

Citation for published version: John, HM, Forte, B, Astin, I, Allbrook, T, Arnold, A, Vani, BC & Häggström, I 2021, 'Performance of GPS positioning in the presence of irregularities in the auroral and polar ionospheres during EISCAT UHF/ESR measurements', Remote Sensing, vol. 13, no. 23, 4798. https://doi.org/10.3390/rs13234798

DOI: 10.3390/rs13234798

Publication date: 2021

Document Version Peer reviewed version

Link to publication

Publisher Rights CC BY

University of Bath

Alternative formats

If you require this document in an alternative format, please contact: openaccess@bath.ac.uk

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



* remote sensing

MDPI

Article				
Performance of	f GPS positioning in the presence of irregulari-			
ties in the auro	ral and polar ionospheres during EISCAT			
UHF/ESR measurements				
Habila Mormi John ^{1,*} , Bia Häggström ⁵	gio Forte ¹ , Ivan Astin ¹ , Tom Allbrook ² , Alex Arnold ³ , Bruno Cesar Vani ⁴ and Ingemar			
	 Department of Electronic and Electrical Engineering, University of Bath, United Kingdom; jonnymor- miv@yahoo.com; b.fortc@bath.ac.uk; eesia@bath.ac.uk Independent; tom.allbrook@bath.edu Independent; alex.arnold@bath.edu Federal Institute of Education, Science and Technology of São Paulo – IFSP, Brazil 2; brunovani@ifsp.edu.br EISCAT Scientific Association, Kiruna, Sweden; ingemar.haggstrom@eiscat.se * Correspondence: jonnymormiv@yahoo.com 			
Citation: John, H. M.; Forte, B.; As- tin, I.; Allbrook, T.; Arnold, A.; Vani, B. C.; Häggström, I. Performance of GPS positioning in the presence of irregularities in the auroral and po- lar ionospheres during EISCAT UHF/ESR measurements . <i>Remote</i> <i>Sens.</i> 2021, <i>13</i> , x. https://doi.org/10.3390/xxxxx Academic Editor: Firstname Last- name	Abstract: Irregularities in the spatial distribution of the ionospheric electron density introduce tem- poral fluctuations in the intensity and phase of radio signals received from Global Navigation Sat- ellite Systems (GNSS). The impact of phase fluctuations originating from irregularities in the auroral and polar ionospheres on GPS positioning was investigated on three days in March 2018 in the presence of quiet-to-moderately disturbed magnetic conditions by combining measurements from GPS and EISCAT UHF/ESR incoherent scatter radars. Two different positioning solutions were an- alysed: broadcast kinematic (BK) and precise static (PS). The results show that the propagation through irregularities induced residual errors on the observables leading to an increase in the posi- tioning error, in its variability, and in the occurrence of gaps. An important aspect emerging from this study is that the variability of the 3-D positioning error reduced and the presence of gaps dis- appeared when the positioning solutions were evaluated at a 1 s rate rather than at a 30 s rate. This is due to the transient nature of residual errors that are more significant over 30 s time inter- vals in the presence of irregularities with scale size between few kilometres in the E region to few tens of kilometres in the F region.			
Received: date Accepted: date Published: date	Keywords: Ionospheric irregularities; Disturbed ionospheric and geomagnetic conditions; TEC fluctuations; Broadcast kinematic positioning; Precise static positioning; EISCAT UHF/ESR			
Publisher's Note: MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations. Orypright: © 2021 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https://creativecommons.org/license s/by/4.0/).	1. Introduction Our modern society increasingly relies on continuous and reliable GNSS positioning, navigation and timing: for example, from surveying to safety-critical applications such as autonomous navigation [1-3]. However, irregularities in the ionospheric electron density distribution can induce disturbances inon the GNSS signals which propagate through. These disturbances take the form of temporal fluctuations inon the intensity and phase of received GNSS radio signals and <u>causcoriginate</u> higher-order errors that cannot be eliminated through the dual-frequency combination of observables [4] or through standard global/regional models. These higher-order residual errors on dual-frequency combinations introduced by ionospheric irregularities along GNSS ray paths lead to an increase in the magnitude and variability of the positioning error [4]. The size of ionospheric irregularities varies between larger and smaller spatial scales due to the action of plasma instability mechanisms in the equatorial, mid-latitudes, and high-latitude-high latitudes ionosphere [5]. In the case of GNSS signals, -the propagation			
Remote Sens. 2021 , 13, x. https://doi	.org/10.3390/xxxxx www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing			

through large-scale ionospheric irregularities induces phase fluctuations over longer tem-45 poral intervals, whereas the propagation through small-scale irregularities leads to scin-46 tillation (i.e. fluctuations over shorter temporal intervals) in the intensity and phase of the 47 received GNSS signals as a consequence of a scattering process. Phase fluctuations origi-48 natingoriginated from the propagation through larger-scale ionospheric irregularities are typically 49 quantifiable through the rate of change of the slant Total Electron Content (TEC) [6] (i.e., 50 temporal fluctuations in Slant TEC). On the other hand, intensity and phase scintillation 51 arising from the propagation through small-scale ionospheric irregularities is quantified by 52 means of the scintillation indices S_4 and σ_{ϕ} , respectively [7; 8; 9; 10]. 53

In the equatorial ionosphere, GNSS signals experience both TEC fluctuations and scintillation as they propagate through large-to-small scale field-aligned irregularities that form in conjunction with plasma bubbles and plumes of ionisation. The occurrence of large-to-small scale field-aligned irregularities in the equatorial ionosphere maximises in the post-sunset sector and increases with solar activity [7; 11; 12; 13; 14].

In the auroral and polar ionospheres, phase fluctuations originate from large-scale field-aligned irregularities forming during particle precipitation, whilst in the polar iono-sphere phase fluctuations also arise from polar patches drifting across GNSS ray paths [9; 10; 15; 16; 17; 18; 19; 10; 20]. The occurrence of large-scale field-aligned irregularities in the auroral and polar ionospheres increases during disturbed magnetic conditions, for example, in the presence of magnetic storms and substorms [21; 22; 10; 23; 24]. In the presence of enhancements in temporal TEC fluctuations and scintillation, higher-order error terms in the observables induce an increase in positioning errors and in the occurrence of outages [4; 8; 23 and references therein].

In the case of positioning required for high-accuracy applications, errors in the observables need to be modelled to higher orders [1; 4; 25; 49]: the positioning algorithms (e.g. precise point positioning) are equipped with various models for the correction of these errors, which introduces high levels of complexity. In general, the complexity of the positioning algorithms increases as the models attempt to correct for higher-order error terms in order to achieve higher accuracy in the positioning solution [1: 4; 49]. In the case of errors induced by ionospheric irregularities through enhancements in TEC fluctuations and scintillation, several approaches are possible for the improvement of the positioning solution through the modelling of higher-order error terms: however, these models typically require external information (e.g. knowledge of scintillation indices, network PPP corrections), operate in post-processing (e.g. refinement of the precise point positioning), and assume a linear behaviour in the receiver (e.g. by modelling stand-alone variances) [2: 22-24; 26; 27; 32; 37; 40; 42]. The net result is that the positioning algorithms depend upon a large number of input, their complexity increases significantly, and their effects are limited by the validity of the assumptions utilised.

Here, the origin of the increase in positioning errors and in the occurrence of outages 83 in the presence of field-aligned irregularities in the auroral and polar ionosphere was in-84 vestigated by taking advantage of an EISCAT UHF (European Incoherent SCATter Ultra 85 High Frequency radar)/ and ESR (EISCAT Svalbard Radar) experiment that sampled the 86 volume where GPS ray paths propagated. The propagated. The experiment was conducted during quiet-87 to-moderate magnetic conditions in March 2018 and two different positioning solutions 88 were considered: (a) a single-point single-epoch positioning with dual-frequency L1 and 89 L2 carrier phases and pseudoranges, and with broadcast ephemeris (labelled as Broadcast 90 Kinematic, BK) and (b) a single-point single-epoch with dual-frequency L1 and L2 carrier 91 phases and pseudoranges, and with precise ephemeris (labelled as Precise Static, PS). The 92 former is typical of real-time applications, whilst the latter is equivalent to post-processing 93 Precise Point Positioning. Only the GPS constellation was considered in the positioning 94 solutions. In order to understand the type of errors induced by irregularities in the auroral 95 and polar ionospheres, EISCAT UHF/ESR electron density profiles were compared with 96 the 3-D positioning error estimated both at 30 s and 1 s rates. 97 following questions: (1) what are the irregularities in the auroral and polar ionospheres 98

54

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78 79

80

81

82

Formatted: Not Highlight
Formatted: Not Highlight

Formatted: Not Highlight

that determine higher variability and gaps in the positioning solution; (2) whether a shorter sampling interval can mitigate against higher variability and outages in the positioning solutions.

