Simultaneity and networks in transnational migration: Lessons learned from an SMS methodology

Mazzucato, V.

Publication date
2008

Published in
Migration and development within and across borders: Research and policy perspectives on internal and international migration

Link to publication

Citation for published version (APA):
Mazzucato, V. (2008). Simultaneity and networks in transnational migration: Lessons learned from an SMS methodology. In J. DeWind, & J. Holdaway (Eds.), *Migration and development within and across borders: Research and policy perspectives on internal and international migration* (pp. 69-100). International Organization for Migration.
http://www.iom.int/jahia/webdav/site/myjahiasite/shared/shared/mainsite/published_docs/books/SSRC.pdf

Simultaneity and Networks in Transnational Migration: Lessons Learned from an SMS Methodology

Valentina Mazzucato[1]
University of Amsterdam

1. Introduction

Migration is a topic of great interest in both research and policy circles. On the one hand, the increasing numbers of migrants to developed countries, and the xenophobic reactions in many of these countries, has led to a slew of studies focusing on migrant integration in receiving country societies. On the other hand, governments of developing countries, as well as development organizations, have become increasingly conscious of the great contribution that migrant remittances make to home country economies, leading to more and more studies commissioned by the World Bank, IMF, and other international institutions on the effects of remittances for the development of migrant home countries.

These studies split migrants' lives in two: either they focus on what migrants do in the receiving country or they study the effects that migrants have on the people back home. Reality, however, is more variegated, with migrants often maintaining linkages with the country of origin while at the same time creating new social ties, adapting ideas and values, and redefining a sense of belonging in the new country of residence. Transnationalism was coined as a concept in the early 1990s to bring these two research arenas to bear on each other. It was noted that migrant realities could only be understood by taking the *linkages* between home and host countries and the *simultaneity* of flows with which these linkages are created and maintained into consideration.

Since the 1990s, there has been a burgeoning of transnationalism studies. Many theoretical works have been written on transnationalism, identifying it as a new and unique area of study. Empirical studies have addressed the theoretical concepts to differing degrees and are still developing methodologies through which to operationalize the theoretical concepts. This paper seeks to review the important theoretical concepts making transnationalism a unique area of study and identifies a methodological gap that remains, in order to address these concepts. It explores how a simultaneous multi-sited (SMS) methodology can address this gap. It does this by way of a case: the Ghana TransNet research program, with reflections on the kinds of additional knowledge an SMS methodology can contribute to current knowledge on migration.

Section 2 briefly reviews transnationalism as a concept, categorizes empirical studies according to the methodologies used, and identifies a methodological gap. Section 3 describes in detail the SMS methodology used by the Ghana TransNet research program. Section 4 reviews some findings that have come out of the SMS methodology that can supplement the knowledge about-migration. Section 5 concludes with some recommendations for research and development policy.

2. Transnationalism

Glick Schiller et al. (1992) were some of the first to theorize about the concept of transnationalism. What sets their analysis apart from previous approaches to the study of migration is that they focus on migration within a globalizing economy and draw into question the role of the nation-state in regulating the activities that migrants engage in and the identities that they create. Transnationalism problematizes notions of space that assume physical, social, and political spaces to perfectly overlap onto one geographical area. The nation-state affects the way migrants move and organize themselves, by creating barriers for them (via restrictive visa policies) or providing opportunities (employment within developed country economies). At the same time, there are also flows that transcend the nation-state, such as cultural images (Appadurai's (1996) ethno-space, media-space, etc.), people, and goods that contribute to the constitution of new kinds of spaces.

Various definitions of transnationalism have been set forth reflecting the different disciplinary backgrounds of scholars it has attracted. Basch, Glick Schiller, and Szanton Blanc define transnationalism as "the processes by which immigrants forge and sustain multi-stranded social relations that link together their societies of origin and settlement" (1994, 7). Vertovec

emphasizes the importance of people within networks by focussing on the "multiple ties and interactions linking people or institutions across the borders of nation-states" (1999, 447). Portes, Guarnizo and Landolt delimit the concept of transnationalism to occupations and activities that require sustained contacts over time across national borders (1999, 218). Other authors emphasize the flow of immaterial things such as ideas and feelings of solidarity across boundaries (Clifford 1994) that serve to form transnational identities.

What these definitions have in common is their emphasis on the linkages that bind people living in different countries. A major contribution of the literature on transnationalism has been that it recognizes the individual migrant as a member of a larger whole that extends beyond geographical boundaries. This conceptualization of transnationalism has methodological consequences. Hannertz (1998) explains that in most transnational cases, the most relevant unit of analysis is the network, or what others have called transnational communities, villages (Levitt 2001), or circuits (Rouse 1992).

Simultaneity is considered to be a second distinguishing feature of transnational linkages (Levitt and Glick Schiller 2004). New technologies (airplanes, telephones, satellite technology, faxes, and computers) make movement and communication between large distances possible with much greater frequency, speed, and regularity, and in larger numbers than even just fifty years ago (for overview articles see *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 1999 22(2); Vertovec 2001, Mazzucato et al. 2004). This facilitates the possibility for people to be simultaneously engaged in both their home country as well as in the other countries where they have lived or are living. Simultaneous engagement enables linkages between dispersed people to tighten, new livelihood opportunities to emerge, social institutions to change, and hybrid identities to develop. These changes have led to qualitative differences in how migrants, the cities in which they live, and their home communities are impacted by migration (Foner 1997).

Thus simultaneity and networks are two important aspects that come out of theoretical transnationalism literature. Below we investigate how these aspects have been operationalized in methodologies used by transnational studies.

The simultaneity of flows means that at least two locations need to be incorporated into one research field. This has been operationalized in two ways. One is by situating research in one geographical location, usually

migrant receiving areas,[2] but focusing on people's discourses about home and their feelings of belonging. Many transnational studies follow this line of questioning (Charles 1992; Ostergaard-Nielsen 2001; Poros 2001; Salih,2002; Smith 1998). They are fundamental for highlighting that, in order to understand migrant realities, it is not sufficient to study how migrants take on cultural forms of the countries in which they reside, or whether they participate in local labor markets, but it is necessary to understand how migrants relate to their countries of origin in their imaginaries, in the cultural forms they practice, the political identities they associate themselves with, and the discourses that they engage in. However, these studies leave largely under-researched the more material social and economic flows that transnational identities result in[3] and they do not include any empirical research in the other location, a migrant's home community, that is conceptualized as being important by the theoretical transnational literature. They also cannot be distinguished from studies on identity and ethnicity that have existed since well before the coining of the concept of transnationalism.

