



Citation for published version:

Bunnell, T, Donnelly, M, Lauder, H & Whewall, S 2020, 'International Mindedness as a platform for class solidarity', *Compare : A Journal of Comparative and International Education*.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2020.1811639>

DOI:

[10.1080/03057925.2020.1811639](https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2020.1811639)

Publication date:

2020

Document Version

Peer reviewed version

[Link to publication](#)

This is an Accepted Manuscript of an article published by Taylor & Francis in *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education* on 24 August 2020, available online:
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/03057925.2020.1811639>

University of Bath

Alternative formats

If you require this document in an alternative format, please contact:
openaccess@bath.ac.uk

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

International Mindedness as a platform for class solidarity

Abstract

There has been reference in literature to the concepts of a Transnational Capitalist Class and a Global Middle Class, but there has been little discussion of how education may form any sense of class solidarity for these groups. In national contexts, ruling class socialisation has been achieved through elite private schooling. But the notion of global classes presents a fundamentally different problem for class socialisation and solidarity since the educational mechanisms for creating solidarity are unclear. This question has achieved prominence through the political discourse identifying and attacking an international, liberal elite who are ‘Citizens of Anywhere’ and ‘Nowhere’. We focus on the role of the elite, traditional ‘International School’, delivering the International Baccalaureate programmes specifically designed to promote ‘international mindedness’ (IM), in the educational trajectories of this echelon of society. We argue that IM offers a class constructed platform in providing an element of global social solidarity.

Keywords

Bernstein, Global Middle Class, international mindedness, International Baccalaureate, solidarity

Introduction

The role of 'elite schooling' within individual countries has been well understood in terms of identity formation of young people into a classed world view, and the fostering of character traits to accompany credential achievement (Wallbank, 1979). Even seemingly meritocratic nations such as Ireland have elite schooling (Courtois, 2015), whilst others (e.g. Scott, 1982; Cannadine, 1994) have noted that the national elite in many countries has always been 'international' in orientation and outlook; for instance, regular travel and international mobility are historic characteristics of national elites across many different countries.

'Elite schooling' has attracted much attention in recent years (e.g. Kenway and Koh, 2015), and continues to be largely conceptualised within a national context (e.g. Singapore: Kenway and Koh, 2013; or Ireland: Courtois, 2018). For instance, the study (Reeves, Friedman, and Rahal, 2017) into the pervasiveness of entry to Britain's edition of *Who's Who* focused upon the importance of privileged access to the major English private schools, and not aspects such as access to globally-derived credentials or qualifications.

However, while the worldliness and privilege that denoted the character and outlook of national elites was formerly expressed through travel, often in readiness for work in the colonies, we are now confronted with a different form of global colonisation which is not based on a competition between nations, but of individuals seeking access to a global labour-market constructed by the needs and demands of transnational capital. Such a development creates the need to move the lens of inquiry beyond national boundaries, to viewing 'elite schooling' within a globalised and networked framework that crosses frontiers, as argued by Kenway and Koh, 2015.

It is widely acknowledged that new social classes have emerged, viewing themselves within an 'international' setting, with common ideals, attributes, experiences, interests, and concerns. Freeland (2010) identifies a 'new global elite', seemingly connected to each other,

but less connected to their home nation. This phenomenon has attracted recent political attack, and forms the background to our paper. In October 2016, the-then British Prime Minister Theresa May, at her Party's Annual Conference, had denounced the 'liberal, cosmopolitan, elite' (*The Telegraph*, 2016). She stated how:

'... today, too many people in positions of power behave as though they have more in common with international elites than with the people down the road, the people they employ, the people they pass in the street.'

May went on to say:

'But if you believe you're a 'citizen of the world', you're a 'citizen of nowhere'. You don't understand what the very word 'citizenship' means.'

It is worth noting the difference between May's 'Citizens of *Nowhere*' and David Goodhart's (2017) crude articulation between those of 'Somewhere versus *Anywhere*'. Both frameworks have a common theme, based upon the notion that there exists a rising cosmopolitan class who are removed from the concerns and interests of the ordinary national citizen. Such a class instead might view themselves as 'global citizens', concerned with common global issues such as 'sustainability' and 'climate change', and undertaking a globally-oriented lifestyle which involves global contact and interests. However, they face attack and dismissal in the current political climate as being merely seen as 'Citizens of Nowhere/Anywhere', a 'Citizen of the World', rather than 'Somewhere'.

This emerging political, economic, and social tension, between a seemingly privileged, isolated and aloof cosmopolitan class, and the 'left-behind' ordinary citizens with nationally-oriented concerns and interests is an important one requiring more considered critical discussion. At the heart of this tension, is the notion that a body of global citizens enjoys class solidarity creating a form of identity, distinction, and potential global network and contacts that might lead to advantage in the global labour-market, and global net worth. In contrast, ordinary

citizens from ‘Somewhere’ are increasingly denied access to the fruits of globalisation, whilst being subject to increasing de-industrial stagnation. Put another way, one body of people enjoy character *elevation*, whilst the majority suffer from character *corrosion* (Sennett, 1998). This social justice tension, based partly on demographic and geographical divisions, was especially evident and brought to the fore by the Brexit debate in Britain, which has divided that nation since 2016.

The emergent identification of a new, globalised class

However, the education of these emerging global classes requires closer scrutiny. Our paper deals with the creation of class solidarity through a particular form of elite education which might be termed ‘elite international schooling’. This arena of schooling aims to deliver the attributes and outcomes of ‘international mindedness’ (IM), an under-reported and under-researched aspect of elite education which we argue can be interpreted as a collectivising and unifying ‘platform’ that acts as a potential binding force, uniting young people with a sense of shared (global) concerns and responsibilities.

