

University of Warwick institutional repository: <http://go.warwick.ac.uk/wrap>

A Thesis Submitted for the Degree of PhD at the University of Warwick

<http://go.warwick.ac.uk/wrap/3938>

This thesis is made available online and is protected by original copyright.

Please scroll down to view the document itself.

Please refer to the repository record for this item for information to help you to cite it. Our policy information is available from the repository home page.

**The 'Disembodied Voice' in *Fin-de-siècle* British Literature:
Its Genealogy and Significances**

Hiroshi Muto

Ph.D. Thesis

The University of Warwick

Department of English and Comparative Literary Studies

March 2001

Contents

Acknowledgements

Abstract

Chapter 1	Introduction: Arthur Symons' 'The Disembodied Voice of a Human Soul'	1
Chapter 2.	Gothic-Romantic Voices, Conradian Voices: Nostalgic for the Pre-Modern Aural-Oral and Reflecting the <i>Fin-de-siècle</i> Colonial	
	Part 1 Gothic-Romantic Voices	39
	Part 2 Conradian Voices	60
Chapter 3	Two Disembodied Voices in Oscar Wilde's Symbolist Play	148
Chapter 4	Two Phono-Texts in Bram Stoker's <i>Dracula</i>	203
Chapter 5	Two Techno-Gothic Voices: Kipling's Art of Concealment	271
Chapter 6	The Disembodied Voice in the Age of Modernism: Voices, Ethereal and Otherwise, in D.H.Lawrence's <i>Lady Chatterley's Lover</i>	320
Chapter 7	Conclusion	364
	Bibliography	373

Acknowledgements

I am deeply grateful to my supervisor, Michael Bell, for his continued support and invaluable counsel. I also wish to express my appreciation to John Stokes, Malcolm Hardman and Noriyuki Harada for reading and commenting on portions of my work in progress.

Many friends have helped me in shaping and completing this project. Special mention must be given to Nobuyoshi Ota and Fuhito Endo for enlightening me about contemporary critical theories and to James Raeside for improving my English.

Abstract

A particular kind of voice recurs in *fin-de-siècle* British literature. It is a voice without a human body, a voice whose source is either invisible or non-human. This study explores the historical factors underlying the literary representation of such a voice.

Chapter 1 examines Arthur Symons' phrase, 'the disembodied voice of a human soul,' and sets up the context for the subsequent discussion by teasing out the four major implications of the *fin-de-siècle* disembodied voice: the socio-political, the aesthetico-linguistic, the techno-scientific, and the sexual-somatic. Chapter 2 first outlines the modern origin of the disembodied voice in the Gothic-Romantic culture of the late eighteenth century, where the frequent description of the disembodied voice is linked to the rise of the nostalgia for pre-modernity; the chapter then analyzes the disembodied voice in Joseph Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* both in terms of Gothic culture and of the *fin-de-siècle* situation. The Romantic aesthetico-linguistic prioritization of the aural-oral, which we call 'melocentrism,' the *fin-de-siècle* consumerism and colonialism, and the then influential scientific concept of ether receive scrutiny. Chapter 3 addresses Oscar Wilde's *Salomé*. Apart from the factors that this play shares with Conrad's novella, the disembodied voice in *Salomé* secretly expresses a longing for the homosexual-cum-communal.

Chapter 4 explores the *fin-de-siècle* imperial and homosexual implications, and the 'melocentric' pre-history, of the phonographic voice in Bram Stoker's *Dracula*. Chapter 5 teases out the hidden political dimension of the technological voice, phonographic and wireless, in Kipling's *Kim* and "Wireless." Chapter 6 compares the *fin-de-siècle* voice with an instance of the early twentieth-century, the wireless voice in D.H. Lawrence's *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, a voice now involved in the global network of broadcasting. It is concluded that the disembodied voice is inseparable from important aspects of *fin-de-siècle* British culture as well as the question of modernity.

Introduction:

Arthur Symons's 'The Disembodied Voice of a Human Soul'

Introduction

In this study, I explore a particular kind of voice that recurs in *fin-de-siècle* British literature. It is a voice without a human body. When you are in conversation, you normally see a person whose voice you are hearing. The disembodied voice, by which we mean a voice whose source is either invisible or non-human, is therefore unusual and mysterious. It has at all times a certain fearful fascination, a powerful appeal for humans.

The disembodied voice is connected with one's early, forgotten self. It is the first voice we hear in life, and is the first medium we find in life for receiving communications from our parents. The fetus hears their voices in the uterus. Ontogenetically, hearing precedes seeing; and the baby is born almost blind, the sense of sight being the last in the growth of the senses in humans.¹ In a discussion of the pre-individual aural-oral self, a French psychoanalyst, Didier Anzieu, points out the vital role played by the disembodied maternal voice in the new-born baby's mental life.² The Lacanian, François Dolto, also cites a clinical case that indicates the connection between the disembodied voice and the subject preceding the mirror stage.³ Philippe Lacoue-Labarthe too discusses the relationship between the prespecular subject and the musical-vocal-rhythmic.⁴ The charm and terror of the bodiless voice, therefore, is connected to the Freudian

uncanny. When what was once familiar to you but has been repressed returns later, it gives rise to an ambivalent emotion of repellent attraction.

However, these a-historical reasons are not all there is to it. Our ensuing examination of the literary representations of the disembodied voice will show that there are a variety of historical implications involved, ranging from socio-political to techno-scientific ones. We will also be able to show how the significances of the disembodied voice are closely linked to important aspects of Western modernity.⁵

For that purpose, five works of four *fin-de-siècle* writers will be scrutinized in the following chapters. Joseph Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* is framed by Marlow's voice in darkness and places Kurtz's bodiless voice at its centre; Oscar Wilde's *Salomé* features Jokanaan's underground voice and the eponymous heroine's voice from the blackened stage. Phonographic and wireless voices are encountered in Bram Stoker's *Dracula* and Rudyard Kipling's "Wireless" and *Kim*. But we will begin, in the present chapter, with Arthur Symons' essay 'The Decadent Movement in Literature,' because of the phrase he uses to describe the ideal of *fin-de-siècle* literature: 'To be a disembodied voice, and yet the voice of a human soul: that is the ideal of Decadence, and it is what Paul Verlaine has achieved.'⁶ An examination of the disembodied voice in Symons' typically *fin-de-siècle* aestheticist essay will set up the framework for our scrutinies of the other bodiless voices, by classifying its significances into four different but interrelated groups: the socio-political, the aesthetico-linguistic, the techno-

scientific, and the sexual-somatic.

In this thesis, we will also make an attempt to trace a genealogy of the disembodied voice from the late eighteenth century to the 1920s. By adding a diachronic-genealogical approach to the synchronic one, focusing on one specific period, we hope to benefit from an added historical perspective.⁷ Special attention will be paid to classic Gothic fiction and D.H. Lawrence's *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, belonging to the cultures of Romanticism and of Modernism respectively. Two key moments in this genealogy will be shown to be, a nostalgia for the declining pre-modern, oral culture, originating in the late eighteenth-century, and embodied in a pan-European craze for the textual collection of folk culture; and the start and subsequent huge success of broadcasting in the early twentieth century.

Arthur Symons's Disembodied Voice of a Human Soul as Ideal Art

The phrase, 'the disembodied voice [...] of a human soul,' is central to Symons's 'The Decadent Movement in Literature' (1893). It is referred to twice in the essay; first at the midpoint to express the ideal of *fin-de-siècle* art and eulogize his favorite poet, Paul Verlaine; then reiterated at the end, to emphasize the centrality of that metaphor to the whole movement of *fin-de-siècle* literature.

The metaphor of the soul's bodiless voice can be traced back to an earlier essay on the poet, 'Paul Verlaine (1892),' in which Verlaine's poetry is likened to 'disembodied song' and 'the note of a bird with a human soul.'⁸ The metaphor resurfaces later in his *The Symbolist*

Movement in Literature (1899): again, in a eulogy of Verlaine as the *fin-de-siècle* supreme artist, his poetry is compared to 'the voice of a bird with a human soul.'⁹

In spite of six years' interval between them, the 1893 essay and the 1899 book have much in common. Although the shift in emphasis from the overcivilized disease of decadence to the spiritual mysticism of symbolism, shared by 'so many writers of the period,' occurred during the interval, the two texts are both an examination of almost the same, largely French, contemporary writers (Verlaine, Mallarmé, Villiers de l'Isle-Adam, Maeterlinck, Huysmans, among others)¹⁰; the earlier essay can be considered as a much shorter version of the enormously influential book. Significantly, the other central figure in the book, Maurice Maeterlinck, who is treated as the supreme Symbolist mystic, is also linked to a disembodied voice, the voice of the marionette.¹¹ Arthur Symons is thus obsessed with the metaphor of a disembodied voice throughout the decade.

The De-Politicizing Disembodied Voice of Transcendence

Symons' invocation of the disembodied voice of a soul in the 1893 essay, as in his two other works, seems rather abrupt. Having been discussing characteristics of Verlaine's poetry, he suddenly resorts to the phrase in question, to epitomize the poet's ability to fix 'the quintessence of things.' It is not, however, that Symons invokes it for no reason. Rather, the sudden reference to the soul's disembodied voice indicates its importance for the author.

The reason for Symons' choice of the phrase is this: it is appropriate for his de-politicized aestheticist manifesto, because the disembodied voice is at once associated with transcendence and intrinsically related to one's nostalgia for a certain early phase of life that one inevitably outgrows. Both disembodiedness and voice suggest freedom from material limitations; hence, the combination of the two is highly indicative of transcendence over the secular and material. At the same time, as we have said, the disembodied voice has psychological connections with the prespecular self of one's infancy. Voice in relation to literature also concerns one's early, apparently replaced self, in that it is also what gets repressed in the process of acquiring a high level of literacy, the art of silent reading. As François Bresson shows by citing medical cases, voice underlies the act of silent reading.¹² Even when it is not allowed to come out of the body of the reader, voice is still heard in his imagination. What Symons needed for his manifesto of a spiritualized transcendental art in the face of an increasingly secular society was a metaphor for a kind of transcendence, not to be sought above in the shape of the personal God, but in the early, deep, forgotten self one unconsciously yearns for. His need was met by 'the disembodied voice of a human soul.' With it, he was able to express his *fin-de-siècle* ideal of the art that transcends history. In other words, the phrase in question helped Symons conceal the socio-political conditions that inevitably affected literature.

The Socio-Political Implications:

The Dichotomy of the Visible and the Vocal in the 'Over-Luxurious' Age

Partly because of the de-politicizing disembodied voice, the socio-political factor is downplayed in 'The Decadent Movement in Literature.' The section on Verlaine is certainly a-historical in approach, and yet, preceding that part, traces of the late nineteenth-century European social situation can be detected. Near the beginning of the essay, where he discusses the Goncourts, Symons links Decadent literature to the 'over-luxurious,' 'sophisticated,' 'overcivilized' society of the *fin-de-siècle* West.¹³ Needless to say, this unprecedented affluence is tied to the late nineteenth-century imperial-transnational system of developed capitalism, what Lenin calls monopoly capitalism. It externally relates to the expansion of the colonial situation overseas, and internally, to the rise of the visually-oriented consumer society. The increasing commercial use of visual art and technologies, such as pictorial advertisements in magazines and newspapers and the elaborate display of commodities at department stores, brought about a significant change in our ways of looking and imagining. The question of the resultant visual phantasmagoria and what lay behind it was of no small concern to *fin-de-siècle* European writers. Of those we will examine in the following chapters, Oscar Wilde gave consideration to it in the most explicit terms. But Conrad also examined the socio-political significance of commodities in the age of imperialism in *Heart of Darkness*. The setting of Kipling's "Wireless," too, is dominated by the visual

phantasmagoria of electric illumination and a poster.

What is particularly important about the socio-political factor in Symons' essay is the implied oppositions of the visible and the aural, of the material and the spiritual, and of appearance and truth, which is supposed to be located in depth. It is the Goncourts and Huysmans who are presented as visual, that is, as offering an optic record of the visible-material aspect of the overluxurious, overcivilized, oversensitive age. The achievement of the Goncourts is epitomized as the creation of specialized vision and, borrowing Edmond de Goncourt's words, the invention of an operaglass; while Huysmans' *À Rebours* is seen as an expression of an era, 'especially in regard to things seen,' executed 'with all the shades of a painter's palette.'¹⁴

The implied opposition between the Goncourts and Verlaine in the essay, which is an opposition of the eye and the ear, deserves emphasizing, in spite of the fact that these writers are on the surface put into the same category of impressionism. It is important that, shortly after Symons compares the Goncourts to the specialized vision and operaglass, Verlaine's work is introduced as music, and then as the disembodied voice.¹⁵ In Symons' later book, the opposition of the visual, material Goncourts to the vocal, spiritual Verlaine becomes more evident. There, the status of the Goncourts is relegated to that of literati belonging to an earlier, vulgar age of science, materialism and literature as record of things visible. Opposed to it in the book is the superior mystic transcendentalism of Symbolism, of which the supreme art is the poetry of Verlaine as 'the voice of a bird with a

human soul,' and the supreme mystic is Maeterlinck, who prizes the disembodied voice of marionettes.¹⁶

A significant shift in Symons' view of Huysmans between 1893 and 1899 also foregrounds the opposition of the material-visible and the spiritual-vocal in the book. In contrast to the earlier essay, where *À Rebours* is eulogized as the representative record of the visible aspect of an epoch, the emphasis in the book falls on the later, spiritual Huysmans: his early power as a naturalist and observer of things visible is seen as useless in itself, and it becomes useful only when serving the spiritual vision of the later Huysmans. Implied here is, again, the hierarchical distinction between the inferior power of visible-material observation and the superior spiritual insight.

The opposition of sight and voice thus relates to the opposition of appearance and the truth that supposedly resides in invisible depth. It also links itself to the connection between one's voice and deeper self: Maeterlinck's marionette voice is, at the same time, the voice of 'a self more profound and more boundless than the self of [...] our customary consciousness.'¹⁷ Consequently, it becomes possible to employ 'the disembodied voice of a soul' as symbolizing something opposed to a visually-dominant, increasingly secularized, modern society, for the purpose of exposing the normally unseen socio-political reality behind the phantasmagoria of the affluent age. Although Symons' works only uses the phrase in question to de-politicize and aestheticize his literary manifesto, two other works of the time, *Heart of Darkness* and *Salomé*, develop its socio-political potential and

employ the disembodied voice to reveal some important aspects of the age.

However, Symons and Conrad share more than this. As will be seen in the next chapter, the opposition of sight and voice is accompanied by two other related topoi in both writers: those of two contrastive visions, physical and spiritual, and of the making visible of the invisible truth. In 'The Decadent Movement in Literature,' the two visions are respectively presented as 'the truth [...] of the visible world to the eyes that see it' and 'the truth of spiritual things to the spiritual vision.'¹⁸ Then, in *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*, a book extolling the spiritual vision, the two visions are placed in a hierarchy, the spiritual being over the physical. An intimation of the superiority of the former over the latter is already observable in an early chapter on Nerval as the proto-Symbolist; and even in a chapter on Verlaine, which alludes to the union of the spiritual and the physical visions in the poet.¹⁹ The motif of the making visible of the invisible is not only to be found in Symons' book, but relates to its central theme, in that the symbol itself is defined by the author as something 'by which the [invisible] soul of things can be made visible.'²⁰ The implications of these topoi in Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* and Preface to *The Nigger of the 'Narcissus'*, in relation to those of the opposition of sight and voice, will be considered in the next chapter. As a citation from Carlyle in the beginning of the book indicates, the culture of Romanticism requires attention in this context.²¹

The Aesthetico-Linguistic Implications I:

The Depiction of the Disembodied Voice

By aesthetico-linguistic implications, we mean the disembodied voice's relations to a tradition which assumes the primacy of the aural-oral in art and language, both of which concern literature. The tradition takes several different but related forms: the depiction of the disembodied voice, the aesthetic prioritization of the aural, particularly music, in the arts, and the assumption of the precedence of the aural-oral in language. All of these can be traced back to a common origin in late eighteenth-century proto-Romanticism where the significant depiction of the disembodied voice occurred side by side with a nostalgia for pre-modern oral culture ('the discovery of the people'), and when music and the view of music changed radically, both becoming expressive and giving rise to the Romantic music-centred aesthetics. It is also around this time, according to John Neubauer, that music ceases to be seen as part of language; it is language that comes to ^{be} regarded as a part of music.²² Johann Gottfried Herder is a key figure in this tradition, which we would also like to call, borrowing Paul de Man's term, the modern 'melocentric' tradition. This tradition prioritizes music, voice, art, symbolism, and values language as voice and melody rather than as statement.²³ An anti-ocular aesthetician and influential folklorist Herder was also a proponent of the aural-oral precedence in language, as well as its human origins.

The description of disembodied voice abounds in the Romantic writings. Symons links the disembodied voice to the singing of a bird

in the 1892 essay on Verlaine and the 1899 book. The phrases used in them are virtually identical: 'the note of a bird with a human soul' ('Paul Verlaine'); and 'the voice of a bird with a human soul' (*The Symbolist Movement in Literature*). They immediately remind one of a group of British Romantic poems featuring the disembodied singing of a bird: Wordsworth's 'To the Cuckoo,' Keats' 'Ode to a Nightingale,' Shelley's 'To a Sky-Lark.' In these poems, the unseen bird's voice is related to a yearning for transcendence; and in the first two, it is linked to the nostalgia for the pre-modern past. Particularly, in Wordsworth's 'To the Cuckoo,' the imaginative restoration of the past both in the forms of an early self and pre-modern times is made possible by hearing the bird's voice. The disembodied voice also recurs in classic Gothic fiction, especially in the work of Ann Radcliffe. As we will show in the next chapter, the Gothic voice without body, too, is inseparable from the nostalgia for the pre-modern oral popular culture which was then on the point of disappearing.

There are also cases of the disembodied voice among German contemporaries and near-contemporaries of the English Romantics. Goethe's *Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship* contains a reference to a musical enthusiast who designs a room to realize his ideal music, which is the singing voice of an invisible singer. In Arthur Schopenhauer's principal work *The World as Will and Representation*, the metaphor of a bodiless voice is related to the ungraspable self within.²⁴ Herder, too, employed the metaphor of a disembodied sound and voice in his prioritization of music.²⁵

The Aesthetico-Linguistic Implications II:

The Aesthetic Prioritization of the Aural

Herder's music-centred aesthetics was inherited by later German Romantics²⁶, and then went via Richard Wagner into French Symbolism, and via Walter Pater and French Symbolism to England. Symons' characterization of Verlaine's work as the disembodied voice of a soul is strongly redolent of one of the central features of *fin-de-siècle* Symbolism, the primacy of music and musicality in art, whose representative instance is Verlaine's famous 'Art poétique.' The poem, which begins with 'De la musique avant toute chose,' reiterates the same idea in the penultimate stanza, this time linking it to the soul:

De la musique encore et toujours!

Que ton vers soit la chose envolée

Qu'on sent qui fuit d'une âme en allée

Vers d'autres cieux è d'autres amours.

(Let there be music, again and forever!

Let your verse be a quick-wing'd thing and light—

{ such as one feels when a new love's fervor
to other skies wings the soul in flight.)²⁷

The poem, then, ends by contrasting genuine poetry to mere 'littérature.' Since 'littera' in the word literature originally signifies 'a letter' ('literature' in the O.E.D.), it implies a depreciation of letters,

as against the music of poetry.

As Charles Chadwick observes, this precedence of music and musicality is a typically Symbolist trait. In support, he cites Mallarmé's 'Avant-dire' au *Traité du Verbe* by René Ghil and Valéry's essay on Baudelaire.²⁸ Baudelaire's dedicatory letter in *Le Spleen du Paris*, where his view of the prose poem is presented, also contains references to the musicality, the soul and a voice.²⁹ It should be evident by now that a combination of two characteristics of Symbolist literature, the aforementioned spiritual transcendentalism and the primacy of musicality, is involved in the making of Symons' 'disembodied voice of a human soul.'

Another central feature of French Symbolism, the poetics of suggestion, can also be found in Verlaine's 'Ars poétique':

Car nous voulons la Nuance encor,

Pas la Couleur, rien que la nuance!

Oh! la nuance seule fiancée

Le rêve au rêve et la flûte au cor!

(Never the Color, always the Shade,

always the nuance is supreme!

Only by shade is the troth made

between flute and horn, of dream with dream!)³⁰

This Symbolist focus on the nuance is, again, related to an aesthetic in which music is valorized. The *fin-de-siècle* prioritization of music is

inseparable from the cult of Richard Wagner,³¹ and, as David Michael Hertz implies, both the Wagnerism and the aesthetics of suggestion can roughly be said to have begun with Baudelaire's essay on the first performance of *Tannhäuser* in Paris, where the composer's music is seen by the author as the art of suggestion.³²

The Wagnerian art of suggestion finds its forefather in German Romantic aesthetics of music as expression of 'vague, nameless, indescribable feelings.'³³ Wagner's belief in the supremacy of music also originates in proto-Romanticism: it is, in turn, influenced by Arthur Schopenhauer, whose prioritization of music is shared by other German contemporaries; it can then be traced back to Johann Gottfried Herder, who stated his musical aesthetics in *Kalligone* (1800).³⁴

The Aesthetico-Linguistic Implications III:

The Philological Assumption of the Primacy

Of the Aural-Oral in Language

The precedence of the aural-oral in language is not only something suggested in Symons' metaphor of the soul's disembodied voice but one of the basic principles in nineteenth-century philology. A concern with philology and the aesthetics of musicality go hand in hand in the arch-Symbolist Stéphane Mallarmé, who, besides poems and essays, wrote books on the English language, and had a plan to write a doctoral dissertation on philology. Particularly, his interest in small units of vocal sound, as shown in his *Les Mots Anglais: Petite Philologie*, is worthy of attention. In this book, which is educational in aim, and

partly philological and partly esoteric in approach, Mallarmé, as well as giving a philological overview of English words, explores hidden meanings in small linguistic units consisting of a single consonant or more. For example, according to him, 'g' signifies a simple aspiration, while the meanings of 'sw' are rapidity, expansion and absorption.³⁵ This sort of interest in the latent meanings of minute linguistic units of sound reminds one of the theory of roots as inherently meaningful phonetic types, propounded by the then influential philologist and professor at Oxford, Max Müller, and is clearly related to the privileging of voice over text in language, a major premise of nineteenth-century philology.³⁶ Nobuo Takeuchi discusses the complicated yet vital importance of Müller's writings to Mallarmé, pointing out the latter's knowledge of the former's work, the basic similarity in their views of myth, and Mallarmé's tenacious efforts to conceal his intellectual debt to Müller.³⁷

The connection between literature and philology in this context is corroborated by Linda Dowling's book-length study of the influence of philology on *fin-de-siècle* literature.³⁸ In a chapter titled 'Disembodied Voices,' Dowling examines the responses of writers of the period to contemporary philology, which gives speech privilege over writing. Beginning with a reference to a disembodied voice described in Lionel Johnson's 'To Morfydd,' the chapter is useful in establishing a relationship between the *fin-de-siècle* writers' vocal self-consciousness and voice-oriented philology.³⁹ Ernest Dowson's idea of Verlainesque sound verse is also redolent of the Symbolist poetics of suggestive

musicality.⁴⁰ Dowling traces the prioritization of the aural-oral in philology to its late eighteenth-century origin, again, in the person of Herder. In his famous *On the Origin of Language (Über den Ursprung der Sprache)*, Herder made an argument for his view of the living language as abstraction from the sounds of nature, which became 'the origins of that valorization of speech over writing that was to survive as the controlling impulse not only of Romantic philology but of the scientific or comparative philology of the next century.'⁴¹

The Techno-Scientific Implications I:

Ether and Wireless

Symons' advocacy of Symbolist literature as a mystic-spiritual refutation of science and materialism appears at first to sever his texts from the science and technology of the time. However, that is not the case in a number of ways. Firstly, it is notable that Donald Benson's two essays on science and literature link some of the key statements of Symons in *The Symbolist Movement in Literature* to the then hugely popular concept of ether, a hypothesized unseen medium permeating the whole of space, whose waving motion supposedly transmitted light and electromagnetism. Because of its invisible, all-permeating character, ether was occasionally even credited by some eminent scientists of the time with spiritual, transcendental qualities. The 'eternal, minute, intricate, almost invisible life, which runs through the whole universe,' affirmed by Symons' spiritual Symbolism and cited by Benson, certainly resembles the *fin-de-siècle* concept of ether. The

metaphor of the unknown sea as the great Symbolist universe, contained in another of Benson's references to Symons, also suggests its relation to ether because of the implied element of waves shared by both.⁴²

Moreover, ether is another name for wireless. Evidently, that is due to its supposed capability of carrying electromagnetic waves. But there is more to it than that: it also has to do with the inevitable association of the all-pervading, potentially spiritual, mysterious character of ether with the sense of wonder caused by the unprecedented phenomenon of wireless communication. The first citation of ether in the sense of wireless in the O.E.D. dates from 1899, the heyday of the concept of ether, and juxtaposes ether and another mysterious invisible substance, the Röntgen rays. The second usage (1923) is in a phrase connecting ether with an entrancing voice: 'the climax of an entrancing week of ether-borne opera. . . She possesses the real "wireless voice".' In the following chapters, we will therefore explore various related ethereal implications of an important description of nature in *Heart of Darkness*, of occult 'wireless' communications in *Dracula* and "Wireless" and of radio broadcasting in *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, all involving the disembodied voice. Particularly, in the chapter on Conrad, we will take a close look at the history and historical ramifications of ether.

The Techno-Scientific Implications II:

Phonograph

Two of the works mentioned in Symons' texts are worthy of attention in relation to the technological disembodied voice. One is Villiers de l'Isle-Adam's *Tomorrow's Eve (L'Eve future)*, an 1886 SF novel featuring Thomas Alva Edison as a major character. It certainly resembles one of its predecessors, E.T.A. Hoffmann's 'Der Sandmann,' in the sense that it is a story of a human-like female automaton whose ideal beauty captivates a young man. But the novel is also radically different from the early nineteenth-century German tale in its incorporation of late nineteenth-century aural technologies and in its attitude toward technological voices. While 'Der Sandmann' ends with the protagonist's disillusionment at finding what he thought was the voice of a beautiful soul to be mechanical, the young man of *Tomorrow's Eve* becomes and remains fascinated with the voice of the automaton, fully knowing its technological nature. Spirituality and mechanicalness are mutually opposed in the former, whereas an affinity between one's soul and aural technologies is suggested in the latter.

Villiers de l'Isle-Adam's novel is full of technological disembodied voices, such as those emerging from the phonograph and telephone. The songs of mechanical birds with a phonograph inside them resound in an underground room, and Edison communicates with people, using hidden speakers around his room. The most important of them all is the enthralling voice of a phonograph set in the female android.

Although she is most of the time described as mechanical, the android behaves independently in an important scene, suggesting that she has a soul of her own.⁴³ She is also telepathically connected to a human soul, the disembodied mind of a woman in a coma.

There are other *fin-de-siècle* instances which suggest the connection between the phonograph and the soul or deep self. In Bram Stoker's *Dracula*, a phonographic voice strikes a major female character as the voice of a soul. Having heard a doctor's diary recorded on phonographic cylinders, Mina Harker exclaims: 'That is a wonderful machine. [...] It told me, in its very tones, the anguish of your heart. It was like a soul crying out to Almighty God.'⁴⁴ In Arthur Machen's story, 'The Autophone,' an occult disc brought by a stranger reproduces voices of the past, exposing a clergyman's hidden self.⁴⁵

The Techno-Scientific Implications III:

Voice of a Soul, Voice of Nothing

A different relationship between the disembodied voice and self, however, is implied in Symons' discussion of another work, Maeterlinck's *La Princesse Maleine*. In a passage on the play in 'The Decadent Movement in Literature,' Symons refers to the fact that, according to Maeterlinck, the play was written for marionettes. And both Symons and Maeterlinck link marionettes to a self deeper than an ordinary one. In the Préface to the English translation of his plays, Maeterlinck gives the marionette's affinity with a soul deeper than can

be reached by the spectacle of the normal human drama, and explains that this is why he prefers the marionette over the actor. In *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*, Symons suggests that the impersonal voice of the marionette is the voice of a deeper self.⁴⁶

The linking by Maeterlinck and Symons of the marionette voice and a deeper self, however, is countered by a contrastive marionette voice in another of the *fin-de-siècle* plays that left an indelible impression on Symons, Alfred Jarry's *Ubu Roi*, whose performance Symons, together with Yeats, saw in 1896. In an essay of the same year on the play, 'A Symbolist Farce,' Symons considers it, first and foremost, as a marionette play:

M. Jarry's idea, in this symbolical buffoonery, was to satirise humanity by setting human beings to play the part of marionettes, hiding their faces behind cardboard masks, tuning their voices to the howl and squeak which tradition has considerately assigned to the voices of that wooden world, and mimicking the rigid inflexibility and spasmodic life of puppets by a hopping and reeling gait.⁴⁷

The marionette disembodied voice was accompanied by an invisible orchestra behind the scenes. In contrast to the notions of Maeterlinck, however, the disembodied voice points to the non-existence of a deeper, spiritual self. Unlike the Wagnerean invisible orchestra at Bayreuth, Jarry's counterpart consists of 'a piano, cymbals, and drums' and plays jangling 'marionette music of fairs.' In short, what Symons saw in

Jarry was the 'antithesis to Maeterlinck.'⁴⁸ In discussing the Symbolist bodiless voice of a soul, therefore, it is most likely that the *fin-de-siècle* British critic was simultaneously aware of the shadow of the other disembodied voice signifying the emptiness of a self.

As regards new aural technologies, this kind of wavering between a deeper self and the denial of it can be observed in two wireless fictions, "Wireless" and *Lady Chatterley's Lover*. This may well derive from the wireless' inherent association with diffusion and distance, in contrast with the reproductive capacity of the phonograph.⁴⁹ Wireless is by its nature concerned with the building of a global network, whereas the possible uses of the phonograph are of more private nature and as a subordinate tool for far-distance communication and broadcasting. Wireless was first used to help establish a global network of communication between British battleships at sea; it then gave rise to the world-wide radio boom in the 1920s, a step further in the construction of the global village. On the other hand, the phonographic disembodied voice of Caruso was mostly consumed in isolation at home. Edison thought of the potential use of the phonograph as a recorder of a message to be sent by telephone, and it has been used to provide music for broadcasting. We will further consider the issue of the wavering in the chapters on Kipling and Lawrence.

The Sexual-Somatic Implications I:

The Problematization of the Dichotomy of Soul and Body

Behind Symons' emphasis on disembodiedness and soul, one can discern his, and his age's, strong awareness of the sexual-somatic element in man

The bodily and the spiritual comprise the two sides of the same coin in Symons, and this attitude is probably derived, firstly, from need to survive in an age when the social purity campaigns were putting pressures on those advocating sexual freedom, including literary decadents; and, secondly, from a change in the map of body and soul brought about by the progress in physiological studies.

More specifically, as R.K.R.Thornton observes, Symons' 1893 'The Decadent Movement in Literature' was most likely written in response to Richard Le Gallienne's repeated attacks on Decadent art in a number of texts published in 1892-3.⁵⁰ In 'Considerations Suggested by Mr. Churton Collins' "Illustrations of Tennyson,' Gallienne links Decadence to insane and limited thinking; in *The Religion of a Literary Man*, he criticizes it for its sensual-materialist attitude toward life; in the beginning of *English Poems*, he displays Francophobia and Wildephobia; and, in a poem in the same poems, titled 'The Décadent Speaks to His Soul,' Decadent literature is seen as the abuse of the soul by the body.⁵¹ Symons' choice of the disembodied voice of a human soul as the metaphor for Decadent literature, therefore, can be taken as an effort to defend it by underplaying its physical-sensual side and thus spiritualizing it. In other words, while Symons was aware of the

physical, the body had to be strategically concealed.

A look at a number of other essays and reviews by Symons also reveals his complex attitude towards the relation of body and soul. At the same time as he extolled the spiritual mysticism of Symbolist art, he was drawn to the vivid corporality and animality of music hall artistes, praising some of them in reviews as real total artists.⁵² Dancers in particular interested him: in an essay titled 'The World as Ballet,' he praises dance as an embodiment of primitive animal life 'having its own way passionately,' which gives it 'its preeminence among the more than imitative arts.'⁵³ What impresses him about Jarry's play was also the expression of 'what is primitively animal in humanity' on the stage.⁵⁴ Though, in another essay, 'Pantomime and the Poetic Drama,' Symons tries to make sense of the split between body and soul, claiming the ultimate oneness of the popular art of pantomime and the high art of the poetic drama, it is nevertheless possible to characterize his attitude toward body and soul as burdened with what R.K.R.Thornton calls 'the Decadent dilemma,' the inner conflict between an active interest in the worldly and a yearning for the unworldly⁵⁵

The problematization of the relationship between body and soul is not confined to Arthur Symons. The *fin-de-siècle* fiction of Arthur Machen often highlights as a source of horror the material-physiological foundation of the soul that destroys the traditional dichotomy of body and soul. For example, 'The Great God Pan' (1894) centres around an operation on 'a certain group of nerve cells in the

brain' that physiologically enables one to see the world of spirit. Another 1894 work, 'The Inmost Light,' is a story of a doctor who performs an operation to take out a soul, which turns out to resemble an opal in texture and colour. Thus, by these medico-occult means, Machen's texts put the boundary between soul and body into question.⁵⁶

Perhaps the most famous instance can be found in the characters of Lord Henry Wotton and the eponymous hero in Oscar Wilde's *The Picture of Dorian Gray*. The following words of Lord Henry, which change the course of Dorian's life, would have required no explanation at this time: 'Nothing can cure the soul but the senses, just as nothing can cure the senses but the soul. [...] That is one of the great secrets of life.'⁵⁷ That the relationship between soul and body can be taken as the central theme of the novel is confirmed by Lord Henry's later meditation.

Soul and body, body and soul—how mysterious they were! There was animalism in the soul, and the body had its moments of spirituality. The senses could refine, and the intellect could degrade. Who could say where the fleshly impulse ceased, or the physical impulse began? How shallow were the arbitrary definitions of ordinary psychologists! [...] The separation of spirit from matter was a mystery, and the union of spirit with matter was a mystery also.'⁵⁸

Under Henry's influence, Dorian then looks for a way of destroying the traditional dichotomy between soul and body, seeking to elaborate some

new scheme of life that would have its reasoned philosophy and its ordered principles, and finds in the spiritualising of the senses its highest realisation.'⁵⁹

Wilde's attitude may well have been influenced by his aesthetic master, Walter Pater. In the most famous of his books, the birth of the Renaissance is equated with the stirring of the sense of the physical after the ascetic Middle Ages; beauty and art are suggested as dissolving the dualism of body and soul. In *Marius the Epicurean*, too, a reading of Apuleius' story of Cupid and Psyche leads the protagonist to an epiphanic moment of the dissolution of the dichotomy of body and soul, whose influence is felt throughout his life: 'The human body in its beauty, as the highest potency of all the beauty of material objects, seemed to him [Marius] just then to be matter no longer, but, having taken celestial fire, to assert itself as indeed the true though visible soul or spirit in things.'⁶⁰

The *fin-de-siècle* problematization of body and soul concerns homosexuality, too. Judging from his relationships with Havelock Ellis and John Addington Symonds, Arthur Symons most likely had some intimate knowledge of the then burgeoning emancipatory sexology and its theory of homosexuality. He was close to Ellis, the author of *Sexual Inversion*, travelling and sharing rooms with him. He also knew John Addington Symonds, the early collaborator with Ellis on the book. The younger Symons had been exchanging letters with Symonds, seeking the advice of the senior scholar-critic, since the age of twenty. The memoir Symons wrote about Symonds suggests that the younger

man was aware of the other's sexuality, since it describes Symonds' Venetian lover, Angelo Fusato.⁶¹ Symons' anonymous review of Symonds' *Our Life in the Swiss Highlands* also hints at his knowledge of the scholar's secret by making specific references to the three chapters in which homoeroticism is strongly present.⁶² John Addington Symonds in turn wrote a letter to Symons, thanking him for the review and his 'understanding of the real man who has "never spoken out" yet.'⁶³

It is worthy of note that Symonds' pioneering study of homosexuality is characterized by the typically *fin-de-siècle* spiritualizing of the physical. As Linda Dowling indicates, his work on homosexuality derives, at least partly, from the mid-to-late nineteenth-century Oxford gay culture which read ~~the~~ Platonic love in terms of homosexuality, and vice versa.⁶⁴ He may also have been influenced by K. H. Ulrichs, the pioneer of gay sexology he admired, whose congenital theory of homosexuality is concerned with the body-soul problem, summed up in the phrase 'anima muliebris virile corpore inclusa' (female soul in male body). Although he dismissed that particular concept of Ulrichs' as out of date in his autobiographical text⁶⁵, Symonds nonetheless eulogized the ideals of Greek love and Whitman's comradeship in a way that problematizes the dualism of body and soul. His advocacy of these ideals is to a large extent the eulogy of the physical desire under the guise of spirituality, leading to the disruption of the dichotomy.⁶⁶ The homosexual factor thus looms large in this question.

The Sexual-Somatic Implications II:

Voice Over Text in Gay Discourse

The figure of talking, repeatedly employed in Symonds's letters, deserves attention here. In his letter thanking Symons for the review implicitly sympathetic to his homosexuality, Symonds writes thus: 'I am unfeignedly glad to hear that you wrote that review in the St James' Gazette. It went straight to my heart, and made me do what I have only once before done: sit down and *talk* to the anonymous reviewer of a book of mine' (my emphasis).⁶⁷ Later in the same letter, the desire to come out is equated with the desire to speak out: 'You are so good to me, and so understanding of the real man who has "never spoken out" yet, that I should like to tell you some things about myself wh [sic.] cannot well be written.'⁶⁸ As in Bram Stoker's letter to Whitman, which will be examined later, the telling of what cannot be written is tantamount to the confessing of one's secret sexuality. Voice is given priority over text when Symonds deals with the question of self-expression as a homosexual. It may also have something to do with the frequency of the description of the attractive male voice in his writings.

Voice often appears in conjunction with touch in *fin-de-siècle* homosexual writers. In another letter, Symonds refers to the fact that he has not met Symons yet, by saying: 'We have not yet touched hands or exchanged the magnetism of spoken words.'⁶⁹ Symonds may have had a homoerotic interest in the younger man; he elsewhere asked Symons for his photograph, too.⁷⁰ Likewise, Walter Pater's *Marius the Epicurean* contains key scenes tinged with the homoeroticism

suggested by disembodied voice and touch,⁷¹ as do Bram Stoker's vampire novel and Oscar Wilde's symbolist play, both of which will receive close attention in later chapters.

Conclusion

In spite of the de-politicizing, transcendent, aestheticist stance that Arthur Symons intends by the phrase, 'disembodied voice of a human soul', four major implications, socio-political, aesthetico-linguistic, techno-scientific, sexual-somatic, can thus be discerned within it. For the rest of the present thesis, we will explore the disembodied voice in its manifold manifestations in the contexts of these four implications. The next chapter is centred on the disembodied voice in Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* as a work belonging to the tradition of Gothic literature. We will first examine the implications of voice, particularly of the disembodied voice, in classic Gothic fictions and the proto-Romantic culture of which Gothic literature is part. In doing so, we will clarify the relation between voice and modern alternative subjectivity which originates in the culture of proto-Romanticism. We will, then, move on to the imperial novella of Conrad, and explore the vocal implications in the text, drawing on other texts by him and others, when necessary. The following chapter, therefore, will have a dual aim: to outline a genealogy of the disembodied voice from the late eighteenth century until the end of the next; and to explore the significances of the bodiless voice in relation to Conrad's novella and its age.

NOTES

¹ See Robert Rivlin and Karen Gravelle, *Deciphering the Senses: The Expanding World of Human Perception* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1984), pp.77-79.

² Didier Anzieu, *The Skin Ego*, trans. by Chris Turner (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1989), pp.157-173.

³ François Dolto, *L'image inconsciente du corps* (Paris: Seuil, 1984), pp.46-49.

For Jacques Lacan, too, the voice as *objet a*, a part-object which is the cause of desire, is prespecular. In an essay in *Écrits*, he states that the *objets a* have no specular image. He elsewhere suggests the affinity between the ear and the unconscious, saying that: 'in the field of the unconscious the ears are the only orifice that cannot be closed.' See Jacques Lacan, 'The Subversion of the Subject and Dialectic of Desire in the Freudian Unconscious,' in his *Écrits: A Selection*, trans. by Alan Sheridan (New York: Norton, 1977), pp.292-325 (p.315); and also Jacques Lacan, *The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psycho-Analysis*, ed. by Jacques-Alain Miller, trans. by Alan Sheridan (London: Penguin, 1979), p.195.

⁴ Philippe Lacoue-Labarthe, 'The Echo of the Subject,' in his *Typography: Mimesis, Philosophy, Politics*, ed. by Christopher Fynsk (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1989), pp.43-138.

⁵ Steven Connor suggests the connection between the disembodied voice, which he calls 'the voice of the acousmètre,' and the modern self. He, however, does not elaborate on it, briefly considering two texts of late Modernism, Joyce's *Finnegans Wake* and Beckett's *The Unnamable*. His approach is also different from ours, in that he considers the experience of reading these novels and what is involved in it, whereas

we will focus on descriptions of, and references to, the disembodied voice in texts. See Steven Connor, 'The Modern Auditory I,' in *Rewriting the Self: Histories from the Renaissance to the Present*, ed. by Roy Porter (London: Routledge, 1997), pp.203-223 (pp.221-223).

⁶ Arthur Symons, 'The Decadent Movement in Literature,' *Harper's New Monthly Magazine*, November 1893, pp.858-867 (p.862).

