EDUCATION POLICY ANALYSIS: EFFECTIVENESS AND EFFICIENCY OF TNI EMPOWERMENT AS TEACHERS IN 3 T AREA (FRONTIER, REMOTE, UNDERDEVELOPED)

Muhammad Khairul Rijal, Fatur Rahman

IAIN Samarinda rijalforza@gmail.com

ABSTRAK

The many problems of education in Indonesia, need fast and right efforts from the government, especially policyholders in the education sector. The dynamic world of education requires the presence of effective and efficient education policies. One of the problems of education in Indonesia is the implementation of education in "3 T" Areas (Frontier, Remote, And Underdeveloped), where there is a shortage of teachers. To solve that problem, the ministry of education and culture create "Maju Bersama Mencerdaskan Indonesia Program" (MBMI) where one of the program contents is empowerment the bachelor's degree to teach in 3 T areas. Certainly, this is a short-term solution, because they become teachers only one year in that area. Not only that, but the government also empowers the army as the teacher in 3 T areas. Empowerment of the army as the teacher leaves a problem about the function of the army in army and police laws. Furthermore, the professionalism of the army as the teacher is doubtful. How much effectiveness and efficiency this policy will try to analyze with SWOT analysis.

Keywords: Education policy, army teaching, 3 T areas

INTRODUCTION

There are so many educational problems in Indonesia, from student problems, teacher problems, education provider institution problems, to policy issues in the field of education. As is well known, a bureaucratic policy is an important area that must be harmonized in carrying out the wheels of education. This is because these factors are given a special mandate that can affect the quality and quantity of education which is one of the benchmarks for the progress of a nation (Maria, Silpiya, and Rijal 2018). Of the many problems in the field of education are the problems of education in the 3 T area. namely the frontier. remote. underdeveloped areas. The mandate of the 1945 Constitution Article 31 paragraph 1 clearly states that "Every citizen has the right to education". However, if we look at the process of education in the 3T area, we will find that there are many problems, from the problem of teacher shortages, educational facilities and infrastructure that do not yet support the learning process, inadequate

learning media, and the quality of teachers that are still below standard. the cause of education in the 3T area seems far behind.

Education policies to break the education gap between 3 T areas and urban areas continue to be created by the government, especially policymakers in the field of National education. This effort was made to equalize the quality of education in Indonesia. However, it must be noted that various educational policies will be born when the essence of an educational process is interpreted correctly. Fatal mistakes will be born from mistakes in interpreting the essence of the educational process because the development of human life itself is related to the educational process. Among the meanings of the educational process itself is to see education as a process of empowerment. Furthermore, if we examine more deeply the educational process, it will be clear that the close relationship between education and power does not mean that power is negative, if without the power factor the educational process itself might never have happened. However, the

suppression of human rights, so that they become helpless human beings often occurs due to the factor of power that continues without limits. (H.A.R Tilaar dan Riant Nugroho 2012) Changes in power in a country also often lead to changes in policies. that is already running. So that a program or policy that is already good sometimes has to stop halfway because of a change of power.

The policy can not only be understood as a purely technical - administrative issue, but also as a political issue. Because it is related to the use of power. The public policy takes place in a certain power setting. This means that there are parties in power and parties in control. (Santoso 2010) Usually, policy analysis can be carried out by those in power, but this analysis may be carried out by those in control. In an authoritarian government, where policy decisions are assumed to be the prerogative of the ruler, policy analysts do tend to position themselves as rulers or accomplices in power. (Nugroho 2007) However, in a democracy, where citizens or people are positioned as holders of sovereignty, the analysis must be done in this position. Policy analysis as a frame of mind has actually existed for a long time in the history of human life. Quoting Duncan MacRae who defines policy analysis as an applied social science discipline that uses rational argumentation by using facts to explain, assess, and generate thoughts to solve public problems. " In this case policy analysis is a method or procedure of using a human understanding of something and to solve a policy problem (Puji Hastuti 2018)

