

The Representation of Reunion 212 in Indonesian Online Media

Nizar Ibnus

English Education Department, Islamic State Institute of Syekh Nurjati Cirebon, Indonesia nizaribnusnizaribnus@gmail.com

Article Info ABSTRACT

Article History

- Article Received 23rd August 2019
- Article Reviewed 09th October 2019
- Article Accepted 21st October 2019

Keywords

Critical discourse analysis Reunion 212 Media Reunion 212 which is the action of a series of previous actions was reported by many media in Indonesia. Each media portrays the action differently. This critical discourse analysis attempts to uncover the practice of power in Indonesian online media regarding the rally. Three reunion 212-related articles published on December 2, 2017 from each of CNN Indonesia.com and Republika Online were collected as the data of the study. Those online media were chosen as preliminary study informs that they frequently take different point of view whey they are reporting moslem or islamic related issues. The data collected were analyzed using van Dijk discourse analysis approach which consisted of text analysis, social cognition, and social context. The findings confirm that CNN Indonesia.com is more concerned about the adverse effects of the action and the purpose of the action which is considered politically charged, while Republika Online brings more humanist themes eventhough it also does not deny the potential political purpose behind the action. The themes are supported by certain lexical and discourse strategies such as word choice, theme choice, cohesion, and coherence. Moreover, the power practice is more visible in CNN Indonesia.com which attempts to convince readers that the action is bad and orientates itself more toward political purposes. While the news from Republika Online is more informative and only contains the positive side of the action.

I. INTRODUCTION

The text is traditionally understood as a piece of writing, such as a poem and an intact novel. The text is defined as a social space where two fundamental social processes occur: awareness and representation of the world, and social interaction[1]. The definition is similar to what Halliday[2] has put forward that the text has at least three simultaneous metaphysics: ideational to represent experience and observation of the world, interpersonal to show social interactions between individuals in a discourse, and textual to make the text tied into one intact assuming language is a social construct and not merely a meaningful unit of speech or speech. Thus, it is safe to say that the actual text does not exist in a vacuum, but it has to do with the context or social situation that surrounds it. In this

regard, Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) comes as an analytical approach to the text that not only focuses on its linguistic features but also on social practices that attempts to be realized through text.

By the end of 2016 there have been massive mass mobilization events taking place in the capital. This mass action originally began on 14 October 2016 or known as the Islamic Defense Action I which purpose was to demand justice to the government over the blasphemy case by Basuki Tjahja Purnana (Ahok) against the chapter of Al-Maidah verse 51 which was followed by hundreds of thousands of people. The action was followed by the next action that is on November 4, 2016 which was then called the Islamic Defense Action II (Action 411). The committee claimed the action was followed by about 3.2 million

people[3]. The judiciary continues and Ahok's status turns into a suspect, but does not make him immediately detained. This subsequently led to follow-up action on December 2, 2016 named Islamic Defense Action III (Action 212) which was considered as the peak as it was joined by around 7.5 million people twice that of Action 411[3]. One year after this action, on December 2, 2017 they held a similar action but with a smaller number of masses. Unlike previous actions, there is no specific demand from this action. According to the committee this action is intended as a gathering event between participants 212 Action a year ago. Therefore, this action is called Reunion 212[4].

The news about Reunion 212 is believed to not be separated from the ideology of each media, not with the exception of CNNIndonesia.com and Republika Online. CNNIndonesia.com in this case represents the face of western media, especially those operated in such BBCIndonesia.com Indonesia as CNBCIndonesia.com, which according to Ambardi[4] are being ignorant and reluctant to portray moslems in a good way. Meanwhile, Republika Online serves as one of Indonesian media that frequently depicts positive sides of moslems and their movements. Besides, they have also a special column relating to Islamic world. This study is then aimed at exploring how Islam especially the Reunion 212 act is represented in those online media and what ideology behind them.