⁷ By taking the double approach, we also hope to avoid the kind of arguments that are too linear and reductive, such as those based on 'technological determinism,' the view that new technologies are the unilateral cause for social change and the modern world is their creation. Marshall MacLuhan's and Walter J. Ong's classic discussions of the role of voice in the cultures of the print and the modern media, for instance, are flawed by this 'technological determinism.' In spite of insights and inspirations, Friedrich A. Kittler's more recent books on the media and text are occasionally hampered by the same tendency. For a detailed definition of 'technological determinism,' see Raymond Williams, *Television: Technology and Cultural Form* (Hanover: Wesleyan Univ. Press, 1992), pp.3-25. See also Marshall MacLuhan, *The Gutenberg Galaxy: The Making of Typographic Man* (Toronto: Univ. of Toronto Press, 1962); his *Understanding Media: The Extensions of Man* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1964); Walter J. Ong, *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word* (London: Methuen, 1982); Friedrich A. Kittler, *Discourse Networks 1800/1900*, trans. by Michael Metteer, with Chris Cullens (Stanford: Stanford Univ. Press, 1990); his *Literature Media Information Systems*, ed. and intro. by John Johnston (Amsterdam: G+B Arts International, 1997); his *Gramophone, Film, Typewriter*, trans. by Geoffrey Winthrop-Young and Michael Wutz (Stanford:

Stanford Univ. Press, 1999).

⁸ Arthur Symons, 'Paul Verlaine,' *The National Review*, 19 (1892), 501-515 (pp.501 and 503).

⁹ Arthur Symons, *The Symbolist Movement in Literature* (London: Heinemann, 1899), p.89.

¹⁰ Holbrook Jackson, *The Eighteen Nineties: A Review of Art and Ideas at the Close of the Nineteenth Century* (1913; repr. London: Cresset, 1988), pp.65-67. The change of emphasis is probably partly due to the puritan ambience of society in general in the post-Wilde-trial period and partly to the personal influence of William Butler Yeats' mysticism, to whom *The Symbolist Movement in Literature* was dedicated.

¹¹ Symons, *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*, pp.154 and 159.

¹² François Bresson, 'La lecture et ses difficultés,' in Roger Chartier ed. *Pratiques de la lecture* (Paris: Rivages, 1985), pp.12-21.

¹³ Symons, 'The Decadent Movement in Literature,' p.859.

¹⁴ Symons, 'The Decadent Movement in Literature,' pp.860 and 866. It might be as well to note here that Rosalind Williams considers the hero of *À Rebours*, Des Esseintes, as a typical *fin-de-siècle* elitist consumer, who shops to assert his or her aristocratic individuality, but, in doing so, becomes increasingly entangled in the vulgar world of consumerism. The question of the *fin-de-siècle* consumer society, linked to the affluence of the West, will emerge later in our discussion of Conrad and Wilde. See Rosalind Williams, *Dream Worlds: Mass Consumption in Late Nineteenth-Century France* (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1982), pp.107-153.

¹⁵ Symons, 'The Decadent Movement in Literature,' pp.860-2.

¹⁶ Symons, *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*, pp.6-10, 89-91, 154 and 159.

¹⁷ Symons, *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*, pp.154-165. The collection of essays by Maeterlinck, *Le Trésor des Humbles*, which was highly valued by Symons, contains references to the soul as voice and as the listening ear.

¹⁸ Symons, 'The Decadent Movement in Literature,' p.859.

¹⁹ Symons, *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*, pp.82, 86 and 91.

²⁰ Symons, *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*, pp.6 and 10.

²¹ It is true that the question of the two visions is very old, but, as M.H.Abrams classic suggests, it comprises an important aspect of Romanticism. See Martin Jay, *Force Fields: Between Intellectual History and Cultural Critique* (London: Routledge, 1993), pp.99-113; and M.H.Abrams, *Natural Supernaturalism: Tradition and Revolution in Romantic Literature* (London: Norton, 1971), pp.341, 356-7, 363-4, 375-7 and 411-27.

²² John Neubauer, *The Emancipation of Music from Language: Departure from Mimesis in Eighteen-Century Aesthetics* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1986), p.1.

²³ Paul de Man, *Allegories of Reading: Figural Language in Rousseau, Nietzsche, Rilke, and Proust* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1979), pp.88-89.

²⁴ Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship*, ed. and trans. by Eric A. Blackall in cooperation with Victor Lange (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1989), pp.332-333; Arthur Schopenhauer, *The World as Will and Representation*, trans. by E. F. Payne, 2vols (New York: Dover, 1969), I, p.278.

²⁵ Johann Gottfried Herder, 'An Excerpt from *Kalligone* (1800): Part II Section 2 Chapter IV: On Music,' in *Musical Aesthetics: A Historical Reader*, ed. by Edward A. Lippman, 3 vols (Stuyvesant: Pendragon,

1986), II: *The Nineteenth Century*, 33-43 (pp.40-41).

²⁶ John Neubauer places Herder as a precursor of German Romantic aesthetics of music, expounded by those such as Heinrich Wackenroder, Ludwig Tieck, Novalis, and E.T.A.Hoffmann. See Neubauer, pp.159-163 and 190-191.

²⁷ Paul Verlaine, *Selected Poems*, trans. by C.F.MacIntyre, bilingual edition (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1948), pp.182-3

²⁸ Charles Chadwick, *Symbolism* (London: Methuen, 1971), pp.4-5.

²⁹ Charles Baudelaire, *Le Spleen de Paris: Petits poèmes en prose*, in his *Œuvres complètes*, ed. by Claude Pichois (Paris: Éditions Gallimard, 1975), pp.273-374 (pp.275-76)

³⁰ Paul Verlaine, *Selected Poems*, pp.180-1

³¹ The Wagner cult in France was at its peak in the 1880s, but it was still strong in the 90s. See Elwood Hartman, *French Literary Wagnerism* (London: Garland, 1988). It is to be noted that most of the writers referred to in Symons' two texts are discussed as Wagnerians in Hartman's book.

³² David Michael Hertz, *The Tuning of the Word: The Musico-Literary Poetics of the Symbolist Movement* (Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois Univ. Press, 1987), pp.xiii and 21-31. Charles Baudelaire, 'Richard Wagner and *Tannhäuser* in Paris,' trans. by P.E.Charvet, in his *Baudelaire: Selected Writings on Art and Literature* (London: Penguin, 1972), pp.325-357.

³³ Edward A. Lippman ed., *Musical Aesthetics: A Historical Reader*, II, 3; See also Edward Lippman, *A History of Western Musical Aesthetics* (London: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1992), pp.210-211.

³⁴ Herder, 'An Excerpt from *Kalligone*.' See also Edward Lippman, *A History of Western Musical Aesthetics*, pp.207-210. .

³⁵ Stéphane Mallarmé, *Les Mots Anglais: Petite Philologie*, in *Œuvres Complètes de Stéphane Mallarmé*, ed. by Henri Mondor and G. Jean-Aubry (Paris: Gallimard, 1945), pp.857-1059 (pp.938 and 947).

³⁶ Max Müller, *The Lectures of the Science of Language*, 3rd edn. (London: Longman, Green, Longman, and Roberts, 1862), pp.254-279 and 349-399.

³⁷ Nobuo Takeuchi, 'Kodai no Kamigami,' in *Mallarmé Zenshu III Bessatsu:Kaidai, Chushaku* (Tokyo: Chikuma, 1998), 119-170.

³⁸ Linda Dowling, *Language and Decadence in the Victorian Fin de Siècle* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1986).

³⁹ Dowling, *Language and Decadence in the Victorian Fin de Siècle*, pp.175-243.

⁴⁰ Dowling, *Language and Decadence in the Victorian Fin de Siècle*, pp.207-8.

⁴¹ Dowling, *Language and Decadence in the Victorian Fin de Siècle*, p.11; Johann Gottfried Herder, *On the Origin of Language*, in *On the Origin of Language*, by Jean-Jacques Rousseau and Johann Gottfried Herder, trans. by John H. Moran and Alexander Gode (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1966), pp.85-176 (p.131).

⁴² Donald R. Benson, "'Catching Light": Physics and Art in Walter Pater's Cultural Context,' in *One Culture: Essays in Science and Literature*, ed. by George Levine (Madison: Univ. of Wisconsin, 1987), pp.143-163 (p.159). Donald R. Benson, 'The Crisis of Space: Ether, Atmosphere, and the Solidarity of Men and Nature in *Heart of Darkness*,' in *Beyond the Two Cultures: Essays on Science, Technology, and Literature*, ed. by Joseph W. Slade and Judith Yaross Lee (Ames: Iowa State Univ. Press, 1990), pp.161-175 (p.167). Arthur Symons, *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*, pp. 10 and 146.

-
- ⁴³ Villiers de l'Isle-Adam, *Tomorrow's Eve*, trans. by Robert Martin Adams (Urbana: Univ. of Illinois Press, 1982), pp.206 and 214.
- ⁴⁴ Bram Stoker, *Dracula*, in *The Essential Dracula*, ed. by Leonard Wolf (London: Plume, 1993), pp.1-445 (p.271).
- ⁴⁵ Arthur Machen, 'The Autophone,' in his *Ritual and Other Stories* (Lewes: Tartarus, 1992), pp.25-29.
- ⁴⁶ Maurice Maeterlinck, Préface to *The Plays of Maurice Maeterlinck*, Second Series, trans. by Richard Hovey (New York: Duffield, 1908), pp.ix-xv. Symons, *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*, pp.154-165.
- ⁴⁷ Arthur Symons, 'A Symbolist Farce,' in his *Studies in Seven Arts* (London: Archibald Constable, 1906), pp.371-377 (p.372). The article was originally published in *Saturday Review*, 82 (19 December, 1896), 645-646.
- ⁴⁸ Symons, 'A Symbolist Farce,' p.374.
- ⁴⁹ Steven Connor points out the 'respective diffusive and reproductive capacities' of the telephone and the radio on one hand and the phonograph on the other. Connor, 'The Modern Auditory I,' p.216.
- ⁵⁰ R.K.R.Thornton, "Decadence" in Later Nineteenth-Century England,' in *Decadence and the 1890s*, ed. by Ian Fletcher (London: Edward Arnold, 1979), pp.15-30 (p.24): see also Karl Beckson, *Arthur Symons: A Life* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1987), p.95.
- ⁵¹ Richard Le Gallienne, 'Considerations Suggested by Mr. Churton Collins' "Illustrations of Tennyson,' *The Century Guild Hobby Horse*, 27 (July 1892), 77-83 (p.81); Richard Le Gallienne, *The Religion of a Literary Man* (London: Elkin Mathews and John Lane, 1893), pp.89-90; Richard Le Gallienne, *English Poems* (London: Elkin Mathews and John Lane, 1892), pp.3 and 106-109.
- ⁵² See, for example, Arthur Symons, "Acrobatics" at the Empire,' *The*

Star, 6 February 1892, p.4; his 'An Original Dancer: A New Artistic Creation by a Dancer who, Poet-like, was Born, not Made,' *The Star*, 20 February 1892, p.4; his 'She Walks on Her Hands: The Most Astonishing Contortionist the World Has Ever Seen,' *The Star*, 5 March 1892, p.4; and his 'An Artist in Serio-Comedy: Something Different from the Pinafore-and-Buckle-Shoe Variety,' *The Star*, 26 March 1892, p.4.

⁵³ Arthur Symons, 'The World as Ballet,' in his *Studies in Seven Arts*, 2nd impression (London: Archibald Constable, 1907), pp.387-391.

⁵⁴ Arthur Symons, 'A Symbolist Farce,' p.375.

⁵⁵ Arthur Symons, 'Pantomime and the Poetic Drama,' in his *Studies in Seven Arts*, pp.381-384. R.K.R.Thornton, "Decadence" in *Later Nineteenth-Century England*, pp.26-29.

⁵⁶ Arthur Machen, 'The Great God Pan,' in *The Caerleon Edition of the Works of Arthur Machen*, 9 vols (London: Martin Secker, 1923), III, 3-88 (pp.7 and 11-14); and his 'The Inmost Light,' in *The Caerleon Edition of the Works of Arthur Machen*, III, 91-136 (pp.115 and 129-130).

⁵⁷ Oscar Wilde, *The Picture of Dorian Gray*, in *The Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, 2nd edn. (Glasgow: Harper Collins, 1966), pp.17-159 (pp.30 and 134).

⁵⁸ Wilde, *The Picture of Dorian Gray*, p.54.

⁵⁹ Wilde, *The Picture of Dorian Gray*, p.99.

⁶⁰ Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean: His Sensations and Ideas* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986), p.53.

⁶¹ Arthur Symons, 'A Study of John Addington Symonds,' *The Fortnightly Review*, 121 (January-June 1924), 228-239 (p.230). See also John Addington Symonds, *The Memoirs of John Addington Symonds: The Secret Homosexual Life of a Leading Nineteenth-Century Man of Letters*, ed. and intro. by Phyllis Grosskurth (Chicago: Univ. of

Chicago Press, 1986), pp.271-283.

⁶² [Arthur Symonds], 'Essays from the Alps,' *St. James's Gazette*, 17 May 1892, p.6.

⁶³ John Addington Symonds, *The Letters of John Addington Symonds*, ed. by Herbert M. Schueller and Robert L. Peters, 3 vols (Detroit: Wayne State Univ. Press, 1969), III, 690-1 (p.691).

⁶⁴ See Linda Dowling, *Hellenism and Homosexuality in Victorian Oxford* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1994).

⁶⁵ Symonds, *Memoirs*, p.64.

⁶⁶ See John Addington Symonds, *Studies in Sexual Inversion Embodying: A Study in Greek Ethics and A Study in Modern Ethics* (n.p.: privately printed, 1928; repr. New York: AMS, 1975); and also his *Memoirs*.

⁶⁷ Symonds, *Letters*, III, p.690.

⁶⁸ Symonds, *Letters*, III, p.691

⁶⁹ Symonds, *Letters*, III, p.361

⁷⁰ Symonds, *Letters*, III, p.433

⁷¹ There are several scenes in which touch and disembodied voice suggest Pater's secret sexuality. Marius' encounter and burgeoning friendship with Cornelius—the Roman soldier who later introduces the hero to Christianity—starts with the disembodied 'youthful voice' of Cornelius and is marked by his laying a hand on Marius' shoulder. Significantly, the scene is preceded by another touch and disembodied voice, of a more symbolic character. In a mountainous region, Marius is nearly hit in the dark by a huge stone, which scene is accompanied by a voice and a touch of nature: 'From the steep slope a heavy mass of stone was detached, after some *whisperings* among the trees above his head, and rushing down through the stillness fell to pieces in a cloud of

dust across the road just behind him, so that he felt the *touch* upon his head (my emphases; 95). It seems that, by transferring the element of danger to the falling of the rock, Pater tries to conceal the perilous sexuality of the male friendship. Nonetheless, it is possible to see a symptom of homoeroticism in the disembodied voice and the touch shared by the two adjoining scenes.

Another scene is the epiphany the protagonist has, owing to a good overnight sleep. In it, he finds a beneficent alter ego, an imaginary companion inside himself, not unlike his former male friends. Again, that companionship is compared to 'the sense of a friendly hand laid upon him' (181). The voices of those he loves best are heard by him in the sleep (176). The scene contains a bird's song as well.

Voice and touch also appear in Marius' talk with Apuleius, who is a source of major influence for him. His talk with the revered poet is, apparently for no reason, abruptly brought to an end by 'a companion's hand laid, in the darkness,' on the shoulder of Apuleius (192). And what Marius later remembers of the scene is the voice of the poet. The reader is naturally tempted to seek some concealed psychological reason on the part of the author for such an enigmatic scene. Notably, when the young Marius relished Apuleius' tale of Psyche and Cupid, where a disembodied voice plays a key role, he was with Flavian, the first of his male companions to have attracted him.

Gothic-Romantic Voices, Conradian Voices:

Nostalgic for the Pre-Modern Aural-Oral

And Reflecting the *Fin-de-siècle* Colonial

Part I: Gothic-Romantic Voices

The Disembodied Voice in Classic Gothic Fiction

Voice, particularly that without a human body, plays a significant part in the whole range of Gothic fiction, from the canonical works by major writers of the genre, such as Ann Radcliffe, Matthew Lewis, Charles Maturin, to novels with a strong Gothic strain, like *Jane Eyre* and *Wuthering Heights*. Apart from the fiction of Radcliffe, which is scrutinized below, in Lewis's *The Monk*, for example, the voices of most major characters are either emphasized as being of extraordinary quality or play a key role in the plot. Maturin's *Melmoth the Wanderer* has in it some dramatic uses of voices, along with reference to an exquisitely attractive music accompanying the appearance of the accursed hero. Both of the Brontës' classic novels highlight voice in a number of crucial scenes: Lockwood's encounter with the ghost of Catherine, Jane's hearing the voice of Rochester's insane wife, and the telepathic vocal communication between Rochester and Jane which induces her to return to marry him. Charlotte Brontë's novel, moreover, starts with a depiction of the heroine's Gothic imaginings which are interrupted by a disembodied voice, and closes with the consoling voice of Jane, disembodied to its hearer the now-blind

Rochester.

Ann Radcliffe

The works of Ann Radcliffe deserve particular attention, not only because of her central place in Gothic fiction, but also because of the heightened awareness of voice and sound which they display. They are simply full of voices and sounds: beautiful singing voices, the charming voice of a heroine, the tremendous voice of a villain, the garrulous voice of a servant, mysterious voices and sounds of suspense, sounds of musical instruments, voices of nature varying from the murmur of a brook to the sighing of the wind, to the roarings of a torrent and a storm. Characters are very aural-conscious, incessantly hearing a voice or listening for a sound. The element of silence, which necessarily results from the strong aural awareness, is also prominent. Significantly, human voice almost always plays a key role in important scenes, dramatic, amorous, or evocative. For instance, *The Italian* starts with the hero's fascination by the voice of the veiled heroine, which is followed by two more typical scenes where the vocal is foregrounded: the utterance of a mysterious warning by a monk whose face is shrouded in a cowl, and the exquisite serenading of the music-loving hero by a fine tenor voice.

Those voices and sounds, which build the overall aural-oral ambience of Radcliffe's works, can be classified into four types. The first comprises the voices of nature and sounds of things, contributing to the Gothic representation of the world as soundscape. Together

with the picturesque scenic descriptions, they provide the sublime backdrop for action, characteristic of classic Gothic fiction. The second category is that of unidentified voices and sounds of mystery used to create the effect of suspense; they are heard in darkness, in a labyrinthine place, or on the other side of a door. And they are often sudden or intermittent, so that they make characters alert and listen in silence after their cessation. The third, and perhaps the most important, is the voice of overwhelming attraction or terror: the irresistible voice of a heroine, the powerful voice of a villain, or the heavenly singing voice. Whichever it may be, a voice of this kind is imbued with a transcendental, latently libidinal power. It is often heard when the speaker or singer is invisible in some way or other, adding to its power and inspiring the hearer's curiosity. The singing voice, frequently accompanied by a lute, is of particular significance, in its relation to the pre-modern, oral, popular culture, which will be shortly examined. Also important in this vein is the fourth kind of voice, the non-stop talk of a garrulous servant with a non-rational, superstitious mindset. This talk occasionally serves the hero as an oral source of information.

The Disembodied Voice and the Popular Oral Culture I:

Ann Radcliffe and Edmund Burke

There are two ways of placing this strong awareness of the aural-oral in Radcliffe in the larger context of the period: one is via Edmund Burke; the other, through Macpherson's Ossian poems. The connection

between Radcliffe and Burke is a familiar one: Alison Milbank points out that effects in the former's fiction are often explained in terms of the latter's notion of the sublime.¹ The comparison of the two, however, also reveals their similarity in respect of the aural-oral. Although most of the time revolving around the discussion of the visual-spatial, Burke's examination of the sublime implies the primacy of the aural. His *Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*, which is by implication also a treatise on the senses, cites obscurity, lack of visual clarity, as a characteristic of the sublime, while at the same time suggesting the vital significance of the aural aspect of language in its function of evoking the strongest emotion, that is, the emotion of the sublime. The following is taken from the passage that elaborates on his notion of obscurity:

The proper manner of conveying the *affections* of the mind from one to another, is by words; there is a great insufficiency in all other methods of communication; and so far is a clearness of imagery from being absolutely necessary to an influence upon the passions, that they may be considerably operated upon without presenting any image at all, by certain sounds adapted to that purpose; of which we have a sufficient proof in the acknowledged and powerful effects of instrumental music.²

Implied here is the contrast between the aural-linguistic and the visual, as well as the primacy of the former over the latter. This point is corroborated by Burke's later examples of the sublime. He

instances 'a fanatic preacher' and a passage from the book of Job where a visually obscure image is followed by a supernatural voice. The powerful emotional evocativeness to be found in the sounds of words, in sharp contrast to the lack of it in visual imagery, is once again suggested in the concluding chapter which focuses on the function of language. Many of the kinds of sounds that recur in Radcliffe's fiction—sudden sounds, unidentified sounds, loud sounds caused by such things as vast cataracts, raging storms and thunder—are also cited as instances of the sublime.

The following quotation from *The Mysteries of Udolpho*, a typical passage depicting the charm of a voice is helpful in further exploring the parallels between Burke and Radcliffe, as well as in connecting Radcliffe to the Ossian poems. One may add that the voice depicted is a disembodied voice, coming from an unseen source, one of many similar instances in Radcliffe's writings.

Her ear suddenly caught the notes of distant music, to which she listened attentively, and, soon perceiving this to be the instrument she had formerly heard at midnight, she rose, and stepped softly to the casement, to which the sounds appeared to come from a lower room.

In a few moments, their soft melody was accompanied by a voice so full of pathos, that it evidently sang not imaginary sorrows. Its sweet and peculiar tones she thought she had somewhere heard before; yet, if this was not fancy, it was, at most, a very faint recollection. It stole over her mind, amidst the anguish of her present suffering, like a celestial strain, soothing,

and re-assuring her; — ‘Pleasant as the gale of spring, that sighs on the hunter’s ear, when he awakens from dreams of joy, and has heard the music of the spirits of the hill.’*

But her emotion can be scarcely imagined, when she heard sung, with taste and simplicity of true feeling, one of the popular airs of her native province, to which she had so often listened with delight, when a child, and which she had so often heard her father repeat!³

The attraction of the singing is here related to its connection with popular culture and childhood and its distance from the sophistication of a civilized society: the song is a popular air of the heroine’s native province; it is the one she loved as a child; it is sung with touching simplicity. The voice in the passage thus suggests its closeness to a place and a time—popular culture and childhood—where aural-oral communication plays a larger role than in their more developed and complicated counterparts. It is tinged with the nostalgia for the pre-modern and pre-adult.

In Radcliffe’s fiction, a person’s character tends to be reflected in his or her attitude toward music; heroes and heroines are often very musical, while the villains of the two major works, *The Mysteries of Udolpho* and *The Italian*, are impervious to the charms of music. There is also an ordering of musical genres: music untainted with the corruption of urban culture is preferred to art music. The simple air sung naturally and feelingly is the most attractive sound in her work; music of the populace is normally represented with sympathy. There

are scenes in which people geographically and socially most remote from civilization produce excellent music with natural delicacy. Her second novel, *A Sicilian Romance*, even contains a favourable description of the music-making of the banditti, the people at the bottom of a society, in the wilderness of Sicily. Villains and villainesses can like music, but their music is something more in the vein of sophisticated court music. French opera is referred to disparagingly in *The Mysteries of Udolpho*. The connection between the attractive voice and popular culture, which is strongly oral, is again indicated by those instances.

Burke's treatise on the sublime also contains sections that suggest the connection between voice and oral culture. In Burke, visual clarity is equated with clarity of understanding, both of which are prominent in civilized cultures; it is therefore claimed, in the concluding chapter of his book, that the French language lacks the power of evoking the sublime because of its clear expressions, whereas 'the languages of most unpolished people [...] have a great force and energy of expression,' owing to their obscurity in meaning.⁴ Elsewhere in the book, the aural-oral, as well as the anti-visual, penchant in popular culture is suggested through the choice of examples—a fanatic preacher and superstitious tales of oral origin—and by juxtaposing it with the more visual orientation of learned culture.

Concerning the relationship between voice and popular culture in Radcliffe's fiction, the role of garrulous servants, one of the stock

figures of Gothic literature, also deserves mention. As was pointed out, they just cannot stop talking, immersed in the habit of lively verbal exchange; they are superstitious, always the first to believe in a supernatural cause when a mysterious incident occurs; and they sometimes serve the hero and heroine as an oral source of the information taken from among their fellow servants. In them, again, voice is combined with popular culture, among whose central elements are superstition and a strong habit of oral communication.⁵

It is interesting in this respect to note the distinction Freud makes between fairy stories and ghost stories. He says that, while fairy stories are immersed in the pre-industrial superstitious community of oral culture, the writer of ghost stories plays with 'our supposedly surmounted superstition.'⁶ As Maurice Richardson indicates, this distinction is also applicable to the relationship between fairy stories and Gothic romance.⁷ In Gothic fiction, the element of superstition, 'supposedly surmounted' but still surviving in a subterranean way, plays a role which is essential yet less central than in fairy tales, in the sense that, in the former, the mysteries giving rise to superstitious feelings are often—and always in the case of Radcliffe—debunked in the end.

The necessary yet marginalized function of superstition structurally parallels that allotted to the loquacious servant representing a popular, oral culture, whose presence is almost ubiquitous, and yet who always plays a minor role supporting the middle or upper-class hero or heroine. In Gothic fiction, the servant

and his superstitious mindset comprise a substructure, essential to the story although apparently marginalized. In contrast, the mindset of the hero and heroine is rational on the surface, though they are nonetheless prone to the superstitious feelings and ideas by virtue of their strong imaginations. This is explicitly stated of the hero of *The Italian*, Vincentio di Vivaldi.⁸ Classic Gothic fiction seems to have arisen at a particular historical period, to make up for the then generally recognized decline of popular oral culture. In other words, the then emerging cultural genre of Gothic fiction came into being as a nostalgic substitute for the disappearing oral culture, incorporating it in the minor shape of the superstitious servant and in the form of the powerful disembodied voice. Of relevance here is Terry Castle's perceptive view of the modern Gothic culture originating in late eighteenth century: she suggests that, as repression always leads to the return of the repressed as the uncanny, so the age of Enlightenment with its banishment of superstition paradoxically give rise to Gothic fiction, in which the rational and the superstitious co-exist.⁹ It is by now clear that both the attractive disembodied voice and the garrulous servant are connected to a proto-Romantic nostalgia for the pre-modern oral culture.¹⁰

The Disembodied Voice and Popular Oral Culture II:

Ann Radcliffe and Macpherson's Ossian Poems

The significance of the strong aural-oral presence in Radcliffe's fiction can also be explored by comparing it to yet another key text of

the latter half of the eighteenth century, James Macpherson's Ossian poems, lines from which are cited in the above quoted passage from *The Mysteries of Udolpho*: "Pleasant as the gale of spring, that sighs on the hunter's ear, when he awakens from dreams of joy, and has heard the music of the spirits of the hill". In Radcliffe's novel, it depicts the charm of the singing voice; in the original poem, *Fingal*, it is spoken by Ossian himself, in praise of the voice of Carrin, the bard of the Irish hero, Cuchullin. Like Radcliffe's fiction, the Ossian poems are also highly attuned to the aural-oral element in a number of ways, and the charming singing voice is a significant part of this. The joy given by the singing of poems is repeatedly mentioned; the bards are urged to sing again and again for mirth, for solace, and for encouragement. Not only the singing voice of bards but also those of heroes and of ghosts are described. There are passages in which the blindness of the supposed author, Ossian, himself once a noted singer-warrior, seems to heighten the aural-oral awareness. Interestingly, while narrating his tales to Malvina, Ossian is in turn fascinated by her disembodied voice. As in Radcliffe's novels, the world frequently presents itself as soundscape in rustling leaves, the roaring wind, an echoing heath, the resounding sea and whispering streams. The noise of battle is emphasized: 'Shields sound; men fall. As a hundred hammers on the son of the furnace, so rose, so rung their swords.'¹¹

The relationship between voice and oral culture is also existent. Firstly, the bard is an oral historian, the only kind of historian in an illiterate society: the heroes in the poems know that for their deeds to

be sung through his voice is to achieve immortality in history, and the poem constantly emphasizes its importance. Secondly, the fact that the significance of the Ossian poems lies in their being a product of oral culture was noted by their translator, James Macpherson, and an early commentator, Hugh Blair. Those sung poems, it was claimed, had comprised the most important aspect of the cultural life of the oral society to which the poems belonged.

Thirdly, it scarcely requires saying that the latter half of the eighteenth century saw an extraordinary rise in interest in oral culture, ancient or popular, both in England and the continent.¹² The craze for textual collections of folklore spread over the whole Europe; along with Thomas Percy's *Reliques of Ancient English Poetry*, Macpherson's Ossian was a notable British example of this vogue. As Peter Burke suggests, just when they lost touch with the popular oral culture, the educated began to admire it.¹³ The element of nostalgia, therefore, is evident in the craze. The upper and middle classes felt nostalgic for what they were destroying through the process of industrialization.

The Highland Oral Culture and Voice:

The Case of Walter Scott

It is instructive in this context to look at yet another related writer: Walter Scott. An admirer of Percy's collection, and aware of the disappearance of oral culture in Scotland, Scott himself collected, as well as imitated, poems of oral origin. He makes a typically Romantic argument for the inseparability of music, poetry and the oral culture of

a primitive society:

The more rude and wild the state of society, the more general and violent is the impulse received from poetry and music. The muse, whose effusions are the amusement of a very small part of a polished nation, records, in the lays of inspiration, the history, the laws, the very religion, of savages.— Where the pen and the press are wanting, the flow of numbers impresses upon the memory of posterity the deeds and sentiments of their forefathers. Verse is naturally connected with music, and, among a rude people, the union is seldom broken.¹⁴

The Celts are, he claims, particularly musical and poetic. In his 'Essay on Imitations of the Ancient Ballad,' Scott also traces the downfall of minstrels, the carriers of oral tradition back to the invention of printing.¹⁵ His consciousness of both the aural aspect of poetry and the oral society to which it belongs is thus evident.

Furthermore, in *Rob Roy* and *Waverley*, two of his novels set in the Highlands—then the last stronghold of Scottish oral culture as well as the supposed birthplace of Macpherson's work—there are moments of significance when the vocal element and that of oral culture overlap. These novels are both accounts of an English traveller's encounter with Highland culture. In *Rob Roy*, the traveller-narrator's first encounter with Highland culture occurs on his hearing the impressive disembodied voice of the eponymous highland hero:

'No, no, landlord,' answered a strong deep voice. [...] This was the first time I had heard the Scottish accent, or, indeed, that I had familiarly met with an individual of the ancient nation by whom it was spoken.¹⁶

The depth and strength of Rob Roy's voice is referred to several times in the novel.

Waverley contains a series of scenes highlighting the vocal, culminating in a Highland woman's recitation of traditional verse, in which her attractive voice, harmonizing with the voices of surrounding nature, creates a kind of cosmic music. The singer is a young woman named Flora, a folklorist of the local culture and sister of a Highland chieftain, Fergus Mac-Ivor Vich Ian Vohr. Like a bard, she sings to a harp amidst the Radcliffesque sublime scenery with the accompaniment of natural sounds:

Flora had exchanged the measured and monotonous recitative of the bard for a lofty and uncommon Highland air, which had been a battle-song in former ages. A few irregular strains introduced a prelude of a wild and peculiar tone, which harmonized well with the distant waterfall, and the soft sigh of the evening breeze in the rustling leaves of an aspen which overhung the seat of the harpress.¹⁷

The words of the Highland song are then quoted in full in the novel, indicating its importance. There is also an indirect reference in the same scene to the Ossian poems: looking back from the vantage point of

the nineteenth century, Scott has Flora prophesy in 1745—two decades before the publication of the Ossian poems—that traditional Gaelic poetry, if translated, ‘cannot fail to produce a deep and general sensation.’¹⁸ That she sings the poems in English translation also suggests parallels with Macpherson’s work.

Flora’s recitation is preceded by three songs and one poem. Before her singing comes that of the chieftain’s bard, which in turn is preceded by the singing of a supernatural legend by a Scottish girl, and that of her compatriot with an enormous memory for popular songs, both living on the border of the Highlands. The first in the series of these aural-conscious incidents is the poem made by the eponymous English protagonist himself upon his departure for Scotland. The dichotomy between the visual-static and the aural-dynamic is prominent in this performance; the former signifies the mirror-like delusion indulged in by the then bookish hero, while the latter, represented by voices of nature such as the groaning of an oak and the roaring of waves, foretells the enlightening reality he is now to encounter. Thus the poem symbolizes the hero leaving the dreamy world of illusions built by his addiction to reading for the real one, of which the oral culture comprises a large part.

Popular Oral Culture and Voice:

The Case of Johann Gottfried Herder

A look at a representative non-British example of the nostalgic craze for pre-modern oral society would be relevant here. In ‘Viertes

Kritisches Wäldchen' (1769), Herder contrasted the coldness of the eye with the passion inherent in hearing, which was to lead to important Romantic valorizations of the aural-oral in a number of fields. His prioritizations of it in philology (*Über den Ursprung der Sprache*) and aesthetics (*Kalligone*) have already been mentioned. But more important here is Herder's contribution to the eighteenth-century 'discovery of the people, one of whose most well-known instances is his folkloric collections, *Volkslieder*. In 'Von Ähnlichkeit der mittlern englischen und deutschen Dichtkunst, nebst Verschiednem, das daraus folget' (1777), based on introductions to the collections, Herder cited the names of both Macpherson and Percy with admiration and eulogized the rise of the British interest in its own pre-modern oral literature, without which, according to him, the health and glory of a nation was not possible. Significantly, his metaphor for the essence of the people is vocal: 'Stimme des Volks.'¹⁹ He elsewhere attacks modernity, comparing it to an excess of light, and urges the reader to go to pre-modern societies to *listen*.²⁰ In Herder, as in Scott and Burke, modernity is linked to the eye, whereas pre-modernity is associated with the ear and the mouth, and is regarded with acute nostalgia.

The Disembodied Voice and Modern Alternative Subjectivity I:

The Case of Arthur Schopenhauer

The disembodied singing voice in the earlier quoted passage from *The Mysteries of Udolpho*, with its suggested link to this nostalgia for pre-modern oral culture, also has two characteristics which point to a

certain notion of the self. Firstly, the voice relates to one's real self: it 'evidently sang not imaginary sorrows.' Secondly, it is distant from one's ordinary consciousness: it is something she thinks she has heard before and yet has 'a very faint recollection' of. What is suggested is, therefore, a self which is vocal, genuine, and yet of which one is normally hardly aware. We will now explore the implications of the Gothic-Romantic bodiless voice in relation to the question of subjectivity, by examining two other near-contemporary passages featuring a disembodied voice.

The first volume of Arthur Schopenhauer's magnum opus, *The World as Will and Representation (Die Welt als Wille und Vorstellung)*, contains an important reference to a voice of Gothic character in relation to the notion of self. In Note 5 of Section 54 (Book 4), the German philosopher contrasts the illusory nature of the concept of the individual self to the transcendence of a disembodied voice from nowhere:

The following remark can also help the person for whom it is not too subtle to understand clearly that the individual is only the phenomenon, not the thing-in-itself. On the one hand, every individual is the subject of knowing, in other words, the supplementary condition of the possibility of the whole objective world, and, on the other, a particular phenomenon of the will, of that will which objectifies itself in each thing. But this double character of our inner being does not rest on a self-existent unity, otherwise it would be possible for us to be conscious of ourselves *in ourselves and*

independently of the objects of knowing and willing. Now we simply cannot do this, but as soon as we enter into ourselves in order to attempt it, and wish for once to know ourselves fully by directing our knowledge inwards, we lose ourselves in a bottomless void; we find ourselves like a hollow glass globe, from the emptiness of which a voice speaks. But the cause of this voice is not to be found in the globe, and since we want to comprehend ourselves, we grasp with a shudder nothing but a wavering and unstable phantom.²¹ (*italics in the original*)

The affinity between this voice of mystery and transcendence and those (voices appearing) in Gothic fiction is evident. It is also obvious that the unknown voice represents the rejection of the notion of the modern rational subject based on a supposedly unified consciousness. And it is possible to take the 'wavering and unstable phantom' of the disembodied voice as pointing to one's other, 'deeper' self, the alternative anti-Cartesian subject. Such voice-related subjectivity is clearly connected with another aspect of the valorization of the aural-oral in Schopenhauer: the prioritization of music over the other, visual arts. He considers music as the only art that is capable of expressing the unrepresentable ultimate reality, what he terms 'der Wille.' Interestingly, he admits that this privileged status of music cannot be proven. The unexplained transcendent nature of music is, according to Schopenhauer, something that can only be stated without demonstration and known by direct experience.²² The parallelism between the undemonstrability of the transcendence of music and the

unlocatability of the transcendent Gothic voice should be noted. On the other hand, elsewhere in the book, he characterizes the ordinary, false form of knowledge as a picture: 'What is knowledge? It is above all else and essentially representation. What is representation? A very complicated physiological occurrence in an animal's brain, whose result is the consciousness of a picture or image.'²³ Schopenhauer thus participates in the tradition of Herder in his prioritization of voice over vision. Given the Gothic-Romantic voices we have seen as they relate to anti-modern nostalgia, the philosopher's reference to the disembodied Gothic voice in relation to the notion of self strongly suggests the emergence of the voice-based, alternative subject in modernity, in reaction to the domination of the visual-rational model of self.²⁴ How it is connected with what de Man calls the 'melocentric' tradition will be discussed later in this chapter.

The Disembodied Voice and Modern Alternative Subjectivity II:

The Case of William Wordsworth

Another major instance of a disembodied voice pointing to the modern alternative subjectivity which differs from the dominant rational-individual model of self is contained in *The Prelude* of William Wordsworth, a poet whose art is closely linked to the language and oral culture of the indigenous people of the less modernized area(+s) of the country. Not surprisingly, instances indicating a strong aural presence abound in British Romantic poetry. The three poems featuring the bodiless voice of a bird ('To the Cuckoo,' 'Ode to a

Nightingale,' and 'To a Sky-Lark') have already been mentioned. The music of a harp without a human player is associated with an imagined utopia stirred into being by a divine intellectual breeze in Samuel Coleridge's 'The Eolian Harp.'²⁵ 'The Rime of the Ancient Mariner,' the poem told in the narrative form belonging to pre-modern oral culture, includes a description of angelic music at the crucial moment of the beginning of the mariner's regeneration. And the aural-vocal plenitude of 'Kubla Khan' hardly requires mentioning.

In the first book of *The Prelude*, music and verse are sanctified together; and the former is compared to the mind of man. The most relevant of the aural passages here, however, is the one characterized by a disembodied voice of nature at the climax of the poem. Climbing Snowdon at night, in the final book of the work, the poet-narrator experiences an epiphany, when he suddenly sees a huge moonlit sea of mist spread at his feet, and hears the voice of running water coming up from below. It strikes him as the voice of 'the Soul, the Imagination of the Whole':

When at my feet the ground appear'd to brighten,
 And with a step or two seem'd brighter still;
 Nor had I time to ask the cause of this,
 For instantly a Light upon the turf
 Fell like a flash: I look'd about, and lo!
 The Moon stood naked in the Heavens, at height
 Immense above my head, and on the shore

I found myself of a huge sea of mist,
 Which, meek and silent, rested at my feet:
 A hundred hills their dusky backs upheaved
 All over this still Ocean, and beyond,
 Far, far beyond, the vapours shot themselves,
 In headlands, tongues, and promontory shapes,
 Into the Sea, the real Sea, that seem'd
 To dwindle, and give up its majesty,
 Usurp'd upon as far as sight could reach.
 Meanwhile, the Moon look'd down upon this shew
 In single glory, and we stood, the mist
 Touching our very feet; and from the shore
 At distance not the third part of a mile
 Was a blue chasm; a fracture in the vapour,
 A deep and gloomy breathing-place thro' which
 Mounted the roar of waters, torrents, streams
 Innumerable, roaring with one voice.
 The universal spectacle throughout
 Was shaped for admiration and delight,
 Grand in itself alone, but in that breach
 Through which the homeless voice of Waters rose,
 That dark deep thoroughfare had Nature lodg'd
 The Soul, the Imagination of the Whole.²⁶

(1805 Text; Book XIII, ll.36-65)

The contrast between the spectacle high up and the voice from down below, with 'the Soul' residing in depth, should be noted. The bodiless voice of 'the Soul,' of 'waters, torrents, streams innumerable,' is later to be related to the divine 'under-presence' that supports the 'mighty mind' of the upper, visible region. The 1850 version also contains a similar image of the mind nourished by intent listening to the voice from the abyss. The association of the disembodied voice with what may be called the under-self is now clear. As in Schopenhauer the shift of attention from the exterior world to the interior enables one to encounter the hidden self represented by the mysterious disembodied voice, so the hearing at Snowdon of the powerful voice of nature originating in the invisible, lower region induces the poet-narrator to find the kind of alternative self whose existence one feels only in the privileged moments of an epiphany. It is also notable that, in Wordsworth, as in Radcliffe and others, the vocal indication of this alternative self is coexistent with a nostalgia for pre-modern oral culture.

Conclusion

Part I of this chapter, which started with the discussion of the disembodied voice in the major Gothic novelist, thus ends with the examination of it in the major poet of Romanticism. The Gothic-Romantic voice without a body has been shown to relate to both the nostalgia for a pre-modern oral society and to the modern alternative subject. In Part II, we will focus on Joseph Conrad as both an

inheritor of this Gothic-Romantic tradition and a creator of one of its important *fin-de-siècle* examples, the imperial Gothic novella *Heart of Darkness*. We will look at the Gothic character of the work, scrutinize its relations to manifold aspects of the last decade of the nineteenth century, and trace a genealogy of the disembodied voice as it concerns Conrad's African masterpiece and other related works.

Part II: Conradian Voices

The *Fin-de-siècle* Gothic Revival

After the classic work of Ann Radcliffe, the Gothic novel transformed itself into various types of fiction. Science Gothic came into being with Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein*; a highly original psychological Gothic novel was written by James Hogg; the Brontës contributed to the creation of domestic Gothic fiction. Gothic elements went into the works of Scott, Dickens, and the sensation novels, until, as Kelly Hurley observes, a resurgence of Gothic fiction occurred in late nineteenth-century Britain.