What needs to be understood in educational policy theory is that policy in the world of education is part of public policy. The consequence of education policy which is understood as part of public policy is that education policy must be congruent with public policy. Therefore policies in the education sector are used to achieve the goals of nation-state development in the field of education, as part of the overall development goals of the nationstate. (Nugroho 2013) The aspect of education, which is a study of educational management, is public goods, not private goods. In this context, education is public property (public) goods and services, in which the community has the right to get education and teaching (Article 31 UUD 1945), and education is the government's obligation to implement it, especially its fundamental role in providing learning opportunities. Because education is a public good, education policy studies should be included in the perspective of public policy in the

dimensions of multidisciplinary education management studies (Sutapa 2008).

Education as an effort to form an intellectual. mental, and spiritual presence must really be felt by the community. So that in formulating education policy, it is necessary to involve elements of society in its formulation as an important element in the success of education. (BPPN dan Bank Dunia 1991) And one of the weak points of education policy in Indonesia today is due to weak analysis in the development of National Education. heterogeneous Indonesian society consisting of many ethnic groups and languages demands the presence of an educational policy that can be felt by all components of the nation's children. Of course, this is quite difficult to do considering that Indonesia is a maritime country where Indonesia's geographic location consists of many islands, and there are still many areas that are lagging behind in terms of infrastructure and technology. National Education policy holders also need to consider all aspirations, suggestions, and input from elements of society that represent Indonesia's heterogeneity, especially in this case, areas that are lagging behind in education problems. The greater the educational aspirations of people in remote areas, the higher the level of educational participation in those areas. Because the aspirations of education from the community, especially in disadvantaged areas, are born from a concern and hope for the National Education System that can accommodate their educational aspirations. It can be concluded that the implementation of education in remote areas is influenced by the aspirations of education in the local community (Kalismaya 2017) So that by absorbing educational aspirations in society, the balance and equity of education in Indonesia can be realized properly and optimally.

One of the government policies regarding the delivery of education in the 3 T area is the empowerment of the TNI (Indonesian National Army) to teach. Due to the lack of teaching staff in the 3T areas, many soldiers assigned to remote areas often had to replace the civilian apparatus who were supposed to serve there. Many soldiers are found teaching staff in schools in the interior of Papua, due to the absence of teachers who are supposed to be on duty there. (Ma'arif 2014) The policy of empowering the TNI to teach in remote areas has drawn pros and cons among experts and expert. Lokataru Human Rights Law Office Director Haris Azhar criticized the Ministry of Education and Culture's policy of cooperating with the TNI to teach

in remote areas. According to Haris, Kemendikbud cannot ask the TNI for assistance. Apart from the rule of law. Haris also highlighted the ethics that should be filled in teaching posts carried out by teachers with civilian status. Meanwhile, according to the Director General (Dirjen) of the Ministry of Education and Culture's GTK, Supriano, this cooperation is motivated by the existence of areas that are difficult to access for ordinary teachers. while the needs of students are available. Therefore, to be able to measure the effectiveness and efficiency of empowering the TNI as teachers in the 3 T area, it is necessary to carry out a policy analysis so that it can become a reference source for National Education policy makers in implementing strategic steps related to the National Education Policy, especially in the process of equalization. education in the 3 T areas.

METHOD

The research method used is analytical research or what is called noninteractive inquiry, where documents are analyzed and studied in depth. Existing data are collected, identified, analyzed, then synthesized, for the interpretation of various concepts and policies. The data that has been collected does not go through an interactive process or without interacting with human data sources, but rather through data sources in the form of documents. (Sukmadinata 2015) The research approach used in this study is a descriptive approach. qualitative research Descriptive qualitative research method is a method used to find knowledge of research subjects at a certain time. Descriptive research is research that is intended to collect information about research subjects and the behavior of research subjects in a certain period. Descriptive qualitative research seeks to describe all existing symptoms or conditions, namely the state of the symptoms according to what they were when the research was conducted (Mukhtar 2013).

