Silicon Valley
Sociological Review
Volume 19
2021

Dr. Molly M. King and Dr. Di Di
Co-Editors

Department of Sociology
Santa Clara University

Silicon Valley Sociological Review

Volume 19 | 2021

THEORY

Dedication to Charles H. Powers

The Department of Sociology is very proud to dedicate this year's issue of the *Silicon Valley Sociological Review*, our flagship undergraduate journal, to our colleague Charles H. Powers. After more than four decades of service to academia, and 35 years at Santa Clara University, our friend and colleague Chuck has decided to retire at the end of the 2021 academic year.

We received Chuck's decision with mixed emotions. One the one hand, we celebrate his many accomplishments and contributions to our profession, university, and department. At the same time, however, we know it will be very difficult to move forward without his presence and contributions. With his retirement, we'll miss an excellent colleague and a distinguished sociologist who set the bar very high for the rest of us to emulate. During his tenure at Santa Clara, Chuck was very generous with his time, serving the university in various capacities including as department chair from 1994 to 2000 and 2011 to 2013. He was also elected to various leadership positions at the American Sociological Association, the Pacific Sociological Association, and the California Sociological Association, as well as to several academic editorial boards. His list of publications is equally copious and meritorious, particularly in the field of sociological theory where his books went through several editions and translations. Chuck was also the recipient of multiple merit awards. In Santa Clara, for instance, he won excellence awards for advising, teaching, and his tenure as chair. He was elected to participate in a Fulbright-Hays Seminar in Brazil.

For those of us who have had the privilege of working with Chuck, we'll also miss his devotion to the department, his contributions and collaborations, his fairness. We wish Chuck the very best and look forward to his continuous association with us.

Enrique S. Pumar
Fay Boyle University Professor and
Department of Sociology Chair

Letter From The Editors of the
***Silicon Valley Sociological Review*, Volume 19**

Dr. Di Di & Dr. Molly M. King, Co-Editors
Emma Kemper, Student Editorial Assistant

The Sociology Department at Santa Clara University is proud to present, in this volume of the *Silicon Valley Sociological Review*, eight research papers written by students majoring in sociology or taking sociology classes. This 19th volume continues a tradition to provide students with a meaningful opportunity in professional socialization while honing their research and writing skills.

As in past years, the substantive, theoretical, methodological, and applied content of the Sociology curriculum at SCU are reflected in these papers. The articles highlight students' ability to engage in meaningful professional work informing sociological understanding of important topics. The authors studied important social topics about individuals, organizations, and institutions.

Anjali Rangaswami and Elvena Gevargiz's "Online Sexual Harassment Amognst Women Students at Santa Clara University" addresses the various ways sexual harassment can be experienced, perceived, and dealt with on a college campus. While the authors focus on occurrences of online sexual harassment, it becomes clear that the emotional toll of such experiences is not confined to the screen. The research utilizes both quantitative and qualitative analysis in order to provide a more nuanced understanding of a complex topic.

Diego Ardilla and Jessica Britt's paper, "Proximity to Santa Clara University and Health in Students During the COVID-19 Pandemic," uses qualitative methods to explore various aspects of students' well-being. Paying particular attention to where students live and who they interact with, the authors differentiate between the varied impacts of physical, mental, and emotional health. The researchers find that students living at home experience greater physical health, while students living closer to campus experience improved emotional and mental health.

Anjali Rangaswami's paper, "Work-Life Balance and Satisfaction with Family Life," relies on quantitative survey data in order to examine potential connections between work-life balance and satisfaction with family life. Work and family are separated by definition, however, this paper explores the reality that many struggle to separate them in practice. Rangaswami's findings indicate that satisfaction with family life can be influenced by the difficulties associated with achieving work-life balance.

Maria Gregg's "Girlhood in the Great Outdoors" provides an insightful comparative analysis between VSCO girls and Girl Scouts within the context of modern day feminism and environmentalism. The paper explores historical and present implications of gender roles and how this may impact the ways in which girls learn to interact with the world

around them. To complete this analysis, Gregg relies on data from Instagram, VSCO, published texts, and information from the Girl Scouts organization itself.

Jasmine Jaing, Orlando Caballero, Erene Shin, Lauren Fujii, and Elli Cooney's paper, "Emergency Department Closures: The Critical Case of Reduced Care Access Within Rural Populations," brings attention to the complex nature of emergency departments within the United States. The authors focus on overcrowding and financial difficulties in order to explain the stressors emergency departments face and how this often results in closures. While addressing the multifaceted nature of this topic, the paper suggests three interventions for readers, health providers, and policymakers to consider.

Madison Hoffman's "Surveillance on the New Jim Crow Era" critically examines mass incarceration within the United States. Incorporating an informative review of the literature, Hoffman calls attention to a rise in policing and surveillance, which has implications for minority groups and, in particular, Black Americans. Hoffman's paper looks at such a complex topic from a sociological lens through acknowledging systems of inequality, stereotyping, and bias.

Jessica Hwang, Megan Imai, Vasudha Kumar, Sophia Lapus, and Judith Li's "Intellectual Biography: Dorothy Smith" provides a comprehensive discussion of the exciting life of sociologist Dorothy Smith. The authors are able to describe the mechanics of standpoint theory and institutional ethnography while also providing colorful historical context. Paying particular attention to feminist movements both past and present, this paper is able to shed light on the lasting impact of Smith's contributions.

Finally, **Maria Gregg, Elvena Gevargiz, Brittany Gillingham, and Sarah Glasser**'s "Power and Punishment: An Intellectual Biography of Michel Foucault" provides a detailed analysis of Foucault's contribution to many different disciplines such as philosophy, psychology, history, and sociology. The authors discuss critiques and current implications, while also attaching important historical and personal context for life events that may have shaped his work.

As a collection, the student research presented in this volume exemplifies the evidence-based social science curriculum offered by the Department of Sociology at Santa Clara University. The social issues explored have important policy and programmatic implications. These applications resonate with the University's mission to prepare students of competence, conscience, and compassion, who will help fashion a more just, humane, and sustainable world.

We are grateful to our volunteer Editorial Board members for this volume for their time and effort in reviewing authors' submissions and providing detailed reviews: Patrick Lopez-Aguado, Laura Nichols, Laura Robinson, Charles Powers, Enrique Pumar, and Di Di. We also are indebted to the hard work of our Student Editorial Assistant, Emma Kemper, who kept us organized and kept communications running smoothly.

Online Sexual Harassment Amongst Women Students at Santa Clara University

By

Anjali Rangaswami and Elvena Gevargiz

ABSTRACT. Online sexual harassment has continued to be a pervasive force in universities. Scholarship suggests that female-identifying students experience particularly high rates of sexual harassment, but little research explores how it manifests in online spaces. Thus, we investigate whether women students at Santa Clara University (SCU) experience online sexual harassment, and what forms of harassment they experience. First, a survey of 50 women undergraduate students was conducted to assess whether respondents had experienced online sexual harassment, and if so, on which platforms. Selecting from survey respondents who opted-in for further research, we conducted semi-structured ethnographic interviews with four students about their experiences with online sexual harassment. In addition, we performed participant observation of an SCU Violence Prevention Program "Post-Election Debrief" event and observed the documentary Netizens, which followed the lives of women who have experienced extreme cyber harassment. The transcription and coding of our ethnographic data revealed six key themes: Social Media, Forms of Sexual Harassment, Impact of Sexual Harassment, Toxic Masculine Culture, Normalization, and Suggestions for Improvements. Our findings indicate that women students at SCU experienced many forms of online sexual harassment, which varied depending on the social media platforms students were active on. This online harassment is normalized within a wider context of gendered power dynamics offline, embodied by a culture of toxic masculinity at Santa Clara University. Importantly, respondents and interviewees strongly emphasized their suggestions for improvement at SCU, which included increasing institutional accountability, implementing preventative and educational programs for students regarding online sexual harassment, and encouraging conversation about sexual violence within the SCU community.

INTRODUCTION

The present COVID-19 pandemic has altered our lives significantly, necessitating that individuals must spend an increasing amount of their time online. A study conducted in April 2020 found that roughly half of U.S. adults (53%) say the internet has been essential for them personally during the pandemic (Vogels et al. 2020). Whether we are attending Zoom meetings and virtual classes, or browsing through social media and e-commerce websites, assessing the safety of virtual spaces is more important than ever— particularly for marginalized groups, like young women, who are most often subjected to violence. While some may assume that the transition to online work

protects women from workplace sexual harassment, this is far from reality; in fact, sexual harassment has become even more rampant online recently (Norris and Torrisi 2020).

Although research has indicated the omnipresence of sexual harassment on the internet, few studies deeply examine the experiences of college-aged women online. Research has established that 43.3% of college students experience online sexual harassment (Lindsay and Krysik 2012). This specific type of harassment varies from stalking, identity theft, revenge pornography, exposure of personal and private information, threats of violence, etc. Studies have also investigated the repercussions and aftermath of harassment which survivors endure after an incident occurs. Their findings revealed that online sexual harassment can lead to emotional and health problems for adolescence and college-aged individuals, and more commonly victims who are women (Fridh, Lindstrom, and Rosvall 2015; Hill and Kearly 2011; Mitchell et al. 2014; Mitchell, Ybarra, and Finkelhor 2007; Van Royen, Poels, and Vandebosch 2016; Ybarra 2004; Ybarra, Espelage, and Mitchell 2007). A few emotional and health impacts survivors may face include a loss of social and familial ties, loss of their careers, judgment or violence from strangers, post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD), depression and anxiety.

As we took into consideration the advancements of technology, previous literature on online sexual harassment and the current worldwide pandemic, we were highly motivated to conduct a qualitative and ethnographic study, focusing our research on women college students, specifically those at Santa Clara University. We proposed the question of, "Do women students at SCU experience online sexual harassment? If so, where and what form of harassment?" As the forms of harassment, specifically online, can vary, we defined online incidents of sexual harassment as unwelcome and inappropriate sexual messages, comments, posts or images targeted at the subject. *Our findings revealed that women students at SCU experienced many forms of online sexual harassment, which varied depending on the social media platforms students were active on. This online harassment is normalized within a wider context of gendered power dynamics offline, embodied by a culture of toxic masculinity at Santa Clara University.*

METHODS

Over a period of two and a half months, we collected sufficient ethnographic data to better understand our research question. In this section, we will discuss the methods used, by analyzing and discussing themes that emerged from our survey, interviews, fieldnotes, memos, as well as highlighting the significance of our most important focused codes by demonstrating the connection between online harassment and offline culture, normalization, gendered power, and institutional accountability. Understanding the online-offline connection is crucial in assessing incidents of sexual harassment, as there is a larger underlying connection between the culture represented and essentially normalized, within the greater presence of society that has transitioned into the realm of the online world.

4

Survey

In sociology, the word survey refers to the study of a population through observation of its members (Jansen 2010). Collecting survey data is very beneficial to research, especially when it is used to compare and contrast with the data findings from conducted interviews. To begin our research findings, we created a short preliminary survey consisting of 10 multiple choice and open-ended questions, asking participants of their experiences either as witnesses and/or survivors of online sexual harassment, their awareness of resources provided by SCU, the type of social media platform the incident occurred on, how many times they have been victimized by online perpetrators, as well as how their experiences were after the incident. As this topic has the potential to be triggering for respondents, we chose to make each question optional, and thus some questions were skipped by participants.

The survey was completed by 50 women students at SCU, consisting of 1 first-year, 5 sophomores, 9 juniors, and 27 seniors, as well as 8 alumni. Once the survey was completed by the 50 respondents, we were intrigued by several of the findings. Fifty-eight percent of respondents said that they had witnessed some form of sexual harassment occur online, while 53% said that they themselves were survivors of online sexual harassment. We see here that a majority of women have either observed another person be targeted by online perpetrators or have personally experienced harassment firsthand. When asked about the number of times respondents were targeted online, 23% said that they had been sexually harassed online between 5 and 10 times, while 33% had been targeted between 2 and 5 times. With this data, it is clear that the consistency of online sexual harassment is very rampant and unfortunately, very common amongst women students.

Although a majority of our findings from our survey were surprising, there were a few that were unsurprising. When asked about their experiences online, our results showed that 63% of respondents felt less safe being present online after their incident occurred. As we will discuss later on within our ethnography section, the film *Netizens* portrays the ways in which social media and the internet in general provides perpetrators with a sense of power over a survivor and how they feel, especially when it comes to their safety or self-esteem. Whether it be with inappropriate comments, sending graphic photos or threats to their safety, perpetrators affect the mental health and social life of the women they choose to attack. With regards to the topic of sexual harassment on SCU's campus, we wanted to ask respondents if they felt this was something that occurred within their community. We found that 90% of respondents reported that they believed sexual harassment does in fact occur at SCU. Thus, it appears that sexual harassment has become very normalized within the campus and its community. As we continue on with our data analysis further on in our study, we will delve deeper into how sexual harassment, specifically online, is normalized and essentially "brushed off" within the community at SCU as well as within our larger society.

Interviews

In qualitative research, it is important to utilize interviews to better understand the population and specific topic a researcher is studying. Interviews are great tools to provide further insight or evidence to a research question as well as possibly uncover new emerging themes which a researcher may not have previously taken into account. When we actually interview someone in the situation, we inevitably discover that we did not understand fully, and perhaps not at all (Weiss 1995). In addition, we felt the need to be very mindful of our word choice and how we went about framing and presenting our interview questions to participants. We chose to refrain from presenting any leading questions and also kept in mind that there would be some participants who would encounter difficulties expressing themselves and their experiences with us during the interviews. As we are both considered "insiders" within the targeted population, we wanted to use this to our advantage to gain the trust of our interviewees. As stated in Lofland, "the participant researcher who is already a member or insider... has the advantage of already knowing the 'cast of characters' or at least a segment of the cast" (Lofland et. al 2006: 41). This thus gives us an opportunity to present our selective competence as it "may be beneficial to reveal a degree of insider knowledge, skill or understanding... in order to make informants feel comfortable and more connected with [us]" rather than researchers invading their personal experiences for personal gain (Lofland et al. 2006: 70).

When looking at the relevance of subjectivity and what role it plays within qualitative research, it is important that as a researcher, you are aware of your subjectivity not only prior to conducting or beginning your research process, but are also paying attention to it actively throughout the entire process. The relevance of this is to "enable researchers to be aware of how their subjectivity may be shaping their inquiry and its outcomes" (Peshkin 1988: 17). The importance of reflecting one's own feelings and reactions allows for both sides of the research to be analyzed, preventing any neglect of the opposite spectrum of research at hand. As we are looking at online sexual harassment and the connection to where and in what form our participants have experienced it, it is important that we analyze our own premeditated judgements, prior to assuming our participants have also encountered the same experiences as us.

For our interviews, we utilized convenience sampling to focus our research population on women students at SCU and found a total of 4 participants who agreed to be interviewed. To protect our interviewees as well as ourselves during the COVID-19 pandemic, we conducted these interviews via Zoom, which lasted a span of approximately 45 minutes to an hour each. Subjects were identified and chosen through our preliminary survey that was discussed earlier. We reached out to respondents who left their contact information at the end of the survey, asking if they would be willing and comfortable to further discuss their experiences in a one-on-one interview. To ensure the safety of our participants, we made it clear that their confidentiality and anonymity would be protected if they were to agree to speak with us further.

While we purposively sampled for homogeneity on the gender of subjects (women), we also purposively sampled for a variation of SCU social involvement. Considering that as researchers, we each come from different social groups at SCU (athletics and greek life), we wanted to ensure that the representation of multiple perspectives was present throughout our collection of data. In addition, we each experienced an insider and outsider researcher perspective by interviewing one subject from each social group—specifically, one subject we knew and one we had never met before.

All 4 of our interviewees provided us with different perspectives and experiences, but we found that they all shared similar themes. Some overlapping themes or discussions that emerged within the interviews were the frustrations of how normalized online sexual harassment and sexual harassment has become normalized at SCU and within our society. One interviewee stated, "Our President right now [Donald Trump] is a known sexual predator, our possible future president [Joe Biden] is also a known sexual predator, and those are the two people that are tryna run the country, so if that's not normalization then, I don't know what is."

We see this dynamic all too often. Men in positions of power seem to get away with being perpetrators of sexual harassment, instead of being held accountable. In addition, the issue of sexual harassment is not limited only to men in powerful positions, but is also perpetrated by men who are from more privileged backgrounds. A notorious example of this would be ex-Stanford swimmer Brock Turner who was convicted of sexual assault back in 2015 (Shapiro 2019). In addition, Aaron Persky, the judge for Turner's case, who was a former Stanford alumni, had received backlash for his lenient sentencing on Turner (Shapiro 2019). With these case details, we see that even within the realm of U.S. law, there is no accountability demanded from those who participate in such criminal behavior. Perpetrators are often let off the hook and able to walk away with only a slap on the wrist while survivors are left to pick up the broken pieces and live a completely new life, oftentimes unable to move on from the trauma. With this lack of accountability, we are essentially indirectly teaching survivors to believe they are inherently bound to experience sexual violence several times throughout their lives, whether it be in the workplace, schools, athletics teams, social groups, etc. It has essentially become a "norm" of what it means to be a woman. As a result of this standard, we see that there is a need to reevaluate our accountability as individuals, as social media platforms, as news outlets, as legal institutions, and beyond.

Ethnography

Our interviews were supplemented and contextualized by conducting two additional ethnographies. As one of us is part of the Violence Prevention Program (VPP) on campus, we thought this would be a perfect opportunity to attend a meeting, especially as VPP was mentioned by multiple interview subjects as a stakeholder in suggestions for improvements. We attended and observed the VPP event which was a "Post Election Debrief," hosted over Zoom in mid-November, 2020. One of us attended as an observer, while the other attended both as an observer and a group discussion leader. During this meeting, we were able to observe women students from SCU discuss their

opinions on the recent presidential election. Participants shared their feelings from before, during, and after the election, as well as their fears and hopes for the upcoming presidency with regards to the topic of violence against women. Many women also discussed how the election impacted their lives academically, socially and emotionally. Their main struggles consisted of being unable to focus on their classes and complete assignments to the best of their ability, feeling frustrated in discussions with family members or friends who had different political perspectives than them, as well as being fearful for what the future held for the lives and rights of women. As this was a discussion based around violence against women, many participants were disappointed with the portrayal of women, particularly women in power. One participant used the example of how Kamala Harris was portrayed within the media as well as in society as a whole, after the vice presidential debate. Rather than Harris being critiqued for her capabilities of assisting Joe Biden in running the country, she was criticized for her character and appearance. When women are put in situations where they feel the need to defend themselves and strongly assert themselves in doing so, they are labeled as "emotional" or "incapable of handling criticism," but in contrast, when a man asserts more dominant behavior to defend himself, he is seen as confident and passionate. Throughout this presidential election, we saw an intensely unequal dynamic regarding gender stereotypes about power and authority, which reflected our society's present social constructions and biases.

For our second observation, we independently watched a film called *Netizens* (2018), a documentary following the stories of three women whose lives were altered dramatically due to online sexual harassment. The forms of harassment varied from non-consensual ("revenge") pornography, cyber-stalking, threats of violence, exposure of private and personal information, online identity theft and impersonation, defamatory character attacks, and more. In addition to highlighting new forms of harassment prevalent online, *Netizens* delved deeper into the real-life repercussions which survivors are forced to endure.

As evidenced by our ethnographies, the connection between online sexual violence and the wider normalization in culture is not limited only to the SCU community. For example, the survivors of sexual harassment interviewed in *Netizens* were mostly middle-aged women from a variety of backgrounds and professions. Their cases demonstrated the inefficacy of social media and web services companies in addressing sexual harassment on their platforms— although, notably, these companies are rarely held accountable by the relevant government institutions. In addition, law enforcement and judiciary institutions frequently denied formal and informal assistance to survivors, often not taking reports of harassment seriously (even when provided evidence) or declaring that there were no avenues for police investigation or legal recourse. Thus, the lack of protection against sexual violence online seems to be a macro-level issue which has been reproduced in the microcosm of Santa Clara University.

Coding Process

After hours of participating in, observing and taking notes about ongoing events in a social setting, most fieldworkers return to their desks and their computers to begin to write up their observations into full fieldnotes (Emerson et al. 2011). As we collected all of our data, we decided to transcribe all four of our conducted interviews as well as type out all our collected notes from both ethnographies into more comprehensive and fully detailed field notes. Once this process was completed, we decided to delve deeper into the data by coding our findings. The process of coding enabled us to sort and organize our data into categories that were meaningful to our research question and theoretical framework (Lofland et al. 2006).

In qualitative research, coding is essentially the process in which you label and organize your findings that were collected, in order to identify different themes and the relationships between them (Medelyan 2020). We began the coding process by completing an initial run through of our interview transcripts and ethnographic field notes and identifying our *open codes*. Open coding is a more inductive approach, starting from scratch and creating codes based on the qualitative data itself (Medelyan 2020). This is done by breaking down the data set into smaller samples and readings through them, then assigning codes to them that best describe the sample from the data. Once this was done throughout all of the interview transcripts and field notes, we then did a second run through of our data, forming *focused codes*. Focused coding is the process in which our open codes are combined and placed into more specific categories that uncover an overarching theme within the data. This involves building up, and in some cases, further elaborating analytically interesting themes, both by connecting data that initially may not have appeared to go together and by further delineating subthemes and subtopics that distinguish differences and variations within the broader topic (Emerson et al. 2011). The 6 main focus codes we felt were most relevant and representative to our research were *Social Media, Forms of Sexual Harassment, Impact of Sexual Harassment, Toxic Masculine Culture, Normalization* and *Suggestions for Improvements.*

Ethical Considerations/Concerns

Throughout our study, we did not encounter significant ethical dilemmas; however, we did believe that as researchers, it was a priority to ensure the comfort, anonymity and confidentiality of our interviewees. Ensuring students had a safe, non-judgemental environment to speak on their experiences with us was paramount in creating confident participant-researcher relationships. Before beginning our interviews, we reminded all interviewees that every question was optional and that the interviews could be stopped or paused at any time. In addition, we phrased our questions as neutrally as possible, ensuring that they did not imply or suggest blame or shame on the part of the survivor. To ensure our interviewees' safety and anonymity, we decided to give them pseudonyms of Maya (first interviewee), Tierra (second interviewee), Rose (third interviewee) and Zoe (fourth interviewee). As 2 of our participants were on athletics teams and the other 2 were a part of greek life organizations, we decided to keep the specifics of what teams and sororities these women were a part of private to protect their identities from being exposed. We also protected their identities to prevent any

re-traumatization, shame or other harmful social effects such as gossip or personal threats from their perpetrators, other students on campus, or faculty and staff members.

RESULTS

Social Media

Social Media was most frequently described by subjects as a place where harassment occurred, though sometimes also as a potential tool for support or positive change. The social media platforms which women SCU students reported experiencing sexual harassment on were GroupMe, Snapchat, Tinder, VSCO, and greek life websites. On our initial survey, respondents had also reported experiencing sexual harassment on Instagram and Zoom, although incidents on these platforms did not arise in our interviews. Many respondents described how social media platforms encouraged or enabled perpetrators to sexually harass women very easily, with one specifically noting the ease at which someone can, for example, leave an inappropriate comment on someone's picture. Another subject explained, "In the ways of encouraging online harassment, it [social media] creates a barrier for those cowardly people that wouldn't say these things to someone else's face — they can say it online behind a screen." The theme of perpetrators feeling more able or more comfortable sexually harassing from "behind a screen" also arose across interviews with SCU students. Another factor which contributed to emboldening harassers online was the anonymity granted by many social media platforms, with one subject noting, "I think not having to attach your name to something is incredibly powerful in a bad way." Anonymity allows for people to sexually harass others without fear of being identified and facing repercussions.

When discussing social media movements, #MeToo was viewed as having limited success, causing negative male reactions to activism, or promoting white feminism which erased the intersectional experiences of Black women and women of color. In contrast, Black Lives Matter was discussed more favorably and perceived as a better model for future movements. Interestingly, one subject mentioned that "I don't think like (..) any social media app creators intentionally were like, 'Oh, we want to make social justice a thing,' but I think it [social media] just creates a space for people to be creative and come up with ways to broadcast things that like the news and other traditional forms of media wouldn't cover." While allowing for creativity and non-traditional media coverage may not have been the intent of social media creators, this has become a positive externality of their platforms. Multiple interviewees thought that posting educational information as a form of raising awareness on social media was a necessary part of addressing sexual harassment.

In addition, the value of survivors finding communities of support on social media arose in two interviews. One subject mentioned that "there are a lot of support groups out there for victims who have been affected, or their family members have been affected, and so it offers another layer of support that you can connect with people from around the world, around the country, that you may have not had contact with before." She highlights the possibility of expanding your network of support using social media, which

could be especially valuable for survivors who do not have sources of support in their offline lives. Another subject specifically highlighted TikTok as a supportive space for survivors, describing the app as "creating this platform where you can inform others on things that you've gone through, and then you get support, and also like people just become informed overall." It was particularly interesting how she noted that the process of sharing your story and receiving support on Tik Tok also resulted in others becoming more "informed overall," which was another unexpected positive aspect of online support groups.

The *Netizens* documentary illustrated the more extreme effects of social media and online harassment on women's lives. One subject, Alexis, described, "I'm expected to accept online harassment as the price of being a woman with an opinion." In Alexis' case, she had founded a feminist YouTube channel which discussed sexist tropes in media. After posting a video about the sexualization of female video game characters, she became the subject of violent, threatening, and seemingly unending harassment and sexual harassment by male trolls online. Alexis described how the internet can "bring people together in communities," but that as in her case, this can quickly become problematic when "people who hate women find thousands of other men who agree with them" and empower each other to attack women. As best described by Alexis, "It's not like misogyny started when Twitter started." She points to the idea that the link between the online and offline world is inherent and that misogyny has always been present in our society. Sexual harassment does not occur within a vacuum online, and is still an unfortunate reality within our offline world. In fact, the offline-online connection is a key theme which appeared in our research as we examined how SCU culture dictated the sexual harassment which women SCU students experienced online.

Forms of Harassment

The specific forms of harassment experienced online varied across our interview subjects depending on the social media platforms that their perpetrators or themselves were active on. One subject, who we will call Maya, discovered that a member of the Men's athletic team had created a poll in his team's GroupMe on whether he should take Maya's virginity. Another subject, who we will call Tierra, was subjected to unwanted advances from a fraternity member over Snapchat and text. Additionally, when Tierra was attending a fraternity formal dinner, fraternity members displayed an inappropriate Snapchat screenshot of her on a slideshow presentation. Our third subject, who we will call Rosa, was persistently sent unwanted and uncomfortable messages by a perpetrator on Tinder. Our final subject, who we will call Zoe, had a selfie screenshotted by fraternity pledges and sent to her boyfriend, with the perpetrators (falsely) claiming that Zoe had been sending the image around to men. Additionally, in a separate incident, a perpetrator posted an anonymous comment about Zoe on a greek life website (falsely) alleging that she had been flirting with fraternity members while in a relationship.

In the *Netizens* film, the forms of harassment differed from those experienced by our SCU student interviewees. Forms displayed in *Netizens* include the posting of revenge

porn, creation of defamatory websites, manipulation of search engine results, posting of fake sex ads on Craigslist, threatening violence or sexual assault, sending of unwanted explicit images, and the exposure of private and sensitive information ("doxxing"). One subject received constant death and rape threats from men after posting videos about how video games sexualize female characters. She showcased countless folders of screenshots of abusive and disturbing Tweets which she regularly recorded to forward to the FBI. The violence and explicitness of the Tweets was disturbing; some contained graphic threats of rape, murder, and even "disemboweling," while others included images of male trolls' bodily fluids.

