

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

### Marine Pollution Bulletin



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/marpolbul

# High plasticity of nitrogen fixation and denitrification of common coral reef substrates in response to nitrate availability



Yusuf C. El-Khaled<sup>a,\*</sup>, Rassil Nafeh<sup>a</sup>, Florian Roth<sup>b,c,d</sup>, Nils Rädecker<sup>b,e,f</sup>, Denis B. Karcher<sup>a,g</sup>, Burton H. Jones<sup>b</sup>, Christian R. Voolstra<sup>b,e</sup>, Christian Wild<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Marine Ecology Department, Faculty of Biology and Chemistry, University of Bremen, 28359 Bremen, Germany

<sup>b</sup> Red Sea Research Center, King Abdullah University of Science and Technology (KAUST), 23995 Thuwal, Saudi Arabia

<sup>c</sup> Baltic Sea Centre, Stockholm University, 10691 Stockholm, Sweden

<sup>d</sup> Faculty of Biological and Environmental Sciences, Tvärminne Zoological Station, University of Helsinki, 00014 Helsinki, Finland

<sup>e</sup> Department of Biology, University of Konstanz, 78457 Konstanz, Germany

<sup>f</sup> Laboratory for Biological Geochemistry, School of Architecture, Civil and Environmental Engineering, École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne (EPFL), CH-1015

Lausanne, Switzerland

g Australian National Centre for the Public Awareness of Science, Australian National University, ACT 2601 Canberra, Australia

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Coral reefs Nutrient pollution Eutrophication Nitrogen cycling Turf algae Coral rubble

#### ABSTRACT

Nitrogen cycling in coral reefs may be affected by nutrient availability, but knowledge about concentrationdependent thresholds that modulate dinitrogen fixation and denitrification is missing. We determined the effects of different nitrate concentrations (ambient, 1, 5, 10  $\mu$ M nitrate addition) on both processes under two light scenarios (i.e., light and dark) using a combined acetylene assay for two common benthic reef substrates, i.e., turf algae and coral rubble. For both substrates, dinitrogen fixation rates peaked at 5  $\mu$ M nitrate addition in light, whereas denitrification was highest at 10  $\mu$ M nitrate addition in the dark. At 10  $\mu$ m nitrate addition in the dark, a near-complete collapse of dinitrogen fixation concurrent with a 76-fold increase in denitrification observed for coral rubble, suggesting potential threshold responses linked to the nutritional state of the community. We conclude that dynamic nitrogen cycling activity may help stabilise nitrogen availability in microbial communities associated with coral reef substrates.

#### 1. Introduction

In the Anthropocene, almost all marine ecosystems worldwide have experienced a range of threats that are relatable to human activities (Halpern et al., 2007), and those anthropogenic impacts are increasing (Halpern et al., 2015). Consequences of anthropogenic stressors are well-documented, ranging from ecosystem to individual and cellular levels. Eutrophication, as a direct consequence of increasing coastal populations (Burke et al., 2011), is among the most impactful local stressors. This is particularly true for ecosystems adapted to oligotrophic, i.e., nutrient-poor environmental conditions, such as tropical coral reefs, where nitrogen (N) is a key factor limiting primary production (Webb et al., 1975; Vitousek and Howarth, 1991; Lesser et al., 2007).

The acquisition, retention and disposal of N are of particular importance in coral reefs, which are partly moderated by microbial N cycling (Rädecker et al., 2015). More specifically, the interplay between

two counteracting N cycling pathways, i.e., dinitrogen (N<sub>2</sub>) fixation and denitrification contribute to maintaining a stable N availability, and ultimately, ecosystem functioning. N2 fixation is the conversion of atmospheric N<sub>2</sub> into bioavailable ammonium by prokaryotic microbes (diazotrophs) serving as a potential alternative nutrient source in times of N scarcity that fluctuates seasonally and in response to varying environmental conditions (Cardini et al., 2016a). In contrast, the microbially performed conversion of nitrate to atmospheric N2, referred to as denitrification, effectively removes excess N from the reef system. The relief of N could be vital to coral reef functioning during excess N availability, particularly under eutrophic conditions (Rädecker et al., 2015). For example, the main framework builders, scleractinian corals, rely on low N levels, as elevated N concentrations can destabilise the host-symbiont symbiosis (Wiedenmann et al., 2012; Morris et al., 2019), which in combination with limited phosphate availability results in an increased coral bleaching susceptibility (Wiedenmann et al., 2012).

\* Corresponding author. E-mail address: yek2012@uni-bremen.de (Y.C. El-Khaled).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2021.112430

Received 16 March 2021; Received in revised form 19 April 2021; Accepted 21 April 2021 Available online 14 May 2021 0025-326X/© 2021 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-ad/4.0/).

Eutrophication divergently affects N fluxes in coral reef environments at the community (Koop et al., 2001, Roth et al., 2021) and organism level (El-Khaled et al., 2020a; Karcher et al., 2020). For example, Koop et al. (2001) reported consistently lower N2 fixation activities and concurrent higher denitrification rates in reef patches under elevated nutrient availability (up to 20 µM N), Roth et al. (2021) reported a shift in small, distinct coral reef communities from a sink to a source of N due to nutrient pollution. A recent study, further] demonstrated that moderately (1-2 µM N) elevated nutrient concentrations may stimulate both N2 fixation and denitrification in turf algae, reef sediments and hard corals (El-Khaled et al., 2020a), suggesting ambivalent responses of N fluxes to nutrient pollution. Consequentially, certain nutrient concentration thresholds that regulate the suppression or stimulation of both N cycling pathways might exist but have not been determined in coral reef environments yet. Additionally, all aforementioned studies have performed their experimental eutrophication experiments on a relatively large time-scale ranging from months (El-Khaled et al., 2020a, Roth et al., 2021) to years (Koop et al., 2001). Due to these timescales, these studies do not allow us to disentangle the indirect consequences of potential community shifts from the direct consequences of altered N availability on the N cycling pathways themselves. Studies investigating responses on a shorter time scale in coral reefs are, however, nonexistent. Rapid responses of both N cycling pathways to runoff events (and a subsequent increase in inorganic N) were previously observed in intertidal mudflats covered by microbial mats (Joye and Paerl, 1993). Hence, we hypothesised decreasing N2 fixation and increasing denitrification rates with increasing nitrate availability.