This study addressed the following questions: (1) what are the irregularities in the 102 auroral and polar ionospheres that determine higher variability and gaps in the position-103 ing solution; (2) whether a shorter sampling interval can mitigate against higher variabil-104 ity and outages in the positioning solutions. 105

2. Materials and Methods

An experiment with EISCAT UHF/ESR incoherent scatter radars was conducted dur-107 ing March 2018 and it was aimed at characterising ionospheric irregularities occurring in 108 the auroral and polar ionospheres. EISCAT UHF/ESR beams sampled the ionospheric vol-109 ume where GPS ray paths propagated: the radars' beams were directed along lines typi-110 cally transverse to GPS ray paths. The EISCAT UHF/ESR beams aimed at different shell 111 heights (i.e. 150 km, 250 km, and 350 km) alternately, by taking into account GPS ray 112 paths propagating to a given GPS ground station. In the case of EISCAT, GPS ray paths to 113 the International GNSS Service (IGS) station in Kiruna were considered; in the case of ESR. 114 GPS ray paths to the IGS station in Ny-Ålesund were considered (more details are illus-115 trated in a companion paper, indicated here as [20]). The alternance of the beam directions 116 over time together with a 60 s integration time [15; 16] necessary to calculate electron 117 density profiles imply that EISCAT UHF/ESR beams were sampling the ionospheric vol-118 ume traversed by GPS ray paths sparsely in space and time. The sparsity of the electron 119 density profiles implies a limitation in the resolution of the spatial and temporal variabil-120 ity of the irregularities detected: this limitation is expected to be overcome with EIS-121 CAT_3D. 122

The increase in positioning errors and in the occurrence of outages were interpreted 123 in view of the electron density profiles measured through EISCAT UHF/ESR as well as of 124 the phase fluctuations occurring on GPS signals. 125

The phase fluctuations occurring in GPS signals propagating through the volume 126 sampled by EISCAT UHF/ESR beams were quantified by means of temporal fluctuations 127 in the uncalibrated Slant TEC [6]. The uncalibrated slant TEC was estimated for each Pseu-128 dorandom Noise (PRN) of relevance by utilising RINEX files containing observables at 129 30 s and at 1 s sampling intervals. RINEX Navigation files containing standard satellite 130 information and RINEX observations files containing 1 s (after downloading, 15-minute 131 individual files were concatenated to ensure continuity in the estimates) and 30 s 132 (single 24-hour file) observables were obtained by using the software RTKLIB (RTKGET, 133 http://www.rtklib.com/) which downloaded the files from the Crustal Dynamics Data In-134 formation System (CDDIS, https://cddis.nasa.gov/) repository. 135

From RINEX observation files, the uncalibrated slant TEC was estimated from 1 s as 136 well as 30 s observables as:

$$TEC(t) \simeq \frac{1}{40.3} \frac{f_1^2 f_2^2}{f_1^2 - f_2^2} (\lambda_1 L_1 - \lambda_2 L_2) \quad [\text{TECU}] \tag{1}$$

where t is time, L_1 and L_2 are carrier phases in cycles corresponding to frequencies 141 f_1 and f_2 in Hz ($f_1 = 154f_0$, $f_2 = 120f_0$, and fundamental frequency $f_0 = 10.23$ MHz), 142 λ_1 and λ_2 are the wavelengths in m. TEC is given in electrons/m² (1 TECU = 143 10¹⁶ electrons/m²) [2328; 2429; 2530]. Equation (1) states that the geometry-free combination for 144 carrier phases is proportional to the uncalibrated TEC due to the presence of additional 145 biases and errors which are typically assumed to be constant or to vary slowly with time. 146 For the purposes of this study, the temporal variation in the uncalibrated TEC was utilised 147 to quantify fluctuations on the carrier phases in the presence of irregularities given its 148 proportionality to the geometry-free combination which has relevance for the positioning 149

99

100

101

106

137 138

solutions. Therefore, temporal *TEC* fluctuations (or rate of change) $\left(\frac{\Delta TEC}{\Delta t}\right)$ for each PRN 150 and at each epoch were estimated as: 151

$$\frac{\Delta TEC}{\Delta t} = \frac{TEC(k) - TEC(k-1)}{\Delta t} \quad [TECU/\Delta t]$$
(2) 153

where TEC(k) is the uncalibrated slant TEC at epoch k, TEC(k-1) is TEC at 155 epoch k - 1, and Δt is the change in time [<u>31</u>; <u>15</u>; <u>32</u>]. Here, Δt can be 1 s or 30 s. TEC fluctuations $\Delta TEC/\Delta t$ were calculated for different ionospheric conditions in con-157 junction with EISCAT UHF/ESR measurements. In view of equations (1) and (2), an en-158 hancement in temporal TEC fluctuations indicates the presence of residual errors in the 159 carrier phases that are not fully removed through dual-frequency combinations, thus typ-160 ically leading to an increase in positioning errors [4].

The BK and PS positioning solutions were calculated at 1 s and at 30 s rates by 162 means of the software gLAB, available on-line at https://gage.upc.es/gLAB/ [33; 34]. 163 In each of the days during EISCAT UHF/ESR measurements BK and PS solutions were 164 calculated for the IGS ground stations in Kiruna (KIRU, in relation to EISCAT electron 165 density profiles) and Ny-Ålesund (NYA1, in relation to ESR electron density profiles). The 166 software gLAB utilised GPS carrier phases (L1 and L2) and pseudoranges (P1 and P2) for 167 the calculation of the BK and PS positioning estimates [34]. 168 169

The Antenna Exchange Format (ANTEX) files, which provide information on the antenna phase centre of the GNSS satellites and of the ground stations, were obtained from 170 standard repositories through gLAB [ftp://ftp.igs.org/pub/station/general/pcv_archive/]. 171

In the case of the BK solution, the orbit and clock data were obtained from the RINEX 172 Navigation files, whereas in the case of the PS solution the orbit and clock data were ob-173 from Standard Product (SP3) files tained and Clock (CLK) files 174 (ftp://cddis.gsfc.nasa.gov/pub/gps/products) [35]. 175

The BK solution was considered because of its relevance to real-time applications (e.g. autonomous navigation, civil aviation, precision agriculture), whereas the PS solution was considered because of its relevance to post-processing applications (e.g. geodesy, 178 surveying) 36; 37; 38].

The performance of the positioning solutions during the EISCAT UHF/ESR experiment was investigated on the basis of the instantaneous 3-D positioning error $E_{3D}(t)$. The instantaneous 3-D positioning error $E_{3D}(t)$ was calculated as [39; 40; 41]:

$$E_{3D}(t) = \sqrt{(X(t) - X_0)^2 + (Y(t) - Y_0)^2 + (Z(t) - Z_0)^2} \quad [m]$$
(3)

where X(t), Y(t), and Z(t) are the ground stations coordinates in the Earth-centred Earth-fixed (ECEF) reference frame at each epoch t and X_0 , Y_0 , and Z_0 are the receiver a-priori ECEF coordinates contained in the RINEX observation files [39; 40; 41; <u>42</u>

X(t), Y(t), and Z(t) and, consequently, the 3-D positioning error $E_{3D}(t)$ were cal-190 culated at 1 s and at 30 s sampling intervals for both the BK and the PS solutions. $E_{3D}(t)$ 191 was then compared with TEC fluctuations $\Delta TEC/\Delta t$ at 1 s and 30 s intervals respec-192 tively, in correspondence to the electron density structures detected through EISCAT 193 UHF/ESR.