Impact of Harassment

The impact of online sexual harassment on our interview subjects encompassed a wide range of psychological and social effects. Immediately following the incidents of harassment, many subjects felt embarrassment, disbelief, annoyance, fear, disappointment, and/or anger. One subject, Tierra, described how it felt to see an inappropriate Snapchat screenshot of herself projected on a slideshow at a fraternity event: "Honestly, it's kind of more like (..) seeing your face on a billboard or something like that. I'm watching the screen in disgust, and then later in the slideshow, I freaked out. It's me. On a massive projector. That an entire fraternity and their dates are watching." The unique setting of this incident, particularly the large projector and audience, made Tierra feel hyper-visible. An additional subject, Zoe, who was sexually harassed by fraternity members using screenshots of her posts and a greek life website, felt "very unsafe" following these incidents. Zoe explained, "[I felt] like I was always being watched by people I didn't know or who were keeping tabs on me. Like I was being judged wherever I went and it made me feel like I did not belong here, that it was not my place to be, that I was intruding on other people's lives by being at this school and that I was an outsider who people felt the need to target." Zoe's feelings of hypervisibility, unbelonging, and scrutinization on and around campus were exacerbated by the fact that her harassers had acted anonymously and still remained unknown to her. She added that, "If I had known who had done those things, maybe I would have said something to them," although this unfortunately never became a possibility. Another subject, Maya, who was sexually harassed by a male athlete in his team's GroupMe, noted the casualness with which men objectify women in their group chats: "They just put your name somewhere and think it's so easy and you won't hear about it, but you do, and then end up being this like sexualized... object. And you feel stupid, you know?" While Maya had done nothing wrong, the incident left her feeling naive and dejected. In response, she made the decision to "shift away from people with that kind of culture and mindset" and change her social circle. When discussing her use of GroupMe following the incident, Maya mentioned, "I feel like I was always really suspicious ...with boys involved in general." Moving forward, she muted large GroupMe's, like the one for her dorm hall's floor.

Each survivor from *Netizens* grappled with a combination of psychological, social, and career impacts from online sexual harassment. The film made it abundantly clear that online harassment has devastating, life-altering impacts on survivors. Impacts of

harassment included being unable to find a job, loss of their career, loss of their social and familial ties, post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD), and more. Essentially, many important facets of each survivor's life were (or are still) completely disrupted. Although years have passed for some survivors since their experiences with online sexual harassment, these women still deal with the fears of uncertainty, retaliation, being recognized, being judged and so much more. One of the main overarching themes we found within all three of these stories was the lack of accountability and action taken by law enforcement and the U.S. criminal justice system. One woman from the film mentioned she was unable to obtain an order of protection because police did not see any harm in the threats that were being made towards her. Due to the lack of experience police officers and attorneys have with online sexual harassment cases, survivors are often forced to endure re-traumatization, victim-blaming as well as minimization or delegitimization of their incident. Another survivor in the film spoke on how her incident of harassment altered her appearance, especially when it came to her taste in clothing. Although she portrayed her character and personality through fashion, her lawyer told her that in order for her to be taken seriously by the courtroom, jury and judge, she had to dress more conservatively. We see through this specific example that survivors of sexual harassment are forced to compromise their character in order to be believed and considered.

Toxic Masculine Culture

Each of our respondents detailed the presence of a dominant toxic masculine culture at SCU that encouraged and reinforced heteronormativity, gendered power dynamics, and the objectification of women students. Although referred to by different names, such as "white male culture," "the frat boy vibe," "male groupthink mentality," or the "masculine environment of the school," toxic masculine behavior was described by all subjects as influencing SCU culture and their experiences as women students. Oftentimes, subjects associated their perpetrators of sexual harassment directly with toxic masculine culture. When describing one of her harassers, a subject explained, "He's very seemingly normal. But I don't know. It just seems like he's somehow superior to women in some way. You know the vibe— the like, frat boy vibe— where they think... that they're better than women or like they view us a little bit more as objects for their pleasure." She notes how the misogynistic outlook of these men implies their sexual expectations of women, specifically the objectification of women for their pleasure. In addition, she added, "I've definitely seen like frat GroupMe's, where a PC [pledge class] or whole frat talks to each other. They basically just disrespect women in the group chats by posting photos of them hooking up with girls and … just bragging about their encounters of women, without the women knowing." Notably, getting consent from women to post intimate photos or brag about sexual encounters was not a part of the equation. Hooking up with women is framed as a competition, accomplishment, and point of masculine pride within these groups. Even if an individual man thinks or feels differently, this is not openly expressed at SCU where "no one wants to be the weirdo or the weak one" because "our school is just so entrenched in gender roles as a whole and men just try so hard to meet that masculinity standard." Thus, men at SCU continue to perform hypermasculine behavior in order to maintain social acceptance in dominant groups.

Another indication of toxic masculine culture at SCU was the treatment of women in relationships with men. One subject, Zoe, described that being in a relationship with a man can mean "all of a sudden you're like an extension of him, you're his property, you're not your own person, [and] whatever you do represents him." In both of Zoe's experiences with online harassment at SCU, her relationship status— specifically the questioning of her fidelity to her boyfriend— played a role. When screenshotting Zoe's selfie post and sending it to her boyfriend, perpetrators were attempting to upset him by alleging that Zoe had "been sending these pictures around to other men." Zoe later found out that the incident was "some frat pledging thing trying to get into my boyfriend's head"— likely the same motivation for a subsequent greek life website comment about Zoe which also falsely alleged infidelity. Fraternity members seemed to think that sexually harassing Zoe was an opportunity to put down her boyfriend, as he seemed to have been affiliated with a 'rival' fraternity. Thus, finding out that the incident was a part of "frat pledging" was quite unsurprising, as pledging often involves sexualizing or objectifying women in order to assert one's masculinity and 'brotherly' commitment. Reflecting on the fraternity culture at SCU, Zoe added, "The male group think mentality is really powerful and really dangerous. You see it in so many different environments and I think especially at a school with the dynamics and demographics of Santa Clara, they aren't thinking as individuals, they're thinking as a group." This was an interesting way of summarizing how the toxic masculine culture on campus is a shared mindset, as opposed to an individual mentality or thought process. It follows that we observed similar patterns throughout the SCU social scene, as the culture of toxic masculinity is present among fraternities and male sports teams alike.

Normalization

The normalization of sexual harassment at SCU arose frequently in our interviews, with a culture of toxic masculinity being identified as one of many driving forces behind it. The process of normalizing sexual violence was clearly described by most interviewees, who shared how SCU students (sometimes including themselves) had initially laughed in response to their experiences of sexual harassment. Each subject had determined that "brushing it off" or "moving on" was their best or only option. Reflecting on her experience being sexually harassed with inappropriate screenshots at a fraternity formal, Tierra described, "I guess I didn't really think further than, 'That's just what the frat guys do,' instead of saying, 'What they do is wrong.' I didn't make the further connection." Tierra points to one of the central tenets of normalization at SCU— acceptance or trivialization of sexual violence because, essentially, 'boys will be boys' and this is simply just how they behave. The pressure to tolerate toxic masculine behavior is also heightened when considering how male-dominated the social scene at SCU is. As noted by two interview subjects, the vast majority of parties are hosted by men. One subject explained, "If you want to go on a Friday night, you're going to mostly likely going to go to a house that's owned by a frat or a sports team or like a group of men and so... there's just like this inherent power dynamic in terms of how you can go out and 'have fun' in the normal college sense." The centralization of social events at all-male houses, which is in part due to the fact that "sororities aren't able to host

parties, even though we have kick ass houses," makes women especially dependent on male hosts. Interestingly, SCU's heteronormative, male-dominated party culture resembles that of certain influential Instagram accounts. Dominant SCU culture is reportedly epitomized by Instagram accounts such as Total Frat Move, Barstool, and Old Row which glorify toxic masculinity and sexualize college women. As put by one subject, when these accounts post women, "It's really just about like their attractiveness. But then it's always about what the men are doing, not about what the women are doing. If it is what the women are doing, it's because they're doing something wrong. Like messing up shotgunning a beer. Whereas, like the dudes are doing something perfectly." By only portraying women for their attractiveness or as a joke, while praising and celebrating men for their masculine partying abilities, Instagram accounts like Total Frat Move, Barstool and Old Row— which have a substantial following of SCU men— serve as normalizing agents of toxic masculine culture and its misogynistic implications on campus.

Our subjects also highlighted additional normalizing agents present in society, like movies and TV shows which reinforced traditional, heteronormative gender roles and depicted sexual harassment and male domination as romantic (e.g., Fifty Shades of Grey). The Violence Prevention Program (VPP) event ethnography also provided insight into the more macro-level forces of normalization. When debriefing the 2020 Presidential Election at this event, many women students discussed the misogyny and objectification directed at female politicians. Many women discussed the differential treatment of Hillary Clinton and Kamala Harris who were constantly critiqued for facial expressions (like smiling), "attitude" and appearance, while President Trump's unprofessional debate conduct was excused, accepted or even celebrated. In addition, neither President-Elect Biden nor President Trump were questioned about the many allegations of sexual assault against them, which upset women SCU students who had sexual violence on the forefront of their minds during the election. At the highest level in our country, the objectification of women and policing of women's "attitudes" is clearly still rampant, while men can behave in extremely unprofessional ways, and even commit sexual assault, yet can still be elected President. The normalization of these dynamics in the highest office of our country has a measurable effect on SCU culture— evident through the expressions of anger, sadness, anxiety, disappointment and fear expressed by many women SCU students at the VPP event.

Suggestions for Improvement

Each interviewee described different aspects of how sexual harassment online was an institutional issue at SCU which would require accountability from administration, educating students, prevention, awareness, bystander intervention, and serious change. More specifically, subjects wanted to see more comprehensive education from the administration on sexual harassment, beyond just the first-year training videos which are never repeated. The importance of encouraging discussions about sexual harassment and sexual violence also emerged several times, indicating a strong desire for the University to help shift the present culture of silence on campus. This also entailed supporting violence prevention, bystander intervention efforts, and investing in

15

resources like CAPS. In addition, subjects urgently wanted to see more accountability from the administration. They felt that school emails about difficult or controversial topics were inauthentic and insincere. Put well by one subject, "I think with that, they [SCU administration] just need to reevaluate their own accountability like financially, morally, ethically, and then be more transparent. I know that they're trying to with all the forums and campus climate dialogs and whatever but ultimately, forming another task force is just a way to direct people away from staring at the real systemic issue." The need for real, systemic change at SCU was emphasized throughout our interviews and also during our ethnographies, which suggested more macro-level changes.

The *Netizens* film provided additional insight into the governmental and legal conceptions of sexual harassment online, and how they contribute to the normalization of sexual violence online and offline. All four subjects provided many suggestions for improvement online. They each underscored the need for significant legal reform and for the creation of laws which protect safety and penalize sexual harassment online. Currently, many harassers are shielded by interpretations of the First Amendment right to free speech. Most of the *Netizens* subjects struggled (or failed entirely) to gain police orders of protection against their harassers and abusers, and one woman was even subjected to her harasser filing false police reports against her. They had to advocate for themselves for 3, 4 and 5 years before any significant state intervention, which subsequently helped to alleviate some of the harassment or provide protection. About revenge porn in her state, one subject said, "It is a crime, but there just isn't a law yet." Every *Netizen's* survivor also underscored the need for accountability from web services and social media companies, like Google, YouTube and Twitter, who essentially gaslight most people reporting sexual harassment and don't attempt to make their platforms safer.

DISCUSSION

Conclusions

Our research demonstrates that women students at Santa Clara University experience a broad range of sexual harassment online, particularly on social media platforms, and that this harassment is largely normalized within SCU culture and beyond. Although incidents occurred on online platforms such as GroupMe, Snapchat, Tinder, VSCO, and greek life websites, there were tangible psychological and social offline impacts of the harassment. Notably, this online-offline connection remained present throughout our study, as we found that online sexual harassment was inherently linked to offline culture. Most incidents of sexual harassment were perpetrated by fellow male students, particularly in fraternities and on sports teams. These perpetrators were enabled by a dominant toxic masculine culture offline which encouraged the sexualization, objectification, trivialization and overall sexist treatment of women. The culture of toxic masculinity at SCU has reproduced rigid heteronormativity and gendered power imbalances, especially in the student social scene which is almost entirely male-run and male-dominated. This culture is further epitomized and celebrated by Instagram

accounts such as Total Frat Move, Barstool, and Old Row which celebrate toxic masculine college culture and objectify college women. Toxic masculine culture influences the behavior of male SCU students where "no one wants to be the weirdo or the weak one" because "our school is just so entrenched in gender roles as a whole and men just try so hard to meet that masculinity standard." Ultimately, these factors aid in the process of normalizing sexual violence, which was clearly described by most interviewees. Subjects recounted how other SCU students— and sometimes themselves— had laughed about their experience of sexual harassment, and subjects ultimately decided that "brushing it off" or "moving on" was their best or only option. Subjects suggested a variety of institutional reforms to combat sexual harassment online at SCU, beginning with real accountability and transparency from administration on the subject, providing consistent information and trainings on sexual violence and bystander intervention, and supporting student discussions in order to raise awareness.

Implications

Our ethnographies revealed that the link between online sexual harassment and broader normalization in culture is not exclusive to Santa Clara University. In particular, the documentary *Netizens* depicted survivors of online sexual harassment who were primarily middle-aged women with a range of professions and backgrounds— a very different population from women SCU students, which nevertheless indicated an eerily similar pattern. While our SCU interviewees described how the culture of the University environment normalized sexual harassment, the *Netizens* subjects described how law enforcement and judiciary institutions acted similarly. Each survivor had experienced police departments and/or courts of law not listening to, not believing, and not following up with their allegations of sexual harassment and online abuse, even when provided concrete evidence. In addition, web services and social media companies were similarly unhelpful to *Netizens* survivors and largely refused to take accountability for creating safe platforms, although they are also not forcibly held accountable by government agencies. It seems that this larger systemic failure to prevent and address sexual harassment online may also influence the micro-level of Santa Clara University.

Recommendations

When assessing the overall campus culture at SCU, we find that issues considered to be controversial, like sexual harassment, are not openly discussed. This study is intended to raise more awareness about this issue within the SCU community, providing an opportunity to move forward in a positive direction. If revisiting our study in the future, we could expand our target population and select a more representative sample, so that the results are more generalizable to the larger population of internet users. We could also replicate our study and interview women who represent another specific population, like women who work in large corporations or in politics. Alternatively, we could undertake an intersectional approach and ethnographically study a different population of marginalized women, such as women migrant workers, queer women, or Black women who may experience online sexual harassment differently. We can also

expand our knowledge on the topic even further by interviewing men who are survivors of online sexual harassment. Since men generally hold more dominant roles within our society, it would be interesting to compare how male survivors' lives were affected to how women survivors' lives were affected by sexual harassment online in this particular study. Future prospects for research on online sexual harassment have the potential to disrupt and transform our present understanding of this issue.

AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTIONS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

REFERENCES

Emerson, Robert M., Rachel I. Fretz, and Linda L. Shaw. 2011. *Writing Ethnographic Fieldnotes,* Second Edition. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Fridh, Maria, Martin Lindstrom, and Maria Rosvall. 2015. "Subjective health complaints in adolescent victims of cyber harassment: Moderation through support from parents/friends—A Swedish population-based study." *BMC Public Health* 15: 949. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-015-2239-7.

Hill, Cathering, and Holly Kearl. 2011. "Crossing the line: Sexual harassment at school." *Online harassment resource.* Washington, DC: American Association of University Women. International Game Developers Association (IGDA). https://www.aauw.org/app/uploads/2020/03/Crossing-the-Line-Sexual-Harassment-at-School.pdf

Jansen, Harrie. 2010. "The Logic of Qualitative Survey Research and its Position in the Field of Social Research Methods." *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, *11*(2): Art. 11. https://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/1450/2946.

Lofland, John., David Snow, Leon Anderson, and Lyn H. Lofland. 2006. *Analyzing Social Settings: A Guide to Qualitative Observation and Analysis.* Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.

Lindsay, Megan, and Judy Krysik. 2012. "Online harassment among college students: A replication incorporating new Internet trends." *Information, Communication, & Society* 15: 703–719. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369118X.2012.674959.

Medelyan, Alyona. 2020. "Coding Qualitative Data: How to Code Qualitative Research" https://getthematic.com/insights/coding-qualitative-data/

Mitchell, Kimberly, Lisa Jones, David Finkelhor, and Janis Wolak. 2014. "Trends in unwanted sexual solicitations: Findings from the youth Internet safety studies." Durham, NH: Crimes Against Children Research Center.

Mitchell, Kimberly J., Michele Ybarra, and David Finkelhor. 2007. "The relative importance of online victimization in understanding depression, delinquency, and substance use." *Child Maltreatment* 12:314–324. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077559507305996.

Netizens. Dir. Cynthia Lowen. Fork Films. 2018. Film.

Norris, Sian and Claudia Torrisi. 2020. "COVID-19 Hasn't Killed Sexual Harassment at Work – It's Just Moved Online." *OpenDemocracy*. https://opendemocracy.net/en/5050/covid19-sexual-harassment-work-online/.

Peshkin, Alan. 1988. "In search of subjectivity: One's own." *Educational Researcher* 17(7):17-21. https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.3102/0013189X017007017.

Shapiro, Emily. 2019. "'Humiliated': Chanel Miller, Survivor in Brock Turner Sex Assault Case, Shares Her Story of Trauma and Recovery." *ABC News*. https://abcnews.go.com/US/humiliated-chanel-miller-survivor-brock-turner-sex-assault/story?id=65821466.

Van Royen, Kathleen, Karolien Poels, and Heidi Vandebosch. 2016. "Help, I am losing control! Examining the reporting of sexual harassment by adolescents to social networking sites." *Cyberpsychology, Behavior, and Social Networking* 19:16–22. https://doi.org/10.1089/cyber.2015.0168.

Vogels, Emily A., Andrew Perrin, Lee Rainie, and Monica Anderson. 2020. "53% Of Americans Say the Internet Has Been Essential During the COVID-19 Outbreak." Pew Research Center. Retrieved November 30, 2020 (https://www.pewresearch.org/internet/2020/04/30/53-of-americans-say-the-internet-has-been-essential-during-the-covid-19-outbreak/).

Weiss, Robert Stuart. 1995. *Learning From Strangers: The Art and Method of Qualitative Interview Studies.* United Kingdom: Free Press.

Ybarra, Michele L. 2004. "Linkage between depressive symptomatology and Internet harassment among young regular Internet users." *Cyberpsychology & Behavior* 7: 247–257. https://doi.org/10.1089/109493104323024500.

Ybarra, Michele L., Dorothy L. Espelage, and Kimberly J. Mitchell. 2007. "The co-occurrence of Internet harassment and unwanted sexual solicitation victimization and perpetration: Associations with psychosocial indicators." *Journal of Adolescent Health* 41:S31–S41. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2007.09.010.

Proximity to Santa Clara University and Health in Students During the COVID-19 Pandemic

By

Diego Ardila and Jessica Britt

ABSTRACT. Our research project investigates the connection between living location (off or on-campus housing or living at home) and physical, emotional, and mental health. The guiding research question for this project was: How does living location impact the emotional, physical, and mental health of Santa Clara college students? To gather data for this research project, each researcher completed two interviews conducted over Zoom and did two hours of field observations. This research paper, which limited its scope to Santa Clara University students, contributes to early findings on the COVID-19 pandemic and its impacts on student health. We found that SCU students living at home experienced better physical health than students living near campus and those living near campus experienced better emotional and mental health than those living at home. This shows that students being near others who can relate to their academic and professional loads improves their mental and emotional health, thus emphasizing the positive effect of student housing near campus on college students' overall health. This also provides empirical support for the decreased physical health in students living near campus during the COVID-19 pandemic. Future studies should explore these themes on a larger scale at other institutions for more generalizability.

INTRODUCTION

For this study, our guiding research question was how does living situation affect the physical, emotional, and mental health of Santa Clara University college students during the COVID-19 pandemic? The onset of the pandemic has catalyzed the growth of a body of research focusing on the effects of the pandemic, including literature focused on health. There have been three main studies on the health of college students during the pandemic, one conducted in Canada, one conducted in Turkey, and one conducted in China (Hamza et al. 2020; Hergüner et al. 2020; Yang, Tu, and Dai 2020). These ask questions that are the most similar to the one we will be investigating in this study. Their findings are supported by the research of other scholars, who have focused predominantly on the impact of the pandemic on those of a specific ethnic background, the general public of Spain, and the mental and physical health implications of the pandemic on college students (Chaney 2020; Hervalejo, Carcedo, and Fernandez-Rouco 2020; Kecojevic, Basch, Sullivan, and Davi 2020; Keel et al. 2020). Based on the findings of our research, we assert that Santa Clara University (SCU) students living at home experience better physical health than their counterparts in Santa Clara, and students living at school experience better emotional and mental health than their at-home peers.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Physical Health

It has been found that students in higher education who are currently enrolled in online learning struggle with physical health. Students who were surveyed on their physical health reported concerns about their weight gain, diet, and lack of physical activity. Some of the most influential factors students reported were screen time and adjustment to COVID-19 living (Keel et al. 2020). The impact of mental and emotional health on physical health is direct; poor mental and emotional health can lead to poor physical health and vice versa (Chaney 2020). We will be collecting similar information to Keel and colleagues' (2020) study, but attempting to analyze the information from a framework based on living location as opposed to a general information collection.

Emotional Health

During our research study, we made a distinction between emotional and mental health. Traditionally in past research, mental health has been defined to include "emotional, psychological, and social well-being," which groups emotional health as a sub-category of mental health (Anon 2020). However, in this study we will be discussing mental and emotional health as separate entities, defining emotional health as "how one experiences and deals with their emotions" and mental health as focus, drive, and motivation level (Anon 2020). We chose to separate the two types of health because both are integral to the life of a college student and we did not feel that proper attention would be paid to either if we tried to group both under a single term for the purpose of the study.

Since we are defining emotional health as how one experiences and deals with their emotions, the following details the relevant aspects of prior studies concerning students in the pandemic. Students participating in online learning have reported high levels of distress, stress, and depression (Kecojevic et al. 2020). The COVID-19 pandemic has taken a strain on students who are more overwhelmed than before, worried about their future, and are in need of emotional support during online learning. Often, a lack of emotional support will translate into a decline in emotional health. One longitudinal study found that within postsecondary students in Canada, the only ones that experienced a marked decay in their emotional health were those who experienced increased social isolation instead of those who had pre-existing mental or emotional health conditions (Hamza et al. 2020). Another study found that family played a very important role in emotional health, and that role could be either protective or threatening to emotional health based on the levels of cohesion, communication, and flexibility present within the familial relationships. This hints towards family being a potential key influence in the social connectivity of college students. Psychological discomfort and feelings of loneliness and isolation were the issues that were discussed most with the healthcare professionals represented in the study, and of those anxiety was the most common diagnosis (Hervalejo et al. 2020). The lack of social connectivity was what

caused these individuals to seek professional help for their suffering emotional health. Another study, done within the African American community and focusing on family, states that physical affection and presence is very important within that community. Elder African-Americans especially are suffering from a lack of physical and emotional connection, and because of this emphasis on physical presence, Zoom and other types of virtual connection are not having the same mitigating effects on social distance in the African-American community as they are in other communities. Finally, anxiety, depression and hopelessness were present in high rates within the African American community as they suffered from a deprivation of physical contact and adequate social connectivity (Chaney 2020). The topic of social isolation and its impact on emotional health has been raised, but has not been fully developed in the existing literature past conceding that it's a factor in the emotional health of an individual. In our study, we hope to gather more information on social connectivity and the role that it plays in each unique individual's emotional health to analyze whether its effect is dependent on quality, quantity, type, or variation of social connection. We intend to do this based on the assumption that if one is living at home, one is with their family and if one moved back to live on or near campus, they are living either alone or with friends.

Mental Health

As for mental health, which we have defined as the focus, drive, and motivation level of students, what follows is accounts from past research studies concerning aspects of our operational definition of mental health in college students. Optimistic attitudes regarding the pandemic were correlated with professional stamina and ability to focus (Hergüner et al. 2020). One of the first studies on student mental health during the pandemic, conducted in Wuhan, found that positive thinking and resilience were important mediators on the effect that COVID-19 had on an individual's mental health (Yang et al. 2020). There has not been a lot of research on mental health in college students during the pandemic, but in the interest of adding a new dimension to existing research, our study tries to analyze mental health from a slightly different angle – living situation and everything it entails. This includes professional concentration levels, academic concentration levels, who the individual is living with, and any extra obligations they have to fulfill as a result of their living situation.

METHODS AND ANALYSIS

The majority of research done on students, health, and online learning has been done through surveys. This is because it is the safest option for collecting information in light of social distancing requirements, and it is relatively easy to contact both groups of subjects – those living at home and those living near campus – from the researchers' locations near campus. One downside to this is that the detailed accounts of students are lost in the generalizability of quantitative methods. Another limitation is that it can be very difficult to form a causal analysis of the data since it is more difficult to get detailed comparisons to and information about the past on a survey than it is in an interview. As a result of this, many scientists are struggling to causally relate the pandemic to health, unless they had a pre-existing set of data from before the pandemic that they could

follow up on (Hamza et al. 2020). Our data was gathered in a slightly different fashion than in other research, consisting mostly of qualitative interviews conducted over Zoom to ensure compliance with social distancing measures. Thus, this study will provide an interesting counterpoint to the quantitative studies previously conducted by being able to contribute more detailed information about individuals' unique experiences and feelings during the pandemic.

Data Collection

For this project, we engaged in three different research sites. One researcher conducted interviews and fieldnotes within her apartment where there were two subjects interviewed and three subjects observed. The second researcher conducted interviews through Zoom with two different friends doing online learning from home. The second researcher also conducted observations at a friend's house near the SCU campus. In that house there were seven subjects who were being observed.

To collect our data, we recruited four participants to engage in roughly half-hour to forty-five minute long interviews, which were conducted over Zoom, a virtual conference application that the researchers and interviewees all had free access to. We had previously agreed that one researcher would focus his interviews on students currently residing at home, while the other would focus her interviews on students currently residing on or near campus in Santa Clara. We chose to focus two interviews on students residing in each location so that we would have a similar body of data from students in both categories to base our analysis on. During these interviews, participants responded to a series of semi-structured questions that were written out and agreed upon prior to beginning interviewing. These questions largely focused on daily physical, mental, and emotional health practices, health quality, and comparisons between health practices and quality around campus versus at home (see Appendix A for interview protocol). Conducting the interviews over Zoom offered the advantage that after the interview was over, we did not have to transcribe it ourselves because Zoom transcribed it for us. After completing the interviews, both researchers engaged in two hours each of fieldnotes. These fieldnotes consisted of field observations conducted in a house or apartment near campus during a time of the day when students would be present in common areas. When conducting field observations both researchers had limited engagement with the subjects that they were observing: one was a completely silent observer and one participated at a level that would be considered "cordial" but tried to keep comments to a minimum. During these hours, researchers took detailed notes on all of the comings, goings, and interactions they observed in the common spaces they were in, then later returned to these notes in order to refine them. Due to both researchers having moved back to the Santa Clara area, one researcher did two hours of field notes during the daytime within an off-campus house near Santa Clara University campus, while the other researcher did two hours of field notes during the evening and nighttime hours within an apartment also near Santa Clara University campus.

Sampling

23

Because of the online learning format and limited number of students available to the researchers there was a degree of convenience sampling done. For the convenience of being able to access subjects while still being COVID-19 safe, there was a pool of friends and roommates chosen for the study. This does come with some limitations: because the subjects were chosen from social circles of the researchers, there may be a level of bias for the researchers to be aware of as well as a degree of similar responses from the subjects. There was also a purposive sampling component used. This was done once the researchers identified the pool of possible participants available to choose from. There was a Typical Case purposive sampling used to try to obtain participation from individuals who were able to represent the typical cases of staying at home or living near the SCU campus. This also comes with limitations. Because the purposive sampling focused on finding a typical case there is a compromise of generalizability of the findings to the larger population of university students. However, in addition to the limitations imposed by the purposeful convenience sampling, there also exist many benefits. First, researchers were able to ensure that the participants recruited for the study were adequately representative of the two groups being studied. Within those groups, researchers were also able to select for some diversity in demographics, involvement, and experiences in order to incorporate different COVID health experiences while still staying true to a Typical Case.

