, predicts that travel to distant foraging areas during the breeding season 355 should reduce reproductive rates, presumably due to increased effort, but also because longer chick 356 feeding intervals could lengthen the breeding season. There was some support for this when 357 comparing across 12 species. However, it is unclear how this might ultimately determine the 358 breeding strategies of black-browed and grey-headed albatrosses, as although grey-headed 359 albatrosses have longer foraging ranges in incubation, there is little difference during chick-rearing, 360 which accounts for the last 5 months of the season (Phillips et al. 2004). Moreover, there is some 361 sexual segregation during incubation, which was attributed to differences in wing loading and flight 362 performance, as opposed to competitive exclusion (Phillips et al. 2004). Consequently, the slightly 363 longer distances travelled during this stage by grey-headed albatrosses should not therefore be 364 interpreted as marginalization to poorer foraging areas, with negative consequences for overall 365 condition. Indeed, although we detected physiological differences in albatrosses at the end of the 366 season that related to their breeding fate (successful, failed, deferred; Fig. 2), there were no 367 significant differences between species or sexes (Fig. 2). Worthy of note was the significantly high 368 T levels in deferring male grey-headed and deferring female black-browed albatrosses. Hector et 369 al. (1986) observed significant increases in T levels in both species and sexes at the end of breeding, 370 although the breeding status of those individuals was not known. The functional significance of 371 these increases is not readily apparent. Although T had no bearing on future reproductive activity, 372 high T in deferring individual could reflect intraspecific interactions (e.g. aggression) prior to out-373 migration, which might also have relevance for the onset and pattern of winter migrations as seen 374 in some passerines (Silverin *et al.* 1989).

375 We did, however, observe a significant negative correlation between plasma Trig at the end 376 of the breeding season and fCort levels in (female) grey-headed albatrosses, but not black-browed 377 albatrosses. This could have functional consequences as grey-headed albatrosses usually migrate 378 considerably longer distance during winter migrations than black-browed albatrosses (Croxall et 379 al. 2005, Phillips et al. 2005). Together, low Trig and high fCort may signal relative need to recover 380 lost body reserves after breeding, and thus indicate a cost (Love et al. 2004, Hennin et al. 2015). 381 However, other studies are needed to more fully explore this possibility. Electronic tracking of 382 individual winter migrations and foraging activity would lend insights to this possibility. However, 383 as previously indicated, variation in fCort did not ultimately predict breeding decision in the next 384 year, as it did in the black-browed albatrosses. We therefore suggest that biennial breeding may 385 have evolved as a bet-hedging strategy in grey-headed albatrosses as a means for buffering the 386 apparent susceptibility of females to negative physiological costs of reproduction (e.g. the negative 387 Trig~fCort correlation, Fig. 3). There are a very few individual grey-headed albatrosses that 388 attempt to breed in successive years (Ryan et al. 2007), and presumably only those in the best 389 relative condition are able to do so (Crossin et al. 2013a).

Previous work with other biennial species lends support to a fundamental role of Cort and body condition in mediating biennial versus annual breeding strategies (Vitousek *et al.* 2010). For example, in the biennially-breeding iguana (*Amblyrhynchus cristatus*) females in poor physiological condition at the onset of breeding are likely to produce smaller hatchlings with poor survival prospects, and risk their own survival. Iguanas that defer reproduction tend to have higher glucocorticoid levels and sensitivity, which might be a response to some exogenous factor like local resource availability, thus enhancing survival probability and subsequent fitness.

397 Although our study provides evidence for both costs of reproduction and carryover effects,398 and suggests plausible mechanisms, it is observational by nature. An alternative approach to

advance our understanding of physiological control of breeding frequency and glean insights into
the evolution of biennial breeding strategies, would be controlled experimental manipulations of
glucocorticoid levels at the onset of the non-breeding season, in tandem with electronic tracking
(Crossin *et al.* 2014), especially of female albatrosses.

