

Manuscript version: Author's Accepted Manuscript

The version presented in WRAP is the author's accepted manuscript and may differ from the published version or Version of Record.

Persistent WRAP URL:

<http://wrap.warwick.ac.uk/160800>

How to cite:

Please refer to published version for the most recent bibliographic citation information. If a published version is known of, the repository item page linked to above, will contain details on accessing it.

Copyright and reuse:

The Warwick Research Archive Portal (WRAP) makes this work by researchers of the University of Warwick available open access under the following conditions.

© 2021 Elsevier. Licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>.



Publisher's statement:

Please refer to the repository item page, publisher's statement section, for further information.

For more information, please contact the WRAP Team at: wrap@warwick.ac.uk.

Journal Pre-proof

Professional identity transitions, violations and reconciliations among new nurses in low- and middle-income countries

Daniel Waweru Mbuthia, Gerald McGivern, Mike English, Sharon Brownie, Debra Jackson, David Gathara, Jacinta Nzinga



PII: S2667-3215(21)00024-X

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssmqr.2021.100024>

Reference: SSMQR 100024

To appear in: *SSM – Qualitative Research in Health*

Received Date: 13 April 2021

Revised Date: 23 November 2021

Accepted Date: 28 November 2021

Please cite this article as: Mbuthia D.W., McGivern G., English M., Brownie S., Jackson D., Gathara D. & Nzinga J., Professional identity transitions, violations and reconciliations among new nurses in low- and middle-income countries, *SSM – Qualitative Research in Health* (2022), doi: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssmqr.2021.100024>.

This is a PDF file of an article that has undergone enhancements after acceptance, such as the addition of a cover page and metadata, and formatting for readability, but it is not yet the definitive version of record. This version will undergo additional copyediting, typesetting and review before it is published in its final form, but we are providing this version to give early visibility of the article. Please note that, during the production process, errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

© 2021 Published by Elsevier Ltd.

Title of article: Professional Identity Transitions, Violations and Reconciliations among New Nurses in Low- and Middle-Income Countries

Authors Information

Corresponding author

Full Name: Daniel Waweru Mbutia ^a

Affiliation: KEMRI Wellcome Trust Research Programme

Email Address: DMbutia@kemri-wellcome.org

Telephone: +254724408404

Postal Address: KEMRI Wellcome Trust Research programme

P.O Box 43640-00100

Lenana place, off Lenana road

Nairobi- Kenya.

Full Name: Prof. Gerald McGivern ^c

Affiliation: University of Warwick

Email Address: Gerry.McGivern@wbs.ac.uk

Full Name: Prof. Mike English ^{ab}

Affiliation: KEMRI Wellcome Trust Research Programme & University of Oxford

Email Address: MEnglish@kemri-wellcome.org

Full Name: Prof. Sharon Brownie ^d

Affiliation: Aga Khan University for East Africa

Email Address: sharon.brownie@gtc.ox.ac.uk

Full Name: Prof. Debra Jackson ^e

Affiliation: University of Sydney

Email Address: debra.jackson@sydney.edu.au

Full Name: Prof. David Gathara ^{af}

Affiliation: KEMRI Wellcome Trust Research Programme and London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine

Email Address: DGathara@kemri-wellcome.org

Full Name: Dr. Jacinta Nzinga ^a

Affiliation: KEMRI Wellcome Trust Research Programme

Email Address: JNzinga@kemri-wellcome.org

Professional Identity Transitions, Violations and Reconciliations among New Nurses in Low- and Middle-Income Countries

Abstract

We examine how new nurses construct their professional identity in Low- and Middle-Income Countries (LMICs) when they enter clinical practice and encounter practical norms violating procedural standards. We conducted interviews and focus group discussions with 47 Kenyan nurses. We describe new nurses experiencing 'shock' entering nursing practice (working and learning alone while responsible for many patients and doing 'dirty work'), which contrasted with their idealized image and expectations of nursing and prior training. We explain this transition using theory about identity and identity work, which we argue elucidates nurses' experiences in LMICs. We suggest that nurses' transition into clinical practice violated pre-existing expectations for their professional identities, which then triggered identity work of 'toughening up', 'maturing through experience', and 'learning practical norms'. Through this identity work, and finally experiencing satisfaction from caring for and nursing patients back to health, some nurses were able to restore their valued professional identity.

Our findings highlight the need for professional educators and healthcare policymakers in LMICs to reconsider the way new healthcare workers are prepared for and socialized into professional practice, acknowledging that nursing practice is often very different to training. We argue for developing formative spaces in which health professionals can safely discuss practical norms deviating from procedural standards. Drawing on such conversations, practical norms benefitting the quality and safety in resource constrained contexts might then be incorporated into care standards and ways found to address practical norms harming of patient care.

Introduction

The idealized identity of the 'good nurse' often fails to reflect economic circumstances affecting much nursing work (Fealy, 2004). Becoming a new nurse, transitioning from training into work where practices contrast with expectations, therefore often involves a 'shock' (Duchscher, 2009). This shocking transition may be extreme in Low- and Middle-Income Countries (LMICs), where nurses (and other health professionals) commonly lack the resources they need, are overworked, and feel undervalued and demotivated (Willis-Shattuck et al., 2008, Chandler et al., 2009, Hadley et al., 2007, Walker and Gilson, 2004, McKnight et al., 2020). However, while nurses comprise the largest part of the healthcare workforce (Bangdiwala et al., 2010, WHO, 2016), we know little about nurses' formative experiences in health care systems in LMICs, or their impact on nurses' careers and clinical practices in the longer term.

Amalberti and colleagues (2006) discuss time and resource pressure on health systems generally pushing professionals to the boundaries of tolerating violations of procedural standards to cope, although such violation are rarely reported and difficult for outsiders to see. High disease burdens and resource shortages mean that nurses in LMICs often struggle to meet professional standards, usually transposed from different (high income) settings (Ritchie et al., 2016), so violations of procedural standards may be particularly prevalent in resource constrained health systems in LMICs. Some violations may enhance patient safety, enabling professionals to cope and provide some patient care in pressurized and resource-limited contexts, while others procedural violations are dangerous and harm patient care.

More generally in LMICs, 'practical norms' (de Sardan, 2015) are often at odds with professional and official norms learned during training. Practical norms are tacit and informal norms diverging from official or social norms, but which implicitly regulate many public servants' practices in Africa and other LMICs in circumstances where laws and guidelines cannot be effectively enforced. 'Adaptive' or 'palliative' practical norms may be deemed necessary to maintain public services in resource constrained contexts unable to meet official norms but elsewhere 'transgressive' practical norms perpetuate corruption and malpractice (de Sardan, 2015).

New nurses commonly adopt the practical norms of senior colleagues, while experiencing procedural violations and transgressive practical norms when starting practicing in health systems in LMICs. This may lead nurses to question their new professional identities and expectations, leading to loss of confidence, demotivation and burnout. However, through 'identity work' (Pratt et al., 2006), other health professional have reconciled their desired professional identity and motivation after similar transitions and identity violations (Pratt et al., 2006). Accordingly, we ask the following research question: *How do nurses experience and deal with the transition from training into practice in LMICs and how does this process affect their professional identities and practices?* The purpose of this paper is therefore to analyse the way new nurses in Kenya construct their professional identities as they encounter and are encultured into nursing practices in new nursing roles.

We discuss theory relating to professional and nursing identity, then outline our qualitative research methods. Next, we describe Kenyan nurses' motivations for professional training and the 'shock' they experienced moving from training into nursing practice, working and learning alone, and doing 'dirty work'. We then explain their identity work, involving

'toughening up' 'maturing through experience' and 'learning practical norms'. Finally, through caring for and nursing patients back to health, some nurses fulfilled their professional calling, secured their position in the health care system, and became role models and mentors to newer cadres of nurses. We conclude by highlighting our contribution to the understanding of healthcare professional and practices in LMICs and discuss their implications for policy, quality and safety in healthcare.

