

Article



1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

24

25

# Research and Development Talents Training in China Universities --- Based on the Consideration of Education Management Cost Planning

Long-Hao Yang <sup>1, 2</sup>, Biyu Liu <sup>1, \*</sup> and Jun Liu <sup>2</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> School of Economics and Management, Fuzhou University, Fuzhou, PR China; more026@hotmail.com
  - School of Computing, Ulster University, Northern Ireland, UK; j.liu@ulster.ac.uk
- \* Correspondence: jasperseu@fzu.edu.cn

Abstract: Research and development (R&D) talents training are asymmetric in China universities 9 and can be of great significance for economic and social sustainable development. For the purpose 10 of making an in-depth analysis in the education management costs for R&D talents training, the 11 belief rule-based (BRB) expert system with data increment and parameter learning is developed to 12 achieve education management cost prediction for the first time. In empirical analysis, based on 13 the BRB expert system, the past investments and future planning of education management costs 14 are analyzed using real education management data from 2001 to 2019 in Chinese 31 provinces. 15 Results show that: 1) the existing education management cost investments have a significant re-16 gional difference; 2) the BRB expert system has excellent accuracy over some existing cost predic-17 tion models; 3) Without changing the current education management policy and education cost 18 input scheme, the regional differences in China's education management cost input always exist. In 19 addition to the results, the present study is helpful to provide model supports and policy refer-20 ences for decision makers in making well-grounded plans of R&D talents training at universities 21

Keywords: Research and development; Talents training; Education management; Belief rule-based22expert system; Cost planning23

# 1. Introduction

The development of society and economy has significantly increased the demand 26 for research and development (R&D) talents who are familiar with professional tech-27 nology and information literacy. How to cultivate R&D talents is being a crucial problem 28 that must be considered in the talents training of colleges and universities. Usually, R&D 29 talents training and education management costs are inseparable. According to the gov-30 ernment data at 2020 China Statistical Yearbook [1], the latest China's education financial 31 investment increased over 50% compared with China's education funding in 2011 and 32 the R&D investment intensity of China is higher than most countries. However, the 33 number of R&D talents per 10,000 employees in China is still lower than some developed 34 countries, among which South Korea is the largest one and over seven times of China's 35 R&D researchers. Thus, making an effective education management cost planning is a 36 critical challenge that must be solved for China R&D talents training in new period [2]. 37

In past decades, China ministry of education is constantly increasing the strength of R&D talents training and putting a large amount of funds for technology improvement, whereas the employment rate of R&D talents in universities is much lower and the talent training in universities lacks practical application and platform support. It is necessary to further promote college students to actively engage in R&D-related activities [3], which are inseparable from effective education management cost planning. With the increasing uncertainty of social and economic environment and the emergence of new technologies, 44

Citation: Yang, L.-H.; Liu, B.; Liu J. Research and Development Talents Training in China Universities -Based on the Consideration of Education Management Cost Planning . *Sustainability* **2021**, *13*, x. https://doi.org/10.3390/xxxx

Academic Editor: Firstname Lastname

Received: date Accepted: date Published: date

**Publisher's Note:** MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



**Copyright:** © 2021 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0 /). traditional cost prediction models are difficult to meet the needs of effective education45cost planning [4][5]. Thus, in order to effectively analyze the relationship between R&D46talents training and education funding [6], an effective cost prediction model must be47selected for education management cost planning.48

In this context, the present study pursues the two objectives: 1) the existing educa-49 tion management cost investments are analyzed and investigated to discuss China re-50 gional and provincial differences in the representative R&D talents training indicators, so 51 it is able to provide a summary of experience for education manages; 2) an effective cost 52 prediction model is designed to not only achieve accurate education management cost 53 planning, but also take into consideration the existing education and teaching reform 54 goals, so it will enable education manages make visionary planning in future R&D talents 55 training at China colleges and universities. 56

However, due to the fact that the process of education management cost planning is complex, the prediction outcome should have strong interpretability, and education managers must participate in modeling and prediction process [7][8], all these strict requirements bring a dilemma in selecting system modeling techniques. Among existing techniques, the belief rule-based (BRB) expert system [9] is one of the most advanced decision-support systems in the researches of explainable artificial intelligence and complex system modeling owing to the following advantages: 63

(1) The BRB expert system takes into consideration the IF-THEN rule with embed64
65
66
66
67
68
68
69
69
69

(2) The BRB expert system is a data-driven, knowledge-driven, or hybrid-driven
model and its rule-base is constructed using historical data and expert knowledge.
Meanwhile, the BRB expert system takes the ER algorithm [12] as an inference engine for
rule reasoning, so it can not only achieve knowledge fusion with uncertain information,
but also have transparent rule integration process. All these components form a powerful
expert system for handing complex practical problems.

(3) The BRB expert system belongs to a "white box" model, which mainly refers to
76 the visible modeling and inference processes, especially for the fact that domain experts
77 can participate in these processes. The inferential results of the the BRB expert system
78 have good traceability and interpretability so that decision-makers can fully understand
79 and explain its working principle more easily when applying BRB expert systems.

Therefore, in this study, the BRB expert system is used as the modeling basis to 81 construct an advanced cost prediction model for meeting the current demand of educa-82 tion management cost planning to the greatest extent. The construction of the education 83 management cost prediction model is based on the use of the data incremental and pa-84 rameter learning to enhance the BRB expert system. Owing to the BRB expert system and 85 its improvements, the education management cost prediction model is capable of 86 providing a reference for the policy-making of education management in universities, 87 and also provide an effective prediction tool for the policy implementers and long-term 88 planners of the education management cost to promote the sustainable development of 89 R&D talents training in China. 90

In order to perform the empirical analysis on China education management costs 91 based on the BRB expert system, real education management data from 2001 to 2019 in 92 Chinese 31 provinces are collected from China Statistical Yearbook. Four representative 93 output indicators and two representative input indicators are collected to investigate and 94 analyze the existing education management cost investment. Furthermore, by using the 95 data from 2001 to 2018 as training data and the data at 2019 as testing data, the perfor-96 mance of the BRB expert system is confirmed in predicting future education management 97 costs. Afterwards, based on the costs of education management predicted by the BRB 98

expert system, the government expenditure on education, technology, and science are 99 further analyzed and discussed to provide policy references for future education management-related cost planning. 101

The novelties and contributions of the present study [13][14] include: 1) R&D talents 102 training in China universities is studied for the first time based on the consideration of 103 education management cost planning, so that the education managers are able to make 104 well-grounded medium- and long-term plans to guide R&D talents training at colleges 105 and universities; 2) Owing to the advantages of the BRB expert system, the education 106 management cost prediction not only considers the knowledge of education managers, 107 but also is able to provide traceable and understandable prediction process and ex-108 plainable prediction outcomes; 3) To best of our knowledge, this is the first time that the 109 BRB expert system is applied to the field of R&D talents training in China universities. 110 The empirical analysis on China education management cost prediction confirms the ef-111 fectiveness of the BRB expert system. 112

The remainder of this research is structured as follows. Section 2 presents the preliminaries of the study. This is followed by a new education management cost prediction model. The empirical analysis on China education management cost planning is detailed in Section 4. Finally, Sections 5 and 6 present the discussions and conclusions.