The focus of our paper is in establishing the potential role of IM in the development of the ‘Citizen of Nowhere/Anywhere’. In doing so, we identify the emergence of these classes, the Transnational Capitalist Class (TNCC) and the Global Middle Class (GMC) that are being dismissed by some as being from ‘Nowhere’, or ‘Anywhere’. These classes, theorised as the TNCC by Sklair, (2000) and Robinson and Sprague (2018) and with respect to the GMC by Ball (2010), have begun to attract attention, and theorisation. Since the empirical focus of our paper is with the education of the TNCC, it is important to define it. Sklair (2002 p.145) argues that it comprises four ‘interlocking’ groups: those who own and control the TNCs (the corporate fraction), globalising bureaucrats and politicians (the state fraction), globalising professionals (the technical fraction), and merchants and media (the consumerist fraction). As we shall see

in the case of a traditional type of International School that we present, students we interviewed came from these four groups. The GMC, on the other hand, represented as the servants rather than the owners of capital (Ball, 2010) are also increasingly entering the International Schooling arena but are largely locally-born students, the children of an emerging middle-class seeking identity and distinction, but also globalised career pathways (Poole, 2020).

There exists, therefore, a need to investigate how these classes are constructed and socialised through education in terms of their view of place. Place assumes great significance because in contrast with national forms of elite education, one of the defining features of these emergent classes is that they have seemingly little attachment or identity with specific nation states. Here the central question is how education contributes to solidarity for classes with a global reach.

The delivery of character through Bernstein

Whilst the study of the TNCC and the GMC is still an emergent field, it is striking that Pierre Bourdieu's work is the theoretical framework used by nearly all contributors thus far. Indeed, this is largely true of discussion generally about elite education, as was noted by Ball (2015). Our paper advances an alternative theoretical framework for understanding the schooling mechanisms by which the TNCC and GMC are potentially produced, drawing instead on the sociological work of Basil Bernstein.

In order to develop the theoretical foundations for this analysis, we turn to Bernstein's work on the sources of consensus and disaffection in schools. This early aspect of Bernstein's work is relatively under-used, and under-recognised compared to his well-cited work on language, for example, using 'elaborated' and 'restricted' codes. It has been said that relatively few studies in education engage with Bernstein, compared to the almost universal use of Bourdieu (Donnelly, 2018 p.316).

Bernstein's work on the sociology of schooling, and in particular his theorisation of school cultures can help to make sense of what forms of 'character' they privilege in the messages they transmit. School culture is composed of two inter-linked dimensions; the 'expressive order' (Bernstein, 1966; 1967) which describes the forms of character, conduct and manner, largely transmitted through rituals, whilst the 'instrumental order' refers to more specific skills and knowledge acquired. At the same time, the two orders which define a school's culture can be 'open' and 'closed', and 'positioned' and 'differentiated' (Bernstein, 1977). For instance, in the context of an elite national schooling experience, the 'expressive order' might be intended at cultivating the open-minded and trusted citizen who intends to study Law at university and then serve national society as a High Court Judge (i.e. offering also a 'closed' and 'positioned' culture). On the other hand, a school might aim to create a 'global citizen' who is open minded and respectful, and seeks the flexibility in later life to perform different jobs in different parts of the world. Such a school culture would be 'expressive, open, and differentiated', giving the student access and advantage to global career pathways rather than a pre-determined, fixed, route. We might expect this educational pathway to be attractive to both the TNCC and the GMC.

To examine the potential of Bernstein's theoretical ideas, we put them to work on data collected from an elite, traditional 'International School' in South East Asia. This is a school which caters largely for the children of the TNCC. Although we should note that International Schools have yet to be extensively analysed in terms of their stratification into schools serving the children of the TNCC and the GMC. In that sense, our analysis is provisional. The key empirical contribution we make here is that this form of education (of which IM is a central component) can offer the platform for class solidarity by offering a platform for young people to hold a sense of similar attributes and concerns (hence forming a common sense of conduct, character, and manner), alongside possessing a similar sense of responsibility and duty (hence

inculcating a common, shared 'conduct'). At the same time as making social connections and associations, it also offers a platform for much flexibility in later life and career, and the enactment of character and duty within a global context, as well as a national one. This is arguably what makes the 'International School' a privileged, elite platform, as well as an increasingly popular one.

The concept of the 'International School'

The Transnational Capitalist Class (TNCC) is a well-established concept, going back two decades in the literature (Sklair, 2000; 2002). This elite body of transient, expatriated, parents serving and employed by multi-national agencies has always had education options available that includes educational institutions within the wide arena of 'elite International Schooling'. Nations such as France, Germany, and Japan provide a large-scale body of 'overseas National Schools' which deliver a National Curriculum to their citizens based abroad who can subsequently be easily repatriated into the national labour-market.

Alternatively, there exists the long-established body of multi-national and independent/autonomous 'overseas International Schools', offering global higher-education and labour-market pathways, and options beyond the national stage. Although the 'International School' defies exact, consensus definition it can be contemporarily identified within a complex framework that views them as:

'Schools with a global outlook located mainly outside an English-speaking country delivering a non-national curriculum at least partly in English' (Bunnell, 2019 p.10).

Within this crude English-Medium of Instruction lens, the market worldwide had by November 2015 reached 8,000 schools, educating 4.26 million children (Keeling, 2015). Four years later, the market had increased to 11,000 schools, revealing a growth rate of two schools *per day*.

Moreover, this arena of education is widely predicted and expected to further double in size over the next decade, in terms of student numbers, schools, teachers, and fee-income (Bunnell, 2019).

The important point to observe here is that ‘International Schooling’ is rapidly growing and can no longer be viewed as a peripheral, innocuous arena of education, and now warrants serious sociological analysis. In particular, the field has become predominantly profit-driven, involving commercially-driven brands of schooling.