Professional identity and nursing

We draw upon theory about identity and identity work to elucidate the experiences of new nurses beginning working in health systems in LMICs. Rather than contributing to the already crowded literature on identity in organisations, we use identity theories to explain new professionals' experiences in health care LMICs. In doing so, we highlight implications for professional training and improving Human Resources for Health (HRH) and in how quality and safety might be improved in health systems in LMICs.

The concept of '*identity*' refers to the meanings that individuals attach reflexively to themselves, and developed and sustained through processes of social interaction as they seek to address the question 'who am I?' (Brown, 2015: 23). Identity may incorporate a *personal identity* (an individual sense of self), a collective *social identity* (membership of a group, e.g. a nationality or profession) and a *role identity* (e.g., being a nurse). Identity is also constructed in relation to wider circumstances, narratives, discourses, the organizations people work in, and so may change as people move between contexts or as contexts change (Brown, 2015). Transitions and tension often require *agentic identity work*, which 'refers to people being engaged in forming, repairing, maintaining,

strengthening or revising the constructions that are productive of a sense of coherence and distinctiveness' (Sveningsson and Alvesson, 2003: 1165). *Professional* identities reflect and shape how professionals (e.g. nurses or doctors) think of themselves individually and collectively (as a member of their profession) and, in turn, enact social roles. Aligning a desired identity with the work people do is a fundamental motivator for healthcare professionals but may require challenging identity work in health care (Pratt et al., 2006, McGivern et al., 2015, Ibarra, 1999, Croft et al., 2015).

For nurses, development of professional identity begins during nursing education. However, moving from being a student to a practicing nurse can be shocking and stressful, as novice nurses struggle to cope with work demands, expectations, theory-practice dissonance, unfamiliar complex workplaces (Duchscher, 2009, Marañón and Pera, 2015) and responsibility for patients (Deppoliti, 2008). Supportive collegial relationships, supervision and mentorship are often crucial during transition from training into practice (ten Hoeve et al., 2018). Frustration with work, role ambiguity, value conflicts and failure to meet expectations have been associated with new nurses feeling disillusioned, burned-out and wanting to leave their profession (Ke and Stocker, 2019).

Nurses can construct positive professional identities in difficult circumstances. For example, South African nurses in Walker and Gilson's (2004) study described themselves as 'bitter but satisfied' serving the public under difficult conditions. Female nurses dealing with socially 'difficult' and 'distasteful' issues in the UK were found to 'celebrate their status as women carrying out 'dirty work' as ennobling, something that only 'real' women could possibly do' (Bolton, 2005: 182).

Conversely, Jewkes et al. (1998) describe South African nurses slapping, shouting at and neglecting patients they judged as inferior or subordinating nurses' authority, which the authors explain as these nurses attempting to secure insecure middle-class professional identity and superior status over patients. Likewise, Hadley et al. (2007) describe female Bangladeshi nurses avoiding caring for male patients, because physical contact with men was associated with commercial sex work and so deemed inappropriate for women, instead busying themselves with 'respectable' administrative work to protect their social status.

Established nurses' and nursing norms influence new nurses' identities and practices in ways that may both be beneficial and harmful to patient care. Yet, despite much interest in the way professionals develop their identity, we know little about nurses' transition from training into nursing practice in LMICs settings or how it affects the way they construct their professional identity. Addressing this oversight, we analyse Kenyan nurses' identity work while transitioning from training into nursing practice.

In particular, we draw upon Sveningson and Alvesson (2003), Pratt et al (2006), who describe identity 'violations' junior doctors experienced during training involving menial work and administration in the USA, which led them to question their professional expectations and identities. However, through 'identity reconciliation work' these junior doctors were able to reconstruct a prized professional identity validated by peers and mentors. We also discuss identity work in relation to practical norms, building on the work of Nzinga et al. (2019a), who explain doctors' identity work involving navigating between competing professional, official and practical norms In the LMIC context.

Methods and research context

Nurses' training in Kenya

In Kenya, nurses are initially trained in three levels; *certificate* (enrolled nurses) involving training for two years; *diploma* (registered nurses) involving training for three years; and *degree* (Bachelor of Science in Nursing, BSN) involving four years' training plus an additional 1-year internship before licensing. Later, nursing training is also offered in various specializations at higher diploma and postgraduate level. Nursing training is offered in both government medical training colleges and universities, as well as faith-based and private sector training colleges. The Nursing Council of Kenya is responsible for developing training guidelines, clinical log book (in addition to other assessment tools), and guiding in the curriculum development and approving curricula for use in the nursing training institutions.

All Kenyan nursing schools are accredited by the Nursing Council of Kenya (NCK) with minimum standard requirements for both training and practical areas set out by the NCK, with most training centres consequently relatively well resourced in terms of infrastructure and staffing. After the initial accreditation, the NCK conducts quality assurance visits from time to time and re-accredit every 5 years to ensure that the training institutions maintain training standards. Trainee nurses must pass a final licensing examination administered by the NCK to be registered and licensed to work in Kenya.

Nursing training in Kenya encompasses learning theory in class, skills lab experience, and skills-building placements within clinical areas in hospitals and in units responsible for public health and community health, which are meant to provide practical experience and develop training nurses' practical skills.

Diploma nursing students begin their placements in their first year, going for a one-month work placement after every three months of classroom-based training during their first and second year. In their third year, diploma trained nursing students undertake placements at primary healthcare facilities and in community placement, each lasting 3 months.

Bachelor of nursing students also begin their placements in their first year, going for a one-month placement after every three months of classroom-based training, with the remaining two semesters being classroom based. However, this varies from one nursing school to another, with some nursing schools offering morning classes and afternoon placements. Bachelor of Nursing students then undergo an additional compulsory one-year internship at the end of their training in approved internship training centres, during this internship period they have a provisional license to practice. During internship, nurse interns have full responsibility for patient care under the supervision of experienced nurses who serve the role of mentors.

Students on placements practice under the supervision of a qualified nurse, who provide feedback through student logbooks on their skill level in addition to the formal assessments, both contributing to the overall grading. NCK accreditation guidelines require that for adequate mentorship in clinical placements the qualified nurses to nursing student ratios in various units should be: Medical / Surgical units 1:6, maternity 1:2, ICU 1:1, Renal unit 1:1, and Theatre 1:2. However, as we describe in our findings section, due to high numbers of students enrolled in nursing schools, placements are sometimes shortened, limiting students' practical work experience and development of practical skills. Furthermore, due to the high numbers, supervision may be compromised or

lacking, with some nursing students avoiding menial nursing activities unnoticed during their placements. Similarly, students rarely receive sufficient mentorship due to shortages of senior staff and tutors (Appiagyei et al., 2014). Consequently, nursing students in Kenyan receive varying levels of practical experience and skills required for independent nursing work depending on their training institution.

Study setting and study participants

We conducted our study in two referral hospitals in different counties in Kenya. The hospitals vary in size and bed capacity, face diverse challenges in terms of financial and human resources and serve different urban/peri-urban and rural areas with a range of disease burdens. Moreover, we purposively selected one hospital in each county to ensure wider generalizability of findings as the counties vary in how they have organized their healthcare systems. County A has independently implemented measures to achieving Universal Health Coverage (UHC) without assistance of the national government. County B is a county nominated to be a UHC pilot site supported by the Kenyan government.

We interviewed 47 nurses, 38 during individual in-depth interviews and 9 during three focus groups with purposively selected frontline nurses and nurse interns, frontline nurse managers, mid-level nurse managers and senior nurse managers in the hospitals in County A and B. To understand how nurses perceive their identities across different stages in their careers, we deliberately sampled new nurses moving from training into clinical practice for the first time, as well as senior nurses. Additionally, we conducted seven purposively selected interviews with national nurse leaders representing nursing

policy and technical actors in Kenya (See Table 1 for more details). Data collection and analysis were undertaken iteratively, and the preliminary analysis also informed the sampling process; the emergent themes in our preliminary analysis therefore was used to inform our sampling process as outlined in the next section on ‘Data analysis’.

