JMLE
JOURNAL OF MEDIA LITERACY EDUCATION

Journal of Media Literacy Education, 13(2), 55-70, 2021
https://doi.org/10.23860/JMLE-2021-13-2-5
ISSN: 2167-8715

Teaching beyond verifying sources and "fake news": Critical media education to challenge media injustices

Jeremy Stoddard

University of Wisconsin - Madison, USA

Jonathan Tunstall

University of Wisconsin - Madison, USA

Leila Walker

University of Wisconsin - Madison, USA

Emily Wight

University of Wisconsin - Madison, USA

Peer-reviewed article

Citation: Stoddard, J., Tunstall, J., Walker, L., & Wight, E. (2021). Teaching beyond verifying sources and "fake news": Critical media education to challenge media injustices. *Journal of Media Literacy Education, 13*(2), 55-70. https://doi.org/10.23860/JMLE-2021-13-2-5

Corresponding Author:
Jeremy Stoddard
jdstoddard@wisc.edu

Copyright: © 2021 Author(s). This is an open access, peer-reviewed article published by Bepress and distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited. JMLE is the official journal of NAMLE.

Received: March 1, 2021
Accepted: July 12, 2021
Published: September 10, 2021

Data Availability Statement: All relevant data are within the paper and its Supporting Information files.

Competing Interests: The Author(s) declare(s) no conflict of interest.

Editorial Board

ABSTRACT

Current popular media literacy programs overemphasize the verifiability, reliability, and expertise of sources over the analysis of how marginalized groups are represented. This analysis privileges traditional news sources – and a hierarchy of "objective" news. These same institutions have been historically responsible for producing and reinforcing stereotypes and media injustices toward marginalized groups. These media literacy programs lack emphasis on how issues of race, oppression, and politics are represented in factually accurate sources. We demonstrate how an alternative model of critical media education can attempt to address issues of representation and media injustice within the contemporary global media ecosystem. We use two pedagogical examples to illustrate how critical media education, emphasizing both critical consumption and media production, may be used to help young people go beyond verifying news sources for accuracy to also critically analyze the perspectives and representations in these sources, and produce media to challenge these media injustices.

Keywords: *media literacy, media representation, media effects, critical pedagogy.*

INTRODUCTION

Since the 2016 US presidential election, media literacy organizations in the US have focused almost solely on inoculating young people to the "fake news" crisis. Similar programs have emerged to combat misinformation campaigns in other countries with growing far right nationalist movements or fragile democracies in Europe, the United Kingdom and former Soviet Bloc Eastern European countries such as Ukraine (Mason et al., 2018). Similar examples have emerged in Singapore and other nations in Asia (e.g., India, Philippines) to combat the impact misinformation campaigns and distrust of media institutions can have on their national cohesion or trust in government (e.g., Pek & Wang, 2018). However, "fake news" can mean everything from misinformation and propaganda - to clickbait-focused stories to garner advertising revenue - to the weaponization of the term to attack the legitimacy of journalism in democratic societies (Higdon, 2020; Hobbs, 2020; Schmeichel et al., 2018).

This focus on fake news in schools is also not new. Current curricula build largely from strategies developed in schools to address the emergence of the internet and access to the world wide web in public schools. In the late 1990s, heuristics emerged for evaluating the quality and veracity of websites as sources of information, including the CRAAP (Currency, Relevance, Authority, Accuracy, and Purpose) test or the evaluation of URL addresses (e.g., .org, .edu) to assess valid sources (Caulfield, 2018). The promise of the democratization of information in the world wide web, meaning that universities, organizations, and even consumers could also now play the role of producers or distributors of knowledge, presented promise and challenges for students. While students could now access a wealth of information, there were many concerns about the quality and expertise in online information; expertise no longer accessed through approved textbooks from large publishers where the quality was not questioned. The current iteration of fake news takes place in the context of the growing role social networks, news aggregators, and for-profit news outlets play in how people access information about the world (Mihaildis, 2014). The added political weaponization of "fake news" used as a way to seed distrust in legacy news media organizations comes at a time when their economic future is already challenging (Higdon, 2020).

However, in many classrooms, this emphasis on evaluating sources of information to combat the rise of fake news has shifted the historic focus of media literacy education from analyzing the power of advertising and media images done primarily with mass media forms (e.g., television, magazines, newspapers, films) to analyzing web-based sources for accuracy, expertise and authority. Winners in this battle against fake news include the traditional news sources and larger corporate media conglomerates emphasized in these news literacy programs as being the most trustworthy (Butler, 2020). What has been lost in this emphasis on rooting out fake news is decades of research on the effects of how historically marginalized and oppressed groups in particular have been treated unjustly in these same trustworthy journalistic sources (Baker-Bell et al., 2017). In this article we illustrate how to teach beyond fact checking and news literacy to also explore issues of power and justice in news media through critical media analysis and media production strategies.

This added layer of awareness, analysis, and critical reflection provided by critical media literacy frameworks, is key to understanding underlying issues of power and information historically and their impacts today. Being technically accurate or upholding a set of standards for reporting accurate facts does not mean this reporting cannot be harmful to groups of people. Being factually accurate does not stop the perpetuation of stereotypes (e.g., race, gender) or harmful narratives in these sources (e.g., xenophobia). More directly, legacy newspapers (e.g., Washington Post) and news conglomerates (e.g., News Corporation) who attempt to maintain a high level of factual accuracy in their reporting are not immune from perpetuating inequities and mis-representations of marginalized groups. Yet these are the sources that are at the top of the news hierarchy being recommended by many news literacy programs around the US and world. This is in part because, in addition to being able to judge the accuracy and expertise in news sources, one of the keys to news literacy programs, such as the popular News Literacy Project (2020), is a focus on news appreciation (Fleming, 2014).