#### 2. Preliminaries for Education Management Cost Prediction

In this section, the BRB expert system is reviewed in Section 2.1, and its optimization 118 and inference process are introduced in Sections 2.2 and 2.3 to give the basic knowledge 119 of education management cost prediction. 120

# 2.1. Brief review of the BRB expert system

As the rule base of a BRB expert system [9], the BRB has a series of belief rules in the form of IF-THEN rules by embedding belief structures into the THEN part. Normally, the *k*th belief rule in the BRB is written as: 124

$$R_{k}: IF U_{1} is A_{1}^{k} \wedge U_{2} is A_{2}^{k} \wedge \dots \wedge U_{M} is A_{M}^{k}, THEN D is \{(D_{n}, \beta_{n,k}); n = 1, \dots, N\},$$
(1) 125

with rule weight  $\theta_k$  and attribute weights  $\{\delta_1, ..., \delta_M\}$ 

where { $U_m$ ; m=1,..., M} denotes a set of M antecedent attributes; { $A_m^k$ ; m=1,..., M} denotes 126 a set of referential values used to describe the kth (k=1,..., L) belief rule, L is a total number 127 of belief rules in the BRB,  $A_m^k$  belongs to { $A_{m,j}$ ;  $j=1,..., J_m$ } that is a complete set of  $J_m$  referential values used to describe the mth antecedent attribute; { $(D_n, \beta_{n,k})$ ; n=1,..., N} denotes 129 belief structure in consequent attribute D, in which  $\beta_{n,k}$  is belief degree to which the consequent  $D_n$  is believed to be true. 131

Table 1. Example of a complete BRB regarding education management cost prediction

132

117

Rule	Rule A	ntecedent attril	butes (weights)	Belief distribution of consequent attribute			
No.	weight	<b>TMTV (δ</b> 1)	NNP ( $\delta_2$ )	Low	Middle	High	
$R_1$	$\theta_1$	Low	Low	$eta_{1,1}$	β2,1	β3,1	
$R_2$	$\theta_2$	Low	Middle	$\beta_{1,2}$	β2,2	β3,2	
Rз	$\theta_3$	Low	High	$\beta_{1,3}$	β2,3	β3,3	
$R_4$	$\theta_4$	Middle	Low	$eta_{1,4}$	β2,4	β3,4	
$R_5$	$ heta_{5}$	Middle	Middle	$eta_{1,5}$	β2,5	β3,5	
$R_6$	$\theta_{6}$	Middle	High	$eta_{1,6}$	$eta_{2,6}$	β3,6	
$R_7$	$\theta_{7}$	High	Low	β1,7	β2,7	β3,7	
$R_8$	$ heta_{\!\!8}$	High	Middle	$eta_{1,8}$	$eta_{2,8}$	β3,8	
R9	<i>Ө</i> э	High	High	$\beta_{1,9}$	β2,9	β3,9	

Taking education management cost prediction for an example, suppose that gov-133ernment expenditure on education (GEE) is related to technical market transaction volume134(TMTV) and number of new products (NNP). Thus, TMTV and NNP are regarded as two135antecedent attributes and GEE is as consequent attribute. When each of the three attrib-136utes is described by three referential values: Low, Middle, and High, a complete BRB for137education management cost prediction is illustrated in Table 1.138

# 2.2. Optimization of BRB expert system

In order to obtain the optimal values for the parameters used in a BRB, *i.e.*, rule 140 weights, attribute weights, belief degrees shown in Table 1, parameter learning should be 141 applied to extract useful information from historical data to assign the parameters value 142 of the BRB. Usually, a global parameter learning model can be written as follows: 143

$$Min \sum_{t=1}^{I} |f(\boldsymbol{x}_{t}) - \boldsymbol{y}_{t}|, \qquad (2a) \quad 144$$

$$s.t. \sum_{n=1}^{N} \beta_{n,k} = 1, k = 1, ..., L$$
, (2b) 145

$$0 \le \beta_{n,k} \le 1, \ n = 1, ..., N; \ k = 1, ..., L,$$
 (2c) 146

$$0 \le \theta_k \le 1, k = 1, ..., L$$
, (2d) 147

$$0 \le \delta_i \le 1, i = 1, ..., M$$
, (2e) 148

$$u(A_{m,j}) < u(A_{m,j+1}), m = 1,..., M; j = 1,..., J_m - 1,$$
 (2f) 149

$$u(A_i^1) = lb_i, u(A_i^L) = ub_i, i = 1,..., M$$
, (2g) 150

$$u(D_n) < u(D_{n+1}), n = 1, ..., N-1,$$
 (2h) 151

$$u(D_1) = lb, u(D_N) = ub$$
, (2i) 152

where  $f(x_t)$  denotes the inference output of a BRB expert system to predict the input data 153  $x_t$ , here  $x_t = (x_{1t}, x_{2t}, ..., x_{Mt})$ ;  $y_t$  is the actual output of the input data  $x_t$ ; T is the total number 154 of historical data used to train the BRB expert system; Eqs. (2b) - (2c) are constraints on 155 the belief degree; Eqs. (2d) - (2e) are constraints on the antecedent attribute weights and 156 the rule weights, respectively; and Eqs. (2f) - (2i) are the constraint on the utility values of 157 the referential values used for antecedent attributes and the consequents used for con-158sequent attribute. Note that the global parameter learning model can be solved by using 159 the MATLAB optimization toolbox [15], clonal selection algorithm [16], and differential 160 evolution algorithm [17]. 161