In interviews, we asked frontline nurses and frontline nurse managers questions around their professional identities and identity work (see interview questions in Appendix x). For the senior nurses, questions centred around leadership and involvement in policy and decision making. Written informed consent was obtained from all the participants. Ethical approval for this study was obtained from the Kenya Medical Research Institute Ethical Review Committee. Data collection was conducted from September 2019 to September 2020.

Table 1: Study participants

Location	Role	Total (n =47)	Female (n =38)	Male (n=9)
County A	Frontline nurses	6	5	1
	<i>(Of whom 3 participated in focus group & 3 in individual interviews)</i>			
	Frontline nurse managers	5	5	0
	Mid-level nurse managers	3	2	1
	Senior nurse managers	3	1	2

County B	Frontline nurses & nurse interns	10	9	1
	<i>(Of whom 6 participated in focus group & 4 in individual interviews)</i>			
	Frontline nurse managers	7	6	1
	Mid-level nurse managers	2	2	0
	Senior nurse managers	4	3	1
National level	Senior nurse managers	7	5	2

Data Analysis

We inductively coded and iteratively analysed the data from audio recorded interviews (which were transcribed verbatim and imported into NVIVO 12 Qualitative Software) (Corbin and Strauss, 1990, Gioia et al., 2013). Preliminary data analysis began with two authors (DM and JN) developing interview summaries identifying emerging themes from the outset of data collection and nascent ‘in vivo’ and theoretical codes emerging from the data. By comparing the emerging codes, we were able to develop our initial themes and categories (such as passion and appeal for nursing work). This informed subsequent data collection and revision of our interview questions/protocol where subsequent data collection pursued emerging themes from our data, and participants who were considered best to inform emerging themes were sampled. Data collection and analysis was therefore done iteratively, making comparisons between new data and the themes and categories from coded data (Corbin and Strauss, 1990, Gioia et al., 2013).

The second level of coding (Corbin and Strauss, 1990, Gioia et al., 2013) involved developing higher level more theoretical themes and categories, grouping similar codes into themes and categories by looking at the relationships between themes to develop higher level concepts in a process of selective coding to explain the emergent phenomenon. We then connected the selected codes to relevant literature on professional identity in nursing (e.g., Professional calling, identity violations and identity reconciliation work) to identify core concepts that explain the development of nurses' identities in the context of Kenyan health care. We show how we connected our data to codes and theoretical concepts in Appendix 1.

Results

Joining the profession

Intrinsic professional motivations: Professional 'calling'

Some nurses were inspired by positive interactions with nurses during childhood and the associated image of the smartly dressed, caring and empathic nurse:

When I was young, I used to visit hospitals... like nurses... I really desired to be a nurse when I grow up... I admired the way they... attended to patients. [Frontline Nurse Manager, County A_005]

To some, nursing was described as 'a calling', with most mentioning that they were attracted to nursing because of its altruistic quality as 'a service to humanity' and 'helping the needy', spending time with patients, listening to their problems and trying to find solutions to them. For some, this 'calling' transcended into professional passion, validated by nursing patients back to health and experiencing 'contentment' from that:

“It was a calling for me, I felt I should be a nurse, taking care of the patients because... I could see how patients have been taken care of... interacting with the staff in that [nearby health] facility... That is how I became a nurse.... when you render the service... you feel... you’ve helped that person, and you feel contented.”
[Senior nurse manager, County A_007]

Pragmatic professional motivations: Nursing as a second-choice career or ‘job in demand’

For others, nursing was a second career choice, sometimes an alternative to medicine for those who did not get the grades for medical school:

“Nursing... was somehow sort of failure, because I wanted to be a medical officer... from childhood and then... KCSE [Kenyan Certificate in Secondary Education] I got B plain [Mean grade across subjects] and I couldn’t manage to attend the medical class so... my parents, they had to push me, I landed in nursing.” *[Focus group discussion, County A_004].*

Some nurses embarked upon a nursing career because they believe it would enable them pursue interests in sciences:

“My career was to be an air hostess, but... I realized... I’m doing so well in sciences... [not] things which are needed in air hostess, like language... There was no one to tell me, ‘Nursing is like this’ ... I just saw myself, like, I’m doing well in sciences, so I can do well in nursing, which is more of science”. *[Frontline nurse, County A_013]*

For other nurses, nursing training was more pragmatically motivated by the prospect of getting a job *‘in demand’*, which offered easy and attractive career opportunities in Kenya

and abroad. As one nurse noted, *“it’s easy to land a job... nursing is always in demand everywhere you go, that’s what I like about nursing.”* Frontline Nurse, County A_013

Another nurse commented: *“I never dreamt [or]... wanted to be a nurse but one of my relatives [said nursing] ... is like being a ‘hot cake’ when you go abroad, so that is how I was wooed into nursing.”* [Frontline nurse focus group, County A_004]

In sum, we see alternative motivations for a nursing career; pursuing a professional ‘calling’ and desire to help patients, a second-choice career for those good at science, an alternative to medicine, a career pushed by relatives, or a pragmatic decision to train for a *‘job in demand’*, providing relatively easy career opportunities

Nurses’ experiences transitioning into nursing practice

Most Kenyan nurses we interviewed described their shock upon moving into nursing practice, in poorly resourced hospital with full responsibility for patient care. Below we describe the shock of ‘working and learning alone’ with demanding workloads and responsibility for patients, and doing ‘dirty work’, which violated their expectations of nursing and pre-existing professional identities.

While placements during nurse training are meant to expose students to the realities of nursing practice, nurses we interviewed noted that, due to over-enrolment of students and insufficient numbers of lecturers at nursing schools, clinical placements were often shortened and mentorship was lacking, providing new nurses with insufficient practical experience and understanding before starting work:

'A student is supposed to be here [training] for eight weeks... We had a class that stayed here for only three weeks... This person does not know anything.'

[Frontline nurse focus group, County B_011]

'Some of these [nursing] colleges they don't have even qualified lecturers... They have reduced the number of years for the training... and now want to reduce the... placement weeks in the clinical area, and you know nursing is more or less practical... we get... half-baked nurse. That is why I am saying the terms of training ... of supervision, they have failed. [Frontline nurse manager, County B_005]

A nurse manager noted new nurses lacking practical skills and also highlighted the attitude of a few students who came to nursing with a mentality of wanting to skip nursing practice and move straight into managerial roles:

"I don't [know] what is being taught in the [nursing] school but we are finding... weakness in the skills that they are supposed to be doing.... [New nurses] needs a lot of supervision and mentorship... The BSN [degree nurses]... come with another mentality... you tell them about patient care... they are not taking it very positively. It's like for them, they are supposed to be... a nurse manager who will be sitting in the office and solving issues in the office... You see the kind of attitude that they have? So even if you taught them a skill, they are not going to grasp it because they know they are not going to use it." [Nurse manager, County B_016]

Working and learning alone

A first transition shock nurses described was being left alone to look after many patients, without collective professional support, and being forced to engage in practices that contrasted what they had learned during training:

“That experience, in the first few days, wasn’t good because while we were in college, we would work under instructions... [In] my first posting... I was shocked. I was left alone with 27 patients and to conduct every procedure, including administering the drugs the tutors had told us we should not administer alone.”
[Frontline Nurse Manager, County A_006]

Nurses reported having to ‘learn the hard way’ when left alone in charge of wards and being criticized for asking colleagues questions:

“[Senior nurse colleagues] used to say, ‘now you are qualified, why keep on asking as if you are a student? Some would ignore you; others would tell you, ‘You will be left alone in the shift, you will learn the hard way.’” *[Frontline nurse, County B_014]*

Participants also described having to win the trust of the senior nurses despite, a lacking experience and confidence in their own competence and fearing approaching experienced nurses as this would often be perceived as a sign of incompetence.