II.LITERATURE REVIEW

a. Critical Discourse Analysis

CDA was firstly known as Critical Linguistics (CL) in the 1970s by which is basically a combination of methods of text analysis that refers to Halliday's Systemic Functional Linguistics with social theories related to politics and ideology and sees language as it functions in social structure[5]. Thus, the language used by a person is determined by the person's position in the social system[3]. This approach is considered interdisciplinary because it involves several different disciplines. His theoretical framework was developed and inspired by the thinking of cross-field figures who were thought to bring enlightenment such as Marx, members of The Frankfurt School, Gramsci, Hall, Althusser, Foucault, Pecheux, and feminist scholars[4]. In its development, the term Critical Discourse Analysis is then more popularly used than Critical Linguistics although both refer to the same approach.

According to Wodak[5], there are several principles of CDA in analyzing texts. First, this approach is interdisciplinary. The problems in society are so complex that they require multi-perspectives and multi-disciplines to solve. To adapt to this, the methodology must be adaptive to the data being studied. Second, CDA is more problem-oriented than just focusing on linguistic features. Again, social issues such as racism, gender equality, and other forms of discrimination are the focus of the real CDA. No CDA if no problem. Text deemed not to show social problems cannot be analyzed using CDA. Third, the theory and methodology are eclectic. Theories and methodologies are integrated into each other and can be freely chosen as long as they can be used to understand and solve social phenomena under study. Fourth, CDA research always combines field studies and ethnography as a pre-condition of further analysis so that bottom-up and top-down approaches can be used simultaneously. Fifth, this approach is abductive that researchers can back and forth examine empirical data to theory and vice versa continuously if needed. This is a prerequisite of the fourth principle. Sixth, various genres and social spaces were studied, as well as inter-textual and inter-discursive relationships were examined. In the postmodern era, there are many innovative and hybrid genres that need further attention. Seventh, the historical context is always analyzed and integrated with the interpretation of discourse and text. Eighth, categories and tools for analyzing are determined in accordance with the steps and procedures and according to the particular problem being investigated. The selection of such things is eclectic and pragmatic. Different CDA approaches use different grand theory, though most use Systemic Functional Linguistics. Ninth, the primary theory serves as the foundation, whereas in the analysis, secondary theory acts to show purpose. Tenth, CDA's research leads to practice and application. The results of his research should provide practical advice to experts from various related fields and can be applied in order to realize changes in certain social and discursive practices.

b. Van Dijk Model of Critical Discourse Analysis

There are various CDA models that have been developed by some scholars, for instance Roger Fowler, Theo van Leeuwen, Sara Mill, Teun A. van Dik, and Norman Faircough. One of the most widely used is the van Dijk analysis model. This is probably because the elements of the discourse have been elaborated so that it can be used more practically [6]. Van Dijk analysis model is known as "social cognition" because it begins with an understanding



that a text analysis should pay attention to the process of producing the text so as to get an answer why the text can be that way[6]. For example, there is a text that marginalizes black people, it is necessary to investigate how the production process of the text and why the text marginalize the group. The text that marginalizes the blacks is born out of the cognition or awareness of the author and also of his society which essentially views the blacks as inferior. So the text is only one small part of the overall discourse practice that discriminates against blacks.

In the analysis phase, van Dijk[6] then divides the discourse into three parts, namely text, social cognition, and social context. In the dimension of the text, what is examined is how the structure and strategy of the text to carry a particular theme. The text itself has an integral structure including macro structures containing a global meaning that can be seen from the topic or theme of a text. Superstructure is related to the framework of a text such as the introduction, content, and closing and micro structure of the discourse meaning that can be observed from a small part of the text such as words, clauses, sentences, and images.

In the dimension of social cognition, analysis focuses on figuring out how the text production process involves the individual's cognition of the text writer[6]. In analyzing it needs to find out how the mental structure of journalists in seeing an event that eventually he packed into a news discourse. For example, how does a journalist understand the demo of the workers causing the traffic jam. The mental structure in understanding the case is called schema. The scheme of digesting the information obtained is then interpreted in the form of categories. The process is influenced by the experience and socialization that people have in their life. That is why disagreements about an event often occur.