Beyond substantial growth, there have been major changes in nature and purpose. In particular, the market has continued to attract both an established globally-mobile, transient elite (the TNCC), alongside a newer body of locally-based customers (the GMC). Put simply, the term ‘*International*’ has come to possess substantial symbolic value, as a sign and measure of prestige and class status; one view is that ‘an international education, whether at home or abroad, equally denotes, something globally valid and hence distinct and better than the normal pathway of education’ (Basaran and Olsson, 2017 p.98).

However, we should be careful in making generalisations, and a myriad of models now exists offering very different educational experiences, and potential outcomes. The ‘non-traditional’ arena (Hayden and Thompson, 2013) has been discussed in this journal (Poole, 2020) in the form of ‘Chinese Internationalised Schools’ serving a local market and delivering a hybrid of curricula choices. There is another growing body of franchised ‘satellite colleges’, a model pioneered by England’s Dulwich College (Bunnell, Courtois, and Donnelly, 2020).

At the same time, there exists a proportionately dwindling yet still-definite ‘Traditional’ arena dominated by established players who are still delivering an international curriculum to a transient global elite (the TNCC) yet also and increasingly the growing localised players who might in turn, and time, become an extension of the global elite (the GMC). Such schools are

historically and traditionally modelled on the 1924-established International School of Geneva ('Ecolint'), founded largely by League of Nations employees.

The subsequent link with serving the 'elite cosmopolitan' (Jansson, 2016), who may for instance now work for United Nations or international aid agencies, as well as Transnational Global Corporations, is thus well-established. One view is that these schools were traditionally:

'Established to offer education to the children of globally mobile parents usually working for the United Nations or its agencies, embassies and multinational companies' (Hill, 2014 p.177).

This body of elite, traditional 'International Schools' has, over time, developed a certain sense of 'organisational culture', which 'is conveyed via ceremony, symbols, etiquette, rituals, heroes, stories, and so on' (Hill, 2018 p. 12). Further, this type of school aims to deliver the skills, attributes, and mind-set connected with the notion of International Mindedness (IM), to be discussed next.

'International mindedness' as an instrument of class solidarity

International Schools pioneered the programmes of the 'International Baccalaureate' (IB), which celebrated its 50th Anniversary as a Geneva-registered Foundation in 2018. The Cold War origins of the IB are still very evident in its current Mission Statement which says (at: www.ibo.org) that: 'The International Baccalaureate aims to develop inquiring, knowledgeable and caring young people who help to create a better and more peaceful world through intercultural understanding and respect.' The ostensible role of IM is very evident here. However, we can also decode the IB mission as forging a strong sense of class solidarity, among young people who share a 'common humanity' and see themselves, together, as

‘guardians of the planet’ with a shared responsibility to facilitate global peace. This is undeniably a powerful message, fostering a sense of shared mission.

The concept of ‘IM’ is generally viewed as confusing (Cause, 2011), and abstract (Lai, Shum, and Zhang, 2014)). One reason why the concept of IM in ‘IB World Schools’ might be ‘clearer’ in social class terms is that the IB as an organisation (i.e. the ‘IBO’) has, over time, created a solid platform for delivering it.

At the centre of this discussion, underpinning the ‘platform’, was the IB’s Learner Profile (IBLP), which had first appeared in 2007. This listing of ten attributes, or outcomes of an IB education, had given strength to the IB’s notion of ‘IM’ which had first appeared in literature in 2008 and which is now central/crucial to an ‘IB education’, and by extension, an ‘elite international schooling’ experience. Indeed, the IBLP has emerged as the IB Mission Statement *in practice* i.e. it has shifted from being ‘Profile as text’ to being the ‘lived Profile’ (Poole, 2017). Alternatively, the IBLP can be viewed as a set of values and attitudes (Wells, 2011) that form the basis of a moral education (Van Oord, 2013).

The ‘IB experience’ is now purposefully intended to create a thinking, knowledgeable, inquiring, risk-taking communicator who is also caring, balanced, open-minded, and principled. It is not claimed to be an exhaustive list, but it is asserted (IBO, 2013) that these ten attributes, and others *like them*, ‘can help individuals and groups become responsible members of local, national and global communities’. What is meant by ‘responsible members’ of the different geographic communities is not defined, and left open to interpretation, but other critiques of the IB point to its Western-Liberal-Humanist foundations (Walker, 2010) and it is in this sense that ‘responsible’ community members may be understood. Whilst IM itself is not formally assessed or evaluated (although it can be argued to be indirectly assessed through formal procedures such as the compulsory ‘Service’ element of the IBDP or the ‘Exhibition’ in

the Primary Years Programme), it is intended to be embedded throughout each IB programme in a holistic and all-encompassing way. In this sense, it can be interpreted as an approach towards shifting attitudes and character formation in its most explicitly expressed form.

At the same time, one might assume that the elite, traditional 'International Schools' embody IM in its purest form. As said, the IB was born and bred in such schools, and we might expect IM to be more valued and respected in schools where the intention is to deliberately cultivate the 'Citizen of the World'.

Collectively, these attributes can be understood as what Bernstein refers to as belonging to the 'expressive' domain of schooling; representing a particular version of the self and personhood which is privileged. These attributes can be interpreted as value-laden and are the product of a particular selection from identity and culture. The forms of conduct, character and manner which they embody privilege a particular version of the self and personhood.

One set of commentators have placed IM at the centre of activity, arguing it 'has become a staple within the context of International Schooling' (Savva and Stanfield, 2018 p.179). Hill (2012 p.246) earlier stressed how IM is '*the* key concept associated with an International Education.' This is intentionally an educational programme for the 'Citizen from Anywhere'.

