A lithium isotope perspective on the carbon and silicon cycles evolution

1 2

_				
3	Boriana Kalderon-Asael ¹ , Joachim A. R. Katchinoff ¹ , Noah J. Planavsky ^{1*} , Ashleigh v.S.			
4	Hood ² , Mathieu Dellinger ³ , Eric J. Bellefroid ¹ , David S. Jones ⁴ , Axel Hofmann ⁵ , Frantz Ossa			
5	Ossa ^{5,6} , Francis A. Macdonald ⁷ , Chunjiang Wang ⁸ , Terry T. Isson ¹ , Jack G. Murphy ⁹ , John A.			
6	Higgins ⁹ , A. Joshua West ¹⁰ , Malcolm W. Wallace ² , Dan Asael ¹ , Philip A. E. Pogge von			
7	Strandmann ^{11,12*}			
8				
9	¹ Yale University, Department of Geology and Geophysics, New Haven, C T 06511, USA			
10	² The University of Melbourne, School of Earth Sciences, Parkville, VIC, 3010, Australia			
11	³ Durham University, Department of Geography, South Road, Durham, DH1 3LE, United			
12	Kingdom			
13	⁴ Amherst College Geology Department, 11 Barrett Hill Road, Amherst, Massachusetts 01002,			
14	USA			
15	5 Department of Geology, University of the Johannesburg, Johannesburg 2092, South Africa			
16	⁶ Department of Geosciences, University of Tuebingen, 72074 Tuebingen, Germany			
17	⁷ University of California Santa Barbara, Department of Earth Sciences, Santa Barbara, CA			
18	93106, USA			
19	⁸ China University of Petroleum, College of Geosciences, 18 Fuxue Road, Changping District,			
20	Beijing 102249, China			
21	⁹ Princeton University, Department of Geoscience, Princeton, NJ 08544, USA			
22	¹⁰ University of Southern California, Department of Earth Sciences, 3651 Trousdale Pkwy, Los			
23	Angeles, CA 90089, USA			
24	¹¹ London Geochemistry and Isotope Centre (LOGIC), Institute of Earth and Planetary Sciences,			
25	University College London and Birkbeck, University of London, Gower Street, London WC1E			
26	6BT, UK			
27	¹² Institute of Geosciences, Johannes Gutenberg University, 55122 Mainz, Germany			
28				
29				
30	*Corresponding authors: noah.planavsky@yale.edu; <u>p.strandmann@ucl.ac.uk;</u>			
31	boriana.kalderon-asael@yale.edu;			
32				

The evolution of the global carbon and silicon cycles are thought to have contributed to the long-term stability of the Earth's climate^{1–3}. Many questions remain, however, 35 regarding the feedback mechanisms at play and more quantitative constraints on the sources and sinks of these elements in the Earth's surface environments are lacking⁴⁻¹². 36 37 Here we argue that the lithium isotope system can be used to track processes controlling 38 the long-term carbon and silicon cycles. Based on the analysis of over 600 shallow-water 39 marine carbonate samples from 101 stratigraphic units, we construct a new carbonate 40 lithium isotope record spanning the past 3 billion years. The data suggest an increase in 41 the carbonate lithium isotope values over time, which we propose was driven by long-term 42 changes in the lithium isotopic conditions of seawater rather than changes in the 43 alterations of older samples. Based on a mass balance modelling approach, we propose 44 that the observed trend in lithium isotope values reflects a transition from the 45 Precambrian carbon and silicon cycles to those more similar to the present day. We 46 speculate that this transition may be linked to a shift to a biologically controlled marine silicon cycle and the radiation of land plants^{13,14}. 47

48

49 Earth has maintained a clement climate for the vast majority of the past 3.5 billon years, despite 50 large changes in solar luminosity, atmospheric oxygen concentrations, and crustal evolution¹. 51 Climate stability has allowed for Earth's persistent habitation and proliferation of complex life 52 over billion-year time scales. Feedbacks within the coupled carbon (C) and silicon (Si) cycles 53 maintain this stability by regulating atmospheric carbon dioxide levels², as exemplified by the 54 continental silicate weathering feedback which removes atmospheric carbon dioxide during continental weathering and transfers silicon to the ocean. This climate dependent mechanism is 55 the most commonly invoked process stabilizing Earth's long-term climate^{2,3}. 56