For this purpose, we investigated the plasticity of coral reefassociated N<sub>2</sub> fixation and denitrification in response to inorganic N availability of two coral reef substrates (i.e., heterogeneous algal assemblages and coral rubble) that commonly increase in their abundance when coral-algae phase shifts occur (Holmes et al., 2000; McManus and Polsenberg, 2004; Norström et al., 2009) and, thus, may have an impact on 'post phase shift' reef-wide N budgets (El-Khaled et al., accepted). The selection and investigation of both substrates will, thus, contribute to the understanding of rapid responses of contemporaneous N<sub>2</sub> fixation and denitrification to eutrophication of post phase shift coral reefs. We aimed i) to quantify the relative activity of N2 fixation and denitrification in the two coral reef substrates, ii) to assess the direct responses of both N fluxes quantified for both substrates to nutrient enrichment, and iii) to identify potential thresholds that mediate both N cycling pathways. For this purpose, we carried out acetylene-based short-term incubations, which allowed us to quantify the effect of four different nitrate concentrations on N2 fixation and denitrification simultaneously.

#### 2. Material and methods

#### 2.1. Study site, sampling and experimental design

The experiment was conducted at the laboratory facilities of the King Abdullah University of Science and Technology (KAUST), Saudi Arabia, in May 2018. Sampling of substrates took place at a semi-exposed area of the Abu Shosha reef in the Jeddah Region ( $22^{\circ}$  18' 15" N,  $39^{\circ}$  02' 56" E) on the west coast of Saudi Arabia in the central Red Sea. Turf algae and coral rubble as predominant coral reef substrates were chosen a) for their dominant spatial benthic distribution (26.2 to 47.5% and 3.3 to 12.1%, resp., benthic cover; Roth et al. (2018)), particularly when phase shifts occur (Roth et al., 2018), and b) their evidently active role as important N fixers and denitrifiers (Davey et al., 2008; Rix et al., 2015; El-Khaled et al., 2020b). 'Turf algae' were defined as dead coral substrates of approx. 10 cm length that were overgrown (1-2 cm in height) with heterogeneous assemblages of different filamentous algae and cyanobacteria (see Fig. S1). 'Coral rubble' was defined as dislodged parts of dead coral skeletons of approx. 5-10 cm length that were partly covered with crustose coralline algae and microbial biofilms (see Fig. S2; Rasser and Riegl, 2002). Both substrates were sampled for the present study to allow for comparisons between fragile filamentous algal assemblages and cyanobacterial structures and coral rubble fragments without turf algal cover. A total of 40 turf algae fragments and 32 coral rubble fragments were sampled from 5 m water depth using hammer and chisel. All samples were stored in recirculation aquaria equipped with ambient reef water on the research vessel. Aquaria were kept at ambient temperature and light levels. Experimental incubations (see below) started < 3 h after sampling.

#### 2.2. Nitrogen fluxes

Four different N concentrations were used for the present study: ambient concentration typical for the central Red Sea (0.1-0.3 µM nitrate) as measured previously (Roth et al., 2018), 1 and 5 µM nitrate addition covering ranges of natural (Cardini et al., 2016a) as well as anthropogenic (Loya et al., 2004) nutrient inputs to local waters and as previously utilised in nutrient-enrichment studies (Wiedenmann et al., 2013; El-Khaled et al., 2020a), and 10 µM nitrate addition being well above observed scenarios in the Red Sea. Nitrate enrichment consisted of previously prepared nitrate stock solution, prepared with MilliQ water and sodium nitrate ( $\geq$  99.0%, Sigma-Aldrich). Nitrate was added immediately prior to incubations (< 5 min). To determine N<sub>2</sub> fixation and denitrification rates, a combined blockage/reduction acetylene assay (COBRA) was performed as previously described in (El-Khaled et al., 2020b). Briefly, all COBRA incubations were conducted in 1 L gastight glass chambers, each filled with 800 mL of either ambient or nutrient-amended seawater. Acetylene gas was then added to both incubation water and remaining headspace at a concentration of 10%. Acetylene in the gastight chambers leads to the preferential reduction of acetylene to ethylene (C2H4), instead of N2 to ammonia by the key enzyme nitrogenase (Balderston et al., 1976). Further, acetylene blocks the nitrous oxide (N2O) activity in the denitrification pathway leading to an accumulation of N<sub>2</sub>O (Yoshinari and Knowles, 1976). Replicate samples were incubated and two additional chambers per respective nutrient concentration and light condition without specimens served as controls to correct for planktonic background activity (Fig. 1). All incubations lasted 12 h, with dark and light incubations being performed separately with differing specimens (Fig. 1). Light was set at a photon flux of  ${\sim}200~\mu M$  quanta  $m^{-2}~s^{-1},$  representing the daytime average photon flux of the studied reef and water depth at this time of the year. All incubation chambers were submerged in a temperature-controlled water bath at 27 °C, resembling the ambient water temperature measured at the reef in 5 m water depth during sampling. Incubation chambers were constantly stirred (500 rpm) to ensure sufficient exchange between the water body and headspace. Gas samples were taken at the start (t<sub>0</sub>), after 4 h (t<sub>4</sub>), and after 12 h (t<sub>12</sub>, i.e., at the end of the incubation), to consider potential initial lag phases (El-Khaled et al., 2020b) and to account for incomplete inhibition of the denitrification pathway (Yu et al., 2010; El-Khaled et al., 2020b). Both target gases (i.e., C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O) were quantified using gas chromatography (Agilent 7890B GC system, Agilent Technologies) and helium pulsed discharge detection with an HP-Plot/Q 19091P-QO4 column (30 m length, l. D. 0.320 mm, film 20.0 µM; Agilent J&W GC Columns, Agilent Technologies). The lower detection limit for both target gases was 0.3 ppm. Gas concentrations were normalised to incubation time and surface area. The latter was calculated using cloud-based 3D models (Lavy et al., 2015; Gutierrez-Heredia et al., 2016) for all specimens (Autodesk Remake v19.1.1.2). We refrained from converting  $C_2H_4$  into actual  $N_2$ fixation rates as we acknowledge the ongoing discussion regarding an appropriate conversion factor (Hardy et al., 1968; Wilson et al., 2012). We used sampling point t4 and t12 as a basis for N2 fixation rate calculation, therefore omitting an initial lag phase; and to and t4 for denitrification to avoid an underestimation due to a potential incomplete inhibition of the denitrification pathway (see El-Khaled et al. (2020b) and references therein).



Fig. 1. Replication of turf algae (green), coral rubble (orange) and control (blue) incubations in various nitrate treatments and light and dark (grey) conditions for N<sub>2</sub> fixation and denitrification quantification. (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the web version of this article.)

