# Kent Academic Repository Full text document (pdf)

# **Citation for published version**

Mahoney, Patrick and Miszkiewicz, Justyna J. and Pitfield, Rosie and Deter, Chris and Guatelli-Steinberg, Debbie (2017) Enamel biorhythms of humans and great apes: the Havers-Halberg Oscillation hypothesis reconsidered. Journal of Anatomy, 230 (2). pp. 272-281. ISSN 1469-7580.

# DOI

https://doi.org/10.1111/joa.12551

# Link to record in KAR

http://kar.kent.ac.uk/57297/

# **Document Version**

Author's Accepted Manuscript

# **Copyright & reuse**

Content in the Kent Academic Repository is made available for research purposes. Unless otherwise stated all content is protected by copyright and in the absence of an open licence (eg Creative Commons), permissions for further reuse of content should be sought from the publisher, author or other copyright holder.

# Versions of research

The version in the Kent Academic Repository may differ from the final published version. Users are advised to check http://kar.kent.ac.uk for the status of the paper. Users should always cite the published version of record.

# Enquiries

For any further enquiries regarding the licence status of this document, please contact: **researchsupport@kent.ac.uk** 

If you believe this document infringes copyright then please contact the KAR admin team with the take-down information provided at http://kar.kent.ac.uk/contact.html





1	Enamel biorhythms of humans and great apes: the Havers-Halberg
2	Oscillation hypothesis reconsidered
3	
4	Patrick. Mahoney <sup>1*</sup> , Justyna J. Miszkiewicz <sup>2</sup> , Rosie. Pitfield <sup>1</sup> , Chris. Deter <sup>1</sup> , Debbie. Guatelli-
5	Steinberg <sup>3</sup> .
6	
7	<sup>1</sup> Human Osteology Lab, Skeletal Biology Research Centre, School of Anthropology and Conservation,
8	University of Kent, United Kingdom.
9	<sup>2</sup> School of Archaeology and Anthropology, Australian National University, Australia.
10	<sup>3</sup> Department of Anthropology, The Ohio State University, United States of America.
11	
12	*p.mahoney@kent.ac.uk
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	

#### 27 Abstract

28 The Havers-Halberg Oscillation (HHO) hypothesis links evidence for the timing of a 29 biorhythm retained in permanent tooth enamel (Retzius periodicity) to adult body mass and 30 life history traits across mammals. Potentially, these links provide a way to access life 31 history of fossil species from teeth. Recently we assessed intra-specific predictions of the 32 HHO on human children. We reported Retzius periodicity (RP) corresponded with enamel 33 thickness, and cusp formation time, when calculated from isolated deciduous teeth. We 34 proposed the biorhythm might not remain constant within an individual. Here, we test our 35 findings. RP is compared between deciduous second and permanent first molars within the 36 maxillae of four human children. Following this, we report the first RP's for deciduous teeth 37 from modern great apes (n=4), and compare these to new data for permanent teeth (n=18)38 from these species, as well as to previously published values. We also explore RP in teeth 39 that retain hypoplastic defects.

40 Results show RP changed within the maxilla of each child, from thinner to thicker 41 enameled molars, and from one side of a hypoplastic defect to the other. When considered 42 alongside correlations between RP and cusp formation time, these observations provide 43 further evidence that RP is associated with enamel growth processes, and does not always 44 remain constant within an individual. RP of five days for great ape deciduous teeth lay below 45 the lowermost range of those from permanent teeth of modern orangutan and gorilla, and 46 within the lowermost range of RP's from chimpanzee permanent teeth. Our data suggest 47 associations between RP and enamel growth processes of humans might extend to great apes. 48 These findings provide a new framework from which to develop the HHO hypothesis, which 49 can incorporate enamel growth along with other physiological systems. Applications of the 50 HHO to fossil teeth should avoid transferring RP between deciduous and permanent enamel,

51 or including hypoplastic teeth.

52 KEY WORDS: Retzius lines, enamel growth, life history, biorhythms.

# 53 Introduction

54 Primate tooth enamel grows incrementally (Boyde, 1979, 1989). Each increment is marked 55 by a growth line, as in shells and trees. One type of marking are Retzius lines (Retzius, 56 1837), which emerge on the outer lateral enamel surface as perikymata (e.g., Goodman and 57 Rose, 1990). Retzius periodicity (RP) is the number of days of enamel growth between 58 adjacent lines. The Havers-Halberg Oscillation (HHO) hypothesis proposes that RP of 59 permanent teeth is a manifestation of an underlying biorhythm that regulates growth, is 60 associated with adult body mass, and is related to life history traits when compared between 61 mammalian species (Bromage et al., 2009, 2012). The underlying cause of the biorhythm is 62 unknown, though experimental research on domesticated pigs implicates resting metabolic 63 rate as an important influence (Bromage et al., 2016).

64 This study builds upon our recent work in which we tested intra-specific predictions of the 65 HHO on human children (Mahoney et al., 2016). We reported that the modal and range of 66 RP's from human deciduous teeth were lower compared to those calculated for human 67 permanent teeth. Based upon this comparison, we suggested that RP might not remain 68 constant within humans, though we did not calculate the periodicity of Retzius lines for 69 deciduous and permanent teeth from the same individuals. We also reported that RP 70 correlated with the reconstructed activity of enamel forming cells (secretory ameloblasts). 71 The total amount of enamel deposited, and the time required by ameloblasts to form a human 72 deciduous second maxillary molar cusp  $(dm^2)$ , were both correlated with RP. Correlation 73 between RP and enamel formation time has been noted previously, within a sample of human 74 permanent canines (Reid and Ferrell, 2006), and during inter-specific comparisons of 75 permanent first molars (M1) from extant and fossil hominoids (Mahoney et al., 2007). These 76 correlations led us to suspect that RP might be related to some enamel growth processes.

77 The present study further investigates the possible links between RP and enamel growth. 78 First, we compare RP between human deciduous and permanent molars within the maxillae 79 of four human children. If the hypothesis that RP changes between these tooth types, from 80 thinner to thicker enamel is correct (Mahoney et al., 2016), then the timing of this growth 81 rhythm should not remain constant within each maxilla. A deciduous molar from a fifth 82 maxilla retained evidence of disturbed enamel growth in the form of a hypoplastic defect (see 83 below). Relationships between non-specific pathology and RP have not been examined 84 previously. Yet, if, as we suspect, RP is linked to enamel growth, then perhaps disturbed 85 enamel growth will be associated with RP in a deciduous crown.