A second type of transnationalism study that became more prevalent in the late 1990s and 2000s operationalized simultaneity by studying both home communities and migrants' country of residence jointly, giving rise to theoretical reflections on the need for multi-sited research (Hannerz 1998; Stoller 1997; Marcus 1995). It is these two-country empirical studies that offer something new from previous approaches and therefore this category will form the focus for the rest of this paper.

Two categories can be distinguished of two-country studies: those with matched samples and those without. A matched sample is where networks of people linked to each other across national boundaries are the unit of analysis. Unmatched sample studies are where people on both sides of the migration process are studied but they are not directly linked to each other. The individual is thus the unit of analysis in unmatched sample studies, while the network is the unit of analysis in matched sample studies. Unmatched sample studies are more numerous.

Since the 1990s, two-country, unmatched-sample, transnational studies have burgeoned and taken research on the linkages between countries further by conceptualizing home and host country as one arena of migrants' social, economic, and political action (Basch et al., 1994; Feldman-Bianco

---

[2]   Based on a literature search of thrty-three articles, book sections, and books, only one study (Georges 1992) situated research in one geographical location and in a migrant sending area.

[3]   Portes et al. 2002 is the exception.

1992; Gardner 1999; Glick Schiller and Fouron 1998; Guarnizo et al., 2003; Hinojosa 2003; Matthei and Smith 1998; Marques et al., 2001; Portes and Guarnizo 1991; Riccio 2002; Rouse 1992).

Matched sample studies are fewer (Osili 1998; Saifullah Khan 1977; de la Cruz 1995). Because such studies collect information from both sides, they can best investigate questions about the inner workings of transnational flows and link migrants' actions with those of people back home: How do migrants decide what and to whom to send remittances? What kinds of reciprocal relations exist between people living in different countries, and how do they work? What mechanisms do migrants use to insure that remittances get used as they intend, and at the same time are migrants' remittances being used in the way migrants intended?

A review of two-country, transnational studies (Table A.1 in Appendix) shows that few studies work with matched samples and no study to date collects information from both ends of the migration process simultaneously.

Two further methodological distinctions can be made of two-country transnational studies: their scope, relating to the number of people they study, and the type of contact with the research population, intensive or one-off. This categorization is presented in Table A.2 in the Appendix. The majority of studies is large in scope (more than twenty respondents) and uses methods in which respondents are interviewed only a few times (such as surveys or one or two in-depth interviews per respondent). Such methods (one-off) can be used to know the extent of certain phenomena and can produce reliable data only if the population involved is not vulnerable (for example, migrants with working permits). In cases of a vulnerable population, a relationship of trust between researcher and respondent is necessary and an intensive research methodology is needed. Intensive methods involve repeated contacts with the same people. Table A.2 shows that those studies that use intensive methods are for the most part ethnographies. They do not collect quantitative data and cannot assess the extent of the transnational phenomena they study (Portes 2001).

This paper explores what we call a simultaneous, matched sample (SMS) methodology in which a relatively large, matched sample of respondents is studied simultaneously and intensively (repeated visits over a long period of time). It reflects on the experiences of using such a methodology from the Ghana TransNet research program by investigating what such a methodology can add to our knowledge of transnational migration as

well as discussing some of the considerations one needs to make before embarking on such a methodology.

3.   A Simultaneous Matched Sample Methodology

The Ghana TransNet research program[4] examines how migrants' transnational networks affect the principles and institutions[5] on which local economies are based. Through flows of goods, money, services, and ideas between migrants and people they know in their home country, values, knowledge, economic opportunities, and means of social assistance change, get adapted and transformed, which ultimately impacts the institutions that shape local economies both at home and abroad. The program thus aims to understand how local economies are being changed, by focusing on institutions that are impacted by migrants' transnational lives.

The research program takes migrants' simultaneous engagement in two or more countries directly into account in the methodology (Mazzucato 2000). The program is composed of three projects based in three important nodes of Ghanaian migrants' transnational networks: Amsterdam, where most Ghanaians in the Netherlands reside; Accra, the capital city of Ghana where most migrants have lived or passed through; and rural to semi-urban villages in the Ashanti Region of Ghana to which many migrants trace their roots. The projects are conducted simultaneously so that transactions between people can be studied on both sides and in real time.

Both quantitative and qualitative research methodologies were applied over a two-year period (2003–2004) with 115 respondents who were followed intensively over the three research locations. In a first phase, twenty-nine Ghanaian migrants in Amsterdam were selected based on a network survey conducted amongst a hundred migrants. There exists no baseline survey of Ghanaians in the Netherlands and a large number of migrants are undocumented. Therefore the one hundred Ghanaians were selected through a variety of gateways (churches, community leaders, hometown associations, cultural projects, and randomly encountered migrants in markets or at the workplace). The diversity of gateways helped ensure we came into contact with a wide variety of migrants with different individual and network characteristics.

---

[4]   See www2.fmg.uva.nl/ghanatransnet.

[5]   Institutions are the commonly held rules and norms that guide social behavior by "defining the incentive structure of societies and specifically economies" (North 1994, 360).

Once the selection of respondents was made, the second phase of the program could begin. The research team jointly developed questionnaires and question lists so that the same questions would be asked in the three research locations. First, a transaction study was developed to record all transactions on a monthly basis conducted in eight domains of daily life, identified from literature and preliminary fieldwork as being important in the economic lives of migrants and people back home. These domains are housing, business (including farming), funerals, church, health care, education, communications, and community development projects. Transactions were recorded on a monthly basis during the period of July 2003 to June 2004. Second, in-depth interviews were carried out on the eight domains. Third, life histories were conducted, focusing on the changes in people's social networks throughout their lifetime. Fourth, observation and participation in social events were employed in Amsterdam from June 2002 to August 2005, and in locations in Ghana from May 2003 to August 2004.

4.   Results from a Simultaneous Matched Sample

This section reviews findings from the Ghana TransNet research program that are particular to the SMS methodology, and reflections are made on how they supplement current knowledge coming from transnational, migration or migration and development studies.

4.1 Linked Policy Consequences across Countries

Expenditure patterns reflect migrant objectives, as well as policies that may create or facilitate certain expenditure categories. An SMS methodology allows migrants' expenditure patterns to be studied simultaneously in the country of origin, in the country of residence, and across national borders. At the same time it allows the effects of migrants' expenditures on network members to be directly observed. As such, an SMS methodology can show the direct effects of policies in one country on livelihoods in another country. Below we illustrate this through the example of Amsterdam-based Ghanaian migrants' expenditures.