#### 2.3. Statistical analysis

Data were analysed using PRIMER-E version 6 software (Clarke and Gorley, 2006) with the PERMANOVA+ add-on (Anderson, 2001). Since the assumptions for the parametric analyses were not met, data were analysed using a non-parametric permutational analysis of variance (PERMANOVA). Analyses were based on Bray-Curtis similarities of measured physiological parameters (square-root transformed data). To test for differences between N fluxes and light conditions between the substrates under various nutrient treatments, 3-factorial PERMANOVAs (factor: N flux, light condition, nutrient treatment) with type III (partial) sums of squares and unrestricted permutation of raw data (999 permutations) with Monte Carlo tests were used. Subsequent pairwise tests were performed when significant differences occurred ( $p \le 0.05$ ).

#### 3. Results

#### 3.1. $N_2$ fixation

Both substrates showed detectable rates of N<sub>2</sub> fixation under all scenarios (Fig. 2, Table S1). The detected N<sub>2</sub> fixation throughout all treatments ranged from  $0.04 \pm 0.00$  nmol C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> cm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> (coral rubble dark 10 µM) to  $5.08 \pm 0.88$  nmol C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>4</sub> cm<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> (turf light 5 µM). The highest N<sub>2</sub> fixation rates for turf algae were observed in light conditions showing an optimum curve response peaking at 5 µM nitrate addition (Fig. 2A). A similar pattern was observed for coral rubble during light with an optimum being at 3 to 4 µM nitrate addition (Fig. 2A). During dark incubations, turf algae N<sub>2</sub> fixation rates were highest in 5 and 10 µM and did not decrease under the highest nitrate treatment. In contrast to this, for coral rubble in the dark, a significant decrease of N<sub>2</sub> fixation rates at 10 µM compared to all other nutrient treatments was observed.

#### 3.2. Denitrification

Both substrates also exhibited denitrification in all scenarios, except

for coral rubble during dark incubations under ambient conditions, when denitrification remained below the detection limit (Fig. 2B, Table S1). Overall, a trend of increasing denitrification with increasing nitrate addition was apparent. Under light conditions, this trend was less pronounced, and coral rubble and turf algae performed comparable denitrification rates. For both substrates, the peaks of denitrification rates were observed at 10 µM under dark conditions. The observed denitrification rate for coral rubble at 10 µM in the dark was significantly higher than all other denitrification rates quantified for turf algae or coral rubble. This significant increase in denitrification corresponds with the sharp decrease in N2 fixation for coral rubble in the dark (described above; Fig. 2, Table 1). A similar increase in denitrification activities at 10 µM compared to other nutrient treatments was observed for turf algae (Fig. 2B). The aforementioned peaks of denitrification for both turf algae and coral rubble in the dark were about four- to 800-fold higher, respectively, compared to all other quantified denitrification rates (Fig. 2, Table 1).

#### 4. Discussion

The interplay of  $N_2$  fixation and denitrification is key for moderating N availability to either supply N or relieve excess N depending on environmental conditions. We here demonstrate that the (in-)activity of N cycling pathways appears to be nitrate-dependent with substrate-specific thresholds stimulating or suppressing  $N_2$  fixation and denitrification in coral reef environments.

#### 4.1. Nitrogen fluxes of turf algae and coral rubble

Both substrates showed detectable levels of  $N_2$  fixation and denitrification simultaneously under all given scenarios except for the absence of detectable denitrification in coral rubble substrates in the dark with no additional nitrate (i.e., under ambient conditions). Potentially, rates for coral rubble that were below the detection limit can be explained as follows: Nitrification, the oxidation of ammonium to nitrite and nitrate,



Fig. 2. N<sub>2</sub> fixation (A) and denitrification (B) activities for turf algae (green) and coral rubble (earth coloured) measured under four different nutrient treatments (ambient, 1, 5, and 10 µM nitrate addition) in light and dark (grey) incubations. Means are shown  $\pm$  SE. Different letters on xaxis indicate significant differences between groups from the same substrate and light/dark condition. Black dots represent quantified N2 fixation/ denitrification rates. Note different scales for N<sub>2</sub> fixation and denitrification. b.d.l. = below detection limit. (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the web version of this article.)

functions as a recycling mechanism within the N cycle (Webb et al., 1975), with its final product serving as a substrate for denitrification. Nitrification is an aerobic pathway (O'Neil and Capone, 2008) that potentially redeems substrate limitation for the denitrification pathway during light incubations (Wiebe et al., 1975; Wafar et al., 1990). This hypothesis is supported through the quantification of denitrification rates for coral rubble during light incubations (Fig. 2B) and for incubations where nitrate was provided. In return, denitrification remained below the detection limit under ambient conditions and during dark incubations where nitrate is limited. Similarly, denitrification rates quantified for coral rubble in dark were consistently lower than under light conditions (except for 10 µM nitrate addition, see below). The denitrification rates of turf algae in all scenarios (Fig. 2B) indicate that these algal assemblages differ in their N cycling properties compared to coral rubble and may be able to persist higher levels of nitrate concentrations even at night. Potentially, another N-relieving mechanism, i.e., anaerobic ammonium oxidation (ANAMMOX) may remove bioavailable N from coral reefs. ANAMMOX can occur in coral reef sponges (Hoffmann et al., 2009), direct evidence for its reef-wide occurrence is, however, missing to date. In how far ANAMMOX is a) an active pathway, and b) potentially varying among coral reefassociated functional groups, hence, needs to be determined in future studies.

The N<sub>2</sub> fixation and denitrification rates in the present study are in

line with rates reported for the Red Sea using acetylene-based measuring techniques (Rix et al., 2015; Cardini et al., 2016a; El-Khaled et al., 2020a). N<sub>2</sub> fixation rates for turf algae and coral rubble quantified in the present study are higher than those of other coral reef organisms and substrates such as scleractinian corals (Cardini et al., 2016b; Tilstra et al., 2019), soft corals (Bednarz et al., 2015), or top-layers of coral reef-associated reef sediments (El-Khaled et al., 2020a). Comparatively high N<sub>2</sub> fixation rates associated with both substrates confirm their role as important N<sub>2</sub>-fixers on coral reefs (Cardini et al., 2016a). Turf algae, in particular, have been described as opportunists (Rosenberg and Ramus, 1984; Littler and Littler, 2013), showing a high N demand to build up biomass and to fuel their metabolism. Previous findings suggest that this high N demand can be satisfied, at least in part, by N<sub>2</sub> fixation (Yamamuro et al., 1995; Rix et al., 2015; Roth et al., 2020), which in return could explain the findings of the present study.