The temporal fluctuations in TEC, $\Delta TEC/\Delta t$, were considered for all PRNs with ele-195 vation angle above 5° for consistency with the positioning solutions which were based on 196 the same elevation mask angle for minimisation of Dilution of Precision (DOP) [34]. 197

The software gLAB utilised both the geometry-free combination and the Melbourne-198 Wübbena combination [43; 44; 45] to detect cycle slips and data gaps [33; 34; 199 46; 47]. If enhancements in temporal TEC fluctuations corresponded to an increase in 200 cycle slips and data gaps, then higher-order residual errors were to become dominant in 201 the carrier phases and, hence, on their combination. 202

154

156

161

176

177

179

180

181

186

187

188 189

3. Results

5 of 28

203

227

Figure 1 shows the positioning results in conjunction with the EISCAT measurements204carried out on 12 March 2018. Figure 1a shows the results in the case of 30 s observables205(i.e. $E_{3D}(t)$ calculated every 30 s), whilst Figure 1b shows the results in the case of 1 s observables206servables (i.e. $E_{3D}(t)$ calculated every 1 s). Figure 1c shows the directions of EISCAT207beams in terms of azimuth and elevation angles from the EISCAT UHF antenna's position208in Tromsø.209

Figures 1a and 1b show (from top to bottom) electron density profiles, TEC fluctua-
tions, number of available observables from all PRNs in view together with the number
of PRNs considered within the positioning solutions, the 3-D positioning error and the
dilutions of precision. In Figures 1a and 1b the electron density profiles are repeated in
the top panels to facilitate the comparison.210211212212213213214

The magnetic conditions on 12 March 2018 were very quiet with $K_p = 0$ 215 (https://www.swpc.noaa.gov/products/planetary-k-index) and with no significant struc-216 tures detected by EISCAT in the auroral ionosphere. Almost all the available PRNs were 217 considered in the positioning solutions with only a very few of them showing larger re-218 sidual errors, leading to low E_{3D} values and low E_{3D} variability in both positioning so-219 lutions. In this case, enhancements in TEC fluctuations occurred in a few isolated instances 220 and did not produce any impact on the positioning solutions: $E_{3D}(t)$ did not show any 221 significant increase and there were no gaps in the solutions. Furthermore, no significant 222 difference between the 30 s and the 1 s positioning solutions could be noticed. The 223 measurements on 12 March 2018 $K_p = 0$ (Figure 1) can be considered as a quiet reference 224 case study which more active_case studies (15 and 16 March 2018, $K_p = 4$) can be com-225 pared with. 226







Remote Sens. 2021, 13, x FOR PEER REVIEW



228

Figure 1. EISCAT electron density profiles, TEC fluctuations and positioning errors for the ground station KIRU (Kiruna) between 229 20:00 and 24:00 UT on 12 March 2018. (a) From top to bottom: EISCAT electron density profiles; 30 s temporal TEC fluctuations 230 for all the PRNs in view with elevation angle above 5°; number of available observables (L1, L2, P1, and P2) from all the PRNs in 231 view together with the number of PRNs considered in the BK solution (red line) and in the PS solution (blue line); 30 s 3-D 232 positioning error E_{3D} for the BK solution (red line) and for the PS solution (blue line); and 30 s DOPs. (b) Same as (a) but for 1 s 233 TEC fluctuations and positioning solutions (the electron density profiles are repeated to facilitate the comparison). In (a) and (b) 234 the TEC fluctuations from different PRNs are plotted with different colours according to the PRN legend on the right-hand side. (c) Azimuth and elevation angles of the EISCAT beams (from Tromsø). 235 236 237

> Figure 2 shows same quantities as in Figure 1 but for EISCAT measurements col-238 lected during 15 March 2018. In this case, more active magnetic conditions $(K_p = 4)$ fa-239 voured inhomogeneous and intermittent particle precipitation in the auroral oval which 240 originated ionisation irregularities and, consequently, enhancements in temporal TEC 241 fluctuations visible over 30 s and 1 s intervals (more details are provided in [1820]). In 242 the case of the 30 s positioning solutions, fewer PRNs were utilised for the positioning 243 solutions in correspondence of enhancements in TEC fluctuations. This fact resulted in 244 increases of E_{3D} and of its variability accompanied by gaps in the 30 s BK solution. In 245 the case of the 30 s PS solution, E_{3D} maintained lower values with low variability but 246 showed an increase in the presence of gaps similarly to the 30 s BK solution. Gaps in both 247 the 30 s PS and BK solutions occurred when the number of PRNs usable in the position-248 solutions became less than 4 (https://gage.upc.edu/sites/deing 249 fault/files/gLAB/gLAB_SUM.pdf). On the contrary, E_{3D} showed low variability in the 250 case of the 1 s BK solution and no gaps occurred on both BK and PS solutions at 1 s de-251 spite enhancements in 1 s TEC fluctuations occurred in correspondence of irregularities 252 detected through EISCAT. 253











Figure 2. EISCAT electron density profiles, TEC fluctuations and positioning errors for the ground station KIRU (Kiruna) between25620:00 and 24:00 UT on 15 March 2018. (a) From top to bottom: EISCAT electron density profiles; 30 s temporal TEC fluctuations257for all the PRNs in view with elevation angle above 5° ; number of available observables (L1, L2, P1, and P2) from all the PRNs in258view together with the number of PRNs considered in the BK solution (red line) and in the PS solution (blue line); 30 s 3-D259positioning error E_{3D} for the BK solution (red line) and for the PS solution (blue line); and 30 s DOPs. (b) Same as (a) but for2601 s TEC fluctuations and positioning solutions (the electron density profiles are repeated to facilitate the comparison). In (a) and261(b) the TEC fluctuations from different PRNs are plotted with different colours according to the PRN legend on the right-hand262side. (c) Azimuth and elevation angles of the EISCAT beams (from Tromso).263

Figure 3 shows same quantities as in Figures 1 and 2 but for ESR measurements col-	265
lected on 16 March 2018 $(K_p = 4)$. ESR beams executed some north-south scans between	266
20:30-21:00 UT and 23:00-24:00 UT because of mechanical constraints in the radar's an-	267
tenna which led to the group points inon the azimuth/elevation plot being scattered over	268
larger areas [1820]. Enhancements in TEC fluctuations occurred between 21:20 and 21:40	269
UT in correspondence of a fast-moving plasma patch and between 21:00-21:10, 21:40-22:00	270
UT, and 23:00-23:20 UT in correspondence of particle precipitation [1820], during which	271

the 30 s BK E_{3D} showed larger values with larger variability together with gaps whereas only gaps were noticeable in the 30 s PS E_{3D} . The 1 s BK E_{3D} showed lower variability than the 30 s BK E_{3D} and no gaps were noticeable in both BK and PS positioning solutions calculated at 1 s intervals. 272 273 274

275 276



(a) 5° elevation mask, 30 s







Figure 3. ESR electron density profiles, TEC fluctuations and positioning errors for the ground station NYA1 (Ny-Ålesund) be-278 tween 20:00 and 24:00 UT on 16 March 2018. (a) From top to bottom: ESR electron density profiles; 30 s temporal TEC fluctuations 279 for all the PRNs in view with elevation angle above 5°; number of available observables (L1, L2, P1, and P2) from all the PRNs in 280 view together with the number of PRNs considered in the BK solution (red line) and in the PS solution (blue line); 30 s 3-D 281 positioning error E_{3D} for the BK solution (red line) and for the PS solution (blue line); and 30 s DOPs. (b) Same as (a) but for 1 s 282 TEC fluctuations and positioning solutions (the electron density profiles are repeated to facilitate the comparison). In (a) and (b) 283 the TEC fluctuations from different PRNs are plotted with different colours according to the PRN legend on the right-hand side. 284 (c) Azimuth and elevation angles of the ESR beams (from Longyearbyen). 285

4. Discussion

In the presence of enhancements in temporal TEC fluctuations originating from irregularities forming between the E and F regions in the auroral and polar ionospheres, the positioning solutions calculated at 30 s and at 1 s intervals showed different behaviours. In general, the 1 s positioning solutions tended to be characterised by a lower 3-D positioning error with lower variability and by the <u>absence</u> of gaps. On the other hand, the 30 s BK positioning solution showed lower values and lower variability for E_{3D} and gaps, whereas the 30 s PS solution showed lower values and lower variability for E_{3D} although with the presence of gaps.