Ghanaian migrants in the Netherlands in our sample spent over 35 percent of their total non-consumption expenditures[6] on remittances in the period of July 2003 to June 2004. Remittances consist of money and goods sent or

_____

[6]   Consumption expenditures refers to all expenditures that are used for obtaining food for daily consumption. All else is considered a non-consumption expenditure.

carried to Ghana by migrants. 40 percent of these remittances were spent on help for network members or organizations in Ghana (including funerals, church donations education, health, community development projects and general subsistence), and 50 percent were spent on investments on housing or business pertaining to the migrant him or herself. Almost 5 percent were spent on identity documents for travel to and stay in the Netherlands, and a remaining 5 percent were for miscellaneous expenditures (Mazzucato 2005).

At the same time, almost 60 percent of non-consumption expenditures were spent in the Netherlands. Non-remittance expenditure patterns show in what way migrants participate in the Dutch economy as well as the consequences of Dutch migration policy on migrants' ability to send money back home, i.e., their contribution to development back home. In discussions of whether migrants support the neighborhoods and cities in which they live, much focus is on whether they start their own businesses or buy their own homes. However, migrants, as inhabitants, can support the neighborhood, city, or country in which they live in many different ways. Table 1 presents the major non-remittance expenditures items and their geographic destination based on the transaction study conducted with thirty Ghanaian migrants over a one-year period.

Table 1. Geographic Destination of Largest Non-remittance Expenditure Items of Amsterdam-based Ghanaian Migrants

Netherlands			International
Neighborhood	**Amsterdam**	**Other**	
• school fees • church/association donations • food shopping • liquor (for celebrations of rites of passage) • services (child care, telephone call centers, money transfers, travel agencies)	• house purchase (real estate agencies) • rent (housing corporations) • car purchase (2nd hand stores) • housing and household refuse taxes • personnel for own business	• Dutch wax cloth (Vlisco) • business and income taxes • health care taxes • *lawyers* • *foreign police* • *"connection men"*[1] • *Dutch embassy in Ghana*	• international phone calls • electronic appliances • airline tickets • shipments via sea freight • *"connection men"*[1]

Source: Transaction study 2003–2004. Table from Mazzucato 2004.
Notes: characters in italic indicate items that represent non-productive investments. [1]Connection men refer to those persons who facilitate the process of obtaining travel or residency papers in exchange for a payment.

Non-remittance spending shows that Ghanaian migrants contribute to businesses and services that are offered at the neighborhood, city, national, and international levels. Not all spending, however, leads to growth in the formal economy. Much money gets absorbed into the formal and informal economies of identity papers (see italic items in Table 1). As mentioned above, identity papers absorbed 5 percent of total remittances sent, but they also take up financial resources in the Netherlands. Substantial amounts of money are spent on lawyer fees. Some of these lawyers are of very low quality, not having specialized in migration law, and can cause delays and ultimately the denial of a visa request due to improper handling of the application procedure (personal communication head of visa office, Dutch consulate, Accra, 26 March 2004). Fees charged by the Dutch embassy for legalization of documents and for visas can also lead to substantial spending. Legalization alone cost EUR 122 in 2002 and, due to the highly stringent procedures, a person may have to pay the fee several times before succeeding. Detailed verification by the embassy of the information provided by migrants leads migrants to hire people to oversee the verification procedure. Such people charged in 2003 and 2004 around EUR 2,000. The immigration police have raised the fees for staying and permanent residency permits eight- and four-fold, respectively, in two years (Table 2). For some migrants this amounts to costs equivalent to their monthly income. One of the most substantial spending items of all for undocumented migrants is the cost of obtaining papers in the informal economy. In 2003 through 2004 the going rate for such transactions was between EUR 10,000 and EUR 15,000. The other great cost is that of using other people's papers to work. The unwritten rule is that the owner of the papers keeps 30 percent of the net salary earned by the undocumented migrant. This can amount to costs of almost EUR 4,500 per year for blue-collar jobs typically conducted by many undocumented migrants. Another cost is that of foregone income of a better-paying job that is inaccessible to those without a working permit. Finally, there is the cost of ill health that one is more likely to encounter when working in jobs available in the informal economy. These jobs are usually physically stressful, as for example cleaning jobs in which people inhale strong cleaning solvents all day or have to repeat the same movement for large parts of the day, and lead to physical ailments.

Table 2. Cost (in Euro) of Formal and Informal Economy of Identity Papers, the Netherlands 2001, 2003

	2001	2003
Staying permit	56	430
Renewal of staying permit	0	285
Staying permit for unlimited time	227	890
Legalization of birth certificate		122
"Help" with legalization procedure		2,000
Marriage partner		10,000 – 15,000
Use of other person's work permit		30% of salary earned
"Typical" immigration lawyer fee		1,000
Prison stay for two months		4,000

Source: Table from Mazzucato 2005a.

These expenditure patterns on both sides of the migration process, through remittances in Ghana and also investments and spending in the Netherlands, reflect the double engagements of migrants in both their home country as well as in the country where they reside. At the same time some expenditures reflect the hardening of Dutch migration policies that create the conditions for both a formal (lawyers, embassies, immigration police) and informal (connection men, marriage partners, use of others' documents) economy of identity papers. Were these resources not taken up by obtaining identity documents (visas, passports, work permits), the current spending patterns of migrants leads us to deduce that these resources would be spent in ways that contribute to the Dutch economy at the neighborhood, city, or national level, to multinational corporations, and to the local economies of the cities and villages of Ghana.

The above analysis links migrant spending in the receiving country with spending in the home country and therefore highlights how migration policies in a receiving country can have development consequences for another. An SMS methodology also brings these effects to bear on the individual level. Joy, a Ghanaian nurse living in the Netherlands, was never able to have her nursing diploma validated in the Netherlands and worked in the lowest ranks of elderly care for nine years. During our fieldwork, Joy reached a limit to her patience and had grown increasingly dissatisfied, with repercussions for her self-esteem. She ultimately decided to move to the UK where she had better chances of getting her diploma recognized. This was not without financial consequences, as she needed to pay for her trip and housing in the UK, and would not have income for the time it would take her to obtain a nursing job. Her husband in the Netherlands had to use all his savings to support her and took on an additional night job. The additional spending and the consequences thereof for Joy's household were documented in the transaction study, and at the same time it was possible to follow the consequences this had in Ghana. Joy and her husband were

supporting a nephew in Ghana through school, and as a consequence of Joy's move, they were not able to pay the school fees for the remainder of the academic year. At the end of our fieldwork no one in Ghana had been able to substitute for the loss in school money, and the child was taken out of the school.