86 In the second stage of this study we compare the timing of Retzius lines between 87 deciduous and permanent teeth of great apes. We report the first deciduous RP values (n=4) 88 for modern orangutan (Pongo pygmaeus), gorilla (Gorilla gorilla), and chimpanzee (Pan 89 troglodytes). These values are compared to new data for permanent teeth (n=18) from these 90 species, as well as to previously published values. Even though the deciduous and permanent 91 teeth are not from the same individuals, we can still determine if deciduous RP's are 92 encompassed within the range of RP's for permanent teeth from each species. The present 93 study will also contribute to a new baseline comparative data set for great ape deciduous 94 teeth. Retzius periodicity of permanent teeth is often compared between fossil and modern 95 hominoids to gain insights into the evolution of dental development (e.g., Beynon et al., 96 1998; Schwartz et al., 2003; Mahoney et al., 2007), but rarely do such analyses include RP of 97 deciduous teeth.

- 98
- 99
- 100
- 101

# 102 The timing of Retzius lines in humans and great apes

103 Retzius periodicity of modern human permanent teeth lies between a lowermost value of six 104 days and an uppermost value of 12 days, with modes between seven to nine days depending 105 upon the sample (Schwartz et al., 2001; Reid and Dean, 2006; Reid and Ferrell, 2006; 106 Mahoney, 2008). The periodicity of 34 human deciduous teeth ranged between four to 11 107 days with a mode of six days (Mahoney et al., 2016). The lowered modal and range of RP 108 values in this sample of isolated deciduous teeth, compared to permanent teeth, suggests the 109 timing of Retzius lines might not remain constant within humans. However, one study 110 reported that RP of a deciduous molar was the same as that observed in a permanent molar 111 from the same mandible (Mahoney, 2012). Thus, it is still unclear if RP changes between 112 these tooth types in modern humans.

113 Modern orangutan permanent teeth have a range of RP's between eight to 11 days, with a 114 mode of 9 or 10 days (Beynon et al., 1991a; Dean, 2000; Schwartz et al., 2001; Kelley and 115 Schwartz, 2010; Smith, 2016). Amongst modern gorillas, RP lies between seven to ten days, 116 with a mode of eight (females) and nine days (males) (Beynon et al., 1991a; Schwartz et al., 117 2001; Kelley and Schwartz, 2010). The RP of modern chimpanzee permanent teeth might be 118 as low as five days (Smith et al., 2010), but the majority of values range between six to nine 119 days (Reid et al., 1998; Schwartz et al., 2001), with a mode of six or seven days (Schwartz et 120 al., 2001; Smith et al., 2007). No study has reported the RP of great ape deciduous teeth.

121

#### 122 Enamel hypoplastic defects

Disruptions to ameloblast activity during the secretory phase of enamel development can lead
to hypoplastic defects that are retained in a tooth crown (Zsigmondy, 1893; Kreshover, 1940;
Guatelli-Steinberg, 2001 for a review). Hypoplastic defects, which are classified by their
morphology as furrow, pit, or plane-type, can be visible from the external surface depending

127 upon the angle that Retzius lines emerge in outermost enamel (Hillson and Bond, 1997; 128 Guatelli-Steinberg et al., 2012). These defects correspond with a range of non-specific 129 stressors in humans, including nutritional deficiencies (vitamin D and calcium), infectious 130 diseases, fevers, and congenital syphilis (Sarnat and Schour 1941; Sweeney et al., 1971; 131 Purvis et al., 1973; Norén et al., 1978; Nikiforuk and Fraser 1981; Goodman et al., 1987; 132 May et al., 1993; Hillson et al., 1998; Berdal et al., 2005; Bossù et al., 2007). Unlike a 133 localised hypoplasia (Goodman and Rose, 1990), these systemic events can disrupt enamel 134 growth in all forming crowns at the same time.

135 Hypoplastic enamel can be less mineralized, softer, and contain smaller hydroxyapatite 136 crystallites, relative to normal enamel (Suckling et al., 1989; Batina et al., 2004). An altered 137 microstructure implies that ameloblasts did not recover from the stress event that occurred 138 during enamel secretion, and this affected subsequent maturation (Suckling et al., 1989; 139 Batina et al., 2004). Hypoplastic enamel can also be as hard as normal enamel, indicating 140 that maturation resumed after the defective secretory phase (Suckling and Purdell-Lewis, 141 1982; Suckling et al., 1989). Thus, disruptions to ameloblast activity can either be temporary 142 or more sustained, which might relate in part to the stage of cell activity (Suga, 1989).

- 143
- 144
- 145
- 146
- 147
- 148
- 149
- 150
- 151

# 152 Materials and methods

Five human juvenile skeletons with erupted dm<sup>2</sup> (*n*=5) and erupting maxillary M1's (*n*=4) were selected (Table 1). The skeletons dated to the medieval period (11<sup>th</sup> to 15<sup>th</sup> Century AD) in England (Hicks and Hicks, 2001) and are curated in the Skeletal Biology Research Centre, University of Kent, UK. The accession numbers are NGB 1988, Sk27; NGA 1989, Sk102, 178, 665, 671. One dm<sup>2</sup> retained evidence of a hypoplastic defect, which was systemic, as we observed a corresponding defect in cervical enamel of dm<sup>1</sup> from the same maxilla.

159 Thin sections of four deciduous teeth from great apes were chosen for this study. One 160 deciduous second mandibular molar (dm<sub>2</sub>) from P. pygmaeus and G. gorilla, and one 161 deciduous mandibular canine (dc<sub>1</sub>) from *P. troglodytes* were selected from the Elliot Smith 162 Collection, housed in the Anatomy Lab, University College London, UK. These sections 163 were selected because it was possible to accurately reconstruct RP. The apes were wild shot 164 specimens from the 1920's. Thin sections from these specimens were first prepared for a 165 paper on tooth wear by Aiello and colleagues (1991). The accession numbers are 166 (Orangutan) J56-E, (Gorilla) CA1F-1472-E, and (Pan) CA20A-2-36. Another dc<sub>1</sub> from P. 167 troglodytes (906-11-73) was selected from a collection of primate sections held at The Ohio 168 State University.

