



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### Reminders of duty: A Kantian theory of blame

Scholten, M.

**Publication date**

2016

**Document Version**

Other version

**License**

Other

[Link to publication](#)

**Citation for published version (APA):**

Scholten, M. (2016). *Reminders of duty: A Kantian theory of blame*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

**General rights**

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

**Disclaimer/Complaints regulations**

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

**REMINDERS OF DUTY**  
**A KANTIAN THEORY OF BLAME**

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor  
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus  
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex  
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,  
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel  
op vrijdag 9 september 2016, te 12.00 uur  
door

Matthé Scholten

geboren te Hoorn

**Promotiecommissie:**

Promotor:	Prof. Dr. J. Früchtl	Universiteit van Amsterdam
Copromotor:	Prof. Dr. M. Willaschek	Goethe-Universität Frankfurt
Overige leden:	Prof. Dr. B. Roessler	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	Prof. Dr. R.J. Wallace	University of California, Berkeley
	Prof. Dr. P. Kleingeld	Rijksuniversiteit Groningen
	Dr. R. Celikates	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	Dr. T.R.V. Nys	Universiteit van Amsterdam
Faculteit:	Faculteit der Geesteswetenschappen	

Het hier beschreven onderzoek werd mede mogelijk gemaakt door DAAD, Prins Bernhard Cultuurfonds, De Breed Kreiken Innovatiefonds en Canon Foundation in Europe.

---

# Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	v
<i>Note on sources and key to abbreviations</i>	vii
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 The various senses of responsibility	2
1.2 Reminders of duty	6
1.3 Method and assumptions	15
1.4 Overview	20
<i>Part I: The Reinhold/Sidgwick Objection</i>	
<b>2 Kantian Autonomy and the Reinhold/Sidgwick Objection</b>	<b>29</b>
2.1 What Kantian autonomy is not	32
2.2 Kantian autonomy	37
2.3 Kantian constructivism	44
2.4 The Reciprocity Thesis: two analogies	47
2.5 The Reinhold/Sidgwick Objection	50
2.6 Moral freedom	56
<b>3 The Supposed Solutions</b>	<b>63</b>
3.1 Reinhold: free self-determination for or against the moral law	64
3.2 Allison: the spontaneity of choice	70
3.3 Paton: under, not in accordance with the moral law	80
3.4 Wood: immoral agents and indifferent swimmers	83
<i>Part II: The Problem of Free Will</i>	
<b>4 Kant's Compatibilism</b>	<b>95</b>
4.1 Kant as a Soft Determinist	96

4.2	The Consequence Argument	106
4.3	The theft: leeway, ultimacy, and the conditional analysis	115
4.4	The malicious lie: altered-past compatibilism	126
4.5	Altered-law compatibilism	131
4.6	Obscure and panicky metaphysics	134
<b>5</b>	<b>Ought Implies Can, Alternate Possibilities, and Asymmetrical Freedom</b>	<b>140</b>
5.1	Kant's Luther cases and his rejection of PAP	143
5.2	Ought Implies Can and the derivation of PAP-B	152
5.3	No blameworthiness without fault	159
5.4	Ought Implies Can: weak or strong?	163
5.5	The motivations for Ought Implies Can	166
5.6	Kant's version of Ought Implies Can	173
5.7	The practical (ir)relevance of transcendental freedom	178
 <i>Part III: Quality of Will</i>		
<b>6</b>	<b>Moral Worth</b>	<b>187</b>
6.1	Schiller's joke and the counterfactual analysis of motivation	189
6.2	The Kantian theory of agency	196
6.3	The authority of the moral law: three models	205
6.4	Kant's account of moral motivation	214
6.5	Acting from duty	218
<b>7</b>	<b>Excuses</b>	<b>226</b>
7.1	Justifications, excuses, and exemptions	229
7.2	Quality of will	239
7.3	Physical constraint	248
7.4	Unintentional bodily movement	251
7.5	Ignorance	255
7.6	Coercion and necessity	261
<b>8</b>	<b>Exemptions</b>	<b>270</b>
8.1	Anxiety, bipolar, and depressive disorders	274
8.2	Kant's explanation of symptoms of schizophrenia	278
8.3	The public use of reason and the objective attitude	286
8.4	Paranoid schizophrenia	291
8.5	Disorganized schizophrenia	296
8.6	The limits of moral address	299
<b>9</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>308</b>
<i>Bibliography</i>		322
<i>Summary</i>		339
<i>Samenvatting</i>		345

