Hypertension

EPIDEMIOLOGY/POPULATION STUDIES



Impact of the 2003 to 2018 Population Salt Intake Reduction Program in England

A Modeling Study

Sergi Alonso[®], Monique Tan[®], Changqiong Wang, Seamus Kent, Linda Cobiac, Graham A. MacGregor, Feng J. He, Borislava Mihaylova[®]

ABSTRACT: The United Kingdom was among the first countries to introduce a salt reduction program in 2003 to reduce cardiovascular disease (CVD) incidence risk. Despite its initial success, the program has stalled recently and is yet to achieve national and international targets. We used age- and sex-stratified salt intake of 19 to 64 years old participants in the National Diet and Nutrition Surveys 2000 to 2018 and a multistate life table model to assess the effects of the voluntary dietary salt reduction program on premature CVD, quality-adjusted survival, and health care and social care costs in England. The program reduced population-level salt intake from 9.38 grams/day per adult (SE, 0.16) in 2000 to 8.38 grams/day per adult (SE, 0.17) in 2018. Compared with a scenario of persistent 2000 levels, assuming that the population-level salt intake is maintained at 2018 values, by 2050, the program is projected to avoid 83140 (95% CI, 73710-84520) premature ischemic heart disease (IHD) cases and 110730 (95% CI, 98390-112260) premature strokes, generating 542850 (95% CI, 529020–556850) extra quality-adjusted life-years and £1640 million (95% CI, £1570–£1660) health care cost savings for the adult population of England. We also projected the gains of achieving the World Health Organization target of 5 grams/day per adult by 2030, which by 2050 would avert further 87 870 (95% CI, 82 050-88 470) premature IHD cases, 126010 (95% CI, 118600–126460) premature strokes and achieve £1260 million (95% CI, £1180–£1260) extra health care savings compared with maintaining 2018 levels. Strengthening the salt reduction program to achieve further reductionsinpopulationsaltintakeand CVD burden should be a high priority. (Hypertension. 2021; 77: 1086-1094. DOI: 10.1161/ HYPERTENSIONAHA.120.16649.) • Data Supplement

Key Words: cardiovascular disease = diet = health care cost = incidence = ischemic heart disease = salt reduction = stroke = United Kingdom

Excess salt intake is strongly linked with raised blood pressure (BP) and thereby increased risks of cardiovascular disease (CVD), as well as with kidney disease, gastric cancer, and osteoporosis,^{1–5} and is recognized as a global health challenge.⁶ Raised BP (>115/75 mm Hg) is responsible for half of the burden of ischemic heart disease (IHD) and >60% of stroke burden.⁷ Consequently, the World Health Organization (WHO) and national governments have issued recommendations to reduce population-level salt intake.^{6,8} Different strategies have been implemented to achieve such reductions, most of them involving industry engagement toward voluntary salt reformulation in processed food.⁹ Partial success of such strategies has been observed in high-income countries, where about 80% of consumed salt comes from processed foods,¹⁰ including the United Kingdom where it represents up to 86% of all salt intake.¹¹ Nevertheless, no country has yet achieved salt intake reductions to recommended levels.

Since 1996, the nongovernmental organization, Consensus Action on Salt and Health, have continuously raised awareness about the health benefits of

The Data Supplement is available with this article at https://www.ahajournals.org/doi/suppl/10.1161/HYPERTENSIONAHA.120.16649.

For Sources of Funding and Disclosures, see page 1093.

© 2021 The Authors. *Hypertension* is published on behalf of the American Heart Association, Inc., by Wolters Kluwer Health, Inc. This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial-NoDerivs License, which permits use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided that the original work is properly cited, the use is noncommercial, and no modifications or adaptations are made.

Hypertension is available at www.ahajournals.org/journal/hyp

Correspondence to: Sergi Alonso, Institute of Population Health Sciences, Barts and The London School of Medicine and Dentistry, Queen Mary, University of London, Yvonne Carter Bldg, 58 Turner St, London E1 2AB, United Kingdom. Email sergio.alonso@qmul.ac.uk

Novelty and Significance

What Is New?

• Between 2000 and 2018, the daily salt intake of adults in England declined by 1 gram/day, from 9.38 to 8.38 grams/day.

What Is Relevant?

We used 2000 to 2018 representative population surveys' salt intake data and a multistate life table model to project the impact of the 2000 to 2018 salt reduction program on cardiovascular disease, quality of life, health care and social costs and value of further salt reduction efforts in England.

Nonstandard Abbreviations and Acronyms

| CVD | cardiovascular disease | |
|------|----------------------------|--|
| IHD | ischemic heart disease | |
| BP | blood pressure | |
| WHO | World Health Organization | |
| QALY | quality-adjusted life-year | |

reducing salt intake in the United Kingdom through providing scientific evidence and advocating political action.¹² Such efforts contributed to a voluntary agreement between the United Kingdom government and the food industry. In 2003 to 2010, the Food Standards Agency, in collaboration with the food industry, established salt reduction targets in several food categories under a voluntary scheme,13 which also involved product labeling, public awareness campaigns, and monitoring of targets' achievement. Reductions in the added salt in processed food were implemented gradually following a stepwise process.¹⁴ Consequently, the average population-level salt intake was reduced by 15% in the period 2000 to 2011,^{15–17} with the decline attributed to food companies reformulating processed products rather than consumers switching to a lower salt diet.¹³ The program's success was based on the fact that gradual marginal reductions are undetected by human taste receptors,18 thus, not affecting consumers' preferences or industry sales.