Therefore, the two questions that arise here are: (1) what type of irregularities determines higher variability and gaps in the positioning solutions; (2) whether a higher sampling rate for the observables can produce any mitigation against higher variability and outages in the positioning solutions. 298

In order to investigate the first question, the link between electron density irregularities detected through EISCAT UHF/ESR, temporal TEC fluctuations, and positioning solutions was explored in detail. In this analysis, gLAB utilised by default both carrier phases (L1 and L2) and pseudoranges (P1 and P2) to compute BK and PS positioning solutions. For both PS and BK solutions, gLAB used both Melbourne-Wübbena (geometryfree and ionosphere-free) and geometry-free (dependent upon the ionosphere) combinations to detect cycle slips (https://gage.upc.edu/sites/default/files/gLAB/gLAB_SUM.pdf).

From the results, it emerges that whenever 30 s TEC fluctuations enhanced simulta-307 neously on various PRNs, the dilutions of precision (DOPs) and the 3-D positioning error 308 increased their values and variabilities in the case of the 30 s BK solution; gaps occurred 309 on both the 30 s BK and PS solutions due to the decrease in the number of available sat-310 ellites (dropping below 4) with carrier phases and pseudoranges suitable for the position-311 ing algorithm. On the contrary, enhancements in 1 s TEC fluctuations occurred on fewer 312 PRNs and with lower magnitude over shorter time intervals in comparison with 30 s ob-313 servables; the values and variabilities of DOPs and of E_{3D} were lower, and no gaps oc-314 curred on the 1 s BK and PS solutions. Therefore, the identification of those irregularities 315 in the auroral and polar ionosphere introducing these effects on positioning can be re-316 searched through the evaluation of enhancements in TEC fluctuations in correspondence 317 of structures detected through EISCAT UHF/ESR. 318

GPS ray paths were propagating through irregularities forming as a consequence of 319 particle precipitation in the auroral ionosphere between 21:20-22:30 UT and 22:40-24:00 320 UT on 15 March 2018 (Figure 2) and in the polar ionosphere between 21:00-21:10, 21:40-321 22:00 UT, and 23:00-23:20 UT on 16 March 2018 (Figure 3); irregularities also formed in 322 conjunction with a fast-moving patch in the polar ionosphere between 21:20-21:40 UT on 323 16 March 2018 (Figure 3) [20]. In general, enhancements in 1 s TEC fluctuations 324 showed lower values over shorter time intervals in comparison with 30 s TEC fluctua-325 tions. EISCAT UHF/ESR electron density profiles indicate that enhancements in TEC fluc-326 tuations occurred in correspondence of irregularities forming between the E and F regions 327 following particle precipitation in the auroral and polar ionospheres (Figures 2-3) as well 328 as a fast-moving patch in the polar ionosphere (Figure 3) [20]. 329

286 287

288

289

290

291

292

293

294

299

300

301

302

303

304

305

306

It is plausible to assume that the irregularities traversed by GPS ray paths must have 330 had a larger scale size such that the changes in TEC over 1s intervals were smaller as 331 compared to larger changes over 30 s intervals. This is supported by the fact that the res-332 olution in range of EISCAT UHF/ESR changes between few kilometres in the E region and 333 tens of kilometres in the F region [15; 16; 20]. 334

The spatial scales over which the TEC changes took place are illustrated in Figures 4-335 6: distances between consecutive pierce points every 30 s (based on 30 s navigation 336 files) and every 1 s (based on interpolated 1 s navigation files) for GPS ray paths above 337 5° elevation angle were calculated at $110\,km$ (E region) and $300\,km$ (F region) shell 338 heights. TEC fluctuations from Figures 1-3 are repeated in Figures 4-6 to facilitate the com-339 parison. 340

In the case of a quiet $(K_p = 0)$ and benign ionosphere (12 March 2018) only few PRNs 341 experienced isolated enhancements in TEC fluctuations at lower elevation angles (Figure 342 4). During more active $(K_p = 4)$ auroral conditions (15 March 2018, Figure 5), more PRNs 343 experienced enhancements in TEC fluctuations over 30 s than over 1 s at all elevation 344 angles. Similarly, in the polar ionosphere enhancements in TEC fluctuations were experi-345 enced by more PRNs over 30 s than over 1 s at various elevation angles due to particle 346 precipitation as well as to the transit of a polar patch (16 March 2018, Figure 6). On aver-347 age, 30 s TEC changes took place over distances approximately between 1 - 20 km and 348 between the E and F regions, respectively (Figures 5 and 6). The TEC changes over 1 s in-349 tervals occurred over distances smaller than approximately 1 km between the E and F 350 regions. Therefore, the observations at 1 s rate originated from areas with smaller differ-351 ences in TEC; on the other hand, observations at 30 s originated from areas with larger 352 differences in TEC. That is, if the irregularities had scale sizes larger than 1 km it is likely 353 to expect smaller changes in TEC over 1s intervals and larger changes over 30s inter-354 vals. As indicated by the EISCAT UHF/ESR electron density profiles (Figures 2-3), the 355 sharpest changes in TEC over 30 s intervals corresponding to gaps in the positioning so-356 lutions were induced by irregularities forming between the E and F regions in both the 357 auroral and polar ionospheres. 358

Hence, it can be deduced that irregularities introducing outages in the 30 s position-359 ing solutions: (a) had an individual scale size ranging from approximately few kilometres 360 in the E region to few tens of kilometres in the F region, (b) were forming between the E 361 and the F regions, (c) were occurring over spatial distances between 400 km in the E re-362 gion and 800 km in the F region (these facts are demonstrated in [20]), (d) their intersec-363 tions with GPS ray paths had separation distances of few kilometres in the E region and 364 few tens of kilometres in the F region. 365



13 of 28

14 of 28

Figure 4. From top to bottom: 30 s TEC fluctuations for GPS PRNs ray paths above 5° elevation 370 from Kiruna; distances between their consecutive pierce points at 110 km shell height (E region) 371 and 300 km shell height (F region) every 30 s (L_{110} and L_{300} at 30 s, respectively); 1 s TEC fluc-372 tuations and pierce points distances every 1 s (L_{110} and L_{300} at 1 s). The calculations are for the 373 time interval between 20:00 and 24:00 UT during 12 March 2018. TEC fluctuations and distances 374 corresponding to different PRNs are plotted with different colours according to the PRN legend on 375 the right-hand side. 376



Figure 5. From top to bottom: 30 s TEC fluctuations for GPS PRNs ray paths above 5° elevation 380 from Kiruna; distances between their consecutive pierce points at 110 km shell height (E region) and 300 km shell height (F region) every 30 s (L_{110} and L_{300} at 30 s, respectively); 1 s TEC fluctrations and piece points distances every 1 s (L_{110} and L_{200} at 1 s). The calculations are for the time interval between 20:00 and 24:00 UT during 15 March 2018. <u>TEC fluctuations and distances</u> corresponding to different PRNs are plotted with different colours according to the PRN legend on the right-hand side.



389



Figure 6. From top to bottom: 30 s TEC fluctuations for GPS PRNs ray paths above 5° elevation 390 from Ny-Ålesund; distances between their consecutive pierce points at 110 km shell height (E re-391 gion) and 300 km shell height (F region) every 30 s (L_{110} and L_{300} at 30 s, respectively); 1 s TEC fluctuations and pierce points distances every 1 s (L_{110} and L_{300} at 1 s). The calculations are for 392 393 the time interval between 20:00 and 24:00 UT during 16 March 2018. TEC fluctuations and distances 394

369

Remote Sens. 2021, 13, x FOR PEER REVIEW

15 of 28

395

396 397

corresponding to different PRNs are plotted with different colours according to the PRN legend on the right-hand side.-

In order to investigate the second question about any advantage offered by a 398 higher sampling rate, the origin of gaps in the positioning solutions was investigated 399 through Figures 7-13. Figures 7-10 show the number of satellites in view together with the 400 number of satellites excluded from a given positioning solution (both at 30 s and at 1 s 401 intervals) due to specific reasons (different line colours and styles in Figures 7-9). The spe-402 cific reasons for the exclusion of a PRN from the positioning solution were obtained from 403 the PRINT SATSEL message output from gLAB [https://gage.upc.edu/sites/de-404 fault/files/gLAB/gLAB_SUM.pdf]. Amongst possible specific reasons for the exclusion of 405 a PRN are: the arc being too short, the occurrence of a cycle slip, an outlier in the geometry-406 free (LI) combination, an outlier in the Melbourne-Wübbena (B_W) combination, elevation 407 angles lower than $5^\circ.$ These specific reasons appeared to be the most recurrent in the case 408 studies analysed here although other reasons are in principle recognised by gLAB 409 (https://gage.upc.edu/sites/default/files/gLAB/gLAB_SUM.pdf). In Figures 7-9 and 11-13 410 the number of satellites excluded is essentially the same in the BK and PS solutions be-411 the cause the two solutions utilised same cycle-slip detectors 412 (https://gage.upc.edu/sites/default/files/gLAB/gLAB_SUM.pdf) [34]. 413 414



Figure 7. The number of satellites utilised in the positioning solutions and the number of those excluded (due to specific reasons) in the case of Kiruna 12 March 2018.