Analysis of Methods

Since both physical sites were places that the researchers had access to before the project and since everyone observed and interviewed were friends, roommates, or acquaintances, both researchers approached this project with an "insider status" due to the college student role shared with subjects as well as the ease of access to research sites (Lofland et al. 2006: 41). As a result of this status, gaining access to the observation site was as simple as asking our subjects if they would not mind being interviewed or observed, bypassing the need for a "gatekeeper" (Lofland et al. 2006: 26). Since the individuals being observed and interviewed were already within our social circles, the "insider status" we occupied was a benefit to data collection because the participants being interviewed and observed already felt comfortable with the researchers. Furthermore, since we already knew the participants and were involved in their lives, we were able to have more confidence that the data we were collecting was accurate. It is important to highlight that the researchers were aware of the similarities shared between them and subjects such as social circles, being undergrad students at SCU, and living near campus. Because of this we kept these similarities in mind when collecting data. This allowed for the experiences of students living at home to be represented accurately (Peshkin 1988: 17). In the interviews, both researchers started with the typical pleasantries to try to make the subject comfortable. One researcher took notes during his Zoom interviews but provided verbal encouragement to his interviewees, while the other conducted in-person interviews and tried to maximize eye contact and encouragement through verbal remarks such as "uh-huh" and "go on" punctuated with vigorous nodding. In this way, both of us were able to establish interviewing relationships built on our previously existing friendships with our subjects

that made the interviewees comfortable talking and sharing. Though the researchers had two different styles of interviewing, there was little difference in the quality or quantity of data collected. One possible explanation for this is that since both of us were friends with those we interviewed, the participants were used to the style of interaction and listening that each respective researcher possessed.

One ethical issue, similar to the issue that Carolyn Ellis had, was that since both of us were friends with those that we studied, though we informed them that we were conducting research – especially during the fieldnotes – it is possible that they were so used to seeing us that they forgot about our identities as researchers during that time (Allen 1997). Another ethical issue similar to what was experienced in Allen's article, was that since the subjects were our friends, we hesitated to draw any sort of negative conclusions about them and their well-being. However, our biggest ethical concern was that asking in-depth questions about serious issues such as emotional and mental health, especially during this time when everyone is struggling in some way, would be harmful to the health of our subjects. We tried to mitigate this as much as possible by structuring our interview questions so that we discussed emotional and mental health last to try to prepare them with other questions. Both researchers also made it clear at the beginning of our interviews that if they chose not to answer a question or to stop the interview with us because our questions were getting at topics that were too sensitive, it would not impact their personal relationships with us at all.

After each interview, we wrote a theoretical memo describing our initial impressions from the interview as well as any inflection or body language details that we noticed and wanted to record (Lofland et al. 2006: 210). Throughout our data-gathering process, we wrote periodical coding memos focusing on specific codes and the patterns that were emerging from those codes, as well as any theoretical connections we were seeing (Lofland et al. 2006: 210). We uploaded the interview transcripts to a free coding website called Taguette, and proceeded to do an initial run through of open-coding the interviews line-by-line looking for "analytic dimensions and analytic categories" (Emerson, Fretz, and Shaw 2011: 8; Lofland et al. 2006: 200-201). These "open codes" referred to any sort of pattern that the researchers noticed when analyzing the transcripts and notes of the participants. When we were both finished coding our interviews, we met over Zoom to discuss possible focused codes and merge open codes into the broader focused code categories, yielding 12 focused codes. These "focused codes" were combinations of several similar open codes or new codes corresponding to broad categories and patterns in the data. We then re-coded the interviews with focused codes. These focused codes served as the foundation for our analysis (Lofland et al. 2006: 201). We also coded the fieldnotes using both focused and open codes. There was also another round of memos that took place after we coded our fieldnotes data. These memos allowed us to reflect on the data and begin conceptualizing and interpreting it (Emerson et al. 2011: 13).

RESULTS

Physical Health

We defined physical health as "diet, sleep, or exercise activities that affect one physically," which was coded for 45 times in our transcripts. Two open codes that represented patterns found within the data pertaining to physical health were Sleep Schedule and Diet Comparison. The primary focused code used in this data was Physical Care, which encompassed both positive and negative remarks concerning physical health practices and their qualities.

Results from near-campus residents. In one interview, Caroline remarked that "I go for a run two or three times a week – I would say three times a week, and I do yoga like three or four times a week depending on what I can do," stating further that "on the days that I don't make it outside … I feel gross," which was coded as Physical Care. Clearly, the runs and yoga that she discusses are for the purpose of keeping her in good physical shape and making her feel better. She also discusses the need to go outside and how when she isn't able to get outside for the day, she feels "gross". Her exercise schedule is for her physical well-being as well as her mental and emotional health so that she doesn't feel like she just sat inside the whole day. However, she goes on to contrast her exercise schedule at school with her exercise schedule when she was at home, stating "when I was in [state] ... I did yoga about every, like every night, it was probably like 6 times a week which was really, yeah it was really good for me.. but in terms of like elevating my heart rate and getting outside I really didn't do that." Supporting Caroline's point of view, another near-campus student, Daisy, discusses how "at home I probably would be going for more walks, because I'd walk my dog or go for hikes or do things like that. But here I always say I'll go for walks and then I end up not doing it." Later in Caroline's interview, she states that at home, "we definitely were eating a lot healthier than I am now," which fell under the Diet Comparison code as well as the Physical Care code. Pertaining to the Sleep Schedule code, Caroline mentioned that "I think I'm getting regular amounts of sleep but as the quarter has gone on I think I'm getting an inadequate amount of sleep."

All field notes were conducted within near-campus residences due to the researcher locations, so our data does not allow for a direct comparison between observation data in homes and in near-campus residences. However, the observations made near campus seem to line up with the implications of the interview data. One hour of fieldnotes mentions a regular runner, Amy, who "returns from a half hour long walk to recover from her class", choosing a walk because she was not able to find time for a run when it was light out. Another observation records a conversation between Caroline and Daisy discussing seasonings for their nutritious tofu and vegetable meal along with Daisy's comment that if her lab hadn't let out early, "she wouldn't have been able to eat until after 8 pm."

Results from students living at home. Luna, a student who is living at home during online learning was asked how her physical health practices are now compared to when she was living at SCU. She responded:

I think they're healthier now. Because even if I was on campus, like the gym isn't open and at least at home, I have like the space to like workout, because I have like a really big backyard. And again, like food wise I like knowing what I'm eating. So I've been able to do more of that at home instead of relying on like the options at Benson does have that are really limited...Yeah, so it's just more motivating at home because my parents are really good about like taking walks in the afternoon, and sometimes I go with them or if it's not that like we have a bike in the backyard and like my dad and I will take turns using it and just like do stupid competition with it sometimes, so I think the motivation is definitely better at home.

Here one can see the contrast Luna expresses between living at home and living at SCU. She mentions how at SCU her workout space and options would be more limited than at home and how her parents also motivate her to workout. This is also paired with a contrast of the choices of food she has at home compared to the ones at SCU. She claims to have more control in knowing what she is eating which she contrasted with a lack of knowing at SCU.

When asked about sleep schedule Emily said

I have commonly been a night owl. So I have almost always just been up at night, however, being home I've realized that I am exhausted. And I'd like to sleep early however I choose not to. Because it is at night that everybody is asleep so that I get the most peace and quiet to be able to focus and do my work, which is when my homework time begins.

Here Emily is explaining how her sleep schedule is similar to the one she had at SCU.

Emotional Health

In terms of this research project, we define emotional health as "the ability to accept and manage feelings through challenge and change."

Social Connectivity. When the transcripts of our interviews were initially open coded, two of the codes that were used to represent emotional health were "good emotional health" and "challenges with emotional health." However, through coding these interviews, we found a direct link between social connectivity and emotional health, suggested by findings such as: "a pretty stable emotional state is I think partially due to me just dealing with things.. but also to have people to support me and to rant to and just get it over with and move on." Thus, we connected emotional health to social connectivity, which we described as "substantial interactions with other human beings," and was coded for 63 times in our transcripts.

Results from near-campus residents. Caroline, living near-campus, says that her "pretty stable emotional state is I think partially due to me just dealing with things.. but also to have [roommates] to support me and to rant to and just get it over with and move

on." In contrast, when she comments on her social experience at home, she discusses how it was "very isolating to have to lock myself in a room essentially and work all the hours I needed to work" and that she felt like she was "piggybacking .. on other people's relationships.. for social interaction" when she was home, which made her uncomfortable and hindered her emotional health. Since Caroline did not have peers who understood the stress and volume of her workload and was interacting with family members in different stages of their lives and with different amounts and schedules of free time, Caroline did not feel like she was able to relate with those around her and her social interactions were void of the school, work, and friends-related themes that she was used to with her peers at school. Daisy, by contrast, remarks that while she is "a very introverted person so like quarantine like just being at home with my family was not disastrous for me like I was like really fine you know not seeing as many people," she does "generally feel better like seeing friends more even if I like would say that I feel fine, I would definitely say I feel better seeing people."

During the hours of fieldnotes observing Daisy, Caroline, and Amy, most instances of Social Connectivity simply refer to the time that the ladies spent together, such as "Daisy and Caroline sit in the kitchen" and "Daisy discusses how someone that works at her lab has asked her for a ride to their friend's house in Washington." At another observation site off campus near SCU, students were observed getting ready to go hang out and get some boba as well as getting brunch while socially distancing. Subjects were also observed discussing their "friendsgiving" plans, a dinner where they cook together and socialize with each other.

Results from students living at home. When asked about her social connectivity and emotional health, Emily said, "How am I feeling at the end of the day, drained and sad and upset. I miss my friends. I'd like to go out, but then I also try to think about it. Okay. How am I feeling at the end of the month? How am I feeling at the end of the quarter or the school quarter."

Here you can see that Emily discusses how a lack of social connection to her friends adds to her feelings of being drained, upset, and sad. She also touches on the inability to do things like go out which add to the frustration of online school at home. Emily explains that the way in which she dealt with the frustration of school before the pandemic was by treasuring brief interactions with friends and acquaintances between classes and around campus and by leaning on others going through the same thing to help her through her stress. The fact that all interactions must now be so intentional and planned over Zoom or FaceTime removes an essential part of the informal support system she had at school. She also stated that "Being back at Santa Clara. I was always around people. And so even when I was upset or feeling down or anxious I always had people around me if they were feeling the same way, or if they just helped me kind of get out of that little slump." Here Emily is talking about what her social connectivity was like at SCU and how her social circle validated her feelings by expressing their own similar feelings or were able to cheer her up and diminish her stress level. This is a contrast to what she reported in the first quote on her social connectivity at home.

When asked about her social connectivity and emotional health Luna said,

> So this whole thing has been really weird to like not be able to see my friends...And I know like… When, when I see like my friends are going through a hard time it's harder for me to like literally be there for them like physically. Um, and that takes a toll on me sometimes just because I know that if we were in person, there's probably more than I could do to like just support them however, they need it.

Here she is discussing how not being able to see her friends and therefore not being able to emotionally support them takes an emotional toll on her.

Quality of Emotional Health

Quality of Emotional Health is a focused code that analyzes accounts from students regarding their general emotional state.

Results from near-campus residents. When asked to discuss her general emotional health, Caroline remarks that "to be able to have deep important conversations about things … that are affecting my mental and emotional, like, state, for good or for bad, to be able to talk about that with people that understand and relate is really important." She discusses the importance of support systems who not only understand what she is going through, but are going through something similar. Although human support systems play a major role in social connectivity, subjects reported specific support systems as playing a more important role in their quality of emotional health than general social connectivity does.

Results from students living at home. When asked about her emotional health in her living situation Luna said:

> I'm like I'm already a very anxious person. I have been for a long time and I've learned to deal with it, but I think being back home. I also now worry about, like, is my brother doing his school. Is he getting his assignments done, you know like is my dad taking care of himself when he goes to work. And obviously like my mom was like, out of the country for a while. So I always wondered about her and how like she was dealing with everything. And obviously like these are all things I would worry about regardless of whether or not I was with them, but I think you know more about what's going on in a person's life and you're actually like living with them physically. So I have worried a lot more (laughs).

This is an example of how living at home can be emotionally taxing for students during online learning by adding more to their plate.

Mental Health

To measure mental health, which we defined as "focus and drive when it comes to academic and professional obligations, especially as compared to in-person academic quarters," we used the focused code Focus, which was coded for 59 times throughout our transcripts. Focus was a combination of Academic Focus and Professional Focus, which were two of our original open codes.

Results from near-campus residents. In her interview, Caroline discusses how with three part-time jobs and four very difficult classes

> it's .. hard… to separate activities. Like I feel like my attention is being called in so many different directions so that ..like I said earlier, like when I sit down to work on one thing .., like my brain is screaming at me about all the other things I should be thinking about.

However, regardless of her issues separating activities, when asked to compare her mental health here to her mental health at home, she explains that "in terms of being focused on work this is the best that it's been in my online experience and .. being in like a more academic setting, I know we're still in our apartment but being somewhere other people are doing school definitely helps." Daisy echoes Caroline's explanations, stating that due to the teachers making classes more structured, she has "been treating my work more like typical, typical school", identifying her levels of focus and drive as better this quarter than winter and spring quarter last year (the beginning of the COVID pandemic). She adds that professionally she feels "more focused than she had before" due to the novelty of being able to go into a workplace to complete her job.

Within the field observations done at an apartment near campus, the only observation that supported good focus is when "Amy has been studying all day and has a test at 5." The bulk of the other observations focus on feelings of burnout, such as Daisy stating "that she doesn't have the mental energy to be the driving force behind her group project for her statistics class," that she "needs to continue work on her statistics midterm, but since she still has 2 days she doesn't feel the need to work on it now," and "that she feels so mentally burnt out that she wants to just sit in a chair and do nothing until March." In another field site, subjects were observed discussing feelings of burnout and low energy together. One subject in particular discussed how she had 15 hours of reading to do and how it was going to affect her other classes.

Results from students living at home. When asked about her focus Emily said she was "not that focused. In all honesty I feel being online has definitely shifted. A lot of students focus where I feel even my closest friends will say 'I feel I haven't learned too much or as much as I would have being on campus or being in a classroom setting'" and in terms of professional focus she said,

> Professionally I have always been able to maintain a certain balance. And I think to this day that has not changed with the virus and with everything that's going on and being at home. I still think that I've been able to uphold that certain image of

acting working speaking as a professional so that I feel hasn't had much effect or change.

When Luna was asked the same questions she said, "Less so than when I was on campus. I don't know exactly how to explain it. Like, I guess, on a scale of one to 10 on campus, I would be like an eight all the time. But at home. I feel like a six...Or like a five on the week."

When asked about professional focus Luna said "I feel like I'm pretty focused like obviously it's a job like you. It's responsibility. So that means you gotta get stuff done." Both Emily and Luna's accounts point towards a pattern of reduction in academic focus among students who are living at home with family during the pandemic due to a decrease in academic engagement and a plateau in professional focus due to professional engagement remaining the same. These sentiments are echoed by Daisy and Caroline, who encountered similar struggles with academic focus when living at home during the pandemic that have now been lessened by their return to near-campus housing.

DISCUSSION

In this research study, we aimed to explore the physical, emotional, and mental health of Santa Clara University college students based on whether they were living near campus or at home. We found that students living near campus in Santa Clara, in general, experienced better emotional health and mental health levels and worse physical health levels. In contrast, students living at home, in general, experienced better physical health and worse emotional health and mental health.

Physical Health

The results of our study support the claim that physical health among Santa Clara University students during the COVID-19 pandemic is generally better within the population of students who are living at home as compared to the physical health of students living near school. Students living near school claimed to eat better while at home. This is due to having food prepared for them by a parent or sibling while at home, having more choices in what goes into their food, and having structured meal times. When asked to compare their workout regimes when living near campus to their workouts at home, students reported that they worked out more regularly and with more intensity at home than they did at school. This can be explained by living at home providing students with gym equipment and space, variety in exercise options, as well as family members to exercise with. Students living both near campus and at home discussed their irregular and inadequate sleep schedules during interviews. As a result of this, there were no reported differences found in sleep between both living contexts studied. This can be explained by the academic and professional work load students reported that caused students to often work late hours.

Emotional Health

The first finding of this study regarding emotional health was that levels of emotional health are very closely linked to levels of social connectivity. When asked for a comparison, both interviewed students currently living near campus remarked that moving back to Santa Clara in the fall and being around friends placed them in a much better emotional state than they were in when they were at home the previous spring. This is because returning to school made them feel more socially connected whereas at home they felt very socially isolated. As a result, our data suggests that students living around campus experienced much better emotional health than their counterparts living at home. Upon returning to campus in the fall, interviewees explained that being able to see and interact with friends and roommates at school aided in the inflation of their emotional health, and both reported that this was boosted even more because they were seeing individuals who could relate to their academic struggles with online learning and the often rigorous schedules they were keeping to finish their work. In contrast, when these individuals were at home, they reflected on feelings of isolation being stuck in their rooms completing their work while their family members were spending time together without them. These findings are also supported by accounts from students currently living at home during the COVID-19 pandemic. The student participants from the group living at home during the pandemic reported feelings of being drained, sad, upset, and lonely. They also reported feeling negatively impacted emotionally due to the social isolation that comes with being at home.

Mental Health

Defining mental health as the level of focus, drive, and motivation a student has (which are essential to collegiate success), our results claim that mental health among students living near campus is better than that among students living at home. While students living near campus mentioned being extremely overwhelmed with the work they had to do and the fact that everything was online, both mentioned feeling the most motivated and focused that they had since school was moved online. This was likely due to many factors, two of which were enumerated in the interviews as better preparation on the part of the teacher and the fact that they were living in a place that they had associated with academics and focus surrounded by people whose academic and professional priorities were the same as theirs. In fact, one interviewee living near campus reported that the ability to complete her job in-person enhanced her focus since it was such a novelty to be able to complete work that was not online. Students living at home reported the opposite of these trends. They discussed a decrease of academic focus due to feeling less engaged and more removed from the material they were working on. By contrast, when asked about professional focus there was a pattern of professional focus staying high and not decreasing among both groups. This was due to them feeling more engaged and socially connected in the workplace due to it being one of few avenues for social connection during the pandemic. The field observations that were made around campus seemed initially to contradict this claim since many observations focused on feelings of burnout and the immense amounts of work yet to be done. However, since all field notes were conducted around school, there is no point of comparison to concretely claim that the data gathered during observations refute the

data gathered in the interviews. Both academic and professional focus are key to keep in mind when studying the health of students due to the impacts it has on work-life balance and in turn the allocation of time for all other aspects of health.

Implications

This exploratory research study serves as an addition to early research on the COVID-19 pandemic and its effects on University students' health. Our findings imply that mental and emotional health is better for students who return to campus and physical health is better for students who do not, but future research would be necessary to generalize our findings in this way. This research gives an insight to the SCU community as well as some social processes its college students face. This includes the influence of social connectivity on emotional health and academic focus as well as family dynamics and their influence in the focus of students. Our findings about physical health hint at a possible contradiction to Keel and colleagues' (2020) research in a southeastern university that stated college students who have been moved online are struggling with weight gain and other aspects of physical health. This is a possible contradiction because our findings showed that students who were living at home did not display the physical health challenges that Keel and colleagues suggest are universal to college students affected by the pandemic. We cannot directly contradict Keel and colleagues' research since we approached physical health with the possibly confounding variable of living situation (which Keel and colleagues did not measure) and do not have a statistically significant sample size. Hamza and colleagues (2020) claim that those who experienced the greatest decline in their emotional health were those who were socially isolated, which was supported by our findings that those who were living at home and were isolated from peers who would be able to relate to their experiences had the worst emotional health. Our findings directly contradict Hervalejo and colleagues' (2020) research about low levels of emotional health. His findings claimed that people felt the most isolated when they were not able to connect with family members, but our findings suggested that the greatest isolation was experienced when students were not able to connect with their friends and peers. These findings may have been different in the studies because they investigated different populations. Since we did not pay specific attention to attitudes or levels of positivity in mindsets throughout our study, our findings do not directly confirm or deny the previous research on mental health.

Recommendations for Future Research

In order to advance this research topic we suggest more studies on various groups of college students. Because this research paper only analyzed a handful of college students, future research should also focus on studying a larger number of students sampled non-purposively in order to be more generalizable to and representative of the broader college student population. We recommend utilizing a random sampling technique to achieve this. We were also unable to make any significant claims using our field observations due to the fact that we were not able to observe any students who were learning from home. Future research should be sure that this population is

adequately represented in field observations to better gauge how students maneuver COVID-19 from home. One of the interesting findings of our study was that one interviewee spent a lot of time focusing on the importance of space in her life as associated with focus: space to study alone, space associated with an academic focus, and space associated with different types of work. We would recommend future research into this finding. Research on the COVID-19 pandemic and its effects shouldn't stop when in person learning resumes but should continue to research how this abrupt change has impacted the health of students.

AUTHOR'S CONTRIBUTIONS

Both co-authors were fully, equal, and collaboratively involved in every aspect of the research design, data analysis, and writing. By prior agreement, the listing of the co-authors is in alphabetical order.

APPENDICES

Appendix A

QUESTIONS
- Living Location
  - Where are you living this quarter? What factors influenced your decision for where to live? How have you enjoyed your living situation this quarter? Walk me through a typical day. What do you think your quarter would have looked like if you had made the opposite decision?
- Physical Health
  - Tell me about your physical health in your current living situation. (Follow-up: What's your diet like? What's your exercise schedule like? What's your sleep schedule like? How healthy do you physically feel on an average day?) How would you compare your diet, exercise, and sleep habits where you are living to your physical health (at home/off campus)?
- Emotional Health (ability to accept and manage feelings through challenge and change)
  - How do you feel about your current living situation? How do you feel social connectivity impacts your emotional health? How has your current living situation affected your social engagement? How has this directly affected your emotional health? Describe any support systems you may have in your current living situation. How do you think your support systems compare (at home/off campus)? How would you compare your emotional health where you are living to your emotional health (at home/off campus)?
- Mental Health (psychological well-being)
  - How do you think your current living situation has had an impact on your mental health? How focused do you feel academically? If you have a job, how focused do you feel professionally? How do you think this differs due to your living situation? Describe your academic concentration level over

the course of your online learning experience (per quarter). How do you think your mental health differs when you are (at home/off campus)?

REFERENCES

Allen, Charlotte. 1997. "When Sociologists Deceive Their Subjects." *Lingua Franca* 7:31−39.

Anon. 2020. "What Is Mental Health?" Retrieved January 10, 2021 (https://www.mentalhealth.gov/basics/what-is-mental-health).

Chaney, Cassandra. 2020. "Family Stress and Coping Among African Americans in the Age of COVID-19." *Journal of Comparative Family Studies* 51(3-4):254–73.

Emerson, Robert M., Rachel I. Fretz and Linda L. Shaw. 2011. *Writing Ethnographic Fieldnotes* (2nd Edition). Chicago IL: The University of Chicago Press.

Hamza, Chloe A., Lexi Ewing, Nancy L. Heath, and Abby L. Goldstein. 2020. "When Social Isolation Is Nothing New: A Longitudinal Study Psychological Distress During COVID-19 Among University Students With and Without Preexisting Mental Health Concerns." *Canadian Psychology/Psychologie Canadienne 62*(1): 20-30.

Hergüner, Gülten, Saltuk Bugra, Sinem Hergüner, and Ahmet Dönmez. 2020. "The Effect of Online Learning Attitudes of University Students on Their Online Learning Readiness."*The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology* 19(4):102–10. Retrieved December 5, 2020 (https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1272871).

Hervalejo, Diego, Rodrigo J. Carcedo, and Noelia Fernández-Rouco. 2020. "Family and Mental Health During the Confinement Due to the COVID-19 Pandemic in Spain: The Perspective of the Counselors Participating in Psychological Helpline Services." *Journal of Comparative Family Studies* 51(3-4):399–416.

Kecojevic, Aleksandar, Corey H. Basch, Marianne Sullivan, and Nicole K. Davi. 2020. "The Impact of the COVID-19 Epidemic on Mental Health of Undergraduate Students in New Jersey, Cross-Sectional Study." *Plos One* 15(9).

Keel, Pamela, Gomez Marielle, Harris Lauren, Kennedy Grace, Riberio Jessica, and Joiner Thomas. 2020. "Gaining 'The Quarantine 15:' Perceived versus Observed Weight Changes in College Students in the Wake of COVID -19." *International Journal of Eating Disorders* 53(11):1801–8.

Lofland, John, David A. Snow, Leon Anderson, and Lyn H. Lofland. 2006. *Analyzing Social Settings: A Guide to Qualitative Observation and Analysis*. Wadsworth Publishing.

Peshkin, A. 1988. "In Search of Subjectivity-One's Own". *Educational Researcher* 17(7): 17-21.

Yang, Dong, Chia-Ching Tu, and Xiao Dai. 2020. "The Effect of the 2019 Novel Coronavirus Pandemic on College Students in Wuhan." *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice, and Policy* 12(S1).

Work-Life Balance and Satisfaction with Family Life: A Methodological Analysis

By

Anjali Rangaswami

ABSTRACT. Balancing work duties and family responsibilities is an ongoing struggle for many American adults. As work is a crucial aspect of maintaining a family unit, an individual's level of work-life balance may affect how they feel about their family life. This raises the question, is there an association between Americans' work-life balance and their satisfaction with family life? To address this question, a sample of 809 American adult respondents was drawn from the International Social Survey Program's (ISSP) Family and Changing Gender Roles Module. The variable of work-life balance was measured by asking respondents how often in the past three months they experienced difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities because of the amount of time spent on their job. The variable of satisfaction with family life was measured by asking respondents how satisfied they were with family life. The data was analyzed using IBM's SPSS software, where I performed a one-way ANOVA test and cross-tabulation to test for association between work-life balance and satisfaction with family life. My findings indicate a significant difference in satisfaction with family life given variation in the frequency of difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities due to work. In particular, participants who "never" experienced difficulty with balancing work and family responsibilities had a higher level of satisfaction with family life than those who experienced difficulty "several times a month" and "several times a week" (P = .001).

INTRODUCTION

In a society which values work as an integral part of maintaining and supporting a family unit, assessing the impact of work responsibilities on one's satisfaction with family life is of great interest. The family is an institution which holds sociological significance relating to structure, as it dictates and socializes many norms, especially regarding the division of power and labor within a family unit. More specifically, the family can be understood as an "institutional arena," or a social space wherein "relations between people in common positions are governed by accepted rules of interaction" (Cohen 2020:9). The family arena also interacts closely with the State and the market arenas. Thus, the following question arises: is there an association between Americans' work-life balance and their satisfaction with family life? In my research, the independent variable is work-life balance and the dependent variable is satisfaction with family life. While previous studies have indicated possible associations between hours worked per week and satisfaction with work–family balance, I did not encounter research that conceptualized or measured work-life balance and satisfaction with family life in the particular way I have chosen (McNamara et al. 2013).

BACKGROUND

My research is well-positioned within the range of inquiries into work-life balance and satisfaction with family life. The dilemma of balancing both work and family responsibilities is perhaps one of the most relatable experiences in our culture. Broader research suggests that increases in the level of work-life balance, measured in terms of time spent on leisure and personal care, can improve the level of overall life satisfaction for men and women (Hideo 2020). However, both work and familial duties may encroach on an individual's ability to spend time on themselves. More specific research demonstrates that work-life balance and job satisfaction are negatively related to work-family conflict, further alluding to the interaction between the workplace and the family (Talukder 2019). Literature also indicates that the individual characteristics of one's work-family boundaries influence their overall work-life satisfaction, and that increased work-family interference is associated with decreased flexibility with familial boundaries (Lin and Jinyan 2015). Thus, individual family norms, such as boundary-setting and flexibility, may further affect how responsibilities are balanced and experienced. In addition, work design characteristics may influence the levels of work interference with family (WIF) among adult workers, where work conditions such as full-time work, varied work shifts, work from home, and work overload are associated with increased odds of experiencing WIF (Smith, Yu and Le 2020). Notably, the likelihood of experiencing WIF increases for employees with children (Smith et al. 2020). Workplace policies regarding flexibility of work schedules may be a further influence, particularly for hourly workers, as the ability for employees to take time off during the workday is associated with greater levels of happiness (Golden, Henly and Lambert 2013). Interestingly, a 1996 study found that workers who reported higher levels of job involvement also reported higher levels of work interfering with family, while workers who reported higher levels of family involvement also reported higher levels of family interfering with work (Adams, King and King 1996). However, while numerous studies examine facets of the work-life and work-family dilemma, my research possesses a unique and specific focus on the relationship between work-life balance and satisfaction with family life overall.