After several years of sustained salt intake reductions aimed at limiting the burden of excess salt by encouraging companies to reformulate recipes, in 2013, the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence recommended a maximum salt intake of 6 grams/day per adult by 2015 and 3 grams/day per adult by 2025.¹⁹ From 2011 to 2017, the salt reduction program continued under the Department of Health as part of the Public

Summary

We project that, if 2018 salt intake levels are maintained, by 2050, the 2000 to 2018 salt reductions would have led to 193870 fewer adults developing premature cardiovascular disease; 542850 more quality-adjusted life years; and large savings from reduced health care and social care utilization. If the 5 grams/day, World Health Organization recommended salt intake is achieved by 2030 in England, these benefits could double.

Health Responsibility Deal. It first aimed to meet the 2012 targets for reducing salt added into 85 food categories, such as bread, cheese, cereals, or soups; but it lacked the political commitment to achieve further reductions necessary to progress toward the recommended levels.¹⁵ Few of the proposed actions were implemented under the Responsibility Deal and, thus, the program failed to achieve the salt intake targeted: in 2014, the average population-level salt intake among adults remained at about 8 grams/day.²⁰ By 2018, however, an increase in salt intake was reported in adult women while no progress was reported in adult men.²¹

The present study evaluates the long-term effects of the 2003 to 2018 salt intake reduction program in England using a model to project its effects on premature CVD, individuals' healthy survival, and health care and social care costs. Moreover, it estimates the potential effects of further salt intake reductions by 2030.

METHODS

We evaluated the health and economic impact of reductions in population-level salt intake in England during the period 2003 to 2018 by comparing population health outcomes and costs under the observed salt intake over the period 2003 to 2018 and assuming it remained at 2018 levels in 2019 to 2050 (basecase analysis) with population-level salt intake maintained at 2000 to 2001 values across the 2003 to 2050 period (comparator; Figure 1). All data used in this study are publicly available.

Salt and Sodium

The terms salt and sodium are often used interchangeably. However, on a weight basis, salt comprises 40% sodium and 60% chloride. Salt is the major source of sodium in the diet (\approx 90%). One gram of sodium=2.5 g of salt. Sodium is the term used in most scientific journals and in nutritional labels in the United States and Canada, and salt is used in Europe and other countries. We used the term salt throughout the article as it reports analysis for England.⁴



Figure 1. Population salt intake (grams/day) scenarios.

In the base-case analysis, we assessed the long-term health and economic impact of the achieved salt intake reduction during the period 2003 to 2018, with 2018 levels maintained until 2050 (base-case scenario) compared with the population-level salt intake in 2000 maintained until 2050 (area in green). In 2 further scenarios, the additional long-term impacts were assessed with further annual salt intake reductions in 2019 to 2030 of (scenario A) 1.37% (the annual reduction rate in 2000–2014); and (Scenario B) 3.36% (achieving the World Health Organization [WHO] recommendation of 5 grams/d per adult in 2030). In both scenarios, we assumed that 2030 salt-intake levels were maintained until 2050.

Population-Level Salt Intake Data

We used publicly available data on salt intake from the National Diet and Nutrition Surveys in adults 19 to 64 year of age in England²¹ that assessed salt intake by 24-hour urinary sodium excretion for a representative population sample in years 2000/2001, 2006, 2008, 2011, 2014, and 2018. The data from complete urinary sodium samples (ie, para-amino benzoic acid \geq 70%), stratified by sex and age (19–34, 35–49, \geq 50) and adjusted using age- and sex-specific survey weights were used to estimate dietary salt intake (grams/day).

Salt Reduction Program Costs

The costs of the salt reduction program were based on estimates by Collins et al,²² which were obtained from the Food Standards Agency Impact Assessment of 2009. Program activities under the Responsibility Deal were similar to those under the Food Standards Agency scheme, and, with the exception of the 2009 to 2012 media campaign, costs included: (1) food industry costs of reducing salt in specific food categories and (2) UK government costs of administering and monitoring the program. No extra food industry costs were considered as costs of labeling and reformulating specific product lines to reduce salt content were assumed to be fully absorbed during the natural product development life cycle²² and progressive salt reformulations were assumed not to impact on industry sales as consumers progressively adjust to lower-salt diets.¹⁷

UK government costs included the cost of a media campaign conducted between 2009 and 2012 (£41.62 million), as well as the cost of monitoring salt intake in the general population and monitoring food industry activities to guarantee manufacturers are labeling and effectively reducing the salt content of food products ($\pounds 2.15$ million per year each).²² Annual monitoring costs were assumed over the lifespan of the program, but future media campaigns were discontinued because of their limited effectiveness: public awareness of the salt-related harmful effects temporarily increased during the campaigns but diminished quickly again after the first campaign year.¹⁴ We present program costs for the total population of England.

The PRIMEtime-CE Model: Impact on Health and Health Care Utilization

PRIMEtime-CE is a multistate life table model, which links sociodemographic and behavioral risk factors to noncommunicable diseases' morbidity and mortality and health and social care costs.²³⁻²⁹ Figure 2 summarizes the conceptual framework in our study.

We used official statistics on age and sex stratified population distribution and all-cause mortality in England in the year 2000.^{30,31} In mid-2000, the population of England was 49.2 million, 51% of which were female, and 62% were aged above 30 years (Figure S1 in the Data Supplement). All-cause mortality rates were calculated using deaths registered by age and sex divided by corresponding population estimates (Figure S2). Population was annually adjusted in subsequent years using the age- and sex-specific rates of population increase during 2000 to 2015. We used an open cohort design to account for all adults over time.

The effects of a reduction in population-level salt intake are propagated in the model through the reduction in BP.³² The effect of salt intake on BP is based on a meta-analysis by He et



Figure 2. Conceptual framework.