“Being alone in the field, or being with experienced people, they want you to do this and do that, but you can’t. You cannot tell them, ‘I am not good at this’. You must be competent ... yet you know very well that you are not competent... it was very difficult.” *[Frontline nurse, County A_013]*

New nurses were criticized for making mistakes and reminded by senior colleagues they were no longer students 'in that blue cyanose dress' (a dress worn by nursing students) and expected to assume the responsibilities of a fully trained nurse, while experienced nurses took advantage by assigning them extra duties:

"You have done a mistake... somebody... tells you, "You are not in that blue cyanose dress, now you should be doing this" ... You are oppressed. You are new, and instead of being assigned duties like everyone else, you are placed on duty every single day... taking advantage of you." [Frontline nurse, County A_013]

To reconcile discrepancies between the theory they learned in class and practice, newcomers adopted experienced nurses' practical norms, violating official guidelines to cope in resource constrained contexts:

"Colleagues, they told me this is how things are done here, I started doing the same and I got used, but it was quite a challenge... Like for example... chloroquine injection, we had been instructed in college not to administer the drug alone... you are forced to go and ask a neighbour [in the next ward] ... She tells you, 'Let me help you, but next time you will do it on your own.'" [Frontline Nurse Manager, County A_006]

For some new nurses, frustrations, challenges, and workload involved in nursing practice led to fatigue, burnout, self-doubt, and loss of 'passion' for nursing and patient care:

"I had a passion for nursing, it is only that the frustrations... make you feel like you would want to quit... you work for so many hours, you are overstretched, your whole energy is drained." [Frontline nurses focus group, County B_011]

For others, coping with this new reality of nursing work and the magnitude of work that was expected of them as qualified nurses necessitated them adopting coping mechanisms, including learning how to ration care and prioritizing care for the very sick patients and focusing on nursing sensitive indicators.

“After I joined, I noticed that there was a lot of work to be done! There was a lot of things nurses needed to do... then a capacity of 60 [patients], documentation became a challenge, you only now had to prioritize the care for the patients, so I learned how to prioritize the care.” [Frontline nurse manager, County A_002]

Thus, new nurses’ shock transitioning from training into nursing practice, working, and learning alone while responsible for many patients, practicing in ways contradicting nursing training, was experienced as a professional and ethical identity violation, which undermined motivation for nursing.

‘Dirty work’

New nurses were also shocked to learn that nursing involved tasks deemed as ‘dirty work’, as one noted:

“These dirty, dirty... patients... who has diarrhoea... you will clean from head to toe... we did not know that they are in nursing,” [Frontline Nurse Manager, County B_09]

Dirty work violated nurse’s image, social status in their communities, and personal identity:

“You are seen as somebody whose job is to carry patients’ dirt, your work is taking care of wounds... looked down upon because of that... when somebody sees you taking a bed pan to a patient, you will be called names such as somebody whose job is to carry patients’ excrements.” [Frontline nurse manager, County A_002]

A senior nurse described a new generation of ‘paper nurses’ who have a negative attitude towards some of the nursing roles and often avoided dealing with dirty work and lacked ‘passion for patients’:

“[New nurses] don’t want to perform those dirty works... a patient who is dirty and they pass. They don’t have that passion for patients... They are paper nurse; they just want to perform light, clean tasks. They don’t want to clean up patients’ excrements.” [Frontline nurse manager, County B_007]

For some nurses, lived experiences of nursing practice led to a realization they were in the wrong profession and were not motivated for work they perceived as ‘inferior’ to their self-identity:

“Nursing is a calling... [But] because of the shortage of the careers or jobs... [people are] joining the profession without even knowing what it entails... only to... realize they are in the wrong profession... Post someone to a facility, when they get there, he feels it’s inferior to do some of the services... They have that mentality... when they see a patient... it’s a bother.” [Senior nurse manager, County A_007]

New nurses’ shock of the dirty work involved in nursing therefore violated some nurses’ personal professional identity in ways linked to their social status.

Identity reconciliation work

As interview extracts above hinted, through their experiences of nursing practice, nurses began to use localized practical norms to reconcile their professional identity with the realities of nursing practice. They did this in ways that were a necessary part of their professional identity construction but also at times detrimental to patient care, as we describe below.

Adopting practical norms: 'Toughening up' and 'maturing through experience'

Nurses described how *"the environment, the nature of work just toughens you up."* [Frontline nurses focus group, County A_004] and they *'have to'* adopt ways of practically coping with unexpected challenges at work, as described in the following account:

"I was still so small, so young... working in a male ward. Those men start toying with you... want to flirt with you... harass you... So, you have to be aggressive... [so patients] know I am the boss... you have to be harsh." [Frontline Nurse, County A_013]

Nurses described how they learned norms of patient care by picking up traits from senior nurses, then changing to behave more like themselves:

"You find the more experienced nurse who is very harsh on patient, you see? You also learn that 'Oh, so this is how things are done', so you also find yourself doing the same.... Some of them [nurses] were kind, polite, so you feel that the trait you had picked [from experienced nurses] is... too harsh, so let me tone down... become polite to the patients like the other nurses. You also start being kind to

[patients]... Other nurses... I picked some of their traits, I would be mean, and won't be myself." [Frontline Nurse, County A_013]

However, sometimes 'toughening up' also involved adopting 'transgressive practical norms' (de Sardan, 2015) and procedural violations that were harmful to patients. For instance, some interviewees described work environments where patients were seen as a 'bother' and beneath nurses' social level:

"When I entered the profession, I started going to the clinical area, I started interacting with them [nurses] more, I really didn't like [it]... I trained in [name of public hospital mentioned], it was really bad. The language used on patients was bad... like patients were a bother... The nurses felt like they were above the patient... that patients were wasting their time." [Frontline nurse manager, County A_011]

Reflecting Jewkes et al.'s (1998) study, nurses described sometimes abusing patients, for example justifying slapping 'uncooperative' mothers giving birth as necessary to maintain authority over them and prevent baby deaths:

"This patient comes out of this hospital... saying nurses are bad but in other ways you have to react... Uncooperative mothers, for example, if she closes the legs when the baby is coming, what do you do? You slap the mother because... the baby's head is outside, so this baby is getting choked, at the end of it you are coming out with a dead baby, so... you have to pinch... slap... or you shout at them... so that they know the seriousness about this matter." [Focus group discussion_ Frontline nurse, County A_004]

Nurses also described how they had ‘matured up through experience’ and learned to understand and deal with rude patients:

“I have matured up through experience... now I know if... the patient is rude... [In the past when a] patient was agitating... I’d talk... out of the anger. I have come to realize... maybe that person is doing that because he is stressed by the disease.”
[Frontline Nurse Manager, County B_001]

Another nurse described how she ‘changed her mind’ about caring for patients suffering from distasteful conditions, developing sense of service and empathy:

“We were being punished if you were brought to ward eight... full with stinking and smelling wounds... We had to change our mind and say this is not a punishment ward... we are here because God chose us to give these services... This is part of the nursing... That patient... is not [here] by choice... So, you put yourself into their shoes, 'If it was me, would I want someone to do this?' So that is what kept me nursing.” *[Frontline Nurse Manager, County B_09]*

Thus, nurses’ identity reconciliation work involved ‘toughening up’ in their new working environment, adopting practical nursing norms and learning to deal with difficult circumstances sometimes in ways violating procedures. They then described ‘maturing up through experience’ and later treating patients kindly and politely to reflect a sense of service expected of a nurse.