This research is normative in nature where secondary data (library) is inventoried and analyzed (content analysis). Secondary data consists of primary materials in the form of statutory regulations and strategic variables from the education policy for the empowerment of the TNI as teachers in 3 T areas. Researchers will identify factors that influence internal conditions including strengths weaknesses. Likewise, the researcher will identify external environmental factors including opportunities and threats. After the external and internal factors can be compiled, an analysis of internal and external factors will be carried out which is often referred to as a SWOT analysis of the education policy for the empowerment of the TNI as teachers in 3 T areas. The results of the SWOT analysis are obtained after recapitulating the IFAS (Internal Factor Analysis Strategy) calculations.) and the calculation of EFAS (external factor analysis strategy) by taking into account the weight and rating values (Rangkuti 2006)

The following table shows the form of a SWOT analysis and how to develop it. (Kementerian Agama Direktorat Jendral Kelembagaan Agama Islam 2004)

IFAS EFAS	STRENGTHS (S)	WEAKNESSES (W)
OPPORTUNITIES(O)	(I) SO Strategy Using strength to seize opportunities	(2) WO Strategy Overcoming weaknesses by taking advantage of opportunities
THREAT (T)	(3) ST Strategy Use strength to face threats	(4) WT Strategy Hiding weaknesses to face threats

Table 1. SWOT Analysis Matrix

Catatan:

- 1. EFAS: External Factor Analysis Summary
- 2. IFAS: Internal Faktor Analisis Summary

By paying attention to the results of the SWOT analysis, it can be concluded how much efficient and effective the empowerment of the TNI as teachers in the 3 T area. According to Thompson, the SWOT analysis is simple but is a very powerful tool to increase capabilities and determine the inefficiency of organizational resources, the opportunity for outside and external threats for a better future. Meanwhile, according to Fred David, SWOT analysis is a strategic planning method that functions to evaluate the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats of a program. This process involves determining the specific goals of speculation and identifying internal and external factors that support and do not achieve these goals (R David 2006).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Identify IFAS (Internal Factor Analysis Strategy) and EFAS (external factor analysis strategy)

The strategic variables of the education policy for empowering the TNI as teachers in area 3 T are identified so that factors that influence internal conditions can be identified, including strengths and weaknesses. Likewise, external environmental factors include opportunities and threats. Then these factors will be given weight and assessment so that it can be seen which factors have the most influence and which factors have the least influence. Weighing and assessing external and internal environmental factors will make it easier to identify strategic factors that have a positive impact (strengths and opportunities) and those that have a negative impact (weaknesses and threats).

Table 2. IFAS Values and Weights

Variable	5	4	3	2	1	Assessment	Weight	
Strength								
1. TNI human resources are able to reach the 3 T.	X					5	0,31	
2. The management and development of human resources in the TNI organization is very good.	X					5	0,31	
3. Provision of Competency Strengthening in the Learning Process in the Classroom by the Ministry of Education and Culture.				х		2	0,12	
Weakness								
1. The empowerment of the TNI as teachers is not in accordance with the TNI / Polri Law.				X		2	0,12	
2. The competence of the TNI to teach is questionable.					X	1	0,06	
3. Short time for teaching competency training by the Ministry of National Education.					X	1	0,06	
Total					16	1		

Source: Data processing

Weight : <u>Assessment</u> X 1 Total Rating

Weight: 5/16 x 1 = 0, 31 Weight: 4/16 x 1 = 0, 25 Weight: 3/16 x 1 = 0,18 Weight: 2/16 x 1= 0,12 Weight 1 / 16 x 1= 0,06 From table 2 above, it can be seen that three components are closely related to the strength variable of the TNI empowerment education policy as teachers in the 3 T area, namely:

1) The first component is the human resources owned by the TNI who can reach the 3 T area with an

- assessment of 5 and the weighted calculation processed is 0.31.
- 2) The second component of management and human resource development in the TNI is very good with a rating of 5 and obtains a calculation weight of 0.31.
- 3) The third component is obtaining provision in strengthening teaching competencies from the Ministry of Education and Culture with a rating of 2 and a weight of 0.12.