In hypothesizing that the discourse of 'international mindedness' (IM) can be seen as a mechanism and marker for creating solidarity and class consciousness the platform provides a strategy for securing identity-formation (Yemini and Maxwell, 2018). One attempt (Barratt Hacking et al, 2018) at studying IM in practice, as evidenced in authorised 'IB World Schools' concluded that IM was a concrete concept, and can be viewed as 'a way of thinking', 'a way of acting', 'a way of living', and 'a mind-set', involving a deliberate 'journey' made by the school leadership and involving all agents within it (Barratt Hacking et al, 2018).

Methods

Having established the theoretical basis for IM, we now focus our paper on data collected from one traditional, non-profit, private/independent 'Elite International School' based in South East Asia, where the market is relatively large, well-established, and well-developed. Given the elite nature of this school, we should make it clear that IM should not be seen as just a curriculum offering but rather pervades the lived experience of students across their family background, their peer and teacher relationships and the school culture, IM in this context is the focal point for this form of identity construction.

We draw here from Eden School, an elite, traditional 'International School' in South East Asia. Fieldwork was conducted at Eden School in September 2018 as part of a comparative study on British young people's university choices. A large number of languages are represented among its student population and this was reflected in what some participants said about the school; that it nurtured a multicultural environment, an awareness of global concerns, and, as a member of staff explained, an 'outward facing' attitude. Pseudonyms are used here, anonymising the school name and all those taking part in the research.

The sample was made up of eleven 17 – 18-year-old British students and one member of staff from the school's Universities advice centre. These students were undergoing the IB's pre-University award, the Diploma Programme (IBDP). A questionnaire captured where participants had lived in the past, where their families had lived, their parents' occupations, what universities their extended family had attended and where participants were considering applying for higher education. Most participants had experienced migration during childhood, with one participant, Evan, having moved five times in 17 years between Asia and Europe, owing to his father's senior role with a global logistics company. Having managerial or highly

skilled professional occupations and being internationally mobile for work were characteristics shared by the parents of most participants. Zara's mum, for example, had been promoted recently from a 'really important person in Asia' to a 'global media manager', while others had parents working in marketing, in banking and in other 'international schools'. Simply put, the parental body in Eden School closely resembled that of the TNCC, the traditional clientele for this type of school.

Participants also completed a qualitative mapping exercise, colour-coding and annotating maps of the UK, of their current locality and of the world, highlighting locations that were important to them, and illustrating for the researcher the social and spatial structures they imagined. For example, they were able to visualise their globally expansive social networks, the places they were orienting towards for higher education study, as well as their perceptions of places in relation to others. In follow-up semi-structured interviews, participants elaborated on these maps, explaining the university choices they had made in the context of their geographical mobility and family history. This process revealed how they negotiated, as highly mobile individuals, a sense of home, belonging and nationhood, as well as the apparent ease with which they were able to 'fit in' or 'feel at home anywhere'. Such claims would arguably identify an emerging 'Citizen of Anywhere'.

Data analysis of the 11 interviews produced some overarching themes (such as 'class consciousness' and 'social capital'), as well as underlying conceptualisations about, for instance, 'home' and 'place.'. The data then underwent discourse and narrative analyses, through which individuals' transcripts were examined at a more granular level, whilst keeping in mind the broader context of individuals' stories. A discursive approach was useful for foregrounding terminology associated with, among other topics, IM and forms of cultural capital.

Expressive order and solidifying of class consciousness

The notion of IM embodies what Bernstein refers to as a school's 'expressive order' – the forms of conduct, character and manner that a school transmits as the end goals – or purpose - of schooling. It represents a notion of what is privileged in the 'ideal' pupil, the kind of *person* the school is attempting to create. This expressive order was manifest in the emergent subjectivities of pupils at Eden School. Indeed, it pervaded the school environment, in how the school justified and enacted the recruitment of pupils, recruiting those deemed to align with these expressive dimensions of the self. This was evident in the discussion with the member of staff from the school's University advice centre, who talked about the 'qualities' students at the school are expected to embody. She explained:

'We have a portion of our students that are here on a fully funded or partially funded place and they are here because they have exhibited the qualities that we would want in a member of our community and they come from all over the world.'

She alluded elsewhere to the 'services' that students are encouraged to get involved in. These services are typically internationally focused programmes through which students engage in a variety of charity work, including human rights, education and aid work in developing countries. This schooling experience (via 'CAS') is a compulsory, regulated and assessed element of an IB education. She added that through this work, the students are expected to become more 'outward looking' and to question of themselves, 'what are we doing for the world and what are we doing in the community?' The use of the word 'community' here is a loose one, implying also an imaginary 'international community' (Anderson, 1991). One female student remarked that: 'I have found that I connect more to the international, sort of like the international community.'

There is a sense that through this charity work, students develop their awareness of issues internationally and build 'character'. It is through the idea of IM that these forms of

conduct, character and manner (the school's 'expressive order') become unified into a sense of self and personhood, collectively acting as platform for class consciousness and solidarity.

Eleanor, whose parents both worked in marketing, exemplifies how attending the school and taking part in these services has developed her sense of 'international mindedness':

'You get to go to so many different places and access these different cultures, it is quite unique, and our school as well, they really have service partnerships with so many, you learn so much about the position you're in... cos I guess, cos of everything they do in school, there are so many cultures out there, you just gain a better appreciation of, erm, you get to enjoy things that you wouldn't otherwise.'

Eleanor reflects here on how attending this particular school and taking part in the activities on offer has enhanced her understanding and 'appreciation' of different cultures. She has also acquired a sense of her own privileged position in relation to those she supports through her service work. What is being narrated here are the forms of solidarity that bind together an internationally schooled elite, their selection of what is privileged is in itself an act of class consciousness.

