

IMPROVING STUDENTS' NARRATIVE WRITING ABILITY BY IMPLEMENTING DIGITAL PICTURE SERIES IN ONLINE EFL CLASS

Evani Risa Girsang

Universitas Negeri Surabaya
evani.17020084086@mhs.unesa.ac.id

Abstrak

Menulis dipandang sebagai salah satu keterampilan yang paling berat untuk dipelajari karena merupakan keterampilan produktif aktif. Siswa harus belajar bagaimana menemukan ide dan menuangkannya ke dalam jenis produk tulisan tertentu. Dalam menulis naratif, siswa mengalami kesulitan untuk menemukan ide dan mengorganisasikan teks naratif. Banyak penelitian telah dilakukan untuk mencari cara dalam membantu siswa meningkatkan kemampuan menulis naratif mereka. Gambar seri adalah satu dari banyak cara yang terbukti meningkatkan penulisan naratif siswa. Penelitian ini menekankan pada penggunaan gambar seri digital karena selama penelitian ini dilakukan secara daring akibat pandemi Covid19. Peneliti menggunakan aplikasi berbasis web bernama *StoryBoardThat.com* sebagai media gambar seri digital. Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk membuktikan apakah penggunaan gambar seri digital dapat meningkatkan kepiawaian menulis naratif siswa dan untuk melihat respon siswa terhadap penggunaannya. Penelitian ini dilakukan pada 15 siswa kelas X MIPA 1 di Sekolah Citra Berkas, Surabaya. Peneliti menggunakan dua instrumen untuk mengetahui data penelitian ini. Untuk mengetahui apakah gambar seri digital dapat meningkatkan kepiawaian menulis naratif siswa, peneliti menggunakan penelitian pra-eksperimen yang mengambil hasil *pre-test* dan *post-test* dan diolah melalui menggunakan *Paired Sample T-test* untuk melihat peningkatan dari menulis naratif. Kemudian untuk mengetahui respon siswa terhadap penerapan gambar seri digital, penulis menggunakan angket berupa *Skala Likert* lima poin yang terdiri dari 21 pernyataan yang dikelompokkan menjadi 7 topik, masing-masing berisi 3 pernyataan. Hasil penelitian ini menunjukkan peningkatan kemampuan menulis narrative yang signifikan setelah penerapan gambar seri digital yaitu (2-Tailed) $< 0,05$ (H_a). Melalui angket, dapat terlihat bahwa 80% siswa setuju bahwa penggunaan gambar seri digital lebih menyenangkan. Berdasarkan hasil penelitian dapat disimpulkan bahwa penerapan gambar seri digital dapat meningkatkan kepiawaian siswa dalam menulis naratif.

Kata kunci: gambar seri digital, menulis naratif

Abstract

Writing skill is considered as one of the most difficult skill to be learnt as it is an active productive skill. Students have to learn how to find out ideas and pour it into a certain type of writing product. In narrative writing, students have some difficulties to find idea and to organize the narrative text. Many studies have been conducted to figure out the ways in helping students improve their narrative writing ability. Picture series is one of many proven ways to help students improve their narrative writing. This study emphasized the use of digital narrative writing because during this research was being conducted, classes are conducted online due to Covid19 pandemic. Researcher used a web-side based application called *StoryBoardThat.com* as the media of digital picture series. This study is to prove that the implementation of digital picture series can improve students' narrative writing ability and also to see students' response of it. This research is done to 15 students of X MIPA 1 grader in Sekolah Citra Berkas, Surabaya. Researcher used two instruments to find out the data of this study. To find out whether digital picture series can improve students' narrative writing, writer used pre-experimental research which took students' pre-test and post-test result and processed using *Paired Sample T-test* to see the improvement of the narrative writing. Then to determine students' response towards the implementation of digital picture series, researcher used questionnaire in a form of five-points Likert Scale consist of 21 statements which grouped into 7 topics, which each of the topic consisted of 3 statements. The result of this study showed a significant improvement of students' narrative writing (2-Tailed) < 0.05 (H_a). From the questionnaire it can be seen that 80% students agreed that digital picture series implementation is more fun. Based on the result, it can be concluded that digital picture series implementation can improve students' ability in narrative writing.

