# LIBERTY UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF MUSIC

# An Effective Online Training Strategy for Worship Leaders in Korea

A Thesis Submitted to the Faculty of the School of Music in Candidacy for the Degree of Doctor of Worship Studies

by

Dong Hyun Kwon

Lynchburg, Virginia

December 6, 2021

Copyright © 2021 by Dong Hyun Kwon

All Rights Reserved

# **DOCTORAL THESIS PROPOSAL DECISION**

The thesis advisor has rendered the following decision concerning the proposal status for

Dong Hyun Kwon

on the

research topic title of

# An Effective Online Training Strategy for Worship Leaders in Korea

as submitted on September 25, 2021:

a.					
b.	Provisional Approval to proceed with proposal pending cited revisions. (This is the most common decision). The student must resubmit the proposal with cited revisions according to the established timeline. The Advisor will indicate the committee's status on your response to the required revisions. The student may NOT apply for IRB approval until full approval is granted.				
c.	Redirecti develop a new proposal, research project. The str	as minor revisions		xpectations for the	
Dr. Je	erry L. Newman			9/25/2021	
Print Name of Advisor/Mentor Signature Date		Date			
Dr. R	odney D. Whaley			9/25/2021	
and the particular	Name of Reader	0	Signature//	Date	

#### DOCTOR OF WORSHIP STUDIES THESIS DEFENSE DECISION

The committee has rendered the following decision concerning the defense for Dong Hyun Kwon on the Thesis, An Effective Online Training Strategy for Worship Leaders in Korea as submitted on December 10, 2021: a. \_\_\_\_\_\_Full approval to proceed with no revisions. The document shouldbe prepared for submission to the Jerry Falwell Library. Provisional approval pending cited revisions. The student must resubmit the project with cited revisions according to the established timeline. Redirection of project. The student is being redirected to take MUSC/WRSP 889 again, as minor revisions will not meet the expectations for theresearch project. 12/10/2020 Dr. Jerry L. Newman Signature Date Print Name of Advisor/Mentor

Dr. Rodney D. Whaley

**Print Name of Reader** 

12/10/2021

Date

Signature

#### **ABSTRACT**

A trained worship leader plays a significant role in a modern church's proper worship experience. It is hard to find well-prepared worship leaders, and most local churches need to train those who are or will be leading their worship services. There have been various courses for this purpose by several organizations in Korea. However, these programs have usually been limited to those who are able to attend at a certain time and place set by the organization. Those who do not live in large cities or cannot afford time off during those hours have been excluded from the opportunity to take in-person classes. Recently, the development of information technology continues to expand the opportunity of online education, in which the limitations of traditional education could be alleviated for service recipients without time and space constraints. This project aims to discover a strategy to establish an effective online education program for Korean worship leaders. This research is supported by a review of the literature covering precedent approaches to the essential qualities required of a worship leader and how to educate them properly, by determining how existing worship schools in Korea are attempting online education, and by analyzing the available online tools for worship education. The expected benefit of this project is to provide more opportunities for current and future worship leaders of local churches who have not been able to attend in-person courses to enhance their ability to lead worship by participating in online programs.

Keywords: Worship leader, Worship school, Online education, Korea

#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

First and foremost, I would like to give all the glory and thanks to my God, who made me, saved me, and showed me the way of life. I am also appreciative that He gave me a yearning for worship and then fulfilled my desire to learn more about it through the opportunity to study here at Liberty University.

No words can express my heartfelt thankfulness to my lovely wife, Jeeyoung, who has walked with me with constant love, care, encouragement, and sacrifice throughout this enduring journey. I wish to express my wholehearted gratitude to my mother, father, and mother-in-law for their endless prayers and support. I am indebted to my late father-in-law and late grandmother, both of whom showered me with their unconditional love. If they were with me right now, they would be overjoyed more than anyone else. I feel their absence.

I wish to express my sincere appreciation to my thesis advisor, Dr. Jerry Newman, who constantly encouraged me not to give up and helped me find the right path until I finished this project. I also wish to express my deep regards to Dr. Rodney Whaley, my thesis reader, for his careful review and heartwarming advice. I must extend my gratitude to other current and former faculty members at Liberty University who inspired and challenged me in numerous ways, including Drs. Taeseong Kim, Timothy T. Chong, Hyun David Chung, Vernon Whaley, Lavon Gray, and Armenio Suzano. I especially thank the late Dr. Daniel C. Kim, who continually urged his students to complete their doctoral degrees, whatever the cost.

I am indebted to many other pastors and friends whom I cannot list every name on this page but will never forget. Without their help and support, I would never have been able to finish my thesis. Every milestone in this journey has their names engraved on it.

# CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
Background	1
Statement of the Problem	12
Statement of the Purpose	12
Significance of the Study	13
Research Question and Sub-Questions	14
Hypothesis	14
Definition of Terms	15
Research Plan	17
Summary	17
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	19
The Training Needs for Korean Worship Leaders	19
Required Roles for Korean Worship Leaders	26
Online Training Ideas for Korean Worship Leaders	37
Summary	56
CHAPTER THREE: METHODS	57
Introduction	57
Design	57
Procedure	59
Data Analysis	61
Summary	62
CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH FINDINGS	63
Introduction	63

	Results	. 63
	Developing Subjects	. 63
	Evaluating Online Tools	. 86
	Summary	. 99
CHAF	PTER FIVE: CONCLUSIONS	100
	Introduction	100
	Summary of the Study	100
	Summary of Purpose	101
	Summary of Procedure	101
	Summary of Findings and Prior Research	102
	Findings on Developing Subjects	102
	Findings on Evaluating Online Tools	103
	Limitations of the Study	104
	Recommendations for Future Study	105
	Implications for Practice	106
	Thesis Summary	107
RIRI I	IOGR APHY	108

# LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Preference for hymns vs. praise songs	4
Table 2. The roles of a worship leader from eight authors	65
Table 3. The roles of a worship leader (Rearranged)	66
Table 4. Recent subjects of WLTS	70
Table 5. Recent subjects of WLTS (Rearranged)	71
Table 6. Elective course subjects of WLTS	72
Table 7. Fall 2018 subjects of AWI (8-week residential)	73
Table 8. Online subjects of AWI (4 to 5-week online)	75
Table 9. 2018 program of WLA	78
Table 10. 2019 program of WLA	79
Table 11. 2020 program of WLA	80
Table 12. Analysis of the WLTS curriculum	82
Table 13. Analysis of the AWI curriculum	82
Table 14. Analysis of the WLA curriculum	83
Table 15. Analysis of the three programs' curricula	85
Table 16. Distance learning types (Ministry of Education in Korea)	88
Table 17. Advantages and disadvantages of each learning type	89
Table 18. Real-time interactive (single and blended) class rate	90
Table 19. Online tools for each learning type	91

# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.

AWI Anointing Worship Institute

CWPE Contemporary Western Protestant Evangelicalism

DLS Distance Learning Systems

On. Online Class

Res. Residential Class

WLA Worship Leader Academy

WLTS Worship Leader Training School

#### **CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION**

## Background

Korean churches, which experienced explosive growth until the late 20th century, have been facing a decrease in the population of believers since 1995. Despite many efforts to examine the causes and overcome the crisis, this downward trend worsens. However, it should be an excellent opportunity to discern the church's mistakes and solidify the fundamentals of the gospel. One of the prominent endeavors on this issue is the growing interest in worship renewal. Kihun Choi asserts the importance of worship to overcome this crisis:

Many churches and Christian leaders are attempting to handle this crisis, but the reality is that churches are finding it difficult to address the issue. One of the best re-engaging places and methods for this generation is worship. Worship is the best place to evangelize unbelievers and encourage believers with faith. Worship is the fundamental beginning point and the best resolving key solution for this problem. However, many churches are attempting to resolve this problem through some programs and events. Worship renovation, which is the center of the gospel, can be a good alternation for this problem. For resolving this problem, churches and pastors should study the various aspects of worship and research the successful cases of the corporation.<sup>3</sup>

Robert Webber clarifies where to focus on worship renewal as follows: "Worship renewal in the twentieth century has focused on two key issues: understanding what worship is and experiencing the power of worship." In the same way, Jonghun Ju suggests two efforts for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Byung Joon Chung, "A Reflection on the Growth and Decline of the Korean Protestant Church," *International Review of Mission* 103, no. 2 (2014): 331.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Angella Son, "Crisis of Church Decline in and Revitalization of Korean Churches," *Pastoral Psychology* 67, no. 5 (2018): 572.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Kihun Choi, "21st Century Evangelistic Worship Strategy for the Emergent Generation in South Korea" (DMin diss., Liberty University, 2014), 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Robert Webber, *The Renewal of Sunday Worship*, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., vol. 3, *The Complete Library of Christian Worship* (Nashville, TN: Star Song Pub. Group, 1993), 99.

worship renewal: "one is to understand accurately the meaning and the role of worship that has developed historically, and the other is to sensitively embrace the culture of this era in order to substantialize it in the changing times suitably." As part of these efforts, Korean churches started to acknowledge the necessity of changing the form of worship for the new century. Phillip Lee observes, "In order to overcome stagnancy and decline in church growth, churches in Korea have attempted to adopt a variety of worship styles." Korean churches experienced a transition in worship styles during recent decades, with countless arguments about which style is suitable for worship. Lee claims that "the conflict of worship exposes two positions. The first position is to maintain the tradition, and the other is to accept new worship styles."

When it comes to the style of worship, music is one of the most significant elements for worship renewal. Webber maintains, "The most significant musical differences between contemporary and traditional worship are those involving instrumentation and song selection and style. J. Michael Walters notes, "Because good liturgy is holistic – involving mind, body, and will – music is perhaps the best medium available for worship, for music involves all three necessary elements of human experience. When we give ourselves to singing, our mind, body, and will are engaged in a way that is rarely experienced otherwise." The answer to which

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Jonghun Ju, 예배, 역사에서 배우다 [Worship, Learning from History] (Seoul, Korea: Seum Books, 2015), 47. All the original Korean texts are translated by the researcher into English for readers' convenience, applied throughout.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Phillip Lee, "Blended Worship: A Future Model of Worship for the Presbyterian Churches in South Korea" (DMin diss., Liberty University, 2014), 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Ibid., 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Ju, Worship, Learning from History, 179.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Robert Webber, *Music and the Arts in Christian Worship*, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., vol. 4, *The Complete Library of Christian Worship* (Nashville, TN: Star Song Pub. Group, 1994), 342.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> J. Michael Walters, Can't Wait for Sunday (Indianapolis, IN: Wesleyan Publishing House, 2006), 121.

worship style is more desirable may vary depending on the circumstances and needs of a specific church. Robbie Castleman maintains, "It's not unusual today for Christian congregations to have two styles of worship, usually designated "traditional" and "contemporary" – and often meeting in two different settings. The decision to develop these two styles is often based on congregational interest in attracting different kinds of worshipers with distinct preferences, especially in music." Some Korean churches still hesitate to accept any new worship style and only offer traditional or liturgical services, while others embrace spontaneous, free, and unconventional worship. However, it is prevalent that most Korean churches sing modern worship songs before or after the "call to worship" in their services, no matter what forms of worship they use. 13

There are several reasons for this tendency: First, the acceptance of modern music has increased in Korean congregations. The generation that experienced Korea's praise and worship movement, which emerged in the 1980s, now became the church's core members. <sup>14</sup> People in this generation grew up learning traditional hymns and children's hymns and then encountered modern worship songs when they were teenagers or young adults. Teenagers at that time are now middle-aged, and those young adults at that time are now becoming seniors. In other words, most church members now in Korea are familiar with both traditional hymns and modern worship songs. In

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Robbie Castleman, *Story-Shaped Worship: Following Patterns from the Bible and History* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2013), 27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Young-Kuk Kim, 성공적인 예배를 위한 음악목회 프로그램 [A Musical Ministry Program for Successful Worship] (Seoul, Korea: Publishing House of the PCK, 2005), 125.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Sun Joo Kim, "A Study of Worship Renewal through the Blended Worship Style in Small Churches" (DMin diss., Liberty University, 2017), 51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Yoojung Justin Lee, "A Strategy of the Worship Renewal for the Korean Church in Postmodern Times" (DMin diss., Liberty University, 2004), 74.

addition, older people's resistance to modern worship songs has been gradually reduced. Table 1 indicates Korean church members' preferences for worship styles in a 2018 survey. People under the age of 50 have a slightly higher preference for praise songs, while older people still prefer hymns. However, it is interesting that more than one-third of those aged 60 and older prefer praise songs.

Table 1. Preference for hymns vs. praise songs

Age	Sum	Hymn-Based Worship	Praise Song-Based Worship
Total	1000	52.6	47.4
19-29	153	48.6	51.4
30-39	180	41.6	58.4
40-49	213	48.2	51.8
50-59	200	57.6	42.4
60 and above	254	62.7	37.3

Source: Data adapted from The Korean National Association of Christian Pastors, 한국 기독교 분석 리포트: 2018 한국인의 종교생활과 의식조사 [Korean Christianity Analysis Report: 2018 Korean Religious Life and Consciousness Survey] (Seoul, Korea: URD, 2018), 154

According to a 2008 survey, 75.7% of believers in their 20s preferred modern worship songs for congregational music, while 90.3% of those in their 60s and above preferred hymns. <sup>15</sup> It shows that there has been a remarkable change in the perspective of music for worship over the past decade. One significant possibility is that older people in Korean churches have more opportunities to be exposed to various styles of Christian songs as internet services and social media grow. They enjoy many worship songs with their online fellows. Even though most senior adults still show resistance to too fast beats or loud music, modern worship songs are no longer

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Sang-Il Lee, "간세대 예배와 회중찬송 [Intergenerational Worship and Congregational Singing]," *Korea Presbyterian Journal of Theology* 43 (12, 2011), 427-28.

foreign to them. Modern worship songs could have a similar status as traditional hymns without any emotional reluctance for them as long as the songs touch their hearts. Taek Seung Oh determines the musical characteristics of elderly members as follows:

Seniors who participate in worship have a rich musical background. In particular, they are the generation that has experienced all the musical changes in Korean society. They have experienced both Korean and Western music, and they continue to listen to more contemporary music today. The songs they have sung in church and the musical genres they have encountered were incomparable to those experienced by today's younger generation. Taking advantage of these characteristics, it is necessary to find a way to experience and enjoy the beauty of God through musical diversity during the Sunday worship service with the elderly congregation.<sup>16</sup>

Second, today's worship encourages each worshiper's active participation and response rather than following denominational tradition.<sup>17</sup> The praise and worship movement in the 1980s did not start just for young believers to enjoy new songs in their churches but to refresh the old customs of worship. Yoojung Justin Lee characterizes the meaning of the movement as follows:

The second is a new wind of worship renewal that has been in the Korean church since the middle of the 1980s. It is a renewal from the traditional and exclusive liturgy. This change is a fluctuation of lithosphere that could be enough to change the traditional worship, which has not changed for the last 100 years. This big change of perception about praise and worship music has moved it from an assistant position to the sermon, which is the main part of worship, to an awareness of praise and worship music as worship. <sup>18</sup>

Traditional ways of worship are often regarded as passive attitudes, while praise and worship movements could be more active. 19 Russell Allen Robbins maintains that "contemporary

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Taek Seung Oh, "고령화 시대를 위한 회중 예배 가능성 연구: 미학적 분석과 적용을 중심으로 [A Study on the Possibility of Congregational Worship for the Aging Era: Focusing on Aesthetic Analysis and Application]" (PhD diss., Seoul Jangsin University, 2019), 107.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Ju, Worship, Learning from History, 35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Lee, "Worship Renewal in Postmodern Times," 72-73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Kim, "Blended Worship in Small Churches," 9.

worship music can both promote an individual understanding of worship and, due to its participatory nature, help build community in corporate worship."<sup>20</sup> Even though there have been criticisms that modern worship songs are too emotional, the proper use of contemporary music should be helpful to offer God worship in spirit and truth (John 4:24).

Third, modern worship songs are effective in approaching unbelievers. Dan Wilt insists, "Contemporary worship music is saying, in hundreds of ways, "God is near, He loves you, and He knows you." If the musicians are truly the orators of our day, unbelievers may never hear the sermon – but they will hear the song." The seeker service, which is designed to invite non-Christians into the place of worship, actively utilizes contemporary music. In the late 20th century, many Korean church leaders attempted to introduce the seeker service for church growth, but the service for non-Christians and believers was not distinguished. Most Korean churches that implemented the seeker service have gradually adjusted their practices through trial and error. They continue to endeavor to attract non-Christians to Sunday worship services, and modern worship songs are an important instrument in this effort.

The transition in the worship style inevitably changed the worship leader's role. Churches have begun to recognize the urgent need for a qualified worship leader as modern worship songs are imported into their services. Some churches let lay leaders or ministers with musical capabilities lead worship, and they soon realized that musical ability is not sufficient to be a

 $<sup>^{20}</sup>$  Russell Allen Robbins, "The Rise of Corporate Individualism in Twenty-First Century Worship" (DWS diss., Liberty University, 2020), 38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> J. Ligon Duncan et al., *Perspectives on Christian Worship: Five Views* (Nashville, TN: B&H Academic, 2009), 188.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Joe Horness, "Contemporary Music-Driven Worship," in *Exploring the Worship Spectrum*, ed. Paul E. Engle and Steve B. Cowan, Zondervan Counterpoints Collection (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2004), 106.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Ju, Worship, Learning from History, 38-39.

worship leader. <sup>24</sup> Franklin S. Page and L. Lavon Gray insist, "As churches placed heavier emphasis on musical skills, and some seminaries refused to acknowledge these skills were even needed, a vacuum developed, leaving many worship leaders with weak theological foundations. To remedy this problem, churches, as well as those called to the worship ministry, must rediscover the importance of a solid theological education." <sup>25</sup> Worship leaders are not only for leading songs before the congregation, and they need to comprehend how to bring the people into God's presence with praise and what kind of music would approach the congregation properly. <sup>26</sup> Kyuhyuk Lee emphasizes the importance of worship leaders as follows:

It is important to understand the importance of worship leaders because worship leaders are those who help the congregation open their eyes toward God and feel God. In order to focus on the goal of worship, the roles of worship leaders are very important. Some worship leaders who are spiritually immature seek to get the glory that is God's, using their musical gifts. The proper role of the worship leader is to help the congregation confess their love for God wholeheartedly and experience the presence of God more deeply.<sup>27</sup>

Leading worship requires a variety of qualities. Dawn H. Cochran observes, "It is probable that the worship leader may be lacking in one or more areas of leadership. These areas may range from leadership, musicianship to biblical training. The role of the worship leader requires a vast array of qualities and characteristics that are essential for a healthy ministry to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Chang-Kyun Ahn, "한국 교회 찬양예배의 문제점과 워십리더교육의 개선 방안 [Proposals for Improving Worship Leader Education Based on the Analysis of the Current Worship and Praise Services in the Korean Church]" (PhD diss., Hoseo University, 2005), 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Franklin S. Page and L. Lavon Gray, *Hungry for Worship: Challenges and Solutions for Today's Church* (Birmingham, AL: New Hope Pub, 2014), 138.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Ahn, "Improving Worship Leader Education," 69.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Kyuhyuk Lee, "A Study for Training and Building Up Worship Leaders for Spiritual Maturity and Revival in South Korea" (DMin diss., Liberty University, 2017), 33.

flourish."<sup>28</sup> If someone has been appointed as a worship leader at a local church, that is probably because they have something better than others. Every worship leader has their strengths and weaknesses to exercise their responsibilities, whether they recognize them or not. The proper education will help them distinguish what to improve and beware.<sup>29</sup>

Due to such demands in the field, various training programs for worship leaders have been established by higher educational institutions or individual organizations in Korea for decades. Training worship leaders at higher educational institutions could be categorized into two groups: First, most universities and seminaries for future pastors provide students with specific classes related to worship music. However, in most undergraduate schools, the proportion of those classes in the curriculum is only a little and not enough to equip prepared worship leaders. Some schools provide a wide range of music-related classes in their Master of Divinity programs, while some provide none. Even if many classes are open, students could take only a few classes unless it was mandatory. Second, various specialized courses to teach modern Christian music have been launched since 1999. They have in-depth curriculums for equipping professional worship leaders with practical Christian music. They would be a good opportunity for those who desire to be a fully dedicated worship leader, but those who need to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Dawn H. Cochran, "The Qualities of the Worship Leader Perceived to Engage Others to Serve in Worship Ministry" (DWS diss., Liberty University, 2020), 78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Stacey Brown, "Five Principles to Empower the Worship Leader" (DWS diss., Liberty University, 2016), 72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Ahn, "Improving Worship Leader Education," 90.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Seong sil Jo, "목회자의 음악적 역량 강화를 통한 목회 활성화 방안 연구 [A Study on the vitalization of Ministry through Strengthening Musical Ability of Pastor]" (Doctor of Chrisitan Musicology diss., Baekseok University, 2017), 81.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Ibid., 93.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Ahn, "Improving Worship Leader Education," 109-10.

lead worship as volunteers feel it is hard to apply for a degree course. Considering the fact that 70-80% of Korean churches are small-sized with 200 or fewer members, and it is complicated to find a suitable worship leader in a small church, different training courses easily accessible for voluntary leaders should be needed. A. W. Tozer claims, "Every Christian church in every country across the world in every generation exists to worship God first, not second; not tacking worship at the end of our service as an afterthought, but rather to worship God primarily, with everything else coming in second, at best." Every church needs a prepared worship leader to give proper worship to God. If there are tens of thousands of churches in Korea, the same number of worship leaders should be needed.

Individual organizations for worship ministry have provided alternative efforts for training worship leaders. This kind, of course, is occasionally opened as short-term programs.<sup>35</sup> Even though it is hard to expect in-depth training for a long-term period, they have the advantage of providing introductory lessons for beginning worship leaders. In addition, their curriculums could be more flexible in responding to the church's current needs than those of higher educational institutions. Those programs have indeed assisted many worship leaders of local churches.<sup>36</sup> However, there are still blind spots where people in need of worship leader training cannot attend any programs due to time and space limitations. Since those programs are only held in large cities, it is almost impossible for worship leaders who live in small cities or rural areas to participate. Even people in large cities often find it difficult to attend the appointed time regularly.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> A. W. Tozer, *The Purpose of Man: Designed to Worship*, ed. James L. Snyder (Ventura, CA: Regal, 2009), 46.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Ahn, "Improving Worship Leader Education," 91.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Hyo Seop Kim, "Effective Worship Leaders in South Korea Churches: Seven Biblical Attitude Principles of a Worship Leader" (DMin diss., Liberty University, 2014), 46.

Regarding these issues, online education could be considered a decent alternative. The advancement of information and communication technology made it possible for distance education, enabled flexible study schedules, and relieved time and space constraints. Page and Gray observe the benefits of technological advances for online education as follows:

Technological advances, like most things, potentially have both positive and negative impacts. A key benefit influenced by technological innovation is the ability to communicate, regardless of location or distance. In a real sense, technology broke down physical and geographical barriers, allowing most people to take care of work-related issues from anywhere. Technological advances, including the Internet, led to the advent of online education, making opportunities to pursue college, graduate, or terminal education readily accessible.<sup>37</sup>

They also insist that "churches must insist that worship pastors have solid theological education from Christian colleges or seminaries. Online education in worship studies has removed many obstacles that once made this type of education a challenge." Expanding online education will increase the educational opportunities for them.