And it can also be seen in the table above that three components are related to the variable weaknesses in the education policy for the empowerment of the TNI as teachers in the 3 T area, namely:

- 1) The first component is the policy to empower the TNI as teachers in the 3 T area, which is not following the duties and functions of the TNI in the TNI / Polri Law with a rating of 2 and a weight of 0.12.
- 2) The second component is the questionable teaching competence of TNI members with a value of 1 and the weight of the processed assessment of 0.06.
- 3) The third component is the short time the teaching competency is provided for members of the TNI who will serve in the 3 T area with an assessment of 1 and a calculation weight of 0.06.

Table 3. EFAS Value and Weight

	Variable	5	4	3	2	1	Assessment	Weight
Opportunity								
1.	Opening access to education, especially in the 3 T.	X					5	0,21
2.	Effective and efficient policies.			X			3	0,13
3.	Strengthen the character education of love for the country in the 3 T.		X				4	0,17
4.	Building a positive image of the TNI in society.		X				4	0,17
Threat								
1.	The teacher education profession is under threat.			X			3	0,13
2.	The dual function of the TNI in the 3T area weakens the border security function.				X		2	0,08
3.	The education management function in the 3 T area is not optimal.		X				4	0,17
4.	Not in line with the implementation of the teacher certification policy.				X		2	0,08
	Total						23	1

Source: Data processing

Weight : <u>Assessment</u> X 1 Total Rating

Weight: $5/32 \times 1 = 0.21$ Weight: $4/32 \times 1 = 0.17$

Weight: $3/32 \times 1 = 0.13$ Weight: $2/32 \times 1 = 0.08$

Weight $1/32 \times 1 = 0.04$

From table 3 above, it can be seen that there are four components that are closely related to the opportunity variable for the empowerment

education policy of the TNI as teachers in the 3 T area, namely:

- 1) The first component is to open access to education, especially in the 3 T. area with an assessment of 5 and the weighted calculation processed is 0.21.
- 2) The second component of an effective and efficient policy with a rating of 3 and obtaining a calculation weight of 0.13.
- 3) The third component is strengthening the character education of love for the country in the 3 T. area with a rating of 4 and a weight of 0.17.

4) The fourth component is to build a positive image of the TNI in the community, with an assessment of 4 and the weighted calculation processed by 0.17.

And it can also be seen in table 3 above that there are four components that are related to the threat variable to the education policy for the empowerment of the TNI as teachers in the 3 T area, namely:

1) The first component is that the teacher education profession is threatened with a rating of 3 and a weight of 0.13.

- 2) The second component is the dual function of the TNI in the 3 T area weakens the function of border security with a value of 2 and the weight of the processed assessment of 0.08.
- 3) The third component is that the education management function in the 3 T area is not running optimally with an assessment of 4 and a calculation weight of 0.17.
- 4) The fourth component is that this policy is not in line with the implementation of the teacher certification policy with a rating of 2 and a weight of 0.08.