DATA AND METHODS

All data was gathered from the Family and Changing Gender Roles Module codebook collected by the International Social Survey Program (ISSP) in 2012 and analyzed using IBM's SPSS software. Although the Family and Changing Gender Roles Module is an international survey, in this analysis, I focused on the context of the United States. The total number of respondents in the survey I analyzed was 809. The sample consisted of adults in the United States over the age of 30 years. The independent variable, work-life balance, is defined as balancing the responsibilities of both paid work and family duties (Lim and Mishra 2020). To measure work-life balance, I will be using Question R23b from the ISSP codebook which asks how often in the past three months "it has been difficult for me to fulfill my family responsibilities because of the amount of time I spent on my job." The answer options are "several times a week," "several times a month," "once or twice," "never," and "doesn't apply/no job." Respondents who selected "doesn't

apply/no job" have been excluded from my research, as I am not interested in measuring their cases. Thus, the independent variable is an ordinal variable with 4 categories, where the highest difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities is represented by "several times a week" and the lowest difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities is represented by "never." The dependent variable, satisfaction with family life, is measured using Question R26 from the ISSP codebook which asks, "All things considered, how satisfied are you with family life?" The answer options are "completely dissatisfied," "very dissatisfied," "fairly dissatisfied," "neither satisfied or dissatisfied," "fairly satisfied," "very satisfied," and "completely satisfied." Thus, the dependent variable is an ordinal variable, which is treated as an interval ratio variable for the purposes of my analysis, with 7 categories; "completely dissatisfied" represents the greatest dissatisfaction with family life, where dissatisfaction decreases incrementally with each category until "completely satisfied," which represents a complete lack of dissatisfaction with family life.

The methodological approach I utilized was selected based on the conceptualization of the independent and dependent variables, work-life balance and satisfaction with family life, respectively. I tested for an association between my two variables using a one-way ANOVA test in SPSS. I performed a cross-tabulation between my independent and dependent variables to see if there was a preliminary association. My methodology and selection of tests enabled me to compare the different levels of familial life satisfaction among different levels of difficulty completing family responsibilities due to work.

FINDINGS

The mean for my independent variable, difficulty fulfilling family responsibility due to work obligation, is 3.03 (Table 1), indicating on average that respondents experience difficulty either once or twice a month or never. However, while the mean can indicate the central tendency of a dataset, it does not reflect variation and can be influenced by outliers.

Table 1: Descriptive Statistics Summary

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Difficulty fulfilling family responsibility	816	1	4	3.03	1.061
Satisfaction with family life	1263	1	7	2.37	1.146
Valid N (listwise)	809				

Alternatively, the standard deviation indicates variation in the data, making it a useful statistic especially in tandem with the mean. The standard deviation for my independent variable, 1.061 (Table 1), means that 68% of participants experience difficulty fulfilling

family responsibility either once or twice a month or never. The mean for my dependent variable, satisfaction with family life, is 2.37 (Table 1), indicating on average that respondents are either "very" or "fairly" satisfied with family life. The standard deviation of 1.146 (Table 1) for my independent variable means that 68% of survey participants are either "very" or "fairly" satisfied with family life.

Table 2: Summary of ANOVA

	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	P
Between groups	18.777	3	6.259	5.311	.001
Within groups	948.691	805	1.178		
Total	967.468	808			

The results of the ANOVA (Table 2) demonstrate that difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities due to work has a significant influence on satisfaction with family life (ANOVA, $F_{3, 805}$ = 5.311, P = 0.001). People who had difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities "several times a week" due to work were significantly less satisfied with their family life than those who "never" experienced difficulty fulfilling their family responsibilities (Tukey's HSD, P = .003). Similarly, people who had difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities "several times a month" were significantly less satisfied with their family life than those who "never" experienced difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities (Tukey's HSD, P = 0.043).

Table 3: Cross Tabulation of Independent and Dependent Variables

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation	95% Confidence Interval	
						Lower Bound	Upper Bound
Several times a week	105	1	7	2.55	1.373	2.29	2.82
Several times a month	132	1	6	2.42	1.049	2.24	2.60
Once or twice	212	1	7	2.33	1.082	2.18	2.48
Never	360	1	6	2.13	1.004	2.03	2.24
Total	809	1	7	2.29	1.094	2.21	2.36

The 95% confidence interval for respondents who "never" experienced difficulty is [2.03, 2.24] (Table 3). Thus, I have 95% confidence that the average of my population, namely

all adults in the United States who have "never" experienced difficulty fulfilling family obligations due to work, lies between 2.03 and 2.24. The 95% confidence interval for respondents who experienced difficulty "once or twice" is [2.18, 2.48] (Table 3). As such, I have 95% confidence that the population mean of all American adults who experienced difficulty "once or twice" lies between 2.18 and 2.48. The 95% confidence interval for respondents who experienced difficulty "several times a month" is [2.24, 2.60] (Table 3). I thus have 95% confidence that the population mean of all American adults who experienced difficulty "several times a month" lies between 2.24 and 2.60. The 95% confidence interval for respondents who experienced difficulty "several times a month" is [2.29, 2.82] (Table 3). Thus, I am 95% confident that the population mean of all American adults who experienced difficulty "several times a week" lies between 2.29 and 2.82. As such, across all levels of difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities, I have 95% confidence that on average, the American adult population is either "very" or "fairly" satisfied with family life.

Table 4: Post Hoc Tests – Multiple Comparisons

(I) Difficulty fulfilling family responsibility	(J) Difficulty fulfilling family responsibility	Mean Difference (I-J)	Standard Error	P	95% Confidence Interval	
					Lower Bound	Upper Bound
Several times a week	Several times a month	.128	.142	.803	-2.4	.49
	Once or twice	.222	.130	.316	-.11	.56
	Never	.419*	.120	.003	.11	.73
Several times a month	Several times a week	-.128	.142	.803	-.49	.24
	Once or twice	.094	.120	.863	-.22	.40
	Never	.291*	.110	.043	.01	.58
Once or twice	Several times a week	-.222	.130	.316	-.56	.11
	Several times a month	-.094	.120	.863	-.40	.22
	Never	.197	.094	.156	-.05	.44
Never	Several times a week	-.419*	.120	.003	-.73	-.11
	Several times a month	-.291*	.110	.043	-.58	-.01
	Once or twice	-.197	.094	.156	-.44	.05

The mean difference is significant at the 0.05 level

My null hypothesis is that satisfaction with family life does not differ based on frequency of difficulty fulfilling family duties due to time spent at work. My alternative hypothesis is that satisfaction with family life is associated with frequency of difficulty completing family obligations due to work. I found evidence to reject the null hypothesis ($P < 0.05$). More specifically, people who have difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities "several times a month" and "several times a week" due to work are significantly less satisfied with their family life than those who never experience difficulty fulfilling their family responsibilities ($P = .001$).

CONCLUSION

My ANOVA analysis demonstrates a significant difference in satisfaction with family life given variation in the frequency of difficulty fulfilling family responsibilities due to work. Post-hoc testing (Table 4) reveals further nuances within my sample. Specifically, participants who "never" experienced difficulty with balancing work and family responsibilities in the past three months have a higher level of satisfaction with family life than those who experienced difficulty "several times a month" and "several times a week" ($P = .001$).

The results of my statistical analysis help to answer my initial research inquiry, which investigates whether there is an association between Americans' work-life balance and their satisfaction with family life. The evidence from my analysis suggests that work-life balance is associated with satisfaction with family life, although further investigation is needed and encouraged. I chose to conceptualize my independent variable, work-life balance, as Question R23b from the ISSP codebook on Gender and Family Life, which measured respondents' frequency of difficulty completing family responsibilities due to time spent at work. While struggling to allocate time to family due to work is one indication of poor work-life balance, there are other measures which can be used that may capture more or better data about the variable of work-life balance. As the International Social Survey Program is a particularly comprehensive survey, the findings I received are representative of the American adult population, which enables me to generalize my findings as such. For more information about the ISSP's sampling strategy, see the ISSP codebook on Gender and Family Life (ISSP Research Group 2016). Notably, there are additional limitations in this research which should be acknowledged, particularly regarding the sample that was utilized. Notably, all ISSP respondents were over the age of 30 years, which means that younger adults were simply not accounted for. In future research, I would recommend that a sample size which represents adults under the age of 30 years be drawn, in order to assess applicability to the wider adult population within the United States. In addition, future research should investigate the potential role of sociological factors such as social class, race, and ethnicity on work-life balance and satisfaction with family life. My research contributes to a growing body of literature which examines the impacts of work on the family unit, a topic which remains important and relevant in social science research and beyond.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

REFERENCES

Adams, Gary A., Lynda A. King, and Daniel W. King. 1996. "Relationships of job and family involvement, family social support, and work–family conflict with job and life satisfaction." *Journal of Applied Psychology*. 81(4):411–420. https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.81.4.411

Cohen, Philip N. 2020. *The Family: Diversity, Inequality, and Social Change*. 3rd ed. New York, NY: W.W. Norton & Company. Retrieved May 4, 2021 (https://wwnorton.com/books/9780393537314).

Golden, Lonnie, Julia R. Henly, and Susan Lambert. 2013. "Work schedule flexibility: A contributor to happiness?" *Journal of Social Research and Policy* 4(2):107–135.

Hideo, Noda. 2020. "Work–Life Balance and Life Satisfaction in OECD Countries: A Cross-Sectional Analysis." *Journal of Happiness Studies* 21(4):1325–48. doi:10.1007/s10902-019-00131-9.

ISSP Research Group. 2016. International Social Survey Programme: Family and Changing Gender Roles IV - ISSP 2012. GESIS Data Archive, Cologne. ZA5900 Data file Version 4.0.0. https://doi.org/10.4232/1.12661.

McNamara, Tay K., Marcie Pitt-Catsouphes, Christina Matz-Costa, Melissa Brown, and Monique Valcour. 2013. "Across the Continuum of Satisfaction with Work–family Balance: Work Hours, Flexibility-Fit, and Work–family Culture." *Social Science Research* 42(2):283–98.

Lim, Misun and Joya Misra. 2019. "Work/Life Balance." *Oxford Bibliographies*. Retrieved February 28, 2021 (https://www.oxfordbibliographies.com/view/document/obo-9780199756384/obo-9780199756384-0218.xml).

Qiu, Lin and Jinyan Fan. 2015. "Family Boundary Characteristics, Work-Family Conflict and Life Satisfaction: A Moderated Mediation Model." *International Journal of Psychology* 50(5):336–44.

Smith, Todd D., Zuojin Yu, and Aurora B. Le. 2020. "An Examination of Work Interference with Family Using Data from a Representative Sample of Workers Participating in the General Social Survey and NIOSH Quality of Worklife Module." *Journal of Family Issues* 41(12):2356–76. doi:10.1177/0192513X20927758.

Talukder, A K M Mominul Haque. 2019. "Supervisor Support and Organizational Commitment: The Role of Work–Family Conflict, Job Satisfaction, and Work–Life Balance." *Journal of Employment Counseling* 56(3): 98–116. doi:10.1002/joec.12125.

Girlhood in the Great Outdoors

By

Maria Gregg

ABSTRACT. Women have historically been socialized to interact with the environment as caretakers or consumers, which has contrasted with men's role as an environmental conqueror. These roles have had an enduring effect on how girls have interacted with their identities and the available avenues for environmental activism. This paper investigates how those roles have manifested in two case studies: the Girl Scouts and VSCO girls. The Girl Scouts have historically focused on environmental service projects and teaching girls outdoors skills, and it uses cookie sales to fund these endeavors. VSCO girls embody an outdoorsy and sustainability-inspired aesthetic and purport to "save the turtles," and VSCO girls must purchase environmentally sustainable products to enact their aesthetic both stylistically and environmentally. As gender roles have evolved, this research investigates the ways in which girlhood informs, enables, and limits these activists' environmental impact. By looking at the similarities and differences between an organization such as the Girl Scouts, which has enabled girls' environmental activism for over a century, and a modern community such as the VSCO girls, whose activism is intrinsically tied to the technology and society of today, this case study comparison seeks to understand how social constructions of girlhood have shaped and continue to shape girls' means of environmental activism.

BACKGROUND

Constructions of femininity and masculinity affect how people view the dichotomy of wilderness and civilization, and in turn, impact the ways men and women interact with the natural environment. Unexplored areas of land have historically been referenced as virginal lands and their lack of exposure to human influence is compared to the purity of feminine virginity (Casey and Neville-Shepard 2020). In this metaphor, the human explorer then embodies a masculine force which deflowers the land. American narratives of wilderness and discourse surrounding the environment have been heavily influenced by frontier mythology and Manifest Destiny (Bessetti-Reyes 2014). The frontier describes a conceptual boundary between settled and unsettled land and is generally accompanied by a mandate for someone to cross it. This mandate is encapsulated in the concept of Manifest Destiny which describes the American cultural belief that white settlers had an almost moral obligation to explore and "civilize" the West (Hofstadter and Lipset 1968). Manifest Destiny is both a cause and effect of 19th-century masculinity; it was a product of paternalistic attitudes and it reemphasized many "mountain man" aspects of masculinity, including physical domination of

surrounding people and places (Bessetti-Reyes 2014; Casey and Neville-Shepard 2020; Vance 1997).

This contrasts with the idea that wild places can be refuges from social constraints, including those imposed by gender norms (Meyer and Borrie 2013). Wilderness is by definition free from the constraints of civilization and since gender performances are dictated by and for the benefit of society, gender in a space free of society, such as wilderness, has the potential to transcend binary constructions of femininity and masculinity. Both Girl Scouts and VSCO girls nominally promote expansions of feminine gender roles, but in reality, still situate their actions and attitudes within traditionally accepted femininity. The Girl Scouts began as a way for girls to gain environmental experience in a structured and supervised way that ensured their safety and that they would be interacting with the outdoors in ways suited to their youth and femininity. It was well established that outdoor activities were a healthy part of boyhood but there was a growing realization that in order to raise boys in the outdoor arena, their mothers would need basic knowledge of some essential outdoors skills (Unger 2012). The Girl Scouts stepped up to meet this need, training young women in basic outdoor skills that they would be able to then teach their sons. The Girl Scouts organization has evolved since then and in the past several years girls in the United States who are interested in environmental activities and involvement have been able to also turn to the VSCO girl community. Contrary to the Girl Scouts' established organization, the VSCO community has arisen out of a shared aesthetic that informs girls' clothing choices, product purchases, and outdoor activities. While this aesthetic is embodied in their day-to-day lives, it is also performed via posts on Instagram, and VSCO girls engage not only with their fellow VSCO friends from their school or neighborhoods, but follow and connect with VSCO girls from all over the country on social media.

METHODS

This paper employs case studies of both the Girl Scouts and VSCO girls to understand how the nature of girlhood influences the ways in which members of these groups interact with the environment. The case studies are formed by researching both what these groups say about themselves and what other published texts describe them as. To do so, it used the official website of the Girl Scouts of the United States, the organization's published studies on its own successes, records of Girl scout badges' introductions, discontinations, and descriptions, as well as several different Scouting Handbooks used over the years. This yields information about what activities are emphasized and in what ways the Girl Scouts encourage environmental activities. VSCO girls do not have a concrete organizational structure, nor do they have any official leadership which can produce definitive material on how the group views themselves. However, all VSCO members share usage of Instagram and this case study used the account vsco.girls.account which was created by and for VSCO girls to help inspire other VSCO girls' content. I used this to emulate the kind of authoritative material produced by the Girl Scout organization, but for the VSCO girls. Additionally, the account provides elements of the digital VSCO girl aesthetic, such as wallpaper pictures that the account's viewers can screenshot and use for themselves. In doing so,

accounts such as these can be seen as both reflections of VSCO girls' preferences and as sources of authority on what is and is not included in the VSCO aesthetic, lifestyle, and digital presence. This paper also used digital ethnography research techniques on Instagram to investigate VSCO girls' interests and involvement in environmental activism. To get a broad range of data from the different sources VSCO girls interact with on Instagram, I included the aforementioned VSCO inspiration account, as well as the hashtag #savetheturtles which has become a VSCO slogan and rallying cry, and a brand's account, Pura Vida bracelets, which were a staple accessory seen in the posts of girls on the VSCO inspo account. The sample of posts used were from posts under these two accounts and the hashtag, between the months of January and March. This time frame allowed for the data to be recent while not including posts from April, which is Earth month and thus may include a disproportionate amount of content related to the environment and environmental activism. To understand how non-group members viewed the identities and efforts of each, I also included research on published studies as well as media portrayals of each organization and the people involved.

FINDINGS

Modern Girl Scouts learn a variety of skills intended to increase their capabilities, community, and self-confidence (Hughes 2001) and no longer are explicitly taught to be mothers of men. However, gendered interactions with the wilderness continue to manifest in other ways. In particular, women have not been allowed to be "conquerors" of the wilderness and instead are relegated to consumers of wilderness. The masculine values inherent in the role of conqueror harken back to the glorification of Manifest Destiny and paternalistic domination and civilization of wild lands and peoples (Casey and Neville-Shepard 2020; Vance 1997). As such, the role of the conqueror is inaccessible to performances of femininity. In its place, women are often seen as consumers. A study of women-targeted advertisements in prominent outdoor magazines found that women were shown enjoying the aesthetic and material trappings of outdoor experience but were rarely pictured accomplishing physical feats with any daring or independence. Advertisements picturing women were often for new products such as backpacks or outdoor clothing, or for picturesque vacation destinations (McNiel, Harris, and Kristi 2012).

The consumer role manifests in how the Girl Scouts are most widely known for their cookie sales, which earn the funds that enable their environmental explorations, yet all too often subsumes those activities and is seen as the principal purpose of Girl Scouts. Outside observers of Girl Scouts are especially apt to think primarily of Girl Scouts' cookie-selling role in part because it puts Girl Scouts into contact with the outside community, and also because the image of the darling gap-toothed Girl Scout, with her hair in pigtail braids and her wheelbarrow of cookies, is an especially socially-acceptable image of these young girls. Similarly, as will be discussed later, the popular image of a VSCO girl is characterized by her distinctive and expensive accessories. As such, both the Girl Scouts and VSCO girls require their members to participate in a consumerist relationship with the environment.

Membership requirements also include more explicit actions: though the Girl Scouts have codified membership, membership within the VSCO girl community is more nebulous. However, VSCO girls still display unifying characteristics that signal group belonging and which are expressed with both commercial accoutrements and specific actions. The official leadership structure and institutional nature of the Girl Scout organization's group membership ensures that its members all recite a common pledge and work towards leadership-sanctioned badges (Meyer and Rowan 1977). VSCO girls label themselves as VSCO girls with little chance of being sanctioned if they incorrectly perform the VSCO aesthetic. However, they do risk negative responses through social media, most commonly through negative Instagram comments or low numbers of likes. Additionally, though they do not have a formal pledge, they share common phrases including "save the turtles," and also have shared slang, such as "and I oop" and "sksksksksk" that unite the members (Gaudet and Clément 2008). While Girl Scouts have their official sashes, VSCO girls have a similarly strict dress code consisting of oversized t-shirts that conceal the shorts worn underneath, Birkenstocks on their feet, and Hydro flasks or metal-strawed reusable water bottles in hands with wrists stacked with scrunchies and Pura Vida bracelets (Dickson 2019; Singer 2019; Thompson 2019). They keep their chapstick in Fjällräven Kånken backpacks and might tuck a Penny skateboard under one arm (Cyr and Matusheski 2020). Most of their clothes are in muted pastels and are often tie-dyed, and the tame color palette contributes to the delicate femininity conveyed by how swamped they appear in their oversized shirts. These colors also complement their natural make-up and emphasize their image of youthful innocence. Despite how curated the elements of the VSCO girl look are, even down to the specific brands central to some of the most identifiable aspects, the effect is ruined if her aesthetic appears at all contrived (Dickson 2019).

The VSCO girls' accessories are also means of conveying VSCO girls' environmental consciousness. While VSCO girls are identifiable by their material products, group membership is contingent on a shared environmental consciousness that is often manifested in the saying: "save the turtles" (Cyr and Matusheski 2020; Dickson 2019). The Hydro Flasks, metal straws, and Pura Vida bracelets are all associated with efforts to live more sustainably and this environmental focus is the only action-oriented goal associated with their aesthetic and lifestyle. By using reusable water bottles and purchasing from environmentally-conscious brands they are presumably reducing plastic waste that would be contaminating oceans and, as the oft-repeated slogan references, harming the turtles (Cyr and Matusheski 2020).

The trappings of the VSCO aesthetic are instrumental to the performance of a VSCO identity, and that performance takes place both in person and on social media. The term "VSCO" references the VSCO photo editing app, which gained popularity in the 2010s and gave photos an atmospheric and understated appeal and its users a platform on which to share galleries of VSCO edited photos with other users (Dickson 2019; Perlman 2019). Through VSCO and instagram, future VSCO girls edited, posted, and interacted with their own and others' applications of this developing aesthetic. Already adept at the use of social media and accustomed to its role as a reinforcing reflection of their own self-images, pre-teen and teenage girls translated the VSCO aesthetic from a

photo filter to an identity. The lifestyle that accompanies this identity, which includes the materialist accessories discussed previously, has essentially become a lived filter which, when applied to a girl or young woman, transforms her into a VSCO girl.

Historical interactions of femininity and wilderness preservation inform how the VSCO girls' aesthetic situates their environmental activism today. Studies of environmental activism have noted the positive correlation between belonging to an environmental organization and rates of activism (Mcfarlane and Boxall 2003; Perkins 2012). The Girl Scouts can serve as one such organization, and while not institutionalized, girls who identify as VSCO girls also face calls to partake in certain environmentally-motivated behaviors as part of accomplishing their aesthetic. However, women are traditionally relegated to grassroots levels of activism movements, including in environmental campaigns, and they are restricted from positions of authority within the larger movements (Buckingham and Kulcur 2009). Additionally, Girl Scouts' and VSCO girls' efforts are impacted by the coupling of their gender and age. Girl Scouts are primarily promoted in popular culture as cute cookie sales girls as opposed to the environmental explorers and protectors that they also can be. Similarly, VSCO girls' efforts to live eco-consciously, though flawed, are perhaps unfairly denigrated not because of the hypocrisy embedded in elements of their identities but because of their identities as girls. The classed consumerism required of VSCO girls may be problematic, but it does not negate the effect of their eco-conscious efforts. The intersection of their youth and femininity makes these activists especially dismissable, not because of their actions but on the basis of their intersectional identity.

CONCLUSION

As the importance of environmental consciousness and actions on both individual and macro levels increases, it is imperative to understand how young girls, as future stewards of the environment, are encountering and interacting with the natural world. The Girl Scouts provide a glimpse into how girls' roles in the environment have both evolved and endured. By comparing this with the most recent manifestation of a specific coupling of girls and environmental interactions, the VSCO girls, we can expand our understanding of how modern girlhood constrains and empowers various avenues of environmental impact and girls' future investment in environmental action.

REFERENCES

Bessetti-Reyes, Gina. 2014. "Women and the American Wilderness: Responses to Landscape and Myth." PhD dissertation, English Department. , Duquesne University

Buckingham, Susan and Rakibe Kulcur. 2009. "Gendered Geographies of Environmental Injustice." *Antipode: A Radical Journal of Geography.* 41(4):659-683.

Casey, Ryan K., and Ryan Neville-Shepard. 2020. "Virgin Lands: Gender, Nature, and the Frontier Myth." *Women's Studies in Communication* 43(1):1-22.

Cyr, Margaret and Laura Matusheski. 2020. "VSCO Girls: The Good, The Bad and The Green." Retrieved February 3, 2021 (https://www.sustainablemillennial.com/home/2019/10/17/vsco-girls-the-good-the-bad-and-the-green).

Dickson, EJ. 2019. "VSCO Girls: All Hail the Latest Gen-Z Meme to Make You Feel Impossibly Old." Retrieved February 3, 2021 (https://www.rollingstone.com/culture/culture-features/vsco-girl-meme-internet-what-is-gen-z-879667/).

Gaudet, S. and R. Clément. 2008. "Forging an identity as a linguistic minority: Intra and intergroup aspects of language, communication and identity in Western Canada." *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 33:213–227.

Hofstadter, Richard, and Seymour M. Lipset. 1968. *Turner and the Sociology of the Frontier.* Basic Books.

Hughes, Alice. 2001. "There's A Lot More Happening than Camping and Cookies! Get to Know Today's Girl Scouts -- Where Girls Grow Strong!" *Colorado Woman,* Feb 28, pp. 15.

McFarlane, Bonita L. and Peter C. Boxall. 2003. "The role of social psychological and social structural variables in environmental activism: an example of the forest sector." *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 23(1):79-87. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0272-4944(02)00080-4.

McNiel, Jamie N., Deborah A. Harris and Kristi M. Fondren. 2012. "Women and the Wild: Gender Socialization in Wilderness Recreation Advertising." *Gender Issues* 29(1-4):39-55. https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s12147-012-9111-1.

Meyer, Angela M. and William T. Borrie. 2013. "Engendering Wilderness: Body, Belonging, and Refuge." *Journal of Leisure Research* 45(3):295-323. https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.18666/jlr-2013-v45-i3-3153.doi:

Meyer, John W. and Brian Rowan. 1977. "Institutionalized Organizations: Formal Structure as Myth and Ceremony." *American Journal of Sociology*. 83(2): 340-363.

Perkins, Tracy E. 2012. "Women's Pathways Into Activism: Rethinking the Women's Environmental Justice Narrative in California's San Joaquin Valley." *Organization & Environment* 25(1): 76–94. https://doi.org/10.1177/1086026612445390.

Perlman, Merrill. 2019. "The Online Popularity of the 'VSCO girl'." Retrieved February 3, 2021 (https://www.cjr.org/language_corner/vsco-girl-sksksksk-and-i-oop.php).

Singer, Melissa. 2019. "Why Are Brands Listening to 'VSCO Girls'?; They Project an Image of Wholesomeness, Dressed in Birkenstocks and Scrunchies, but These 'Woke' Consumers Have Very Short Attention Spans." Sydney Morning Herald, The: Web Edition Articles (Australia), September 29. (https://www.smh.com.au/lifestyle/fashion/what-exactly-is-a-vsco-girl-and-why-brands-are-listening-to-them-20190924-p52ugw.html).

Thompson, Courtney. 2019. "What Is a VCSO Girl? Shop the Latest Teen Trend - CNN Underscored." Retrieved February 3, 2021 (https://www.cnn.com/2019/10/14/cnn-underscored/what-is-a-vsco-girl/index.html).

Unger, Nancy C. 2012. Beyond Nature's Housekeepers : American Women in Environmental History. Cary: Oxford University Press USA.

Vance, Linda. 1997. "Ecofeminism and Wilderness." *NWSA Journal* 9(3):60-76.