Based on the content from preceding studies, Da Young Kong presents the advantages and disadvantages of online education: Its advantages include cost reduction, flexibility, the provision of in-depth learning and high-level lessons, and the creation of valuable learning materials. In addition, learners can choose the schedule, learning method, and instructors, and instructors can teach remotely and use diverse lecture content. Its disadvantages are the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Page and Gray, *Hungry for Worship*, 161-62.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Ibid., 138.

information gap among learners, the need for more effort from both learners and instructors, the difficulty of shifting existing courses toward online courses, and technical barriers.<sup>39</sup>

Despite the limitations of online education, it is the best option in order to provide educational opportunities for those who cannot attend in-person classes. Thus, for decades, an online-based methodology has expanded gradually in various educational fields. Since the beginning of 2020, the pandemic has brought about a drastic change in the educational environment. Every college and university had to change their classes to online in accordance with the government's social distancing policy without enough time to prepare. 40 Before the outbreak of COVID-19, most schools opened various classes in the same room at different times. Distance learning in different places is attracting attention during the pandemic.<sup>41</sup> Worship schools of professional organizations were no exception to those issues. Before the pandemic, online programs for worship leaders were hard to find in Korea. The organizations had to suddenly close or suspend all scheduled programs at the beginning of the pandemic and reopen online after a long time. Although it is hard to tell for now whether these attempts will be temporary in this time of unprecedented global trouble or continuously expanded after the virus threat disappears, it is predictable that there will be much more demand for online programs among worship leaders in Korea even after the pandemic is entirely over.

The expansion of online education provides more opportunities not only for learners but also for instructors. As the number of learners is increased through online education, more

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Da Young Kong, "비대면 수업시스템 성공요인에 대한 교수자, 학습자, IT 관리자의 인식비교: 상호지향성 모델을 중심으로 [Coorientational Analysis among Distance Learning Systems Users: Instructors, Learners and IT practitioners]" (PhD diss., Korea University, 2021), 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Ibid., 1-2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Ibid., 9.

instructors are required to enrich the program. There are plenty of qualified individuals who majored in worship and can teach diverse topics to Korean worship leaders. The more opportunities for them to teach can be provided, the better the quality of education will be.

#### Statement of the Problem

Although many institutions have already started offering online classes during the pandemic, there are almost no prior studies for online training of worship leaders in Korea.

Understanding potential learners who desire to take online programs and how to teach them is critical to developing more effective strategies.

Numerous worship leaders in Korea need training for their roles but cannot take suitable courses in traditional education methods due to time and space constraints. Only a handful of worship leaders are professionals in Korea since most churches are small to medium in size and cannot afford to hire them. Volunteer worship leaders need short programs as efficiently as possible. This is why most worship schools have offered short-term courses, and online programs should do the same. It is vital to discern what most worship leaders need to equip and how to deliver the ideas in the best possible way to save time.

#### Statement of the Purpose

This project aims to articulate potential aspects of online education applicable to training Korean worship leaders as well as provide appropriate and practical methods for organizations offering online programs. Accordingly, the targets are those who need education for worship leaders in Korea: current worship leaders in local churches and those who may lead worship in the future. There are many Korean immigrant churches worldwide, and the outcome of this study could also apply to their worship leaders. Even though online education is not limited to regional restrictions, this study is geographically limited to Korea to ensure its accuracy.

As this project is focused on providing educational opportunities to as many people as possible, degree programs in higher education will not be covered in this paper. Considering the quality and quantity of education to be covered, short-term online programs cannot be compared to long-term face-to-face programs. Still, online training programs are meaningful if more worship leaders could attend and learn the essential lessons.

## Significance of the Study

Several organizations in Korea have already started online programs for worship leaders due to the COVID-19 pandemic. In order to continue this effort, theoretical backgrounds must be consistently supported. Even though online education is a familiar idea in this era, it has not been studied for worship leader training so far. This project will evaluate relevant points from previous studies on online education in other academic areas, fundamental ideas that every worship leader should understand from preceding works on worship, and the latest online tools applicable to teaching worship leaders.

Suppose an organization attempts to launch a specific online course for Korean worship leaders. In that case, it is necessary to prepare answers to a couple of questions in advance, such as what subjects are suitable for online education to be included and what online tools are proper to be considered. This study could be utilized as a practical resource for the preparation plan to reduce trial and error. Since the primary goal of online education for worship leaders is to expand educational opportunities, the curriculum should consist of basic lessons first. However, if there is a high demand, advanced or long-term courses through online or hybrid methods could also be considered afterward. Ultimately, this study will contribute to revitalizing worship in Korea by producing more qualified worship leaders for local churches.

#### **Research Question and Sub-Questions**

## **Primary Research Question**

- How can an online training program for worship leaders be effectively established in Korea?

#### **Sub Research Questions**

- 1. What are the proper subjects to be addressed in online education for worship leaders in Korea?
  - 2. What are the applicable tools to support online education for worship leaders in Korea?

## Hypothesis

- 1. Considering the characteristics of online education, it may be more advantageous to focus on theoretical education, such as the principles of biblical worship or qualifications of worship leaders, rather than practical education for musical improvement. Online lessons are only available for sight and hearing among the five senses, usually within a very limited bandwidth. Although some music lessons could be designed online, specific musical skills may have constraints in teaching online. Online lessons may also include practical worship leading guidance, ways to cultivate spirituality as a worship leader, and communication methods with team members and the congregation.
- 2. Video lectures are likely to be considered essential for the effective delivery of teaching content, and a platform for online discussion could also be required for the interaction between participants. Text-based discussion and real-time video conversation may be used for more effective communication among participants. Online assignment submission could also help investigate the participants' understanding and achievements.

#### **Definition of Terms**

Online education: A method of teaching that bridges the geographic gap between instructors and learners by using enhanced information and communication technologies such as video tutoring and online conferencing.<sup>42</sup> It is considered more flexible than the traditional face-to-face method since instructors provide learners with training through multiple online tools and learners access learning materials and submit assignments online with ease.<sup>43</sup> It is often called e-learning or distance learning with similar meanings.<sup>44</sup> Electronic devices are essential for using online education.

**A worship leader**: A person who leads a partial or complete section of a worship service at a specific worship gathering such as a church or a small group. This role's primary responsibility includes planning and leading the worship service with music. <sup>45</sup> This role often seems to perform as a lead singer in worship, but the worship leader's most essential role is to lead each worshiper's heart to God's presence rather than just lead singing. <sup>46</sup> Thus, the worship leader should possess a variety of qualities in addition to musical abilities. <sup>47</sup>

**Worship school** refers to any kind of course or program in which students take lessons related to worship. The term "worship school" is often limited to specialized courses

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Nhu Quynh Phan, "A Comparative Study on Factors Affecting Learners' Intention to Continuous Use of Online Learning: Focus on cultural differences between Korea and Vietnam" (PhD diss., Soongsil University, 2020), 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Brown, "Five Principles to Empower," 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Webber, *The Renewal of Sunday Worship*, 386.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Ibid., 387-390.

designed and provided by professional organizations since regular degree programs operated by higher educational institutions typically use their official names. There are various subdivisions such as worshiper school, worship leader school, praise leader school, and worship director academy, depending on the particular subject. It is generally offered as a short-term course.<sup>48</sup>

Traditional Hymn: Korean churches have used a unified hymnal book called *TongIlChanSongGa* in common regardless of the denomination since 1983. <sup>49</sup> This is a remarkable tradition, but it has often caused Korean churches to avoid accepting new worship songs. In Korean churches, the term "hymn" usually means the specific songs listed in that book. *The New 21st Century Hymnal Book*, the revised version of the unified hymn book, was released in 2006, and most churches have officially decided to use the new one. <sup>50</sup> Still, most Korean believers seldom sing the songs newly included in the new hymnal book. Even though the songs are included in the official hymnal book, they are less familiar to the congregation than well-known modern worship songs. Korean churches still prefer the hymns in the previous version but sing them with revised lyrics in the new version. In this paper, traditional hymns refer to the songs in the official hymnal books that have been sung in Korean churches for over decades.

**Modern worship song**: It is also called contemporary worship music or song(s), but this kind of music is not limited to the "contemporary worship style." The music styles that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Kim, "Effective Worship Leaders," 46.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> The Hymn Society of Korea, "The History of Korean Hymns," accessed March 22, 2021, https://hymnkorea.org/53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Ibid.

the terms "modern" or "contemporary" imply may vary depending on the period. Most songs in this category are focused on God and composed for worshipers to sing together. <sup>51</sup> This paper refers to songs that have been introduced to the Korean church congregations and used in their worship services after the beginning of the 21<sup>st</sup> century. It is possible to include some traditional songs or hymns written more than several decades ago if arranged in modern styles.

#### Research Plan

Qualitative and historical research methods are most suitable for this study. There are plentiful resources available but never organized on this topic. The conclusion is expected through the following processes: gathering and organizing pertinent data from existing literature on training worship leaders, evaluating current online programs of primary worship schools in Korea, and analyzing the latest online tools applicable to this subject.

#### Summary

Korean churches have been attempting to renew worship for an extended period in order to overcome the crisis. As the worship style in many churches has been changed, the use of modern worship songs has been increasing regardless of the form of worship. This tendency is because Korean believers have gradually begun to open their minds to modern music. The importance of each worshiper's active participation and response is more emphasized, and modern worship songs effectively invite unbelievers into the place of worship. The worship leader's role has also changed in line with this trend. A worship leader should have various

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Robb Redman, "The Commercial Connection," in *Discerning the Spirits: A Guide to Thinking about Christian Worship Today*, ed. John D. Witvliet, The Calvin Institute of Christian Worship Liturgical Studies (Grand Rapids, MI; Cambridge, U.K.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2003), 75.

qualities to lead the congregation to God's presence with the proper musical tools. Higher educational institutions or individual organizations have founded various specialized programs in Korea to train worship leaders. Many people, however, are unable to attend those classes due to time and space constraints. Even though it also has drawbacks, online education is the best solution to provide more opportunities for potential learners. Most in-person courses for worship leaders have been inevitably transformed into online programs after the outbreak of COVID-19. After the pandemic, online education should be more studied and developed for worship leaders. This project aims to demonstrate how to establish online education for training worship leaders in Korea. Since most Korean worship leaders are volunteers rather than professionals, the training program should be brief and efficient. This project provides the theoretical background to expand online education and eventually contribute to the revitalization of Korean worship.

#### **CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW**

This chapter contains a series of related materials from the precedent literature for this research, consisting of three sections. The first section presents a review of literature that articulates how significant it is to train competent worship leaders for Korean churches. The following section discusses what roles are required for Korean worship leaders to fulfill their responsibilities. The last section observes online education's necessity and effectiveness in training Korean worship leaders.

### The Training Needs for Korean Worship Leaders

There are plenty of resources that indicate the importance of having authentic worship leaders, but on the other hand, it is challenging to find well-prepared worship leaders in local churches. Therefore, it is crucial to articulate the necessity of worship leader training and preceding studies before discussing online methodologies. This section also introduces suggestions for worship schools to educate worship leaders.

Hungry for Worship is an outstanding resource covering various issues encountered in the worship ministry of 21<sup>st</sup>-century churches. Franklin S. Page and L. Lavon Gray bring up ten topics to prompt discussion and more profound thought with a biblical perspective and practical manner.<sup>52</sup> In particular, chapter 4 indicates how to train worship leaders for the changing churches.<sup>53</sup> They emphasize the importance of education for worship leaders as follows: "Those charged with teaching the next generation of worship leaders have an enormous responsibility, and Scripture does not take it lightly ... Our pursuit of the heart of God shapes how we view the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Page and Gray, *Hungry for Worship*, 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Ibid., 71.

world, our art, and our calling. This must not be approached lackadaisically. Worship leaders must lead from the overflow, and educators should do the same."<sup>54</sup>

Page and Gray also offer a positive outlook for the future of worship education. They affirm, "Over the next decade, institutions that teach broad skillset for worship practitioners will be most successful. Those who continue to resist changing will face declining enrollment and the elimination of church music programs." This book provides an overall understanding of the need for worship leader education and suggests what direction worship leader education should take in the future with great ideas.

Jerry L. Newman emphasizes the need for worship leader training in his 2019 research with the purpose of evaluating how pastors and worship pastors can prepare and develop their leadership in musical and theological aspects.<sup>56</sup> He criticizes that some worship pastors recently demonstrate insufficient theological or musical preparations since they enter their job through various channels.<sup>57</sup> He illustrates the urgent need for worship leader education in local churches as follows:

Many worship pastors, although musically proficient, may be inadequately equipped to serve in the areas of pastoral leadership due to lack of training. These shortcomings can be problematic as it can create confusion, frustration, and decreased retention within the local church and ministry team. Breakdown can occur due to theological perplexity and doctrinal misperception. Frustration can be apparent due to ministerial exasperation and congregational disappointment. Finally, decreased retention of a worship leader can be problematic. The abbreviation of tenure is common in worship ministry. In cases where the worship pastor is weak in pastoral leadership and people skills, worship leaders can become isolated from the congregation, and in some cases, completely withdraw from

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Page and Gray, *Hungry for Worship*, 77-78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Ibid., 80.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Jerry L. Newman, "Worship Pastor's Need For Pastoral Leadership Development" (DWS diss., Liberty University, 2019), 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Ibid., 67.

congregational fellowship.58

Chang-Kyun Ahn's dissertation, "Proposals for Improving Worship Leader Education Based on the Analysis of the Current Worship and Praise Services in the Korean Church," is a pioneering study emphasizing worship leader education in Korea. He presents a strategy to vitalize praise and worship services and improve the worship leader academies in Korea by analyzing Korean worship and Christian applied music in higher education in 2005.<sup>59</sup> He insists that praise should be added in addition to the proclamation, education, fellowship, and serving traditionally recognized as the functions of the church.<sup>60</sup> According to Ahn, "praise has not only changed the form of worship in the modern church, but it also restores and encourages the essential responsibility and mission of the church, as well as performs a holistic function."<sup>61</sup>

Ahn affirms that a worship leader must achieve a balance between spirituality and musicality and that such aspects should be reflected in the curriculum to train a worship leader.<sup>62</sup> He suggests a worship school as a specialized educational institution that can enhance the professionalism and functionality of worship leaders at local churches.<sup>63</sup> This study includes a massive amount of information on educational institutions for worship leaders in Korea at that time. Although some data on educational institution status and curriculum have become out of date over time, the author's analysis and solutions to the problems remain relevant today.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Newman, "Worship Pastor's Need," 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Ahn, "Improving Worship Leader Education," 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Ibid., 130.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Ibid., 131.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Ibid., 136-37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Ibid., 143.

Byeong-Man Park majored in church music and theology. After serving as a worship pastor for many years, he is now a senior pastor in several churches. His book, *A Worshiper on a Stage*, offers balanced perspectives on worship ministries as a church musician and a pastor. He emphasizes the need for spiritual and musical training for those in charge of music in the church as follows:

It means that all church musicians who work in the church today must be disciplined with the spiritual and faith training necessary to be holy people of God who serve Him forever, prior to being chosen for their musical talents, or taking musical lessons. Of course, it is important to provide or take musical education from an early age to develop musical talents and to live as church musicians who honor God with their musical gifts. Nevertheless, there is one thing to remember and be done together: training the holy personality in Christ. We believe in God who desires to rejoice and enjoy Himself through music. We cannot please God with cheap music from those who are not spiritually trained and have not properly formed their personalities in faith. That is why all church musicians must be trained spiritually and musically at the same time.<sup>64</sup>

This book does not provide any specific methodology or program but encourages musicians, including worship leaders, to the need for training to serve their job in a local church.

Hyo Seop Kim, in his 2014 research, asserts that there have been various problems caused by worship leaders in Korean churches since senior pastors in Korea tend to focus more on musical talent rather than spiritual maturity in selecting worship leaders. <sup>65</sup> The purpose of this study is to establish an internship program so that Korean senior pastors can examine future worship leaders based on seven vital biblical principles. <sup>66</sup> He stresses, "Selecting a worship leader is a vital role of a senior pastor, and one should thoroughly evaluate every candidate with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Byeong-Man Park, 무대 위의 예배자 [A Worshiper on a Stage] (Seoul, Korea: Vitnara, 2015), 50-51.

<sup>65</sup> Kim, "Effective Worship Leaders," 1-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Ibid., 5.

key biblical principles before hiring. This is significant for senior pastors because hiring is receiving from God, not the people." <sup>67</sup> Kim discovers seven significant values for worship leaders from the Bible; relationship, calling, obedience, integrity, preparation, mission/vision, and recovery/celebration. <sup>68</sup>

Kyuhyuk Lee's thesis, "A Study for Training and Building Up Worship Leaders for Spiritual Maturity and Revival in South Korea," reveals how important the role of a worship leader is and what the required strategies and training are to perform that role. <sup>69</sup> This study surveyed fifty-three worship leaders (twenty-eight ministers as worship leaders and twenty-five lay worship leaders) in Korean churches. <sup>70</sup> He explains the importance of training worship leaders more precisely as follows:

Worship leaders are not just persons who lead the congregation with songs. A worship leader is the person who actively encourages the congregation to engage in God-centered worship and cooperates with the senior pastor and other staff members. Therefore, all worship leaders should understand the importance and roles of worship leaders and train themselves to be equipped with the ability to serve in their ministries. The spiritual maturity of a worship leader has a direct and indirect impact on the spiritual growth and maturity of the congregation. Worship leaders should abandon their passive attitudes and actively train themselves in the presence of God. Through continuous training, they must have an intimate relationship with God by knowing Him more deeply and becoming lifestyle worshipers.<sup>71</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Kim, "Effective Worship Leaders," 63.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Ibid., 81.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Kyuhyuk Lee, "Training and Building up Worship Leaders," 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Ibid., 67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Ibid., 138.

This study is meaningful in emphasizing the necessity of training worship leaders in Korea from the perspective of spiritual maturity and provides a practical training program for worship leaders.

Sung Hee Kim's 2014 dissertation also demonstrates the necessity and effectiveness of training for worship leaders. This study is based on the church that he serves as the senior pastor, located in the metropolitan area, with about 200 attendees. As part of the efforts for the revival of the church, he desires to vitalize the church's praise and worship services through training for worship leaders and all church members. The proposes the social learning theory of Albert Bandura, a Stanford University professor and proponent of social cognitive theory, and a German psychologist Kurt Levin's three-step model of change as a method for worship transformation and revitalization. After multiple efforts, he evaluates this project, including sharing the vision with elders and church leaders, preaching the vision, establishing the committee and the worship team, hosting worship seminars, and providing music lessons. Leventually, Kim stresses the importance of worship education as follows:

When I saw the church members trying to stick to their own religious experiences and traditions persistently, I realized how difficult it is to change their minds. Finally, education is the solution to all these problems. Still, there is a problem of how to develop educational materials in the future, given this reality where education on worship and praise – the essence of the church and the most important aspects to serve God – is very insufficient. I recognized that slow but continuous education eventually leads to change,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Sung Hee Kim, "예배자와 예배인도자 훈련을 통한 찬양예배의 활성화 방안: 신평교회를 중심으로 [A Proposal to Revitalizing the Praise Service through Training the Worshipers and the Worship Leaders: Focusing on Shin Pyung Church]" (ThD diss., Presbyterian College & Theological Seminary, 2013), 2-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Ibid., 59.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Ibid., 70-107.

and that those in the position to educate must be patient.<sup>75</sup>

Since Kim's research focuses more on training all worship-related members in his church than on training worship leaders, it does not deal much with practical methodologies for worship leaders. It indicates the brief history and importance of praise and worship, provides the rationale for the change in worship, and proves that continuous worship education makes a real difference in local churches.

Yung Jae Moon's 2020 research uncovers the development process and application model of the "All Nations Worship and Praise" movement, one of the most well-known and influential praise and worship gatherings in Korea. In this study, he observes the etymological meaning, biblical-theological understanding, and overall history of worship and praise, as well as the history, contribution, and influence of the "All Nations Worship and Praise" movement. <sup>76</sup> He then analyzes over fifty albums from this movement to find the flow of worship music in Korean churches. <sup>77</sup>

This study mainly provides a wide range of information and analysis, such as the history, models, evaluations, and potentialities of worship and praise in Korea. However, it also covers worship education in several sections: First, Moon introduces the early efforts of the movement through worship and praise seminars conducted by inviting famous worship leaders from abroad as main speakers who delivered deep spirituality to the worshipers in Korean churches.<sup>78</sup> Second,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Kim, "Revitalizing the Praise Service," 127.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Yung Jae Moon, "올네이션스 경배와 찬양 운동의 발전과정과 적용모델 연구: 온누리교회를 중심으로 [A Study on the Development Process and Application Model of the All Nations Worship and Praise Movement: Focusing on Onnuri Church]" (ThD diss., Baekseok University, 2019), 5.

<sup>77</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Ibid., 94.

he outlines the history of the Worship and Praise courses that opened as majors at Jeonju University and Yonsei University's United Graduate School of Theology. 79 Third, he suggests a worship school to nurture the worship team, as he has conducted several worship schools, such as a "one-day worship school" and a "Songs of God seminar." 80 He proposes that his worship school models could be planned and implemented according to the conditions of each local church. 81 His worship school model is not only for worship leaders but for all worship team members.

As various researchers addressed above, worship leaders in this era have a great responsibility to lead the congregation into God's presence, while most of them are put into the field without sufficient training. This is why proper training programs for current or future worship leaders are so important. Even though abundant studies emphasize the need for worship leader education, there has been little discussion of online education. Online training programs for worship leaders must be considered to provide more educational opportunities to all who need such education.

## Required Roles for Korean Worship Leaders

To compose the educational content for Korean worship leaders, it is necessary to determine the various roles that worship leaders perform in their place of worship. The detailed roles may differ depending on the classification criteria. This section reviews various resources

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Moon, "All Nations Worship and Praise," 99-100.

<sup>80</sup> Ibid., 207-10.

<sup>81</sup> Ibid., 210-11.

on this topic, from prominent authors on worship studies to Korean scholars who can represent the Korean context.

Vernon M. Whaley, former dean of the Liberty University School of Music, should be cited first when discussing the various roles of a worship leader. According to Stacey Brown, Whaley suggests eighteen roles of the worship leader in his book and online lecture: worshiper, theologian, disciple, professional, artist, musician, servant-leader, pastor, staff member, administrator, team member, teacher, student, counselor, family person, evangelist, mentor, and producer.<sup>82</sup>

Zac Hicks, the writer of *The Worship Pastor*, emphasizes the significant responsibilities of worship leaders to directly influence God's people's lives through worship.<sup>83</sup> He affirms, "Every pastor should consider worship leadership part of their duty, and every worship leader should view their job as fulfilling a pastoral function. Every pastor and worship leader is a worship pastor."<sup>84</sup> From a similar but slightly different perspective than Whaley's, he then explains sixteen qualities of a worship leader: church lover, corporate mystic, doxological philosopher, disciple-maker, prayer leader, theological dietician, war general, watchful prophet, missionary, artist chaplain, caregiver, mortician, emotional shepherd, liturgical architect, curator, and tour guide.<sup>85</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Vernon M. Whaley, *The Role of Worship Leader Workbook* (Virginia Beach: Academx, 2010); Vernon M. Whaley, "Introduction" (Lecture WRSP 820, Liberty University, Lynchburg, online) quoted in Brown, "Five Principles to Empower," 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Zac M. Hicks, *The Worship Pastor: A Call to Ministry for Worship Leaders and Teams* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan, 2016), 13-14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Ibid., 18.

