

human relations

The Management of Second-Generation Migrant Workers in China: A Case Study of Centrifugal Paternalism

Journal:	<i>Human Relations</i>
Manuscript ID	HR-2020-0543.R3
Manuscript Type:	Standard Manuscript
Keywords:	Employment Relations, migrant workers, paternalism, China, rural-to-urban life, management control, neoliberalism

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

1
2
3
4 **The Management of Second-Generation Migrant Workers in China: A Case**
5
6 **Study of Centrifugal Paternalism**
7
8
9

10
11 Jingqi Zhu, University of Liverpool, UK (corresponding author), Jingqi.Zhu@liverpool.ac.uk
12

13 Rick Delbridge, Cardiff University, UK
14
15
16
17

18 **Abstract**
19

20 How have organisations sought to manage tensions between the needs for flexible
21 labour in neoliberal market economies and the benefits of a committed and motivated
22 workforce? Through an in-depth, qualitative study of a Chinese company, we identify and
23 theorise a novel variation of paternalism that was developed by the organisation to manage
24 the tensions under neoliberal capitalism. We label this management regime ‘centrifugal
25 paternalism’ since it organises employment relations along the lines of ‘adult-like’ employers
26 and ‘child-like’ employees but involves the diminution of employee dependency over time
27 with an ultimate impulse *away* from the employing organisation. We find that the emergence
28 of centrifugal paternalism is closely related both to the socio-demographic identity of the
29 company’s employees as China’s second-generation migrant workers and to the economic
30 context of the organisation. Through a ‘tough love’ approach, this regime allows the firm to
31 secure flexible labour while responding to migrant workers’ needs for personal skills
32 development and a fruitful rural-to-urban transition. Our research responds to recent calls for
33 reconnecting organisation studies with society and situating workplace practices within their
34 contexts. It also underlines the enduring importance of paternalism for understanding the
35 dynamic and evolving nature of capitalist employment relations and management regimes.
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 **Keywords:** employment relations, migrant workers, paternalism, neoliberalism, China, rural-
4
5 to-urban life, management control
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Peer Review Version

Introduction

Neoliberalism produces tensions in business organisations. On the one hand, the pursuit of efficiency and profitability in unpredictable and competitive markets requires flexibility in employment leading to an increase in precarious and ‘bad jobs’ (Kalleberg, 2009). On the other hand, organisations require a committed and motivated workforce given the intensive and demanding work that is needed to succeed in competitive markets (Brannan et al., 2015; Fleming, 2005). This paper investigates how these tensions between the demands of a neoliberal market economy and the benefits of a committed and motivated workforce can be managed. Through an in-depth, qualitative study of a Chinese company, we identify and theorise a novel variation of paternalism developed by the organisation to achieve exactly this. We label this management regime ‘centrifugal paternalism’ since it organises employment relations along the lines of ‘adult-like’ employers and ‘child-like’ employees but involves the diminution of employee dependency over time with an ultimate impulse *away* from the employing organisation. This is compared with the previous forms of paternalism identified in literature, which we collectively term ‘centripetal paternalism’ as these deepen employee dependency over time. To capture the variations of paternalistic management regimes in metaphorical terms: centripetal paternalism binds employee and employer in familial relations while centrifugal paternalism sees the employee graduate from ‘school’.

In this paper, we examine paternalism as a management regime that emerges and is embedded within the specifics of the socio-political context and includes both formal management and employment relations practices as well as an understanding of management’s actions and obligations in delivering these practices. We describe how a ‘centrifugal paternalism’ regime is manifested and implemented at the workplace, through a ‘tough love’ approach in which managers ‘guide’, ‘educate’, ‘take care of’, and ‘socialise’ workers before they are ‘let go’ to find their way in the world. We examine the social and

1
2
3 political contexts that give rise to centrifugal paternalism, concluding that the emergence of
4 centrifugal paternalism is closely related to the socio-demographic identity of the company's
5 employees as China's second-generation migrant workers. These migrant workers are eager
6 to pursue a better life in urban cities, but have difficulties adapting to and settling into the
7 cities due to China's house registration system, known as *hukou*. Under this system, migrant
8 workers remain registered in their home villages and are not able to gain access to public
9 services and other rights in urban cities (Xiang and Tan, 2005). Centrifugal paternalism
10 represents a management regime which allows the firm to meet its needs for flexible labour
11 while at the same time developing migrant workers' capabilities to increase their prospects
12 for their longer-term settlement in the urban city under the *hukou* system.
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

26 Our study is informed by labour process theory with its focus on management-
27 employee relations, particularly the practices of management control, at the point of
28 production (Ackroyd and Thompson, 1999; Burawoy, 1979; Delbridge, 1998), and the
29 concern to locate and explain novel management practices in their relevant and meaningful
30 social-political contexts (Delbridge, 2006; Vincent et al., 2020). Our contributions are
31 threefold. First, we identify and theorise a novel management regime which we term
32 'centrifugal paternalism'. We demonstrate how paternalistic regimes can be developed in
33 neoliberal societies and be used to manage the tensions between neoliberal employment and
34 the need for high levels of commitment in otherwise precarious and 'bad' jobs. Second, this
35 research challenges the claim that paternalistic practices are incompatible with contemporary
36 workplaces that require flexible and highly mobile labour forces (Choi and Peng, 2015; Chou,
37 2002). The evidence and theorisation presented in our study suggests that a contemporary
38 manifestation of paternalism continues to be relevant despite economic changes that have
39 eroded the prospects of permanent employment and job security. In doing so, our research
40 underlines the importance of paternalism for understanding the dynamic and evolving nature
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 of capitalist employment relations Traditional paternalism drew attention to how employee
4 dependency was heightened over time; our study identifies a form of paternalism where the
5 dynamic is reversed. Third, this study responds to recent calls both for reconnecting
6 organisation studies with society (Hinings and Meyer, 2018) and situating workplace
7 practices within their political and economic environment (Vincent et al., 2020), by
8 investigating why and how novel practices arise in a particular societal context in which the
9 company is embedded. Following Vincent et al (2020), we show both the conditioning
10 influence of social-political environment and the practical agency of management in
11 producing a specific organisational approach to managing second-generation migrant workers.
12 While this paper focuses on migrant workers in China, we outline implications for the study
13 of paternalism and for the management of employees in other fluid labour markets where
14 employees are more committed to their future mobility in the external market than to job
15 security with one organisation.
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32

33 The paper proceeds with an overview of the literature on paternalism, taking a labour
34 process theory perspective which connects workplace practices and relations with their wider
35 socio-economic contexts. We then outline the setting of the study regarding migrant workers
36 in China and the particular challenge that managing this ‘second-generation’ poses to
37 managers. Next we introduce our case and methods. We theorise our findings and reflect on
38 their broader implications in the discussion and concluding sections.
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47

48 **Situating workplace relations: labour process theory and paternalism**

49
50 The relationship between workplaces, organisations and society has long been a
51 central topic in both sociology of work and organisation studies. However, scholars have
52 recently pointed out that contemporary organisational theorising has become rather
53 introspective and as a result, ‘the relationship between society and organisations or
54 organisational forms disappears from the radar’ (Hinings and Meyer, 2018, p. 73). Similarly,
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 Vincent et al. (2020) argue that engagement with political and economic contexts has been
4
5 missing from much mainstream research on human resource management (HRM), resulting
6
7 in a number of limitations both in terms of the theoretical promise and practical reality of
8
9 HRM. We concur that a broader perspective is thus needed to explain how and why
10
11 workplace practices and relations are embedded in and shaped by the political economy. In
12
13 this paper, we build from previous work that has used labour process theory to theorise
14
15 various forms of paternalism and the contexts within which they developed.
16
17
18

19
20 Labour process theory (LPT) offers a useful theoretical framing to examine
21
22 connections between ‘higher level’ social structures and processes and workplace-level
23
24 practices and outcomes (Delbridge, 2006; Vincent et al., 2020). LPT focuses attention on
25
26 management control and the indeterminacy of workplace relations between managers and
27
28 employees. It engages with political economy and class relations in understanding ‘what
29
30 people do and the contexts in which they act’ (Delbridge, 2006: 1210). Indeed, since its
31
32 emergence, understanding of the labour process has been driven by analyses of new contexts
33
34 and empirical settings, from workplaces under monopoly capitalism (e.g. Burawoy, 1979;
35
36 Edwards, 1979), factories under lean-production regimes (e.g. Delbridge, 1998), call centres
37
38 in the contemporary service economy (Sallaz, 2015; Taylor and Bain, 1999), to platforms in
39
40 the gig economy (Gandini, 2019; Wood et al., 2019). In this paper, we deploy LPT as an
41
42 underpinning analytical framework to assess the management practices and workplace
43
44 relationships between managers and employees that are associated with paternalism and to
45
46 understand the socio-political environment in which different forms of paternalism emerged
47
48 and flourished in different societies in different times. We then extend previous work to
49
50 interpret what contextual factors have contributed to the emergence of centrifugal paternalism
51
52 and how these factors shape the implementation and reception of this novel approach at the
53
54 workplace.
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 Paternalism is a long-established concept in the sociology of work (Abercrombie and
4 Hill, 1976; Sheppard and Sheppard, 1951). It has been used to describe a form of labour
5 control and management regime which establishes employer authority and seeks to generate
6 employee effort and consent by organising employment relations along the lines of ‘father-
7 like’ employers and ‘child-like’ employees (Ackers, 1998). Paternalism does not exist within
8 a social vacuum – it is embedded in a particular system of social stratification (Newby, 1975).
9

10
11 Paternalism emerged and flourished initially in early industrialisation in some British
12 factory villages (Burawoy, 1985; Joyce, 1980) and subsequently in some US companies (Hall,
13 1987; Hareven, 1982). According to Burawoy (1985), classical paternalism emerged in a
14 transitional period in industrialisation when British industry was in search of a new system to
15 respond to increasing market competition and technological changes. While some firms
16 embraced direct, Taylorist control, other firms adopted paternalism as an alternative form of
17 organisation.
18

19
20 Paternalism in early industrialisation was founded on an ideology of moral
21 responsibility on the part of employers and dependency on the part of employees (Bendix,
22 1959). Rural-to-urban migrant and immigrant workers figured prominently in descriptions of
23 paternalistic workplaces in their earliest descriptions both in the UK and US. Meyer (1985)
24 argues that the ‘re-making’ of workers in Ford was intended to adjust preindustrial labourers
25 as they moved from rural areas to new industrial and urban conditions. Thompson (1967) also
26 stressed that ‘the transition to mature industrial society entailed a severe restructuring of
27 working habits’ (p.57). These studies signal the importance of transforming workers and
28 changing their habits and character so that they could adjust to new industrial and urban
29 conditions. As Barley and Kunda (1992) suggest, early paternalists aimed to improve the
30 ‘conditions of the “workingmen (sic)” rather than improve working conditions’ (p.567).
31
32 These early forms of paternalism were seen to contribute to the stabilisation of employment
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 relationships and led to a management regime with a deferential relationship between
4
5 employees and their employers (Newby, 1975).
6