Hurley ascribes the phenomenon to various late-Victorian scientific discourses, such as evolutionism, criminal anthropology, degeneration theory, sexology, pre-Freudian psychology, all of which dismantled "conventional notions of the human" and re-made the human subject.²⁷ In a similar line of argument, David Glover also

names psychic research.²⁸ Furthermore, in his examination of Bram Stoker, Glover takes account of contemporary political factors, such as English liberalism in crisis and Irish nationalism. Indeed, the *fin-de-siècle* Gothic literature boasts a great diversity: the 'scientific romances' of H.G.Wells, pseudo-medical Gothic novels such as Arthur Machen's *The Three Impostors* and Stoker's *Dracula*; detective Gothic tales, represented by the Sherlock Holms series; imperial Gothic fictions such as Haggard's African romances, aestheticist Gothic novels like *The Picture of Dorian Gray*. Joseph Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* belongs to this *fin-de-siècle* tradition.

The function of the disembodied voice in *Heart of Darkness* resembles its counterpart in classic Gothic fiction, as does that of the bodiless voices in *Salomé*, *Dracula*, and Kipling's "Wireless" and *Kim*. The voice in *Heart of Darkness* is related to the nostalgia for the pre-modern oral culture, which, in Conrad's novella, is the African continent. The voice also points to the alternative subject, opposed to the English, metropolitan, vision-oriented, bourgeois self, in the sense that it reveals what is hidden from the supposedly normal, unified, rational consciousness. Here, the implications of the disembodied voice in Conrad will be explored in terms of the earlier mentioned four major factors: the socio-political, the aesthetico-linguistic, the techno-scientific, the sexual-somatic. The colonial situation of the late nineteenth century in both its domestic and international aspects, the Romantic aesthetico-linguistic tradition of aural-musical primacy, and the cultural significance of the then influential, originally scientific

concept of ether will be examined in turn; at the end of the chapter I will examine how the sexual-somatic aspect, is tied to the colonial situation, though seemingly only traces of it are observable in *Heart of Darkness*.

Conrad as Gothic Writer

Although the Gothic strain in the writings of Conrad was pointed out as early as 1921 by Edith Birkhead, no attempt has been made to explore the similarities between classic Gothic fiction and Conrad's novella, in terms of the treatment of voice.²⁹ Even the most detailed study to this day of Conrad's appropriation of the tradition of classic Gothic fiction, Joan Elizabeth Steiner's dissertation, 'Joseph Conrad and the Tradition of the Gothic Romance,' makes only one brief reference to a vocal characteristic of classic Gothic fiction. While enumerating a variety of Gothic features in Conrad's writings, such as the use of houses and ships as analogues of the haunted castle and natural descriptions to create an atmosphere of fear and suspense, Steiner only once touches upon the resounding voice of the Gothic villain.³⁰

Several other scholars have paid attention to the Gothic element in *Heart of Darkness*, but their focuses, too, differ from ours.³¹ William Patrick Day discusses the work as 'the clearest link between the Gothic and modernism,' but his main interest lies in Conrad's use of Gothic fantasy to construct the modernist myth of the world as wasteland³²; even when he considers Kurtz as the Gothic villain, Day is mostly

concerned with the question of the masculine identity of the villain. Patrick Brantlinger hints that *Heart of Darkness* is an instance of what he calls 'imperial Gothic' along with the works of H. Rider Haggard and John Buchan, as well as referring to the use of the conventions of Gothic romance in the novella. However, he stops at that: no analysis of specific Gothic devices is given, his main focus being on the dual character of the work as racist and anti-imperialist narrative. Susan J. Navarette considers *Heart of Darkness* as a *fin-de-siècle* decadent Gothic. Her focus is on its narrative characteristics, such as disruption, hesitancy, instability, semantic ambiguity, and what F. R. Leavis has termed 'adjectival insistence upon inexpressible and incomprehensible mystery.' Navarette looks at these features in the light of the contemporary decadent literature. Finally, Chris Baldick's classic work on the history of the figure of Frankenstein and his monster contains a chapter comparing Mary Shelley's novel and *Heart of Darkness*. Among the Gothic features shared by the two works, he mentions, are the figure of the transgressor-villain (Frankenstein and Kurtz), his dying confession, and the device of the framed narrative.³³ His remarks, like those of the others mentioned here, are of interest in themselves, but, except in some details, are of little concern to the focus of the present thesis.³⁴

There are many parallelisms, aural-oral and otherwise, between classic Gothic fiction and Conrad's imperial novella. Apart from the pervading ambience of mystery and horror (Kurtz, among others, is often presented in terms of an apparition) and the Gothic features

mentioned above, the foreign setting, the figure of the garrulous servant, the motif of the discovered book and handwriting and the unutterability topos in *Heart of Darkness* can also be counted as inherited characteristics of the Gothic tradition.³⁵ The typical Italian setting of the classic Gothic fiction and the setting of Africa in *Heart of Darkness* represent a sameness and a difference between these works. In his discussion of the English fear of Catholicism as reflected in classic Gothic fiction, Victor Sage states that the foreign setting of Italy is part of that fear, and also suggests a connection with the Protestant fear of the conquered Catholic in Britain.³⁶ The Italy of the classic Gothic fiction, therefore, is similar to the late-nineteenth-century Africa of Conrad's novella, then newly conquered and feared as the dark continent. Gothic and Conradian romance share the conqueror's fear of the conquered, at the same time reflecting the different socio-political situations of the different periods.

The Gothic figure of the garrulous servant unable to speak properly and logically is, in varying ways and degrees, represented by several characters. The one closest to the voluble Gothic servant would be the Russian harlequin, serving Kurtz with devotion; his seemingly superfluous function in relation to the main plot also suggests a derivation from the role of the servant in classic Gothic fiction. The one least able to speak properly is another servant-figure, the native boy-servant of the manager of the central station who announces Kurtz's death in pidgin English. Besides, the novella abounds in voluble minor characters.

but Italy
was
conquered
or a
story
of Italy

The Gothic topos of the discovered book and handwriting, as seen in a variety of shapes in Walpole, Radcliffe, Maturin and others, is represented in *Heart of Darkness* by Marlow's encounter on the African riverbank with a certain person's handwriting and an English book with handwritten marginal notes.³⁷ Like characters in Gothic fiction, Marlow is very much struck by the discovery of an unknown hand and also imbues the scene with a feeling of mystery, taking the Russian notes in Cyrillic alphabet to have been written in cipher. It is reminiscent of one of the discovered manuscripts, Spanish written in Greek characters, in Maturin's *Melmoth the Wanderer*. As discovered manuscripts and books in classic Gothic literature are most often in one of the Romance languages, reflecting the anti-Catholic strain in England, the fact that it is the Russian language that adds to the sense of mystery in Conrad's novella seems to relate to the political situation of the period when the Eastern question was one of the most important issues. The political factor will be fully discussed later when the question of voice is focused on.

Radcliffesque and Conradian Gothic Voices

A comparison of Ann Radcliffe's fiction and Conrad's novella provides a good starting point for the discussion of voice, the most important of these shared characteristics. We have pointed out the plenitude of voices and sounds in her fiction; and that 'the human voice almost always plays a key role in important scenes, dramatic, amorous or evocative.' We have also said that the aural-oral in her fiction can

be classified into four types: 'voices of nature and sounds of things contributing to' the representation of the world as soundscape; 'unidentified voices and sounds of mystery used to create the effect of suspense'; the voice of overwhelming power, whether it is the irresistible voice of the heroine or the awe-inspiring tremendous voice of the villain; and the non-stop talk of the garrulous servant.

It is possible to make a similar remark about the aural-oral in *Heart of Darkness*. The novella is self-consciously full of voices, human or non-human, and often disembodied. Its framed narrative highlights the voice of the second narrator, Marlow, and makes possible the rendition of the disembodiedness of his voice in darkness:

It had become so pitch dark that we listeners could hardly see one another. For a long time already he, sitting apart, had been no more to us than a voice. [...] I listened, I listened on the watch for the sentence, for the word, that would give me the clue to the faint uneasiness inspired by this narrative that seemed to shape itself without human lips in the heavy night-air of the river. (83)

The listeners' responses are also indicated, through Marlow's words, as aural-oral and without visible physicality: 'Who's that grunting' (97); 'Why do you sigh in this beastly way, somebody? Absurd?' (114).

Many of the characters in the work are avid talkers for some reason or other: the manager of the Central station 'began to speak as soon as he' sees Marlow and was described by him as 'a chattering idiot' (75);

the brickmaker, an ally of the manager, 'talked precipitately' (81); the harlequin 'rattled away at such a rate he overwhelmed me' (123); Kurtz's Intended 'talked as thirsty men drink' (159); Marlow also describes his storytelling as 'the speech that cannot be silenced' (97). The most overwhelming voice of all is, of course, owned by Kurtz. His ability to talk is the most prominent of all his gifts (113), and his voice is inexplicably tremendous considering his emaciated state.³⁸ Kurtz is, more than anything, a wide open mouth, as indicated by Marlow's first sight of him, and is 'very little more than a voice' coming from a gaunt body, repeatedly described as a 'phantom,' an 'apparition,' a 'wraith,' a 'shadow' (115, 117, 133-4 and 141). In Marlow's mind, this disembodied voice is linked to others' voices, also disembodied: 'He [Kurtz] was very little more than a voice. And I heard—him—it—this voice—other voices—all of them were so little more than voices' (115). Indeed, Marlow's memory of Africa is summarized as one vocal soundscape:

The memory of that time itself lingers around me, impalpable, like a dying vibration of one immense jabber, silly, atrocious, sordid, savage, or simply mean, without any kind of sense. Voices, voices. (115)

It is an inverted, cacophonic version of ^{the} Verlainesque musical poem. It is clear that vocality is one of the most foregrounded elements in the work.

The voices of nature in *Heart of Darkness* are those uttered by the

African wilderness. As compared with their counterparts in the works of Radcliffe, the voices of African nature, though less conspicuous in terms of frequency, are thematically more significant: they do not merely comprise the background soundscape of the work, but play a more active role, metaphorically speaking to, and thus affecting, people, especially Kurtz. Watching the African coast from a steamer, Marlow seems to hear its voice of seduction: 'There it [the coast] is before you—smiling, frowning, inviting, grand, mean, insipid, or savage, and always mute with an air of whispering, Come and find out' (60). He receives a similar impression about the way the African helmsman dies: 'Only in the very last moment, as though in response to some sign we could not see, to some whisper we could not hear, he [the helmsman] frowned heavily' (112). Most importantly, according to Marlow, the whisper of the African wilderness has destroyed Kurtz: 'the wilderness had found him [Kurtz] out early, and had taken on him a terrible vengeance for the fantastic invasion. I think it had whispered to him things about himself which he did not know, things of which he had no conception till he took counsel with this great solitude—and the whisper had proved irresistibly fascinating' (131). As Dorice Williams Elliott suggests, this central voice of the African wilderness can be considered as the origin that in turn compels those who hear a voice from the darkness to become voices themselves, trying to convey to their respective listeners the esoteric kind of knowledge they have obtained vocally: the voice of Africa turns Kurtz into a bodiless voice, the hearing of which turns Marlow into a voice disembodied by

darkness.³⁹ The voice of African nature also invades England, following Marlow. On a visit to Kurtz's Intended, Marlow hears, among other African voices, voices of African nature, such as 'the ripple of the river,' and 'the souging of the trees swayed by the wind' (159).

There are also various voices of suspense and mystery in the novella. In an early part of the work, the noises made by the cannonading of the African wilderness from a ship of war and by the blasting at an African cliff are both spoken of by Marlow as belonging together: 'the same kind of ominous voice' of the activities whose objects are an enigma (61 and 64). Another voice of ominous mystery is that uttered by native Africans. Abrupt, incomprehensible African voices, inspiring a feeling of fear and uncertainty in the Western listener, recur in the novella. The following is taken from one of those several passages:

A cry, a very loud cry, as of infinite desolation, soared slowly in the opaque air. It ceased. A complaining clamour, modulated in savage discords, filled our ears. The sheer unexpectedness of it made my hair stir under my cap. I don't know how it struck the others: to me it seemed as though the mist itself had screamed, so suddenly, and apparently from all sides at once, did this tumultuous and mournful uproar arise. It culminated in a hurried outbreak of almost intolerably excessive shrieking, which stopped short, leaving us stiffened in a variety of silly attitudes, and obstinately listening to the nearly as appalling and excessive silence. 'Good God! What is the meaning—.' (101-2)

The overhearing of plotters' disembodied voices from a hidden vantage point is a frequently used device in novels with a strong Gothic strain, ranging from Lewis' *The Monk* to Collins' *The Woman in White* to Stevenson's *Treasure Island*. Conrad's novella also contains such a sinister overheard voice: Marlow, though he does not seem to grasp their meaning until later, overhears the secret conversations of those plotting against him and Kurtz twice: he once briefly hears the manager of the Central station suggesting to one of his men a way of delaying Marlow's voyage to save Kurtz (167); at another time, he hears, again, the manager complaining to his uncle about Kurtz (179-182).

The *Fin-de-siècle* Implications of Conrad's Voice I:

The Socio-Political Factor: Ivory as Commodity

So far, the aural-oral features in *Heart of Darkness* have been discussed in relation to the significant role of the vocal derived from Gothic romance. A consideration of the contemporary causes for the strong aural-oral presence in Conrad's imperial novella will occupy much of the rest of the present chapter. In discussing them, the earlier analysis of the aural-oral in the period of the classic Gothic fiction is to be kept in mind, and will be referred to, when necessary, to clarify the connection between the works of the two different eras.

The twofold significance, domestic and international, of the socio-political in *Heart of Darkness* reflects the double implications of ivory as a commodity of luxury and a raw material. Before looking at it

closely, however, we will briefly consider another commodity which is named in the novella, a Huntley & Palmer biscuit-tin. Taken together with ivory, it confirms Conrad's awareness of the significance of commodity in relation to the imperial system of the time. The reference to the tin is brief. It is used as a metaphor in the description of the ship Marlow is repairing in the central station in Africa: 'She [the ship] rang under my feet like an empty Huntley & Palmer biscuit-tin kicked along a gutter' (85). Its importance, however, is clarified by Valentine Cunningham's essay, in which he presents several significant details. Citing numerous examples of the connection between Huntley & Palmer biscuits and the colonial situation, which Conrad must have known, Cunningham argues convincingly that Conrad's mention of the biscuit-tin is meant to suggest the implication of the British trade in imperialist exploitation. Among Cunningham's observations are the fact that the biscuits were sold by appointment to the Belgian King; and that their various names revealed the company's colonialist ambition and success, such as 'Colonial' and 'Empire'; their ornamental tins were named 'Indian,' 'Orient,' 'Ivory.'⁴⁰ One might add that the simile of the ship resounding like an empty Huntley & Palmer biscuit-tin surely reminds the reader of the figure of Kurtz as a vessel loudly reverberating because of its hollowness. Anne McClintock's examination of the relationship between what she calls 'commodity racism' and *fin-de-siècle* consumer spectacles, that is, of the involvement of the contemporary advertisement in the spread of the imperialist ideology is

also relevant here.⁴¹ One of the instances she cites is an imperial advertisement for Huntley & Palmers' biscuits: it depicts a group of male colonials sitting 'in the middle of a jungle on biscuit crates, sipping tea.'⁴² The advertisement, reprinted in her book, also features African servants, thus showing the imperial racial hierarchy. The involvements of biscuit-tins in some of the feats of Henry Stanley, which Conrad must have been highly aware of in writing *Heart of Darkness*, are also mentioned by both Cunnigham and McClintock. It is true that ivory and the biscuit-tin are of different characters, with different associations, and differently treated in the novella, but they share one common function in it, that is, the exposure of the link between commodity and imperialism.

Ivory first appears in the novella as a commodity obtainable in England, a box of dominoes, also called 'bones' in the text. Dominoes were so called at that time since they were often made of ivory. Ivory as a commodity belongs to, and is handled by, an English professional in the beginning of the work: it has been brought aboard by one of the metropolitan middle-class listeners to Marlow's African tale, the accountant. However, these middle-class Englishmen do not seem interested in the origin of the 'bones,' the process in which ivory has been turned into a commodity for their consumption. Ivory as a commodity is owned, looked at, and handled by the English, but they are unaware of the imperial implications of exploitation. Still, they somehow do not 'begin that game of dominoes'; Marlow, instead, starts telling his African story, revealing the other aspect of ivory which is

connected with Kurtz's imperial activities and the contemporary colonial invasion and plunder. In Marlow's story, ivory appears as the raw material, presumably of future luxury goods, that fascinates and ruins Kurtz. Moreover, the novella depicts ivory as something to be disinterred out of the earth, the ivory collected by Kurtz being mostly that which has been concealed underground by native Africans (115-6 and 137). It reminds one of the way in which precious metals such as gold, the raw material out of which money is made and upon which the monetary system is founded, are obtained. Ivory as a raw material in *Heart of Darkness*, thus, functions in more than one important way. In short, the English aspect of ivory is related to the affluent world of consumption, whereas the African one is concerned with the colonial situation. We would like to pursue each of them in turn.

Ivory as a commodity of luxury in Conrad's novella can be connected with what Anne McClintock calls 'consumer spectacles,' the late nineteenth-century consumer society characterized by highly visual modern forms of advertisement and sale, such as pictorial advertisements in magazines, department stores with window displays, publicity using electric illumination. The dominance of the visual that resulted increased the significance of the contrast between visibility and invisibility.

In the beginning of the novella, where ivory takes the form of a commodity, the motif of deceptive appearance is conspicuous, and is soon followed by, and makes a sharp contrast with, the voice in darkness of Marlow telling his story. The following passage shows the

distinction between the sea and the sky and the movement of barges which are nonetheless belied by appearances: 'In the offing the sea and the sky were welded together without a joint, and in the luminous space the tanned sails of the barges drifting up with the tide seemed to stand still' (45). The ambiguity between motion and lack of motion, deriving from the visual ambiguity, can be even noted as early as the first sentence of the novella: 'The *Nellie*, a cruising yawl, swung to her anchor without a flutter of the sails, and was at rest' (45). The next instance of deceptive appearance is provided by one of the listeners to Marlow's tale. The text emphasizes that, though he looks most like a typical, trustworthy seaman, the listener is really 'the Director of Companies' working in the capital of Britain. These listeners and Marlow also first appear to be on friendly terms, something which their negative responses to Marlow's story later show to be false.

Then come the dominoes of ivory, 'bones.' The term 'bones' suggests a link, among others, to a symbol of Kurtz's atrocities: human skulls on the stakes around his house. Still, Marlow's listeners do not seem to see the hidden implication of 'bones,' unable to go beyond the superficial and visual aspect of the dominoes. Soon, however, with the sunset, the world of deceptive appearance fades away. As the world darkens, the traffic of ships is foregrounded (48 and 51), and the voice telling its African story begins, gradually becoming a disembodied one in the dark. The world of consumption in England thus gives place to that of the imperial traffic on the Thames and the sea, then to that of raw materials in the heart of Africa. In the process, the motif of

visual deception is replaced by that of the voice which, if partially, speaks the truth.

The connection between the primacy of the visual and the late nineteenth-century consumer society has been recently studied by a number of scholars, such as Rosalind Williams, Rachel Bowlby, Thomas Richards. Beginning with a contrastive description of the dazzling spectacle of a department store and the sombreness of a traditional shop, Williams discusses aspects of the consumer culture in late nineteenth-century France, among which are the dominance of the phantasmagoric visual images over reality and the connection between the universal expositions and the 'consumer revolution' of the period. Bowlby also focuses on the late nineteenth century, but deals with the relationship between the rise of consumerism and that of naturalist fiction in France, the United States and Britain. As the title of her book, *Just Looking*, indicates, her emphasis on the visual nature of the emerging consumer culture is evident. She illustrates the primacy of the image by referring to department stores, window displays, universal expositions. British consumer culture is treated in most detail by Thomas Richards. Focusing particularly on the then burgeoning modern advertising industry and its role in the consumer culture, Richards discusses various forms of advertising images that dominated late Victorian society. Interestingly, the visual dominance in modern advertisement is contrasted with the traditional cry of streetsellers which had prevailed until the mid-nineteenth century; the shift from aural to visual in advertising in the nineteenth-century

Britain is thus suggested.⁴³

Western economic expansion being continuous for the last three centuries, however, the dating of the birth of consumer society is a rather controversial issue. Some date it to the late nineteenth century, some, to the eighteenth century, others, even to the early modern period. It is possible, therefore, to see a criticism of eighteenth-century consumer culture in Radcliffe's fiction, in which lavish consumption is linked to the villains' dissipated lifestyle. As John Styles points out, the use of the term 'consumer society' is at present somewhat loose.⁴⁴ Some clarification of the term is therefore useful here. When we say the *fin-de-siècle* consumer society, we mean the society: 1. that is, after Britain's unprecedented expansion, political and economical, of the Victorian times, generally much more affluent than the previous century; 2. that is, as was earlier observed, characterized by highly visual modern forms of advertisement and sale—pictorial advertisement in periodicals and newspapers and on hoardings, department stores with window displays and displays using electric lights⁴⁵—which helped enhance the commodity fetishism of the period; 3. whose mode of consumption is entangled with other characteristics of the time, such as imperialism and aestheticism.

Invisibility and the Disembodied Voice

What is particularly relevant to the analysis of *Heart of Darkness* is the significance of invisibility as a special site to oppose the phantasmagoria of the late nineteenth-century consumerism. In a

number of *fin-de-siècle* literary works and books, the site of invisibility, often accompanied by voice, is used to counter the visually dominant world of consumption. The 'Invisible Man' of H.G. Wells' 1897 novella, which Conrad had read with enthusiasm just before he started working on *Heart of Darkness*, is a social outcast who, bearing rancour against, and feeling alienated from, the money-oriented society of his time, invades and ravages the citadel of the new consumerism, a department store where 'everything is to be bought.'⁴⁶ In *Salomé*, written by an author who, while being himself a symbol of *fin-de-siècle* luxury, from time to time wrote stories which revealed the substructure of the affluent consumer society, the court life of Herod, filled with luxury goods, is decried by a voice from an invisible underground source, the disembodied voice of Jokanaan. The topos of a voice from underground bitterly denouncing a seemingly affluent and civilized society also appears in an 1890 book on the underprivileged in England, *In Darkest England and the Way Out*, allegedly written by William Booth, the founder of the Salvation Army, but in truth ghostwritten by W. T. Stead.⁴⁷ Robert Louis Stevenson's 'The Isle of Voices,' one of the south sea tales of his late years which express his anti-European view of the contemporary colonial situation,⁴⁸ contains passages in which the process of the acquisition of money, as contrasted to the accumulation of luxury goods made possible by money, is rendered as invisible to the natives of the island and accompanied by the 'bodiless voices' of international money-grabbers. Disembodied voices from invisible men thus reveal the reality of the colonial exploitation, normally concealed

from view by the serene appearance of commodities. Marlow's and Kurtz's speaking voices, together with the presentation of ivory as commodity in the beginning of Conrad's novella, should be considered in this context; their disembodied voices are some of the *fin-de-siècle* voices from an invisible source that expose the dark side of the then most affluent nation in the world.

Ivory as Raw Material:

The Disembodied Voice and the Colonial Situation

When Marlow takes over the narration of the novella from the first, anonymous narrator, the motif of voice, often disembodied, and the theme of the non-Western colony is foregrounded. The stark colonial realities are exposed by Marlow's voice coming from darkness.

Moreover, his tale repeatedly highlights the powerful, apparitional voice of the almost bodiless emaciated Kurtz, who, 'very little more than a voice' (115), seems to hold the secret of the dark continent. Kurtz, with his ivory face, ivory head and ivory body (115, 134 and 149), is also equated with ivory as raw material: its body has to be 'disinterred' by Marlow, as is 'fossil,' the ivory buried by Africans for concealment, by Kurtz (115-116). Most of the ivory Kurtz collects is this 'fossil' (137). Therefore, Kurtz's voice is, at the same time, the voice of ivory as raw material speaking the truth of imperialism. The final scene of the novella, Marlow's meeting with Kurtz's fiancée is also invaded by the mysterious voices of Africa, human and non-human, reminding Marlow of Kurtz's last word and the colonial situation, and

disrupting the complacency of the metropolitan bourgeois world. Marlow hears her speech accompanied by:

All the other sounds, full of mystery, desolation, and sorrow, I had ever heard—the ripple of the river, the souging of the trees swayed by the wind, the murmurs of the crowds, the faint ring of incomprehensible words cried from afar, the whisper of a voice speaking from beyond the threshold of an eternal darkness. [...] The dusk was repeating them in a persistent whisper all around us, in a whisper that seemed to swell menacingly like the first whisper of a rising wind. 'The horror! the horror!' (159 and 161).

The characteristic Gothic voice, once connected in the age of Romanticism with disappearing oral cultures such as those of the Highlands and of peasants, is thus, in *Heart of Darkness*, a reflection of the late nineteenth-century imperial and international situation.

The Dual Significance of the Knowledge of the Non-West

In Conrad, voice also relates to the question of the true knowledge of the non-West that it is imagined can only be gained 'over there.' From the viewpoint of the colonizing West, the knowledge is valuable for its contribution to the maintenance of the Imperial system. But, at the same time, the question of this sort of knowledge is tied to a Western fantasy, affected by the West's simultaneous fear and desire of the other and its resultant projection of the yearning for what it lacks

onto the non-West, that the ultimate truth lies in the non-West.⁴⁹ Closely linked to it is another question of what is meant by Kurtz's well-known whispered cry of 'The horror! The horror!.' The cry is, as Marlow sees it, the expression of the 'complete knowledge' attained by Kurtz (149), and, because of the double focus of the novella on knowledge concerning Africa, the secular knowledge of Africa as colony and the ultimate knowledge of the human reality to be revealed only in Africa, the significance of his 'complete knowledge' must be taken in a dual sense: it concerns both the worldly truth about Africa and the ultimate truth about humanity. The text suggests that both truths can be found in Africa, but not in the West, and that they are conveyed by the apparitional voice of Kurtz from Africa, which, in turn, is told through the disembodied voice of Marlow. Marlow also indicates that it is the voice of the African wilderness that had first imparted the knowledge to Kurtz: its whispered messages 'echoed loudly in him' (131). The ultimate truth about humanity is also related to the voice and sound of Africans: a glimpse of howling and dancing African natives in 'the heart of darkness (95)' is, for Marlow, equivalent to the gaining of insight into the eternal truth—'truth stripped of its cloak of time'—about humans (96-7).

The question of the knowledge just discussed can be further clarified by looking at some of the works of Conrad's contemporaries. For instance, Thomas Richards, in his *The Imperial Archive: Knowledge and the Fantasy of Empire*, discusses the English imagining around the turn of the century of Tibet as a site where total knowledge can be

recuperated. Among the persons, imaginary or real, cited by him are Sherlock Holmes, 'repository of "a complete knowledge of all the streets of London," who retires to Tibet during his two-year disappearance, beyond the reach of call, to collect his wits by meditating on the sum total of knowledge itself'; and H.P. Blavatsky (Madam Blavatsky), one of the theosophists active in Britain who 'located the spiritual masters of the universe' there.⁵⁰

Kim and Heart of Darkness

Richards also makes a noteworthy remark concerning the political implications of the knowledge of the non-West in a novel written around the turn of century: Kipling's *Kim* [...] represents the [British] India Survey as gathering knowledge for the state in regions of Tibet and India, and turning that knowledge into military intelligence useful in consolidating British hegemony in the region.⁵¹ His connection of the gathering of the information about the area with the maintenance of the British Empire is persuasive, but there is one problem about his reading of *Kim*: his failure to take account of the complementarity of two main characters, Kim and the lama. It should be noted that Kim represents the secular knowledge of the East, while the lama stands for its wisdom. The boy-hero collects and transmits information for the Empire, moving around and making full use of his multi-lingual ability. The kind of activities Kim engages in, however, do not help him acquire the lama's kind of knowledge, the eternal truth about humanity, and this occasionally puts the boy into a mood of existential anxiety. The

lama, on the other hand, lacks Kim's kind of knowledge, the worldly knowledge of India. That is why they are mutually attracted, each making up for the lack of the other. And what is most important about their mutual complementarity is its relation to Conrad's imperial novella: the two different types of knowledge represented by the two characters in Kipling's imperial novel correspond to the two aspects of Kurtz's 'complete knowledge': the true knowledge of the non-West, gained there and useful to the colonizing West, and the ultimate knowledge about humanity, to be found in the non-West. In other words, the two types of thorough knowledge, Kim's and the lama's, in Kipling's novel and the 'complete knowledge' of Kurtz in *Heart of Darkness* can be seen as both representing, though in different ways, the twofold *fin-de-siècle* Western attitude toward the knowledge of the non-West. Kipling's *Kim*, together with Thomas Richards' analysis of the Western image of Tibet, is thus helpful in placing the dual significance of Kurtz's 'complete knowledge' in context.

Kim is the text that is perhaps the most explicitly self-conscious about the political importance of the knowledge of the non-West for the West. The following remark in the novel indicates that information matters more than arms for the maintenance of the British Empire: 'Dynamite was milky and innocuous beside that report of C25 [one of the spies for the British Empire].'⁵² It is not, however, the only fiction in which the war of information is conducted between the West and the non-West. In Bram Stoker's *Dracula*, too, the fight between the vampiric Count, representing the East, and the anti-Dracula Western

league largely concerns the obtainment of essential aural-oral information about the enemy.⁵³ Furthermore, the political significance of the lama's unworldly knowledge, complementary to the boy-hero's worldly counterpart, can be somewhat clarified by comparing Kipling's novel to *Dracula* and yet another enormously popular fiction of the time, H.Rider Haggard's *She*, a Gothic novel with typical Gothic voices, awful and attractive. The comparison shows that it is important that Kim and the lama are both for the British Empire. For, if the possessor of the transcendental knowledge is against the hegemony of Britain, as the vampire is, and as the Ayesha of Haggard's *She* potentially is, he/she can pose a serious threat to the Empire. Both *Dracula* and *Ayesha* ask an Englishman about his country. In Stoker's novel, that indicates *Dracula's* intention to conquer Britain; and, in *She*, Horace Holly, the narrator who has witnessed her questioning, takes it as part of a sign of her possibly coming conquest.⁵⁴ The motif of *Ayesha's* questioning and its link with her ambition to rule the world is referred to again, and even in more detail, in the sequel to *She*, *Ayesha: The Return of 'She.'*

Haggard and Conrad

Haggard deserves further consideration here for three more reasons. Firstly, the meaning of *Ayesha's* knowledge overlaps that of *Kurtz's*. Both are concerned with the ultimate truth about humanity to be found by a white in the midst of the dark continent. *Ayesha's* tale, like that of *Kurtz's*, is about passion freed from restraint and

'complete knowledge' obtained against the African backdrop. Haggard's novel, taken together with Conrad's novella, thus helps us confirm the significance of Africa as the site of 'complete knowledge.' Secondly, and relatedly, both *She* and its 1905 sequel, *Ayesha*, show a link between Africa and the above-discussed Tibet, in terms of the subject under discussion. In the beginning of *She*, a novel retrospectively narrated, the two main English characters, Horace Holly and Leo Vincey, having returned from the African adventure where they have witnessed the secret of life, are portrayed as being on the way 'this time to Central Asia where, if anywhere upon this earth, wisdom is to be found.'⁵⁵ And their exploration of the area for some ultimate knowledge is to be fully delineated in *Ayesha: The Return of 'She.'* It is important that, in the sequel, they are helped by Tibetan monks on the threshold to the unknown territory of Central Asia. Africa and Tibet are thus linked in Haggard's two related novels as the site of transcendental knowledge. Indeed, in these novels, most of the imagined sites of wisdom in the Western history since antiquity are referred to: Ancient Greece, Egypt, China, Africa, Tibet. Leo Vincey is the reincarnation of an ancestor of his who was a priest of Isis in Egypt but of Greek extraction. Amenartas, his wife in a past life, was an Egyptian princess with magical power. Ayesha has been a ruler in Central Africa, who has obtained the secret of life from a hermit, who in turn had gained it from the lost civilization of Kôr. Kôr is located in Africa, but some of its characteristics, such as the supposed skin colour of its people as judged from their descendents mixed with blacks and

the characters it has left behind, are redolent of China.⁵⁶ Knowledge of a superior nature is thus linked with various civilizations, past or present.⁵⁷

Africa and Scotland

This leads us to the third point: the relation of Africa and yet another place, Scotland, which illustrates the connection between classic Gothic literature and the late nineteenth-century imperial Gothic novels, of which *Heart of Darkness* is one. Haggard's 1887 novel, *Allan Quatermain*, is about a land of people of white race, Zu-Vendis, in the midst of Africa. Although Zu-Vendis is, on the whole, portrayed as half European and half non-European, a variety of European elements are included in its description. The physiognomy of the people is that of the Southern European; the climate of the country resembles that of southern England; it is about the size of France.⁵⁸ At the end of the novel, it comes to be more like England in terms of political system (273 and 281). The Scottish element, especially that of the Highlands, is particularly prominent. On the way to Zu-Vendis, a group of three English adventurers is helped by a minister in Africa, who provides them with useful information about their destination. This person is Scottish, and Haggard seems very conscious about it. The minister speaks 'broad Scotch,' and his place in the midst of Africa, 'at the highest navigable point of the Tana river,' is called 'The Highlands' (20). What is described as 'the most remarkable object that we had yet seen in this charming place,' 'a

single tree of the conifer tribe,' is of a variety which grows 'freely on the *highlands* of this part of Africa' (42-3; my italics). Both in direct reference and by association, Scotland looms large in this place serving as the threshold to Zu-Vendis. Having parted from him, the three Englishmen come across a lake at a high altitude where they are wrapped in 'an unmistakable Scotch mist' (107). The Scottish motif continues even after they have reached their destination. The people of Zu-Vendis wear 'an unmistakable kilt,' a fact that is repeatedly referred to; and the narrator of the novel, one of the English adventurers, refers to them as 'a white race that existed in the *highlands* of the interior of this vast continent' (127; my italics). Those Englishmen then become involved in a civil war dividing Zu-Vendis into two opposing areas. Interestingly, one of them, the northern part of the land, which was originally the territory of a warrior, is compared to Scotland: 'Nasta's [the warrior's] dominions, of which he was virtually king, were to Zu-Vendis much what Scotland used to be to England' (198). In a virtual declaration of rebellion to the Queen, Nasta terms his people 'a hardy race of mountaineers,' who are later also called 'highlanders' (243). These references remind one of the 1715 and 1745 Jacobite rebellions as described in Walter Scott's *Waverley* and *Rob Roy* where the opposition between the north and the south (Scotland as opposed to England, and the Highlands as opposed to the rest of Britain) is a key factor. In *Ayesha*, too, the people of the northern mountainous region, described as 'untamable highlanders,' and in conflict with those living in the fertile plains of the south is

compared to the ancient Scots.⁵⁹

The connection between Scotland and Africa can also be found in John Buchan's two works titled 'Prester John.' Although the well-known *Prester John* was published in 1910, the earlier story also named after the mythic figure was first published in 1897. It is about an ancient shepherd encountered by the narrator in the misty wilderness of Scotland. The old man lives in tune with nature, is contrasted with those in the lowlands and the cities, and embodies the last remnant in Scotland of pre-modern oral culture: he is full of strange 'old tales of the place, learned from a thousand old sources,' which the narrator desires to have published as fantasy tales.⁶⁰ Considering the traditional strong African association of the legendary figure of Prester John, one can find a suggestion of the link between Scotland and Africa in terms of the shared pre-modern form of knowledge here. In the later novel, the link is more obvious. The charismatic black leader, John Laputa, the present-day Prester John, is first found practising black magic in Scotland. Later, he moves to Africa and attempts a rebellion against the white dominion, making use of his superhuman charisma. The esoteric knowledge possessed by John is thus first in Scotland, and then is shifted to Africa. Significantly, the Scottish narrator who also goes to Africa sees in John Laputa a reflection of his father, a minister in his Scottish hometown, further illustrating the link between Scotland and Africa in terms of transcendental knowledge.⁶¹ The novel abounds in Scottish features in Africa in other ways, too. There are a number of Scottish characters in the continent,

most notably Tam Dyke, the narrator's childhood friend who witnesses John Laputa's black magic with him when they are boys together. Tam runs across the narrator at the beginning and the end of the latter's African stay, as if to further indicate the Afro-Scottish link at the crucial points of the narrator's journey. There is a quotation from Walter Scott's *Marmion* on hearing the eerie sound of the underground river near the secret place of the African rebels led by John Laputa.⁶² In the mass gathering of those rebels, the oral poetry of the kind redolent of the Ossian poems is sung.⁶³ The sound of the African aural telegraphy of native drums reminds the narrator of 'the churning in one of the pot-holes of Kirkcapple cliffs.'⁶⁴ Perhaps, as in Haggard's *Allan Quatermain* and *Ayesha*, John Laputa's African rebellion harks back to the Jacobite rebellions of more than a century earlier. Particularly in the following instances, the connection between Scotland and the African rebellion is suggested: immediately after the Scottish narrator is struck by a similarity between the African John and his Scottish father, he is mesmerized by John's powerful voice making a speech against the West, which includes England.⁶⁵ Moreover, the map provided by Buchan himself shows that the conflict between the West and Africa in the novel is, at the same time, between the South and the North. Therefore, it is possible to say, at least, that, in rendering the colonial conflict in Africa around the turn of the century, some authors, consciously or unconsciously, relate their subject-matter to the earlier parallel example of Scotland.

The historical, cultural and literary implications of the connection

between Scotland and Africa in terms of the Gothic, the vocal and Conrad are now to be considered. Of course, it should be first noted that powerful voices abound in all these Scottish-African stories as well as in the classic Gothic fiction and *Heart of Darkness*. However, there are a number of further significant parallelisms between the former, written in the period of Romanticism, and the latter, produced around the turn of the century. Firstly, the subordinate political position of Scotland in relation to England in the century after the 1707 Act of Union and reconfirmed by the failure of the Jacobite Rebellions is not unlike that of Africa in the period of Imperialism. Secondly, the literary treatments of these areas in these respective periods are similar to one another: some central truth about humanity was imagined to reside in both areas; and that truth is often the kind that is to be conveyed through voice and is connected with the culture of the area retaining a strong oral residue. Scotland features prominently in the late-eighteenth-to-early-nineteenth-century interest in the oral culture and the Romantic imagining of some essential truth in it, as is illustrated by the enormous popularity of the Ossian poems and Walter Scott's Scottish novels. Percy and Wordsworth's treatment of the Scottish Borders also reflects their interest in, and imagining about, its oral culture.

The relation of classic Gothic literature to Scotland and oral culture has been discussed earlier. Here, a few additional remarks would be appropriate. The first concerns the close relationship between the representative Gothic author, Ann Radcliffe, and Scotland.

Alison Milbank refers to the political and literary significance of the setting of the Highlands in Ann Radcliffe's first novel, *The Castles of Athlin and Dunbayne*, a precursor to her later masterpieces. She relates the setting to the political situation of eighteenth-century Scotland on one hand, and, on the other, to the prominence of Scottish writers in early Romantic literature, of which the work of Radcliffe comprises an essential part.⁶⁶ We, too, have earlier explored the quotation from the Ossian poems in *The Mysteries of Udolpho*; and it should be added here that two major Scottish poets, James Beattie and James Thomson, are among the most frequently quoted in Radcliffe's fiction.

Secondly, as Robert Crawford outlines, in the course of the nineteenth century, the interest of the Scottish intellectuals of the previous century in the oral, pre-industrial culture of their homeland developed into the late nineteenth-century modern anthropology and anthropological approach to literature to which the Scottish greatly contributed. Among those involved were J.G.Frazer, Andrew Lang and Robert Louis Stevenson, all most influential in different ways. Crawford traces their anthropological interests through Walter Scott to the eighteenth-century Scottish Enlightenment tradition. J.G.Frazer, for example, was the protégé of William Robertson Smith, who had been influenced by J.F.McLennan, 'the father of modern anthropology,' whose work in turn grows from eighteenth-century Scottish roots. Crawford also notes the shadow of Scott in the famous opening description of the lake of Nemi in *The Golden Bough*, and calls nature as romantically

rendered in Frazer's texts 'all developments of the Scottscape.'⁶⁷ Moreover, elements of Gothic fiction can be easily noted in Frazer's writings. The opening representation of a priest in terror in the beautiful nature around the lake of Nemi is strongly redolent of the descriptive style of Gothic literature. The priority given to the oral over the textual information in the Preface to the first edition, too, confirms the present argument. The work of Andrew Lang, who desired to be regarded primarily as an anthropologist, was also inspired by Scott and McLennan.⁶⁸ Besides, Lang, sympathetic to the non-realistic mode of narrative, such as romance and fairy tale, was the dedicatee of Haggard's *She*, as well as being his collaborator in writing an 1891 romance, *The World's Desire*. He also commented on the influence of Radcliffe on his close friend, R.L. Stevenson, yet another folklore collector⁶⁹; and the latter's well-known defence of the tradition of romance against modern English realism, of course, is, at the same time, a defence of the Gothic imperial adventure fiction of the period, which he himself engaged in.⁷⁰ It should be added that, for Stevenson, Walter Scott is the embodiment of the tradition of romance.⁷¹

It should by now be clear that this aspect of the Scottish intellectual tradition further corroborates the link between Scotland and Africa in terms of the interest in the oral, pre-industrial culture. Such a concern, transposed into the mode of fiction, gives rise to emphasis on voice at the level of description. *Heart of Darkness*, an imperial Gothic adventure tale set in Africa, and classic Gothic literature are thus connected through the Afro-Scottish link, too. The

fact that Africa largely replaced Scotland in the *fin de siècle* is certainly a reflection of the age of imperialism and internationalism. Although these socio-political implications of the bodiless voice are the most prominent of the factors involved in Conrad's novella, there are other aspects to be examined now.

