

How to Cite:

Reznik, O. M., Andriichenko, N. S., Zvozdetska, I. V., Zarosylo, V. O., & Hryshko, V. I. (2021). Results and perspectives on policing as part of the national security sector. *Linguistics and Culture Review*, 5(S3), 411-421.
<https://doi.org/10.37028/lingcure.v5nS3.1544>

Results and Perspectives on Policing as Part of the National Security Sector

Oleg M. Reznik

Sumy State University, Sumy, Ukraine

Nadiia S. Andriichenko

Sumy State University, Sumy, Ukraine

Irina V. Zvozdetska

The National University of Water and Environmental Engineering, Rivne, Ukraine

Volodymyr O. Zarosylo

Interregional Academy of Personnel Management (IAPM), Kyiv, Ukraine

Viktoriiia I. Hryshko

The National University of Water and Environmental Engineering, Rivne, Ukraine

Abstract--The police are one of the actors involved in ensuring national security. Therefore, the relevance of this article stems from the need to ensure effective performance. The issue of studying the experience of countries in this field is relevant to find the best models to assess the activities of these structures, which will contribute to a better performance of tasks assigned to them by law - this is one of the tools to assess the performance of the police. The aim of the article was to investigate the peculiarities of police performance assessment, thereby identifying practices that can improve the assessment of police performance. The objective was achieved by using dogmatic, statistical, comparative legal methods and a system-structural approach. The authors revealed the peculiarities of police assessment in Ukraine, the USA, Canada, France and the UK. The focus is on the assessment of police performance based on the level of citizens' trust and statistical data. The conclusion is made that citizens' trust in the police is necessary for the effective performance of its tasks. It is noted that the use of statistics to draw an objective conclusion about police performance is questionable because of the ability of police management to manipulate the data. It is concluded that each of these areas needs significant improvement. The findings are complementary to previous studies and have implications for

improving the assessment of Ukrainian police performance and police performance in foreign countries.

Keywords---changes in legislation, police activities, police efficiency, public administration, public trust.

Introduction

The police agencies of all states without exception, in view of their authority, will always be responsible for maintaining law and order, where necessary. Their duties will undoubtedly include the prosecution and transfer of offenders to the judiciary, as well as the fight against organized crime, both nationally and internationally. This testifies to the importance of the police in every democratic society and reinforces the tendency of its cooperation with the public. This approach is an integral part of the national security, which is the ultimate goal of the activity of all stakeholders, which guarantees the rights, freedoms and legitimate interests of every citizen (Chalom et al., 2001). However, such cooperation between these entities is possible only if the public trusts the police (Agle, 2020). However, the results of a sociological survey conducted in Ukraine in 2019 indicate that 49.4% of respondents estimate the activity of local police as unsatisfactory, and 52.7% of respondents estimate the activity of the Ukrainian police unsatisfactory. Obviously, the percentage of respondents who are satisfied with the work of these structures is much lower (33.7% and 29.5% respectively).

This situation makes it necessary for the state to find ways to influence police performance to ensure that the police properly performs its tasks. One of the methods involves the evaluation of police performance based on the predefined criteria that are enshrined at the statutory level. Thus, the study of the issue related to the experience of evaluating police performance meets the current needs of the state and is aimed at solving existing problems in society.

The activities of the police are multidimensional, which makes it difficult to exercise proper control over the performance of their duties. At the same time, the state must ensure that the police agencies carry out their activities effectively and that its employees do not violate the rights and freedoms of other subjects. However, the current situation in Ukraine indicates the opposite. In addition to the fact that the majority of citizens consider the activity of the police agencies unsatisfactory, 4.6% of the respondents noted that during the year the police officers repeatedly violated their rights or the rights of their relatives or did not fulfill their obligations stipulated by law, and 1.7% of respondents reported being beaten by police and ill-treated. Most striking is that 90.7% of these individuals did not file formal complaints about police decisions, actions or omissions. As 51.4% of respondents explained, the reason they did not appeal to the competent authorities was the belief that it would not help (Assessment of the activity..., 2019).