7
8 In Asia, paternalism has long been identified as a distinguishing characteristic of
9
10 Japanese workplaces both before and after World War II (Abercrombie and Hill, 1976; Dore,
11
12 1973; Littler, 1982). Typical paternalistic practices in the post-war period included the
13
14 provision of permanent employment, relatively high pay levels for core employees and a
15
16 wide range of employee benefits. The rise of Japanese paternalism is often explained as a
17
18 natural outgrowth of the country's cultural heritage featuring 'groupism, feelings of
19
20 dependency, and a high regard of harmony' (Abegglen, 1973; Hazama and Kaminski, 1979)
21
22 but more critical accounts ascribe Japanese workplace relations not to cultural predispositions
23
24 but rather the outcome of intense employment relations conflict post-World War II (Gordon,
25
26 1998). Likewise, it has been argued that Japanese paternalism was a product of Japanese
27
28 managers consciously implementing the 'best practices' of Western employers modelled on
29
30 'welfare capitalism' (Tsutsui, 1997).
31
32
33
34

35
36 China constitutes an interesting and potentially fruitful context to study paternalism.
37
38 Traditionally, China has been a paternalistic society under the influence of Confucianism
39
40 (Warner, 2009). Before China's economic reform in the 1980s, this paternalistic culture was
41
42 integrated into a patriarchy-based political system in which the party and government acted
43
44 as a 'father figure' making choices on behalf, and in the interests, of the masses (Mandle,
45
46 1984). It was then manifested in workplaces in the form of '*danwei*' (work units) featuring
47
48 'job for life' and 'cradle to grave' welfare for employees (Lu and Perry, 1997). In the *danwei*
49
50 system, Confucius cultural tradition, personal relations, family norms, kinship and communal
51
52 associations play an important role in regulating and legitimising industrial authority
53
54 (Warner, 2009). *Danwei* was not only a workplace but also an 'all-encompassing work and
55
56 residence community' that offered employees jobs-for-life and all social welfare including
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 housing, medical care, childcare and jobs for children of the employees (Chan and Unger,
4 2009). As the economic reform proceeded, China actively embraced neoliberal and
5 entrepreneurial mindsets and has imported western-style management practices into its
6 workplaces (Warner, 2009). Consequently, the old ‘*danwei*’ system was replaced by
7 marketized employment relations (Friedman and Lee, 2010). In contemporary China,
8 informal precarious work represents a majority of urban employment and is closely
9 associated with migration and industrialisation processes (Swider, 2015). However,
10 paternalism does not just disappear; some empirical studies have shown the legacy and
11 remnants of *danwei* in the management strategies used by former state-owned firms and
12 village enterprises (Chen, 2008). Therefore, it is worthwhile investigating whether and how
13 paternalism may be blended with market-based practices in neoliberal, contemporary
14 workplaces.

15
16 While there have been significant variations in the forms of paternalism reported, it is
17 widely understood that paternalism is associated with ‘permanent’ employment, provision of
18 certain worker benefits beyond remuneration, a heavy reliance on internal labour markets and
19 a greater emphasis on job security and employee loyalty in contrast with arms-length,
20 market-based and contractual employment relations (Ackers, 1998). It also features high
21 levels of pay and financial incentives to motivate employees (Weatherburn, 2020). These
22 management practices develop and reinforce the dependence of workers and strengthen the
23 authority of employers. In effect, employees become ensnared in a closed system with limited
24 (and declining) external options. We label these forms of paternalism as ‘centripetal
25 paternalism’ since ‘centripetal forces’, shaped by external social and economic structures, are
26 directed *inwards* on the workplace and act to draw in and bind the employee to the employer.

27
28 Over several decades, globalisation and neoliberal governance have led to
29 transformations in the post-Fordist pattern of work organisations, heralding high levels of
30

1
2
3 flexibility in both production and employment. This poses a challenge to the viability of
4 paternalism given its emphasis on relatively stable employment. While some scholars have
5 concluded that paternalism was best viewed as a periodic practice that belongs to a bygone
6 age (Chou, 2002; Drummond, 1995), others argue that the viability of paternalism is
7 ‘bounded not by time but by social structures’ (Ackers, 1998). A small number of recent
8 studies have suggested that forms of paternalism exist in a variety of contemporary
9 workplaces. For example, the company town studied by Moonesirust and Brown (2021)
10 shares many similarities with early paternalistic regimes in that management control extends
11 beyond formal organisational boundaries into the private lives of employees. Studies on
12 knowledge-intensive, professional service firms have also implied that these firms are highly
13 paternalistic (as evidenced, for example, by their mentoring practices and alumni networks)
14 yet with short-term employment and high turnover (e.g. O’Mahoney and Sturdy, 2016).
15 However, these contemporary manifestations of paternalism are both rare and require further
16 theorisation.

17
18 In what follows we detail how a new and distinctive form of paternalism, termed
19 ‘centrifugal paternalism’, was identified and theorised through inductive and exploratory
20 research of a Chinese case. Centrifugal paternalism shares characteristics with its centripetal
21 forms, in that it advocates mutual respect, care and reciprocity between ‘adult’ (parent- or
22 teacher-like) employers and ‘child-like’ employees. Management takes responsibility for
23 employees and claims to act in their ‘best interests’, developing practices that help employees
24 become more proficient and effective and that improve their wellbeing. However, in contrast
25 to centripetal forms, centrifugal paternalism does not seek to strengthen the paternalistic
26 nature of these relationships over extended periods of time and thereby reinforce employees’
27 long-term dependence on a particular firm. Rather, it develops the employees to be
28 independent and ultimately to be able to adapt to, and integrate into, the external labour
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 market. The role of the employer is conceived to include the preparation of employees for
4 their future *outside* their current workplace rather than their continuing effectiveness and
5 well-being *within* it. In the case presented, this involves preparing migrant workers from
6 China's rural areas for work in a large company, for life in a large urban city, and more
7 broadly to cope with the social and personal consequences of industrialisation. In doing so,
8 managers have developed a 'tough love' approach in order to 'guide', 'educate', 'take care
9 of', and 'socialise' the workers before they 'let them go' into the wider world. By situating
10 centrifugal paternalism in its surrounding socio-political contexts, we show how the
11 management system in our case produces 'centrifugal forces' which draw on external
12 structures and relations and direct employees *outwards* away from their workplaces into the
13 wider external environment. We argue that 'centrifugal paternalism' represents the firm's
14 strategic choice to accommodate its needs for flexible and precarious labour while
15 responding to migrant workers' pressing needs for personal skills development and their
16 future prospects of settling down in urban cities.

36 **Context: second-generation migrant workers in China**

37
38
39 China's rapid industrialisation and economic growth since 1978 has created one of the
40 greatest rural-to-urban migrations in human history. In 2019, there were an estimated 290
41 million peasant workers, among whom 135 million were rural-to-urban migrant workers who
42 travelled from the countryside to work in urban cities (National Bureau of Statistics of China,
43 2019). The first generation of migrant workers came to urban cities in the 1980s when China
44 started its economic reform and the demand for labour in cities increased sharply (Chan,
45 2018). Although these workers made enormous contributions to urban development, they
46 could not move their families to the cities due to the institutional segregation between rural
47 and urban areas. According to China's house registration system, known as *hukou*, migrant
48 workers who were registered in their home villages rather than in the cities where they
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 worked were not able to gain access to public services and other rights such as retirement
4 benefits, public education, subsidised housing, and health care (Xiang and Tan, 2005). The
5
6 absence of these rights forced the first-generation migrant workers to leave behind some of
7
8 their family members (mainly children and the elderly) in the village while they worked in
9
10 the city. This led to the creation of a population of what are now known as ‘left-behind
11
12 children’ (Ye and Lu, 2011).
13
14
15

16
17 In 2018, there were more than 7 million left-behind children in rural areas, 96% of
18
19 whom are cared for by their grandparents (Ministry of Civil Affairs of China, 2018). Most
20
21 parents start migrating when their children are still toddlers, hoping to earn and save money
22
23 for their children’s maintenance and future education. They tend to work in urban cities for
24
25 20 to 30 years, living separately from their children, and then move back in their 40s and 50s
26
27 when their children have grown up. Due to inflexible working times, large distances and
28
29 considerable travel cost, they normally return home once a year and some have never
30
31 returned (Ye and Lu, 2011). ‘Left-behind’ children thus often have little or no direct care and
32
33 guidance from their parents. The level of education among left-behind children is lower than
34
35 average, partly because of the lack of teachers and resources in rural areas and partly because
36
37 these children are often required to contribute to house and farm work (Ye and Lu, 2011).
38
39
40
41

42
43 When these children are old enough, many follow their parents’ footsteps and join the
44
45 migration flow. They have become a ‘second generation’ of migrants who entered the labour
46
47 market in the late 1990s and 2000s. Compared to their parents who migrated predominantly
48
49 for economic earnings and usually intended to return to their rural families after working in
50
51 the urban cities, the new generation is more motivated by their ‘urban dreams’ and workers
52
53 are more committed to the pursuit of personal development and long-term urban settlement
54
55 (Frenkel and Yu, 2014). These new characteristics of migrant workers have resulted in
56
57 challenges in their management. First, the second generation of migrants strive to obtain
58
59
60

1
2
3 better labour conditions than their predecessors. They are no longer willing to undertake
4 tough and dirty work but demand decent work with better working environments, higher pay
5 and potential for career advancement (Cheng, 2014; Hannan, 2008). Second, these workers
6 are 'less tolerant of disrespectful treatment by management and more likely to initiate
7 spontaneous collective action to fight for their interest and rights' (Choi and Peng, 2015:
8 291). The dominant management regime used for managing the first generation of migrants
9 (Pun and Smith, 2007) has been seen as increasingly problematic because it is based on strict
10 labour control and close surveillance in isolated factory dormitories. A recent study in a
11 labour-intensive factory in South China shows that even the so-called 'humanised
12 management' failed to effectively manage migrant workers and improve workplace
13 relationships because a pure 'paternalistic' rhetoric did not change the despotic nature of the
14 management regime (Choi and Peng, 2015). Lastly, responding quickly and proactively to
15 dissatisfaction in labour and living conditions, second-generation migrants have a high
16 tendency towards mobility. They are less concerned about job security with one employer but
17 more interested in their opportunities in the external labour market, resulting in high turnover
18 and considerable organisational costs and disruptions (Choi and Peng, 2015; Qin et al., 2018).