Table 4.IFAS (Internal Factor Analysis Summary)

Variable	Weight	Rating	Weight x Rating
Strength			
1. TNI human resources are able to reach the 3 T.	0,31	5	1,55
2. The management and development of human resources in the TNI organization is very good.	0,31	5	1,55
3. Provision of Competency Strengthening in the Learning Process in the Classroom by the Ministry of Education and Culture.	0,12	2	0,24
Weakness			
1. The empowerment of the TNI as teachers is not in accordance with the TNI / Polri Law.	0,12	2	0,24
2. The competence of the TNI to teach is questionable.	0,06	1	0,06
3. Short time for teaching competency training by the Ministry of National Education.	0,06	1	0,06
Total	1		3,7

Information:

Rating for strength (Strength):

Value 1: has very little positive effect

Score 2: has a small positive effect

Value 3: has a neutral effect

Value 4: has a big positive influence

Value 5: has a very large positive influence

Rating for weakness (Weaknes):

Value 1: has a very large negative effect

Value 2: has a large negative effect

Value 3: has a neutral effect

Value 4: has a small negative effect

Value 5: has very little negative effect

If we pay attention to table 4 above, it can be concluded that the internal factor in the form of the strength variable of the education policy, namely

the empowerment of the TNI as teachers in the 3 T area gets an average score of 4, which means it has a large positive influence. So it can be concluded that all the strength variables possessed by the TNI can be used to streamline and streamline government policies in the education sector related to the empowerment of the TNI as teachers in the 3 T area. 1.4 that means it has a very large negative influence. So it is concluded that the weak point of the education policy, namely the empowerment of the TNI as teachers in the 3T area needs more attention from the government.

Table 5. EFAS (External Factor Analysis Summary)

Variable	Weight	Rating	Weight x Rating
Opportunity			
1. Opening access to education, especially in the 3 T.	0,21	5	1,05
2. Effective and efficient policies.	0,13	3	0,39
3. Strengthen the character education of love for the country in the 3 T.	0,17	4	0,68
4. Building a positive image of the TNI in society.	0,17	4	0,68
Threat			
1. The teacher education profession is under threat.	0,13	3	0,39
2. The dual function of the TNI in the 3T area weakens the border security		2	0,16
function.			
3. The education management function in the 3 T area is not optimal.	0,17	4	0,68
4. Not in line with the implementation of the teacher certification policy.	0,08	2	0,16
Total	1		4,19

Information:

Ratings for Opportunities (Opportunities)

Value 1: has very little positive effect

Score 2: has a small positive effect

Value 3: has a neutral effect

Value 4: has a big positive influence

Value 5: has a very large positive influence

Rating for threats (Threath)

Value 1: has a very large negative effect

Value 2: has a large negative effect

Value 3: has a neutral effect

Value 4: has a small negative effect

Value 5: has very little negative effect

By looking at table 5, it can be concluded that the external factor in the form of an opportunity variable from the education policy, namely the empowerment of the TNI as teachers in the 3 T area gets an average value of 4, which means it has a large positive influence. So it can be concluded that all the opportunity variables owned by the TNI can be used to streamline and streamline government policies in the education sector related to empowering the TNI as teachers in the 3 T area. 2.75 that means it has a neutral effect. So it can be concluded that the point of threat from the education policy, namely the empowerment of the TNI as teachers in the 3T area has a large negative potential.

From the results of previous research conducted by Almasdi Syahza on the development model of underdeveloped areas, it was concluded that the classic problems of poverty that occur, especially in disadvantaged areas, are caused by weak human resources and weak social services for the community, especially access to health and education. So, one of the strategies implemented to develop underdeveloped areas is to improve social service programs in the education and health sectors. (Riau 2012) The government through

the Ministry of Education and Culture has implemented a program of accelerating and equitable education in 3T areas including undergraduate teaching programs in 3T areas. (SM3T) by sending undergraduate teacher students to serve one year in the 3T area. The results of research conducted by Saiful Ridlo stated that only 36% of PPG-SM3T students stated that they wanted to return to the 3T area after their teaching period was over, provided that after 3-5 years they had to return to Java. (Ridlo 2014)

To anticipate the shortage of teachers in the 3T area, one of the government policies related to the delivery of education in the 3T area is the empowerment of the TNI (Indonesian National Army) to teach. The education policy for the empowerment of the TNI to teach in 3T areas must be really able to participate in strengthening social services, especially in the field of education as one of the steps to develop disadvantaged areas. clearly described what opportunities and threats are faced by this education policy combined with its strengths and weaknesses.