This testifies to several problems: first, the activities of police agencies sometimes go beyond the law, and the state does not respond properly, which affects both the trust of citizens in police agencies and government agencies. Accordingly, the

state today needs radical changes in terms of managing police agencies, creating conditions for preventing abuse of their rights by police officers, facilitating the proper performance of their duties, and involving the public in this process. However, this is possible, in particular, when evaluating the effectiveness of police performance. The foreign experience should be taken into account, and the possibility of implementing some advanced elements in Ukraine should be critically evaluated, given the realities of the country's development, elaboration of relevant proposals and changes to the legislation (Steptoe et al., 2002; Nichiforel et al., 2020).

Literature review

The issue of evaluating police performance has received considerable attention in scientific doctrine, as evidenced by the number of recent publications and research. In particular, A. Maslov notes that, in the context of scarce resources, it is becoming increasingly important to evaluate the effectiveness of the police, in order to ensure that its performance complies with its objectives. At the international level, the states agreed that it was necessary to apply effective indicators of their activity to optimize police performance (Maslov, 2015).

J.O. Sampaio, R.D.L.D.S. Bueno, R.G. De Pieri, and L.G. Cunha state that trust in state institutions is one of the central pillars in the stability of democracies. At the same time, the results of research conducted by scientists make it possible to conclude that the increase in the total number of crimes reduces the trust in the police (Sampaio et al., 2019). This opinion is supported by L.R. Blanco who argues that feeling of insecurity of citizens and rising crime rates significantly reduce trust in institutions, especially those directly deal with the fight against crime (police and the judiciary) (Blanco, 2013). A. Higgins and G. Hales note that the role of the police given the current development of the state is significantly changing, and therefore it is necessary to ensure the transition of the police from reducing crime to the operational management of existing threats and risks, eliminating the damage caused by them (Higgins & Hales, 2016).

It is also possible to support the opinion of N. La Vigne, J. Fontaine, and A. Dwivedi who emphasize that police performance should be judged in terms of its legitimacy. In addition, that, in the public's view, police activities are legitimate when citizens are convinced that police officers are representatives of the law who apply the law without prejudice, do not abuse their powers, act to meet the needs of society and the state (La Vigne et al., 2017). Meeting the needs of society and the state should be a priority for all public authorities. Moreover, Y.O. Romanenko and I.V. Chaplay even investigated the possibility of introducing marketing tools into the activities of these entities in order to ascertain the needs of the population and make decisions taking it into account (Romanenko & Chaplay, 2016).

This is especially relevant in the context of bureaucratization of the state apparatus and the increase in the level of political corruption, which, according to A. Kulish, N. Andriichenko, and O. Reznik, reduces the trust of citizens in state agencies and is an obstacle to the interaction between them (Kulish et al., 2018). S. Staubli points out that the perception of the police and other institutions of the

state depends on the number of contacts with representatives of the latter. Official data show that in Finland and Sweden police authorities have contact with 49.5% of the population in a year, in Belgium - 47.8%, in Switzerland - 42.9%, in the Netherlands - 42.5%, in Norway - 38.1%. The scientist has substantiated the thesis that the higher the percentage of the population with which the police interacts, the greater the probability that the latter are satisfied with police performance (Staubli, 2017). Thus, recent research and publications indicate that in the scientific field, the issue of evaluating police performance is relevant. However, a single approach to the criteria and indicators, which should be taken into account when evaluating police performance, has not been elaborated yet.

Materials and Methods

Research into the issue of evaluating the performance of police as part of the national security sector involved the use of dogmatic, statistical, comparative legal and systemic-structural approach. The dogmatic method made it possible to define the dogmas of evaluating police performance in the state. The statistical method became the basis for the analysis of empirical data and the isolation of only those data that reflect the real level of citizens' trust in the police in Ukraine. In its turn, the comparative legal method provided an opportunity to reveal common and different aspects of foreign experience related to evaluating police performance, and systemic-structural approach was used to summarize and systematically present the conclusions and provisions obtained.

Research into the issue of evaluating the performance of police as part of the national security sector involved the use of general and special scientific methods, such as dogmatic method, method of generalization, statistical method, method of critical analysis, comparative and legal method, synthesis method, systemic and structural method. The dogmatic method made it possible to disclose the role of police as a part of the national security sector and to define the dogmas of evaluating police performance in the state. The method of generalization helped to summarize the existing criteria for evaluating police performance. The statistical method became the basis for the analysis of empirical data and the isolation of only those data that reflect the real level of citizens' trust in the police in Ukraine. Method of critical analysis allowed to find out and evaluate recent publications and researches devoted to the evaluating police performance, to disprove the importance of statistics in evaluating police performance. In its turn, the comparative and legal method provided an opportunity to reveal common and different aspects of foreign experience related to evaluating police performance. In particular this method became the basis for revealing the specificities of the police performance evaluation in Canada, Northern Ireland, United Kingdom, Scotland, United States. The synthesis method showed general tendency in police performance evaluating in the world. Therefore systemic and structural approach was used to summarize and systematically present the conclusions and provisions obtained.