Both substrates showed more  $N_2$  fixation during light than during dark incubations (Fig. 2A). For turf algae, these findings are in line with previous studies (Williams and Carpenter, 1997; den Haan et al., 2014), but contradict those of Rix et al. (2015) who showed substantially higher night-time  $N_2$  fixation. Varying diel  $N_2$  fixation rates for turf algae with high rates depending on the presence of light hypothetically reflect the presence of rather oxygen-tolerant diazotroph communities. Potentially, heterocystous cyanobacteria dominated in turf algae fragments used for the present study. They prevalently perform  $N_2$  fixation despite the

#### Table 1

Results of pairwise permutational analysis of variance (PERMANOVA) for N<sub>2</sub> fixation (A, B) and denitrification (C, D) measured under four nutrient treatments (ambient, 1, 5, and 10  $\mu$ M nitrate addition) under light and dark (grey) incubations. Significant values in bold. Top: t-values; bottom: *p*-values.

$\mathbf{A}$ - N <sub>2</sub> Fixation		Turf Algae			
		Ambient	$+1 \ \mu M$	+5 μM	+10 μM
	Ambient		0.0495	4.437	2.011
Turf Algae			0.639	0.001	0.061
	+1 μM	1.636		3.944	2.126
		0.144		0.006	0.053
	+5 μM	3.380	1.600		1.065
		0.011	0.139		0.324
	+10 µM	1.336	0.277	1.874	
		0.204	0.826	0.102	

<b>B</b> - N <sub>2</sub> Fixation		Coral Rubble			
		Ambient	+1 μM	+5 μM	+10 µM
Coral Rubble	Ambient		1.349	0.8377	6.155
			0.233	0.411	0.001
	1 μM	1.285		0.567	7.603
		0.253		0.583	0.001
	5 μΜ	1.993	0.605		7.098
		0.075	0.556		0.002
	10 µM	1.691	0.209	0.568	
		0.109	0.902	0.592	

<b>C</b> - Denitrification		Turf Algae			
		Ambient	+1 μM	+5 μM	+10 μM
	Ambient		0.004	0.685	2.345
Turf Algae			0.971	0.519	0.032
	+1 μM	0.826		0.757	2.451
		0.406		0.468	0.043
	+5 μM	0.236	1.059		1.612
		0.801	0.321		0.154
	+10 μM	2.448	6.89	1.948	
		0.049	0.001	0.098	

<b>D</b> - Denitrification		Coral Rubble			
		Ambient	+1 μM	+5 μM	+10 μM
Coral Rubble	Ambient		1.000	1.000	5.7759
			0.358	0.356	0.002
	+1 μM	2.302		0.885	5.767
		0.069		0.432	0.001
	+5 μM	1.571	0.298		5.672
	·	0.164	0.783		0.002
	+10 μM	4.160	0.570	0.794	
		0.006	0.604	0.471	

presence of oxygen generated via photosynthesis (Bergman et al., 1997; Staal et al., 2002), even though being capable of fixing N in the dark under oxygen-depleted conditions (Millineaux et al., 1981; Staal et al., 2002). Heterogeneous cyanobacterial community compositions between replicates could also explain the relatively large variation in the present data (Fig. 2A). We, hence, recommend simultaneous molecular analyses in future studies to define community compositions (Bauer et al., 2008), and to ultimately identify the role of (non-)heterocystous cyanobacteria in the respective specimens that potentially drive  $N_2$  fixation. For coral rubble, we hypothesise the abundance of a diazotroph community consisting of heterotrophic bacteria equally adapted to both dark and light conditions (Staal et al., 2002), as  $N_2$  fixation was observed during light and dark (Fig. 2A).

## 4.2. Rapid $N_2$ fixation and denitrification responses to nutrient enrichment

Both substrates followed a pattern of increasing N<sub>2</sub> fixation activities with increasing nutrient concentrations up to a treatment of 5  $\mu$ M nitrate, despite lacking statistical significance. Interestingly, N<sub>2</sub> fixation rates for both substrates tend to diminish with higher nitrate treatments (i.e., 10  $\mu$ M), except for turf algae during dark incubations, where rates quantified in 5 and 10  $\mu$ M nitrate treatments remained higher than those at ambient and 1  $\mu$ M nitrate treatments. Congruent to decreasing N<sub>2</sub> fixation rates under 10  $\mu$ M nitrate treatments, we observed significant increases in denitrification rates for both substrates in both dark and light incubations compared to ambient, and to a certain extend to 1 or 5  $\mu$ M nitrate amended incubations (Fig. 2B).

Interestingly, turf algae continued to fix N despite the presence of nitrate well above ambient concentrations, even though acquiring N via N<sub>2</sub> fixation is an energetically costly pathway (Holl and Montoya, 2005; Knapp, 2012). Turf algae are also capable of rapidly taking up environmentally available N (den Haan et al., 2016; Karcher et al., 2020), which we assume to be the case in the present study as well. Further, turf algal morphology (high surface area to volume ratio) is a key parameter shaping the uptake of environmentally offered nutrients (Littler and Littler, 1980; Rosenberg and Ramus, 1984). We, thus, conclude that the large N demand of turf algae may effectively limit N availability within the substrate even under high levels of seawater nitrate concentrations. Hence, efficient N uptake (via assimilation) and N2 fixation contribute to the algae's capacity to proliferate rapidly, particularly in continuously eutrophied environments (Kuffner and Paul, 2001; Smith et al., 2005). Following this pattern, N-stimulated growth of the algae is likely closely linked to an enhanced growth of the overall microbial community (Kopp et al., 2013). Thereby, the abundance of diazotrophs (Muscatine et al., 1989) and potentially denitrifiers may increase, which in return could explain the increased N<sub>2</sub> fixation and denitrification rates under 5 and 10 µM nitrate concentrations during incubations.

Coral rubble-associated microbes continued to fix N in all scenarios except for dark incubations at 10  $\mu$ M nitrate enriched conditions. Coral rubble can be colonised by epilithic and endolithic microbial communities (Tribollet et al., 2006) enabling the substrate 'holobiont' to fix N (Charpy et al., 2010). We conclude that microbial communities associated with coral rubble utilise the available N to stimulate N<sub>2</sub> fixation and to promote growth. The latter, even though not quantified in the present study, could lead to an increased abundance of diazotrophs, thus, explaining increased N<sub>2</sub> fixation rates.