Keywords: digital picture series, narrative writing

INTRODUCTION

There are 4 language skills in English. Harmer (2007) stated that we use language in terms of four skills; reading, writing, speaking and listening. These are often divided into two types of skills. Reading and listening skills are extracted from the discourse which simplified as receptive skill. The other skill is called after productive skill where students are required to independently produce language and this term known as the skill for speaking and writing skills.

Hence writing is an active productive skill, it is regarded to be one of the most difficult to learn of the four skills. Students who learned writing should learn how to find ideas and write the ideas into a certain type of writing product. Students are able to be independent from teachers and be the main actor of writing achievement (Foorman & Schatschneider, 2003). That is why it is considered very hard among most of Indonesian students. When it comes to writing narrative story, students faced with a lot of issues. To begin with, students were at a loss what to write about. Also, it's tough for students to organize a text. (Smith, 2009). Students in 10th grader of Sekolah Citra Berkart Surabaya had similar issues. Therefore, teachers must organize the right strategy in learning.

One of the media suitable to be applied on narrative writing learning is picture series. It is claimed that picture series are more engaging for students because it provides colorful pictures, which is why students will see the situation in the picture provided. Aschawir (2014) stated that pictures can stimulate and encourage students to elevate their ideas, mental and imagination to create a certain text. Picture series are essential in helping students to get clear idea of something since the picture can represent mood, place, people, or object. Picture series assist learners giving them inspiration to tell in a plot. Patricia et al., (1998) stated that development of character, story concept, sequencing, recognizing details and can be understood by the students by implementing pictures.

However, technology implementation in education has become such an important and inescapable media. Recently, due to the global pandemic of Covid-19 students are forbidden to go to school and have no choice but to study at their houses and connect through digital platforms. Since then, there has been much attention paid to the growing blended learning course. The merging technology in learning known as online learning which included the contents and instructions of education delivered virtually through the internet (Watson and Kalmon, 2005).

Starting from the problems arising, the researcher decided to conduct a research combining digital platform and picture series as the media to see if it can elevate

students' ability in narrative writing which entitled as *Improving Students' Narrative Writing Ability by Implementing Digital Picture Series in Online EFL Class*. This teaching technique focused on online class learning and teaching, which is relevant to the recent condition due Covid-19 pandemic, and students' improvement in narrative writing by using picture series. Based on the explanation above, researched questions can be formulated as follow: 1. Does the digital picture series implementation improve narrative writing in the eighth grade students of Sekolah Citra Berkart Surabaya in Academic Year 2020/2021?; and 2. How does the students' respond toward the implementation of digital picture series implementation in the tenth grade students of Sekolah Citra Berkart Surabaya in Academic Year 2020/2021?

METHOD

This study was conducted to find out students' improvement in narrative writing using digital picture series. Hence, to figure out the improvement of students' score, a pre-experimental pre-test-post-test research was carried out. Pre-experimental research design is a research method that includes observing a participant or a group after a treatment has been given to see is the treatment has the potential to affect change (Frey, 2018) It used to investigate students' improvement by looking and comparing students' scores of pre-test and post-test. Since the class that took place in this research was consisted of 15 students so researcher decided to give treatment to all of those 15 students. The result of this is to answer the first research question and processed as a quantitative result. Based on the previous explanation, one group pre-experimental research is the best method for this research.

To answer the second research question, researcher used questionnaire which were translated into Bahasa Indonesia to help students understand the questionnaire. The questionnaire were divided into 7 big topics which are students' enjoyment, students' motivation, teachers' method and instruction, teaching materials, technical matters and sustainability. In each topic, writer set 3 kinds of statements and students' will give their assessment in the scale from 1 to 5. 1 is the lowest and 5 is the best.

Participants

This research took place in Sekolah Citra Berkart Surabaya, to be precise this research is conducted in 10 MIPA 1 class as the population. They are currently running National+ curriculum. There are 15 students in this class. The students are around the age of 16 to 18 years old.

The scoring of pre-test and post-test of speaking English was using the method by Brown (2004). The descriptive statistic showed the minimum, maximum,

mean and the standard deviation of pre-test and post-test result as shown below:

Table 1. Descriptive Statistics

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Pre-test	15	53.00	67.00	62.28	4.123
Post-test	15	67.00	85.00	77.26	5.655
Valid N (listwise)	15				

It is known that all 15 students had a better score in the post-test compared to the pre-test. In the pre-test, the minimum score was 53.00, and the maximum was 67.00, with a mean of 62.28 and a standard deviation of 4.123. The minimum and maximum scores increased in the post-test, 67.00 for minimum and 85.00 for maximum, respectively, with the mean of 77.26 and standard deviation of 5.655.