Results and Discussion

Today, the central category in evaluating police performance is public trust

(Ardelean, 2013). In particular, this is evidenced by the provisions of the Law of Ukraine On the National Police, according to which the trust of citizens is the main criterion for evaluating police performance (On the National Police..., 2015). It is worth agreeing with D. Schaap that the police agencies need the public's trust in order to carry out their activities effectively. Recognizing this, police organizations in Europe have begun to emphasize this, but do not pay attention to what the police are really doing to increase public confidence. However, according to D. Schaap, trust is the result of a dialogue between the public and the police, and trust-building strategies are developing in an unpredictable, dynamic set of interrelated social and institutional factors (Schaap, 2021).

This is also confirmed by the fact that, according to M.P.J. Ashby and L. Tompson, police work is divided into two types, "active" and "proactive". Active police activities are actions initiated by members of the public, including reports of crimes committed or being committed (Rinartha & Suryasa, 2017). Proactive actions of the police are initiated by the latter on their own: stopping vehicles, checking ID documents, patrolling the territory, etc. Although these activities overlap, more time is needed for active policing (Ashby & Tompson, 2017). In sociological literature, trust is generally regarded as a psychological attribute, as a feature of social relations and social systems, explained by behavior based on actions and orientations at the individual level. However, there is no consensus on the possibility of trust in government agencies. For some authors, trust can only apply to people, whereas things, social and natural processes cannot be covered by the trust category. Despite the controversy over public trust in the police, the concept of "community policing", which is based on the category of trust, is popular. The principles of this concept, according to scientists, include:

- reducing crime;
- increasing the transparency of police performance;
- increase of citizens' satisfaction with police performance;
- reducing the level of complaints about the activities of police officers;
- increasing the satisfaction of police officers with their work;
- involvement of the public in the activities of the police;
- improving the efficiency of police performance and the quality of the tasks assigned to police officers (McCold & Wachtel, 1996).

If we evaluate the positive aspects of the community policing concept, it can be concluded that it meets the needs of citizens who are interested in the transparent work of police agencies, the availability of opportunities to cooperate with the police, increase in the efficiency of police and police officers, in particular, their satisfaction with their work (Drake & Simper, 2005). The state also benefits from the implementation of this concept as the effectiveness of police activities increases, and the public recognizes the functioning of this institution and assists in the performance of its tasks and functions.

The mandatory component of this concept is periodic public surveys, public control over police performance, consideration of citizens' appeals, which testifies to the focus of the police on the needs of citizens (Aladwan et al., 2021). This trend is observed today in democratically developed countries, while some countries in Eastern Europe and Central Asia, where democracy has only just

begun to emerge, are more likely to adhere to the principle of zero tolerance in police performance (Lum, 2009). It should be noted that opinion polls are a major tool for evaluating law enforcement in the United States, France, Japan, Austria, and Italy. Although in such states the issue of improving the forms of public control over police performance as guarantors of respect for human and citizen's rights and freedoms is urgent (Gordeev, 2017).

At the same time, citizens' trust is not the only criterion for evaluating police performance. In particular, in Canada, the basis for evaluation of police performance is a strategic indicator, which includes assessing the impact of police performance on the state of crime in the state, the level of citizens' trust in the police, and the operational indicator, which is formulated by quantitative indicators of police performance based on the annual plans and activity reports. Thus, the actual assessment of police performance in Canada is based on qualitative and quantitative data (Vavreniuk et al., 2021). Evaluating police performance in Canada involves a comprehensive assessment of the environment of police agencies, which are a system where strategic planning, collaboration with citizens, management of available resources, and the outcomes of these agencies and institutions are closely interrelated (Lelandais & Bodson, 2007).

