#### UIUCLIS--2006/3+IMLS

# Oksana Zavalina. User Searches in IMLS DCC Collection Registry: Transaction Log Analysis. Technical Report UIUCLIS--2006/3+IMLS, Graduate School of Library and Information Science, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, Champaign, IL, 2006.

#### Introduction

Subject access to collections has been in the focus of attention of LIS field for decades. A number of catalog use studies have been conducted in attempts to better understand its role and the problems user faces while searching for the information on a particular topic, with transaction log analysis being one of the methods widely employed by these studies. However, issues of subject access in federated collections, where the "unit of analysis" is a collection rather than an item search, have not yet been investigated. This paper reports an attempt of such an analysis performed on the IMLS Digital Collection Registry transaction log dataset.

IMLS Digital Collections and Content project is being implemented at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign since January 2003. Within the project framework, a registry of all National Leadership Grant collections with digital content has been created. The IMLS Collection Registry includes collection level descriptions<sup>1</sup> and links to homepages of over 170 digital collections, created by libraries, museums, historical societies, botanical gardens and other cultural heritage institutions with support of the National Leadership Grant administered by the Institute of Museum and Library Services since 1998. The IMLS Digital Collections Registry is indexed with the GEM (Gateway to Educational Materials) subject headings, which provide broad categories for browsing considered suitable for the educational and cultural heritage communities.

GEM project, started in September 1996, is an initiative of the National Library of Education to expand educators' access to Internet-based lesson plans, curriculum units and other educational materials (Sutton, 1999). GEM Element Set is an extension of the Dublin Core Element Set, with eight elements added to the initial 15-element DC package. In 1997, GEM subject scheme was created as the Subject Element GEM Controlled Vocabulary to describe digital objects in Gateway for Educational Materials repository. In part due to high national and international

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See for example <u>http://imlsdcc.grainger.uiuc.edu/collections/FullDisplay.asp?cid=2404</u>

reputation that GEM project in general has gained since its inception, today GEM subject scheme's application goes beyond its original domain: the Gateway to Educational Materials database. GEM subject scheme is now one of the many<sup>2</sup> controlled vocabularies and subject hierarchies being used to provide subject access to online resources and digital libraries such as Everglade, Internet Scout Portal, Federal Resources for Educational Excellence (FREE), RefWorks, National Science Digital Library etc. Being a domain-specific controlled vocabulary aimed at educators, GEM subject headings are considered suitable for browsing databases in both educational and more general humanities domains.

GEM subject scheme (see Attachment 1) consists of 12 "level 1" broad subject headings: Arts, Educational Psychology, Foreign Languages, Health, Language Arts, Mathematics, Philosophy, Physical Education, Religion, Science, Social Studies, Vocational Education, each of which has from 12 to 29 narrower "level 2" headings under it. The second level subject headings for Philosophy and Religion replicate ERIC Thesaurus "Narrower Terms" for these two broad subjects. Several of the level 2 GEM subject headings – Careers, History, Informal education, Instructional issues, Process skills, and Technology – are facets applicable to each of the twelve broad subject headings.

According to Stuart Sutton (2004), the major deficiency of the digital library architecture, including GEM, is the absence of the standardization in name authority; neither name nor place subject are represented in GEM subject scheme.

Collection administrators participating in the IMLS Collection Repository project are required to provide top-level GEM subjects in collection descriptions for the registry. Use of other subject headings is not required but supported by the metadata schema. As recently collected survey and interview data show, collection administrators are not completely satisfied with GEM subject scheme use for collection level description. Most of them point at the significant drawback of GEM subject scheme – lack of breadth and depth in topic coverage, especially at the top level of the subject hierarchy.

#### **Research Question**

The major research question in this study was: How suitable is the GEM (Gateway for Educational Materials) subject scheme adopted by IMLS Collection registry for describing diverse collections in the Registry? If it does not provide appropriate subject representation,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> GEM subject scheme is one of the 129 thesauri listed by the Library of Congress list of codes for subjects http://www.loc.gov/marc/sourcecode/subject

would another controlled vocabulary do a better job for this particular registry?

Based on the literature for evaluating subject schemes (Cochrane 1986, Larson 1991A etc.) and my own observations I have formulated eight general criteria for measuring GEM subject scheme suitability to collection level description in IMLS registry:

- 1. diversity of topics covered by GEM subject headings (breadth and depth of subject coverage),
- 2. syndetic structure of the GEM subject scheme,
- 3. heading structure of GEM subject headings,
- 4. currency of GEM subject headings,
- 5. availability of links between GEM subject headings and subject terms from other controlled vocabularies
- 6. degree of overlap between GEM subject terms and other subject terms used in the collection level description,
- degree of overlap between the collection level description GEM subject terms and subject headings used in item level description.
- 8. semantic match between the GEM subject terms and keywords used by searchers of the registry.

A preliminary analysis of a sample of 23 digital collections based on the first seven criteria demonstrated overall inability of GEM subject scheme to adequately represent breadth and depth of subjects of the diverse collections in IMLS Collection registry. For this project, I chose to focus on the last and very important criterion – the semantic match between keywords applied by users in their searches and the GEM subject headings used in collection description records. Because no research has been done yet with the focus on specifics of search types and approaches in federated collections at collection level, another area of my interest in this project is general description of the searches made by users in IMLS Digital collection registry: the weight of subject versus known-item searches, typical query profile in terms of the number of words, frequency of each query use etc. I am also interested in correlation – if any – between the type of search and the semantic match of search terms with controlled vocabulary terms.

Given all the above, the more specific research question for this project is: how similar are the IMLS Collection Registry user keywords (extracted from transaction log) and the controlled vocabulary terms from three different controlled vocabularies – GEM thesaurus and its

alternatives? Which of the three controlled vocabularies matches higher percentage of the search terms from the user queries made in the Registry?

### Data Collection and Data Analysis

Based on the recent decade's research on matching user terms with controlled vocabulary terms (Collantes 1995, Dubin 1998, Greenberg 2001, Gault, Shultz & Davies 2002, Gross & Taylor 2005, Nowick & Mering 2003, Qin 2000), the following conclusions can be made regarding the typical data source, data processing and data analysis techniques applied: *Typical source of data*: transaction logs, user terms submitted for mediated search *Typical data processing techniques*:

- Parsing user queries into separate terms (excluding stop words) and phrases
- Extracting stems from the words in user queries

Typical analysis steps:

- Match user queries with controlled vocabulary terms: most often exact, near exact matches (with variations in spelling, endings and plurals/singulars), and synonyms (SYN), sometimes also broader terms (BT), related terms (RT), narrower terms (NT) (the latter works only in structured thesaurus, which GEM is not).
- Run user queries (with user terms either mapped or un-mapped to particular thesaurus, including SYN, BT, NT, RT) in the same or other comparable system they originate from (e.g. OPAC, article database)

Typical data analysis techniques: Qualitative analysis and descriptive statistics.

The major dataset used in the analysis is the IMLS Collection Registry transaction log dataset – an Access file that consists of over 19,000 records and covers a period of approximately 7 months, between February 2005, when collection registry was first made publicly accessible, and September 2005. Initially transaction log file consisted of over 100,000 records, but after exclusion of the noise – searches and browsing made in the Collection Registry by web crawlers and Registry testers – the size was reduced to approximately 19,000 records. Each record/row contains information on IP address the query originated from, date and time of access, webpage visited within the Collection Registry, raw query string etc.