This effect came out of simultaneously collecting transaction data in different locations. Joy and her husband had not mentioned their inability to pay school fees for the nephew, either because they had not thought of it, or because they were ashamed of it. Asking respondents in Ghana, after a long period of having taken the boy out of school, may also not have turned up this information as the link between the remittances and the boy's schooling may have been forgotten or the link may not be so clear in people's minds. Thus this effect would not have come out by just relying on informants on one side of the migration process, and may have been overlooked if the information was not collected simultaneously.

Migrants' transnational lives mean that factors affecting their resources will have repercussions in more than just one country. Economic studies on the benefits and costs of migration for receiving countries typically focus on migrants' participation in the labor market and their use of social services such as education, health, and pension (Roodenburg 2003). The analyses presented above show that a more accurate estimation of the costs and benefits of migration involves widening the scope of these studies to include estimates of the costs of excluding migrants from participating in an economy to the state of the receiving country (the budget of the Dutch migration police is greater than that of the whole of the UNHCR, (Veenkamp, et al. 2003)), to the migrant (less resources, ill health, unsatisfactory life), and to the migrant's home country economy (in the form of foregone remittances).

4.2 Two-way Flows

Studies on migration and development singly focus on one-way flows: what migrants do for the home country. However, there are also flows that go in the other direction, from home country to receiving country. These flows are usually ignored by migration and development studies. As a recent overview of international migration and economic development (Lucas 2005) shows, the only flows considered by this literature are those from the migrant to the home country, with one exception. These are studies on the brain drain that provide detailed analysis of flows from developing countries to migrant receiving countries (Mensah et al. 2005). Transnationalism studies too tend to focus on what migrants do for their

home countries, for example, through hometown associations and festivals in which contributions are collected for community development projects, or through entrepreneurial activities (Guarnizo et al. 2003; Levitt 2001; Portes 2002). Some transnationalism studies make mention of services that people at home provide to migrants such as child care or managing housing construction (Levitt 2001), or local goods sent from home to the migrant (Wiltshire 1992) but no detailed analysis is conducted of these flows.

Below we present a study of how insurance works between migrants and their network members back home and show that two-way flows can help explain the linkages that bind country of residence with home country.

One of the possible uses of remittances is for insurance purposes. The New Economics of Migration (NEM) theory argues that migration is a household-level strategy for dealing with risk (Stark and Levhari 1982; Lucas and Stark 1985; Stark and Bloom 1985; Taylor 1999). Remittances are explained as the outcome of a self-enforcing contractual arrangement between migrants and their families in which both parties expect to be better off. The family helps the migrant to move to where he expects to have better income opportunities. The migrant then sends remittances either as delayed payment for the initial investment the family made to send him on migration, or as insurance to the family in times of shock (Stark and Lucas 1988). What makes the migrant abide with the contract are his altruistic feelings towards his family and/or his desire to be eligible for the family inheritance (de la Brière 2002), usually land or cattle.

No study to date, though, has explored the possibility that migrants and home-country dwellers may be involved in a mutual insurance contract, meaning that a migrant may provide for the family because she is also in need of their help. Using an SMS methodology, we investigated this possibility.

Migration histories of our respondents revealed that migration trajectories of Ghanaian migrants in the Netherlands have three phases: first, the preparation phase in Ghana to gain the money and documents necessary for the trip; second, the installation phase in the Netherlands during which migrants regularize their stay by obtaining the necessary documents; and third, the settled phase in which they have succeeded in obtaining their documents. This phase often includes extensive travel back and forth to Ghana. In the 1980s and first half of the 1990s, the second phase of undocumented stay in the Netherlands lasted between two to five years. However, with increasingly stringent visa policies in the Netherlands and in the rest of Europe, the period of having illegal status and waiting for

papers is becoming longer. There were respondents in our sample who had been waiting ten years.

During the second phase of the migration trajectory the probability of an unforeseen event with a large income shock for the migrant is high. An insurance event must involve a degree of unpredictability; if one could know exactly if and when the event will occur, then one could make the necessary plans and not need to rely on mutual insurance arrangements. An insurance event must also involve a substantial financial cost otherwise people would be able to pay for the events on their own (Dercon 2000). Table 3 shows the kinds of shocks that can be experienced during the second phase of a migration trajectory.

Table 3. Insurance Events for Migrants in the Netherlands during Phase II

Insurance event	Service	Unpredictability	Urgency[1]	From whom
getting a staying permit legally	paperwork in Ghana	+	+	family and friends in Ghana
getting a staying permit in the black market	• finding a candidate • candidate paperwork	++	++	family and friends in Ghana and the Netherlands
marriage deal gone wrong	Arbitration	++	+++	family and friends in Ghana and the Netherlands
getting put in prison	getting you out of prison	+++	+++	family and friends in Ghana and the Netherlands

Notes: [1]Urgency is used as a proxy for financial cost, as the help that is needed from the migrant is usually a service like obtaining correct documentation, arbitration, obtaining accurate information, etc. These services are not always quantifiable in terms of financial costs.

Source: Table from Mazzucato 2005.

There are different aspects that make the events outlined in Table 3 unpredictable. First, one does not have the certainty that they will occur. For example, some people are lucky and are never caught by police even if they do not have a staying permit. Secondly, migration policy in the Netherlands and in Europe has changed quite dramatically and frequently over the past fifteen years, becoming increasingly stringent towards migrants. This made it so that a potential migrant may have gotten outdated information about the ease of obtaining documents in the Netherlands that was no longer valid once the migrant arrived in the Netherlands.

These insurance events can constitute a large financial cost for the migrant. Our data show that migrants use their own financial resources or borrow from their network of migrants in the country of residence. However, those respondents who encountered these situations also needed services of family and friends located in Ghana. Below we describe the kinds of services for each insurance event.

Respondents without papers first try the cheapest route of obtaining papers via the official channels. This entails a lot of work in Ghana, such as collecting the necessary documentation and informing all those who might be interviewed by the embassy controllers, on what answers to give. This system is necessary because the Dutch embassy employs strict documentation verification that is virtually impossible to satisfy for Ghanaians older than twenty-five because the consistent documentation system needed to satisfy embassy requirements did not exist twenty-five years ago. This means migrants need to have documents made, school records changed, hospital birth records forged, and the extended family informed about the "official" answers to be given to the controllers who come around to one's village to verify all information put in the application form. One friend or trusted family member in Ghana will be charged with collecting forms at the embassy, entailing many hours of waiting in lines at the different agencies that issue documents, much time spent traveling and enormous coordination efforts in order to get information to be consistent on all records. These services entail a large input from the family or friend in Ghana, all of which can be documented with an SMS methodology.