<sup>85</sup> Ibid., 21-192

In his book, *Worship Leaders, We Are Not Rock Stars*, Stephen Miller refers to the phenomenon of modern worship leaders pursuing music and spectacle as the "rock star worship syndrome" and criticizes how the tools of worship are replacing worship itself. <sup>86</sup> He determines the eight roles that worship leaders should have as follows: (1) "The Redeemed and Adopted" indicate their primary identity is as children of God. (2) "Worshipers" reveal the purpose for which they were created. (3) "Pastors and Deacons" represent their privilege and responsibility to teach and serve the people of God. (4) "Theologians" imply that their job is to maintain the doctrines through their music. (5) "Storytellers (Liturgists)" demonstrate that they should carefully design and practice the order of worship to tell the story of God. (6) "Evangelists" display that their role is indeed to preach the gospel through their worship and daily life. (7) "Artists" suggest that they should persistently hone their creativity for worship. (8) "Christians" affirm that they are disciples of Christ like other ordinary believers. <sup>87</sup>

Stacey Brown affirms five essential keys to empower worship leaders based on worship literature and the Bible: (1) The foremost factor is "The Power of Lists," which means the importance of planning and organization for worship leaders. This concept includes a daily walk with God. 88 (2) "The Power of Learning" refers to the fact that worship leaders must receive ongoing education to teach their staff, teams, and congregations properly. 89 (3) As a communicator, worship leaders need "The Power of Lunch," which indicates the relationship with others. 90 (4) "The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Stephen Miller, Worship Leaders, We Are Not Rock Stars (Chicago, IL: Moody Publishers, 2013), 16.

<sup>87</sup> Ibid., 26-28.

<sup>88</sup> Brown, "Five Principles to Empower," 73.

<sup>89</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Ibid., 74.

Power of Love" means that worship leaders must appreciate their love for God, themselves, their family, and other people. 91 (5) "The Power of Legacy" implies that worship leaders must desire to pass on their vision and accomplishments to the next generation. 92

Brown also discovers two significant commonalities after examining the various ideas of prior studies related to the role of worship leaders: First, the roles of the worship leader are not different regardless of the size or worship style of the church, as well as his or her educational level or field experience. Second, the duties required of a worship leader are the most complex and demanding compared to other positions in the church. 4

The Complete Worship Leader by Kevin J. Navarro is an excellent guide for all who may be called worship leaders to understand and pursue their role in the church. It contains biblical foundations for various qualities that worship leaders should possess and practical advice they may encounter at their workplaces. As Navarro insists, "The worship service is the most important event in the local church and the engine that drives all programming. Church health depends on what happens in that experience.... Worship is the reason for the existence of the church." He emphasizes the necessity of a worship leader for the success of worship. He suggests four elements that a worship leader should prepare: theology, discipleship, artistry, and leadership. Although these four requirements cannot be regarded as sufficient conditions for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Brown, "Five Principles to Empower," 74.

<sup>92</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Ibid., 21.

<sup>94</sup> Ibid.

<sup>95</sup> Navarro, The Complete Worship Leader, 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Ibid., 14.

<sup>97</sup> Ibid.

becoming a worship leader, they are meaningful in presenting the essential parts with insightful ideas for worship leaders.

Ron Kenoly determines four qualities that every worship leader must have, referring to his experience of being asked to recommend someone to lead congregational worship. He insists that a worship leader must (1) be a chief musician who has sufficient vocal skills to deliver a pleasant mood to the congregation, adequate communication skills for music with other singers and musicians, and good management skills to put the right people in the right place; (2) be an excellent vocal leader who can sing on pitch in clean melodies for the congregation, encourage worshipers to be willing to join the celebration to God, wear appropriate attire to make a positive first impression on people, and reflect the church and the pastor; (3) be an administrator who can design and adjust timetables and rotations, recognize and obey the vision and mission of the church leadership, and serve diverse roles in the church; (4) have pastoral skills to convey a heart of love for the people with balanced and effective manners in addition to the musical capability. Kenoly continues to explore eight keys for an effective worship leader to lead other people in the remainder of his book: leadership, knowledge, testimony, prayer, boldness, skill, sensitivity, and organization. Sequence of the people with the remainder of his book: leadership, knowledge, testimony, prayer, boldness, skill, sensitivity, and organization.

Thomas Christopher Gonzales indicates that the tenure of worship pastors in Contemporary Western Protestant Evangelicalism (CWPE) is relatively short compared to other positions, and worship pastors' absence or frequent shifts cause collateral damage to

<sup>98</sup> Ron Kenoly, The Effective Praise & Worship Leader (Panama City, FL: Parsons Publishing House, 2008), 1-6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Ibid., 7-68.

congregational worship and the spiritual formation of the church. 100 His 2020 research aims to help the pastoral-ministerial search committee find qualified worship pastors for efficiency and longevity. 101 He determines the qualifications of a worship pastor in terms of biblical principles, theological indications, and the demands of CWPE as follows: In the biblical perspective, a worship pastor is a professional musician and music teacher for the church and motivates believers with pastoral care. 102 A worship pastor's role includes counseling, weddings, funerals, hospital visitations, discipleship, and evangelism, as Pauline theology addresses. 103 Gonzales then implies that "his educating, counseling characterizes the worship pastor's influence, and shepherding the congregation. In addition to other pastoral staff members, he is a resident educator, theologian, and counselor." <sup>104</sup> Gonzales also introduces the four standard qualifications of the worship pastor that most CWPE churches expect: "accredited and conferred higher education, minimum years of experience met, professional and administrative proficiency, and unquestionable character and positive attitude." 105 Even if his study is based on a specific denomination, the outcome could be applied to other churches. In addition, it provides a comprehensive list of schools in the United States that offer worship studies as undergraduate, master's, and doctoral programs. 106

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Thomas Christopher Gonzales, "Begin with Worship Pastor Longevity in Mind: A Biblical Guide for the Evangelical Worship Pastor Search Committee" (DWS diss., Liberty University, 2020), 1-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Ibid., 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Ibid., 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Ibid., 12.

<sup>104</sup> Ibid.

 $<sup>^{105}</sup>$  R. Albert Mohler, A *Guide to Church Revitalization* (Louisville, KY: SBTS Press, 2015), 1, quoted in Gonzales, "Begin with Worship Pastor," 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> Gonzales, "Begin with Worship Pastor," 56-59.

Dawn H. Cochran's 2020 research states that "the worship leader must demonstrate the essential qualities necessary to engage others to serve in the worship ministry." <sup>107</sup> She explains four significant qualities for worship leaders: character, capability, commitment, and chemistry as follows:

The quality of character is a representation of one's spiritual walk that exhibits integrity through his/her actions and attitudes. A person of character is one who displays transparency and encouragement in relationships with others.

The quality of capability is directly linked with leadership in areas such as musicianship and biblical and intellectual knowledge. A worship leader should display an attitude that he/she has the ability to lead others with confidence and intentionality.

The quality of commitment is evidenced in every area of the worship leader's life. Areas include his/her personal life, spiritual life, all levels of ministry and interpersonal relationships with staff, congregants, and personal relationships.

The quality of chemistry envelops the ability of connection and influence with others. This type of leader draws others to him/herself and brings out the best qualities of others. Chemistry involves a type of magnetism that creates an atmosphere for love and trust to thrive. 108

She also affirms that "three specific characteristics of the worship leader that help to promote congregational engagement include: serving in the role of a shepherd, a counselor and fostering friendships with ministry team members." 109

Greg Scheer's book, *The Art of Worship: A Musician's Guide to Leading Modern Worship*, contains practical advice for contemporary worship teams or bands to develop their skills in various contexts. In addition, the author also explains the several debates on blended worship and how to plan the service effectively: "There are three fundamental methods used to blend traits of these worship models: modernizing style, substituting elements, and combining

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Cochran, "The Qualities of the Worship Leader," 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Ibid., 66-67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Ibid., 87.

structures. We will focus primarily on the blending of Experiential model traits into Liturgical and Thematic structures, as this is the most frequently used technique." The author distinguishes four types of worship leaders: the conductor, the cheerleader, the entertainer, and the enlivener. He also argues, "Though it is theoretically possible for a congregation to sing together without a leader, the Praise & Worship style usually requires up-front leadership of some sort. This does not mean that the worship leader should focus on the congregation's attention; it simply means they know where to look if they need help.... The worship leader's role is to help the congregation sing." This conclusion is simple and clear to define what a worship leader is and why this position is needed. A worship leader should learn the proper knowledge and attitude to help the people of God worship.

Hyuk Choi's *Praise Leader* is an early resource for Korean worship leaders that contains plentiful suggestions and practical ideas to lead praise and worship. He defines a worship leader as (1) a spiritual and musical shepherd, (2) the one who leads the congregation into the presence of God, and (3) a worshiper.<sup>113</sup> He also highlights the need for worship leader training in both spiritual and musical aspects as follows: First, the spiritual power of the worship leader can be developed through Bible study and a variety of prayers, as well as often delivered at meetings filled with the Holy Spirit.<sup>114</sup> Second, the musical ability of the worship leader can be supported by praise and worship theory, music theory, music practice, worship leading practice, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Greg Scheer, *The Art of Worship: A Musician's Guide to Leading Modern Worship* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2006), 101

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Ibid., 207-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Ibid., 208-9.

<sup>113</sup> Hyuk Choi, 찬양리더 [Praise Leader] (Seoul, Korea: Kyujang, 1999), 52-53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Ibid., 54-57.

knowledge of the sound systems. In addition, understanding music psychology and popular psychology will make the worship ministry more effective. 115

In his 2007 study, Choon-Geun Yang observes various aspects of music ministry related to worship in the Korean church. He argues that the reason for the negative growth of the Korean church is that the essence of worship is missed, especially in the confusion of worship music. 116

The purpose of this dissertation is to prove the necessity of a music ministry system for the revitalization of worship in Korean churches and devise a method to revitalize worship through music ministry. 117 He divides the qualifications of the music minister into external and internal aspects: External qualification means that a music minister must be a musical leader and a pastor at the same time. In other words, a music minister must have adequate training in both music and theology. As for internal qualifications, a music minister must have a sense of calling from God, a right relationship with God, an attitude to strive for self-development constantly, musical and spiritual leadership, and administrative ability. 118

Yang defines the role of the music minister in four ways: as a spiritual leader, a musician, a teacher, and a church music administrator. He emphasizes that music is essential to revitalizing Christian worship because music has essentially the same characteristics as the Christian culture, such as nonobjectivity, temporality, and dynamism. Since Christianity and music have something in common, worship without music becomes hard and dry, and music

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Choi, *Praise Leader*, 57-61.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Choon-Geun Yang, "한국교회 예배활성화를 위한 음악목회의 역할 [The Role of Music Ministry for Revitalization of Worship in Korean Churches]" (DCM diss., Hansei University, 2006), 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Ibid., 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Ibid., 45-63.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Ibid., 63-72.

enriches worship and activates vitality. <sup>120</sup> He proposes three points to vitalize worship; organizing a worship team, attempting a new worship style, and transforming to blended worship. <sup>121</sup>

Although Yang's study is mainly based on traditional church music, the result of this study is also applicable to modern worship leaders because his perspective is not limited to it and is open to new worship styles such as blended worship. While this study was written more than a decade ago, it is still relevant today as it provides essential guidance for those who lead worship with musical means.

Seong sil Jo's 2017 study indicates why the pastor's musical ability is essential and how to strengthen it through suitable education. He asserts that strengthening the pastor's musical ability helps to vitalize the church ministry. He defines the role of the pastor in worship as follows:

The pastor has the authority and responsibility to select songs to be sung in the worship service beyond simply leading the songs in worship. It is also the role of the pastor to design appropriate songs to be sung in the worship service according to the church calendar and the biblical text. For this role, the pastor must have a biblical and theological perspective on church music, which is called music theology or praise theology.<sup>122</sup>

In this study, Jo maintains five musical roles that a protestant pastor should have: a worship leader, a praise leader, a music educator, a music administrator, and a mission mobilizer. 123 He then points out the importance of a pastor having both pastoral and musical

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Yang, "The Role of Music Ministry," 78-80.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Ibid., 85-103.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Jo, "Strengthening Musical Ability of Pastor," 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Ibid., 55-60.

competencies regardless of background, by critically presenting the music courses in seminaries and the ministry courses in the church music major in parallel. 124 He argues that all pastors must receive a minimal musical education, and a minimal theological education must be provided to those who major in music and will serve the church. 125

This study is basically focused on typical pastors rather than worship leaders. However, many pastors in Korean churches serve as worship leaders <sup>126</sup>, and lay worship leaders must have a pastoral mind <sup>127</sup>. Thus, what this study delivers would be applied to worship leader education as well. In addition, Jo also suggests the cultivation of pastors specializing in church music and the development of lay leaders in worship music. <sup>128</sup>

Aesra Kim's 2018 study emphasizes the importance of training worship leaders to overcome the various problems inherent in contemporary worship. She asserts that educational institutions that nurture professional worship leaders must be expanded and developed, as well as preparation, education, and support for the worship leaders in each local church should be provided since many worship leaders in Korean churches lack an understanding of contemporary worship and praise. <sup>129</sup> Based on the results of in-depth interviews with three worship leaders and three preachers on various questions about worship leaders, contemporary worship, and worship

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Jo, "Strengthening Musical Ability of Pastor," 61-102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Ibid., 138-40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Ibid., 51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Ibid., 53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Ibid., 109-12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Aesra Kim, "현대예배 찬양인도자 리더십 강화를 위한 방안 연구 [A Study on Enhancing Leadership for Contemporary Worship Leaders]" (PhD diss., Baekseok University, 2018), 1-4.

art, <sup>130</sup> as well as on the analysis of the curriculums that higher education institutions offer for worship leaders in the United States, <sup>131</sup> she suggests a curriculum model that strengthens the leadership of worship leaders in four key aspects: Bible, influence, music, and leadership. <sup>132</sup>

Kim's research contributes to establishing an educational curriculum for worship leaders in Korean churches by introducing and organizing the current efforts of worship education institutions in the United States. It does not cover the institutions in Korea, but the in-depth interview with several Korean ministers helps to understand the reality and needs of the Korean churches and Korean worship leaders in detail.

As explored above, the roles of the worship leader can be classified in various ways depending on the researcher's experience and intention. Whether he or she has divided them into a few key aspects or more than a dozen details, it implies that a worship leader's to-do list will be broad and intense in any church. Nobody can fulfill all of these responsibilities appropriately without proper training. Besides, these roles should be carefully considered when defining the specific topics for lectures in the online programs.

## Online Training Ideas for Korean Worship Leaders

Various online education methods have been steadily developing with the growth of information technology in this century, and the need for them has been rapidly demanded due to the global spread of COVID-19. 133 As mentioned in chapter one, a few organizations in Korea have already launched online programs for worship leaders, and appropriate studies are needed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Kim, "Leadership for Contemporary Worship Leaders," 133-75.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Ibid.," 176-89.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> Ibid., 189-200.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> Kong, "Coorientational Analysis," 1-2.

to ensure that these efforts continue to grow. Although numerous studies on online education and its effects have increased in recent years, there is no direct study on online education for worship leaders. Since it is impossible to review the extensive literature on general online education, priority is given to materials directly or indirectly related to online church education. Also, several online tools available for worship leader training are evaluated in this section.

Jae Deog Yu broadly diagnoses and evaluates the future of church education after the pandemic caused by COVID-19 in his article, "Church Education in the COVID-19 Era." He warns that church education is almost extinct, unlike public education in the pandemic, and identifies the effects of the pandemic into three types: globalization is declining, digital culture is accelerated, and accordingly, the education system is changing. 134 He then presents the following crises that the church must overcome in the post-coronavirus era: First, it is becoming difficult for the church to survive unless it adapts to the digital culture. While many churches are still hesitant to migrate to the virtual world, believers no longer find it awkward to access online services. 135 Second, the church needs to respond appropriately to the sudden decline of authority. He asserts that the collapse of the existing order inevitably follows after the pandemic, just as the outbreak of the Black Death affected the success of Luther's Reformation. 136 Third, church consolidation will increase due to declining membership and financial problems. 137 Fourth, the traditional culture of the church will either disappear or be wholly transformed, and the church

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Kong, "Coorientational Analysis," 16-22.

<sup>135</sup> Ibid., 22-23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Ibid., 23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> Yu, "Church Education," 23-24.

space will be rearranged. Friendly greetings with physical contact are becoming uncomfortable, and larger spaces will be needed for social distancing. 138

In conclusion, Yu suggests the future direction of church education in the post-pandemic era as follows: First, the educational space should be developed as a convergence model that appropriately reflects the different characteristics of offline and online, such as a mobile church school operated by multiple churches in the same region or denomination. <sup>139</sup> Second, it is necessary to introduce a blended learning model at the local church level, a form of distance education that integrates various media and methodologies with traditional lectures and online materials. <sup>140</sup> Third, homeschooling is a possible method to connect the church school with families. <sup>141</sup> Fourth, the traditional approach of teacher-centered or learner-centered models must be advanced with the truth community by subject-centered models. <sup>142</sup>

Since this study focuses on Sunday school education, in contrast to elementary and secondary education, it does not directly respond to worship leader education, primarily for adults. Still, it is significant because it presents an overall guideline for church education in preparation for the world after the pandemic.

Nakjung Kim's 2021 study is on the practice of online worship at Korean churches in the Northern Virginia area. He evaluates existing online education approaches to cultivate online

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Yu, "Church Education," 24-25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> Ibid., 27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Ibid., 27-28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Ibid., 28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> Ibid., 28-29.

worship. <sup>143</sup> He insists, "One of the common challenges of online education is preparing with appropriate tools and skills to operate, which applies to both students and instructors. Those who are neglected from such sources are likely to have struggles in getting a proper education." <sup>144</sup> He also maintains, "Online education needs to be well planned in terms of schedule and time management.... Because online education is predisposed to being initiated voluntarily, with no inspector or supervisor, participants' spontaneity is required to manage educational times." <sup>145</sup> Finally, he emphasizes interactive communication with instructors and learners in online education. <sup>146</sup>

In his article "How Do We Gather Now?" Bryan Cones addresses the efforts to continue worship services for Episcopal churches through the online communication tool called Zoom in the COVID-19 pandemic when the church members cannot meet in the same place of worship.<sup>147</sup>

He reveals the limitations of virtual worship given the liturgical principle as follows: "the primary symbol of the liturgy is the gathered assembly itself, which refracts grace in its gathering and movement, its word and song, it is washing in baptism, and it is sharing the eucharistic meal at the common table. In the absence of actual bodies, such a symbol seemed impossible." 148

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> Nakjung Kim, "A Study on the Essence of Worship in Online Worship Groups under COVID-19 Pandemic: Focus on Korean Ministers in the Northern Virginia Area" (DWS diss., Liberty University, 2021), 54.

<sup>144</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> Ibid., 55.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> Ibid., 55-56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> Bryan Cones, "How do we Gather Now?" *The Christian Century* (1902) 137, no. 18 (08, 2020): 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Ibid., 23.

Cones discovers some unexpected advantages that he found after using Zoom for his church. First, participants can see each other's faces rather than the backs of their heads when they gather online. He determines that "the ten minutes we give to gathering and greeting one another helps to build the relational component that shifts a group from a social gathering to an assembly ready to do its work." Second, all members in Zoom have a horizontal relationship. He describes the experience in Zoom as follows:

What's more, in the absence of table, bread, wine, water, and font, that primary symbol of the liturgy-the assembly-has no competitors. Yes, without gathering in person, that symbol is limited in the shapes it can reveal. Yet the absence of the building and its hierarchical sorting of people – pews for some, chairs for leaders, all in greater or lesser proximity to the table – also serves to level the assembly: on Zoom, everyone gets the same box. My collar might mark me as presider, but most screens only show a few people at a time anyway and won't always show me. I may speak more often than most, but when I am not leading prayer, my image settles among the rest. <sup>150</sup>

Third, the church members can participate more actively not only with voice but also with chat. He illustrates this phenomenon as follows: "The chat box chirps here and there with thanks to the leaders or responses to the readings and preaching. During the prayers of the people, it hums with specific intentions during the longer-than-usual silences built into the prayers." <sup>151</sup>

Cones also displays the limitations of using Zoom. Since close contact or intimate interaction is not possible in remote meetings, most Zoom activities are word-based. 

Moreover, there are usually many challenges to practicing communion online, even though some

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Cones, "How do we Gather Now," 23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Ibld.

<sup>151</sup> Ibid.

<sup>152</sup> Ibid.

try a kind of "home eucharist" with their own family. <sup>153</sup> In conclusion, Cones summarizes the worship activities through Zoom as follows:

This online service has become the people's work, and I am noticing that members are taking up roles that they might not try out in person. They seem more willing to share their own unique contribution to the gathered symbol of the assembly, including suggesting alterations to our prayer. Our prayer book didn't anticipate an event like this (how could it?), and this seems to have released any constraint people had regarding common prayer. We are diving into something like the ordered liberty of the Reformed traditions, with more emphasis on the liberty than ever before. And I suspect that the expansion of leadership and voices will influence our common prayer when we gather again, too. 154

Kyle Kenneth Schiefelbein-Guerrero discusses worship, church, and sacrament from a theological and historical perspective during quarantine due to COVID-19, while many other prior studies have taken a pragmatic approach to online worship. <sup>155</sup> He insists that online classes and whole-person formation do not contradict one another since the online environment certainly affects the physical and mental aspects of the users. <sup>156</sup> He also points out that while the online relationship can be described as "low stakes," the church's online environment can be understood as "high stakes," as it is an alternative to a temporary situation where face-to-face contact is not possible. <sup>157</sup> He identifies the difference between livestreaming and web conferencing as follows:

When it comes to using video-based technology to broadcast online, two terms usually appear: livestream and web conference. Although both of these practices use webcams and microphones, their level of interactivity is quite different. The livestreaming approach is unidirectional, which is how one currently watches television and YouTube. The broadcaster creates the material, and those who watch consume the material. Participation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> Cones, "How do we Gather Now," 23-24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> Ibid., 24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> Kyle Kenneth Schiefelbein-Guerrero, "Whether One May Flee from Digital Worship: Reflections on Sacramental Ministry in a Public Health Crisis," *Dialog: A Journal of Theology* 59, no. 2 (06, 2020): 49.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> Ibid., 50.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>157</sup> Ibid.

at best is passive and could be analogous to a pre-Reformation understanding of the mass. The main role of the worshiper is to watch at the important moments, while simultaneously engaging in their own devotional practices. Livestreaming (and admittedly web conferencing if the feature is enabled) allows for recording, meaning those unable to participate at the scheduled time could join in when they are able, but this can increase the individualism present in contemporary society today.... The web conferencing approach is bidirectional and multidirectional. It allows for both proclamation and response through the same online tool, which is not the case with livestreaming. The "congregation" is part of the interactivity just as the worship leaders. This better simulates the dialogical nature of Lutheran worship that I defined earlier. 158

The article "Online Teaching and Biblical Studies" contains valuable information and assessments on online education for biblical studies presented by several Bible scholars. Richard Ascough examines the benefits of online education, based on his experience for two decades teaching online, blended, and face-to-face courses at Loyola University and Queen's University. First, he discusses how to establish practical discussions online. He set up his online introductory course primarily asynchronous discussion so that his students from all over North America in different time zones could jump in and out of the discussion anytime. This idea could also be helpful for busy people who find it difficult to arrange appointments in the same time zone. He advises on the online discussion tips as follows:

What did I learn? In using interactive activities online, I learned that being quickly responsive to students is very important. They want to hear back from the professor. They want feedback to know that they're doing things correctly. And in an asynchronous environment, this is a little harder to do because you don't know when you're going to receive those kinds of messages. To mitigate this a bit, I ensured that during every activity, students were in small groups of six or seven. I assigned one person in each group as moderator and another as summarizer, so that I didn't have to do all the responding. The moderator's job was to encourage those who were participating with affirmations, and to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> Schiefelbein-Guerrero, "Flee from Digital Worship," 50-51.