57

58 The idea that the terrestrial silicate weathering feedback played the dominant role in climate regulation through Earth's history has been challenged in the last decade^{4,5}. For example, there 59 have been several recent suggestions that sedimentary and hydrothermal processes in the marine 60 realm strongly affected atmospheric carbon dioxide levels earlier in Earth's history^{6–9}. It has 61 62 been proposed that extensive authigenic clay formation in marine sediments (reverse weathering) in Si-rich oceans was a key factor leading to a warm climate through most of 63 Earth's history^{8,10}. In this view, the evolutionary radiation of siliceous organisms (sponges, 64 65 radiolarians, and later diatoms) forced a drop in dissolved marine Si levels and hence a marked 66 decrease in the extent of reverse weathering. There has also been extensive debate about whether, how, and when land plants transformed the silicate weathering feedback^{11,12}. 67

68 Disagreement on fundamental aspects of the long-term C cycle demands new empirical records

- 69 that provide constraints on the evolution of the C and Si cycles over geological time.
- 70

71 The Li isotope system can be used to track processes controlling the long-term C and Si cycles. 72 Seawater Li isotope values are strongly influenced by the global extent and dominant modes of clay formation and therefore can be used to determine global weathering regimes¹⁵. Lithium in 73 the crust is predominantly found in silicate minerals and the largest Li isotope fractionations 74 75 occur during the low-temperature formation of secondary silicate minerals—largely clays. Clay minerals preferentially incorporate the lighter Li isotope (⁶Li), leaving residual waters enriched 76 in the heavier isotope (⁷Li)¹⁶. Clay formation occurs on land during incongruent silicate 77 weathering and in the oceans during off-axis seafloor alteration and during reverse weathering 78 79 in sediments. Therefore, clay formation in the marine and terrestrial realms has the potential to 80 drive the dissolved seawater Li isotope signature towards values heavier than the average crust (crustal value is $\sim 0\%$; Ref. 17)^{15,16,18,19}. Tracking clay formation and its link to continental and 81 82 marine weathering processes, the Li isotope system is a powerful tool for investigating the long-83 term controls of the C and Si cycles.

84

Given that carbonates can be a reliable archive of seawater $\delta^7 \text{Li}^{18,20,21}$, we generated a new carbonate Li isotope record through Earth's history. We analysed over 600 shallow-water marine carbonate samples from 101 stratigraphic units that range in age from 3.0 Ga to the modern (Fig. 1 and SI Tables 1 and 2). Our sampling focused on micritic carbonates but also included grainstones, reef cements, microbialites, and brachiopods. Samples were selected using a combination of standard and cathodoluminescence petrography (see SI for additional information on sampling protocols and selected units).

92

A major concern with all carbonate-based proxies is whether the samples record primary signals 93 or if they have been overprinted²². The Li isotopic composition of shallow-water marine 94 95 carbonates in the sedimentary record depends on both the primary mineralogy of the sediment (aragonite vs. calcite) and the type of alteration during early burial²³. Additionally, carbonate 96 97 samples can undergo late-stage alteration. Given potential uncertainties associated with these 98 processes, we tested the extent to which we can reconstruct seawater values from our carbonate 99 record in four ways (see SI). First, we generated a complementary record to our samples from 100 well-preserved early marine cements-the carbonate component that can be most robustly screened for diagenetic alteration in both Phanerozoic and Precambrian rocks²⁴ (see SI Table 1: 101

Supplementary information). Second, to gauge the effects of mineralogy and diagenesis, besides petrology, we analysed all samples for major/minor/trace element ratios. Third, following Ref. 25, we focused our sampling on carbonate units that are not from carbon isotope excursions given that these excursions are interpreted as being a signal for either short-term carbon cycle perturbations or diagenetic events (see SI)^{26,27}. Lastly, a subset of our sample suite was analysed for Ca isotopes, which has emerged as a powerful tracer of the extent and type of diagenetic alteration in shallow-water marine carbonates^{28,29}.