The transaction log was manually processed to extract all the keyword search query strings – a total of 945, which were then alphabetized (see Attachment 2). Given the time constraints of this project, a subset of 533 user queries was selected for analysis. Since the sample constitutes a large portion – over 56% – of the total dataset, it should be representative of a dataset as a whole.

Sampling procedure was conveniently applied as follows: queries that start with letters "A" to "L" were selected for analysis. The limitations of such sampling include uneven distribution of potential search terms throughout the alphabet: some letters have much more words starting with them than the others. Also, the search terms that started with numbers were not included. The rest of the dataset will be included in further analysis.

The user keyword queries vary in complexity and length. For example, the number of words in each query ranges from 1 to 7, with the vast majority consisting of one or two words, as can be seen from the chart below.



Preserving the context of a search is an important factor for analysis, especially when trying to decide on search type and finding a match with the terms in a controlled vocabulary. Therefore, the decision was made not to parse queries into separate words or even further – into stems. The minimal processing of the queries was done with noun words in queries: plurals were truncated and grouped together in the same query with the singulars of the same words (e.g. "Indians" and "Indian" became "Indian\*", "clipper ships" and "clipper ship" became "clipper ship\*"). Both correct and misspelled versions of the same words were considered the instances of the same query (e.g. "Antarctica" and "antartica", "immigration" and "imigration").

At the **first stage of analysis**, general descriptive statistics procedures were used: search frequencies and the number of words excluding stop words in queries were calculated for each query, averaged for the whole sample and for each category separately. The stop words for these purposes included prepositions, conjunctions and articles.

The major part of the first stage of analysis was categorizing the user queries into seven broad search types or categories, derived from the Functional Requirements for Bibliographic Records (FRBR, 1998) classification of the entities in bibliographic universe. Seven out of ten FRBR entities that can be subjects of the work were used in this study's framework: *work, person, corporate body, concept, object, event* and *place*. The definitions of each entity and examples given by FRBR – detailed for *work, person,* and *corporate body,* but scarce for *object, concept, event* and *place* – were followed as guidelines for distinguishing between the categories. In essence, seven categories are characterized by FRBR as:

- 1. work: a distinct intellectual or artistic creation (FRBR, p. 16)
- 2. "*person*: an individual; encompasses individuals that are deceased as well as those that are living" (p. 23)
- 3. "corporate body: an organization or group of individuals and/or organizations acting as a unit; encompasses organizations and groups of individuals and/or organizations that are identified by a particular name, including occasional groups and groups that are constituted as meetings, conferences, congresses, expeditions, exhibitions, festivals, fairs, etc. The entity also encompasses organizations that act as territorial authorities, exercising or claiming to exercise government functions over a certain territory, such as a federation, a state, a region, a local municipality, etc. The entity encompasses organizations and groups that are defunct as well as those that continue to operate" (p. 24)
- 4. "concept: an abstract notion or idea; encompasses a comprehensive range of abstractions that may be the subject of a work: fields of knowledge, disciplines, schools of thought (philosophies, religions, political ideologies, etc.), theories, processes, techniques, practices, etc. A concept may be broad in nature or narrowly defined and precise" (p. 25)
- 5. "object: a material thing; encompasses a comprehensive range of material things that may be the subject of a *work*: animate and inanimate objects occurring in nature; fixed, movable, and moving objects that are the product of human creation; objects that no longer exist" (p. 26)

- "event: an action or occurrence; encompasses a comprehensive range of actions and occurrences that may be the subject of a work: historical events, epochs, periods of time, etc."(p. 27)
- "place: a location; encompasses a comprehensive range of locations: terrestrial and extraterrestrial; historical and contemporary; geographic features and geo-political jurisdictions"(p. 27).

FRBR's *expression, manifestation* and *item* entities were not adopted as categories for this analysis, since it is virtually impossible to detect from transaction log what exactly the user was searching for: an abstract work, its particular expression, manifestation or item. Therefore, in my classification of Collection Registry queries, *work* is broader than FRBR's *work* and covers any artistic creation that has a title, including the digital collections that are members of IMLS Collection Registry.

Although the FRBR *person* entity does not currently cover families, there is a provision to update FRBR model with adding *family* entity to the same group of entities that contains *person* and *corporate body*. Therefore, I tentatively expanded the *person* category in my analysis to include families (e.g. "Cushmans"), as well as ethnic groups/nationalities (e.g. "Irish Americans") and classes of persons (e.g. "children that are abused") that I believe belong to the same group of entities and are tightly connected with *person* entity.

The rare occasions of fictitious characters were treated on the basis of "what they would be if they really existed" (e.g., TV series' character Alf is a creature, thus an FRBR's *object*, as would also be a dog or a squid).

For consistency in distinguishing between types of searches in less straight-forward cases, some simple rules were developed: unspecified social and business institutions (e.g. "library", "archive", "can company", "amusement park") were classified as *concepts*, institutions for which physical structure is more important (e.g., "ballrooms", "highways") as *objects*, and more specifically named ones (e.g., "Icy Hot Bottle Co.", "library+Moorhead") as *corporate bodies*. Some queries presented a real challenge for classification: "books" was one of them, which I tentatively categorized as a *concept*, although it could as well be an *object*. As any categorization, such an approach is inevitably judgmental, which is one of the limitations of the study. Another limitation of applying FRBR framework – as probably any other – for

categorization of subject searches lies in ambiguity of actual searches, further discussed in Findings and Discussion section.

The queries that presented no clue as to what type they belong to (e.g., "aF", "beyond", "LU+65") were grouped together in an eighth category – *unknown*.

The **second stage** of analysis included searching in three controlled vocabularies – GEM, LCSH, and Art and Architecture Thesaurus – for the semantic matches of actual user queries from the IMLS Collection Registry transaction log. Library of Congress Subject Headings was selected for analysis as a controlled vocabulary that almost a half of digital collections participating in Collection Registry are using for item-level description and that is being considered by some of surveyed collections as an alternative to GEM for collection-level description. OCLC Connexion database features – LCSH authority file and Web Dewey search for editorially mapped LCSH headings – were used for matching user queries with LCSH. Art and Architecture Thesaurus (AAT) was selected as another plausible alternative for describing cultural heritage materials – and possibly collections. A number of collections participating in the registry are using AAT for their item-level description. Moreover, AAT is a controlled vocabulary of a smaller scope than LCSH, but significantly more detailed than GEM.

Only exact/abbreviated and synonymous matches (e.g., "inoculation" and "vaccination") were treated as semantic matches for the purposes of this analysis. Abbreviated queries were matched with the full terms in controlled vocabularies, e.g. "ilgwu" with "International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union". The order of the terms in the query, as well as presence or absence of prepositions and conjunctions was ignored for analysis. (e.g., "French art" was matched with "Art, French"; "epistemology" with "knowledge, theory of", "children that are abused" with "abused children"). Endings of the words were also disregarded, as long as they did not affect the meaning (e.g., "automated speech recognition" was matched with "automatic speech recognition"). Both preferred terms and variant terms in controlled vocabulary were considered legitimate matches. For example, both 150 MARC field (USE) and 450 field (USE FOR) in LCSH authority records were analyzed to find a semantic match to a user query. Simple user queries were in some cases matched with compound LCSH subject headings, for instance "housing for shipyard workers" was matched with "Shipbuilding industry—Employees—Housing".