The final dimension is the social context. At this stage the focus of analysis is the construction of discourse that develops in society about the themes raised in the text[8]. The discourse of communism, for example, has developed in such a way in Indonesia by leading to the prohibition and stamp that communism is a forbidden ideology. It is at least built by two main things namely power and access. The power to manipulate discourse in society must be in the dominant or powerful group. In the context of the discourse of communism, Soeharto regime had power and played a major role in shaping the mindset of the people through its massive propaganda. The regime convinced the public that communism was the enemy

of the state and whoever defended it was part of them. So, not infrequently in Indonesia a lot of news that marginalize people to understand left. Besides, elite groups usually have greater access than other groups therefore they have more power to control the mind and even the actions of others. The government has a bureaucracy, educational institutions, and mass media as a tool of practice of its power. Groups that do not have it will only become consumers even play a role to multiply what they receive to other people.

c. Previous Studies

Muslims have been common to be the object of the practice of power in various mass media. Muslims are often represented negatively and identified with an exclusive and violent group in many western media[9]; [10][11][12][13]. Warsono[9] in his research utilized appraisal theory to examine the attitudes of news writers against the Al-Qaeda group. He concluded the authors always showed attitudes and negative judgments against Al-Qaeda. Regardless of whether or not what Al-Qaeda is doing, the negative judgment is strongly influenced by the ideological background of the author. The author of the news comes from Britain where the majority of the population is converted to Christianity and from its historical background Christianity is always opposed to Islam a religion that is the identity of the Al-Qaeda group. Meanwhile, Lemmouh's[10] research on critical linguistics and semantic corpus suggests that the New York Times represents Muslims especially in the western world as a threat and problem bearer for the majority community. In the syntactical choice it is seen that Muslims are more often circumvented in subject positions in transitive active clauses rather than as agents in passive clauses. Muslims are also more often involved in active verbs that mean violence.

Islam is also often even represented negatively in a predominantly Muslim country like Indonesia. The face of Islam through its religious organizations, especially the Islamic Defenders Front (FPI) has always been positioned with violence and hatred[14]; [15][16][17]. Rachimawati[14] concluded that Jawa Pos was presenting FPI as a mass organization wrapped with violence, vandalism, intimidation and sheep and always against the government. Nevertheless, FPI is said to still have the support of most Indonesians. Meanwhile, according to Perdana, Karlinah, and Yudhapramesti[15], there is no balance between FPI and media, in this case Tempo Weekly News Magazine, putting more opinions from sources opposed to FPI than supporters. It was also

mentioned that the FPI was never even asked for adequate information related to certain issues.

The results above are also similar to the research of Artha[16] which states that the news portal www.liputan6.com commits a co-modification effort on the image of the Islamic Defenders Front (FPI). Of all the news about FPI, it all raises the discourse of violence. Titles that use potentially cause fear and anxiety for the readers. Even the media explicitly stated FPI as a hard-line organization with anarchist steering, divisiveness, and the source of all hostilities that ultimately led to widespread public disdain and hostility. Even riots that have not been confirmed who the cause of the media directly accused the FPI as a mastermind. As happened in the case of the attack on Huria Kristen Batak Protestan (HKBP) church in Bekasi which apparently was not a member of FPI cause. But the media did not apologize or rectify the news. In this case, the media contribute to the construction of social reality including divisions and disputes between groups within society. The ideology and attitude of the media cannot be separated from the influence of political economy practices that occur within the body of the media itself because they are intermediate faced with competition, advertising, and the interests of capital owners. Meanwhile in Wibowo's[17] research, FPI's negative representation is evidenced by the choice of certain language features. In the syntactic level, FPI is often positioned to occupy the subject function in an active sentence. Words that often appear as well as verbs that contain material and relational processes. The material process shows that FPI is actively involved as an actor in an action that requires physical movement. The relational process shows FPI labeled certain by the author through adjectives addressed to them.