In finding the normality of the test distribution, Shapiro-Wilk test were used since the data taken was less than 50 participants. The data collection has been processed by using IBM SPSS. As the result, the data's outcome can be seen as below:

Table 2. Normality Test

	Shapiro-Wilk		
	Statistic	df	Sig
Pre-test	.959	15	.674
Post-test	.925	15	.233

From the table above, the result showed that the data was distributed normally because the value of Sig. > 0.05. Both result of result showed higher than 0.05. For pre-test it showed 0,674 and for post-test 0,233. Researcher concluded that the data was distributed normally and could cover the population.

Data Collection

The data was gathered in an online classroom setting for 2 meetings. The researcher would ensure to the participants that their identities would not be revealed to anyone. Their identities would be removed from the questionnaire and in analyzing the data.

Every class meetings were held for 90 minutes. The first 45 minutes was used were being used explain the material to students by the English teacher. Then, the students were given other 45 minutes to create their own narrative story in every meeting. Students' narrative texts were being submitted to teacher's Google drive so it can be access easily for everyone. Teacher created 2 separated folders for pre-test and post-test. After all of the students finished writing their narrative stories, students submitted

their stories to the Google Drive provided. For the pre-test students were asked to make their own narrative text. Then, for the post-test, to emphasize digital media students were asked to make picture series by using StoryBoardThat.com as the digital picture series. StoryBoardThat.com is a website based graphic organizer which claimed to be the leading storyboard creator worldwide which presents digital storytelling into a new level.

Data Analysis

The data in this study were analyzed using IBM SPSS to answer the first research question to find out the improvement of students' writing skill by using digital picture series at grade 10th students of Sekolah Citra Berkat Surabaya in academic Year 2020/2021. Then, to answer the second research question researcher reviewed the questionnaire to find out students' response of digital picture series at 10th grade students of Sekolah Citra Berkat Surabaya in academic Year 2020/2021. The questionnaire was interpreted topic by topic to study students' response toward digital picture series implementation.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This section shows the result of each research question. Those are: 1. To find out the improvement of students' narrative writing skill by implementing digital picture series at 10th grade students of Sekolah Citra Berkat Surabaya in academic Year 2020/2021; and 2. To know the response of using digital picture series at 10th grade students of Sekolah Citra Berkat Surabaya in academic Year 2020/2021.

Students' improvement in implementing using digital picture series

This sub-section is to answer the first research question, researcher used pre-test and post-test to see students' narrative writing improvements by implementing digital picture series. The pre-test was carried out when the writer first entered the class and the post-test was carried out the second time of the research session.

Table 3. Paired Samples T-Test

		Paired Samples Test							
		Paired Differences			95% Confidence Interval of the Difference		t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
		Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean	Lower	Upper			
Pair 1	Pretest- Posttest	-14.13333	6.77038	1.74811	-17.88265	-10.38402	-8.085	14	.000

Paired sample T-test was applied to find the difference in results before and after the implementation of digital picture series in improving students' narrative writing

ability. As the research conducted, the goal of this research is to figure out the significant improvement of students' narrative writing skills by implementing digital picture series (H_a), on the other hand, there would be any chance that there is no improvement in students' narrative writing by using digital picture series (H_o). There was a difference in the mean value between before (pre-test mean = 62.28) and after using digital picture series (post-test mean = 77.26). Furthermore, there was an increased in the mean value, which indicated that digital picture series could improve students' writing skills. The result of the t-test can be seen in the table 4 as follows:

Table 4. Paired Sample Correlation

N	Correlation	Sig.	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
15	0.067	0.000	-8.085	14	0.000

From table 3, it can be seen that the correlation coefficient value is 0.067, and the significance is 0.000. Since the significance value is $0.000 < 0.05$, there is a correlation between the pre-test and post-test variables. It can also be known that the significance (2-tailed) in Table 3 above is $0.000 < 0.05$, which means that hypothesis H_o was rejected and H_a is accepted. It can be concluded that there is a difference between the results before and after digital picture series implementation, which means that there is a significant improvement of using digital picture series to improve students' narrative writing ability.