109

110 Our dataset suggests a dramatic change in carbonate Li isotope values through time (Fig. 1 and 111 SI Table 2). Cainozoic and Mesozoic values range from 14.6‰ to 29.5‰ with an average of 112 $23.1\pm 3.8\%$ 1STD (n = 45). This is similar to foraminifer records from the Cainozoic that range from 20.1‰ to 33.7‰ with an average of 25.9±2.7‰ 1STD $(n = 319)^{18,30,31}$. Low carbonate 113 δ^7 Li values persist through most of the Palaeozoic with a mean δ^7 Li = 10.1±4.3‰ 1STD (n = 114 263) (Fig. 1). Precambrian values range from -3.8% to 23.5% but with a mean $\delta^7 Li =$ 115 116 $7.7\pm5.7\%$ 1STD (n = 217). Basic descriptive statistics suggests there are significant shifts in 117 carbonate Li isotope values through time. For instance, a Welch's ANOVA test demonstrates that δ^7 Li values are significantly different (F = 273.6, p < 0.001) for samples from present to 118 end-Mesozoic (0 - 252 Ma, n = 45), from samples spanning the Palaeozoic (252 - 541 Ma, n = 45)119 120 263), and samples spanning the Precambrian (541 - 3,000 Ma, n = 217). Critically, these low 121 values are also found in well-preserved micro-drilled marine cements (Figs. 1, 2). The general 122 trend in the δ' Li record in carbonates resembles, to a first-order approximation, the trend in the 123 carbonate strontium isotope record through time (Fig. 1c).

124

125 Our observed trend in Li isotope values could be a signal of varying extents of alteration or a 126 signal for environmental evolution. However, several lines of evidence are inconsistent with the 127 premise that our carbonate Li isotope record reflects varying extents of alteration. Importantly, the observation that low carbonate δ^7 Li values, relative to modern, persist for the majority of 128 129 Earth's history, even after the data set is screened for detrital contamination and diagenetic 130 tracers, suggests an explanatory mechanism other than only alteration in our samples. Shallow-131 water carbonate Li isotope values are likely to be 0%–10% lighter than coeval seawater values, 132 depending on the original mineralogy and the mode of burial diagenesis (see SI; Ref. 23). Yet, critically, Sr/Ca ratios and $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca analysis can be used to track the burial offset from seawater 133 in shallow-water carbonates^{23,32} (see SI), and there is no evidence for a systematic change in the 134 135 mode of early marine diagenesis through time that could explain the observed $\sim 15\%$ increase

in mean carbonate δ^7 Li values (or *a priori* reason to expect such a change). Additionally, we 136 137 used a suite of commonly employed geochemical filters to constrain primary mineralogy 138 (Sr/Ca, Mg/Ca), track detrital contamination (Al/Ca, Rb/Ca) and diagenetic alteration (Mn/Sr, 139 Pb/Ca) (see SI for further detail). Samples screened using these methods show similar trends in 140 the unscreened Li isotope data (Fig. 1; See SI). Nonetheless, we acknowledge that some units in 141 our study may have experienced late-stage alteration that is not easily screened with typical 142 elemental tracers. Critically, however, late-stage diagenetic alteration appears to result in a shift towards higher $\delta^7 \text{Li}$ values³³, indicating that our carbonate record of lighter values in older 143 samples is unlikely to reflect a diagenetic bias. Building upon previous work on the effects of 144 alteration on the Li isotope system³³, we argue that if detrital contribution can be ruled out, the 145 lower boundary of the δ^7 Li values will most accurately represent seawater evolution. With this 146 framework, the Li isotope record would be interpreted in a similar fashion to the scatter in the 147 148 long-term Sr isotope records (e.g., Ref. 34; Fig. 1d). Further, carbonate cements with 149 exceptionally well-preserved fabrics-samples that could not have undergone extensive 150 alteration after deposition (see Refs. 24,35; Fig. 1)—display the same trend as our larger bulk 151 rock dataset.

152

153 Using our carbonate record, (filtered for detrital contamination, and assuming an offset of 154 4±5‰ from seawater; see SI; following Ref. 23), we were able to reproduce previously estimated Cainozoic (Fig. S14), as well as Mesozoic and Palaeozoic $\delta^7 Li_{SW}$ values (Fig. 1a). 155 Assuming this same offset for Precambrian samples, we estimate Precambrian $\delta^7 Li_{SW}$ values 156 were on average 6-16‰, notably lighter than the modern oceans (31‰; Ref. 36). As with other 157 isotope systems³⁷, it will be critical to verify our reconstructed Li isotope trends in another 158 159 sedimentary archive. Nonetheless, we propose that the most straightforward explanation of our 160 carbonate Li isotope dataset is that there were significant changes in seawater Li isotope values 161 across Earth's history.