Obtaining documents in the black market means in most cases that the migrant needs to find a "marriage partner" with legal documents. Again, here migrants make use of friends or family in the Netherlands or in Ghana to put them in contact with a trustworthy candidate. Migrants are in extremely vulnerable positions vis-à-vis the marriage partners because the costs of the marriage need to be made up front. Many are the occasions in which a migrant loses his money on a deal gone wrong. Thus finding a trustworthy candidate is essential.

In the case of a marriage deal gone wrong, one of the major ways a migrant has to try to recuperate the money is by acting through the marriage partner's network members in Ghana. This involves the migrant asking his/her own network members in Ghana to put pressure on the candidate through his/her social network, to repay the costs. This happened to one of our case study people, in which he had already paid EUR 2,000 when the candidate disappeared. Through his parents in Ghana, he was able to recuperate the money as they went to speak with the parents of the partner.

In the case of having been caught and put in prison, again the migrant may rely on friends and family in Ghana. In the case of a respondent who was caught and put in prison in the Netherlands, the family in Ghana was asked to provide help by going to a prayer camp with pastors believed to have powers to resolve document problems. Asking family in Ghana to attend prayer camps also occurred in other occasions with respondents who were experiencing problems in obtaining their staying permits (see also van Dijk 1997). This involves financial costs for the family back home for travel and donations made at the prayer camp, but also costs in terms of their time, as attending a prayer camp on behalf of a migrant usually involves an extended stay of one or two weeks during which people pray and fast.

The kinds of services described above in relation to insurance are difficult to note for a researcher based in a migrant's home country. They are not visible because they blend in with everyday tasks. Furthermore, some difficulties migrants experience, like being put in jail, are shameful and the family back home may not want to tell people about it. An SMS methodology can help make such services more visible because when an unexpected insurance event occurs to the migrant, the researcher in the migrant receiving country can alert the researchers in the home country to observe attentively and ask how network members deal with the crisis.

The above analysis relates to insurance-related services that people in home countries conduct for migrants. However, there are many other kinds of services that migrants receive from people at home, such as helping them with housing construction, business investments, and child care in their home country. These services have been described by transnational studies (de la Cruz 1995; Matthei et al. 1998; Marques et al. 2001). An SMS methodology can help researchers go beyond the description of reciprocal relations and explain how these relations work, by observing both sides of the reciprocal relation simultaneously. Additionally, by following people over a longer period of time, it is possible to try to quantify these services, for example, through a time-budgeting study that collects data on how much time is spent on these services.

4.3 Triangulation, Tracking Change, and Getting beyond Migration Discourses and False Dichotomies

Up to here, the paper has focused on the type of information that can be found by using an SMS methodology. In this section, we focus on the quality of data that are obtained, centering the discussion on three characteristics: triangulation, tracking change, and getting beyond migration discourses both in practice and in academia.

Having people collect similar data in different localities contemporaneously can enhance the quality of data, in that researchers can triangulate with each other information about their research locations. This enables researchers to complete and correct information by asking more relevant or detailed questions to their own respondents and by questioning about topics that they would otherwise not think of. For example, a respondent in Accra did not mention that she owned a business, but it came out in Amsterdam that the migrant helped her to start one. This alerted the researcher in Accra to ask more detailed questions about business activities in order to get more complete information. Another example is when it resulted from an interview with a migrant that had a tense relationship with one of her network members in Ghana; it was possible to also ask the network member in Ghana about this relationship so as to get both versions of a story. More detail was added and better insight was gained on the nature of the relationship and how it evolved over time to become strained.

The repeated nature of the research methods, interviewing people on a monthly basis over a one-year period, made it possible to *observe* changing attitudes or social relationships that occurred over the fieldwork period. In the course of our study, a mother (in Ghana) and daughter (in Amsterdam) became closer to each other after a period of estrangement. We were able to ask about the reasons for the estrangement and also to observe how the relationship evolved. Quantitative data showed that the closeness between mother and daughter resulted in a series of two-way flows between Ghana and the Netherlands that had not existed in previous years.

In another case, we witnessed the growing religiosity of a respondent. While at the beginning of the research we conducted various interviews in which the respondent was quite critical of Ghanaian pastors operating in Amsterdam, she slowly became a frequenter of one of the Pentecostal churches in her neighbourhood. We were able to trace the events leading to her increasing religiosity and the effects this had on her exchanges with people in Ghana. We were thus able to document what important factors lead to such strong membership to Ghanaian Pentecostal churches in the Netherlands and the flows this generates. Another way the SMS methodology can track changes, although not unique to it, is by following those respondents who move from one research location to another (Smith 1998; Sorense 1998).

One year of data collection cannot pick up on all changes, but it does enable researchers to *observe* the evolution of some attitudes and social relationships, rather than rely only on interviews. These latter are subject to

the pitfalls of human recollection and reflect discourses about the way people want to remember the past rather than the actual events themselves.

Collecting information from more than one site, and following what people do over an extended period of time, also facilitates getting beyond dominant discourses. Various discourses exist around migration both amongst migrants and academics. An example is migrants' complaining of their family's constant requests for help. Often, researchers who base their findings on one-off interviews with migrants report this discourse as a finding, and thus propagate the image of the migrant as a helpless victim of extended family systems prevalent in developing countries. Observing what migrants do, i.e., their practices, revealed in our study the various strategies migrants employ in order to continue supporting people back home while at the same time giving space to their own personal objectives (Mazzucato 2005a). In reality migrants have more room for maneuver, we concluded, than they portray themselves to have. Furthermore, we observed that some migrants do not receive so many requests, and others that do sometimes explicitly deny these requests. Finally, as stressed in section 4.2, migrants are also dependent on their relations in the home country, particularly in certain phases of their migration trajectory. This can partially help explain why they continue to send remittances despite the fact that they say they feel oppressed by requests. We were only able to come to this conclusion by observing and collecting quantitative data from the different sides of the migration process. Migrants' reliance on home did not come out of interviews with migrants themselves because migrants often view this reliance with shame, as it is associated with a "failed" migration story.

Another dominant discourse is that migrants show off their hard-earned income in their country of origin, leading to the misconception in the country of origin that "money grows on trees" overseas. This then results in youths wanting to migrate and in extended family members making constant requests for money and goods from migrants. Having researchers in different locations meant that we could observe migrants' behaviour on their home visits. We also asked migrants what they tell their network members in Ghana about life overseas. At the same time, we could check this information by asking the network members in Ghana what they knew of life overseas. It resulted that people in Ghana, especially in the cities, had a very realistic picture of life in developed countries and were aware that their compatriots were often working and living in difficult conditions. We found that migrants were usually not explicit to their network members about their own personal circumstances, but they explained how living conditions were difficult in general and sometimes gave details about

people they knew. In fact, some of our young respondents who were able to secure a decent job in urban Ghana did not express any desire to migrate. This showed that while the "money growing on trees" discourse may have reflected reality at the beginning of Ghanaians emigration overseas in the 1980s, it is now outdated. Many migrants have since returned temporarily or permanently with realistic stories about their experiences, or worse, with little to show from their stay abroad. The discourse may, however, still be relevant in rural areas (Kabki et al. 2004) or areas of Ghana from where not many people emigrate overseas (de Lange 2003).