19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
Qin et al. (2019) suggest that migrant workers' commitment to work hinges on how
well they transition from rural to urban identities and adjust to urban employment and
lifestyle. Therefore, management needs to facilitate workers' rural-to-urban adaptation and
develop their belongingness in the new urban environment. In this study, we demonstrate
how a distinctive form of paternalism, with a particular focus on migrant workers' rural-to-
urban transition, has been developed and practised in a Chinese workplace.

Empirical case, data collection and analysis

The data presented are taken from an in-depth qualitative case study of TypingKids (a
pseudonym)¹, a Chinese firm which provides information processing services such as data

1
2
3 inputting and editing to Japanese clients. Its major clients include NTT Data, Fuji Xerox and
4
5 NEC. TypingKids is a privately-owned company founded by a female entrepreneur in 1992.
6
7 It operates in both China and Japan, providing offshore services (in Dalian, China) and
8
9 onshore services (in Tokyo, Japan). The Chinese workplace is located in a business cluster
10
11 where hundreds of firms are providing IT outsourcing services to Japanese clients.
12
13

14
15 TypingKids has a workforce of 1,000 employees, 650 of whom undertake business
16
17 process outsourcing (BPO) tasks. The BPO tasks involved Chinese workers taking Japanese
18
19 handwritten documents, which are scanned, faxed or emailed over from Japan, and typing
20
21 them into a digital database in the Japanese language. Most of the BPO workers in
22
23 TypingKids have a rural family background and fit the category of second-generation
24
25 migrant workers, typically receiving only basic education (6 years of primary school and 3
26
27 years of secondary school) in rural areas, before migrating and enrolling in technical schools
28
29 in Dalian city. Most are between 16 and 22 years old and the majority reported that they grew
30
31 up with their grandparents or other family members as their parents worked outside their
32
33 hometowns. About 55% of these workers were female.
34
35
36
37

38
39 BPO firms are subject to significant neoliberal tensions. On the one hand, the BPO
40
41 market is highly competitive and volatile, requiring a flexible, short-term workforce that has
42
43 relatively low levels of pay. BPO workers, on the other hand, need to be highly committed to
44
45 deliver services that meet the high expectations of clients in terms of quality and speed.
46
47 TypingKids was selected for this research project because of its reputation in Dalian as a
48
49 'responsible' employer which cared for employees. This was especially interesting given that
50
51 many BPO firms were considered to be exploitative due to their low pay and short-term
52
53 employment. The broad objective of the research project was to gain an in-depth
54
55 understanding of how TypingKids managed employees in accordance with the demands of
56
57 Japanese clients with specific reference to management control and employee responses. This
58
59
60

1
2
3 was reflected in the level of details collected about the working lives of workers and informs
4
5 the arguments presented in this paper as it pertains to the experience of migrant workers and
6
7 the company's control strategy for those workers.
8
9

10 Data collection was primarily undertaken in three different phases: direct observation
11
12 and interviews in TypingKids' Chinese workplace in Dalian during May and July 2011, and
13
14 in the firm's Japanese office in Tokyo in March 2012, and interviews in Dalian in February
15
16 2014. During the periods of direct observation, one of the research team worked full-time
17
18 (but unpaid) as an HR consultant within TypingKids' Chinese and Japanese workplaces.
19
20 Researching both the Chinese and Japanese workplaces allowed the research team to capture
21
22 the cross-national nature of the TypingKids and offered valuable insights into the experience
23
24 of workers. Access to the company and the authorisation to conduct research were gained
25
26 from a manager of TypingKids, whom the researcher contacted directly through LinkedIn.
27
28 The observation started with a two-week shadowing of the Human Resource (HR)
29
30 Department in TypingKids' Chinese workplace in Dalian, after which the lead researcher
31
32 volunteered to assist the firm with its initiative to formulate and implement a new employee
33
34 appraisal system. Through this involvement, the researcher had the opportunity to talk to
35
36 managers and workers in different departments and participated in managerial meetings,
37
38 daily briefings and other activities.
39
40
41
42
43

44 Field notes were taken on each working day, both at work and after work. The
45
46 observations during this period included active participation in the company's various events,
47
48 close observations on events happening around the researcher, large numbers of informal
49
50 conversations with different employees over lunchtime, breaks and activities outside work,
51
52 and detailed field notes recording observations, the experience of participation and thoughts.
53
54 The observation generated detailed insights into management practices, the labour process
55
56 and employees' daily experiences at work.
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 In total, 58 semi-structured interviews were conducted. Forty-three interviews were
4 conducted with managers and workers in Dalian, China and 15 in Tokyo, Japan. The
5 interview dataset covered all positions in the organisational hierarchy. The length of the
6 interviews varied from 60 to 90 minutes each. Most interviews were undertaken in the
7 Chinese language except two, which were in Japanese with the help of an interpreter who
8 spoke both Chinese and Japanese. Each interview proceeded by asking interviewees to give a
9 brief statement of their personal background and tenure in their current jobs, followed by
10 more detailed questions relating to their job duties and responsibilities, routines and practices
11 at workplaces, their perceptions of the work and the firm, and their relationships with others
12 at workplaces. All the interviews were recorded and subsequently transcribed in their original
13 language (i.e. Chinese). Translation of transcripts into a different language was deliberately
14 not undertaken out of a concern to preserve the original cultural nuances of each interview
15 encounter. All names were replaced with pseudonyms and potentially identifying information
16 was removed.

17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
The research team then coupled observational and interview data with research
extensions out to the larger market-fields (Burawoy, 1998). An extensive review of archival
data was conducted on the development of the IT outsourcing business cluster in Dalian and
the relationships between Dalian and Japan. Special attention was paid to the institutional
arrangements in the business cluster in relation to migrant workers and relevant changes over
time.

The analysis was undertaken in an iterative coding process, starting with picking out
key events, issues and interactions from the interview transcriptions and field notes and
moving on to producing thematic categories (Corbin and Strauss, 2008). These categories
were firstly loosely informed by the literature on labour process theory and included themes
addressing control, resistance, social contexts, institutional arrangement and so on. We then

1
2
3 focus on management control techniques and identify a ‘tough love’ approach at the
4 workplace through which managers ‘guide’, ‘educate’, ‘take care of’, and ‘socialise’ workers
5 before they are ‘let go’ to find their way in the wider city. The exploratory nature of the study
6 meant that our main objective was to look for findings that could inform the literature, and
7 we iterated to identify valuable theoretical concepts and frames, alighting on paternalism as
8 one such. We do not claim generalisation to all empirical settings. Rather our objective is to
9 develop novel theoretical insight from these data in order to advance our understanding of the
10 development of paternalism so that these insights are then examined in the context of new
11 empirical settings.
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

23
24 The analysis of the empirical data is presented in the following section. We first
25 introduce the case firm TypingKids, the city of its location and its rural migrant employees,
26 followed by an in-depth discussion about how managers develop a ‘tough love’ approach at
27 the workplace.
28
29
30
31
32
33

34 **TypingKids, Dalian city and migrant workers**

35

36 Dalian City is a port city in Liaoning province and is the major gateway to China’s
37 northeast region. Being less than two hours away from Japan by air and a former colonial city
38 of the Japanese, the Dalian local government has taken a distinct economic development path
39 since the 1990s, prioritising the provision of relatively low-skilled outsourcing services to
40 Japanese organisations. This strategy has led to a booming business cluster of hundreds of
41 companies providing business process outsourcing (BPO) and information technology
42 outsourcing (ITO) services. In Thomas Friedman’s (2005) bestseller ‘The World is Flat’,
43 Dalian City is described as the ‘Bangalore of China’. This regional strategy has led to, and
44 been reinforced by, a large population of low-skilled migrant workers moving to Dalian from
45 the rural areas of Northern China resulting in the establishment of a dozen local technical
46 schools that welcome migrants and offer them very basic, entry-level training on computer
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 skills and the Japanese language. Migrants study in these schools for one or two years and
4
5 then seek job opportunities in the cluster.
6
7

8 Flexible labour is crucial for BPO companies in Dalian. This is because demand from
9
10 Japanese clients fluctuates and changes rapidly. Due to the low skill and labour-intensive
11
12 nature of the BPO work, Japanese companies constantly look for suppliers at a lower price
13
14 and they can switch suppliers easily. Before the fieldwork in 2011, Japan was badly hit with
15
16 the Tohoku earthquake and tsunami, which caused a sharp decrease of business to BPO firms
17
18 in Dalian. To adapt to fluctuating demand and cut labour costs, BPO providers require
19
20 flexible labour that can be obtained at short notice when business comes in and dismissed
21
22 easily when business declines. For this reason, most companies in the cluster rely on agencies
23
24 to provide temporary workers, but this often leads to dissatisfaction with the performance of
25
26 workers including quality issues (see Zhu and Morgan, 2018).
27
28
29

30
31 TypingKids, however, has developed a different model. TypingKids needs to respond
32
33 to changing demand from the market just as the other providers in the cluster, but its business
34
35 can be largely managed on a seasonal basis. Every year, the period from August to the
36
37 following February is considered to be the ‘busy season’ since the firm gets a large amount of
38
39 business involving inputting annual reports for Japanese institutions and editing Christmas
40
41 and New Year cards. March to July is seen as the ‘low season’, during which the firm and
42
43 consequently the workers do not get as much work to do.
44
45
46

47 Instead of hiring agency workers, TypingKids develops collaboration with local
48
49 technical schools and recruits senior graduating students from these schools. The recruitment
50
51 is strategically scheduled every year in May and June when schools finish their terms and
52
53 students start planning for the summer holiday. New entrants are then given three-months
54
55 training before they are ready to work for the busy season starting in August and September.
56
57
58 By doing this, TypingKids aligns its recruitment and training practices with its seasonal
59
60

1
2
3 business fluctuations and technical school schedules to ensure enough labour capacity for the
4
5 incoming business. New student recruits have to finish a one-year internship assignment
6
7 before they can sign a standard three-year employment contract with the company. These
8
9 interns are paid at a much lower wage rate (at 400–600RMB per month in 2011) than that of
10
11 the established workers and the mid-career entrants (normally at 1100–3000RMB per month).
12
13 As we will show later, many workers leave voluntarily during low seasons and managers in
14
15 TypingKids do not attempt to retain them; this helps keep their workforce numbers flexible
16
17 and linked to demand. Workers are organised in teams of between 10 and 20 and supervised
18
19 directly by team leaders. Team leaders are supervised by section chiefs, who typically
20
21 oversee five to 10 teams, and project managers. When needed, TypingKids also sends
22
23 employees to provide onshore services at their Japanese clients' sites. At the time of the
24
25 research, there were more than 40 expatriates in Japan on either short-term assignment (up to
26
27 six months) or long-term assignment (more than one year).
28
29
30
31
32