Reclaiming Professional identity: Fulfilling a professional calling through caring for patients

Eventually, new nurses realized they had become fully fledged nurses when senior colleagues recognized them as such by assigning them important responsibilities, such as allocating duties and mentoring students:

I used to be given tasks by my previous In-Charges [senior nurses], like duty allocations, student mentorship... I made it and they saw I was a capable person [Frontline Nurse Manager, County A_002]

More significantly, despite the challenges during the transition from training into practice, many nurses were finally about to reclaim and derive satisfaction from their valued professional identity through caring for and nursing patients to recovery:

"This is the profession I needed... the right place to be... despite all the challenges... you just feel like you are doing the best you could ever do in your life... to take care of these people... that pushes me to love the job." [Frontline nurse manager, County A_002]

"Nursing is a... good profession, I just feel we are good because that sick patient depends on you... It is satisfying especially when that sick baby comes in the ward, you do the right thing... that child goes home" [Frontline Nurse, County B_014]

Coping with difficult situations, work pressure, high expectations, learning from mistakes and earning the trust of colleagues and patients, enabled nurses to reclaim their professional identity:

“You take responsibility for... everything you do, so if you make a mistake you take responsibility for that... When you finish the day without mistakes, messed [up] because of the pressure, but you have learnt, it is a step and then when you get used to the system things become very simple. [Frontline Nurse_ County B_003]

Proximity to and caring for patients also then enabled nurses to claim to best understand and represent patient interests, and thus reclaim their inter-professional status in relation to doctors within the wider health care system:

“The nurses want now to claim their position in healthcare... as much as some of the other cadres look down upon them... the healthcare system, it depends largely on what they [nurses] do, because they are the ones with the patients most of the time, they understand the patients better than any other person.” [Senior nurse manager, County B_015]

Finally, nurses described how they became role models and sources of knowledge for new generations of nurses, enabling them to restore their collective professional identity:

“[New nurses] keep on asking me, so it has even made me go back to books to equip myself with more knowledge, so that I can be a source of knowledge to them, because they always look upon you and they feel that you should be knowing”. [Frontline Nurse Manager, County A_011]

In sum, by overcoming the challenges of transitioning into nursing practice, through identity reconciliation work, caring for and nursing patients back to health, nurses were able to reclaim their professional identity and authority within their wider health system.

Discussion

Research (MacIntosh, 2003, Duchscher, 2009) has long highlighted the shock nurses in high income countries experience moving into new roles, yet little research has examined this transition in LMIC healthcare contexts involving extreme resource limitations. We examine such experiences among new nurses in the LMIC context of Kenya.

Some nurses we interviewed described being motivated by a professional 'calling' and idealized image of nursing providing 'service to humanity', often following inspiring encounters with nurses during childhood. However, for others nursing was a second choice career (for example, for those unable to get into medical school) or simply a 'job in demand' in which they could easily earn a living (cf Price, 2009).

Regardless of initial motivations, transitioning from training into nursing practice was a shock for most nurses, as it violated their previous idealized image and expectation of nursing and patient care. First, nursing involved 'working and learning alone', 'learning the hard way', dealing with heavy workloads, responsibility for patients and having to treat patients in ways violating training (e.g., administering drugs single-handedly), with little support from experienced colleagues. This violated new nurses' expectations of a being part of a collegial and ethical profession providing high quality patient care.

Second, nurses described being shocked having to deal with 'dirty' patients and medical conditions, work they described meant that the public looked down upon them. Drawing on Jewkes and colleagues (1998) and Hadley and colleagues (2007), we suggest this 'dirty work' violated some new nurses' expectations of a middle-class professional status and identity, which led them to question their nursing career and undermined their motivation to provide high quality patient care.

Such transition shocks suggest that nursing schools are failing to adequately prepare trainee nurses for nursing work, placing too much emphasis on abstract theory and too little on placements that bridge the theory-practice gap (Shoghi et al., 2019). This, in part, is due to the large student cohorts and low number of tutors able to provide the guidance and mentoring student nurses need (Appiagyei et al., 2014). Furthermore, having to take responsibilities and decisions affecting patients' health and lives in chaotic working environments, was more stressful than nurses expected. This consequently resulted in some nurses having to depersonalize patients and patient care to cope with working in such resource-constrained contexts, as have been described in other studies of nursing work (Menzies, 1959, McKnight et al., 2020).

However, as we noted earlier, identity violations can trigger identity reconciliation work (Pratt et al., 2006). Similarly, through *toughening up*, learning and adopting localized *practical norms* violating procedural standards to cope with the demands of practice, nurses in our study reconstructed their professional selves. Novice nurses were quickly enculturated into experienced nurses' routines and practices, including rationing care, prioritizing technical care, justifying bad behaviours and procedural violations, and using authority over patients, reflecting practices also noted in other studies of nursing work (Nzinga et al., 2019b, McKnight et al., 2020, Mackintosh, 2006).

Nurses then described how 'maturing up through experience' they gradually found their more authentic professional selves, adopting or rejecting more experienced nurses' practices, behaviours and practical norms. For some, this often resulted in the provision of sub-optimal patient care, while other nurses were able to restore their valued professional identity and reclaimed this position in the health system through caring for

patients and experiencing satisfaction as patients recovered. The development of a mature nursing identity was finally recognized and validated by senior colleagues, as for junior doctors (Pratt et al., 2006), when seniors assigned nurses responsibility for mentoring other new nurses, thus passing down knowledge to a new cadre of new nurses. We make several contributions. First, we extend analysis of identity newcomer transition shocks for nurses (MacIntosh, 2003, Duchscher, 2009) into the empirical context of LMICs, using theory about professional identity work (Pratt et al., 2006), practical norms (de Sardan, 2015, Nzinga et al., 2019a) and normalized procedural violations (Amalberti et al., 2006, Banja, 2010) to explain this transition. Empirically, we explain shocks (particularly 'working and learning alone' and doing 'dirty work') that new nurses in a LMIC health care context experience transitioning from training into practice, which violate their expectations of their professional identities. We also show the consequent identity work ('toughening up', 'maturing through experience', and 'learning practical norms') nurses use to restore their professional self. As we noted earlier, rather than contributing to the crowded identity and identity work literature, we argue that using identity theories in this way can highlight nurses' experience in ways bringing out implications for the HRH training, patient safety and quality improvement in LMICs.

Novice nurses' early experiences in the workplace play a huge role in helping them cope with work demands (ten Hoeve et al., 2018) but these experiences are often negative, characterized by lack of supportive mentorship and mistrust as reported above. Such difficult relationships between new nurses and their supervisors contribute to a 'stifled' identity, as novices' self-confidence and competence are undermined (Ke and Stocker, 2019). To cope with harsh realities, nurses are forced to innovate coping mechanisms

(Nzinga et al., 2019b, McKnight et al., 2020). We highlight the importance of professional 'calling' in helping health professionals' transition into clinical practice. We show how, through using practical norms to care for patients to recovery, and validating a mature identity with senior colleagues, health professionals in LMICs can reclaim a valued professional identity. This appears important for the motivation and retention in health professions and subsequently role modelling.

Implications for policy, quality and safety in health care in LMICs

Idealistic images of nursing profession among students can result in disillusionment and negatively impact how new health professionals settle into, interpret, and enact their roles (Mooney, 2007, ten Hoeve et al., 2018, Mackintosh, 2006). In our study, we similarly found that preconceived and idealized expectations of nursing work playing a big role in new nurses' transition shock. Therefore, providing a more realistic image of nursing practice and providing more practical experience during training would help to mitigate this shock during transition into practice.

Our study therefore highlights the need for nursing education to better prepare students for nursing work, perhaps through more extensive placements and practical experiences. While such placements and experiences may be the norm in high income countries, they seem to be squeezed out during nurses training in LMICs, over-enrolment and increasingly busy nurse trainers, resulting in the problematic transition shocks we describe. New nurses need to be made aware of and prepared for potential transitional shocks and identity violations they may experience when first encountering nursing practice.

New nurses then need to be supported to rework their professional practices and identities during this period. Novice nurses might be provided dedicated mentoring, supervision and professional groups that they can draw upon for support and advice. The lack of preceptors to orient and support new nurses into practice can contribute to difficulties transitioning into work, with research linking this to intentions to leave the profession (Flinkman and Salanterä, 2015, Ulupinar and Aydogan, 2021). Policymakers and nurse managers therefore need to cultivate more supportive workplace culture where new nurses can discuss work performance with preceptors and feel comfortable asking questions and foster positive socialization to help new nurses develop competency and confidence (Innes and Calleja, 2018, Azimian et al., 2014). However, given the resource constraints within LMICs, this aspiration may be challenging.