The representation of the face of Islam is also seen not only through its religious organizations but also through important actions and phenomena that have occurred, such as the Islamic Defense Action that took place in Indonesia[14][18]. Regarding the action of Muslims, Rachimawati[14] states that the media in Indonesia show different attitudes about the event and this is influenced by their ideology. Republika Online as a media that is considered pro-Islam see Islamic Defense Action as an action lawsuit in which the Muslim community demands Basuki Tjahja Purnama (Ahok) punished for being considered to have blasphemed religion. While Metrotynews.com as secular media view the action as a political action where the supporting parties and actors behind the action want to reduce Ahok's electability in the election of the Governor of DKI Jakarta at that time.

The media positioned Ahok as a victim of identity politics. Karman[18] also agrees that the ideological differences in viewing this case can be seen from the editorials of some of the media on the same theme. Republika Online sees this as a matter of seeking justice or law. Kompas see it as a religious and political issue. Meanwhile, Suara Pembaruan and Media Indonesia see this action as a political issue. It is then concluded that the general media or the mainstream can even be partisan when faced with a particular issue or context.

This study attempts to fill the gap of those studies concerning on how Islamic Defense Action Series is represented by Indonesian media. Reunion 212, however, has not widely analyzed as this action is more likely to be neglected due to its different objectives with those of the previous similar actions. This action is also not the peak among the series. How Indonesian media represent Reunion 212 has not been answered in a Critical Discourse Analysis study.

III. METHODOLOGY

This research is Critical Discourse Analysis study focusing on investigating how Indonesian Online media represent Reunion 212 act. Six news articles related to Reunion 212 from www.cnnindonesia.com and www.republika.co.id published on December 2, 2017 are used as the objects of the study. All news articles about Reunion 212 at CNNIndonesia.com were collected from the section Focus menu, while the news articles of Republika Online were taken from Hot menu. News articles from both media were selected by purposive sampling method which means selection is done by considering the suitability of the data to be investigated with the study. The selected articles were then analyzed using van Dijk Critical Discourse Analysis model which covers three aspects namely textual analysis, social cognition analysis, and social context analysis.

IV. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

This research focuses on text, social cognition, and social context. At the text level there are three levels of analysis, namely macro structure, superstructure, and microstructure. Macro structure analysis focuses on the global meaning of the text that is visible on the topic or title used. Superstructure analysis focuses on the textual framework, how the authors organize texts to create coherence. The micro structure focuses on local meaning and text writing style. At the level of social cognition, research focuses on looking at the



writers' realm of an event. While at the social context level, the analysis focuses on community-minded construction on an issue.

a. Text Analysis

i. Text Allalysis	
CNNIndonesia.com	Republika Online
- Wajah-wajah	- Posko Kesehatan
Cemas Rakyat di	Siapkan Jasa Bekam
Reuni Akbar 212	Bagi Peserta Reuni
	212
Worried People's	Health Posts
Faces in Grand	Prepare Cupping
Reunion 212	Service for
	Participants of
	Reunion 212
- Absen di Reuni	- Anies Baswedan
212, Jokowi Pilih	Hadir di Tengah
Hormati Guru	Peserta Reuni 212
Absent at Reunion	Anies Baswedan
212, Jokowi Selects	Comes to Reunion
Respect for	212
Teacher	
- Reuni Alumni 212,	- Reuni 212 Jangan
Kaum Sekuler	Sampai Menyimpang'
dan Perebutan	1 9 1 0
Suara 2019	
212 Alumni	'Reunion 212 Do
Reunion, Secular	not Deviate'
and Voice Seize in	
2019	

Table 1. The titles of the news articles related to reunion 212

At the level of superstructure C1 is constructed with story-telling or narrative style. The schematic or chronological sequence of each event is structured in such a way as to construct a cohesive text addressing a theme of residents' unease about Reunion 212. There were two events that actually happened at that time: Reunion 212 and citizens going to the airport. Because the journalists arrange the incident of residents who want to go to the airport first, then that is reflected the reunion action 212 that disturb and disturb the interests of citizens of Jakarta. To overcome traffic jams, the police have actually engineered traffic across the Monas, but the information is preceded by information on the anxiety of the citizens.