162

To evaluate the mechanisms that could be driving long-term changes in seawater Li isotope values, we employed a stochastic mass balance modelling approach (Fig. 3). Specifically, we use an isotope mass balance model to conduct solution space testing. This provides a means of exploring possible configurations of the Li isotope system responsible for the long-term shift that we observe in estimated $\delta^7 \text{Li}_{SW}$ values. In our simulations, we solve Li isotope mass balance at 1 Myr time intervals and allow for a wide range of possible values for high- and lowtemperature hydrothermal fluxes, riverine fluxes, and their isotopic values (Table SI 3). At each time-step, we employ a Monte Carlo routine to re-sample the uniformly distributed key parameters 1,000 times, with acceptable solutions being the ones that match our estimated, error-bounded, Li isotope record (Fig. 3; see SI for the model derivation).

173

With our modelling approach, persistently low $\delta^7 Li_{SW}$ values in the Precambrian (Fig. 3 and 174 175 Figs. S18-23) appear to require changes in terrestrial and marine Li cycling in Earth's past 176 relative to the modern. For instance, the only Earth system (i.e., the prominent combination of 177 Li cycle parameters) that fits our data from the Precambrian (Fig. 3) requires rivers with low Li isotope values ($\delta^7 Li_{Riv} < 10\%$) together with muted isotope fractionation ($\Delta^7 Li < 10\%$) during 178 Li burial in the marine realm through marine authigenic clay formation (maac) and low-179 temperature basalt alteration (lowT). Low Precambrian $\delta^7 Li_{SW}$ could be related to elevated high-180 temperature hydrothermal Li fluxes, which are a source of relatively light Li (~6.3‰; Ref. 38). 181 182 However, most geophysical models show that near modern hydrothermal activity was reached by the Paleoproterozoic³⁹, and some estimates suggest constant hydrothermal heat flux⁴⁰, which 183 184 would lead to approximately constant, long-term hydrothermal Li fluxes. Therefore, consistent 185 with our modelling results, enhanced high-temperature hydrothermal fluxes are likely not 186 responsible for the low $\delta^7 Li_{SW}$ values through most of Earth's history.

187

188 The proliferation and diversification of land plants over much of the Phanerozoic has been hypothesized to have fostered more extensive formation and retention of clay minerals in the 189 terrestrial realm¹³. Our work—which calls for an increase through time in $\delta^7 Li_{Riv}$ values (Fig. 190 3)—supports this idea. There are multiple ways in which plants may have changed weathering, 191 192 but fostering soil development and increasing water-rock interaction times is one way to increase the probability of clay formation¹³. There is some mineralogical evidence that also 193 supports the hypothesis that prior to the rise of land plants there was more limited paedogenic 194 clay mineral formation⁴¹. Weathering regimes may have continued to shift until the rise to 195 dominance of angiosperms at roughly 80 Ma¹⁴. 196

197

Extensive clay formation in the marine sediment column, as has been proposed for the Precambrian^{8,10}, is one obvious way of changing the marine Li cycle. Our prediction of a more limited effective isotope fractionation during Li burial ($\Delta^7 \text{Li}_{\text{maac}}$ and $\Delta^7 \text{Li}_{\text{lowT}}$) earlier in Earth's history can be linked to rapid rates of clay formation, which could have led to high rates of Li uptake and the reaction sites being in restricted contact with the reactant pool (seawater)⁴². For the majority of Earth history, without the presence of Si-biomineralizers, seawater was highly oversaturated with respect to Si phases, which could have resulted in rapid and extensive clay formation⁸. This style of reverse weathering and Li removal is likely to have limited the effective Li isotopic fractionation (see SI; Ref. 42). The progressive decrease in marine Si concentrations over the Phanerozoic⁴³ linked to the transition to a more biologically controlled Si cycle may, therefore, may have driven a shift in seawater Li isotope values.