Table 6. SWOT matrix

IFAS STRENGTHS (S) WEAKNESSES (W) 1. TNI human resources are able to 1. The empowerment of the TNI as reach the 3 T. teachers is not in accordance with 2. The management and the TNI / Polri Law. development of human resources The competence of the TNI to in the TNI organization is very Short time for teaching good. 3. Provision of Competency competency training by the Strengthening in the Learning Ministry of National Education. Process in the Classroom by the Ministry of Education and Culture. **EFAS** OPPORTUNITIES(O) (I) SO STRATEGY OPPORTUNITIES (2) WO Strategy Overcoming weaknesses by taking Using strength to seize opportunities 1. Opening access to advantage of opportunities education, especially in the Selecting TNI members who 2. Effective and (3-1) Preparing the optimal duration efficient will serve in the 3T area by policies in terms of human taking into account teacher of time in debriefing the resources and costs. qualifications / competencies. strengthening of the teaching Conducting a comparative competence of the TNI. 3. Strengthen the character (2-2)study of the budget for the education of love for the country in the 3 T. empowerment of the TNI to teach in the 3T area with the 4. Building a positive image sending of professional teachers. of the TNI in society. (2-3) Packaging alternative learning content with the main theme / roadmap of love for the country which is much needed in border areas THREAT (T) (3) ST Strategi (4) WT Strategi Use strength to face threats Hiding weaknesses to face threats 1. The teacher education profession is under threat. 2. The dual function of the (1-1/4) Revise the TNI Law No.34 (1-1/3) Involving teachers to serve TNI in the 3T area in the 3T area under the of 2004 Article 7 concerning the weakens the border coordination of the Ministry main duties of the TNI paragraph 2 b security function. of Education and Culture to point 9 concerning assisting the education 3. The participate in fostering and duties of the regional government by management function in synergizing with the TNI on including an explanation of helping the 3 T area is not optimal. education in 3T areas which lack duty in the 3T area. 4. Not in line with the Increase TNI personnel in the teachers. implementation of the 3T area with additional teacher certification teaching competency policy. qualifications.

If you look at the results of the SWOT matrix table, strategies that can be taken to realize effective and efficient education policies

in the 3T area by empowering the TNI as teachers include utilizing the strengths possessed by the TNI to maximize existing opportunities.

Not only that, another strategy that can be applied is to overcome the weaknesses that are owned by the existing opportunities. In addition, the next strategy is to use existing strengths to face threats and hide weaknesses to face threats. For more details, some of these strategies are described as follows:

SO STRATEGY OPPORTUNITIES Using strength to seize opportunities

- (1-2) Selecting TNI members who will serve in the 3T area by taking into account teacher qualifications / competencies.
- (2-3) Conducting a comparative study of the budget for the empowerment of the TNI to teach in the 3T area with the sending of professional teachers.
- (2-3) Packaging alternative learning content with the main theme / roadmap of love for the country which is much needed in border areas.

WO Strategy

Overcoming weaknesses by taking advantage of opportunities

(3-1) Preparing the optimal duration of time in debriefing the strengthening of the teaching competence of the TNI.

ST Strategi

Use strength to face threats

- (1-1/3) Involving teachers to serve in the 3T area under the coordination of the Ministry of Education and Culture to participate in fostering and synergizing with the TNI on duty in the 3T area.
- (2-3) Increase TNI personnel in the 3T area with additional teaching competency qualifications.

WT Strategi

Hiding weaknesses to face threats (1-1/4) Revise the TNI Law No.34 of 2004 Article 7 concerning the main duties of the TNI paragraph 2 b point 9 concerning assisting the duties of the regional government by including an explanation of helping education in 3T areas which lack teachers.