To bring up the chosen theme, journalists also use the background and details that are perceived to support the theme. Information will usually be chosen by the author in excess to benefit himself or to produce a certain image [8]. In C1, it was described by some residents who were about to leave for the airport. Their agenda is disrupted because some roads have to be closed due to Reunion 212. Many residents are worried because they are worried about the scheduled departure of the train, bus and plane they are headed for. The number of public facilities such as the Gambir station parking is used by the participants of Reuni 212, which come from outside Jakarta, making it difficult for train passengers to park their vehicles.

The humanist themes raised in R1 are constructed through a more descriptive scheme. Volunteers Cupping Indonesia (RBI) reportedly mobilized its members as many as 30 people to provide health services to the participants of the action for free. Health facilities include reflection, acupuncture, dry brushing, and massage. In addition, honey and herbal medicines are also given to those in need. Detailed information that certainly supports the image of action that goes so humanist and uphold the solidarity. Selection of this information is based on certain considerations of journalists concerned.

At the superstructure level, two events occur in C2, namely Jokowi attending National Teacher Day and Reunion 212. Both are connected in a coherent way as seen in sentence (1). This schematic sequence shows the priority of activities that Jokowi must attend. In addition, the absence of Jokowi also seems to be in the legitimacy of the sentence (2). The sentence shows that Jokowi is quite cooperative with Muslims by having come to previous actions. Only this time there are activities that he prioritized.

(1) Dengan hadir di perayaan guru ini, Jokowi absen pada Reuni Akbar Alumni 212 di Lapangan Monas yang dihadiri puluhan ribu umat Islam.

By attending this teacher's celebration, Jokowi is absent from the 212th Alumni Reunion at Monas Square attended by tens of thousands of Muslims.

(2) Satu tahun sebelumnya, Jokowi menghadiri Aksi Bela Islam 212 dengan ikut salat Jumat berjamaah.

One year earlier, Jokowi attended the Islamic Defense Action 212 with a Friday congregational prayer.

In C3, Reunion 212 was discouraged as a political activity. Of course this is supported by more detailed information. Reunion 212 is referred to as the mobilization section for the 2019 election winner. The article also quotes the opening part of a proposed activity that essentially is Muslims need to take part in building this country through power because so far the religion has always been separated from the life of the state. This is also reinforced by the opinion of Head of Indonesian Police and some political observers who stated that this activity is not far from political objectives. But at the end of the writing, the information is denied by Muhammad Al Khaththath. It appears that journalists display two different propositions. Journalists want to show inconsistencies between what is written in the proposals of this Reunion 212 activity with the original opinions of the committee. Journalists suspect and invite the reader also suspicious that it is true the action is not separated from the political content because if not should be in the preliminary part of the proposal does not need to be submitted such a thing.

In R3, the theme is caution. This theme is constructed by quoting many similarly suggestive opinions that the message of Reunion 212 remains at its original destination. Followed by a description of the activity that states there is a billboard that reads Islam Love Peace, Islam Work Professional, Islam Love the Homeland, Islam Love Art and Culture as reinforce the message of Muslim leaders in the previous section.

In the microstructure level, the local meanings within each text are analyzed. In C1, the addition of detailed information as in (3)shows that Reunion 212 is very tense. The word hell and the phrase of the wild parking lot is a metaphorical form that describes the situation at that time. In (4)it appears that the author also took added detail information to contrast the feelings of the participants with the surrounding community who did not follow the action. Participants of the action called being in joy, but the community around condemned for being late. The author builds the impression that the participants of the action have fun over the suffering of others.