Thin sections of 18 ape permanent teeth were selected from the Elliot Smith Collection. These were a mix of maxillary and mandibular permanent first, second, and third molars of *P*. *troglodytes* (*n*=8: accession numbers CA-11, CA-13D, CA-14, CA-14A two slides, CA-14E, CA-19B, D-Case), permanent premolars and molars of *G. gorilla* (*n*=6: accession numbers HT41-89 two slides, HT42-89, HT44-89, UCL-CA-18, UCL-CA-4), and permanent premolars and molars of *P. pygmaeus* (*n*=4: accession numbers HT-162/88 two slides, HT-166/88, HT-1/91. No permits were needed to examine the deciduous or permanent slides.

#### 177 Sample preparation

178 The human molars were prepared using standard methods (e.g., Mahoney 2008). Each tooth 179 was embedded in polyester resin to reduce the risk of splintering while sectioning. Using a 180 diamond-wafering blade (Buehler® IsoMet 4000 precision saw), sections were taken through 181 the outermost enamel cusp tip, the tip of the dentin horn, and the most cervical enamel 182 extension. Each section was mounted on a microscope slide, and lapped (Buehler® Eco-Met 183 300) using a graded series of grinding pads (ranging in grit size from P400 to P1200) to 184 reveal incremental lines. Each section was polished with an aluminum oxide powder 185 (Buehler® Micro-Polish II: 0.3µm) placed in an ultrasonic bath to remove surface debris, 186 dehydrated through alcohol baths, cleared (Histoclear®), and mounted with a coverslip using 187 a xvlene-based mounting medium (DPX®).

188

### 189 Microscopy

All sections were examined at magnification (20-60x) using a high-resolution microscope (Olympus® BX51). Images were captured with a microscope digital camera (Olympus® DP25) and analyzed in CELL® Live Biology imaging software. RP's for human juveniles were recorded over a five-year period. Each slide was recorded four times. If values were not the same from one recording to the next, then the slide was not included in this study.

195 We calculated RP in post-natal lateral enamel, avoiding cervical enamel immediately 196 adjacent to the tooth cervix, because the 'packing' effect of Retzius lines in this region makes it difficult to calculate their periodicity. In humans, dm<sup>2</sup> lateral enamel forms from about 197 198 three months after birth, to around the end of the first post-natal year (see Mahoney, 2015 for data: and discussion in Mahoney et al., 2016). A neonatal line, the marker between pre-, and 199 200 post-natal enamel, was located in cuspal enamel of the great ape dm<sub>2</sub>'s (which can be seen in 201 the corresponding Figure of the orangutan  $dm_2$  reported in the Results section). Cuspal 202 enamel forms before lateral enamel. The word 'cuspal' refers to enamel that forms over the

dentine horn, excluding lateral and cervical enamel. The word 'cusp' (e.g., protocone, or
metacone cusp) refers to the first formed enamel over the dentine horn to the last formed
enamel at the cervix.

A neonatal line, with a corresponding accentuated marking in dentin, was located towards the end of cuspal enamel growth in the chimpanzee  $dc_1$  from the UCL collection. RP was calculated for this  $dc_1$  from Retzius lines that were present in lateral enamel, just after the neonatal line. A neonatal line was not present in the chimpanzee  $dc_1$  from The Ohio State University collection. We recorded Retzius lines in the most apical lateral enamel of this tooth.

The number of daily enamel growth increments (cross-striations) was counted along a rod between two adjacent Retzius lines of one human molar, the orangutan deciduous molar, and two ape permanent molars. Cross striations correspond with a circadian rhythm (Lacruz et al., 2012; Zheng et al., 2013). For all other sections, RP was calculated by measuring the distance between Retzius lines of lateral enamel. The measurement was divided by average local daily enamel secretion rates (DSRs) (Mahoney, 2008 for a methodology).

218

# 219 Average enamel thickness

Average enamel thickness (AET) was calculated by dividing the area of the enamel crown by the length of the dentin-enamel junction (DEJ), which provides the average straight-line distance in mm between the DEJ and outer enamel surface (Martin, 1983, 1985).

223

224

225

226

#### 228 **Results**

#### 229 **RP** in human deciduous and permanent enamel

Human RP data are in Table 1. In the maxillae of three children, RP increased from  $dm^2$  with a lower mean AET of 0.69mm to M<sup>1</sup> with a higher mean AET of 1.01mm. In one maxilla, RP decreased from 10 days in a  $dm^2$  with an AET of 0.89mm to eight days when compared to M<sup>1</sup> with an AET of 0.81mm.

234

## 235 **RP in a crown with hypoplasia**

Figure 1 illustrates the enamel defect and Retzius lines. The average distance of  $14.5\mu$ m between two adjacent lines in mesio-buccal cusp lateral enamel, before the defect formed, divided by a local average DSR of  $3.81\mu$ m, gave an RP of four days. When the analysis was repeated on an equivalent region of the mesio-lingual cusp it gave an RP of four days. The average distance of  $21\mu$ m between two Retzius lines in cervical enamel, after the defect formed, divided by a local average DSR of  $4.10\mu$ m, gave an RP of five days.

242

## 243 **RP** in great ape deciduous and permanent enamel

Retzius periodicity data for great apes are in Table 2. Figure 2 illustrates a direct count of cross striations between adjacent Retzius lines in the mesio-lingual cusp of the orangutan  $dm_2$ , which was five days. Periodicity for the mesio-lingual cusp of the gorilla  $dm_2$  was five days. When the analysis was repeated on the mesio-buccal cusp of the gorilla molar it gave a count of five days. RP of the chimpanzee  $dc_1$  from the UCL collection was five days. The periodicity of the  $dc_1$  from the Ohio collection was either five or six days.

Retzius periodicity of permanent teeth ranged between 10 to 12 days for *P. pygmaeus*, seven to eight days for *G. gorilla*, and five to eight days for *P. troglodytes*. The one uppermost value of 12 days for *P. pygmaeus* extends the know range of RP's from permanent teeth for this species by one day.