---

## Acknowledgments

First of all, I would like to thank my supervisors Josef Früchtel and Marcus Willaschek, Josef for putting trust in me and for believing in my project and Marcus for generously welcoming me at the Goethe University Frankfurt and for meticulously commenting on all the chapters of this dissertation. I am very grateful to Jay Wallace for hosting my stay at UC Berkeley and to Masaki Ichinose for hosting my stay at the University of Tokyo. DAAD, Prins Bernhard Cultuurfonds, De Breed Kreiken Innovatiefonds and Canon Foundation in Europe kindly provided me with financial support for my stays abroad. Thanks also go out to Victor Kal, who first got me thinking about the issues discussed in this dissertation in a BA seminar on Kant's *Religion*.

During my PhD, I learnt a lot from exchanges with the colleagues with whom I taught the courses Introduction to Philosophy, History of Philosophy and Issues in Ethics, of whom I want to mention Pieter Pekelharing, Johan de Jong, Frank Rebel, Thomas Muntz, Thomas Nys and Henri Wijsbek. I also benefitted greatly from the discussions at the PPA colloquium, for which I would like to thank Beate Roessler, Gijs van Donselaar and Robin Celikates.

Many thanks go out to the participants of the OZSW study group Philosophy of

Responsibility for their comments on several chapters of this thesis and their willingness to read some obscure Kant quotes. I am grateful to Jan Willem Wieland and Philip Robichaud for organizing the meetings. Finally, the political analogies that I develop in this dissertation are inspired by many lively discussions with Jeroen van Rooy, Eric Boot and Arnold de Groot.

I would like to thank all the people who made my stays abroad worthwhile also in non-academic respects. In particular I would like to thank those who made me feel welcome at the philosophy departments that I visited, and here I want to mention Claudia Blöser, Gabriele Gava, Filippo Ranchio, Titus Stahl, Julian Jonker, Pax Abad, Ikuro Suzuki, Shoko Kinoshita, Richard Dietz, Shohei Takasaki and Yusuke Yoshida. Finally, I want to thank my fellow PhD students at the University of Amsterdam, Dilek Yamali, Eva Groen-Reijman, Bernardo Caycedo, Nathasha Basu, Noortje de Leij, Daniël de Zeeuw, Anna Blijdenstein, Bastiaan Hoorneman, Corstin Dieterich, Sanneke de Haan, Jelle Bruinenberg and Tamar de Waal.

Thanks above all to Mariko.

---

## Note on sources and key to abbreviations

All translations of Kant's works are from the *Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant*, edited by Paul Guyer and Allen W. Wood, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

With the exception of the references to the *Critique of Pure Reason*, all references are to the volumes and pages of the standard edition of Kant's works by the Royal German Academy of the Sciences. The references to the *Critique of Pure Reason* are to the page numbers of the A and B pagination of the first and second edition. I will use the following abbreviations:

A/B	<i>Critique of Pure Reason</i> , Kant (1998).
Anth	<i>Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View</i> , in Kant (2007).
Br	<i>Correspondence</i> , Kant (1999).
DMC	<i>On the Philosopher's Medicine of the Body</i> , in Kant (2007).
GMS	<i>Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals</i> , in Kant (1996a).
KpV	<i>Critique of Practical Reason</i> , in Kant (1996a).
KU	<i>Critique of the Power of Judgment</i> , Kant (2000).
MS	<i>The Metaphysics of Morals</i> , in Kant (1996a).



Prol	<i>Prolegomena to any Future Metaphysics</i> , in Kant (2002).
Refl	<i>Reflexionen</i> , in Kant (2005).
RGV	<i>Religion Within the Boundaries of Mere Reason</i> , in Kant (1996b).
SF	<i>The Conflict of the Faculties</i> , in Kant (1996b).
VE	<i>Lectures on Ethics</i> , Kant (1997a).
VKK	<i>Essay on the Maladies of the Head</i> , in Kant (2007).
VM	<i>Lectures on Metaphysics</i> , Kant (1997b).
WA	<i>An Answer to the Question: What is Enlightenment?</i> , in Kant (1996a).
ZeF	<i>Toward Perpetual Peace</i> , in Kant (1996a).