Emergency Department Closures:
The Critical Case of Reduced Care Access Within Rural Populations

By

Erene Shin, Jasmine Jaing, Orlando Caballero, Lauren Fujii, Elli Cooney

ABSTRACT. In this paper, the researchers analyzed the effects of overcrowding and financial difficulties faced by rural emergency departments, which can lead to closures. To achieve this goal, we relied on a systematic analysis of the rural emergency department system, including the financial aspects, ethical considerations, and patient demographics. The researchers also utilized past evaluated interventions in order to determine methods of creating an efficient emergency department. We found that while there was an increase in emergency department patients, finances have not increased to accommodate overcrowding. This paper contributes to emergency department and rural health literature, as the researchers propose an evidence-based intervention that will minimize overcrowding and utilize finances effectively, while taking into account patient medical knowledge and scheduling.

INTRODUCTION

The healthcare system within the United States is very complex and multifaceted due to the wide variety of care venues patients can choose from. One of the primary centers at which an increasing number of Americans have sought care is the emergency department (ED). Due to its walk-in nature and unlimited hours of operation, it serves as a convenient and comparatively quick way to access care (Coster et al. 2017). However, for those in rural communities, an increasing number of hospitals and their EDs are closing, significantly reducing access to emergency care in these areas. According to the Center for American Progress, from 2013 to 2017 rural hospitals have closed at a rate nearly double that of the previous five years. Additionally, "Between 2000 and 2014, the number of annual emergency department visits in the United States rose by 33 million. The number of EDs in operation also fell by 242 [in the same time period]. The result of this divergence was a 39% increase in the average number of visits made to each [remaining] ED per year" (Woodworth 2020). This convergence of reduced rural emergency departments and increased visits to the remaining emergency departments has put immense pressure on these safety net sites. Consequently, overcrowding has become the norm in remaining emergency departments.

To explore this issue, financial difficulties faced by all emergency departments will be investigated, as will factors which make rural populations most sensitive to these difficulties. Then, the negative consequences for overcrowding will be discussed for this particular population and potential solutions to those issues will be evaluated. This paper includes a thorough literature review with three unique interventions, improving

health literacy, triaging more effectively, and optimizing staff scheduling, as well as proposes a comprehensive approach with a plan for evaluating the efficacy of the intervention following its implementation.

BACKGROUND

The emergency department is a specialized department within any type of hospital that focuses on addressing patients' immediate medical and surgical needs. They operate by first evaluating the urgency, or acuity, of a patient's complaint or condition in a process called triaging, which is conducted by a triage nurse. A triage nurse is a registered nurse specifically trained for the emergency department and is responsible for making the medical assessments necessary in the triage process. This system allows emergency department staff to effectively rank the order in which patients need to be seen, thus allowing patients in the most critical condition to be seen first while patients with lower acuity injuries must wait longer to receive care (Healthcare Support Organization 2014).

There are typically three categories of patients. The first category consists of patients who are in critical condition, such as those who have stopped breathing, have severe head or neck injuries, or have experienced a prolonged seizure. They are admitted into the emergency department immediately. The second category consists of patients in less critical condition but who exhibit signs that their condition is worsening are also frequently admitted into the emergency department for further monitoring to ensure they do not become critical. Such patients may have trouble breathing, an unusual headache, or be experiencing heavy bleeding (U.S. National Library of Medicine n.d.). Finally, the third category consists of patients who come to the emergency department with mild or non-urgent conditions will likely be seen last. Due to the time-sensitive nature of emergency department care and the constraints such care puts on emergency department staff and resources, these non-urgent patients may receive nurse treatment or may be referred to an urgent care clinic either within the same facility or a nearby location. Considering the vital role registered nurses play in the triage process, they have become essential fixtures of the emergency department and play a large part in properly managing patient flow and providing quality care (Healthcare Support Organization 2014).

The ability of emergency department staff to manage patient flow and triage effectively is essential, as it is often the first point of contact for individuals seeking affordable medical care. In 1986, Congress enacted the Emergency Medical Treatment and Labor Act (EMTALA) to provide and ensure access to emergency medical care, regardless of an individual's ability to pay (CMS n.d.). Therefore, regardless of one's health insurance status, the emergency department is legally required to provide them medical services. EMTALA requires emergency departments to fulfill three obligations to any individual that may walk through their doors (Maughan 2019). First, they must "provide all patients with a medical screening examination" (Maughan 2019) to determine the patient's level of acuity. The second requirement is that emergency departments must "stabilize any patients with an emergency medical condition" to ensure the patient may safely be

discharged or transferred (Maughan 2019). The final requirement is that emergency departments "transfer or accept appropriate patients as needed," which may require referral to a specialized department if that patient is in very critical condition or admitting them as inpatients (Maughan 2019). Thus, emergency departments within the United States function simultaneously as critical care sites and public safety nets for those who are otherwise unable to access care.

Due to these contradictions, the past few decades have caused those in healthcare, as well as in business, to question the financial viability of emergency departments. Such questions are not without merit; in the past few decades, the United States has experienced a rise in emergency department closures resulting from financial distress and unsuccessful cost-saving measures. Between 1991 and 2001, 546 emergency departments were permanently shut down around the nation due to an increase in patient visits and stagnant operating budgets (Sinreich and Jabali 2007). This trend of closures has continued and has had significant impacts on rural hospitals: between 2013 and 2017, an additional 64 rural hospitals have closed, representing almost 2x the number of closures "during the previous 5-year period" (Cosgrove 2018). Alarmingly, an inverse relationship between emergency department closures and annual visits to the remaining emergency departments has also become clear. Between 1996 and 2016, the increase in volume of patients who visited the emergency department was 61.2% (Augustine 2019). This increase reflects the effects of both a shrinking number of open emergency departments nationwide and general increase in illness severity, population age, and percentage of those in the United States who are underinsured or uninsured (Augustine 2019). Considering these trends and the continued strain on emergency departments predicted, it is crucial to better understand the ethical motivations for EMTALA and how it contributes to the financial pressure departments face.

ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

The requirements of EMTALA carry distinct ethical implications; everyone who needs care should have access to it and it is partly the role of the government to ensure access. These underlying beliefs align with Hippocratic ethical principles, specifically the principles of fidelity and justice. The principle of fidelity essentially demands the duty of physicians and other health care workers to show patients respect. When extrapolated, the principle of fidelity can extend to the prioritization of a patient's medical needs over financial factors, as well as factoring in their individual circumstances. EMTALA can then be perceived as upholding the principle of fidelity, causing the emergency department blind to a patient's financial position. The principle of justice is taken to mean that the health care system should support a non-discriminatory community standard of care, indicating that all patients should be treated equitably. In the case of those who utilize the emergency department for primary care purposes due to having no other recourse, the principle of justice implies an even greater duty to provide care than for those who do not have the means to secure medical care elsewhere. Hence, EMTALA can be perceived as also ensuring the principle of justice be honored when patients are facing the most urgent need.

However, while EMTALA appears to line up with Hippocratic ethical principles, these distinct principles tend to favor a deontological way of thinking which supports adherence to duties despite the consequences of doing so. In a world with finite medical resources and personnel, and resources which are distinctly strained in the emergency department, a utilitarian approach to ethics may be more suitable. Utilitarianism upholds the weighing of consequences along with the duties when making a decision. As mentioned previously, the inappropriate use of emergency departments plays a huge factor in overcrowding and the adverse effects that come along with it. Taking into consideration these factors, a utilitarian approach to ethical considerations within the emergency department may provide the most financially and ethically prudent way ahead.

FINANCIAL ASPECTS OF EMERGENCY DEPARTMENTS

Consequently, as EMTALA indicates, the emergency department is made vulnerable by the very elements of its practice and policy which make the care it provides accessible to all. The American College of Physicians describes this conundrum as the federal government's attempt at "universal health care" without the necessary provisioning of resources to accommodate the largely uncompensated care provided. Inevitably, this has led to the emergency department being dubbed a "loss leader," a "service which is provided at a loss to encourage utilization of other goods or services" (Pines 2006). In the context of the emergency department, the inpatient services are the other goods provided by the associated hospital. It is from patients who enter the hospital system through the emergency department and then are admitted as inpatients by which the emergency department recoups the largest percentage of its spending (Nagasako et al. 2014). Although these statistics vary largely from department to department, approximately 26% of patients who enter hospitals through adult emergency departments are admitted as inpatients (Augustine 2019).

One of the largest factors contributing to the financial vulnerability of all types of emergency departments is the venue's payer mix. Payer mix refers to the distribution of patients with public insurance, private insurance, and those without insurance (Wall 2010). In light of EMTALA, the insurance status of those who seek care in emergency departments is significantly important to the department and hospital's bottom line. According to the National Hospital Ambulatory Medical Care Survey conducted in 2012, data collected from the five most populous states – Florida, California, Texas, Illinois, and New York – only 33% of patients aged 18-64 who visited emergency departments that year had private insurance (Albert et al. 2013). Of the remaining patients, more than 20% had no insurance to speak of (Albert et al. 2013). While emergency departments have historically used the practice of cost shifting in which private insurers pay more for the same care than the publicly insured or uninsured in order to subsidize their care, this strategy is becoming less effective due to reduced reimbursement rates of private insurers from "77.7% [of charge] to 65.7%" (American College of Emergency Physicians n.d.). Thus, a smaller and smaller percentage of emergency department care is being fully compensated, placing enormous strain on emergency department operations.

Another element of emergency department operations which makes them costly to run is the need for specialized and on-call staffing every day of the week for 24 hours a day. While all hospital departments require constant staffing, ideal staffing to patient ratios in the emergency department are especially difficult to determine as patient flow is ever-changing and thus difficult to anticipate (Recio-Saucedo et al. 2015). The nature and acuity of patients coming to the emergency room is also extremely variable, meaning the variety of staff needed to provide the most appropriate care is substantial. In fact, according to the California Healthcare Association, "one fourth of all [emergency] visits require the involvement of a consulting medical or surgical specialist" not currently on duty (Green et al. 2005). Retaining such a variety of on-call specialists can be extremely costly for emergency departments, thus staffing takes up a "large portion of the operational cost" of running departments (Wang 2013). This cost is exacerbated by the shortage of ED physicians and registered nurses (Pines 2006). Additionally, "academic centers [frequently] spend significant resources training" healthcare workers for their emergency departments only to have them leave for other work due to intense competition resulting from national staffing shortages (Pines 2006). The loss of even one emergency physician can cost a department upwards of $160,000 in rehiring costs (Shah et al. 2015). All of these factors contribute to emergency department staffing shortages, which greatly impact a department's ability to function efficiently.

IN-DEPTH ANALYSIS OF RURAL AREAS

The geographic region which is particularly affected by emergency department closures are rural areas. In fact, one hundred-thirty rural hospitals have closed since 2010 and this number continues to rise each year (The Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research 2020). Additionally, over 20% of rural hospitals in the U.S. are near collapse (Mosley and DeBehnke n.d.). The U.S. Census Bureau (2017) defines rural areas as being "sparsely populated, hav[ing] low housing density, and [being] far from urban centers." Ninety-seven percent of the United States' land mass is classified as rural, but only 1 in 5 Americans live in rural areas (U.S. Census Bureau 2017). Thus, this population's access to health resources is generally low due to low population density. Another factor which influences the rural population's ability to access care is their financial circumstances. Rural populations are typically less financially affluent than those who live in non-rural areas. For example, the Healthcare Cost and Utilization Project found that in 2008, 56.2% of rural emergency department patients lived in the lowest income areas, compared to 30.1% of non-rural emergency department patients (Hines et al. 2011). These statistics demonstrate that patients who typically visit rural emergency departments are from lower income households and thus less likely to have the ability to pay for the full cost of their care. Emergency departments in rural areas are also more frequently used by Medicaid beneficiaries and the uninsured, which further strains these department's ability to continue to provide care (Williams 2015). These financial difficulties pose particular challenges to the elderly in rural communities, which make up a larger portion of the population than in non-rural areas (Williams 2015). Americans who live in non-metropolitan areas have higher rates of poverty compared to

those in metropolitan areas. They also typically live farther from potential in-family sources of care (Nemet and Bailey 2000).

Long distances from health centers can lead to increased difficulty accessing care, which is especially vital to elderly patients who experience greater need. Increased travel time has extremely adverse effects on patient health, particularly in emergency situations, and can result in increased patient mortality. Additionally, according to the NC Rural Health Research Program, rural populations are generally sicker (Williams 2015). While the most frequently treated conditions among adults were the same in rural and urban areas, rural sites are experiencing a more rapid increase in utilization rates (Greenwood-Erickson et al. 2019). From 2005 to 2016, rural emergency department visit estimates increased from 16.7 million to 28.4 million, while urban visits increased from 98.6 million to 117.2 million; essentially, rural emergency department visits increased by approximately 50% (Greenwood-Erickson et al. 2019). As rural emergency departments continue to close while utilization by rural populations rises, the distance this population has to travel to access care increases and the medical care deficit grows. While data which indicates the exact degree of the relationship between rural emergency department closures and increased usage of urban departments by rural residents is not easily retrievable, it can be inferred that the statistic is significant.

Finally, the quality of care in rural emergency departments is not the same as in urban departments due to the lack of qualified physicians. The overall number of board-certified emergency medicine physicians in rural areas is insufficient to keep up with the growing demand (Casey et al. 2008). Out of 408 rural hospitals, it was noted that 52% of hospitals reported a total lack of emergency medicine physicians (Casey et al. 2008). It is also highly unlikely that there will be an increase in board-certified emergency medicine physicians in rural areas, as 10 of the 12 most rural states do not have emergency medicine residency programs (Casey et al. 2008).

NEGATIVE CONSEQUENCES FOR OVERCROWDING

The negative logistical consequences of overcrowding in EDs are well established, and include threatened patient health and quality of care. Emergency departments must allocate "high capital intensive but limited resources such as nurses, physicians, beds, laboratories, and imaging facilities" (Ahsan et al. 2019). Due to the constraints of these resources which are exacerbated by overcrowding, emergency departments have difficulty providing the care patients need. This in turn causes increased wait times. According to the Canadian Association of Emergency Physicians and National Emergency Nurses Affiliation, this can cause situations in which "sick patients who need hospital beds languish on emergency stretchers, while suffering patients who need emergency care wait in hallways and waiting rooms" (CAEP and NENA 2001). As this quote implies, immense challenges to limited emergency department resources posed by overcrowding leads to the delivery of substandard care.

Even when functioning efficiently, the emergency department is a high-stress work environment largely due to constantly observing patient suffering and the unforeseeable

nature of the job (Hamdan and Hamra 2017). Thus, overcrowding has been shown to further decrease employee satisfaction (Tekwani et al. 2013). In fact, "the work in the ED is unbounded, involves multiplicity, is characterized by a high level of uncertainty and care is provided under significant time constraints" (Seow 2013). Therefore, continuously working in such an environment can lead to burnout (Tekwani et al. 2013). Burnout is considered a "long-term stress reaction marked by emotional exhaustion, depersonalization, and a lack of sense of personal accomplishment" (Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality n.d.). Burnout has potential negative consequences for the healthcare provider (physical and mental), the patient (e.g. quality of care, patient satisfaction) and health care organizations (e.g. higher absenteeism, turnover, job dissatisfaction, higher costs and financial losses) (Reith 2018). As burnout is particularly common among emergency department workers, it is crucial that there are management strategies and plans in place to address the issue and mitigate its negative consequences.

RELEVANCE TO EMERGENCY DEPARTMENT SENIOR MANAGEMENT

Emergency department managers and leaders are constantly faced with the challenges of managing their departments, along with mitigating the effects of issues such as burnout and overcrowding. In order to combat and control unexpected events which are common in the emergency department, senior management must actively plan, prepare, practice, review, analyze, strategize, and adapt to unforeseen change (Kayden et al. 2014). Furthermore, another important responsibility of senior management is cultivating a well-built team that can handle unpredictable situations and competing demands in the emergency department. Consequently, communication and teamwork are essential to achieving the emergency department goal of contingency planning (Seow 2013). Overall, the quality of senior management within emergency departments can determine whether a department is able to provide the best quality care to patients and so is critical to running an efficient emergency department.

EVALUATED INTERVENTIONS

Option 1: Improving Patient Flow

Hospitals are always finding ways to improve patient flow to create efficient emergency departments. As emergency departments improve patient flow, it enhances performance and drives positive patient satisfaction.

One of the ways in which hospitals and their associated emergency departments have tried to improve patient flow and alleviate the negative consequences of overcrowding is through health literacy. Many studies have shown that low health literacy rates, or "a patient's ability to manage per-sonal health," can contribute to poor outcomes and inefficient use of resources (Wei and Camargo 2000). In the emergency department, negative consequences of low health literacy rates often manifest in inappropriate usage of the department and ultimately hinders patient flow (Wei and Camargo 2000). However, few health literacy interventions have been tested specifically in the context of

the emergency department, which poses its own particular set of challenges (Wei and Camargo 2000).

To determine the efficacy of health literacy interventions in the emergency department and potentially save on costs, Memorial Hermann Community Benefits Corporation– a hospital with an associated emergency department located in Houston, Texas– conducted a quasi-experimental patient navigation study from 2008 to 2012 (Enard and Ganelin 2013). The intervention was based on the usage of community health workers who were culturally competent, effective communicators, and well-versed in the health care system to assist patients in accessing primary care (Enard and Ganelin 2013). Patients with low acuity ratings were the main focus of the intervention, as it was assumed that a higher level of health literacy could have resulted in greater primary care utilization, making the emergency department visit unnecessary.

Upon entrance to the emergency department, "prospective patients" would be "identified during triage," triggering a patient navigator to then be assigned to their case (Enard and Ganelin 2013). To ascertain the barriers to a patient's care, the patient navigator would find time to meet with them during their visit and identify 1) their access to primary care provider 2) any medical conditions they may have and 3) remind them of the importance of keeping medical appointments (Enard and Ganelin 2013). They would then use that information to make a tailored plan for each patient by utilizing knowledge of healthcare networks and community resources. Finally, 3-10 days after patients included in the study were discharged, they received either a phone call or in-person checkup to determine how well their individual plans were helping to improve access to primary care (Enard and Ganelin 2013).

The study divided participants into five categories: those who had "1+, 2+, 3+, 4+, and 5+ PCR-ED visits 12 and 24 months prior to the intervention" (Enard and Ganelin 2013). They found that 46.4% of patients with 1+ visits and 36.0% of patients with 2+ visits 12 and 24 months prior did not return to the ED during the 12 months post intervention (Enard and Ganelin 2013). Additionally, "at 24 months the intervention was associated with significantly lower unadjusted odds of having any post-observation PCR-ED visit for all patients, regardless of pre-observation visit frequency" (Enard and Ganelin 2013). The study also noted that there were reductions in frequency of emergency department visits among intervention group patients that had more frequent pre-intervention visits, but these results may not be sustained over long periods of time (Enard and Ganelin 2013). Despite the intervention's success, there were some limitations, including lack of full randomization, the potential for participants to have visited other emergency departments over the course of the study or passing away, and a large portion of immigrants within the study, which may have skewed the results (Enard and Ganelin 2013).

Option 2: Triaging Through Streaming

Nurses play a key role in triaging patients with the emergency department. Through triaging, nurses must be able to effectively maintain the flow of patients into and out of

the ED to promote efficiency in time management, resources, and staffing. Using the focus of streaming, patients will be grouped into categories based on their acuity so their treatment and care within the ED is tailored towards each group. In addition, triage nurses will be trained to address patients within a specified category so they have a greater understanding of the patients they treat, thus boosting the efficiency of their care and reducing the intensive demands of the nurses.

Another intervention used in the emergency department to curb the negative effects of overcrowding includes triaging more effectively through streaming and expanding triage nurse capabilities. Streaming is "when patients are grouped into broad acuity categories and managed through separate processes," (Boyle et al. 2012) leading to reduced waiting times. This is efficient for bottleneck situations, such as laboratory and radiology waiting times for results. Having multiskilled staff will reduce the bottlenecks of patient demands, and specifically targets patients of lower acuity. In addition to streamlining in-patient services, it is also important for the staff to understand how to properly transfer patients to another ward or hospital if needed.

In a before-and-after designed study conducted in the emergency department of Western Hospital in Melbourne, Australia, it was found that in order for the ED to run the most smoothly and efficiently, triage nurses had to learn to multitask within a specified group of patients. Comparisons were done throughout 2003-04 and then 2004-05. Two groups were studied: those likely to be admitted to the hospital and those who were soon to be discharged. Specific barriers that delayed treatment and consultations for each group were assessed. For the likely admitted group, the major barriers were the limited number of beds in the ED and the length of time of waiting for an assessment or investigation. These same barriers occurred for the likely to be discharged group. To combat these barriers and save time, money, and resources, the emergency department implemented "streaming… based [on the] likelihood of admission or discharge, and re-allocation of medical and nursing staff into two teams [for each group]" (Kelly et al. 2007). Triage nurses were able to specialize in the types of "closeness of observation, intensity or investigation and treatment, consultations and organizing of home supports or follow-up" (Kelly et al. 2007) for both the admitted and discharged group. This team-based approach and focus on a particular group of patients improved patient flow by reducing the competing demands on staff.

The results of the study support this method; the "proportion of discharged patients increased to 97% within the first month and was sustained at an average of 92% over the first year of the project," compared to the original 83% of discharged patients before the study (Kelly et al. 2007). From the staff's point of view, "90%... believed the ED ran better after the change" (Kelly et al. 2007). This intervention of streaming patients in two different categories based on their specific needs not only improved efficiency for patients to be seen or discharged from the emergency department in a more appropriate time frame, but also reduced the intensive demands on the triage nurses since they were able to specialize on the tasks specifically within their focus group. Even though the implementation of this intervention was successful, a limitation of the

study was that it was conducted in Australia where the healthcare system differs from the United States, and therefore may hinder its applicability.

Option 3: Optimized Scheduling

Optimized scheduling attempts to reduce overcrowding by evenly distributing the number of non-emergency patients admitted into the hospital throughout the week. As a result, more inpatient beds are available, allowing patients who arrive at emergency departments to be admitted more efficiently. This helps to improve overall patient flow by decreasing waiting times in emergency departments.

Another option to increase efficiency of operations in remaining emergency departments is optimized scheduling and early discharges. The capacity to provide care is oftentimes driven by the supply of healthcare providers and physicians at a particular institution and unevenly distributed across the country. As mentioned previously, emergency departments in urban settings tend to offer a broader range of speciality and subspecialty physicians compared to those in rural settings; therefore, the issues of patient flow and long wait times are often exacerbated in large hospital emergency departments. These challenges have led to the adoption of optimized scheduling processes (Brandenburg et al. 2015). Optimized scheduling aims to evenly distribute the number of patients admitted to the hospital throughout the week, which reduces overcrowding. Patients arriving at emergency departments are then able to be admitted faster and discharged more efficiently.

Studies have shown the effectiveness of optimized scheduling practices when used on the scheduling of elective surgeries. Many surgeries tend to be scheduled earlier in the week instead of being spread out throughout the week. This is due to the fact that many patients require physical therapy a few days after surgery to prevent possible postoperative complications, but many hospitals have less physical therapy staff available on the weekends (Salway et al. 2017). Therefore, hospitals try to schedule surgeries more towards the beginning of the week, so that patients are more able to access physical therapy services. However, scheduling more surgeries leads to less availability of inpatient beds, which hinders the ability to quickly admit patients in the emergency department. In a retrospective review study of 93,274 ED visits between 2002 and 2003, results showed that "elective surgeries were associated with a maximum of 35 hours of additional ED dwell time" (Rathlev et al. 2007). Dwell time is equivalent to boarding, which means holding admitted patients in the emergency department because there are no available inpatient beds. When emergency department beds are taken up by inpatient surgery patients, there are fewer beds for those admitted directly through the emergency department. Thus, when hospitals optimized their schedules to more evenly distribute elective surgeries, there was a significant decrease in boarding and increased availability of floor and ICU beds (Salway et al. 2017). Despite the success of this intervention, there are limitations regarding the lack of data showing how the intervention impacted patient quality measures, such as length of stay.

PREFERRED INTERVENTION

After an evaluation of the three potential interventions to address emergency department overcrowding, a dual approach within both existing emergency departments in urban areas and rural communities whose emergency departments have closed has been developed. The implementation of these interventions simultaneously strives to help emergency departments operate more efficiently through the use of more detailed triaging and referrals, and educating those in rural communities on preventative care and basic health knowledge to prevent the need for emergency medical care. These interventions were chosen due to the effective and successful management techniques used in the respective studies.

The preferred approach within open emergency departments is to introduce more efficient triaging through initial nurse review and subsequent referral to the appropriate setting. Initial nurse review would be done by expanding nurse capabilities and tasks within their assigned group, those likely to be admitted or those likely to be discharged, and thus becoming more knowledgeable about that group's care. Reviewing patients in this way increases efficiency since each staff member more easily recognizes the challenges and solutions to issues faced by those in their particular group. This team-based approach therefore reduces the competing demands on triage nurses to manage the increased influx of patients and the overall flow of the emergency department. In addition, there will be a group of triage nurses that are familiar with the culture and lifestyle of those residing in rural communities placed in the remaining departments. These changes would lead to increased trust and communication between staff and patients. In regards to subsequent referral, the implementation of optimized scheduling practices would help reduce inpatient overcrowding. Freeing up inpatient beds would allow for the reduction or elimination of boarding in emergency departments, thereby allowing patients to be admitted into the hospital quicker and more efficiently (Salway et al. 2017). By effectively determining the level of acuity early on in the admission process and having designated triage nurses for patients from rural areas, patients could move more quickly through the system and receive the care they need in the most appropriate setting. However, a barrier to the implementation of this portion of the intervention is the initial additional time required for nurse and community health worker training when the program is launched.

In order to measure the effectiveness of this approach, how quickly a patient is seen upon their arrival to the emergency department can be measured and compared to before the implementation of the approach. According to the CDC, patients in about 40% of emergency department visits are seen within the first fifteen minutes (Centers for Disease Control 2020). Therefore, the goal of this portion of the intervention would be to have at least 60% of emergency department patients be seen by a triage nurse within the first fifteen minutes of their arrival. Additionally, measuring the average length of stay before and after the implementation would allow the hospital to gauge the effectiveness of the optimized scheduling portion of the approach. According to the Healthcare Cost and Utilization Project, the average length of stay in U.S. hospitals was 4.6 days in 2016 (Freeman et al. 2018). The optimized scheduling practices would aim

to decrease length of stay by 0.5 days. The reduction in average length of stay after implementation would demonstrate the success of optimized scheduling.

The second approach of the intervention expands on the idea of improving health literacy within rural communities themselves, with an emphasis on preventive and primary care. This would be done through offering educational health classes and fitness classes at local community centers, as well as offering open clinic hours within those centers to increase basic care access. Additionally, our intervention would aim to provide health literacy surrounding when it is appropriate to visit an ED compared to visiting urgent care. These measures would reduce the need for emergency services and decrease the number of people who use the emergency department inappropriately, thus helping to decrease overall emergency department crowding. The main barriers to implementing this element of the approach include strained budgets for both staff and facilities. However, the cost of increasing access to primary care and basic health knowledge in this population is likely to be less than the overall cost to the healthcare system of continued inappropriate emergency department use. To gauge the success of this portion of the intervention, the number of patients admitted to the emergency department, as well as the number of primary care appointments scheduled before and 6 months after the intervention will be recorded. The metric used to determine success will be a proportional or greater increase of scheduled primary care appointments to emergency department visits.

CONCLUSION

The emergency department is considered to be a "unique operation, optimized to exist at the edge of chaos" (Seow 2013). However, this chaos has become increasingly difficult for rural emergency departments within the United States to handle. Consequently, an increasing number of hospital emergency departments have closed resulting in significant reduction of access to emergency and primary care in rural areas. These closures are particularly harmful within rural communities as they have lower average incomes, older populations, and a predominantly greater prevalence of illness. Despite these factors, little has been done within the medical or public health community to address the financial difficulties faced by these emergency departments, forcing those from rural areas to seek care far from home. As a result, overcrowding has become a significant issue within the remaining emergency departments. Through the proposed intervention including improving health literacy, triaging more effectively, and optimizing staff scheduling, both decreased access to health care within rural communities and the effects of their displacement can be addressed. Proper management and competent leadership will play a crucial role in the effectiveness of this and other subsequent interventions. Future research should investigate other potential interventions aimed at aiding rural hospitals and emergency departments before they close in order to mitigate the issue of overcrowding caused by displaced populations.