#### 2.3. Inference of BRB expert system

162

After constructing a BRB expert system based on parameter learning, it means that163the BRB expert system is able to have an excellent performance for predicting any given164input data. Suppose that  $x=(x_1, x_2, ..., x_M)$  is the input vector and  $x_i$  denotes the input data165of the *i*th antecedent attribute, The following steps should be performed to obtain an in-166ference output.167

Step 1: To calculate individual matching degrees. The individual matching degree168can be transformed from the input data x using utility-based equivalence transformation169techniques, *i.e.*, the individual matching degrees of  $x_i$  are calculated by170

$$\alpha_{i,j} = \frac{u(A_{i,j+1}) - x_i}{u(A_{i,j+1}) - u(A_{i,j})} \text{ and } \alpha_{i,j+1} = 1 - \alpha_{i,j}, \text{ if } u(A_{i,j}) \le x_i \le u(A_{i,j+1}), \quad (3) \quad 171$$

$$\alpha_{i,k} = 0$$
, for  $k = 1, ..., J_i$  and  $k \neq j, j+1$ , (4) 172

where  $A_{i,j}$  represents the *j*th referential value for the *i*th antecedent attribute,  $u(A_{i,j})$  represents the utility value of  $A_{i,j}$ ,  $\alpha_{i,j}$  represents the individual matching degree of the given input  $x_i$  to  $A_{i,j}$ . As a result, the distribution of the individual matching degree for the *i*th antecedent attribute is represented as follows: 176

$$S(x_i) = \{ (A_{i,j}, \alpha_{i,j}); j = 1, ..., J_i \},$$
(5) 177

Step 2: To calculate activation weights. While the BRB expert system is constructed178under the conjunctive assumption, the activation weight for the *k*th belief rule is calculated179lated as follows:180

$$w_k = \frac{\theta_k \prod_{i=1}^{M} (\alpha_i^k)^{\bar{\delta}_i}}{\sum_{l=1}^{L} (\theta_l \prod_{i=1}^{M} (\alpha_i^l)^{\bar{\delta}_i})}.$$
(6) 181

where  $\alpha_i^k$  is the individual matching degree to the *i*th antecedent attribute in the *k*th 182 rule, and 183

$$\overline{\delta}_{i} = \frac{\delta_{i}}{\max_{i=1,\dots,M} \{\delta_{i}\}},$$
(7) 184

where  $\theta_k$  is the rule weight of the *k*th belief rule,  $\delta_i$  is the attribute weight of the *i*th 185 antecedent attribute.

Step 3: To integrate belief rules for producing an inference output. After calculating187activation weights for all belief rules in the BRB, the combined belief degree  $\beta_i$  can be188calculated using the ER algorithm:189

$$\beta_{i} = \frac{\prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( w_{k} \beta_{i,k} + 1 - w_{k} \sum_{n=1}^{N} \beta_{n,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{n=1}^{N} \beta_{n,k} \right)}{\sum_{n=1}^{N} \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( w_{k} \beta_{n,k} + 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - (N-1) \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \beta_{j,k} \right) - \prod_{k=1}^{L} \left( 1 - w_{k} \sum_{j=1}^{N$$

Next, the inference output of the BRB expert system f(x) can be obtained as follows: 191

$$f(\mathbf{x}) = \sum_{i=1}^{N} \left( u(D_i)\beta_i \right) + \frac{\left( u(D_1) + u(D_N) \right)}{2} \left( 1 - \sum_{i=1}^{N} \beta_i \right).$$
(9) 192

where  $u(D_i)$  denotes the utility value of the consequent  $D_i$ .

3. Education Management Cost Prediction based on the BRB Expert System

For education management cost prediction, the historical input and output data 195 always grow over years. However, the inference output of a BRB expert system is limited 196 by the minimum and maximum utility values, which are given based on the lower and 197 upper bound of historical data, leading to the dilemma that the BRB expert system fails to 198 predict the cost of education management. For example, the lower and upper bound of 199 historical data  $x_t$  (t=1,...,T) is  $x_t \in [100, 200]$ , which also means that the input data needed 200 to predict must be  $x \in [100, 200]$ . In other words, the BRB expert system can not produce 201 an inference output for the input data x=210 because of 210 > 200. 202

In order to overcome the dilemma, the data increment is introduced to improve the 203 prediction performance of the BRB expert system. According to [18], the definition of 204 data increment is given as follows: 205

**Definition 1** (Data increment). Consider a case of a *M*-dimensional function y=f(x) 206 with  $x=\{x_1,...,x_M\}$  and its definition domain [a, b], where *a* and *b* are all *M*-ary vectors, 207 respectively. When there exists an input-output data pair  $\langle x_0, y_0 \rangle$  in the function y=f(x), 208 for any  $x_1 \in [a, b]$ , the data increment regarding the input and output data can be written 209 as  $\Delta x=x_1-x_0$  and  $\Delta y = f(x_1)-f(x_0)=f(x_0+\Delta x)-f(x_0)$ , respectively. 210

According to *Definition* 1, the lower bound and the upper bound of historical data 211 increment are  $\Delta x_{t,l} = x_{t-x_{l}}$  and  $\Delta x_{t,l} \in [-100, 100]$  (t, l=1,..., T) for historical data  $x_{t}$  and  $x_{l}$ , so it 212 is possible for BRB expert system to produce an inference output when x=210 because 213 data increment is  $\Delta x = x - x_{t}$  and  $\Delta x \in [-100, 100]$ . Based on the above viewpoint, Fig. 1 provides a framework of the BRB expert system for education management cost prediction. 215



Figure 1. Framework of BRB expert system in education management cost prediction

From Fig. 1, the steps of using BRB expert system to predict education management 218 costs are introduced as follows: 219

Step 1: To determine antecedent and consequent attributes. Suppose that one certain 220 education management cost D is related with M education management indicators  $\{U_i\}$ 221  $i=1,\ldots,M$ . In order to construct a BRB expert system, all these D and U<sub>i</sub> are regarded as 222 antecedent and consequent attributes of the BRB expert system. Moreover, gives Ji ref-223 erential values  $\{A_{i,j}, j=1,..., J_i\}$  for the *i*th antecedent attribute and N consequents  $\{D_n, J_n\}$ 224 n=1,...,N for consequent attribute. 225