209

The apparent common occurrence of low $\delta^7 Li_{SW}$ values in the Precambrian and the early 210 211 Palaeozoic, supports the premise that the carbon cycle operated in a fundamentally different 212 mode for the majority of Earth's history compared to the present day. While we cannot use Li 213 isotope values to constrain a single Earth system, our modelling work suggests there was a 214 major shift in clay factories through Earth's history—with a likely increase in clay formation on 215 land and a decrease in clay formation in the oceans. Clay formation is a critical part of the 216 coupled C-Si cycles, suggesting that the mode of climate regulation on Earth has changed 217 dramatically through time. The shift from a Precambrian Earth state to the modern state can 218 likely be attributed to significant biological innovations—the radiation of sponges, radiolarians, 219 diatoms, and land plants. Further, our record suggests that the development of a more modern-220 style carbon cycle tied to these ecological transitions was protracted instead of being marked by 221 step changes.

- 222
- 223 References:
- Jaffrés, J. B. D., Shields, G. A. & Wallmann, K. The oxygen isotope evolution of
 seawater: A critical review of a long-standing controversy and an improved geological
 water cycle model for the past 3.4 billion years. *Earth-Science Rev.* 83, 83–122 (2007).
- Berner, R. A., Lasaga, A. C. & Garrels, R. M. Carbonate-silicate geochemical cycle and its effect on atmospheric carbon dioxide over the past 100 million years. *Am. J. Sci.* 283, 641–683 (1983).
- West, A. J., Galy, A. & Bickle, M. Tectonic and climatic controls on silicate weathering. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 235, 211–228 (2005).
- Isson, T. T. *et al.* Evolution of the global carbon cycle and climate regulation on Earth.
 Global Biogeochem. Cycles 34, 1–28 (2020).
- 5. Hilton, R. G. & West, A. J. Mountains, erosion and the carbon cycle. *Nat. Rev. Earth Environ.* 1, 284–299 (2020).
- Mills, B., Lenton, T. M. & Watson, A. J. Proterozoic oxygen rise linked to shifting
 balance between seafloor and terrestrial weathering. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 111, 9073–
 9078 (2014).
- Coogan, L. A., Gillis, K. M., Pope, M. & Spence, J. The role of low-temperature (off-axis) alteration of the oceanic crust in the global Li-cycle: Insights from the Troodos ophiolite. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 203, 201–215 (2017).
- 8. Isson, T. T. & Planavsky, N. J. Reverse weathering as a long-term stabilizer of marine pH and planetary climate. *Nature* 560, 471–475 (2018).