33 Like the majority of second generation migrant workers in China, the BPO workers in
34
35 TypingKids are generally keen on pursuing their 'dream lives' in urban cities. At the time of
36
37 the fieldwork, the Dalian government implemented a house registration system which offers
38
39 some possible pathways for migrant workers to obtain a local *hukou*. One of the most
40
41 common paths was for migrant workers to prove they had had stable jobs (with large and
42
43 reputable employers) and regular monthly earnings for more than five years in Dalian.
44
45 Another pathway was through investment in real estate in the city (the property size should
46
47 be no smaller than 70 square metres) or new ventures with no less than 1.2 million RMB of
48
49 registered capital (approximately \$200,000) (Dalian Government, 2012). Such a condition-
50
51 based system meant that migrants could 'earn' access to social services in urban cities if they
52
53 managed to meet the required conditions.
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

A 'Tough love' Approach

1
2
3 *A 'big family' with migrant 'kids'*
4

5 The fieldwork began with shadowing the HR department in which a team of 10
6 people dealt with all the personnel and administrative issues of the company. One key
7 observation was made during these two weeks: people in the HR department always referred
8 to their frontline BPO workers as '*xiaohai*' or '*haizi*' (small child or kid) – 'one kid came by
9 this morning to collect his payslip', 'I need to sort out insurance forms for the kids', 'oh, this
10 kid messed it up'. As the fieldwork progressed, the researcher found this was a company-
11 wide phenomenon as team leaders, project managers and the general manager all called the
12 frontline BPO workers 'kids'. The use of 'kids' did not indicate the worker's age because
13 several employees in the HR department were younger than those whom they called 'kids'.
14 Instead, it was related to the nature of the BPO workers as 'migrant workers' who were
15 viewed as innocent and inexperienced in 'adult life' and had difficulties in integrating into
16 the city. As one HR associate explained, 'I guess I am not suggesting they are "children" by
17 age... I meant by their experience... knowledge, you know, about the city...'.
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34

35 The widespread use of 'kids' was complemented by the management's attempts to
36 'help' these migrant 'kids' integrate into city life and work. There was a strong sense of
37 sympathy among the management towards migrant workers. The team leaders and managers
38 often talked about how difficult it was for a migrant worker to adapt to urban life and live in
39 the city permanently, given the '*hukou*' system and that they had grown up in rural areas as
40 'left-behind children'. The researcher was told on several occasions that the BPO workers
41 were far away from their families so that the management tried to make the company like a
42 big substitute family. The managers in TypingKids were mostly local *hukou* holders but there
43 were also a number of non-locals who came from rural areas but had managed to settle in the
44 city. The management felt they were in a superior and advantaged position compared to their
45 migrant workers because they either held the local *hukou* or had 'succeeded' in integrating
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 into urban life. Therefore, they often spoke of their responsibilities to help their workers
4
5 ‘settle down’ in the city. By ‘settle down’, the managers did not necessarily mean the migrant
6
7 workers would obtain a local *hukou*, but more generally that the migrant workers could live a
8
9 stable life in the city, manage to ‘earn’ access to public goods like health and education, and
10
11 ultimately gain respect from the city population and find a sense of urban belonging. The
12
13 firm’s paternalistic nature was reflected in the CEO’s speech at the 2010 Corporate Annual
14
15 Party. In his talk, the CEO presented the firm as a ‘big family’ for young, migrant workers
16
17 and concluded that, ‘TypingKids helps you to grow and to pursue your dream life in this
18
19 exciting city’ (Corporate video). During the fieldwork, ‘we are a family’ was frequently
20
21 mentioned by managers, either in introducing the corporate culture (*‘we have a culture that*
22
23 *feels like a family’ (general manager)*); in describing their style of management (*‘our*
24
25 *management is different from that in western firms; our style is softer, more humanised, like*
26
27 *a family’ (department manager)*); or in explaining their approach to employment (*‘...we have*
28
29 *never failed to care for our workers, their wellbeing, their growth. We educate and train our*
30
31 *workers like their parents’ (an article written by the CEO published in the corporate in-*
32
33 *house magazine)*).

34
35
36
37
38
39
40 To fulfil what the firm identifies as its responsibilities to its new migrant recruits,
41
42 TypingKids has developed a ‘tough love’ approach at the workplace in order to ‘guide’,
43
44 ‘educate’, ‘train’, and ‘socialise’ the BPO workers, and finally ‘let them go’ when they
45
46 become ‘independent’ enough. The following sections will discuss each of these elements in
47
48 detail. As our data reveal, the paternalistic relationship in TypingKids is centred on the
49
50 ‘parents’ helping ‘migrant kids’ settle down and integrate into their new urban life.
51
52

53
54
55 *To guide: ‘draw the right picture of the urban world’*

56
57
58 ‘To guide’ was mentioned frequently by team leaders and managers as part of their
59
60 role. The general manager emphasised in an interview that this was not only about work tasks,

1
2
3 but more importantly, about the worker's life and further career in urban cities in general. She
4 stressed that 'since their parents were away and their grandparents at home were too busy
5 with household duties to educate them, these children had received very little guidance about
6 their future careers and life'.
7
8
9
10
11

12 Efforts in 'guiding' the workers were made in two ways. Firstly, the management
13 offered direction and guidance to help the workers make good sense of their new urban
14 circumstances. The HR manager commented that parents of 'left-behind children' regularly
15 sent money and 'urban' commodities (toys, mobile phones, electronics) to their rural families
16 and this gives their children false impressions that it was easy to make money in cities:
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

24 They think everything is better in the city, they think lives in their rural families are
25 tough and poor, they think people in the city make big money. You get me? They get
26 all these rosy, unrealistic pictures...Once they join the urban workforce, they soon
27 find the market is competitive and hard... I think they need someone to guide them
28 through and draw the right pictures, from the first day of their work (HR manager,
29 Dalian)
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37

38 This comment reveals how managers tend to deny the accuracy of workers' past perspectives
39 of the city. They see workers as 'outsiders' who have little (or an unrealistic) idea of urban
40 life and work. The managers, therefore, claim that they have a responsibility to direct the
41 workers in their life and career. At the same time, they affirm the toughness of work in the
42 city and the limited level of remuneration at TypingKids.
43
44
45
46
47
48

49 Secondly, managers gave guidance on *how* migrant workers can get settled and
50 integrate into the city. Managers emphasised that 'good work performance' could transcend
51 the workers' non-local citizenship and enable them to gain social respect and status in the city.
52 At one morning briefing, the team leader highlighted the importance of work performance by
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 telling her team members that they would pay a penalty for every error they made in their
4
5 work. She said this corporate policy reflected the ‘rules of games’ in the city.
6
7

8 At morning briefings, meetings, conversations and in the in-house magazines,
9
10 managers made a strong and consistent point that hard work was the key to achieving
11
12 personal success and living a better life. In one article in the corporate magazine, the author
13
14 emphasised that hard work was the *only* way for migrant workers to succeed since they
15
16 ‘cannot win by family, cannot win by wealth, cannot win by education’. This view was
17
18 highlighted by one expatriate in Japan who was awarded the ‘Star of Dedication’ for her hard
19
20 work during pregnancy and shortly after giving birth. At the award presentation speech, she
21
22 said, ‘I knew I had no advantages over the others in terms of my family and educational
23
24 background. All I do is to work hard’ (Corporate Video).
25
26
27

28 Management’s attempts at ‘drawing the right picture’ of urban life and work are
29
30 associated with its assumed authority as local, urban citizens, with an accompanying
31
32 assumption that the migrant workers are outsiders and their perspectives are incorrect. This
33
34 both creates a sense of fear amongst the newly arrived migrant workers about how they will
35
36 survive in their new environs and also promotes a sense of inadequacy on the part of the new
37
38 recruits. One new recruit reported after the induction meeting that she was excited before the
39
40 meeting but felt more anxiety than excitement afterwards because everything ‘sounds new,
41
42 difficult and demanding’ and she was afraid of not being able to learn and adapt to her new
43
44 circumstances quickly and successfully. These guiding practices draw on the managers’
45
46 knowledge of their city, reinforce the dependence of workers on their employers to provide
47
48 the ‘right’ perspective and subsequently strengthen the authority of managers as ‘urban
49
50 citizens’. Having helped to create a sense of uncertainty, the company then sets out its vision
51
52 for how to survive and be successful; management portrays an urban life in which only
53
54 performance speaks and prescribes one way of living that is based on hard work. In doing so,
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 TypingKids seeks to instil a strong work ethic in its workers. Indeed, while ‘drawing the right
4 picture of urban life’ for its employees, the desirable attitude of hard work is advanced and
5
6 the authority of management reinforced.
7
8
9

10
11 *To educate: ‘once you learn the skill, you get your foothold in the city’*
12

13
14 Under neoliberalism, skills are considered 'private goods' that should only be invested
15
16 by individuals in accumulating their 'human capital', meaning that firms invest little or
17
18 nothing in their employees' skill development (Fleming, 2017). In contrast, TypingKids
19
20 offers a three-month off-the-job training programme that equips its workers with skills that
21
22 are much needed in the local labour market. The training focuses on the necessary skills of
23
24 typing numbers before working up to the greater complexity of Japanese letters and
25
26 characters. Workers are taught to use an application which enables them to type Japanese
27
28 characters based on their structures (appearance) rather than on pronunciations or meanings.
29
30 TypingKids was a pioneer firm when introducing this application to the workplace and was
31
32 the first firm to develop a systematic training programme for it.
33
34
35

36
37 Since other employers in the city do not commonly offer such skills development, it
38
39 became a big selling point for TypingKids in recruitment and corporate branding. The
40
41 training was part of the company’s preparation for the busy season every year. It was offered
42
43 annually upon the entry of new starter employees and enables them to be proficient enough
44
45 for the coming busy season in just three months’ time. Through the training programme,
46
47 TypingKids builds up a distinct reputation within the cluster as a ‘good starting point of one’s
48
49 career’. The majority of workers interviewed listed the skills training as one reason for them
50
51 to join the company. The allure of this training loomed large when the HR manager
52
53 addressed migrant workers’ desire to settle down in the city:
54
55
56

57 The training will equip you with a skill on which you can rely for your future. We
58
59 will teach you to type and edit Japanese documents quickly and accurately. There are
60

1
2
3 hundreds of firms out there looking for people with this skill so once you get it,
4
5 you've gained your foothold in the city. I mean, you need a skill to survive in the
6
7 city... (HR manager, new employee induction)
8
9