We described new nurses learning to cope with their demanding work through 'toughening up' and 'learning the hard way' but, in doing so, they adopted senior colleagues' practices that deviated from official guidelines as a tolerated practical norm. In our study, some violations were seen to be justified, for example as means for pushing new nurses to learn and improve or to control patients to avert negative outcomes. This raises important questions relating to patient safety as the distinction between practical norms enabling the delivery of health care in severely resource constrained circumstances and those simply perpetuating low quality and dangerous practices, is often unclear. Similar findings are reported in other LMIC settings, a study in India describe birth work as 'dirty work' and mistreatment of women during labour being normalised and therefore informing workplace norms such that these violations become acceptable (Mayra et al., 2021).

Amalberti and colleagues (2006) posit that the consequence of this is that it predisposes professionals to operate at the boundary of the deviance, which poses a significant risk to the way new professionals are socialized into practice. This normalization of deviance may be problematic where deviations and violations become accustomed to or condoned to the extent that they are not questioned, but instead become rationalized. This problem may be compounded by the lack of transparency in LMIC health systems (McGivern et al., 2017, Cleary et al., 2013), meaning that procedural violations are allowed to continue by virtue of their invisibility.

Given the extreme human, material and financial resources limitations in most LMICs, care guidelines need to be contextualized to reflect local realities (English et al., 2020). Internationally recommended guidelines transposed into these settings may be unachievable and may therefore contribute to stress, resistance to change and demotivation of healthcare workers. Therefore guidelines need to be better adapted to reflect LMIC settings in practice, taking into account the perspectives of the local experts/stakeholders (Olayemi et al., 2017, Maaløe et al., 2021).

Echoing Banja (2010), we therefore call for 'formative spaces' (McGivern and Fischer, 2012) within healthcare systems in LMICs, in which professionals can openly speak, in 'psychological safety' (Edmondson, 1999), about practical norms, procedural violations and challenge violations that are both necessary or dangerous/harmful to patients. This has important implications for both patient safety and professional identity formation, as a means of preventing the normalization of deviance in future generations of health professionals. If nurses and other health professionals are able to safely and openly discuss adaptive and transgressive practical norms and procedural violations affecting

their work, both nurses and policy makers may become more aware of both harmful and adaptive practical norms. Adaptive practical norms might then be incorporated into professional standards to better reflect practices on the ground and become easier to comply with, while nurses will hopefully become more reflective of the harms caused by transgressive practical norms.

Creating such space, supervision, and mentoring is challenging in resource constrained LMICs. However positive examples of formative spaces, supervision and mentoring exist, like 'Balint Groups' (Kjeldmand and Holmström, 2008), 'Schwartz Rounds' (Lown and Manning, 2010) and Quality Improvement networks (McGivern et al., 2017, English et al., 2016, 2017), which help health professionals cope with work challenges, learn, avoid burnout, and might serve as guiding models for future policy-development.

Limitations, boundary conditions and future research

We suggest that Kenyan nursing may be an extreme case revealing transition shocks and identity work relevant to health professionals in other LMICs and beyond. However, our study was conducted in one country (Kenya) and profession (nursing) hence further research in other countries and professions is needed to test whether our findings can be generalised.

Moreover, the number of nurses we interviewed who were undertaking their internships at that time was limited. We interviewed other nurses about their experiences of becoming new nurses several years after they had done so. We believe their accounts of internships and independent practice are valid. However, we acknowledge that these nurses may

have suffered from recall and survival bias, involving recalling past events in a way neglecting, overlooking, justifying or reinterpreting past failures to construct a more socially acceptable account of their behaviours. Future research therefore is needed to further critically explore the changing 'live' experiences of new nurses as they are going through internships to further validate our findings.

Finally, our study also highlights the need for more research examining the practical norms health professionals draw upon and normalized procedural violations in health systems in LMICs. Making such practical norms and normalized procedural violations more visible, and then informing ways to challenge and prevent those that are harmful from reoccurring, could have a highly positive impact on the quality of patient care provided in practice in LMICs.

Conclusion

We examine how new nurses in LMICs construct their professional identities when starting clinical practice involving unexpected practical norms deviating from training and official procedures. Novice nurses trained to pursue a 'calling' to service and patient care or because nursing was a 'job in demand'. However, nurses described their 'shock' when they were forced to work and learn alone while responsible for many patient and do 'dirty work'. This violated their expectations of an idealized professional identity and previous training. However, this violation triggered reconciliation identity work, involving 'toughening up', 'maturing through experience', and learning practical norms. Finally, some nurses experienced satisfaction from caring for and nursing patients back to health and restored their valued professional identity. Our findings highlight the need for professional educators and health policymakers to better prepare new professionals for

the challenges of clinical practice, providing more extensive placements involving more practical experience of nursing and better supervision. We also suggest that policymakers provide formative spaces, supervisory and mentoring to help nurses through their transition into nursing work and to develop positive professional identities essential to the motivation and retention of nurses in LMICs.

Acknowledgement

This work was supported by a [TBA] grant awarded to [TBA] by [TBA], grant number [TBA]. The funding sources had no role in the study design, writing of the report and in the decision to submit the manuscript for publication. This paper was written and published with the permission of [TBA].

References

- AMALBERTI, R., VINCENT, C., AUROY, Y. & DE SAINT MAURICE, G. 2006. Violations and migrations in health care: a framework for understanding and management. *BMJ Quality & Safety*, 15, i66-i71.
- APPIAGYEI, A. A., KIRIINYA, R. N., GROSS, J. M., WAMBUA, D. N., OYWER, E. O., KAMENJU, A. K., HIGGINS, M. K., RILEY, P. L. & ROGERS, M. F. 2014. Informing the scale-up of Kenya's nursing workforce: a mixed methods study of factors affecting pre-service training capacity and production. *Human Resources for Health*, 12, 1-10.
- AZIMIAN, J., NEGARANDEH, R. & FAKHR-MOVAHEDI, A. 2014. Factors affecting nurses' coping with transition: an exploratory qualitative study. *Global Journal of Health Science*, 6, 88.
- BANGDIWALA, S. I., FONN, S., OKOYE, O. & TOLLMAN, S. 2010. Workforce resources for health in developing countries. *Public Health Reviews*, 32, 296-318.
- BANJA, J. 2010. The normalization of deviance in healthcare delivery. *Business horizons*, 53, 139-148.
- BOLTON, S. 2005. Women's work, dirty work: the gynaecology nurse as 'other'. *Gender, work & organization*, 12, 169-186.
- BROWN, A. 2015. Identities and Identity Work in Organizations. *International Journal of Management Reviews*, 17, 20-40.
- CHANDLER, C., CHONYA, S., MTEI, F., REYBURN, H. & WHITTY, C. 2009. Motivation, money & respect: A mixed method study of Tanzanian non-physician clinicians. *Social Science & Medicine*, 68, 2078-88.
- CLEARY, S., MOLYNEUX, C. & GILSON, L. 2013. Resources, attitudes and culture: an understanding of the factors that influence the functioning of accountability mechanisms in primary health care settings. *BMC Health Services Research*, 13.
- CORBIN, J. M. & STRAUSS, A. 1990. Grounded theory research: Procedures, canons, and evaluative criteria. *Qualitative sociology*, 13, 3-21.
- CROFT, C., CURRIE, G. & LOCKETT, A. 2015. The impact of emotionally important social identities on the construction of a managerial leader identity: a challenge for nurses in the English National Health Service. *Organization Studies*, 36, 113-131.
- DE SARDAN, J.-P. 2015. Practical Norms: Informal regulations within public bureaucracies (in Africa and beyond). In: DE HERDT, T. & DE SARDAN, J.-P. (eds.) *Real Governance and Practical Norms in Sub-Saharan Africa: The game of the rules*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- DEPPOLITI, D. 2008. Exploring how new registered nurses construct professional identity in hospital settings. *The Journal of Continuing Education in Nursing*, 39, 255-262.
- DUCHSCHER, J. E. B. 2009. Transition shock: The initial stage of role adaptation for newly graduated registered nurses. *Journal of advanced nursing*, 65, 1103-1113.
- EDMONDSON, A. 1999. Psychological Safety and Learning Behavior in Work Teams. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 44, 350-383.
- ENGLISH, M., AYIEKO, P., NYAMAI, R., WERE, F., GITHANGA, D. & IRIMU, G. 2017. What do we think we are doing? How might a clinical information network be promoting implementation of recommended paediatric care practices in Kenyan hospitals? *Health Research Policy and Systems*, 15.
- ENGLISH, M., GATHARA, D., NZINGA, J., KUMAR, P., WERE, F., WARFA, O., TALLAM-KIMAIYO, E., NANDILI, M., OBENGO, A. & ABUYA, N. 2020. Lessons from a Health Policy and Systems Research programme exploring the quality and coverage of newborn care in Kenya. *BMJ global health*, 5, e001937.
- ENGLISH, M., IRIMU, G., ADWEYA, A., GATHARA, D., OLIWA, J., AUYIEKO, P., WERE, F., PATON, C., TUNIS, S. & FORREST, C. 2016. Building Learning Health Systems to Accelerate Research and Improve Outcomes of Clinical Care in Low and Middle-Income Countries *PLOS Medicine*, 13, e1001991.

