



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Muslim reformism in Daghestan

Islamic politics and Muslim education after the Russian Revolution

Sahakyan, N.

Publication date

2021

Document Version

Other version

License

Other

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Sahakyan, N. (2021). *Muslim reformism in Daghestan: Islamic politics and Muslim education after the Russian Revolution*.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.



Naira Sahakyan

Форма № 1, районная

РИК № 2-11.

На основ. пост. СНК СССР № 1447
14.9.1939 г. утвержд. ЦУНХУ Гос-
лана СССР, № 10-978 от 16.12.1939 г.

Отсылается в переселенческий от-
дел области на 3 день по окончании
отчетного месяца.

район

(с начала года до конца отчетного месяца)

всего вселено

хозяйств, из них:

в существующие поселки

хозяйств

экономически прибыло

хозяйства (полных семей)		человек					Из прибывших хозяйств имеют		Выбыли из пределов района	
в т. ч. кол-во холостых	всего обоюбого пола	из них		трудоспособных от 16 лет	вселино в от-ремонтнрован-или вновь по-строен. дома	коров или телок	лошадей	хозяйств	в них человек	
		мужчин	женщин							
7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17

Muslim Reformism in Daghestan

Islamic Politics and Muslim Education After the Russian Revolution

Muslim Reformism in Daghestan

Islamic Politics and Muslim Education After the Russian Revolution

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor

aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam

op gezag van de Rector Magnificus

prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex

ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties
ingestelde commissie,

in het openbaar te verdedigen

op donderdag 4 februari 2021, te 10.00 uur

door

Naira Sahakyan

geboren te Yerevan

Promotiecommissie

<i>Promotores:</i>	prof. dr. M. Kemper	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	prof. dr. B.I. Kolonitsky	European University at Saint Petersburg
<i>Copromotor:</i>	dr. A.K. Bustanov	Universiteit van Amsterdam
<i>Overige leden:</i>	prof. dr. G.A. Wiegers	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	prof. dr. A.D. Knysh	University of Michigan
	prof. dr. V. Bobrovnikov	Higher School of Economics
	dr. S. Shikhaliev	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	dr. G.R. Sibgatullina	Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Geesteswetenschappen



EUROPEAN
UNIVERSITY AT
ST. PETERSBURG

This work has been financed by the European University at Saint Petersburg as part of the research programme on the Muslim Nations of Russia partly funded by the "Peri" foundation.

Part of a research was financed by the ZEIT-Stiftung Ebelin und Gerd Bucerius through a Bucerius Dissertation Completion Scholarship within the frame of "Trajectories of Change" program.



Muslim Reformism in Daghestan

Islamic Politics and Muslim Education After the
Russian Revolution

Naira Sahakyan

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	9
Notes on Translation and Transliteration	13
Introduction	15
Chapter I	39
Histori(ographi)cal Background: The Russian Revolution and Early Soviet Rule in Daghestan (1917-1929)	41
1.1. Introduction	41
1.2. The years of freedom and the main actors in revolutionary Daghestan	44
1.2.1. The first revolutionary turbulences in Daghestan.....	44
1.2.2. Restoration of the imamate? The Andi Congress	46
1.2.3. Conflicts between Najm al-Dīn Gotsinskii and ‘Alī Ḥajjī Akushinskii.....	54
1.2.4. The break between Najm al-Dīn and Uzun Ḥajjī.....	59
1.3. The first Soviet decade in Daghestan	64
1.3.1. Sovietization of Daghestan and the anti-Soviet uprising	64
1.3.2. Soviet attempts to force the Daghestani ‘ulamā’ to support their policies.....	69
1.3.3. The start of massive repressions of the Daghestani ‘ulamā’.....	80
1.4. Conclusion	83
Chapter II.....	85
The Concept of “Freedom” and the Issue of the Imamate in the Revolutionary Discourse of the Daghestani Reformists.....	87
2.1. Introduction	87
2.2. Perceptions of the concept of “freedom” in revolutionary Daghestan.....	89
2.2.1. The concept of “freedom” in Islam and its echoes in Daghestan	89
2.2.2. Talking about freedom in the revolutionary discourse of the Daghestani reformists	91