10 While this 'skill for life' is rather simple and has little to do with the workers' Japanese
11
12 language or computer skills, local demand for this skill is high from BPO firms serving
13
14 Japanese firms using this particular software. Therefore, the three-month training may have a
15
16 transformational impact on the migrant workers' career prospects and offer them a decent
17
18 starting point in their new 'urban life'. In the fieldwork, what became particularly apparent
19
20 was that workers were positive about the training opportunity offered by the company. Not a
21
22 single worker spoken to questioned the value of the skills they learnt. Workers were very
23
24 positive about securing other jobs in the local cluster with these skills and the management
25
26 discourse of the 'skills for life' was positively received. Workers told the researcher that it is
27
28 common for companies in the cluster to recruit directly from the agency and not bother to
29
30 train them. Agencies provide some basic training but not as practical and recognisable as the
31
32 TypingKids' training. Because of the lack of training, young employees who were hired by
33
34 agencies ended up with 'bad' assignments for years with the lowest pay. TypingKids stands
35
36 out from the rest in the cluster because it develops young workers and its training programme
37
38 is highly regarded by other companies. This gives workers hope for better jobs in the future
39
40 and opens up more promising career prospects.
41
42
43
44
45

46
47 In daily practice, the team leaders kept motivating workers to perfect their skills and
48
49 type faster. They ran workplace competitions and arranged competitive ranking in teams by
50
51 giving specific typing tasks and recording each worker's time using a stopwatch. The
52
53 management liked to interpret these speed games as activities reflecting the 'competitive'
54
55 nature of urban society. One team leader explained that these 'games' helped to raise the
56
57 workers' 'awareness of competition' which, in her opinion, was 'essential in today's society'.
58
59
60

1
2
3 At the annual meeting, the CEO said that ‘the company has designed daily practices and
4 activities to prepare you [the workers] for your future’.
5
6

7
8 Apart from the in-house training, some managers also took active roles in advising
9 and encouraging workers to take other advanced training courses such as e-commerce,
10 Japanese language and IT skills. As one project manager commented, training in TypingKids
11 was not only about ‘skills’, but about general ‘career development’. Managers were heard
12 several times telling the workers that they should not limit themselves to BPO work, but
13 ensure that they are ‘looking in the long term’ and explore different career possibilities and
14 ‘dream big’. One project manager proudly reported that one of his former workers left the
15 company and started his own e-commerce business. Indeed, when asked about their future
16 career plans, almost half of the respondents said they were considering jobs unconnected to
17 BPO work and many of them commented that working in TypingKids gave them inspiration
18 and confidence for the future.
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32

33 The above comments show that the company’s management practices are not only
34 focused on the workers’ present work at TypingKids, but also on their success in the wider
35 urban society and for their long-term future. TypingKids offers education and mentorship to
36 the workers with the intention that they see what they are capable of, and intends to provide
37 them with skills, work habits and inner confidence that is needed for their future life and
38 career in the urban city.
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47

48 *To take care of: ‘there are too many temptations in the city’*
49

50 In addition to providing guidance and training, managers also claim to feel
51 responsible for ‘taking care of’ their workers and actively place themselves in ‘parental’
52 positions of authority over extra-work activities. There are both hard and soft aspects in
53 TypingKids’ caring approach.
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 The 'hard' care aims to 'protect' workers. This 'protection' was observed when a
4 section chief stopped his team member from playing computer games in a cybercafé; when
5 one HR associate criticised a girl for wearing 'cheap' make up; when a project manager gave
6 a severe reprimand to the worker who was caught smoking; when a team leader reminded her
7 team members to save money instead of buying new mobile phones. In each example, the
8 workers are cast as children who cannot tell right from wrong and lack self-discipline, with
9 their managers as the wise and authoritative parent.
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18

19 When the managers highlighted the importance of their 'protective' roles, they made
20 reference to the distinctiveness of young migrant workers. Li, a section chief, who described
21 himself as the 'guardian' for his team members, explained that migrant workers were
22 particularly vulnerable to temptations in the city due to their rural background and
23 inexperience. Therefore, he felt responsible to 'protect' these workers from 'bad' influences:
24
25
26
27
28
29

30 Life here [in the city] is different from where they came from [the rural areas]. There
31 is not much going on in rural places, materially or mentally; it's simple, not like here.
32 Here, it is exciting, too entertaining, too many exciting things...they [the workers] are
33 too young and they get lost...well, they are away from their parents, and somehow I
34 am acting as their parents [laugh].
35
36
37
38
39
40
41

42 This comment was echoed by another manager who observed that the huge contrast between
43 cities and countryside made many young migrants envious of the urban affluence they lack;
44 'they become addicted to the material world but do not want to work hard'.
45
46
47
48

49 At the workplace, protecting workers involves keeping them disciplined and 'well
50 behaved'. This is manifested in the managers' strict implementation of an 'Employees' Code
51 of Conduct', a bell-controlled working timetable and a closely-monitored daily operating
52 system. This hard discipline is then married with a soft version of practices aiming to show
53 'love and empathy' to workers because 'these children have the desire for parental love'
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 (Project Manager, Dalian). To this end, team leaders take a strong counseling role, advising
4
5 their members on personal problems and responding to their ‘emotional needs’. Accordingly,
6
7 workers tend to form close bonds with their team leaders and see them as trustworthy
8
9 mentors. By offering guidance, protection and mentoring, section and team leaders establish
10
11 personal relations with the workers. These relationships go beyond the formal employment
12
13 contract and often continue after the workers leave the firm. These relational efforts also
14
15 played a prominent role in early industrialism’s paternalism fostering reciprocity and
16
17 stabilising employment relationships between employers and workers (Ackers, 1998).
18
19
20

21
22 This combination of hard and soft approaches in managing workers constitute the core
23
24 elements of what managers described as ‘tough love’:
25

26 I am a strict manager. I stress accuracy, discipline, and performance at work. I
27
28 criticize and punish workers when they make a mistake. But I do all these to help
29
30 them. They are still children, inexperienced, immature...Most of my workers know
31
32 that I am harsh for their sake, but even if they don’t, they will understand eventually
33
34 in the future. (Project Manager, Dalian)
35
36
37
38

39 *To socialise: ‘let the workers experience the spirits of city life’*
40

41 Unlike firms which manage migrant workers under isolated, dormitory-based regimes
42
43 (Pun and Smith, 2007), TypingKids makes considerable effort to socialise workers with the
44
45 activities, norms and values of city life. The HR department regularly provides workers with
46
47 free tickets for the latest films, exhibitions and sports facilities in the city with the purpose to,
48
49 in the HR manager’s words, ‘let the workers experience the spirits of city life’. Short trips,
50
51 picnics, barbeques and other activities are often organised for teams during weekends and
52
53 holidays. Managers commented that these activities were not organised as part of the
54
55 corporate team-building training but were ‘simply hangouts’. Although these activities are
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 normally arranged voluntarily, workers were encouraged to participate and took them as
4
5 opportunities to explore the city and to learn ‘social skills’.
6

7
8 Team leaders play a central role in socialising migrant workers not only into city life
9
10 but also their own families, sometimes establishing close personal relationships with workers.
11
12 One team leader said that she took her team members into her own home almost as part of
13
14 her own family.
15

16
17 This socialisation is not limited to the Chinese workplace but also extended to
18
19 TypingKids’ Japanese workplace. Expatriates were collectively accommodated in corporate-
20
21 rented buildings and supervised by managers from both China and Japan. Managers not only
22
23 cared for the wellbeing of the expatriates, but also organised sightseeing and social events for
24
25 the workers to explore Tokyo. During the fieldwork in Tokyo, the Japanese manager invited
26
27 the expatriates and the researcher to have dinner at his home with his wife and children. Two
28
29 daytrips (a picnic in a park and a short trip to a tourist site in Tokyo) were also organised for
30
31 expatriates and their families during that period. In many cases, managers intentionally
32
33 involved workers in the planning and organising of social activities. Every individual
34
35 expatriate was assigned tasks such as booking tickets, communicating with the hotel or
36
37 restaurant staff, shopping and so on. Managers explained this was meant to provide workers
38
39 with opportunities to practice social skills and the Japanese language. The expatriates were
40
41 excited about these activities and felt grateful to the firm: ‘It is eye-opening. I would not have
42
43 had these opportunities to experience the city, not to mention a foreign city like Tokyo, if I
44
45 were not with TypingKids.’
46
47
48
49

50
51 All these socialisation activities helped migrant workers to integrate into city life and
52
53 reinforced the firm’s parental role in both managing and educating the migrant workers.
54
55

56
57 *To let go: ‘you will graduate sooner or later’*
58
59
60

1
2
3 Centripetal paternalism is long-term oriented, featuring permanent employment in
4 return for employee loyalty. By contrast, employment in TypingKids is short-term and highly
5 flexible. Annual turnover in TypingKids is higher than 50 per cent and most employees leave
6 after one-year's work. In fact, given the seasonal fluctuation of its business, managers are
7 happy to 'let' workers voluntarily leave for other companies during low seasons, making
8 little effort to retain them. According to several managers, in doing so, the firm avoided
9 making workers redundant.

10
11
12 Labour flexibility is achieved by implementing a pay system which minimises the
13 fixed basic pay whilst emphasising the variable piece-rate bonus. On the one hand, the fixed
14 basic pay only accounted for 40 per cent of employee monthly income (Corporate Report,
15 2013). The fixed basic pay in TypingKids (average of 800RMB) was significantly inferior to
16 the best rates in the cluster (average of 1000RMB). On the other hand, workers got well paid
17 during the busy seasons when they had regular overtime opportunities. During the quiet
18 season, however, when workers are not doing overtime, pay is comparatively low, leading to
19 people leaving the company at that time – which in turn reduces costs to the company. It is
20 also made possible by the wide availability of job alternatives offered by the BPO cluster.