These models of news literacy also frame news sources (e.g., Tweets, online news stories) as static texts and not as part of a larger social and technological network where members can shape how others view and read these messages. They also do not reflect the more democratic ways in which many youth in particular today get their information (Mihaildis, 2014). These heuristics also do not engage students in a deeper understanding of how these individual sources are part of a larger media ecosystem or in information seeking

behaviors (Mason et al., 2018; Stoddard, 2014). While this approach aligns with the goals of fostering an appreciation for journalism and in the development of skills for evaluating the quality of news, it also avoids engaging with key issues critical media education approaches have long fostered. Critical media education strategies add additional layers to these heuristics, helping students to reflect on how the story is told, who is impacted by how the story is being told, and the ways in which headlines, images, and elements of the story and the narratives it contains or perpetuates, may do harm to historically marginalized or minoritized groups in society.

In this article we first explore some of the limitations of current popular news and media literacy education programs that overemphasize legacy news sources while engaging students in analyzing fake news and issues of representation without acknowledging issues of power. We also identify the lack of emphasis on how issues of racism, oppression, and injustice shape how these stories are presented and represented. This lack of focus on the effects of these representations lead to the reproduction of media portrayals of marginalized groups - from xenophobic anti-immigrant tropes to the ways Black Lives Matter protests and anti-Black violence occurring at the hands of police - are covered. We then use two conceptual pedagogical cases to illustrate how media education activities could engage students in critical consumption and (re)production of media, emphasizing both the veracity of media sources *and* being conscious of the issues of power in the representation of historically marginalized groups in these sources. These activities model ways that young people can resist dominant narratives and the hegemonic forces of mass media and partisan social networks.

RELEVANT LITERATURE AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

We use theoretical work from critical media studies, cultural studies, and critical race theory to inform a critical media education framework for analyzing issues of representation and oppression in media beyond the kinds of heuristics that emphasize accuracy and expertise. Critical media studies frameworks provide a lens and tools for examining issues of power related to how media shapes how marginalized groups, in particular, are represented. US youth rely increasingly on participatory and social media for news and information (Godlewski, 2016; Middaugh et al., 2017), as do youth across western Europe (Hazard Owen, 2018; Waterson, 2019). Youth are also increasingly learning about and engaging in political issues of interest online (CIRCLE, 2018). Over half of U.S. teens report their best understanding of news comes from visual media (Common Sense Media, 2019). This reliance on online media sources highlights the need for young people to be skilled in interpreting and analyzing visual elements as part of critical media education, in addition to analyzing text and audio components of online news sources (Cohen et al., 2011; Guthey & Jackson, 2008).

Cultural studies and critical race theory further allow us to theorize the impact of those representations on media injustices committed against marginalized groups. Media messages are constructed (Thoman, 2003), but for whom and in tandem with whose ideologies and discourses (Shohat & Stam, 2014)? Visual media influences understanding of news through implicit and explicit messaging, such as stereotypes fostered in photographs (Firer, 1998). These images, selected by predominantly white news media producers, come to represent reality for the audience (Gamson et al., 1992, Savali, 2015)[1]. This imbalance of power between those being represented and those in power, combined with the use of strong emotional responses to capture audience s' attention to reproduce new media, continues the spread of stereotypes and distortions (Shohat & Stam, 2014; Sivek, 2018), and of Black youth as "dangerous Others," in particular (Baker-Bell et al., 2017).

Conceptual framework: Critical media education for challenging media injustice

Critical media education explicitly moves this set of competencies to include issues of power, representation, and access to media and audiences. Critical media education may be viewed as the marriage between media studies (e.g., Hall, 2006; Masterman, 2003) and the work of critical pedagogy (Funk et al., 2016). Using a critical media education lens includes the ability to critically consume, through being able to recognize the

[1] We consciously chose to capitalize "Black" and not "white" in this article when referencing specific racial/ethnic groups. We do this given the focus of this article on empowering people historically marginalized in the press and to recognize that people who identify as white do not have the same shared histories of those who identify as Black in the US. For more on this decision see the Associated Press's similar decision: https://apnews.com/article/entertainment-cultures-race-and-ethnicity-us-news-ap-top-news-7e36c00c5af0436abc09e051261fff1f

author, intent, audience, and issues of representation in any given media text, as well as to examine issues of power as part of the production and distribution (or sharing) of media. Both aspects - consumption and (re)production of media - are key, given the shifting media ecosystems driven by social media platforms and dynamic web 2.0 capabilities (Mason et al., 2018).

Hoechsmann & Poyntz (2012) depict *media literacy* as “a set of competencies that enable us to interpret media texts and institutions, to make media of our own, and to recognize and engage with the social and political influence of media in everyday life” (p. 1). This focus, on social contexts of media and participation in various forms of production, is particularly important for fostering more conscious and thoughtful consideration of sharing and commenting on media within social networks – as a form of media (re)production (Middaugh, 2018).

We are particularly interested in how critical media education can be used to address issues of representation in news media. We are especially focused on issues related to racial stereotypes, the effects of colonialism and the perpetuation or reproduction of oppressive effects on marginalized groups in societies across the globe. These effects are what Baker-Bell et al. (2017) refer to as media injustices. The effects of media injustices by mass media - such as portraying Black men as violent, hypersexualized criminals - has been well known for decades (e.g., Bogle, 2001; Noble, 2018).

As a way to help contextualize the effects of mass media on group representation, Shohat and Stam (2014) introduced the concept of the burden of representation. They argue that because historically marginalized groups are included so rarely in mass media (e.g., film, television, journalism), any representation that is included has a larger proportional effect on how that group is viewed in society. This oppression comes to define whole communities of people and pain is documented to “obtain particular political or material gains” (Tuck, 2009).

Shohat and Stam argue that “stereotypes and distortions largely arise, then, from the powerlessness of historically marginalized groups to control their own representation” in media portrayals (2014, p. 184). The authors apply heuristics similar to those from critical media literacy, but adapted for specific focus on issues of representation of marginalized groups. They argue that a “full understanding of media representation... requires a comprehensive analysis of the institutions that generate and distribute mass- mediated texts as well as of the audience that receives them” (2014, p. 184). As Butler (2020) adeptly discusses, a core consideration for any critical media education approach should include a focus on the capitalistic interests of those involved, of which we also include here news organizations now driven more by their economic needs as well as their journalistic goals. Butler also points out that the same news organizations and foundations, together with corporate media organizations such as Twitter or Facebook, the latter of which particularly contributed to the spreading of misinformation, are also the organizations now offering to help in the mission of news and media literacy in education.