REFERENCES

Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality. n.d. "Physician Burnout." Retrieved January 3, 2021 (https://www.ahrq.gov/prevention/clinician/ahrq-works/burnout/index.html).

Ahsan, Kazi Badrul, M. R. Alam, Doug Gordon Morel, and M. A. Karim. 2019. "Emergency Department Resource Optimisation for Improved Performance: A Review." *Journal of Industrial Engineering International* 15(S1):253–66.

Albert, Michael, Linda F. McCaig, and Jill J. Ashman. 2013. "Emergency Department Visits by Persons Aged 65 and over: United States, 2009-2010." *NCHS Data Brief* (130):1–8.

American College of Emergency Physicians. n.d. "The Impact of Unreimbursed Care on the Emergency Physician." Retrieved January 3, 2021 (http://www.acep.org/administration/reimbursement/the-impact-of-unreimbursed-care-on-the-emergency-physician/).

Augustine, James J. 2019. "Latest Data Reveal the ED's Role as Hospital Admission Gatekeeper." *ACEP Now: The Official Voice of Emergency Medicine*. Retrieved January 3, 2021 (http://acepnow.com/article/latest-data-reveal-the-eds-role-as-hospital-admission-gatekeeper/).

Brandenburg, Lisa, Patricia Gabow, Glenn Steele, John Toussaint, and Bernard J. Tyson. 2015. "Innovation and Best Practices in Health Care Scheduling." *NAM Perspectives* Discussion Paper, National Academy of Medicine, Washington, DC. doi: 10.31478/201502g.

Boyle, Adrian, Kathleen Beniuk, Ian Higginson, and Paul Atkinson. 2012. "Emergency Department Crowding: Time for Interventions and Policy Evaluations." *Emergency Medicine International* 2012:838610.

CAEP and NENA (Canadian Association of Emergency Physicians, and National Emergency Nurses Affiliation). 2001. "Joint Position Statement on Emergency Department Overcrowding." *Canadian Journal of Emergency Medicine* 3(2):82–88. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1481803500005285

Casey, Michelle M., Douglas Wholey, and Ira S. Moscovice. 2008. "Rural Emergency Department Staffing and Participation in Emergency Certification and Training Programs." *The Journal of Rural Health: Official Journal of the American Rural Health Association and the National Rural Health Care Association* 24(3):253–62.

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. 2020. "Emergency Department Visits." Retrieved January 3, 2021 (https://www.cdc.gov/nchs/fastats/emergency-department.htm).

Centers of Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). n.d. "Emergency Medical Treatment & Labor Act (EMTALA)." Retrieved January 3, 2021 (http://www.cms.gov/Regulations-and-Guidance/Legislation/EMTALA).

Cosgrove, James. 2018. "Rural Hospital Closures: Number and Characteristics of Affected Hospitals and Contributing Factors." U.S. Government Accountability Office. Retrieved January 3, 2021 (https://www.gao.gov/assets/700/694125.pdf).

Coster, Joanne E., Janette K. Turner, Daniel Bradbury, and Anna Cantrell. 2017. "Why Do People Choose Emergency and Urgent Care Services? A Rapid Review Utilizing a Systematic Literature Search and Narrative Synthesis." *Academic*

Emergency Medicine: Official Journal of the Society for Academic Emergency Medicine 24(9):1137–49.

Enard, Kimberly R., and Deborah M. Ganelin. 2013. "Reducing Preventable Emergency Department Utilization and Costs by Using Community Health Workers as Patient Navigators." *Journal of Healthcare Management* 58(6):412–27; discussion 428.

Freeman, William J., Audrey J. Weiss, and Kevin C. Heslin. 2018. "Overview of U.s. Hospital Stays in 2016: Variation by Geographic Region: Statistical Brief #246." *Healthcare Cost and Utilization Project (HCUP) Statistical Briefs*. Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality. Retrieved January 3, 2021 (https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/30720972/)

Green, Lois, Glenn Melnick, and Amar Nawathe. 2005. "On-Call Physicians at California Emergency Departments: Problems and Potential Solutions - California Health Care Foundation." California Health Care Foundation. Retrieved January 3, 2021 (https://www.chcf.org/publication/on-call-physicians-at-california-emergency-departments-problems-and-potential-solutions/).

Greenwood-Ericksen, Margaret B., and Keith Kocher. 2019. "Trends in Emergency Department Use by Rural and Urban Populations in the United States." *JAMA Network Open* 2(4):e191919.

Hamdan, Motasem, and Asma'a Abu Hamra. 2017. "Burnout among Workers in Emergency Departments in Palestinian Hospitals: Prevalence and Associated Factors." *BMC Health Services Research* 17(1). doi: 10.1186/s12913-017-2356-3.

Healthcare Support Organization. 2014. "Triage Nurse." *Healthcaresupport.com*. Retrieved January 3, 2021 (https://www.healthcaresupport.com/triage-nurse/).

Hines, Anika, Taressa Fraze, and Carol Stocks. 2011. "Emergency Department Visits in Rural and Non-Rural Community Hospitals, 2008." Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality. Retrieved January 3, 2021 (https://www.hcup-us.ahrq.gov/reports/statbriefs/sb116.pdf).

Kayden, Stephanie, Philip D. Anderson, Robert Freitas, and Elke Platz, eds. 2014. *Emergency Department Leadership and Management: Best Principles and Practice*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.

Kelly, Anne-Maree, Michael Bryant, Lisa Cox, and Damien Jolley. 2007. "Improving Emergency Department Efficiency by Patient Streaming to Outcomes-Based Teams." *Australian Health Review: A Publication of the Australian Hospital Association* 31(1):16–21.

Maughan, Eric. 2019. "All about EMTALA: The Law That Runs the ED." *EM Resident.* Retrieved January 3, 2021 (http://www.emra.org/emresident/article/emtala/).

Mosley, David, and Daniel DeBehnke. n.d. "Rural Hospital Sustainability: New Analysis Shows Worsening Situation for Rural Hospitals, Residents." *Navigant.* Retrieved January 3, 2021 (http://guidehouse.com/-/media/www/site/insights/healthcare/2019/navigant-rural-hospital-analysis-22019.pdf%20.).

Nagasako, Elna M., Mat Reidhead, Brian Waterman, and W. Claiborne Dunagan. 2014. "Adding Socioeconomic Data to Hospital Readmissions Calculations May Produce More Useful Results." *Health Affairs (Project Hope)* 33(5):786–91.

Nemet, G. F., and A. J. Bailey. 2000. "Distance and Health Care Utilization among the Rural Elderly." *Social Science & Medicine (1982)* 50(9):1197–1208.

Pines, Jesse M. 2006. "The Economic Role of the Emergency Department in the Health Care Continuum: Applying Michael Porter's Five Forces Model to Emergency Medicine." *The Journal of Emergency Medicine* 30(4):447–53.

Rathlev, Niels K., John Chessare, Jonathan Olshaker, Dan Obendorfer, Supriya D. Mehta, Todd Rothenhaus, Steven Crespo, Brendan Magauran, Kathy Davidson, Richard Shemin, Keith Lewis, James M. Becker, Linda Fisher, Linda Guy, Abbott Cooper, and Eugene Litvak. 2007. "Time Series Analysis of Variables Associated with Daily Mean Emergency Department Length of Stay." *Annals of Emergency Medicine* 49(3):265–71.

Recio-Saucedo, Alejandra, Catherine Pope, Chiara Dall'Ora, Peter Griffiths, Jeremy Jones, Robert Crouch, and Jonathan Drennan. 2015. "Safe Staffing for Nursing in Emergency Departments: Evidence Review." *Emergency Medicine Journal: EMJ* 32(11):888–94.

Reith, Thomas P. 2018. "Burnout in United States Healthcare Professionals: A Narrative Review." *Cureus* 10(12):e3681.

Salway, R. J., R. Valenzuela, J. M. Shoenberger, W. K. Mallon, and A. Viccellio. 2017. "Emergency Department (Ed) Overcrowding: Evidence-Based Answers to Frequently Asked Questions." *Revista Médica Clínica Las Condes* 28(2):213–19.

Seow, Eillyne. 2013. "Leading and Managing an Emergency Department—A Personal View." *Journal of Acute Medicine* 3(3):61–66.

Shah, Shital, Anay Patel, Dino P. Rumoro, Samuel Hohmann, and Francis Fullam. 2015. "Managing Patient Expectations at Emergency Department Triage." *Patient Experience Journal* 2(2):31–44.

Sinreich, David, and Ola Jabali. 2007. "Staggered Work Shifts: A Way to Downsize and Restructure an Emergency Department Workforce yet Maintain Current Operational Performance." *Health Care Management Science* 10(3):293–308.

Tekwani, Karis L., Yaniv Kerem, Chintan D. Mistry, Brian M. Sayger, and Erik B. Kulstad. 2013. "Emergency Department Crowding Is Associated with Reduced Satisfaction Scores in Patients Discharged from the Emergency Department." *The Western Journal of Emergency Medicine* 14(1):11–15.

The Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research. 2020. "176 Rural Hospital Closures: January 2005 – Present (134 since 2010)." University of North Carolina. Retrieved January 15, 2021 (https://www.shepscenter.unc.edu/programs-projects/rural-health/rural-hospital-closures/)

U.S. Census Bureau. 2017. "What Is Rural America?" *One in Five Americans Live in Rural Areas*. Retrieved January 3, 2021 (http://www.census.gov/library/stories/2017/08/rural-america.html.).

U.S. National Library of Medicine. n.d. "When to Use the Emergency Room - Adult." *Medlineplus.gov*. Retrieved January 3, 2021 (https://medlineplus.gov/ency/patientinstructions/000593.htm).

Wall, J. K. 2010. "'Payer Mix' Playing Role in Hospital Merger - Indianapolis Business Journal." *Ibj.Com*. Retrieved January 3, 2021 (https://www.ibj.com/articles/22925-payer-mix-playing-role-in-hospital-merger).

Wang, Xiaoqing. 2013. "Emergency Department Staffing: A Separated Continuous Linear Programming Approach." *Mathematical Problems in Engineering* 2013:1–8.

Wei, H. G., and C. A. Camargo Jr. 2000. "Patient Education in the Emergency Department." *Academic Emergency Medicine: Official Journal of the Society for Academic Emergency Medicine* 7(6):710–17.

Woodworth, Lindsey. 2020. "Swamped: Emergency Department Crowding and Patient Mortality." *Journal of Health Economics* 70(102279):102279.

Surveillance in the New Jim Crow Era

By

Madison Hoffman

ABSTRACT. Modern American society is plagued with the features of the New Jim Crow era, a term first coined by Michelle Alexander. The news of innocent and unarmed Black Americans being killed by police officers is almost regarded as commonplace. The mass incarceration of Black Americans continues to be wrongly justified and disregarded. This New Jim Crow era is characterized by the increased suspicion, policing, and incarceration of Black Americans. This article aims to build off Alexander's term to identify the role of surveillance and advancing surveillance technologies like police-worn body cameras, facial recognition, and social media surveillance on the increasing criminalization of Black Americans.

BACKGROUND

Previous research examines the growing phenomenon of surveillance in urban areas, yet there remains a lack of literature on the effect of surveillance on the increasing criminalization of Black Americans. Specifically, this article aims to fill these gaps and address the role of surveillance in what is known as the New Jim Crow, an era highlighted by the increased suspicion, policing, and incarceration of Black Americans. This article will discuss how the U.S. utilizes various mechanisms of covert surveillance including video surveillance and monitoring techniques, police body cameras, and facial recognition technologies to hyper-police poor minority communities, often consisting predominantly of African Americans. The disparities between those being surveilled and those doing the surveilling bring up the concept of the "white gaze." The act of surveillance allocates significant power and privilege to those doing the watching, leaving the watched vulnerable to the policies and practices of their monitors (Byfield 2019). When surveillance is practiced and enforced, it becomes racialized, meaning that "blackness" essentially becomes the site being surveilled (Byfield 2019). In this way, the technologies, practices, and legislation associated with surveillance create and reinforce social hierarchies, allowing white overseers to socially control those who they deem "dangerous" or "criminal." Surveillance then acts as a mechanism for those in positions of power, often white police officers or governmental officials, to target, police, and control communities, specifically those of color, based on preconceived ideologies or stereotypes (Iverson and Jaggers 2015).

Although not all police officers and police chiefs identify as white, police officers have similar implicit biases about Black people, regardless of their race, explains Rashawn Ray (as quoted by Doubek) (Doubek 2020). Officers, regardless of their race, are more likely to associate weapons with Black individuals rather than white individuals (Doubek 2020). Thus, nonwhite officers contribute to the persistence of the "white gaze" and the

involuntary association of Blackness with criminality. A recent study that gathered information from 7,000 police officers within the Chicago Police Department from 2012 to 2015 found that a police officer's race does in fact influence police-civilian interactions (Ba and Mummolo 2021). Black and Hispanic officers make significantly fewer stops and arrests than their white counterparts and use force less often against Black civilians (Ba and Mummolo 2021). These differences became more apparent in majority African American communities within the Chicago area. Specifically, Black police officers made 39% fewer stops of Black civilians and used force against Black civilians 38% fewer times as compared to white police officers (Ba and Mummolo 2021). Black police officers were also 33% less likely to make stops based on "suspicious behavior" as compared to their white counterparts (Ba and Mummolo 2021). As is consistent with the current literature, white police officers are more likely to employ methods of policing in order to survey African American populations.

In a study that analyzed all New York City police stops from 2007 to 2014, 85% of all individuals stopped were Black, although African Americans only make up 20% of the population (Kramer and Remster 2018). This same study found Black individuals to be 27% more likely to experience force by police, which included physical assaults as well as verbal abuse or the presence of a weapon, during a stop than white civilians (Kramer and Remster 2018). This hyper-policing of Black Americans is associated with higher arrest rates and more killings of Black individuals during police encounters (Byfield 2019). In a separate study, researchers interviewed 23 undergraduate Black males at a predominantly white university in the Midwest (Iverson and Jaggers 2015). The Black participants revealed they were commonly surveilled and policed by campus security and law enforcement (Iverson and Jaggers 2015). Several students, part of a Black Greek organization, noticed being visibly surveilled by campus police during house parties (Iverson and Jaggers 2015). Previous literature heavily emphasizes that surveillance leads to hyper-policing and increased police encounters within Black communities. However, the question remains as to whether surveillance is in some ways responsible for the characteristics of the New Jim Crow era including mass incarceration and police brutality. A nationwide study, organized by the Stanford Open Policing Project, gathered evidence from 93 million traffic stops from 29 police departments over the country between 2001 and 2017 and found that Black drivers are 20% more likely to be pulled over by police officers than white drivers (Pierson et al. 2020).

With the advancement of surveillance technologies came the advent of police body cameras and facial recognition, two more methods that made Black bodies increasingly visible under a white lens. Body-Worn Cameras (BWC's) emerged with the passing of the Patriot Act during the post-9/11 era that allowed for massive expansion of surveillance techniques (Hood 2020). Facial recognition technologies have since been integrated into BWC's in an attempt to make transparent police misconduct (Hood 2020). However, police officers have the ability to switch on or off their cameras, ultimately giving them the power to decide which actions are recorded and which are left out (Taylor 2016). Newell's (2017) survey of police officers in Washington state makes apparent officers' concerns of body worn cameras in regards to their own privacy. More

than 50% of officers surveyed agreed that use of BWC's intrudes on their privacy, many of them citing fears about public reactions to their behaviors and actions (Newell 2017). Glasbeek's interviews with police officers in Canada yielded similar results. One participant expressed the common argument made by police officers: "all you see is me grab him, drop him, and go to the ground and cuff him. So, you think, oh my god, that's police brutality…All you catch is the end result" (Glasbeek et al. 2020:337). Officers consistently justify their ability to manipulate the recordings of their BWC's, citing reasons relating to privacy concerns. However, this biased control inherently thwarts the original purpose of BWC's: to accurately, with a third-party perspective, make transparent police officer actions. Studies on facial recognition technologies, which are widely used by police departments to identify suspects, have also been shown to be deeply problematic. The U.S. National Institute of Standards and Technology tested facial recognition technologies in being able to determine whether a photo of someone has a match in one of four U.S. databases, including mugshots (Grother et al. 2019). These facial recognition systems were consistently worse at matching Black faces than white faces and produced higher rates of false positive matchings for African Americans, making them more susceptible to being falsely accused of a crime (Grother et al. 2019).

Beyond facial recognition technologies and body worn cameras, police officers are increasingly utilizing social media surveillance to "build evidence for criminal indictments" (Patton et al. 2017:1). According to data from the International Association of Chiefs of Police, 96.4% of police agencies use social media surveillance in some way, the most common being for recruiting evidence for future charges (IACP 2015). Jelani Henry, a young Black man from Harlem, was arrested and subsequently incarcerated because of Facebook posts that made him *appear* like a criminal affiliate (Patton et al. 2017). Henry faced 40 years in prison for two counts of attempted murder because he "liked" Facebook posts of violent gang members (Patton et al. 2017). Although the charges were eventually dropped, Henry never received any compensation for his wrongful incarceration (Patton et al. 2017). While posting pictures on social media with gang signs might just be a friendly joke or an expression of solidarity, it can have especially horrendous consequences for young Black men. NYPD's *Operation Crew Cut* also relied on social media surveillance to monitor suspected gang members. This became problematic as police agencies began to criminalize young men of color who "simply communicate or sympathize" with suspected gang members (Patton et al. 2017). A 2016 study of gang-related charges in Harlem found that 46% of the charges were made based on evidence gathered from social media policing (Lane and Ramirez 2016). Yet while social media surveillance claims to prevent "anticipated future deviance," the case of Dylann Roof proves the inherently racist nature of social media surveillance (Patton et al. 2017:8). Despite his consistently active presence on social media, including a racist manifesto and 60 pictures of racist propaganda and weapons, Roof was not known by police before his attack on a Charleston church (Patton et al. 2017). In essence, Roof's whiteness protected and made invisible his acts of deviance while young Black men are all too often criminalized for their seemingly sympathetic association with potential gang members on social media.

In her book, Michelle Alexander highlights a concept she terms the New Jim Crow (Alexander 2010). While America thought to celebrate the end of racism with the election of Barack Obama, Alexander emphasizes how Black men are still burdened with the weight of criminal records, hoarded into prisons, and at the same time, denied basic human rights (Alexander 2010). Mass incarceration was intensified by President Nixon's war on drugs (Moore and Elkavich 2008). As the media fueled fear and panic nationally, there seemed a greater need to escalate the war on drugs, which led to increased policing, stricter laws, and increased incarceration (Moore and Elkavich 2008). People of color are not more likely to use drugs, yet they are more likely to be arrested and incarcerated for their use (Moore and Elkavich 2008). As of 1996, Blacks made up 62.6% of people convicted of drug offenses in American prisons (Moore and Elkavich 2008). Increased policing of Black communities and the imprisonment of drug users has grave social consequences for communities of color including a lack of employment opportunities and wages, the inability to vote and participate politically as well as mental and physical health effects (Pettit and Gutierrez 2018). Although the U.S. has witnessed decreasing crime rates over the past two decades, the incarcerated population continues to grow (Pettit and Gutierrez 2018). This may be a result of advanced surveillance technologies and greater policing. This article aims to build off of Michelle Alexander's concept and identify the role of surveillance in the existence of mass incarceration and other social injustices committed against Black Americans.

OPPORTUNITIES FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

Based on the review of the existing literature, I invite future scholars to establish a cause-and-effect relationship between increased surveillance and the characteristics associated with the New Jim Crow era. Data might be gathered utilizing mixed-method strategies that can include both structured surveys and open interviews. The survey could consist of multiple-choice questions to determine whether respondents have experienced force by the police, if they have been arrested or incarcerated, and whether or not they have noticed increased surveillance and policing in their area. Examples of survey questions can include: "Have you ever had an encounter with the police? Have the police ever used force against you? Have you ever been arrested or incarcerated? Have you noticed increasing surveillance or policing in your area?" The multiple-choice survey will be helpful in providing relatively comprehensive information on the relationship between increased surveillance and the characteristics of the New Jim Crow era. The open interviews will then give a more detailed, robust account of this relationship. Clearer definitions of terms including force, surveillance, and policing may reduce biases involved in instrument design. It is important that these terms be clarified in order for participants to answer each question with an understanding of their meaning and to ensure the study is valid, or that it accurately studies what it intends to study. Each question could have answer choices to choose from, including yes, no, or unsure. Structured surveys could be conducted among both self-identified Black men and self-identified white men within a given area. Participants could be selected randomly using a probability cluster sampling method. Random, predominantly Black neighborhoods and European white neighborhoods could be chosen. Participants from

these randomly selected neighborhoods can then be selected at random and asked to participate.

After surveys have been conducted, a smaller portion of those who have completed the survey could be chosen randomly to be interviewed. These interviews can be conducted in person, can be open in structure, and all answers could be recorded. Ultimately, these open interviews will provide more detailed descriptions of particular incidents experienced by participants in regards to their interactions with police, surveillance and policing mechanisms, and issues relevant to incarceration. The qualitative data analyzed from the interviews will therefore serve to add detailed accounts to the empirical evidence gathered from the initial surveys.

Data gathered from the survey could be analyzed by assigning numerical values to participant responses. A "yes" answer can be assigned a point value of one while both answers of "no" and "unsure" can have a zero-value assigned to them. In this way, it will be possible to numerically compare respondents' answers in order to determine whether the hypothesis can be supported or rejected. The hypothesis being tested is that surveillance does play a role in the characteristics of the New Jim Crow era, including issues like mass incarceration and police brutality. To represent and support this claim, the data would need to show higher or significantly higher numbers of "yes" answers from Black respondents than white respondents.

On the other hand, qualitative data from the conducted open interviews can be analyzed with use of codes. Coding approaches may vary based on the researchers' preferences. A grounded theory approach will better enable the data to speak for itself and reduce the imposition of researchers' bias. In this way, codes and subsequent analysis will come from the data itself. Analysis might rely on pattern-seeking strategies as well as saturation in order to determine which patterns or themes are the most prevalent. Both manifest and latent codes could be used to analyze transcript documents. Manifest codes can objectively include words or phrases actually stated by participants while latent codes can be more subjective, written based on thematic representations of what was stated by respondents, examples including such issues of Black American abuse at the hands of the police or mass incarceration.

Limitations to such a possible study include issues with the sampling process and selection. There is no accessible national list of U.S. citizens according to race or ethnicity, making it difficult to implement strategies to ensure the population sampled only includes Black and white men. Therefore, time constraints may exist as significant time and effort must be taken to identify the race and ethnicity of respondents before gathering data.

CONCLUSION

As is apparent by the current literature, increasing surveillance and policing has had disproportionate impacts on Black Americans. From being stopped more frequently by police to racist facial recognition technologies and racially biased social media

surveillance techniques, it is clear that minority communities, especially African American communities, are forced to bear the compounded effects of advancing surveillance technologies. Future research could focus on establishing a relationship between the consequences of increased surveillance with the characteristics established by Michelle Alexander's concept of the New Jim Crow era. In striving for racial equity, justice, and accountability, it is essential that the consequences of advancing surveillance technologies are understood, especially in how they contribute to the increased suspicion and incarceration of Black Americans. Future research might also focus on the relationship between increasing surveillance and police brutality, and how, if possible, surveillance technologies can be better utilized to hold police officers, and those in positions of power and authority, accountable for their actions.

REFERENCES

Alexander, Michelle. 2010. *The New Jim Crow: Mass Incarceration in the Age of Colorblindness.* New York, NY: The New Press.

Ba, Bocar., Dean Knox, Jonathan Mummolo, and Roman Rivera. 2021. "The Role of Officer Race and Gender in Police-Civilian Interactions in Chicago." *Science* 371(6530): 696-702. DOI: 10.1126/science.abd8694

Byfield, Natalie P. 2019. "Race Science and Surveillance: Police as the New Race Scientists." *Social Identities* 25(1): 91–106.

Doubek, James 2020. "Police Researcher: Officers Have Similar Biases Regardless of Race." *National Public Radio.* https://www.npr.org/sections/live-updates-protests-for-racial-justice/2020/06/22/881643215/police-researcher-officers-have-similar-biases-regardless-of-race

Glasbeek, Amanda , Mariful Alam, and Katrin Roots. 2020. "Seeing and not-seeing: Race and body-worn cameras in Canada." *Surveillance & Society* 18(3): 328-342.

Grother, Patrick, Mei Ngan, and Kayee Hanaoka. 2019. "Recognition Vender Test (FRVT) Part 3: Demographic Effects." *National Institute of Standards and Technology Interagency or Internal Report 8280.* Retrieved May 18, 2021 (https://doi.org/10.6028/NIST.IR.8280).

Hood, Jacob. 2020. "Making the Body Electric: The Politics of Body- Worn Cameras and Facial Recognition in the United States." *Surveillance & Society* 18(2): 157-169

International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP). 2015. "2015 Social Media Survey Results". Retrieved May 18, 2021. (https://www.valorforblue.org/Documents/Clearinghouse/IACP_2015_Social_Media_Survey_Results.pdf).

Iverson, Susan V., and Dametraus J Jaggers. 2015. "Racial Profiling as Institutional Practice: Theorizing the Experiences of Black Male Undergraduates." *Journal of Student Affairs Research and Practice* 52(1): 38-49.

Kramer, Rory , and Brianna Remster. 2018. "Stop, Frisk, and Assault? Racial Disparities in Police Use of Force During Investigatory Stops." *Law & Society Review 52*(4): 960–993.

Lane, Jeffrey and Fanny Ramirez. 2016. "Beyond Admissibility: The Prosecutorial Affordances of Social Media Use." Paper presented at the *International Communication Association Convention,* Fukuoka, Japan.

Moore, Lisda D., and Amy Elkavich. 2008. "Who's Using and Who's Doing Time: Incarceration, the War on Drugs, and Public Health." *American journal of public health* 98(5): 782–786. https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2007.126284

Newell, Bryce Clayton. 2017. "Collateral Visibility: A Socio-Legal Study of Police Body Camera Adoption, Privacy, and Public Disclosure in Washington State." *Indiana Law Journal*: 92(4). Retrieved May 18, 2021 (https://www.repository.law.indiana.edu/ilj/vol92/iss4/2).

Patton, Desmond U., , Douglas-Wade Brunton, Andrea Dixon, Reuben Jonathan Miller, Patrick Leonard, and Rose Hackman. 2017. "Stop and Frisk Online: Theorizing Everyday Racism in Digital Policing in the Use of Social Media for Identification of Criminal Conduct and Associations". *Social Media + Society* 3(3). https://doi.org/10.1177/2056305117733344

Pettit, Becky. and Carmen Gutierrez. 2018. "Mass Incarceration and Racial Inequality." *The American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 77(3): 1153-1182. https://doi.org/10.1111/ajes.12241

Pierson, Emma, Camelia Simoiu, Jan Overgoor, Sam Corbett-Davies, Daniel Jenson, Amy Shoemaker, Vignesh Ramachandran, Phoebe Barghouty, Cheryl Phillips, Ravi Shroff, and Sharad Goel. 2020. "A Large-Scale Analysis of Racial Disparities in Police Stops Across the United States." *Nature Human Behavior* 4: 736-745. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41562-020-0858-1

Taylor, Emmeline 2016. "Lights, Camera, Redaction... Police Body-Worn Cameras: Autonomy, Discretion and Accountability." *Surveillance & Society* 14(1): 128-132.

Intellectual Biography: Dorothy Smith

By

Jessica Hwang, Megan Imai, Vasudha Kumar, Sophia Lapus, Judith Li[1]

ABSTRACT. Drawing from Smith's own works and other scholars' analysis of her theories, we create a comprehensive review of the work of Dorothy Smith, including insights from her personal and academic backgrounds and her major contributions to the field of sociology. Specifically, we examine standpoint theory and institutional ethnography with particular attention to influences from Smith's own life experiences. In addition, we recognize Smith's transformation of sociology to represent those who are excluded by traditional theories and methods. These academic contributions continue to influence scholars around the world both within and beyond the field of sociology.