Finally, an SMS methodology is useful for researching migration beyond the academic divide of international and internal migration. As Skeldon (1997) argues, often the two are related, with migrants first migrating internally and then overseas, and involve similar dynamics and ties with the home area. An SMS methodology does not depart from national boundaries as defining the relevant research field, but rather works from the network and where the nodes of the network are located. These nodes may be located both within the same country and/or beyond country borders. In the Ghana TransNet research program, for example, this meant not only studying linkages Amsterdam-based migrants have with people in their hometown or in Accra, but also the linkages between the hometowns and Accra. It is in this latter case that we were able to document the intermediary function of Accra-based network members, disbursing migrant remittances to members located in hometowns, and the fact that Accra-based network members were often used to check on how others were using remittances. These dynamics show that internal and international migration are parts of one process, fulfilling different functions in a transnational network of people.

5. Conclusions

There are two overall implications that result from this review of SMS methodology and its contribution to our knowledge about the migration and development nexus. First is that more studies using SMS methodology are needed. SMS methodology allows the operationalization of two concepts that make transnationalism a unique area of study: the *simultaneity* of flows and that people are embedded in *networks* that span national borders. Two-country transnationalism studies are multi-sited, focusing on both migrants' home communities as well as the countries where they reside; however, data have, to our knowledge, never been collected simultaneously and hardly ever across a matched sample of people. Therefore empirical studies that rigorously operationalize concepts such as networks and simultaneity of flows that have been brought to the fore

by theoretical transnationalism studies are needed. One way to do this is through an SMS methodology. This paper has reviewed the main added advantages of using such a methodology. First, an SMS methodology allows migration policies in a receiving country to be directly linked to effects at the local level in developing countries. Second, it highlights that flows engendered by migration are two-way: Not only do they involve remittances from migrant recipient countries to their home countries, but flows of especially services also go from developing to developed country and that these should be taken into account when studying the benefits and costs of migration for developing countries. Regarding the quality of data, an SMS methodology allows the triangulation of results, provides supplemental information with which to improve the reliability of data, and it allows getting beyond dominant migration discourses. Finally, an SMS methodology goes beyond the dichotomy of internal versus international migration, and rather highlights how the two forms of migration are linked through transnational networks.

A second implication regards how migration is to be conceptualized both in academia and policy circles. Migration is usually either seen as an issue with respect to development and is studied by developing-area specialists (development economics, development studies), or as related to issues of integration and social exclusion and is studied by people of different disciplines focusing on the developed world, where migrants usually move to (for a recent review, see Portes and DeWind 2004). Policies follow a similar separation. While development often falls under the mandate of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, integration is an issue dealt with by the ministries concerned with the national territory, such as the Ministry of the Interior, of Education, and of Justice. This dichotomy obfuscates the relationship that exists between migration policies in developed countries and development in the countries where many migrants come from. A bifocal lens used in transnationalism studies and in specific an SMS methodology is useful for highlighting the linkages that exist between migration policies in developed countries and people's lives in the developing world.

For migration research, this means that researchers should be familiar with the economy and society of the country where the migrant group they study comes from, as well as with the policy and economic circumstances migrants are faced with in their receiving country. Working in interdisciplinary teams of developing-area specialists, with urban anthropologists, sociologists, legal experts, and economists specialized in developed countries, is one way to combine this knowledge (Stoller 1997; Hannerz 1998).

For policymakers, migrants' transnational lives linking developed and developing countries means that receiving-country governments affect development in migrants' home countries, both through their migration as well as development policies. Migration policies should focus on reducing, if not eliminating, the unintended consequences they have produced, such as the formal and informal economies of identity papers. An SMS methodology has shown that migration is related to development, not only through flows (remittances) from the receiving country to the home country but also through reverse flows of services that home-country residents have to conduct for migrants in order to bring security to migrants' vulnerable lives in the receiving country. This has the consequence of absorbing productive resources of network members back home that, in the absence of migration, could have been employed elsewhere. Designing policies that recognize migrants' double engagement in both their home country as well as the receiving country economies can help avoid the negative unintended consequences of migration policies. Such policies need to aim at creating space for migrants to invest in their home country while facilitating their more active participation and offering them a secure living in the receiving country economy.

At the same time, development policies should aim at making migrant remittances as productive as possible. This means investing in basic infrastructure and human capital to attract migrant investments or fostering the creation of credit unions in migrant sending areas that provide multiple services for migrants such as money transfer services, and health and funeral insurance for migrants' family members, similar to what has been done in some rural communities in Central America (Orozco 2003). Credit unions have mandates in which they must reinvest their profits in the community, leading to more multiplier effects from migrant remittances than are currently being realized in countries such as Ghana, where most profits from remittances accumulate to large multinationals such as Western Union with no obligation to reinvest in migrant sending areas.

This mixture of migration and development policies needs to be coordinated and implemented simultaneously in order to avoid the effects of one policy countering those of another. This can only be obtained through a closer collaboration between ministries that deal with migrant integration and the ministry that deals with development cooperation than is currently done in most developed countries.

References

Appadurai, A.

1996   *Modernity at large: Cultural dimensions of globalization*,
        University of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis.

Basch, L., N. Glick Schiller, and C. Szanton Blanc

1994   *Nations unbound: Transnational projects, postcolonial
        predicaments, and deterritorialized nation-states*, Gordon
        and Breach Science Publishers, Amsterdam.

Charles, C.

1992   "Transnationalism in the construct of Haitian migrants'
        racial categories of identity in New York City," in N. Glick
        Schiller, L. Basch, and C. Szanton Blanc (eds.), *Towards
        a transnational perspective on migration: Race, class,
        ethnicity, and nationalism reconsidered*, New York Academy
        of Sciences, New York, pp. 101-123.

Clifford, J.

1994   "Diasporas," *Cultural Anthropology* 9: 302-338.

Constantinides, P.

1977   "The Greek Cypriots: Factors in the maintenance of ethnic
        identity," In J. Watson (ed.), *Between two cultures: Migrants
        and minorities in Britain*, Basil Blackwell, Oxford.