Typology of media injustice

Using the tenets of critical race theory as a guide, Baker-Bell et al. (2017) describe these patterns of mainstream media injustice theorized by Shohatt and Stamm (2014), and the media’s vilification of Black communities in the United States. Here we seek to expand their typology of media injustice (Baker-Bell et. al., 2017, p. 133-135) to include other historically marginalized groups in analyses of media portrayals. We adapt this typology of media injustice developed by Baker-Bell and her colleagues, to apply more globally across minoritized and racialized groups (including refugees and asylum seekers). This adapted typology (presented below) is used as an alternative media education analytical framework throughout this article.

1. Humanizing dominant - usually white - groups in society, and dehumanizing marginalized groups - usually persons of color: media sources rarely posit people of color in positive ways;
2. Compromising photos of persons of color: media outlets using compromising and even damaging photos of persons of color;
3. “Lone wolf” characterization (or a single harmful person) of white people, but not persons of color: the media frames persons of color in ways that perpetuate stereotypes about the entire community they represent;
4. Children of color represented as adults guilty of a crime;
5. Self-defense versus “guilty until proven innocent” portrayals: the media describes white folks as protecting themselves, and in contrast, persons of color are viewed through a lens of guilty until proven otherwise;
6. Double-standard depictions of justice movements: media outlets describing protesters of color in stereotyped, criminal ways.

This typology for the analysis of media text and images for patterns of injustice must be coupled with assessment of viewer impact for critical media analysis. News media today is built on using emotions to capture an audience's attention, and images that generate "strong emotions [are] more likely to be shared; negative emotions seem to increase the likelihood of virality" (Sivek, 2018, p. 126). Understanding the role of emotions when reading content that news companies specifically designed to target user's emotions is crucial to reading contemporary media. As emotions become more intertwined with how users perceive and distribute media, critical analysis of feelings produced by both media and media images becomes increasingly necessary.

In this article we also make the case for expanding the notion of media used in critical media education. While mainstream mass media has historically supported stereotypical narratives, other media can be leveraged to challenge these representations of historically marginalized communities. Media forms that emerge from marginalized communities potentially challenge and counter the effects of mass media, and should be viewed through a critical lens. The development of genres of music such as the blues, soul, and rap illustrate how media can better represent the voices, struggles and acts of resistance of marginalized groups. Music and the contextual culture from which it emerges can be utilized as a model for critical media education and critical pedagogy, as our case of rap pedagogy demonstrates below. As a form of participatory storytelling, rap pedagogy uses music, ritual, performance, and counter-storytelling in ways that shape identity, build community, and can transform societal beliefs and norms (Kuttner, 2016). Rap music, as counter storytelling, is a way to develop sociopolitical consciousness in students, and provides space for discussing topics of social justice and community reform (Akom, 2009).

In the rest of this article we use this framework first to examine elements from two popular media literacy curricula and then as a guide to illustrate some alternative models of critical media education. To do this we use two cases of pedagogical practice. The first of these cases focus on national and international news stories as they are commonly accessed by youth – as an image and headline or byline shared via social media, and linked to a story. We also look at how editorial choices linking images and text shape meaning, and in particular, depictions of marginalized groups – from asylum seekers migrating during the COVID 19 pandemic to Black Lives Matter protestors. The second case then presents rap pedagogy as a form of critical media education pedagogy. In particular, rap pedagogy, with its emphasis on social critique and counter-storytelling, provides a medium for analyzing and critiquing news media representations and media injustices. These examples illustrate how teachers, teacher educators, and those involved in media literacy work, may help young people (and adults) become both critical consumers of media representations and more thoughtful media producers and (re)producers who act to challenge, rather than to reinforce, these hegemonic representations.

The limits of news and media literacy approaches

A large number of media literacy curricula have been made available to schools from governmental agencies and private organizations in the past decade. These curricula often focus heavily on teaching students to spot "fake news" through assessing credibility and accuracy of news sources as the key goal (Huguet et al., 2019). This emphasis on verifying accuracy, sources, and expertise is an important skill set, but largely ignores analyzing how these stories may also reinforce stereotypes and harmful representations of marginalized groups, even when technically accurate. They may also be designed to engage students in limited analyses of issues of representation, such as levels of inclusion or bias, but do not provide spaces for participation in the production of media for critical media literacy – meaning challenging the common narratives dominating traditional news sources. To illustrate the limitations of these approaches, we provide examples from two of the most popular and widely recommended sources for media literacy curricula and programs in K-16 classrooms in the US, The News Literacy Project (2020) and Common Sense Education (2020) (e.g., Snelling, 2020).

The News Literacy Project (2020) was formed by former newspaper editors and funded by newspaper foundations (e.g., Knight Foundation) with the mission of helping young people better discern and appreciate the quality of journalism. The News Literacy Project's Checkology[2] program includes heuristics for evaluating

[2] https://newslit.org/educators/checkology/

quality news sources. These heuristics emphasize markers of quality, such as having "been verified by an editor or expert," prior to being published or broadcast.

When applied to stories such as Fox News coverage of confrontations at the US-Mexico border in 2018 (Fox & Friends, 2018), where US Border Patrol officers fired teargas canisters onto the Mexican side of the border, would this source be considered quality news?[3] According to the News Literacy heuristic, an editor/producer had approved the story and an expert, a former border patrol officer who is the President of the Border Patrol Foundation, was interviewed – thus making it a verified and trustworthy source. Following this heuristic, students using the News Literacy Project criteria focus more on the source and aspects of expertise than the message - that teargas was harmless and that you could "actually put it on your nachos and eat it" (Brice-Sadler, 2018). This comment, especially if taken as valuable news, both reinforces a stereotype of Latinx migrants while also downplaying what was being described as an inhumane use of force by other news sources. The Checkology heuristic verifying that the news was reliable potentially reinforces both the hierarchy of traditional corporate news sources, and ignores the issues of representation displayed in the expert's commentary.