Figure 8. The number of satellites utilised in the positioning solutions and the number of those excluded (due to specific reasons) in the case of Kiruna 15 March 2018.









Figure 9. The number of satellites utilised in the positioning solutions and the number of those excluded (due to specific reasons) in the case of Ny-Ålesund 16 March 2018.

Figures 7-9 illustrates how the number of satellites utilised in the positioning solu-427 tions varied between 00:00 and 24:00 UT on 12 March 2018 (Kiruna), 15 March 2018 (Ki-428 runa) and 16 March 2018 (Ny-Ålesund), respectively. The number of satellites utilised in 429 the 30 s positioning solution decreased in the more active days in the auroral and polar 430 ionospheres because of a combination of aspects, i.e. arc too short, occurrence of a cycle 431 slip, outliers in the geometry-free (LI) combination, outliers in the Melbourne-Wübbena 432 (B_w) combination. Occasionally, PRNs were excluded because of an elevation angle lower 433 than 5° although this aspect seemed to be independent of geomagnetic conditions and 434 related to the orbits. On the contrary, the number of satellites utilised in the 1 s position-435 ing solutions remained stable throughout the days considered here. 436

The inspection of the magnetograms recorded in Kiruna on 12 March 2018 and 15 437 March 2018, and in Ny-Ålesund on 16 March 2018 (Figure 10) reveals how sensitive the 30 s positioning solutions were to magnetic conditions: the decrease in the number of satellites utilised closely matched the perturbations in the geomagnetic field. 440

441

423

424







Figure 10. Variations in the *HDZ* local geomagnetic field components (ΔH – red colour, ΔD – green colour, and ΔZ – blue colour, in nT) between 00:00 and 24:00 UT from IMAGE stations located at (a) Kiruna (KIR) on 12 March 2018, (b) Kiruna (KIR) on 15 March 2018, and (c) Ny-Ålesund (NAL) on 16 March 2018 (https://space.fmi.fi/image/www/?page=user_defined).

During the EISCAT UHF/ESR measurements (20:00-24:00 UT) such a decrease in the 447 number of satellites utilised in the positioning solutions occurred in correspondence of 448 irregularities forming due to particle precipitation and a polar plasma patch which were 449 detected on the electron density profiles. This aspect is further illustrated through Figures 450 11-13 which show the variation of the radars' Vertical Total Electron Content (VTEC) es-451 timated by integrating the EISCAT UHF/ESR electron density profiles with height be-452 tween 100 km and 400 km of altitude [1820]. Figures 11-13 show that the number of sat-453 ellites excluded from the 30 s positioning solutions increased when the radar's VTEC 454 showed higher values and higher variability in correspondence of irregularities forming 455 between the E and the F regions. Here, the number of satellites with too short an arc rep-456 resents the cumulative number of satellites excluded for individual specific reasons (as 457 shown in Figures 7-9). On the contrary, the 1 s positioning solutions were not affected as 458 the number of satellites utilised remained almost constant in the presence of those irreg-459 ularities. 460

461



Figure 11. Comparison between EISCAT VTEC and the number of satellites excluded from the positioning solutions in the case of Kiruna on 12 March 2018.





Figure 12. Comparison between EISCAT VTEC and the number of satellites excluded from the positioning solutions in the case of Kiruna on 15 March 2018.





Figure 13. Comparison between ESR VTEC and the number of satellites excluded from the positioning solutions in the case of Ny-Ålesund on 16 March 2018.

The geometry-free combination L1 is given by the combination of L1 and L2 carrier phases and it can be written as [4348]:

$$LI(t) = \left(\lambda_1 L_1(t) - \lambda_2 L_2(t)\right) = 40.3 \cdot 10^{16} \frac{f_1^2 - f_2^2}{f_1^2 f_2^2} TEC(t) + \Delta_1 - \Delta_2 \tag{4}$$

where L_1 and L_2 are the carrier phases in cycles corresponding to the carrier frequencies f_1 and f_2 in Hz; λ_1 and λ_2 are the wavelengths in m; the slant *TEC* is given in TECU. The terms Δ_1 and Δ_2 contain biases and errors, and are given by:

$$\Delta_i = k_{i,r} - k_i^S + \lambda_i N_i + \lambda_i w + m_i + \varepsilon_i \tag{5}$$

where $i = 1, 2, k_{i,r} - k_i^S$ describes receiver and satellite instrumental biases, $\lambda_i N_i$ describes the ambiguity in the carrier phases, $\lambda_i w$ describes the phase wind-up, m_i describes errors due to multipath, and ε_i describes errors due to receiver noise [44].

In the Melbourne-Wübbena combination (B_W) [43; 44; 45] carrier phases and codes measurements are combined through the wide-lane (Φ_W) and narrow-lane (R_N) combinations [49; 50]. It can be shown that the Melbourne-Wübbena combination is given by:

$$B_W = \Phi_W - P_N = f_1 \Delta_1 - f_2 \Delta_2 - f_1 \delta_1 - f_2 \delta_2 \tag{6}$$

where the wide-lane combination for the carrier phases is given by:

$$\Phi_W = \frac{f_1 L_1(t) - f_2 L_2(t)}{f_1 - f_2} \tag{7}$$

and the narrow-lane combination for the code pseudoranges is given by:

$$P_N = \frac{f_1 P_1(t) + f_2 P_2(t)}{f_1 + f_2} \tag{8}$$

with $P_1(t)$ and $P_2(t)$ the pseudoranges (in units of m) estimated from the code at the carrier frequencies f_1 and f_2 .

In equation (6), it can be shown that:

$$\delta_i = p_{i,r} - p_i^S + M_p + \varepsilon_{p,i} \tag{9}$$

where $p_{i,r} - p_i^S$ describes receiver and satellite instrumental biases, M_p describes errors due to multipath, and $\varepsilon_{p,i}$ describes errors due to the receiver noise [49].

Residual errors in the presence of ionospheric irregularities during active geomag-netic conditions $(K_p = 4)$ must arise from the error terms described through equations (4) - (9). A close inspection of equations (5) and (9) indicates that the receiver and satellite instrumental biases together are not expected to vary with geomagnetic conditions and can be considered constant over the short-term measurement epochs of relevance. Errors due to ground multipath could, in principle, have an effect since all PRNs with elevation angles higher than 5° were considered: however, ground multipath cannot justify the re-sults presented here as it depends upon the orbits and does not vary with geomagnetic conditions. Necessarily, the error terms that can be affected by a degradation in the geo-magnetic conditions are the terms referring to the ambiguities, to the phase wind-up, and to the receiver noise. The presence of irregularities (as indicated by enhancements in GPS TEC fluctuations as well as by higher values and higher variability in radars' VTEC) in-troduces higher phase errors with higher variability in the receiver carrier and code track-ing [49; 4]. These higher errors with higher variability generated at the signal tracking stage then propagate onto the observables to produce higher residual errors with higher variability: these residual errors increase the uncertainty on the phase ambiguities, the phase wind-up and the receiver noise over shorter temporal intervals.