21
22
23 The high turnover rate is normalised through a discourse of 'graduation'. Instead of
24 the 'family' image which usually features in the rhetoric of a paternalist workplace, workers
25 in TypingKids tend to describe the firm as a 'school' from which they will graduate sooner or
26 later. This discourse was also prevalent among managers. The CEO described the company
27 as a 'springboard' for workers, from where they learned essential skills and then moved to
28 other positions. In his opinion, 'workers are free to pursue every opportunity they want'.
29 Project managers and team leaders also encouraged the workers to learn fast and 'graduate'
30 quickly so as to pursue other good opportunities. The fieldwork started in the low season and
31 the HR department was receiving resignation letters almost every day. The HR associate
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 simply signed off each one and told the researcher, ‘they [the workers] have made their
4 decisions and we do not hold them back’. The company had thus developed an approach
5 which both highlighted the developmental nature of its skills training and normalised
6 employees quitting, allowing it to control costs through labour mobility. Meanwhile, workers
7 were told that they were welcome to ‘come back home’ when they wanted to, as the HR
8 explained to me, ‘we keep the door open and would re-hire former workers in busy seasons’.
9

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17 Given the seasonal fluctuation of business in TypingKids and the job opportunities
18 available in the local cluster, workers were used to the idea of quitting. As one worker
19 reflected, ‘we stay during the busy seasons and we are free to job-hop during the low seasons
20 to secure a higher basic pay’. Many workers said they planned to leave for other jobs after
21 accumulating experience in TypingKids.
22
23
24
25
26
27

28
29
30 Overall, the management approach of TypingKids has a symbolic authority analogous
31 to a school. Managers are cast as the workers’ ‘teachers’, with the responsibility to protect
32 and take care of them both at and outside work, while motivating them to learn and practice
33 both technical and social skills and eventually supporting them to graduate from the ‘school’.
34 Accordingly, workers are cast as ‘kids’ who are immature, inexperienced and lack skills and
35 self control. Such an image is rooted in the workers’ socio-demographic identity as ‘migrant
36 workers’ and contrasted with the management’s identity as ‘urban citizens’. Management
37 systematically and deliberately infantilises workers by denying the value and validity of
38 workers’ past experiences and perspectives on urban life and work. Thus, the foundations for
39 labour control are created and this is then achieved through management’s role in ‘guiding’
40 workers through a new world (i.e. the urban life) and helping them to survive and eventually
41 succeed in this world; a ‘tough love’ approach is enacted in the purported interests of
42 individual employee’s future life in the city. At the same time, and while the company
43 maintains flexibility in employment costs through variable pay and the voluntary turnover of
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 employees, the most damaging aspects of precarious work in terms of loss of employment
4
5 and the stress related to this are potentially ameliorated by the prospect of alternative
6
7 employment.
8
9

10 Centrifugal paternalism enables TypingKids to achieve its strategic goals in several
11
12 ways. First, while other companies prefer experienced workers, the centrifugal paternalism in
13
14 TypingKids is used to manage a segment of the labour force that is generally undervalued by
15
16 the market: young graduates from technical schools. TypingKids hires these graduates at
17
18 comparatively low cost and rapidly prepares them to work for the busy seasons after three
19
20 months of training. In doing so, TypingKids secures a predictable and low cost labour supply
21
22 without having to use agency workers as other companies do. Second, while other companies
23
24 struggle to keep agency workers motivated and satisfied, TypingKids' 'tough love' approach
25
26 appears to have generated high commitment and relative satisfaction among workers. This is
27
28 achieved by preparing workers for their future career and life in the urban city, addressing
29
30 their desires for 'parental love', a sense of belonging, personal skills development, career
31
32 prospects, and future settlement as second-generation migrant workers. Third, while the use
33
34 of inexperienced workers is often associated with quality and productivity concerns,
35
36 TypingKids has managed to impose discipline and encouraged hard-working ethics by
37
38 linking these with the education of young workers in the 'right' mindsets and norms needed
39
40 in the urban world, stressing these as the gateway to future success. By offering training and
41
42 development opportunities, TypingKids has produced higher quality labour than is available
43
44 directly from the agencies so that they can offer high-quality services and retain clients. Last
45
46 but not least, in contrast to the centripetal paternalism that is long-term oriented, the
47
48 centrifugal paternalism developed in TypingKids is in line with the company's needs for
49
50 flexible labour. It achieves this by strategically scheduling labour recruitment and training
51
52 according to the seasonal fluctuations of its business as well as the patterns of technical
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 schools, deploying a pay-by-piece reward system and letting workers voluntarily leave during
4
5 the low seasons.
6
7

8 9 **Discussion: understanding a new form of paternalism**

10
11 Our exploratory study has identified a distinctive, novel management regime
12 developed by the organisation to manage tensions in neoliberal capitalism between the need
13 for a flexible workforce with precarious jobs and the need for dedicated and motivated
14 workers to deliver demanding tasks. Drawing on a labour process framing, we extend the
15 well-established concept of paternalism to theorise this management approach as a novel and
16 distinctive form. We term this ‘centrifugal paternalism’ and, in this section, we first analyse
17 the similarities and differences between our case and centripetal paternalism before
18 discussing the contextual features that inform the development of centrifugal paternalism.
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

29 The most important similarity shared between TypingKids and other cases of
30 paternalism is that they all organise employment relations along the lines of ‘adult-like’
31 employers and ‘child-like’ employees and they all involve employers’ commitments to help
32 employees develop their capabilities. As with the paternalists in the early industrialised UK
33 and US, managers in TypingKids believe that they shoulder some responsibility to help their
34 employees cope with their working lives. Indeed, there are also similarities in how migrant
35 workers (and immigrants in the US case) were assisted in their capacity to survive the
36 changes wrought through industrialisation. In our case study, this includes help to integrate
37 and settle when moving to an urban city from the countryside. Having experienced urban life
38 and a sense of belonging, these managers assume superior competence over their migrant
39 workers and believe that they act in the best interests of the workers as their ‘teachers’. Under
40 their perceived authority and greater expertise in urban living, the management in
41 TypingKids establishes a paternalistic system claiming to help workers with their
42 identification with, and life in, the city. This is achieved by developing workplace practices to
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 ‘guide’, ‘educate’, ‘take care of’ and ‘socialise’ workers. These practices constitute
4 something more substantive than a paternalistic style of leadership (Chan, 2014; Pellegrini
5 and Scandura, 2008), or the rhetoric of paternalism that has been reported in other
6 contemporary workplaces both in the West (Fleming, 2005; Kerfoot and Knights, 1993) and
7 China (Choi and Peng, 2015) and represent substantial efforts to prepare workers for the
8 future and facilitate their urban settlement in the long-run. Efforts that, as we have seen, also
9 deliver on the needs of the company for a flexible and motivated workforce.
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18

19 However, along with these key similarities, the ‘tough love’ approach in TypingKids
20 differs in fundamental ways from the paternalism that has been reported previously. While
21 centripetal paternalism is based on long-term commitment and loyalty between employers
22 and employees, our case reveals two-way but short-term commitment. The company provides
23 the migrant workers with much needed training and guidance in return for their labour but
24 this is understood to be for a finite period. TypingKids delivers a strong message about its
25 moral responsibility in helping the migrant workers to achieve the transition from
26 dependence to independence over a relatively short period of time so that they are able to
27 settle down and succeed in the city by ‘graduating’ from the company. This stands in contrast
28 with a centripetal paternalistic work regime in which dependence is deepened over time. In
29 the context of highly seasonal demand, TypingKids’ business model benefits considerably
30 from this highly flexible and short-term orientated employment relationship; there is no
31 intention to provide and maintain long-term employment. The company presents itself as a
32 career ‘springboard’ for workers and builds its reputation on the skills training offered to new
33 recruits. It normalises employees quitting by encouraging workers to ‘graduate’ from training
34 and pursue other opportunities. The whole management system is designed for new, young
35 workers which, to a certain extent, forces relatively older, more experienced and skilled
36 workers to leave and makes the labour force more mobile. From the workers’ perspective,
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 few of them stay in the firm for a long time, never mind the life-time employment historically
4 common under earlier forms of paternalism. Workers are used to the notion of job-hopping
5 and, therefore, instead of stabilising the labour force and lengthening service as with
6 centripetal paternalism, centrifugal paternalism features a more dynamic and mobile
7 workforce with the company 'returning' their employees to the labour market.
8
9

10
11
12
13
14
15 In this study, we take a comprehensive view of paternalism, studying it as a
16 management regime that emerges within and is embedded in the specifics of the socio-
17 political context. Such a comprehensive view is consistent with how paternalism has been
18 researched in the literature (Burawoy, 1985, Ackers, 1998). It has been argued that
19 paternalism represents either a transitional form of management regime from pre-industrial to
20 industrial society (Burawoy, 1985), or a counteraction to the ascendant marketisation and
21 casualisation of employment as part of the Polanyi 'double movement' (see Kalleberg, 2009).
22 However, *centrifugal* paternalism presents a form of contemporary management regime that
23 accommodates the needs of flexible employment and production. It also speaks to the
24 individual employee, consistent with the atomising nature of neoliberalism. Rather than long-
25 term job security, centrifugal paternalism is centred on the importance of personal
26 development and achievements. While there is attention to workers' physical and
27 psychological wellbeing, more emphasis is given to developing their personal skills and
28 knowledge, motivating them to do better, and 'move on'. In TypingKids, workers were
29 strongly advised not to pay much attention to material reward (i.e. pay and benefits) in job-
30 seeking but to prioritise learning opportunities and skills training. Accordingly, it was widely
31 held that good employers are those providing employees with learning and career
32 opportunities, even if their levels of wages and benefits are basic.
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55

56 What are the social and institutional factors that give rise to and sustain the centrifugal
57 paternalism found in TypingKids? First and foremost, the social composition of the labour
58
59
60

1
2
3 markets to be found in China's industrialising urban centres (and thus of TypingKids'
4 workforce) plays a vital role in shaping the management regime. This is an important feature
5
6 in previous analyses of the development of paternalism, but there are variations in the details.
7
8 In the historical Western context, it has been argued that the greater presence of female and
9
10 immigrant workers contributed to the rise of paternalism (Meyer, 1985). In the case of
11
12 TypingKids, however, most significant in the rise of this particular form of paternalism is that
13
14 the workforce is primarily made up of young, second-generation, rural-to-urban migrant
15
16 workers. These workers lack identification with and experience of working and living in
17
18 urban cities. Yet, realising the lack of opportunity in their rural home, they are determined to
19
20 seek a way to stay in the city and pursue a successful career. Speaking to both the fears and
21
22 the desires of this group of migrant workers, the essence of paternalism in TypingKids is its
23
24 view of the migrant workers as children to be cared for and socialised to the social and
25
26 cultural norms of urban society.
27
28
29
30
31
32

33 Second, we suggest that it is the institutionalised, long-lasting rural-urban chasm in
34
35 China that enables managers in TypingKids to claim authority based on their status and
36
37 experience as urban residents. As Pun and Lu (2010) argued, China's industrialisation is
38
39 accompanied by an *unfinished* proletarianisation of migrant labour. That is, while the Chinese
40
41 authorities called on rural workers to work in the city, they did not want them to stay in the
42
43 cities for extended periods. Therefore, even after 40 years of industrialisation, most migrant
44
45 workers still have to constantly move between cities and rural families, failing to establish
46
47 their urban citizenship and more permanent settlement. However, the management of second-
48
49 generation migrant workers at TypingKids is very different from that experienced by the first
50
51 generation and appears to have avoided the resistance prompted by more authoritarian
52
53 approaches that has been reported elsewhere (Qin et al., 2018). In this context, the
54
55 paternalistic system claiming to help workers with their identification with, and successful
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 life in, the city is attractive to newly arrived rural workers and fosters their commitment. It
4 particularly addresses the desires of the second-generation migrants to develop skills,
5 integrate in urban life and eventually claim a sense of belonging in the city. Here we can see
6 the *interaction* of the conditioning context and practical agency of management that is
7 highlighted in multilevel model for contextualizing human resource management (Vincent et
8 al., 2020)).
9