PRIMEtime-CE is a multistate life table model for estimating the health and economic impact of health interventions.^{23–29} CVD indicates cardiovascular disease; NDNS, National diet and nutrition survey; ONS, office for national statistics; QALY, quality-adjusted life-year; and WHO, World Health Organization.

al,³² which estimated that a reduction in salt intake of 6 grams/ day was associated with a decrease of 5.8 mm Hg (95% Cl, 2.50-9.20) in systolic BP. Salt intake changes in the model are implemented by sex and age and account for the positive association between higher dietary salt intake and BP: for a given reduction in salt intake, the fall in systolic BP is larger in older compared with younger individuals.³³ Reductions in systolic BP are associated with reductions in risk of CVD, including IHD and stroke.³⁴ During each year in the model, IHD and stroke prevalence and incidence were computed using population impact fractions, which accounted for the proportion by which disease incidence and mortality in the population were reduced given changes in BP because of the salt reduction program. Table S1 summarizes the parameters, probability distributions, and respective data sources used in the model; as well as the data sources informing the epidemiological estimates used in PRIMEtime-CE.

Quality-adjusted life-years (QALYs) were obtained by combining life years and EQ-5D utilities, associated with included diseases,³⁵ stratified by age and sex. During each year, the extra years and QALYs, and health care and social care cost savings due to reductions in IHD and strokes associated with the salt reductions achieved, were estimated (Methods in the Data Supplement).

Base-Case Analysis

We estimated the effects of the salt reduction program for the adult population in England, aggregated in 5-year bands, over the periods 2000 to 2018 and 2019 to 2050. For both study periods, age- and sex-specific CVD morbidity and mortality were simulated annually according to the risk associated with salt intake. Starting at 2000 levels, population salt intake was assumed to change according to the population-level salt intake observed in England from 2000 to 2018 and to remain at 2018 values for the remaining time horizon. Due to lack of data, individuals older than 64 years of age were assumed to have daily salt intake corresponding to the 50- to 64-year-old age and sex category. We estimated the total premature CVD morbidity and mortality cases, life-years, and OALYs, and health care and social care costs associated with 2000 to 2018 salt intake values, and compared them with those obtained should the salt intake levels remained at 2000 levels (baseline; Figure 1). Health gains associated with the salt reduction program were expressed as: premature (ie, before 75 years of age) IHD and stroke cases avoided, and life years and QALYs gained. We considered IHD and stroke cases occurring to individuals dependent on BP reductions and adjusted for decreasing trends in prevalence of CVD according to age and sex.³⁶ We present nondiscounted CVD cases, life years and QALYs, as well as discounted at 1.5% per annum QALYs gained with the salt reduction program.³⁷

Health care and social care costs were presented in 2014 UK£ values and discounted at an annual rate of 1.5%.³⁷ Health care savings were calculated for the period 2000 to 2050 as the difference between the cumulative health care costs associated with the salt intake levels before the salt reduction program (year 2000) minus the cumulative health care costs under decreasing population salt intake in 2000 to 2018. For the base-case analysis, we further calculated the incremental costs to the UK government as the government costs associated with monitoring and administering the salt reduction program minus the cost savings due to reducing health care and/ or social care utilization.

Scenarios of Further Salt Reductions

We used PRIMEtime-CE to evaluate 2 additional scenarios with further population-level salt intake reductions after 2018. Between 2019 and 2030, we assumed a linear reduction in the average population-level salt intake (1) equivalent to the annual reduction rate of 1.37% observed over the period 2000 to 2014 (scenario A) or (2) of 3.36% to achieve WHO recommendation of 5 grams/day per adult (scenario B; Figure 1). We assumed that thereafter, salt intake was maintained at 2030 levels until 2050. For each scenario, we estimated the health outcomes and health care and social care costs associated with reduced salt intake and expressed the outcomes as the additional premature morbidity and mortality cases averted, life-years gained, OALYs gained, as well as the additional health care and social care savings compared with the base-case analysis (maintained salt intake at 2018 levels).

Sensitivity Analyses

We undertook a probabilistic sensitivity analysis to account for the uncertainty in model parameters using 1000 random draws from their probability distributions (Table S1) to estimate the SEs and 95% Cls.

Sensitivity analyses evaluated the impact of model parameters on key results. First, we projected the long-term benefits if the program had not stalled in 2014 to 2018 by assuming continued decrease in salt intake from 2014 to 2030 at the 2000 to 2014 annual rate with achieved reduction by 2030 maintained until 2050. Second, we evaluated the effect of assuming the government salt reduction program was responsible for only half of the observed 2000 to 2018 salt intake decrease. Third, we assessed the impact of using a higher effect of a decrease in salt intake on BP, as estimated from observational data under a more prolonged period of lower salt intake (compared with randomized trials), in which a decrease in salt intake of 1.4 grams/day, as measured by 24-hour urine sodium excretion in a random population sample, was associated with a fall in systolic BP of 2.7 mmHg. 1 Finally, we used a higher suggested estimate for 2014 population-level salt intake. $^{\rm 38}$

RESULTS

Reduction in Population-Level Salt Intake and Its Short and Long-Term Effects

In 2000 to 2001, the average population-level salt intake was 9.38 grams/day (SE, 0.16), 10.72 grams/ day (SE, 0.25) in men, and 8.08 grams/day (SE, 0.18) in women. By 2014, the average population-level salt intake fell to 7.58 grams/day (SE, 0.18), 8.68 grams/ day (SE, 0.27) in men, and 6.43 grams/day (SE, 0.22) in women. The 19.20% reduction in salt intake in the period 2000 to 2001 to 2014 (Table S2) was somewhat larger in younger adults with >25% reduction in individuals 35 years of age or younger. However, the salt intake trend then stalled and by 2018, men had increased their intake to 9.19 grams/day (0.29) and women to 7.58 grams/day (0.23).