INTRODUCTION

Dorothy Smith is a prominent figure in sociology due to her work in developing standpoint theory and institutional ethnography. Inspired by her own experiences as a woman during the 1970's feminist movement, Smith's work sheds light on the area of women's studies. Although retired, she continues to be an influential force in sociology today. As a critical theorist and feminist sociologist, Dorothy Smith was critical of the field of sociology itself for being developed and practiced mostly by men, perpetuating through academia a worldview which excludes women's experiences. She drew from various existing theories and methods, including most notably Marxism, phenomenology, ethnomethodology, and symbolic interactionism, to develop standpoint theory and institutional ethnography. Standpoint theory gives voices to women and promotes learning about society from women's experiences and knowledge, bridging the gap between women's experience in the real world and sociological accounts. Smith's research on institutional ethnography was significant because she argued that institutional ethnography was a "sociology for people." Smith describes how the social organizations that individuals are a part of shapes the way in which they live their daily lives, how they make decisions, and what their preferences are. In addition to her theoretical pursuits, Smith also frequently collaborates with government, activist, and women's groups. Thus, through her emphasis on the embodied experiences of everyday people, Smith has transformed the practice of sociology.

PERSONAL BIOGRAPHY: EARLY LIFE AND EDUCATION

---

[1] All authors contributed equally.

Dorothy Smith is a pioneer in the field of feminist theories and gender studies. Born in Yorkshire, England in 1926, Smith created many sociological theories still used today such as feminist standpoint theory and institutional ethnography.

Before examining her sociological theories, it is important to bring attention to her background and influences. Smith was born into an upper middle class family and had the privilege of attending boarding school and studying abroad. She was not the first in her family to be interested in studying feminism and women's rights. Deirdre Smythe has traced her ancestry back to Margaret Fell, a 17th-centry feminist leader during the Quaker movement. Her mother, Dorothy Foster Place, was the main female figure in her life and Smith developed respect for the occupation of being a homemaker, describing housework as a productive force (Smythe 2009). Additionally, both her mother and grandmother were members of the Women's Social and Political Union which played a role in the women's suffrage movement in England. These two women were active in the Birkenhead chapter of the Women's Social Political Union and their work in non-violent political activism set the tone of Smith's later studies (Smythe 2009). The suffragettes perfectly characterized what it meant to be a strong and elegant woman of the early 1900s. In fact, many of their activities revolved around tasks they would do at home. For example, in order to create fundraising events, the women would often host bake sales and make the most out of their domestic skills. Smith observed her mother and grandmother cook for events and sew clothes at suffrage fairs. However, the suffragettes were not a force to be reckoned with. They also secretly burned buildings and vandalized artworks and objects around the city. Furthermore, Smith's mother was arrested when she was 25 years old for a glass-breaking campaign in Oxford Circus. However, that did not stop her from continuing to support the movement and donating to the Suffragette fund until she passed.

Existing studies point out the influence from other female figures in Smith's life. It was through the influence of both her family members and society as a whole that she was able to create standpoint theory. In addition, her theories come from her Marxist-feminist identity during the Vancouver Women's Movement during 1968 to 1977 as she had just relocated to Canada during that time (Campbell 2003). During her time developing theories and completing her Ph.D., Smith raised her children as a single mother. Her struggles trying to balance her family time and professional career further fueled her exploration into the experiences of women.

Smith completed her undergraduate studies in 1955 at the London School of Economics where she received a B.S in Sociology with a Major in Social Anthropology (Dillion 2020). She then moved to the United States where she received her Ph.D. in Sociology at the University of California, Berkeley in 1963. Surprisingly, she did not complete her doctoral thesis on any of the theories she had come up with. Instead, she wrote about the state of mental institutions as she was inspired by Erving Goffman, her PhD supervisor. Smith went on to become a lecturer at Berkeley for two years after her graduation. Smith's teaching did not stop there. She moved to Canada in 1967 and taught at the University of British Columbia. Here she founded and helped establish the Women's Studies Program, one of the firsts of its kind. Smith then moved to Toronto in

1977 and worked at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education. She had one final teaching role in 1994 as an adjunct professor at the University of Victoria. Smith currently serves on the advisory board for *Signs*, a feminist journal.

Smith was motivated to study feminist theories as she believed the world of education was very male-dominated and little respect was given to women. Her point of view comes from her life experiences as a mother, a wife, and a woman. Smith's work advocating for developing sociology for women is the origin of standpoint theory. It was all based on everyday experiences that seemed too mundane for other sociologists to study, but Smith found value in this area. Therefore, during this essay we will examine how Smith has made numerous contributions to sociology through standpoint theory, institutional ethnography, and how her work is still making a lasting impact on society and academia today.

INTELLECTUAL TRAJECTORY

Dorothy Smith can be considered a sociologist of critical theory, which is characterized by combining elements of various sociological paradigms while simultaneously aiming to understand how they perpetuate unequal power dynamics. Smith says of someone who were to follow her approach to sociology: "So although she doesn't take up the standpoint of any particular theoretical enclave (structural functionalism, symbolic interactionism, ethnomethodology, survey methods, Marxism, or whatever), she has any or all of these to draw on *as they come to hand*" (Smith 1997:820). Smith was concerned that becoming overly absorbed in a specific theoretical approach confined the researcher and prevented them from seeing the full picture of how things work (Campbell 2003). Thus, she viewed existing theories and paradigms as tools to modify and apply to her findings. Patricia Hill Collins describes her approach as "using the best of sociological traditions to challenge the notion of sociological tradition" (1992:74). Consistent with the hallmark of critical theory, Smith criticized how sociology was itself a mechanism used to perpetuate and justify dominant knowledge production and the marginalization of other perspectives of the world.

More specifically, Smith is a feminist sociologist, and used the theoretical frameworks of her choosing, including elements of Marxism and phenomenology, to critique societal structures which center around men's experiences, including the field of sociology itself. She committed to challenging the practice of sociology to reflect people's (especially women's) actual lived experience. The aim of this section is to illustrate some of the most important influences of established paradigms on Smith's sociological approach, and highlight the ways in which she criticized and revolutionized the field of sociology to become more representative of marginalized people's experiences.

One of Smith's main criticisms of traditional sociology was that "Sociological procedures legislate a reality rather than discover one" (Dillon 2020:314). By this, she means that the methodology of sociology as a field plays a role in how a particular issue is constructed and understood. The resulting knowledge, Smith claims, is not truly representative of the lived experiences of the people being studied. "Established

sociology is interested in explaining people's behavior. By contrast, the sociology I'm interested in aims at explaining society to people" (Smith 1997:819). Smith wanted her sociological construction of various issues to reflect people's actual experiences, and help people understand how forces of society affect their daily lives. Smith's belief that the traditional approach is harmful to women and those outside of the dominant narrative of society, which has been constructed by white men, led to her development of standpoint theory and institutional ethnography, which are explained in more detail later.

We can understand a lot of Dorothy Smith's criticism of traditional social theory by thinking about her role as a feminist scholar. It is important to note that Smith was beginning her career during the 1960s and 1970s. This context of the emergence of the so called "second wave" of the feminist movement contributed to her interest in gender inequality and social justice for women as well as giving her an eager audience and an opportunity to be a more public intellectual and really emphasize the need for change within society and sociology. She criticized sociology, as well as other social structures, for being thought of and created through the perspective of men. Men have historically had power over women in society, and this includes having the power to construct the social world itself. We see this critique through Smith's study of ruling texts. Smith presents the idea that many of the texts which guide social practice and ideas, including written documents like the Bible or Constitution as well as images and everyday discourse, were written or created by men or through the lens of male thought. These texts objectify a certain way of thinking about gender and other concepts, a way which privileges men (Dillon 2020). "To explain what women in the 1970s were recognizing as their subordination, she argued that women's exclusion from the positions where society and culture were put together accounts for how social life is ordered by knowledge that doesn't fit women's realities" (Campbell 2003:14). Smith's work challenged male domination of discourse and knowledge in society as she sought to study women's lives from their own perspective. This includes her critique of sociology itself. The ruling texts in sociology, namely the institutionalized empirical practices which generate supposedly objective knowledge, have historically been dominated by a white male perspective, which means the knowledge generated is not, in fact, objectively true. Social relations are far more complex and varied than represented through positivist sociological research, so Smith proposed an alternative way of studying sociology which allowed for the study of the intricacies of everyday social life (Dillon 2020) (Smith 1974).

Closely tied with the feminist perspective of Smith's work is how she uses a Marxist framework to understand subordination of women to men in society. A Marxist perspective is especially prominent in Smith's work during the 1970s, but would remain a significant aspect of her intellectual works (Campbell 2003). Our society is hierarchical, and Dorothy Smith saw that in addition to society being controlled by the ruling economic class, it is ruled by a certain gender - (white) men. "Using Marx's methodology for examining commodity relations under early capitalism, Smith investigates discourse and ideology as social relations essential to contemporary capitalism" (Collins 1992:75). This comes back to Smith's study of ruling texts and how knowledge in sociology and many other fields is primarily produced from a male

perspective. In addition, Smith drew from Marx's emphasis on exploitation and the division of labor. "She and other feminists saw that men work as they do because women are there to provide for them. In feminist politics, this insight motivated women to redefine domestic relationships and try to change the division of domestic labour" (Campbell 2003:15). This parallels Marx's basic theory that the working class is exploited by the ruling capitalist class, and it is laborers' excess work from which the capitalist profits. In the same way, women's domestic work supports men's professional success and associated increase in status. The division of labor, including that of domestic work, can also be alienating because the work being done is done for someone else (Dillon 2020). Additionally, as women reach out into academia and the workforce, they must adapt to the existing male centered standards (Campbell 2003). This perpetuates the oppressive system just as in Marxist theory, the laborers in a capitalist system contribute to the system which exploits and alienates them (until the alleged class revolution). Though Smith recognizes the limitations of Marxist theory, including the lack of discussion of gender and that there are social and institutional processes like the relations of ruling which prevent widespread revolution, she uses the important themes of power and oppression to apply Marxist theory to feminist sociology.

Erving Goffman was Dorothy Smith's thesis advisor when she studied for her PhD at UC Berkeley, and while she did not take up his dramaturgical approach, the importance of everyday face to face interactions which is the crux of symbolic interactionism was not lost on her (Campbell 2003). Smith aimed to understand how people's regular social relations were organized(Smith 1997). For example, the gender roles constructed by ruling texts influence how we present ourselves in everyday social situations. Smith studied the discourse of femininity prescribed in the media and other ruling texts which influences both how women present themselves and how others view them and interact with them (Dillon 2020). While the original symbolic interactionist theories paid little attention to gender and power dynamics, Smith uses its framework to apply it to these very issues, once again demonstrating her ability to pull from various sociological paradigms and build upon their weaknesses.

There is also a clear influence of phenomenology and ethnomethodology in Smith's approach to sociology. Phenomenology "focuses on the significance of everyday reality and everyday experiences on how individuals construct knowledge of their social world and the practical implications of such knowledge" (Dillon 2020:282). Ethnomethodology aims to describe how individuals create an ordered social reality through their everyday activities, "recognizing and making sense of their experiences in ways that fit with the shared norms of order and reasonableness in society" (Dillon 2020:293). The study of everyday reality is an absolutely essential characteristic of Dorothy Smith's approach to sociology because her main criticism of traditional sociology is that it fails to examine the complex nuances of people's everyday lives and how they relate to the larger society. She uses the idea that societal discourse is pervasive in what she calls our "everyday/everynight worlds" to address the experiences of women navigating both domestic and public spheres which are overlooked by male constructed knowledge (Dillon 2020). Again, Smith's analysis of how ruling texts influence how people think and act demonstrates the influences of these fields because it illustrates that the way people

think and act everyday are both shaped by and used to perpetuate an already existing set of norms and power structures. The theoretical roots of ethnomethodology and phenomenology in the importance of everyday experiences are evident in Smith's development of standpoint theory and practice of institutional ethnography as she aims to ground her research and understanding of women's experiences in their day to day realities and create a set of knowledge which acknowledges the presence and significance of multiple perspectives.

Smith's intellectual trajectory is characterized by a combination of many existing sociological ideas to create an approach which gives a voice to women by committing to observing lives how they are actually lived, and using this knowledge to understand the constraining institutions and structures in society on the subjects of study. Her criticisms of traditional sociology allow other theorists, such as prominent sociologist Patricia Hill Collins, to build off of her work and apply standpoint theory and institutional ethnography to women of color as well as other marginalized groups. Over the course of her career, Dorothy Smith has laid the foundation for sociology for all people.

CONTRIBUTIONS: STANDPOINT THEORY

The historical root of standpoint theory came from Georg Hegel and Karl Marx's dialectics. Hegel argued that in the master/slave dialectic relationship, the oppressed slaves could have a better insight and consciousness of oppression and injustice through their daily struggle than their masters. Inspired by the master/slave relationship, Karl Marx came up with the dialectical bourgeois/proletariat relationship, in which proletariats had a superior starting point of understanding capitalism.

Learning from dialectical standpoint theories of Hegel and Marx, Smith suggested that women's voices have disappeared in history and in current society. However, the standpoints of women and other marginalized groups could become "sites of epistemic privilege and thus productive starting points for enquiry into questions about not only those who are socially and politically marginalized, but also those who, by dint of social and political privilege, occupy the positions of oppressors" (Bowell). Smith explained it in her book *The Conceptual Practices of Power: A Feminist Sociology of Knowledge*: "The only way of knowing a socially constructed world is knowing it from within. We can never stand outside it" (1990:22). Therefore, women's everyday/everynight experiences and their firsthand knowledge of these experiences provided them an understanding different from men's. It was women's exclusion from the relations of ruling that gave women knowledge about how experience was determined (Clough 1993:173). Starting off research from women's experiences and knowledge did not mean to create a matriarchal sociology which was also partial and distorted but to generate an objective discourse and impartial accounts of all human beings and the whole society. Therefore, feminist standpoint theory gave voices to women and focused on learning society from women's experience and knowledge, bridging the gap between women's experience in the real world and sociological accounts.

The contribution of feminist standpoint theory was not only to suggest a new analysis perspective, but challenged the current claims of sociology "to be a value-neutral, object science" (Collins 1992:73). Under the context of the 1960s, gender, class, sexuality and race presented new social changes and challenged the mainstream understanding of society. However, sociological academia "remains strangely untouched by the changes buffeting the remainder of the discipline" (Collins 1992:73). In addition to the slow reaction to current social changes, sociological theory had long ignored or neglected marginalized groups' accounts. Even though women's experience and knowledge had been excluded from the set of scientific procedures and scientific discipline of sociology, sociology presented its knowledge "as a universally true, objective account of the world" (Dillon 2020:313).

In addition to neglect, current sociological accounts protected males' dominated position in the ruling relations. Smith argued that people's epistemic knowledge--what we know, how we know and the limitation of what we are able to know--is defined by their location: gender, class, ethnicity, sexuality, etc. These locations are closely related with the ruling relations. Sociology was "written from the standpoint of men located in the relations of ruling our societies" (Smith 1987: 1). Men wrote texts and controlled the way people should understand the world, although they could not share marginalized groups' location and knowledge. Current sociological knowledge was not only partial, but also "protect[ed] the ruling apparatus" through texts (Collins 1992:76). It became an echo room, preventing males from thoroughly understanding society and secluding marginalized accounts from sociology. The relations of ruling structured and shaped knowledge, but that socially-situated knowledge which was embedded in ruling relations should not be understood as subjectivity; rather, it could help sociologists understand society through a more objective lens and ameliorate the objectivity of sociology as a discipline.

Although feminist standpoint theory gained popularity and developed fast in the past decades, there were critiques raised toward it. One of the common criticisms is false universalism, seeing women as a oneness, proposing "a single, monolithic feminist standpoint" (Bowell N.d.). Because women were the "primary organizer of an emerging political discourse" (Smith 1990:11), one criticism claimed that feminist standpoint theory over generalized to all females, "[denying] the differences within and between women, a fantasy of unity against oppression" (Clough 1993:174). To answer this criticism and improve standpoint theory, Smith and later feminist standpoint theorists, such as Nancy Hartsock and Sandra Harding, argued and further explained that standpoint was an achieved collective consciousness, not "merely a perspective that is occupied simply by dint of being a woman" (Bowell N.d.). Everyone could generate a perspective based on their location, context, and historical background. Perspectives were individual lens to see the world. Their perspectives could provide them a starting point for research and the emergence of a standpoint. However, a standpoint could only be earned through social, political or economic struggle and oppression. By acknowledging others who shared the same struggle and oppression, women in particular formed a standpoint different from men. Sandra Harding explained the formation of standpoint in her book *Whose Science/ Whose Knowledge?*:

Only through such struggles can we begin to see beneath the appearances created by an unjust social order to the reality of how this social order is in fact constructed and maintained. This need for struggle emphasizes the fact that a feminist standpoint is not something that anyone can have simply by claiming it. It is an achievement. A standpoint differs in this respect from a perspective, which anyone can have simply by 'opening one's eyes' (1991:127).

In addition to overgeneralization, some claimed that false universalism raised the question whether every woman was similarly excluded from the relation of ruling. In other words, it criticized that Smith did not pay enough attention to women with different race, sexuality, class and age. However, as standpoint theory developed, other feminists complemented it to make the theory adjustable for women with different locations and experiences. For example, Patricia Hill Collins presented Black women's standpoint theory to address the intersectionality between gender, race, and class. Following Smith's feminist standpoint theory, Collins argued that sharing the formative experience of slavery, black women generated a standpoint different from that of white women. She pointed out that "the split between the (white) domestic and public sphere did not become a defining part of the black experience" (Dillon 2020:324). After the end of slavery, black women continued to live in black communities and "combine work and family to help ensure a sufficient family household income" (Dillon 2020:324). Different from white women's inequality, black women also suffered from discriminatory controlling images and stereotypes.

Today, researchers use standpoint theory to explore and promote diversity. Standpoint theory as an epistemological tool helps us understand why people may have different views and perspectives towards the same event or the same institution. In her class "Diversity in the Media," Professor Barbara Barnett discusses how the mass media challenge or reinforce social norms of race, class, sex, sexual identity, age, and physical abilities etc. She encourages students to take different ways to experience situations, respect people's expertise gained from their lived experience, and critically question the notion of subjectivity and dualism (Barnett 2009). The modern application of standpoint theory illustrates its vitality and its great contribution toward sociological academia.

The pluralism within standpoint theory had gone beyond the white females' and a single standpoint, solving the problem that it lacked attention to different female groups. Smith's standpoint theory laid the foundations for other sociologists to bring marginalized groups' experiences into the forefront and give voice to them. She brought a new epistemological perspective to the discipline of sociology, leading sociological academia and the world to a more equal level.

CONTRIBUTION: INSTITUTIONAL ETHNOGRAPHY

Smith's introduction to institutional ethnography helped pave the way for the Marxist feminist approach that shapes our society. Smith's research on institutional ethnography helps explain how things work together, the way in which individuals view social organizations, and why individuals view organizations in this way. Through analyzing

the texts of an organization, researchers need to be able to interpret any patterns that may come up in the field and make connections as to why individuals are impacted by society in the way that they are. This is accomplished by examining the categories used in the texts and looking at an individual's experiences and how they interact with one another within their social organizations. Smith's groundwork allowed individuals to have a new and unique perspective on the impact of social organizations and our Marxist feminist approach is a prominent result of her studies.

Smith was greatly influenced by Marxist theory, which is noticeable as she unpacks her own beliefs regarding how things are related to one another. Her fascination with Marx's work led to the creation of her first notable book, "Feminism and Marxism: A Place to Begin, A Way to Go," which conveys her feminist thinking in regards to a suppressive society (Smith 1977). Smith's development of institutional ethnography was revolutionary because she emphasized how feminist movements were closely related to how norms in society were formed in the first place. That being said, rather than solely focusing on the inequities that women faced in society, Smith took a different approach and made the argument that *all* people are impacted by the stereotypical roles placed on them by society and how we unintentionally reinforce these standards everyday. By doing so, Smith claimed that institutional ethnography was a 'sociology for all people,' which challenged the belief that her work was exclusively focusing on liberating women (Campbell 2003:17). This was far from the truth, and Smith made it clear that all people are connected in one way or another and our actions and decisions greatly impact the way social organization's function.

Institutional ethnography is so impactful because it helps individuals begin to understand their daily routines through examining the social organizations that they are involved in. Likewise, the concept of ruling relations helps bring clarity to understanding what power means in society and why some individuals have power over others. Smith explains that individuals may not be fully aware that their own choices and preferences are shaped by forms of knowledge and interests that *originate* from the social organizations that they are a part of. Individuals may make decisions based on what they believe is 'rational,' however, what they believe is 'right' is inherently being dictated by an institutional force. In turn, all of the social organizations that individuals interact with are leading them to reinforce their daily routines. Smith would argue that it is important to look at the individual's experiences as well as their practices in local sites and wider processes of ruling and governing. Moreover, understanding the particular mechanisms that impact the way in which individuals interact in their social spaces is crucial to understanding the process of institutional ethnography.

Smith's institutional ethnography pioneered the emphasis on standpoint theory, the starting point for a study, which influenced other theorists such as Sandra Harding who built upon this concept. In addition to emphasizing an individual's experience, Smith noted that researching from a particular location was paramount to understanding sociology for women; however, it is not limited to a woman's experience. For Smith, the importance of location was synonymous with understanding that all individuals' experiences in the world are vastly connected to the way in which they view and interact

within social organizations. This makes logical sense because depending on where individuals are in relation to one another this would impact how they see things work together in society. Depending on our unique lens in which we view the world, this greatly affects how we personally view social organizations and therefore, affects how we believe things function (Deveau 2008:14). Likewise, individuals tend to interact with other people who have similar backgrounds to them and therefore, they presumably have comparable interpretations of the organizations to which they belong.

Smith was not only interested in studying peoples' experiences at face value, but also understanding the processes and procedures in the institutional context, which shapes these experiences. Smith describes how the social organizations that individuals are a part of shapes the way in which they live their daily lives, how they make decisions, and what their preferences are. Smith argues that this influences the way individuals see the impact of said organization because everything is connected by the preconceived notions individuals have already placed on society. In order to understand how things work together, we need to examine all individuals' unique narratives, which can be achieved by inspecting the texts of a given social organization. The significance of this is that institutional ethnography relies on individuals' experiences and it is no wonder that Smith's research was so crucial to the critique of traditional sociology that takes precedence today.

In addition, in order to understand how impactful Smith's work on institutional ethnography is, it is important to examine studies that utilized this methodology. Many current sociologists and researchers have found institutional ethnography to be a great approach to studying research in the health professions education area (Kearney et al. 2019). Nichols et al. (2015) used institutional ethnography to examine how parents can support the well-being and health of their children within the realm of family health work. The researchers used qualitative data from focus groups with parents, all from various socioeconomic backgrounds, to learn about social determinants such as the individual, social, cultural, and structural factors that influence the well-being of their children. This study was used to address critical public health concerns that will help healthcare professionals design better programs to properly address various needs for more diverse family types (Nichols et al. 2015). This study is just one example among many that demonstrates the practicality and efficacy of institutional ethnography.

Although Smith's introduction to institutional ethnography helped future researchers and sociologists understand the relationship between individuals and society, there are still individuals who claim that Smith's work was flawed. For instance, Smith argues that the transcripts of individuals in ethnographic research may need to be 'reassembled' in order to draw conclusions. By looking for recurring themes and data in individuals' transcripts, this may lead to a biased outcome because this allows for researchers to confirm their original beliefs. This may lead to a slippery slope especially in regards to keeping the original story and perspective of the individual as accurate as possible. Moreover, this may compromise the authenticity of a study because the last thing that should occur is false representations of individuals, which would completely alter the truth of how individuals see themselves in relation to social organizations and how they

work (Walby 2013:147). Smith's institutional ethnography technique can be improved with the refinement of data analysis and the ways in which researchers make conclusions about how things work together without making implausible generalizations.

That being said, the generalizations that institutional ethnography makes are used as a framework to discern the commonalities between individuals' experiences. The texts that are used in institutional ethnography are extremely helpful because they trace any patterns that individuals share within their given location. We need to keep in mind that the location of individuals is very telling of their unique experiences, and therefore, their perceptions of the world. Similarly, it is common that individuals will have different experiences depending on where they live, who they are surrounded by, and the traditions of their social organizations that they are involved in. By coming to terms with the idea that individuals have a unique perspective on the world, and therefore, they view social organizations in a different light, this will help researchers better understand the way in which things work together. This is accomplished through interpreting patterns that multiple individuals share with one another and making a connection between the stereotypes that society unduly places on individuals and how this affects their perception of organizations. We also need to be aware that there is not only one system or specific set of patterns that all researchers look for when they are making conclusions about individuals and their experiences. Researchers are merely making observations that come up in the field, which help shape interpretations of why individuals behave in a certain way, make decisions and follow routines, and how social institutions are formed and maintained.

Smith is a notable figure in sociology due to her immense contributions to how individuals frame their current beliefs as well as her ability to challenge people to think about different perspectives. Her research on institutional ethnography helped explain the biases that society has toward women in contrast to their male counterparts and how current beliefs need to be confronted in order to live in a more equitable community for all people.

CONTRIBUTIONS BEYOND SOCIOLOGY: SMITH AS A SCHOLAR-ACTIVIST

Smith's work draws together different approaches to oppression and knowledge production: second-wave feminism, ethnomethodology, and Marx's framework from *The German Ideology*. Her scholarship is considered a breakthrough in Canadian Sociology as Smith moved beyond theories that originated in and centered the United States, and instead worked to study everyday people, specifically women (Carroll 2010). In addition to her contributions in Marxist feminism, standpoint theory, and institutional ethnography, Smith has been active in other related disciplines. In "Feminist Reflections on Political Economy" (1989), Smith offered critiques of knowledge production in the field of political economy. Here, she used the same ideas that characterize her sociological work – feminism, Marxism, epistemology, and the ruling apparatus – in order to reflect on the ways scholars were developing theories of political economy. Referring to the tendency to reduce class struggle to trade unionism, she writes, "To treat 'trade unions' as a textual stand-in for class is an illustration of the kind of centripetal pull of the 'main business' and its marginalization of women that I'm

explicating here. Though the political economist may recognize class as gendered, in practice, when the point of production is treated as the exclusive site of class and class struggle, major dimensions of women's lives are dropped from view," (Smith 1989:53). In this article Smith also cites *Orientalism*, revealing that postcolonial scholars like Edward Said are a strong influence on her theoretical development. For critiquing the ways in which disciplines like political economy attempt to conceal the power structures that characterize their scholarship and distance themselves from everyday experiences of oppression, Smith, in her own words, "got into deep, deep trouble" and was dropped from the board of the *Studies for Political Economy* (Carroll 2010:18).

Smith's work has gained wide prominence both within and outside of the field of feminist sociology. Throughout her academic career, Smith has consistently challenged the male perspective that characterizes traditional forms of sociology. As Patricia Hill Collins writes, Smith believes that sociology is "incapable of analyzing its relations to its underlying social conditions because its procedures objectify and separate people from their knowledge," (1992:75). Some scholars have called Smith's approach to the socially constituted nature of all knowledge better than even Durkheim's (Hart and McKinnon 2010). Hence, Smith's work has influenced a whole generation of feminist scholars. In *Thinking Through: Essays, Marxism, and Anti-Racism,* Himani Bannerji (1995) builds on Smith's Marxist and feminist standpoints by questioning the conceptualizations of race, class, and gender as distinct issues and instead emphasizes how these social relations are embodied. Pulling from ideas about the ruling apparatus, Chandra Talpede Mohanty (1991) draws attention to decolonial and postcolonial theory (DeVault 1996). Campbell & Manicom's work (1995) compiles together a wide variety of research in which ideas central to Smith's methodology are further elaborated and developed by other theorists. These essays include discussions of the AIDS epidemic, multiculturalism and ideology, the British empire, homosexuality and sexual policing, children's development, education, urban planning, and photography among others – testament to the relevance and significance of Smith's work across contexts and disciplines.