Alongside the expressive dimension, it was clear that the instrumental order dimension (acquisition of skills, knowledge, qualifications) pervaded their schooling experiences and was something that was equally privileged. Alistair, though studying for the IBDP, explained that the school were helping him gain additional qualifications to improve his chances of going to university in the USA. Alistair's father was the CEO of a global logistics company, and his mum the director of a health and fitness company. He had moved four times during childhood, living in the UK, Australia and now South East Asia, and, after expressing his desire to study in the USA, his parents told him, 'you can do whatever you want, we'll pay.' He discussed how several teachers at the school planned to coach him through his SATs to 'put me in place to go to the US as well' as Universities in other countries, demonstrating the efforts of the

school to equip him with the necessary credentials to pursue different higher education trajectories. Again, this arguably fits well with the identity of a ‘Citizen from Anywhere’.

The forms of character, conduct and manner which define the school’s expressive order were apparent throughout the school, evident in the student body, activities, visual artefacts, interactions between teachers and pupils, as well as the rituals of reward and punishment.

Here we can see IM, offering a common discourse and long-term sense of shared emotional experience (of which the Learner Profile plays a key part). Part of this discourse of IM centered around living the ‘international school life’ and being part of the imaginary ‘international community.’ George, whose dad worked as a pilot, expressed this explicitly. He suggested that the school was even more diverse than the multicultural city where it was located:

‘I’m in, like, a bubble because of the school I go to. So, like, I go to an international school, so, it’s not [the local area], like, [the local area’s] really diverse in its own ways. But the fact that I go to an international school and the fact that I’ve sort of been living, like, an international school life, I don’t feel like [the local area’s] my home, even though I’ve lived here for the majority of my life.’

Through his narrative, George revealed that because of the diversity of the student body and the kind of ‘life’ the school offered, it had become somewhat more of a home to him than the local area, despite having spent most of his life living there. Here, the identity of a ‘Citizen of Nowhere’ begins to emerge. One student was asked by the researcher: ‘So, your identity is very much kind of British?’ She replied: ‘Yeah, but international you know?’

A collective and shared expressive dimension was evident within the school in terms of images of conduct, character and manner they aimed to transmit under the banner of ‘IM’. The school displayed posters and artefacts expressing the attributes of IM, as one might expect of an authorised and regulated ‘IB World School’. Some of this, such as visual displays of the

Learner Profile are required by the IB, helping to add legitimacy to the school being both an 'IB World School' and an 'International' one (Bunnell, Fertig, and James, 2018). Further, it potentially aids in institutionalising both the school, and its community; the students, for example, emerge over time as 'IB Learners' and the teachers become 'IB Educators' (Bunnell, Fertig, and James, 2019). Posters saying 'opening eyes, opening minds, opening hearts' and 'understanding', 'integrate' and 'connect' were pervasive upon entry to the school and displayed throughout in corridors and in classrooms. This issue, of pervasive visual 'reminders' of character, conduct, and manners regarding IM was also noted by other studies in such schools (Barratt Hacking et al, 2018). The notion of the school 'role modelling' is a strong one.

Another set of visual displays around the school showed quotes from school alumni about how attending the school had shaped their outlook, intended to inspire current students and further communicate the benefits of IM. Some examples included: 'I was given a global context in which to stand'; 'I seek to engineer a better world'; and, from a film maker, 'my films are an act of global citizenship.' As such, a powerful unifying discourse was evident throughout the school. As the member of staff from the UAC explained:

'We are trying to create students that can advocate for themselves and find their own way and that we're not a crutch... they can figure out their own way... I was talking to one of my grade 11s, I love this story... [I was] saying, like, what does all this mean to you, like this process, and he said, 'I feel like I'm figuring out who I want to be as a human being and an adult.'... I think this kind of mirrors who we are as a school... it's about who you are as a human being... and what kind of skills do you need in order to be a success in the world?'

The staff member shared that the role of the school and its staff was, through the University advice centre as well as the services the school ran, to develop independence and self-reflection in the students, not just to equip them with academic credentials. These sorts of dispositions

are reflective of the autonomous self-determining actor that is best equipped within the context of contemporary neoliberal capitalist structure (Sennett, 2006). It is these expressive order dimensions of the person, espoused by the IB, and enacted by 'Elite International Schools', which solidify into a form of class consciousness and forming the basis for social (re)production of the TNCC.

The presence of discourses espousing IM within the school was a pervasive force in the way young people positioned themselves and their desired futures. Alistair, for example, explained that he understood 'a lot of cultures and, erm, cos of the school, it's just everything to know about the rest of the world.' For others, like George, remaining part of the 'international community' in the future, as a university student, had become important in his decision making. He added that, because he had attended such a diverse school with an international outlook, an international 'environment' with an 'international community' was 'sort of where I belong.' The emphases on global concerns, ingrained in the school's expressive order, were also exemplified in what the students said about their futures. James, whose dad was a doctor and whose mum worked for the national government, explained his reasons for choosing to study law:

Because I just want to make a difference in the world, for me I get a lot of satisfaction out of doing service in the school, it's very fulfilling and law's the same cos you get to help other people and just the idea of helping others and making sure people have fair and equal rights and stuff, just what I want to do, something practical make a change.

James highlighted here how his involvement in a service at the school had shaped his ambition to study international law and to proactively 'make a change' in the future. Alistair too envisaged his future role addressing challenges related to global climate change. By studying marine biology at a highly ranked university, Alistair could:

help the world, like, cos the ocean is pretty much how we're going to survive if stuff goes bad... I would sort of conduct my own research cos I want to find a way to sort of make a living in the ocean, I mean, not as a financial, I mean as in actually living in the ocean... yeah, I mean even like allowing humans to be there as well.