Police Information and Statistics Committee is an entity authorized to collect information on crimes at national and international levels (Fathoni & Lanrong, 2021). The aforementioned Committee ensures the integrity and comparability of major policing activities by facilitating the collection and analysis of data by the Canadian Police Services. This information includes data on the number of crimes reported to the police, the number of cases solved by the police, the number of police officers, the cost of maintaining police agencies (Maslov, 2015). Special entities designed to assess the activities of the police also operate in Northern Ireland and the United Kingdom (with the exception of Scotland). The Northern Ireland Policing Board, as an independent public body, monitors police performance, takes steps to improve police engagement with the public, conducts a survey of citizens' trust in police forces and ensures that the results of the survey are published (Davis, 2012). In turn, the Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary and Fire & Rescue Services (except Scotland) also monitors the activities of police units and reports annually on its activities, which, in addition to the conclusions and generalizations resulting from the monitoring, include information on the status of achievement of the goals set (Sviatokum, 2013).

In the territory of Scotland, a feature of the evaluation of police performance is its implementation in the following areas: quality of services provided; citizens' feeling of security and safety; criminal justice and the fight against crime; management and activity efficiency (Sun, 2002). Each area is evaluated with three groups of indicators: resources expended, measures taken and their results. At the same time, each police agency carries out a self-assessment, the results of which are audited to establish their authenticity by a specially authorized state agency. The activities of the Scottish Police are also assessed through a public opinion survey about their activities (Bhuiyan, 2011; Lozano & Vallés, 2007). Their main task is to supplement official police statistics by interviewing citizens about crimes they have become aware of or victims of during the reporting period. First, it reveals information about crimes that have not been reported to the

police. Moreover, the opinion of citizens on the effectiveness of police performance is explored (Buhaichuk, 2015).

In the United States, police performance is assessed by quantitative criteria, in particular by the ratio of solved cases to registered cases; the ratio of the number of arrests and registered crimes; the number of identified crimes and the dynamics of their indicators (Tauhid et al., 2020). At the same time, unlike Canada, in the United States, the assessment of police performance provides for a qualitative assessment of the police officer based on the annual certification and the police unit. It should be noted that they use statistical data and population surveys to determine the effectiveness of the police unit (Krapyvin, 2016).

In general, we note that statistics are used in many states to analyze the activities of government agencies, including the police. However, the experience of some countries is more progressive. In particular, in France, a list of statistical data has been developed for each level of police agencies that best reflects the fulfillment by the latter of the tasks assigned to them and allows obtaining objective information about their activities, strengths and weaknesses of their work (Eterno & Silverman, 2019). It is important to note that the evaluation of strengths and weaknesses of the activity, comparison of the results with the previously obtained results, according to S. Bondarenko, I. Liganenko, O. Kalamani, L. Niekrasova is one of the preconditions for the development of any subjects (Bondarenko et al., 2018).

S. Bondarenko, L. Bodenchuk, O. Krynytska, I. Gayvoronska in their study argue that objective statistics allow selecting individual indicators for further analysis for identifying the risks related to police performance that may arise in the future (Svitlana et al., 2019). At the same time, the approach taken in France to complete statistical tables creates the possibility to manipulate statistics and to enter information in the table that will create a false perception of the effectiveness of police performance. We believe that it is possible to solve an existing problem by conducting independent verification of the submitted statistical information for its accuracy and to minimize the desire of police officers to abuse the possibility of submitting inaccurate data by imposing disciplinary or administrative liability. As for Ukraine, police reports indicate that statistics are the basis for them, and, thus, the prevention of manipulation of statistics is relevant for Ukraine as well.

At the same time, A. Krivins, in order to avoid manipulation of statistics, proposes another option to minimize such fraud, in particular to use the proportion of latent crime as a primary criterion for police activity performance instead of using the reduction in crime rates. This proposal, according to the scientist, will allow the police to neutralize the desire to manipulate statistics in case of a sufficiently high crime rate and to interest police officers in collecting information about crimes in the state (Krivins, 2015). Indeed, such a proposal is relevant and can solve the issue of manipulating statistical data to create fictitious effectiveness of the police. However, this idea is not perfect, despite a number of existing factors.

In particular, R.V. Veprytskyi, supporting in general the idea of the need to identify and register latent crime, notes the unanimity of scientists about the

extreme complexity of the study of this phenomenon, due to problems of epistemological and methodological nature, which include the lack of reliable methods that allow obtaining reliable data on actual crime in society (Veprytskyi, 2014). We also believe that a scientist's approach that is rational and raises many questions for the proposal to use the state of latent crime as a criterion for evaluating police performance should be supported.