Students' response towards digital picture series implementation in narrative writing

This sub-section contains students' response towards digital picture series implementation in improving students' narrative writing skills, which was intended to answer the second research question. The implementation of the digital picture series were conducted on the second meeting. Researcher use StoryBoardThat.com for students to create their own picture series. After they created their picture series, teacher distributed the picture randomly to their other friends. Hence, each student creates the narrative text from their friend's picture series. To get the data, researcher used questionnaires to know students' responses toward digital picture series implementation after the last meeting. The students were asked to fill in questionnaire after the implementing digital picture series. The questionnaire is in a form of 5-point Likert Scale. 1 indicates disagree, 2 indicates somewhat agree, 3 indicates neutral, 4 indicates somewhat agree and 5 indicates agree. The table below presented the frequency and percentage distribution of the results filled in by students:

Table 4. Percentage distribution of students' enjoyment (%)

No.	Statement	Rating Scale				
		1	2	3	4	5
1.	So far, the learning media used by the English teacher is fun	-	26.7	73.3	-	-
2.	Teaching with picture series is more fun than ordinary teaching	-	-	-	20	80
3.	I don't get bored easily when being taught with picture series	-	-	-	33.3	66.7

The first topic is about students' enjoyment. It showed that students enjoy using digital picture series. 80% student agreed and 20% other somewhat agreed that digital picture series was more fun rather than the ordinary teaching.

Second topic is about students' motivation toward the implementation of picture series. These statements are important to figure out whether digital picture series can gain students' motivation. Students' perception can be seen as below:

Table 5. Percentage of students' motivation (%)

No.	Statement	Rating Scale				
		1	2	3	4	5
1.	1. I'm more enthusiastic about learning English with picture series	-	-	13.3	73.3	13.3
2.	2. I'm more motivated to learn writing in English after being taught with picture series	-	-	-	26.7	73.3
3.	3. I'm braver to ask the teacher when the teacher uses picture series	-	-	66.7	20	13.3

73.3% student agreed and 26.7% student somewhat agreed that their motivation increased after being taught using picture.

The third topic is about teacher's method and instruction while implementing digital picture series in teaching narrative writing. This section was to find out students' thoughts on teachers' given method and instruction efficiency. The result can be seen in percentage as follows:

Table 6. Percentage distribution of teacher's method and instruction (%)

No.	Statement	Rating Scale
-----	-----------	--------------

		1	2	3	4	5
1.	When using picture series, teacher's explanation is easy to understand	-	-	26.7	73.3	-
2.	My English teacher always teaches with different media	-	80	20	-	-
3.	I can answer teacher questions using picture series	-	-	86.7	-	13.3

73.3% student somewhat agreed and 26.7% student are neutral that teachers' explanation is easier to understand when using picture series.

The fourth topic is about teachers' material. The result can be seen in the table below:

Table 7. Percentage distribution of teachers' material (%)

No.	Statement	Rating Scale				
		1	2	3	4	5
1.	The material provided in the picture series is easier to understand	-	-	-	86.7	13.3
2.	The material provided in the picture series provides additional information that I don't know about	-	-	80	6.7	13.3
3.	I can make the material used by the teacher by myself or get it on the internet	-	-	-	-	100

There were 13.3% student agreed and 86.7% student somewhat agreed that by providing digital picture series as the media was easier to understand. Marble (2012) mentioned that pictures can be used to assist students to elevate the details, ideas, or sequences of a narrative text.

Technical matter

The fifth topic is about technical matters. Technical matter determined teacher's capability in operate digital picture series, especially in an online classroom. The result of students' thought on technical matters can be seen in the table below:

Table 8. Percentage distribution of technical matters (%)

No.	Statement	Rating Scale				
		1	2	3	4	5
1.	The teacher can operate the teaching equipment during the class	-	-	-	26.7	73.3
2.	The teaching equipment in the classroom is sufficient	-	-	13.3	26.7	60

3.	Teaching with picture series can be done in an online classroom	-	-	-	33.3	66.7
----	---	---	---	---	------	------

66.7% students agreed that teaching with picture series can be done in online classroom and 33.3% other students somewhat agreed on it. From this, it can be concluded that picture series could be done online furthermore; students were enjoying the implementation of picture series even in online classroom.