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17 Third, at the local level, the specific institutional context in Dalian City and the local
18 BPO cluster play a significant role in supporting centrifugal paternalism. Unlike the first-tier
19 Chinese cities with populations over five million such as Beijing, Shanghai and Shenzhen,
20 where migrant workers are subject to the most stringent *hukou* administration and
21 institutional discrimination (Chan, 2018), Dalian City, as a second-tier city, is one of the
22 pioneers that has embarked on *hukou* reform. Since the 2000s, Dalian City has issued policies
23 to open *hukou* restrictions and grant local urban *hukou* to migrant workers who meet the
24 required skill, financial or employment requirements. Although those entry requirements
25 were set high, the loosening up of the *hukou* administration gives migrant workers hope and
26 belief that there are possibilities for them to claim urban citizenship and integrate into urban
27 life if they follow the paternal instructions given by the management in TypingKids. The
28 local government strategy focusing on developing BPO business with Japan and the
29 associated opportunities to study in local technical schools allow migrants to undertake
30 ‘white-collar, office work’ instead of the traditional 3D (dirty, demanding and dangerous)
31 jobs that most migrant workers do in other cities. This suggests that centrifugal paternalism
32 founded in Dalian may not be generalisable to the largest Chinese cities where there is no
33 current prospect of reform of the *hukou* system. Furthermore, the aggregation of hundreds of
34 BPO firms in the cluster requiring a similar set of data-input skills enables TypingKids to
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 underpin its paternalistic systems through providing skills training that has wider local labour
4
5 market currency.
6

7
8 Lastly, in Burawoy's (1985) accounts of factory regimes, he argues that a paternalistic
9
10 form of production politics is most likely to emerge where workers are dependent on a given
11
12 employer and are employed by a firm that enjoys a monopolistic economic position (as still
13
14 evident in contemporary company towns (Moonesirust and Brown, 2021)). In appearance,
15
16 our case seems to contrast sharply with these conditions in that there are hundreds of BPO
17
18 firms in the business cluster where TypingKids is located. However, it is important to note
19
20 that although workers are not relying on TypingKids for job security, they do count on
21
22 TypingKids for skills and training to pursue other job opportunities in the cluster.
23
24 TypingKids is one of the oldest and most reputable firms in the cluster and provides
25
26 comparatively more valuable and systematic skills training to workers. It is widely
27
28 recognised that BPO workers trained by TypingKids are valued more highly in the local
29
30 labour market. This dependence on skills development is then extended by the management
31
32 in its claims to 'urbanise' workers and elevate them to a better standard of urban life, which
33
34 matches well with the second-generation migrants' desire to pursue a successful career and
35
36 life in the city.
37
38
39
40
41

42 Therefore, in TypingKids, the workers are most dependent on the company during the
43
44 first period after they graduate from the technical schools. Once they are equipped with skills
45
46 and experience, they are open to job opportunities available in the wider job market. The
47
48 company regards itself as a career springboard and encourages workers to leave once they
49
50 become 'independent'. In other words, whereas in centripetal paternalism the employers are
51
52 actively involved in strengthening and deepening the level of worker dependence over time
53
54 through their extensive involvement in workers' lives, work and community, the company in
55
56 our case draws in an initially dependent workforce but gradually reduces worker dependence
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 through their training, personal development practices, mentoring and guidance. This
4
5 contrasting nature of dependence and the direction of the development of the relationship
6
7 between employer and employee overtime is reflected in what we capture in the use of the
8
9 terms ‘centripetal paternalism’ and ‘centrifugal paternalism’; in previous examples,
10
11 dependence is gradually strengthened drawing workers further into the organisation (the
12
13 deepening relations of a ‘family’) whereas in this instance, dependence is gradually reduced
14
15 as workers move outwards and towards their exit from the firm (graduating from ‘school’).
16
17
18
19

20 **Conclusion and implication**

21
22 The emergence of neoliberal market economies has given rise to increasing
23
24 casualisation in employment practices, and to an increased reliance on temporary and agency
25
26 workers. While bringing flexibility to the organisation, this can often result in high labour
27
28 turnover, low employee commitment, and worsened management-employee relations. This
29
30 study has shown how an organisation sought to develop a distinctive management regime to
31
32 elicit commitment from workers while retaining flexibility in employment. We have
33
34 theorised this management regime as a variation of paternalism, which we term ‘centrifugal
35
36 paternalism’, and we have analysed the social, economic and political contexts in which it
37
38 emerged and developed. In so doing, we respond to the concerns of scholars that current
39
40 organisation theory is less well embedded in its societal contexts than was the case during its
41
42 formative periods, with the result that much work appears to be trapped in a ‘theory cave’ and
43
44 have very little to say about or to society (Hinings and Meyer, 2018; Vincent et al., 2020).
45
46
47
48
49

50
51 In identifying this new management regime – centrifugal paternalism – that has
52
53 emerged in China during one of the greatest rural to urban migrations in history, we extend
54
55 the well-established concept of paternalism and discuss how this distinctive new form of
56
57 paternalism has developed in a specific contemporary societal setting. We find that the
58
59 characteristics and needs of migrant workers during a period of place-based industrialisation
60

1
2
3 played a critical role in the emergence of centrifugal paternalism. It is the migrant workers'
4 desire to settle in urban cities and the institutional barriers (i.e. *hukou*) they face in doing so
5 that enable the management to claim authority based on their status and experience as urban
6 residents and develop a management system to help the workers adapt to the new urban cities.
7
8 This context has similarities to the periods of industrialization in the UK and the US that saw
9 managers develop management regimes that prepared migrant (and immigrant) workers for
10 industrial work and life.
11
12

13
14
15 Under centrifugal paternalism, the employer takes responsibility for preparing its
16 employees to cope with the challenges presented in migrating from rural to urban society.
17 Like previous forms, this form of paternalism also attempts to 'remake' employees and
18 develop relational reciprocity, but in ways that are time-limited and place emphasis on
19 individual development in an economic context that does not support long-term employment
20 nor job security. In this sense, the pertinent social metaphor is not that of the family and
21 parent-child relationship which characterises centripetal paternalism; centrifugal paternalism
22 is better understood as the workplace as school with teacher-child relations that see the
23 employer prepare the employee for 'graduation' to a future career elsewhere and into the
24 wider urban world.
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41

42 The case study presented is a specific example of how a management approach has
43 been developed in a particular context of industrialisation involving second generation rural-
44 to-urban migrant labour in China. Nonetheless, the evidence and theorisation presented here
45 suggest that a contemporary manifestation of paternalism continues to be relevant despite
46 economic changes that have eroded the prospects of permanent employment and job security.
47 Moreover, our findings may have wider implications for management and employment under
48 neoliberalism. It is true that China is somewhat unusual in that the migrant workforce is
49 recruited domestically and is part of the dominant ethnic group. However, there are
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 similarities between migrant workers in China and many precarious immigrant workers
4 globally in terms of their needs to adapt to new work and life environments, to learn skills
5 and to ‘earn’ long-term citizenship and settlement rights according to the requirements set by
6 the country or city of destination. As firms increasingly recruit internationally and engage in
7 helping their immigrant workers in integrating and settling in their new country/city, an
8 approach of centrifugal paternalism may become an increasingly prevalent option. Given its
9 emphasis on (re-)skilling and personal development, centrifugal paternalism, with firms
10 acting as ‘preparatory schools’, could also be relevant to workers who lose out under the
11 pressures of globalisation (e.g. blue-collar workers in the US ‘rust-belt’) and those whose
12 jobs might be displaced by technological changes (such as the introduction of robots or
13 artificial intelligence) or market transformations in the future. Whatever the wider relevance
14 of centrifugal paternalism proves to be, a research approach which combines a sensitivity to
15 workers’ roles and experiences, locating these within the specific workplace relationships
16 between managers and employees, and interprets these within the social structural context of
17 such contemporary developments should remain prominent in future analyses.

18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39 ¹ This pseudonym was chosen because managers refer to BPO workers as “kids”—a
40 phenomenon we discuss below. The real name of the firm has no reference to kids.

41 42 43 44 45 **Acknowledgements**

46 Jingqi Zhu wishes to acknowledge Cardiff Business School for funding the PhD project
47 underpinning this research. The authors thank Andrew Brown, Associate Editor, and the three
48 anonymous reviewers for their constructive feedback and guidance throughout the review
49 process. We also thank Mike Reed, Andrew Sturdy, Matt Vidal, Jeff Sallaz, Steven Vallas, as
50 well as participants at EGOS 2019 and the HRMWE seminar at Newcastle University
51 Business School, for helpful comments given on earlier versions of this paper. Lastly, we
52 would like to thank the AOM Annual Conference 2017 (Critical Management Studies
53 Division) for valuable comments and recognizing an earlier version of this paper as the 'Best
54 Critical Paper on International Business'.