The *Fin-de-siècle* Implications of Conrad's Voice II:

The Aesthetico-Linguistic 'Melocentricism'

The assumed primacy of the aural-oral in aesthetics and language study, together with frequent descriptions of the disembodied voice, in Romantic texts can be considered in the light of what Paul de Man calls the 'melocentric' tradition. It is a tradition that considers language primarily as voice and melody rather than as statement, and that by implication prioritizes music over the other arts.⁷² De Man equates the 'melocentric' thinking with the Derridean logocentrism and relates it to the history of Western metaphysics from Plato to Heidegger. Here, however, modifying de Man's concept, we would periodize the 'melocentric' tradition. Although, as Jacques Derrida and Jonathan Rée demonstrate, the 'melocentric' inclination has existed since antiquity, the late eighteenth century can be said to have witnessed the birth of what may be called modern 'melocentricism,' as illustrated by the valorization of the aural, the vocal and the musical in a variety of texts around that time⁷³: language study, while modernizing itself by casting aside the Biblical account of the divine origin of language, started treating sound, not words, as the basic unit of language, which

led to the modern philology's groundbreaking discoveries such as Grimm's law⁷⁴; the aesthetic prioritization of music began with German proto-Romanticism, which was to lead eventually to the *fin-de-siècle* aesthetic ideal of literature as music⁷⁵; all the three major collectors of oral poetry in Britain, Macpherson, Percy, and Scott, were also 'melocentric,' in that they considered poetry in the primitive oral culture as inseparable from music. The Gothic-Romantic voice emerged from such a 'melocentric' background.

Herder's essay on Johann Denis' German translation of James Macpherson's Ossian poems is typically Romantic-'melocentric.' The German thinker is critical of the translation, since it fails to convey the musical quality of the original. He complains that it cannot be sung in Denis' translation, indicating that the rhythm and melody in poetry matters much more than the meaning of the text.⁷⁶ A similar 'melocentric' remark is made, though in a different manner, by Macpherson himself. He observes that, in the ancient Gaelic poems, 'so well adapted are the sounds of the words to the sentiments, that, even without any knowledge of the language, they pierce and dissolve the heart.'⁷⁷ What is implied is the primacy of voice over other linguistic elements: it is as if the meaning intrinsically belonged to the sound in the language that is untainted with letters.

Also to be noted in this context is the implied connection between a 'melocentric' reference to inner hearing in the essay and a nostalgia for pre-modern oral culture.⁷⁸ The internal hearing is 'melocentric,' because it presupposes an imagined interior mental space where one

can gain unmediated access to the voice of the Derridean pure presence and where the impure medium of language as statement is to be abolished. Herder observes that Denis should use his inner ear to discover the distinctive tone of the Ossian poems .⁷⁹

This metaphor of internal listening also reflects the state of voice and text involved in the craze for folk culture of the time. In reading collections of oral tales, songs, and poetry, hugely popular around that time across Europe, the reader does not hear the physical voice but reproduces the imaginary one in his mind from the textualized record of aural-oral art; in other words, he internally hears the voice of the oral culture, imagining that he is being put in touch with the origin of humanity and language. Herder's 'melocentricism,' with its reference to the inner ear, thus reflects the age of increasing textualization and its modern nostalgia for pre-modern society. After Herder, we find many inarticulate 'melocentric' voices: among them are Schopenhauer's mysterious Gothic voice, the Wordsworthian voice of 'waters, torrents, streams' at Snowdon, Keats' 'unheard melodies,' the Symbolist poetry of suggestion where nothing is clearly stated, and African and other voices, some of which Marlow internally hears, in the writings of Conrad.

Since Herder can be seen as an anti-Enlightenment seminal Romantic of enormous influence, and since there is, as Martin Jay remarks, a strong penchant towards the sense of sight in the Enlightenment, in contrast with the centrality of aural-oral knowledge in the proto-Romantic Herder, the knowledge of Western modernity can

roughly be classified into two basic forms: the rational-visual model of the Enlightenment and the aural-oral counter-model of Romanticism.⁸⁰ This having been said, however, the dichotomy is occasionally complicated by the coexistence of the two models and by the Romantic motif of spiritual vision. For instance, Wordsworth's attitude toward vision is far from simple: although vision is denounced as the most despotic of the senses in Book XI of *The Prelude*, it does not follow that the exclusively aural-oral form of knowledge is endorsed. Rather, the statement against vision is belied by the scene of the poet's encounter with a sublime spectacle at Snowdon in Book XIII. The passage has been discussed earlier in this chapter, but we should note in addition that the 'melocentric' voice of nature located as the home of the soul is first heard, supporting the spectacle over the mist, and then, in the poet's recollection, leads to an 'under-presence' exalting 'the perfect image of a mighty mind.' In other words, the disembodied voice first relates to the magnificent scene of nature, which in turn leads to a spiritual vision of transcendental truth. In view of the discussion above, we will examine and contextualize the vocal-visual form of knowledge which is nonetheless 'melocentric' in Conrad's novella.

Fin-de-siècle 'Melocentricism'

And the Vocal-Visual Form of Knowledge in Conrad

Perhaps the most typically 'melocentric' concept in *fin-de-siècle* British literature is Arthur Symonds' 'disembodied voice of a human soul,' describing Verlaine's anti-statement poetics, based on the ideal

of music. Still, a distinctive 'melocentric' element can be discerned at the centre of Conrad's colonial novella, too: the foregrounding of language as voice rather than statement. Kurtz's is probably the most 'melocentric' of the disembodied voices in the work. According to Marlow, he is first and foremost a powerful voice and 'little more than a voice.' And, although his speaking voice impresses and influences Marlow as well as the Russian harlequin, little of what Kurtz has said, and nothing of the enlightening remarks he supposedly has made, is registered in the text of the novella. Kurtz, therefore, ends up striking the reader as the speaking voice with enormous power and reverberation but little content. What is more, his 'melocentric' presence is surrounded by two other voices with a 'melocentric' inclination: the inarticulate voice of the African wilderness, heard by Marlow, often with his *internal* ear, confirming the centrality of the work's 'melelocentricism,' and the disembodied voice of Marlow, whose tale lacks narrative clarity and so fails to function as a statement understandable to the listeners on board. Marlow's memory of Africa is also compared to a vibration of a mass of inarticulate voices.

In spite of the prominent 'melocentric' element in *Heart of Darkness*, however, the kind of knowledge Marlow's tale is supposed to provide is concerned with both voice and vision. The following is a well-known passage describing the form of knowledge conveyed by Marlow's narrating:

The yarns of seamen have a direct simplicity, the whole meaning of which

lies within the shell of a cracked nut. But Marlow was not typical (if his propensity to spin yarns be excepted), and to him the meaning of an episode was not inside like a kernel but outside [MS: outside in the unseen], enveloping the tale which brought it out only as a glow brings out a haze, in the likeness of one of these misty halos that sometimes are made visible by the spectral illumination of moonshine. (48; the inserted text of the manuscript, indicated by square brackets, is taken from the Norton edition of *Heart of Darkness*⁸¹)

What is first to be noted is the relationship between the vocal and the visual suggested here. According to the passage, the function of Marlow's tale, that is, of his speaking voice, is to make visible what normally remains unseen in something like the atmosphere in the dark. In other words, what is aimed at in his tale is the making visible of the usually invisible truth, while the medium used for that purpose is a disembodied speaking voice. This structure is also shared by Symons' idea of what Verlaine's supreme art does: the vision of truth conveyed by the disembodied voice or through the musical suggestiveness of his style.⁸²

Such a relationship between voice and vision is not limited to the meaning of Marlow's tale (and Symons' Symbolist aesthetics). The revelation of knowledge by or to Kurtz is occasionally linked to vision but conveyed by his frequently emphasized voice. A disciple of Kurtz's, the Russian 'harlequin,' while associating the knowledge with vision, saying 'He [Kurtz] made me see things—things (127)', is mostly

impressed by his voice, that is, his talk, particularly his recitation of poetry (140). Kurtz' final climactic cry of 'The horror! The horror!' is construed by Marlow as the moment when the normally invisible ultimate truth is revealed: Marlow's voice in the dark says that Kurtz cried 'at some vision' in the 'supreme moment of complete knowledge,' and that he himself felt 'as if a veil had been rent' (149). Again, the ultimate truth is visually conceived and vocally conveyed.

Preface to *The Nigger of the 'Narcissus'*

The vocal-visual model of knowledge in *Heart of Darkness* is also similar to the conception of truth as suggested in Conrad's well-known early artistic manifesto, Preface to *The Nigger of the 'Narcissus,'* which shows traces of the influence of Walter Pater. Like the anonymous narrator's comment on the function of Marlow's tale, it states that the aim of art is to make visible the normally invisible truth: 'art itself may be defined as a single-minded attempt to render the highest kind of justice to the visible universe, by bringing to light the truth, manifold and one, underlying its every aspect.'⁸³ The realm of the artist is, therefore, according to Conrad, 'that part of our nature which [...] is necessarily kept out of sight' (viii). And truth is conceived, first and foremost, as something to be exposed to view by the artist's effort, as is shown in a famous passage of the preface: 'My task [...] is, by the power of the written word to make you hear, to make you feel—it is, before all, to make you *see*' (Italics in the original; x). 'If I succeed,' Conrad goes on, 'you shall find [...] that glimpse of truth for which you have

forgotten to ask' (x).

However, when it comes to the question of what is the best sensory medium for the expression of truth, the author seems to suggest the primacy of hearing, according to which 'to make you hear' matters most and 'to make you *see*' concerns understanding rather than vision. A 'melocentric' statement in the preface of the supremacy of music among the arts, 'the magic suggestiveness of music—which is the art of arts' (ix), harks back to Pater and the aesthetic tradition running through both German Romanticism and French Symbolism; and it can also be taken as a description of the obscure and evocative style of *The Heart of Darkness*, mostly consisting of Marlow's tale. It is certainly 'the magic suggestiveness' of Marlow's disembodied voice describing in turn 'the magic suggestiveness' of Kurtz's and other voices in the text that characterizes the narrative of the novella.

In the passage expressing his dissatisfaction with the superficial contemporary narrative methods available, such as realism and naturalism, Conrad also tries to suggest what the artist must go through before a new, appropriate method is created out of *fin-de-siècle* aestheticism; and, in doing so, he resorts to a series of auditory metaphors ('stammerings,' 'outspoken,' 'cry,' 'ring' and 'whisper'):

All these gods [traditional types of narrative] must, after a short period of fellowship, abandon him [the artist]—even on the very threshold of the temple—to the stammerings of his conscience and to the outspoken consciousness of the difficulties of his works. In that uneasy solitude the

supreme cry of Art for Art, itself, loses the exciting ring of its apparent immorality. It sounds far off. It has ceased to be a cry, and is heard only as a whisper, often incomprehensible, but at times, and faintly, encouraging.

(xi)

The incomprehensibility of the whisper suggests 'melocentricism,' and the cry turned into a whisper resembles Kurtz' whispered cry of 'The horror.' And it is this voice, the text suggests, that provides a clue to a modernist artistic breakthrough, exemplified by the work to which it serves as a preface, *The Nigger of the 'Narcissus,'* yet another work of Conrad that is haunted by voice. The whisper that is encouraging also seems to lead up to 'a sigh' as the metaphor of the revealed truth in the last sentence of the preface (xii).

Walter Pater's Shadow

Paterian influence upon the preface has been noted by critics, such as Ian Watt and Cedric Watts, and his letter of 23/24 March 1896 to Edward Garnett shows the Paterian view of life Conrad held at that time.⁸⁴ What deserves particular mention here and which has received no attention yet, however, is the similarity between the preface and Pater's *The Renaissance* in terms of vision and hearing. As in Conrad's preface, aural and visual inclinations coexist in *The Renaissance*. On one hand, music is exalted in a variety of ways. First and foremost, it is considered as the ideal art form, which is probably one of the sources for Conrad's similar statement.⁸⁵

Musicality is also employed in describing great works of the Renaissance masters (61, 76 and 80) as well as in explaining the aim of the poets of the *Pleiade* (104-8). In the chapter on the school of Giorgione, whose works Pater thinks most approaches the ideal condition of art, that of music. He mentions not only the abundance of paintings depicting musical themes, but even compares life to a sort of listening to music, voice, and nature (96). In the famous conclusion, the vocal art, singing, is praised as suitable for 'the wisest' (153); song and music are associated with Abelard and *Aucassin and Nicolette*, representative of the liberation of passion and body, which Pater considers the hallmark of the Renaissance (3, 11 and 17); and the musicianship of Da Vinci and of Giorgione and the madrigals of Michelangelo are touched upon (52, 69 and 96).⁸⁶

On the other hand, the verb 'to see' is used in the concluding part of the book in a way strongly redolent of how the same word is employed in a key passage of Conrad's preface, suggesting the influence of the former upon the latter. In both, the act of seeing is juxtaposed with other senses. In Conrad's preface, hearing and feeling are set beside seeing: 'to make you hear, to make you feel—it is, before all, to make you see' (x). In the conclusion of *The Renaissance*, touch is juxtaposed with vision: 'With this sense of the splendour of our experience [of life] and of its awful brevity, gathering all we are into one desperate effort to see and touch, we shall hardly have time to make theories about the things we see and touch' (152).⁸⁷ These juxtapositions with other senses highlight the meaning of seeing as perception, and yet, in either

case, it is also clear from the context of the passage and of the author's philosophy that 'to see' also implies the act of understanding. The same vocal-visual model of knowledge, therefore, applies to both authors; and the influence of the Paterian view of knowledge upon Conrad is highly probable.

Conrad and the 'Melocentricism' of Wagner

The *fin-de-siècle* British aestheticism under the shadow of Pater, of which Conrad's Preface to *The Nigger of The 'Narcissus'* forms a part, is connected with the strongly 'melocentric' German aesthetic tradition; F.C. McGrath observes, in his book on Pater, that British 'turn-of-the-century aesthetics was thoroughly imbued with German philosophy.'⁸⁸ The 'melocentric' voice in *Heart of Darkness*, therefore, can be linked to that tradition. Particularly important is, of course, the presence of Arthur Schopenhauer and Richard Wagner in the *fin-de-siècle* cultural scene. Among the noted literary figures influenced by both or either of them are George Moore, John Davidson, George Bernard Shaw, George Gissing, Thomas Hardy, William Butler Yeats, Oscar Wilde, Arthur Symons, Aubrey Beardsley, Ernest Dowson. Anne Dzamba Sessa, in her *Richard Wagner and the English*, points out that 'Admiration for Wagner in England was nearly inseparable from admiration for Schopenhauer' because of the way they were introduced to Britain: many of those who wrote about them are Wagnerians-cum-Schopenhauerians, such as Francis Hueffer (the father of Ford Madox Ford) and William Ashton Ellis.⁸⁹ Schopenhauer was discussed and

translated in the periodicals of Britain's Wagner Society, *The Meister*.

Two Conradian scholars, Edward W. Said and Cedric Watts, respectively refer to Conrad's lifelong interest in, and admiration for, Richard Wagner.⁹⁰ In a letter of 31 May 1902, Conrad cites Wagner as one of his predecessors as the modern artist who had to struggle for recognition.⁹¹ In another letter dated 4 May 1894, he compares the concluding part of *Almayer's Folly* to a long solo of Tristan in Wagner's opera.⁹² Resemblances between the plot of *Der Ring des Nibelungen* and that of *Almayer's Folly* as well as of *Nostramo* have been noted, as were the references to *Tristan und Isolde* in *The Nature of A Crime*, jointly written with Ford Madox Hueffer [Ford].⁹³

The most explicitly Wagnerian of Conrad's works is a Malay tale, 'Freya of the Seven Isles.' Although it was written as late as 1911, it is close in its theme as well as retrospective narrative form to the earlier *fin-de-siècle* Malay stories of annihilating passion. 'Freya of the Seven Isles' is a story of uncontrollable desires of love and theft, and those passions are expressed through descriptions of Wagner's music and powerful voices. The heroine of the tale is several times described as playing 'a modern, fierce piece of love music' of Wagner, which, judging from the *Liebestod* motif of the tale (Freya dies of love, as the narrator says at the end of the story), is probably the music of *Tristan und Isolde*. The music plays a key role in some important scenes: Freya's playing of Wagner on the piano against the background of a thunderstorm with Jasper Allen, her lover, listening enthralled is the first impressive scene of the tale, suggesting that passion and

violence are its main themes. Freya's confrontation with Heemskirk, the jealous villain who is madly in love with her and eventually ruins her lover, also features the same Wagnerian love.

Notably, in this tale the motif of Wagner's music works in conjunction with another motif, that of voice, both representing the desire which cannot be restrained by the modern, bourgeois, supposedly rational norm. The text indicates that Heemskirk's malevolent nature, with its villainous uncontrollable desire, is in his laughter: 'That [his wickedness] was obvious, directly you heard him laugh. Nothing gives away more a man's secret disposition than the unguarded ring of his laugh.'⁹⁴ Later, when Freya confronts Heemskirk, who begins to make advances to her, the battle between the two passionate natures becomes the aural battle of music and voice, with Freya using the Wagnerian love music against Heemskirk's voice confessing his feeling for her. In the scene, the vocality of his utterance is highlighted: 'when his voice reached her she went cold all over. It was the voice, not the words' (194). As in *Heart of Darkness*, a strong 'melocentric' tendency is discernible here.

The connection between voice and uncontrollable desire takes yet another form, the kleptomania of a mariner with the name redolent of the Kurtz of the African novella. Like Kurtz, this mariner, called Shultz, has a wonderful voice. As Kurtz's is in *Heart of Darkness*, Shultz's extraordinary voice is repeatedly and somewhat excessively emphasized. Probably the name of Schultz is a compound of the German Schuld (guilt) and the Kurtz of his earlier colonial novella.

Indirectly because of a theft he could not resist committing, Schultz eventually kills himself by cutting his throat, as if to destroy his 'tender, persuasive, manly, but fascinating voice' (231). Considered together with Freya's Wagnerian *Liebestod*, this method of suicide can be taken to stand for the destruction of the untamable desire represented by auralty, which cannot be tolerated in the modern text-dominated society. The presence of Wagner and the 'melocentric' voice are thus related in this tale, which bears some 'melocentric' resemblances to *Heart of Darkness*.

Conrad and the 'Melocentricism' of Schopenhauer

In Conradian criticism, Schopenhauer has received more attention than Wagner. Ian Watt, for instance, suggests the influence of Schopenhauer on Conrad's aesthetics as shown in the Preface, drawing attention to the belief in the primacy of music and the value of aesthetic experience shared by the two authors.⁹⁵ John Galsworthy, in his 1924 'Reminiscences of Conrad,' recalls Conrad's interest in Schopenhauer around the turn of the century.⁹⁶ And Owen Knowles, as well as citing an example of a direct Schopenhauerian echo in one of Conrad's 1899 letters, links the *fin-de-siècle* Schopenhauer mania to 'Conrad's dark letters of the late 1890s which contain 'extravagant Schopenhauerian outbursts.'⁹⁷

A comparison of Schopenhauer and Conrad shows their sharing major 'melocentric' characteristics: the valorization of interiority, the prioritization of music, and the reference to the 'melocentric' voice

without statement. In Preface to *The Nigger of the 'Narcissus,'* Conrad links the idea of a descent into one's interior self to the usual invisibility of truth:

Confronted by the same enigmatical spectacle [of the world] the artist descends within himself, and in that lonely region of stress and strife, [...] he finds the terms of his appeal. His appeal is made to our less obvious capacities: to that part of our nature which [...] is necessarily kept out of sight within the more resisting and hard qualities—like the vulnerable body within the steel armour. (vii-viii)

As has been said, the Conradian truth resulting from this is something to be snatched from the invisible realm of one's inner self and exposed to view, but also to be conveyed by the aural-oral medium whose art can be compared to music.

Likewise, in Conrad's colonial novella, Africa also serving as a symbolic interior world of the *heart of darkness*, the reader is invited to enter the inner realm, to hear the disembodied voices of Kurtz, Marlow and the African wilderness. These voices are supposed to carry the ultimate truth, and yet they are without any clear statements. In Schopenhauer's case, too, the notion of one's interiority in relation to the ultimate truth, or the ultimate truth of the non-existence of the ultimate truth, can be connected with the aural-oral. And the earlier quoted passage from *The World as Will and Representation*, should be now looked at again:

As soon as we enter into ourselves in order to attempt it, and wish for once to know ourselves fully by directing our knowledge inwards, we lose ourselves in a bottomless void; we find ourselves like a hollow glass globe, from the emptiness of which a voice speaks. But the cause of this voice is not to be found in the globe, and since we want to comprehend ourselves, we grasp with a shudder nothing but a wavering and unstable phantom.⁹⁸

The voice that symbolizes the ultimate ground of one's being is the 'melocentric' one that speaks, but carries no statement.

The notion of interiority can also be linked to music as the best approach to the ultimate truth in Schopenhauer. He asserts that every aspect of 'the Will,' including 'all emotions of one's innermost being,' can be expressed by music.⁹⁹ The following is also taken from the passage where he enthuses on music:

It [music] is such a great and exceedingly fine art, its effect on man's innermost nature is so powerful, and it is so completely and profoundly understood by him in his innermost being as an entirely universal language, whose distinctness surpasses even that the world of perception itself. [...]
[W]e must attribute to music a far more serious and profound significance that refers to the innermost being of the world and of our own self.¹⁰⁰

Music is thus almost inseparable from the interior truth of the individual as well as of the world. It is well to be reminded here that

the valorization of interiority and of music in relation to truth are attitudes shared by Conrad and Pater. Additionally, the viewing of music as 'universal language' in the passage also entails the 'melocentric' view of language as voice and music.

The modern 'melocentricism' of Romantic origin thus ranges from Herder through Wordsworth, Schopenhauer, Wagner, Pater to Conrad. It underpins the pervasive voice-scape of *Heart of Darkness* created by the disembodied voice. And yet, it is occasionally complicated by the simultaneous valorization of spiritual vision, one of whose instances is the Conradian vocal-visual model of knowledge.

The *Fin-de-siècle* Implications of Conrad's Voice III:

The Scientific Concept of Ether

One scientific element lies concealed in *Heart of Darkness*: the concept of ether. It has some bearing on the question of the modern alternative aural subjectivity. It gained a privileged status as the basis for all the phenomena of nature in the increasingly secularized eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. And its importance reached a peak in the late nineteenth century, with the revival of the wave theory of light, the discovery of electromagnetic waves and the consequent invention of wireless communications. The ethereal implications of the disembodied voice will be further examined in the chapters on Stoker, Kipling, Lawrence.

The examination of the concept of ether in Conrad can begin by looking again at the anonymous narrator's comment on Marlow's tale,

whose disembodied voice, from the site of the modern alternative subject, exposes the imperial situation, domestic and abroad:

Marlow was not typical (if his propensity to spin yarns be excepted), and to him the meaning of an episode was not inside like a kernel but outside [in the unseen (MS)], enveloping the tale which brought it out only as a glow brings out a haze, in the likeness of one of these misty halos that sometimes are made visible by the spectral illumination of moonshine. (48; the inserted text of the manuscript, indicated by square brackets, is taken from the Norton edition of *Heart of Darkness* 9).

Marlow's narrating voice is thus compared to a light which makes visible the truth normally invisible in the unlit atmosphere, the metaphors of 'a haze' and 'misty halos' presupposing the existence of the unseen atmosphere. His bodiless voice is, both metaphorically in the context of the quoted comment as well as physically, carried through the medium of the invisible atmosphere. In his excellent paper on Conrad and science, Ronald R. Benson finds a close connection between this presupposed atmosphere and ether, a then prevalent scientific concept. Drawing on the scientific and social discourse of the time, Benson illustrates the parallelism between the two, citing a distinguished physicist of the time, William Crookes, whose concept of 'nerve atmosphere' was to be later developed in his discussion of ether.¹⁰¹ Elsewhere, Benson also cites other well-known scientists, Lord Kelvin [Sir William Thomson] and John Tyndall, as respectively

seeing ether simply as 'a continuation of our own atmosphere or comparing it to 'a second, finer atmosphere.'¹⁰² Herbert Spencer, too, is mentioned for his metaphorical use of ether, which indicates the term's popularity at that time.¹⁰³ Furthermore, just before he began to write *Heart of Darkness*, Conrad indicated in a letter, which will be scrutinized below, that ether is the ultimate reality. Being carried through it, therefore, Marlow's voice can be said to be the voice of ether. What we will do now is to expand on the significance of ether as suggested in Conrad's text, in relation to the science and culture of the late nineteenth century. The concept of ether here also looks forward to our later scrutiny of the wireless voice in Stoker, Kipling and D.H. Lawrence.

Definition of Ether

It might be well first to elucidate the sense of the term I am referring to, with the help of the *Oxford English Dictionary*. The following is definition 5.a. of ether in the dictionary:

5.a. *Physics*. A substance of great elasticity and subtilty, formerly believed to permeate the whole of planetary and stellar space, not only filling the interplanetary space, but also the interstices between the particles of air and other matter on the earth; the medium through which the waves of light are propagated. Formerly also thought to be the medium through which radio waves and electromagnetic radiations generally are propagated. Sometimes called *the luminiferous ether*. Also *attrib.*, as in *ether-strain*,

-vibration, -wave.

Later views of the ether were that it provided a frame of reference for the universe, with respect to which Maxwell's equations of electromagnetism or other field equations are valid, but that it possibly lacked any material properties. Following the special theory of relativity, which assumed that there is no absolute frame of reference and which explained why the Michelson-Morley experiment failed to detect an 'ether wind,' the concept was gradually discarded in scientific thought, and received little support since the 1920s. (*OED*)

One chronological confusion should be rectified here. The *OED* definition gives the impression that the assumption of ether as the medium of 'radio waves and electromagnetic radiations' was replaced by the view of ether as 'a frame of reference for the universe.' This is wrong: they happened simultaneously.

History of Ether up to the Eighteenth Century

The first instance given for this sense in the *OED* is in 1644, but the concept of ether is as old as ancient Greece, where it meant higher air, and was associated with such things as fire, soul, life, motion.¹⁰⁴ The philosophies of the pre-Socratic Anaximenes and Heraclitus contained references to the ethereal, but the first theory of ether as such was presented by Aristotle, who counted it as an additional element beside the classic four elements (3-5). The middle ages 'saw deployment of the Greek ideas of *aither* and *pneuma* whenever—and

that was often—doctrines of spirit or of heaven were given a physical interpretation' (8). In the seventeenth century, Descartes used the concept of ether in explaining the mechanism of perception: according to him, the motion of subtle substance, what was then called Cartesian ether, in the nerves caused perception (11-17). Isaac Newton's idea of ether as 'an active agent initiating in bodies new motions' is applied to his theories of gravitation and of animal motion and perception (19-24).

Although there are conflicting views on the popularity of ether in the eighteenth century (61 and 158-60), the century of the secularizing Enlightenment certainly saw changes in the concept of ether reflecting the modernity of the age. Firstly, it distanced itself from the idea of divine origin and came to be treated 'as inherently active substance'; in other words, it came to be seen as functioning as 'the source of the activity of nature' and independently of God (62, 72 and 131). The relationship between secularization and ether in this period also emerges in J. R. R. Christie's examination of the significance of ether in the thoughts of progressive scientists and philosophers of the time, such as William Cullen, David Hume and Adam Smith. One could include in this category David Hartley, whose largely materialistic physiological psychology is also noted, though briefly, by Christie.¹⁰⁵ Secondly, with the secularizing shift in focus from God to Nature, that century saw attempts to find a universal ether underlying diverse phenomena of nature, such as fire, light, electricity, heat, magnetism (73-80 and 160). This trend continued into the following century. Around the turn of the century, Thomas Young stated that ether 'may

possibly be the ground work of all the phenomena of nature (79). It was also around that time when Anton Mesmer's magnetic therapy and view of the universe based on an ethereal, universal and subtle fluid held sway in France, a theory that was to dominate Britain later in the period from the 1830s to around 1870.¹⁰⁶

Ether in the Nineteenth Century

As 'the burgeoning enthusiasm for electrical studies' (68) was responsible for the attention given to ether in the eighteenth century, the wave theory of light gave rise to the renewed, nineteenth-century interest in the medium. Early in the century, the wave theory of light, originally proposed by the late seventeenth-century thinker Christiaan Huygens, was revived and developed by the Briton Thomas Young and the Frenchman Augustin Fresnel, and the existence of what was called 'luminiferous ether' was presupposed as a medium of the vibration of light (215-9). By the late 1820s, 'the balance of opinion was shifting perceptibly towards the undulatory theory' of light (173); 'by the 1850s, the wave theory of light (and the associated hypothesis of a luminiferous ether) enjoyed' wide acceptance among natural philosophers (180). Then, the latter half of the century witnessed the attribution of additional functions to ether:

James Clerk Maxwell showed how the optical ether could be fruitfully regarded as the seat of electrical and magnetic effects as well; and William Thomson (Lord Kelvin) argued that atoms of ordinary matter could be

viewed as nothing but patterns of vortex motion in a ubiquitous, space-filling medium [...]. These ideas of Maxwell and Thomson, as interpreted and elaborated in the closing decades of the nineteenth century by George Fitzgerald, Oliver Lodge, Joseph Larmor, and others, gave rise to the notion of a truly universal ether [...,] “assumed to be the ultimate seat of all phenomena.” (239)

In other words, Maxwell’s and Thomson’s works encouraged a further development of the eighteenth-century idea of universal ether; and by ‘the 1880s, the doctrine of the universal ether had become firmly established in Victorian physics’ (258). Ether was viewed not only as the medium of light and electromagnetic waves but as the basis for matter and the field in which the vortex motion of atoms occurred (254-9). Furthermore, late in the century, it was frequently considered as imbued with spiritual qualities. Apart from providing the basis for gross matter, it was seen as the intermediary between the spiritual and the material, and was related to spiritualism, which was then widely popular (135-56). G.N.Cantor points out that many eminent scientists of the time, such as Oliver Lodge, J.C.Adams, A.R.Wallace, Lord Rayleigh, J.J.Thomson and William Crookes, were interested in psychic phenomena, and the ether was frequently resorted to in their attempts to integrate their religious views with contemporary scientific theories (147). An influential book of the time by two renowned physicists, Balfour Stewart and Peter Guthrie Tait, *The Unseen Universe*, made use of current scientific doctrines, to argue

for the existence of the invisible, extra-sensory, spiritual world above the physical one, and employed the contemporary concept of invisible ether to support its arguments.

It is, of course, this privileged, late nineteenth-century status of ether, associated with the idea of the ultimate, sometimes spiritual, reality which is most important to the issue of Conrad and science. And it is possible to relate, as Benson does, the unseen atmosphere carrying Marlow's disembodied voice to the invisible ether. A comparison of Conrad and John Tyndall, an eminent late-Victorian scientist famous for his popular *Fragments of Science*, can further clarify our point here.

John Tyndall on Ether

In the book, Tyndall refers to the similarity of the inseparable relationship between sound and air and that between light and ether:

From the earliest ages the questions, "What is light?" and "What is heat?" have occurred to the minds of men; but these questions never would have been answered had they not been preceded by the question, "What is sound?"

[...] Sound we know to be due to vibratory motion. A vibrating tuning-fork, for example, moulds the air around it into undulations or waves, which [...] shake the auditory nerve, and awake in the brain the sensation of sound.

[...] [A]nd it was not until numberless experiments of this kind had been executed, that the scientific investigator abandoned himself wholly, and without a shadow of misgiving, to the conviction that what is sound within

us is, outside of us, a motion of the air. But [...] once having proved this fact [...], the thought soon suggested itself that light might be due to an agitation of the optic nerve. This was a great step in advance of that ancient notion which regarded light as something emitted by the eye, and not as anything imparted to it. But if light be produced by an agitation of the retina, what is it that produces the agitation?¹⁰⁷

Tyndall's answer to the last question in the passage now quoted is, of course, ether. In another chapter of the book, he is more explicit and concise: 'the conception of a medium filling space and fitted mechanically for the transmission of the vibrations of light and heat [i.e. ether], as air is fitted for the transmission of sound' (33); and that chapter is concluded with an instance of sound, voice and hearing (72-3). When the comment of the anonymous narrator on Marlow's tale in Conrad's novella is considered in the light of those words of Tyndall's on sound and air and light and ether, the implied comparison of Marlow's voice to the light conveying the ultimate truth and the assumed existence of the atmosphere strongly suggest the invisible presence of the other factor which is not named in the nameless narrator's comment, that is, ether.¹⁰⁸

There are further significant parallels between Tyndall and Conrad, which corroborate our reading. Firstly, the Victorian scientist's reference to the relationship between light and haze emphasizes the former as the real cause of an effect generally ascribed to the latter: 'It is not the interposition of haze *as an opaque body* that renders the

[distant] mountains indistinct, but [...] the *light* of the haze which dims and bewilders the eye (my emphasis).'¹⁰⁹ This is reminiscent of the comment on Marlow's oral tale in *Heart of Darkness*: Marlow's tale and its meaning are compared to a light and a mist, the latter of which is unseen in the dark, and the primacy of the former in their relationship is described thus: the tale brings out the meaning 'only as a glow brings out a haze, in the likeness of one of these misty halos that sometimes are made visible by the spectral illumination of moonshine' (48). Secondly, Tyndall elsewhere also compares light to music: 'the light of all suns, and of all stars, is in reality a kind of music, propagated through this interstellar air [ether].'¹¹⁰ Implied here is his connection with the Romantic-'melocentric' aesthetic tradition, shared by Pater and Conrad.

The vein of Romantic aesthetics in Tyndall is also apparent in his view of the important role to be played by imagination in the understanding of elusive concepts such as that of ether. He controversially eulogizes imagination, whose function he says is indispensable for the comprehension of the invisible medium.¹¹¹ Imagination, he states, enables one to mentally picture what cannot be grasped through ordinary vision, and thus the imaginative faculty, whose literary association is often considered anti-scientific, is in truth essential even to scientific investigations.¹¹²

Conrad's Ethereal Letter

Another important piece of evidence pointing to the relevance of

ether in *Heart of Darkness* is a letter of Conrad's addressed to Edward Garnett, written on 29 September, 1898, just a few months before he started on the novella in mid-December.¹¹³ It is referred to in Benson's essay on Conrad, too, but his examination of it is somewhat cursory; the letter, therefore, requires scrutiny here. Describing his visit to a Glaswegian Dr. John McIntyre, one of the first radiologists, this long letter suggests both the degree of Conrad's excitement and the kind of influence that contemporary science and technology exerted on him. It deserves an extensive quotation:

I do not regret having gone. McIntyre is a scientific swell who talks art, knows artists of all kinds—looks after their throats, you know. He has given himself a lot of trouble in my interest and means to hammer away at it till I do get something.

All day with the shipowners and in the evening dinner, phonograph, X rays, talk about *the* secret of the universe and the nonexistence of, so called, matter. The secret of the universe is in the existence of horizontal waves whose varied vibrations are at the bottom of all states of consciousness. If the waves were vertical the universe would be different. This is a truism. But, don't you see, there is nothing in the world to prevent the simultaneous existence of vertical waves, of waves at any angles; in fact there are mathematical reasons for believing that such waves do exist. Therefore it follows that two universes may exist in the same place and in the same time—and not only two universes but an infinity of different universes—if by universe we mean a set of states of consciousness; and note, *all* (the

universes) composed of the same matter, *all matter* being only that thing of inconceivable tenuity through which the various vibrations of waves (electricity, heat, sound, light etc.) are propagated, thus giving birth to our sensations—then emotions—then thought. Is that so?

These things I said to the Dr [sic] while Neil Munro stood in front of a Röntgen machine and on the screen behind we contemplated his backbone and his ribs. The rest of that promising youth was too diaphanous to be visible. It was so—said the Doctor—and there is no space, time, matter, mind as vulgarly understood, there is only the eternal something that waves and an eternal force that causes the waves—it's not much—and by the virtue of these two eternities exists that Corot and that Whistler in the dining room upstairs (we were in a kind of cellar) and Munro's here writings and your Nigger and Graham's politics and Paderewski's playing (in the phonograph) and what more do you want?¹¹⁴ (*italics in the original*)

Although ether is not named, there is an abundance of evidence in the letter indicating that what Conrad has in mind in the passage is ether. Firstly, the concept of ether is inseparable from the idea of wave and vibration, especially so in the late nineteenth century, when it received a great amount of attention in conjunction with the wave theory of light. The idea of ether was, as Cantor and Hodge observe, associated with motion and action as early as the time of ancient Greece (5-6); and with the idea of vibration in the eighteenth century (123). Probably, it was on account of such kinetic, undulatory implications that ether became so popular in the latter half of the following century, with the

establishment of the wave theory of light. The inseparability of ether and wave-like motion in *fin-de-siècle* Britain is epitomized in the pronouncement of Lord Salisbury in his 1894 presidential address at the meeting of the British Association for the Advancement of Science: 'the main, if not the only function of the word ether has been to furnish a nominative case of the verb "to undulate".'¹¹⁵

Secondly, the question of horizontal and vertical vibrations, referred to in the letter, is also known to have been connected with ether. Scientists discussing it in relation to ether range from the early nineteenth-century Augustin Jean Fresnel to the *fin-de-siècle* Helmholtz and Sir William Thomson [Lord Kelvin]. Thirdly, that 'the various vibrations of waves' mostly concern 'electricity, heat, sound, light' strongly suggests the medium in question ('that thing of inconceivable tenuity') being ether. It is simply because electricity, light and heat were the phenomena that were most often discussed in connection with the idea of ether around that time. Sound is also included here, probably because the analogy between sound/air and light/ether was not uncommon then, as is suggested by Tyndall's frequent recourse to it.

Fourthly, the remark in the letter that ether functions as the original cause of sensations, emotions and thoughts can be related to the link between ether and sensation and perception, which was touched upon in my earlier discussion of Tyndall. The connection between ether and sensation/perception, however, is older. The ethereal theory of perception and sensation can be detected in

Descartes and Newton, as well as in David Hartley's physiological psychology, in which sensations and thoughts are considered to be brought about by the vibration of ether propagated through nerves. Nevertheless, Tyndall's explanation of the visual perception by the reception of the vibration of ether in the optical nerve reflects the age to which it belongs, differing from the preceding theories in that it is under the influence of the wave theory of light. Another representative idea of the time, spiritualism, can also be detected in William Crookes' late nineteenth-century, mystical idea of ether, in which ether is posited as a medium for, among other things, the transmission of thought.¹¹⁶ Furthermore, Conrad's equation of the ethereal universe with the state of consciousness in the letter structurally parallels the overlapping of the exterior and the interior worlds suggested in the title and content of *Heart of Darkness*.

Fifthly, the allusion to ultimate reality in phrases in the letter, like 'the eternal something that waves and an eternal force that causes the waves,' is redolent of the *fin-de-siècle* association of ether with an ultimate reality. Apart from its religious dimension, which has been touched upon, there were several distinguished physicists of the time, such as Hermann von Helmholtz, Hendrik Antoon Lorentz, Oliver Lodge, who saw in ether the ultimate reality. The idea of force in the above phrase, again apart from its suggestion of divinity, is also ether-related, in the sense that the nineteenth-century idea of ether which is inseparable from the concept of electromagnetism originates in Faraday's concept of line of force.

Lastly, X rays and ether are also connected through electromagnetism; the former is a form of electromagnetic wave, whereas the late nineteenth-century idea of the latter is impossible without Maxwell's discussion of it in relation to electromagnetic waves. On the visit to the Glaswegian radiologist, Conrad was very excited to have his hand X-rayed and see a friend's skeleton before the X-ray machine.¹¹⁷ And in the same year, when the letter was written and the composition of *Heart of Darkness* was launched, another eminent scientist, William Crookes, stated that 'a wave or ether theory' of X rays was gaining acceptance.¹¹⁸ It should by now be clear that what Conrad has in mind in the letter is ether.

It is not only the fact that the letter was written shortly before the writing of *Heart of Darkness* but also a suggestion of aural awareness in the letter that relates the content of the letter to the ethereal voice in the novella.¹¹⁹ We have noted that sound is mentioned along with light, heat, electricity in the letter. We have also seen that ether was occasionally compared to air at the time, and that the relationship between sound and its medium, air, was used as an analogy for the relationship between light and ether. Therefore, the inclusion of sound in the letter may be said to derive from this analogy, in spite of the fact that, to be exact, the reference to sound in the passage was an aberration: unlike light, heat and electricity, it was air, not ether, that was considered to carry sound. The juxtaposition of sound with light, heat and electricity, therefore, can also suggest the special closeness of sound and ether in the mind of Conrad.

It is noteworthy, too, that, near the end of the letter, the disembodied, vibrating quality of ultimate reality, together with the contrasted vanity of appearance, is indicated in a joking remark about the renting of a house—Pent Farm—to be sublet by Ford Madox Hueffer [Ford]:

I returned [from Glasgow] to the bosom of my family at 1 pm today and wrote to Hueffer at once to clinch the matter (there's no matter) of Pent Farm (which is only a vain and delusive appearance). I hope I may get it. If I don't I shall vanish into space (there's no space) and the vibrations that make up me [sic].¹²⁰

The references in the letter to the phonograph, a then recent invention that, by setting the air into vibration, emits disembodied voices, is also important, confirming Conrad's consciousness of aurality in the letter.¹²¹ These instances foreshadow the vital role assigned to the disembodied voices, which are accompanied by the awareness of visual deception, in *Heart of Darkness*.

Two Later Ethereal References

His later references to technology in two of his twentieth-century essays can be seen as developments of the *fin-de-siècle* ethereal voice of *Heart of Darkness*. 'The Unlighted Coast,' a 1917 report (not published until 1925) on his experience aboard HMS *Ready*, contains a brief depiction of a man in charge of wireless communication. The

essay begins with a strong impression of the darkness of land in state of war. Then, that darkness is joined by a disembodied voice:

For just as I was remarking to the officer by my side that surely neither Caesar's galleys nor the ships of the Danish rovers had ever found on their approach this land so absolutely and scrupulously lightless as this—just then a voice behind us was heard: 'I've here two messages I have just picked up.'

It was our wireless man. That shadow emitting no sound waves, no waves of light, was talking to its watchers at sea; filling the silence with words pregnant with the truth, the naked, ugly truth of the situation.¹²²

Significant, interrelated motifs we have seen in *Heart of Darkness*, those of darkness, disembodied voice, and the naked truth, as well as the reference to ancient Roman colonialists shared by the novella, are here. And wireless is linked to a Gothic disembodied voice, which conveys the message of the naked truth against the background of darkness. At that time, the medium for electromagnetic waves, upon which wireless communication depends, was widely supposed to be ether. William Crookes even considered psychic phenomena of Gothic character, such as telepathy, in terms of ether. The reference to waves in the essay also suggests that the author was thinking of ether.