## 254 **Discussion**

255 The present study builds upon our previous work by showing that in humans, within the same 256 individual, RP can change from deciduous to permanent teeth. Our data also suggests that 257 this may be the case in great apes, although RP differences between deciduous and permanent 258 teeth of the same individuals would be necessary to confirm this hypothesis. Our study 259 further suggests that RP can change on either side of a hypoplastic defect, where both a 260 higher RP and an increase in daily secretion rates can occur after the defect has formed. 261 Combined, these observations indicate that if RP is a systemic rhythm governed by supra-262 chiasmic nuclei (in the hypothalamus), then it appears that it does not always remain constant 263 over an individual's lifespan, as previously assumed (Bromage et al., 2009). Instead, the 264 timing of Retzius lines within an individual will either remain constant (Mahoney, 2012), or 265 vary by up to three days, from deciduous to permanent teeth (Table 1, and Table 3).

266

#### 267 **RP** in human deciduous and permanent enamel

268 An increase in RP from deciduous to permanent molars from the same individual is 269 consistent with our previous finding, that the timing of Retzius lines is associated with 270 enamel thickness (Mahoney et al., 2016). However, in one maxilla where RP decreased from 271 a deciduous to a permanent molar, the dm<sup>2</sup> was slightly larger with thicker enamel compared 272 to  $M^1$ . Normally,  $dm^2$  has an AET that is less than  $M^1$ . Sometimes though, permanent first 273 molars can be slightly smaller than their deciduous precursors (Moorrees and Reid, 1964), and their range of AET values can overlap ( $dm^2$  range= 0.42-1.04;  $M^1$  range= 0.82-1.21; 274 275 Skinner et al., 2015; Mahoney et al., 2016). These data suggest that RP can change with age 276 for human children when enamel is thicker, or thinner, in later forming permanent molars, 277 relative to deciduous molars.

279 Several factors contribute to primate tooth enamel thickness. One is RP, which we have 280 shown. The number of active ameloblasts, their secretory life span and the time taken to 281 form regions of a crown, as well as the rate these cells secrete enamel matrix, also relate to 282 enamel thickness (Macho, 1995; Grine and Martin, 1998; Dean, 2000; Dean et al., 2001; 283 Mahoney, 2011). It is not surprising therefore that RP correlates with the time required to 284 form dm<sup>2</sup> paracone cusp enamel (Mahoney et al., 2016). Shorter total crown formation times, 285 thinner enamel, and lowered RP's of deciduous compared to permanent teeth (Mahoney, 286 2011, 2012, 2016; Reid and Dean, 2006) are consistent with this idea. RP also correlates 287 with permanent canine lateral enamel formation time (Reid and Ferrell, 2006), though this 288 might relate to the duration of enamel extension. Whether there is also an association 289 between the length of the enamel-dentin junction and enamel thickness of permanent canines, 290 when for example smaller are compared to larger teeth, has yet to be determined.

291 Two additional analyses were undertaken to further explore RP and the amount, and rate, 292 of enamel deposition within enamel 'layers'. The distance between two adjacent Retzius lines in 14 human dm<sup>2</sup>'s, from different individuals, was compared to RP from the same teeth (Fig. 293 3). RPs were observed and measured in homologous locations, in outer lateral post-natal 294 295 enamel, within each of the crowns. The distance between lines was significantly and 296 positively correlated with RP (Pearson's r=0.940, p < 0.000). Thus, higher RP's are associated 297 with thicker enamel 'layers' in this sample of teeth because there are a greater number of 298 days - more cross striations - between each 'beat' of the biorhythm. However, thicker enamel 299 'layers' between Retzius lines of higher periodicity were not accompanied by a clear change 300 in the rate that ameloblasts secrete enamel. Mean DSRs in mid to outer lateral enamel of 301 molars with RP's of four to seven days ranged between  $3.44-4.20\mu$ m (one outlier of  $5.10\mu$ m), 302 overlapping with mean DSRs of 3.50-4.50µm from molars with RP's of nine to 11 days. 303 These data suggest, if the rate that enamel matrix is deposited between adjacent Retzius lines

304 varies only slightly, higher RP's, combined with ameloblasts that have longer secretory life 305 spans, should lead to thicker enamel on molar crowns. Our results imply that, when secretion 306 rates are constrained, RP variation appears to be a major contributor to enamel thickness, 307 when equivalent enamel regions from one tooth type are compared between individuals. 308 Retzius periodicity was calculated high in outer lateral enamel and compared to RP low in 309 outer cervical enamel of the same section, for three permanent second molars. Retzius 310 periodicity did not change between these locations in each molar (RP of 7, 8, and 10 in each 311 molar respectively). This makes sense, because here - unlike the comparison of RP between 14 dm<sup>2</sup>'s above - secretion rates are not constrained, as they vary greatly from one enamel 312 313 region to the next in human permanent molars (e.g., Lacruz and Bromage 2006, their Table 314 2). In the three molars examined here, DSR's ranged between  $4.65\mu$ m and  $5.09\mu$ m high in 315 outer lateral enamel, and between  $2.58\mu m$  to  $3.10\mu m$  low in outer cervical enamel. The 316 spacing of Retzius lines, as well as their surface manifestation as perikymata, also become 317 compressed in cervical compared to lateral enamel (e.g., Beynon, 1991b; Dean and Reid, 318 2001; Reid and Ferrell, 2006; Guatelli-Steinberg et al., 2007). Thus, the narrow enamel layers that form towards the end of a crown's growth period, do so slowly, leading to the 319 320 same RP as the thicker enamel layers of lateral regions, which form relatively faster and 321 earlier on in crown growth. In each of these enamel regions, the number of cross striations 322 between adjacent Retizus lines remains constant, even though the amount of enamel 323 deposited, and the spacing between the lines, changes. Thus, the relationship between RP 324 and enamel layers is much weaker when DSRs are more variable. Our results imply that the 325 timing of Retzius lines does not vary within a 'healthy' molar crown.

Factors that contribute to enamel thickness are not constant from one tooth type to the next, when compared along the row (e.g., Mahoney, 2015). Given that RP can be associated with enamel thickness, then there is reason to suspect that these associations will also not

329 transfer unchanged from one tooth type to the next, in any one individual. That is, 330 relationships between RP, and enamel growth and thickness, are likely to be *relative*, within a 331 tooth type. For example, large portions of enamel forming at the same time in different 332 deciduous teeth, such as maxillary lateral incisors and first molars, might have equivalent RPs that are associated with very different developmental pathways. Ameloblasts secrete 333 334 enamel at an accelerated rate in deciduous incisors but have a shortened secretory life span, 335 leading to a thinner enamel crown, compared to molars (Mahoney, 2010, 2011, 2012, 2013). 336 Theoretically, accelerated ameloblast secretion rates of incisors could produce thickened 337 enamel layers, relative to enamel layering in molars with the same RP's that have slower 338 secretion rates. Thicker enamel layers of deciduous incisors would then be associated with a 339 thinner incisor enamel crown, when compared to deciduous molars (also see developing the 340 HHO below).