The number of matches was totaled and averaged for the whole sample and for search types. Complete categorized listing of user query terms, along with descriptive statistics and calculations is available at <a href="https://netfiles.uiuc.edu/zavalina/MDRTpapers/AtoLwithAAT.xls">https://netfiles.uiuc.edu/zavalina/MDRTpapers/AtoLwithAAT.xls</a>.

### Findings and Discussions

As the first stage of analysis demonstrated, two thirds of all searches made in IMLS Digital Collection Registry are spread between three broad FRBR categories: *concept*, *object*, and *person*, with *concept* search leading among both search terms and search instances. *Place* also takes significant percentage of searches, while *corporate body*, *event*, *work*, and *unknown* search types combined total below 20% of the searches. The low level of *event* searching is surprising, since most of the historical searches would be searches for *events*.





Because of the very nature of *concept, object, place*, and *event*, these cannot possibly belong to the widely-used in LIS general type of known-item searches (i.e. searchers where the user knows either author or title of the work sought), and therefore search categories can be safely considered subject searches in the IMLS Collection Registry. As can be easily seen from the chart below, then subject search constitutes at least 62% of all search terms and all search instances.





However, of course not all *person* searches will be known-item searches, since the broad *person* category includes also families, ethnic groups/nationalities and classes of persons. In the sample studied, over one third – 34% to 37% – of all searches initially assigned to the *person* search type represents these types of searches:





Thus, by adding these family, ethnic group/nationality and class of persons searches to the pool of subject searches, the percentage of subject searches made in the IMLS Collection Registry increases to 70% by both search term and search instance:





Although the number of federated digital collections has been rapidly growing recently, as did the creation and use of collection registries, no attempt has been documented in LIS literature so far to conceptualize known-item and subject searches at the collection level. In my operational definition, since in IMLS Digital Collection Registry the searches are conducted at the collection level, the known-title search in such situation will be the search, where the user knows the title of the digital collection; everything else will be a subject search, which, broadly defined, includes both controlled- and uncontrolled-vocabulary searches with an intent to find information on particular subject/topic/discipline/area.

The majority – sixty-three percent of search terms and seventy-two percent of search instances – of the *work* searches in the Registry were the searches for specific digital collection title, thus a known-item search. Although the rest of *work* searches were for the specific item-level titles, and therefore at the collection-level search can be treated as subject searches, the number of them was not significant enough to affect the distribution of two major search types – subject and known-item – as shown above.

The prevalence of subject search is obvious from the charts and remains in agreement with results of the 1982 large-scale Council for Library Research (CLR) study of online catalog use, which radically changed the conception of catalog use by finding subject search to be unexpectedly widely used by patrons – 59% of all searches. Compared to the earlier transaction log studies of online catalog use (e.g., Larson 1991B), including CLR study itself, the relative value of subject search as shown by the current study is much higher, which can be explained by at least two reasons:

- a general shift towards subject searches in a world where abundance of publication makes it less and less possible to know the title or author of the specific item
- a conceptual difference between collection-level and item-level searches, which implies a trend towards increased levels of subject search in federated collection registries.

Further research into how the search type distribution in IMLS Item-level Repository and IMLS Digital Collection Registry correlate with each other will help to answer these questions.

It should be noted here that actual searches conducted by users in the Registry rarely could be categorized "strictly" as any one of the search categories/FRBR entities, and sometimes presented a real challenge in determining which entity was the major component of a query. Below is a discussion of some of the examples found in this transaction log:

- "Amusement park". As an abstract idea of amusement parks this query might be categorized as a *concept*. On the other hand, amusement parks are physical structures created by people, which makes it an *object* in FRBR definition. There is no correct answer to this question, even asking a user what (s)he meant when making this search would not clarify the ambiguity in most cases, because a concept of amusement parks is tightly connected to the object of amusement park. If you ask a user, you might learn that the search was for a specific institution, thus a FRBR *corporate body* Similar examples of queries from the sample studied include "Archives", "Ballrooms", "Highways", "detroit+historical+museums" (the latter is also inseparable from a specific location FRBR place, as is "library Moorhead").
- "Industrial models". The very word "models" implies it being a *concept*, as modeling requires conceptualizing. On the other hand, industrial models are physical structures created by people to assist in specific industrial processes, therefore it can also be categorized as an *object*. "lesson+plans" appears to be a very similar example, only from another realm education rather than industry.
- 3. "Landscape" is something that exists in the nature, or can be created by people, thus it seems to be a FRBR *object*. However, the possibility exists for it to be classed as a *concept* too, if a user is searching for literature on landscapes and landscaping as a discipline.
- 4. "*letters+from+19th+century*" is a pretty straightforward example of *object* search. However, it is qualified by a specific time period, which, in FRBR definition, is an *event*.
- 5. "asian+American" appears to be a *person* search, although often refers to a broader category nonexistent in FRBR model yet an ethnic group. However, it is inseparable from two *places* Asian and American continents. In my understanding, a person or ethnic group in general is in most cases defined through place. Similarly, "*children+that+are+abuse*" is also a group (or a class) of *persons* inseparable from another FRBR entity, but defined by *event* of abuse rather than by *place*.
- 6. "henry+fordmuseum+and+greenfiel+village" is a specific corporate body (the Library of Congress corporate body authority file exists for it in WorldCat). However, it is

obvious, that a *person* of Henry Ford and a *place* of Greenfield Village are integral parts of this query.

- 7. "don+quijote" is both a fictitious character created by Cervantes and a phrase widely known as a title of his book -- although in fact it is just a part of the book's title. Categorization of this search entirely depends on the user intention, which cannot be known from the query itself. If the search was for a book, it was a *work* search, but if it was for a character it was either a *concept* (something abstract that does not exist and never physically existed), or a *person* if we follow the logic of "what it would be if it existed".
- 8. "Civil rights movement" might be classified as an *event*, which is a tricky entity because it is, according to Functional Requirements to Subject Authority Records (Zeng and Salaba, 2005), a combination of *place* and time. But where is time and place in this query? It may equally refer to various times and place, e.g. 1950s United States, or 1960s France, or 1970s Soviet Union, or 2000s China. Does the absence of explicit or implicit qualifiers make it a *concept?* "Census" seems to belong to the same cluster of examples.

Studies of transaction logs typically look at the frequencies of search term use and the average number of words in the search query. For the sample of queries analyzed in this study, the average frequency of term use was rather low -1.4. The highest search term use frequency was recorded for *place* category -1.58 – and the lowest was recorded for *event* category -1.08. In terms of the typical number of words in query excluding stop words, the average for the whole sample constituted 1.69 words per query. The highest average number of words per query was recorded for *corporate body* category of search -2.78 – and the lowest was recorded for *place* -1.35 words per query.