 $<sup>^{159}</sup>$  Richard Ascough et al., "Online Teaching and Biblical Studies," Teaching Theology & Religion 21, no. 2 (04, 2018): 120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> Ibid., 121.

cajole and provoke those who were not actively participating into getting involved. 161

Second, Ascough emphasizes that online learning allows students to participate with greater autonomy in their learning. He indicates, "Students respond well to the idea that they can have control over their learning, guided by a content expert, but with enough latitude that they can bring their research and ideas into each conversation." He also points out the importance of developing online lecture materials, including videos, podcasts, and asynchronous discussion formats. Third, Ascough advises that an instructor needs to prepare for sudden changes in both face-to-face and online classes because the students' interests and passions can often drive the learning process successfully. 164

Ruth Anne Reese discovers how to enhance spiritual formation through online education. She insists that "teaching online is a constant opportunity for learning. Trying, evaluating, and reforming are parts of the ongoing work of teaching. What works in the online classroom may or may not also work in the on-campus classroom and vice versa." She illustrates the limitations of online classes as follows:

However, there were some very real differences caused by format. First, the forums were asynchronous, so people would write out their responses and leave them for others to read at a later time. There was no immediate feedback or response to their questions. Second, people did not share as openly with people they could not see. Third, it quickly became apparent that these groups were simply viewed as a task that had to be completed. They were not producing the kind of formational community experience I had hoped for. Eventually, I did away with that portion of the class because it was not effective in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> Ascough et al., "Online Teaching and Biblical Studies," 123.

<sup>162</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>164</sup> Ibid., 124.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>165</sup> Ibid.

producing community formation. Unfortunately, this class was eliminated from the curriculum, and so I didn't have the opportunity to find a way to replace that piece. 166

Reese then shares a successful example of online education from her experience when she taught the "Biblical Narrative" course, which was provided both in face-to-face and online classes. She describes the practice of the course as follows: "Along with papers that ask students to engage with canonical and thematic material, they are also required to complete a lectio divina exercise. This gives them an explicit opportunity to read in ways that attend to the way the text is speaking to them as individuals." The following assessment is her analysis of the online teaching experience:

What's really interesting to me there is that there's no difference in terms of the response between my online students and my face-to-face students. They both find it an enjoyable, beneficial, formative experience. My evaluation as a teacher is that it is a good spiritual discipline for my students and one that they find rewarding and beneficial. At the same time, I'm also aware that it is a very individual experience. In contrast to the first course I described where I was experimenting with small groups of four or five people meeting together, I now have individuals reading the text in a way that is formational, but which is not communal. I'm continuing to think about what I might do in terms of course assignments and activities to promote more formation in community. <sup>168</sup>

Ahida Calderón Pilarski emphasizes the evaluation methods for online classes. She provides a brief overview of the online teaching methods at her college, in which proper support is provided for those who are developing online courses. <sup>169</sup> She indicates that the discussion

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> Ascough et al., "Online Teaching and Biblical Studies," 125.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> Ibid.

<sup>168</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> Ibid., 126.

forum is the best method to improve students' critical skills, and the forum should include two essential components: guidelines and a rubric for evaluation. <sup>170</sup>

Eric D. Barreto asserts that pedagogy, formation, and identity are more essential aspects of teaching online than technique and technology. <sup>171</sup> He continually maintains, "The gift and challenge of online teaching are that it forces us to learn anew what it means to teach. The best online teaching requires a rebuilding of our assumptions, skills, and aims. Teaching online is not just a matter of translation but a transformation of pedagogy." <sup>172</sup> He acknowledges that online education has some disadvantages compared to traditional methods, but it also has excellent advantages. <sup>173</sup>

The final part of this article also contains a discussion among those scholars that provides meaningful insights about online education. Barreto suggests that online education should be considered for those who do better online than attending residential classes a few times a week. 174 Steve Delamarter insists that the online environment is fundamentally equitable for the following reasons: "This is often experienced very positively by people who are internal processors, rather than verbal processors. Some women and persons of color report that they experience the online environment as easier. Everyone's megaphone is the same wattage. The verbal processors, or persons who in other ways consume social spaces, cannot dominate the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> Ascough et al., "Online Teaching and Biblical Studies," 126.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Ibid., 128.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> Ibid., 128-29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Ibid., 130.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> Ibid.

environment so much."<sup>175</sup> Ascough agrees with Delamarter as he states his experience as follows: "I had a student who was visually impaired taking an online course in our theology program. I knew this ahead of time since I had to ensure that everything was legible for her text reader, but nobody else in the course knew of her impairment at first."<sup>176</sup>

Pilarski admits that she better understands her students online than in her face-to-face classes since her online classes have fewer students than regular ones. Moreover, more outspoken extroverts do not have more opportunities to speak online than others. The also describes the difficulties of preparing for online classes: "For example, it is very time consuming to make video lectures. They are generally no more than 10 minutes in length, but I needed to develop thirty lectures for my course. It takes time – and expertise – to record them properly and edit them. It took me ten tries to record a video that I felt comfortable with, and it was a couple of days' work for me to produce a ten-minute video." The students of the produce of the produce a ten-minute video." The students of the produce of the produ

Victor K. Lai defines three types of online education in his article "Pandemic-Driven Online Teaching: The Natural Setting for a Flipped Classroom?" as follows:

In general, online teaching can be classified broadly in the following ways: (1) fully online and synchronous, where students log in to a video conferencing platform at set class times during the week; (2) fully online but asynchronous, where students access posted lecture materials at their own time; or (3) a hybrid model, which is a mix of synchronous and asynchronous classes, e.g., students meet online at a set time only once a week and watch prerecorded videos for the rest of the week. Note that these classifications are for fully online lecture classes only and do not include teaching models that involve some form of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> Ascough et al., "Online Teaching and Biblical Studies," 130.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Ibid., 131.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> Ibid., 135.

in-person instruction or courses with a laboratory component. 179

He maintains that students' fatigue, anxiety, and depression are increasing as they take online classes through Zoom for a long time, and instructors are also complaining of difficulties in preparing for online lectures due to the sudden change in the distant learning environment, as well as having a hard time with their families during the long-standing telecommuting situation. He then emphasizes that "technological issues such as poor internet and software proficiency aside, one of the biggest challenges for instructors is maintaining student interest and engagement in their courses." 181

After attempting his methods to improve students' online learning experiences, Lai discovers some key ideas for online classes: First, students who turn on cameras during class are more engaged, but it is better to do it voluntarily than to make it mandatory. Second, breakout rooms are necessary for online classes and should be enhanced even if some students are reluctant to participate in online activities. He conveys several potential suggestions to consider for building online student groups: (1) Students should choose their groups as long as minorities are not excluded. (2) It is possible to switch up breakout groups periodically all over the semester. (3) Students may choose to join a group or work alone, although Lai implies that students who study alone tend to have lower learning outcomes than those who belong to a group, from his own experience. Third, sharing screens with students is very helpful in online classes, especially when specialized software is used. Fourth, in addition to traditional exams,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>179</sup> Victor K. Lai, "Pandemic-Driven Online Teaching: The Natural Setting for a Flipped Classroom?" *Journal of Biomechanical Engineering* 143, no. 12 (2021).

<sup>180</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> Ibid.

problem-based learning or collaborative exams can improve student performance. However, it is not certain whether these are more effective in online classes. 182

In conclusion, Lai summarizes his opinions on online classes as follows:

First, while an overwhelming number of students strongly prefer in-person instruction over online learning, several students have benefited from the flexibility afforded by online learning. A potential option would be to offer an online section of the same class to accommodate students for whom traveling to campus may be inconvenient or may experience conflicts with work or personal schedules. Second, holding more online office hours may encourage more students to seek help when they can access instructor/TA help from home. However, online office hours for this class were poorly attended compared to in-person office hour attendance in previous semesters. Hence, it is unclear if students will utilize the convenience of online office hours. Finally, the availability of recorded lectures over the past year could allow for better resource sharing between faculty, not just within the same institution but also collaboratively with other institutions. ... Hence, now armed with some knowledge and experience with online teaching and without the unexpected stress of a sudden pivot from a pandemic, it may be prudent for instructors to continue to consider effective strategies for online teaching to adapt to this changing landscape. <sup>183</sup>

Ko-Woon Yeon's 2013 research determines diverse characteristics of the online discussion process. She admits that online discussions occur in a text-based virtual space via a computer, unlike the conventional face-to-face discussions via voice. 184 She identifies several benefits and drawbacks of using online discussions. The educational effects of online discussion include that: (1) it helps to improve the logical discussion skills of the discussion participants because they can visually find the well-organized opinions of other members; (2) it provides an optimal environment for reviewing one's perception of the given topic and gathering criticism from others, and (3) it enables many-to-many communication without physical obstacles and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> Lai, "Pandemic-Driven Online Teaching."

<sup>183</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> Ko-Woon Yeon, "App 기반과 Web 기반 온라인 토론수업의 학습효과 연구 [A Study on the Learning Effects in App-Based and Web-Based Online Debate Conferencing]" (PhD diss., Kwandong University, 2013), 33.

expands equal opportunities for participation.<sup>185</sup> On the other hand, the possible downsides involve that: (1) participants who lack reading or writing skills may feel rejected; (2) the participation and achievement of learners may be affected concerning anonymity; (3) computer literacy may affect participation in discussions; and (4) uninhibited behavior and exacerbation problems may occur during the discussion.<sup>186</sup>

Yeon also distinguishes between synchronous and asynchronous online discussions:

Synchronous online discussion refers to communication in which messages are exchanged simultaneously through online tools. It has several advantages, such as immediate reaction and feedback, uninterrupted conversation, and the formulation of a sense of community among participants. Its disadvantages include that it requires fast typing and the ability to understand the context, and that participants possibly tend to engage perfunctorily rather than assert logically structured ideas. In an asynchronous online discussion, participants can join in the discussion at any time and review the recorded conversation repeatedly. Also, they can browse or edit the materials to feel less pressure during the conversation. However, participants may feel isolated since immediate responses and feedback are complicated, and one's own opinions can be presented without real-time reactions from others. They often tend to offer their opinions without adequate review, even when they have enough time to do so. Iso In short, asynchronous online discussions are suitable for learning activities that are task-oriented and require deep thinking.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> Yeon, "Online Debate Conferencing," 35-36.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>186</sup> Ibid., 36-37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> Ibid., 37-40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> Ibid., 40-41.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> Ibid., 41.

Another implication of Yeon's research is that app-based and web-based platforms are evaluated separately in online education. It should be noted, in particular, the importance of an app-based approach as smartphone use grows. 190

The results of Da Young Kong's 2021 study reveal the difference in perceptions of instructors, learners, and IT managers about the success factors of Distance Learning Systems (DLS). <sup>191</sup> In this research, she examines representative online platforms widely used worldwide and applicable to online education, such as Zoom, Google Hangouts/Meet, Webex by Cisco, Microsoft Teams, RemoteMeeting, Skype, Naver Band Live, and Kakao Live Talk. <sup>192</sup> She then derives eleven success factors from prior studies: quality of class contents, IT department support services, system quality of hardware and network, class preparation function support, class management function support, communication function support, online DLS education and training, the brand image of online DLS, willingness to support the school's online DLS, user propensity for IT technology, and the willingness of users to participate. <sup>193</sup> The result of a survey of 91 professors, 234 learners, and 104 IT managers implies that the highest priorities of success factors are system quality of hardware and network, quality of class content, and IT department support services, even though the detailed ranking is slightly different depending on the group of instructors, learners, and IT managers. <sup>194</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Yeon, "Online Debate Conferencing," 89-90.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> Kong, "Coorientational Analysis," 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> Ibid., 11-16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup> Ibid., 62.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> Ibid., 143-44.

According to Junghoon Leem, Mihwa Kim, and Sehyun Lee, the sudden transition to online classes without sufficient preparation during the COVID-19 era has increased skepticism about university education. <sup>195</sup> Their 2021 study aims to create and provide a model of class design procedure and steps when a university education provider needs to conduct distance classes in the midst of the current pandemic. <sup>196</sup> The outcomes of their study present the five stages of the online education process: "online instructional analysis and preparation," "online instructional design," "online instructional materials and content development," "online implementation," and "online instructional evaluation and reflection." <sup>197</sup> These five phases can be continuously repeated and circulated, with the content being adjusted and enhanced throughout the cycle. <sup>198</sup> They also distinguish the typical categories of online classes as follows:

In general, the types of non-face-to-face online classes are roughly divided into content utilization classes and real-time interactive classes, and each is divided into three categories: lecture type, activity-based type, and lecture with activity type. For example, a real-time interactive class can be conducted as a lecture type based on the instructor's explanation, or an activity type such as team discussion or problem-solving activities among learners. The class may be operated in the form of an appropriate mixture of the two. However, there is a limit to the activity-based class method in the content utilization class, because, in a non-real-time class, it is difficult for learners' activities such as discussions, projects, experiments, and practice to be officially included in the class time, as well as almost impossible for instructors to monitor them. Therefore, non-face-to-face online classes can be classified into three types: content utilization classes, real-time interactive classes, and a mix of the two. In the case of a real-time interactive class, it is a

<sup>195</sup> Junghoon Leem, Mihwa Kim, and Sehyun Lee, "코로나 일상 시대의 대학 비대면 수업을 위한 온라인 수업설계 모형 개발 [Development of an Online Instructional Design Model for Higher Education in the Era with COVID-19]," *The Journal of Educational Information and Media* 27, no. 1 (03, 2021): 282.

<sup>196</sup> Ibid., 290.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> Ibid., 297-302.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>198</sup> Ibid., 302.

realistic solution to divide it into a lecture type and an activity type. 199

At the request of the Seoul Metropolitan Office of Education, Byungmin Lee and three other authors conducted the research, "An Investigation on the Current Status of Distance Education in Response to COVID-19 in Seoul Metropolitan City Elementary, Middle, and High Schools." Distance This report aims to identify the current status and weaknesses of various distance learning programs practiced in Seoul, the Republic of Korea's capital and largest city, and recommend improvements. Materials for distance education support from the Ministry of Education and the Seoul Metropolitan Office of Education and international resources on distance education are used as prior literature to review. Deep The research outcomes are derived from an online survey of 1,311 instructors from 128 schools in Seoul and an in-depth interview of twenty-four teachers along with expert advice. In this study, distance learning methods are divided into five categories: a real-time interactive class, self-recorded video class, self-created content-based class, existing content utilization-based class, and task-based class. This report provides a huge amount of reference data by evaluating in detail the types and characteristics of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> Leem, Kim, and Lee, "Online Instructional Design Model," 286.

<sup>200</sup> Byungmin Lee et al., "서울시 초·중·고등학교 코로나 19 대응 원격교육 현황 조사 [An Investigation on the Current Status of Distance Education in Response to COVID-19 in Seoul Metropolitan City Elementary, Middle, and High Schools]," Seoul Metropolitan Office of Education, 1, on December 8, 2020, accessed November 30, 2021, http://www.sen.go.kr/web/services/bbs/bbsView.action?bbsBean.bbsCd=244&bbsBean.bbsSeq=154; http://www.sen.go.kr/web/services/bbs/bbsView.action?bbsBean.bbsCd=244&bbsBean.bbsSeq=155; http://www.sen.go.kr/web/services/bbs/bbsView.action?bbsBean.bbsCd=244&bbsBean.bbsSeq=156. The PDF file was divided into three parts and uploaded due to the attachment file size limit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>201</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> Ibid., 2-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> Ibid., 8-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> Ibid., 5-6.

various online classes being utilized in Korea, along with their benefits, drawbacks, challenges, preparation time, and resources.

Alexey Surov, Christine March, and Maciej Pech discover significant data on the preparation of video materials for online education. The purpose of their study is to evaluate online educational methods newly launched for medical students of radiology in situations where "social distancing" is required during the COVID-19 pandemic. University Hospital Magdeburg offers a mandatory course, "Imaging Procedures," which consists of 12 seminars for third-year students each summer semester, and they modified it for online with video presentations and video conference seminars using Zoom during the pandemic. Five weeks after the beginning of the semester, an anonymous online survey was conducted for participating students. The number of views, duration and average viewing time of the video presentations were examined using an analysis tool on the online platform.

As a result of the survey, most participants responded that video presentations were easy to access and that the expected level of knowledge for video presentations was appropriate.<sup>208</sup> In addition, shorter video clips are more beneficial for learning than one long video presentation.

More than half of respondents answered that an individual video of about 10-20 minutes is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> Alexey Surov, Christine March, and Maciej Pech, "Curriculare Lehre während der COVID-19-Pandemie: Evaluation eines onlinebasierten Lehrkonzepts [Curricular Teaching during the COVID-19-Pandemic: Evaluation of an Online-Based Teaching Concept]," *Der Radiologe* 61, no. 3 (2021): 300.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>206</sup> Ibid., 300-01.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> Ibid., 301.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> Ibid., 302.

appropriate, while about a third of respondents wanted a longer one of about 21-40 minutes.<sup>209</sup> The authors summarize their research findings on the use of video presentations as follows:

The time discrepancy between the average duration of the video seminars and the viewing time allows two possible conclusions. On the one hand, it is conceivable that shorter videos were actually viewed in their entirety, while longer videos may have been interrupted or fast-forwarded. On the other hand, there are indications that longer videos were more likely to be played back at up to twice the speed. ... The percentage difference determined in the average viewing time between individual long overall videos (45.0%) and several videos with an overall long video duration (65.3%) is particularly interesting. If one generally assumes an increased playback speed, it can be assumed that even with a long overall video duration for a seminar topic, the individual sections were viewed at normal to slightly increased speed, whereas long individual videos were viewed at twice the speed and sometimes not in full. Therefore, it may be beneficial to divide the video presentations into shorter sections. Especially since the majority of the students surveyed agreed with the statement that shorter video segments would make learning easier. <sup>210</sup>

The authors also emphasize that "despite the physical distance, interactivity and dialogue are maintained in the digital seminars." <sup>211</sup> In conclusion, they suggest that "online-based teaching should consist of a combination of video presentations as preparation and interactive online seminars." <sup>212</sup> They also add that "the video presentations should be divided into short, clearly structured sections and include an opportunity to deal with cases or questions." <sup>213</sup>

As explored above, after the recent global pandemic, research on online education has been actively conducted in various fields. However, there are still few studies on online education for churches, especially for worship leader training. It is necessary to continuously

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> Surov, March, and Pech, "Online-Based Teaching Concept," 303.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>210</sup> Ibid., 304-05.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> Ibid., 305.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>213</sup> Ibid.

develop and evaluate online training methods for worship leaders while appropriately applying the achievements of various educational fields.

## **Summary**

This chapter reviewed prior studies on worship leader training and online education in three aspects: First, it is vital to appoint well-prepared worship leaders because they directly influence the spiritual growth and maturity of the congregation. Unfortunately, most worship leaders begin their ministry with less theological and musical preparation, harming the worshipers. Worship leaders must continue to exercise their spirituality in their daily lives and acquire the necessary knowledge and skills for their responsibilities. Consideration of a worship school is an excellent solution to this challenge. Second, while the specific roles of a worship leader differ among scholars, it is clear that all worship leaders perform more diverse functions than any other minister in the church. The most crucial role of a worship leader is to help the congregation worship God. In addition, he or she must serve the people of God in various ways through musical, pastoral, spiritual, educational, and organizational leadership. Finally, churches must adapt to digital culture in a rapidly changing world, and the transition to online throughout church education, including worship leader training, is inevitable. To overcome the limitations of online education and maximize its effects beyond traditional educational methods, it is necessary to distinguish and utilize the characteristics of online tools and environments.

### **CHAPTER THREE: METHODS**

#### Introduction

This chapter introduces the overall process of collecting and examining relevant data extracted from diverse resources, including academic literature, curricula from existing worship schools, and descriptions of online tools. Since the purpose of this research is to present a practical method for effective online worship leader training in Korea, it involves determining the content (what to teach) and tools (how to teach) for the anticipated curriculum. Thus, this research uses a qualitative design using various historical materials. Although the nature of this study is somewhat similar to that of program development, it focuses on the analysis and synthesis of existing resources to derive outcomes without the implementation and evaluation of the program.

# Design

This research employed a qualitative and historical design to formulate applicable strategies from existing resources. Deborah Court examines that "the social sciences also embrace qualitative research, which usually begins with a broad theoretical framework but approaches a study with general questions and no hypotheses or specific variables." Considering the subject of online education for worship leaders in Korea, the most essential process is to formulate a new methodology by synthesizing a variety of existing materials. Although there have been no direct studies on online education for worship leaders in Korea,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> Nancy Jean Vyhmeister and Terry Dwain Robertson, *Quality Research Papers: For Students of Religion and Theology* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2014), 45-52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> Deborah Court, *Qualitative Research and Intercultural Understanding: Conducting Qualitative Research in Multicultural Settings* (London: Routledge, 2017), 3.

numerous studies on education for worship leaders and online education have been observed. A proper combination of the two scopes is expected to produce meaningful findings on this subject.

Regarding the method for this research, W. H. McDowell insists that the quality of the historical research is dependent to "a significant extent on the availability, careful use, and proper documentation of source material." He also addresses available resources for historical research: "unpublished documents, letters and diaries, memoirs and autobiographies, oral evidence, official publications, business records, local history records, newspapers, paintings, prints and maps, photographs, and filmed evidence." In addition, George N. Heller and Bruce D. Wilson identify the values of historical research in music education as follows:

Historical research in music education holds much promise for solving present problems and for organizing future efforts. It is becoming more clearly recognized as an important field of knowledge. Development of new techniques and refinement of existing ones promote both new discoveries and the understanding of old information. Historical research is taking advantage of ideas and techniques borrowed from related disciplines.<sup>218</sup>

The resources to use in this research are historical. Various materials such as academic studies by various authors, public advertisements and curricula by several worship schools, and policy statements described by online tool providers are widely analyzed and synthesized to draw outcomes in this study.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>216</sup> W. H. McDowell, *Historical Research: A Guide* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2013), 54.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>218</sup> George N. Heller and Bruce D. Wilson, "Historical Research in Music Education: A Prolegomenon," *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music* Education, no. 69 (1982): 19. http://www.jstor.org/stable/40317695.