Alistair's future goals – to help 'humans' – exemplified how the school's nurturing of students' awareness of global issues had instilled in him a sense of his own future role as a leader in the fight against global climate change. A strong sense of (global) responsibility and duty was emerging, alongside a willingness to take risks (financial, and professional). These forms of conduct and manner, and ways of acting in the world, form part of a convincing narrative about the elite careers and university destinations which these young people have on their horizons. They provide a narrative, or platform, to potentially give the young people the edge in the labour market, which is vital in the context of a saturated labour market where dispositions and forms of expression matter more as signaling devices to discern 'talent' (Brown et al, 2016)

Like many other elite private schools, whether 'National' or 'International', the school had an extensive programme of support and encouragement for attending Universities around the world – including some of the most selective and high-status (the school organises a staggering 300 visits from universities around the world, including Harvard and Oxbridge). Elite music conservatoires (from the UK and Canada) came to the host-nation to do auditions with students there in person. Alistair added: 'They try to get as many universities in to talk... they're from really all around the world. We had quite a few last time from the US. We had maybe four or five from the UK as well.' Therefore, the school not only transmitted messages which encouraged an individualising sense of self, seeking out opportunities at Universities overseas, but also provided the practical support in accessing this elite sub-set of Universities.

One of the key mechanisms by which the schools transmitted their shared expressive orders was their intentional moulding of a diverse student body. There was evidence that the

school purposefully selected students based on their cultural background and were careful to ensure a balance of identities. This diversity transmits in an implicit way key elements of the schools' expressive order, especially in terms of being 'open minded' and aware of cultural difference. The daily encounters pupils had with students spanning diverse nationalities was a powerful form of character training. Referring to an international scholarship programme the school runs, the member of staff from the University advice centre expanded further on the diversity of the student population:

They come from all over the world... we've got some Fijian students who are on scholarship in grades 9 and 10, we've got Cambodian scholarships... that throws a whole other mix into it in terms of the stories that they come with and how they've got here.

Eleanor even went so far as to claim that 'surprisingly in our school, they don't really allow local people to come, so it's very diverse.' Emma, whose parents both worked in education, expressed that, because she had gone to an 'International School' her 'entire life', she had '[grown] up in lots of little cultures.' And Lena, whose parents were teachers at the school (which is quite normal in an elite, traditional model), and who had moved countries five times during childhood, shared with the researcher that attending her current school meant she had friends in other parts of the world, like North America, which had influenced her choice of potential universities. Daily encounters with a diverse student population also represented for some a form of social capital on which they could potentially draw in the future. Alistair, for instance, suggested that the friends he had met at Eden School would 'probably help each other out' professionally in the future. This is a further dimension to the class solidarity and kind of 'platform' offered by an 'elite international school'.

These students' experiences emulate the sorts of work-place in terms of transcending national borders and working with others from different nationalities and themselves moving

across national borders for work (Yemini and Furstenburg, 2018). It is reflective of what Sennett (1998) refers to as ‘drift’ in the new economy, whereby workers are constantly moving because of short-term contract work, or to seek out new opportunities in developing their careers. In this way, the expressive dimension of Eden School was providing students with a form of experiential learning and a set of attributes that would equip them well to survive in the global workplace they were destined for, and wherever that might be. The students discussed here a world that is akin to Sennett’s (1998) account of the modern economy in terms of its chaotic, unpredictable nature and state of being in constant flux. It is important to note that their imagined future self is framed around mixing with diverse nationalities, reflecting their current school-based experiences.

Concluding remarks

In this paper, we have advanced an account of how the nature of the character education (Sennett, 1998) in elite, traditional ‘International Schools’, those that continue to offer the IB programmes, elevates character and offers an educational experience that is radically different to that in national elite education where a national curriculum might be offered. At the heart of this difference is IM, offering a common discourse and long-term sense of shared emotional experience, with its own symbols, imagery, and vocabulary. Previous research has assumed that elite forms of international education are by themselves enough to provide a basis for global class solidarity. However, why this might be the case has not been articulated. We have argued here that the elite, traditional ‘International Schools’, in delivering the programmes of the IB (some offer three, the ‘K-12 Continuum’, or even all four) and thus delivering in full the intended constructs of IM, do potentially provide the platform for the formation of class solidarity. The notion of belonging, and entering into an imaginary ‘international/global

community' was evident in our study, and shows that this arena of schooling is indeed a 'rich site for sociological inquiry in global times' (Tarc and Mishra Tarc, 2015 p.34).

Our paper has advanced an understanding of the possible nature and character of the TNCC. It is our view that the TNCC is best, at the present time, considered as a class *in-formation* and rather than focus on the *reproduction* of privilege, we need to understand more the role of elite education plays in the *production* of this class. A key element in this process is 'IM', which acts as a potential 'gel', gluing the class (globally) together. It potentially provides a platform for creating a shared sense of identity, focused upon common interests, attributes and concerns. Given the vagueness of IM, and the high degree of debate that exists in the literature, it was striking that the respondents in Eden School had a common understanding of the messages the school was trying to transmit.

However, as a 'class', the future of the emergent TNCC is highly uncertain. The combination of the footloose nature of the TNCC and the rise of new technologies is leading to forms of digital Taylorism (Brown, Lauder and Ashton, 2011) and 'Artificial Intelligence' (AI) that threaten jobs across the globe. Under these conditions the global 'gel' of IM could enable 'potential TNCC students' greater flexibility in seeking jobs across national/global labour markets. In this regard, IM provides a platform to access opportunities that 'elite National Schools' may not offer because it provides a way of speaking and acting that facilitates access to the global labour market and a way of speaking and acting within it. At the same time, it offers a platform for politically attacking the 'Citizens of the World', and creates a deep tension and barrier with ordinary 'Citizens of Somewhere' who are increasingly barred from accessing entry to the global labour market. In this context, IM offers the conditions for economic and social division and fragmentation among national citizens, which is ironic given its aim to facilitate greater understanding, mutual respect, and inter-connections.

