

VU Research Portal

On Foreign Grounds

van Egmond, Catharina Geertruida Gerarda

2021

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

van Egmond, C. G. G. (2021). *On Foreign Grounds: Rethinking work rights and political rights of non-members in the framework of human rights based on non-humiliation*. s.n.

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Table of contents

Dankwoord1

Abbreviations5

PART I INTRODUCTION

1. Introduction8

1.1. Non-humiliation..... 11

1.2. Non-members are the core case 13

1.3. Who is the non-member?..... 15

1.4. Rethinking the current framework of human rights and its moral basis 19

1.5. Focus on Work Rights and Political Rights..... 20

1.6. Basic assumptions and theoretical background 24

1.7. Philosophical and political relevance 28

1.8. Outline of this thesis..... 29

2. The (semi)public world and the migrant's place within it31

2.1. Introduction 31

2.2. Migrants' standing in the political realm..... 32

2.2.1. Exclusionary measures..... 33

2.2.2. Political agency and resilience 40

2.3. Migrants' standing in the socio-economic realm 42

2.3.1 Utility..... 43

2.3.2. Leverage..... 46

2.3.3. Exclusionary policies 51

2.4. Foreign domestic workers 54

2.4.1. Like a Trojan horse..... 56

2.4.2. The unfamiliar amidst the familiar 60

2.4.3. Domestic work and child rearing are two different activities 62

2.4.4. Who cares for the family left behind? 64

2.4.5. Acts of resistance..... 66

2.5. Conclusion 68

PART II A FRAMEWORK OF HUMAN RIGHTS BASED ON NON-HUMILIATION

3. A discourse of human rights.....72

3.1. Introduction 72

3.2. A brief history of the contemporary human rights movement	73
3.2.1. A framework of human rights.....	75
3.3. What does it mean to hold a human right?	78
3.3.1. The subject of the entitlement	79
3.3.2. The substance of the entitlement	81
3.3.3. The basis of the entitlement.....	82
3.3.4. The purpose of the entitlement	84
3.3.5. The addressee of the entitlement	86
3.3.6. The weight of the entitlement.....	89
3.4. A distinction between general rights and membership rights	90
4. Justifying Human Rights.....	97
4.1. Introduction	97
4.2. Dignity as the inherent relational component of self-respect	98
4.2.1 The ontological claim	99
4.2.2. The relational claim	102
4.2.3. The limited-state claim	107
4.3. How my proposal differs from Margalit’s Decent Society	109
4.3.1. How my proposal falls short of Margalit’s decent society	109
4.3.2. Adding the ability to make claims.....	111
4.4. Non-humiliation as the minimum basis of human rights.....	114
4.4.1. Four senses of humiliation.....	114
4.5. Justifying a minimal code of morality.....	117
4.5.1. A negative justification	118
4.5.2. Why non-humiliation?	120
4.6. How non-humiliation relates to justice	121
4.6.1. Margalit’s decent society in comparison to Rawls’s just society	122
4.6.2. A bedrock of justice	124
4.6.3. What is lost, what is won?	124
4.7. Conclusion	127
5. Non-humiliation and the ability to reciprocate	129
5.1. Introduction	129
5.2. A fourth sense of humiliation: withholding a person the ability to reciprocate	130
5.2.1. The principle of reciprocity.....	131
5.3. The public and the socio-economic sphere: introduction to Hannah Arendt.....	132
5.4. Political reciprocity in the public sphere	135

5.4.1. Asymmetrical reciprocity in the realm of politics.....	136
5.4.2. Exemption from reciprocity within the realm of the public.....	139
5.4.3. Humiliation as absentia	140
5.5. Reciprocal agency in the socio-economic sphere	144
5.5.1. The activities of labour and work	145
5.5.2. Reciprocity in the socio-economic realm	149
5.5.3. Non-humiliation in the socio-economic realm	152
5.6. Conclusion	153

PART III RETHINKING THE WORK RIGHTS AND POLITICAL RIGHTS OF NON-MEMBERS BASED ON NON-HUMILIATION

6. Rethinking the ability to work of non-members	156
6.1. Introduction	156
6.2. Work rights within the international human rights regime	157
6.2.1. Liberty rights: the prohibition of compulsory labour	157
6.2.2. Decent working conditions: rights at work.....	158
6.2.3. Access rights: the right to work	159
6.3. Do these rights guarantee a basis of human dignity as non-humiliation?.....	165
6.3.1. Self-realisation is not the aim	165
6.3.2. The ability to work is a capacity that is one's own	166
6.3.3. A right not to be prohibited from working	168
6.4. Concerns and counter arguments	170
6.4.1. socio-economic reciprocity through other means besides work	171
6.4.2. Subsistence support makes a right not to be prohibited from working superfluous	173
6.4.3. right to work, but not everywhere	176
6.5. Consequentialist counter-arguments.....	177
6.5.1. The pull-factor argument.....	178
6.5.2. Decrease of employment opportunities and lower wages for national workers	184
6.5.3. Jeopardizing the economy of sending countries	190
6.5.4. Conclusion.....	191
7. Rethinking the political agency of non-members.....	193
7.1. Introduction	193
7.2. Political rights within the international human rights regime	194
7.2.1 Legal regulation and adjudication	195

7.2.2. Participation in political and normative discourses	204
7.3. Do these rights guarantee human dignity as non-humiliation?	212
7.3.1 Self-respect requires the ability to appear in the public realm	212
7.3.2 Permanent guests	216
7.3.3 Nationality as a stranglehold	220
7.3.4. Widening the political rights of non-members.....	225
7.4. A right to be consulted	226
7.4.1. Possible concerns and objections to a right to consultation	232
7.5. A right to renounce one’s nationality and thereby to claim membership in the host community.....	235
7.5.1. Coherence between moral rights and legally binding entitlements	237
7.5.2. Commitment to non-discrimination on the basis of nationality	238
7.6. Possible concerns and objections against a right to renounce one’s nationality and thereby claim membership in the host community.....	240
7.6.1. When does someone become a permanent guest?.....	241
7.6.2. Loss of dual citizenship	243
7.6.3. A state’s loss of control over membership	244
7.6.4. Counteracting the development of a more cosmopolitan democracy that would enhance international cooperation and global justice.....	253
7.7. Conclusion	255
8. Concluding remarks	256
8.1. Widening the entitlements of non-members in the realm of work and politics	257
8.1.1. An activity blueprint	258
8.1.2. Standing in the socio-economic realm in which we work	260
8.1.3. Standing in the public realm to facilitate political agency.....	261
8.1.4. The ability to arrive	262
8.2. The elephant in the room	263
8.2.1. Mobility.....	264
8.2.2. Continuing effort	267
Bibliography.....	268
Summary	287
Samenvatting.....	299