De la Brière, B., E. Sadoulet, A. de Janvry, and S. Lambert

2002   "The roles of destination, gender and household composition
        in explaining remittances: An analysis for the Dominican
        Sierra," *Journal of Development Economics* 68: 309-328.

De la Cruz, B.

1995   "The socioeconomic dimensions of remittances: case studies
        of five Mexican families," *The Berkeley McNair Journal* 3:
        1-10.

De Lange A.

2003   "In Soulemitenga things are there: A study on images of the West in Northeast Ghana," Master's thesis, Department of Anthropology, University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam.

Ethnic and Racial Studies

1999   Special issue on transnationalism, 22(2).

Feldman-Bianco, B.

1992   "Multiple layers of time and space: The construction of class, sthnicity, and nationalism among Portuguese immigrants," in N. Glick Schiller, L. Basch and C. Szanton Blanc (eds.), *Towards a transnational perspective on migration: Race, Class, ethnicity, and nationalism reconsidered*, New York Academy of Sciences, New York, pp. 145-174.

Foner, N.

1997   "What's new about transnationalism? New York immigrants today and at the turn of the century," *Diaspora* 6: 355-376.

Gardner, K.

1999   "Desh-Bidesh: Sylheti images of home and away," in S. Vertovec and R. Cohen (eds.), *New York, migration, diasporas and transnationalism*, Edward Elgar Publishing Limited, Cheltenham, UK, Northampton, MA, U.S., pp. 488-502.

Georges, E.

1992   "Gender, class, and migration in the Dominican Republic: Women's experiences in a transnational community," in N. Glick Schiller, L. Basch and C. Szanton Blanc (eds.), *Towards a transnational perspective on migration: Race, class, ethnicity, and nationalism reconsidered*, New York Academy of Sciences, New York, pp.81-99.

Glick Schiller, N., and G. Fouron

1998   "Transnational lives and national identities: The identity politics of Haitian immigrants," in M.P. Smith and L.E. Guarnizo (eds.), *Transnationalism from below*, Transaction Publishers, New Brunswick, pp. 130-161.

Glick Schiller, N., L. Basch, and C. Szanton Blanc (eds.)

1992   *Towards a transnational perspective on migration: Race, class, ethnicity, and nationalism reconsidered*, The New York Academy of Sciences, New York.

Goldring, L.

1998   "The power of status in transnational social fields," in M.P. Smith and L.E. Guarnizo (eds.), *Transnationalism from below*, Transaction Publishers, New Brunswick, pp. 195-195.

Guarnizo, L. E., A. Portes, and W. Haller

2003   "Assimilation and transnationalism: Determinants of transnational political action among contemporary migrants," *American Journal of Sociology* 108(6): 1211-1248.

Hannerz, U.

1998   "Transnational research," in H. Russell Bernard (ed.), *Handbook of methods in anthropology*, Altamira Press, Walnut Creek, CA.

Hinojosa Ojeda, R.

2003   *Transnational migration, remittances and development in North America: Globalization lessons from the Oaxa California transnational village/community modeling project*, Remittances as a Development Tool in Mexico organized by the Multilateral Investment Fund (MIF) of the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB), Mexico City, Mexico.

Kabki, M., V. Mazzucato, and E. Appiah

2004　　"Wo benanɛ a ɛyɛ bebree: The economic impact of remittances of Netherlands-based Ghanaian migrants on rural Ashanti," *Population, Space and Place* 10: 85-97.

Klaver, J.

1997　　"From the land of the sun to the city of angels," *Netherlands Geographic Studies,* no. 228, Amsterdam.

Landolt, P.

2001　　"Salvadoran economic transnationalism: Embedded strategies for household maintenance, immigrant incorporation, and entrepreneurial expansion," *Global Networks* 1(3): 217-241.

Levitt, P.

2001　　*The transnational villagers*, University of California Press, Berkeley.

Levitt, and Glick Schiller

2004　　"Conceptualizing simultaneity: A transnational social field perspective on society," *International Migration Review* 38(3): 1002-1039.

Lucas

2005　　*International migration and economic development: Lessons from low-income countries*, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Sweden.

Lucas, R., and O. Stark

1985　　"Motivations to remit: Evidence from Botswana," *The Journal of Political Economy* 93(5): 901-918.

Marcus, G.

1995 "Ethnography in/of the world system: The emergence of multi-sited ethnography," *Annual Review of Anthropology* 24: 95-117.

Marques, M., R. Santos, and F. Araujo

2001 "Ariadne's thread: Cape Verdean women in transnational webs," *Global Networks* 1(3): 283-306.

Matthei, L., and D. Smith

1998 "Belizean 'Boyz 'n the Hood'? Garifuna labor migration and transnational identity." in M.P. Smith and L.E. Guarnizo (eds.), *Transnationalism from below*, Transaction Publishers, New Brunswick, pp. 270-290.

Mazzucato, V.

2000 "Transnational networks and the creation of local economies: Economic principles and institutions of Ghanaian migrants at home and abroad," Nederlandse Organisatie voor Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek, grant number 410.13.010P, also available on www2.fmg.uva.nl/ghanatransnet.

2005a "Ghanaian migrants' double engagement: A transnational view of development and integration policies," *Global Migration Perspectives*, no. 48, http://www.gcim.org/en/ir_gmp.html.

2005b "Informal insurance arrangements in a transnational context: The case of Ghanaian migrants' networks." Paper presented at COMPAS seminar series, 9 June 2005, Oxford University, Oxford, soon available at http://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/publications/working_papers.shtml.

Mazzucato, V., R. van Dijk, C. Horst, P. de Vries

2004c "Transcending the nation: Explorations of transnationalism as a concept and phenomenon," in D. Kalb, W. Pansters and H. Siebers (eds.), *Globalization and development: Themes and concepts in current research*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht, pp. 131-162.

Mensah, K., M. Mackintosh, and L. Henry

2005   *The 'skills drain' of health professionals from the developing world: A framework for policy formulation*, Medact, London.

North, D.

1994   "Economic performance through time," *The American Economic Review* 84(3): 359-368.

Orozco, M.

2003   "Remittances, the rural sector and policy options in Latin America," Migration Information Source, June, http://www.migrationinformation.org/Feature/display.cfm?id=128.

Osili, U. O.

1998   *Migrants and housing investments: Theory and evidence from Nigeria,* Labor Economics Seminar, Northwestern University.

Ostergaard-Nielsen, E.K.

2001   "Transnational political practices and the receiving state: Turks and Kurds in Germany and the Netherlands," *Global Networks* 1(3): 261-281.

Poros, M.V.

2001   "The role of migrant networks in linking local labor markets: the case of Asian Indian migration to New York and London," *Global Networks* 1(3): 243-259.