Additionally, Mueller et al. (2016) demonstrated that both light and nutrient availability together determine dissolved organic carbon (DOC) release by turf algae. Most diazotrophs and denitrifiers rely on DOC as part of the organic carbon pool as their main energy source (Her and Huang, 1995; Lema et al., 2012; Chen et al., 2018). Increased N<sub>2</sub> fixation and denitrification rates with increasing nitrate availability could, thus, be explained by an increased DOC availability, that could even be translocated to neighbouring functional groups (Haas et al., 2011).

#### 4.3. Threshold identification

Interestingly, the short time scale, which was intentionally set for the present experimental design, suggests a rapid, definite switch from active N<sub>2</sub> fixation to stimulation of denitrification to relieve N depending on nitrate addition. In the present study, we were able to observe the stimulation or suppression of N<sub>2</sub> fixation and denitrification (Fig. 2). This ambiguity has been recognised in coral reef environments in previous studies. For example, reef patch-wide denitrification increased with a congruent decrease of N<sub>2</sub> fixation under high (i.e., 10–30  $\mu$ M) N addition (Koop et al., 2001), Roth et al. (2020) modelled decreasing N<sub>2</sub> fixation with increasing nitrate availability for benthic pioneer communities, whereas a nitrate-depending stimulation (10–500  $\mu$ M) of denitrification was observed for coral reef sediments (Capone et al.,

1992). Opposite effects on N<sub>2</sub> fixation and denitrification, however, were reported for turf algae, reef sediments and a hard coral under moderate eutrophication (El-Khaled et al., 2020a). We conclude that divergent effects of nutrient enrichment on both N2 fixation and denitrification observed here and in previous studies (Capone et al., 1992; Joye and Paerl, 1993; Koop et al., 2001; El-Khaled et al., 2020a) could be related to the amount of nutrients added, either stimulating or suppressing N fluxes depending on nutrient availability. In how far divergent effects can be observed in other substrates, with potentially different microbial communities or life histories, e.g., through the exposure to other environmental conditions, remains to be targeted in future studies. Furthermore, the role of P and other micronutrients (Ferrier-Pagès et al., 2016; Luo et al., 2019) and potential shift from N to P-limitation (Wiedenmann et al., 2013) needs to be considered, and should be targeted in future studies. Based on the data of the present study, we hypothesise an identification of a threshold for a common benthic coral reef substrate (i.e., coral rubble), at which N<sub>2</sub> fixation is largely inactive and denitrification is initiated. Our data suggest that thresholds are substrate-specific and that thresholds for N2 fixation and denitrification may (i.e., as identified for coral rubble) but do not have to be (i.e., as identified for turf algae) linked.

#### 4.4. Ecological implications

It is of paramount importance to understand the effects of anthropogenically-induced nutrient enrichment, such as sewage outfalls (McManus and Polsenberg, 2004), terrestrial run-offs (den Haan et al., 2016), or aquaculture (Loya et al., 2004), on nutrient cycles that contribute to the functioning of coral reef ecosystems.

We identified turf algae and coral rubble as important sources of de novo N under ambient and elevated nutrient concentrations (Fig. 2A). Algae are likely to increase in dominance in future coral reefs (Pandolfi et al., 2011; Hughes et al., 2017) due to their aforementioned opportunistic behaviour and their competitive advantage compared to classical reef framework builders (i.e., hard corals) under stressed environmental parameters. Shifts from coral to algae dominance have been recognised worldwide (Hughes, 1994; McManus and Polsenberg, 2004; Bruno et al., 2009; Norström et al., 2009), potentially resulting in an increase of bioavailable N as i) a direct consequence of increases in turf algae abundance (El-Khaled et al., accepted) or ii) due to the stimulation of N<sub>2</sub> fixation under moderate eutrophied conditions (El-Khaled et al., 2020a). In this context, a rapid response to short-term nutrient pollution by increasing N<sub>2</sub> fixation for turf algae might have several implications on a shorter time scale. The fast on-set and increase of N<sub>2</sub> fixation within minutes to hours after nitrate addition, for example in turf algae, might add to explaining their competitive advantages. Given turf algae's opportunistic use of N for growth, this might provide an additional 'head start' under eutrophication; however more functional groups would need to be analysed to investigate the first hours of competition under pulse N availability. Besides that, a rapid accumulation of biomass based on the availability of N may eventually result in an energy transfer to higher trophic levels (Roth et al., 2020) by either herbivorous grazing (Fong and Paul, 2011) or a decay of biomass (Duarte and Cebrián, 1996). The latter potentially causes hypoxia (oxygen deficiency) or anoxia (no oxygen) through the proliferation of oxygen-consuming microbes (Hughes et al., 2020), which eventually have adverse effects for the health of coral reefs (Dubinsky and Stambler, 1996).

Turf algae and coral rubble have been identified as major N fixers before (Cardini et al., 2016a), their role as denitrifiers under ambient conditions is comparatively small (El-Khaled et al., accepted). In that study, turf algae and coral rubble were among the least active denitrifiers under ambient conditions compared to hard and soft corals, reef sediments, and biogenic rock. However, particularly under eutrophied scenarios, coral rubble, for which we were able to identify a threshold that suppresses  $N_2$  fixation and stimulates denitrification (Fig. 2), seems to play a crucial role in rapidly relieving substrates from N. Hence, the fast response to short-term eutrophication, e.g., from nutrient pulses (den Haan et al., 2016) might be key for alleviating excess N via denitrification. In how far previously identified key denitrifiers such as corals (shown to perform highest denitrification rates among the aforementioned functional groups, El-Khaled et al., accepted) or reef sediments (Capone et al., 1992) respond to short-term eutrophication remains to be determined.

Given the observed threshold under high nitrate addition, it needs to be considered that such high N availability (i.e. 10  $\mu$ M nitrate) is far above the environmental conditions, even under anthropogenic impact. Under lower, more realistic N availability, N<sub>2</sub> fixation appeared to increase more strongly and steadily with increasing nitrate additions than denitrification. In return, this means that the 'threshold' for a drastic N relief via denitrification (vs. N<sub>2</sub> fixation) is likely not 'hit' soon enough to counter eutrophication. Therefore, the role of microbial nutrient cycling in enhancing the effects of moderate, even short-term, eutrophication should be considered in coastal development and planning (e.g., runoff events, drainage, sewage outfalls, etc.).