Step 2: To generate data increments. Suppose that there are S input-output educa-226 tion management data pairs  $\langle x_i, y_i \rangle$  (*t*=1,..., *S*) for the *M* antecedent attributes {*U<sub>i</sub>*; *i*=1,..., 227 *M*} and consequent attribute *D*, where  $x_t = \{x_{t,1}, \dots, x_{t,M}\}$ . Based on *Definition 1*, the data in-228 crements of any two input-output data pairs, e.g.,  $\langle x_t, y_t \rangle$  and  $\langle x_s, y_s \rangle$  ( $t, s=1,..., S; t\neq s$ ), are 229 generated as follows: 230

$$\Delta \boldsymbol{x}_{ts} = \boldsymbol{x}_t - \boldsymbol{x}_s \tag{10} \quad 231$$

$$\Delta y_{t,s} = y_t - y_s \tag{11} 232$$

where the new set of training data has  $S \times (S-1)$  input-output data increment pairs. For the 233 sake of descriptions, these  $S \times (S-1)$  data increment pairs are denoted as  $\langle \Delta x_{k}, \Delta y_{k} \rangle$ 234  $(k=1,..., T; T=S \times (S-1)).$ 235

Step 3: To train parameter value of BRB expert system. Based on the parameter 236 learning model shown in Section 2.2 and the T input data increment pairs shown in Eqs. 237 (10) - (11), the parameters of the BRB expert system, including rule weights, attribute 238 weights, belief degrees, and utility values, can be trained to obtain their optimal values, so the resulting BRB expert system is able to accurately predict the cost of education 240 management.

Step 4: To predict education management cost for any given input data. Suppose 242 that there are a new input data  $x = \{x_i; i=1, \dots, M\}$  and a recent input-output historical data 243 pair  $\langle x_k, y_k \rangle$ . Hence, the data increment of x and  $x_k$  can be calculated and it is denoted as 244  $\Delta x = \{\Delta x_i; i=1, \dots, M\}$ . Furthermore, based on the three steps detailed in Section 2.3, an in-245 ference output of the BRB expert system  $f(\Delta x)$  can be obtained to produce a final pre-246 dicted education management cost by  $y_{k+} f(\Delta x)$ . 247

For the above-mentioned steps, the case detailed in Section 2.1 is used to describe how to predict education management costs using the BRB expert system as follows:

216 217

239

241

248

269

279

Firstly, a total of 9 belief rules can be constructed by combining all the referential 250values of each antecedent attributes, as shown in Table 1, where the parameter values of 251 all these belief belief may be inaccurate because they are usually given by only according 252 to expert knowledge. Secondly, suppose that there are 3 historical data  $\langle x_1, y_1 \rangle = \langle x_{1,1} \rangle$ 253 12142, *x*<sub>1,2</sub>= 5695.28, *y*<sub>1</sub>=1137.18>, <*x*<sub>2</sub>, *y*<sub>2</sub>>=<*x*<sub>2,1</sub>=11010, *x*<sub>2,2</sub>=4957.82, *y*<sub>2</sub>=1025.51> and <*x*<sub>3</sub>, *y*<sub>3</sub>>= 254  $\langle x_{3,1}=10490, x_{3,2}=4486.89, y_3=964.62\rangle$ , the resulting data increments can be calculated and 255 they are  $\langle \Delta x_{1,1}=1132, \Delta x_{1,1}=737.46, \Delta y_1=111.67 \rangle$ ,  $\langle \Delta x_{2,1}=-1132, \Delta x_{2,1}=-737.46, \Delta y_2=-111.67 \rangle$ , 256  $<\Delta x_{3,1}=1652, \ \Delta x_{3,1}=1208.39, \ \Delta y_3=172.56>, \ <\Delta x_{4,1}=-1652, \ \Delta x_{4,1}=-1208.39, \ \Delta y_4=-172.56>, \ <\Delta x_{5,1}=-1208.39, \ \Delta y_{5,1}=-1208.39, \ \Delta y_{5,1}=$ 257 520,  $\Delta x_{5,1}$ =470.93,  $\Delta y_5$ =60.89>, and < $\Delta x_{6,1}$ =520,  $\Delta x_{6,1}$ =470.93,  $\Delta y_6$ =60.89>. Thirdly, all these 6 258 data increments are used to optimize the parameter values of 9 belief rules to improve the 259 performance of the BRB expert system, in which the parameter learning model is intro-260 duced in Section 2.2. Finally, when a new input data  $x = <x_1 = 13142$ ,  $x_2 = 6695.28$  is given, 261 the data increment regarding  $\langle x_1, y_1 \rangle$  should be calculated by  $\Delta x_1 = 13142 - 12142 = 1000$  and 262  $\Delta x_2$ =6695.28-5695.28=1000. Afterwards, the three steps detailed in Section 2.3 is used to 263 produce  $f(\Delta x)$ , *e.g.*,  $f(\Delta x)$ =300, and the final predicted cost is f(x)=300+1137.18=1437.18. 264

#### 4. Empirical Analysis on China Education Management Cost Planning

In this section, based on the cost prediction method detailed in Section 3, actual education management data derived from 31 provinces in mainland China are used to perform an empirical case study. 268

#### 4.1. Data collection and indicator explanation

In empirical analysis, the education management data related with 31 Chinese 270 provinces from 2001 to 2019 are derived from China Statistical Yearbook, which is the 271 most commonly used and reliable public database for the study of education manage-272 ment cost planning in China, and a total of four education management output indicators 273 and two education management input indicators are collected based on literature sum-274 mary, the reality of education management, data availability in China Statistical Year-275 book, and the requirement of complex system modeling[2][3][9], respectively, to analyze 276 the past and future education management cost planning. The specific interpretations of 277 these indicators are shown in Table 2. 278

Table 2. Introduction of indicators in education management cost planning

Indicator name	Abbr.	Corresponding relationship
Number of R&D employees	NRDE	Antecedent
Number of new products	NNP	Antecedent
Number of invention patent applications	NIPA	Antecedent
Technical market transaction volume	TMTV	Antecedent
Government expenditure on education	GEE	Consequent
Government expenditure on science and technology	GEST	Consequent