Table 1 reports the estimated impact of the achieved reduction in population-level salt intake on CVD burden and health care and social care cost. The model estimated that 27 630 (95% Cl, 26580-27650) premature IHD and 39250 (95% Cl, 38500-40050) premature stroke cases were avoided during the period 2000 to 2018. These health gains translated into 33660 (95% Cl, 31840-33750) QALYs gained for the adult population in England. In that period, the overall costs of the salt reduction program reached £103 million (95% Cl, £103-£104), whereas the reduced CVD morbidity resulted in health care savings of £310 million (95% Cl, £295-£311). Overall, the salt reduction program was cost-saving, estimated to save £860 million (95% Cl, £830-£870) in health care and social care costs.

The model estimated that by 2050, even in the absence of further salt intake reductions (Table 1), 83 140 (95% CI, 73710–84520) premature IHD and 110730 (95% CI, 98390–112260) premature stroke cases would be averted by achieved reductions to date, if maintained, compared with 2000 levels. Adopting a 50-year time horizon, the estimated UK government costs for the salt intake reduction program rose to 190 million (95% CI, $\pounds 189-\pounds 191$), whereas the estimated cost savings due to reducing health care and social care utilization increased to $\pounds 7110$ million (95% CI, $\pounds 6940-\pounds 7230$), and quality of life in England increased by 542850 (95% CI, 529020–556850) QALYs, or 334660 (95% CI, 319650–343680) discounted QALYs (Table 1).

Further Salt Intake Reductions

The extra benefits with further salt intake reductions in the population of England on CVD morbidity and the health care and social care savings are shown in Table 2.

| | | | 1 | | |
|--|--------------------------|---------------------------|------------------------|--|--|
| Study outcome | 2000-2018 | 2019-2050 | Whole 2000-2050 period | | |
| Health benefits (95% CI) | | | | | |
| Premature IHD cases averted* | 27630 (26580-27650) | 55850 (54080-57610) | 83140 (73710-84520) | | |
| Premature stroke cases averted* | 39250 (38500-40050) | 72110 (69350–73670) | 110730 (98390–112260) | | |
| Years of life gained | 37 130 (34 250 - 38 240) | 702960 (694250-720660) | 740090 (728490–760900) | | |
| QALYs gained | 33660 (31840-33750) | 516190 (497180-523100) | 542850 (529020-556850) | | |
| OALYs gained (discounted)† | 27490 (26450-27840) | 307 170 (293 200-315 840) | 334660 (319650-343680) | | |
| Costs† (£ mln) (95% Cl) | | | | | |
| Total care cost savings | 960 (930–970) | 6340 (6200–6450) | 7300 (7130–7430) | | |
| Health care cost savings | 410 (400-420) | 1220 (1170–1240) | 1640 (1570–1660) | | |
| Social care cost savings | 550 (530–560) | 5120 (5030–5210) | 5670 (5560–5770) | | |
| Government cost for salt reduction program | 103 (103–104) | 87 (86–87) | 190 (189–191) | | |
| UK government cost savings‡ (£ mln) (95% CI) | | | | | |
| Total cost savings | 860 (830–870) | 6250 (6110–6370) | 7110 (6940–7230) | | |
| Cost savings excluding social care costs | 310 (295–311) | 1130 (1080–1160) | 1450 (1380–1470) | | |

| Table 1. | Projected Health Benefits and Costs of the 2003 to 2018 Salt Reduction Program Among Adults in |
|----------|--|
| England | |

Health effects and costs were estimated using the population-level salt intake reduction achieved during 2000 to 2018 and assuming the 2018 levels were maintained until 2050 compared with a scenario with the 2000 salt intake levels were maintained until 2050. Costs expressed in 2014 UK\$. CVD indicates cardiovascular disease; IHD, ischemic heart disease; mln, million; and QALY, quality-adjusted life-year.

*Premature cases are cases among adults up to 75 y of age.

†Discounted at 1.5% per annum.

+Government cost savings calculated as the difference between the total health care and social care savings because of averted CVD minus the government costs of monitoring and administering the salt reduction program.

Reducing the population-level salt intake during 2018 to 2030 at the same annual rate observed in 2000 to 2014 was estimated to achieve average salt intake levels of 6.77 grams/day per adult by 2030. Such a reduction was estimated to result in 37870 (95% CI, 36310-38550) further premature IHD cases and 56310 (95% Cl, 54480-57890) further premature stroke cases avoided by 2050, representing a 45% and 50% increase respectively of base-case results. Such health gains had additional health care and social care savings of £2560 million (95% Cl, £2510-£2620). Achieving larger population salt intake reductions, as recommended by WHO, by 2030 implied an average salt intake reduction of 3.38 grams/day per adult, which led to 87870 (95% Cl, 82050-88470) fewer premature IHD cases and 126010 (95% CI, 118600-126460) fewer premature stroke cases by 2050 compared with the health gains in the base-case analysis. This reduction in disease burden led to 343260 (95% Cl, 334810-352430) further OALYs gained and additional cost savings of £5330 million (95% Cl, £5120-£5380). The program remained a cost-saving policy strategy.

premature CVD cases avoided doubled by 2050, with an additional 91 000 premature IHD cases and 143 700 premature stroke cases avoided, while the population quality of life in England increased by further 463300 QALYs, compared with the base-case analysis. While health gains and governmental savings decreased when we attributed only 50% of salt intake reductions to the salt reduction program (Table S4), even under this assumption, the program averted 29300 premature IHD cases and 38400 premature stroke cases over 2000 to 2050, with £2500 million government cost savings. Conversely, assuming a higher effect of salt intake reduction on BP doubled the premature CVD cases averted (Table S5) with 154100 premature IHD cases and 205500 premature stroke cases averted in the period 2000 to 2050 (base-case); and further 312400 premature IHD cases and 431200 premature stroke cases potentially averted if the WHO salt intake recommendation was achieved. Finally, adopting the adjusted 2014 salt intake estimates resulted in about 10% less health gains compared with the basecase with the program remaining cost-saving (Table S6).