The other essay, 'Confidence' (1919), a eulogy of the British Merchant Service, concerns another important factor present in *Heart of Darkness*, the crisis of liberal humanism, based on the supposedly

rational, unified subject. The letter of 29 September 1898 suggests the crisis regarding the centrality of human beings in the universe, implied by the theory of ether: human individuals being only part of the ultimate, ethereal reality. The imperial novella also shows Western bourgeois-individualist humanism as threatened by voices from Africa, which are mediated by the ethereal voices of Marlow and Kurtz; all these voices, as we have shown, relate to the alternative vocal subjectivity. In the 1919 essay, the future British seaman is momentarily imagined as being loaded with modern technological equipment of communication. As is suggested by the phrase 'scientific antennae' in the following quotation, the ethereal voice conveyed by electromagnetic waves seems to comprise a part of that future vision:

I don't know what the seaman of the future will be like. He may have to live all his days with a telephone tied up to his head and bristle all over with scientific antennae like a figure in a fantastic tale. But he will always be the man revealed to us lately, immutable in his slight variations like the closed path of this planet of ours on which he must find his exact position once, at the very least, in every twenty-four hours.¹²³

Thus, in the passage, Conrad assures the reader of the unchanging human-centredness of future society, as if to repress the nightmarish vision of the robot-like seaman that has momentarily erupted into his description. And yet, the last sentence in the quoted passage, which is meant to confirm the everlasting centrality of the human individual in

the world, can also be taken as inadvertently reflecting an anxiety about the place of man, in that the metaphor chosen can imply that the future seaman will be able to know his position in the universe *only* once in twenty-four hours. The ethereal voices of technology in the post-1900 Conrad, threatening the supposedly unified, bourgeois subject, can thus be seen as variations on the same theme of the 1890s. In later chapters, We will return to scrutinize the question of the wireless voice and the subjectivity it represents.

The *Fin-de-siècle* Implications of Conrad's Voice IV:

The Overlapping of the Sexual and the Political

Recent studies in the relationship between imperialism and sexuality show that the sexual is imbricated with the political, which is true of Conrad's imperial novella, too.¹²⁴ The way in which the sexual and the political overlap in *Heart of Darkness* seems typical of the fiction set in the colonies during the high period of Imperialism. In the novella, as Marianna Torgovnick observes in her *Gone Primitive*, Kurtz's African mistress is equated with the African wilderness (136), which can be counted as one of the instances of the conflation of the colonized region and the female body in Conrad's works, pointed out by Padmini Mongia.¹²⁵ Her argument itself is based on Anne McClintock's reading of Haggard's *King Solomon's Mines*, in which British colonialism is represented by a number of overlapping factors, a map, a woman, treasure and knowledge. All these elements, linked to *fin-de-siècle* imperialism, are, of course, shared by *Heart of Darkness*;

which fact further supports the interpretation of the novella in terms of the sexual-cum-political. The significance for the English imperial imagination of the identification of the colonized with the female sex to be feared and desired has been fully discussed by scholars such as Robert Young and Sander Gilman, as well as McClintock. Ronald Hyam, on the other hand, in his *Empire and Sexuality*, traces the actual sex life of Englishmen in the British imperial territory and its relation to the British Empire from the eighteenth to mid-twentieth centuries, including the close relationship between Englishmen and African women; and, based on the book, we can say that Kurtz's taking an African mistress is nothing extraordinary. It is thus possible to look at the African woman in the novella in the context of imperialism and sexuality.

Voice is of importance here, too. On the surface, *Heart of Darkness* is a story of men involved in the imperial situation, with women mostly in the background and their sexuality underplayed. However, it does not follow that female sexuality is only a minor element in the work. Rather, sexuality is de-emphasized in a way that hints at its power and importance, redolent of how something important is repressed and intimated in the Freudian psychology. The striking image of Kurtz's African mistress is a case in point. Her mysterious presence, which is left unexplained and yet very powerful, radiates an abundant sexual energy. And, on Kurtz going aboard the ship, she gives a shout, which is taken up by the natives in 'a roaring chorus' (146). Considering the topos of Africa equated with the feminine and

the sexual, observed by McClintock and Young and Gilman, and also the significance of the African voice of mystery as ultimate truth in the novella, the African woman's cry, whose meaning Kurtz understands but Marlow cannot, can be taken to signify the ultimate truth of sexuality *and* colonialism to be found in Africa.

There is another scene in which the vocal, hidden female sexuality and imperialism are interlinked: Marlow's visit to Kurtz's fiancée near the end of the novella. There, although she looks innocently free of the sexual element, it still creeps in in the form of Marlow's love for her. His feeling for her is only intimated: 'I concluded I would go and give her back her portrait and those letters myself. Curiosity? Yes; and also *some other feeling* perhaps' (155; my emphasis). Still, Conrad's remark elsewhere that there is a 'shadow of love interest' in the last pages of the work most certainly refers to this feeling of Marlow's for the woman.¹²⁶ Here, sexuality, projected onto the female in the relationship between Kurtz and his African mistress, is displaced onto Marlow, in order to preserve the domestic innocence of the Victorian Englishwoman. And yet, it cannot be doubted that the sexual element is in the scene; it is clear from the overlapping of the fiancée and the African mistress in Marlow's mental vision, too (160). Hearing the fiancée talk, Marlow sees Kurtz in his mind; then he says:

I shall see this eloquent phantom [Kurtz] as long as I live, and I shall see her [the fiancée], too, a tragic and familiar Shade, resembling in this gesture another one [the African mistress], tragic also, and bedecked with

powerless charms, stretching bare brown arms over the glitter of the infernal stream, the stream of darkness. (160-1)

Significantly, when the fiancée prattles on about her memories of Kurtz, the African voices, human and natural, return to Marlow, as if awoken by the Englishwoman's voice (160-2). In other words, the woman's latently sexual voice recalls the latently sexual African voices, whose return has the power to divulge the reality of colonial life if the listener/reader is willing. Sexuality and the colonial situation are thus linked via some of the voices in this novella which come back like the Freudian return of the repressed.

Conclusion

The implications of the vocal in *Heart of Darkness* are manifold. We have seen the affinities between Conradian voices and Gothic-Romantic voices; and that the former can be traced back to the culture of proto-Romanticism and Romanticism, to which the latter belongs. Related to this are the questions of the modern alternative subject and of the nostalgia for pre-modern oral culture. And we have also seen reflections of many contemporary elements in his treatment of voices: the most prominent in Conrad are the socio-political factors, such as the consumer society and the imperial situation, but there are other factors involved: the 'melocentricism' of the aesthetico-linguistic tradition, the scientific concept of ether, and the overlapping of the sexual with the political. What is yet to be done is to compare what we

have observed in Conrad's imperial novella with works of other writers of the time and of other times, thereby seeking to put the question of the disembodied voice in modern British literature into a wider perspective.

NOTES

-
- ¹ Alison Milbank, Introduction to *A Sicilian Romance* by Ann Radcliffe (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1993), pp.ix-x.
- ² Edmund Burke, *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*, ed. and intro. by Adam Phillips (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1990), p.56.
- ³ Ann Radcliffe, *The Mysteries of Udolpho*, ed. and intro. by Bonamy Dobrée (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1980), p.386.
- ⁴ Burke, p.160.
- ⁵ As to the connection between the popular culture of the Romantic period and superstition, see David Vincent, 'The Decline of the Oral Tradition in Popular Culture,' in *Popular Culture and Custom in Nineteenth-Century England*, ed. by Robert D. Storch (London: Croom Helm, 1982), pp.20-47.
- ⁶ Sigmund Freud. 'The Uncanny,' in *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud*, trans. by James Strachey, 24 vols (London: Hogarth, 1953-1974), XVII: *An Infantile Neurosis and Other Works* (1955), 217-252.
- ⁷ Maurice Richardson, 'The Psychoanalysis of Ghost Stories,' *The Twentieth Century* 166 (December 1959), 419-431 (p.420).
- ⁸ Ann Radcliffe, *The Italian, or the Confessional of the Black Penitents; A Romance*, ed. and intro. by Frederick Garber (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1981), pp.397-398.
- ⁹ See Terry Castle, *The Female Thermometer: Eighteenth-Century Culture and the Invention of the Uncanny* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1995), pp.3-20 and 120-139.
- ¹⁰ The villain's powerful voice is also connected to the pre-modernity, because of his association with a traditional system such as

Catholicism and aristocracy. Nostalgia is always mixed with fear. For Gothic fiction and the anti-Catholicism, see Victor Sage, *Horror Fiction in the Protestant Tradition* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1988), pp.26-69.

¹¹ James Macpherson, *The Poems of Ossian and Related Works*, ed. by Howard Gaskill, intro. by Fiona Stafford (Edinburgh: Edinburgh Univ. Press, 1996), p.86.

¹² Peter Burke, *Popular Culture in Early Modern Europe*, 2nd edn. (Aldershot: Scolar, 1994), pp.3-22.

¹³ Burke, p.286.

¹⁴ Walter Scott, Introduction to *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*, rev. and ed. by T.F.Henderson, 4 vols (Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1932), I, 55-176 (p.156).

¹⁵ Walter Scott, 'Essay on Imitations of the Ancient Ballad,' in his *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*, rev. and ed. by T.F.Henderson, 4 vols (Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1932), IV, 1-52.

¹⁶ Walter Scott, *Rob Roy*, ed. by John Sutherland (London: Dent, 1995), pp.30-31.

¹⁷ Walter Scott, *Waverley*, ed. and intro. by Andrew Hook (London: Penguin, 1972), p.178.

¹⁸ Scott, *Waverley*, p.173.

¹⁹ Johann Gottfried Herder 'Von Ähnlichkeit der mittlern englischen und deutschen Dichtkunst, nebst Verschiednem, das daraus folget,' in his *Schriften zur Ästhetik und Literatur 1767-1781*, ed. by Gunter E. Grimm (Frankfurt: Deutscher Klassiker, 1993), pp.550-562 (p.556). See also his essay on Macpherson's Ossian poems, 'Auszug aus einem Briefwechsel über Ossian und die Lieder alter Völker,' in *Schriften zur Ästhetik und Literatur 1767-1781*, pp.447-497.

²⁰ Johann Gottfried Herder, 'Auch eine Philosophie der Geschichte zur Bildung der Menschheit,' in *Johann Gottfried Herder Werke*, 10 vols (München: Carl Hanser, 1984), I: *Herder und der Sturm und Drang 1764-1774*, ed. by Wolfgang Pross, 630 and 666 (pp.589-689).

²¹ Arthur Schopenhauer, *The World as Will and Representation*, trans. by E.F.J.Payne, 2vols (New York: Dover, 1969), I, 278.

²² Schopenhauer, I, 255-267 (p.257).

²³ Schopenhauer, II, 191.

²⁴ Vincent Pecora connects disembodied voices in Schopenhauer and Conrad in the context of modern subjectivity. His mostly philosophical genealogy, however, differs from ours, starting with David Hume's doubt on personal identity and leading through the German philosopher to Jacques Derrida's critique of phonocentrism. See his 'Heart of Darkness and the Phenomenology of Voice,' *ELH*, 52 (1985), 993-1015.

²⁵ In this respect, the present thesis is related to M.H.Abrams' discussion of the topos of the voice of the invisible wind as a form of the Romantic revolt against the ocularcentricism of Enlightenment. See M.H.Abrams, 'The Correspondent Breeze: A Romantic Metaphor,' in his *The Correspondent Breeze: Essays on English Romanticism* (New York: Norton, 1984), pp.25-43.

²⁶ William Wordsworth, *The Prelude: 1799, 1805, 1850*, ed. by Jonathan Wordsworth, M.H.Abrams, Stephen Gill (London: Norton, 1979), p.460. Further references to this edition are given in the text.

²⁷ Kelly Hurley, *The Gothic Body: Sexuality, Materialism, and Degeneration at the Fin de siècle* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1996), p.5.

²⁸ David Glover, *Vampires, Mummies, and Liberals: Bram Stoker and the Politics of Popular Fiction* (Durham: Duke Univ. Press, 1996), p.60.

²⁹ Conrad wrote one explicitly Gothic tale and one parody of Gothic story: 'The Inn of the Two Witches' (*Within the Tides*) and 'The Black Mate' (*Tales of Hearsay*). Edith Birkhead, *The Tale of Terror: A Study of the Gothic Romance* (1921; repr. New York: Russell & Russell, 1963), pp. 194-5 and 227.

³⁰ Joan Elizabeth Steiner, 'Joseph Conrad and the Tradition of the Gothic Romance,' (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan, 1971), pp.4 and 274.

³¹ Apart from Edith Birkhead, Steiner refers to four early brief remarks on the connection between Conrad and the Gothic tradition, those by J.B.Priestly, H.P.Lovecraft, Devendra P. Varma, and C.J.Rawson. We will confine our attention to later, more scholarly discussion of the topic.

³² William Patrick Day, *In the Circles of Fear and Desire: A Study of Gothic Fantasy* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1985), pp.166-177 (p.167).

³³ Patrick Brantlinger, *Rule of Darkness: British Literature and Imperialism, 1830-1914* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1988), pp. 227-274; Susan J. Navarette, *The Shape of Fear: Horror and the Fin de Siècle Culture of Decadence* (Lexington: Univ. of Kentucky Press, 1998), pp. 202-227; Chris Baldick, *In Frankenstein's Shadow: Myth, Monstrosity, and Nineteenth-Century Writing* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1987), pp. 163-172.

³⁴ By contrast, Bette London's and Bruce Henricksen's discussions of *Heart of Darkness* concerns not the Gothicity of the work but the question of voice. By voice, however, they mean a Foucauldian discourse. This use of voice as metaphor for discourse representing a certain stance or position competing with other discourses in society

lies outside the scope of the present thesis, which is an attempt to consider a variety of implications in the more concrete descriptions of voice in the text. See Bette London, *The Appropriated Voice: Narrative Authority in Conrad, Forster, and Woolf* (Ann Arbor, Univ. of Michigan Press, 1990); and also Bruce Henricksen, *Nomadic Voices: Conrad and the Subject of Narrative* (Urbana: Univ. of Illinois Press, 1992).

³⁵ Of the Gothic features mentioned here, the foreign setting and the figure of the garrulous servant are referred to by Steiner.

³⁶ Sage, pp. 1-69.

³⁷ Joseph Conrad, *Heart of Darkness*, in his *Youth, Heart of Darkness, The End of the Tether*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1946), pp.98-99 (pp.43-162). Further references to *Heart of Darkness* are given in the text and taken from this New Dent edition, except in cases where the contents of the manuscript affect our interpretation, when the Norton edition will also be resorted to.

³⁸ Radcliffe's fiction may have exerted an influence on Conrad's novella in one specific way, which is suggested by a striking similarity between Kurtz and Schedoni, the arch-villain of Radcliffe's last Gothic novel, *The Italian*. As in the case of Kurtz, not only does Schedoni own a tremendous voice, and make a dying confession, constituting the climax of the novel, but also the terrible truth of the manner of his death is concealed by the hero of the novel from two major female characters.

³⁹ Dorice Williams Elliott, 'Hearing the Darkness: The Narrative Chain in Conrad's *Heart of Darkness*,' *English Literature in Transition 1880-1920*, 28 (1985), 162-181 (p.163).

⁴⁰ Valentine Cunningham, *In the Reading Gaol: Postmodernity, Texts, and History* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1994), pp.252-256.

⁴¹ Ann McClintock, *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest* (London: Routledge, 1995), p.33.

⁴² McClintock, pp.219-221.

⁴³ Rosalind Williams, *Dream Worlds: Mass Consumption in Late Nineteenth-Century France* (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1982); Rachel Bowlby, *Just Looking: Consumer Culture in Dreiser, Gissing and Zola* (London: Methuen, 1985); and Thomas Richards, *The Commodity Culture of Victorian England: Advertising and Spectacle, 1851-1914* (London: Verso, 1991).

One can discern behind these studies a tradition of Marxist thinking on the commodity fetish, ranging from Karl Marx himself through Georg Lukács and Walter Benjamin to Guy Debord. This tradition associates vision with illusion and employs that association in an analysis of the deceptive appearance of commodities.

See also Alison Adburgham's *Shopping in Style* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1979) and *Shops and Shopping 1800-1914* (London: Allen and Unwin, 1981), Diana and Geoffrey Hindleys' *Advertising in Victorian England 1837-1901* (London: Wayland, 1972), and E.S.Turner's *The Shocking History of Advertising* (London: Michael Joseph, 1952).

⁴⁴ John Styles, 'Manufacturing, Consumption and Design in Eighteenth-Century England,' in *Consumption and the World of Goods*, ed. by John Brewer and Roy Porter (London: Routledge, 1993), pp.527-554 (p.535); for contrasting views of the dating of the birth of the consumer society to the eighteenth century in the book, see Styles's essay and Jean-Christophe Agnew's 'Coming Up for Air,' in *Consumption and the World of Goods*, ed. by Brewer and Porter, pp. 19-39. John Benson, in his *The Rise of Consumer Society in Britain 1880-1980* (London: Longman, 1994), observes the difficulty of defining

the consumer society, too (233-5). See also Joan Thirsk, *Economic Poilicy and Projects: The Development of a Consumer Society in Early Modern England* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1978); Neil McKendrick, John Brewer and J.H.Plumb, *The Birth of a Consumer Society: The Commercialization of Eighteenth-Century England* (London: Europa, 1982).

⁴⁵ Publicity using electric illumination in the street is, as Wolfgang Schivelbusch observes, a twentieth-century phenomenon, but the employment of electric lights for the display of luxury items as well as the decoration of the interiors of a shop in the late nineteenth century is noted by Adburgham in her *Shops and Shopping 1800-1914*, pp.181 and 235.

⁴⁶ H.G.Wells, *The Invisible Man*, in his *The Invisible Man, The War of the Worlds, A Dream of Armageddon*, *The Works of H.G.Wells Atlantic Edition*, 28 vols (New York: Scribner, 1924), III, 3-205 (p.146). John Benson observes that by 1900 there were over two hundred department stores in Britain.

⁴⁷ General Booth, *In Darkest England and The Way Out* (London: Salvation Army, 1890); and J.O.Baylen, 'W.T.Stead,' *The Times Literary Supplement*, 5 June 1998, p.17.

⁴⁸ See Roslyn Jolly's Introduction to Robert Louis Stevenson, *South Sea Tales* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1996), pp.ix-xxxiii.

⁴⁹ Besides Thomas Richards' *The Imperial Archive*, which I will refer to shortly, the topoi of the 'regeneration of Europe by Asia and of 'the wisdom of the East' in the Orientalist tradition, mentioned by Edward W. Said (*Orientalism*, 113, 115, 209 and 252), and the question of the Western oblique desire for the non-West, discussed by Robert Young, among others, have given us useful hints for the formulation of our

point here.

What we call the 'Western fantasy [...] that the ultimate truth lies in the non-West' has much to do with what Marianna Torgovnick writes about the tacit belief of Western intellectuals around the turn of the century, such as Malinowski, Freud, Havelock Ellis and Frazer, that the key to the universal truth can be found in primitive societies. She terms the writings underpinned by this belief 'primitivist discourse.' See her *Gone Primitive* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1990), pp.7-8 and 251.

⁵⁰ Thomas Richards, *The Imperial Archive: Knowledge and the Fantasy of Empire* (London: Verso, 1993), p.12.

⁵¹ Richards, *The Imperial Archive*, p.12.

⁵² Rudyard Kipling, *Kim*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 35 vols (London: Macmillan, 1938), XXI, 29-30.

⁵³ The implications of voice in *Dracula* will be scrutinized in Chapter Four.

⁵⁴ H. Rider Haggard, *She*, ed. and intro. by Daniel Karlin (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1989), pp.254-256.

⁵⁵ Haggard, *She*, p.4.

⁵⁶ Haggard, *She*, pp.80, 132, 178 and 265.

⁵⁷ For the history up to the period of silent film of the image of Egypt as the place of mystic knowledge, see Antonia Lant, 'The Curse of the Pharaoh, or How Cinema Contracted Egyptmania,' in *October* 59 (Winter 1992): 86-112; see also, in this connection, Bram Stoker's 1903 *The Jewel of Seven Stars*, intro. by David Glover (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1996).

⁵⁸ H. Rider Haggard, *Allan Quartermain*, ed. and intro. by Dennis Butts

(Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1991), pp.127 and 153-154. Further references to this edition are given in the text.

⁵⁹ H. Rider Haggard, *Ayesha: The Return of 'She,'* (New York: Dover, 1978), pp.60 and 85.

⁶⁰ John Buchan, 'Prester John,' *Chambers's Journal*, 5 June 1897, 362-365 (p.364).

⁶¹ John Buchan, *Prester John*, ed. and intro. by David Daniell (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1994), p.104.

⁶² Buchan, *Prester John*, p.48.

⁶³ Buchan, *Prester John*, p.100.

⁶⁴ Buchan, *Prester John*, p.62.

⁶⁵ Buchan, *Prester John*, p.195

⁶⁶ Alison Milbank, Introduction to *The Castles of Athlin and Dunbayne* by Ann Radcliffe (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1995), pp.vii-xxiv.

⁶⁷ Robert Crawford, *Devolving English Literature* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1992), p.159.

⁶⁸ Crawford, *Devolving English Literature*, p.155.

⁶⁹ Andrew Lang, *Adventures Among Books* (London: Longmans Green and Co., 1905), p.125.

⁷⁰ See Robert Louis Stevenson, 'A Gossip on Romance,' in his *Memories and Portraits & Memoir of Fleeming Jenkin*, *The Works of Robert Louis Stevenson*, 25 vols (London: Chatto and Windus, 1911), IX, 134-147; and also 'A Humble Remonstrance', in his *Memories and Portraits & Memoir of Fleeming Jenkin*, 148-60.

⁷¹ Stevenson, 'A Gossip on Romance,' p.145.

⁷² Paul de Man, *Allegories of Reading*, pp.88-89.

⁷³ We will further elaborate on the reason for the periodization in the concluding chapter.

⁷⁴ See Roy Harris ed., *The Origin of Language* (Bristol: Thoemmes, 1996), p.xi. For the history of philology, see also Hans Aarsleff, *The Study of Language in England: 1780-1860* (London: Athlone, 1983; and also Linda Dowling, *Language and Decadence in the Victorian Fin de siècle* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1986).

⁷⁵ See Neubauer, pp.159-163 and 190-210.

⁷⁶ Johann Gottfried Herder, 'Auszug aus einem Briefwechsel über Ossian und die Lieder alter Völker,' in his *Schriften zur Ästhetik und Literatur 1767-1781*, ed. by Gunter E. Grimm (Frankfurt: Deutscher Klassiker, 1993), pp.447-497.

⁷⁷ Macpherson, 205

⁷⁸ Jacques Derrida discusses the connection between interiority and logocentrism in his *Speech and Phenomena and Other Essays on Husserl's Theory of Signs*, trans. and intro. by David B. Allison (Evanston: Northwestern Univ. Press, 1973), pp.22 and 70-80.

⁷⁹ Herder, p.448.

⁸⁰ Martin Jay, *Downcast Eyes: the Denigration of Vision in Twentieth-Century French Thought* (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1993), pp.105-106.

M.H.Abrams' classic discussion of the topos of the voice of the invisible wind as Romantic revolt against the ocularcentricism of Enlightenment also corroborates, to some degree, the two contrastive models of knowledge presented here: see M.H.Abrams, 'The Correspondent Breeze,' in his *The Correspondent Breeze: Essays on English Romanticism* (New York: Norton, 1984), pp.25-43.

⁸¹ Joseph Conrad, *Heart of Darkness: An Authoritative Text, Backgrounds and Sources, Criticism*, ed. by Robert Kimbrough, 3rd edn (New York: Norton, 1988), p.9.

⁸² See Symons, *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*, pp.77-102.

⁸³ Joseph Conrad, *The Nigger of the 'Narcissus'*, in his *The Nigger of the 'Narcissus' and Typhoon and Other Stories*, Dent's New Collected Edition (London: Dent, 1950), pp.vii-173 (p.vii). Further references to this edition are given in the text.

⁸⁴ Ian Watt, *Conrad in the Nineteenth Century* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1980), p.86; Cedric Watts, Commentary, in Cedric Watts ed. *The Nigger of the 'Narcissus'* by Joseph Conrad (London: Penguin, 1988), pp.129-142 (p.132); Joseph Conrad, *The Collected Letters of Joseph Conrad*, ed. by Frederick R. Karl and Laurence Davies (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1983-), I: *1861-1897* (1983), 267-268.

⁸⁵ Walter Pater, *The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry*, ed. and intro. by Adam Phillips (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1986), pp.86-89. Further references to this edition are given in the text.

⁸⁶ In his novel *Marius the Epicurean* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1986), too, music is referred to as a metaphor for living (84-5 and 264) and the hero's hearing of hymns helps turn him to Christianity, the final goal of his life (chapter XXI). Even the connection between voice and latent homosexuality can be discerned in the text (94-96, 192-4).

⁸⁷ The emphasis on sight and touch in this passage may derive from a similar tendency in Pater's elder colleague, John Ruskin, but this question does not lie within the focus of the present thesis.

⁸⁸ F.C.McGrath, *The Sensible Spirit: Walter Pater and the Modernist Paradigm* (Tampa: Univ. of South Florida Press, 1986), p.238.

⁸⁹ Anne Dzamba Sessa, *Richard Wagner and the English* (London: Associated Univ. Press, 1979), p.66.

⁹⁰ Edward W. Said, 'Conrad and Nietzsche,' in *Joseph Conrad: A*

Commemoration, ed. by Norman Sherry (London: Macmillan, 1979), pp.65-76 (p.65); and Cedric Watts, *A Preface to Conrad*, 2nd ed. (London: Longman, 1993), p.108.

⁹¹ Joseph Conrad, *The Collected Letters of Joseph Conrad*, ed. by Frederick R. Karl, II: 1898-1902 (1986), p.418.

⁹² Conrad, *The Collected Letters*, I, 156

⁹³ For the relationship between Wagner and Conrad, see the following studies: Cedric Watts, *A Preface to Conrad*, 2nd edn. (London: Longman, 1993), pp. 108 and 184; Edward W. Said, 'Conrad and Nietzsche,' in Norman Sherry ed. *Joseph Conrad: A Commemoration* (London: Macmillan, 1979), p.65; Bernard C. Meyer, *Joseph Conrad: A Psychoanalytic Biography* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1967), pp.133-153; Stephen K. Land, *Conrad and the Paradox of Plot* (London: Macmillan, 1984), pp.9-13; Paul L. Wiley, *Conrad's Measure of Man* (New York: Gordian, 1966).

⁹⁴ Joseph Conrad, 'Freya of the Seven Isles: A Story of Shallow Waters,' in his *'Twiixt Land and Sea*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1947), pp.147-238 (p.159). Further references to this edition are given in the text.

⁹⁵ Watt, *Conrad in the Nineteenth Century*, p.86. Critics on the influence of Schopenhauer upon Conrad are numerous. Owen Knowles' essay "Who's Afraid of Arthur Schopenhauer", by looking at the place of Schopenhauer in the general cultural milieu of the 1890s, provides a more focused perspective than the others. Among others who discuss the relationship between the two authors are Paul Kirshner, Vincent Pecora, William W. Bonney, Bruce Johnson, Mark A. Wollaeger, William J. Scheick, and Nic Panagopoulos, the last of which, a book-length study on the influence of Schopenhauer as well as Nietzsche on Conrad, is

disappointingly unfocused, picking up some similarities between them in unmethodical ways.

⁹⁶ John Galsworthy, 'Reminiscences of Conrad: 1924,' in his *Castles in Spain & Other Screeds* (London: Heinemann, 1927), pp.74-95 (p.91).

⁹⁷ Owen Knowles, "'Who's Afraid of Arthur Schopenhauer?': A New Context for Conrad's *Heart of Darkness*," *Nineteenth-Century Literature*, 49 (1994), 75-106 (pp.77-78 and 98).

⁹⁸ Schopenhauer, *The World as Will and Representation*, I, 278.

⁹⁹ Schopenhauer, *The World as Will and Representation*, I, 262-264.

¹⁰⁰ Schopenhauer, *The World as Will and Representation*, I, 256.

¹⁰¹ Donald R. Benson, 'The Crisis of Space: Ether, Atmosphere, and the Solidarity of Men and Nature in *Heart of Darkness*, in *Beyond the Two Cultures: Essays on Science, Technology, and Literature*, ed. by Joseph W. Slade and Judith Yaross Lee (Ames: Iowa State Univ. Press, 1990), pp.161-175 (p.164).

¹⁰² The comparison of atmosphere and ether is also implied in Tyndall's use of the transmission of sound in air as the metaphor of that of light in ether; see John Tyndall, 'On Radiant Heat in Relation to the Colour and Chemical Constitution of Bodies,' in his *Fragments of Science: A Series of Detached Essays, Addresses, and Reviews*, 6th edn., 2 vols (London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1879), I, 73-95. The similar comparison can be found in scientists such as Thomas Young and Count Rumford around 1800, as well as in Newton, too; see G.N.Cantor and M.J.S.Hodge eds., *Conceptions of Ether: Studies in the History of Ether Theories 1740-1900* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1981), pp.21, 46 and 79. The latter's idea of heat and ether was taken up by Tyndall himself. Etymologically, too, ether is not unrelated to atmosphere. The first meaning of the word given in the *OED* is: '1.a. The clear sky;

the upper regions of space beyond the clouds; the medium filling the upper regions of space, as the air fills the lower regions.'

¹⁰³ Donald R. Benson, "Catching Light": Physics and Art in Walter Pater's Cultural Context,' in *One Culture: Essays in Science and Literature*, ed. by George Levine (Madison: Univ. of Michigan Press, 1987), pp.143-163 (pp.147-148 and 154).

¹⁰⁴ We largely depend on G.N.Cantor and M.J.S.Hodge's *Conceptions of Ether* for our discussion of the history of ether. Further references to this edition are given in the text. David Park's *The Fire Within the Eye* also contains a useful chapter on the history of ether; see David Park, *The Fire Within the Eye: A Historical Essay on the Nature and Meaning of Light* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1997), pp.270-309.

¹⁰⁵ J.R.R.Christie, 'Ether and the Science of Chemistry: 1740-1790,' in *Conceptions of Ether*, ed. by G.N.Cantor and M.J.S.Hodge, pp.85-110 (p.96).

¹⁰⁶ See Robert Darnton, *Mesmerism and the End of the Enlightenment in France* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1968); and Alison Winter, *Mesmerized: Powers of Mind in Victorian Britain* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1998).

¹⁰⁷ Tyndall, 'On Radiant Heat in Relation to the Colour and Chemical Constitution of Bodies,' pp.74-75.

¹⁰⁸ For the wave theory of light, sound and heat in the late nineteenth century and for the popularity of Tyndall at the time, see also Gillian Beer, *Open Fields: Science in Cultural Encounter* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1996), pp.242-72 and 295-318.

¹⁰⁹ Quoted in Benson, "Catching Light",' p.154.

¹¹⁰ Quoted in Benson, "Catching Light",' p.154.

¹¹¹ Tyndall, 'On Radiant Heat,' pp.76-77; see also Tyndall's famous

essay, *Scientific Use of the Imagination*, in his *Essays on the use and Limit of the Imagination in Science* (London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1870), pp.13-51.

¹¹² John Tyndall, 'Radiation,' in his *Fragments of Science*, I, 28-73 (pp.71-73).

¹¹³ Zdzislaw Najder, *Joseph Conrad: A Chronicle*, trans. by Halina Carroll-Najder (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1983), p.249.

¹¹⁴ Conrad, *Collected Letters*, II, 94-95.

¹¹⁵ Lord Salisbury, 'The Presidential Address,' in *Report of the Sixty-Fourth Meeting of the British Association for the Advancement of Science* (London: Murray, 1894), pp.3-15 (p.8). See also Beer, pp.295-318.

¹¹⁶ William Crookes, 'The 1898 Presidential Address,' in *Report of the Sixty-Eighth Meeting of the British Association for the Advancement of Science* (London: Murray, 1899), pp.3-38 (p.31).

¹¹⁷ Joseph Conrad, *Joseph Conrad's Letters to R.B.Cunninghame Graham*, ed. by C.T.Watts (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1969), p.107.

¹¹⁸ Crookes, 'The 1898 Presidential Address,' p.24; an advocate of spiritualist theory of ether, he is also related to X rays, in the sense that his Crookes tube contributed to the making and discovery of X rays.

¹¹⁹ The topic of the fourth dimension, which figures large in a work of the writer Conrad admired, H.G.Wells' *Time Machine*, as well as in *The Inheritors*, co-authored by Conrad with Ford Madox Hueffer [Ford], was also related to ether and electromagnetism around that time; see Alfred M. Bork's 'The Fourth Dimension in Nineteenth-Century Physics,' *Isis* 53 (1964): 326-338. As was stated, Conrad had read with enthusiasm

Wells' *The Invisible Man*, too, just before starting to write *Heart of Darkness*. Thus, the motif of invisibility, which can lead to disembodiedness, and the motif of the ether-related fourth dimension, the major features in Wells' two most celebrated works, may have exerted an influence on the ethereal voice of *Heart of Darkness*.

¹²⁰ Conrad, *Collected Letters*, II, 95-96.

¹²¹ Ivan Kreilkamp's recent paper on the significance of the phonographic voice in *Heart of Darkness* fails to be persuasive, in that it wrongly ascribes the birth of the disembodied voice to the invention of the phonograph. We hope to have already shown in the present and earlier essays that the disembodied voice in modern British literature has origins other than that. See Ivan Kreilkamp's 'A Voice Without a Body: The Phonographic Logic of *Heart of Darkness*,' *Victorian Studies*, 40 (1997), 211-244.

¹²² Joseph Conrad, *Last Essays*, in his *Tales of Hearsay and Last Essays*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1955), pp.1-171 (p.49).

¹²³ Joseph Conrad, *Notes on Life and Letters*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1949), pp.207-208.

¹²⁴ See such studies as Anne McClintock, *Imperial Leather*; Robert Young, *Colonial Desire: Hybridity in Theory, Culture and Race* (London: Routledge, 1995); Ronald Hyam, *Empire and Sexuality: the British Experience* (Manchester: Manchester Univ. Press, 1990); and Sander Gilman, *Difference and Pathology: Stereotypes of Sexuality, Race, and Madness* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1985).

¹²⁵ Marianna Torgovnick, *Gone Primitive: Savage Intellectuals, Modern Lives* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1990), pp.154-155; and Padmini Mongia, "Ghosts of the Gothic": Spectral Women and Colonized Spaces

in *Lord Jim*,’ in *Conrad and Gender*, ed. by Andrew Michael Roberts (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1993), pp.1-16 (pp.5-6).

¹²⁶ Conrad, *Collected Letters*, II, 145-146.

Two Disembodied Voices in Oscar Wilde's Symbolist Play

Salomé's Voice, Jokanaan's Voice

This chapter aims to clarify the significances of two disembodied voices in Oscar Wilde's *Salomé*. One is the voice of Jokanaan, heard from underground, making prophecies and denouncing those on the stage; the other, the voice of the eponymous princess of the play, heard near the end from the momentarily-darkened stage. Both arise from the site of the alternative aural-oral subject, opposing *fin-de-siècle* British bourgeois society. Like its Conradian counterpart, Jokanaan's anti-visual voice exposes the problem of the consumer culture of the high period of imperialism. Aesthetically, it shows traces of the influence of Richard Wagner's musico-dramatic art. Salomé's voice, on the other hand, thematically combining itself with the sense of touch, relates to two latent, interrelated desires in the play: longing for the communal and for the homosexual.

'Melocentric' Nostalgia for the Pre-Modern Aural-Oral:

'We Must Return to the Voice'

What underlies those somewhat specific implications of these bodiless voices from the dark is the author's more general attitude toward the aural-oral, which is, as in the case of Conrad, characterized by a nostalgia for the pre-modern aural-oral. Before delving into the two disembodied voices in his play, we therefore need to examine Wilde's relation to voice in general. The following 'melocentric'

comment from 'The Critic as Artist,' urging one to 'return to the voice,' provides a good starting point:

Since the introduction of printing, and the fatal development of the habit of reading amongst the middle and lower classes of this country, there has been a tendency in literature to appeal more and more to the eye, and less and less to the ear, which is really the sense which, from the standpoint of pure art, it should seek to please, and by whose canons of pleasure it should abide always. Even the work of Mr. Pater, who is, on the whole, the most perfect master of English prose now creating amongst us, is often far more like a piece of mosaic than a passage in music, and seems, here and there, to lack the true rhythmical life of words and the fine freedom and richness of effect that such rhythmical life produces. We, in fact, have made writing a definite mode of composition, and have treated it as a form of elaborate design. The Greeks, upon the other hand, regarded writing simply as a method of chronicling. Their test was always the spoken word in its musical and metrical relations. The voice was the medium, and the ear the critic. I have sometimes thought that the story of Homer's blindness might be really an artistic myth, created in critical days, and serving to remind us, not merely that the great poet is always a seer, seeing less with the eyes of the body than he does with eyes of the soul, but he is a true singer also, building his song out of music, repeating each line over and over again to himself till he has caught the secret of its melody, chaunting in darkness the words that are winged with light. [...] When Milton became blind he composed, as every one should compose, with the voice purely. [...] Yes:

writing has done much harm to writers. We must return to the voice.¹

A number of related observations can be found here. The 'melocentricism' is emphasized by the equation of art (with) language, voice and music. Nostalgia for the pre-modern voice is expressed by the denigration of literacy and the eulogy of the prioritization of the aural-oral in ancient Greece. The voice in darkness is also mentioned, in the discussion of Homer's method of composition. The passage has a typical *fin-de-siècle* Symbolist ring, strongly redolent of the poetics of such writers as Symons, Mallarmé, and Verlaine. At the same time, it has much in common with that proto-Romantic nostalgia for the pre-modern aural-oral, which we already have examined. Perhaps it is related to Wilde's biographical background: his father's devotion to Irish folklore. But the more important point is that the aesthetic of late nineteenth-century high art can be considered as a continuation of the tradition of the Romantic interest in oral culture, in the sense that they share the 'melocentric' hostility to modernity and nostalgia for the pre-modern.² We will return to this point later.

Other 'Melocentric' Instances

In spite of the apparent centrality of the visual theme of a portrait, there is a strong 'melocentric' undercurrent in *The Picture of Dorian Gray*. As Marlow is influenced by Kurtz's powerful 'melocentric' voice, Lord Henry Wotton is aware that Dorian Gray's life has been transformed by his 'musical words said with musical utterance.'³ He

compares the delight of influencing Dorian through his words to 'playing upon an exquisite violin' (39). Earlier in the novel, Henry is described as having 'such a beautiful voice,' and it is 'in his low musical voice' that the words tempting Dorian are first spoken (28). Perhaps it is relevant that, at the outset of the novel, Henry is represented by the organ of mouth, smoking 'innumerable' cigarettes on a couch (18). Significantly, the first sign of Dorian's degradation on his portrait appears around the mouth (74).

The statue of 'The Happy Prince' in Wilde's most famous children's tale also has a 'low musical voice.'⁴ The motif of the valorization of the vocal-musical recurs in a number of these children's stories. The swallow in 'The Happy Prince' will sing forever in God's garden of Paradise as a reward, whereas the deceptive nature of appearance is stressed by citizens' disgust with the disfigured statue and the prince going blind as a result of his charities. 'The Nightingale and the Rose' has a bird singing for love's sake while a man's understanding is depicted as hampered by his bookishness. In 'The Birthday of the Infanta,' cruelty and love are represented by visual and aural elements respectively: the beautiful Infanta, flowers and a mirror function as destructive factors, while the ugly dwarf in love, anti-visual for being not beautiful to look at, but who is good at making pipes and a cage 'for grasshoppers to sing in,' is befriended by birds. That these birds, as opposed to the snobbish flowers, represent aural-orality is clear from the following: 'they did not mind his being ugly a bit. Why, even the nightingale herself, who sang so sweetly in the orange groves at night

that sometimes the Moon leaned down to listen, was not much to look at after all.’⁵

Music Playing and Its Replacement by Talk

There is a curious pattern in Wilde’s descriptions of music playing: when a character first appears, s/he has often just finished playing music. As *The Importance of Being Earnest* opens, the piano Algernon is playing is first heard, then ceases, and he immediately enters. At the outset of the critical dialogue, ‘The Critic as Artist,’ Gilbert is at the piano, having been playing music. Likewise, Dorian Gray is first presented to the reader as sitting at the piano, looking enrapturedly at a volume of Schumann’s ‘Forest Scenes’ (28).

The musical Dorian, living in the world of non-verbal inarticulacy and ignorance, is then initiated through Lord Henry’s ‘musical voice’ into the realm of language which carries within it sin and self-awareness. The Gilbert and Ernest of ‘The Critic as Artist’ also shift from the ‘indefinite’ musical sphere to the linguistic one, in the following way:

Ernest: No; I don’t want music just at present. It is far too indefinite.
 [...] No; Gilbert, don’t play any more. Turn round and talk to me. Talk to me till the white-horned day comes into the room. There is something in your voice that is wonderful.

Gilbert: (*rising from the piano*): I am not in a mood for talking to-night.
 [...] After playing Chopin, I feel as if I had been weeping over sins that I

had never committed, and mourning over tragedies that were not my own. Music always seems to me to produce that effect. [...] I can fancy a man who led a perfectly commonplace life, hearing by chance some curious piece of music, and suddenly discovering that his soul, without his being conscious of it, had passed through terrible experiences, and known fearful joys, or wild romantic loves, or great renunciations. And so tell me this story, Ernest. I want to be amused.⁶

As in *The Picture of Dorian Gray*, in shifting from the musical to the verbal realm, a reference to an attractive voice is involved ('There is something in your voice that is wonderful'). This is worthy of attention because the focus on the charm of voice makes the boundary between music and language unstable. The beautiful voice simultaneously belongs to the musical and the linguistic spheres. Therefore, in both Wilde's novel and critical dialogue, voice, the medium for language, is contrasted to music, and yet, at the same time, it is suggested that the former is part of the latter. It seems that Wilde, while remaining 'melocentric' in endorsing music and voice, wants to replace music with language at another level, because it is the linguistic realm where he is at home: by nature and by profession far more eloquent than musical. This Wildean pattern will be returned to in our examination of Jokanaan's voice.