At the second stage of analysis, the number of matches for user search queries in three controlled vocabularies – GEM subject scheme, Library of Congress Subject Headings, and Art and Architecture Thesaurus – was compared for each search term (combination of terms in the user query), for each category of searches, and for the whole sample. A total of 10 matches – 2.6% out of 380 unique search terms – were found in GEM subject scheme. A total of 271 matches – 71.3% – were found in LCSH. Art and Architecture Thesaurus matched only 86 – 22.63% of user keywords. The only category of user searches GEM had matches to was *concept*, while LCSH had matches to all the categories, including a couple of *unknown* searches, which as the category were the worst represented in LCSH. Art and Architecture Thesaurus terms matched mostly *concepts* and *objects*, with no matches at all in *corporate body*, *place* and *work* search categories. The table below illustrates absolute and relative values of these semantic matches:

FRBR subject type	Unique search terms	search instances	GEM match	GEM match, %	LCSH match	LCSH match,%	AAT match	AAT match, %
concept	94	125	10	10.54	87	92.55	53	56.38
corporate body	9	10	0	0	5	55.56	0	0
event	12	13	0	0	6	50.00	2	16.66
object	79	108	0	0	51	64.56	29	36.71
person	78	117	0	0	63	80.77	1	1.28
place	55	87	0	0	51	92.73	0	0
Work	34	49	0	0	4	11.76	0	0
Unknown	19	24	0	0	4	21.05	1	5.26
TOTAL	380	533	10	2.63	271	71.32	86	22.63

#### Table 1.

The low level of matching between the user search terms and the GEM subject terms is explained by the extreme broadness of this subject scheme. There is no widely shared notion of the digital collection even among collection creators and managers (Lee 2000, Hill et al. 1999); much more confusion exists among the users of federated collection repositories. Such an ambiguity can cause sometimes unjustified preciseness and narrowness of collection-level search terms selected by Registry users, who are not making distinction between searching for items in collection and searching for collections in collection registry. Whatever is the reason, the mismatch between the GEM subject scheme and actual searches is obvious.

Surprisingly, LCSH, although matching most of the user terms, still leaves almost 30% unmatched. LCSH is the most effective in matching *places* and *concepts*, while *works* remain the least matched; only about a half of *corporate bodies* and *events* from this study's sample are covered by LCSH terms. The reason may lay in general inflexibility of LCSH – a large scheme that is extremely hard to keep up-to-date. A vivid illustration from this study is the absence of such term as "learning standards" in LCSH authority file.

However, as can be seen from the Table 2 below, compared to the other two controlled vocabularies, LCSH on its own (without overlap with AAT or GEM) covers the lion share – almost 50% of user search terms. Only 6 terms matched by AAT were not also matched in LCSH, and all the terms matched in GEM were also matched in LCSH.

FRBR subject type	unique search terms	matched by GEM alone	matche d by GEM and LCSH	matche d by GEM and AAT	matche d by LCSH alone	matche d by LCSH and AAT	matche d by AAT alone	matche d by ALL	matche d by NONE
concept	94	0	3	0	32	45	1	7	6
corporate									
body	9	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	4
event	12	0	0	0	4	2	0	0	6
object	79	0	0	0	26	25	4	0	24
person	78	0	0	0	62	0	1	0	15
place	55	0	0	0	51	0	0	0	4
work	34	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	30
unknown	19	0	0	0	3	1	0	0	15
TOTAL	380	0	3	0	187	73	6	7	104

Table 2.

The most unexpected finding of the second stage of analysis was that well-developed, up-to-date, flexible and faceted Art and Architecture Thesaurus, which seems to be especially suitable for describing cultural heritage materials and possibly collections, matched such a small proportion of user search terms. The explanation can lay in the fact that AAT, just as GEM, does not include name and place authority files. However, the broader Getty Thesaurus framework, along with AAT, also includes such authority files.

#### Conclusions

This study results demonstrate an unusually high for catalog use / transaction log analysis studies level of subject searching made by patrons at the collection level. Further investigation is needed into the reasons of such increase in subject search proportion, including collection of data through collection registry users' interviews and observations.

Further research is also needed into which controlled vocabulary would best represent digital collections in the IMLS collection registry. Although LCSH has shown relatively good results, none of the three controlled vocabularies in this study fully represents the subjects of diverse collections in the IMLS Digital Collection Registry, or at least a user's expectations towards these subjects. For the future study, another – more flexible than LCSH – controlled vocabulary of the moderate scale, which, unlike GEM or AAT, represents a wider variety of search types – not just *concepts* and/or *objects* – should be selected for the same analysis and for comparison with GEM, LCSH, and AAT. To compensate for deficiencies of the transaction log analysis as a method that does not provide any insight into user motivations and intentions and deals only with user actions, think-aloud protocol observation of the users searching IMLS Digital Collection registry should be incorporated into further analysis.

#### **Bibliography**

- Cochrane, P. (1986). *Improving LCSH for Use in Online Catalogs*. Colorado Springs, CO: Libraries Unlimited.
- Cochrane, P. (2000). Improving LCSH for use in online catalogs revisited: what progress has been made, what issues still remain. *Cataloging and Classification Quarterly*, 29 (1/2), 73-89.
- Collantes, L. Y. (1995). Degree of Agreement in Naming Objects and Concepts for Information Retrieval. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science*, *46*(2), 116-132. http://www3.interscience.wiley.com.proxy2.library.uiuc.edu/cgi-bin/fulltext/10050153/PDFSTART
- Dubin, D. S. (1998) Addressing the heterogeneity of subject indexing in the ADS databases. In U. Grothkopf, H. Andernach, S. Stevens-Rayburn, and M. Gomez, editors, *Library and Information Services in Astronomy III, volume 153 of A.S.P. Conference Series*, 77-83, San Francisco. Astronomical Society of the Pacific.<u>http://www.eso.org/gen-fac/libraries/lisa3/dubind.html</u>
- Functional Requirements for Bibliographic Records: Final report (1998). IFLA. UBCIM Publications, New Series, 19. http://www.ifla.org/VII/s13/frbr/frbr.pdf
- Gault, L. V., Shultz, M., & Davies, K. J. (2002). Variations in medical subject headings (MeSH) mapping: From the natural language of patron terms to the controlled vocabulary of mapped lists. *Journal of the Medical Library Association (JMLA ), 90(2),* 173-180. <u>http://www.pubmedcentral.nih.gov/articlerender.fcgi?artid=100762</u>
- Greenberg, J. (2001). Automatic Query Expansion via Lexical-Semantic Relationships. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science*, *52*(*5*), 402-415. http://www3.interscience.wiley.com.proxy2.library.uiuc.edu/cgi-bin/fulltext/77002637/PDFSTART
- Gross, T., & Taylor, R. (2005). What Have We Got to Lose? The Effect of Controlled Vocabulary on Keyword Searching Results. *College and Research Libraries*, 66 (3), 212-230. <u>http://vnweb.hwwilsonweb.com/hww/jumpstart.jhtml?recid=0bc05f7a67b1790e183771395b86e5aa98</u> 5cedb4235ee102d23781fb323b5ec2a6cec93038a63198&fmt=P
- Hill, L., Janée, G., Dolin, R., Frew, J., & Larsgaard, M. (1999). Collection metadata solutions for digital library applications. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science*, *50 (13)*, 1169-1181.
- Larson, R. R. (1991A). Between Scylla and Charybdis: Subject searching in online catalogs. *Advances in Librarianship*, 15, 175-236.
- Larson, R. R. (1991B). The decline of subject searching: long-term trends and patterns of index use in an online catalog. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science*, 42 (3), 197-215.
- Lee, H. (2000). What is a collection? Journal of the American Society for Information Science, 51(12), 1106-1113.
- Matthews, J. R., Lawrence, G. S., & Ferguson, D. K. (Eds.), (1983). Using online catalogs: A nationwide survey: A report of a study sponsored by the Council on Library Resources. New York, NY: Neal-Schuman.
- Nowick, E., & Mering, M. (2003). Comparisons between Internet Users' Free-Text Queries and Controlled Vocabularies: A Case Study in Water Quality. *Technical Services Quarterly*, *21*(2), 15-32. <u>http://www.haworthpress.com.proxy2.library.uiuc.edu/store/E-</u> <u>Text/View\_EText.asp?sid=F38AWX7KVNXE8G8K3MJ2XBKG9S4U2SXE&a=3&s=J124&v=21&i =2&fn=J124v21n02%5F02</u>
- Qin, J. (2000). Semantic Similarities between a Keyword Database and a Controlled Vocabulary Database: An Investigation in Antibiotic Resistance Literature. *Journal of American Society for Information Science*, 51(2), 166-180. <u>http://www3.interscience.wiley.com.proxy2.library.uiuc.edu/cgibin/fulltext/69501138/HTMLSTART</u>
- Sutton, S. A. (1999) "Conceptual design and deployment of a metadata framework for educational resources on the Internet." *Journal of the American Society for Information Science*, *50*, 1182-1192.
- Sutton, S. A. (2004) Building an Education Digital Library: GEM and Early Metadata Standards Adoption. In Metadata in Practice. Ed. by D. I. Hillmann, E. L .Westbrooks - Chicago: American Library Association, 1-15.
- Zeng, M., & Salaba, A. (2005). Toward an International Sharing and use of Subject Authority Data. FRBR Workshop, OCLC, 2005. <u>http://www.oclc.org/research/events/frbr-</u> workshop/presentations/zeng/Zeng\_Salaba.ppt