341

#### 342 **RP and hypoplasia**

343 A change in the timing of Retzius lines, from one side of a hypoplastic defect to the other in a 344 deciduous crown suggests that RP can be modulated by local systemic stress events. A period 345 of 'catch up growth' in enamel secretion, after a period of reduced secretion, has been 346 documented previously (e.g., Macchiarelli et al., 2006; Mahoney, 2008), but an increase in 347 RP after a hypoplastic lesion is a new observation. We observed greater spacing between 348 Retzius lines in cervical enamel after a hypoplastic defect, which also has been reported for 349 enamel of domestic pig and wild boar (Witzel, et al., 2006; 2008 see their Fig 8a). Slightly 350 accelerated average DSRs in cervical compared to lateral enamel were also unexpected, 351 because like permanent teeth, rates usually decrease towards the end of the growth period in 352 deciduous crowns (Mahoney, 2011). Taken together, greater distance between Retzius lines, 353 and accelerated secretion rates, suggest that ameloblasts deposited more enamel between each

354 'beat' of the underlying biorhythm, after recovering from a stress event that led to a355 hypoplastic defect.

356 One futher analysis was undertaken to explore RP in three isolated permanent teeth that 357 retained evidence of hypoplastic defects (Table 3). In two of these teeth, RP changed, 358 increasing from one side of the defect to the other. Like the hypoplastic deciduous tooth, 359 secretion rates also accelerated after the defect formed in two permanent teeth, and this was 360 combined with a slower beat of the biorhythm leading to a higher RP and an increased 361 spacing between Retzius lines. These preliminary data from a few teeth imply that ameloblast 362 secretion rates and the underlying biorhythm can both respond to systemic non-specific 363 pathology.

364

## 365 **RP in great ape deciduous and permanent enamel**

366 Retzius periodicity of deciduous teeth from P. pygmaeus and G. gorilla extends below the 367 lowermost RP's we observed in permanent molars from these species (Table 2), as well as 368 those reported previously (Schwartz et al., 2001; Kelley and Schwartz 2010). RP's of two 369 deciduous canines from *P. troglodytes* lie within the lower range of RP's from permanent 370 teeth (see our Table 2; Schwartz et al., 2001; Smith et al., 2010). Clearly, the extent of 371 similarities or differences in RP of deciduous and permanent enamel from great apes has yet 372 to be determined. Nevertheless, the deciduous RP's are all low, compared to RP's from 373 permanent teeth of great apes.

Lower RPs from ape deciduous teeth are consistent with the proposal that RP may be linked to enamel thickness, and at least one underlying enamel growth mechanism, formation time. The orangutan  $dm_2$  AET of 0.53 mm (0.4 to 0.5mm: Zanolli et al., 2015) extends below the lowermost AET of 0.77mm from permanent molars of this species (Skinner et al., 2015). Further analysis of the  $dm_2$  reveals a mesio-buccal cusp formation time of 396 days (see Mahoney, 2011 for method), which lies outside the lowermost formation time of 1006

days reported from an analysis of six permanent M1 mesio-buccal cusp's of *P. pygmaeus* (Smith, 2016). The gorilla dm<sub>2</sub> AET of 0.54mm extends below the lowermost AET of 0.79mm for permanent molars (Skinner et al., 2015). Further analysis of the dm<sup>2</sup> reveals a mesio-buccal cusp formation time of 366 days (see Mahoney, 2011 for method), which is less than the formation time of 843 to 891 days reported for two permanent M1 mesio-buccal cusps of *G. gorilla*. No study has reported AET for permanent maxillary canines from *Pan*.

386

#### **387 Developing the HHO**

388 More work is needed to understand the interaction between the different factors that 389 contribute to enamel thickness, and the timing of Retzius line. Perhaps crown extension in 390 height combined with enamel thickness and crown formation time will show some 391 associations with RP, given the stretching of the ameloblast sheet that has been demonstrated 392 and modeled previously (Shellis, 1984). Disentangling these relationships will benefit the 393 development of the HHO. For example, lower RP's were associated with longer lateral 394 enamel formation times within a sample of permanent canines, while higher RPs were related 395 to longer cusp formation times within a sample of deciduous molars (Reid and Ferrell, 2006; 396 Mahoney et al., 2016).

397 Enamel thickness increases along the human tooth row, from first to third permanent 398 molars (Grine, 2005). We have shown RP is one major contributor to enamel thickness when 399 DSR variation is constrained. Whether RP is associated with enamel thickness when 400 compared between analogous regions along the molar row from the same individuals has yet 401 to be determined. Future studies might incorporate an assessment of RP, enamel thickness, 402 DSR's and the length of time over which ameloblasts secrete enamel. One such approach 403 would be to count the total number of cross-striations along an enamel prism, calculate DSRs 404 along the prism length, and then assess how those numbers correspond with RP. Based upon

405 our findings, it would seem likely that all three variables, RP, DSR, and the length of time
406 over which ameloblasts secrete enamel, need to be considered and incorporated into
407 predictions about how these factors affect enamel thickness.

408 Future studies might explore associations we have reported across primates. For example, 409 AET of human permanent molars ranges between 0.67 to 2.30mm (Olejniczak et al., 2008) 410 which coincides with a range of RP's between six and 12 days. AET of *Pan* molars ranges 411 between 0.58 and 0.94mm (Skinner et al., 2015), which coincides with an RP of five to nine 412 days. If RP is linked to permanent enamel thickness, and, or, underlying enamel formation 413 processes, then these different ranges might be expected. Given that enamel thickness relates 414 to lifespan and high-wear diets across primates (Pampush, 2013), such analyses may 415 potentially reveal new ways to explore the timing of life history traits.