2.3. Reformist critiques of Gotsinskii’s claim to the imamate.....	102
2.3.1. The Andi Congress through the prism of the reformist understanding of freedom	109
2.3.2. Reformists’ religious argumentations against Najm al-Dīn’s imamate	114
2.3.3. The reformists’ arguments of (dis-)continuity of the imamates of Shamīl and Najm al-Dīn.....	121
2.4. Conclusion	126
Chapter III	129
The Visions of Daghestan’s Future in Debates on Education and on the Language of Instruction	131
3.1. Introduction	131
3.2. Islamic education in Daghestan and visions of the future	132
3.2.1. The ‘rise and fall’ of Islamic education in Daghestan.....	132
3.2.2. Competing projects to modernize the education system in Daghestan.....	137
3.2.3. The creation of the image of “backward traditionalists”	145
3.3. Language debate and visions for the future in Daghestan.....	153
3.3.1. A divine language for religious society: The debates around the role of Arabic in the future of Daghestan	153
3.3.2. National languages on the reformers’ vision of the future.....	159
3.3.3. Russian language and the Unitarists.....	163
3.4. Conclusion	167
Chapter IV.....	169
The New Scopes of the Islamic Discourse: Inner-Islamic and Soviet Trajectories of the 1920s in the Journal Bayān al-Ḥaqā’iq.....	171
4.1. Introduction	171
4.2. The orientations of the religious journal Bayān al-Ḥaqā’iq and the “Islamic” model of the Soviet state.....	172
4.3. The debates over Daghestani Sufism on the pages of Bayān al-Ḥaqā’iq.....	177
4.4. The “Wahhābī” stigma of the reformists and its echoes in Daghestan	186

4.5. Bayān al-Ḥaḡā'iq's criticism of the Wāhhābiya	192
4.6. The Congresses of Cairo and Mecca and the responses of Bayān al-Ḥaḡā'iq and the OGPU.....	198
4.7. Conclusion.....	205
General Conclusion	209
The Main Personalities.....	227
List of Primary Sources	237
Bibliography.....	245
List of Abbreviations	261
Muslim Reformism in Daghestan: Islamic Politics and Muslim Education after the Russian Revolution.....	263
Summary	263
Moslim reformisme in Dagestan: Islamitische politiek en Moslim Onderwijs na de Russische Revolutie	267
Samenvatting.....	267

Acknowledgments

This thesis would not have been possible without many along the way. First, I am eternally grateful to my supervisors, Professor Michael Kemper, Dr. Alfrid Bustanov and Professor Boris Kolonitskii, for their feedback, encouragement and inspiration. Their deep knowledge of Islamic and Russian history continually amazes me and has set for me the standard of what a researcher should be. While Alfrid Bustanov and Boris Kolonitskii helped me to make my first steps in the writing of this thesis, Michael Kemper's support in finalizing the project was invaluable. They became impeccable guides through the field of Studies of Russian Muslims and Russian Revolution and pushed me to think in new ways about Islamic and Russian history.

It was a great pleasure for me to experience Daghestani hospitality during my trips to Daghestan between 2016 and 2019. Many thanks go to the collective of the Institute of History, Archaeology and Ethnography of the Daghestan Federative Research Center at the Russian Academy of Sciences, especially to Dr. Shamil Shikhaliev and Dr. Makhach Musaev, who opened for me the doors of the institute's rich manuscript collections. I owe special thanks to Halisat Shikhalieva and Leyla Kaplanova, my guides into Daghestani cuisine. I will never forget the taste of Botlikh pie!

In Daghestan, I also enjoyed the hospitality of the archivists at the Central State Archive of the Republic of Daghestan. They helped me not only with finding necessary materials but also by organizing interesting discussions

during our Daghestani-type tea breaks. During a trip with Lina Tsrinova to the mountainous parts of Daghestan, G. Omarov from the village of Sograti and M. Abdulaev from the village of Gimry showed me the whole beauty of the “Land of the Mountains” and organized special tours to the sights where the Daghestanis defeated Nādir Shāh, Imām Shamīl fought against Russia and Imām Ghāzī Muḥammad grew up.

A special acknowledgement must go to Elena Campbell, my host supervisor at the University of Washington, where I spent the fall semester of 2018. Elena and her family made my stay at Seattle memorable. Our not-Starbucks coffee breaks were so enjoyable. In my beloved Seattle, Susie Sargsyan and Judy Cochran were always ready to help. Susie, thank you for making my Seattle evenings into some of my life’s most memorable moments. Judy, our hiking trips to Mount Rainier and other corners of the Evergreen State will remain unforgettable adventures!