## **ATTACHMENT 1**

GEM Level 1	GEM Level 2
Arts	Architecture
	Art therapy
	Careers*
	Computers in art
	Dance
	Drama/dramatics
	Film
	History*
	Informal education*
	Instructional issues*
	Music
	Photography
	Popular culture*
	Process skills*
	Technology*
	Theater arts
	Visual arts
Educational	Audio-visual equipment
technology	Careers*
	Educational media
	History*
	Informal education*
	Instructional issues*
	Integrating technology into the classroom
	Language laboratories
	Multimedia education
	Process skills*
	Staff inservice
	Technology*
	Technology planning
Foreign	Alphabet
languages	Bilingualism
	Careers*
	Cultural awareness
	Grammar
	History*

Informal education\* Instructional issues\*

Linguistics

# Gateway to Educational Materials Subject Scheme

	Listening comprehension
	Process skills*
	Reading
	Speaking
	Spelling
	Technology*
	Vocabulary
	Writing
Health	Aging
	Body systems and senses
	Careers*
	Chronic conditions
	Consumer health
	Death and dying
	Disease
	Environmental health
	Family life
	History*
	Human sexuality
	Informal education*
	Instructional issues*
	Mental/emotional health
	Nutrition
	Cofety
	Smoking
	lechnology*
Language	Alphabet
Arts	Careers*
	Debate
	Grammar
	Handwriting
	History*
	Informal education*
	Instructional issues*
	Journalism
	Listening comprehension
	Literature
	Mechanics
	Phonics
	Process skills*
	Deading
	Speecn

	Spelling
	Story tolling
	Lechnology*
	Vocabulary
	Whole language
	Writing (composition)
Mathematics	Algebra
	Applied mathematics
	Arithmetic
	Calculus
	Careers*
	Discrete mathematics
	Functions
	Geometry
	History*
	Informal education*
	Instructional issues*
	Measurement
	Number sense
	Number theory
	Dattorns
	Fibless skills
	Triggeremetry
	Ingonometry
Philosophy	Aesthetics
Note:	Careers*
$2^{nd}$ level = ERIC	Educational Philosophy
Thesaurus	Epistemology
"Narrower Terms"	Ethics
	Existentialism
	Hermeneutics
	History*
	Informal education*
	Instructional issues*
	Logic
	Marxism
	Phenomenology
	Platonism
	Process skills*
	Semiotics
	Technology*
	Adventure and rick shellongs satisities
Physical	Adventure and risk challenge activities

Education	Aquatics
	Careers*
	Games (educational)
	Gymnastics(educational)
	History*
	Individual sports
	Informal education*
	Instructional issues*
	Motor/movement skills
	Outdoor education
	Process skills*
	Rhythms and dance
	Skill-related fitness
	Team sports
	Technology*
	Technology
Religion	Buddhism
Note:	Careers*
$2^{nd}$ level = ERIC	Christianity
Thesaurus	Confucianism
"Narrower Terms"	History*
	Informal education*
	Instructional issues*
	Islam
	Judaism
	Process skills*
	Taoism
	Technoloav*
Science	Agriculture
	Astronomy
	Biological and life sciences
	Biology
	Botany
	Careers*
	Chemistry
	Earth science
	Ecology
	Embryology
	Engineering
	Entomology
	General science
	Geology
	Histology
	History*
	Informal education*

[	
	Metallurgy
	Meteorology
	Natural history
	Oceanography
	Paleontology
	Pharmacology
	Physical sciences
	Physics
	Process skills*
	Space sciences
	Technology*
Social	Anthropology
studies	Careers
	Comparative political systems
	Criminology
	Current events/issues
	Economics
	Geography
	Gerontology
	History*
	Human behavior
	Human relations
	Informal education*
	Instructional issues*
	Process skills*
	Psychology
	Social work
	Sociology
	State history
	Technology*
	Technology and civilization
	United States Constitution
	United States government
	United States history
	Urban studies
	World history
1	
Vocational	Agriculture
education	Allied health occupations
	Business
	Careers*
	Cooperative education
	Distributive
	History*
	Informal education*

Instructional issues*
Occupational home economics
Process skills*
School-to-work
Tech prep
Technical
Technology*
Trade and industrial

#### **ATTACHMENT 2**

#### User Keyword Queries in IMLS Digital Collection Registry: Alphabetic Sequence

- 1. 16+MM
- 2. 1704
- 3. 1704
- 4. 1800-1849+fashion+
- 5. 1800-1849+fashion+of+clothing
- 6. 1800-1849+fashion+of+clothing
- 7. 1818+
- 8. 1876
- 9. 1895
- 10. 1895
- 11. 1976
- 12. 19th+century+epistles
- 13. a%3F
- 14. A.J.+Small
- 15. a+bird+in+a+gilded+cage
- 16. a+streetcar+named+desire
- 17. aboriginal
- 18. accounting
- 19. adams
- 20. adult
- 21. aerial
- 22. aeruak
- 23. africa
- 24. africa
- 25. africa+focus
- 26. africa+focus
- 27. african
- 28. african
- 29. african+american+studies
- 30. agriculture
- 31. aircraft
- 32. Ajumawi
- 33. Ajumawi%2Fatsugewi
- 34. akron
- 35. alex+janis
- 36. alf
- 37. alferd+packer

- 38. alfred+packer
- 39. algeria
- 40. alternative+energy
- 41. american+
- 42. American+Centuries
- 43. american+history&type=text
- 44. american+indian
- 45. american+jouneys
- 46. american+jouneys
- 47. american+journeys
- 48. american+journies
- 49. american+literature
- 50. american+literature
- 51. american+natural+science
- 52. american+studies
- 53. amusement
- 54. amusement+park
- 55. amusement+parks
- 56. animals
- 57. ansil+addams
- 58. Antarctica
- 59. Antarctica
- 60. antarctica
- 61. Antarctica
- 62. antartica
- 63. antartica
- 64. Antifederal+Club
- 65. arab
- 66. archaeological
- 67. archaeology
- 68. archaeology
- 69. architecture
- 70. architecture
- 71. Architecture
- 72. archives
- 73. Arizona
- 74. arkansas