55 56 57 **Funding**

58 **Cardiff Business School - PhD scholarship**
59
60

References

- 1
2
3
4
5 Abegglen JC (1973) *Management and Worker: The Japanese Solution*. Sophia University.
6
7
8 Abercrombie N and Hill S (1976) Paternalism and Patronage. *The British Journal of*
9
10 *Sociology* 27(4): 413–429.
11
12 Ackers P (1998) On Paternalism : Seven Observations on the Uses and Abuses of the
13
14 Concept in Industrial Relations , Past and Present. *Historical Studies of Industrial*
15
16 *Relations* 5: 173–193.
17
18 Ackroyd S and Thompson P (1999) *Organisational Misbehaviour*. London: Sage.
19
20
21 Barley S and Kunda G (1992) Design and devotion: Surges of rational and normative
22
23 ideologies of control in managerial discourse. *Administrative Science Quarterly* 37(3):
24
25 363–399.
26
27
28 Bendix R (1959) Industrialization , Ideologies , and Social Structure. *American Sociological*
29
30 *Review* 24(5): 613–623.
31
32
33 Brannan MJ, Parsons E and Priola V (2015) Brands at Work: The Search for Meaning in
34
35 Mundane Work. *Organization Studies* 36(1): 29–53.
36
37
38 Burawoy M (1979) *Manufacturing Consent: Changes in the Workplace under Monopoly*
39
40 *Capitalism*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
41
42
43 Burawoy M (1985) *The Politics of Production: Factory Regimes Under Capitalism and*
44
45 *Socialism*. Norfolk: The Thetford Press.
46
47
48 Burawoy M (1998) The Extended Case Method. *Sociological Theory* 16(1): 4–33.
49
50
51 Chan A and Unger J (2009) A Chinese State Enterprise under the Reforms: What Model of
52
53 Capitalism? *The China Journal* 62: 1–26.
54
55
56 Chan KW (2018) China’s Hukou System at 60 : Continuity and Reform. In: Yep R, Wang J,
57
58 and Johnson T (eds.) *Handbook on Urban Development in China*. Edward Elgar.
59
60
61 Chan SCH (2014) Paternalistic leadership and employee voice: Does information sharing

- 1
2
3 matter? *Human Relations* 67(6): 667–693.
4
5
6 Chen C (2008) *Some Assembly Required: Work, Community, and Politics in China's Rural*
7
8 *Enterprises*. Cambridge and London: Harvard University Asia Center.
9
10 Cheng Z (2014) The New Generation of Migrant Workers in Urban China. In: Cheng Z,
11
12 Wang M, and Chen J (eds.) *Urban China in the New Era: Market Reforms, Current*
13
14 *State, and the Road Forward*. Berlin: Springer Berlin Heidelberg, pp. 125–153.
15
16
17 Choi SYP and Peng Y (2015) Humanized management? Capital and migrant labour in a time
18
19 of labour shortage in South China. *Human Relations* 68(2): 287–304.
20
21
22 Chou W-CG (2002) The transformation of industrial authority and paternalistic capitalism in
23
24 the global economy: case studies of Taiwan's textiles industries. *International Journal*
25
26 *of Human Resource Management* 13(3): 550–568.
27
28
29 Corbin J and Strauss A (2008) *Basics of Qualitative Research: Techniques for Developing*
30
31 *Grounded Theory*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
32
33
34 Dalian Government (2012) Dalian shi huji zhunru guiding dazhengfa [2012] 55 hao.
35
36 Available at: <http://www.ga.dl.gov.cn/publish/2013116134508.asp>.
37
38
39 Delbridge R (1998) *Life on the Line in Contemporary Manufacturing: The Workplace*
40
41 *Experience of Lean Production and the "Japanese" Model*. Oxford: Oxford University
42
43 Press.
44
45
46 Delbridge R (2006) Extended Review: The Vitality of Labour Process Analysis.
47
48 *Organization Studies* 27(8): 1209–1219.
49
50
51 Dore RP (1973) *British Factory, Japanese Factory: The Origins of National Diversity in*
52
53 *Industrial Relations*. London: George Allen & Unwin.
54
55
56 Drummond D (1995) *Crewe: Railway Town, Company and People 1840-1914*. Scolar Press.
57
58
59 Edwards R (1979) *Contested Terrain: The Transformation of the Workplace in the Twentieth*
60
61 *Century*. London: Heinemann.

- 1
2
3 Fleming P (2005) ‘Kindergarden Cop’: Paternalism and Resistance in a High-Commitment
4
5 Workplace. *Journal of Management Studies* 42(7): 1469–1489.
6
7
8 Fleming P (2017) The Human Capital Hoax: Work, Debt and Insecurity in the Era of
9
10 Uberization. *Organization Studies* 38(5): 691–709.
11
12
13 Frenkel S and Yu C (2014) Chinese migrants’ work experience and city identification:
14
15 Challenging the underclass thesis. *Human Relations* 68(2): 261–285.
16
17
18 Friedman ED and Lee CK (2010) Remaking the world of Chinese labour : a 30-year
19
20 retrospective. *British Journal of Industrial Relations* 48(3): 507–533.
21
22
23 Friedman TL (2005) *The World Is Flat: A Brief History of the Twenty-First Century*. New
24
25 York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux (FSG).
26
27
28 Gandini A (2019) Labour process theory and the gig economy. *Human Relations* 72(6):
29
30 1039–1056.
31
32
33 Gordon A (1998) *The Wages of Affluence: Labor and Management in Postwar Japan*.
34
35 Harvard University Press.
36
37
38 Hall J (1987) *Like a Family: The Making of a Southern Cotton Mill World*. Chapel Hill:
39
40 University of North Carolina Press.
41
42
43 Hannan K (2008) China: Migrant Workers Want “Decent Work.” *The Copenhagen Journal*
44
45 *of Asian Studies* 26(2): 60–81.
46
47
48 Hareven T (1982) *Family Time and Industrial Time: The Relationship Between the Family*
49
50 *and Work in a New England Industrial Community*. Combridge: Cambridge University
51
52 Press.
53
54
55 Hazama H and Kaminski J (1979) Japanese Labor-Management Relations and Uno Riemon.
56
57 *The Journal of Japanese Studies* 5(1): 71–106.
58
59
60 Hinings B and Meyer RE (2018) *Starting Points: Intellectual and Institutional Foundations*
of *Organization Theory*. Cambridge University Press.

- 1
2
3 Joyce P (1980) *Work, Society and Politics: The Culture of the Factory in Later Victorian*
4
5 *England*. Brighton: The Harvester Press.
6
7
8 Kalleberg AL (2009) Precarious Work, Insecure Workers: in Transition Employment
9
10 Relations. *American Sociological Review* 74(1): 1–22.
11
12 Kerfoot D and Knights D (1993) Management, Masculinity and Manipulation: from
13
14 Paternalism to Corporate Strategy in Financial Services in Britain. *Journal of*
15
16 *Management Studies* 30(4): 659–677.
17
18
19 Littler C (1982) *The Development of the Labour Process in Capitalist Societies*. Heinemann
20
21 Educational Books.
22
23
24 Lu X and Perry EJ (1997) *Danwei: The Changing Chinese Workplace in Historical and*
25
26 *Comparative Perspective*. M.E. Sharpe.
27
28
29 Mandle JR (1984) Strategies of Change in Paternalistic Socialism: The Case of China.
30
31 *International Journal of Social Economics* 11(3/4): 3–11.
32
33
34 Meyer S (1985) *The Five Dollar Day: Labour Management and Social Control in the Ford*
35
36 *Motor Company*. Albany, N.Y.
37
38
39 Moonesirust E and Brown AD (2021) Company towns and the governmentality of desired
40
41 identities. *Human Relations* 74(4): 502–526.
42
43
44 National Bureau of Statistics of China (2019) *2019 Nongmingong Jiance diaocha baogao*.
45
46 Available at: http://www.stats.gov.cn/tjsj/zxfb/202004/t20200430_1742724.html.
47
48
49 Newby H (1975) The Deferential Dialectic. *Comparative Studies in Society and History*
50
51 17(2): 139–164.
52
53
54 O’Mahoney J and Sturdy A (2016) Power and the diffusion of management ideas: The case
55
56 of McKinsey & Co. *Management Learning* 47(3): 247–265.
57
58
59 Pellegrini EK and Scandura TA (2008) Paternalistic Leadership: A Review and Agenda for
60
Future Research. *Journal of Management* 34(3): 566–593.

- 1
2
3 Pun N and Smith C (2007) Putting transnational labour process in its place: the dormitory
4 labour regime in post-socialist China. *Work, Employment and Society* 21(1): 27–45.
5
6
7
8 Qin X, Hom PW and Xu M (2019) Am I a peasant or a worker? An identity strain perspective
9 on turnover among developing-world migrants. *Human Relations* 72(4): 801–833.
10
11
12 Sallaz J (2015) Permanent Pedagogy: How Post-Fordist Firms Generate Effort but Not
13 Consent. *Work and Occupations* 42(1): 3–34.
14
15
16
17 Sheppard HL and Sheppard AP (1951) Paternalism in employer-employee relationships. *The*
18 *American Journal of Nursing* 51(1): 16–18.
19
20
21 Swider S (2015) Building China: precarious employment among migrant construction
22 workers. *Work Employment And Society* 29(1): 41–59.
23
24
25
26 Taylor P and Bain P (1999) ‘ An assembly line in the head ’: work and employee relations in
27 the call centre. *Industrial Relations Journal* 30(2): 101–117.
28
29
30
31 Tsutsui WM (1997) Rethinking the Paternalist Paradigm in Japanese Industrial Management.
32 *Business and Economic History* 26(2): 561–572.
33
34
35
36 Vincent S, Bamber GJ, Delbridge R, et al. (2020) Situating human resource management in
37 the political economy: Multilevel theorising and opportunities for kaleidoscopic
38 imagination. *Human Resource Management Journal* 30(4): 461–477.
39
40
41
42 Warner M (2009) ‘Making Sense’ of HRM in China: Setting the Scene. *The International*
43 *Journal of Human Resource Management* 20(11): 2169–2193.
44
45
46
47 Weatherburn M (2020) Human Relations’ invented traditions: Sociotechnical research and
48 worker motivation at the interwar Rowntree Cocoa Works. *Human Relations* 73(7):
49 899–923.
50
51
52
53
54 Wood AJ, Graham M, Lehdonvirta V, et al. (2019) Good Gig, Bad Gig: Autonomy and
55 Algorithmic Control in the Global Gig Economy. *Work Employment And Society* 33(1):
56 56–75.
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 Xiang B and Tan S (2005) Does migration research matter in China? A review of migration
4
5 research and its relations to policy since the 1980s. *International Journal on*
6
7 *Multicultural Societies* 7(1): 11–32.

8
9
10 Ye J and Lu P (2011) Differentiated childhoods: impacts of rural labor migration on left-
11
12 behind children in China. *The Journal of Peasant Studies* 38(2): 355–377.

13
14 Zhu J and Morgan G (2018) Global supply chains, institutional constraints and firm level
15
16 adaptations: A comparative study of Chinese service outsourcing firms. *Human*
17
18 *Relations* 71(4): 510–535.

25 26 **Biographies**

27
28
29 Jingqi Zhu is a Senior Lecturer in International Business at University of Liverpool
30
31 Management School. Her research examines how institutions shape globalizing
32
33 organisations and individuals, with a focus on professional service sectors and IT
34
35 offshore outsourcing. She has published in *Human Relations*, *Accounting, Organizations*
36
37 *and Society*, *Organization, Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, *Journal of*
38
39 *Professions and Organization*.

40
41
42
43
44
45 Rick Delbridge is Professor of Organizational Analysis, Cardiff Business School, Cardiff
46
47 University, and co-convenor of the Centre for Innovation Policy Research (CIPR). His
48
49 research interests include work and workplace relations, critical human resource
50
51 management, the management of innovation and theorizing organization. He has
52
53 published widely on these and related topics in *Academy of Management Review*,
54
55 *Human Relations*, *Journal of Management Studies*, *Organization Science* and
56
57 *Organization Studies*.