

Anmerkungen:

- 1 B. Unfried/J. Mittag/M. van der Linden (Hrsg.), *Transnationale Netzwerke im 20. Jahrhundert. Historische Erkundungen zu Ideen und Praktiken, Individuen und Organisationen*, Wien 2008.
- 2 M. Caballero, *Latin America and the Comintern 1919–1943*, Cambridge 1986.
- 3 Vgl. R. Kößler, *Dritte Internationale und Bauernrevolution. Die Herausbildung des sowjetischen Marxismus in der Debatte um die ‚asiatische‘ Produktionsweise (= Quellen und Studien zur Sozialgeschichte Band 3)*, Frankfurt a. M. 1982; R. M. Bao, *La recepción del orientalismo antiimperialista en América Latina: 1924–1929*, in: *Cuadernos Americanos* año XIX/109 (2005), S. 11–41.
- 4 Vgl. die Beiträge in: E. Concheiro/M. Mondonesi/H. Crespo (Hrsg.), *El comunismo. Otras miradas desde América Latina*, México, D. F. 2007.

Sean Scalmer: Gandhi in the West. The Mahatma and the Rise of Radical Protest, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011, 248 S.

Rezensiert von
Gita Dharampal-Frick /
Milinda Banerjee, Heidelberg

The book under review aims at delineating the trajectory of Gandhian ideas and strategies of insurrection as invoked and practised in the United States and Britain in the 1950s and 1960s. While the author examines in painstaking detail the changing images of Gandhi in the West, his primary focus is on the civil rights movement for the empowerment of African Americans in the USA, and on the anti-nuclear arms movements both in the US and Britain. In

presenting his research, the author's stated aim is to retrieve conceptual resources for understanding as well as transforming the present world (p. 8). The enterprise is ambitious: Firstly, its objective of presenting a transnational history of the reception and use of Gandhian views and techniques is in tune with contemporary concerns about global flows and networks in the circulation of ideas and people. Secondly, the methodological focus on highlighting these flows contributes towards 'globalizing' Gandhian concepts, thereby assisting in the de-provincialization of history.

However, certain issues remain problematic; for instance, the author appears to have de-contextualized Gandhian concepts, segregating them from the South Asian landscape in which they were rooted. While such an approach may be useful to a certain extent in constructing a 'transnational' historiography, it does, needless to say, engender problems. The differences between the 'success' of Gandhian vocabularies of protest in India, and their relative peripherality in the West, cannot be understood without taking into account the differences integral to the socio-political landscapes themselves. Gandhian techniques were relatively successful in South Asia since they were affiliated to local peasant structures of community power, the traditional practice of resistance to 'unrighteous' laws, and the firm belief in the concept of moral authority. Gandhian ideas of non-violence were similarly related to South Asian devotional movements and their ideas of solidarity formation and community-building based on a shared sense of belonging. It was this linkage with deeply engrained beliefs in socio-political righteous conduct that enabled Gandhian nationalism to break the

limits of colonial elite politics in India, and to create connections between Indian nationalism and popular anti-colonial resurgence in a context of exploitative rule and acute rural poverty induced by the British raj. Given the absence of similar constellations in 20th century USA and Britain, the (lack of) success of Gandhian concepts in the West would naturally assume different textures; this crucial consideration seems to have been overlooked in this volume. Further, in offering a relatively homogenized interpretation of Gandhi, Scalmer obscures the contextual diversity of arenas which Gandhian politics could serve. In a related manner, the book also over-stresses the conceptual 'novelty' of Gandhian techniques, rendering invisible the manner in which Gandhi himself located his idiom within long-standing South Asian methods of political self-assertion.

While the book glosses over these historical and culturally significant specificities, it does succeed in presenting a more sophisticated analysis of the varying ways in which so-called 'Gandhians' in the USA and Britain 'domesticated' the image of Gandhi in order to transpose and localize his ideas into Euro-American conceptual genealogies. Initially, as Scalmer graphically presents, Anglo-American perceptions of Gandhi were entangled in Orientalist categories about Indian spirituality and asceticism, as well as being coloured by misappraisals of Indian other-worldliness and political immaturity. To his critics, Gandhi appeared as a textbook case of the Indian inability to master the tools of Western political paraphernalia, appearing as a "half-naked fakir" to use the British politician (and later Prime Minister) Winston Churchill's expressive description

(p. 16). To those who were enchanted by him, Gandhi constituted the quintessential Eastern guru. The frequent comparisons which his Anglo-American followers made between him and Christ underscore an enigmatic convergence in pacific-messianic expectation in an attempt to link war-weary Europe and post-Independence India. More significantly, the conflation of Gandhi and Christ exerted a strong appeal a decade later in the USA as well, particularly among African Americans. Martin Luther King, the preeminent figure in the African American civil rights movement, suggested that in the movement, "Christ furnished the spirit and motivation, while Gandhi furnished the method" (p. 170). In the process, however, Anglo-Americans 'tamed' and transformed the meaning of Gandhian resistance in ways which were not always conducive to the success of resistance movements. The author underscores how Gandhi, in being endowed with European-Christian genealogies, was often misappropriated into a quasi-Christian apostle of peace and non-resistance. Scalmer quite justifiably argues that this gridding of Gandhi into a charismatic spiritual-pacific cultic icon ultimately rendered him politically inefficacious in the West.