Another commonly used media literacy program from Common Sense Media does have one activity focused specifically on representation in the media - specifically on gender stereotypes. *Common Sense Education*[4] is a nonprofit organization with corporate and foundation sponsors that focuses on providing reviews of media for families, and media literacy curriculum for educators. This lesson provides four activities for students to engage with issues of representation of gender that they see online. While this lesson attempts to address issues of representation in the media, it does not foster the kinds of critical engagements with news identified in the typology adapted from Baker-Bell et al. (2017), and does not focus on any specific marginalized groups in their analysis. It is designed to engage students in understanding the concept of stereotypes, using common gender representations in media related to dress, behavior, and social status or role. These include identifying stereotypes such as "Boys are competitive and like to win," and "Girls worry about how they look."[5] However, the activity does not ask students to engage more critically with issues of sexuality or any kind of impacts that these stereotypes promote. Nor does it ask students to examine the role of media organizations and corporations in perpetuating these stereotypes. They do not emphasize a more critical analysis that engages with issues of power around media representations. Instead, it asks them to create an avatar of the stereotype and find ways that they could challenge the stereotype.

While the News Literacy heuristic and Common Sense programs help students to verify sources for accuracy and expertise and consider the potential impact for how news is represented in media, there is no critical component that teaches students to question the media's role in maintaining hegemony. Instead these curricula imply that there are reliable and objective news sources for students to access, and that issues of representation in media end at the level of largely minimal stereotypes with no clear impact. Students are not asked to reflect on nor analyze how news stories and media representations present political and social perspectives through word choice, narrative framing, images and other editorial choices that align with the typology for understanding media injustice. This focus on media accuracy and basic levels of media analysis also potentially reinforces the traditional power structures that control media outlets, which in turn reproduce harmful stereotypes and representations of marginalized groups of people.

We have focused here primarily on media literacy programs in the US context, but many of these issues match those in other countries. For example, countries like the United Kingdom that have historically had strong media education programs, have found them now marginalized. A program developed in Ukraine to combat propaganda and misinformation campaigns, *Learn to Discern,*[6] has a similar emphasis on fact checking and filtering news but without explicit focus on the politics driving the propaganda. Other efforts with more global versus national interests have attempted to fill this void. UNESCO has put together a framework of media information literacy that focuses on

[3] https://www.mediamatters.org/fox-friends/fox-friends-guest-defends-use-pepper-spray-migrant-caravan-its-natural-you-could
[4] https://www.commonsense.org/education/

[5] These examples come from the commonsense.org activity titled: Beyond Gender Stereotypes How do gender stereotypes shape our experiences online?
[6] https://www.irex.org/project/learn-discern-l2d-media-literacy-training

educating teachers in critical media literacy[7] The framework offers three specific topics with which to engage teachers: 1) the comprehension of media and information and its connection to democracy; 2) evaluating and critiquing sources of media and information; and 3) creation and use of media (UNAOC, 2020). While these three modules fit within our call for a more critical media literacy focus, specifically with the intentional focus on assessment of sources and production of media, this framework is designed for teachers. UNESCO has yet to offer a comprehensive curriculum designed for students to engage in the process of critical media literacy. Overall, as we have demonstrated above, popular curricula and strategies being used in US schools today, and in similar programs in other countries, place the focus on particular types of news sources as being accurate and objective, or at best offer a minimal examination of issues of representation. These potentially reinforce, rather than challenge, the nationalistic narratives in these sources and the long history of stereotypes and negative portrayals of historically marginalized communities they perpetuate (Baker-Bell et al., 2017).

ALTERNATIVE PEDAGOGICAL APPROACHES FOR CRITICAL MEDIA EDUCATION

What would alternate forms of media education pedagogy look like that would help young people focus on issues of accuracy and also the potential impact of the messages being communicated in these sources? In the following section, we present two conceptual examples of what critical media education could look like using our adapted typology focused on media justice through combining both critical consumption and (re)production, that also address issues of representation and social justice.

Going beyond sourcing and basic stereotypes to analyze media representations

Our first pedagogical example provides a window for students to critically examine a key facet of news stories in the contemporary media ecosystem - namely the images or graphics associated with a headline and news story (if the reader opens it). This issue is highlighted in the News Literacy example provided in the previous section where we highlight the issues of representation in a source deemed trustworthy using the heuristic for evaluating news sources. For this example, we focus on images in particular, as they often generate emotional responses for viewers. These emotional responses are desired by media companies as the images are designed to entice viewers to click on the linked story or share the story with their social network. We also focus on images as they can often tell a different or even divergent tale from that of the story itself. Using the adapted typology we presented above, this example provides a model for how to help students begin to analyze the issues of power and representation within media images, and to recognize and reflect on the messages these images send. It also asks them to consider these messages when they decide whether or not to share or comment on these media.

Using the six patterns of media injustice as a pedagogical lens, teachers can help youth evaluate the intent, emotional impact, and validity of images. Prior to any classroom image analysis, discussion of the purposes of media (for whom it is produced, what the goals of media producers are) would be useful to help students begin to critically examine media for biases. Baker-Bell et al. (2017) and Yosso (2002) discuss the importance of classroom community building around discussion of media images, and Baker-Bell and co-authors, in particular, offer some examples of how to build these communities.

To provide an example of how to engage students in analyzing the way images included with news stories send particular messages and challenge or support media injustices, we selected several examples highlighting the decades-long issue of how migrants and refugees are portrayed in the media. In particular, we use the examples of images from French and US news organizations that portray immigrant, migrant, or refugee youth (published in October 2019). Both France and the U.S. have contemporary and historic acrimonious immigration rhetoric. Below we present a sample analysis of these images to demonstrate how our typology illustrating patterns of media injustice could be employed with students - for both critical consumption and sharing or reproduction goals.

Key to this kind of analysis is a focus on issues of representation within the image and how it aligns with the news story. Basic semiotic analysis of the images can

[7] http://www.unesco.org/new/en/communication-and-information/resources/publications-and-communication-materials/publications/full-list/media-and-information-literacy-curriculum-for-teachers/

reveal how visual elements symbolize and signify social and political messages. The three images we selected to demonstrate our framework (see Appendices A-C), all from photographers working with the Associated Press or Getty Images services, illustrate common representations of migrant and refugee youth included with widespread news stories. The first two (Appendices A, B) represent images at the US-Mexico border. They portray Border Patrol officers in positions of power (e.g., above the migrants, with weapons, back to the camera). They also do not align with the headline or news story being told. For example, Appendix B accompanies a story accusing Border Patrol officers of illegally deporting migrants and denying asylum, while portraying these immigrants with their hands behind their head as if guilty. Appendix C, a ship docking in Italy with migrants from Africa entering the European Union, portrays migrants reaching land – but in the background the words "rescue" on the boat and a crew member in full protective gear are shown. The image of the crew member in protective gear in particular portrays the migrants as dangerous.