In equations (4) - (9) these error terms are typically indicated as constants (or as very 530 slow functions of time). However, the results presented through Figures 1-3 and 7-13 in-531 dicate that they become faster functions of time over shorter temporal intervals (i.e., tem-532 poral transients) in the presence of ionospheric irregularities: that is, they increase with 533 the variability in the ionisation (summarised through the radars' VTEC in Figures 11-13). 534 These higher-order temporal transients in the error terms in equations (5) and (9) are not 535 removed through the dual-frequency combination of the observables and therefore intro-536 duce residual errors in the positioning solution. Due to their higher variability these tran-537 sients introduce outliers in the cycle-slip detectors based upon the geometry-free and the 538 Melbourne-Wübbena combinations, hence leading to gaps in the positioning solutions. 539 These higher-order temporal transients remain low and vary slowly with time over 1 s 540 intervals whereas they vary more significantly over 30 s intervals given that GPS TEC 541 fluctuations attain lower variability over 1 s intervals as opposed to 30 s intervals in the 542 presence of irregularities with a scale size ranging from approximately few kilometres in 543 the E region to few tens of kilometres in the F region (compare Figures 1-3 and 11-13). 544

Although the results presented here depend upon the specific implementation of the cycle-slip detectors within a given positioning algorithm, it is evident how irregularities in the active auroral and polar ionosphere introduce a degradation due to the increase of errors in the phase and code measurements, with the net result of reducing the number of satellites available for the positioning solutions. 549

These results indicate that the thresholds and the internal parameters of the models 550 utilised in the cycle-slip detectors within positioning algorithms such as gLAB can be im-551 proved for the 30 s positioning solutions [51] to reflect the variability in TEC, as illus-552 trated here in the case of active auroral and polar ionospheres. However, the use of a 553 higher sampling rate immediately increased the performance of the positioning solutions 554 both in real-time and in post-processing. This aspect is in line with the results shown in 555 Vani et al. [42] where a high sampling rate was found necessary to reduce errors and 556 gaps in the positioning solution during the presence of intensity scintillation originating 557 from small-scale irregularities in the post-sunset equatorial ionosphere. 558

A higher sampling rate for the observables measurements and a higher rate at which 559 positioning is performed seemed to provide an immediate mitigation against residual er-560 rors introduced during active geomagnetic conditions. A higher sampling rate has the 561 advantage of reducing the complexity of both the receiver and the positioning algorithms: 562 it is indeed not necessary to optimise the tracking stages of the receiver or the specific 563 settings of the positioning algorithms (e.g. by introducing additional models that depend 564 upon external information in order to specifically correct for higher-order error terms due 565 to enhanced TEC fluctuations and scintillation) as they become optimal over shorter sam-566 pling intervals in their standard configuration. The trade-off between a larger memory 567 storage requirement (to accommodate for higher sampling rates) and the reduction in the 568 complexity of both the receiver logics and the positioning algorithm seems to provide a 569 suitable solution for precision applications in both real-time and post-processing. 570

Therefore, in relation to question (1), the irregularities responsible for higher varia-571 bility and gaps in the positioning solutions were those forming between the E and the F 572 regions with scale sizes ranging approximately from few kilometres in the E region to 573 few tens of kilometres in the F region. This scale size is comparable to the separation dis-574 tance between their intersections with GPS ray paths. These irregularities originated en-575 hancements in GPS TEC fluctuations over 30 s intervals and over 1 s intervals. How-576 ever, TEC changes over 1 s intervals were smaller than those occurring over 30 s: this 577 aspect can be visualised in the schematic diagram in Figure 14 where GPS ray paths spent 578 more time within the irregularities when the sampling interval is 1 s. At 30 s sampling 579 interval these irregularities were responsible for higher phase errors and gaps in the po 580 sitioning solutions. 581

In relation to question (2), higher-order temporal transients introduced residual errors on the observables as well as outliers in the cycle-slip detectors: these transients were 583 responsible for the increase in the 3-D positioning error and in the occurrence of gaps. 584 Whilst these transients have lower values and lower variability over 1s intervals, they 585 become significant over 30 s intervals in the presence of irregularities forming between 586 the E and the F regions in the active auroral and polar ionospheres.





5. Conclusions

The performance of GPS positioning in the presence of enhanced TEC fluctuations in 596 the auroral and polar latitudes was investigated in conjunction with measurements col-597 lected through EISCAT UHF/ESR incoherent scatter radars. Two dual-frequency position-598 ing solutions were implemented: a single-epoch solution relying upon broadcast ephem-599 eris (BK, typical of real-time applications) and a single-epoch solution relying upon pre-600 cise ephemeris (PS or PPP, typical of post-processing applications). 601

The BK and PS positioning solutions were estimated at both 30 s and 1 s rates by utilising observables from GPS satellites collected at the IGS ground stations in Kiruna and Nv-Ålesund during individual days in March 2018.

In general, the 30 s BK positioning solution showed higher variability in the 3-D po-605 sitioning error E_{3D} and the presence of gaps, whereas the 30 s PS solution showed lower 606 values and lower variability for E_{3D} though it was affected by gaps. On the other hand, 607 the 1 s positioning solutions showed lower 3-D positioning errors with lower variability 608 and the absence of gaps. 609

The higher variability in E_{3D} and the presence of gaps on the 30 s positioning solu-610 tions were induced by irregularities forming between the E and the F regions with scale 611 sizes ranging from approximately few kilometres in the E region to a few tens of kilome-612 tres in the F region; the intersections between these irregularities and GPS ray paths had 613 separation distances of a few kilometres in the E region and few tens of kilometres in the 614 F region, which is comparable to their scale sizes. These irregularities induced residual 615 errors on the observables (from the receiver's tracking stages) and outliers in the cycle slip 616 detectors based upon the geometry-free and the Melbourne-Wübbena combinations. 617

587 588

589 590

591

592 593 594

595

602

603

628

629

630

631

643

671

The residual errors introduced by the receiver on the observables had a temporal transient nature: they appeared more significant over 30 s temporal intervals but became less significant over 1 s temporal scales in the presence of irregularities in the active auroral and polar ionospheres. 621

The results indicate that the use of higher sampling rates for observables as well as for the positioning solutions improves the performance of real-time and post-processing positioning and reduces the complexity of the receiver logics and of the positioning algorithm.

Author Contributions: Conceptualization, BF, IA, IH; Methodology, BF, IA, HMJ and BCV; Software, HMJ, AA, TA, BF; Formal Analysis, HMJ, BF, IH; Writing – Original Draft Preparation, HMJ and BF; Writing – Review & Editing, HMJ, BF, IA, AA, TA, BCV and IH; Supervision, BF; Funding Acquisition, BF, IA and HMJ.

 Funding: This research is funded by the Petroleum Technology Development Fund (PTDF), Abuja,
 632

 Nigeria; EISCAT UK time allocation; and the Natural Environment Research Council (NERC)
 633

 [Grant number NE/R009082/1_and Grant number NE/V002597/1].
 634

Data Availability Statement: EISCAT/ESR data are available at http://portal.eiscat.se/schedule/schedule.cgi. 635

Data from the IMAGE Magnetometer Array are available at https://space.fmi.fi/image/www/index.php?. 637

The 1-s and 30-s RINEX data were accessed through the International GNSS Service (IGS) from the
online archives of the Crustal Dynamics Data Information System (CDDIS), NASA Goddard Space640FlightCenter,
Greenbelt,MD,
USA(https://cddis.nasa.gov/Data_and_Derived_Prod-
ucts/GNSS/GNSS_data_and_product_ar-641

chive.html),http://dx.doi.org/10.5067/GNSS/gnss_daily_0_001.

In the case of the BK solution, the orbit and clock data were obtained from the RINEX Navigation644files, whereas in the case of the PS solution the orbit and clock data were obtained from Standard645Product (SP3) files and Clock (CLK) files (ftp://cddis.gsfc.nasa.gov/pub/gps/products) [30].646

gLAB is a software tool suite develop under a European Space Agency (ESA) Contract by the Re-
search Group of Astronomy and Geomagnetics (gAGE) from the Universitat Politecnica de Catalu-
nya (UPC), is an interactive educational multipurpose package to process and analysis GNSS data
(http://www.gage.upc.edu/gLAB).647
648