From Table 1, the four indicators, namely number of R&D employees, number of 280 new products, number of invention patent applications, and technical market transaction 281 volume, are used as the antecedent attributes of the BRB expert system, respectively. 282 Correspondingly, two indicators, namely government expenditure on education and 283 government expenditure on science and technology, are used as the consequent attrib-284 utes of the BRB expert system, respectively. Additionally, due to the education man-285 agement data related with 31 provinces, a total of 31 BRB expert systems need to be con-286 structed for each year while investigating education management cost planning. Addi-287 tionally, the BRB expert system within this study is implemented by Microsoft Visual C++ 288 6.0 in Windows 7 Ultimate (64-bit Operating System) with Intel (R) Core (TM) i5-4300 289 CPU @1.90GHz 2.50GHz and 4GB RAM. 290

### 4.2. Analysis of education management cost investments during 2001-2019

In this subsection, the past education management cost investments during 2001 - 292 2019 are analyzed based on the education management data collected from 31 provinces 293 in China, so that the existing differences among Chinese provinces can be illustrated to 294 establish the basis of predicting future education management cost planning. 295

Firstly, Figs. 2 - 7 show the data of different education management costs and the 296 R&D talents training of different provinces. From Figs. 2 and 3, it can be found that the 297 number of R&D employees and number of new products have significantly regional 298 differences, in which the number of R&D employees and number of new products in 299 most eastern provinces are much higher than that of western provinces in China. The 300 regional differences of R&D level in China are not only related to the differences of 301 physical and geographical environment in the central and western regions, but also 302 closely related to the number of universities in various provinces and the local financial 303 support. Compared with the western region, universities in the eastern region are more 304 densely distributed, and the employment opportunities of scientific and technological 305 talents in the eastern region are also higher than those in the western region. Especially, 306 the eastern economic circle is a high-tech industry concentration area, and the R&D 307 support and the number of new product production in these provinces are significantly 308 higher than those in other regions. 309



Figure 2. NRDE for 31 Chinese provinces during 2001 - 2019



Figure 3. NNP for 31 Chinese provinces during 2001 – 2019

Compared to the regional differences of the number of R&D employees and new 314 products, the number of invention patent applications and technical market transaction 315 volume in Figs. 4 and 5 show that the province with highest value of technical market 316 transaction volume is Beijing, and the highest number of invention patent applications is 317 in Guangdong province. As China's political center, Beijing has natural policy ad-318

310 311

vantages in science and technology market transactions, and it is also the center of Chi-319 na's international exchanges and exhibitions. Therefore, considering the special political 320 position of Beijing, it can effectively bring certain convenience to science and technology 321 market transactions. It is worth noting that except for some coastal areas such as 322 Guangdong, Zhejiang and Jiangsu, the R&D capacity of most provinces needs to be im-323 proved. The reason is that there are many achievements in scientific research manage-324 ment with few patents applied in actual economic activities, and the conversion rate of 325 scientific research achievements is often lower in most provinces, which also leads to the 326 lack of guidance in talents training based on the combination of professional knowledge 327 teaching and practical social practice [19]. Moreover, the strength of scientific research 328 talents is relatively scattered in China's current talents training and it is difficult to effec-329 tively integrate different teams and resources for new products and patterns innovation. 330



Figure 4. NIPA for 31 Chinese provinces during 2001 - 2019





From Figs. 6 and 7, it can be found that the regional distribution differences of gov-335 ernment expenditure on education, science, and technology are basically consistent with 336 the regional distribution of R&D capacity showed in Figs. 2 - 5, that is, the research ca-337 pacity in the eastern coastal areas are higher than those in the central and western re-338 gions. In addition, R&D capability is closely related to the external trading policy envi-339 ronment, the strategic positioning of new products and the international competitive 340 environment. From the perspective of talents training in universities, in order to enhance 341 the competitiveness of R&D talents, it must emphasize the independent practice ability 342 and engineering practice ability of talents training. Around the social needs of various 343 industries and practical activities for information technology talents training, engineering 344 practice projects can be added in the process of education management, and encourage 345 self- learning for the design and program realization of new products. The application 346 investigation of new patents and new products is also carried out in the form of team 347 formation so as to stimulate the independent practice awareness of R&D talents. 348

331 332



10 of 16



Figure 6. GEE for 31 Chinese provinces during 2001 – 2019



Figure 7. GEST for 31 Chinese provinces during 2001 - 2019

### 4.3. Verification of BRB expert system for cost prediction

In order to analyze future education management cost planning based on the BRB expert system, this subsection firstly verify the effectiveness of the BRB expert system for 355 education management cost prediction. For this purpose, the data of education man-356 agement during 2001 to 2018 are used as training data and the data of education man-357 agement at 2019 as testing data. Based on the BRB expert system detailed in Section 2.2, the results of education management cost prediction are showed in Figs. 8 and 9. The results show that the research on education management cost is closely related to the level of R&D ability, and proves the necessity of research on education management cost 361 prediction, that is the regional distribution differences of education management cost are 362 basically consistent with the regional distribution of R&D capacity showed in Figs. 2 - 7. 363 This also indicates that in order to effectively improve the R&D ability, it is necessary to 364 predict the investment of education management. 365



Figure 8. Comparison of predicted GEE and real GEE for 31 Chinese provinces at 2019

351 352

353 354



369



Figure 9. Comparison of predicted GEST and real GEST for 31 Chinese provinces at 2019

From Figs. 8 and 9, they show that the predicted education management costs based 370 on the BRB expert system is highly consistent with the two types of actual education 371 management costs, and the prediction results are applicable to the education manage-372 ment analysis of 31 provinces with high prediction accuracy. Therefore, considering the 373 high fitting degree between the prediction results of BRB expert system and the actual 374 costs, it can be considered that the education management cost prediction based on the 375 BRB expert system has certain reference significance for the future R&D talents training 376 of various provinces. 377

In order to validate the effectiveness of the BRB expert system for education man-378 agement cost prediction, the results of each predicted cost that obtained by different 379 prediction models are measured with accuracy. Tables 3 and 4 shows the comparison of 380 the BRB expert system with other rule-based systems, including fuzzy rule-based system 381 (FRBS) 21 and adaptive neuro fuzzy inference system (ANFIS) [22], and other time series 382 forecasting models, including grey model (GM) [20], auto regressive (AR) model, and 383 moving average (MA) model, in which the comparisons of these models in education 384 management cost prediction are based on MAE and MAPE. From Table 3, the BRB expert 385 system produces satisfactory prediction results for two management costs compared 386 with existing models, and the MAE of the BRB expert system are 82.4 and 18.59, respec-387 tively. Comparatively, the MAPE of the BRB expert system are 9.62% and 12.99%, which 388 are better than FRBS and ANFIS. Furthermore, in the comparison of the three time series 389 forecasting models, the BRB expert system also show its better performance in predicting 390 GEE and GEST. Although the AR model has a lower MAE and MAPE in GEE than the 391 BRB expert system, the BRB expert system obtains the second best results in GEE and the 392 best results in GEST. In summary, they reveal that the BRB expert system has a better 393 performance than the other prediction models used in education management cost pre-394 diction. 395