### Procedure

John W. Creswell and J. David Creswell maintain that the qualitative research process consists of "emerging questions and procedures, data typically collected in the participant's setting, data analysis inductively building from particulars to general themes, and the researcher making interpretations of the meaning of the data."<sup>219</sup> According to this guideline, research questions and hypotheses are established to proceed with the research as follows:

Primary Research Question: How can an online training program for worship leaders be effectively established in Korea?

Sub Research Question 1: What are the proper subjects to be addressed in online education for worship leaders in Korea?

Sub Research Question 2: What are the applicable tools to support online education for worship leaders in Korea?

Hypothesis 1: Considering the characteristics of online education, it may be more advantageous to focus on theoretical education, such as the principles of biblical worship or qualifications of worship leaders, rather than practical education for musical improvement. Online lessons are only available for sight and hearing among the five senses, usually within a very limited bandwidth. Although some music lessons could be designed online, specific musical skills may have constraints in teaching online. Online lessons may also include practical worship leading guidance, ways to cultivate spirituality as a worship leader, and communication methods with team members and the congregation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>219</sup> John W. Creswell and J. David Creswell, *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*, 5<sup>th</sup> ed. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2018), 4.

Hypothesis 2: Video lectures are likely to be considered essential for the effective delivery of teaching content, and a platform for online discussion could also be required for the interaction between participants. Text-based discussion and real-time video conversation may be used for more effective communication among participants. Online assignment submission could also help investigate the participants' understanding and achievements.

Graham R. Gibbs clarifies, "Qualitative data are essentially meaningful, but aside from that they show a great diversity. They do not include counts and measures, but they do include just about any form of human communication – written, audio, or visual – behaviour, symbolism, or cultural artefacts." Various materials are used to determine each research question. The search engine of Liberty University's Jerry Falwell Library is primarily used to collect relevant academic resources in the United States. Most dissertations written by Korean scholars are discovered on the RISS (Research Information Sharing Service) website. 222 Google Scholar is also a significant tool for finding other academic texts. Websites provided by three major organizations in Korea that run worship schools on a regular basis are also explored, such as Bridge Builders Korea, 224 Anointing Ministry, 225 and Worship Ministry Institute. 226 To articulate the current facts about the popular online tools and Korean online communities that can be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>220</sup> Graham R. Gibbs, *Analyzing Qualitative Data*. Qualitative Research Kit. 55 (City Road, London: SAGE Publications Ltd, 2018), 3, http://dx.doi.org.ezproxy.liberty.edu/10.4135/9781526441867.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>221</sup> Jerry Falwell Library, accessed November 7, 2021, https://www.liberty.edu/library/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> RISS, accessed November 7, 2021, http://www.riss.kr/index.do.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>223</sup> Google Scholar, November 7, 2021, https://scholar.google.com/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>224</sup> Bridge Builders Korea, accessed November 7, 2021, http://bridgebuilders.or.kr/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> Anointing Worship Institute, accessed November 7, 2021, http://awi.anointing.co.kr/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>226</sup> Worship Ministry Institute, accessed November 7, 2021, http://www.wmi.or.kr/.

utilized for worship leader education, their up-to-date descriptions and policies on their websites are scrutinized as well as academic interpretations.

## **Data Analysis**

The data collected for the research must be measured according to certain criteria to obtain meaningful results. Gibbs maintains, "Qualitative analysis involves two activities: first developing an awareness of the kinds of data that can be examined and how they can be described and explained, and, second, a number of practical activities that assist with the kinds of data and the large amounts of it that need to be examined."<sup>227</sup> Available data discovered from multiple resources will be coded and categorized to respond to the research questions. Gibbs defines coding as follows:

Coding is how you define what the data you are analyzing are about. It involves identifying and recording one or more passages of text or other data items such as the parts of pictures that, in some sense, exemplify the same theoretical or descriptive idea. Usually, several passages are identified and they are then linked with a name for that idea – the code. Thus all the text, etc., that is about the same thing or exemplifies the same thing is coded to the same name. Coding is a way of indexing or categorizing the text in order to establish a framework of thematic ideas about it.... When you first come across it, the idea of a code might seem rather mysterious. You probably first think about it in terms of secret codes and ciphers. For others, the association with computer code and programming might come to mind. As used here, codes are neither secretive nor to do with programming. They are simply a way of organizing your thinking about the text and your research notes.<sup>228</sup>

He also indicates that the list of codes is not permanent and could be adjusted during the analysis process, whether concept-driven or data-driven coding.<sup>229</sup> To provide a curriculum that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> Gibbs, *Analyzing Qualitative Data*, 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> Ibid., 54.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>229</sup> Ibid., 60-61.

meets the needs of worship leaders, the following two factors will be compared and analyzed: literature defining the role of a worship leader and current curriculums introduced by existing online worship schools. Diverse aspects of public online tools for education and communication will also be coded and accessed to determine the most relevant ones for worship leader education. Finally, determining the overall duration of the entire course and the amount of time allotted to each educational element is an essential part of designing a training curriculum. Several existing online programs will be analyzed for time allocation issues along with related academic materials.

## Summary

This research employs a qualitative and historical design to establish an effective online training for Korean worship leaders. This method is appropriate to develop a new approach by synthesizing existing resources. Various materials are widely imported from multiple resources on education for worship leaders and online education. Several search engines, websites, and current programs of existing worship schools are also observed to discover valuable data. The collected data are coded and categorized to determine each research question and hypothesis.

#### **CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH FINDINGS**

#### Introduction

This chapter presents the research findings derived from qualitative-historical research approaches to reveal the primary research question: "How can an online training program for worship leaders be effectively established in Korea?" The two sub-research questions are examined and identified using suitably selected methods for each of them. This process includes gathering, categorizing, arranging, and evaluating a wide range of publicly available resources, such as academic literature and relevant websites, to clarify the outcomes as practical responses to each inquiry. The obtained information in each issue is classified as a coding task and analyzed to distinguish the results. Eventually, the discoveries are offered as recommendations for developing effective online training strategies for Korean worship leaders.

#### Results

# **Developing Subjects**

The first emerging question for establishing an online training program for worship leaders in Korea is "What are the proper subjects to be addressed in online education for worship leaders in Korea?" The first step in deciding what to educate those who serve or will serve as worship leaders is to examine their roles and responsibilities thoroughly. As discussed in chapter two, various scholars propose diverse classifications on this issue based on their own criteria. Each role discussed in their literature is coded and analyzed for similarities and differences and applicability to online classes. Also, several organizations have provided worship leader training programs, either through residential or online courses. After examining the subjects covered in

the curricula they have provided, the outcomes are compared to the worship leader's tasks found above to distinguish the areas that are deficient and need to be improved.

Literature on the Worship Leader's Roles

When it comes to the qualifications required of Korean worship leaders, it is frequently stated that they must be equipped with both "spirituality" and "musicality."<sup>230</sup> Finding a worship leader with both aspects is difficult because most of those who take on this job are either theologically trained ministers or laypeople with musical abilities.<sup>231</sup> However, various worship experts insist that the tasks that a worship leader's obligations are more complicated than these two broad categories. Two scholars propose the roles of worship leaders in more than sixteen areas, whereas others distinguish three to eight. Table 2 summarizes the descriptions of the eight authors mentioned in chapter two of what a worship leader is.

Although different perspectives, integrating them distinguished the roles yielded a meaningful outcome. Table 3 lists a total of ten roles proposed by those writers, arranged by the number of researchers who imply them. Even if this result does not include all the roles and activities that a worship leader must undertake in every situation, it is helpful in understanding worship specialists' general priorities. It is also worth noting that certain roles often overlap with others. This is particularly true for authors who divide them into small numbers. For example, only four scholars present a worshiper in the role of a worship leader. However, this identity must be essential for a worship leader. Except for Choi, the other three researchers divide a worship leader's roles into more than eight categories, whereas the four academics who do not

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>230</sup> Ahn, "Improving Worship Leader Education," 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>231</sup> Jo, "Strengthening Musical Ability of Pastor," 2.

include a worshiper classify them into four or five. Likewise, just because all scholars except Miller discuss leadership does not indicate he ignores that value. Leadership is obviously vital for a worship leader, as the word implies. Rather, it is probable that the other qualities that Miller suggests encompass leadership.

Table 2. The roles of a worship leader from eight authors

Authors	Descriptions	Total
Vernon M. Whaley	Worshiper, theologian, disciple, professional, artist, musician, servant-leader, pastor, staff member, administrator, team member, teacher, student, counselor, family person, evangelist, mentor, and producer	18
Zac Hicks	Church lover, corporate mystic, doxological philosopher, disciple-maker, prayer leader, theological dietician, war general, watchful prophet, missionary, artist chaplain, caregiver, mortician, emotional shepherd, liturgical architect, curator, and tour guide	
Stephen Miller	The redeemed and adopted, worshipers, pastors and deacons, theologians, storytellers (liturgists), evangelists, artists, and Christians	8
Seong sil Jo <sup>a</sup>	A worship leader, a praise leader, a music educator, a music administrator, and a mission mobilizer	5
Kevin J. Navarro	Theologian, disciple, artist, and leader	4
Ron Kenoly	Chief musician, excellent vocal leader, administrator, and pastor	4
Choon-Geun Yang	Spiritual leader, musician, teacher, and church music administrator	4
Hyuk Choi	Spiritual and musical shepherd, the one who leads the congregation into the presence of God, and worshiper	3

Sources: Data from Whaley, *The Role of Worship Leader Workbook*; Whaley, "Introduction;" Hicks, *The Worship Pastor*, 21-192; Miller, *We Are Not Rock Stars*, 26-28; Jo, " Strengthening Musical Ability of Pastor," 55-60; Navarro, *The Complete Worship Leader*, 14; Kenoly, *Praise & Worship Leader*, 1-6; Yang, "The Role of Music Ministry," 63-72; Choi, *Praise Leader*, 52-53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Jo's classification relates to the musical roles of a pastor, but it may also be used for a worship leader.

Table 3. The roles of a worship leader (Rearranged)

Roles	Authors (Descriptions)	Total
Leader	Whaley (Servant-leader), Hicks (Curator / Tour guide / Prayer leader / War general), Jo (Worship leader / Praise leader), Navarro (Leader), Kenoly (Excellent vocal leader), Yang (Spiritual leader), and Choi (The one who leads the congregation into the presence of God)	7
Pastor	Whaley (Pastor / Counselor / Mentor), Hicks (Church lover / Watchful prophet / Caregiver / Mortician / Emotional shepherd), Kenoly (Pastor), Miller (Pastor and Deacon), and Choi (Spiritual and musical shepherd)	6
Musician /Artist	Whaley (Musician / Artist), Hicks (Artist chaplain), Miller (Artist), Navarro (Artist), Kenoly (Chief musician), and Yang (Musician)	6
Worshiper	Whaley (Worshiper), Hicks (Corporate mystic), Miller (Worshiper / The Redeemed and Adopted), and Choi (Worshiper)	4
Disciple	Whaley (Disciple), Hicks (Disciple-maker), Miller (Christian), and Navarro (Disciple)	4
Theologian	Whaley (Theologian), Hicks (Doxological philosopher / Theological dietician), Miller (Theologian), and Navarro (Theologian)	4
Evangelist /Missionary	Whaley (Evangelist), Hicks (Missionary), Miller (Evangelist), and Jo (Mission mobilizer)	4
Administrator	Whaley (Administrator / Producer), Jo (Music administrator), Kenoly (Administrator), and Yang (Church music administrator)	4
Teacher	Whaley (Teacher), Jo (Music educator), and Yang (Teacher)	3
Liturgist	Hicks (Liturgical architect) and Miller (Storyteller-Liturgist)	2
Other roles	Whaley (Professional / Staff member / Team member / Student / Family person)	n/a

Sources: Data from Whaley, *The Role of Worship Leader Workbook*; Whaley, "Introduction;" Hicks, *The Worship Pastor*, 21-192; Miller, *We Are Not Rock Stars*, 26-28; Jo, " Strengthening Musical Ability of Pastor," 55-60; Navarro, *The Complete Worship Leader*, 14; Kenoly, *Praise & Worship Leader*, 1-6; Yang, "The Role of Music Ministry," 63-72; Choi, *Praise Leader*, 52-53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> The number in this column refers to the total number of scholars who suggest the specific roles, regardless of whether a scholar lists several divisions of a role.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>b</sup> Certain roles that are not found in other writers besides a specific author are classified as "other roles."

It is difficult to tell which of the various roles of a worship leader is more or less important than others. Every feature is significant in some way, and certain abilities may be more in demand depending on the situation. However, this finding reveals that the majority of scholars commonly emphasize the following three aspects: a leader, a musician, and a pastor. It is also recognized that the next priorities for a worship leader are as a worshiper, a disciple, a theologian, an evangelist/missionary, and an administrator. Other roles, such as teacher, liturgist, staff member, team member, student, and family person, are the less common elements in the prior studies. The next step is to explore the curricula of existing worship schools in Korea to discover how this finding can be applied to actual subjects in training courses.

## Curricula of Worship Leader Training Courses

As mentioned in chapter three, three major organizations in Korea have offered training courses for worship leaders for many years: Bridge Builders Korea, Anointing Ministry, and Worship Ministry Institute. They are prominent and influential worship ministries that continually provide worship resources, including worship and praise albums, worship seminars, and diverse materials for worship. Since it is impossible to cover all the class subjects they have provided over the decades, this study examines their programs in the last few years.

Worship Leader Training School (WLTS). This program, hosted by Bridge Builders Korea, is one of the most prominent courses for worship leaders in Korea. The history of Bridge Builder Korea begins with Praise School at Choongshin Church in 1986. Afterward, various worship ministry teams were unified under the name of Bridge Builders Korea in 1997. Since then, they have continued to hold worship leader conferences and release albums and organize

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> Bridge Builders Korea, "연혁 [Brief History]," accessed November 11, 2021, http://bridgebuilders. or.kr/연혁/.

worship seminars not only in Korea but also in diverse countries such as Mongolia, Thailand, Vietnam, India, the Philippines, and Indonesia.<sup>233</sup> Praise School, which started in 1986,<sup>234</sup> was renamed Worship School and continued to the 46<sup>th</sup> session,<sup>235</sup> and WLTS, which started in 2000,<sup>236</sup> is now in progress of the 41<sup>st</sup> session.<sup>237</sup> Worship School provides basic understandings of worship as the teaching subjects consist of "Worship and Evangelism," "Christian Worldview," "the Meaning of Worship (Old Testament)," "the Meaning of Worship (New Testament)," "the Meaning of Praise," "Worship and Prayer," and "Worship and Life." On the other hand, the motto of WLTS is "worship leading to be considerate for the congregation, and to go with the church." According to Seong Sil Jung, who has been participating in WLTS from the 1<sup>st</sup> session to the present, the targets and the purposes of this program are as follows:

WLTS is a training course for everyone who leads worship. It refers to those who lead worship with worship leading, who lead worship with musical instruments, who lead worship with singing, who lead worship with techs. It is a school that trains the worship team to be wary of placing weight on the non-essential rather than the essence of worship and the worship team, as well as to serve with the desire for worship that meets God and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>233</sup> Bridge Builders Korea, "연혁 [Brief History]."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>234</sup> Bridge Builders Korea, "예배교육 [Worship Education]," accessed November 11, 2021, http://bridgebuilders.or.kr/예배교육/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>235</sup> Bridge Builders Korea, "예배학교 [Worship School]," accessed November 11, 2021, http://bridgebuilders.or.kr/예배학교/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>236</sup> Bridge Builders Korea, "예배교육 [Worship Education]."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>237</sup> Bridge Builders Korea, "예배인도자학교 [Worship Leader Training School]," accessed November 11, 2021, http://bridgebuilders.or.kr/예배인도자학교/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> Bridge Builders Korea, "예배학교 [Worship School]."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>239</sup> Bridge Builders Korea, "예배인도자학교 [Worship Leader Training School]."

responds to God.240

WLTS was conducted as residential classes up to the 38<sup>th</sup> session held in November 2019, but due to a sudden pandemic caused by COVID-19, it has been offered online from the 39<sup>th</sup> session held in fall 2020.<sup>241</sup> The curricula from the 36th to the 41st session are almost identical, except for only a few subjects. Table 4 indicates the compiled list of recent in-person classes (the 36<sup>th</sup> to the 38<sup>th</sup> sessions) and online classes (the 39<sup>th</sup> to the 41<sup>st</sup> sessions).

An analysis of the curricula over the past three years reveals certain patterns. The first part of the course usually consists of theoretical lectures, and the latter part covers practical lectures. Some lectures have been continued with minor changes to their titles. For example, it is noticeable that the lecture titled "Worship in the Bible and the calling" in the in-person classes has been divided into "The calling as a worship team" and "Worship, the treasure in the Bible" in the online classes. "The worshiper God created" and "Why worship?" also seem to share similar concepts. "Rhythms, chords, and melodies that worship teams must know" and "The world of sound engineering that worship teams must know" were no longer provided even before the online classes launched. "Diverse ways to worship," "Band workshop," "Practical rehearsal," and "Worship leading, instruments, vocals, and sound engineering" (3-week elective course) have been provided in all sessions. "The Graduation ceremony" has been discontinued in online sessions. "Worship in the world" was held only once in place of "the Graduation ceremony" at the last class of the first online session. The subjects in table 4 are rearranged in table 5 according to their importance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>240</sup> WLTS, April 24, 2021, accessed November 11, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/WLTS.BBK/photos/a.588882114535091/4225817110841555.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>241</sup> WLTS, September 15, 2020, accessed November 11, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/WLTS.BBK/posts/3609485459141393.

Table 4. Recent subjects of WLTS

		]	Residentia	ıl		Online	
	Session	36 <sup>th</sup>	37 <sup>th</sup>	38 <sup>th</sup>	39 <sup>th</sup>	40 <sup>th</sup>	41 <sup>st</sup>
	Semester	Fall 2018	Spring 2019	Fall 2019	Fall 2020	Spring 2021	Fall 2021
Subjects	Weeks	11	11	9	10	8	9
The worshiper God created		1 <sup>st</sup>	$2^{nd}$				
Why worship?				$1^{st}$		$1^{st}$	$1^{st}$
The calling as a worship team					$1^{st}$		
Worship, the treasure in the Bibl	le				$2^{\text{nd}}$		$2^{nd}$
Worship in the Bible and the cal	ling	$2^{nd}$	$1^{st}$	$3^{rd}$			
Diverse ways to worship		$3^{\text{rd}}$	$3^{\text{rd}}$	$2^{nd}$	$3^{rd}$	$2^{nd}$	$3^{\text{rd}}$
Rhythms, chords, and melodies that worship teams must know		$4^{th}$	$4^{ ext{th}}$				
Worship leading, instruments, vocals, and sound engineering (3-week elective course)		5 <sup>th</sup> -7 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> -7 <sup>th</sup>	$4^{th}$ - $6^{th}$	$4^{th}$ - $6^{th}$	3 <sup>rd</sup> -5 <sup>th</sup>	4 <sup>th</sup> -6 <sup>th</sup>
Band workshop		$8^{th}$	$8^{th}$	$7^{\text{th}}$	$7^{th}\text{-}8^{th}$	$6^{th}\text{-}7^{th}$	$7^{\text{th}}\text{-}8^{\text{th}}$
The world of sound engineering that worship teams must know		9 <sup>th</sup>	$10^{\text{th}}$				
Practical rehearsal		$10^{\text{th}}$	$9^{th}$	$8^{th}$	$9^{th}$	$8^{th}$	$9^{th}$
Graduation ceremony		$11^{\rm th}$	$11^{\text{th}}$	9 <sup>th</sup>			
Worship in the world					$10^{\text{th}}$		

Sources: Data adapted from WLTS, September 9, 2018, accessed November 11, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/WLTS.BBK/posts/1946686622087960; WLTS, February 28, 2019, accessed November 11, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/WLTS.BBK/posts/2189406981149255; WLTS, September 17, 2019, accessed November 11, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/WLTS.BBK/posts/2525531660870117; WLTS, September 18, 2020, accessed November 11, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/WLTS.BBK/posts/3618120998277839; WLTS, April 2, 2021, accessed November 11, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/WLTS.BBK/posts/4158438704246063; WLTS, September 29, 2021, accessed November 11, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/WLTS.BBK/posts/4696949133728348.

*Note*: The numbers in the body indicate the week in which the lecture was held.

**Table 5. Recent subjects of WLTS (Rearranged)** 

Title	Res.	On.	Total
Worship leading, instruments, vocals, and sound engineering			
(Elective 3-week course)	9	9	18
Band workshop	3	6	9
Diverse ways to worship	3	3	6
Worship in the Bible / The calling as a worship team	3	3	6
Practical rehearsal	3	3	6
The worshiper God created / Why worship?	3	2	5
Graduation ceremony	3	0	3
Rhythms, chords, and melodies that worship teams must know	2	0	2
The world of sound engineering that worship teams must know	2	0	2
Worship in the world	0	1	1

*Sources*: Data adapted from WLTS, September 9, 2018; February 28, 2019; September 17, 2019; September 18, 2020; April 2, 2021; September 29, 2021.

In the 3-week elective course, students take different classes depending on the positions they have applied for. The subjects have slightly changed by session and instructor, and they mostly include the topics in table 6.

Anointing Worship Institute (AWI). Anointing Ministry started as a worship ministry team of Bridge Builders Korea introduced above, and became independent in 2003 to focus on more professional worship ministry. They serve local churches by worship concerts, operate worship schools for worship team education and training, provide worship camps and retreats for worshipers' spirituality, including worship team members, and supply worship songs through worship albums.<sup>242</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>242</sup> Anointing Ministry, "어노인팅은 [Anointing is]," accessed November 13, 2021, http://anointing.co.kr/about.php.

Table 6. Elective course subjects of WLTS

Positions	Subjects
Worship leading	The world of worship leading that worship leaders must know
	Organizing songs for worship and preparing sheets
	The practice of worship leading
Musical instruments	Rhythm ensemble / Keyboard ensemble / Performance ensemble
	Praise and worship song arrangement / Hymn arrangement
	Three principles of beautiful music
	Five basic musical skills that worship teams must know
Vocals	The roles and practice of vocals in worship
	Vocalization and breathing
	Reviving rhythm
	Combination of vocalizations in the flow of worship
Sound engineering	Sound engineering (Basic / Advanced / Practice)
	Audio equipment for worship / Adjusting sound settings
	Basic terms and functions
	Basic theories / Operating mixing consoles
	Setting, mixing, and monitoring of microphones

Sources: Data adapted from WLTS, September 9, 2018; February 28, 2019; September 17, 2019; September 18, 2020; April 2, 2021; September 29, 2021.

AWI, operated by Anointing Ministry, is a training program that offers diverse courses for worship team members.<sup>243</sup> Beginning with the first worship leader course in July 2011, they offer an eight-week course twice a year in the spring and fall.<sup>244</sup> The 17<sup>th</sup> worship leader course, the 9<sup>th</sup> singer course, the 16<sup>th</sup> beginning sound engineer course, and the 7<sup>th</sup> intermediate sound engineer course have been completed as in-person classes by fall 2019.<sup>245</sup> Table 7 displays the subjects covered in one of their recent residential sessions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>243</sup> AWI, accessed November 13, 2021. https://www.facebook.com/anointing.awi/about/?ref=page\_internal.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>245</sup> AWI, September 4, 2019, accessed November 13, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/anointing.awi/photos/a.282365538550191/2437548533031870.