Sustainability is the sixth topic of finding out students' respond towards digital picture series implementation. Sustainability determined to meet students' need and the ability to keep being used in the future generation. The findings can be seen as follows:

Table 9. Percentage distribution of sustainability (%)

No.	Statement	Rating Scale				
		1	2	3	4	5
1.	Picture series can be applied in further learning	-	-	26.7	6.7	66.7
2.	I don't mind the continuous use of picture series	-	-	86.7	13.3	-
3.	If the picture series is being used again after this, the way teacher deliver is must be different	-	-	13.3	-	86.7

Viewing 3 statements of topic *F* (sustainability), students' showed that they are open to use digital picture series for further material. In terms of applying digital picture series, 66.7% student agreed that picture series can be applied in further lesson while 6.7% student somewhat agreed and 26.7% other are neutral. But, 86.7% student preferred a different ways of delivering and 13.3% student are neutral about ways of delivering.

The last topic is to find out students' difficulties in implementing digital picture series in the teaching and learning process as shown in the table below:

Table 10. Percentage distribution of difficulties (%)

No.	Statement	Rating Scale				
		1	2	3	4	5
1.	The exercises given are more difficult when using picture series media	86.7	13.3	-	-	-
2.	The teacher takes longer time to prepare teaching with picture series	13.3	80	6.7	-	-

3.	The use of picture series makes students less able to actively participate in the teaching and learning process	13.3	80	6.7	-	-
----	---	------	----	-----	---	---

The finding of Solak and Cakir (2015) stated that effective online learning strategies is essential because, in doing so, students learn faster, have more pleasure, and learn more efficiently and effectively. In addition, online learning creates opportunities for students being an active learner (Dolence & Norris, 1995).

80% student somewhat disagree that picture series implementation less able to active in class participation, while 13.3% disagree and 6.2% neutral about it.

As a conclusion digital picture series is able to help students improve their narrative text and students have positive response to the implementation of digital narrative writing.

Discussion

CONCLUSION

To sum it up, digital picture series implementation in teaching and learning activities can improve students writing skills of 10th grader students of Sekolah Citra Berkas Surabaya. It can be said that there was an improvement in students' narrative writing skills after using digital picture series. The positive effect of digital picture series implementation in the learning process is in line with previous research that has been conducted by Agustina Dwi (2017), Muryani (2020), and Khotimah, Bukhari Daud and Burhansyah (2017).

Based on the result and discussion presented above, it can be stated that digital picture series have a good impact on students' narrative writing abilities. The 15 students who participated as the sample of this study improved their narrative writing skill after being taught by implementing digital picture series. From the questionnaire, us showed that students responded the digital picture series implementation positively. Result showed that student think it's more fun, makes them more enthusiast, more motivated and they can access it easily in the internet.

After exploring students' responses by reviewing the given questionnaire, it can clearly be seen that students enjoyed using digital picture series to learn narrative writing. This benefit were also suggested by Smaldino et al. (2005:9) who suggests picture series implementation will make students captivated in writing English. Students gain more motivation to learn picture series. Wright (1989:2) stated that picture series have the ability to provide students' students' motivation, a sense of the context of the language and a specific important stimulus.

Suggestions

Students felt that using digital picture series was more fun rather than using the ordinary media. Digital picture series helped students understand more on how to organize narrative text. According to Singh (2017), when students interested in writing, the teachers will find it easier to teach writing skills since the learning atmosphere is lively and the students are engaged in the lesson. Digital picture series implementation also made students enjoyed the learning process and made them more motivated in making narrative text. This research also proved that digital picture series can be applied in online class efficiently and effectively. In the same research, he mentioned that it needed constant effort and motivation from both students and teachers to take consideration of the effectiveness of the chosen teaching technique and be creative in using numerous techniques that can improve students' writing ability in the future.

Due time limitation, this research had not been able to represent the entire tenth grader of Sekolah Citra Berkas Surabaya. Therefore, further studies need to be carried out by increasing the number of samples. Other writers or researchers should do further research at different levels of EFL learners, it is advised.

REFERENCES

Since this research was carried out during the Covid19 pandemic so an effective digital media is needed. This research showed that digital picture series is a proven effective media in teaching and learning narrative writing.

Agustina Dwi. 2017. *IMPROVING STUDENTS' WRITING SKILLS OF NARRATIVE TEXTS USING PICTURE SERIES (A Classroom Action Research to the Eighth Grade Students of SMP Ta'mirul Islam Surakarta in Academic Year 2015/2016)*: THE STATE ISLAMIC INSTITUTE OF SURAKARTA

Aschawir, A. (2014). Using Series pictures to develop the Students' ideas in English narrative writing. *Scholarly Journal of Education*, 3(October), 88–95

Brown, H.D. (2004). *Language Assessment: Principles and Classroom Practices*. New York, USA: Longman.