Table 3 Comparison of rule-based systems for education management cost prediction

Predicted	MAE				MAPE			
costs	BRB	FRBS	ANFIS	BRB	FRBS	ANFIS		
GEE	82.40 (1)	164.17 (2)	2683.36 (3)	9.62% (1)	17.57% (2)	400.76% (3)		
GEST	18.59 (1)	38.81 (2)	446.91 (3)	12.99% (1)	22.74% (2)	245.18% (3)		

Table 4 Comparison of time series forecasting models for education management cost prediction

Predicted	MAE				MAPE			
costs	BRB	AR	MA	GM	BRB	AR	MA	GM
GEE	82.40(2)	56.27(1)	384.16(4)	256.94(3)	9.62%(2)	4.45%(1)	35.22%(4)	27.43%(3)
GEST	18.59(1)	25.27(2)	76.82(4)	54.86(3)	12.99%(1)	13.21%(2)	36.92%(4)	23.09%(3)

396

#### 4.4. Analysis of future education management cost planning

To effectively analyze the change of education management cost planning in the 399 next 6 years, the target input of future education management is obtained by time series 400 forecasting firstly, and then the education management costs of 31 provinces in China in 401 next 6 years are predicted using the BRB expert system. The corresponding results are 402 showed in Fig. 10. It can be clearly found that the government expenditure of two types 403 of education cost planning will show a significant growth trend in the next 6 years, in-404 dicating that the training of R&D talents must have time sustainability and it is necessary 405 to continuously invest education funds to support the development of new products and 406 new technologies. This is consistent with China's current development strategy and is 407 also rejuvenating the country through science and education. At the same time, the per-408 formance evaluation of the use of education funds should be strengthened when the in-409 vestment in education funds is increasing. With the increase of the education investment 410 scale, decision makers should have the concept of improving education management ef-411 ficiency and pay attention to the standardization of education investment management 412 policy and performance accountability system. 413



Figure 10. Average predicted GEST and GEE for 31 Chinese provinces in the next 6 years

To further analyze the future education management cost planning of 31 provinces, 416 the government expenditure on education, science, and technology predicted by the BRB 417 expert system for 31 provinces at 2025 are showed in Fig. 11. The results show that in the 418 future education management cost planning, the government expenditure on education 419 in Henan, Guangdong, Jiangsu, Hebei and Sichuan provinces is significantly higher than 420 other provinces. In addition to Guangdong and Jiangsu provinces, the government ex-421 penditure on science and technology in Beijing is higher than other provinces. From the 422 perspective of regional differences of education management cost planning at 2025, ex-423 cept for the situation that the education management costs of Sichuan and Shannxi 424 provinces are significantly higher in the western region, the education management costs 425 of most western regions are still lower than that of the eastern region in China. Similarly, 426 in addition to the high investment in education management costs in Beijing and Hebei 427 provinces, the education management costs in most provinces in northern China are 428 significantly lower than those in southern regions. From the perspective of the relation-429 ship between the R&D talents training in China universities and the cost investment of 430 regional education management, effective policies and measures are important to not 431 only make up for the regional differences in R&D talent training and education man-432 agement, but also weaken the regional differences of China education and talent training. 433

398

414



Figure 11. Predicted GEST and GEE for 31 Chinese provinces in 2025

# 5. Discussions

This study focused on the discussion of R&D talents training in China universities 437 based on education management cost planning. The BRB expert system was proposed 438 with the use of data increment and parameter learning. The results showed that the BRB 439 expert system can be well applied to the prediction of education management cost under 440 high prediction accuracy, which provides a reference for the future planning of education 441 management cost in China universities. As mentioned in most existing studies [23], the 442 results analysis indicated that in the future planning and prediction of education man-443 agement cost, education management cost shows an increasing trend, but the regional 444 differences of education management cost still exists in China. The regional difference of 445 education management cost exists for a long time. In addition to regional environment, 446 regional policy and regional population, education management cost is closely related to 447 economic development. Education management cost comes from the direct expenditure 448 of government finance in talent training, which is closely related to the financial revenue 449 of local government. This also determines that the cost of education management is 450 closely related to the income of local residents, industrial development and population 451 density. Regional economic factors play a vital role in the development of China's edu-452 cation level [24]. The higher the level of education has positive influence on the higher the 453 regional economic development, therefore, in the long-term development of R&D talents 454 training, the regional differences of education management costs will exist. Furthermore, 455 from the time series change of education management cost, the overall rising trend of 456 education management cost is consistent with China's education policy of paying atten-457 tion to talent training [25], that is, increasing the investment in education management 458 cost to improve the talent training level of universities and encourage the innovation of 459 R&D talents. This also shows that the investment of education management cost plays a 460 vital role in the process of R&D talent training. 461

The investment and use of funds is an important basis for the development of higher 462 education, as a non-profit organization, i.e., public knowledge production organization 463 and talent training organization, the development of education needs financial support 464 from all walks of life [26][27]. Some scholars believe that the cost of talents training in 465 Colleges and universities includes direct costs in the process of students cultivating, in-466 direct costs in the process of managing and organizing student training, and all kinds of 467 economic assistance costs. Another group of scholars believe that the training cost of 468 students in Colleges and universities includes direct and indirect resource consumption, 469 which is a combination of multiple meaning costs including school, department, aca-470 demic and school system cost [28]. This study chooses the direct cost in the process of 471 talents training in universities as the cost prediction objective, and no matter what kind of 472 education management cost accounting method, to a certain extent, it reflects the neces-473 sity of effective cost planning and prediction in R&D talents training and education 474 management [6]. 475

In the existing research of education management cost, most of the studies focused 476 on the concept introduction [29], accounting methods [30][31] and theoretical analysis of 477