244	9.	Krissansen-Totton, J. & Catling, D. C. Constraining climate sensitivity and continental
245		versus seafloor weathering using an inverse geological carbon cycle model. <i>Nat</i> .
246		<i>Commun.</i> 8 , 1–15 (2017).
247	10.	Krissansen-Totton, J. & Catling, D. C. A coupled carbon-silicon cycle model over Earth
248		history: Reverse weathering as a possible explanation of a warm mid-Proterozoic climate.
249		Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 537, 116181 (2020).
250	11.	Keller, C. K. & Wood, B. D. Possibility of chemical weathering before the advent of
251		vascular land plants. <i>Nature</i> 364 , 223–225 (1993).
252	12.	Ibarra, D. E. <i>et al.</i> Modeling the consequences of land plant evolution on silicate
253		weathering. Am. J. Sci. 319 , 1–43 (2019).
254	13	McMahon W J & Davies N S Evolution of alluvial mudrock forced by early land
255	10.	plants Science 359 1022–1024 (2018)
256	14	Berner R A & Kothavala Z GEOCARB III. A revised model of atmospheric CO2 over
257	11.	Phanerozoic time Am I Sci 301 182–204 (2001)
258	15	Dellinger M <i>et al</i> Riverine Li isotope fractionation in the Amazon River basin
259	10.	controlled by the weathering regimes <i>Geochim Cosmochim Acta</i> 164 71–93 (2015)
260	16	Vigier N et al Quantifying Li isotope fractionation during smectite formation and
261	10.	implications for the Li cycle <i>Geochim Cosmochim Acta</i> 72 , 780–792 (2008)
261	17	Sauzéat I. Rudnick R. I. Chauvel C. Garcon M. & Tang M. New perspectives on
202	17.	the Li isotonic composition of the upper continental crust and its weathering signature
203		Earth Planat Soi Lett A28 181 102 (2015)
204	10	Lurin Funet. Sci. Leit. 426 , 181–192 (2015). Migra S. & Fraaliah D. N. Lithium isatana history of approximator: Changes in
203	10.	silicate weathering and reverse weathering. Science 225 , 919, 922 (2012)
200	10	Sincate weathering and reverse weathering. Science 555, 818–825 (2012).
207	19.	Pogge von Strandmann, P. A. E. & Henderson, G. M. The Li isotope response to
200	20	mountain upint. Geology 43, $07-70$ (2013).
269	20.	Pogge von Strandmann, P. A. E. <i>et al.</i> Assessing bulk carbonates as archives for seawater
270	21	Li isotope ratios. Chem. Geol. 550, 119538 (2019).
271	21.	washington, K. E. <i>et al.</i> Lithium isotope composition of modern and issilized Cenozoic
272	22	brachlopods. Geology 48, $27-30$ (2020).
2/3	22.	Fantle, M. S., Barnes, B. D. & Lau, K. V. The role of diagenesis in shaping the
2/4		geochemistry of the marine carbonate record. Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 48, 549–583
275	• •	(2020).
276	23.	Dellinger, M. <i>et al.</i> The effects of diagenesis on lithium isotope ratios of shallow marine
277		carbonates. Am. J. Sci. 320 , 150–184 (2020).
278	24.	Hood, A. van S. & Wallace, M. W. Synsedimentary diagenesis in a Cryogenian reef
279		complex: Ubiquitous marine dolomite precipitation. Sediment. Geol. (2012)
280		doi:10.1016/j.sedgeo.2012.02.004.
281	25.	Blättler, C. L. & Higgins, J. A. Testing Urey's carbonate–silicate cycle using the calcium
282		isotopic composition of sedimentary carbonates. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 479, 241–251
283		(2017).
284	26.	Ahm, A. C. et al. An early diagenetic deglacial origin for basal Ediacaran "cap
285		dolostones". Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 506, 292-307 (2019).
286	27.	Hoffman, P. F. & Lamothe, K. G. Seawater-buffered diagenesis, destruction of carbon
287		isotope excursions, and the composition of DIC in Neoproterozoic oceans. Proc. Natl.
288		Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 116, 18874–18879 (2019).
289	28.	Ahm, A. S. C., Bjerrum, C. J., Blättler, C. L., Swart, P. K. & Higgins, J. A. Quantifying
290		early marine diagenesis in shallow-water carbonate sediments. Geochim. Cosmochim.
291		<i>Acta</i> 236 , 140–159 (2018).
292	29.	Higgins, J. A. et al. Mineralogy, early marine diagenesis, and the chemistry of shallow-
293		water carbonate sediments. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 220, 512-534 (2018).