The future global middle-class worker needs to be flexible: open minded, respectful, reflective and ready to take risks – attributes defined by Sennett (2006) as central to the culture of new capitalism. This ‘expressive order’ is the hallmarks of IM in practice, and undermines its strategic role in potentially creating the new ‘global worker’, who is willing and able to work *anywhere* (i.e. they are ‘Citizens of Anywhere’). This seems different from the education desired and sought after by an established class, such as the national elite/upper middle class who might be more inclined to seek positioning within national society, for example as a doctor or lawyer, perhaps following in the career footsteps of their parents, and thus ‘instrumental order’ skills are potentially more advantageous in advancing a designated career through Higher Education and beyond. Here, the flexible attributes of IM hold less currency.

However, it is the explicit way in which IM places attributes such as ‘risk taking’ into the daily life of the school which marks out our study as offering a very purposeful form of character elevation. As argued by Sennett (2006), risk is an integral part of the modern economy and workplace, it is a ‘daily necessity shouldered by the masses’ (p.80) as they navigate what is an unstable and changing set of demands and contexts.

In the school in our study, the IM experience is woven into the fabric of the school, from the hallway displays which articulate each attribute, to the forms of pedagogy and micro-level interactions between students and teachers; the practices associated with IM are firmly embedded in the school environment.

This deliberate, intentional experience involves long-term exposure to a common discourse, or language, expressed by educators, students and parents. In our study, a form of internal class solidarity between schools, parents and students – on a global scale – resulted. At the same time, it ought to be noted that the school in our study has the advantage over most ‘normal’ IB schools (i.e. public schools in the United States, or Ecuador) in that it possesses a greater extent of cultural identity and a more traveled body of educators, students, and parents

which most probably facilitates a greater sense of global identity. The sort of character training advanced in Eden School bonded teachers and pupils together on an international scale that has arguably not been seen before. It is almost as though a new sort of person, a ‘Citizen of the World’, is being created, indeed replicated.

That said, empirical evidence on the longitudinal impact of the Creativity, Activity, and Service (CAS) element of the IBDP, a compulsory aspect of the ‘core’ of the programme alongside the Extended Essay and Theory of Knowledge, suggests that its most important effect turns on the construction of the neo-liberal subjects (Chandler and Reid, 2016) rather than on one who is internationally responsible (Hayden and McIntosh, 2018). The school in our study may produce different outcomes, especially as it is an ‘Elite International School’ i.e. it offers a combination of the strong expressive culture of the ‘International School’ alongside the attributes of IM. Furthermore, although some empirical studies (e.g. Gigliotti-Labay, 2010) have shown that IBDP schools in general might implement IM in a superficial way, it is arguably the case that the ‘Elite International School’ such as the one in our study values and respects the concept as part of its own identity as a legitimate ‘International School’ (Bunnell, Fertig, and James, 2017). However, what is clear is that IM, as we have noted, provides a way of speaking and acting, whether it be for individual gain within the class logic of the TNCC, as argued by Sklair (2000; 2002), or a collective sense of responsibility.

Further work needs to take forward our analysis to critically question further the origins and destinations of these students attending similar schools to Eden School in different continents and in receipt of similar messages. This work of inquiry needs to explore more the sense these students make of this as well as its impact on their career and life trajectories. This work is essential if we are to better understand also the nature of the GMC, as well as the TNCC, in its formation. The comments made above by Eden School’s ‘Alistair’ strikingly

reveal a consciousness that his schooling experience might be useful in making contact with others like him, anywhere.

Finally, offering an alternative to the dominant Bourdieusian theoretical framing usually found in literature on elite education, we have begun to demonstrate here the value of Bernstein's theoretical tools for uncovering these classed schooling experiences, especially in terms of the subtly distinct way of theorising school cultures and the level of analytical precision afforded by the framework. Distinguishing between a school's expressive and instrumental order dimensions enables account to be taken of the importance character holds relative to credentials for the life chances of the young person who undergoes an 'Elite International School' experience.

References

- Anderson, B. (1991) *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso.
- Ball, S. (2010). Is there a global middle class? The beginnings of a cosmopolitan sociology of education: A review. *Journal of Comparative Education*, 69(1), 137-161.
- Ball, S. (2015) The future of elite research in education: Commentary, in: C. Maxwell and P. Appleton (Eds.) *Elite Education: International Perspectives* pp.69-75. Routledge: Abingdon, England.
- Barratt Hacking, E., Blackmore, C., Bullock, K., Bunnell, T., Donnelly, M., & Martin, S. (2018) International Mindedness in practice: The evidence from International Baccalaureate schools. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 17(1), 3-16.

- Basaran, T., & Olsson, C. (2017). Becoming International: On Symbolic Capital, Conversion and Privilege. *Millennium* 46 (2), 96-118.
- Bernstein, B., Elvin, H. L., & Peters, R. S. (1966) Ritual in education, *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences* 251 (772), 429-436.
- Bernstein, B. (1967) Open Schools – Open Society? *New Society* 10 (1967), 351-353.
- Bernstein, B. (1977). *Class, codes and control: Towards a theory of educational transmissions (2nd Edition)*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Bernstein, B. (2000). *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research and Critique*. Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield
- Brown, P.; Lauder, H. and Ashton, D. (2011) Digital Taylorism, in: P. Brown.; H. Lauder. And D. Ashton (Eds.) *The Global Auction: The Broken Promises of Education*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Brown, P., Power, S., Tholen, G. and Allouch, A. (2016). Credentials, talent and cultural capital: a comparative study of educational elites in England and France. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 37(2), 191-211.
- Bunnell, T. (2019) *International Education and Schooling in the 'New Era': Emerging Issues*. Emerald Publishing: Bingley, England.
- Bunnell, T.; Courtois, A.; and Donnelly, M. (2020) British elite private schools and their overseas branches: Unexpected actors in the global education industry, *British Journal of Educational Studies*.
- Bunnell, T; Fertig, M; and James, C. (2017) Establishing the legitimacy of a school's claim to be 'International': The provision of an international curriculum as the institutional primary task, *Educational Review* 69 (3), 303-317.