Sensitivity Analyses

We investigated the impact of specific model assumptions on results. First, we estimated the impact if the salt intake reduction trend from 2000 to 2014 had continued until 2030 (Table S3). Under this scenario, the estimated

DISCUSSION

The 2003 to 2018 population salt reduction program put in place in England has been remarkably successful in reducing population-level salt intake. We report that, according to our model, this reduction projects 193870 fewer premature CVD cases and 542850 extra QALYs

| Study outcome | Scenario A: 1.37% annual reduction in salt intake 2019–2030 (reaching 6.77 grams/d in 2030) and maintaining 2030 level to 2050 | Scenario B: 3.36% annual reduction 2019–2030 (reaching 5 grams/d in 2030) and maintaining 2030 level to 2050 | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| Additional health benefits (95% CI) | | | | | |
| Additional premature IHD cases averted* | 37 870 (36 310–38 550) | 87 870 (82 050-88 470) | | | |
| Additional premature stroke cases averted* | 56310 (54480-57890) | 126010 (118600-126460) | | | |
| Additional years of life gained | 220 530 (188 370-226 130) | 451 930 (435 300-494 900) | | | |
| Additional QALYs gained | 171 520 (167 340-220 530) | 343 260 (334 810-352 430) | | | |
| Additional QALYs gained (discounted)† | 95120 (92870-98210) | 189540 (189160–191530) | | | |
| Additional costs† (£ mln) (95% CI) | | | | | |
| Additional total care cost savings | 2560 (2510-2620) | 5330 (5120-5380) | | | |
| Additional health care savings | 570 (540–580) | 1260 (1180–1260) | | | |
| Additional social care savings | 1980 (1970–2050) | 4080 (3940-4120) | | | |

Table 2. Projected Benefits for Adults in England With Further Population Salt Intake Reductions Post-2018

Effects of scenarios A and B were compared with maintaining 2018 levels until 2050. No additional government costs were included as costs of reformulating specific products were assumed to be absorbed by the food industry. Costs expressed in 2014 UKS. IHD indicates ischemic heart disease; mln, million; and OALY, guality-adjusted life-year.

*Premature cases are cases occurring up to 75 y of age.

†Discounted at 1.5% per annum.

among the adult population in England by 2050. More importantly, further strengthening and scaling up of the salt reduction program, to achieve the WHO recommendation of 5 grams/day per adult by 2030, could bring further large reductions in CVD burden with 213880 further premature CVD cases avoided by 2050. These health gains could bring substantial accumulated savings to the UK government of £5330 million by 2050 due to reductions in population need for health care and social care.

Our results underscore the value of investing in public health interventions to reduce the burden of noncommunicable diseases, with substantial savings to the UK government.³⁹ The food industry in the UK is still producing high-salt products in spite of strong evidence that it is technologically feasible and commercially viable to produce lower-salt products, and there is ample room for incremental reductions in their salt content to achieve further population salt reductions in the United Kingdom.¹⁵

The salt reduction program in England was highly successful until 2011 because of the government pressure on industry to reduce salt content, resulting in a decline in the average population-level salt intake of 14% (Table S2; 8.3% reduction 2006–2011). A recent study reported 5.1% reduction in the salt content of the UK grocery basket of a nationally representative sample of households from 2005 to 2011.¹³ These estimated reductions are consistent with the reduction reported by He et al, in high-salt products in supermarkets (from 3.3 to 1.8 g of salt per serving of product), which identified bread as the single largest contribution to salt to the UK diet: 18% of total salt intake.¹⁴ The salt reductions were also driven mainly by product reformulation, as opposed to net product introduction and changes in consumer preferences.¹⁴ The observed decline in program effectiveness after

2011²¹ was attributed to reduction in the government pressure on industry.¹⁵ To get back on track, the program will benefit from (1) a strict enforcement of salt reduction targets, for example, through legislation or financial penalties for food companies failing to comply; (2) setting more stringent salt targets; and (3) extending salt targets to the out-of-home sector, which remain lenient and lack the proper monitoring mechanisms.

Several studies have previously indicated that salt reduction strategies have been effective and cost-effective in the United Kingdom,^{22,40-42} and worldwide.⁴³⁻⁵³ Our study adds further important evidence to the literature as it also includes the latest 2018 data on sodium excretion obtained from 24-hour urinary samples, that is, the most accurate way to assess salt intake, to estimate the health gains associated with reducing salt intake. Furthermore, we also project the reduction in CVD burden with further strengthening of salt reduction strategies to achieve the WHO recommendations on salt intake.