Acknowledgments: H. M. J. wishes to thank the Petroleum Technology Development Fund (PTDF), 651 Abuja, Nigeria for providing for the PhD research scholarship. The EISCAT campaigns were sup-652 ported through the EISCAT UK time allocation. This work was also supported by the Natural En-653 vironment Research Council (NERC) [Grant number NE/R009082/1 and Grant number 654 NE/V002597/1]. EISCAT is an international association supported by research organisations in 655 China (CRIRP), Finland (SA), Japan (NIPR and STEL), Norway (NFR), Sweden (VR), and the United 656 Kingdom (NERC). We thank the institutes who maintain the IMAGE Magnetometer Array: Tromsø 657 Geophysical Observatory of UiT the Arctic University of Norway (Norway), Finnish Meteorological 658 Institute (Finland), Institute of Geophysics Polish Academy of Sciences (Poland), GFZ German Re-659 search Centre for Geosciences (Germany), Geological Survey of Sweden (Sweden), Swedish Institute 660 of Space Physics (Sweden), Sodankylä Geophysical Observatory of the University of Oulu (Finland), 661 and Polar Geophysical Institute (Russia). The 1s and 30s RINEX data were accessed through 662 the International GNSS Service (IGS). Many thanks to GNSS Calendar and Utility product available 663 online through http://www.gnsscalendar.com/ where orbit and clock sources both broadcast and 664 precise modes were downloaded. gLAB is a software tool suite develop under a European Space 665 Agency (ESA) Contract by the Research Group of Astronomy and Geomagnetics (gAGE) from the 666 Universitat Politecnica de Catalunya (UPC), is an interactive educational multipurpose package to 667 process and analysis GNSS data (http://www.gage.upc.edu/gLAB). Many thanks to the providers 668 of RTKLIB, which was used to download the 1 s and 30 s RINEX observation and navigation data, 669 used to calculate TEC fluctuations, 3-D position error, variability in timing error, and DOPs. 670

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Remote Sens. 2021, 13, x FOR PEER REVIEW

		672
Ref	References	
1.	Cosmen-Schortmann J, Azaola-Sáenz M, Martinez-Olague MA, Toledo-López M. Integrity in urban and road environments and its use in liability critical applications. In2008 IEEE/ION Position, Location and Navigation Symposium 2008 May 5 (pp. 972-983). IEEE. https://doi.org/10.1109/PLANS.2008.4570071	674 675
2.	Lee, J., Morton, Y.J., Lee, J., Moon, H.S. and Seo, J., 2017. Monitoring and Mitigation of Ionospheric Anomalies for GNSS-Based Safety Critical Systems: A review of up-to-date signal processing techniques. IEEE Signal Processing Magazine, 34(5), pp.96- 110. https://doi.org/10.1109/MSP.2017.2716406	677 678
3.	Shagimuratov, I.I., Krankowski, A., Ephishov, I., Cherniak, Y., Wielgosz, P. and Zakharenkova, I., 2012. High latitude TEC fluctuations and irregularity oval during geomagnetic storms. Earth, planets and space, 64(6), pp.521-529.	680 681
4.	van den IJssel, J., Forte, B. & Montenbruck, O. Impact of Swarm GPS receiver updates on POD performance. Earth Planet Sp 68, 85 (2016). https://doi.org/10.1186/s40623-016-0459-4.	682 683 684
5.	Kelley, M.C., 2009. The Earth's ionosphere: plasma physics and electrodynamics. Academic press.	685
0.	GPS network. Geophysical Research Letters, 24(18), pp.2283-2286.	687
7.	Basu, S., MacKenzie, E. and Basu, S., 1988. Ionospheric constraints on VHF/UHF communications links during solar maximum and minimum periods. Radio Science, 23(03), pp.363-378.	688 689
8.	Bhattacharyya, A., Beach, T.L., Basu, S. and Kintner, P.M., 2000. Nighttime equatorial ionosphere: GPS scintillations and differ- ential carrier phase fluctuations. Radio Science, 35(1), pp.209-224. https://doi.org/10.1029/1999RS002213.	690 691
9.	Xu, J.S., Zhu, J. and Li, L., 2007. Effects of a major storm on GPS amplitude scintillations and phase fluctuations at Wuhan in China. Advances in Space Research, 39(8), pp.1318-1324. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asr.2007.03.004.	692 693
10.	Prikryl, P., Jayachandran, P.T., Mushini, S.C., Pokhotelov, D., MacDougall, J.W., Donovan, E., Spanswick, E. and St-Maurice, J.P., 2010. GPS TEC, scintillation and cycle slips observed at high latitudes during solar minimum. Annales Geophysicae (09927689), 28(6), https://ui.adsabs.harvard.edu/link_gateway/2010AnGeo.28.1307P/doi:10.5194/angeo-28-1307-2010.	694 695 696
11.	Kriegel, M., Jakowski, N., Berdermann, J., Sato, H. and Mersha, M.W., 2017, January. Scintillation measurements at Bahir Dar during the high solar activity phase of solar cycle 24. In Annales Geophysicae (Vol. 35. No. 1, pp. 97-106). Copernicus CophH	697 698
12.	Spogli, L., Alfonsi, L., Romano, V., De Franceschi, G., Francisco, G.M.J., Shimabukuro, M.H., Bougard, B. and Aquino, M., 2013. Assessing the GNSS scintillation climate over Brazil under increasing solar activity. Journal of Atmospheric and Solar-Terres- trial Physics, 105. pp.199-206.	699 700 701
<u>13.</u>	Cai, X., Burns, A.G., Wang, W., Coster, A., Qian, L., Liu, J., Solomon, S.C., Eastes, R.W., Daniell, R.E. and McClintock, W.E., 2020. Comparison of GOLD nighttime measurements with total electron content: Preliminary results. Journal of Geophysical Research Grant Physical 15(0), p. 20101 A0277(7).	702 703
<u>14.</u>	Kesearch: Space Physics, 125(9), p.22019(A027767. Karan, D.K., Daniell, R.E., England, S.L., Martinis, C.R., Eastes, R.W., Burns, A.G. and McClintock, W.E., 2020. First zonal drift velocity measurement of Equatorial Plasma Bubbles (EPBs) from a geostationary orbit using GOLD data. Journal of Geophysical	704 705 706
13. <u>1</u>	<u>Research: Space Physics. 125(9), p.e2020JA028173.</u> <u>5.</u> Forte, B., Smith, N.D., Mitchell, C.N., Da Dalt, F., Panicciari, T., Chartier, A.T., Stevanovic, D., Vuckovic, M., Kinrade, J., Tong, J.R. and Häggström, I., 2013, April. Comparison of temporal fluctuations in the total electron content estimates from EISCAT and GPS along the same line of sight, Annales Geophysicae, Vol. 31, No. 4, p. 745. https://doi.org/10.5194/angeo-31-745-201.	707 708 709 710
14. <u>1</u>	6. Forte, B., C. Coleman, S. Skone, I. Häggström, C. Mitchell, F. Da Dalt, T. Panicciari, J. Kinrade, and G. Bust (2017), Identification of scintillation signatures on GPS signals originating from plasma structures detected with EISCAT incoherent scatter radar along the same line of sight, I. Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 122, 916–931, doi:10.1002/2016JA023271.	711 712 713
15. <u>1</u>	<u>7. Fejer</u> , B.G. and Kelley, M.C., 1980. Ionospheric irregularities. Reviews of Geophysics, 18(2), pp.401-454. https://doi.org/10.1029/RG018i002p00401.	714 715
16. <u>1</u> 17. <u>1</u>	 Kelley, M.C., Vickrey, J.F., Carlson, C.W. and Torbert, R., 1982. On the origin and spatial extent of high-latitude F region irregularities. Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics, 87(A6), pp.4469-4475. https://doi.org/10.1029/JA087iA06p04469. <u>9</u>. Keskinen, M.J. and Ossakow, S.L., 1983. Theories of high-latitude ionospheric irregularities: A review. Radio science, 18(06), and the state of the science of	716 717 718
18. <u>2</u>	pp.1077-1091. https://doi.org/10.1029/IS0018000001077. (0) John, H. M., Forte, B., Astin, I., Allbrook, T., Arnold, A., Vani, B. C., Häggström I., and Sato H. (2021). An EISCAT UHF/ESR experiment that explains how ionospheric irregularities induce GPS phase fluctuations at auroral and polar latitudes. Radio Science, 56, e2020RS907236. https://doi.org/10.1029/2020RS907236	719 720 721 722
19. <u>2</u>	1_Aarons, J., 1982. Global morphology of ionospheric scintillations. Proceedings of the IEEE, 70(4), pp.360-378. https://https://doi.org/10.1109/PROC.1982.12314.	723 724
20. <u>2</u>	2Skone, S. and Cannon, M.E., 1998. Auroral zone ionospheric considerations for WADGPS. Navigation, 45(2), pp.117-127. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-4296.1998.tb02376.x.	725 726