294	30.	Hathorne, E. C. & James, R. H. Temporal record of lithium in seawater: A tracer for
295		silicate weathering? Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 246, 393-406 (2006).
296	31.	Hall, J. M., Chan, L. H., McDonough, W. F. & Turekian, K. K. Determination of the
297		lithium isotopic composition of planktic foraminifera and its application as a paleo-
298		seawater proxy. Mar. Geol. 217, 255–265 (2005).
299	32.	Crockford, P. W. <i>et al.</i> Reconstructing Neoproterozoic seawater chemistry from early
300		diagenetic dolomite. Geology 49, 1–5 (2021).
301	33.	Ullmann, C. V. et al. Partial diagenetic overprint of Late Jurassic belemnites from New
302		Zealand: Implications for the preservation potential of δ 7Li values in calcite fossils.
303		Geochim, Cosmochim, Acta 120 , 80–96 (2013).
304	34.	Veizer, J. Strontium Isotopes, in <i>Encyclopedia of Paleoclimatology and Ancient</i>
305		<i>Environments</i> (ed. Gornitz, V.) 923–926 (Springler, 2009). doi:10.1007/978-1-4020-
306		4411-3 215
307	35	Hood A van S & Wallace M W Neoproterozoic marine carbonates and their
308	50.	paleoceanographic significance <i>Glob Planet Change</i> 160 28–45 (2018)
309	36	Leffcoate A B Elliott T Thomas A & Bouman C Precise small sample size
310	50.	determinations of lithium isotopic compositions of geological reference materials and
311		modern seawater by MC-ICP-MS Geostand Geographytical Res 28 161–172 (2004)
312	37	Galili N <i>et al.</i> The geologic history of seawater oxygen isotopes from marine iron
312	57.	oxides Science 365 469–473 (2019)
314	38	Coogan L A & Dosso S An internally consistent probabilistic determination of ridge-
315	50.	axis hydrothermal fluxes from basalt-hosted systems <i>Earth Planet Sci Lett</i> 323–324
316		92-101 (2012)
317	39	O'Neill C Lenardic A Höink T & Coltice N Mantle convection and outgassing on
318	57.	terrestrial planets in <i>Comparative climatology of terrestrial planets</i> (eds Mackwell S
319		I Simon-Miller A A Harder I W & Bullock M A) 473–486 (University of Arizona
320		Press. 2013). doi:10.2458/azu uapress 9780816530595-ch19.
321	40.	Korenaga, J. Initiation and Evolution of Plate Tectonics on Earth: Theories and
322		Observations, Annu, Rev. Earth Planet, Sci. 41, 117–151 (2013).
323	41.	Rafiei, M. & Kennedy, M. Weathering in a world without terrestrial life recorded in the
324		Mesoproterozoic Velkerri Formation. Nat. Commun. 10, (2019).
325	42.	Clark, S. K. & Johnson, T. M. Effective isotopic fractionation factors for solute removal
326		by reactive sediments: A laboratory microcosm and slurry study. <i>Environ. Sci. Technol.</i>
327		42 , 7850–7855 (2008).
328	43.	Conley, D. J. et al. Biosilicification Drives a Decline of Dissolved Si in the Oceans
329		through Geologic Time. Front. Mar. Sci. 4, (2017).
330	44.	Pogge Von Strandmann, P. A. E. <i>et al.</i> Global climate stabilisation by chemical
331		weathering during the Hirnantian glaciation. <i>Geochemical Perspect. Lett.</i> 3 , 230–237
332		(2017).
333	45.	Lechler, M., Pogge von Strandmann, P. A. E., Jenkyns, H. C., Prosser, G. & Parente, M.
334		Lithium-isotope evidence for enhanced silicate weathering during OAE 1a (Early Aptian
335		Selli event). Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 432 , 210–222 (2015).
336	46.	Pogge von Strandmann, P. A. E., Jenkyns, H. C. & Woodfine, R. G. Lithium isotope
337		evidence for enhanced weathering during Oceanic Anoxic Event 2. Nat. Geosci. 6, 668–
338		672 (2013).
339	47.	Shields, G. & Veizer, J. Precambrian marine carbonate isotope database: Version 1.1.
340		Geochemistry, Geophys. Geosystems 3, (2002).
341	48.	McArthur, J. M., Howarth, R. J. & Shields-Zhou, G. A. Strontium isotope stratigraphy. in
342		A Geologic Time Scale 2012 (eds. Gradstein, F., Ogg, J., Schmitz, M. & Ogg, G.) 127-
343		144 (Cambridge University Press, 2012). doi:10.1017/CBO9780511536045.008.

- Holland, H. D. Why the atmosphere became oxygenated: A proposal. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 73, 5241–5255 (2009).
- 34650.Tajika, E. & Matsui, T. Evolution of terrestrial proto-CO2 atmosphere coupled with
thermal history of the earth. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **113**, 251–266 (1992).
- 348

349

Acknowledgements: NJP acknowledges funding from the Alternative Earths NASA Astrobiology Institute and the Packard Foundation. PPvS was funded by ERC Consolidator Grant 682760 CONTROLPASTCO2. AvSH acknowledges funding from an ARC DECRA (DE190100988). BKA acknowledges financial support provided by Yale Institute for Biospheric Studies. We thank the Yale Peabody Museum of Natural History, Jessica Utrup and Susan H. Butts for providing brachiopods and carbonate samples. We are grateful to Jeremy K. Caves Rugenstein and two anonymous referees for reviews.