403

404 Acknowledgements

405 We thank Derren Fox and Andy Wood at the British Antarctic Survey for field and data 406 support. We also thank the suggestions of two anonymous reviewers. Financial support was 407 provided by the Antarctic Science International Bursary, awarded to GTC. Additional support was 408 provided by the British Antarctic Survey through a Natural Environment Research Council 409 (NERC) Collaborative Gearing Scheme awarded to RAP and others, a Natural Sciences and 410 Engineering Research Council of Canada (NSERC) Post-doctoral Fellowship to GTC, NSERC 411 Discovery Grants to TDW, OPL and GTC, and a National Science Foundation (USA) grant IOS-412 1048529 to LMR. This study represents a contribution to the Ecosystems component of the British 413 Antarctic Survey Polar Science for Planet Earth Programme, funded by NERC.

414

415 Author contributions

GTC performed the field work, collected the data, performed the triglyceride and hematocrit assays, analyzed the data, and wrote the manuscript. RAP assisted with the coordination of the field plan, provided funding and logistical support through BAS, and contributed to the writing. XB assisted with statistical analysis. CRL and LMR ran the corticosterone assays. CH and OPL ran the testosterone assays. TDW provided logistical and intellectual guidance with respect to the field plan, the analyses, and the framing of the manuscript, as well as providing financial and other support. All authors reviewed and edited the final submitted manuscript.

T_{LJ} NULLIUU	423	References
-------------------------	-----	------------

- BONIER, F., MARTIN, P.R., MOORE, I.T. & WINGFIELD, J.C. 2009. Do baseline
 glucocorticoids predict fitness? Trends in Ecology and Evolution, 24, 634-642.
- BORTOLOTTI, G.R., MARCHANT, T.A., BLAS, J. & GERMAN, T. 2008. Corticosterone in
 feathers is a long-term integrated measure of avian stress physiology. Functional Ecology, 22,
 428 494-500.
- BREUNER, C.W., PATTERSON, S.H. & HAHN T.P. 2008. In search of relationships between
 the acute adrenocortical response and fitness. General and Comparative Endocrinology, 157,
 288-295.
- BUGONI, L., NAVES, L.C. &FURNESS, R.W. 2015. Moult of three Tristan da Cunha seabird
 species sampled at sea. Antarctic Science, 27, 240-251.
- 434 CATRY, P., POISBLEAU, M., LECOQ, M. & PHILLIPS, R.A. 2013. Differences in the timing
 435 and extent of annual moult of black-browed albatrosses *Thalassarche melanophris* living in
 436 contrasting environments. Polar Biology, 36, 837-842.
- 437 CROSSIN, G.T., PHILLIPS, R.A., TRATHAN, P.N., FOX, D.S., DAWSON, A., WYNNE-

438 EDWARDS, K.E. & WILLIAMS, T.D. 2012. Migratory carryover effects and endocrinological

- 439 correlates of reproductive decisions and reproductive success in female albatrosses. General and
- 440 Comparative Endocrinology, 176, 151-157.
- 441 CROSSIN, G.T., PHILLIPS, R.A., WYNNE-EDWARDS, K.A. & WILLIAMS, T.D. 2013a. Post-
- 442 migratory body condition and ovarian steroid production predict breeding decisions by female
- 443 gray-headed albatrosses. Physiological and Biochemical Zoology, 86, 761-768.

	444	CROSSIN.	G.T.	. PHILLIPS.	. R.A.	. LATTIN	. C.R.	. ROMERO	. L.M. &	WILLIAMS	. T.D.	2013
--	-----	----------	------	-------------	--------	----------	--------	----------	----------	----------	--------	------

445 Corticosterone mediated costs of reproduction link current to future breeding. General and446 Comparative Endocrinology, 193, 112-120.

447 CROSSIN, G.T., COOKE, S.J., GOLDBOGEN, J.A. & PHILLIPS, R.A. 2014. Tracking fitness in

448 marine vertebrates: current knowledge and opportunities for future research. Marine Ecology
449 Progress Series, 496, 1-17.