However sincere Anglo-American 'Gandhians' in the 1950s and 60s may have been in adopting Gandhian techniques of self-examination and reform as viable initiatory tools for political activism, yet as agitators confronted police and white mob violence (thereby being beaten down and occasionally killed), the limits of Gandhian techniques became self-evident to many. Scalmer demonstrates how Anglo-American protesters, and par-

ticularly those involved in the civil rights movement, subsequently embarked on a self-conscious project of forgetting Gandhi, and struck the path of retaliating violently against state and societal brutality. In the new usable pasts that they sought for themselves, names such as Mao, Che Guevara, and Vietnam became more potent than Gandhi as tropes of transnational solidarity-enunciation. Nevertheless, as the book argues convincingly, the radicalization of politics in the USA and in Britain had owed some of its most significant foundational contours and organizational unity to the Gandhian insistence on resisting unjust authority through mass-based programmatic action. However, the book demonstrates its conceptual lacunae at another juncture, too, namely with regard to the iconization of Gandhi, both in the East and in the West, which albeit exaggerated did not render him inefficacious in the Indian anti-colonial struggle, in the manner in which it rendered his ideas impracticable in Britain and America. The author does not seriously address this disjuncture. A closer scrutiny of salient South Asian research – and particularly studies by historians of the Subaltern Studies collective such as Shahid Amin – regarding the iconicity of Gandhi among Indian peasants would have provided seminal insights into this contrastive scenario. Scalmer would then have been well equipped to demonstrate the crucial differences between the Indian situation and the Euro-American imaginaries into which Gandhi was graphed by his ‘cosmopolitan translators’ (p. 92).

For 21st century readers, the ways in which the media creates celebrities is obviously of great relevance. From this vantage point, Scalmer is to be commended

for the important and multidimensional role he attributes to the Anglo-American media in projecting Gandhi to the West. With ingenious dexterity Scalmer details how the construction of Gandhi as a stand-alone celebrity in the early phase was superseded in the 1960s by the production of non-violent resistance itself as a tool of media-driven spectacle. The author creatively demonstrates how the American civil rights movement transformed non-violence from a medium of social rebellion to a mere crisis-inducing prelude to violent protest, as a tool “to ‘dramatize’ an issue” (p. 212). But as Scalmer rightly notes, this departed to a significant extent from Gandhi’s own moral standpoint of *satyagraha* which, as the symbolic incorporation of change, was not a mere overture towards such change; indeed, it constituted an existential and soteriological goal rather than serving as a means of convenience. Although the instigation of media spectacles was undoubtedly politically significant in colonial India, it became the *sine qua non* of ‘Gandhian’ protests in North America and Britain in the third quarter of the 20th century. In the process, a mediatized imperialism overpowered the (after-)life of Gandhi. In critical hindsight (though not mentioned by Scalmer), Churchill’s focus on Gandhi’s sartoriality can be appraised as being obliquely complicit with media concerns about Gandhi’s celebrity charisma; all the while, both perspectives were framed by the dictates of the then still influential visual objectification of non-Western societies.

To summarize, the author deserves accolades for producing a meticulously-researched work which inscribes in detail the manner in which Gandhi was conceived,

refracted, and (mis)appropriated in the USA and Britain. Scalmer has empirically highlighted diverse aspects of the Anglo-American reception of Gandhi, including the contribution of the media and of intellectual 'translators', in producing *bricolage* versions of 'Gandhi' which eclectically and transculturally utilized Gandhi by incarcerating him into concept-structures immediately understandable to Anglo-American audiences. According to us, the author could have profitably compared this trajectory to Gandhi's own self-understanding of his political philosophy, as well as to the South Asian lineages of his ideas. But this would prompt a fundamental (and perhaps troubling) cluster of questions, namely: Can one transpose Gandhian ideas to the West without first configuring a more radical shift in global spaces of power, where non-European community and intellectual structures (and not merely deracinated images) are brought to the centre of global epistemologies? Without such substantive shifts, how far can Gandhi's influence impact in the West?

**Ewald Nowotny / Peter Mooslechner /
Doris Ritzberger-Grünwald (Hrsg.):
The Integration of European Labour
Markets, Cheltenham, MA: Edward
Elgar Publisher, 2009, 301 S.**

Rezensiert von
Nancy Scharpff, Leipzig

reichische Nationalbank organisierten Konferenz in Wien im November 2008 entstanden. Anlässlich einer als zunehmend protektionistisch wahrgenommenen Arbeitsmarkt- und Immigrationspolitik auf Seiten einiger europäischer Länder (vor allem Österreichs und Deutschlands) bestand das Ziel dieser Konferenz darin, zur politischen Debatte über die Vor- und Nachteile einer Öffnung nationaler Grenzen im Rahmen europäischer Integration und Erweiterung beizutragen (Vorwort der Herausgeber und der Herausgeberin: S. x). Der Band widmet sich deshalb vor allem den Zusammenhängen zwischen (Arbeits-)Migration und makroökonomischen Entwicklungen und deren Einfluss auf die Arbeitsmarktintegration im europäischen Rahmen. Beiträge über die Einflüsse von Handelsdynamiken sowie von Kapital- und Investitionsflüssen als Form wirtschaftlicher Internationalisierung sind dabei im Vergleich zu Beiträgen über die Wechselwirkungszusammenhänge von Migrationsprozessen unterrepräsentiert. Dies mag mitunter darin begründet liegen, dass auf Seiten europäischer Zentralbanken, wie der Österreichischen Nationalbank, ein besonderes Interesse an der Untersuchung von Migrationsprozessen und ihren möglichen, auch finanzpolitischen Implikationen besteht. Der Miterausgeber und Wirtschaftswissenschaftler Ewald Nowotny, seit 2008 Gouverneur der Österreichischen Nationalbank, erläutert dieses spezifische Interesse in seiner Einleitung und weist auf die Gefahren protektionistischer, restriktiver Einwanderungspolitiken hin.

Einleitend wird damit sogleich ein politikberatender Ton angeschlagen, der jedoch nicht von der Lektüre der mehrheitlich

Der im Folgenden besprochene Sammelband ist im Kontext einer durch die Öster-