Using our framework, these images can be used to engage students in evaluating how the migrants, a group often marginalized, are portrayed in the images in comparison to the border patrol officers or rescue boat crew members. In all images, the officers and ship's crew are portrayed in positions of power – while none of their faces are shown. They become representative of official power. The migrants are portrayed as less than human (pattern 1 of media injustice): huddled against a border fence, with hands on the back of their heads in detention, or leaving a boat while crew members, in full protective gear, look on. These images also represent patterns 4 and 5 in our adapted typology of media injustice: portraying children along with adults as if they are guilty of a crime not even outlined in the story – and as guilty until proven innocent. This latter act of media injustice is particularly apparent in Appendix B : a migrant man portrayed with his hands at the back of his head accompanies a headline that raises the question of unlawful acts done by the U.S. Border Patrol.

With events of the past year, and the physical restrictions (such as distancing, curfews, and lockdowns) that change in severity due to the COVID-19 pandemic, Americans increasingly rely on the internet (Anderson & Vogels, 2020; Vogels et al., 2020), including in schooling. Common images, and patterns of images, connected with news associated with COVID-19 (especially citizens of China, as seen in Appendix D), and Black Lives Matter (BLM) protesters (example in Appendix E), could be analyzed using the adapted framework from Baker-Bell et al., in particular including examples of dehumanization and stereotype perpetuation (patterns 1 and 3), and for BLM activists, double-standard depictions of protesters (pattern 6).

After using the framework for examining media injustices to analyze images, students can discuss any patterns noticed, emotions evoked, and their analysis of the motivating factors behind the portrayal (e.g., capitalism, racism, xenophobia). The pathos appeal of the images is undeniable, and it is clear how unjust stereotypes proliferate in visual media. Following these discussions, teachers can involve students in the uplifting and sharing of news stories that do not proliferate patterns of media injustice. Another step could be creating their own narratives and images that counteract historical patterns of marginalization, stereotyping, and dehumanization.

Further, as these images are often the primary representation that – along with a headline – appear in social media newsfeeds, this analysis can prompt a discussion of the ethics of sharing (Middaugh, 2018). Discussions should include a reflection on the emotional response to images and considerations for when and how these media should be shared or commented on – as well as the potential impact of that sharing on others in a user's social network. Additional areas for analysis could include images across a broader range of news sources, or images that include only adults. In articles on immigration, a pattern of close-up photographs of white males in positions of power (presidents, acting commissioners, directors) was clear and can be juxtaposed to the actual law enforcement officers on the border – whose identities are largely hidden. This could be analyzed, particularly within its textual context.

Hip Hop pedagogy as critical media education

The case of examining images that accompany news stories from traditional news sources above easily fits within what many consider media education. We also, however, want to illustrate how emerging media or media that often do not enter classroom spaces are also powerful sites for consumption and production toward critical aims. Our second example is hip hop pedagogy. Hip hop pedagogy is grounded in hip hop culture, music, and art. Hip hop and rap music (and music videos) are forms of media that historically have been utilized for social, cultural, and political critique (Love, 2019). In particular, we see the creation of rap music as a form of media production and counter-storytelling, as a way to

develop sociopolitical consciousness in students and challenge the media injustices outlined in our framework (Akom, 2009). Unlike traditional legacy media sources, the target audience for hip hop is not white middle class people, but is for marginalized communities. Complicating this statement is the fact that economically, the number one consumer group of hip hop is white middle class teens. However, the message, aesthetics, and cultural heritage of hip hop is rooted in Black culture.

Furthermore, rap as counter story-telling can provide various levels of psychic protection for African American students from the overt racist tropes that they are constantly inundated with by mainstream media. News stories tend to humanize white criminals and white supremist acts of terror. In the case of Dylan Roof, who murdered several members of a South Carolina Black church congregation in cold blood, he was described as having mental instability by mainstream media. Being described as a lone wolf completely ignored his ties to white supremacy. Fear of alienating their white middle class audience prevented news media from analyzing the system of white supremacy as motivating this act of terror. These same news sources simultaneously rationalize violence against Black victims, by saying children like Tamir Rice look old for their age, or in their dauntless search for criminal records or rationale when Blacks are victims of police racial violence (Baker-Bell et al., 2017). The care legacy news sources take not to alienate or offend their white middle class audience, biases these sources against marginalized communities.

Hip hop has emerged across the globe as a medium for marginalized youth to share their voice and to promote awareness for issues of justice that news stories are failing to recognize due to their tendency to cater to their white middle class audience. Below we describe how hip hop may be utilized as a form of critical pedagogy for analyzing issues of justice in news. One way in which this is accomplished, is in partnership with community organizations in order to directly address local and national political issues negatively impacting local communities (Dewhurst, 2014). Hip hop pedagogy allows space for students to address the anti-blackness within society that coincides with national topics like police brutality. Since no effort is made to appease the white middle class audience, rationalizations like the lone wolf depiction in news stories that will characterize the action of one bad officer, without critiquing the entire institution, are not found (Baker-Bell et al., 2017). This allows for a more honest analysis of societal injustice. This form of critical pedagogy works to challenge the media injustices outlined in our framework above, and works toward critical media education that focuses "on ideology critique and analyzing the politics of representation of crucial dimensions of gender, race, class, and sexuality" (Kellner & Share, 2007, p. 8) and allows for media production to take action and critique these ideologies.