Salomé as 'Melocentric' Play

The disembodied voices in *Salomé* should be considered against

this 'melocentric' background, but there are some additional factors in the play which cannot be found in Wilde's other works. The 'melocentric' elements are in essence thematically treated in most of the works discussed above, whereas, in Wilde's Symbolist play, they are embodied as well, not only in the physical voices of actors and actresses but in its characteristic linguistic style. The fullest use is made of the musical in language, creating a highly distinctive style of its own, repetitive, heavily rhythmic, and chant-like, and making sharp aural contrasts between the speeches of characters, as seen in the exchanges that Salomé holds with Jokanaan and with Herod.⁷ Structurally, too, the recurring motifs, such as the moon, the act of looking and the wings of the angels of death, are somewhat redolent of Wagnerian leitmotifs. The similarity between the overall structure of the play and a musical composition was noted in early reviews. Richard Le Gallienne, for instance, remarked: 'It seems built to music. Its gradual growth is exactly like the development of a theme in music. One by one the several motives cunningly steal in almost unnoticed.'⁸ Having read the review, Wilde wrote to Le Gallienne, saying that he had 'glided into the secret of the soul of my poem [*Salomé*].'⁹ The musical potential in *Salomé* was later to be fully realized in the total theatre approach—including actual music—of the production by Max Reinhardt and the operatic composition by Richard Strauss.¹⁰

Salomé as Play of Total Theatre and the Question of the Senses

Salomé is not only a 'melocentric' work; but, as has been observed

by Katherine Worth and others, it also embodies the Wagnerian-Symbolist concept of total theatre.¹¹ The influence of French Symbolists Wilde mixed with while writing the play in Paris, as well as that of Maurice Maeterlinck, has been frequently mentioned. Studies by John Stokes and Worth also suggest the influence of English aesthetes such as E.W. Godwin, Lady Archibald Campbell, Professor Hubert von Herkomer, the last of whom, in an attempt to realize his version of total art, constructed a theatre modelled on the Festspielhaus at Bayreuth.¹²

Salomé, as a total theatre piece, involves a variety of senses: vision, hearing, touch, smell, and kinesthesia. The motif of touch evolves round the princess's desire to touch and kiss the prophet and its realization, whose significance will be discussed later in this chapter. The sense of smell is also referred to several times; the most notable occasion being when Salomé puts on perfumes in preparation for the dance. It would be, however, difficult to get their smell across to the audience. Still, Wilde had an intriguing notion, not totally impractical, about the use of smell for the actual performance: he threw out the idea to W. Graham Robertson of putting, 'in place of an orchestra, braziers of perfume' which was to raise 'scented clouds [...] partly veiling the stage from time to time—a new perfume for each new emotion.'¹³

The most prominent of the senses in the actual performance of the play, however, are vision, hearing, and kinesthesia, respectively represented by the spectacle on the stage, the voices of characters, and

Salomé's dance. The importance of the voices and Salomé's dance requires no explanation and their significances will be scrutinized immediately below. That Wilde paid a great deal of attention to the play's visual aspect is also clear both in and out of the text. His frequent discussions with a couple of friends, Charles Ricketts and W. Graham Robertson, about the colour scheme for the stage is on record. Wilde suggested to Robertson yellow costumes for all characters and a violet sky.¹⁴ The notion he threw out at Ricketts was, on the other hand, that the Jews should be in yellow, the Romans in purple, the soldiers in bronze green, Jokanaan in white, and Salomé in 'green like a curious and poisonous lizard.'¹⁵ The text of the play itself shows an awareness of its visual dimension, as illustrated by the darkening of the stage at the climax and the changing of the colour of the moon into red near the end, the latter corresponding to the colour scheme that Salomé invokes in wooing Jokanaan, starting with the colour white and ending up in red. The question of the senses thus lies at the centre of the play.

Voice, Dance, the Senses: Herder, Wagner, Marx:

The Aesthetic and the Communal Longings

The foregrounding of the interrelated questions of voice and dance and of the senses in *Salomé*, both characteristic of *fin-de-siècle* Symbolist aesthetics¹⁶, are also redolent of some of the proto-Romantic 'melocentric' texts. Again, it is Herder's essay on the German translation of Ossian poems that is of relevance here. In it, he tries to

grasp oral poetry in its original context of performance. That is, he sees it essentially as something that is sung and occurs in conjunction with dance. 'Dance-likeness' ('Tanzmässig') and melody are also among the elements he claims to comprise genuine pre-modern folk poetry. And Herder contrasts his refreshing experience of such poetry in a situation close to the original one with the modern habit of reading poems in 'dead letters' in civilized surroundings. Likewise, Thomas Percy's definition of the work of the minstrel includes dancing and acting as well as the singing of verse and musicmaking, with which is contrasted the sedentary men of letters composing art poetry.¹⁷ The nostalgia for voice and the movement of the body in the age of increasing sedentary silent reading can be felt in those writings.

The eighteenth century was also a period when the question of the senses received wide attention among thinkers. According to Robert E. Norton, Edmund Burke was the first to connect the question of the senses with aesthetics, a connection which was developed by Herder, who, in his *Kritische Wällder*, related each genre of art to a specific sense. Hearing, sight, and touch were each assigned to music, painting and sculpture in Herder's aesthetics. Interestingly, poetry was given the place of a total art, with a 'melocentric' inclination, involving a variety of senses¹⁸:

Poetry is more than silent painting and sculpture; and in fact, it is something entirely different from both: it is discourse, it is music of the soul. The sequence of ideas, images, words, and sounds is the essence of its

expression; in this it is similar to music. [...] In the end, however, it should make those lively motions and sensations sensate which all these dead arts merely expressed lifelessly and music alone expressed darkly; [...] poetry absorbed whatever is called *life* and *impulse* and *action* and transplanted it intellectually in its essence, in its expression and in the delivery of expression, high recitation—Divine poetry! intellectual art of the beautiful! Queen of all of the ideas from all of the senses! meeting place of all of the magic in all of the arts!¹⁹

Then, in the following century, two intellectual giants, Richard Wagner and Karl Marx, connected the question of the senses with critique of modernity from aesthetic and socio-political points of view. For Wagner, the antithesis of the modern corrupt capitalist West was ancient Greece, where the ideal community and the total theatre consisting of poetry, visual art, acting, dancing and music, were supported by the thriving free spirit of the folk and their uninhibited attitude toward the senses.²⁰ As to the question of voice and dance, too, he was Herder's descendent in considering dance as an essential part of the early poetic-musical performance.²¹ He was also 'melocentric,' in that he regarded genuine language as aural-oral, calling it 'tone speech.'²² He further resembled Herder, in thinking that the modern European languages had lost their power as 'tone speech,' the vocal language of feeling. According to the German composer, modern music was playing the role of 'tone speech,' instead.²³ In Wagner, therefore, the question of the senses links itself to his

nostalgic ideal of *Gesamtkunstwerk*, which coexists with a 'melocentric' inclination.

In his early *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts*, Karl Marx, too, related the history of the senses to ~~the~~ world history, saying that 'the *cultivation* of the five senses is the work of all previous history (italics in the original).'²⁴ And the young Marx thought that the supersession of private property and the resultant realization of the communist society would lead to the emancipation of the senses.²⁵ Given his use of optical metaphors such as phantasmagoria in his critique of modernity, it can be concluded that his discussion of the senses relates to the anti-visual socio-political longing for the communal. On the other hand, Wagner's is more concerned with the aesthetic and 'melocentric' longing, although it is simultaneously connected with his yearning for the ideal community. The influences of both are discernible in Oscar Wilde's Symbolist play.

Voice and Vision in Jokanaan I:

Richard Wagner and the Aesthetico-Linguistic Aspect

Having examined the overall significances of voice and the senses in Oscar Wilde's *Salomé* and other works, we are ready to examine the two specific instances of the disembodied voice in the play.

It is true that the vocality of Jokanaan originates in the Bible and resurfaces in Gustave Flaubert's tale of Salomé: in the prophesy of Isaiah, he figures as 'a voice of one calling in the desert'²⁶; and when he baptizes Jesus, 'a voice from heaven' confirms that Jesus is the son of

God²⁷; as in Wilde's play, the voice of Jokanaan, imprisoned in a cistern, is heard from underground in Flaubert's 'Hérodias.'²⁸ Given Wilde's consciousness of *Salomé* as a *fin-de-siècle* embodiment of total theatre, however, there is more to it than that. Wilde further developed the traditional aural-oral association of John the (b)aptist, to realize the Wagnerian-Symbolist ideal in the play, and to offer a critique of contemporary society.

It is because it rises from underground that Jokanaan's voice becomes disembodied. And it is the contrast between the visible world on stage and the aural-oral one down below that is foregrounded by the disembodiedness of the voice. The contrast is reinforced by the different styles allotted to the speeches of the invisible Jokanaan and of the other characters. It is thus that Jokanaan's underground voice represents an aural-oral world opposing its specular counterpart on stage. The site from which the voice speaks is that of the alternative, aural-oral subject. We will now explore two kinds of implications of this voice: the aesthetic one under the shadow of Wagner and the socio-political one in the vein of the Marxist tradition.

For Wagner, as for Herder and Schopenhauer, sound relates to the inner, deeper, unconscious self, as opposed to the external, visual, ordinary self. Based on Schopenhauer's idea of music, Wagner argues that the former self is able to approach the ultimate reality through sound, while the latter is prone to illusion.²⁹ As suggested before, the kind of sound he regards as the closest to the deepest self is not the sound of the modern European language, whose abstractness has

severed it from one's deep feelings. Instead, he finds the expression of primal emotions in what might be called primitive voices, such as an involuntary cry, a vocal exchange between gondoliers at night, a yodel of a cowherd.³⁰ In the Wagnerian theatre, however, the deepest emotions are to be conveyed not by a human voice singing melodies, but an orchestra taking care of harmony in music; as has been observed, he thinks that modern music is taking the place of 'tone speech.' Only the orchestra is able to convey the purely emotional, '*the unspeakable*,' whereas 'the verse melody' alone, lacking harmony and constrained by language, is the more individual and superficial:

The instruments represent the rudimentary organs of Creation and Nature; what they express can never be clearly defined or put into words, for they reproduce the primitive feelings themselves, those feelings which issued from the chaos of the first Creation, when maybe there was not as yet one human being to take them up into their heart. 'Tis quite other with the genius of the human voice; that represents the heart of man and its sharp-cut individual emotion. Its character is consequently restricted, but definite and clear.³¹

Jokanaan's Disembodied Voice,

Wagner's Disembodied Orchestral Voice

A major feature of Wagner's total theatre is to sink the orchestra deeply in underground darkness, making it invisible. That he thinks of the device as central to the Bayreuth Festspielhaus is clear from the

following passage:

To explain the plan of the festival theatre now in course of erection at Bayreuth I believe I cannot do better than to begin with the need I felt the first, that of rendering invisible the mechanical source of music, to wit the orchestra; for this one requirement led step by step to a total transformation of the auditorium of our neo-European theatre.³²

He also left the auditorium itself in darkness, which was then groundbreaking. The orchestra music, carrying messages which are genuinely emotional, beyond the reach of language and vision, and deeper than what was sung and acted on stage, was therefore expected to rise from utter darkness, from the underground invisible ensemble. A structural and functional similarity between it and Jokanaan's voice, whose source is invisible, underground and in darkness, is obvious. Like the Wagnerian orchestra, his underground voice sends powerful messages different in kind from words said above, adding dimension to what is taking place on stage. It, therefore, possesses the power of frightening Herod, of angering Herodias, and, most of all, of attracting the princess of Judaea. Wagner describes the intended effect of the sunk, invisible orchestra as being that the scene should be like 'the unapproachable world of dreams, while the spectral music sounding from the "mystic gulf" [the orchestra pit].'³³ Such a description—a contrast between a dream-like spectacle on stage and spectral sound from down below—also fits *Salomé*, if one equates Wagner's orchestral

sound with Jokanaan's voice. Wilde must have known the famous device for the orchestra at Bayreuth, and also might have known a similar device at the British version of Bayreuth, von Herkomer's theatre.³⁴ In view of the 'melocentric' tendency and the concept of total theatre Wilde shared with, and inherited from, Wagner in the creation of the play, as well as the enormous presence of the German composer in the *fin-de-siècle* Symbolism, it is difficult not to see the Wagnerian shadow in Wilde's use of the underground disembodied voice.

This conjecture is to be corroborated in a number of ways. Firstly, as illustrative of the total theatre approach he took in the production of the play, Wilde showed an unusual interest in the orchestra pit in the theatre: it was in the pit that he thought of placing braziers of perfume, to fill the auditorium with its smell. Such an interest in the underground part of the stage further suggests a link between the Wagnerian pit and the prophet's voice rising from another kind of pit.

Secondly, Wilde's typically Wagnerian view of music as indefinite, inarticulate and yet emotionally powerful is redolent of Jokanaan's voice.³⁵ In discussing Wagner's music in 'The Critic As Artist,' Wilde also makes a related remark that music is capable of multiple interpretations

Sometimes, when I listen to the overture to *Tannhäuser*, I seem indeed to see that comely knight treading delicately on the flower-strewn grass, and to hear the voice of Venus calling to him from the caverned hill. But at

other times it speaks to me of a thousand different things, of myself, it may be, and my own life, or of the lives of others whom one has loved and grown weary of loving, or of the passions that man has known, or of the passions that man has not known, and so has sought for.³⁶

Jokanaan's voice is likewise characterized by the powerful appeal to emotion and the lack of clarity, which leads to Salomé's failure to understand him on one hand, and causes his messages to be read differently by different characters on the other: Jokanaan knows what he says, but the way he says it is similar to the music as Wagner and Wilde see it, in the sense that his words either baffle the understanding of their listeners or result in mutually incompatible interpretations by them. Different characters interpreting Jokanaan's words differently recurs in *Salomé*. For instance, Herodias's reading of Jokanaan's words is contested by Herod in the following scene:

The Voice of Jokanaan: He shall be seated on this throne. He shall be clothed in scarlet and purple. In his hand he shall bear a golden cup full of his blasphemies. And the angel of the Lord shall smite him. He shall be eaten of worms.

Herodias: You hear what he says about you. He says that you shall be eaten of worms.

Herod: It is not of me that he speaks. He speaks never against me. It is of the King of Cappadocia that he speaks.³⁷

It is not only the royal couple who make differing readings of Jokanaan's message: the phrase 'the Saviour of the world', that Jokanaan employs in answer to a question of Herod's is differently interpreted by a Roman and a Nazarene, which in turn leads to a wrangle involving six characters.

Thirdly, one significant difference between Wilde and Wagner, which obliquely points to their shared 'melocentric' premise, is Wilde's writerly desire to replace music with language, in contrast to Wagner's tendency to consider modern music as a substitute for the purest kind of speech. It is the same 'melocentricism' that underlies both of them seeing language and music as interchangeable. As Wagner's view can be considered a strongly musical variation of Herder's musico-linguistic 'melocentricism,' so can Wilde's be seen as a linguistically biased version of Wagnerian musical 'melocentricism.' And this common premise justifies our equating the Wildean voice in the figure of Jokanaan in the pit with the Wagnerian music, represented by the orchestra in the pit.

Voice and Vision in Jokanaan II:

Wagner, Marx, *Fin-de-siècle* Consumption

There is also a certain hostility to contemporary capitalist culture in Wagner's work, which can be linked to the Wagnerian dichotomy of light-sight on one hand and darkness-sound on the other, leading to an implicit criticism of the dominance of the visual in the age of capitalism. Notably, *Der Ring des Nibelungen* contains two strongly anti-visual

episodes that respectively start and conclude the cycle: the finding of the gold in the Rhine which, with the renunciation of love, gives the power over the world, and the destruction of the magnificent Valhalla, built with the power of that gold. Although Wagner places the story out of the historical context by the use of myth, it is not difficult to see a reflection of the anti-bourgeois view of contemporary society of Wagner the revolutionary, as is discussed by George Bernard Shaw and Bryan Magee, an aspect that has been foregrounded by such recent productions as those of Patrice Chéreau and Götz Friedlich.³⁸

As has been observed, the anti-visual strain in the critique of capitalism is shared by Wagner's contemporary anti-bourgeois compatriot, Karl Marx, whose work is likely to have exerted an influence on the composer.³⁹ We have also looked at the presence of Marx and the Marxist tradition, represented by Benjamin and Lukacs, in the recent studies of visuality and late nineteenth-century consumer society.

What Jokanaan's disembodied voice opposes is the visual dominance of *fin-de-siècle* capitalist consumer society, elaborated on by Thomas Richards, Rachel Bowlby, Rosalind Williams, and represented by characters on stage in *Salomé*. It is true that the play does not refer to it in the way his comedies do with witticisms and by offering the glaring mirror-spectacle of the *fin-de-siècle* affluence to the wealthy audience at Haymarket and St. James's.⁴⁰ But *Salomé* relates to the visual opulence of the period by the use of the dichotomy of sight and hearing through verbal motifs as well as its total theatre

approach.⁴¹

The Danger of Looking and the Glittering Abuse of the Simile

One of the central motifs concerning vision in the play is the danger of looking, frequently referred to throughout the play. Narraboth ends up committing suicide because of having looked at the princess and having allowed himself to be tempted by her promise to look at him; Herod's looking at her results in his making a fatal promise; he eventually becomes frightened of the act of looking, both looking at things and being looked at; Salomé looks at Jokanaan and desires him, which is the beginning of the tragedy. Jokanaan, on the other hand, mentions the lust of eyes, refuses to look at, and to be looked at by, her. He is the voice; he alone can recognize the sound of the wings of the angel of death. Herod, who wavers between the desire to look and the dread of looking, a man of the world yet with a feeling of awe for the religious, can hear the sound of the wings of the angel of death, but does not know what it is.

The act of looking also gives rise to the instability of knowledge, which is, in this play, connected with a particular ^{hieru} mode of rhetoric, the simile. In *Salomé*, looking at things is inseparable from speeches governed by similes. Characters, looking at the moon, make remarks on it, which reflect their moods and desires; in doing so, they make an abundant use of similes. The page of Herodias' says:

Look at the moon! How strange the moon seems! She is like a woman

rising from a tomb. She is like a dead woman. You would fancy she was looking for dead things! (583)

Narraboth remarks:

She has a strange look. She is like a little princess who wears a yellow veil, and whose feet are of silver. She is like a princess who has little white doves for feet. You would fancy she was dancing. (583)

Herod comments:

The moon has a strange look to-night! Has she not a strange look? She is like a mad woman, a mad woman who is seeking everywhere for lovers. She is naked, too. She is quite naked. The clouds are seeking to clothe her nakedness, but she will not let them. She shows herself naked in the sky. She reels through the clouds like a drunken woman. . . . I am sure she is looking for lovers. Does she not reel like a drunken woman? She is like a mad woman, is she not? (592)

The connection between looking, appearance and the use of similes is clear. These differences between their remarks are also striking. Each comment reflects the speaker's mood, as well as foreboding what is going to happen, what Salomé is to do: the page's words show his anxiety about the young Syrian he loves and his presentiment that 'something terrible may happen'; Narraboth's reflects his infatuation

with the princess; Herod's is a projection of his own lustful obsession with his step-daughter, as well as a premonition about her. In short, these simile-laden remarks about the moon are, in terms of cognition, unstable; and they have little to do with what the moon really is. Only Herodias, totally practical-minded with little imagination, is able to say tautologically that 'the moon is like the moon; that is all' (592).

A certain cognitive instability can also be noted within their individual remarks. The page repeats similes and an expression close to simile ('you would fancy'), slightly changing his meaning, as if groping for the one final figure for the moon but never reaching it. So does the young Syrian, Narraboth. The cognitive instability in Herod's remark is indicated by the repeated tag questions, as well as his use of similes like those used by the former two.

Salomé's cognitive instability and use of similes derives from her looking at Jokanaan. Her swing from one extreme emotion to the other is accompanied by expressions of similes ('like'; and 'not so...as') throughout. For instance:

Salome: Jokanaan, I am amorous of thy body! Thy body is white like the lilies of a field that the mower hath never mowed. Thy body is white like the snows that lie on the mountains, like the snows that lie on the mountains of Judaea, and come down into the valleys. The roses in the garden of the Queen of Arabia are not so white as thy body. [...] There is nothing in the world so white as thy body. [...] Thy body is hideous. It is like the body of a leper. It is like a plastered wall where vipers have

crawled; like a plastered wall where the scorpions have made their nest. It is like a whitened sepulchre full of loathsome things. (589-590)

What is brought forth by such glitteringly visual use of similes, characteristic of the language of the play, is a phantasmagoric vision of a nightmare in which no identity is stable. Having been obsessed with looking at Salomé, Herod notices the anxiety caused by similes:

How red those petals are! They are like stains of blood on the cloth. That does not matter. You must not find symbols in everything you see. It makes life impossible. It were better to say that stains of blood are as lovely as rose petals. It were better far to say that. . . . But we will not speak of this. (599)

In sharp contrast, Jokanaan rarely uses similes, and, while the message in his speech remains vague to others on stage, he, unlike them, knows what he talks about; he has confidence in what he says. He is free from the phantasmagoric instability in the act of identification that other characters suffer from.

Implied in the diatribe of Jokanaan, who has lived on wild honey and locusts, is also a denunciation of luxury goods that seem glamorous to the eye. His disembodied voice, for instance, says: 'He shall be clothed in scarlet and purple. In his hand he shall bear a golden cup full of his blasphemies. And the angel of the Lord shall smite him' (598). Jokanaan's voice opposes what is represented by Herod's

resplendent hoard of treasures, which the latter enumerates in trying to dissuade Salomé from demanding the prophet's head. The treasures and the way the tetrarch describes them reflect not only the author's fascination with jewellery and luxury goods but also the consumer society of the period in a number of ways. It is also to be noted that the description of the glittering treasures is governed by similes.

Rosalind Williams, in her excellent study of late nineteenth-century consumerism, discusses the connection between the aesthete of the period and the arising society of mass consumption. The paradoxical, entangled aspect of the relationship deserves attention here. The paradox of the aesthete, here represented by des Esseintes, the hero of Huysmans's *Against Nature (À Rebours)*, is, as she points out, that his lofty ideal of spiritual aristocracy, which he opposes to the materialism of the vulgar bourgeoisie, depends upon the vulgar act of shopping. In other words, he has to express himself through consuming. He fights against the consuming mode of the bourgeoisie and the populace, and thus searches for what is not tainted by the hand of those he despises. In doing so, however, he loses sight of the inherent value of things and subjects himself to the vulgar force of market value, because his judgment comes to be governed by what is fashionable and what is not: for example, des Esseintes avoids buying a diamond because it 'has become terribly vulgar now that every businessman wears one on his little finger.'⁴² The shopping pattern of the aesthete comes to resemble what Georges d'Avenel has termed the 'furious search for the "unique" of the modern wealthy consumer.'⁴³ In

her discussion, Williams also quotes the lament of Oscar Wilde the *fin-de-siècle* dandy consumer: 'I find an ever-growing difficulty in expressing my originality through my choice of waistcoats and cravats.'⁴⁴

Herod's aria on his jewellery and *objets d'art* evokes a mirage of the ideal imagined and sought after in vain by the aesthetic and wealthy consumer who tries to transcend the market value and reach the aesthetic, non-material realm through commodities. Herod describes his treasures as unique and priceless, that is, as above market value; his hoard is depicted as if limitless in volume. The aria begins with an elaborate description of an emerald, which is claimed to be the largest in the world and to have a unique magical power; it then moves on to white peacocks with gilt beaks and purple-stained feet, which Herod repeatedly says are the most wonderful birds in the world. After that comes an enumeration of the jewels he conceals, in which similes and visual imagery abound. The act of enumeration suggests the scale of his wealth; after a spell of enumerating, Herod says: 'But this is not all' (603). The pricelessness of some of the jewels are referred to; the supernatural power of others gives them the unique quality the aesthetic consumer is in search for. Given the pride and elation with which Herod sings about the jewels, he could be compared to a man like F.R. Leyland, a major late nineteenth-century collector and patron of art, called¹ 'Liverpool Medici,' who commissioned the famous Peacock Room. He was one of the nouveau riche and an aesthete as collector. So is Herod himself, an aesthetic collector

whose father was a camel driver.

His aria relates to *fin-de-siècle* consumerism in another way. The enumeration of luxury goods is structurally similar to a catalogue of a shop such as Liberty's⁴⁵; the depiction of them is redolent of the language of advertising with its emphasis on the uniqueness and magical quality of things described. The connection between *fin-de-siècle* aestheticism and Liberty's would need no explanation. Asked if he had influenced Oscar Wilde, Arthur Liberty is reported to have said: 'Indeed, yes. My art fabrics were produced before he became a celebrity. I gave him his opportunity, and he helped me mightily with mine through the publicity he commanded.'⁴⁶

Consumption and the Colonial Situation

The international political situation is also latent in Herod's aria on the treasures, which seem to have come from all over the world, presenting, as Williams says of des Esseintes' collection, the spectacle of the personal version of a world exhibition; fans have been sent from the Indies; a garment of ostrich feathers, from Numibia. They illustrate the power of Herod. An emerald has been sent by Caesar's minion. Herod's complex attitude toward it is interesting, and reflects the nature of his power in another way: the tetrarch is proud of the emerald being a gift from Caesar's minion, but, at the same time, he boasts that the emerald that he owns is larger than Caesar's. This suggests Herod's simultaneous delight and resentment at being a surrogate for Caesar. As a surrogate for Caesar, he is powerful; yet he

is powerless. His hoard of treasures is something with which he symbolically and safely emulates Caesar. Compared to some other works of Wilde's, however, the political theme is only suggested here. One of his children's stories, 'The Young King,' which also treats an aesthetic ruler, develops what is politically latent in *Salomé*. One night, the hero of the tale, a young king mad about things beautiful, experiences three dreams, in which the system that produces objects of beauty, that of the capitalist and imperialist exploitation, is exposed. The dreams criticize the unequal social system in which the working class suffer, slavery kills, and greed reigns. What the dreams do explicitly in 'The Young King,' the voice of Jokanaan in *Salomé* does implicitly.

The Class Implication of the Underground Voice

The other important socio-political significance of Jokanaan's underground disembodied voice is its class implication. The topos of the invisible disembodied voice criticizing affluent *fin-de-siècle* British society has been observed in the previous chapter; and the positional terms for classes (upper, middle, and lower) themselves suggest the association of the working class with underground, but that is not all there is to it. Voice, subterraneity, darkness, and unintelligibility, which are attributes of the prophet of the play, are all characteristic metaphors used in the representations of the British metropolitan working class around the turn of the century. General William Booth's 1890 *In Darkest England and the Way Out* compares the London slums

to the dark continent of Africa, and associates the working class with inarticulacy and a bitter cry, the latter of which comprises part of the title of Andrew Mearns' 1883 book, *The Bitter Cry of Outcast London*. In both texts, the cry signifies that of the troubled underprivileged that goes up from the darkest depths.⁴⁷

Abyss as the metaphor for the East End is characteristic of the age, as illustrated by titles such as C.F.G. Masterman's 1902 *From the Abyss* and Jack London's 1903 *The People of the Abyss*. Masterman's book, too, contains references to voice, darkness, and inarticulacy in the representation of the metropolitan poor.⁴⁸ The image of the residents of the London slum as underground savages of a dark region is already manifest in the beginning of George R. Sims' 1889 *How the Poor Live and Horrible London*.⁴⁹ The most famous *fin-de-siècle* literary instance of this equation of the unskilled workers with dwellers of the abyss is probably the future sub-human underground proletariat described in H.G. Wells' 1895 'The Time Machine.' Jokanaan's subterranean voice should also be understood in this context. It is a reflection of the bourgeois consciousness of the class question in *fin-de-siècle* Britain. The vocal image was adopted because of the self-consciously modernized bourgeoisie's fearful fascination with the pre-modern voice.

To summarize its socio-political implications, Jokanaan's voice opposes what is represented by the dominance of looking, its logic of the simile, and Herod's glittering enumeration and description of his treasures, that is, the late nineteenth-century consumer society. It is

also implicitly connected with questions of imperialism and class. A comparison of the play with Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* may be pertinent here. In both works, the voice exposes and opposes the late-capitalist phase of the British society, with its dual aspects of consumerism within the country and the imperialist exploitation abroad. Yet, while the disembodied voice in Conrad's novella focuses more on the colonial side, Jokanaan's voice foregrounds this aspect of conspicuous consumption.

Voice and Touch in *Salomé I: the Desire for the Communal*

There is no doubt that Jokanaan's disembodied voice and *Salomé's* have something in common, which is the Wagnerian-Symbolist influence. Stéphane Mallarmé's vision of an ideal language conveys something of the quality of a disembodied voice: 'When I say: "a flower!" then from that forgetfulness to which my voice consigns all floral form, something different from the usual calyces arises, something all music, essence, and softness: the flower which is absent from all bouquets.'⁵⁰ *Salomé's* final dissolution into a disembodied voice after all the Symbolist diction and cadence of the play can be taken to be the Wildean embodiment of the Mallarméan-Symbolist ideal of poetry as music. However, when one pays attention to their respective attitudes toward the senses, the difference between Jokanaan's and *Salomé's* voices becomes clear. Wilde's concern for the aspect of the total theatre in the play, together with the marked contrast between looking and hearing, justifies a reading of the work in terms of the senses.

Jokanaan is concerned only with the sense of hearing: he will not look or be looked at; he will not touch or be touched. Salomé's relation to the senses, on the other hand, is more complex: touch as well as hearing are involved in her disembodied voice from the darkened stage at the climactic moment of the play. While Jokanaan's is an inhibitory and commanding Oedipal voice of a father-male in isolation, Salomé's relates to a desire fulfilled, the kissing of Jokanaan's mouth, the source of the voice that once refused to be touched. Since, as Didier Anzieu observes, voice and touch are closely linked to the making of the pre-individual, pre-specular, pre-Oedipal self in the symbiotic-dynamic relationship between the baby and the mothering environment, a combination of the two senses implies a longing for one's communal relation to others, although it is normally overshadowed in performance by the sanguinary image of Salomé kissing the decapitated head.⁵¹

Salomé's Initial Visual Thinking

However, we will begin by examining Salomé's initial, vision-dominated mode of thinking. As is the case with other characters, Salomé's first words on looking at the moon are important:

Salomé: How good to see the moon. She is like a little piece of money, you would think she was a little silver flower. The moon is cold and chaste. I am sure she is a virgin, she has a virgin beauty. Yes, she is a virgin. She has never defiled herself. She has never abandoned herself to men, like

the other goddesses. (586)

These words should be understood in the context of her relationship to her parents, particularly to Herod. Her first comment ('She is like a little piece of money'), apparently rather out of place, is to be seen as influenced by the logic and rhetoric of her stepfather and his court: it is governed by a simile, the rhetoric of Herod, and by the image of money, glitteringly visual and capitalist. Given two of the formerly mentioned points, the tetrarch as wealthy aesthetic consumer and the critique of contemporary capitalism in the play, the first comment of Salomé on looking at the moon should be taken to indicate her thinking in the framework of her parents. Herod as capitalist-consumer is the major influence here.

Her second comment ('you would think she was a little silver flower.') shows the princess, perhaps unconsciously, trying to veil the monetary element in the rhetoric of aestheticism. A trace of the monetary is still discernible ('silver'), but her speech is now in the process of being wrapped up in aesthetic rhetorical decoration. It parallels what her stepfather as aesthete does in singing the aria on his treasures.

The passage that follows, consisting of repetitive references to chastity and virginity, is spoken by the adolescent in Salomé who is anxious about her sexuality and that of her parents. It reflects the girl's confusion about the sexual appeal she has for her stepfather, as well as her annoyed consciousness of Herod's lecherous looking and

Herodias' promiscuous nature.

Before she meets Jokanaan, she is sexual only in the eyes of Herod. The encounter, however, turns her into a sexual being in her own right. As was just shown, her mode of thinking is first under the strong influence of Herod and what he represents. And what she does after meeting the prophet is to handle her sexuality in a confused way, with the mindset governed by visuality, which she has acquired from her environment, Herod's court.

She is torn between the visually-oriented thinking mode of Herod and the aural-orality of Jokanaan, which is further complicated by her finally awakened sexual desire to touch and kiss him. She is first drawn to his voice from the underground and wants to speak with him. Looking into the darkness of the cistern whence the voice comes, however, she begins to desire to see him. The aural element in his attraction for her gradually lessens, while she becomes more visually attracted, employing obsessively the rhetoric of simile, which she shares with her stepfather. As the sexual urge arises and grows in her, she also experiences the strong desire to touch and, then, to kiss him.

Her exchange with Jokanaan is characterized by miscommunication. It has much to do with the fact that their thinking-communication modes are incompatible. Jokanaan's is aural-oral. He is the ear as well as the voice: during the exchange with Salomé, he hears the beating of the wings of the angel of death, which the princess does not hear. It is true that Salomé urges him to speak, to tell her what to do, but, when he does so, she does not

understand, because of their different mindsets: having been told by him to go and 'seek out the Son of Man,' Salomé asks an impertinent, aesthetic, visually-oriented question: 'Is he as beautiful as thou art, Jokanaan?' (589). Jokanaan, however, is anti-visual and anti-tactile, refusing to be looked at and touched by her, and yet, in a burning desire to touch and kiss him, Salomé describes his body to him, using visual similes that swing from one extreme to the other. For instance:

Thy hair is like clusters of grapes, like the clusters of black grapes that hang from the vine-trees of Edom in the land of the Edomites. Thy hair is like the cedars of Lebanon, like the great cedars of Lebanon that give their shade to the lions. [...] It is like a crown of thorns which they have placed on thy forehead. It is like a knot of black serpents writhing round thy neck.
(590)

Transition from Sight to Voice

However, the part of Salomé's final long speech which precedes the one in which she becomes a disembodied voice from the darkened stage shows some signs of a transitional character in terms of its attitude toward the senses. It is true that, for most of that part, Salomé's speech still concerns looking: the visual theme starts near its beginning with the sentence 'but wherefore dost thou not look at me?', and continues almost to its end, with a corresponding one: 'if thou hadst looked at me thou hadst loved me' (604). And yet, if one compares it to her earlier long speech in her exchange with Jokanaan,

one can discern in it a decrease in the simile-laden visuality.

The section is also framed by non-visual motifs. It is the motif of the kiss that appears at the outset. And it ends with a theme of love:

Ah! ah! wherefore didst thou not look at me, Jokanaan? If thou hadst looked at me thou hadst loved me. Well I know that though wouldst have loved me, and the mystery of love is greater than the mystery of death. Love only should one consider. (604)

The passage shows that, of the motifs of looking and of love, the former fades out while the latter remains, gaining in importance. Its latter half leaves the motif of looking behind and leads to the final disembodied part of Salomé's aria in darkness, which mostly concerns the motif of love.

There are other signs suggesting the transitional character of that section. The shift from the present to the past perfect tense between the two corresponding sentences that starts and concludes the motif of looking in the part hints at the fading of the motif of looking. One also finds a symptomatic sign of transition from looking to hearing in one of the two sentences using synaesthetic metaphors: 'when I looked on thee I heard a strange music' (604). Also to be noted is a passage in the middle, similar to one in her earlier exchange with Jokanaan:

Thy body was a column of ivory set on a silver socket. It was a garden full of doves and of silver lilies. It was a tower of silver decked with shields of

ivory. There was nothing in the world so white as thy body. There was nothing in the world so black as thy hair. In the whole world there was nothing so red as thy mouth. (604)

Although the imagery is still visual, the number of similes, inseparable from the visual mode of thinking at Herod's court, is markedly smaller here. The first three sentences in the quotation would have employed similes in the earlier part.

After this comes the rejection of looking by Herod, now aware of the havoc played by the act of looking: 'I will not look at things, I will not suffer things to look at me. Put out the torches! Hide the moon! Hide the stars! Let us hide ourselves in our palace' (604-605). This completes the setting for the shift from sight to voice. Nature, as well as slaves, obeying the tetrarch's injunction, the stage darkens with the following direction: *'The slaves put out the torches. The stars disappear. The great black cloud crosses the moon and conceals it completely. The stage becomes very dark.'*

Salomé's Disembodied Voice

Then, from the darkness comes the disembodied voice of the heroine:

The Voice of Salomé: Ah! I have kissed thy mouth, Jokanaan. I have kissed thy mouth. There was a bitter taste on thy lips. Was it the taste of blood . . . ? But perchance it is the taste of love. . . . They say that love

hath a bitter taste. . . . But what of that? What of that? I have kissed thy mouth, Jokanaan. (605)

The content is rather simple. It presents the motifs of kiss, taste, blood, and love. The reference to the taste of love is the only new element here. Yet, the disappearance of the visually-oriented rhetoric is striking. The motif of blood suggests a sexual consummation. Salomé's desire to touch and to kiss is now fulfilled in the anti-visual setting of the darkened stage and of the rhetoric and motif of touch.

The significance of the darkened stage is threefold: the disappearance of the visual, the highlighting of voice and touch, and the turning into invisibility of the severed head. The first point needs no further comment. The second is best illustrated by a comparison of the scene in question to the one that precedes it. Before the stage darkens, one sees Salomé holding Jokanaan's head, speaking most about looking. When it has become dark, one hears her voice chanting about kissing and tasting. In the former scene, one *sees* the touch (Salomé holding the head); in the latter, one *hears* it (Salomé's aria on kissing and tasting from darkness). Voice is now the medium through which touch finds itself expressed.

The darkening of the stage also conceals the spectacle of the mutilated body. It should be noted that the head of Jokanaan is of a dual, ambivalent character: it symbolizes the fulfillment of the princess' desire, when it is touched and kissed; but, when it is looked at, its mutilation, its deadness and its thingness, filling one with a sense

of horror and morbidity, represents the failure of fulfillment. The failure derives from Salomé's visual-capitalist mode of thinking, which shows clearly in her declaration in the middle of her aria: 'Thy head belongs to me. I can do with it what I will' (604). Here, Salomé thinks that the head is something one can own. The thought is similar to that sense of ownership evident in her stepfather when he enumerates his treasures. Significantly, Herod's glittering visual description of the treasures using similes and expressing his proud sense of ownership leads to Salomé demanding a human head as if it were a luxury item in Herod's possession. Then, Salomé in turn boasts of owning the head, in the long speech where the motif of looking looms large, while the grim spectacle of the severed head on the stage attracts the eyes of the audience. The connection between the spectacle of the severed head, a human head as a thing to own and do what one pleases with, and the visual-capitalist aspect of Salomé is now clear.

With the darkened stage and the disappearance of the bizarre spectacle of the severed head, the play moves towards its catharsis. The negative side of Jokanaan's head, the spectacle of its mutilatedness, its thingness, lessens; the element of fulfillment comes forward. The visual-capitalist thinking, governed by similes, is removed by the darkened stage. Instead, the elements of hearing and touch, conveyed by the voice speaking of kiss, taste and love, monopolize the attention of the audience.

The darkened world lasts only momentarily. It is quickly replaced by the lit world of Herod, when Salomé is killed by his order. However,

during that brief moment of darkness, the cathartic fulfillment occurs. It is now necessary to explore the nature of this fulfillment of voice and touch-kiss.

The Utopia of Touch-Kiss in the Wilde *Oeuvre*

In the works of Wilde, a kiss often occurs with death and offers the Wildean version of 'Liebestod.' Moreover, a kiss followed by death becomes a site where the communal fulfillment as well as the personal, sexual one is glimpsed. In his early play, *Vera*, the kiss of Vera the peasant turned anarchist and her lover, the humanistic new Czar, simultaneously symbolizes the fulfillment of their love and the realization of the united, classless utopian society. It, however, does not last for more than a moment, immediately followed by Vera's suicide in order to save the man she loves from other anarchists. In 'The Happy Prince,' a tale of the rectification of social inequality and also, covertly, of the homosexual love between the swallow and the prince, the swallow kisses the mouth of the prince shortly after a passage offering a glimpse of an equal society:

Leaf after leaf of the fine gold the Swallow picked off, till the Happy Prince looked quite dull and grey. Leaf after leaf of the fine gold he brought to the poor, and the children's face grew rosier, and they laughed and played games in the street. "We have bread now!" they cried.⁵²

Immediately after the kiss, the swallow dies. The bourgeois society

returns the next morning.

There are other works that contain, in a less explicit form or in a modified way, this pattern of kiss-touch, death and the momentary, simultaneous realization of the social and personal dreams. In 'The Fisherman and His Soul,' the fisherman kisses the lips of the mermaid he loves, now dead. The rift caused by their belonging to different worlds—those of humans and mermaids—is symbolically healed by the kiss. Again, the fisherman dies immediately after it. 'The Nightingale and the Rose' can be considered as a variation on the pattern: the bird sings for love with its breast thrust against the thorn of a rose-tree and dies because of it. Touch and death are combined by love here.

Sometimes, the kiss, the death and the realization of an equal society occur separately but in the same work. In *The Duchess of Padua*, the killing of a tyrant by his democratic wife happens in the middle of the play, and the kiss and death of her and her lover, at the end. Still, the result is similar: a glimpse of an equal society and a 'Liebestod.' *A Florentine Tragedy*, too, contains the murder of a nobleman, which eliminates classes in the play, and the kiss, though not accompanied by a 'Liebestod,' of a husband and an adulterous wife.

Although *Salomé* is not like *Vera* or 'The Happy Prince,' in that the socio-political theme is rather submerged while personal passion is foregrounded, it still contains all the factors that are in those works just discussed. As was explained, Jokanaan, imprisoned underground, having lived on wild honey and locusts, and denouncing luxury, can be

identified with the working class, as opposed to Salomé as a member of the ruling class. Her disembodied voice speaking of the kiss and taste of love in the final scene, with the darkness concealing the spectacle of the severed head, therefore represents a moment of a glimpse of the classless utopia as well as of the fulfilled desire. The utopia of touch is momentarily evoked by the disembodied voice here.