416

# 417 CONCLUSION

418 Our data have shown that RP can change within human children. Preliminary insights suggest 419 great ape dentition might follow a similar pattern. When these data are considered alongside 420 altered RP's within a crown, from one side of a hypoplastic disruption to the other, as well as 421 correspondence between RP and the amount of enamel deposited within an 'enamel layer', it 422 suggests that the timing of Retzius lines is linked to enamel growth. If RP is as a measure of 423 an underlying systemic biorhythm that affects multiple physiological systems (Bromage et 424 al., 2012), then we conclude that the influence of the biorhythm extends to enamel growth, 425 can be modulated by local stress events, and may even express differently in enamel of 426 different thickness and, or, in teeth with contrasting secretion rates and formation times.

427

# 428 Acknowledgements

We thank the Editor and two anonymous reviewers for comments that improved themanuscript.

#### 431 LITERATURE CITED

- Aiello LC, Dean MC, Montgomery C (1991) The natural history of deciduous tooth
  attrition in hominoids. *J Hum Evol* 21, 397-412.
- 434
- 435 Batina N, Renugopalakrishnan V, Casillas Lavin PN, Guerrero JCH, Morales M,
- 436 Garduno-Juarez, R, Lakka SL (2004) Ultrastructure of dental enamel afflicted with
- 437 hypoplasia: An a atomic force microscopic study. *Calcif Tissue Int* **74**, 294–301.
- 438
- Berdal A, Bailleul-Forestier I, Davideau J-L, Lezot F (2005) Dento-alveolar bone complex
  and vitamin D. In: *Vitamin D*. (eds Feldman D, Pike JW, Glorieux FH). pp.599–607, San
  Diego: Elsevier Academic Press.
- 442
- Beynon AD, Dean MC, Leakey MG, Reid DJ, Walker A (1998) Comparative dental
  development and microstructure of Proconsulteeth from Rusinga Island, Kenya. *J Hum Evo*35, 163–209.
- 446
- Beynon AD, Dean MC, Reid DJ (1991a) Histological Study on the chronology of the
  developing dentition in Gorilla and Orangutan. *Am J Phys Anth* 86, 189-203.
- 449
- Beynon AD, Dean MC, Reid DJ (1991b) On thick and thin enamel in hominoids. *Am J Phys Athropol* 86, 295–309.
- 452
- Bossù M, Bartoli A, Orsini G, Luppino E, Polimeni A (2007) Enamel hypoplasia in
  coeliac children: a potential clinical marker of early diagnosis. *Eur J Paediatr Dent* 8, 31–37
- т*ээ*
- Boyde A (1979) Carbonate concentration, crystal centres, core dissolution, caries, cross
  striation, circadian rhythms and compositional contrast in the SEM. *J Dent Res* 58, 981–983.
- 458
- 459 **Boyde A** (1989) Enamel. In: *Teeth. Handbook of microscopic anatomy* (eds Berkovitz BKB,
- 460 Boyde A, Frank RM, et al.). pp 309–473. Berlin: Springer-Verlag.
- 461
- Bromage TG, Hogg RT, Lacruz RS, Hou C (2012) Primate enamel evinces long period
  biological timing and regulation of life history. *J Theor Biol* 305, 131–144.
- 464

465	Bromage TG, Lacruz RS, Hogg R, et al. (2009) Lamellar bone is an incremental tissue
466	reconciling enamel rhythms, body size, and organismal life history. Calcif Tiss Int 84, 388-
467	404.
468	
469	Bromage TG, Idaghdour Y, Lacruz RS, et al (2016) The swine plasma metabolome
470	chronicles "many days" biological timing and functions linked to growth. PLoS ONE 11(1):
471	e0145919. doi:10.1371/journal. pone.0145919
472	
473	Dean MC (2000) Progress in understanding hominoid dental development. J Anat 197, 77-
474	101.
475	
476	Dean MC, Leakey MG, Reid DJ, Schrenk F, Schwartz GT, et al (2001) Growth processes
477	in teeth distinguish modern humans from Homo erectus and earlier hominins. Nature 414,
478	628–631.
479	
480	Dean MC, Reid DJ (2001) Perikymata spacing and distribution on hominid anterior
481	teeth. Am J Phys Anth 116, 209–215.
482	
483	Goodman AH, Allen LH, Hernandez GP, Amador A, ArriolaLV, Chavez A, and Pelto
484	GH (1987) Prevalence and age at development of enamel hypoplasias in Mexican children.
485	Am J Phys Anthropol 72, 7-19.
486	
487	Goodman AH, Rose JC (1990) Assessment of systemic physiological perturbations from
488	dental enamel hypoplasias and associated histological structures. <i>Ybk Phys Anth</i> <b>33</b> , 59–110.
489	
490	Grine FE, Martin LB (1988) Enamel thickness and development in Australopithecus and
491	Paranthropus. In The Evolutionary History of the Robust Australopithecines (ed. Grine FE),
492	pp. 3–42. Aldyne de Gruiter.
493	
494	Grine FE (2005) Enamel thickness of deciduous and permanentmolars in modern Homo
495	sapiens. Am J Phys Anthropol 126, 14–31.
496	
497	Guatelli-Steinberg D (2001) What can developmental defects of enamel reveal about
498	physiological stress in nonhuman primates? Evo Anth 10, 138–151.

499	Guatelli-Steinberg D, Ferrell RJ, Spence J (2012) Linear enamel hypoplasia as an indicator
500	of physiological stress in great apes: reviewing the evidence in light of enamel growth
501	variation. Am J Phys Anth 148, 191–204.
502	
503	Guatelli-Steinberg D, Reid DJ, Bishop T (2007) Did the lateral enamel of Neandertals
504	grow differently from that of modern humans? J Hum Evol 52, 72-84.
505	
506	Hicks M, Hicks A (2001) St. Gregory's Priory, Northgate, Canterbury Excavations 1988–
507	1991. Canterbury Archaeological Trust Ltd: Volume II.
508	
509	Hillson S, Bond S (1997) The relationship of enamel hypoplasia to the pattern of tooth crown
510	growth: a discussion. Am J Phys Anthropol 104, 89-103.
511	
512	Hillson S, Grigson C, Bond S (1998) Dental defects of congenital syphilis. Am J Phys
513	Anthropol 107, 25-40.
514	
515	Kelley J, Schwartz GT (2010) Dental development and life history in living African and
516	Asian apes. PNAS 107(3), 1035-1040.
517	
518	Kreshover SJ (1940) Histopathologic studies of abnormal enamel formation in human teeth
519	Am Orthodont Oral Surg 26: 1083-1101.
520	
521	Lacruz RS, Bromage TG (2006) Appositional enamel growth in molars of South African
522	fossil hominids J Anat 209: 13–20.
523	
524	Lacruz RS, Hacia JG, Bromage TG, et al (2012) The circadian clock modulates enamel
525	development. J Biol Rhyth 27: 237–245.
526	
527	Macchiarelli R, Bondioli L, Debénath A, et al (2006) How Neanderthal molar teeth grew.
528	Nature 444: 748-751.
529	
530	Macho G (1995) The significance of hominid enamel thickness for phylogenetic and life-
531	history reconstruction. In Aspects of Dental Biology: Palaeontology, Anthropology and