Despite the high-quality data on population-level salt intake and disease burden used, our study has some limitations. First, the sample size for 24-hour urine collections was small, particularly after stratifying by age and sex. Second, our model does not capture the effect of salt intake on the burden of gastric cancer, renal disease, and osteoporosis,^{2,5,12} and, therefore, likely underestimates the health benefits of the program. Moreover, the effect of salt reduction policies in children⁵⁴ were also not included because of lack of salt intake data in children. Finally, the long study period may present a further limitation due to the uncertainty in model parameters, assumptions on continuity of the salt reduction program, and evolution of CVD and salt intake trends. In particular, salt intake trajectories from 2019 onward are a main source of uncertainty, especially given the salt intake increase observed after 2014. However, the main objective of the current study was to highlight the long-term population health benefits should the government strengthen and enhance the UK salt reduction program.

PERSPECTIVES

The 2003 to 2018 salt reduction program in England achieved an overall salt intake reduction of 1 gram/day in the adult population from 9.38 grams/day per adult in 2000 to 8.38 grams/day per adult in 2018. We modeled the long-term effects of this reduction and demonstrated that the program led to reduced cardiovascular burden and improved quality-adjusted life expectancy of the adult population, as well as yielding large savings in health care and social care. However, reductions in salt intake achieved by 2014 are already being lost. Reversing this and achieving the WHO recommended salt intake of 5 grams/day per adult requires continuous efforts in strengthening the implementation and monitoring of the program. Such efforts are shown likely to be well compensated by further reductions in cardiovascular disease burden.

ARTICLE INFORMATION

Received November 5, 2020; accepted January 18, 2021.

Affiliations

From the Institute of Population Health Sciences (S.A., B.M.) and Wolfson Institute of Preventive Medicine (M.T., C.W., G.A.M., F.J.H.), Barts and The London School of Medicine and Dentistry, Queen Mary University of London, United Kingdom; National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence, London, United Kingdom (S.K.); and Nuffield Department of Population Health, University of Oxford, United Kingdom (L.C., B.M.).

Sources of Funding

There were no external sources of funding for this study.

Disclosures

F.J. He is a member of the Consensus Action on Salt & Health group, a nonprofit charitable organization, and its international branch, World Action on Salt & Health, and does not receive any financial support from the Consensus Action on Salt & Health, and does not receive any financial support from the Consensus Action on Salt & Health, and Chairman of World Action on Salt & Health. G.A. MacGregor is the Chairman of Blood Pressure UK, Chairman of the Consensus Action on Salt & Health, and Chairman of World Action on Salt & Health, and does not receive any financial support from any of these organizations. Blood Pressure UK, the Consensus Action on Salt & Health, and World Action on Salt & Health are nonprofit charitable organizations. M. Tan and C. Wang are funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) (NIHR Global Health Research Unit Action on Salt China at Queen Mary University of London) using Official Development Assistance (ODA) funding (16/136/77). F.J. He and G.A. MacGregor are partially funded by the NIHR grant. The views expressed in this publication are those of the author(s) and not necessarily those of the NIHR or the Department of Health and Social Care.

REFERENCES

- He FJ, Pombo-Rodrigues S, MacGregor GA. Salt reduction in England from 2003 to 2011: its relationship to blood pressure, stroke and ischaemic heart disease mortality. *BMJ Open.* 2014;4:e004549. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2013-004549
- D'Elia L, Rossi G, Ippolito R, Cappuccio FP, Strazzullo P. Habitual salt intake and risk of gastric cancer: a meta-analysis of prospective studies. *Clin Nutr.* 2012;31:489–498. doi: 10.1016/j.clnu.2012.01.003