Vladimir Bobrovnikov also deserves special mention. Thank you for your advice, reading tips, shared papers and especially the inspiring discussion we had during our visit to the Van Gogh Museum.

It is a pleasure to acknowledge the institutions whose financial support made this project possible. This project could not have been completed without their generous assistance. The research and writing of this project began at the European University at Saint Petersburg (EUSP). There I benefited from the EUSP’s Doctoral Scholarship on the History of Daghestan, partly supported by Ziyavudin Magomedov Charitable Foundation “Peri.” The continuation of this project at the University of Amsterdam became possible with the Bucerius Dissertation Completion Scholarship within the framework of the “Trajectories of Change” program by ZEIT-Stiftung Ebelin und Gerd Bucerius.

UvA’s ACES Research Support, the Davis Graduate Student Travel Grant for ASEEES, LSE Paulsen Grant and the University of Illinois’ Summer Research Laboratory Grant as well as the “Politicization of the Religious Language and Sacralization of the Political Language during the Russian Civil War” Research Project Grant supported by the Russian Foundation for Basic Research allowed me to conduct additional archival research to expand the scope of the project and present my finding at international conferences and workshops where I always received the feedback of respected scholars like Dr. Sarah Badcock and Dr. Aaron Retish.

Throughout the research process, I met many knowledgeable scholars and intellectuals whose support has been invaluable. I particularly want to thank Natalya Potapova, Mikhael Krom, Sarah Slye, Maria Trofimova, Alexei Miller, Davit Hovhannisyan, Anna Gevorgyan, Hayk Kocharyan, Gevorg Avetikyan, Anatoly Pinsky, Mansur Gazimzyanov and many others. Their unconditional support, guidance, and invaluable hints on how to improve the research expanded my understanding of the subject. They all deserve special appreciation.

Nothing in this thesis would have been possible without the support of my family. Mam, Dad and my beloved sisters Arpine and Knarik, thank you for being always there. You have been a constant source of love and encouragement.

My friends, at last! Mariam Mkhitaryan and Ashkhen Hakobyan—thank you for always keeping up with the fluctuations of my mood and moments of existential crises! Many thanks to my friends in Amsterdam, especially Aysenur Korkmaz and Uğur Ümit Üngör, for inviting me into their home and making my stay at Amsterdam so easy; to Tatjana Das for helping me navigate the University of Amsterdam.

Notes on Translation and Transliteration

All translations from Arabic and Russian are mine unless indicated otherwise or quoted from a published translation. For quotations from the Qur'an I use the English translation by Abdullah Yusuf Ali completed in 1937.¹

I use the names of Daghestani intellectuals as they are mainly known in the historiography, i.e., mainly as Russian or Russified names. Additionally, at their first appearance in the text, I also mention the Arabic version of their names with which they signed their articles in the Arabic language newspapers or where mentioned by their contemporaries' Arabic language texts (e.g. 'Ali Kaiaev [Alī al-Ghumūqī]).

Transliterations from the Arabic and Cyrillic alphabets adhere to the following charts, except for names and words widely known in English by other spellings.

¹ The Holy Qur'an. Translated by Abdullah Yusuf Ali and edited by Tom Griffith. Wordsworth Editions Limited, 2000.

From Arabic and Turkic

'	ء	ş	ص	u/v	و
b	ب	ḍ	ض	y	ی
t	ت	ṭ	ط	ā	آ
th	ث	ẓ	ظ	ī	ی
j	ج	‘	ع	ū	و
ḥ	ح	gh	غ	a	ا
kh	خ	f	ف	i	ی
d	د	q	ق	u	و
dh	ذ	k	ک	p	پ
r	ر	l	ل	ch	چ
z	ز	m	م	zh	ژ
s	س	n	ن	g	گ
sh	ش	h	ه		

From Cyrillic

a	a	м	m	ч	ch
б	b	н	n	ш	sh
в	v	о	o	щ	shch
г	g	п	p	ъ	“
д	d	р	r	ы	y
е,ё	e	с	s	ь	‘
ж	zh	т	t	э	e
з	z	у	u	ю	iu
и,й	i	ф	f	я	ia
к	k	х	kh		
л	l	ц	ts		