- 450 CROSSIN, G.T., LOVE, O.P., COOKE, S.J. & WILLIAMS, T.D. 2016. Glucocorticoid
 451 manipulations in free-living animals: considerations of dose delivery, life-history context, and
 452 reproductive state. Functional Ecology, 30, 116-125.
- 453 CROXALL, J.P., PRINCE, P.A., ROTHERY, P. & WOOD, A.G. 1998. Population changes in
 454 albatrosses at South Georgia. Pages 69-83 in G. Robertson and R. Gales, editors. Albatross
 455 biology and conservation. Surrey Beatty and Sons, Chipping Norton.
- 456 DAAN, S., DEERENBERG, C. & DIJKSTRA, C. 1996. Increased daily work precipitates natural
 457 death in the kestrel. Journal of Animal Ecology, 65, 539-544.
- DESCAMPS, S., BÊTY, J., LOVE, O.P. & GILCHRIST, G.H. 2011. Individual optimization of
 reproduction in a long-lived migratory bird: a test of the condition-dependent model of laying
 date and clutch size. Functional Ecology, 25, 671-681.
- EBBINGE, B.S. & SPAANS, B. 1995. The importance of body reserves accumulated in spring
 staging areas in the temperate zone for breeding in dark-bellied brent geese *Branta b. ber- nicla*in the high Arctic. Journal of Avian Biology, 26, 105-113.

464	FAIRHURST, G.D., BOND, A.L., HOBSON, K.A., & RONCONI, R.A. 2015. Feather-based
465	measures of stable isotopes and corticosterone reveal a relationship between trophic position
466	and physiology in a pelagic seabird over a 153-year period. Ibis, 157, 273-283.

GUGLIELMO, C.G. & WILLIAMS, T.D. 2003. Phenotypic flexibility of body composition in
relation to migratory state, age, and sex in the western sandpiper (*Calidris mauri*). Physiological
and Biochemical Zoology, 76, 84-98.

470 HARMS, N.J., LEGAGNEUX, P., GILCHRIST, H.G., BÊTY, J., LOVE, O.P., FORBES, M.R.,

471 BORTOLOTTI, G.R., & SOOS, C. 2015. Feather corticosterone reveals effect of moulting

472 condition in the autumn on subsequent reproductive output and survival in an Arctic migratory

473 bird. Proceedings of the Royal Society B, 282, 000-000.

474 HARRISON, X.A., BLOUNT, J.D., INGER, R., NORRIS, D.R. & BEARHOP, S. 2011. Carryover

475 effects as drivers of fitness differences in animals, Journal of Animal Ecology, 80, 4-18.

476 HECTOR, J.A.L., FOLLETT, B.K. & PRINCE, P.A. 1986, Reproductive endocrinology of the

477 Black-browed albatross *Diomedea melanophris* and the grey-headed albatross *D. chrysostoma*.

478 Journal of Zoology, London, 208, 237-253.

479 HENNIN, H.L., LEGAGNEUX, P., BÊTY, J., WILLIAMS, T.D., GILCHRIST, H.G., BAKER,

T.M. & Love, O.P. 2015. Pre-breeding energetic management in a mixed-strategy breeder.
Oecologia, in press.

JOUVENTIN, P. & DOBSON F.S. 2002. Why breed every other year? The case of albatrosses.
Proceedings of the Royal Society B, 269, 1955-1961.

484	KALMBACH, E., GRIFFITHS, R., CRANE, J.E. & FURNESS, R.W. 2004. Effects of
485	experimentally increased egg production on female body condition and laying dates in the great
486	skua Stercorarius skua. Journal of Avian Biology, 35, 501-514.

487 KOUWENBERG, A.L., HIPFNER, J.M., MCKAY, D.W. & STOREY, A.E. 2013. Corticosterone
488 and stable isotopes in feathers predict egg size in Atlantic puffins. Ibis, 155, 413-418.

LATTIN, C.R., REED, J.M., DESROCHERS, D.W. & ROMERO, L.M. 2011. Elevated
corticosterone in feathers correlates with corticosterone-induced decreased feather quality: a
validation study. Journal of Avian Biology, 42, 247-252.

492 LOVE, O.P., BREUNER, C.W., VÉZINA, F. & WILLIAMS, T.D. 2004. Mediation of a
493 corticosterone-induced reproductive conflict. Hormones and Behaviour, 46, 59-65.