Hip hop pedagogy can also extend beyond the analysis and creation of rap text as a function of societal analysis. Recent protests following the murder of George Floyd have inspired a number of hip hop graffiti/murals. In Madison, Wisconsin, there are a number of murals depicting Black excellence, promoting Black Lives Matter, and criticizing racialized violence committed by the police department. Contemporary messages of "black girl magic" and "black boy joy," meant to inspire and combat stereotypical characterizations of the angry Black man or Black woman, are found all over downtown Madison. Here hip hop visual media is used to critique anti-Black violence and directly confront systemic racism in a way traditional news sources' consumer-focused approach fails to do. Representations of social unrest, and artistic expressions showing the majesty and beauty of blackness, are on the front of almost every store up and down State Street, a popular street next to the city's capital. This is yet another iteration of hip hop as critical media education, speaking truth to power.

Another strategy is community organizations' use of underground youth created rap. These rap texts foster sociopolitical consciousness by creating greater awareness of local issues that plague communities across America. One example of this is the song "Grow Food."[8] Sponsored by the nonprofit Appetite for Change, "Grow Food," features young artists from ages 12-15 tackling the issue of food deserts and analyzing the causes and effects of inner-city neighborhoods being saturated with fast food restaurants and an absence of community gardens or affordable healthy options. This is an example of critical media production in so far as students are directly analyzing an issue in their neighborhood, access to healthy food, and sharing their analysis with the world by disseminating their rap text and media. Food deserts disproportionately impact low

[8] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PqgU3co4vcI

income marginalized communities, and are not an issue for middle class white families; therefore, they are not a story covered by legacy news sources. If it is covered by major papers, it is done with a white middle class audience in mind, and becomes a problem for marginalized communities and not a systemic problem related to housing, segregation, and food systems. This is where community based local organizations step in and use hip hop to discuss both problems and solutions. Another great source for youth created hip hop is 'Brave New Voices,'[9] a national slam poetry team that features middle and high school students. Topics like the relevance of traditional education, the hypocrisy of American society, and social justice issues that range from anti-blackness to Islamophobia, are just a few of the topics these young people tackle. A particularly powerful piece is entitled "Why are Muslims So,"[10] and was written by two teenage Muslim girls wearing hijabs and talking about the various racist stereotypes they have had to endure. This powerful example of counter narrative storytelling is a good lesson for people of all ages, and is a powerful tool of both societal analysis and counter narrative storytelling. Using hip hop as a tool of analysis in tandem with counter narrative storytelling, is necessary in order to move towards critical pedagogy and justice centered media analysis. The power of rap music as a vehicle for the voices of the disenfranchised is not limited to the United States either.

In Iran and Spain, rappers have been arrested for creating songs that were oppositional to the government and fostered civil unrest. In Thailand, the musical group "Rap Against the Dictatorship" released a song accusing the Parliament of being filled with military lackeys, police beating citizens at peaceful protest, and the government running a dictatorship under the guise of democracy (Minhaj, 2020). The government, instead of trying to stop the video - which had millions of streams - have instead opted to try and create pro-government rap music. This move has been adopted by other governments as well, including Vladimir Putin in Russia, who claimed that rap should be controlled by the state and has gone as far as intending pro-government rap concerts himself in order to connect with the people. Even in a medium made to highlight the voices of marginalized communities, there is need for critical analysis, as this same vehicle can be used to support hegemonic aims of oppressive governments. This interest convergence in the use of rap as a medium, reinforces the need for coinciding critical consumption with critical production even for media largely viewed as a source for challenging media injustices. Hip hop pedagogy fosters critical analysis of news coverage on key issues of justice as well as a space for producing media that counters historic issues of representation in mainstream news and informs marginalized communities.

DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS

As words like post-truth, epistemic crisis, and fake news dominate calls for media literacy, we make the case here to go far beyond an updated version of the CRAAP test. Particularly with respect to historically marginalized groups and current patterns of media injustice, issues of power and representation have never been more visible. Engaging in critical media education practices with representation and race at the forefront, is key for all students to begin to recognize and challenge the injustices perpetrated by mass media and social media alike. When applied to practice, we believe our framework for critical media education to be essential for supporting youth in understanding the ways media shapes and is shaped by their lives. We also hope to foster their critical consumption of media as well as media production toward the goals of critique and counter-storytelling. Our examples above of alternative pedagogical stances for critical media education against media injustices are just that: examples. They are provided as counter-stories of their own against the predominant narrative of fake news in schools – a narrative that reproduces rather than challenges the media injustices in the framework we present.

REFERENCES

AFP. (2020). *A medical worker collects a sample of a person to be tested for the Covid-19 coronavirus on a street in Mudanjiang, China's northeastern Heilongjiang province* [Photograph]. Hindustan Times. https://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/after-wuhan-china-conducts-mass-testing-in-the-city-of-mudanjiang/story-qcVbsu3mr7T7yczs4bPgtI.html

Akom, A. (2009). Critical hip hop pedagogy as a form of liberatory praxis. *Equity & Excellence in*

[9] http://youthspeaks.org/bravenewvoices/

[10] https://www.tes.com/lessons/Cu6TaBOMre1SJQ/muslim-life

Education, 42(1), 52-66. https://doi.org/10.1080/10665680802612519

Anderson, M. & Vogels, E. (2020, March 31). *Americans turn to technology during COVID-19 outbreak, say an outage would be a problem*. Pew Research Center. https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2020/03/31/americans-turn-to-technology-during-covid-19-outbreak-say-an-outage-would-be-a-problem/

Baker-Bell, A., Stanbrough, R. & Everett, S. (2017). The stories they tell: Mainstream media, pedagogies of healing, and critical media literacy. *English Education, 49*(2), 130-152.

Baldwin, D. L. (1999). Black empires, white desires: The spatial politics of identity in the age of hip hop. *Black Renaissance, 2*(2), 138. https://ezproxy.library.wisc.edu/login?url=https://www-proquest-com.ezproxy.library.wisc.edu/docview/215532771?accountid=465

Bogle, D. (2001). *Toms, coons, mulattoes, mammies, and bucks: An interpretive history of Blacks in American films.* Bloomsbury Publishing.

Brice-Sadler, M. (2018, November 26). 'You could actually put it on your nachos and eat it,' Fox guest says of gas used at the Mexican border. *Washington Post.* https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/2018/11/26/you-could-actually-put-it-your-nachos-eat-it-fox-guest-says-gas-used-mexican-border/

Butler, A. (2020). *Educating media literacy: The need for critical media literacy in teacher education.* Brill Sense.