Table 7. Fall 2018 subjects of AWI (8-week residential)

Courses	Week	Titles
Worship leader	1	Worship, expanding your heart and mind
course	2	The identity and roles of the worship ministry
	3	Selecting songs and setting the flow
	4	Meditation on worship songs and understanding of song selection
	5	Understanding the band helping the worship leader
	6	Creating a worship flow considering the community
	7	Q&A for leaders
	8	Worship and community
Beginning sound	1	Worship, expanding your heart and mind
engineer course	2	Introduction to sound engineering and basic acoustics
	3	Right usage of analog consoles and cables/connectors
	4	Digital consoles and the monitoring system
	5	Understanding outboards (E.Q, effector, and compressor)
	6	Live sound system setup
	7	Worship team mixing technique (application of the digital console)
	8	Worship and community
Intermediate sound	1	Worship, expanding your heart and mind
engineer course	2	Acoustics summary
	3	Microphone techniques
	4	Practical E.Q techniques
	5	Practical Comp/Gate techniques
	6	Live mixing 1
	7	Live mixing 2
	8	Worship and community
Worship team	1	Worship, expanding your heart and mind
singer course	2	The roles and attitude of the worship team singers
	3	Breathing and vocalization
	4	Worship song meditation
	5	Singers, let's go hand in hand with the harmony!
	6	Singers, let's go hand in hand with the band!
	7	Singers, let's go hand in hand with the worship leader!
	8	Worship and community

Source: Data from Shin-eui Kim, "어노인팅 예배학교 2018 가을학기 개강 [AWI Fall 2018 open]," 크리스천투데이 [Christian Today], October 1, 2018, accessed November 13, 2021, https://www.christiantoday.co.kr/news/316478.

The 18<sup>th</sup> worship leader course, the 10<sup>th</sup> singer course, and the 17<sup>th</sup> beginning sound engineer course were scheduled for Spring 2020<sup>246</sup>, they were postponed once<sup>247</sup> and eventually canceled due to the sudden pandemic.<sup>248</sup> Instead, AWI has opened its online classes since Summer 2020.<sup>249</sup> Unlike their in-person courses, the session number is no longer counted and only three categories are offered for online programs: worship team singer course, keyboardist course, and worship leader course.<sup>250</sup> Table 8 presents their official curricula. The most noticeable change in the AWI program from in-person to online is that the sound engineer course was excluded, and the keyboardist course has recently been launched. In addition, the duration has been reduced from eight weeks to four or five weeks. Their official website provides lecture videos and online forums for announcements, communications, and assignment submissions that are only accessible by certified members.<sup>251</sup>

<sup>246</sup> AWI, January 31, 2020, accessed November 13, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/anointing.awi/posts/2749773998475987.

 $<sup>^{247}</sup>$  AWI, February 26, 2020, accessed November 13, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/anointing.awi/posts/2803579453095441.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup> AWI, March 23, 2020, accessed November 13, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/anointing.awi/posts/2861502277303158.

 $<sup>^{249}</sup>$  AWI, July 15, 2020, accessed November 13, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/anointing.awi/posts/3140876476032402.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>250</sup> AWI, "과정안내 [course introduction]," accessed November 13, 2021, http://online.anointing.co.kr/bbs/content.php?co\_id=course.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>251</sup> Anointing Online Class, "예배팀성어 과정 [Worship team singer course]," accessed November 13, 2021, http://online.anointing.co.kr/bbs/content.php?co\_id=dashboard\_a; Anointing Online Class, "건반연주자 과정 [Keyboardist course]," accessed November 13, 2021, http://online.anointing.co.kr/bbs/content.php?co\_id=dashboard\_b; Anointing Online Class, "예배인도자 과정 [Worship leader course]," accessed November 13, 2021, http://online.anointing.co.kr/bbs/content.php?co\_id=dashboard\_c.

Table 8. Online subjects of AWI (4 to 5-week online)

Courses	Week	Titles
Worship leader	1	Worship reflection
course (5-week online)	2	Understanding and application of the order of worship
	3	Setting the flow with the selection of worship songs
	4	Selecting worship songs through meditation on the Word
	5	Q&A
Worship team	1	Worship team singers, set your heart together
singer course (5-week online)	2	Vocal techniques for worship team singers
,	3	Worship songs, singing with all your heart
	4	Understanding bands and arrangements for worship team singers
	5	Q&A
Keyboardist course	1	Worship and playing instruments
(4-week online)	2	Sound making for the keyboardist of the worship team
	3	Playing according to the speed of the worship song (ZOOM small group meeting)
	4	Playing that communicates and responds in worship

Sources: Data adapted from Anointing Online Class, "Worship leader course;" "Worship team singer course;" "Keyboardist course."

Worship Leader Academy (WLA). This program is operated by Worship Ministry Institute, which was established in 2005 for the purpose of developing worship, music, and leadership to build healthy churches and cultures.<sup>252</sup> Yoojung Lee, who has served as the chief director since 2011, was a famous Christian artist in Korea and studied worship at Liberty University. He also served as a worship pastor at a local church for a decade and taught worship

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>252</sup> Worship Ministry Institute, "예배사역연구소 소개 [Introduction]," accessed November 14, 2021, http://www.wmi.or.kr/theme/white/company.php.

studies at several schools.<sup>253</sup> As a minister who balances theory and practice, he has been actively supporting various worship ministries related to worship while traveling between Korea and the United States for years. Worship Ministry Institute has offered several programs for those who lead worship in Korean churches. Considering the changing situation and needs of the field, the program titles have changed in the order of Worship Pastor Academy, Worship Director Academy, and Worship Leader Academy.<sup>254</sup>

Worship Pastor Academy was established to train professional worship pastors who would work with the senior pastor to conduct inspired worship ministries. In a medium-sized or bigger church, planning and preparation of worship services, the ability to touch the believers' hearts, and pastoral leadership are all essential. It has been put on hold for the time being, and it will resume when it is determined that the Korean church urgently requires worship pastors. This program was conducted ten times from 2009 to 2013. 256

Worship Director Academy was designed for both pastors and laypeople. Worship leaders are responsible for leading worship and praise as well as supporting the congregation in becoming worshipers, whereas worship directors oversee their church's worship team, choir, media team, and all special events. Each student will gain leadership abilities as a practical worship coach and expert worship strategist with reinforced worship planning, administrative practice, ministry positioning, and strategic plans, which are all necessary for the pastoral fields. It has been

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> Worship Ministry Institute, "섬기는 사람들 [Staff]," accessed November 14, 2021, http://www.wmi. or.kr/theme/white/people.php.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>254</sup> Worship Ministry Institute, "아카카데미 [Academy]," accessed November 14, 2021, http://www.wmi. or.kr/theme/white/academy.php.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>255</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>256</sup> Worship Ministry Institute, "예배 목사 아카데미 [Worship Pastor Academy]," accessed November 14, 2021, http://www.wmi.or.kr/bbs/board.php?bo\_table=academy01.

suspended for now, and it will reopen when the Korean church's needs are determined to be pressing.<sup>257</sup> This program was conducted five times from 2014 to 2016.<sup>258</sup>

Worship Leader Academy (WLA) is a small-group training program designed for worship leaders who desire to improve their pastoral care, theology, liturgy, leadership capabilities, and praise and worship skills. Students are equipped as inspirational worship leaders, creative communicators, and ministry strategic advisors through field-based education that includes 80 hours of worship, lectures, mentoring, small groups, and experiential workshops for two semesters a year. This program was operated from 2018 until the outbreak of the pandemic. Except for a four-week online course just for existing students during the pandemic, WLA has not reopened officially yet. Instead, the institute is gearing up to assist worship ministries with various online resources. WLA covers a broader range of subjects than other programs, and not only has the name of the program changed, but the lecture contents are also constantly updated to keep up with the changing world. Tables 9 to 11 introduce their official curricula for the years 2018-2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>257</sup> Worship Ministry Institute, "아커데미 [Academy]."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>258</sup> Worship Ministry Institute, "예배 디렉터 아카데미 [Worship Director Academy]," accessed November 14, 2021, http://www.wmi.or.kr/bbs/board.php?bo\_table=academy02.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>259</sup> Worship Ministry Institute, "아카데미 [Academy]."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>260</sup> Worship Ministry Institute, "예배 인도자 아카데미 [Worship Leader Academy]," accessed November 14, 2021, http://www.wmi.or.kr/bbs/board.php?bo\_table=academy03.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>261</sup> Worship Ministry Institute, October 25, 2020, accessed November 14, 2021, https://www.facebook.com/wmikorea/posts/3497572983667947.

Table 9. 2018 program of WLA

Spring	Titles
Week 1	Why do worship ministers need the humanities?
Week 2	Five biblical reasons to risk your life for worship
Week 3	Past, present, and future of congregational praise
Week 4	Worship Diagnosis for the 4 <sup>th</sup> industrial revolution era
Week 5	Research for worship trends in Northern America
Week 6	Case study of corporate worship planning
Week 7	Creative worship through team ministry
Week 8	The practice of the four-fold structure and song selection for corporate worship
Week 9	Worship accompaniment ensemble
Week 10	Dealing with the broken heart of a leader
Fall	Titles
Week 1	Heavenly Father's heart I
Week 2	Worship followership I
Week 3	Family worship leading with havruta
Week 4	Everything in the worship environment
Week 5	Worship leader and gift development
Week 6	Experience worship: that worship
Week 7	Living and ministering with evangelism
Week 8	Worship leader who empathizes with humanities
Week 9	Heavenly Father's heart II
Week 10	Worship followership II
Week 11	How to practice havruta family worship

Sources: Data adapted from Worship Ministry Institute, "예배인도자아카테미 1기(2018 년 봄학기) [Worship Leader Academy the 1<sup>st</sup> session (Spring 2018)]," August 22, 2018, accessed November 13, 2021, http://www.wmi. or.kr/bbs/board.php?bo\_table=academy03&wr\_id=2; Worship Ministry Institute, "예배인도자아카테미 2기(2018 년 가을학기) [Worship Leader Academy the 2<sup>nd</sup> session (Fall 2018)]," August 22, 2018, accessed November 13, 2021, http://www.wmi.or.kr/bbs/board.php?bo\_table=academy03&wr\_id=4.

Table 10. 2019 program of WLA

Spring	Titles
Week 1	Why do worship ministers need the humanities?
Week 2	Five biblical reasons to risk your life for worship
Week 3	Past, present, and future of congregational praise
Week 4	Worship Diagnosis for the 4 <sup>th</sup> industrial revolution era
Week 5	Research for worship trends in Northern America
Week 6	Case study of corporate worship planning
Week 7	Creative worship through team ministry
Week 8	The practice of the four-fold structure and song selection for corporate worship
Week 9	Worship accompaniment ensemble
Week 10	Dealing with the broken heart of a leader
Fall	Titles
Week 1	Heavenly Father's heart I
Week 2	Worship followership I
Week 3	Family worship leading with havruta
Week 4	Everything in the worship environment
Week 5	Worship leader and gift development
Week 6	Experience worship: that worship
Week 7	Living and ministering with evangelism
Week 8	Worship leader who empathizes with humanities
Week 9	Heavenly Father's heart II
Week 10	Worship followership II
Week 11	How to practice havruta family worship

Sources: Data adapted from Worship Ministry Institute, "[모집요강] 2019 봄학기 예배인도자아카데미 수강생 모집 [Spring 2019 Admission guide to Worship Leader Academy]," January 25, 2019, accessed November 13, 2021, http://www.wmi.or.kr/bbs/board.php?bo\_table=academy03&wr\_id=7; Worship Ministry Institute, "2019 가을학기 예배인도자아카데미(예인아) 수강생을 모집 [Fall 2019 Admission guide to Worship Leader Academy]," August 8, 2019, accessed November 13, 2021, http://www.wmi.or.kr/bbs/board.php?bo\_table=academy03&wr\_id=8.

Note: Since fall 2019, WLA has extended the course duration from ten to eleven weeks.

Table 11. 2020 program of WLA

Spring	Titles
Week 1	Biblical worship we must restore
Week 2	Praise leader theory
Week 3	Theology of praise and the Trinity
Week 4	Past, present, and future of congregational praise
Week 5	Liturgy and communion
Week 6	Research for worship trends in Northern America
Week 7	Principles of song selection
Week 8	Experience worship with four-fold structure: that worship
Week 9	Case analysis: Congregational praise
Week 10	Transmission of faith in corporate worship with the humanities
Week 11	A new family worship is coming
Fall	Titles
Week 1	Heavenly Father's heart
Week 1 Week 2	Heavenly Father's heart Worship followership
	·
Week 2	Worship followership
Week 2 Week 3	Worship followership Family worship leading with havruta
Week 2 Week 3 Week 4	Worship followership Family worship leading with havruta Everything in the worship environment
Week 2 Week 3 Week 4 Week 5	Worship followership Family worship leading with havruta Everything in the worship environment Worship leader and gift development
Week 2 Week 3 Week 4 Week 5 Week 6	Worship followership Family worship leading with havruta Everything in the worship environment Worship leader and gift development Evangelical worship ministry
Week 2 Week 3 Week 4 Week 5 Week 6 Week 7	Worship followership Family worship leading with havruta Everything in the worship environment Worship leader and gift development Evangelical worship ministry Developing empathy of humanities
Week 2 Week 3 Week 4 Week 5 Week 6 Week 7 Week 8	Worship followership Family worship leading with havruta Everything in the worship environment Worship leader and gift development Evangelical worship ministry Developing empathy of humanities The worship that the senior pastor, worship leader, and congregation desire for one another

Source: Data adapted from Worship Ministry Institute, "2020 년 봄학기 예배인도자 아카데미 [Spring 2020 Worship Leader Academy]," February 19, 2020, accessed November 13, 2021, http://www.wmi.or.kr/bbs/board.php?bo\_table=academy03&wr\_id=10.

Note: This course was planned and advertised in early 2020, but was finally canceled due to the pandemic.

The following characteristics emerge from an examination of the curricula of three major worship schools in Korea: WLTS and AWI both provide several courses for worship team

members such as worship leaders, keyboardists, vocalists, and sound engineers, whereas WLA solely offers worship leader training. WLTS covers broad functions for worship leaders and worship teams, and AWI concentrates on more specialized topics. WLA covers a more intermediate level for worship leaders with a wide range of issues.

Another finding is that there is much interest in media and sound-engineering education among worship leaders in Korea. Even though it is not directly included in the classification of the eight scholars discussed ahead, it implies that a media technician should be included in the list of the roles of a worship leader. Given the situation in most Korean churches, particularly small ones, this implies that worship leaders are often required to provide PowerPoint presentations or operate the audio equipment for worship services. Aside from the roles of a worship leader, the Korean worship schools also cover a few essential topics such as practical applications and diverse issues in the modern church context, making the curriculum more vivid and realistic.

## Integration and analysis of the data

As assessed above, three roles of a worship leader, such as a leader, a musician or artist, and a pastor, should be given the utmost attention according to the emphasis by most authors to establish a worship leader education. Other functions of a worship leader should also be concerned with and carefully selected for the aims of education. In addition, it is required to include a media technician as a worship leader's role. Finally, covering the practical application and current issues should be encouraged for worship leader training in Korea. At this step, the outcome is evaluated by comparing the subject covered by each worship school with the roles of a worship leader identified by multiple academics as well as other features discovered in each other's curriculum. Tables 12 to 14 indicate the comparative analysis of the curriculum of each worship school based on these criteria.

Table 12. Analysis of the WLTS curriculum

Roles	Title	Res.	On.
Leader	The world of worship leading that worship leaders must know <sup>a</sup>	3	3
	The practice of worship leading <sup>a</sup>	3	3
Musician/Artist	Band workshop	3	6
	Practical rehearsal	3	3
	Rhythms, chords, and melodies that worship teams must know	2	0
	Organizing songs for worship and preparing sheets <sup>a</sup>	3	3
Worshiper	Diverse ways to worship	3	3
	The worshiper God created / Why worship?	3	2
	Worship in the world	0	1
Theologian/Philosopher	Worship in the Bible / The calling as a worship team	3	3
Media technician	The world of sound engineering that worship teams must know	2	0
Practical application	Graduation ceremony	3	0

*Sources*: Data adapted from WLTS, September 9, 2018; February 28, 2019; September 17, 2019; September 18, 2020; April 2, 2021; September 29, 2021.

Table 13. Analysis of the AWI curriculum

Roles	Title	Туре
Leader	The identity and roles of the worship ministry	Residential
Musician/Artist	Selecting songs and setting the flow	Residential
	Understanding the band helping the worship leader	Residential
	Creating a worship flow considering the community	Residential
	Setting the flow with the selection of worship songs	Online
Pastor	Worship and community	Residential
Worshiper	Worship, expanding your heart and mind	Residential
Theologian/Philosopher	Worship reflection	Online
	Understanding and application of the meaning of the order of worship	Online
Theologian/Philosopher	Meditation on worship songs and understanding of song selection	
	Selecting worship songs through meditation on the Word	Online
Practical application	Q&A for leaders	Residential
	Q&A	Online

*Source*: Data adapted from Kim, "AWI Fall 2018 open;" Anointing Online Class, "Worship leader course;" "Worship team singer course;" "Keyboardist course."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Provided through a 3-week elective course for the worship leading class. (Only the worship leading classes from the 3-week elective courses are included in this table).

Table 14. Analysis of the WLA curriculum

Roles	Subject (Titles may vary)	Total	
Leader	Worship leader and gift development		
	The broken heart / private world of a worship leader	2	
	Worship leadership you need	1	
	Praise leader theory	1	
Musician/Artist	Congregational praise	3	
	Worship accompaniment ensemble	2	
	The flow of congregational hymns	1	
	Principles of song selection	1	
Worshiper	Heavenly Father's heart	3	
	Pastoral strategy for the next generation: Worship is the answer	1	
Disciple	Worship followership	3	
Theologian/Philosopher	Worship and humanities	4	
	The biblical worship	3	
	The four-fold structure and song selection	2	
	Theology of praise and the Trinity	1	
	Biblical gifts for a worship leader	1	
Evangelist/Missionary	Worship and evangelism	3	
Administrator/Director	Worship plan for your church	2	
	Worship directing workshop	1	
	Marketing strategies for creative worship ministry	1	
	Learn from the planning of the Everland event	1	
Liturgist	Liturgy and communion / Vintage worship	3	
Other: Team member	Creative worship through team ministry	2	
Other: Family person	A new family worship / Family worship with havruta	4	
Media technician	Worship environment, communication, and media	3	
Practical application	Experience worship	3	
Current Issues	Research for worship trends	4	
	Post praise and worship	1	
	Worship and the 4th industrial revolution era	1	
	The worship that the senior pastor, worship leader, and congregation desire for one another	1	
	Experience worship for all generations	1	

*Source*: Data adapted from Worship Ministry Institute, "1st session (Spring 2018);" "2nd session (Fall 2018);" "Spring 2019 Admission;" "Fall 2019 Admission;" "Spring 2020."

It is difficult to draw a straight line between each subject and the role of a worship leader, since multiple topics are often addressed in a single lecture. For example, "Diverse ways to worship" taught by WLTS is obviously about worship, but it may be close to worship theology depending on the lecture content. Likewise, both theological and musical aspects should usually be considered when choosing worship songs. In spite of these restrictions, certain trends are discovered through this classification.

Table 15 summarizes the differences between each institution to make them more visible. The focus of WLTS and AWI is on the basics of worship leadership. The roles stated in table 5 are arranged in the order that worship scholars discuss them the most (see table 3). The majority of the subjects addressed in these two programs are converged at the top. In particular, the themes presented in WLTS are mainly centered on four areas: leadership, music, worship, and theology. Basic sound engineering lessons and graduation ceremonies were provided in residential courses, but were discontinued in online courses. In the case of AWI, although the proportion of music is relatively high, other themes such as leadership, pastorship, worship, and theology are also evenly handled. However, as it moved online and shortened the course duration, it was redesigned to focus on music and theology. Another noteworthy feature of this program is that students may communicate what they are truly inquisitive about through active two-way conversation during the Q/A session, which is presented as a distinct lecture. WLA, on the other hand, covers a far broader range of areas. In particular, it deals more with the four aspects of leadership, music, theology, and current issues, and it appears to be actively responding to the practical needs of worship leaders by continuously updating subjects. Since WLA has not officially launched its online programs yet, comparing them with residential programs is not available at this time.

Table 15. Analysis of the three programs' curricula

		WL	TS	AV	WI	WLA
Priority	Roles	Res.	On.	Res.	On.	Res.
Core	Leader	6	6	1		6
	Pastor			1		
	Musician/Artist	11	12	4	2	7
Necessary	Worshiper	6	6	1		4
	Disciple					3
	Theologian	3	3	1	3	11
	Evangelist/Missionary					3
	Administrator					5
	Teacher					
	Liturgist					3
Referable	Professional					
	Staff member					
	Team member					2
	Student					
	Family person					4
	Media technician	2				3
Practical	Current Issues					8
	Experience of Worship					3
	Graduation ceremony	3				
	Q and A session			1	1	

*Source*: Data adapted from WLTS, September 9, 2018; February 28, 2019; September 17, 2019; September 18, 2020; April 2, 2021; September 29, 2021; Kim, "AWI Fall 2018 open;" Anointing Online Class, "Worship leader course;" "Worship team singer course;" "Keyboardist course;" Worship Ministry Institute, "1st session (Spring 2018);" "2nd session (Fall 2018);" "Spring 2019 Admission;" "Fall 2019 Admission;" "Spring 2020."

*Note*: Since each school's sample number of lectures is different, the above data should only be used to compare the distribution of courses within the program, not to compare it to other programs.

When comparing the hypotheses established at the beginning of this study with the research findings, several points are distinguished as follows:

Given the limitations of online education, the researcher hypothesized that it could be more reasonable to concentrate on theoretical education, such as the principles of biblical worship or qualifications of worship leaders, rather than practical subjects for musical progress. Despite the prejudice that teaching practical music or sound engineering online would be difficult, however, existing worship institutes have successfully produced several online courses for keyboardists, vocalists, and sound engineers. Even while not all the prior courses have been transformed, and some have been reduced, it implies that practical subjects can also be covered in online classes with proper methodologies.

Another hypothesis regarding the first research question was that practical worship leading guidance, ways to cultivate spirituality as a worship leader, and communication methods with team members and the congregation may be included in the curriculum. It was discovered that most worship schools cover these practical disciplines directly or indirectly. Furthermore, other diverse themes related to practical applications are actively employed according to the demands of the worshiping fields. However, the results indicate that pastoral themes are hardly discussed in any of the three programs. Although AWI's "Worship and Community" was classified as a pastoral course in a broad sense, it was not included in the online courses. Since every program has responded to the needs of the field and has been refined over a long period of time, there may be a sound reason for the pastoral issues to be given less attention.

## **Evaluating Online Tools**

The other critical question in designing an online program must be "What are the applicable tools to support online education for worship leaders in Korea?" There are various free and paid online tools applicable to education, such as platforms for video streaming, teleconference tools, online discussion boards, and file-transferring systems. These tools have

broadly been applied and evaluated in various forms of online education. The aim of this subsection is to analyze the aspects of these tools and determine how they might be utilized for worship leader training. Since it is impossible to investigate all kinds of online education tools and their features in this research, key components of particular online resources are summarized and classified according to the characteristics of online education, so that they can be utilized for specific purposes.