- FEALY, G. 2004. 'The good nurse': visions and values in images of the nurse. *Journal of advanced nursing*, 46, 649-656.
- FLINKMAN, M. & SALANTERÄ, S. 2015. Early career experiences and perceptions—a qualitative exploration of the turnover of young registered nurses and intention to leave the nursing profession in Finland. *Journal of nursing management*, 23, 1050-1057.
- GIOIA, D. A., CORLEY, K. G. & HAMILTON, A. L. 2013. Seeking qualitative rigor in inductive research: Notes on the Gioia methodology. *Organizational research methods*, 16, 15-31.
- HADLEY, M., BLUM, L., .MUJADDID, S., PARVEEN, S., NUREMOWLA, S., HAQUE, M. E. & ULLAH, M. 2007. Why Bangladeshi nurses avoid 'nursing': social and structural factors on hospital wards in Bangladesh. *Social Science & Medicine*, 64, 1166-1177.
- IBARRA, H. 1999. Provisional Selves: Experimenting with Image and Identity in Professional Adaption. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 44, 764-791.
- INNES, T. & CALLEJA, P. 2018. Transition support for new graduate and novice nurses in critical care settings: an integrative review of the literature. *Nurse education in practice*, 30, 62-72.
- JEWKES, R., ABRAHAMS, N. & MVO, Z. 1998. WHY DO NURSES ABUSE PATIENTS? REFLECTIONS FROM SOUTH AFRICAN OBSTETRIC SERVICES. *Social Science & Medicine*, 47, 1781-95.
- KE, Y. T. & STOCKER, J. F. 2019. On the difficulty of finding one's place: A qualitative study of new nurses' processes of growth in the workplace. *Journal of clinical nursing*, 28, 4321-4331.
- KJELDMAND, D. & HOLMSTRÖM, I. 2008. Balint Groups as a Means to Increase Job Satisfaction and Prevent Burnout Among General Practitioners. *Annals of Family Medicine*, 6, 138-145.
- LOWN, B. A. & MANNING, C. F. 2010. The Schwartz Center Rounds: evaluation of an interdisciplinary approach to enhancing patient-centered communication, teamwork, and provider support. *Academic Medicine*, 85, 1073-1081.
- MAALØE, N., ØRTVED, A. M. R., SØRENSEN, J. B., DMELLO, B. S., VAN DEN AKKER, T., KUJABI, M. L., KIDANTO, H., MEGUID, T., BYGBJERG, I. C. & VAN ROOSMALEN, J. 2021. The injustice of unfit clinical practice guidelines in low-resource realities. *The Lancet Global Health*.
- MACINTOSH, J. 2003. Reworking professional nursing identity. *Western journal of nursing research*, 25, 725-741.
- MACKINTOSH, C. 2006. Caring: the socialisation of pre-registration student nurses: a longitudinal qualitative descriptive study. *International journal of nursing studies*, 43, 953-962.
- MARAÑÓN, A. A. & PERA, M. P. I. 2015. Theory and practice in the construction of professional identity in nursing students: A qualitative study. *Nurse Education Today*, 35, 859-863.
- MAYRA, K., MATTHEWS, Z. & PADMADAS, S. S. 2021. Why do some health care providers disrespect and abuse women during childbirth in India? *Women and Birth*.
- MCGIVERN, G., CURRIE, G., FERLIE, E., FITZGERALD, L. & WARING, J. 2015. Hybrid manager-professionals' identity work, the maintenance and hybridization of medical professionalism in managerial contexts. *Public Administration*, 93, 412-432
- MCGIVERN, G. & FISCHER, M. D. 2012. Reactivity and reactions to regulatory transparency in medicine, psychotherapy and counselling. *Social Science & Medicine*, 74, 286-296.
- MCGIVERN, G., NZINGA, J. & ENGLISH, M. 2017. Pastoral practices' for quality improvement in a Kenyan clinical network. *Social Science & Medicine*, 195, 115-122.
- MCKNIGHT, J., NZINGA, J., JEPKOSGEI, J. & ENGLISH, M. 2020. Collective strategies to cope with work related stress among nurses in resource constrained settings: an ethnography of neonatal nursing in Kenya. *Social Science & Medicine*, 245, 112698.
- MENZIES, I. 1959. A case study in the functioning of the social system as a defence against anxiety. *Human Relations*, 13, 95-121.
- MOONEY, M. 2007. Facing registration: the expectations and the unexpected. *Nurse education today*, 27, 840-847.

- NZINGA, J., MCGIVERN, G. & ENGLISH, M. 2019a. Hybrid clinical-managers in Kenyan hospitals: Navigating between professional, official and practical norms. *Journal of Health Organization & Management*, 33, 173-187.
- NZINGA, J., MCKNIGHT, J., JEPKOSGEI, J. & ENGLISH, M. 2019b. Exploring the space for task shifting to support nursing on neonatal wards in Kenyan public hospitals. *Human resources for health*, 17, 18.
- OLAYEMI, E., ASARE, E. V. & BENNEH-AKWASI KUMA, A. A. 2017. Guidelines in lower-middle income countries. *British journal of haematology*, 177, 846-854.
- PRATT, M. G., ROCKMANN, K. W. & KAUFMANN, J. B. 2006. Constructing Professional Identity: The Role of Work and Identity Learning Cycles in the Customization of Identity among Medical Residents. *Academy of Management Journal*, 49, 235-262.
- PRICE, S. L. 2009. Becoming a nurse: a meta-study of early professional socialization and career choice in nursing. *Journal of advanced nursing*, 65, 11-19.
- RITCHIE, L. M. P., KHAN, S., MOORE, J. E., TIMMINGS, C., VAN LETTOW, M., VOGEL, J. P., KHAN, D. N., MBARUKU, G., MRISHO, M. & MUGERWA, K. 2016. Low-and middle-income countries face many common barriers to implementation of maternal health evidence products. *Journal of clinical epidemiology*, 76, 229-237.
- SHOGHI, M., SAJADI, M., OSKUIE, F., DEHNAD, A. & BORIMNEJAD, L. 2019. Strategies for bridging the theory-practice gap from the perspective of nursing experts. *Heliyon*, 5, e02503.
- SVENINGSSON, S. & ALVESSON, M. 2003. Managing managerial identities: Organizational fragmentation, discourse and identity struggle. *Human Relations*, 56, 1163-1194.
- TEN HOEVE, Y., KUNNEN, S., BROUWER, J. & ROODBOL, P. F. 2018. The voice of nurses: Novice nurses' first experiences in a clinical setting. A longitudinal diary study. *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, 27, e1612-e1626.
- ULUPINAR, S. & AYDOGAN, Y. 2021. New graduate nurses' satisfaction, adaptation and intention to leave in their first year: A descriptive study. *Journal of Nursing Management*.
- WALKER, L. & GILSON, L. 2004. "We are bitter but we are satisfied": nurses as street-level bureaucrats in South Africa. *Social Science & Medicine*, 59, 1251-61.
- WHO 2016. Global strategy on human resources for health: workforce 2030.
- WILLIS-SHATTUCK, M., BIDWELL, P., THOMAS, S., WYNESS, L., BLAAUW, D. & DITLOPO, P. 2008. Motivation and retention of health workers in developing countries: a systematic review. *BMC Health Serv Research*, 4, 247.