(3) Sabtu, 2 Desember, lalu lintas di sekitar Gambir dan Monas bak neraka, macet luar biasa. Ruas jalan berubah menjadi lahan parkir liar. Bukan cuma motor dan kendaraan pribadi yang, bus berbadan besar dengan pelat daerah, turut berhenti.

Saturday, December 2, the traffic around Gambir and Monas is like hell, it's stuck. Road segment turned into a wild parking lot. Not just motorcycles and private vehicles, large buses with regional plates, also stopped.

(4) Pada hari itu, saat sebagian orang merayakan suka cita reuni di Monas, sebagian lagi merutuk karena terlambat.

On that day, when some people celebrate the joy of reunion at Monas, some are cursed for being late.

Things like the above are not found in Republika Online news articles that are more informative. There is no negative lexicon selection to refer to the action participants or those who reject the action. Precisely Republika always emphasize the action participants as friendly people and humanist as seen from the sentence (5)In R2, the use of the word volunteers means they are not paid officers, and there is an element of sincerity there. Moreover, the volunteers did good deeds such as providing free food or drink.

(5) Di sepanjang jalan Medan Merdeka Selatan sendiri selain terlihat posko kesehatan yang didirikan oleh relawan-relawan reuni, ada juga banyak relawan yang menyediakan makanan maupun minuman gratis bagi peserta reuni 212.

Along the road of Merdeka Selatan Square, apart from the sight of health posts established by reunion volunteers, there are also many volunteers who provide free food and drinks for reunion participants 212.

b. Social Cognition Analysis

How the news texts are made clear cannot be separated from the writer's mental offer. There are at least three things that become a journalist strategy in presenting news on CNNIndonesia.com. First, on news C1 reporters highlighted the perspective of residents harmed by the Reunion 212 action. The journalist selects detailed information that supports the adverse effects of the action. He certainly does not add information that contradicts his point of view as a peaceful action and the many volunteers who volunteer for action. Second, journalists reproduce the information obtained. In this case the journalist seemed to add his opinion about the situation there, as evidenced by the metaphor of hell and wild parking lot to describe the situation there. Third, the reporter concludes the conclusion at the end of the story by



repeating what he said early on the anxiety of the citizens of Jakarta due to the action. Journalists emphasize that anxious citizens are also people who have the same rights as the participants of the action that must be maintained its rights. Fourth, local transformation realised by the author using narrative plots to show the situations and anxieties of the citizens little by little.

The process also occurs on Republika Online news, as seen on R1 news. Journalists choose information that supports the theme he raised that is about health post. Obviously things that are not related to health posts not delivered here. The existence of detailed information on the number of volunteers, the number of posts and areas of origin of volunteers was also delivered. The flow used by journalists in R1, R2, or R3 is just a plain news flow by simply passing information one by one.

c. Social Context Analysis

Basically the social context for news coming from CNNIndonesia.com and Republika Online is the same. This is derived from the social context in which the action runs in 2017 where the next year of 2018 is the year of the Governor Election simultaneously and 2019 is the year of the Presidential Election. Reunion 212 is also clearly a part of the series of previous actions in which Action 212 itself was accused of a political content element that was to defeat Ahok in the Governor Election 2016. Not to mention the fact that the Reunion 212 was clearly attended by political figures. Meanwhile, the anxiety theme CNNIndonesia.com articles exist because of the social context of society who are afraid of the nation will be shattered by the existence of such an action.

There are two groups in seeing this action, that is the supporting groups, such as the committee of action, the participants of the action, and citizens who do not join the action but they support the action and opposing group that do not support the action including those who suffer from this action or those who think that the action is politically charged. Both groups have access to the media to present news on this action.