Conclusions

Given the foregoing, it is obvious that many issues in the field of evaluating police performance remain debatable, in particular, the feasibility of using statistical data in the assessment, given the high probability of data manipulation, and the search for new optimal criteria. One of which is the state of latent crime in the state, although its implementation in national law is preceded by a number of questions requiring answers.

Thus, the experience of states in evaluating the effectiveness of police performance is different. At the same time, there is a general tendency to find a balance between qualitative and quantitative criteria, i.e. between the level of citizens' trust in the police and statistical data on their activities. It is undoubted that the trust of citizens in the police is necessary for the latter to effectively carry out their tasks. The use of statistics on police performance in order to formulate an objective conclusion about its effectiveness is questionable given the possibility of manipulating such data.

Accordingly, it is necessary to minimize the ability of police officers to abuse their powers and manipulate statistical data. One of the ways to solve this problem is to introduce disciplinary or administrative liability for such acts, to carry out independent verification of statistical data reliability, introduce latent crime status as a criterion for evaluating police performance. However, it should be noted that it is important to agree on general principles for evaluating police performance at the regional level, which would allow states, guided by them, both to evaluate the effectiveness of the police and to quickly improve its activities in accordance with the needs of the development of society and the state.

Acknowledgments

The article was carried out within the framework of projects: No.0118U003575 "System of criteria for external monitoring of the activity of a unified law enforcement agency in the sphere of financial and economic security of the state".

References

- Agley, J. (2020). Assessing changes in US public trust in science amid the COVID-19 pandemic. *Public Health*, 183, 122-125.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.puhe.2020.05.004>
- Aladwan, M. A., Salleh, H. S., Anuar, M. M., ALhwadi, H., & Almomani, I. (2021). The relationship among service quality, patient satisfaction and patient loyalty: case study in Jordan Mafraq hospital. *Linguistics and Culture Review*, 5(S3), 27-40.

- Ardelean, A. (2013). Auditors' ethics and their impact on public trust. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 92, 55-60. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.08.637>
- Ashby, M. P., & Tompson, L. (2017). Routine activities and proactive police activity: A macro-scale analysis of police searches in London and New York City. *Justice Quarterly*, 34(1), 109-135.
- Bhuiyan, S. H. (2011). Modernizing Bangladesh public administration through e-governance: Benefits and challenges. *Government Information Quarterly*, 28(1), 54-65. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2010.04.006>
- Blanco, L. R. (2013). The impact of crime on trust in institutions in Mexico. *European Journal of Political Economy*, 32, 38-55. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejpoleco.2013.06.004>
- Bondarenko, S., Liganenko, I., Kalamani, O., & Niekrasova, L. (2018). Comparison of methods for determining the competitiveness of enterprises to determine market strategy. *International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology*, 9(13), 890-898.
- Buhaichuk, K.L. (2015). Criteria for evaluating the performance of police forces in specified countries.
- Chalom, M., Leonard, L., Vanderschueren, F., & Vezina, C. (2001). Urban safety and good governance: the role of the police.
- Davis, R.C. (2012). Selected international best practices in police performance measurement.
- Drake, L. M., & Simper, R. (2005). Police efficiency in offences cleared: An analysis of English "Basic command units". *International Review of Law and Economics*, 25(2), 186-208. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.irle.2005.06.003>
- Eterno, J. A., & Silverman, E. B. (2019). *The crime numbers game: Management by manipulation*. crc Press.
- Fathoni, A., & Lanrong, Y. (2021). Transportation policy toward sustainable tourism development: Province of East Java, Indonesia. *International Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(1), 1-8.
- Gordeev, A.Yu. (2017). On the issue of positive experience in crime prevention in foreign countries. *Matters of Russian and International Law*, 7(11A), 115-121.
- Higgins, A., & Hales, G. (2016). *Cutting Crime in the 21st Century: Informed Proactivity in the Midst of Social and Organisational Change*. Police Foundation.
- Krapyvin, Ye. (2016). *Assessing the effectiveness of the police in Ukraine: from "sticks" to the new system (case study): scientific and practical issue*. Kyiv: Sofia-A. 120 p.
- Kriviņš, A. (2015). Towards security and safety: police efficiency across European countries. *Journal of security and sustainability issues*, 5(1), 35-44.
- Kulish, A., Andriichenko, N., & Reznik, O. (2018). A step forward in the minimization of political corruption in financial support of political parties: The experience of Ukraine and Lithuania. *Baltic Journal of Law & Politics*, 2018 vol. 11, iss. 1, p. 108-130.
- La Vigne, N., Fontaine, J., & Dwivedi, A. (2017). How do people in high-crime, low-income communities view the police?
- Lelandais, I., & Bodson, J. (2007). Measuring police performance: International experiences. *Montreal: International Centre for the Prevention of Crime*.
- Lozano, M., & Vallés, J. (2007). An analysis of the implementation of an environmental management system in a local public administration. *Journal of*