532	Evolution (ed. Moggi-Cecchi J), pp. 51-68. Florence: International Institute for the Study of
533	Man.
534	
535	Grine FE, Martin LB (1988) Enamel thickness and development in Australopithecus and
536	Paranthropus. In The Evolutionary History of the Robust Australopithecines (ed. Grine FE),
537	pp. 3–42. Aldyne de Gruiter.
538	
539	Mahoney P (2008) Intraspecific variation in M1 enamel development in modern humans:
540	implications for human evolution. J Hum Evol 55, 131–147.
541	
542	Mahoney P (2010) Two dimensional patterns of human enamel thickness on deciduous
543	(dm1, dm2) and permanent first (M1) mandibular molars. Arch Oral Biol 55, 115–126.
544	
545	Mahoney P (2011) Human deciduous mandibular molar incremental enamel development.
546	Am J Phys Anthropol 144, 204–214.
547	
548	Mahoney P (2012) Incremental enamel development in modern human deciduous anterior
549	teeth. Am J Phys Anthropol 147, 637–651.
550	
551	Mahoney P (2013) Testing functional and morphological interpretations of enamel thickness
552	along the deciduous tooth row in human children. Am J Phys Anthropol 151, 518–525.
553	
554	Mahoney P (2015) Dental fast track: Prenatal enamel growth, incisor eruption, and weaning
555	in human infants. Am J Phys Anthropol 156, 407-421.
556	
557	Mahoney P, Miszkiewicz JJ, Pitfield R, Schlecht SH, Deter C, Guatelli-Steinberg D
558	(2016) Biorhythms, deciduous enamel thickness, and primary bone growth in modern human
559	children: a test of the Havers-Halberg Oscillation hypothesis. J Anat 228: 919-928
560	
561	Mahoney P, Smith T, Schwartz G, Dean C, Kelley J (2007) Molar crown formation in the
562	late Miocene Asian hominoids, Sivapithecus parvada and Sivapithecus sivalensis. J Hum
563	<i>Evol</i> <b>53</b> , 61–66.
564	

565	Martin LB (1983). Relationships of the later Miocene Hominoidea. Ph.D. Dissertation,
566	University College London
567	
568	Martin LB (1985) Significance of enamel thickness in hominoid evolution. Nature 314, 260-
569	263.
570	
571	May R.L, Goodman AH, Meindl RS (1993) Response of bone and enamel formation to
572	nutritional supplementation and morbidity among malnourished Guatemalan children. Am J
573	Phys Anthropol 92, 37-51.
574	
575	Moorrees CFA, Reed RB (1964) Correlations among crown diameters of human teeth.
576	Arch Oral Biol 9, 685-697.
577	
578	Nikiforuk G, Fraser D (1981) The etiology of enamel hypoplasia: a unifying concept. $J$
579	Pediatr 98, 888-93.
580	
581	Norén JG, Magnusson BO, Grahnén H (1978) Mineralisation defects of primary teeth in
582	intra-uterine under nutrition. A histological and microradiographic study. Swe Dent J 2, 67-
583	72.
584	
585	Olejniczak AJ, Smith TM, Wang W, Potts R, Ciochon R, Kullmer O, Schrenk F, Hublin
586	J-J (2008) Molar enamel thickness and dentine horn height in Gigantopithecus blacki. Am J
587	Phys Anth 135, 85-91.
588	
589	Pampush JD, Duque AC, Burrows BR, Daegling J, Kenney WF, McGraw WS (2013)
590	Homoplasy and thick enamel in primates. J Hum Evol 64, 216-224.
591	
592	Purvis RJ, Mackay GS, Cockburn F,McK Barrie WJ, Wilkinson EM, Belton NR,
593	Forfar JO (1973) Enamel hypoplasia of the teeth associated with neonatal tetany: a
594	manifestation of maternal vitamin-d deficiency. Lancet 302, 811-814.
595	
596	Reid DJ, Dean MC (2006) Variation in modern human enamel formation times. J Hum Evol
597	<b>50</b> , 329-346.
598	

599	Reid DJ, Ferrell R (2006) The relationship between number of striae of Retzius and their
600	periodicity in imbricational enamel formation. J Hum Evol 50, 195-202.
601	
602	Reid DJ, Schwartz GT, Dean MC, Chandrasekera MS (1998) A histological
603	reconstruction of dental development in the common chimpanzee, Pan troglodytes. J Hum
604	<i>Evol</i> <b>35</b> , 427–448.
605	
606	Retzius A (1837) Bemerkungenq ber den inneren Bau derZähne, mit besonderer Rücksicht
607	auf dem in Zahnknochen Vorkommenden Röhrenbau. Arch Anat Physiol 486–566.
608	
609	Rose JC, Armelagos GJ, Lallo JW (1978) Histological enamel indicator of childhood
610	stress in prehistoric skeletal samples. Am J Phys Anthropol 49, 511-516.
611	
612	Sarnat BG, Schour I (1941) Enamel hypoplasias (chronologic enamel hypoplasia) in
613	relation to systemic diseases: a chronological, morphological and etiological classification. J
614	Am Dent Assoc 28, 1989–2000.
615	
616	Schwartz GT, Liu W, Zheng L (2003) Preliminary investigation of dental microstructure in
617	the Yuanmou hominoid (Lufengpithecus hudienensis), Yunnan Province, China. J Hum Evol
618	44, 189–202.
619	
620	Schwartz GT, Reid DJ, Dean C (2001) Developmental aspects of sexual dimorphism in
621	hominoid canines. Int J Primatol 22, 837-860.
622	
623	Shellis RP (1984) Variations in growth of the enamel crown in human teeth and a possible
624	relationship between growth and enamel structure. Arch Oral Biol 29, 671–682.
625	
626	Skinner MM, Alemseged Z, Gaunitz C, Hublin J-J (2015) Enamel thickness trends in
627	Plio-Pleistocene hominin mandibular molars. J Hum Evol 85, 35-45.
628	
629	Smith TM (2016) Dental development in living and fossil orang-utans. J Hum Evol 94, 92-
630	105.
631	