Caulfield, M. (2018). *A short history of CRAAP*. Hapgood. https://hapgood.us/2018/09/14/a-short-history-of-craap/

Center for Information & Research on Civic Learning & Engagement. (2018, October 15). *CIRCLE poll: so much for slacktivism, as youth translate online engagement to offline political action*. CIRCLE. https://civicyouth.org/circle-poll-so-much-for-slacktivism-as-youth-translate-online-engagement-to-offline-political-action/

Cohen, L., Manion, L. & Morrison, K. (2011). *Research methods in education* (7th ed.). Routledge.

Common Sense Education. (2020a). *Everything you need to teach digital citizenship*. Common Sense Education. https://www.commonsense.org/education/digital-citizenship

Common Sense Education. (2020b). *The Four Factors of Fair Use*. Common Sense Education. https://www.commonsense.org/education/digital-citizenship/lesson/the-four-factors-of-fair-use

Common Sense Media. (2019, August 12). *New survey reveals teens get their news from social media and YouTube*. Common Sense Media. https://www.commonsensemedia.org/about-us/news/press-releases/new-survey-reveals-teens-get-their-news-from-social-media-and-youtube

Dewhurst, M. (2014). *Social Justice Art: A Framework for Activist Art Pedagogy*. Harvard Education Press.

Firer, R. (1998). Human rights in history and civics textbooks: The case of Israel. *Curriculum Inquiry, 28*(2), 195-208. https://www.jstor.org/stable/1180134

Fleming, J. (2014). Media literacy, news literacy, or news appreciation? A case study of the news literacy program at Stony Brook University. *Journalism & Mass Communication Educator*, *69*(2), 146-165.

Funk, S., Kellner, D., & Share, J. (2016). Critical media literacy as transformative pedagogy. In Yildiz, M. N. & Keengwe, J. (Eds.), *Handbook of research on media literacy in the digital age* (pp. 1-30). IGI Global.

Gamson, W., Croteau, D., Hoynes, W. & Sasson, T. (1992). Media images and the social construction of reality. *Annual Review of Sociology, 18*, 373-393. https://www-jstor-org.ezproxy.library.wisc.edu/stable/2083459

Godlewski, N. (2016, June 21). *Teens are getting almost all of their news from Snapchat and Twitter these days*. Business Insider. https://www.businessinsider.com/how-do-teens-get-news-2016-6

Guthey, E. & Jackson, B. (2008). Revisualizing images in leadership and organization studies. In D. Barry & H. Hansen (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of new approaches in management and organization* (pp. 84-92). SAGE.

Hall, S. (2006). Encoding/decoding. In M. Durham & D. Kellner (Eds.), *Media and cultural studies: Keyworks* (pp. 164-173). Blackwell Publishers.

Hazard Owen, L. (2018, October 30). *Younger Europeans are tuning out of TV news - but they're into newspaper websites*. NiemanLab. https://www.niemanlab.org/2018/10/younger-europeans-are-tuning-out-of-tv-news-but-theyre-into-newspaper-websites/

Higdon, N. (2020). *The anatomy of fake news: A critical news literacy education.* University of California Press.

Hobbs, R. (2020). *Mind over media: Propaganda education for a digital age*. WW Norton.

Hoechsmann, M., & Poyntz, S. R. (2012). *Media literacies: A critical introduction.* John Wiley & Sons.

Hong, J. C. (2019). [Photograph of a man with his arms behind his head next to a border patrol agent, with a child standing behind the man]. Buzzfeed News. https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/adolfoflores/mexican-immigrants-deported-without-asylum-request-credible

Huguet, A. Kavanagh, J., Baker G., & Blumenthal, M. (2019). *Exploring media literacy education as a tool for mitigating truth decay.* Rand Corporation. https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/research_reports/RR3000/RR3050/RAND_RR3050.pdf

IREX. (2020). *Learn to Discern (L2D)—Media Literacy Training*. International Research & Exchanges. https://www.irex.org/project/learn-discern-l2d-media-literacy-training

Kahne, J., Middaugh, E. & Allen, D. (2014). *Youth, new media, and the rise of participatory politics*. YPP Research Network. http://ypp.dmlcentral.net/sites/default/files/publications/YPP_WorkinPapers_Paper01.pdf

Kellner, D., & Share, J. (2007). Critical media literacy, democracy, and the reconstruction of education. In D. Macedo & S.R. Steinberg (Eds.), *Media literacy: A reader* (pp. 3-23). Peter Lang Publishing.

Kuttner, P. J. (2016). Hip-Hop Citizens: Arts-Based, Culturally Sustaining Civic Engagement Pedagogy. *Harvard Educational Review*, *86*(4), 527–555. https://doi.org/10.17763/1943-5045-86.4.527

Love, B. (2019). *We want to do more than survive: Abolitionist teaching and the pursuit of educational freedom*. Beacon Press.

Mason, L., Krutka, D. & Stoddard, J. (2018) Media literacy, democracy, and the challenge of fake news. *Journal of Media Literacy Education*, *10*(2), 1 -10. https://doi.org/10.23860/JMLE-2018-10-2-1

Masterman, L. (2003). *Teaching the media*. Routledge.

Melendez, A. (2020). *Quinton Desamours recently quit his job at Publix in Fort Myers, FL, after they told him he could not wear a mask that had "BLM" for Black Lives Matter written on it* [Photograph]. Tampa Bay Times. https://www.tampabay.com/news/2020/06/15/publix-forbids-employees-from-wearing-black-lives-matter-masks-at-work/

Middaugh, E. (2018). Civic media literacy in a transmedia world: Balancing personal experience, factual accuracy and emotional appeal as media consumers and circulators. *Journal of Media Literacy Education, 10*(2), 33-52.

Middaugh, E., Bowyer, B. & Kahne, J. (2017). U suk! Participatory media and youth experiences with political discourse. *Youth & Society, 49*(7), 902-922. https://doi.org/10.1177/0044118X16655246

Mihaildis, P. (2014). *Media literacy and the emerging citizen.* Peter Lang.

Minhaj, H (2020). *Hip Hop and streaming: Patriot Act with Hasan Minhaj.*Netflix. (n.d.)