CONCLUSION

To realize an effective and efficient education policy in the 3T area by empowering the TNI as teachers, several strategic steps can be taken which are recommendations to stakeholders related to education, including:

- 1) Selecting TNI members who will serve in the 3T area by taking into account teacher qualifications / competencies.
- 2) Conducting a comparative study of the budget for the empowerment of the TNI to teach in the 3T area with the sending of professional teachers.
- Packaging alternative learning content with the main theme / roadmap of love for the country which is much needed in border areas.
- 4) Preparing the optimal duration of time in debriefing the strengthening of the teaching competence of the TNI.
- 5) Involving teachers to serve in the 3T area under the coordination of the Ministry of Education and Culture to participate in fostering and synergizing with the TNI on duty in the 3T area.
- 6) Increase TNI personnel in the 3T area with additional teaching competency qualifications.
- 7) Revise the TNI Law No.34 of 2004
 Article 7 concerning the main duties of the TNI paragraph 2 b point 9 concerning assisting the duties of the regional government by including an explanation of helping education in 3T areas which lack teachers.

REFERENCES

- BPPN dan Bank Dunia. 1991. "School Best Manajemen." Jakarta: BPPN dan Bank Dunia.
- H.A.R Tilaar dan Riant Nugroho. 2012. "Pengantar Untuk Memahami Kebijakan Pendidikan Dan Kebijakan Pendidikan Sebagai Kebijakan Publik." Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Kalismaya, Irvandra. 2017. "Aspirasi Pendidikan Masyarakat, Di Daerah Terpencil Desa Bugelan, Kismantoro, Wonogiri." Jurnal Kebijakan Pendidikan Edisi 3 Vol.VI.
- Kementerian Agama Direktorat Jendral Kelembagaan Agama Islam. 2004. "Visi, Misi, Dan Strategi Pembinaan Madrasah." Jakarta: Jurnal MP3A.
- Ma'arif, Syamsul. 2014. "Prajurit Profesional-Patriot - Menuju Tni Profesional Pada Era Reformasi." Jurnal Sosiologi Masyarakat, Vol. 19, No. 2.
- Maria, Dewi, Silpiya Silpiya, Muhammad Khairul Rijal. 2018. "Kesenjangan Birokrasi Pendidikan Menuai Tanya Di Mata Publik." Tarbivah Wa Ta'lim: Jurnal Pendidikan Penelitian Dan Pembelajaran. https://doi.org/10.21093/twt.v5i3.220
- Mukhtar. 2013. "Metode Praktis Penelitian Deskriptif Kualitatif." Jakarta: Referensi.

- Nugroho, Riant. 2007. "Analisis Kebijakan." Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- ——. 2013. "Kebijakan Pendidikan Yang Unggul." Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Puji Hastuti, Tri dan Soehartono. 2018. "Kebijakan Pendidikan Di Tinjau Dari Segi Hukum Kebijakan Publik." Jurnal Jurisprudence edisi No.1, Vol.8.
- R David, Fred. 2006. "Manajemen Strategik." Jakarta: Salemba Empat.
- Rangkuti, Freddy. 2006. "Analisis SWOT Teknik Membedah Kasus Bisnis." Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Riau, Propinsi. 2012. "MODEL PENGEMBANGAN DAERAH TERTINGGAL PEDESAAN DI KABUPATEN KEPULAUAN MERANTI Pendahuluan," 1–23.
- Ridlo, Saiful. 2014. "Lembaran Ilmu Kependidikan" 43 (2): 94–102.
- Santoso, Purwo. 2010. "Analisis Kebijakan Publik." Yogyakarta: Research Center for Politics and Government Jurusan Politik dan Pemerintahan Universitas Gadjah Mada.
- Sukmadinata, Nana Syaodih. 2015. "Metode Penelitian Pendidikan." Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Sutapa, Mada. 2008. "Kebijakan Pendidikan Dalam Perspektif Kebijakan Publik." Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan edisi no.2, Vol. IV.