436

434

education management cost [32], and ignores the consideration of education manage-478 ment cost planning and prediction. In the application of the existing prediction model [21] 479 [22], few scholars consider applying the expert system to the planning of education 480 management cost and accurately predict the future trend of education management cost. 481 In the present study, the cost of education management was predicted based on the BRB 482 expert system and it created the application of the BRB expert system in the field of ed-483 ucation management, and further improves the performance of BRB expert system in the 484prediction of education management cost by proposing incremental prediction and pa-485 rameter optimization methods, which provides a reference direction for the planning and 486 prediction of education management cost in the future studies. 487

# 6. Conclusions

In the present study, the R&D talents training in China universities was studied 489 based on the consideration of education management cost planning. The purpose of the 490 present study is due to the dilemma that the R&D investment intensity of China is higher 491 than most countries, but the quantity of R&D talents per 10,000 employees in China is 492 still lower than some developed countries. Therefore, the study of making an effective 493 education management cost planning is a critical challenge and necessary research ob-494 jectives for China R&D talents training in new period. 495

Within the background of considering education management cost planning to im-496 prove R&D talents trainings in China universities, the existing China education man-497 agement cost investments during 2001 to 2019 were discussed firstly to show the past 498 development of universities' R&D talents training and government expenditures. Fur-499 thermore, an explainable and advanced rule-based system, called the BRB expert system, 500 was applied to construct a novel education management cost prediction model, so that 501 the future government expenditures on education, science and technology are foreseea-502 ble for education managers and they could make visionary planning in future R&D tal-503 ents training at China universities [33][34]. 504

### 6.1. Theoretical implications

The BRB expert system-based education management cost prediction model pro-506 posed in this study has theoretical implications for future research. 507

(1) Due to the problem of sparse data in the field of education management cost 508 prediction, the system modeling has to suffer from the over fitting problem. The data 509 increment of education management input and output indicators were used to enrich 510 data for modeling expert system, the resulting BRB expert system is able to overcome the 511 over fitting problem. 512

(2) To overcome the subjectivity of parameters given by experts, the global param-513 eter learning model was introduced to enhance the BRB expert system construction, so that the parameter values of the BRB expert system can be optimized according to the 515 historical education management input and output data. 516

(3) The results of comparative studies demonstrated that the data increment and 517 parameter learning could effectively improve the performance of the BRB expert system. 518 The government expenditures on education, science and technology predicted by the 519 BRB expert system were much lower than the other prediction models. 520

#### 6.2. Policy suggestions

From the present study on R&D talents training in China universities with the con-522 sideration of education management cost planning, the following policy suggestions 523 could be summarized for future research: 524

(1) To optimize the setting of professional knowledge learning in universities based 525 on the demand of economic market and social development, that is the course learning in 526 universities for R&D talents should be improved and designed according to the current 527

488

505

514

market environment and industry demand, so that they can better understand the market 528 demand and master relevant professional technology through school-enterprise cooper-529 ation and exchange, so as to make up for the shortage of professional technicians in rel-530 evant fields in the market. 531

(2) To advocate expanding teaching and cultivate R&D talents' basic quality and professional skills for social practice by relying on the practice carrier outside the universities professional classroom, so they can train professional skills and improve prac-534 tical ability in expanding teaching. 535

(3) To establish a diversified training mode for R&D talents, and adopt a variety of 536 talent training methods to improve the innovation of scientific and technological capa-537 bility is an important strategy for R&D talents training in China universities. Decision 538 makers of education management should also pay attention to improve the professional 539 and technical level of R&D talents so as to ensure that the talents trained in universities 540 can be truly applicable to new products and technologies innovation of actual economic 541 activities. 542

# 6.3. Limitations and future researches

The present study has several limitations. The first limitation is related to the mod-544 eling process where the four representative indicators were selected based on expert ex-545 periment and literature review. More indicators and data-driven indicator selection 546 methods should be used in the modeling process. The second limitation is related to the 547 rule scales of the BRB expert system whose number of rules will increase exponentially 548 with increasing the number of indicators, so the BRB expert system usually have to face 549 the combinatorial explosion issue when considering a large number of indicators. 550

Despite the limitations outlined above, the results of the present study are mean-551 ingful in that we confirm the BRB expert system to predict education management costs. 552 For the future researches, owing to the different characteristics of education management 553 in different provinces and universities, the influences of regional education policies and 554 economic development differences on education management investments should be 555 analyzed and discussed. Furthermore, because of the combinatorial explosion issue, this 556 study only considered four representative indicators in education management cost 557 prediction. Hence, in the future research, more abundant indicators could be involved for 558 education management cost prediction and some extensions of the BRB expert system 559 could be also introduced to model a novel cost prediction method when education 560 manage involves these indicators. 561

Author Contributions: Conceptualization, L.-H. Y. and B. L.; methodology, J. L.; validation, L.-H. 562 Y., B. L. and J. L.; formal analysis, L.-H. Y.; investigation, B. L.; writing—original draft preparation, 563 L.-H. Y.; writing-review and editing, B. L.; All authors have read and agreed to the published 564 version of the manuscript. 565

Funding: This research was funded by the National Natural Science Foundation of China, grant number 566 72001043 and 71971064, the National Science Foundation of Fujian Province, China, grant number 567 2020J05122, the Humanities and Social Science Foundation of the Ministry of Education of Chi-568 na ,grant number 20YJC630188. 569

#### Data Availability Statement: Not applicable 570

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest..