632	Smith TM, Reid DJ, Dean MC, Olejniczak AJ, Ferrell RJ, Martin LB (2007) New
633	perspectives on chimpanzee molar crown development. In: Dental Perspectives in Human
634	Evolution: State of the Art Research in Dental Anthropology. (eds Bailey S, Hublin JJ). pp
635	177–192, Berlin: Springer-Verlag.
636	
637	Smith TM, Smith BH, Reid DJ, et al (2010) Dental development of the Taï Forest
638	chimpanzees revisited. J Hum Evol 58, 363-373.
639	
640	Suckling GW, Nelson DGA, Patel MJ (1989) Macroscopic and scanning electron
641	microscopic appearance and hardness values of developmental defects in human
642	permanent tooth enamel. Adv Dent Res 3(2), 219-233.
643	
644	Suckling GW, Purdell-Lewis DJ (1982) The pattern of mineralization of traumatically-
645	induced developmental defects of sheep enamel assessed by microhardness and
646	microradiography. J Dent Res 61, 1211-1216.
647	
648	Suga S (1989) Enamel hypomineralization viewed from the pattern of progressive
649	mineralization of human and monkey developing enamel. Adv Dent Res (3), 188–198.
650	
651	Sweeney EA, Saffir AJ, De Leon R (1971) Linear hypoplasia of deciduous incisor teeth in
652	malnourished children. Am J Clin Nutr 24(1), 29-31.
653	
654	Witzel C, Kierdorf U, Dobney K, Ervynck A, Vanpoucke S, Kierdorf H (2006)
655	Reconstructing impairment of secretory ameloblast function in porcine teeth by analysis of
656	morphological alterations in dental enamel. J Anat 209, 93-110.
657	
658	Witzel C, Kierdorf U, Schultz M, Kierdorf H (2008) Insights from the inside: Histological
659	analysis of abnormal enamel microstructure associated with hypoplastic enamel defects in
660	human teeth. Am J Phys Anthropol 136, 400–414.
661	
662	Zanolli C, Grine FE, Kullmer O, Schrenk F, Macchiarelli R (2015) The early Pleistocene
663	deciduous hominid molar FS-72 from the Sangiran Dome of Java, Indonesia: a taxonomic
664	reappraisal based on its comparative endostructural characterization. Am J Phys Anth 157,
665	666–674.

666	
667	Zheng L, Seon YJ, Mourão MA, Schnell S, Kim D, Harada H, Papagerakis S,
668	Papagerakis P (2013) Circadian rhythms regulate amelogenesis. Bone 55: 158–165.
669	
670	Zsigmondy O (1893) On congenital defects of the enamel. Dental Cosmos 35, 709–717.
671	
672	
673	
674	
675	
676	
677	
678	
679	
680	
681	
682	
683	
684	
685	
686	
687	
688	
689	
690	
691	
692	
693	
694	
695 696	
696 607	
09/ 609	
098	
699	

	RP in da	ays					
Sk	Udm2	UM1	<u> </u>				
27*	4 to 5						
102	6	7					
178	9	10					
665	7	10					
671	10	8					
Sk = Skeletal number. *Hypoplastic.							
Tooth types: Udm2, upper second deciduous molar,							
UM1, u	pper first pe	rmanen	t mola	ır.			
Table 2. Retzius periodicity in great apes							
		RP in	days		2		
Species	6	5	6	7	8 9		
Decidu	ous						

# 700 Table 1. Retzius periodicity in humans



a= The RP of this lower deciduous canine was either 5 or 6 days. b= The RP calculated in
the lateral enamel of the mesio-buccal cusp of this premolar was 12 days. When the analysis
was repeated in the mesio-lingual cusp lateral enamel of the premolar it gave an RP of 12
days.

712

с

					715		
	LI2		LC1	LC1			
Enamel Region	<b>RP</b> days	<b>DSR</b> μm	<b>RP</b> days	<b>DSR</b> μm	<b>RP</b> days	<b>DSR</b> μm	
Before defect	8	4.43	6	3.57	11	4.25	
During defect	8	3.51	6	3.36	11	3.57	
After defect	10	3.93	8	3.99	11	4.02	

714 Table 3. Retzius periodicity and daily secretion rates in hypoplastic teet	h
--	---



Fig. 1 Hypoplastic defect and Retzius periodicity (zoom in to see Retzius lines). (a) Human deciduous maxillary second molar mesio-lingual enamel highlighted in grey. (b) The same region imaged using a polarizing lens. Dashed arrow points to a hypoplastic defect associated with an accentuated marking. Magnification = 4x. (c) Blue arrow points to Retzius lines that formed before the hypoplastic defect.
Magnification = 20x. (d) Blue arrow points to Retzius lines that formed after the hypoplastic defect. The stress event did not prevent secretory ameloblasts from recovering, as these cells had a functional Tomes process (separate rods are visible) that deposit enamel at a slightly accelerated rate.

Fig.1 166x240mm (300 x 300 DPI)



Fig. 2 Retzius periodicity in a juvenile orangutan lower second deciduous molar. (a) Retzius lines in cervical enamel. Magnification = 4x. (b) Daily cross striations. White arrows point to the first and last cross striation between two adjacent Retzius lines (zoom in to see). Magnification = 20x. (c) Large white arrows point to the same two adjacent Retzius lines. Smaller white arrows point to cross striations, corresponding to five days of enamel secretion. Magnification = 60x.

Fig.2 195x277mm (300 x 300 DPI)



Fig. 3 Scatter plot of dm2 Retzius periodicity against Retzius line spacing. There is a significant (p < 0.000) and positive correlation between the two variables.

Fig. 3 102x67mm (300 x 300 DPI)