75.	art+deco
76.	artificialintelligence
77.	Asia+continent
78.	asian+American
79.	assessing+governmental+performance%3A
	+an+analytical+framework
80.	astronomy&type=image
81.	Atsuge
82.	audio
83.	autoharp
84.	automated+speech+recognition%94+&type
	=dataset&type=text
85.	automated+speech+recognition%94+AND+
	%28software+OR+system%29
86.	automated+speech+recognition%94+AND+
	%28software+OR+system%29&type=datase
	t&type=text
87.	automobile
88.	automobile
89.	automobile
90.	Baby+Beauty+Contests+in+Pittsburgh%2C
	+PA+1936-1941
91.	Ballrooms
92.	Bangwell+Putt
93.	Bangwell+Putt
94.	baseball
95.	baseball
96.	baseball&type=image&type=moving+image
	&type=sound
97.	basketball
98.	baskin
99.	basque
100	basque
101	battle+of+new+orleans
102	Bay+State+Belting+Co.
103	beadwork
104	beaver
105	Belle+Isle
106	berkely+university+dinosaur
107	berryman
108	beyond
109.	biography+of+Enid+M.+Baa

110.birds 111.birth+announcements 112.black 113.black+studies 114.blimp 115.blue&type=sound 116.blue&type=sound 117.blue&type=sound 118.BNDIAN+SITE 119.body 120.bohemian+grove 121.bohemian+grove 122.bohemian+grove 123.bohemian+grove 124.bohemian+grove 125.bolles 126.Books 127.books 128.Boston+City+Directory+1885 129.Boston+City+Directory+1905 130.Boston+City+Directory+1935 131.bottom+trawling 132.Bozeman+area+Indians 133.BROMELIAD 134.bronx+neighborhoods 135.bronx+postcards 136.bronxart.lehman.cuny.edu%2Fpa%2Fneighb orhood.htm 137.brooklin%2C+maine 138.brooklin+me 139.Brooklyn+Daily+Eagle+-+Dittman 140.Brooklyn+Daily+Eagle+in+1941 141.broward 142.busquets 143.california+city+directories 144.california+digital+library 145.californian+indian+art 146.cameo 147.can+company 148.Canada 149.canada 150.Canaletto

151.canalleto 152.canion 153.cannibals 154.cape+cod 155.cape+may 156.car 157.car 158.car 159.car 160.car 161.car 162.car 163.car 164.car 165.car 166.carbon 167.Cars 168.cars 169.cars 170.cat 171.catherine+beecher 172.catherine+beecher 173.catherine+beecher 174.census 175.cervantes&type=text 176.chemistry&type=unknown 177.Cheques 178.chess 179.chicago 180.chicago 181.child+abuse 182.child+abuse+ 183.childabuse+case+ 184.childabuse+case+in+maryland 185.children+that+are+abuse 186.Chile 187.Chinese 188.chinese 189.Chinese 190.chinese&type=text 191.chinese+American 192.chinese+language

193.city+directories 194.civil+rights+movement 195.civil+war+records++illinois 196.clark 197.cleveland 198.clipper+ship 199.clipper+ship+cards 200.clipper+ships 201.close+quarters+in+detroit 202.coal 203.coal 204.Colorad 205.Colorado 206.Colorado 207.Colorado 208.colorado 209.Colorado 210.Colorado+Granger 211.Colorado+Granger 212.columbia 213.communist 214.community 215.computer 216.comradeship 217.concrete+music 218.confucianism 219.Congressional+Record 220.Connecticut 221.connecticut 222.connecticut+history 223.connecticut+history+online 224.connecticut+teaching 225.conservation 226.Cook 227.Cook+San+Francisco+Scrapbook 228.Cook+Scrapbook 229.cookbook 230.cookbooks 231.coommunity 232.correspondence+19th+century 233.costume 234.county

235.Crosley 236.cruikshank 237.Cruikshank 238.cruikshank 239.cruikshank 240.cuba+ 241.cuba+ 242.cuba+indipendence 243.cuban+immigrants 244.cuban+immigrants 245.cubans 246.cultural+competency 247.currency 248.cushman 249.Cutrell 250.Daugherty 251.daumier 252.Daumier 253.deaf 254.deaf+child 255.Deerfield 256 Deerfield 257.deerfield 258.deerfil%5Celd 259. demography 260.dentist 261.dentist 262.design 263.Detoit 264.Detroit 265.Detroit 266.Detroit+Boat+Club 267.detroit+historical+museums 268.detroit+river 269.diaries+from+the+1930s+under+the+New+ Deal+agencies 270.digital+dress 271.digital+dress 272.digital+dress 273.dinosaur 274.dinosaurs 275. dissertations

276.documenting+american+south 277.documenting+the+american+south 278.dogs 279.dogs 280.dolphins 281.dolphins%5C 282.don+quijote 283.don+quixote 284.dorothea 285.dorothea+lange 286.dorothea+lange 287.dorothea+lange 288.Dorothea+Lange 289.dorothea+lange 290.dorothea+lange 291.dorothea+lange&submit=Search 292.dortha+lange 293.dottie+long 294.dottie+lucille+long 295.drabik 296.dresses+from+the+1900+to+1980 297.durer 298.earth+field+trip 299.easter 300.eastern+Europe 301.Eastman 302.economics 303.economics 304.economics 305.edge+of+the+cedars+museum+collection 306.education+by+design 307.edward+curtis 308.edward+curtis+wax+cylinder 309.Edward+Mattis 310.edwards 311.Egypt 312.eico+369 313.Elsevier 314.empire+state+building 315.empire+state+building 316.epistemology 317.erik+satie

318.eubie+blake 319.eubie+blake 320.eubie+blake+scores+free 321.eugenics 322.exploratorium 323.fairport+ny 324.family 325.family+tree 326.farming+ 327.fashion 328.fashion 329.fashion 330.fashion+for+the+1800-1849 331.fashion+for+the+1800-1849%5C 332.feeding 333.feeding 334.feeding+America 335.feeding+america 336.feeding+america 337.ferrotype+Lincoln 338.FILM 339.find+it 340.fire 341.florida 342.florida 343.Florida&type=dataset&type=interactive+res ource 344.Florida&type=dataset&type=soun 345.florida+folklife 346.flying+cloud 347.folkstreams 348.Fox+%2Cet+al+First+steps+to+accreditatio n+%2C+1992+gazette 349.fragrance 350.Frances+Lee+Pratt 351.freemasonry 352.french+art&type=image 353.french+art&type=image 354.freshwater+mussels 355.gabriel+Moulin 356.gambling 357.gandhi

358.gardener 359.GATT 360.gauguin 361.GEM 362.Genealogical 363.genealogy 364.genealogy 365.genealogy&type=image&type=text 366.george+washington 367.gerd 368.Giant+Squid 369.glen+genz 370.global+warming 371.glopad 372.google 373.grainger 374.grand+central+station 375.graves 376.graybar+building 377.great+lakes 378.Gros+Ventres 379. Guinea 380.Hamonic 381.Hamonic+Fire 382.harry+collins 383.hartford+Connecticut 384.haven%2C+maine 385.haven+colony 386.Hawaii 387.hawaii%2C 388.hearth 389.heliotrope 390.Heliotropium 391.Heliotropium+tenellum 392.henry+fordmuseum+and+greenfiel+village 393.henry+fordmuseum+and+greenfiel+village 394.Hibi 395.higher+education 396.Highland+Park 397.Highways 398.hippopotamus 399.hippopotamus&type=image