- MONAGHAN, P., BOLTON, M. & HOUSTON, D.C. 1995. Egg production constraints and the
 evolution of avian clutch size. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B, 259, 189-191.
- MONAGHAN, P. & NAGER, R.G. 1997. Why don't birds lay more eggs? Trends in Ecology and
 Evolution, 12, 270-272.
- MONAGHAN, P., NAGER, R.G. & HOUSTON, D.C. 1998. The price of eggs: increased
 investment in egg production reduces the offspring rearing capacity of parents. Proceedings of
 the Royal Society of London B, 265, 1731-1735.
- 501 O'CONNOR, C.M., NORRIS, N.R., CROSSIN, G.T. & COOKE, S.J. 2014. Biological carryover
 502 effects: linking common concepts and mechanisms in ecology and evolution. Ecosphere, 5, 1503 11.

- 504 PRINCE, P.A. 1985. Population and energetic aspects of the relationships between black-browed
- and grey-headed albatrosses and the Southern Ocean marine environment. In Antarctic nutrient
- 506 cycling and food webs: Proceedings of the SCAR symposium on Antarctic biology, 473-477.
- 507 Siegfried, W.R., Condy, P.R. & Laws, R.M. (Eds). Berlin: Springer Verlag.
- 508 PRINCE, P.A., RODWELL, S., JONES, M. & ROTHERY, P. 1993. Moult in black- browed and
- grey-headed albatrosses *Diomedea melanophris* and *D. chrysostoma*. Ibis, 135, 121-131.

510 PHILLIPS, R.A., SILK, J.R.D., PHELAN, B., CATRY, P. & CROXALL, J.P. 2004. Seasonal

511 sexual segregation in two *Thalassarche* albatross species: competitive exclusion, reproductive

- role specialization or foraging niche divergence? Proceedings of the Royal Society of LondonB, 271, 1283-1291.
- 514 PHILLIPS, R.A., SILK, J.R.D., CROXALL, J.P., AFANASYEV, V. & BENNETT, V.J. 2005.
- 515 Summer distribution and migration of nonbreeding albatrosses: individual consistencies and
- 516 implications for conservation. Ecology, 81, 2386-2396.
- 517 PIERSMA T., EVERAARTS, J.M. & JUKEMA, J. 1996. Build-up of red blood cells in refueling
 518 bar-tailed godwits in relation to individual migratory quality. Condor, 98, 363-370.
- 519 PROP, J., BLACK, J.M. & SHIMMINGS, P. 2003. Travel schedules to the high arctic: barnacle
- 520 geese trade-off the timing of migration with accumulation of fat deposits. Oikos, 103, 403- 414.
- ROHWER, S., VIGGIANO, A. & MARZLUFF, J.M. 2011. Reciprocal tradeoffs between molt and
 breeding in albatrosses. The Condor, 113, 61-70
- 523 ROMERO, L.M. & FAIRHURST, G.D. 2016. Measuring corticosterone in feathers: strengths,

- 524 limitations, and suggestions for the future. Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology A, 000,525 000-000.
- 526 RYAN, P.G., PHILLIPS, R.A., NEL, D.C. & WOOD, A.G. 2007. Breeding frequency in grey527 headed Albatrosses. Ibis, 149, 45-52.
- 528 SILVERIN, B., VIEBKE, P.A. & WESTIN, J. 1989. Hormonal correlates of migration and
 529 territorial behavior in juvenile willow tits during autumn. General and Comparative
 530 Endocrinology, 75, 148-156.
- 531 TICKELL, W.L.N. 2000. Albatrosses. Sussex, UK: Pica Press.
- 532 VITOUSEK, M.N., MITCHELL, M.A., ROMERO, L.M., AWERMAN, J., WIKELSKI, M. 2010.
- To breed or not to breed: physiological correlates of reproductive status in a facultatively
 biennial iguanid. Hormones and Behavior, 57, 140-146.
- WEIMERSKIRCH, H., DELORD, K., GUITTEAUD, A, PHILLIPS, R.A. & PINET, P. 2015.
 Extreme variation in migration strategies between and within wandering albatross populations
 during their sabbatical year, and their fitness consequences. Scientific Reports, 5, 8853. DOI:
 10.1038/srep08853
- WILLIAMS, T.D. 2012. Physiological adaptations for breeding in birds. Princeton University
 Press, Princeton, New Jersey, USA.