Clarke, T., & Hermens, A. (2001). Corporate developments and strategic alliances in e- learning. *Education and Training*, 43(4/5), 256-267.

Dolence, M. G., & Norris, D. M. (1995). *Transforming higher education: A vision for learning in the 21st century*. Ann Arbor, MI: Society for College and University Planning.

E. Smaldino, Sharon. (2005). *Instractional Technology and Media For Learning*. Boston: Pearson

- Foorman, B. and Schatschneider, C. (2003). Measuring teaching practice during reading/language arts instruction and its relation to student achievement. In S. R. Vaughn and K. L. Briggs (Eds.), *Reading in the classroom: Systems for observing teaching and learning*. Baltimore: Paul Brookes.
- Frey, Bruce B. 2018. *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Educational Research, Measurement, and Evaluation*. Encyclopedia Doi: <https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781506326139.n536>
- Gregoria, K., Gutiérrez, C., Puello, M. N., Alberto, L., & Galvis, P. (2015). *Using Pictures Series Technique to Enhance Narrative Writing among Ninth Grade Students at Institución Educativa Simón Araujo*. *English Language Teaching*, 8(5), 45–71. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v8n5p45>
- Harmer, Jeremy. 2007. *The Practice of English Language Teaching*. Harlow: Longman
- Khotimah, Daud, Bukhari, Burhansyah. 2017. *Using Picture Series To Enhance Students' Ability In Narrative Writing*. Syiah Kuala University, Banda Aceh.
- Marble, S. (2012). *How Do Wordless Picture Books Help Develop Writing For All Students ? How Do Wordless Picture Books Help Develop Writing For All Students ?* New York: Fisher Digital Publication.
- Muryani. 2020. *Improving Students' Writing Ability in Narrative Text through Picture Series*. Teacher in SD Inpres 2 Mensung Parigi Moutong. *JME* Volume 6 no. 1 Juni 2020, 32-38. ISSN: 12580-3522
- Mustafa, F., Kirana, M., & Bahri Ys, S. 2015. *Errors in EFL writing by junior high students in Indonesia*. Banda Aceh: *International Journal of Research Studies in Language Learning* 2017 January, Volume 6 Number 1, 38-52
- Patricia, A., Sharon, M., Stacey, L., Gail, M., Daune, M., Carter, P. A., & Sebastian, D. M. (1998). *Improving Student Writing Skills Using Wordless Picture Books by Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in Teaching and Leadership Saint Xavier University & IRI / SkyLight Field-Based Master ' s Program Actio*. Chicago: Eric.
- Saeed, A., Hussain, S., & Fatima, S. (2015). *Prepositional errors in the writings of Pakistani ESL students*. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 5(3),120-128. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/ijel.v5n3p120>
- Singh, Charanjit Kaur S., Mei, Tan P., Abdullah, Maria S., Othman, Wan M., & Mostafa, Nor A. (2017). *ESL Learners' Perspectives on the Use of Picture Series in Teaching Guided Writing*. Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris, Malaysia.
- Smith R. (2009, October 15). 20 Common problems in students writing [Blog]. Retrieved January 13, 2017 from <https://sites.google.com/site/mrsmithsgboard/assignments/20common-problems-in-student-writing>
- Solak, E., Cakir, R. (2015). *Exploring the effect of materials designed with augmented reality on language learners' vocabulary learning*. *Journal of Educators Online* 13(2):50-72 DOI:[10.9743/JEO.2015.2.5](https://doi.org/10.9743/JEO.2015.2.5)
- Yulia, Erika. 2014. *The Use of Picture Series to Improving the Writing Skills of Tenth Grade Students of SMA N 1 Srandakan in Writing Narrative Texts in the Academic Year of 2013/2014*. English Education Department Faculty of Languages and Arts Yogyakarta state University.
- Yunus, Noor Azlina. 1981. *Preparing and Using Aids for English Language Teaching*. Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University Press.
- Watson, J., & Kalmon, S. (2005). *Keeping pace with K–12 online learning: A review of statelevel policy and practice*. Naperville, IL: Learning Point Associates. DOI: 10.6007/IJARPED/v6-i4/3463