- Cook NR, Cutler JA, Obarzanek E, Buring JE, Rexrode KM, Kumanyika SK, Appel LJ, Whelton PK. Long term effects of dietary sodium reduction on cardiovascular disease outcomes: observational follow-up of the trials of hypertension prevention (TOHP). *BMJ*. 2007;334:885–888. doi: 10.1136/bmj. 39147.604896.55
- He FJ, Tan M, Ma Y, MacGregor GA. Salt reduction to prevent hypertension and cardiovascular disease: JACC state-of-the-art review. J Am Coll Cardiol. 2020;75:632–647. doi: 10.1016/j.jacc.2019.11.055
- Woo J, Kwok T, Leung J, Tang N. Dietary intake, blood pressure and osteoporosis. J Hum Hypertens. 2009;23:451–455. doi: 10.1038/jhh.2008.156
- World Health Organisation. *Guideline: Sodium Intake for Adults and Children*. Geneva; 2012.
- Lawes CMM, Hoorn SV, Law MR, Elliot P, MacMahon S, Rodgers A. Blood Pressure. Ezzati M, Lopez AD, Rodgers A, Murray CJL. Comparative Quantification of Health Risks: Global and Regional Burden of Disease Attributable to Selected Major Risk Factors. Geneva, Switzerland; 2004.
- European Commission. The European Commission's Science and Knowledge Service. Dietary Salt/ Sodium. Brussels; 2019. https://ec.europa.eu/ jrc/en/health-knowledge-gateway/promotion-prevention/nutrition/salt. Accessed March 20, 2020
- Trieu K, Neal B, Hawkes C, Dunford E, Campbell N, Rodriguez-Fernandez R, Legetic B, McLaren L, Barberio A, Webster J. Salt reduction initiatives around the world - a systematic review of progress towards the global target. *PLoS One.* 2015;10:e0130247. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0130247
- James WP, Ralph A, Sanchez-Castillo CP. The dominance of salt in manufactured food in the sodium intake of affluent societies. *Lancet*. 1987;1:426-429. doi: 10.1016/s0140-6736(87)90127-9
- Scientific Advisory Committee on Nutrition. Public Health England. Salt and Health. London, UK; 2003. https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/ government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/338782/ SACN_Salt_and_Health_report.pdf.
- He FJ, Jenner KH, Macgregor GA. WASH-world action on salt and health. Kidney Int. 2010;78:745–753. doi: 10.1038/ki.2010.280
- Griffith R, O'Connell M, Smith K. The importance of product reformulation versus consumer choice in improving diet quality. *Economica*. 2017;84:34– 53. doi:10.1111/ecca.12192
- He FJ, Brinsden HC, MacGregor GA. Salt reduction in the United Kingdom: a successful experiment in public health. *J Hum Hypertens*. 2014;28:345– 352. doi: 10.1038/jhh.2013.105
- MacGregor GA, He FJ, Pombo-Rodrigues S. Food and the responsibility deal: how the salt reduction strategy was derailed. *BMJ*. 2015;350:h1936. doi: 10.1136/bmj.h1936
- Department of Health. Assessment of Dietary Sodium Levels among Adults (Aged 19-64) in England, 2011. London, UK; 2011. https://www.gov.uk/ government/publications/assessment-of-dietary-sodium-levels-amongadults-aged-19-64-in-england-2011. Accessed July 15, 2019
- Wyness LA, Butriss JL, Stanner SA. Reducing the population's sodium intake: the UK Food Standards Agency's salt reduction programme. *Public Health Nutr.* 2012;15:254–261. doi: 10.1017/S1368980011000966
- Girgis S, Neal B, Prescott J, Prendergast J, Dumbrell S, Turner C, Woodward M. A one-quarter reduction in the salt content of bread can be made without detection. *Eur J Clin Nutr.* 2003;57:616–620. doi: 10.1038/sj. ejcn.1601583
- National Institute for Health and Care Excellence. Cardiovascular Disease Prevention. Manchester; 2010. https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/ph25/ resources/cardiovascular-disease-prevention-pdf-1996238687173. Accessed July 15, 2019
- Government UK. PHE data on salt consumption levels. Public Health England press office. Available at: https://www.gov.uk/government/news/newphe-data-on-salt-consumption-levels. Published 2016. Accessed July 15, 2019
- Public Health England. National Diet and Nutrition Survey: Assessment of Salt Intake from Urinary Sodium in Adults (Aged 19 to 64 Years) in England, 2018 to 2019. London, UK; 2020. https://www.gov.uk/government/statistics/national-diet-and-nutrition-survey-assessment-of-salt-intake-fromurinary-sodium-in-adults-aged-19-to-64-years-in-england-2018-to-2019. Accessed March 30, 2020
- Collins M, Mason H, O'Flaherty M, Guzman-Castillo M, Critchley J, Capewell S. An economic evaluation of salt reduction policies to reduce coronary heart disease in England: a policy modeling study. *Value Health.* 2014;17:517–524. doi: 10.1016/j.jval.2014.03.1722
- 23. Briggs ADM, Cobiac LJ, Wolstenholme J, Scarborough P. PRIMEtime CE: a multistate life table model for estimating the cost-effectiveness of

interventions affecting diet and physical activity. BMC Health Serv Res. 2019;19:485. doi:10.1186/s12913-019-4237-4

- Scarborough P, Harrington RA, Mizdrak A, Zhou LM, Doherty A. The preventable risk integrated model and its use to estimate the health impact of public health policy scenarios. *Scientifica (Cairo)*. 2014;2014:748750. doi: 10.1155/2014/748750
- Briggs ADM, Scarborough P, Wolstenholme J. Estimating comparable English healthcare costs for multiple diseases and unrelated future costs for use in health and public health economic modelling. *PLoS One*. 2018;13:e0197257. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0197257
- Barendregt JJ, Van Oortmarssen GJ, Vos T, Murray CJ. A generic model for the assessment of disease epidemiology: the computational basis of DisMod II. *Popul Health Metr.* 2003;1:4. doi: 10.1186/1478-7954-1-4
- Cobiac LJ, Scarborough P, Kaur A, Rayner M. The eatwell guide: modelling the health implications of incorporating new sugar and fibre guidelines. *PLoS One.* 2016;11:e0167859. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0167859
- NHS England. 2013/14 CCG Programme Budgetting Benchmarking Tool. https://www.england.nhs.uk/prog-budgeting/. Published 2015. Accessed June 3, 2019
- NHS England. Technical Guide to Allocation Formulae and Pace of Change for 2016-17 to 2020-21 Revenue Allocations to Clinical Commissioning Groups and Commissioning Areas.; 2016. https://www.england.nhs. uk/publication/technical-guide-to-allocation-formulae-and-pace-ofchange-for-2016-17-to-2020-21-revenue-allocations-to-clinical-commissioning-groups-and-commissioning-areas/.
- Office for National Statistics. Population Estimates for UK, England and Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland. https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/populationandmigration/populationestimates/ datasets/populationestimatesforukenglandandwalesscotlandandnorthernireland/mid2014. Published 2018. Accessed June 3, 2019
- Office for National Statistics. Deaths. https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/birthsdeathsandmarriages/deaths. Published 2019. Accessed June 3, 2019
- He FJ, Li J, Macgregor GA. Effect of longer term modest salt reduction on blood pressure: cochrane systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised trials. *BMJ*. 2013;346:f1325. doi: 10.1136/bmj.f1325
- Huang L, Trieu K, Yoshimura S, Neal B, Woodward M, Campbell NRC, Li Q, Lackland DT, Leung AA, Anderson CAM, et al. Effect of dose and duration of reduction in dietary sodium on blood pressure levels: systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised trials. *BMJ*. 2020;368:m315. doi: 10.1136/bmj.m315
- Lewington S, Clarke R, Qizilbash N, Peto R, Collins R, MacMahon S, Peto R, Aromaa A, Baigent C, Carstensen J, et al. Prospective studies collaboration. Age-specific relevance of usual blood pressure to vascular mortality: a metaanalysis of individual data for one million adults in 61 prospective studies. *Lancet*. 2003;360:1903–1917. doi:10.1016/s0140-6736(02)11911-8.
- Sullivan PW, Slejko JF, Sculpher MJ, Ghushchyan V. Catalogue of EQ-5D scores for the United Kingdom. *Med Decis Making*. 2011;31:800–804. doi: 10.1177/0272989X11401031
- Public Health England. Mortality Profile. https://fingertips.phe.org.uk/profile/mortality-profile. Accessed June 15, 2019
- HM Treasury. The Green Book. Central Government Guidance on Appraisal and Evaluation. The National Archives, Kew, London TW9 4DU; 2018. https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/ uploads/attachment_data/file/685903/The_Green_Book.pdf. Accessed March 20, 2020
- Public Health England. National Diet and Nutrition Survey: Assessment of Dietary Sodium. Adults (19 to 64 Years) in England, 2014. London, UK; 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/statistics/national-diet-andnutrition-survey-assessment-of-dietary-sodium-in-adults-in-england-2014. Accessed March 20, 2020