Table 1 | The numbers and fates of black-browed (*Thalassarche melanophris*, BBA) and greyheaded (*T. chrysostoma*, GHA) albatrosses sampled in two consecutive breeding seasons at Bird
Island, South Georgia (austral summer 2008/09 to 2009/10). To link current 2008/09 breeding to
future 2009/10 breeding, the dataset was restricted to albatrosses sampled for tail feathers in
2009/10 (future breeding).

		2008/09			2009/10	
Species	Sex	Successful	Failed	Deferred	Bred	Deferred
BBA (total N=50)	Female	15	9	4	22	6
	Male	11	5	6	19	3
GHA (total N=18)	Female	5	3	1	3	6
	Male	2	4	3	4	5

Table 2: Comparison of models exploring the effects of breeding status (successful breeder, failed breeder, or deferred breeder) and postbreeding season physiological condition of black-browed and grey-headed albatrosses on reproductive decision a year later. Output were generated from a backward stepwise generalized linear model with a binomial response and logit link function. Species were run separately due to known differences in breeding strategy and physiology.

552

Species	Model	AICc
BBA (N=50)	sex + breeding status + hematocrit + triglyceride + testosterone + fCort	38.04
	breeding status + hematocrit + triglyceride + testosterone + fCort	35.21
	breeding status + triglyceride + testosterone + fCort	32.99
	breeding status + triglyceride + fCort	31.02
	breeding status + fCort	28.80
	null (~1)	37.99
GHA (N=18)	sex + breeding status + hematocrit + triglyceride + testosterone + fCort	40.49
	sex + breeding status + hematocrit + testosterone + fCort	33.14
	sex + breeding status + hematocrit + fCort	27.49
	null (~1)	25.30

Table 3 | Results of a generalized linear model comparing the binomial breeding decision (breed
or defer) of black-browed (*Thalassarche melanophris*, BBA) and grey-headed (*T. chrysostoma*,
GHA) albatrosses. Models are the most parsimonious as determined by AICc model comparisons
(Table 2). Given differences in breeding strategy (BBA are annual breeders, and GHA are biennial
breeders), separate models were run for the two species. Significant model effects are indicated by
bold text.

Species (N)	Effects	estimate	Z	Р
BBA (50)	Previous breeding fate	-19.567	-0.005	0.996
	fCort	-0.955	-2.196	0.028
GHA (18)	Null (intercept)	0.357	0.724	0.469

562 Figure legends

Fig. 1 | Schematic representing annual cycle of black-browed (BBA, *Thalassarche melanophris*) and grey-headed (GHA, *T. chrysostoma*) albatrosses at Bird Island, South Georgia during the austral summer of 2008/09 (breeding season 1) and 2009/10 (breeding season 2). Brackets indicate times when physiological samples were collected. The yellow bars indicate the period when tail feathers are moulted and regrown; the dashed segment indicates that the duration of the period of tail feather growth is presently unknown. See Table 1 for samples sizes.

569

Fig. 2 | Physiological variables in black-browed (BBA, *Thalassarche melanophris*) and greyheaded (GHA, *T. chrysostoma*) albatrosses measured at the end of the 2008/09 breeding season. Feather Cort levels reflect circulating Cort in the weeks/months after breeding, when tail feathers are moulted and then replaced. Data are classified according to species and breeding fate (S=successful breeders, F=failed breeders, D=deferred breeders). Females are indicated with triangles and males with circles, while GHA values are in grey and BBA values are in black. Values represent least squares means \pm SEM.

577

Fig. 3 | Correlations between plasma triglyceride levels and residual feather corticosterone levels in black-browed (BBA, *Thalassarche melanophris*) and grey-headed (GHA, *T. chrysostoma*) albatrosses. Triglyceride levels were measured at the end of breeding in the 2008/09 season, while fCort levels reflect circulating Cort at the time of feather regrowth in the early to mid nonbreeding season. Females are indicated with triangles and males with circles, while GHA values are in grey and BBA values are in black. All feathers (whether from breeding or deferring albatrosses) were sampled at the beginning of the 2009/10 season.



Fig. 1









Fig. 3