Moore, J. (2019). *US Border Patrol agents speak with a mother and daughter from Ecuador next to the border fence after detaining them on Sept. 10 in Penitas, Texas* [Photograph]. Buzzfeed News. https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/hamedaleaziz/dna-collection-undocumented-immigrants-trump-proposal

News Literacy Project. (2020). *For educators*. News literacy project. https://newslit.org/educators/

Noble, S. (2018). *Algorithms of oppression: How search engines reinforce racism.* New York University Press.

Pek, S., & Wang, D. (2018). National Library Board's public education on information literacy: Teaching citizens to fight fake news. *Singapore Journal of Library & Information Management*, *47*.

Ruta, F. (2019). *Un enfant descend de l'« Ocean-Viking » dans le port de Pozzallo en Sicile (Italie), mercredi 30 octobre* [Photograph]. Le Monde. https://www.lemonde.fr/international/article/2019/10/30/une-centaine-de-migrants-sauves-par-l-ocean-viking_6017454_3210.html

Savali, K. (2015, June 2). Throw away the script: How media bias is killing Black America. *The Root*. https://www.theroot.com/throw-away-the-script-how-media-bias-is-killing-black-1790860024

Schmeichel, M., Garrett, J., Ranschaert, R., McAnulty, J., Thompson, S., Janis, S., Clark, C., Yagata, S., & Bivens, B. (2018). The complexity of learning to teach news media in social studies education. *Journal of Media Literacy Education, 10*(2), 86-103. https://doi.org/10.23860/JMLE-2018-10-2-5

Shohat, E. & Stam, R. (2014). *Unthinking Eurocentrism: Multiculturalism and the media.* (2nd edition). Routledge.

Sivek, S. (2018). Both facts and feelings: Emotion and news literacy. *Journal of Media Literacy Education, 10*(2), 123-138.

Snelling, J. (2020). *10 resources to boost student media literacy*. International Society for Technology in Education. https://www.iste.org/explore/10-resources-boost-student-media-literacy

Stoddard, J. (2014). The need for media education in democratic education. *Democracy & Education 22(1).* http://democracyeducationjournal.org/home/vol22/iss1/4

Thoman, E. (2003). Skills & strategies for media education. *Center for Media Literacy*. http://www.medialit.org/

Tuck, E. (2009). Suspending damage: A letter to communities. *Harvard Educational Review*, *79*(3), 409-427. https://doi.org/10.17763/haer.79.3.n0016675661t3n15

UNAOC. (2020). *Framework*. Media Information Literacy for Teachers. http://unesco.mil-for-teachers.unaoc.org/framework/

Vito, C. (2014). Who said hip-hop was dead? The politics of hip-hop culture in Immortal Technique's lyrics. *International Journal of Cultural Studies, 18*(4), 395-411. https://doi.org/10.1177/1367877914528529

Vogels, E., Perrin, A., Rainie, L. & Anderson, M. (2020, April 30). *53% of Americans say the internet has been essential during the COVID-19 outbreak.* Pew Research Center. https://www.pewresearch.org/internet/2020/04/30/53-of-americans-say-the-internet-has-been-essential-during-the-covid-19-outbreak/

Waterson, J. (2019, July 24). Young people in UK abandon TV news 'almost entirely'. *The Guardian.* https://www.theguardian.com/tv-and-radio/2019/jul/24/young-people-uk-abandon-tv-news-almost-entirely-ofcom

Watson, V. (2013). Censoring freedom: Community-based professional development and the politics of profanity. *Equity & Excellence in Education, 46*(3), 387-410. https://doi.org/10.1080/10665684.2013.808096

Westheimer, J. & Kahne, J. (2004). What kind of citizen? The politics of educating for democracy. *American Educational Research Journal, 41*(2), 237-269. https://www.jstor.org/stable/3699366

Yosso, T. (2005) Whose culture has capital? A critical race theory discussion of community cultural wealth. *Race Ethnicity and Education, 8*(1), 69-91. https://doi.org/10.1080/1361332052000341006

Yosso, T. (2002). Critical race media literacy: Challenging deficit discourse about Chicanas/os. *Journal of Popular Film and Television*, *30*(1), 52-62. https://doi.org/10.1080/01956050209605559

APPENDIX A
Woman and child talking to two border patrol agents

Note. From *US Border Patrol agents speak with a mother and daughter from Ecuador next to the border fence after detaining them on Sept. 10 in Penitas, Texas* [Photograph], by J. Moore, 2019, Buzzfeed News, https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/hamedaleaziz/dna-collection-undocumented-immigrants-trump-proposal.

APPENDIX B
Man and child walking with border patrol agent

Note. From *Man with his arms behind his head next to a border patrol agent, with a child standing behind the man* [Photograph], by J. C. Hong, 2019, Buzzfeed News, https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/adolfoflores/mexican-immigrants-deported-without-asylum-request-credible.

APPENDIX C
Child and adult descend from ship

Note. From *Un enfant descend de l'"Ocean-Viking" dans le port de Pozzallo en Sicile (Italie), mercredi 30 octobre* [Photograph], by F. Ruta, 2019, Le Monde, https://www.lemonde.fr/international/article/2019/10/30/une-centaine-de-migrants-sauves-par-l-ocean-viking_6017454_3210.html.

APPENDIX D
Medical worker testing for COVID-19 in China

Note. From *A medical worker collects a sample of a person to be tested for the Covid-19 coronavirus on a street in Mudanjiang, China's northeastern Heilongjiang province* [Photograph] by AFP, 2020, Hindustan Times, https://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/after-wuhan-china-conducts-mass-testing-in-the-city-of-mudanjiang/story-qcVbsu3mr7T7yczs4bPgtI.html.

APPENDIX E
Man holding a mask with "BLM" written on it

Note. From *Quinton Desamours recently quit his job at Publix in Fort Myers, FL, after they told him he could not wear a mask that had "BLM" for Black Lives Matter written on it* [Photograph] by A. Melendez, 2020, Tampa Bay Times https://www.tampabay.com/news/2020/06/15/publix-forbids-employees-from-wearing-black-lives-matter-masks-at-work/.