The Utopia of Touch

Conveyed by the Wildean Disembodied Voice

The question of touch is addressed by Richard Ellmann in his essay 'Overtures to *Salomé*.'⁵³ Although the essay is marred by a misquotation at a crucial place (sadly, to be repeated in his biography of Wilde), the argument that Ruskin and Pater represent Jokanaan's refusal of touch and Pater's sympathy with touch respectively is still persuasive and suggestive. Ellmann himself identifies Wilde with Herod, who wavers between the Ruskinian refusal and the Paterian approval. Yet, if one focuses on Salomé's final speech from the darkness, it is not difficult to see in it a reflection of the sexually emancipatory trend in the *fin-de-siècle* society. What was disapproved of by Ruskin, and was contemplated with sympathy by Pater, is performed and heightened into a catharsis by Salomé's voice from the darkened stage.

Another way of placing the question of touch in context, also leading to the same conclusion, is a comparison of Wilde's play and Mallarmé's dramatic poem on the same princess, 'D'Hérodiade.' The

poem is concerned with the cold, narcissistic consciousness of the virgin princess. Her refusal to be touched plays a central role in this work, forming a striking contrast with Wilde's princess. Wilde must, nonetheless, have been highly conscious of this earlier work on the same subject by the high priest of Symbolism. Wilde's *Salomé* may well have been meant as a response to the Symbolist tradition, adding a pro-sensual element of his own to it. It starts with the Wagnerian voice of the prophet who keeps aloof, and the chaste, virgin Mallarméan princess. It then gradually changes into the Wildean play. The sexual element is added by Salomé's awakening to sensuality and desire to touch and kiss; Jokanaan representing the Wagner-Mallarméan tradition is killed; finally, the other disembodied voice, of the Wildean Symbolism, in the darkness arises, combining touch-kiss and love in a sexual fulfillment, and giving a glimpse of a utopia based on touch.

The 'Melocentric' Longing for the Communal

In the Post-Enlightenment Aesthetics

The desire for the communal suggested in Salomé's disembodied voice also comprises part of the post-Enlightenment 'melocentric' tradition we have examined. It connects with Herder and what he represents, the proto-Romantic craze for oral culture, to which, as has been shown, many disembodied voices of Gothic-Romantic texts are related. We have argued that the craze was underpinned by a nostalgic longing in the modernized West for a pre-modern oral

community. The desire also connects with Wagner and his communal as well as aesthetic nostalgia for ancient Greek society. As for Wilde's contemporaries, it also can be related to the work of Arthur Symons, whose aesthetic ideal of the disembodied voice we have examined in the introductory chapter. In Symons, as in Wilde, the 'melocentric' aestheticism coexists with a yearning for the communal. While introducing the high aestheticism of French Symbolism to Britain, Symons simultaneously took a great interest in the popular culture of the music hall, particularly in its communality as well as physicality. One of the things that struck him about it is the lively communication between artistes and the audience. In praising his favourite music hall star, Katie Lawrence, Symons wrote: 'she has a curious and delightful way of making the audience sing the chorus while she supplies the gestures.'⁵⁴ His enthusiasm about the music hall made him describe the music hall performer as an artist of total art, who can act, sing, dance, and knows how to involve the audience in his or her performance. Symons' music-hall criticism, on the whole, suggests that the Wagnerian concept of *Gesamtkunstwerk* has seen its realization in the music hall, where not the elitist but the communal atmosphere prevails.⁵⁵ High art and popular culture were for him different sides of the same coin; as I have said in the introductory chapter, he saw the Symbolist poetic drama and the popular entertainment of pantomime as ultimately at one.⁵⁶ It is therefore possible to hear the echo of the communal voice of the popular culture in his Symbolist disembodied voice, and vice versa.

That the nostalgia for pre-industrial society underlies this communal appeal of the music hall is indicated by the following words of another of the many music hall aficionados among the *fin-de-siècle* aesthetes, George Moore:

It is wholly and essentially English; its communal enjoyment and its spontaneity sets us thinking of Elizabethan England—I mean the music-hall. [...] What delightful unison of enjoyment, what unanimity of soul, what communality of wit; all knew each other, all enjoyed each other's presence; in a word, there was life.⁵⁷

It might be added that Wilde himself, like a music-hall artiste, enjoyed a sparkling exchange with the audience.⁵⁸ Be that as it may, we can now conclude that several interrelated aspects of the post-Enlightenment 'melocentric' high art, including the ideal of the total theatre, the question of the senses, and the desire for the communal, are all implied in Salomé's disembodied voice at the end of Wilde's play.⁵⁹

Voice and Touch in Salomé II:

The Desire for the Homosexual-Communal

In Salomé's voice and touch at the climax, one can also discern the partial overlapping of the dream of a utopia and the desire for the sexual. The suggested sexual fulfillment does not wholly belong to the personal realm. The utopia of Salomé's disembodied voice can be said

to be a homosexual as well as classless community for a number of reasons.

Firstly, as was pointed out in the introductory chapter, the reference to a combination of voice and touch was often a secret indication of forbidden desire in the late nineteenth century: we have looked at John Addington Symonds' suggestive letter to the young Arthur Symons, which says that 'we have not yet touched hands or exchanged the magnetism of spoken words'. The homoeroticism implied by a disembodied voice and touch in Walter Pater's *Marius the Epicurean* has also been discussed. The communal aspect, too, is involved in it: the two latently gay friends of Marius, Cornelius and Flavian, are more or less concerned with Marius' final joining of the Christian community; Cornelius introduces him to the community, and the singing that impresses Marius there reminds him of Flavian. The community therefore can be characterized as secretly gay. As we will demonstrate in the next chapter, Bram Stoker's hidden homosexuality is also suggested by his mentioning of voice and touch in his letters to Whitman as well as in his vampiric novel.

As Joseph Donohue observes, much commentary has focused on covert homosexuality in *Salomé*.⁶⁰ Kate Millet sees it as 'a drama of homosexual guilt and rejection followed by a double revenge,' while Norbert Kohl finds in it the secret justification of homosexuality by demonizing the woman.⁶¹ Apart from the explicitly expressed homoerotic feeling the page of Herodias entertains for the young Syrian captain, perhaps the most concrete piece of evidence for homosexuality

in the play is the green flower Salomé promises to let fall for him if the captain brings forth Jokanaan from the cistern. Gagnier identifies the flower with the artificially coloured green carnation Wilde would wear.⁶² As H. Montgomery Hyde points out, it was a secret symbol of the Parisian homosexuals.⁶³ Interestingly, Wilde tried to persuade as many men as possible to wear it at the premiere of *Lady Windermere's Fan*.⁶⁴ And its popularity spread among his youthful admirers, till a play titled *The Green Carnation* was published in 1894.⁶⁵ That the idea of a secret gay community is implied by Salomé's mention of the green flower is now evident. It is probably relevant that Wilde placed a green wall around the cistern in the play, and once thought of having Salomé wearing a green costume.⁶⁶

Lastly, the darkened stage weakens the heterosexual factor conveyed by the spectacle of Jokanaan and Salomé on the lit stage. When it becomes dark, the only information which remains in the play is Salomé's disembodied female voice, which hints at a state of single-sexness. In the darkness, the protagonist of this covertly homosexual play could even turn into her real self behind the mask, that is, her male self, without being noticed. The shift in focus from the spectacle to voice and touch during the darkness thus helps indicate the homosexual element in the play. It is by now clear that Jokanaan calls Salomé 'Daughter of Sodom' for a good reason (589): a momentary glimpse of the homosexual community is conveyed by the heroine's bodiless voice during the brief moment of darkness.

Conclusion

We are now able to compare Wilde and Conrad, in terms of the disembodied voice. Socio-politically, both are concerned with dual aspects of *fin-de-siècle* late capitalism, consumerism and colonialism, though they focus on them differently. Aesthetically, both are involved with the 'melocentric' tradition, relating to Herder, Wagner, French Symbolism, British aestheticism, in varying ways and degrees. The nostalgically communal implication of the tradition is implicit in Salomé's voice. The homosexual dimension, which is absent from the Conradian voice, is important in Wilde's play, as it is in Bram Stoker's Gothic novel. While the concept of ether underlies the Conradian disembodied voice, no scientific factor is discernible behind the Wildean equivalent. However, the ethereal technology, wireless, will be examined soon. We will scrutinize two major inventions of the late nineteenth century, phonograph and wireless, in relation to the disembodied voice in Stoker's *Dracula* and Kipling's *Kim* and "Wireless".'

NOTES

-
- ¹ Oscar Wilde, 'The Critic As Artist,' in his *Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, 3rd edn., (Glasgow: Harper Collins, 1994), pp.1108-1155 (p.1115).
- ² Our point here is certainly related to the argument put forth by Linda Dowling, in her *Language and Decadence*, which sees British *fin-de-siècle* literature in the tradition of modern language study prioritizing voice over text.
- ³ Oscar Wilde, *The Picture of Dorian Gray*, in *The Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, pp.17-159 (p.53). Further references to the novel are given in the text and taken from this Harper Collins edition.
- ⁴ Oscar Wilde, 'The Happy Prince,' in *The Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, pp.271-277 (p.272).
- ⁵ Oscar Wilde, 'The Birthday of the Infanta,' in *The Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, pp.223-235 (p.229).
- ⁶ Wilde, 'The Critic As Artist,' pp.1109-1110.
- ⁷ See Katherine Worth, *Oscar Wilde* (London: Macmillan, 1983), p.21.
- ⁸ Richard Le Gallienne (signed Logroller), 'Mr. Oscar Wilde's "Salomé",' *The Star*, 22 February 1893, p.2. For other early reviews mentioning the structural similarity to music of the play, see Alan Bird, *The Plays of Oscar Wilde*, (London: Vision, 1977), pp.81-82.
- ⁹ Oscar Wilde, *More Letters of Oscar Wilde*, ed. by Rupert Hart-Davis (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1987), pp.120-121.
- ¹⁰ See William Tydeman and Steven Price, *Wilde: Salome* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1996), pp.31-40.
- ¹¹ Worth, pp.8, 21, 53 and 73; Tydeman and Price, p.3.
- ¹² John Stokes, *Resistible Theatres: Enterprise and Experiment in the Late Nineteenth Century* (London: Paul Elek, 1972), pp.31-110; Worth,

pp.8 and 53.

¹³ W. Graham Robertson, *Time Was: the Reminiscences of W. Graham Robertson* (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1931), p.126. Tydeman and Price say that this olfactory idea 'probably derived from the Théâtre d'Art's experiment on 11 December 1891,' when Wilde was in Paris working on *Salomé*; see Tydeman and Price, p.191.

¹⁴ Robertson, p.126.

¹⁵ Charles Ricketts, *Pages on Art* (London: Constable, 1913), pp.243-244.

¹⁶ The importance of voice for Symbolism has already been discussed. The centrality of dance for Symbolism as well as Modernism, as exemplified by the enthusiasms for it shown by such writers as Stéphane Mallarmé, Arthur Symons, W.B.Yeats, is discussed in Frank Kermode's classic essay. See Frank Kermode, 'Poet and Dancer Before Diaghilev,' in his *Modern Essays*, 2nd ed. (Glasgow: Fontana, 1990), pp.11-38. He also dates the birth of modern dance from around 1890, in the figure of Loïe Fuller. The *fin-de-siècle* vogue for *Salomé* and dance as a subject of painting would need no explanation. As to the question of the senses, the idea of synesthesia and the related concept of *Gesamtkunstwerk* probably represent Symbolism's relation to them: the synesthetic experiments by the protagonist of J.K.Huysmans's *Against Nature (À Rebours)* hark back to a predecessor of Symbolism, Charles Baudelaire's idea of correspondence between the senses; Arthur Rimbaud's dream of the poetic language that is capable of evoking a variety of senses is an instance of the typically Symbolist dream of total art.

¹⁷ Thomas Percy, 'An Essay on the Ancient Minstrels in England,' in his *Reliques of Ancient English Poetry*, ed. by Henry B. Wheatley, 3 vols

(London: Bickers, 1876), I, 345-381 (pp.345, 347 and 356).

¹⁸ Robert E. Norton, *Herder's Aesthetics and the European Enlightenment* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1991), pp.155-232.

¹⁹ Quoted in translation in Norton, pp.200-201.

²⁰ See Richard Wagner, 'Art and Revolution,' in his *The Art-Work of the Future and Other Works*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1895; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1993), pp.21-65; and Richard Wagner, "Zukunftsmusik", in his *Judaism in Music and Other Essays*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1894; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1995), pp.293-345.

²¹ See Richard Wagner, 'The Art-Work of the Future,' in his *The Art-Work of the Future and Other Works*, pp.69-213 (pp.100-149).

²² Richard Wagner, *Opera and Drama*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1893; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1995), p.224.

²³ Wagner, *Opera and Drama*, p.231. See also Wagner, "Zukunftsmusik", p.319.

²⁴ Karl Marx, *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts*, in his *Early Writings*, trans. by Rodney Livingstone and Gregor Benton, intro. by Lucio Colletti (London: Penguin, 1992), pp.279-400 (p.353).

²⁵ Marx, *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts*, pp.350-355.

²⁶ Matthew 3.3; Mark 1.3; Luke 3.4; John 1.23.

²⁷ Matthew 3.17; Mark 1.11; Luke 3.23.

²⁸ Gustave Flaubert, 'Herodias,' in his *Three Tales*, trans. by A.J.Krailsheimer (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1991), pp.71-105.

²⁹ Wagner, 'The Art-Work of the Future,' pp.91-94; Richard Wagner, 'Beethoven,' in his *Actors and Singers*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis

(London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trüber, 1896; Lincoln: repr. Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1995), pp.57-126 (pp.63-81).

³⁰ Wagner, 'Beethoven,' pp.69 and 73-74.

³¹ Richard Wagner, 'A Pilgrimage to Beethoven,' in his *Pilgrimage to Beethoven*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trüber, 1898; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1994), pp.21-45 (pp.41-42); see also Wagner, 'The Art-Work of the Future,' pp.190-191; Wagner, *Opera and Drama*, pp.317-318; and Bryan Magee's classic, *Aspects of Wagner*, 2nd edn. (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1988), pp.36-37.

³² Richard Wagner, 'Bayreuth,' in his *Actors and Singers*, pp.307-340 (p.333).

³³ Wagner, 'Bayreuth,' p.335.

³⁴ See Stokes, p.85; and Worth, p.8.

³⁵ See Wilde, *The Picture of Dorian Gray*, p.29; and 'The Critic As Artist,' pp.1109-1110.

³⁶ Wilde, 'The Critic As Artist,' p.1127.

³⁷ Oscar Wilde, *Salomé*, in *The Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, 3rd edn. (Glasgow: Harper Collins, 1994), pp.583-605 (p.598). Further references to the play are given in the text and taken from this Harper Collins edition.

³⁸ Magee, pp.13-14. See also George Bernard Shaw, *The Perfect Wagnerite: A Commentary on the Niblung's Ring* (New York: Dover, 1967).

³⁹ Magee, pp.13-14.

⁴⁰ For a discussion of his comedies in this context, see Regina Gagnier, *Idylls of the Marketplace: Oscar Wilde and the Victorian Public* (Aldershot: Scolar, 1986), pp.101-136.

⁴¹ Bram Dijkstra, though her reading is far too simplistic, touches on the opposition between seeing and hearing in *Salomé*. See her *Idols of Perversity: Fantasies of Feminine Evil in Fin-de-siècle Culture* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1986), pp.396-397.

⁴² J.-K.Huysmans, *Against Nature*, trans. by Robert Baldick (London: Penguin, 1959), pp.54-55.

⁴³ Quoted in Rosalind Williams, p.138.

⁴⁴ Quoted in Rosalind Williams, p.123.

⁴⁵ See Alison Adburgham, *Liberty's: A Biography of A Shop* (London: Unwin Hyman, 1990), pp.33-34, 54-55 and 58.

⁴⁶ Quoted in Alison Adburgham, *Shops and Shopping 1800-1914*, 2nd edn. (London: Allen and Unwin,1981), p.174, as well as in her *Liberty's*, p.73.

⁴⁷ See General Booth, pp.1-15, 30, and 41-42; and Andrew Mearns, *The Bitter Cry of Outcast London: An Inquiry into the Condition of the Abject Poor* (London: n.pub., 1883; repr. London: Frank Cass, 1970), pp.5, 20, and 22-23.

⁴⁸ See C.F.G.Masterman, *From the Abyss: Of Its Inhabitants by One of Them* (London: R. Brimley Johnson, 1902), pp.1-27 and 82-96.

⁴⁹ George R. Sims, *How the Poor Live and Horrible London* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1889; repr. New York: Garland, 1984), p.1.

⁵⁰ Stéphane Mallarmé, 'Crisis in Poetry,' in *Mallarmé: Selected Prose Poems, Essays, & Letters*, trans. and intro. by Bradford Cook (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1956), pp.34-43 (p.42).

⁵¹ Anzieu, pp.52, 101, 157-173, and 181.

⁵² Wilde, 'The Happy Prince,' p.276.

⁵³ Richard Ellmann, 'Overtures to *Salome*,' in *Oscar Wilde: A Collection of Critical Essays*, ed. by Richard Ellmann (Englewood Cliffs, NJ:

Prentice-Hall, 1969), pp.73-91.

⁵⁴ Arthur Symons, 'An Artist in Serio-Comedy,' *The Star*, 26 March 1892, p.4

⁵⁵ The enthusiasm for the music hall and the related yearning for the communal was taken over in the twentieth century by the 'melocentric' poet of *Four Quartets*, T.S.Eliot, who wrote an essay in praise of Marie Lloyd. In it, he observes: 'The working man who went to the music-hall and saw Marie Lloyd and joined in the chorus was himself performing part of the act; he was engaged in that collaboration of the audience with the artist which is necessary in all art.' The effect of this communal atmosphere was not limited to the auditorium, Eliot claimed, and exerted an influence of the whole working-class community, whom he called 'that part of the English nation which has perhaps the greatest vitality and interest,' by supporting its unity and providing a moral backbone for it. See T.S.Eliot, 'Marie Lloyd,' in *Selected Prose of T.S.Eliot*, ed. and intro. by Frank Kermode (London: Faber & Faber, 1975), pp.172-174.

⁵⁶ See Symons, 'Pantomime and the Poetic Drama.'

⁵⁷ George Moore, *Confessions of a Young Man*, in *The Collected Works of George Moore (The Carra Edition)*, 21 vols (New York: Boni and Liveright, 1923), IX: *Confessions of a Young Man and Avowals*, 297-489 (pp.427-428).

⁵⁸ Wilde could be considered as a kind of artiste: his art for the verbal exchange at public places has something of that of the music hall performer. For instance, his speech from the stage after the first performance of *Lady Windermere's Fan* indicates that he provided his audience at the prestigious St. James with the upper-class version of the pleasure of the communal exchange. As Regenia Gagnier points

out, the atmosphere of first-nights at theatres of that status was *intime* when everyone knew everyone else. After the final curtain of the first performance, 'Wilde came forward from the wings in response to cries of "Author!" He knew how he wished to look, and what he wanted to say. In his mauve-gloved hand was a cigarette, and in his buttonhole a green carnation.' He said: "Ladies and gentlemen: I have enjoyed this evening *immensely*. The actors have given us a *charming* rendering of a *delightful* play, and your appreciation has been *most* intelligent. I congratulate you on the great success of your performance, which persuades me that you think *almost* as highly of the play as I do myself.' See Richard Ellmann, *Oscar Wilde* (London: Penguin, 1988), p.346; and also Regenia Gagnier, *Idylls of the Marketplace: Oscar Wilde and the Victorian Public* (Aldershot: Scolar, 1987), p.108.

⁵⁹ Salomé's dance is, of course, a very important part of the play. As shown before in the discussions of Herder and Wagner, dance and the longing for the communal are also interrelated in the 'melocentric' tradition. Symons' fascination with the dance of the *fin-de-siècle* music-hall culture can be looked at in this context. That Salomé's dance, too, has something to do with the dance of the *fin-de-siècle* popular culture is evident from the following episode:

One day when he [Wilde] and Stuart Merrill went into the Moulin Rouge and saw a Rumanian acrobat dancing on her hands. Wilde hastily wrote something on his calling card and sent it to her, but to his disappointment she did not respond. He had wanted, he said, to make her an offer to dance the part of Salome in a play he was writing. 'I want her to dance on her hands, as in Flaubert's story.' (Richard Ellmann, *Oscar Wilde*, p.324)

Notably, this Rumanian dancer, probably Eugénie Petrescu, also fascinated Symons in a London music hall, who described her as an 'incredible animal' and 'human masterpiece' (Arthur Symons, 'She

Walks on Her Hands,' *The Star*, 5 March 1892, p.4).

The question of touch, too, is not limited to Wilde's play. It concerns Herder both literally and metaphorically. Opposing the Enlightenment's inclination to prioritize vision, Herder, like George Berkeley, emphasizes the role of touch involved in the act of looking, and concludes that the plastic art is essentially based on the sense of touch. (See his *Plastik*.) His organicist view of human society implies the metaphorical importance of people in mutual contact. It is relatedly significant that the relationship between a man and a woman has recurrently functioned as a symbol of the union of the different classes of a society throughout the history of the British novel from Benjamin Disraeli's *Sybil* to D.H.Lawrence's *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, in the latter of which touch is foregrounded in the love across the class boundary. In another of Lawrence's novels, *The Lost Girl*, the author critiques the visual and anti-tactile dominance in the modern society, opposing to it the communal warmth of the disappearing music hall culture and its artistes. Its middle-class heroine becomes involved with one of the artistes; and the symbolic touching of their hands is described in the beginning of their relationship. Lawrence's reference to feeling in its dual sense (touch and emotion) reminds one of Herder's similar use of the word *Gefühl*, a very important concept in his philosophy.

⁶⁰ Joseph Donohue, 'Distance, Death and Desire in *Salome*,' in *The Cambridge Companion to Oscar Wilde*, ed. by Peter Raby (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1997), pp.118-142 (p.127).

⁶¹ Kate Millet, *Sexual Politics* (London: Sphere, 1971), pp.152-156; and Norbert Kohl, *Oscar Wilde: The Works of a Conformist Rebel*, trans. by David Henry Wilson (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1980), p.192.

See also Richard Dellamora, 'Traversing the Feminine in Oscar Wilde's *Salomé*,' in *Oscar Wilde: A Collection of Critical Essays*, ed. by Jonathan Freedman, pp.99-113.

⁶² Gagnier, pp.163-164.

⁶³ H. Montgomery Hyde, *The Trials of Oscar Wilde* (New York: Dover, 1973), p.57.

⁶⁴ Robertson, pp.135-136.

⁶⁵ Hyde, p.57.

⁶⁶ Ricketts, p.244.

Two Phono-Texts in Bram Stoker's *Dracula*

Shorthand and Phonograph

In this chapter, we will explore the two types of phono-texts, which comprise part of the whole text of Bram Stoker's *Dracula*. They are the shorthand journals kept by Mina and Jonathan Harker and the phonograph diary kept by Dr. John Seward. In doing so, we will consider the history and the pre-history of the phonograph, which concerns, among others, the aesthetico-linguistic 'melocentric' tradition. As in Conrad, these disembodied voices are also linked to the *fin-de-siècle* imperial situation; as in Wilde, homosexuality is implied by them. At the end of the chapter, we will examine yet another instance of mysterious aural-orality, Mina's telepathic voice, in terms of its relation to the phono-texts as well as its political and technological implications.

Pitman's 'Phonography' and the 'Melocentric' Use of It

At the outset, the question of why the shorthand journal should be called a phono-text perhaps requires explanation; there are two reasons for this, external and internal. The external evidence is as follows. The shorthand Mina and Jonathan use is most certainly Pitman's. Of the two systems of shorthand, lexical and phonographic, the Pitman system belongs to the latter, which, in the modern times, started with John Byrom's 1767 *Universal English Shorthand*.¹ It is clear from the names Pitman gave his method that he was highly conscious of his

system being phonographic, that is, a system of transcribing the sound of speech, not of abbreviated signs for words: Pitman first named it 'stenographic sound-hand' (1837), then 'phonography' (1840). Being the author of *A History of Shorthand*, he knew the historical significance of his own method as the culmination of the various phonographic systems, and as the most logical and easiest to use of them all. Interestingly, the publisher of Pitman's book of shorthand wrote a piece of verse, in which he, comparing the significance of 'phonography' to the ear to that of photography to the eye, points to the aural element characteristic of phonographic shorthand that distinguishes the Pitman system from normal writing: 'Artists and scribes not more delight, / Their arts imperfect found, / Daguerre now draws by rays of Light, / And Pitman writes by Sound.'² Since English spelling is far from being phonetically faithful, there is a sense in which the Pitman shorthand is more aural than normal writing.

As to the internal evidence pointing to the aural-orality in Mina's shorthand writing, one might as well start with the following entry in her shorthand journal in an early part of the novel:

26 July.—I am anxious, and it soothes me to express myself here; it is like whispering to one's self and listening at the same time. And there is also something about the shorthand symbols that makes it different from writing.

I am unhappy about Lucy and about Jonathan.³

The aural-orality in whispering and listening to oneself, linked with

the therapeutic effect of self-expression, deserves attention. The reference to the special nature of shorthand writing that 'makes it different from writing' suggests its relation to the aural-oral element.

The connection between the aural-oral charm and the shorthand symbols becomes clearer from what Mina says later when she becomes excited at hearing a voice from a phonograph for the first time. She writes in the 29 September entry of the shorthand diary:

I went down to Dr. Seward's study. At the door I paused a moment, for I thought I heard him talking with some one. As, however, he had pressed me to be quick, I knocked at the door, and on his calling out, "Come in," I entered.

To my intense surprise, there was no one with him. He was quite alone, and on the table opposite him was what I knew at once from the description to be a phonograph. I had never seen one, and was much interested. [...]

'Oh,' he replied with a smile, 'I was only entering my diary.'

'Your diary?' I asked him in surprise.

'Yes,' he answered. 'I keep it in this.' As he spoke he laid his hand on the phonograph. I felt quite excited over it, and blurted out:—

'Why, this beats even shorthand! May I hear it say something?' (268-

269)

In what ways does the phonograph beat the shorthand, then? As it will turn out, there are two related answers: firstly, the former outdoes the latter as a device that produces a disembodied voice of enthralling

power; secondly, as a vessel of aural-oral information. As for the second answer, it should be noted that the phonograph, in its early years, was sold mainly as a dictating machine; as a dictating device, therefore, the phonograph and the shorthand stand on common ground. They can be considered as containers of aural-oral data, normally to be turned later into text written in the normal alphabet for public use. This aspect, however, will be discussed later; here, we wish to focus on the aspect of the power of the disembodied voice.

Having heard Dr. Seward speaking in his room and entering in expectation of finding a listener, Mina is strongly impressed when she fails to see anyone. The spectacle is at first mysterious to her. Then, she becomes eager to hear the machine speak.

The significance of the aural-oral element in her shorthand writing is further corroborated in a passage from Dr. Seward's ^{Mina's} diary of the same day describing her strong response upon hearing his voice on the phonograph:

'I have been more touched than I can say by your grief [registered in the recorded voice of Dr. Seward]. That [the phonograph] is a wonderful machine, but it is cruelly true. It told me, in its very tones, the anguish of your heart. It was like a soul crying out to Almighty God. No one must hear them spoken ever again! See, I have tried to be useful. I have copied out the words on my typewriter, and none other need now hear your heart beat, as I did.' (271)

It is now clear that Mina feels that the phonograph 'even beats shorthand' in terms of the power of voice conveyed by the machine. One can note the 'melocentric' factor in the suggested prioritization of voice and the disembodied voice's link to truth and one's true self.

Stoker's 'Melocentric' First Story: 'The Crystal Cup'

In order to explore the meaning of Mina's enigmatic sensitivity to voice, it is helpful to look at some other writings of Bram Stoker. After a consideration of the various implications of voice in Stoker's whole *oeuvre*, we will return to the text of *Dracula* and apply some of the insights gained from his other writings to the vampire novel.

His first published story, 'The Crystal Cup,' is similar to the vampire novel in a couple of ways: the imprisonment of the hero in a castle and the use of a receptacle for voice. The crystal cup made by the imprisoned artist-hero plays the same role of a receptacle for voice in the story as shorthand and phonograph do in *Dracula*: the cup gives an echo which originates in the hero's singing voice while working on it.

The immaculately beautiful cup is inseparable from the power of voice and related to what is most important to its maker. The idea of the cup is first inspired by his hearing in a dream the old song he used to sing with his beloved wife. As he works on the cup, he always sings that cherished song, which eventually turns the cup into the receptacle of his voice. After his decease, the wife sings the song at a 'Feast of Beauty' with such perfection that her voice brings about both ecstasy and destruction: the singer dies a 'Liebestod' while it is suggested that

the aesthete-king who imprisoned the artist dies in rapture at the beauty of the performance. The connection between the cup and what is the most important thing to the artist is also clear in a couple of ways. The artist's strongest desire, his yearning for his wife, is involved with the creation of the cup: the idea for the cup first comes from the song that symbolizes their love, and the motive for his making the cup is freedom, which will make his reunion with his wife possible. The immense power of their love contained as an echo of voice in the cup becomes apparent when her singing causes the ecstatic destruction. The tendency in Stoker to connect something vitally important with the power of voice can thus be detected from the beginning of his literary career.

Here, it is also pertinent to note one element in 'The Crystal Cup' that is not conspicuous but is likely to underlie the power of voice in *Dracula*: the supremacy of music. Instances of this abound in the story, ranging from the echo of the song in the cup, through the wife's climactic singing from 'the Throne of Sound,' through Aeolian harps like singing children comforting the aesthete-king, to his courtier equating music with 'the voice of Truth.'⁴ Stoker was an admirer of the Wagner conductor Hans Richter and made a pilgrimage to Bayreuth in the 1890s. In an early plan for the vampire novel, Stoker intended the English hero to go to see Wagner's *Der fliegende Holländer* in Munich.⁵ These circumstances perhaps show Stoker's affinity with the 'melocentric' tradition of musical supremacy.

Letters to Whitman: Voice, Text, Homosexuality

Stoker's characteristic attitude toward voice can also be seen in his poem and letters to Walt Whitman. Stoker in his twenties idolized the American poet, then a cult figure among English gay men who preached the manly attachment of 'comradeship.' In the poem Stoker dedicated to Whitman, he praises him as a powerful vocal presence that quenches the soul's thirst in the following way: 'The Master's [Whitman's] voice / In sweetest music bids their souls rejoice / And wakes an echo there that never dies.'⁶

The two remaining letters to Whitman also illustrate Stoker's tendency to give primacy to voice as well as the resulting complex relationship between speech and writing. The letters, respectively dating from 1872 and 1876, were sent at the same time, the former enclosed in the latter, because he had hesitated for four years over whether to post the 1872 letter, a kind of love letter, because of its personal nature. In the 1876 letter, he yearns for the situation in which one can talk rather than write, opposing speech and writing: 'I only hope we may sometime meet and I shall be able perhaps to say what I cannot write.'⁷ The 1872 letter, in contrast, desires to create in writing a situation resembling conversation. After a long preliminary passage expressing anxiety as to how Whitman will take the letter (Stoker even asks him to burn the letter if he does not like it), the 1872 letter says: 'If you have gone this far you may read the letter and I feel in writing now that I am talking to you. [...] I would like to call you Comrade and to talk to you as men who are not poets do not often talk.'⁸

In either case, voice is the medium of communication Stoker favours. He desires to use the letters as a vessel of voice like shorthand, but is also aware of the discrepancy between writing and speech. That is why writing is treated varyingly: it is suggested in the 1876 letter that writing is insufficient, whereas it is assumed to be, to some extent, capable of imitating speech.

As in *Dracula*, an element of secrecy is involved in the writer's attitude toward speech in the letters, which suggest that there is something one cannot write that one can speak: 'I only hope we may sometime meet and I shall be able perhaps to say what I cannot write.'⁹

As Talia Schaffer, among others, makes clear, Stoker's homosexuality is most certainly the cause. Schaffer pays particular attention to the expression 'my kind' in the concluding sentence of the 1872 letter, reading for it 'homosexuals.'¹⁰ There are other passages that hint at his, as well as Whitman's, sexual identity: Stoker calls Whitman 'Comrade'; he praises Whitman's candour, in comparison to which 'Rousseau's Confession is reticence,' and contrasts it to his own secretiveness; he laments that, unlike the poet who has 'shaken off the shackles,' he, who was 'reared a conservative in a conservative country,' is not free. The motif of speech is joined by the suggestion of homosexual attachment in the following passage: 'How sweet a thing it is for a strong healthy man with a woman's eyes and a child's wishes to feel that he can speak so to a man who can be if he wishes father, and brother and wife to his soul.'¹¹ Stoker also says that one must be open with the poet; still, all he can do is to insinuate and yearn for the

situation where he can say what cannot be written.

Another motif in these letters that has relevance to *Dracula* is that of burning a medium of voice. The 1872 letter, in which Stoker says that he feels like talking to Whitman, begins with a hint at the poet's homosexuality, followed by a request for the burning of the letter in case he does not like it: 'If you are the man I take you to be you will like to get this letter. [...] If you are not I don't care whether you like it or not and only ask you to put it into the fire without reading any farther.'¹² The burning of the letter is repeatedly referred to, indicating the writer's nervousness. It is only after a long anxious preliminary passage that he begins to feel safe. The request that Whitman should burn the letter is clearly related to his anxiety about the text as a container of the voice of the secret truth; such a vocal text must be kept from anyone unsympathetic to the secret.

Encounter with Henry Irving

Reciting Thomas Hood's 'The Dream of Eugene Aram'

What was perhaps the most importance incident in Stoker's life was also connected with voice and its relation to text. In 1876, when Irving visited Dublin, he liked Stoker's reviews of his performance and invited him to the personal recitation of a poem, Thomas Hood's 'The Dream of Eugene Aram.' Both the reciter and the listener were greatly moved; and they struck up a life-long friendship on that occasion. It was described in a highly charged tone in Stoker's *Personal Reminiscences of Henry Irving*. For example: 'here was incarnate

power, incarnate passion, so close that one could meet it eye to eye, within touch of the outstretched hand.' At the end of the recitation, Irving 'collapsed half fainting' while Stoker burst into 'something like a violent fit of hysterics.' Moved by his response, Irving 'went into his bedroom and after a couple of minutes brought me out his photograph with an inscription on it.'¹³ There is a hint of homoerotic feeling in the passage; the emotional curve of its central paragraph somewhat resembles that of intercourse, ending, after the ecstatic description of the recitation ('incarnate power, incarnate passion,' for instance), with something like the post-coital exhaustion of the reciter ('collapsed half fainting'). Furthermore, Stoker's descriptions of the performer (Irving) and the character (Eugene Aram) seem to merge in part, making the sin of the latter (murder) a mask for sexual sin: 'Then came the awful horror on the murderer's face as the ghost in his brain seemed to take external shape before his eyes, and enforced on him that from his there was no refuge. [...] Then he [Irving] collapsed half fainting.'¹⁴ Stoker's disguising of their mutual homosexual attraction as something spiritual ('something in the soul which lifts it above all that has its base in material things,' and 'Soul had looked into soul!¹⁵) is somewhat redolent of Mina's description of Seward's phonographic voice as 'a soul crying out to Almighty God.'

Voice and text interface on three levels in the recital of the poem. Firstly, the voice of the reciter relates to the text of the poem. Even if he recited from memory, Irving was under the influence of the text in a couple of ways: he must have been helped by the text in learning the

poem by heart; and he depended upon it for the authority of the standard version of the poem that exists in the textual form. Secondly, textuality and aural-orality coexist and interrelate in the two major characters of the poem, Eugene Aram and the boy to whom he tells the story of his crime. Both the academic Aram and the boy are first described as reading. Aram finds him reading a book while the other pupils in school are playing, and decides to tell the story to the boy. The two readers thus become the teller and the listener. It seems that Aram has chosen the boy because he is a reader. The title of the boy's book is, significantly, 'The Death of Abel,' symbolically paralleling the oral story of Aram's murder that is to be told by the murderer himself. Therefore, although it is the story told by Aram, comprising the major part of the poem, that reveals the secret of the crime, textuality precedes and underlies orality in it. Thirdly, voice and reading described in the poem stand in opposition to each other. Aram reads all day in school after the crime, but the reading is powerless against 'the awful voice of the blood-avenging Sprite.'¹⁶ As in letters to Whitman, voice and text interact in complex and apparently contradictory ways.

Intertwined with voice and text are elements of the poem, suggestive of Stoker's homosexuality: sin and concealment. The motif of sin appears as early as the eighth line ('And souls untouch'd by sin'). The book of sin ('The Death of Abel') introduces the main body of the poem, the oral storytelling of sin by the protagonist-narrator; and both of them are described in the text of sin (the poem as printed). The

concealment of the crime and the murdered body, urged by a supernatural voice, also play a major role in the poem: having heard the voice telling him to hide the body, Aram is obsessed with concealing of the body, first casting it into a river, then moving it to a 'lonesome wood.' Like the bite of the vampire, the murder described in the poem ('One hurried gash with a hasty knife') could be taken as a forced penetration. The depiction of the murder as 'spill[ing] life's sacred stream,' suggests the transference of the sexual (semen) to the violent (blood). The motif of hiding is also apparent in the form of Aram's storytelling: he tells his true story as a fiction or a dream. The passage following Aram's discovery of the title of the boy's book summarily shows how the reference to the book leads to the introduction of other major motifs, such as orality (speech, oral tradition, supernatural voice), the concealment of sin (and the impossibility of it), penetration ('horrid stabs'):

And down he [Aram] sat beside the lad,

And talk'd with him [the boy] of Cain;

And, long since then, of bloody man,

Whose deeds tradition saves;

Of lonely folk cut off unseen,

And hid in sudden graves;

Of horrid stabs, in groves forlorn,

And murders done in caves;

And how the sprites of injur'd men

Shriek upward from the sod,—
 Aye, how the ghostly hand will point
 To show the burial clod;
 And unknown facts of guilty acts
 Are seen in dreams from God!¹⁷

The Socio-Political Implication of Voice and Text in Stoker

However, it is not correct to ascribe the focus on voice and text exclusively to Stoker's sexuality. Socio-political factors also need to be taken into account. In the passage about Irving's recitation of the poem in Stoker's *Personal reminiscences of Henry Irving*, mention is made of the latter's first book, *The Duties of Clerks of Petty Sessions in Ireland*. It is significant that the reference book for the officialdom, dismissively described by the author as 'dry as dust,' is touched upon in the passage concerning Irving's vocal power and the self-consciously vocal-textual poem. Mention of the book seems to be part of an attempt to prove that Stoker is not usually prone to hysterics, into which, however, Irving's voice caused Stoker to fall at the recitation. Thus the contrast between voice and text is suggested here, too.

Voice and text represent the two different socio-political aspects between which Stoker is torn. The latter relates to Stoker's more public, conservative side. The writing of the book means writing for the establishment. Having been promoted to be Inspector of Petty Sessions in 1876, he started working on the book which was self-consciously textual, a 'collation of the enormous mass of written

documents,' meant to implement a more efficient and systematic data handling method for the bureaucracy. Stoker's career in Ireland was that of a typical ruling-class Anglo-Irish man: the son of a bureaucrat at Dublin Castle, and a graduate of Trinity College, he chose the same career as his father at the Castle. As he said in the confessional letters to Whitman, Stoker was 'reared a conservative in a conservative country' and thus became a bureaucrat. It is also notable that the young Stoker as a drama critic wrote for two Tory papers, *The Evening Mail* and *The Warder*.

Textuality, however, is not the only factor associated with the position of Inspectorship. As Barbara Belford writes, the position, which 'involved traveling with the magistrate's court to rural areas where there was no sitting judiciary,' put Stoker in direct contact with the rural Ireland and its people; he 'witnessed how farmers in the countryside suffered under the English landlord system' and 'watched hearings that ranged from stealing, unpaid rents, and the avoidance of taxes to dog attacks on cattle.' (The book includes a section on how to deal with oral information.) This experience, Belford continues, gave birth to his Irish novel, *The Snake's Pass*.¹⁸ In the novel, which is set in West of Ireland with its strongly superstitious culture, the oral tradition plays an important background role as well as being a source of information. The job as Inspector of Petty Sessions thus not only led to Stoker's first book, written as a tool for the textual control of the rural Ireland with its strongly oral culture, but also became a means of exposing him to that same culture.

Stoker's relation with the Irish oral culture, however, had started even earlier with the voice of his storytelling mother, Charlotte, who was so Irish as to 'firmly believe that she had heard the banshee wail before her mother died.'¹⁹ When he was a child, she 'sat by his bed and told him the myths of Ireland. [...] Stoker [thus] learned much from the skillful art of Irish storytelling.'²⁰ Perhaps more socio-politically important is the fact that Stoker became a regular visitor at the house of the nationalist Sir William Wilde and his family in the early 1870s. Sir William, as well as being a distinguished doctor, was known as a folklorist and collector of superstitions in Ireland, while Lady Wilde was a fiery nationalist poet, who in one of her poems urged the burning of Dublin Castle. Among their publications were Sir William's *Irish Popular Superstitions* (1852) and Lady Wilde's *Ancient Legends, Mystic Charms, and Superstitions of Ireland* (1888), which were late examples of the tradition of 'Discovery of the People' that had started in the late eighteenth century. The young Stoker, who complained about the repressive conservatism of his environment in a confessional letter to Whitman, must have found something congenial in the Wildes. The until recently overlooked significance of Irish folklore in the creation of *Dracula*, as pointed out by Haining and Tremayne, could well have originated, at least in part, in his acquaintance with the Wilde family. In London, Stoker was to become an advanced liberal and a member of the National Liberal Club.²¹ Perhaps because of his sense of sympathy for the Irish storytelling voice, he did not discard his Irish accent when he came to London.

Voice, Touch, Homosexuality in *Dracula*

In *Dracula*, too, there are a couple of elements, sexual-somatic and socio-political, related to the treatment of voice. As to the former, two relationships in the novel, those between Dracula and Harker and between Seward and Renfield, require consideration. Dracula's disembodied voice in conjunction with his touch and sexuality, similar to that of Salomé in Wilde's play, and the significance of Renfield in Seward's vocal diary will receive particular attention. In discussing the relationship between Seward and Renfield, the role Mina plays in turning the phono-texts into typescripts and the different statuses assigned to the vocal and the typed texts will also be scrutinized. A consideration of these factors will show that there is an ambivalent relationship between voice and body in Stoker's work, similar to the one we have observed in Arthur Symons.