Our study, concludes that short-term eutrophication has strong implications on the reef N-cycling, that substrate specific thresholds ( $N_2$  fixation vs. denitrification) seem to exist, that those substrate- and context-specific thresholds may help explaining varying outcomes of eutrophication studies, and that the effects of moderate eutrophication may physiologically alter the overall N budget in the reef.

#### CRediT authorship contribution statement

YEK, FR, CRV and CW conceptualised and designed research. YEK, FR, NR and DBK performed research. YEK, RN, and DBK analysed data. BHJ, CRV and CW contributed to research materials, logistics and interpreting data. YEK wrote original draft of the manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

#### Funding

This work was supported by grant Wi 2677/9-1 from the German Research Foundation (DFG) to CW and by KAUST baseline funding to CRV and BHJ.

#### Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

#### Acknowledgements

We are grateful to Najeh Kharbatia from CORE Labs of the King Abdullah University of Science and Technology (KAUST) for his technical support with the GC.

#### Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2021.112430.

#### References

- Anderson, M.J., 2001. A new method for non-parametric multivariate analysis of variance. Austral. Ecol. 26, 32–46.
- Balderston, W.L., Sherr, B., Payne, W.J., 1976. Blockage by acetylene of nitrous-oxide reduction in Pseudomonas-Perfectomarinus. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 31, 504–508.
- Bauer, K., Díez, B., Lugomela, C., Seppälä, S., Borg, A.J., Bergman, B., 2008. Variability in benthic diazotrophy and cyanobacterial diversity in a tropical intertidal lagoon. FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. 63, 205–221.
- Bednarz, V.N., Cardini, U., Van Hoytema, N., Al-Rshaidat, M.M.D., Wild, C., 2015. Seasonal variation in dinitrogen fixation and oxygen fluxes associated with two dominant zooxanthellate soft corals from the northern Red Sea. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 519, 141–152.

- Bergman, B., Gallon, J.R., Rai, A.N., Stal, L.J., 1997. N2 fixation by non-heterocystus cyanobacteria. FEMS Microbiol. Rev. 19, 139–185.
- Bruno, J.F., Sweatman, H., Precht, W.F., Selig, E.R., Schutte, V.G.W., 2009. Assessing evidence of phase shifts from coral to macroalgal dominance on coral reefs. Ecology 90, 1478–1484.
- Burke, L., Reytar, K., Spaulding, M., Perry, A., 2011. Reefs at Risk. World Resources Institute.
- Capone, D.G., Dunham, S.E., Horrigan, S.G., Duguay, L.E., 1992. Microbial nitrogen transformations in unconsolidated coral reef sediments. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 80, 75–88.
- Cardini, U., Bednarz, V.N., van Hoytema, N., Rovere, A., Naumann, M.S., Al-Rshaidat, M. M.D., Wild, C., 2016a. Budget of primary production and dinitrogen fixation in a highly seasonal Red Sea coral reef. Ecosystems 19, 771–785.
- Cardini, U., van Hoytema, N., Bednarz, V.N., Rix, L., Foster, R.A., Al-Rshaidat, M.M.D., Wild, C., 2016b. Microbial dinitrogen fixation in coral holobionts exposed to thermal stress and bleaching. Environ. Microbiol. 18, 2620–2633.
- Charpy, L., Palinska, K.A., Suzuki, Y., Abed, R.M.M., Golubic, S., 2010. Dinitrogen-fixing cyanobacteria in microbial mats of two shallow coral reef ecosystems. Microb. Ecol. 59, 174–186.
- Chen, S., Wang, F., Zhang, Y., Qin, S., Wei, S., Wang, S., Hu, C., Liu, B., 2018. Organic carbon availability limiting microbial denitrification in the deep vadose zone. Environ. Microbiol. 20, 980–992.

Clarke, K.R., Gorley, R.N., 2006. PRIMER v6: Use manual/Tutorial. Plymouth, England.

Davey, M., Holmes, G., Johnstone, R., 2008. High rates of nitrogen fixation (acetylene reduction) on coral skeletons following bleaching mortality. Coral Reefs 27, 227–236.