Appendix 1: Coding table & data structure

Thematic codes	First order subthemes & codes	Illustrative interview & focus group extracts
Motivation for professional training: Professional calling	Passion for nursing, patient care & service Image of (smartly dressed) nurses before training	<i>It was like a call; I had the passion... to nurse that patient and take care of them.</i> <i>You know I have that heart [passion] for a patient. You know if you want to become a nurse, you must have patients at heart and you put yourself in their shoe- that situation the patient is in.</i> <i>You see nursing is in my blood. Because I tell people and they feel it's quite funny. When I was in primary school... I was always going to the hospital, so my wounds were always being dressed, and I found it fun.</i> <i>When I was young, I went to the hospital and I saw how smartly the nurses were dressed and I desired to be dressed like them... That image is what attracted me to nursing.</i>
Pragmatic job choice	Ease finding a job Second career choice	<i>I like nursing... because when you do nursing, it's the ease to get a job. And you find that you are in demand, nursing is always in demand everywhere you go.</i> <i>I wanted to be a doctor, but... my grade made me go for nursing</i>
Identity violations transiting into professional practice	Learning and working alone 'Dirty work'	<i>It was frightening... you are alone, you have the patient there. So you're like, are you going to now make it?</i> <i>It was hard...it was my first posting. I found senior nurses who were not friendly... if you went to the other wards for assistance... they speak ill of you.</i> <i>I was left alone very... junior from school. No senior qualified staff to assist me...So it was difficult for me</i> <i>As a junior, you're given the dirty jobs.</i> <i>What I dislike about nursing is the kind of job you do. Like cleaning wounds, like now somebody would come with a wound which has got maggots, and you have to clean, all that smell- one thing I dislike about nursing is that, the kind of work you do.</i>

Identity reconciliation work:	Toughening up	<i>Guys are toughened because it's like you are been conditioned to the same kind of environment every day.</i>
	Adopting practical norms	<p><i>I also learnt how to be innovative, sometimes you come and find that like you have only one flow meter then you are supposed to give oxygen to three patients and the flow meter is one so you cant choose which one to start with so you think of, I get the normal saline in bottles, you open all the oxygen in bottles then you attach the nasal flows to this normal saline in bottle so that you can at least deliver the oxygen to the three patients who need that, so there was that ability to try and to innovate</i></p> <p><i>like some procedures, you know if you are alone, and maybe you were supposed to do a procedure as two [nurses] but you are alone, you will have to adapt and learn to do it alone... Like sometimes turning-turning [a patient] because you are in the afternoon duty alone. Be sure you are going to turn alone</i></p>
	Maturing	<p><i>I'm finding there's a reality in being a nurse, I'm responsible to that patient. All that patient wants is for somebody to explain what is happening, what is your expectation. If you have to undergo labor... has someone explained to the mother, what are the expectations...If maybe there's loss?</i></p> <p><i>I've learnt that there's what we call respective [respectful] nurse care, respective [respectful] maternity care, you talk to that [patient], and the moment they understand, their expectations of the outcomes, then you find the relationship is closer.</i></p>
Reclaiming professional identity	Fulfilling a professional calling through caring for patients	<p><i>This is the right place to be... you manage a patient; this patient has been in coma ... suddenly this patient wakes up you just feel like you are doing the best you could ever do in your life</i></p> <p><i>Being a nurse is... a privilege because you will find most of the time the nurse is the one who spends time with the patient.</i></p> <p><i>And after helping them, somebody gets cured, or passes through my hands I felt I was satisfied because the feedback that I would get from them, that, we have recovered, we are okay, they come to me, let's</i></p>

		<i>say we helped them during delivery, they feel they are contented. So initially there were those minor, you know, challenges, but after now adapting and getting to the system fully, everything, it was okay.</i>
	Building relationships with & understanding of patients	<i>I'm there to help the patient. To listen to the patient, to talk to them, to give them the assurance. You are the one who is able to identify what is their [patients'] need at this time and who is supposed to fulfil that need.</i>
	Improving professional competency & mentoring new nurses Developing the nursing profession	<i>When you have learnt something... you want to share that knowledge and ... experiences with others There is that confidence.. on how to deliver the service... and then there is that critical thinking. You can think on your feet because you have seen such a case before, so this one you can be able to handle without struggle. And also... being a mentor to students and teaching them. I should be able to move the nursing profession from where I found it in the hospital to a better level</i>

Acknowledgement

This work was supported by a joint Health Systems Research Initiative grant awarded to David Gathara and Jacinta Nzinga by the Department for International Development, UK (DFID), Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC), Medical Research Council (MRC) and Wellcome Trust, grant number MR/R018510/1. The funding sources had no role in the study design, writing of the report and in the decision to submit the manuscript for publication. This paper is published with the permission of the Director of KEMRI.

Journal Pre-proof

Conflict of Interest and Authorship Conformation Form

- All authors have participated in (a) conception and design, or analysis and interpretation of the data; (b) drafting the article or revising it critically for important intellectual content; and (c) approval of the final version.
- This manuscript has not been submitted to, nor is under review at, another journal or other publishing venue.
- The authors have no affiliation with any organization with a direct or indirect financial interest in the subject matter discussed in the manuscript.

Author's name**Affiliation**

Daniel Mbutia	KEMRI Wellcome Trust Research Programme
Prof. Gerald McGivern	University of Warwick
Prof. Mike English	KEMRI Wellcome Trust Research Programme & University of Oxford
Prof. Sharon Brownie	Waikato Institute of Technology
Prof. Debra Jackson	University of Sydney
Prof. David Gathara	KEMRI Wellcome Trust Research Programme & London School of Hygiene and Tropical medicine
Dr. Jacinta Nzinga	KEMRI Wellcome Trust Research Programme

Ethical Statement for Solid State Ionics

Hereby, I Daniel Mbutia consciously assure that for the manuscript '*Professional Identity Transitions, Violations and Reconciliations among New Nurses in Low- and Middle-Income Countries*' the following is fulfilled:

- 1) This material is the authors' own original work, which has not been previously published elsewhere.
- 2) The paper is not currently being considered for publication elsewhere.
- 3) The paper reflects the authors' own research and analysis in a truthful and complete manner.
- 4) The paper properly credits the meaningful contributions of co-authors and co-researchers.
- 5) The results are appropriately placed in the context of prior and existing research.
- 6) All sources used are properly disclosed (correct citation). Literally copying of text must be indicated as such by using quotation marks and giving proper reference.
- 7) All authors have been personally and actively involved in substantial work leading to the paper, and will take public responsibility for its content.

The violation of the Ethical Statement rules may result in severe consequences.

To verify originality, your article may be checked by the originality detection software iThenticate. See also <http://www.elsevier.com/editors/plagdetect>.

I agree with the above statements and declare that this submission follows the policies of Solid State Ionics as outlined in the Guide for Authors and in the Ethical Statement.

Date: April 13, 2021



Daniel Mbutia.