Portes, A.

1999   "Conclusion: Towards a new world – the origins and effects of transnational activities," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* (22)2: 463-77.

2001   "Introduction: The debates and significance of immigrant transnationalism," *Global Networks* 1(3): 181-193.

Portes, A., and J. DeWind

2004   "A cross-Atlantic dialogue: The progress of research and theory in the study of international migration," *International Migration Review* 38(3): 828-851.

Portes, A., L. E. Guarnizo, and W. J. Haller

2002   "Transnational entrepreneurs: An alternative form of immigrant economic adaptation," *American Sociological Review* 67(2): 278-298.

Portes, A., L. E. Guarnizo, and P. Landolt

1999   "The study of transnationalism: Pitfalls and promise of an emergent research field," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* (22) 2: 217-237.

Portes, A., and L.E. Guarnizo

1991   *Capitalistas del tropico: La inmigracion en los Estados Unidos y el desarrollo de la pequena empresa en la Republica Dominicana, Santo Domingo*, The John Hopkins University, Flacso.

Riccio, B.

2002   "Senegal is our home: The anchored nature of Senegalese transnational networks,". N. Al-Ali and K. Koser (eds.), in *New approaches to migration? Transnational communities and the transformation of home*, Routledge, London and New York, pp. 68-83

Rouse, R.

1992   "Making sense of settlement: Class transformation, cultural struggle, and transnationalism among Mexican migrants in the United States," in N. Glick Schiller, L. Basch, and C. Szanton Blanc (eds.), *Towards a transnational perspective on migration: race, class, ethnicity, and nationalism reconsidered*, New York Academy of Sciences, New York, pp. 25-52.

Saifullah Khan, V.

1977   "The Pakistanis: Mirpuri villagers at home and in Bradford," in J. Watson (ed.), *Between two cultures: Migrants and minorities in Britain*, Basil Blackwell, Oxford.

Salih, R.

2002   "Shifting meanings of 'Home': Consumption and identity in Moroccan women's transnational practices between Italy and Morocco," in N. Al-Ali and K. Koser (eds.), *New approaches to migration? Transnational communities and the transformation of home*, Routledge, London and New York, pp. 51-67.

Skeldon, R.

1997   *Migation and development: A global perspective,* Longman, Essex.

Smith, M.P.

2001   *Transnational urbanism: Locating globalization*, Blackwell Publishers, Oxford.

Smith, M.P., and L.E. Guarnizo (eds.)

1998   *Transnationalism from below*, Transaction, New Brunswick, NJ.

Smith, R.

1998   "Transnational localities: Community, technology and the politics of membership within the context of Mexico and U.S. migration," in M.P. Smith and L.E. Guarnizo (eds.), *Transnationalism from below*, Transaction, New Brunswick, NJ, pp. 196-239.

Sorensen, N.

1998   "Narrating identity across Dominican worlds," in M.P. Smith and L.E. Guarnizo (eds.), *Transnationalism from below*, Transaction, New Brunswick, NJ, pp. 241-269.

Stark, O., and D. Bloom

1985   "The new economics of labor migration," *American Economic Review* 75: 173-78.

Stark, O., and D. Levhari

1982   "On migration and risk in LDCs," *Economic Development and Cultural Change* 31: 191-96.

Stark, O., and R. Lucas

1988   "Migration, remittances and the family," *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, 36(3): 465-481.

Stoller, P.

1997   "Globalizing method: The problems of doing ethnography in transnational spaces," *Anthropology and Humanism* 22(1): 81-94.

Taylor, E.

1999   "The new economics of labor migration and the role of remittances in the migration process," *International Migration* 37(1): 63-88.

Van Dijk, R.

1997   "From camp to encompassment: Discourses of transsubjectivity in the Ghanaian Pentecostal diaspora," *Journal of Religion in Africa* 27 (2): 135-69.

Veenkamp, T., T. Bentley, and A. Buonfino

2003   *People flow: Managing migration in a new European commonwealth*, Demos, London.

Vertovec, S.

1999   "Conceiving and researching transnationalism," *Ethnic and racial studies*, 2(2): 447-462.

2001   "Transnationalism and identity," *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 27(4): 573-582.

Watson, J.

1977   "The Chinese: Hong Kong villagers in the British catering trade," in *Between two cultures: Migrants and minorities in Britain*, Basil Blackwell, Oxford.

1977   *Between two cultures: Migrants and minorities in Britain*, Basil Blackwell, Oxford.

Wiltshire, R.

1992   "Implications of transnational migration for nationalism: The Caribbean example," in N. Glick Schiller, L. Basch, and C. Szanton Blanc (eds.), *Towards a transnational perspective on migration: Race, class, ethnicity, and nationalism reconsidered*, New York Academy of Sciences, New York, pp. 175-187.

Appendix

Table A.1. Two-country Transnational Studies by Simultaneity and Matched Sample

Sample	Simultaneous	Step-wise
Matched		De la Cruz (1995) Osili (1998) Saifullah Khan (1977)
Partly matched		Basch et al. (1994) Constantinides (1977) Goldring (1998) Kramer (1997) Landolt (2001) Levitt (2001) Sorensen (1998) Wiltshire (1992)
Unmatched		Feldman-Bianco (1992) Gardner (1999) Glick Schiller and Fouron (1998) Guarnizo et al. (2003) Hinojosa Ojeda (2003) Matthei and Smith (1998) Marques et al. (2001) Portes and Guarnizo (1991) Riccio (2002) Rouse (1992) Watson (1977)

Source: own literature review.

Table A.2. Two-country Transnational Studies by Scope and Type of Respondent Contact

	Respondents N ≤ 20 per country	Respondents N > 20 per country
Intensive contact with respondents	Levitt (2001)[1] Matthei and Smith (1998)[2] Saifullah Khan (1977) Sorensen (1998)[2]	Costantinides (1977)[2] Rouse (1992)[2] Watson (1977)[2]
One-off contact with respondents	De la Cruz (1995) Kramer (1997)[1]	Basch et al. (1994) Feldman-Bianco (1992)[2] Gardner, (1999) Glick Schiller and Fouron (1998)[2] Goldring (1998)[2] Guarnizo et al. (2003) Landolt (2001) Marques et al. (2001) Osili (1998) Portes and Guarnizo, (1991) Riccio (2002)[2] Wiltshire (1992)[1] Hinojosa Ojeda (2003)

Source: own literature review.

Notes: [1]Include surveys by way of background information but the material on migrants' lives comes from a partly matched sample of respondents. These studies are categorized according to their methods with the partly matched sample. [2]Ethnographies in which it is not clear how many people are studied.