- den Haan, J., Visser, P.M., Ganase, A.E., Gooren, E.E., Stal, L.J., van Duyl, F.C., Vermeij, M.J.A., Huisman, J., 2014. Nitrogen fixation rates in algal turf communities of a degraded versus less degraded coral reef. Coral Reefs 33, 1003–1015.
- den Haan, J., Huisman, J., Brocke, H.J., Goehlich, H., Latijnhouwers, K.R.W., Van Heeringen, S., Honcoop, S.A.S., Bleyenberg, T.E., Schouten, S., Cerli, C., Hoitinga, L., Vermeij, M.J.A., Visser, P.M., 2016. Nitrogen and phosphorus uptake rates of different species from a coral reef community after a nutrient pulse. Sci. Rep. 6, 28821.
- Duarte, C.M., Cebrián, J., 1996. The fate of marine autotrophic production. Limnol. Oceanogr. 41, 1758–1766.
- Dubinsky, Z.V.Y., Stambler, N., 1996. Marine pollution and coral reefs. Glob. Chang. Biol. 2, 511–526.
- El-Khaled, et al.. Marine Pollution Bulletin Article. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-02 1-90204-8.
- El-Khaled, Y., Roth, F., Tilstra, A., Rädecker, N., Karcher, D., Kürten, B., Jones, B., Voolstra, C., Wild, C., 2020a. In situ eutrophication stimulates dinitrogen fixation, denitrification, and productivity in Red Sea coral reefs. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 645, 55–66.
- El-Khaled, Y.C., Roth, F., Rädecker, N., Kharbatia, N., Jones, B.H., Voolstra, C.R., Wild, C., 2020b. Simultaneous measurements of dinitrogen fixation and denitrification associated with coral reef substrates : advantages and limitations of a combined acetylene assay. Front. Mar. Sci. 7, 411.
- Ferrier-Pagès, C., Godinot, C., D'Angelo, C., Wiedenmann, J., Grover, R., 2016. Phosphorus metabolism of reef organisms with algal symbionts. Ecol. Monogr. 86, 262–277.
- Fong, P., Paul, V.J., 2011. Coral reef algae. In: Dubinsky, Z., Stambler, N. (Eds.), Coral Reefs: An Ecosystem in Transition. Springer, Dordrecht, pp. 241–272.
- Gutierrez-Heredia, L., Benzoni, F., Murphy, E., Reynaud, E.G., 2016. End to end digitisation and analysis of three-dimensional coral models, from communities to corallites. PLoS One 11, e0149641.
- Haas, A.F., Nelson, C.E., Kelly, L.W., Carlson, C.A., Rohwer, F., James, J., Wyatt, A., Smith, J.E., 2011. Effects of coral reef benthic primary producers on dissolved organic carbon and microbial activity. PLoS One 6, e27973.
- Halpern, B.S., Selkoe, K.A., Micheli, F., Kappel, C.V., 2007. Evaluating and ranking the vulnerability of global marine ecosystems to anthropogenic threats. Conserv. Biol. 21, 1301–1315.
- Halpern, B.S., Frazier, M., Potapenko, J., Casey, K.S., Koenig, K., Longo, C., Lowndes, J. S., Rockwood, R.C., Selig, E.R., Selkoe, K.A., Walbridge, S., 2015. Spatial and temporal changes in cumulative human impacts on the world's ocean. Nat. Commun. 6, 1–7.
- Hardy, R.W.F., Holsten, R.D., Jackson, E.K., Burns, R.C., 1968. The acetylene ethylene assay for  $N_2$  fixation: laboratory and field evaluation. Plant Physiol. 43, 1185–1207.
- Her, J.-J., Huang, J.-S., 1995. Influences of carbon source and C/N ratio on nitrate/nitrite denitrification and carbon breakthrough. Bioresour. Technol. 54, 45–51.
- Hoffmann, F., Radax, R., Woebken, D., Holtappels, M., Lavik, G., Rapp, H.T., Schläppy, M.L., Schleper, C., Kuypers, M.M.M., 2009. Complex nitrogen cycling in the sponge Geodia barretti. Environ. Microbiol. 11, 2228–2243.
- Holl, C.M., Montoya, J.P., 2005. Interactions between nitrate uptake and nitrogen fixation in continuous cultures of the marine diazotroph Trichodesmium (cyanobacteria). J. Phycol. 41, 1178–1183.
- Holmes, K.E., Edinger, E.N., Hariyadi, Limmon G.V., Risk, M.J., 2000. Bioerosion of live massive corals and branching coral rubble on Indonesian coral reefs. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 40, 606–617.
- Hughes, T.P., 1994. Catastrophes, phase shifts, and large-scale degradation of a Caribbean coral reef. Science 265, 1547–1551.
- Hughes, T.P., Barnes, M.L., Bellwood, D.R., Cinner, J.E., Cumming, G.S., Jackson, J.B.C., Kleypas, J., Van De Leemput, I.A., Lough, J.M., Morrison, T.H., Palumbi, S.R., Van Nes, E.H., Scheffer, M., 2017. Coral reefs in the Anthropocene. Nature 546, 82–90.

#### Y.C. El-Khaled et al.

- Joye, S.B., Paerl, H.W., 1993. Contemporaneous nitrogen fixation and denitrification in intertidal microbial mats: rapid response to runoff events. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 94, 267–274.
- Karcher, D.B., Roth, F., Carvalho, S., El-Khaled, Y.C., Tilstra, A., Kürten, B., Struck, U., Jones, B.H., Wild, C., 2020. Nitrogen eutrophication particularly promotes turf algae in coral reefs of the central Red Sea. PeerJ 8, e8737.
- Knapp, A.N., 2012. The sensitivity of marine N2 fixation to dissolved inorganic nitrogen. Front. Microbiol. 3, 374.
- Koop, K., Booth, D., Broadbent, A., Brodie, J., Bucher, D., Capone, D., Coll, J., Dennison, W., Erdmann, M., Harrison, P., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., Hutchings, P., Jones, G.B., Larkum, A.W.D., O'Neil, J., Steven, A., Tentori, E., Ward, S., Williamson, J., Yellowlees, D., 2001. ENCORE: the effect of nutrient enrichment on coral reefs. Synthesis of results and conclusions. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 42, 91–120.
- Kopp, C., Pernice, M., Domart-Coulon, I., Djediat, C., Spangenberg, J.E., Alexander, D.T. L., Hignette, M., Meziane, T., 2013. Highly dynamic cellular-level response of
- symbiotic coral to a sudden increase in evironmental nitrogen. MBio 4 (e00052-13). Kuffner, I.B., Paul, V.J., 2001. Effects of nitrate, phosphate and iron on the growth of macroalgae and benthic cyanobacteria from Cocos Lagoon, Guam. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 222, 63–72.
- Lavy, A., Eyal, G., Neal, B., Keren, R., Loya, Y., Ilan, M., 2015. A quick, easy and nonintrusive method for underwater volume and surface area evaluation of benthic organisms by 3D computer modelling. Methods Ecol. Evol. 6, 521–531.
- Lema, K.A., Willis, B.L., Bourneb, D.G., 2012. Corals form characteristic associations with symbiotic nitrogen-fixing bacteria. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 78, 3136–3144.
- Lesser, M.P., Falcón, L.I., Rodríguez-Román, A., Enríquez, S., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., Iglesias-Prieto, R., 2007. Nitrogen fixation by symbiotic cyanobacteria provides a source of nitrogen for the scleractinian coral Montastraea cavernosa. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 346, 143–152.
- Littler, M.M., Littler, D.S., 1980. The evolution of Thallus form and survival strategies in benthic marine macroalgae. Am. Nat. 116, 25–44.
- Littler, M., Littler, D., 2013. The nature of turf and boring algae and their interactions on reefs. Smithson. Contrib. Mar. Sci. 213–217.
- Loya, Y., Lubinevsky, H., Rosenfeld, M., Kramarsky-Winter, E., 2004. Nutrient enrichment caused by in situ fish farms at Eilat, Red Sea is detrimental to coral reproduction. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 49, 344–353.
- Luo, Y.W., Shi, D., Kranz, S.A., Hopkinson, B.M., Hong, H., Shen, R., Zhang, F., 2019. Reduced nitrogenase efficiency dominates response of the globally important nitrogen fixer Trichodesmium to ocean acidification. Nat. Commun. 10, 1521.
- McManus, J.W., Polsenberg, J.F., 2004. Coral-algal phase shifts on coral reefs: ecological and environmental aspects. Prog. Oceanogr. 60, 263–279.
- Millineaux, P.M., Gallon, J.R., Chaplin, A.E., 1981. Acetylene reduction (nitrogen fixation) by cyanobacteria grown under alternating light-dark cycles. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. 10, 245–247.
- Morris, L.A., Voolstra, C.R., Quigley, K.M., Bourne, D.G., Bay, L.K., 2019. Nutrient availability and metabolism affect the stability of coral–Symbiodiniaceae symbioses. Trends Microbiol. 1–12 xx.
- Mueller, B., Den Haan, J., Visser, P.M., Vermeij, M.J.A., Van Duyl, F.C., 2016. Effect of light and nutrient availability on the release of dissolved organic carbon (DOC) by Caribbean turf algae. Sci. Rep. 6, 1–9.
- Muscatine, L., Falkowski, P.G., Dubinsky, Z., Cook, P.A., Mccloskey, L.R., 1989. The effect of external nutrient resources on the population dynamics of Zooxanthellae in a reef coral. Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. 236, 311–324.
- Norström, A.V., Nyström, M., Lokrantz, J., Folke, C., 2009. Alternative states on coral reefs: beyond coral-macroalgal phase shifts. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 376, 293–306.