#### Three Methods of Online Education

The types of online education should first be identified to classify the numerous online tools. The Ministry of Education of the Republic of Korea distributed the "Operating Guidelines for Distance Learning" through a press release immediately after the outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic. Although this information was provided primarily for primary and secondary schools, the overall concepts and examples of online education are also valid for any institution that uses the technology. In this document, online education methods are categorized into the following four items: real-time interactive classes, content utilization-based classes, task-based classes, and others. Table 16 indicates the characteristics of each method.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>262</sup> Ministry of Education, "보도자료: 체계적인 원격수업을 위한 운영 기준안 마련 [Press Release: Preparation of the Operating Guidelines for the Systematic Distance Learning Class]," on March 27, 2020, accessed November 24, 2021, https://www.moe.go.kr/boardCnts/view.do?boardID=294&boardSeq=80131&lev=0&searchType=null&statusYN=W&page=1&s=moe&m=020402&opType=N.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>263</sup> Ibid., 2.

**Table 16. Distance learning types (Ministry of Education in Korea)** 

Type	Description
Real-Time Interactive Class	Using a real-time distance education platform, video classes are conducted between teachers and students, and immediate feedback such as real-time discussion and communication is provided.  **Examples of video class tools: Naver Line Works, Gooroomee, Google Hangouts, MS Teams, ZOOM, and Cisco Webex.
Content Utilization-Based Class	(Lecture type) Students watch pre-recorded lectures or educational content. Teachers check on learning progress and provide feedback. (Lecture and Activity type) After watching the content, students conduct a remote discussion with comments and replies.   ** Examples of content: EBS lectures and teacher-created materials.
Task-Based Class	Teachers issue online assignments and provide feedback based on each subject's accomplishment criteria, allowing them to assess students' self-directed learning achievements in context.  ** Example of the process: Issuing assignments: carrying out student activities such as book reviews, worksheets, and other learning materials; submitting learning outcomes; review and feedback by the teacher
Others	Depending on the context of each district or school, it can be set up independently.

Sources: Data adapted from Ministry of Education, "Operating Guidelines," 2, 6.

Besides, Byungmin Lee and three other authors divide the content utilization-based class into three sub-categories according to the aspect of the content: a self-recorded video class, self-created content-based class, and existing content utilization-based class. Therefore, they investigate various aspects of distance learning in five categories: a real-time interactive class, self-recorded video class, self-created content-based class, existing content utilization-based class, and task-based class. Their research outcomes on the strengths and weaknesses of each teaching method are summarized in table 17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> "Naver Line Works" and "Google Hangouts" have now been renamed "Naver Works" and "Google Meet" respectively.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>264</sup> Lee et al., "Current Status of Distance Education," 5-6.

Table 17. Advantages and disadvantages of each learning type

Type	Advantages	Disadvantages
Real-Time Interactive Class	The most similar to in-person classes Free communication between teachers and students	Difficulty in preparation of class materials Managing distracted students
Self-Recorded Video Class	Effective delivery of class content Ease of class operation	Time-consuming to produce Lack of facilities and equipment Lack of video recording/editing skills Lack of interaction with students Lack of student participation in learning Decreased sense of realism in class
Self-Created Content-Based Class	Providing a variety of class materials Ease of preparing class materials Self-directed learning of a student	Time-consuming to produce Lack of interaction with students Reduced learning effects with one-way class Copyright restrictions on the usage of materials
Existing Content Utilization-Based Class	Reducing the burden of remote class operation Providing quality learning materials Convenience of class preparation	Lack of interaction with students Copyright restrictions on the usage of materials Lack of student participation in learning
Task-Based Class	Self-directed learning of a student Encouraging a variety of learning activities	Difficulty in selecting an appropriate task Difficulty in presenting an effective task Difficulty in giving feedback on assignments Difficulty in managing unsubmitted assignments

Sources: Data adapted from Lee et al., "Current Status of Distance Education," 11-188.

*Note*: In the original data, the results for elementary, middle, and high school teachers were split. On this table, however, common items are collected and arranged.

As shown in table 17, similarities are found among the subcategories of content utilization-based classes. However, instructors who create their own teaching resources, whether the materials are videos or other media, face many challenges in the production process, whereas it is more convenient to use available information. This study also reveals that task-based classes

are rarely utilized by secondary school teachers. <sup>265</sup> Other studies also support the fact that the real-time interactive class and the content utilization-based class are the most commonly applied in Korean schools. According to the public document, "A step-by-step implementation plan for the full return to school for the fall semester," presented by the Ministry of Education in June 2021, the ratio of real-time interactive classes and the use of teacher-created content are on the rise, as a result of a survey of 89,629 instructors who teach online classes in a total of 11,283 elementary, middle, and high schools. <sup>266</sup> Table 18 indicates the detailed figures for the increase of real-time interactive classes, and it also implies that the task-based method is typically utilized as a supplement to other classes rather than as a primary approach.

Table 18. Real-time interactive (single and blended) class rate

	Di d	Utilization rate (%)			
	Distance learning type	Spring 2020	Fall 2020	Spring 2021	Incrementa
Single	Real-Time Interactive Class	6.00%	19.30%	44.90%	Δ25.6%p
	Content Utilization-Based Class	45.10%	22.80%	15.10%	△7.7%p
	Task-Based Class	8.00%	4.40%	2.40%	△2.0%p
Blended	Content and Task	32.10%	17.20%	4.30%	△12.9%p
	Interactive and Content	4.30%	23.10%	22.20%	△0.9%p
	Interactive and Task	2.30%	6.90%	5.30%	△1.6%p
	Interactive, Content, and Task	2.20%	6.40%	5.20%	△1.2%p
Total Rate with Real-Time Interactive Class		14.80%	55.70%	77.60%	∆21.9%p

Sources: Data from Ministry of Education, "Step-by-Step Implementation Plan," 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Increment from Fall 2020 to Spring 2021

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>265</sup> Lee et al., "Current Status of Distance Education," 99, 156.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>266</sup> Ministry of Education, "2 학기 전면 등교를 위한 단계적 이행방안 [A Step-by-Step Implementation Plan for the Full Return to School for the Fall Semester]," 5, on June 20, 2021, accessed November 30, 2021, https://www.moe.go.kr/boardCnts/view.do?boardID=72752&boardSeq=89120&lev=0&searchType=S&statusYN=W&page=1&s=moe&m=010609&opType=.

As mentioned in chapter two, Leem, Kim, and Lee also verify this fact: "Therefore, non-face-to-face online classes can be classified into three types: content utilization classes, real-time interactive classes, and a mix of the two. In the case of a real-time interactive class, it is a realistic solution to divide it into a lecture type and an activity type." Besides, other resources are also required for educational providers in addition to the online communication tools, which include PowerPoint software that makes presentations of class materials, screen recording software for capturing the instructor's lecture, video editing software for encoding and editing the video clips, and digital whiteboard for assisting the effective lecture process, as well as an education management system for supervising the entire course and organizing content uploads and downloads. Based on the prior research results, table 19 displays a summarized list of the online educational tools necessary for each distance learning method.

Table 19. Online tools for each learning type

Type		Required Online Tools		
Real-Time Interactive Class		Real-time video communication tools		
Content	Lecture with self-recorded videos	Video streaming tools		
Utilization- Based Class	Lecture with self-created content	File transference tools		
Based Class	Lecture with existing content	Depending on the content (videos or other files)		
	Lecture and activity	Online discussion tools		
Task-Based Class		Depending on the task (videos or other files)		
Other Related	Content preparation	Video editors, Screen recorders, or PowerPoint		
Tools	Lecture support	Digital whiteboard		
	Class management	Course management tools		

*Sources*: Data adapted from Ministry of Education, "Operating Guidelines," 6; Lee et al., "Current Status of Distance Education," 5-6; Kim, "Online Humanities Classes," 131-34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>267</sup> Leem, Kim, and Lee, "Online Instructional Design Model," 286.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>268</sup> Moonju Kim, "코로나 시대에 동영상 강의를 활용한 온라인 인문교양 수업의 실제 [The Practice of Online Humanities Classes Using Video Lectures in the COVID-19 Era]," *Culture and Convergence* 43, no. 2 (02, 2021): 131-34.

The next subsections address major features and examples of the online tools shown in the table above.

#### Real-time Video Communication Tools

As listed in table 16, there are several online tools applicable to the real-time interactive class in Korea. <sup>269</sup> According to a recent survey from Korea Federation of Teachers' Associations, Zoom is currently the most widely known and used in the education field in Korea among those platforms. <sup>270</sup> This survey indicates that "the platform mainly used for real-time interactive video lessons reached 73.0% for Zoom. The other platforms, such as Cyber Learning System (10.2%), Google Classroom (7.4%), and EBS Online Class (4.8%), had very little utilization. The zoom usage rate by school level was 79.6% for elementary schools, 61.8% for middle schools, and 61.6% for high schools." <sup>271</sup> However, it is still beneficial to recognize various alternatives together in today's online culture where the Internet environment and each company's policies are rapidly changing. Among the examples in table 16, Cyber Learning System, Google Classroom, and EBS Online Class are difficult to utilize outside of public schools, so they are not appropriate for worship leader training operated by individual organizations. <sup>272</sup> Besides, since Gooroomee is more optimized for organizing group studies among students rather than creating

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>269</sup> Ministry of Education, "Operating Guidelines," 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>270</sup> Korea Federation of Teachers' Associations, "보도자료: 줌(Zoom) 유료화 전환 관련 현장 인식조사 결과 발표 [Press Release: Announcement of results of on-site perception survey related to the conversion of Zoom to paid service]," on May 17, 2021, accessed November 25, 2021, https://www.kfta.or.kr/page/pressView.do?menuSeq=170000000015&seq=210517000000.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>271</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>272</sup> Cyber Learning System, "e 학습터란? [What is Cyber Learning System?]," accessed November 25, 2021, https://cls7.edunet.net/cyber/cm/mcom/intro.do; Google, "Classroom FAQ," accessed November 25, 2021, https://support.google.com/edu/classroom/answer/6025224; EBS, "온라인클래스 소개 [Introduction to Online Class]," accessed November 25, 2021, https://www.ebsoc.co.kr/onlineclass.

classrooms between instructors and students, it is excluded from this study.<sup>273</sup> Thus, those who are organizing an online training program for worship leaders in Korea using the real-time interactive method must first consider the following five resources: Naver Works,<sup>274</sup> Google Meet,<sup>275</sup> Microsoft Teams,<sup>276</sup> Zoom,<sup>277</sup> and Cisco Webex.<sup>278</sup> Since the pricing and specific policies of each service are frequently subject to change, it is necessary to compare them before making a decision at the point of use.

### Video Streaming Tools

These resources allow instructors to utilize pre-made videos for their lessons. Video files are typically massively larger than other types of files, making the file transference tools discussed in the next subsection challenging to utilize. As indicated in Table 19, several types of distance learning classes need those kinds of tools: lectures with self-recorded videos, as well as lectures with existing content and task-based classes, if they utilize video clips. In Table 16, the guidelines provided by the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Korea only include EBS lectures and teacher-created materials as examples, and there is no specific list of such instruments. Yeong Hee Lee's 2019 research informs the platforms for utilizing video content in Korea as follows: Internet broadcasting platforms include YouTube, Afreeca TV, Kakao TV, Twitch TV, Popcorn TV, and Full TV; Examples of OTT (Over-The-Top) services are Netflix,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>273</sup> Gooroomee, "Home," accessed November 25, 2021, https://gooroomee.com/camstudy/room.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>274</sup> Naver, "Naver Works," accessed December 1, 2021, https://naver.worksmobile.com/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>275</sup> Google, "Google Meet," accessed December 1, 2021, https://meet.google.com/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>276</sup> Microsoft, "Microsoft Teams," accessed December 1, 2021, https://www.microsoft.com/en/microsoft-teams/group-chat-software.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>277</sup> Zoom, "Zoom," accessed December 1, 2021, https://zoom.us/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>278</sup> Cisco, "Cisco Webex," accessed December 1, 2021, https://www.webex.com/.

YouTube, Amazon, Oksusu, Pooq, Tving, D'LIVE, and MCN (Multi Channel Network); and Afreeca TV, Pandora TV, YouTube, Podcast, Facebook, Portal Sites, blogs, and social network services (SNS) provide One-Man Media using various platforms.<sup>279</sup> YouTube is currently the most exceptional and useful platform among these numerous resources.<sup>280</sup> However, it should be noted that YouTube's revenue model relates to users who watch advertisements or who sign up as premium members instead of advertisements.<sup>281</sup> YouTube encourages individual users to sign up for paid services,<sup>282</sup> whereas other services, such as Zoom, offer free services to participants as long as the host utilizes a subscription service.<sup>283</sup>

### File Transference Tools

As described in table 19, online tools for using various files other than videos, such as documents, audios, photos, images, and PowerPoint files, are required in the content utilization-based class. Various platforms can be utilized since the size of a file is typically not too large, other than video clips. For example, some tools, such as FTP software, are designed only for file transfer. E-mail attachments or social media platforms can also be used to deliver files. In Korea, online communities have been developed in the form of Internet cafés, which are usually

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>279</sup> Yeong Hee Lee, "영상콘텐츠 활용의 교육적 가치 탐색: 메이커 교육을 중심으로 [Exploring The Educational Value of Video Content Usage: Focusing on Maker Education]" (PhD diss., Chung-Ang University, 2019), 46-47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>280</sup> Ibid., 6-7, 35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>281</sup> YouTube, "YouTube Premium," accessed December 1, 2021, https://www.youtube.com/premium.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>282</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>283</sup> Zoom, "Plans and pricing," accessed December 1, 2021, https://zoom.us/pricing.

provided by large portal sites, instead of Internet forums.<sup>284</sup> The most popular platforms of this sort are Naver Café<sup>285</sup> and Daum Café, both of which are available for free.<sup>286</sup> Various worship schools in Korea have long used Naver and Daum Cafe for activities such as posting announcements, sharing lecture materials, and submitting homework assignments. For example, Bridge Builders Korea has operated its Naver café since December 2013.<sup>287</sup> Anointing Ministry opened its Naver café in May 2013,<sup>288</sup> but recently migrated to its own website.<sup>289</sup> According to Internet Trend, which provides data generated based on domestic anonymous 50 million MAU website behavior data, as of 2021, the domestic market share of Naver and Daum is 57.27% for Naver and 5.25% for Daum, which is almost ten times different.<sup>290</sup> However, Daum Café has started supporting online education through its platform called "Online Class," after the pandemic due to COVID-19.<sup>291</sup> These aspects should be taken into account while deciding between two internet cafés.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>284</sup> Puck Siemerink et al., "Digital User Research in Korea: Defining Quality Factors for an internet-based Research Tool," *Proceedings of the 8<sup>th</sup> ACM Conference on Designing Interactive Systems* (08, 2010):378, ACM Digital Library.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>285</sup> Naver, "Naver Café," accessed December 1, 2021, https://section.cafe.naver.com/ca-fe/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>286</sup> Daum, "Daum Café," accessed December 1, 2021, https://top.cafe.daum.net/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>287</sup> Bridge Builders Korea, "다리놓는사람들 예배인도자학교 [Bridge Builders Korea WLTS]," accessed December 1, 2021, https://cafe.naver.com/bbkwlts/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>288</sup> Anointing Ministry, "어노인팅 예배학교 예배인도자 과정 [Anointing Worship Institute]," accessed December 1, 2021, https://cafe.naver.com/awiworship.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>289</sup> Anointing Worship Institute..

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>290</sup> Internet Trend, "검색엔진[Search Engine]," accessed December 1, 2021, http://www.internettrend.co.kr/trendForward.tsp. The period was set from January 1, 2021, to November 30, 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>291</sup> Daum, "온라인 교실 [Online Class]," accessed December 1, 2021, https://top.cafe.daum.net/\_c21\_/2020\_online\_class.

### Online Discussion Tools

When it comes to the online tools for discussion, the traditional method is to use the message boards of the internet café or the worship school's own website, if available. Since all participants in the program have already joined the same Internet café or website to use class materials, it is inconvenient to register for another membership on a different platform. However, there are several dedicated online discussion platforms in the market. Washington University in St. Louis Center for Teaching and learning suggests some applicable resources for online discussion: Padlet, Piazza, Discord, Dotstorming, Flipgrid, and Miro. 292 Since Padlet 293 and Discord 294 support the Korean language, Korean worship schools may consider either of them. As observed in chapter two, online discussion is divided into synchronous and asynchronous types. 295 Each has advantages and disadvantages, so it can be decided according to the educational goals of the worship school. Besides, any online method mentioned above can conduct both types of discussions. The only difference is whether everyone joins in at the scheduled time, or if they can voice their ideas at any point within the time frame. 296

#### Other Tools for Online Education

As stated in table 19, other tools required for preparing, supporting, and managing the training process should also be determined for online classes. These tools are typically used by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>292</sup> Washington University in St. Louis, "Online Discussion Tools," accessed December 1, 2021, https://ctl.wustl.edu/resources/tools-for-online-discussion/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>293</sup> Padlet, "It's a beautiful day. Make something beautiful," accessed December 1, 2021, https://padlet.com/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>294</sup> Discord, "Imagine a Place...," accessed December 1, 2021, https://discord.com/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>295</sup> Yeon, "Online Debate Conferencing," 37-40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>296</sup> Ibid., 59-62.

professors or class facilitators, and they are not required for students to utilize. More diverse tools may be employed depending on the teacher, but only the following tools are addressed in this subsection: content preparation, lecture support, and class management tools.

Content preparation. As described in table 17 and 19, Self-recorded video, self-created material other than video, and existing accessible content are the three types of content in online classes. Since existing content does not require teachers to create new ones, the content they must create is separated into video clips and non-video resources. Among non-video content, the most commonly used method is to add audio after PowerPoint is created.<sup>297</sup> For video production, screen recording and video editing software are required, either free or paid.<sup>298</sup>

Lecture support. The most common example of a lecture-supporting gadget is a digital whiteboard.<sup>299</sup> Michael Campbell, Maridelys Detres, and Robert Lucio define, "A digital whiteboard is an interactive screen display that allows users to write, draw, present media, audio, pictures or other information to promote collaboration. Students can interact with each other, as well as the content."<sup>300</sup> Moonju Kim also affirms that "a digital whiteboard is a teaching delivery method that combines the traditional blackboard writing method with digital technology, which can be an effective way to bring out the learner's concentration on learning as it takes a lot of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>297</sup> Lee et al., "Current Status of Distance Education," 28, 88, 144.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>298</sup> Kim, "Online Humanities Classes," 131-32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>299</sup> Michael Campbell, Maridelys Detres, and Robert Lucio, "Can a digital whiteboard foster student engagement?" *Social Work Education* 38, no. 6 (01, 2019), https://doi-org.ezproxy.liberty.edu/10.1080/02615479. 2018.1556631.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>300</sup> Ibid.

effort from the instructor."<sup>301</sup> This approach contributes to improving students' class satisfaction.<sup>302</sup>

Class management. To run online classes successfully, a class management strategy, such as attendance and absence management, a class participation check, and time management, is required.<sup>303</sup> There are various class management tools for regular schools, including Cyber Learning System, Google Classroom, and EBS Online Class.<sup>304</sup> However, most worship schools operated by individual organizations find it difficult to use such tools. In this situation, Daum Café's online classes<sup>305</sup>, as well as paid platforms such as Teechee,<sup>306</sup> may be a viable option.

As examined above, there are a variety of online resources that may be utilized for online education. Each worship school can choose the most appropriate instrument from among these options for their educational goals. In response to the second research question, the researcher hypothesized that the following online tools would be required: video lectures for the effective delivery of teaching content; online discussion platforms for the interaction between participants; text-based discussion tools and real-time video conversation tools for more effective communication among participants; and online assignment submission tools for investigating the participants' understanding and achievements.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>301</sup> Kim, "Online Humanities Classes," 134.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>302</sup> Ibid., 135-139.

<sup>303</sup> Kong, "Coorientational Analysis," 48-50.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>304</sup> Cyber Learning System, "What is Cyber Learning System?;" Google, "Classroom FAQ;" EBS, "Introduction to Online Class."

<sup>305</sup> Daum, "Online Class."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>306</sup> Teechee, "나만의 온라인 클래스 Teachee 와 함께 만들어보세요! [Create your own online class with Teachee!]," Accessed December 1, 2021, https://www.teachee.kr/home?query\_computed=1.

The research findings demonstrate that these tools are all widely utilized in educational fields as predicted by the hypothesis. However, more specifically, this research also reveals that each online tool closely relates to distance learning types. In other words, the findings of the study indicate that identifying the class type comes first, followed by selecting the proper online tools along with the kind.

### Summary

Two research questions practically required for training worship leaders online in Korea were discussed in this chapter: which subjects to teach and which online tools to employ. First, based on worship scholars' contributions as well as analysis of several worship schools' curricular, online worship schools must teach various subjects based on worship leaders' diverse roles, as well as practical approaches such as current issues and the practice of worship. The three most significant values of a leader, pastor, and musician/artist should be prioritized when designing the curriculum. Practical music lessons may also be taught with proper effort. In addition, a variety of online tools were determined and categorized by their nature according to the distance learning types, such as real-time interactive classes, content utilization-based classes, and task-based classes. The following is a list of the online tools required for each type of class: real-time video communication tools, video streaming tools, file transference tools, online discussion tools, and other tools for online education, including content preparation tools, lecture support tools, and class management tools. When establishing an online training program, determining the class type should be done ahead of choosing online tools.

#### **CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSIONS**

#### Introduction

This final chapter begins with a brief summary of the study, its purpose, and procedure, followed by the study's findings compared to prior research. The significance of the study is briefly discussed in relation to the research questions as well. This chapter also introduces the study's limitations and presents recommendations on specific issues that may be researched and further developed in the future. Another aspect that makes this study more practical is its implications for practice. Finally, it recapitulates how to organize an online program to train Korean worship leaders effectively.

# Summary of the Study

The Korean church has been attempting for a long time to overcome the phenomenon of church stagnation through the worship renewal movement, and as a consequence, the role of the worship leader has become extremely essential. Although most worship leaders are usually recruited from those who have musical skills among pastors or laypeople, the tasks that worship leaders must perform in their places are not only related to music but much more diverse.

Accordingly, the importance of worship leader training has begun to be recognized, and several higher education institutions and individual organizations in Korea have been providing specific programs to educate worship leaders for decades. Those who cannot attend the classes at the appointed time and location, however, have been excluded from the opportunity to receive the proper education for them. The impact of COVID-19, which began in early 2020, has brought significant changes in most areas of the world. It is absolutely a terrible disaster, but it has also become a great catalyst for increasing online education using existing technologies. Since online education is the ideal method to reduce time and space restrictions, it should be seriously

considered for worship leaders as well. There are various aspects to determine when establishing online training programs for worship leaders, and in particular, this study concentrates on the two most significant research questions: "what to teach" and "how to teach."