357

358 Author contributions: BK-A, NJP, PPvS, JARK designed the research. EJB, AvSH, DSJ, FAM,

359 MWW, JARK, AH, FOO, MD and NJP collected samples. BK-A, PPvS, JARK, MD, JGM,

360 DA, FAM conducted geochemical analyses. JARK wrote the Li isotope mass balance model.

- 361 BK-A wrote the Li isotope diagenetic model. BK-A, NJP, PPvS, JARK analysed the data and
- 362 wrote the paper. All authors contributed to the preparation of the manuscript.
- 363

364 Competing interests: The authors declare no competing interests.



366 Figure 1: Isotope records in carbonates through time. a A compilation of lithium isotope 367 values measured in different types of carbonates, including the new data from this study (open 368 symbols) and previously published data (closed symbols) ($n_{total} = 1396$; Refs. 369 18,20,21,23,30,31,33,44-46). Grey - calcite, yellow - aragonite, green - dolomite, blue -370 diagenetically altered carbonates, and red – samples from periods of known carbon isotope 371 excursions. Shapes denote different types of carbonate archives: squares – cements, crosses – 372 foraminifera, diamonds – brachiopods, triangles – belemnites, hexagons – corals. **b** New filtered 373 lithium isotope data ($n_{filtered} = 525$; $n_{new} = 712$). Samples with indications of diagenetic alteration 374 or of high detrital input (i.e., with Al/Ca > 0.00054 ppm/ppm) are omitted. Light grey squares 375 denote new data from well-preserved marine cements (n = 74). Light grey diamonds denote 376 brachiopods. Light grey solid curve denotes a LOWESS fit of the mean of the data. Light grey 377 dashed curve denotes a LOWESS fit of the lowest ten percent of the values. c Oxygen isotope 378 values measured in carbonates (Ref. 47). Blue curve denotes a robust loess fit of the data. d 379 Strontium isotope ratios measured in carbonates (Refs. 32,48). Red curve denotes a robust loess 380 fit of the lowest ten percent of the values.



381 382

383 Figure 2: Thin section photomicrographs of representative well-preserved carbonates 384 from this study. a,b Neoproterozoic carbonates: a Multiple generations of dolomite (and 385 mimetically dolomitised calcite) marine cements and micrite from the Tonian Devede Fm., 386 Namibia; b Well-preserved dolomitised calcite cements from the Tonian Beck Spring Dolomite, 387 USA. c Paleozoic carbonate: calcite marine-cemented sponge from the Devonian Napier 388 Formation, Australia. d Precambrian carbonate: calcite seafloor fans of the Neoarchean 389 Campbellrand Gp., South Africa. The presence of well-preserved carbonate textures rules out 390 extensive secondary alteration.

391



392 393

394 Figure 3. Two-dimensional density heatmap of lithium isotope mass balance results. Each 395 panel indicates the density of the parameters that successfully match our empirically 396 determined, LOWESS-smoothed Li isotope record (LOWESS conducted on lower ten percent 397 of data (dashed line in (a)), with upper and lower solid filtering bounds) through Earth's history. 398 The light red represents higher counts per bin, red represents lower counts per bin, and white 399 regions represent solution space that cannot satisfy a steady-state ($F_{in} = F_{out}$) Li seawater isotope 400 value as determined by our empirical record. Panels show **a** the Li isotope value of seawater, **b** 401 riverine Li isotope value, c the isotopic fractionation associated with Li removal from seawater 402 during basalt alteration ($\Delta^7 Li_{lowT}$), **d** the isotopic fractionation associated with Li removal from 403 seawater during marine authigenic clay formation ($\Delta^7 \text{Li}_{\text{maac}}$), **e** outgassing estimates from Refs. 39,49,50, **f** the riverine Li flux, **g** the proportion of Li removed through basalt alteration (f_{lowT}), 404 and **h** the proportion of Li removed through marine authigenic clay formation (f_{maac}). F_{HT} is 405 406 scaled linearly to a mean value of outgassing estimates. The LOWESS curve is regressed through our original data with an applied calcite fractionation from seawater ($\Delta^7 \text{Li} = -4\%$). The 407

- 408 lower filtering bound is -4‰ from the LOWESS curve, representing fluid buffered solutions,
- 409 whereas the upper bound is +5‰ from the LOWESS curve, representing the potential for any
- 410 samples to be aragonite.





