

SEATTLE



SEAHAWKS

Whine

MADE FROM THE FINEST
SOUR GRAPES

ALSO MADE WITH POOR
SPECIAL TEAMS, ONE
CRUSHING INTERCEPTION,
HORRID CLOCK MANAGEMENT,
AND TEARS.

12.5% Alcohol By Volume
Vintage 2006

Markets, Networks, and Trafficking in Women

Phil Williams

I Introduction

- Déjà vu – late nineteenth century
- Examine the market in women
- Examine the criminal networks that link supply and demand
- Identify and assess market facilitators and inhibitors
- Conclusions and recommendations

Problems of analysis

- Not just within specific areas such as Europe
 - outflow to Israel
 - Inflow from Nigeria/ Asia/Latin America
- Not just cross-border
- Problem of categorizing states
- Sheer complexity of framing the issue
- Multiple dimensions – but highly criminalized

II The Market Approach

- Need to understand market dynamics since women are being reduced to commodities
- Dynamics of supply and demand
- Scale and scope of the market
- Nature of the commodities – multiple trade
- Attractive profit to cost ratios
- Low entry barriers

The Contours of the Market

- Supply countries are states-in transition and developing states
- Demand countries are in EU and North America
- Push and pull factors
- Break down of family structures
- Migration to the illegal economy or to another country or both
- Balkan hot spots – developed world enclaves

Value of the market

- No methodology for assessment
- But profitable: profits are
 - Spent
 - Re-invested in women trafficking
 - Re-invested in other criminal enterprises
 - Laundered

Relationship to arms and drug trafficking

- Parallel trafficking
- Combined trafficking
- Reverse trafficking
- Displacement trafficking

III The Trafficking Networks

- Multiple players
 - Opportunistic amateurs - friend and fiancé operations
 - Specialist trafficking organizations
 - Broad portfolio transnational criminal organizations
 - Traditional criminal organizations
 - Ethnic organizations
- Hybrid networks that mix the players

Networks in Action: Insights from Girasole

- The investigation was:
- Italian in origin
- Two phased operation
- Europol – intelligence support and coordination
- Truly multi-national law enforcement effort
- Significant arrests - numbers and targets

Insights from Girasole

- The network uncovered by Girasole was characterized by a multiplicity of criminal individuals and organizations who engaged in high levels of cooperation. It used front companies and legitimate business for criminal purposes, was truly transnational in scope, and was highly profitable.

Insights from Girasole

- Russian organized crime played a critical role
- Albanians important role (bought from Serbs)
- Linked to Camorra and 'Ndrangheta
- Use of travel agencies in Ukraine with partner travel agencies and hotels in Austria, Italy, Germany, France and Spain.
- Closely woven collusive network – professor
- Nightclub outlets for prostitution and cocaine

IV Facilitators (and Inhibitors)

- State weaknesses in source countries
- Multiple transshipment countries
- Political-criminal nexus
- Police corruption
- Widespread connivance
- Use of coercion and violence
- Diaspora and migrant networks

Facilitators (continued)

- Low risks of trafficking
- Uncertainty about ownership of the problem.
- Variations in combating trafficking

Inhibitors

Conclusions and Recommendations

- Comprehensive attack
- Target demand and supply – education and law enforcement
- Remove critical nodes in the network
- Increase inhibitors especially risk
- Repressive and punitive strategies against the traffickers combined with both sensitive and empowering approaches to the victims

Key issues 1

- Defining the problem
 - is it trafficking or prostitution?
 - can prostitution be voluntary?
- One of the characteristics of trafficking is that it denies even willing prostitutes the fruits of their labor
- Role of wishful thinking - makes deception easier for traffickers

Key issues 2

- Value of global vs. regional perspectives
- Dynamics are global
- Regional cases have some distinctive features, but overall dynamics of the market are the same (For example, Italy as recipient of women from Nigeria and Balkans)

Key issues 3

- Relationship to globalization
- Dark side of globalization
 - globalization as dislocator (winners and losers)
 - globalization as facilitator (made trafficking easier)
- Shares many common features with other trafficking issues (plus human rights)

Key issues 4

- Global trafficking system is a complex adaptive system – more than the sum of its parts:
 - Dynamic
 - Adaptive
 - Co-evolves with counter-trafficking efforts
- Competition in learning
- The bad guys do it better partly because they are networked while governments remain bureaucratic and hierarchical

Key issues 5

- Emphasis on limited knowledge and lack of base line
- Both known unknowns and unknown unknowns
- Should have limited confidence about impact of policy interventions
- Recognize unintended, inadvertent and undesirable consequences (car theft)

Key issues 6

- Importance of demographic factors
- Youth bulge feeds into organized crime and terrorism
- Disadvantaged unemployed females feed into the trafficking business

Key issues 7

- Are terrorist groups players in the global sex market?
- Probably not - but could be
 - Appropriation of criminal methods - DIY organized crime
 - Some connections (prisons)
 - Some hybrids
 - Radicalization of criminals (Madrid)

Key issues 7

- US role
- Problems with unilateralism
- Problems with multilateralism
 - Lack of capacity
 - Everyone's problem _ no one's
 - Excuse for burden shedding and procrastination
- Balance between unilateralism and multilateralism

Key issues 8

- Problems with TIP Scorecard approach
 - “Legalistic-moralistic” strand
 - Creates procedural norms not substantive norms
 - Encourages cosmetic conformity – Potemkin villages generally lack brothels
 - US not evaluate itself
 - Tier inflation and politicization

Key issues 9

- How well are we doing?
- Little bit of self-congratulation on new laws and on prosecution, but real issue is scope of legal response compared to scope of problem
- But started from such a low base that anything is an improvement

Key Issues 10

- Ernesto Savona – need to increase risk and harmonize level of risk when dealing with transnational problems
- US approach contrasted with European approach but no single European approach
- Need far better MOEs including number of indictments, number of convictions and severity of convictions (have to increase risk and severe penalties that are enforced are essential – compare with other forms of trafficking)

Final observations

- Trafficking is symptom of underlying global disorder
- States do not do very well against networks
- Both problem of states (capacity gaps and functional holes) and markets - where legal market not work well, people migrate to illegal economy and markets
- Live with trafficking for a long time unless develop strategies that are holistic, effective, and deal with all facets of the problem (women as victims. traffickers as networks to be disrupted, and markets as something where it is necessary to remove the profits)