Dorothy Smith's contributions also extend far beyond the theoretical realm. During her time at the University of British Columbia, Smith was involved in the formation of a women's action group with the objective of changing the status of women throughout all levels of the university (Carroll 2010). In 1973, she helped found the Women's Research Center in Vancouver that worked to provide research assistance to women's organizations. She also began teaching sociology at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE), where she and other women scholars helped introduce progressive transformations. At the University of Toronto, she founded and directed the Center for Women's Studies in Education. Not only has Smith published pioneering scholarship throughout her career but she has also partnered with various activist groups and unions to understand the mechanisms of oppression in order to build progressive social movements and create social change. Here, her work includes collaboration with the Canadian Teachers' Federation, the Committee on the Status of Women, and the Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women (Carroll 2010). However, Smith does not consider these involvements extraneous. In fact, her theories and

scholarship are very much grounded in her collaboration with women's and activist organizations. She writes, "We thought we would reverse the normal flow of information and inquiry that transfers knowledge about people to the institutions which produce knowledge for the ruling of society, namely, to universities and academic discourses. We thought of a women's research centre as a means of producing knowledge for women, making the stored-up knowledge and skills of academe serve the people who are usually their objects," (Smith 1989:37). In this manner, Smith challenged and reinvented the relationship between social scientists and their objects, and thus, radicalized the ways in which sociological knowledge was being produced at the time. For Smith, epistemology is not reserved for academics and social scientists, but that "the social act is already epistemological practice," (Hart and McKinnon 2010).

As a feminist sociologist, Smith emphasizes the study of social relations and structures of power in which practices are embedded. In her pursuit to examine the everyday worlds in which women are situated, she offered social scientists a radical approach to knowledge production, thereby transforming sociological research forever. While her contributions influence a diverse range of scholars across contexts, Smith takes her approach beyond the theoretical realm to center and support everyday people, especially marginalized groups. For her theory and praxis, Smith has been recognized and awarded by academic associations, universities, activist groups, and governments.

CONCLUDING REMARKS

For her multidimensional theories that blend feminist, neo-Marxist, phenomenological, and ethnomethodological ideas, Smith is a world-renowned scholar. Influential British sociologist John Scott writes, "By developing the [institutional ethnography] approach and helping to ensure that it is embedded in the set of methodological approaches adopted by sociologists, Smith has made a distinctive and important contribution to the discipline," (2007, 204). Smith's contributions have been recognized as revolutionary through awards like the Jessie Bernard Award for Feminist Sociology in 1993 and the American Sociological Association's Center of Distinguished Scholarship award in 1999 (Scott 2007:204). IE as a methodological approach also has wide and far-reaching impacts: the Society for the Study of Social Problems created an Institutional Ethnography division as a space to further extend Smith's framework and elaborate on its impacts and usefulness. Smith's wide contributions across contexts have recast her methods of standpoint theory and institutional ethnography from a "sociology for women" to a "sociology for people" and transformed the field of sociology to be able to represent those who are excluded by traditional theories and methods.

REFERENCES

Barnett, Barbara. 2009. "From Theory to Classroom: Some Practical Applications of Standpoint Theory." *Feminist Teacher* 19:186-194.

Bowell, Tracy. N.d. "Feminist Standpoint Theory." *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Matin: The University of Tennessee at Martin. Retrieved Nov. 10, 2020 (https://iep.utm.edu/fem-stan/#H2).

Campbell, Marie. 2003. "Dorothy Smith and Knowing the World We Live In." *Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare.* 30(1): 3-22.

Carroll, William K. 2010. "'You Are Here': an interview with Dorothy E. Smith." *Socialist Studies/Études Socialistes* 6(2):9-37.

Collins, Patricia Hill. 1992. "Transforming the Inner Circle: Dorothy Smith's Challenge to Sociological Theory." *Sociological Theory.* 10(1): 73-80.

Clough, Patricia T. 1993. "On the Brink of Deconstructing Sociology: Critical Reading of Dorothy Smith's Standpoint Epistemology". *The Sociological Quarterly.* 34(1): 169-182.

DeVault, Marjorie L. 1996. "Talking back to sociology: Distinctive contributions of feminist methodology." *Annual Review of Sociology* 22(1):29-50.

Deveau, J. L. 2008. "Examining the Institutional Ethnographer's Toolkit." *Socialist Studies*. 4(2):1-19.

Dillon, Michele. 2020. *Introduction to sociological theory: theorists, concepts, and their applicability to the twenty-first century.* 3rd ed. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.

Earles, Jennifer, and Sara L. Crawley. 2019. "Institutional Ethnography" in *SAGE Research Methods Foundations.*, edited by P. Atkinson, S. Delamont, A. Cernat, J.W. Sakshaug and R.A. Williams.

Hard, Randle J., and Andrew McKinnon. 2010. "Sociological epistemology: Durkheim's paradox and Dorothy E. Smith's actuality." *Sociology* 44(6):1038-1054.

Harding, Sandra. 1991. *Whose Science/ Whose Knowledge?* Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

Kearney, Grainne P., Michael K. Corman, Nigel D. Hart, Jennifer L. Johnston, and Gerard J. Gormley. 2019. "Why Institutional Ethnography? Why Now? Institutional Ethnography in Health Professions Education." *Perspectives on Medical Education* 8(1):17–24.

McCoy, Liza. 2004. "Reviewed Work: Mapping Social Relations: A Primer in Doing Institutional Ethnography." *Health* 8(1):129-133

Nichols, Naomi, Micheal Fridman, Khaled Ramadan, Lee Ford Jones, and Niraj Mistry. 2015. "Investigating The Social Organization of Family Health Work: An institutional ethnography." *Critical Public Health* 26(5):554-565. https://doi.org/10.1080/09581596.2015.1119804

Scott, John. 2007. "Dorothy Smith." Pp. 200-205 in *Fifty Key Sociologists: The Contemporary Theorists*, edited by John Scott. London: Routledge.

Smith, Dorothy. 1974. "Women's Perspective as a Radical Critique of Sociology." *Sociological Inquiry.* 44(1): 7-13.

Smith, Dorothy E. 1989. "Feminist Reflections on Political Economy." *Studies in Political Economy* 30(1):37-59.

Smith, Dorothy. 1990. *The Conceptual Practices of Power: A Feminist Sociology of Knowledge*. Boston: Northeastern University Press.

Smith, Dorothy. 1997. "Response to Susan Mann and Lori Kelley." *Gender & Society.* 11(6): 819-821.

Smith, Dorothy. 2002. "Institutional Ethnography" in *Qualitative Research in Action.* edited by T. May. London: SAGE Publications.

Smith, Dorothy. 2005. *Institutional Ethnography: A Sociology for People.* Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Smythe, Deirdre. 2009. *A few laced genes: women's standpoint in the feminist ancestry of Dorothy E. Smith*. Sage Publications UK.

Walby, K. 2013. "Institutional ethnography and data analysis: making sense of data dialogues." *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*. 16(2): 141–154.

Power and Punishment: An Intellectual Biography of Michel Foucault

By

Maria Gregg, Elvena Gevargiz, Brittany Gillingham, Sarah Glasser

ABSTRACT. The French post-structuralist thinker, Michel Foucault, was a philosopher, psychologist, historian and sociologist. He combined this interdisciplinary knowledge to theorize new conceptualizations of discipline, power, and knowledge and their implications for ideas of human bodies, sex, and sexuality, all of which culminated in his overarching quest to investigate the production of truth. Foucault examined how institutions and people regulate bodies, both their own and those of others, in society and rooted his theories in examples of the institutions and discourses of his time while channeling experiences from his own identity as a disciplinary scholar and gay man. Deviating from conflict theory, Foucault theorized truth and power as omnipresent and relational forces constructing all institutions, disciplines, and discourse. Beyond conflict theorists' critiques of Foucault's ideas on power, Foucault has also received many critiques from feminist scholars such as Nancy Hartsock and Nancy Fraser who objected to his perspective on power, considering his own position of relative privilege as a man. Thus, his discussions of power, though intended for a universal audience, are less relevant to women's experiences. Additionally, his conception of power as an omnipresent and relational force limits people's ability to change power discrepancies. This intellectual biography finds that while Foucault's own identity and background crucially informed his theories, they also left his ideas vulnerable to the criticisms they face today. Nonetheless, through both his enduring contributions and their continual critique and revision by modern theorists, Foucault's impact on sociology, psychology, and philosophy, among other things, continue to impact contemporary social and cultural works.

PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY

Michel Foucault is a major figure in the poststructuralist wave of thought, connecting to intellectuals from all different fields. At the end of his life, he claimed to be the most prominent living intellectual in France and achieved celebrity-like status. This hubris, while arguably justified, also provides fodder for his modern critics. His work ranges from multiple disciplines, such as history, sociology, psychology, and philosophy. He is one of the most cited authors across all of the humanities in general, except for philosophy, the primary subject that he was educated in. Foucault is best known for his critical studies of social institutions, psychiatry, medicine, human sciences, and of course, the history of human sexuality. His fascination with sexuality and the human body likely derived from his personal relationships and sexuality. He proved that understanding one's sexuality is not as easy as one may think.

Additionally, his theories address the relationship between power and knowledge, and how they are used as a form of social control. He believed that individuals oversimplify

the transition from monarchy to democracy. He also makes the point that where power lies, resistance is also present. Foucault mentioned that all of his work was part of a single project to investigate the production of truth. He continually sought a way of understanding ideas that can shape our present by tracing the changes in their function through history. Michel Foucault is an "influential intellectual who steadfastly refused to align himself with any of the major traditions of western social thought" (Ball, 2013). His interdisciplinary background and elevated vision of his own accomplishments allows him to forge his own path of original theoretical thought.

BIOGRAPHY

Born in 1926, Michael Foucault, or Paul-Michel Foucault, is a 20th-century French historian and philosopher. As the son of a STEM family, Foucault grew up in a stable, bourgeois family but diverged onto a path of philosophy and psychology. Both parents were children of the local doctor and surgeon; they longed for Foucault to follow in their footsteps. With a medical background from his parents, it would have made complete sense for Michel to follow them into the medical field. Michel, of course, chose a different path while his sister did fulfil their parents' wish to have a child work in the medical field.

Michel decided to move to Paris to attend the École Normale Supérieure d'Ulm — "the most prestigious institution for education in the humanities in France" and the "standard launching pad for major French philosophers" (Kelly, 2019). At the ENS, he established a reputation as a brilliant but erratic student. He focused his studies on philosophy but also took material from his psychology class, completely defying the wishes of his father. His years at ENS were filled with constant depression, which led to a suicide attempt. After his attempt, Foucault became more open and understanding about his homosexuality. Foucault also joined the French Communist Party but was never active. His experiences with depression and coming-to-terms with his identity as a homosexual man informed his later psychological and sociological works. His political interests coupled with his identity as a white man shaped some of his most well known and oft-critiqued ideas on power.

After obtaining his philosophy degree, he taught psychology at ENS; one of his students being Jacques Derribe, a philosophical antagonist of Foucault. Foucault went on to take positions at the University of Uppsala in Sweden, Poland, and Institute Français in Hamburg before eventually publishing his initial famous piece, *A History of Madness*. Foucault found work in Paris and forged an academic relationship with Daniel Defert, a student turned sociologist. In the 1970s, he became incredibly politically active and protested on behalf of marginalized groups. He then founded the Prisons Information Group, sometimes known as the GIP. This group worked to provide aid for political prisoners but also sought to give a voice to these prisoners. His work with prison reform inspired his book, *Discipline and Punish.* In the late 1970s, when the political climate began to cool off, Foucault withdrew from activism and turned his attention to journalism.

Foucault began to spend more time teaching in the United States because he was welcomed by a very enthusiastic audience. In 1983, he agreed to take a position as visiting professor at the University of California, Berkeley. A year after taking the position, Foucault passed away from AIDS. He had acquired HIV during his time in the United States, which soon developed into AIDs. His health quickly declined while trying to edit the first two volumes of *The History of Sexuality.* He left two volumes to be completed by Defert; however, only one was published. He was working up to the day of his death trying to complete his works. Michel Foucault was a brilliant student and teacher of the humanities with long-lasting theories. He continues to affect society decades later as people both adopt and critically evaluate his contributions.

INTELLECTUAL TRAJECTORY

Michel Foucault's own identity as a gay man, informed by his studies of philosophy and psychology, enabled his inquiry into social narratives surrounding human bodies and sexuality that did not seem to accurately encapsulate his own experience of his body and sexuality. This, coupled with the academic influence of sociologist Daniel Defert, resulted in Foucault introducing the application of a sociological lens to the human body itself and, in particular, to conceptions of human sexuality.

Foucault's theories are rooted in a post-structuralist perspective within the European tradition (Finkelde 2013). As such, Foucault views social institutions and conventions as the primary influences of our sense of self and our subsequent behaviors. In particular, Foucault applies this way of thinking to his examination of the human body itself and how people identify and manifest their sexuality. He recognized that conceptions of bodies are not simply biological, but are socially regulated (Powers 2011). He is especially known for using this perspective to prove that categories of sexuality are social constructions, shaped by the institutions and interactions around us (Beckett, Bagguley, Campbell 2017).

Foucault wrote about institutions as a primary disciplinary force that regulate our ideas and behaviors. He applies Jeremy Bentham's Panopticon model to describe how institutions, which he sees as the primary disciplinary force, all act as a form of Panopticon to describe how people are disciplined by their involvement in systems of constant observation and regulation (Foucault 1979). On an individual level, Foucault traces social change through the continual discipline of bodies, which results in the creation of docile bodies. As we get older, we are subjected to more and more layers of discipline, and the more experience we have within the variety of institutions that we encounter, the more we are taught to regulate our bodies to best fit and function within our society (Foucault 1979).

While this describes individuals' internal development, Foucault also describes how as the world changed with the progression of industrialization and capitalism, so too did bio-power (Foucault 1986). Those developments led to further expansions of institutions, and therefore the expansion of governing discourses, such as bio-power techniques (Gane 2018). Additionally, through discourse, we delineate what is

considered normal, exceptional, shameful, etc. and we can also be empowered by our confessions (Beckett, Bagguley, Campbell 2017). This is because power exists in what is said and what is not said, and is experienced by those speaking and those listening, and thus informs all aspects of our lives.

Foucault delved deeply into investigations of the concepts and manifestations of power and truth. In doing so, he theorizes about the attributes of power in ways that deviate from the conflict perspective on power and its roles. As mentioned, to Foucault power is omnipresent, continually shaped, and constructs institutions and discourse. For example, informed by his work in many different areas of academic study, Foucault argued that disciplines of knowledge use power to grant themselves and their findings legitimacy. Foucault viewed power as relational and identified it when it was being exercised, not when it was used by and on any particular source or target (Foucault 1986). Similarly — according to Foucault — the concept of truth includes all aspects of the discourses produced by all elements of institutions (Deacon 2002). His sociological revelations require us to critically evaluate the discourses surrounding topics of bodies, sex, and sexuality and to recognize their origins in bio-politics to better evaluate their truth (Prozorov 2017). Foucault writes that bio-power imbues biological attributes with their social, political, and economic consequences and leads to increased control of people's bodies, sexuality, and sex (Foucault 1986). He argues that as the world grew increasingly industrialized and capitalism spread, so too did bio-power. This is because as those developments led to further expansions of institutions, it also expanded governing discourses, such as bio-power techniques. The concept of bio-power is also an example of how Foucault saw power as relational and circulatory and is exercised through discourse.

CONTRIBUTIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

Foucault was one of the most influential and controversial scholars of the post World War II period. He was regarded as a "master of thought" (Miller 1993). He wrote mostly on philosophical questions with an emphasis on the nature of knowledge, truth, and power. His noteworthy intellectual contribution was his ability to illustrate how these three things were used as a platform of social control through various societal institutions. Some institutions that he discussed included science, medicine, and penal systems. These institutions often created subject categories for people to inhabit and turn others into objects of scrutiny and knowledge. Foucault argued that because of this, there was the creation of hierarchies of power among people and in turn, this produced hierarchies of knowledge. This shaped the idea that when one obtains any form of knowledge, they are also considered to be powerful, legitimate and right. In contrast, anything less of this is considered invalid, inaccurate, and wrong. Foucault argues that those who control institutions and their discourses wield power in society because they shape the trajectories and outcomes of people's lives (Cole 2019). Therefore, we learn that power is not held by individuals, but rather lives within institutions and is accessible only to those who control institutions and the creation of knowledge.

Throughout his focus on uncovering how "power" was developed through ways of regulating and controlling people, Foucault discussed the "birth" or creation of prisons, madness, education, mental illness clinics, asylums and sexuality (Dillon 2020). In the example of prisons and the reasons as to why they should be created, we realize that with Foucault's perspective in mind, prisons weren't designed to lock away criminals, but rather serve as houses of confinements and departments of correction. It was — and still is — a form of power and hierarchy of the police officers and guards within the prisons over the prisoners. Examples of this hierarchy of power include the controlled and supervised daily routines by the armed guards, scheduled and monitored meal times, shower times, visiting hours, etc. Through this, we see that society controls and regulates our human bodies.

CONTROVERSIES AND CRITICISMS

Although Foucault brought many ideas and theories to the table within the realm of sociology, he had many critics. Roger Kimball, an American art critic and conservative social commentator, criticized both Foucault's sexual ideals as well as James Miller's justification and support of Foucault's theories from his book, *The Passion of Michel Foucault*. In his article, Kimball argues that arrogance and mystification were two indications of Foucault's character and writing. Foucault was said to attempt suicide several times as well as threaten it, while self-destruction, sex and death were also some of his obsessions. Miller, however, suggests that Foucault, in his radical approach to the body and its pleasures, was a kind of visionary; and that in the future, once the threat of AIDS has receded, men and women, both straight and gay, will renew, without shame or fear, the kind of corporeal experimentation that formed an integral part of his philosophical conquest (Kimball 1993). Kimball goes on to discuss how Foucault's ideas of sadomasochism were wrong and disturbing. In one of his interviews, Focault praises sadomasochism and says that "the idea that bodily pleasure should always come from sexual pleasure and that sexual pleasure is the root of all our possible pleasure" (Kimball 1993). Here, Kimball argues that there are many other ways for a human being to receive pleasure other than sexually. Things such as having one's favorite meal, getting a haircut, going to the movies, reading a book, spending time with friends and family, etc. can all be considered forms of pleasure.

German philosopher and sociologist in the tradition of critical theory, Jurgen Habermas, is also one of Focault's critics. In a 1981 discussion of postmodernism, he referred to Foucault as a "young conservative" (Fraser 2008). Habermas categorized him as such because of his critique of modernity. He was critical of Foucault not because power is incongruous but because Foucault's conceptions of it inflict environmental damage for which he can be held philosophically accountable (Kelly 1994). Although both acknowledge power and its influence within practices and society, Habermas' view is different from Foucault's. He believes that although power is to be considered, it should be done so through a critical theory to be able to make normative distinctions between legitimate and illegitimate uses of power (Kelly 1994). Another difference between Foucault and Habermas is their view and stance on modernity. Foucault rejects criticism

of modernity, while Habermas defines it as a set of problems related to the issue of time and relates it to the Enlightenment.

Nancy Hartsock, an American philosopher and renowned feminist, stated that women could "discover their own values and gain authentic agency only through acts of solidarity with feminist protesters and dissenters" (Meyers, 2019). In Foucault's theories, women are not explicitly examined as a different category. Foucault "... fails to provide an epistemology which is usable for the task of revolutionizing, creating, and constructing" (Hartsock, 2013). In Foucault's eyes, deconstructing power is only a weakening movement -- one that cannot bring forth adequate transformations. This exclusive definition of power leads Hartsock and other feminists to feel as if "Foucault's world is not [their] world but instead a world in which I feel profoundly alien in" (Hartsock, 2013). His perspective on power comes from a position of power that does not allow for external reflection. Foucault is in the majority as he is both white and male and has not experienced the struggle to fight the power that he dismisses in his theory. In Hartsock's critique, she believes that Foucault "...reinforces the relations of domination in our society by insisting that those of us who have been marginalized remain at the margins" (Hartsock, 2013). Despite recent traction, women have been historically oppressed and marginalized. With current feminist movements and media representation women have begun to gain more recognition, but, "his account makes room only for abstract individuals, not women, men or workers" (Hartsock, 2013). Although Foucault's theories are directed towards the general public, Hartsock reminds his audience that the universal man does not share the same experience as any marginalized group. Despite commonalities, women are different, women have specific experiences, and women recognize that they are not the universal man that can experience the world in the way Foucault imagines it.

Nancy Fraser, a prominent feminist professor, expanded on her critiques of his theories by saying that his work was too tied to the idea of "docile bodies," which denied the fact that people have the ability and desire to resist power. When Foucault talked about resisting and reproducing power, he argued that there would always be unequal power relations, thus silencing any argument and ultimately reproducing power. The idea that the relations between race, economy, gender, etc. cannot change only further the discrepancies between men and women. For women, resisting power is a means of change and a fight for equality. To ignore that in his theories is as if to say that women do not deserve the same rights. These ideas benefit white male hegemonic ideologies and construct a view of gender and sexuality that are limiting in their beliefs. His theories are rather gender-neutral and do not acknowledge how vastly different women and men are impacted by the hierarchies of power. Foucault does not agree with the Enlightenment theory that truth is directly opposed to power, which undermines the emancipatory goals of feminism. Fraser argues that Foucault's non-partisan opinion on power does not support feminism because it lacks resources that could criticize his hierarchy of domination and facilitate social change.

CONCLUSION

Foucault's particular blending of his own identity-specific experiences, his varied academic interests, and his formidable intellect resulted in contributions to sociology, psychology, and philosophy that are both respected and critically reckoned with today. From his initial years in France, he was able to develop some of his theories on power, knowledge, and the way society upholds certain hierarchies. He was most known for his idea that power is controlled by people and communities through certain acts of force and control; power is not in the hands of a single ruler, but rather omnipresent. His work covered a broad range of subjects and his theories on bio-power continue to influence studies in philosophy and political science. Michel Foucault was a revolutionist for his time, as he was able to explore many ideas that had not been elaborated on by other sociological theorists. He became enthralled by the concepts of punishment and discipline and actively sought engagement in communities that expressed unique methods of surveillance such as mental asylums, prison, schools, factories, and other workplaces. These environments allowed him to explore his ideas on power and see how they were manifested in places that had direct sources of domination. Through his personal understanding of sexuality and gender studies, Foucault was able to better analyze how such topics were presented in the 19th century. Even though he despised the term homosexual and often grappled with his sexuality, he applies his sexual curiosity to his work in France. However, though Foucault utilized his own identity and experiences in these instances to gain especially incisive insight, his areas of privilege insulated him from other perspectives, such as a feminist perspective, among others, and inform critiques of his work today.

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF FOUCAULT'S MAIN WORKS

Much of Foucault's work surrounded theories of madness, power relations, bodies and sexuality, and the orders of life and knowledge. His work reflected the environments that he was in whether it be academic settings, specific organizations, or personal endeavours. The evolution of Foucault's personal growth and sociological analysis is evident in his critically acclaimed pieces, *Madness and Civilization, The Birth of the Clinic, The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences, The Archaeology of Knowledge, Discipline and Punish,* and the three volumes of *The History of Sexuality.*

Madness and Civilization

This is a historical examination of the concept of madness and the role that madness has played in all facets of society, whether in ideas, behaviors, or institutions. This work is formed from both Foucault's extensive archival work and his anger at what he saw as moral hypocrisy. Foucault also argued that the antithesis of madness is Reason, but that newer supposed treatments of madness are essentially controlling forces.

The Birth of the Clinic

Building off of his previous examination of the medical profession concerning the treatment of madness, in this book Foucault focuses on the development and function

of teaching hospitals. Additionally, he evaluates the power and limitations of the medical regard/medical gaze.

The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences

Foucault interrogated assumptions of truth throughout history and proved the malleability of truth depending on the conditions surrounding its construction at the given time, place, and context. Foucault offers an analysis of what knowledge meant, as well as how it is changed in Western thought from the Renaissance to the present.

The Archeology of Knowledge

This was a notable publication because it marked both Foucault's foray into methodological writing and his first in-depth discussion of the power and role of discourse, which became central to his theories and his particular conceptualization of post-structuralism.

Discipline and Punish

In this work, Foucault heavily critiques systems of punishment and contrasts historical punishment that was exercised via repression tactics with modern era disciplinary styles of punishment that are enacted by "professionals" with authority over prisoners. This has inspired many of the prison and disciplinary institution reformists and is also where Foucault detailed his influential application of the Panopticon model to larger societal functions.

The History of Sexuality (3 Volumes)

These three volumes had slightly differing focuses but all were set in the 1800s to the present, which was a more modern focus than his previous works, which had all extended further historically. These works formed some of the most potent elements of his legacy today since they featured discussions of sexuality, the politics of sexuality, and the relationship between sexuality and the rise of bio-politics. Foucault achieved this through an examination of both expressions and repressions of sexuality.

REFERENCES

Miller, James. 1993. *The Passion of Michel Foucault*. New York, NY: Bantam Doubleday Dell Publishing Group, Inc.

Marshall, James D. 1996. *Michel Foucault: Personal Autonomy and Education*. Dordrecht, NL: Klewer Academic Publishers.

Power, Michael. 2011. "Foucault and Sociology." *Annual Review of Sociology*. 37: 35-56.

Ball, Stephen J. 1990. *Foucault and Education: Disciplines and Knowledge*. New York, NY: Routledge, Chapman, and Hall, Inc.

Gutting, Gary and Johanna Oksala. 2018. "Michel Foucault." *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Retrieved October 10, 2020 (https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/foucault/).

Faubion, James. 2020. "Michel Foucault." *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Retrieved October 10, 2020 (https://www.britannica.com/biography/Michel-Foucault).

Faubion, James. 2020. "Foucault's Influence." *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Retrieved October 10, 2020 (https://www.britannica.com/biography/Michel-Foucault/Foucaults-influence).

Foucault, Michel. 1979. *Discipline and Punish: the Birth of the Prison*. Translated by A. S. Sheridan. Vintage Books.

Foucault, Michel. 1986. *The History of Sexuality*. Translated by R. Hurley. Pantheon Books.

Kelly, Mark. 1996. "Michel Foucault (1926-1984)." *Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Retrieved October 10, 2020 (https://iep.utm.edu/foucault/).

Beckett, Angharad E., Paul Bagguley, and Tom F. Campbell. 2017. "Foucault, Social Movements and Heterotopic Horizons: Rupturing the Order of Things." *Social Movement Studies* 16 (2): 169-181.

Gane, Mike. 2018. "The New Foucault Effect." *Cultural Politics* (2018) 14 (1): 109–127.

Prozorov, Sergei. 2017. "Foucault's Affirmative Biopolitics: Cynic Parrhesia and the Biopower of the Powerless.*" Political Theory* 45(6): 806-823.

Chris, Cynthia. 2016. "Editor's Note." *Women's studies Quarterly.* 44(3)9-13.

Deacon, Roger. 2002. *Truth, Power and Pedagogy: Michel Foucault on the Rise of the Disciplines*. Retrieved October 12, 2020. (https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1469-5812.2002.tb00518.x).

Finkelde, Dominik. 2013. "Post-Structuralism." *New Catholic Encyclopedia Supplement 2012-13: Ethics and Philosophy, 3:1245-1247*. (https://www.hfph.de/hochschule/lehrende/prof-dr-dominik-finkelde-sj/artikel-beitraege/poststructuralism.pdf).

Hartsock, Nancy. 1990. "Foucault on Power: A Theory for Women?" Pp. 157-75. *Feminism/Postmodernism*, Linda Nicholson (ed.) New York: Routledge.

The School of Life. 2015. *Philosophy-Michel Foucault*. YouTube.com. 8:16. (https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BBJTeNTZtGU).