V. CONCLUSION

Judging from the formulation of this research problem there are at least two conclusions that can be taken. First, CNNIndonesia.com and Republika Online preach the Reunion 212 action in a different way. CNNIndonesia.com is more concerned with the

theme of the adverse effects of the action and the purpose of the action that is considered politically charged. The themes are supported by lexical options such as metaphors, and negative lexicon as well as discourse strategies such as coherence, and the use of narrative paths. While Republika Online raised the theme of humanist but also did not deny the potential political goals behind the action. The themes are supported by more informative lexical choices. The lexicons used are not negatively significant. Discourse strategy used is also the same that is coherence.

Secondly, the exercise of power is more pronounced on news from CNNIndonesia.com where journalists are trying to convince readers that the Reunion 212 action is so disturbing and contains political purpose. Even in one story there are more journalists' opinions than facts. Efforts to influence readers way of thinking is then referred to as the power of the media. Meanwhile, the articles from Republika Online is more informative.

REFERENCES

- [1] Fairclough, N. 1995. Media Discourse. Great Britain: Edward Arnold.
- [2] Halliday, M. A. K. 1978. Language as Sosial Semiotic. London: Edward Arnold.
- [3] https://www.republika.co.id/berita/nasional/u mum/16/12/04/oho06r257-jumlah-peserta-aksi-212-mencapai-75-juta-orang retrieved on October 11 2019.
- [4] https://www.cnnindonesia.com/internasional/2 0150213150907-106-31950/pengamat-media-barat-malas-mengenal-islam retrieved on October 11 2019.
- [5] Wodak, R. 2002. "Aspects of Critical Discourse Analysis," Zeitschrift für Angewandte Linguistik, 36(10), pp.5-31.
- [6] Van Dijk, T.A. 1993. "Principles of Critical Discourse Analysis," Discourse and Society.
- [7] Fairclough, N. 1992. Language and Power. Fouth impression. London: Longman.
- [8] Eriyanto, 2009. Analisis Wacana: Pengantar Analisis Teks Media. Cetakan VII. Yogyakarta:
- [9] Warsono. 2008. "A critical Discourse Analysis to Unmask the Ideological Stance behind 'Al- Qaeda inthe Asia Pacific: Origin, Capability, and Threat'," Humaniora, 20(2): 191-199.
- [10] Lemmouh. Z. (2008). A Critical Linguistic analysis of the representation of Muslims in The

- New York Times. Journal of Language and Communication Studies, (40): 217-240.
- [11] Baker, P., Gabrielatos, C., dan McEnery, T. 2012. "Sketching Muslims: A Corpus Driven Analysis of Representations Around the Word 'Muslim' in the British Press 1998–2009". Oxford University Press, 34(3): 255–278.
- [12] Poorebrahim, F., dan Zarei, G. H. 2013. How is Islam Portrayed in Western Media? A Critical Discourse Analysis Perspective. Unpublished.
- [13] Tahir. M. 2013. "A Critical Discourse Analysis of Religious Othering of Muslims in the Washington Post," Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research, 14 (6): 744-753.
- [14] Rachimawati. 2012. How is Islam Portrayed in Western Media? A Critical Discourse Analysis Perspective, unpublished. Surakarta: Universitas Sebelas Maret.
- [15] Perdana, A., Karlinah, S., and Yudhapramesti, P. 2012. "Pemberitaan Front Pembela Islam dalam Majalah Berita Mingguan Tempo," E-Jurnal Mahasiswa Universitas Padjajaran, 1(1): 1-20.
- [16] Artha, D. A. 2013. "Representasi Tekstual Aksi Ormas FPI dalam Pemberitaan di Majalah Detik Edisi Oktober 2014," Unpublished. Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia.
- [17] Wibowo, D. 2014. "Representasi Tekstual Aksi Ormas FPI dalam Pemberitaan di Majalah Detik Edisi Oktober 2014," unpublished. Yogyakarta: Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta.
- [18] Karman. 2017. "Kontestasi Frame Surat Kabar Nasional dalam Liputan 'Aksi Bela Islam'." Jurnal Pekommas, 2(1): 87-98.