O'Neil, J.M., Capone, D.G., 2008. Nitrogen cycling in coral reef environments. In: Nitrogen in the Marine Environment, pp. 949–989.

Pandolfi, J.M., Connolly, S.R., Marshall, D.J., Cohen, A.L., 2011. Projecting coral reef futures under global warming and ocean acidification. Science 333, 418–422.

- Rädecker, N., Pogoreutz, C., Voolstra, C.R., Wiedenmann, J., Wild, C., 2015. Nitrogen cycling in corals: the key to understanding holobiont functioning? Trends Microbiol. 23, 490–497.
- Rasser, M.W., Riegl, B., 2002. Holocene coral reef rubble and its binding agents. Coral Reefs 21, 57–72.
- Rix, L., Bednarz, V.N., Cardini, U., Van Hoytema, N., Al-Horani, F.A., Wild, C.,
- Naumann, M.S., 2015. Seasonality in dinitrogen fixation and primary productivity by coral reef framework substrates from the northern Red Sea. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 533, 79–92.
- Rosenberg, G., Ramus, J., 1984. Uptake of inorganic nitrogen and seaweed surface area: volume ratios. Aquat. Bot. 19, 65–72.
- Roth, F., Saalmann, F., Thomson, T., Coker, D.J., Villalobos, R., Jones, B.H., Wild, C., Carvalho, S., 2018. Coral reef degradation affects the potential for reef recovery after disturbance. Mar. Environ. Res. 142, 48–58.
- Roth, F., Karcher, D.B., R\u00e4decker, N., Hohn, S., Carvalho, S., Thomson, T., Saalmann, F., Voolstra, C.R., K\u00fcrten, B., Struck, U., Jones, B.H., Wild, C., 2020. High rates of carbon and dinitrogen fixation suggest a critical role of benthic pioneer communities in the energy and nutrient dynamics of coral reefs. Funct. Ecol. 34 (9), 1991–2004.
- Roth, F., El-Khaled, Y.C., Karcher, D.B., R\u00e4decker, N., Carvalho, S., Duarte, C.M., Silva, L., 2021. Nutrient pollution enhances productivity and framework dissolution in algae- but not in coral-dominated reef communities. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 168, 112444.
- Smith, J.E., Runcie, J.W., Smith, C.M., 2005. Characterization of a large-scale ephemeral bloom of the green alga *Cladophora sericea* on the coral reefs of West Maui, Hawai ' i. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 302, 77–91.
- Staal, M., Te Lintel, Hekkert S., Herman, P., Stal, L.J., 2002. Comparison of models describing light dependence of N2 fixation in heterocystous cyanobacteria. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 68, 4679–4683.
- Tilstra, A., El-Khaled, Y.C., Roth, F., Rädecker, N., Pogoreutz, C., Voolstra, C.R., Wild, C., 2019. Denitrification aligns with N2 fixation in Red Sea corals. Sci. Rep. 9, 19460.
- Tribollet, A., Langdon, C., Golubic, S., Atkinson, M., 2006. Endolithic microflora are major primary producers in dead carbonate substrates of Hawaiian coral reefs. J. Phycol. 42, 292–303.
- Vitousek, P.M., Howarth, R.W., 1991. Nitrogen limitation on land and in the sea: how can it occur? Biogeochemistry 13, 87–115.
- Wafar, M., Wafar, S., David, J.J., 1990. Nitrification in reef corals. Limnol. Oceanogr. 35, 725–730.
- Webb, K.L., DuPaul, W.D., Wiebe, W., Sottile, W., Johannes, R.E., 1975. Enewetak (Eniwetok) atoll: aspects of the nitrogen cycle on a coral reef. Limnol. Oceanogr. 20, 198–210.
- Wiebe, W.J., Johannes, R.E., Webb, K.L., 1975. Nitrogen fixation in a coral reef community. Science 188, 257–259.
- Wiedenmann, J., D'Angelo, C., Smith, E.G., Hunt, A.N., Legiret, F.E., Postle, A.D., Achterberg, E.P., 2012. Nutrient enrichment can increase the susceptibility of reef corals to bleaching. Nat. Clim. Chang. 3, 160–164.
  Wiedenmann, J., D'Angelo, C., Smith, E.G., Hunt, A.N., Legiret, F.E., Postle, A.D.,
- Wiedenmann, J., D'Angelo, C., Smith, E.G., Hunt, A.N., Legiret, F.E., Postle, A.D., Achterberg, E.P., 2013. Nutrient enrichment can increase the susceptibility of reef corals to bleaching. Nat. Clim. Chang. 3, 160–164.
- Williams, S.L., Carpenter, R.C., 1997. Grazing effects on nitrogen fixation in coral reef algal turfs. Mar. Biol. 130, 223–231.
- Wilson, S.T., Böttjer, D., Church, M.J., Karl, D.M., 2012. Comparative assessment of nitrogen fixation methodologies, conducted in the oligotrophic north pacific ocean. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 78, 6516–6523.
- Yamamuro, M., Kayanne, H., Minagawa, M., 1995. Carbon and nitrogen stable isotopes of primary producers in coral reef ecosystems, Limnol. Oceanogr. 40, 617–621.
- Yoshinari, T., Knowless R., 1976. Acetylene inhibition of nitrous oxide reduction by denitrifying Bacteria. Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun. 69, 705–710.
- Yu, K., Seo, D.C., Delaune, R.D., 2010. Incomplete acetylene inhibition of nitrous oxide reduction in potential denitrification assay as revealed by using 15N-nitrate tracer. Commun. Soil Sci. Plant Anal. 41, 2201–2210.