### Summary of Purpose

The purpose of this study was to discover practical factors to consider when establishing an online training program for Korean worship leaders. It concentrated on analyzing the elements required for online education rather than presenting specific examples or models. This study was performed for all who currently lead or will lead worship in Korea as well as organizations that provide or will provide online training programs for worship leaders. In particular, this study only covered short-term courses as it aims to provide a broader range of educational opportunities to more worship leaders. Thus, specific programs in degree-granting institutions such as seminaries and universities were not addressed in this research since they are restricted to a limited number of students and require a significant amount of tuition and time.

### Summary of Procedure

A qualitative-historical research approach was used to perform this study. The following two research questions were discussed using appropriate coding and analysis based on the criteria derived from the research process, and fundamental data were obtained from diverse academic literature related to this subject. The first research question was, "What are the proper subjects to be addressed in online education for worship leaders in Korea?" To determine the answers to this question, the perspectives of several worship scholars who categorize the roles of a worship leader were gathered, and then their commonalities and importance were assessed. Finally, the results were compared to the subjects provided by current worship schools. The second question was, "What are the applicable tools to support online education for worship

leaders in Korea?" To answer this, the characteristics of online education were examined and classified, and current online tools applicable to worship leader training were identified by each method.

### Summary of Findings and Prior Research

# **Findings on Developing Subjects**

In response to the first research question, this study has derived an organized list of the worship leader's roles from the literature of worship scholars explored in chapter two as follows: leader, pastor, musician/artist, worshiper, disciple, theologian, evangelist/missionary, administrator, teacher, liturgist, and other roles including professional, staff member, team member, student, and family person. The first three roles, leader, pastor, and musician/artist, are the most commonly stated by the authors and should be prioritized when designing a training program for worship leaders, especially for beginners or short-term courses. The next priorities, a worship leader as a worshiper, a disciple, a theologian, an evangelist/missionary, and an administrator, should also be recognized as items for education. If the training course takes several months or longer, it is necessary to review whether any of these elements are missing. The less common elements, including a teacher, a liturgist, a staff member, a team member, a student, and a family person, should also be recognized, especially in certain contexts.

After that, this study analyzed three existing Korean worship schools, such as WLTS, AWI, and WLA, that have been providing residential or online courses for worship leaders for many years. Because the demand for the usage of media and sound technology as part of a worship leader's responsibilities became apparent through this analysis, a media technician was added to the list of the worship leader's roles. Another finding of analyzing the existing curricula is that certain subjects, such as discussion on current issues in worship and practice of worship,

could be included in the training programs even if they are not directly relevant to the role of a worship leader. These findings can be applied to establish more successful online worship leader education programs.

This research also found that practical music or sound engineering courses are also available to teach online. Despite the reduction of some courses, the endeavor to transition from in-person to online continues. Today is the era of having abundant online resources that may enable whatever education there is a need to learn. It should not be overlooked that there have been committed individuals who have made substantial contributions to the revitalization of local churches through educating worship leaders, even in harsh situations.

In chapter two, various writings that define the roles of a worship leader, emphasize the importance of worship leader education, and propose practical curricula for worship leader training were examined. Eventually, the findings of this study were produced on the basis of these prior resources and developed through additional research.

# **Findings on Evaluating Online Tools**

To answer the second research question, the characteristics and types of online education were identified in this study. According to the official guidelines of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Korea, the method of online education is divided into four categories: real-time interactive classes, content utilization-based classes, task-based classes, and others. Several prior studies agree with the fact that the first two types are dominant, while task-based classes and other types are rarely utilized in Korean schools. In addition, the content utilization-based classes are subdivided into three based on the nature of the content: a self-recorded video class, a self-created content-based class, and an existing content utilization-based class.

Each type of online class requires specific online tools to perform the lecture process. These tools include real-time video communication tools, video streaming tools, file transference tools, online discussion tools, and other tools for content preparation, lecture support, and class management. Given the rapidly changing nature of the Internet environment, there is no guarantee that a platform's current policy will be maintained. Flexibility enough to switch to another platform may be needed.

As explored in chapter two, there have been numerous studies that attempt to adapt traditional teaching methods to the online environment as soon as possible, following the urgent demands of the educational field during the COVID-19 pandemic. Even though the prior literature on online education for worship leaders in Korea was rare, various components of online education were distinguished based on existing research throughout a broad area of education so that they could be applied to education targeting worship leaders as well.

# Limitations of the Study

As with any other research, this study contains unavoidable limitations. When drawing conclusions from the research, the following limitations should be recognized:

Some limitations arose from the method of the study. Since this study employed a qualitative-historical method mostly utilizing existing academic literature and accessible sources open to the public, it did not survey education providers or consumers. In addition, as there are few resources on worship leader training directly related to online education, this study adopted a wide range of relevant references from other educational fields, which may affect the precision of the research outcome. Finally, this study concentrated on the two key aspects of lecture content and online resources, but it did not address how to organize the components in educational programs.

Some limitations occurred due to the focus of the study. Although online education typically transcends regional boundaries, this study only covered Korea geographically, considering certain factors such as time zone and cultural differences. Other factors regarding participants connecting from all over the world were not taken into account. Likewise, considering the purpose of this study is to provide as many educational opportunities to current and prospective worship leaders as possible, it only covers short-term courses operated by private organizations. Worship leader training in degree-granting higher education institutions may have relevance to this study, but direct applications are discouraged.

Another limitation was related to the nature of online education. Although various online tools have been extensively introduced in this study, it should be noted that the detailed features of each tool may change in time, given the rapidly transforming online world.

# Recommendations for Future Study

Based on the findings and limitations of this study, several recommendations for additional research are considered as follows:

Because the current study relied solely on prior literature and public resources, future researchers may conduct surveys and interviews with those who work for any worship school or who require worship leader training to ascertain the participants' needs and make detailed adjustments. Besides, this study only focused on worship leader training in Korea. Even though there have been few studies on relevant subjects yet, further studies may consider comparing different countries or international programs as long as more studies on online worship leader training are conducted in the future. In this sense, further research may also include actual program evaluations or case studies.

There is a wide range of interesting topics related to online education. For example, further study may consider the difference between app-based and web-based online accessibility related to worship leader education. Because individuals are increasingly using smartphones instead of PCs, additional research on the differences in demand between the two types of devices may be required. In addition, online education may provide an interesting place to apply various existing pedagogical achievements, such as smart learning and flipped learning. Online education for worship leaders may have a variety of educational impacts beyond just offering the same level of expectation as in-person classes. Thus, it is recommended that further research be conducted on online training for worship leaders with those educational methodologies.

# Implications for Practice

The programs already implemented by existing worship schools are the fine result of years of experience and contemplation. However, those programs may be improved with the support of various academic study findings. The results of this study contain practical suggestions that may be directly applied to their curricula. Most of all, the findings of this study can be utilized to evaluate the suitability and balance of subject compositions presented in their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>307</sup> Yeon, "Online Debate Conferencing," 1-6.

<sup>308</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>309</sup> Sa Youn Hwang, "스마트러닝의 서비스품질이 만족도와 재이용의도에 미치는 영향에 관한 연구: 이용자의 자기효능감, 몰입의 조절효과를 중심으로 [A Study on the Effect of Service Quality of Smart Learning Services: Focusing on the Moderating Effects of Users' Self-Efficacy and Flow]" (PhD diss., Inha University, 2018), 15-20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>310</sup> Eun Hye Park, "플립드 러닝 수업 방식의 기독교 교양 수업에의 적용 사례 연구 [A Case Study on the Application of Flipped Learning on Christian Liberal Arts Education]," *Journal of Christian Education in Korea*, 50 (06, 2017), 355-61.

courses. Also, the worship schools can employ various online resources available for worship leader training according to their characteristics distinguished in this study, as well as find more effective ways to practice with what they already have. Not only present worship schools but also other organizations or churches planning to establish new online education programs for worship leaders will be able to obtain helpful ideas in determining how to set up online education.

# Thesis Summary

Even though trained worship leaders are in great demand in Korean churches, there is still a dearth of education for them. Online education is the ideal way to increase their educational opportunities. This research was conducted to develop an effective online training program for worship leaders in Korea. As this research employed the qualitative-historical research method, the following outcomes were reached after evaluating diverse resources, including prior literature and publicly available data: what subjects should be involved, and what online tools could be applied to achieve this goal. Despite its limitations, the findings of this study are expected to serve as a basis for the future growth of online education for Korean worship leaders.

#### **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

- Ahn, Chang-Kyun. "한국 교회 찬양예배의 문제점과 워십리더교육의 개선 방안 [Proposals for Improving Worship Leader Education Based on the Analysis of the Current Worship and Praise Services in the Korean Church]." PhD diss., Hoseo University, 2005.
- Anointing Worship Institute. Accessed November 7, 2021, http://awi.anointing.co.kr/.
- Ascough, Richard, Eric D. Barreto, Bruce C. Birch, Ahida Calderón Pilarski, and Ruth Anne Reese. "Online Teaching and Biblical Studies." *Teaching Theology & Religion* 21, no. 2 (04, 2018): 120-37.
- Bridge Builders Korea. Accessed November 7, 2021, http://bridgebuilders.or.kr/.
- Brown, Stacey. "Five Principles to Empower the Worship Leader." DWS diss., Liberty University, 2016.
- Campbell, Michael, Maridelys Detres, and Robert Lucio. "Can a digital whiteboard foster student engagement?" *Social Work Education* 38, no. 6 (01, 2019): 735-52. https://doiorg.ezproxy.liberty.edu/10.1080/02615479.
- Castleman, Robbie. *Story-Shaped Worship: Following Patterns from the Bible and History*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2013.
- Choi, Hyuk. 찬양리더 [Praise Leader]. Seoul, Korea: Kyujang, 1999.
- Choi, Kihun. "21st Century Evangelistic Worship Strategy for the Emergent Generation in South Korea." DMin diss., Liberty University, 2014.
- Chung, Byung Joon. "A Reflection on the Growth and Decline of the Korean Protestant Church." *International Review of Mission* 103, no. 2 (2014): 319-33.
- Cochran, Dawn H. "The Qualities of the Worship Leader Perceived to Engage Others to Serve in Worship Ministry." DWS diss., Liberty University, 2020.
- Cones, Bryan. "How do we Gather Now?" *The Christian Century* (1902) 137, no. 18 (08, 2020): 22-24.
- Court, Deborah. Qualitative Research and Intercultural Understanding: Conducting Qualitative Research in Multicultural Settings. London: Routledge, 2017.
- Creswell, John W., and J. David Creswell. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches.* 5<sup>th</sup> ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2018.
- Duncan, J. Ligon, Dan Kimball, Michael Lawrence, Mark Dever, Timothy C. J. Quill, Dan Wilt and J. Matthew Pinson. *Perspectives on Christian Worship: Five Views*. Nashville, TN: B&H Academic, 2009.

- Gibbs, Graham R. *Analyzing Qualitative Data*. Qualitative Research Kit. 55 City Road, London: SAGE Publications Ltd, 2018. http://dx.doi.org.ezproxy.liberty.edu/10.4135/9781526441867.
- Gonzales, Thomas Christopher. "Begin with Worship Pastor Longevity in Mind: A Biblical Guide for the Evangelical Worship Pastor Search Committee." DWS diss., Liberty University, 2020.
- Heller, George N., and Bruce D. Wilson. "Historical Research in Music Education: A Prolegomenon." *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, no. 69 (1982): 1-20. http://www.jstor.org/stable/40317695.
- Hicks, Zac M. *The Worship Pastor: A Call to Ministry for Worship Leaders and Teams*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2016.
- Horness, Joe. "Contemporary Music-Driven Worship." In *Exploring the Worship Spectrum*, edited by Paul E. Engle and Steve B. Cowan, 99-135. Zondervan Counterpoints Collection. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2004.
- Hwang, Sa Youn. "스마트러닝의 서비스품질이 만족도와 재이용의도에 미치는 영향에 관한 연구: 이용자의 자기효능감, 몰입의 조절효과를 중심으로 [A Study on the Effect of Service Quality of Smart Learning Services: Focusing on the Moderating Effects of Users' Self-Efficacy and Flow]." PhD diss., Inha University, 2018.
- Jo, Seong sil. "목회자의 음악적 역량 강화를 통한 목회 활성화 방안 연구 [A Study on the vitalization of Ministry through Strengthening Musical Ability of Pastor]." Doctor of Chrisitan Musicology diss., Baekseok University, 2017.
- Ju, Jonghun. 예배, 역사에서 배우다 [Worship, Learning from History]. Seoul, Korea: Seum Books, 2015.
- Kenoly, Ron. *The Effective Praise & Worship Leader*. Panama City, FL: Parsons Publishing House, 2008.
- Kim, Aesra. "현대예배 찬양인도자 리더십 강화를 위한 방안 연구 [A Study on Enhancing Leadership for Contemporary Worship Leaders]." PhD diss., Baekseok University, 2018.
- Kim, Hyo Seop. "Effective Worship Leaders in South Korea Churches: Seven Biblical Attitude Principles of a Worship Leader." DMin diss., Liberty University, 2014.
- Kim, Moonju. "코로나 시대에 동영상 강의를 활용한 온라인 인문교양 수업의 실제 [The Practice of Online Humanities Classes Using Video Lectures in the COVID-19 Era]." *Culture and Convergence* 43, no. 2 (02, 2021): 125-44.
- Kim, Nakjung. "A Study on the Essence of Worship in Online Worship Groups under COVID-19 Pandemic: Focus on Korean Ministers in the Northern Virginia Area." DWS diss., Liberty University, 2021.

- Kim, Sun Joo. "A Study of Worship Renewal through the Blended Worship Style in Small Churches." DMin diss., Liberty University, 2017.
- Kim, Sung Hee. "예배자와 예배인도자 훈련을 통한 찬양예배의 활성화 방안: 신평교회를 중심으로 [A Proposal to Revitalizing the Praise Service through Training the Worshipers and the Worship Leaders: Focusing on Shin Pyung Church]." ThD diss., Presbyterian College & Theological Seminary, 2013.
- Kim, Young-Kuk. 성공적인 예배를 위한 음악목회 프로그램 [A Musical Ministry Program for Successful Worship]. Seoul, Korea: Publishing House of the PCK, 2005.
- Kong, Da Young. "비대면 수업시스템 성공요인에 대한 교수자, 학습자, IT 관리자의 인식비교: 상호지향성 모델을 중심으로 [Coorientational Analysis among Distance Learning Systems Users: Instructors, Learners and IT practitioners]." PhD diss., Korea University, 2021.
- Korea Federation of Teachers' Associations. "보도자료: 줌(Zoom) 유료화 전환 관련 현장 인식조사 결과 발표 [Press Release: Announcement of results of on-site perception survey related to the conversion of Zoom to paid service]." on May 17, 2021. Accessed November 25, 2021, https://www.kfta.or.kr/page/pressView.do?menuSeq= 17000000015&seq=210517000000.
- Lai, Victor K. "Pandemic-Driven Online Teaching: The Natural Setting for a Flipped Classroom?" *Journal of Biomechanical Engineering* 143, no. 12 (2021).
- Lee, Byungmin, Jungeun Choi, Hyunsoon Kim, and Jungeun Lee. "서울시 초·중·고등학교 코로나 19 대응 원격교육 현황 조사 [An Investigation on the Current Status of Distance Education in Response to COVID-19 in Seoul Metropolitan City Elementary, Middle, and High Schools]." Seoul Metropolitan Office of Education, 1, on December 8, 2020. Accessed November 30, 2021, http://www.sen.go.kr/web/services/bbs/bbsView.action?bbsBean.bbsCd=244&bbsBean.bbsSeq=154; http://www.sen.go.kr/web/services/bbs/bbsView.action?bbsBean.bbsCd=244&bbsBean.bbsSeq=155; http://www.sen.go.kr/web/services/bbs/bbsView.action?bbsBean.bbsCd=244&bbsBean.bbsSeq=156.
- Lee, Kyuhyuk. "A Study for Training and Building Up Worship Leaders for Spiritual Maturity and Revival in South Korea." DMin diss., Liberty University, 2017.
- Lee, Sang-II. "간세대 예배와 회중찬송 [Intergenerational Worship and Congregational Singing]." *Korea Presbyterian Journal of Theology* 43 (12, 2011), 415-35.
- Lee, Yeong Hee. "영상콘텐츠 활용의 교육적 가치 탐색: 메이커 교육을 중심으로 [Exploring The Educational Value of Video Content Usage: Focusing on Maker Education]." PhD diss., Chung-Ang University, 2019.
- Lee, Yoojung Justin. "A Strategy of the Worship Renewal for the Korean Church in Postmodern Times." DMin diss., Liberty University, 2004.

- Lee, Phillip. "Blended Worship: A Future Model of Worship for the Presbyterian Churches in South Korea." DMin diss., Liberty University, 2014.
- Leem, Junghoon, Mihwa Kim, and Sehyun Lee. "코로나 일상 시대의 대학 비대면 수업을 위한 온라인 수업설계 모형 개발 [Development of an Online Instructional Design Model for Higher Education in the Era with COVID-19]." *The Journal of Educational Information and Media* 27, no. 1 (03, 2021): 281-311.
- McDowell, W. H. Historical Research: A Guide. New York, NY: Routledge, 2013.
- Miller, Stephen. Worship Leaders, We Are Not Rock Stars. Chicago, IL: Moody Publishers, 2013.
- Ministry of Education. "2 학기 전면 등교를 위한 단계적 이행방안 [A Step-by-Step Implementation Plan for the Full Return to sSchool for the Fall Semester]." 5, on June 20, 2021. Accessed November 30, 2021, https://www.moe.go.kr/boardCnts/view.do? boardID=72752&boardSeq=89120&lev=0&searchType=S&statusYN=.
- \_\_\_\_\_\_. "보도자료: 체계적인 원격수업을 위한 운영 기준안 마련 [Press Release: Preparation of the Operating Guidelines for the Systematic Distance Learning Class]." on March 27, 2020. Accessed November 24, 2021, https://www.moe.go.kr/boardCnts/view.do?boardID=294&boardSeq=80131&lev=0&searchType=null&statusYN=W&page=1&s=moe&m=020402&opType=N.
- Mohler, R. Albert. *A Guide to Church Revitalization*. Louisville. KY: SBTS Press, 2015. Quoted in Thomas Christopher Gonzales, "Begin with Worship Pastor Longevity in Mind: A Biblical Guide for the Evangelical Worship Pastor Search Committee." DWS diss., Liberty University, 2020.
- Moon, Yung Jae. "올네이션스 경배와 찬양 운동의 발전과정과 적용모델 연구: 온누리교회를 중심으로 [A Study on the Development Process and Application Model of the All Nations Worship and Praise Movement: Focusing on Onnuri Church]." ThD diss., Baekseok University, 2019.
- Newman, Jerry L. "Worship Pastor's Need For Pastoral Leadership Development." DWS diss., Liberty University, 2019.
- Oh, Taek Seung. "고령화 시대를 위한 회중 예배 가능성 연구: 미학적 분석과 적용을 중심으로 [A Study on the Possibility of Congregational Worship for the Aging Era: Focusing on Aesthetic Analysis and Application]." PhD diss., Seoul Jangsin University, 2019.
- Page, Franklin S., and L. Lavon Gray. *Hungry for Worship: Challenges and Solutions for Today's Church*. Birmingham, AL: New Hope Pub, 2014.
- Park, Byeong-Man. 무대 위의 예배자 [A Worshiper on a Stage]. Seoul, Korea: Vitnara, 2015.

- Park, Eun Hye. "플립드 러닝 수업 방식의 기독교 교양 수업에의 적용 사례 연구 [A Case Study on the Application of Flipped Learning on Christian Liberal Arts Education]."

  Journal of Christian Education in Korea, 50 (06, 2017), 351-84.
- Phan, Nhu Quynh. "A Comparative Study on Factors Affecting Learners' Intention to Continuous Use of Online Learning: Focus on cultural differences between Korea and Vietnam." PhD diss., Soongsil University, 2020.
- Redman, Robb. "The Commercial Connection." in *Discerning the Spirits: A Guide to Thinking about Christian Worship Today*, edited by John D. Witvliet, The Calvin Institute of Christian Worship Liturgical Studies. Grand Rapids, MI; Cambridge, U.K.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2003.
- Robbins, Russell Allen. "The Rise of Corporate Individualism in Twenty-First Century Worship." DWS diss., Liberty University, 2020.
- Scheer, Greg. *The Art of Worship: A Musician's Guide to Leading Modern Worship*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2006.
- Schiefelbein-Guerrero, Kyle Kenneth. "Whether One May Flee from Digital Worship: Reflections on Sacramental Ministry in a Public Health Crisis." *Dialog: A Journal of Theology* 59, no. 2 (06, 2020): 49-54.
- Siemerink, Puck, Minyou Rek, Annemiek van Boeijen, Yong-Ki Lee, and Kun-Pyo Lee. "Digital User Research in Korea: Defining Quality Factors for an internet-based Research Tool." *Proceedings of the 8<sup>th</sup> ACM Conference on Designing Interactive Systems* (08, 2010):376-79. ACM Digital Library.
- Son, Angella. "Crisis of Church Decline in and Revitalization of Korean Churches." *Pastoral Psychology* 67, no. 5 (2018): 569-77.
- Surov, Alexey, Christine March, and Maciej Pech. "Curriculare Lehre während der COVID-19-Pandemie: Evaluation eines onlinebasierten Lehrkonzepts [Curricular Teaching during the COVID-19-Pandemic: Evaluation of an Online-Based Teaching Concept]." *Der Radiologe* 61, no. 3 (2021): 300-306.
- Tozer, A. W. *The Purpose of Man: Designed to Worship*, edited by James L. Snyder. Ventura, CA: Regal, 2009.
- Vyhmeister, Nancy Jean, and Terry Dwain Robertson. *Quality Research Papers: For Students of Religion and Theology*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2014.
- Walters, J. Michael. Can't Wait for Sunday. Indianapolis, IN: Wesleyan Publishing House, 2006.
- Webber, Robert. *Music and the Arts in Christian Worship*. 1<sup>st</sup> ed. Vol. 4, *The Complete Library of Christian Worship*. Nashville, TN: Star Song Pub. Group, 1994.

- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Renewal of Sunday Worship*. 1<sup>st</sup> ed. Vol. 3, *The Complete Library of Christian Worship*. Nashville, TN: Star Song Pub. Group, 1993.
- Whaley, Vernon M. "Introduction" (Lecture WRSP 820, Liberty University, Lynchburg, online). Quoted in Stacey Brown, "Five Principles to Empower the Worship Leader." DWS diss., Liberty University, 2016.
- \_\_\_\_\_. The Role of Worship Leader Workbook. Virginia Beach, VA: Academx, 2010.

  Quoted in Stacey Brown, "Five Principles to Empower the Worship Leader." DWS diss.,
  Liberty University, 2016.
- Worship Ministry Institute. Accessed November 7, 2021, http://www.wmi.or.kr/.
- Yang, Choon-Geun. "한국교회 예배활성화를 위한 음악목회의 역할 [The Role of Music Ministry for Revitalization of Worship in Korean Churches]." DCM diss., Hansei University, 2006.
- Yeon, Ko-Woon. "App 기반과 Web 기반 온라인 토론수업의 학습효과 연구 [A Study on the Learning Effects in App-Based and Web-Based Online Debate Conferencing]." PhD diss., Kwandong University, 2013.