400 hisako 401.historic+atlas 402.historic+atlase 403.historic+atlases 404.History 405.history 406.history+of+highways 407.history+of+physical+education 408.Hokusai 409.Hollywood 410.Hollywood 411.holocaust 412.holocuast 413.homefront 414.honore 415.honre 416.horse 417.House 418.housing 419.Housing+for+Shipyard+Workers 420.hungary 421.Icy+Hot+Bottle+Co. 422.ieee+collections 423.ieee+publications 424.ilgwu 425.illinois 426.illinois 427.Image 428.imigration+diaries 429.imigration+photographs 430.immigration+ 431.immigration+diaries 432.impeachment 433.indian 434.indian 435.indian 436.indian 437.Indian 438.indian 439.indian 440.indian 441.Indian+House+Door

442.INDIAN+MOUND 443.Indians 444.indians 445.Indonesian 446.industrial+models 447.infomine 448.INFOMINE&type=unknown 449.information+ 450.injection 451.inoculation 452.inquisition+ 453.insurance 454.insurance 455.insustrial+models 456.international+pewter 457.Internet 458.interstate+compacts 459.Interstate+Water+Compacts 460.Interstates 461.Iquique 462.Iranian 463 irish 464.irish+american 465.irish+country+people 466.Irish+folk+tales 467.iron 468.iron+forge 469.israel 470.Israel 471.israel 472.italy 473.j.+b.+priestley 474.jabotinsky 475.jackson 476.jackson+davis 477.jackson+davis 478.jacques+louis+david 479.jameskojack 480.japan 481.Japan&type=moving+image 482.Japanese+art&type=image&type=physical+ object

483.Japanese+art&type=moving+image%2C+ph ysical+object 484.Japanese+art&type=moving+image&type=p hysical+object 485.Japanese+art&type=physical+object 486. jerusalem 487.jew 488. jewish 489.jews 490.Jews 491.john+brow 492.john+brown+invoice 493.john+cage 494.K-12 495. Kansas 496.Karachi 497.kendall+thomas 498.kendall+Thomas 499.kennywood 500.kentucky 501.keystone&type=image 502.king+county+snapshots 503.king+philip 504.king+Philip 505.King+Philipe+Augustus 506.King+Philipe+II 507.King+Phillip+II 508.klan 509.klimt 510.kmoddl 511.knowledge+wins 512.labor 513.labor 514.laboratory&type=image 515.ladies+garmet+workers+of+1900 516.lake+st+clair 517.Lakota 518.land+development 519.Landscape 520.landscape&type=image 521.landscape&type=image 522.Landscape+prints

523.learning+standards 524.lesson+plans 525.letters+from+19th+century 526.lewis 527.librarian 528.librarians 529.librarianship 530.librarianship 531.librarianship 532.libraries 533.library 534.library 535.library%2Bmoorhead 536.Lincoln 537.lincoln+blood 538.linking+florida 539.list+of+cherokee+names+ 540.list+of+cherokee+registery+names+ 541.list+of+cherokee+registry+names 542.liver 543.liver+disease 544.logging 545.los+angeles 546.losier 547.love+letters+ 548.Lowry 549.lozier 550.LU.+65 551.lyman 552.madison+county 553.maine+memory 554.making+resultsbased+state+government+work 555.mambi 556.man&type=image 557.manuel+fernandez+del+casillo 558.manuel+fernandez+del+Castillo 559.maps 560.maps&type=dataset 561.maps&type=image 562.maps&type=interactive+resource 563.maps&type=moving+image

564.maps&type=physical+object 565.maps&type=sound 566.maps&type=text 567.maps&type=unknown 568.maria+thomas 569.marianas 570.marin 571.marin+county 572.mark+twain 573.mars+hill 574.masonic+%2Bmanuscripts 575.massachusetts 576.massachusetts+arms+invoice 577.matsusaburo+Hibi 578.mccaskey 579.mchale 580.meadow+brook+hall 581.medieval+quest 582.mesta+machine+co 583.method+of+dating 584.metis 585.michael+Collins 586.middle+east 587.Migrant+workers 588.milgrim 589.milgrims 590.mind+mode%3Bs 591.mind+models 592.mines 593.mining 594.mining 595.mining+stocks 596.minnesota 597.mint 598.MISANTHROPE 599.mizltplec 600.moac 601.monsen 602.moon&type=image 603.moorhead 604.motor+city 605.motorcycle

606.motorcycle 607.MP3 608.msp01047 609.msp01047 610.msp01047 611.Mulholland+highway 612.museum 613 museum+Illinois 614.music 615.music+boxes%22&type=image%2C+physic al+object%2C+sound%2C+text 616.music+boxes&type=image%2C+physical+o bject%2C+sound%2C+text 617.music+boxes&type=image&type=physical+ object&type=sound&type=text 618.music+therapy 619.musique+concrete 620.mussels 621.Mystic 622.naismith 623.naismith 624.Nakajima 625.narraguagus+river 626.Native+American 627.Native+American 628.Native+American 629.native+american+photos 630.native+american+settlement 631.native+american+settlement 632.naturalization 633.naturalization 634.naturalization+lesson+plans 635.ND-10043 636.Nevada 637.New+Deal+agencies 638.new+jersey 639.new+york 640.new+york+city+skyline 641.new+york+picture 642.new+york+public+library 643.newberry 644.newspaper

645.newspapers 646.nietszche 647.noank 648.Norman+Rockwell 649.Norman+Rockwell 650.Noronic 651.north+Carolina 652.north+Carolina 653.north+carolina+experience 654.north+caroline+experience 655.Oac 656.oakland+california 657.octopus 658.oklahoma 659.olfaction 660.olga+constantine 661.oliver 662.online+archive+of+California 663.oteiza 664.otto+perry 665.Ottoman 666.park+forest 667.park+forest%2C+il 668.pdf 669.pee+wee 670.Peep+into+the+Antifederal+Club 671.pennsylvania 672.penrose+correspondece 673.penrose+correspondece 674.penrose+correspondece 675.perfum\* 676.perfum\* 677.perfum\*&type=image&type=text 678.perfume 679.perfumer 680.perfumes 681.perfumes 682.personal+correspondence 683.philadelphia 684.philadelphia&type=dataset 685.philadelphia&type=interactive+resource 686.philippines

687.photographs 688.Photographs 689.photographs+of+river 690.photographys 691.photos+of+Matilda+Wilson+Dodge 692.pictures+of+Enid+Baa 693.pictures+of+Enid+M.+Baa 694.pioneer 695.Pit+River 696.Pitt+River 697.Pittsburgh 698.Pittsburgh+And+Lake++Erie+Rairoad 699.pittsburgh+and+lake+erie+r.r. 700.Pittsburgh+And+Lake+Erie+Railroad 701.Pittsburgh+And+Lake+Erie+Railroad 702.plain+Indians 703.plains 704.plains 705.plant%2Blabel 706.plant+images 707.plate+no+28 708.plate+no+29 709.plate+no+29 710.plate+no+39 711.plate+no+39 712.policy 713.Polio 714.population 715.portfolios 716.portraits 717.poster 718.Pratt%2C+Frances 719.pre-Columbian 720.prisoners re-entry%5C 721.prisons 722.prohibition 723.propaganda+ 724.propaganda+techniques 725.public+art 726.public+art+bronx 727.puck