- environmental management*, 82(4), 495-511.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2006.01.013>
- Lum, C. (2009). Community policing or zero tolerance? Preferences of police officers from 22 countries in transition. *The British Journal of Criminology*, 49(6), 788-809.
- Maslov, A. (2015). Measuring the performance of the police: the perspective of the public.
- McCold, P., & Wachtel, B. (1996). Police officer orientation and resistance to implementation of community policing.
- Nichiforel, L., Deuffic, P., Thorsen, B. J., Weiss, G., Hujala, T., Keary, K., ... & Bouriaud, L. (2020). Two decades of forest-related legislation changes in European countries analysed from a property rights perspective. *Forest Policy and Economics*, 115, 102146. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.forpol.2020.102146>
- Rinartha, K., & Suryasa, W. (2017). Comparative study for better result on query suggestion of article searching with MySQL pattern matching and Jaccard similarity. In *2017 5th International Conference on Cyber and IT Service Management (CITSM)* (pp. 1-4). IEEE.
- Romanenko, Y. O., & Chaplay, I. V. (2016). Formation and directions in implementation of marketing mechanism in the system of public administration. *Aktual'ni Problemy Ekonomiky= Actual Problems in Economics*, (180), 102.
- Sampaio, J. O., Bueno, R. D. L. D. S., Pieri, R. G. D., & Cunha, L. G. (2020). Does Concern about Local Crime affect People's Trust in the Police?. *Estudos Econômicos (São Paulo)*, 49, 661-686.
- Schaap, D. (2021). Police trust-building strategies. A socio-institutional, comparative approach. *Policing and Society*, 31(3), 304-320.
- Small, W., Kerr, T., Charette, J., Schechter, M. T., & Spittal, P. M. (2006). Impacts of intensified police activity on injection drug users: Evidence from an ethnographic investigation. *International Journal of Drug Policy*, 17(2), 85-95. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.drugpo.2005.12.005>
- Staubli, S. (2017). *Trusting the police: comparisons across Eastern and Western Europe* (p. 200). transcript Verlag.
- Steptoe, A., Wardle, J., Fuller, R., Davidsdottir, S., Davou, B., & Justo, J. (2002). Seatbelt use, attitudes, and changes in legislation: an international study. *American journal of preventive medicine*, 23(4), 254-259. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0749-3797\(02\)00513-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0749-3797(02)00513-5)
- Sun, S. (2002). Measuring the relative efficiency of police precincts using data envelopment analysis. *Socio-economic planning sciences*, 36(1), 51-71. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0038-0121\(01\)00010-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0038-0121(01)00010-6)
- Sviatokum, I.O. (2013). UK experience in assessing the effectiveness of the police and the prospects for its use in Ukraine. *Law and Safety*, 1(48), 64-49.
- Svitlana, B., Liliya, B., Oksana, K., & Inna, G. (2019). Modelling instruments in risk management. *International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology*, 10(01), 1561-1568.
- Tauhid, T., Ishaka, M. ., Kamaluddin, K. ., & Taufiq, M. . (2020). The bureaucratic political relation model in perception of officers public: A study on bima city government. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 4(3), 142-150.

- Vavreniuk, S. A., Nepomnyashchyy, O. M., Marusheva, O. A., Lahunova, I. A., & Shostak, S. M. (2021). Mechanisms of public administration in post-soviet societies. *Linguistics and Culture Review*, 5(S2), 354-365.
- Veprytskyi, R. S. (2014). Crime latency and ways to overcome it. In *Forum Right* (Vol. 1, pp. 72-74).