Bunnell, T.; Fertig, M. and James, C. (2019) The institutionalisation of schools and the implications for identity of experienced teachers; The case of International Baccalaureate World Schools, *Cambridge Journal of Education*.

Cannadine, D. (1994). *Aspects of Aristocracy: Grandeur and Decline in modern Britain*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.

Cause, L. (2011). 'International-mindedness': a field of struggle, confusion and hope. *Global Journal of Human-Social Science Research*, 11(7).

Chandler, D. and Reid, J. (2016) *The Neoliberal Subject: Resilience, Adaptation and Vulnerability*. Rowman and Littlefield International: London.

Courtois, A. (2015). 'Thousands waiting at our gates': moral character, legitimacy and social justice in Irish elite schools. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 36(1), 53-70.

Donnelly, M. (2018) Inequalities in higher education: Applying the sociology of Basil Bernstein, *Sociology* 52 (2), 316-332.

Freeland, C. (2010) The rise of the new global elite, *The Atlantic* 307 (1), 44-55.

Friedman, J. Z. (2018). The global citizenship agenda and the generation of cosmopolitan capital in British higher education. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 39(4), 436-450.

Goodhart, D. (2017) *The Road to Somewhere: The Populist Revolt and the Future of Politics*. London: C Hurst & Co.

Gigliotti-Labay, J. (2010) *Fulfilling its mission: The promotion of International Mindedness in IB Diploma Programmes*. Unpublished EdD Dissertation, University of Houston.

Hayden, M. and McIntosh, S. (2018) International Education: The transformative potential of experiential learning, *Oxford Review of Education* 44 (4), 40-413.

Hayden, M., & Thompson, J. (2013) International Schools: Antecedents, current issues and metaphors for the future, in: R. Pearce (Ed.) *International Education and Schools: Moving Beyond the First 40 Years* pp.3-24. Bloomsbury Academic: London.

Hill, I. (2012). Evolution of education for international mindedness, *Journal of Research in International Education* 11(3), 245-261.

Hill, I. (2014) Internationally minded schools as cultural artefacts: Implications for school leadership, *Journal of Research in International Education* 13 (3), 175-189.

Hill, I. (2018) A subjectivist model of school leadership for 'International Schools': Greenfield revisited, *Peabody Journal of Education* 93 (5), 518-533.

International Baccalaureate Organisation (2013). *The IB Learner Profile*. Geneva: IBO.

Jansson, A. (2016) How to become an 'elite cosmopolitan': The mediated trajectories of United Nations expatriates, *Journal of Cultural Studies* 19 (5), 465-480.

Keeling, A. (2015, November 11) International Schools market expands to 8,000 schools, *Relocate Magazine*.

Kenway, J. and Koh, A. (2013) The 'elite school' as 'cognitive machine and social paradise': Developing transnational capitals for the national field of power, *Journal of Sociology* 49 (2-3) 272-290.

Kenway, J. and Koh, A. (2015) Sociological silhouettes of elite schooling, *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 36 (1), 1-10.

Lai, C., Shum, M., & Zhang, B. (2014). International mindedness in an Asian context: The case of the International Baccalaureate in Hong Kong. *Educational Research*, 56(1), 77-96.

Poole, A. (2017). Interpreting and implementing the IB Learner Profile in an internationalised school in China: a shift of focus from the 'Profile as text' to the 'lived Profile'. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 16(3), 248-264.

Poole A (2020) Decoupling Chinese Internationalised Schools from Normative Constructions of the International School. *Compare*, 50(3), 447-454.

Reeves, A.; Friedman, S.; Rahal, C.; and Flemmen, M. (2017) The decline and persistence of the old boy: Private schools and elite recruitment 1897 to 2016, *American Sociological Review* 82 (6), 1139-1166.

Robinson, W. and Sprague, J. (2018) The Transnational Capitalist Class, in: M.

Juergensmeyer; M. Steger and S. Sassenn (Eds.) *The Oxford Handbook of Global Studies*.

Savva, M., & Stanfield, D. (2018) International-Mindedness: Deviations, Incongruities and Other Challenges Facing the Concept, *Journal of Research in International Education*, 17(2), 179-193.

Scott, J. (1982). *The upper classes, property and privilege in Britain*. London: Macmillan.

Sennett, R. (1998). *The corrosion of character*. New York: W.W. Norton & Company.

Sennett, R. (2006). *The culture of the new capitalism*. New Haven: Yale University Press

Sklair, L. (2000). *The transnational capitalist class*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Sklair, L. (2002) Democracy and the Transnational Capitalist Class, *International Political Science Review* 23 (2), 159-174.

Tarc, P., & Mishra Tarc, A. (2015). Elite international schools in the Global South: transnational space, class relationalities and the 'middling' international schoolteacher. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 36(1), 34-52.

The Telegraph (2016, October 5) Theresa May's Conference Speech in full. <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2016/10/05/theresa-mays-conference-speech-in-full/>

Van Oord, L. (2013) Moral education and the International Baccalaureate Learner Profile, *Educational Studies* 39 (2), 208-218.

Walker, G. (2010). East is East and West is West (*IB Position Paper*). Geneva: IBO.

Wallbank, M. (1979). Eighteenth century public schools and the education of the governing elite. *History of Education*, 8(1), 1-19.

Wells, J. (2011) International Education values and attitudes: A critical analysis of the International Baccalaureate (IB) Learner Profile, *Journal of Research in International Education* 10 (2), 174-188.

Yemini, M. & Furstenburg, S. (2018). Students' perceptions of global citizenship at a local and an international school in Israel. *Cambridge Journal of Education*.

Yemini, M. & Maxwell, C. (2018). De-coupling or remaining closely coupled to 'home': educational strategies around identity-making and advantage of Israeli global middle-class families in London. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*.