- World Health Organisation. Regional office for Europe. The Case for Investing in Public Health.; 2014. http://www.euro.who.int/__data/assets/pdf_ file/0009/278073/Case-Investing-Public-Health.pdf.
- Barton P, Andronis L, Briggs A, McPherson K, Capewell S. Effectiveness and cost effectiveness of cardiovascular disease prevention in whole populations: modelling study. *BMJ*. 2011;343:d4044. doi: 10.1136/bmj.d4044
- Smith-Spangler CM, Juusola JL, Enns EA, Owens DK, Garber AM. Population strategies to decrease sodium intake and the burden of cardiovascular disease: a cost-effectiveness analysis. *Ann Intern Med.* 2010;152:481–7, W170. doi: 10.7326/0003-4819-152-8-201004200-00212
- Dodhia H, Phillips K, Zannou MI, Airoldi M, Bevan G. Modelling the impact on avoidable cardiovascular disease burden and costs of interventions to lower SBP in the England population. *J Hypertens*. 2012;30:217–226. doi: 10.1097/HJH.0b013e32834d86ee
- Webb M, Fahimi S, Singh GM, Khatibzadeh S, Micha R, Powles J, Mozaffarian D. Cost effectiveness of a government supported policy strategy to decrease sodium intake: global analysis across 183 nations. *BMJ*. 2017;356:i6699. doi: 10.1136/bmj.i6699
- Wilson N, Nghiem N, Eyles H, Mhurchu CN, Shields E, Cobiac LJ, Cleghorn CL, Blakely T. Modeling health gains and cost savings for ten dietary salt reduction targets. *Nutr J.* 2016;15:44. doi: 10.1186/s12937-016-0161-1
- Schorling E, Niebuhr D, Kroke A. Cost-effectiveness of salt reduction to prevent hypertension and CVD: a systematic review. *Public Health Nutr.* 2017;20:1993–2003. doi: 10.1017/S1368980017000593
- Selmer RM, Kristiansen IS, Haglerod A, Graff-Iversen S, Larsen HK, Meyer HE, Bonaa KH, Thelle DS. Cost and health consequences of reducing the population intake of salt. *J Epidemiol Community Health.* 2000;54:697– 702. doi: 10.1136/jech.54.9.697
- Palar K, Sturm R. Potential societal savings from reduced sodium consumption in the U.S. adult population. *Am J Health Promot.* 2009;24:49–57. doi: 10.4278/ajhp.080826-QUAN-164
- Nghiem N, Blakely T, Cobiac LJ, Cleghorn CL, Wilson N. The health gains and cost savings of dietary salt reduction interventions, with equity and age distributional aspects. *BMC Public Health.* 2016;16:423. doi: 10.1186/s12889-016-3102-1
- Martikainen JA, Soini EJ, Laaksonen DE, Niskanen L. Health economic consequences of reducing salt intake and replacing saturated fat with polyunsaturated fat in the adult Finnish population: estimates based on the FINRISK and FINDIET studies. *Eur J Clin Nutr.* 2011;65:1148–1155. doi: 10.1038/ejcn.2011.78
- Cobiac LJ, Vos T, Veerman JL. Cost-effectiveness of interventions to reduce dietary salt intake. *Heart.* 2010;96:1920–1925. doi: 10.1136/hrt. 2010.199240
- Asaria P, Chisholm D, Mathers C, Ezzati M, Beaglehole R. Chronic disease prevention: health effects and financial costs of strategies to reduce salt intake and control tobacco use. *Lancet*. 2007;370:2044–2053. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(07)61698-5
- Bibbins-Domingo K, Chertow GM, Coxson PG, Moran A, Lightwood JM, Pletcher MJ, Goldman L. Projected effect of dietary salt reductions on future cardiovascular disease. N Engl J Med. 2010;362:590–599. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa0907355
- Mason H, Shoaibi A, Ghandour R, O'Flaherty M, Capewell S, Khatib R, Jabr S, Unal B, Sözmen K, Arfa C, et al; MedCHAMPS project team. A cost effectiveness analysis of salt reduction policies to reduce coronary heart disease in four Eastern Mediterranean countries. *PLoS One.* 2014;9:e84445. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0084445
- Leyvraz M, Chatelan A, da Costa BR, Taffé P, Paradis G, Bovet P, Bochud M, Chiolero A. Sodium intake and blood pressure in children and adolescents: a systematic review and meta-analysis of experimental and observational studies. *Int J Epidemiol.* 2018;47:1796–1810. doi: 10.1093/i je/dyy121