#### References

- 1. China National Bureau of Statistics, http://www.stats.gov.cn/tjsj/ndsj/.
- 2. Wang, H., Wei, A.M., Talent Demand and Training Strategy of Oceangoing Cruise Company Based on Customized Talent 574 Development Model. Journal of Coastal Research, 2020, 106: 233-236. 575
- Zheng, C.B., Zhou, W.R., Research on Information Construction and Management of Education Management Based on Data 3. 576 Mining. Journal of Physics: Conference Series, 2021, 1881: 042073. 577

532 533

543

571

572

- Narendra, U.P., Prabhakar, M., Pradeep, B.S., Framework for knowledge management on education. *International Journal of Advanced Science and Technology*, 2020, 129: 2122-2128.
   579
- Alexandra, G.R., Lauren, L., Jesse, D., Training across the academy: The impact of R&D funding on graduate students. *Research Policy*, 2021, 50: 104224.
   581
- Kim, W.J., Hoi, T.V., Tuan, L.N., Trung, N.N., R&D, training and accessibility to finance for innovation: a case of Vietnam, the country in transition. *Asian Journal of Technology Innovation*, 2019, 27: 172-193.
- 7. Chang, L.L., Zhang, L.M., Explainable data-driven optimization for complex systems with non-preferential multiple outputs using belief rule base. *Applied Soft Computing*, **2021**, 110: 1-13.
- 8. Zhou, Z.J., Hu, G.Y., Hu, C.H., Wen, C.L., Chang, L.L., A Survey of Belief Rule-Base Expert System. *IEEE Transactions on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics: Systems*, **2021**: In Press.
- 9. Yang, J.B., Liu, J., Wang, J., Sii, H.S., Wang, H.W., Belief rule-base inference methodology using the evidential reasoning approach RIMER. *IEEE Transactions on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics Part A: Systems and Humans*, **2006**, 36(2): 266-285.
- Sun, R., Robust Reasoning: Integrating Rule-Based and Similarity-Based Reasoning. Artificial Intelligence, 1995, 75(2): 241-295.
   Cao, Y., Zhou, Z.J., Hu, C.H., He, W., Tang, S.W., On the interpretability of belief rule based expert systems. *IEEE Transactions on Fuzzy Systems*, 2021, In Press.
- Wang, Y.M., Yang, J.B., Xu, D.L., Environmental impact assessment using the evidential reasoning approach. *European Journal* of Operational Research, 2006, 174(3): 1885-1913.
- 13. Saura J. R., Using Data Sciences in Digital Marketing: Framework, methods, and performance metrics. *Journal of Innovation & Knowledge*, **2021**, 6: 92-102.
- 14. Saura J. R., Paracios-Marques D., Iturricha-Fernandez A., Ethical design in social media: Assessing the main performance measurements of user online behavior modification. *Journal of Business Research*, **2021**, 129: 271-281.
- 15. Wang, S., Ye, F.F., Environmental Governance Cost Prediction of Transportation Industry by Considering the Technological Constraints. *Symmetry-BASEL*, **2020**, 12(8): 1-15.
- 16. Tang, X.L., Xiao, M.Q., Liang, Y.-J., Zhu, H.Z., Li, J.F., Online updating belief-rule-base using Bayesian estimation. *Knowledge-Based Systems*, **2019**, 171: 93-105.
- 17. Chang, L.L., Fu, C., Zhu, W., Liu, W.-Y., Belief rule mining using the evidential reasoning rule for medical diagnosis. *International Journal of Approximate Reasoning*, **2021**, 130: 273-291.
- 18. Yang, L.H., Wang, S., Ye, F.F., Liu, J., Wang, Y.M., Hu, H., Environmental investment prediction using extended belief rule-based system and evidential reasoning rule. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, **2021**, 289: 1-19.
- 19. Mohamad, Y.N., Said, R., Hook, L.S., Do cost of training, education level and R&D investment matter towards influencing labour Productivity? *Journal Ekonomi Malaysia*, **2014**, 48: 133-142.
- 20. Chen, L., Wang, Y.-M., Lai, F.-J., Feng, F., An investment analysis for China's sustainable development based on inverse data envelopment analysis. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, **2017**, 142: 1638-1649.
- 21. Ye, F.F., Yang, L.H., Wang, Y.M., Fuzzy rule based system with feature extraction for environmental governance cost prediction. *Journal of Intelligent & Fuzzy Systems*, **2019**, 37(2): 2337-2349.
- 22. Ye, F.F., Yang, L.H., Wang, Y.M., Cost forecast method of environmental governance based on input-output relationship and efficiency. *Control and Decision*, **2020**, 35(4): 993-1003.
- 23. Kujal, P., Juan, R., Cost effectiveness of R&D and strategic trade policy. *Documentos de trabajo del Banco de España*, 2007, 1: 9-50.
- 24. Martínez, N. A., García, C. E., Innovation performance feedback and technological alliance portfolio diversity: The moderating role of firms' R&D intensity. *Research Policy*, **2021**, 50(9):21-35.
- 25. Zhao, B. Strategic Policy on the Development of Higher Education in China. Learning & Education, 2020, 9(4):22-32.
- 26. Fomby, P., KravitzWirtz, N., Family Systems and Parents' Financial Support for Education in Early Adulthood. *Demography*, **2019**, 56(5): 1875-1897.
- 27. Jeanette, F., Kristinn, H., Social origin and the financial feasibility of going to university: the role of wage penalties and availability of funding. *Studies in Higher Education*, **2019**, 44(11): 2025-2040.
- 28. Andrew D., Colegrave-Margaret J. Giles., School cost functions: A meta-regression analysis. *Economics of Education Review*, **2007**, 27(6): 688-696.
- 29. Zheng, W. X., Profit Expectation, Cost Perception, Risk Assessment, and Decision-making for the Integration of Industry and Education. *Frontiers in Sustainable Development*, **2021**, 1(3):1-15.
- 30. Zhao, X. J., An Analysis of College Education Cost Accounting under the New Government Accounting System. *Frontiers in Educational Research*, **2020**, 3(14): 1-20.
- 31. Gao, B., Discussion on The Accounting Method of Students' Education Cost in Colleges and Universities. *International Journal of Education and Economics*, **2020**, 3(2): 22-37.
- Pouragha, B., Arasteh, M. T.,Zarei, E., Abdolahi, M., Sheikhbardsiri, H., Cost analysis of education for students in the School of Health of Alborz University of Medical Sciences: An application of activity-based costing technique. *Journal of education and health promotion*, 2020, 9: 165-165.
- Saura J. R., Ribeiro-Soriano D., Palacios-Matques D., From user-generated data to data-driven innovation: A research agenda to understand user privacy in digital markets. *International Journal of Information Management*, 2021, 60: 1-13.
- 34. Ribeiro-Navarrete S., Saura J.R., Palacios-Marques D., Towards a new era of mass data collection: Assessing pandemic surveillance technologies to preserve user privacy. *Technological Forecasting & Social Change*, **2021**, 167: 1-14.

585

586

587

588

589

590

591

592

593

594

595

596

597

598

599

600

601

602

603

604

605

606

607

608

609

610

611

612

613

614

615

616

617

618

619

620

621

622

623

624

625

626

627

628

629

630

636