21.22 Share S.H. 2001 The impact of momentic strengt on CDS accelum performance. Learned of Constant, 75(0,10), pp. 457.460	707
21.23. Skone, S.H., 2001. The impact of magnetic storms on GPS receiver performance. Journal of Geodesy, 75(9-10), pp.457-468.	727
https://www.researchgate.net/deret/http%3A%2F%2Fdx.doi.org%2F10.100/%2Fs001900100198.	728
22.24. Doherty, P.H., Delay, S.H., Valladares, C.E. and Klobuchar, J.A., 2003. Ionospheric scintillation effects on GPS in the equatorial	729
and auroral regions. Navigation, 50(4), pp.235-245. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-4296.2003.tb00332.x.	730
25. Defraigne, P., Pinat, E. and Bertrand, B., 2021. Impact of Galileo-to-GPS-time-offset accuracy on multi-GNSS positioning and	731
timing, GPS Solutions, 25(2), pp.1-15.	732
26. Wang, L., Li, Z., Wang, N. and Wang, Z., 2021. Real-time GNSS precise point positioning for low-cost smart devices. GPS Solu-	733
tions. 25(2). pp. 1-13	734
27 Guo K. Veettil S.V. Weaver, B.L. and Aguino, M. 2021. Mitigating high latitude ionospheric scintillation effects on GNSS	735
Proceeding and provide a second secon	726
recise Fourier Scholing exploring 1-5 schulation indices, journal of Geodest, 20(3), pp.1-10.	730
23.26. Correla, E., Muela, M., Altonsi, L., Prol, F. and Camargo, r., 2010. GPS schullations and total electron content climatology in	737
the southern American sector. In Accuracy of GNS5 Methods, Intercopert, https://doi.org/10.5/72/intercopen./9218.	738
24.29. Kao, K.D. and Dutt, V.S.I., 2017. An Assessment of Mapping Functions for VIEC Estimation using Measurements of Low	739
Latitude Dual Frequency GPS Receiver. Int. J. Appl. Eng. Res, 12(4), pp.422-427.	740
25.30. Ward, N., 1997. Understanding GPS—Principles and Applications. Elliott D. Kaplan (Editor). £75. ISBN: 0-89006-793-7. Artech	741
House Publishers, Boston & London. 1996. The Journal of Navigation, 50(1), pp.151-152.	742
26.31. Carrano, C.S. and Groves, K.M., 2007, April. TEC gradients and fluctuations at low latitudes measured with high data rate	743
GPS receivers. In Proceedings of the 63rd annual meeting of the Institute of Navigation, Cambridge, MA (pp. 156-163).	744
27.32. Luo, X., Gu, S., Lou, Y., Xiong, C., Chen, B. and Jin, X., 2018. Assessing the Performance of GPS Precise Point Positioning Under	745
Different Geomagnetic Storm Conditions during Solar Cycle 24. Sensors, 18(6), p.1784. https://doi.org/10.3390/s18061784.	746
28.33. Hernandez-Pajares, M., Juan, J.M., Sanz, J., Ramos-Bosch, P., Rovira-Garcia, A., Salazar, D., Ventura-Traveset, J., Lopez-Ec-	747
hazarreta, C. and Hein, G. 2010. December. The ESA/UPC GNSS-lab tool (glab). In Proc. of the 5th ESA Workshop on Satellite	748
Navigation Technologies (NAVITEC'2010) ESTEC Noordwijk The Netherlands	749
Futigation recursive Carria A Sanz Liura IM Concelez-Geodo C Limenez-Baños D Lónez-Echezarreta C Lanin L The	750
CNICE Laboratory: Tool Suite Jr., Juan Jw., Golzanez-Casado Global Manitoring System Oth ECA Workshow on Sathline	750
Substational to the second state of the stat	751
Navigation Technologies (NAVITEC 2018), Noordwijk, The Netherlands. December 5 - 7, 2018. DOI: 10.1109/NA-	752
V11EC.2018.8642/0/.	753
30.35. C. Noll, The Crustal Dynamics Data Information System: A resource to support scientific analysis using space geodesy, Ad-	754
vances in Space Research, Volume 45, Issue 12, 15 June 2010, Pages 1421-1440, ISSN 0273-1177, DOI: 10.1016/j.asr.2010.01.018.	755
31.36. El-Hattab, A.I., 2014. Assessment of PPP for establishment of CORS network for municipal surveying in Middle East. Survey	756
Review, 46(335), pp.97-103.	757
32.37. Jacobsen, K.S. and Andalsvik, Y.L., 2016. Overview of the 2015 St. Patrick's day storm and its consequences for RTK and PPP	758
positioning in Norway. Journal of Space Weather and Space Climate, 6, p.A9. https://doi.org/10.1051/swsc/2016004.	759
33.38. Wabbena, G., Schmitz, M. and Bagge, A., 2005, September. PPP-RTK: precise point positioning using state-space representation	760
in RTK networks. In Proceedings of the 18th International Technical Meeting of the Satellite Division of The Institute of Navi-	761
gation (ION GNSS 2005) (pp. 2584-2594).	762
34.39. Borre K, Akos DM, Bertelsen N, Rinder P, Jensen SH. A software-defined GPS and Galileo receiver: a single-frequency approach.	763
Springer Science & Business Media; 2007 Aug 3. https://10.1007/978-0-8176-4540-3.	764
35.40. Jacobsen, K.S. and Dähnn, M., 2014. Statistics of ionospheric disturbances and their correlation with GNSS positioning errors	765
at high latitudes. Journal of Space Weather and Space Climate, 4, p.A27. https://doi.org/10.1051/swsc/2014024.	766
36.41. Vani, B.C., Ivánová, I., Monico, J.F. and Shimabukuro, M.H., 2014, January. Visualizing the Quality of GNSS Multivariate Data.	767
In GeoInfo (pp. 95-106).	768
37.42. Vani B. C., Forte B., Monico J. F. G., Skone S., Shimabukuro M. H., de O. Moraes A., Portella I. P. and Marques H. A. (2019), A	769
novel approach to improve GNSS Precise Point Positioning during strong ionospheric scintillation: theory and demonstration,	770
IEEE Transactions on Vehicular Technology, vol. 68, no. 5, 8663444, pp. 4391-4403. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVT.2019.2903988.	771
38.43. Melbourne W. G. 1985. The case for ranging in GPS based geodetic systems, in Proceedings of the 1st International Symposium	772
on Precise Positioning with the Global Positioning System, C. Goad (ed.), US Department of Commerce, Rockville, Maryland	773
(1985), pp. 375–386.	774
39.44. Wübbena G. 1985. Software Developments for Geodetic Positioning with GPS Using Tl 4100 Code and Carrier Measurements,	775
in Proceedings of the 1st International Symposium on Precise Positioning with the Global Positioning System, C. Goad (ed.),	776
US Department of Commerce, Rockville, Maryland (1985), pp. 403-412.	777
40.45. Blewitt G. 1990. An automatic editing algorithm for GPS data, Geophysical Research Letters, 17, No. 3, 199–202.	778
41.46_Cai, C., Liu, Z., Xia, P. and Dai, W., 2013. Cycle slip detection and repair for undifferenced GPS observations under high	779
ionospheric activity. GPS solutions, 17(2), pp.247-260.	780
42.47. Zeng, T., Sui, L., Xu, Y., Jia, X., Xiao, G., Tian, Y. and Zhang, Q., 2018. Real-time triple-frequency cycle slip detection and repair	781
method under ionospheric disturbance validated with BDS data. GPS solutions, 22(3), pp.1-13.	782
43.48. Krypiak-Gregorczyk, A. and Wielgosz, P., 2018. Carrier phase bias estimation of geometry-free linear combination of GNSS	783
signals for ionospheric TEC modeling. GPS Solutions, 22(2), pp.1-9. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10291-018-0711-4.	784

44. <u>49.</u> Teunissen, P. and Montenbruck, O. eds., 2017. Springer handbook of global navigation satellite systems. Springer.	785
45.50. He, X. and Zhang, X., 2015. Characteristics Analysis of BeiDou Melbourne-Wübbena Combination. In China Satellite Navigation	
Conference (CSNC) 2015 Proceedings: Volume III (pp. 31-45). Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg. https://doi.org/10.1007%2F978-3-	787
662-46632-2.	788
46.51. Zhang, X., Guo, F. and Zhou, P., 2014. Improved precise point positioning in the presence of ionospheric scintillation. GPS	789
solutions, 18(1), pp.51-60. https://doi.org/ 10.1007/s10291-012-0309-1.	790

27 of 27

Remote Sens. 2021, 13, x FOR PEER REVIEW