728.quilt
729.quilts
730.R. Pullman
731.raffles
732.raid+on+deerfield
733.raid+on+deerfield
734.raid+on+deerfield
735.raid+on+Deerfield
736.raid+on+deerfield
737.raid+on+deerfield
738.raid+on+Deerfield
739.railroad
740.real+estate+appraisal
741.red+sox
742.re-entry
743.registry+repair
744.renewable+energy+
745.renewable+energy+sources
746.rhinoceros
747.richard+olderman
748.Richmond++Housing+for+Shipyard+Worke
rs
rs 749.rights
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot 752.rivers+of+Guinea
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot 752.rivers+of+Guinea 753.rivers+of+Guinea
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot 752.rivers+of+Guinea 753.rivers+of+Guinea 754.Roads
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot 752.rivers+of+Guinea 753.rivers+of+Guinea 754.Roads 755.rochester
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot 752.rivers+of+Guinea 753.rivers+of+Guinea 754.Roads 755.rochester 756.rubus
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot 752.rivers+of+Guinea 753.rivers+of+Guinea 754.Roads 755.rochester 756.rubus
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot 752.rivers+of+Guinea 753.rivers+of+Guinea 754.Roads 755.rochester 756.rubus 757.russia
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot 752.rivers+of+Guinea 753.rivers+of+Guinea 754.Roads 755.rochester 756.rubus 756.rubus 757.russia 758.rwanda
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot 752.rivers+of+Guinea 753.rivers+of+Guinea 754.Roads 754.Roads 755.rochester 756.rubus 756.rubus 757.russia 758.rwanda 759.sailing+ships 760.Saint-denis
rs 749.rights 750.riker-jaynes 751.riot 752.rivers+of+Guinea 753.rivers+of+Guinea 754.Roads 755.rochester 756.rubus 756.rubus 757.russia 758.rwanda 759.sailing+ships 760.Saint-denis
rs   749.rights   750.riker-jaynes   751.riot   752.rivers+of+Guinea   753.rivers+of+Guinea   754.Roads   755.rochester   756.rubus   757.russia   758.rwanda   759.sailing+ships   760.Saint-denis+tombs   762.Saint-denis+tombs
rs   749.rights   750.riker-jaynes   751.riot   752.rivers+of+Guinea   753.rivers+of+Guinea   754.Roads   755.rochester   756.rubus   757.russia   758.rwanda   759.sailing+ships   760.Saint-denis+tombs   762.Saint-denis+tombs   763.sales+reciept
rs   749.rights   750.riker-jaynes   751.riot   751.riot   752.rivers+of+Guinea   753.rivers+of+Guinea   754.Roads   755.rochester   756.rubus   757.russia   758.rwanda   759.sailing+ships   760.Saint-denis+tombs   762.Saint-denis+tombs   763.sales+reciept   764.satellite
rs   749.rights   750.riker-jaynes   751.riot   752.rivers+of+Guinea   753.rivers+of+Guinea   754.Roads   755.rochester   756.rubus   757.russia   758.rwanda   759.sailing+ships   760.Saint-denis+tombs   762.Saint-denis+tombs   763.sales+reciept   764.satellite   765.savage+indian
rs   749.rights   750.riker-jaynes   751.riot   751.riot   752.rivers+of+Guinea   753.rivers+of+Guinea   754.Roads   755.rochester   756.rubus   757.russia   758.rwanda   759.sailing+ships   760.Saint-denis+tombs   762.Saint-denis+tombs   763.sales+reciept   764.satellite   765.savage+indian   766.savage+indian
rs     749.rights     750.riker-jaynes     751.riot     752.rivers+of+Guinea     753.rivers+of+Guinea     753.rivers+of+Guinea     754.Roads     755.rochester     756.rubus     757.russia     758.rwanda     759.sailing+ships     760.Saint-denis     761.Saint-denis+tombs     763.sales+reciept     764.satellite     765.savage+indian     766.savage+indian     767.sayres

769.scarves 770.Scavenger 771.Scavengers 772.scent 773.scent 774.scorsasie&type=moving+image 775.sculpture 776.Sheldon 777.Sheldon+House+Door 778.ship+images 779.ships 780.Shoshone 781.singapore 782.Sioux 783.sioux+indian 784.sitting+bull 785.skyscraper 786.smell 787.smell 788.Smithsonian 789.social+customs+ 790.social+security 791.social+work 792.sonora 793.south 794.southeast+asia 795.soviet+union 796.spain 797.spanish+american 798.spanish+american 799.spectra&type=unknown 800.Springer+link 801.Springfield 802.springfield+ymca 803. standard + operating + procedure + for + laboratories 804.stanford+green+library 805.star+maps&type=image 806.stark+county (**cd**=2484) 807.stars&type=image 808.starvation 809.steel+works

810.stephen+king&type=text 811.street 812.streets 813.stutler 814.stutler+brown 815.stutler+brown 816.summer+drawings 817.summer+drawings 818.summer+landscape&type=image 819.summer+landscape&type=image 820.summons 821.summons+to+comradship 822.summons+to+comradship 823.Sweets+Ballroom 824.tain+bo+%22825.teacher+and+student+resources 826.teaching+with+digital 827.team+work 828.teamwork 829.teepee 830. TELEVISION 831.tepee 832.test 833.texas 834.The+Great+Plains 835.the+nazi+march+in+Skokie 836.The+Tigers+claw 837.the+uffizi+an+anthology 838.the+wave 839. Theresa+Cha 840.thesis 841.three+rivers 842.tibbetts 843.tobacco 844.tobacco+currency 845.tobacco+currency 846.tom+sawyer 847.tom+sawyer&type=moving+image 848.tools 849.top+religion+in+1930s 850.Topaz 851.topiary

852.TRAIN&type=image 853.training 854.trains 855.Transportation 856.transportation 857.Transportation 858.transportation 859 tranvias 860.Turkish 861.type=moving+image 862.U.S.+History 863.ukraine 864.university 865.university+collections 866.university+of+California 867.university+Wisconsin 868.utah+newspaper 869.vaccination 870.van+gogh&type=text 871.Van+Horn 872.vanhorn 873 varese 874.victor+elford 875.Vocational+Education 876.voice+of+colorado 877.volleyball 878.von+tilzer 879.voyager+spacecraft 880.W.P.A.+PHOTO 881.w.p.a.+puppets 882.Wales 883.walking+stick 884.walking+stick 885.Walter+Hawkins&type=text 886.war 887.war 888.war 889.war 890.Washington&type=image 891.washington+stae 892.washington+state 893.washington+state

894. Washington+township 920.world+war+i 921.world+war+i 895.Watkins 922.World+War+I 896.wayne+state%22 897.Welsh+language 923.World+War+I 898.western+1818 924.wpa+program 925.wrighting 899.western+high+schoo 900.western+high+school 926.wrighting 901.western+waters 927.WW1+Posters 902.westervelt 928.wwii 903.wgbh 929.Wyandoch+Kansas 904.whaling 930.yearbook 905.whaling 931.ymca 906.white+train 932.YMCA 907.Whitman 933.YMCA 908.William+Letts+Oliver 934.YMCA 935.YMCA 909.windorpski 936.YMCA 910.wisconsin 911.wisconsin 937.ymca 912.wisconsin 938.ymca 913.wisconsin 939.YMCA 914.Women 940.yoko+ono 915.women 941.z39.50 916.women 942.zeppelin 917.women 943.Zionism 918.women, 2530) 944.Zohaib+khan 919.world+war 945.zoo