The homoerotic attraction between the vampiric count and the English hero has been discussed by such scholars as Talia Shaffer, Paul Hammond and Christopher Craft.²² A close look at the text of the novel reveals traces of the concealment of Dracula's biting of Harker. The scene crucial to this type of approach is the one at Castle Dracula in which the attack of three vampiric women upon Harker is furiously halted by the Count. Ordering them away from the English hero, Dracula says: "How dare you touch him, any of you? [...] This man belongs to me" (53). The phrase 'this man belongs to me' is vital to the creation of *Dracula*. In fact, it is the germ out of which the whole

novel is developed. It is there in Stoker's working notes for the novel from the very beginning. As early as March 1890, the following words were written down in the notes: 'young man goes out—sees girls one tries—to kiss him not on the lips but throat. Old Count interferes—rage and fury diabolical. This man belongs to me I want him.'²³ Throughout his manuscript notes, this motif recurs again and again, indicating that the whole novel, in its genesis, evolves from, and revolves around, it.²⁴

In connection with this, Harker's loathing for these female vampires and preference of Dracula over them should also be noted: 'It is maddening to think that of all the foul things that lurk in this hateful place the Count is the least dreadful to me [Harker]; that to him alone I can look for safety' (50). Even the bedroom allotted to him by the Count serves as 'a sort of sanctuary' against 'those awful women' (55). The scene in question, therefore, can be construed as indicating the triumph of homosexual over heterosexual attractions.

The motif of voice and touch is also discernible in this scene. To recognize it, a couple of elements need to be taken into account. Firstly, the connection between voice and biting in Stoker is important. In his *Personal Reminiscences of Henry Irving*, Stoker writes extensively about Alfred Tennyson and Richard Burton. Interestingly, both of them are described as having both a powerful voice and a prominent canine tooth, the latter, according to Stoker, indicating a character of a fighter. Particularly, the description of Burton's canine tooth could be that of Dracula's: 'his canine tooth showed its full length

like the gleam of a dagger.'²⁵ The auralty of the human voice and the orality of vampirism are, for Stoker, akin to each other.

Secondly, as those scholars who have discussed homosexuality in *Dracula* observe, there is a tendency in Stoker, typical of gay writers, to express his homosexual drive by describing it in heterosexual terms. The homosexual desire in the novel is rendered via male characters' disguised desire for Lucy or Mina. Dracula's heterosexual desire for Lucy's blood, for instance, can be taken to be a cover under which his desire for the male blood which has been transfused into Lucy is expressed. Therefore, while the scene of the triangular struggle between the Count, Harker, and the vampiric women can be taken as the triumph of homosexuality over heterosexuality, it is at the same time a case of representing homosexual desire as heterosexual one, reflecting the complexity of the gay narrative.

Voice and touch recur in this sexually charged scene, in forms both homosexual and disguisedly heterosexual. First of all, the vampiric women's attack upon Harker, who in a swooning state of mind awaits the penetration of the teeth like that of a phallus, highlights touch and biting:

I could feel the soft, shivering touch of the lips on the super-sensitive skin of my throat, and the hard dents of two sharp teeth, just touching and pausing there. I closed my eyes in a languorous ecstasy and waited—waited with beating heart. (52)

Then, the Count appears and 'with his strong hand grasp[s] the slender neck' of the female vampire who herself is in touch with Harker; in other words, Dracula touches Harker through the vampiric woman. After that comes Dracula's voice, which explicitly refers to touch:

In a voice which, though low and almost in a whisper, seemed to cut through the air and then ring round the room he said:—

'How dare you touch him.' (53)

The motif of voice and touch is conspicuous in yet another memorable scene at the castle, in which the Count attempts the only same-sex vampiric attack on Harker. A few days after the arrival at the castle, the Englishman writes in his shorthand journal:

I only slept a few hours when I went to bed, and feeling that I could not sleep any more, got up. I had hung my shaving glass by the window, and was just beginning to shave. Suddenly I felt a hand on my shoulder and heard the Count's voice saying to me, 'Good-morning.' I started, for it amazed me that I had not seen him, since the reflection of the glass covered the whole room behind me. In starting I had cut myself slightly, but did not notice it at the moment. [...] When the Count saw my face [with blood trickling over the chin], [...] he suddenly made a grab at my throat. I drew away, and his hand touched the string of beads which held the crucifix. It made an instant change in him. (34-35)

Redolent of the function of Salomé's voice from darkness, the auditory and the tactile senses are foregrounded in the early part of the quoted passage, because of the invisibility of the vampiric Count.²⁶ It is also notable that Dracula's only same-sex attack in the work is prevented by the crucifix, the symbol of Christianity, which specifically condemns homosexuality. The scene may not exude as much homoeroticism as the one in which the female vampires appear, but several pieces of evidence outside the text suggest that this is one of the scenes crucial to the homosexual aspect of the novel.

A similar scene in *The Snake's Pass*, Stoker's early novel set in the West of Ireland, deserves attention here. As in *Dracula*, though more vaguely, the novel contains an element of the conflict between heterosexuality and homosexuality. Voice and touch play a central role in the scene crucial to this conflict. A romance occurs between the English hero, Arthur Severn, and the Irish heroine, Norah Joyce, in this novel. The first encounter of the two takes place somewhat strangely in the dark, the exchange between them being exclusively vocal and tactile. When Arthur drives Norah's father to the latter's house, he meets the girl in the following way: 'Another hand took mine as he relinquished it [the father's hand]—a warm, strong one—and a sweet voice said, shyly: 'Good night, sir, and thank you for your kindness to father.'²⁷ The strong hand reminds the reader of the repeated references to the powerful grip of the Count in *Dracula*.

On the way back to his place, Arthur keeps thinking of 'the warm hand and the sweet voice coming out of the darkness' (46). The other

thing that sticks in his mind is the prophetic word of an Irish 'old story-teller,' Dan Moriarty, which Arthur heard in a preceding scene:

'The Hill [the main setting of the novel] can hold tight enough! A man has reasons—sometimes wan thing and sometimes another—but the Hill holds him all the same!'

And a vague wonder drew upon me as to whether it could ever hold me, and how! (46)

The above scene, however, is followed by the apparently inexplicable but suggestive repression of the manly touch ('a strong ^{manly?} hand') and the voice in it; the repression, in view of the author's general strategy of secrecy over his homosexuality, conversely indicates the significance of the scene. The manly touch is already beginning to be repressed within the quoted passages: 'a warm, strong' hand in the first encounter changes into a mere 'warm hand' in the hero's reflections on the way back. In the beginning of the next chapter, where Arthur recollects 'the experience of that strange night, with the sweet voice coming through the darkness in the shadow of the hill' (47), the reference to the touch is completely dropped, the voice becoming the only factor mentioned.

There is a conspicuous mystery in the treatment of the voice. The strong impression made upon the protagonist by the voice in the dark is emphasized in his recollection of it: he finds that he is in love with the voice. Still, when Arthur comes across Norah later, this time during

the daytime so that he can see her, he does not recognize her voice, which he hears singing 'Ave Maria.' He is struck by the sweetness of her voice this time, too; and yet, he does not notice that the disembodied voice in the darkness and the voice in the day are the one and same. Arthur at this moment makes an implausible distinction between the two voices: 'That sweet voice through the darkness seemed very far away now—here was a voice as sweet, and in such habitation' (76).

The repression of the manly touch and the voice in the dark indicate one of the narrative rifts, typical of Stoker, through which his sexuality can be glimpsed. The voice in the dark combined with the manly touch relates to homosexuality, while the later voice in the day combined with the singing of the sacred song points to the simultaneous de-sexualization and heterosexualization enforced by the Victorian norm. In its early suggestion of homosexuality and the later excision of it, *The Snake's Pass* is structurally similar to the vampire classic: in *Dracula*, too, the homosexual Count who imprisons Harker in his castle later transforms into a heterosexual predator looking at a beautiful woman when he appears for the first time in central London.

In the light of the above discussion, the word 'Hill' in the prophetic remark by the Irish storyteller, Dan Moriarty, elicits a homosexual reading which also involves the tactile sense. 'Hill' is to be read for 'he'll,' that is, the will of homosexual desire. The passage in question, in which Arthur wonders whether the hill can really hold him, therefore, is concerned with the viability of the homosexual desire to 'hould' the

hero.

Voice, touch and sexuality are also seen together in Stoker's impassioned description of Irving's recitation of Thomas Hood's poem and his homosexual letters to Whitman. At the climax of the depiction of the actor's vocal art, the references to the hand concern the physical proximity and the expression of powerful emotion:

But here was incarnate power, incarnate passion, so close that one could meet it eye to eye, within touch of the outstretched hand. [...] How a change of tone or time denoted the personality of the 'Blood-avenging Sprite'—and how the nervous, eloquent hands slowly moving, outspread fanlike, round the fixed face—set as doom, with eyes as inflexible as Fate—emphasised it till one instinctively quivered with pity!²⁸

In Stoker's letters to the American poet, too, after a long anxious introductory part, Stoker writes thus: 'If you have gone this far you may read the letter and I feel in writing now that I am talking to you. If I were before your face I would like to shake hands with you, for I feel that I would like you. I would like to call you Comrade and to talk to you as men who are not poets do not often talk.'²⁹ That speaking, touching, and the use of the latently homosexual appellation 'Comrade' appear together is no coincidence. The instances so far discussed point to the homoerotic element in Stoker's treatment of voice and touch. And the scene in which Dracula touches and speaks to Harker from behind should be interpreted accordingly.

Seward's Phonographic Voice and Renfield

Let us return to the scene in which Mina talks excitedly about Seward's phonographic voice, and consider the homosexual implication in it:

I [Mina] have been more touched than I can say by your grief. That [the phonograph] is a wonderful machine, but it is cruelly true. It told me in its very tones, the anguish of your heart. It was a soul crying out to Almighty God. No one must hear them spoken ever again! (271)

There is a mystery in the passage. At the point of the above passage (before dinner, 29 September), she has only heard Seward's journal from 25 May up to 7 September. Strangely, there is not much in that part of the journal which justifies such a strong response. Only the last entry (7 September) contains a record of the beginning of the first victimization of English women, which might cause a shock to the listener. Even that entry, however, only records the first of the blood transfusions given to the victim, Lucy Western, upon the discovery of her emaciation; the existence of the vampire has not yet been suspected. It is also difficult to take what Mina means by 'your [Seward's] grief' to refer to his own brokenheartedness over Lucy's rejection of his proposal: there are as few as four brief references to his own misery owing to disappointed love. Rather, most of the journal up to 7 September concerns a mad patient in his charge, Renfield.

Regarding Seward's relation with Renfield, some significant parallelisms between Seward and Dracula should be noted. Both Seward and Dracula are bloodsuckers: the former has once sucked out Van Helsing's poisoned blood from a wound made by a knife (148). Both Seward and Dracula are 'masters': Dracula is Renfield's master and is so called by him; Seward, too, is Renfield's master in the sense that the latter is an inmate of the former's hospital; and Seward is called 'master' in Van Helsing's broken English, while Dracula calls himself so (28 and 157). Perhaps the most important parallelism lies in Seward's and Dracula's respective relations with Renfield and Harker. As Dracula takes an interest in Harker and imprisons him in the castle, Seward is intrigued by Renfield and confines him in his asylum. Both Harker and Renfield are put under the power of a man who is the master of his domain. Still, both rebel in a similar way: Harker attacks and cuts Dracula once with a shovel and once with a knife; Renfield attacks and cuts Seward with a dinner knife (67-68, 181 and 443). Considering the homosexual attachment in the relationship between Dracula and Harker, it is natural to conclude that Mina's inexplicably strong response to Seward's voice in the diary also points to the same-sex attraction, this time represented by the relationship between Seward and Renfield. This interpretation is further supported by Stoker's strategy of expressing homosexual desire (Dracula's for Harker; Seward's for Renfield) in terms of heterosexual one (Dracula's for English females; Seward's for Lucy).

This reading is also a strong one in that it helps explain some other

unaccountable points in the novel. Firstly, Renfield somehow knows about his doctor's private life: in a conversation with Renfield, Seward is surprised by the madman's knowledge of his proposal to Lucy (282), a knowledge that can only be explained by the existence of a relationship that goes beyond that between doctor and patient. Secondly, when he hands Mina his phonographic journal, Seward says to her: 'Take the cylinders and hear them—the first dozen of them [the part of the journal up to 7 September] are personal to me, [...] then you will know me better' (270). It is now clear that the word 'personal' and the better knowledge of him the journal is to give her indirectly refer to Seward's homosexuality. Thirdly, it deserves attention that the first entry of Seward's journal, in the first edition of the novel, is mistakenly dated 25 April, instead of the logically correct 25 May. The slip could well be Freudian. 25 May is the date when Oscar Wilde was sentenced to two years' hard labour. The homosexual panic caused by Wilde's conviction, as Talia Schaffer says, stimulated Stoker to start writing the vampire novel in August 1895, embodying the 'Wilde-as-threat' in the novel's villain.³⁰ The simultaneous choice and avoidance of that date points to Seward's desire to both reveal and conceal his homosexuality.

Phonographic Voice and Typescript

In relation to the sexual element in the novel, we will now consider another significant point in the scene where Mina enthuses about the phonographic voice: her handling of the voice, that is, her typewriting

of it. The part of the conversation between Mina and Seward that follows the above quotation is relevant here:

'No one must hear them [Seward's words] spoken ever again! See, I have tried to be useful. I have copied out the words on my typewriter, and none other need now hear your heart beat, as I did.'

'No one need ever know, shall ever know,' I [Seward] said in a low voice. She laid her hand on mine and said very gravely:—

'Ah, but they must!'

'Must! But why?' I asked.

'Because it is a part of the terrible story, a part of poor dear Lucy's death and all that led to it; because in the struggle which we have before us to rid the earth of this terrible monster we must have all the knowledge and all the help which we can get. I think that the cylinders which you gave me contained more than you intended me to know; but I can see that there are in your record many lights to this dark mystery.' (271)

As the passage shows, Mina turns Seward's phonographic diary into a typescript for two reasons. Firstly, it is because Seward's voice must be kept secret. She suggests that it should be kept from the ear of others because of the poignancy of the emotion expressed by his voice.

In view of what we have observed, particularly the prominence of

7 Renfield in the part of the diary in question, the poignant emotion 'no
(one must hear' relates to homosexuality. Secondly, Mina makes a typescript of the phonographic diary because the vampiric information

should be put down in the normal alphabet, to be shared by others; it is for the sake of the campaign against the essentially homosexual Count. The vocal diary relates to the secret homosexuality, whereas the typescript is connected with the anti-homosexual, conservative strain in the novel. This also corresponds to what has been said about Stoker's general attitude towards voice and text, which respectively represent the private and progressive and the public and conservative sides of the author.

A similar dual structure can be noted in Jonathan Harker's shorthand journal. The most important part of the journal written in 'phonography,' of course, is concerned with his latently homosexual relationship with Dracula. This journal, when Mina and Jonathan wed in Budapest after the latter's escape from the castle, is treated in a very strange fashion. In a letter to Lucy reporting their wedding, Mina writes thus:

When the chaplain and the Sisters had left me alone with my husband [...], I took the book [Harker's shorthand journal] from under his pillow, and wrapped it up in white paper, and tied it with a little bit of pale blue ribbon which was round my neck, and sealed it over the knot with sealing wax, and for my seal I used my wedding ring. Then I kissed it and showed it to my husband, and told him that I would keep it so, and then it would be an outward and visible sign for us all our lives that we trusted each other; that I would never open it unless it were for his own dear sake or for the sake of some stern duty. (139)

The reason why their marriage should be founded on the sealing of the journal is not given in the text. From what we have seen so far, however, we know it as part of Stoker's homosexual narrative strategy: the aim of the sealing of the journal upon the wedding is the validation of the heterosexual relationship by the concealment of the homosexual one.

There are other instances that support this interpretation. Firstly, Harker refers to the journal as the secret he does not want to know. He also wants Mina to share this ignorance in spite of his saying that there should be no secret between husband and wife. Secondly, the nurse who has taken care of him while he was still raving in a state of shock keeps silent about what he said then. She only suggests that there is no other woman involved, which gladdens Mina (138-139). The reticence and the suggestion of no woman involved, however, can be taken as pointing to the homosexual presence of the vampiric Count.

Later, Mina reads the journal, but it is only after the reappearance of Dracula, by then transformed into a distinctly heterosexual predator observing a beautiful girl in central London (215). The heterosexual Count means the removal of the homosexual threat to the marriage. Whatever the superficial reason provided by the text, it is the disappearance of the threat that enables Mina to read the journal and make the typed transcript of it. Here again, therefore, the vocal relates to the secret homosexual realm, whereas the typescript stands

for those values conforming to the Victorian norm.

Spiritualization of Voice

As Concealment of the Sexual-Somatic

An important point to be clarified by this survey of the relationship between voice and homosexuality is Stoker's similarity to Arthur Symons in terms of the ambivalently dual implications, somatic and spiritual, of voice. As in Symons, voice in Stoker is spiritualized, but that spiritualization can be seen as an attempt to conceal the relationship that exists between voice and body. In *Dracula*, Mina spiritualizes Seward's voice, comparing it to 'a soul crying out to Almighty God' (271). Seward's voice, however, is connected with homosexual desire, which, in the relationship between Dracula and Harker, is represented by touch as well as voice. In view of Stoker's overall strategy of suggestive secrecy over his sexual identity, Mina's spiritualization of Seward's voice can be taken as a cover for the more somatic implication of the voice. A similar duality can be observed elsewhere in Stoker's writings. In Stoker's description of Irving's recitation, the consciousness of touch and the spiritualization of the occasion are seen together. In his relations to Whitman, while the desire to touch and talk are expressed in his letters, the poem dedicated to the American poet contains the spiritualization of Whitman's voice.

The Phono-Texts as Vessels of Truth

Yet another place in the novel requires consideration, to illustrate

the utmost importance of the question of the phono-texts and the typescripts. The narrative of *Dracula* has an epilogue, which is of much interest and relevance here. It takes the form of a note written by Harker seven years after the encounter with and destruction of Dracula. The significance of the epilogue lies in the fact that, by denying at the end the reliability of the text of the novel, it allows one a corroborative glimpse of Stoker's narrative strategy about voice and typewriting. In it, Harker observes concerning the record of the Dracula incident:

I took the papers from the safe where they had been ever since our return [from Transylvania] so long ago. We were struck with the fact, that in all the mass of material of which the record is composed, there is hardly one authentic document; nothing but a mass of typewriting, except the later note-books of Mina and Seward and myself, and Van Helsing's memorandum. We could hardly ask any one, even did we wish to, to accept these as proofs of so wild a story. (444-445)

There are two points worthy of attention in the passage. The first of them is that, by implication, the phono-texts, as distinct from the typescripts, are defined as 'authentic document[s].' In other words, the connection between the phono-texts and truth and that between the typescripts and falsity are suggested here. The related, second point is one grave implication of the passage: the possible falsehood of almost all the information in the novel. The text of the novel is based on the

typescripts, for two reasons. Firstly, the major part of the original information is not in normal alphabet but in shorthand and phonographic journal, so it needs to be turned into typescripts to provide the basis for the text of the novel. Secondly, those vocal vessels of the original information are destroyed by Dracula in his raid upon Seward's mental institution.

By equating the typescripts with falsity, the epilogue intimates the nature of the novel's narrative strategy of secrecy about homosexuality. In other words, the epilogue constitutes a confession of the concealment committed by the homophobic-conformist typed narrative.

There is yet another aural element—a pun—in the epilogue which points to the homosexual strain in *Dracula*. Talia Schaffer's excellent suggestion that the word 'wild' can be read for 'Wilde' gives a useful clue to the homosexual interpretation of the following part of the passage: 'we could hardly ask any one, even did we wish to, to accept these [the typescripts] as proofs of so wild a story.' The conformist typescripts which provide the basis for the text of the novel naturally cannot serve as proof of 'so "Wilde" a story.' Only the destroyed phono-texts are congenial to the homoerotic strain in the novel.

The Imperial Implications of Voice

As was said in an earlier discussion of voice in Stoker's other writings, it is incorrect to ascribe the significance of voice exclusively to the sexual factor. Typically of what Patrick Brantlinger terms 'Imperial Gothic' fiction, the merging of the sexual and the socio-

political elements is to be seen to a large extent in *Dracula*. After the foregoing discussion, therefore, the second of these elements remains to be explored.

In *Dracula*, as in much of Kipling's fiction, oral knowledge becomes the focus of political conflict between opposing forces. In sharp contrast to Kipling, in whose work it is those on the side of Britain who are in search of oral knowledge, Stoker's vampire novel portrays the anti-British force in the shape of Dracula, as well as those brave knights defending Britain, as seeking oral information.³¹ This is evidently related to the often-discussed *fin-de-siècle* fear of reverse colonization that can be discerned in the novel.

Several scholars have paid attention to socio-political factors in *Dracula*. Burton Hatlen, remarking that Dracula represents 'everything that is "other" to the Victorian bourgeoisie,' discusses the questions of class and race in late-nineteenth-century Imperial Britain. However, Hatlen, like some others, does not delve much into specific contemporary socio-political problems likely to be relevant to the novel.³² Yet others examine its socio-political implications more specifically.³³ Contemporary problems such as the Balkan situation, the Jewish immigration into the East End from the Eastern Europe, the Irish question, the rising rivalry of Germany and the United States have been examined.³⁴ The image of the Romanians as the coming race, a threat to the declining British Empire, in Emily Gerard's *The Land Beyond the Forest*, to which the author of the Romanian vampire novel is heavily indebted, has also been noted.³⁵ Particularly noteworthy is

Stephen D. Arata's excellent essay, in which he defines Dracula as an "Occidental" scholar, the reverse of the Western Orientalist scholar, and examines the relationship between power and knowledge.³⁶ Knowledge is sought in order to gain political power, whether it takes the form of the conquest of a new territory or the control of those already conquered. Socio-politically, it is for this power-related knowledge, the knowledge which would make possible his conquest of Britain, that Dracula wants Harker at his castle. And it is most relevant to our discussion that the kind of knowledge Dracula is looking for is aural-oral.

Near the beginning of the novel, Dracula is shown to have already collected an enormous amount of textual information about Britain:

In the library [of the castle] I [Harker] found, to my great delight, a vast number of English books, whole shelves full of them, and bound volumes of magazines and newspapers. A table in the centre was littered with English magazines and newspapers, though none of them were of recent date. The books were of the most varied kind—history, geography, politics, political economy, botany, geology, law—all relating to England and English life and customs and manners. There were even such books of reference as the London Directory, the 'Red' and 'Blue' books, Whitaker's Almanack, the Army and Navy Lists, and—it somehow gladdened my heart to see it—the Law List. (27-28)

Later, Harker is even surprised to find the Count reading 'an English

Bradshaw's Guide,' the comprehensive timetable of the British railway.

Now that he has almost all the essential textual information about the country, he looks for another kind of knowledge which is learned by another means:

'These friends'—and he laid his hand on some of the books—'have been good friends to me, and for some years past, ever since I had the idea of going to London, have given me many, many hours of pleasure. Through them I have come to know your great England; and to know her is to love her. I long to go through the crowded streets of your mighty London, to be in the midst of the whirl and rush of humanity, to share its life, its change, its death, and all that makes it what it is. But alas! as yet I only know your tongue through books. To you, my friend, I look that I know it to speak.'

'But, Count,' I said, 'you know and speak English thoroughly!' He bowed gravely.

'I thank you, my friend, for your all too-flattering estimate, but yet I fear that I am but a little way on the road I would travel. True, I know the grammar and the words, but yet I know not how to speak them.'

'Indeed,' I said, 'you speak excellently.'

'Not so,' he answered. 'Well, I know that, did I move and speak in your London, none there are who would not know me for a stranger. That is not enough for me. Here I am noble; I am *boyar*; the common people know me, and I am master. But a stranger in a strange land, he is no one; men know him not—and to know not is to care not for. I am content if I am like the rest, so that no man stops if he sees me, or pause in his speaking if he hear

my words, to say, 'Ha, ha! a stranger!' I have been so long master that I would be master still—or at least that none other should be master of me. You come to me not alone as agent of my friend Peter Hawkins, of Exeter, to tell me all about my new estate in London. You shall, I trust, rest here with me a while, so that by our talking I may learn the English intonation; and I would that you tell me when I make error, even of the smallest, in my speaking.' [...] It was evident that he wanted to talk. [...]

'Come,' he said at last, 'tell me of London and of the house which you have procured for me [in a London suburb].' [...] He was interested in everything. (28-31)

Like Kipling's English heroes, who help maintain the Empire with their orally obtained knowledge, Dracula wants to master the English pronunciation so that he can collect the kind of information that can be obtained only through talks between native speakers. He secretly thinks that oral knowledge of that sort is necessary for his conquest of Britain, and he wants Harker for the oral knowledge of the English language that will enable him to obtain the oral information by speaking with Englishmen like an Englishman.

The quoted passage also indicates the relationship between his desire to *master* English and his insistence on being *master* wherever he goes. The question of oral knowledge is thus shown to be inseparable from that of power. Later, when the vampiric biting starts, Dracula's desire for oral knowledge becomes aligned to his desire for the oral blood-knowledge, that is, the biting.³⁷

Notably, those who fight against the vampire, too, rely on oral information. The scene in which Van Helsing shares his knowledge of the vampire with others is relevant here. Although there is an element of complexity in his attitudes towards the civilized and hence essentially textual form of knowledge and the barbarian oral form of knowledge, he eventually states that the source for his information about vampires is originally oral. At the outset of his speech, he stresses the power of a civilized society characterized by scientific thought and freedom: 'Well, you know what we have to contend against; but we, too, are not without strength. We [...] have sources of science; we are free to act and think' (288). However, then, in contradiction to what has just been said, the primacy of oral information—traditions and superstitions—over scientific information is confessed, before he goes into specific characteristics of the vampire:

'All we have to go upon are traditions and superstitions. These do not at the first appear much, when the matter is one of life and death—nay of more than either life or death. Yet must we be satisfied; in the first place because we have to be—no other means is at our control—and secondly, because, after all, these things—tradition and superstition—are everything. Does not the belief in vampires rest for others—though not, alas! for us—on them? A year ago which of us would have received such a possibility, in the midst of our scientific, sceptical, matter-of-fact nineteenth century? We even scouted a belief that we saw justified under our eyes.' (289)

The 'traditions and superstitions' that provide the Dracula information for Van Helsing and his group are related to voice in yet another way. Near the beginning of the novel, set in Transylvania, two forms of orality are noted: one is characterized by references to food, particularly red food, foretelling the vampiric biting; the other relates to the oral knowledge and voice of the people. While still in Britain, Harker has obtained the knowledge that Transylvania is a multi-racial area rich in superstition. However, when he comes across the folklore of the area as represented by the actual speech of the locals, he can only partially understand it because of his lack of the knowledge of the languages spoken there:

They [the locals] were evidently talking of me, for every now and then they looked at me. [...] I could hear a lot of words often repeated, queer words, for there were many nationalities in the crowd; so I quietly got my polyglot dictionary from my bag and looked them out. I must say they were not cheering to me, for amongst them were 'Ordog'—Satan, 'pokol'—hell, 'stregoica'—witch, 'vrolok' and 'vlkoslak'—both of which mean the same thing one being Slovak and the other Servian for something that is either were-wolf or vampire. [...] I soon lost sight and recollection of ghostly fears in the beauty of the scene as we drove along, although had I known the language, or rather languages, which my fellow-passengers were speaking, I might not have been able to throw them off so easily. (10-11)

The oral knowledge contained in these voices, multi-lingual and mostly

unintelligible to Harker, is the kind of knowledge Van Helsing later acquires. Had Harker been able to understand what these voices said, he might have escaped the clutches of the Count. The vital significance of oral information in the politically unstable multi-racial are is suggested here.³⁸

The Burning of the Phono-Texts:

The Overlapping of the Sexual and the Political

Dracula's destruction of the phono-texts when he burns them during his raid upon Seward's lunatic asylum provides a good example of the convergence of the socio-political and the sexual as they relate to voice. In this most impressive scene, Dracula, helped by Renfield, breaks into the building, kills Renfield, and commits a symbolic form of sexual intercourse with Mina, forcing her to drink his vampiric blood. The destruction of the shorthand journals of the Harkers and the phonographic cylinders of Seward's diary is the vampire's other significant act:

'He [Dracula] had been there, and though it could only have been for a few seconds, he made rare hay of the place. All the manuscript had been burned, and the blue flames were flickering amongst the white ashes; the cylinders of your phonograph too were thrown on the fire, and the wax had helped the flames.' Here I [Seward] interrupted. 'Thank God there is the other copy [the typescripts] in the safe!' (340-341)

No explanation for Dracula's motive is clearly given in the passage, while the implication of the incident for those fighting against the vampire is suggested. Van Helsing's word—'Our hope now is in knowing all'—and Seward's word—'Thank God there is the other copy [the typescripts]—indicate the importance of the destroyed journals as a store of information to be used against Dracula. However, the different meanings given to the phono-texts and the typescripts in the novel are ignored and repressed by these normative, anti-vampiric men. It is therefore not enough to draw upon their remarks and conclude that Dracula's motive is simply the destruction of the anti-vampiric information. In view of many instances indicating the significance of the vocal in the novel—particularly the epilogue linking the phono-texts and the typescripts to truth and falsity respectively—the reason why Dracula destroys the phono-texts and not the typescripts needs to be considered.

The destruction of the phono-texts can be traced to two causes, political and sexual. Politically, the central significance of oral knowledge in the information war between the West—Britain—and the East—Transylvania—is the cause. Both sides look for oral knowledge about each other, which is crucial to the destruction of the enemy. Conversely, it becomes necessary to destroy the oral information accumulated by one's enemy. In sexual terms, because of the connection between voice and homosexuality and of Stoker's gay strategy of secrecy over his sexual identity, Dracula destroys the phono-texts to conceal his homosexuality. Moreover, Dracula's

burning of these aural-oral journals is reminiscent of Stoker's request that Whitman burn his implicitly homosexual letters, if he dislike them.

The Irish Context

Another socio-political question deserves attention here. This is the significance of Stoker's homeland, Ireland, a country, like Romania, very rich in oral culture and a focus of British Imperial politics. However, the subject is somewhat elusive because of the author's ambivalent relations both to Ireland and England. As was said before, Stoker was part of the establishment in Ireland, having been born into an Anglo-Irish family, and he himself, following in the footsteps of his father, became a bureaucrat at Dublin Castle. Under this conservative façade, however, there was another Stoker, a Whitmanite, a close associate of the Wildes, a man who was to support Home Rule, in short, a pro-nationalist progressive with a concealed sexual identity. Then, after he moved to London, he became part of the establishment in another way, the acting manager of the theatre of the first knighted actor. There, also, to borrow Arata's phrase, his 'national allegiances were conspicuously split.'³⁹ Against the background of the tense relationship between the two nations characterized by 'the rise of Fenianism and the debate over Home Rule,' he mixed with celebrities in the English capital, yet still retaining an Irish accent, and also unsuccessfully tried to persuade his 'master,' Henry Irving, to support Home Rule.

This situation seems to have given rise to a number of complex implications of Ireland in the vampire novel. Arata's apt summary of the complexity is helpful here: '*Dracula* suggests two equations in relation to English-Irish politics: not just, Dracula is to England as Ireland is to England, but, Dracula is to England as England is to Ireland.'⁴⁰ Reflecting Stoker's 'split allegiance' to the two nations, the meaning of *Dracula* in this aspect keeps floating between several discrete positions.

Firstly, the reliance of the anti-vampire group on books of superstition for information should be noted. The identification of the superstitious region with the monster seems to be a reflection of the monstrous image of the Irish prevalent in the nineteenth-century England. *Dracula*, in this respect, represents Ireland as the anxiety-ridden *fin-de-siècle* English saw it, and Stoker identifies with the latter. However, the collecting of superstitions and traditions also reminds one of the works of the nationalist Wildes, who were close to the young Stoker. Being an Anglo-Irish nationalist himself, Stoker must have had in mind their books of Irish folklore when writing his novel.

Secondly, the imprisonment of Harker at the castle deserves attention. To the author who was once a young bureaucrat in Dublin, Castle *Dracula* cannot merely mean a castle in Eastern Europe; neither can it be related exclusively to a castle in Scotland, which Haining and Tremayne claim to be its model.⁴¹ 'Castle,' without doubt, means to him his first workplace: Dublin Castle. As has been pointed out, the

young Stoker felt as if he was imprisoned there, working away like his father and keeping to himself ideas that did not suit the establishment. His first published story, 'The Crystal Cup,' written while still at Dublin Castle, is also a story about an imprisoned hero in a castle where a father-figure reigns. Count Dracula, in this sense, stands for the English establishment incarcerating a Stoker-figure.

Thirdly, Dracula's foreign accent can be linked to Stoker's Irish accent. The latter retained his accent even after coming to London. Whether he could not drop it or did not choose to do so is not known, but the Count's irritation at his inability to mingle freely in English society because of his accent could be a reflection of the feeling of the Irishman who, despite many prestigious connections, remained an exile in a foreign land.

Yet another aural-oral implication of Ireland is pointed out by Haining and Tremayne: the presence of the Irish folklore in the genesis of the name of the vampiric Count. Although the name 'Dracula' was formerly thought to originate in the name of a Transylvanian warrior lord, which also meant 'devil,' Haining and Tremayne argue for the influence of the Irish oral culture, suggesting the Irish *droch-fhola* (pronounced *drok'ola*; meaning bad blood) and *Dún Dreach-Fhola* (pronounced *drak'ola*) behind the name Dracula. The latter is the folkloric 'castle of blood visage' inhabited by the vampiric 'neamh-mhairbh (Un-Dead).'⁴² As he concealed his sexuality in voice, the secretive Stoker might have hidden his Irish roots in the sound of the name of the vampire. The disembodied voice in *Dracula* thus relates to

the *fin-de-siècle* imperial situation it belongs to in complex, sometimes contradictory ways.

The Technological Implications:

The Two Phono-Texts and Mina's Telepathic Voice

Concerning the technological aspect of the disembodied voice in *Dracula*, we will examine how Pitman's shorthand ('phonography') and phonograph are interrelated as well as their connections with other factors like the study of language, and clarify why phonograph and 'phonography' are juxtaposed in this novel.

There is yet another kind of mysterious voice in *Dracula*: Mina's telepathic voice. It appears late in the novel as if to replace the destroyed phono-texts and plays a vital role in the information war between Dracula and those against him. There is a reason for the appearance of this wireless voice of telepathy in the novel published in 1897. We will consider that point after a discussion of phonograph and 'phonography.'

As Steven Connor suggests, phonograph and 'phonography' are part of the nineteenth century's various efforts in various fields to record, transmit, and artificially reproduce the human voice.⁴³ Before the births of telephone and phonograph in 1876-77, for example, devices to register the vibration of sound visibly, such as phonautograph and singing flames, had been invented; speaking automata had been popular; the question of phonetic spelling and symbols had drawn a great deal of attention; many had been working on acoustic telegraphy.

Of particular interest and relevance here is the increased nineteenth-century interest in phonetic spelling and symbols, which resulted from the aural-oral emphasis in the contemporary study of language. This aural-oral primacy in philology derives from Herder's 'melocentric' prioritization of the aural-oral in language, and thus relates to the linguistic side of the aesthetico-linguistic 'melocentric' implications of the disembodied voice.

Phonograph, 'Phonography,' Phonetic Spelling

More specifically, phonograph and 'phonography' are connected via ~~the~~ phonetic spelling and symbols. 'Phonography' is itself a system of phonetic symbols of a more practical or less scientific kind, but that is not all there is to it. Isaac Pitman, who perfected the phonographic shorthand that had started with John Byrom's 1767 *Universal English Short-Hand*, also worked for spelling reform advocating the employment of a phonetic spelling. For that, he collaborated with the philologist Alexander John Ellis and first published a phonetic alphabet called 'Fonotypy' in 1844. Although attempts to reform English spelling date back to as early as 1200, the nineteenth century, particularly the latter half of it, saw a growth of the spelling reform movement, centring around the adoption of a phonetic spelling.⁴⁴ Ellis and Pitman were among the earliest advocates of that movement; and what they had started soon became a major topic of discussion among philologists. In 1869, the Philological Society founded a committee for the amendment of English orthography, and the question of phonetic

spelling was intensely discussed that year and the following year. In 1879, two years after the invention of the phonograph, the British Spelling Reform Association was founded and 'attracted the support of eminent literary and political figures'⁴⁵: Alfred Tennyson and Charles Darwin were both vice presidents of the association. The first issue of the journal of the association, *The Spelling Reformer*, reflected on the change in the situation thus:

Twenty years ago the spelling reformers were regarded as a small and obscure band of harmless enthusiasts, harmless because there was not the slightest chance of their emerging from their obscurity. But all is changed now.⁴⁶

1880 saw a revival of the question in the Philological Society: James Murray, the first editor of the *O.E.D.*, noted a 'steady growth of scholarly opinion in favour of spelling reform,' and expressed his own support for a phonetic notation.⁴⁷ In the next year's Annual Address of the President, Ellis himself discussed the subject in detail.⁴⁸ Other leading scholars of the new philology, such as Henry Sweet and Walter Skeat, also supported the movement.⁴⁹ Involved with these major voice-related linguistic phenomena, Pitman embodies the importance and mutual closeness of 'phonography' and phonetic symbols in the late nineteenth-century Britain.

Strange as it may seem, the best person to look to in order to consider the relationship between the phonograph and the phonetic

spelling and symbols, is Alexander Graham Bell. Although he is the inventor of telephone, not the phonograph, the pre-history of his invention of the telephone can also be read as a pre-history of the phonograph. It is not only that both Bell and Edison were part of the large-scale nineteenth-century movement of aural-orally related experimentation, that both worked on devices for the transmission and reproduction of sound and voice; but also that Bell's particular background indicates that he is the person who should have invented phonograph. Indeed, a few months after Edison's patent on the phonograph, Bell wrote to his father-in-law: 'it is an astonishing thing to me that I could possibly have let this invention slip through my fingers when I consider how my thoughts have been devoted to this subject for many years past.'⁵⁰

Bell's involvement with the phonograph, like Edison's with the telephone, continued even after the time of the invention. As Edison improved the telephone by the introduction of the carbon-type transmitter (1877) and the chalk receiver (1879), Bell worked to improve upon Edison's phonograph, first patenting methods 'for transmitting and recording sound by means of gaseous or liquid jets and by means of radiant energy.'⁵¹ He later discarded them, and instead came up with the ideas of using cardboard coated with wax and a loosely mounted stylus in place of Edison's tin foil and a rigid reproducing needle. The machine was patented in 1886. The patent 'specified a disc record' instead of Edison's cylinder, though Bell later returned to the use of a cylinder. The constant speed was also secured

by a foot-treadle mechanism or an electric motor. He named his distinctively improved version of phonograph 'graphophone'; he sold the patent to a group of capitalists and American Graphophone Company was organized in 1887. Against Bell's move, Edison responded quickly by starting to improve on his own invention and coming up with a new Edison phonograph as early as 1888.⁵²

Bell's article in *The National Geographic Magazine*, 'Prehistoric Telephone Days,' refers to a great variety of influences on his invention: music, acoustic and electrical sciences, the study and education of language, speaking automata, phonautograph. The greatest influence came from his family, particularly from his father. Graham's grandfather, Alexander Bell, was 'an elocutionist and a corrector of defective speech.'⁵³ It became a family profession, and Graham's father, Alexander Melville Bell, pursued the same profession. Notably, in studying the mechanism of human speech production, Melville Bell invented a system of phonetic symbols called 'visible speech.'

Some leading philologists, looking for an appropriate system of phonetic symbols, paid attention to Melville Bell's work. Henry Sweet, the foremost phonetician of the day, while, with characteristic disdain, calling Pitman's phonetic alphabet the 'Pitfall system,' adopted Melville Bell's 'visible speech' in his publications of the late 1880.⁵⁴ James Murray was also greatly impressed by the phonetic notation system of Graham's father, 'one of the first men [...] to make a scientific study of phonetics' in Britain. Melville Bell introduced Murray to

Alexander John Ellis, the former collaborator with Pitman in 'Fonotypy,' who had also made use of Bell's system.⁵⁵ Graham Bell, in his essay, mentions the names of many contemporary illustrious philologists, whom he got to know through his father. Interestingly, some of them also enlightened the young Graham Bell in acoustic and electrical sciences. Ellis, for example, told him about the acoustic and electrical discovery of Helmholtz, when the aurally-sensitive eighteen-year old boy communicated to him 'my discovery that in uttering the vowel elements of speech faint musical tones could be heard accompanying the sound of the voice.'⁵⁶

The young Graham's involvement with his father's phonetic symbols was considerable. He worked as an assistant at the demonstrations of his father's phonetic notation system. The job of the assistant consisted of reproducing from the phonetic symbols written down by his father the sounds uttered by volunteers from the audience. He was able to reproduce for the notations all sorts of sounds ranging from the noise of sawing wood given by an amateur ventriloquist to the difficult Sanscrit sound called the 'Sanscrit cerebral T' given by a professor of Hindustani.⁵⁷ As Steven Connor notes, the role of the assistant, in other words, was to serve as something like a human phonograph.⁵⁸

Graham Bell the 'Melocentric' Oralist

Following a passage describing these demonstrations, Graham Bell writes:

Such incidents as these led my father to predict that persons who were born deaf might, through the use of his symbols, be taught to use their vocal organs and speak, instead of being limited in their means of communication to gestures, finger-spelling, or writing.⁵⁹

This is exactly the job Graham Bell took up: the teaching of speech to the deaf. He devoted himself to it; it became his lifework.

And he became a passionate oralist in his approach to the language education for the deaf, vehemently rejecting the teaching of sign language to them. The oralist approach thrived in the late nineteenth century. As Avital Ronell suggests, the ‘melocentric’ premise underlies the oralism, which prioritizes voice over other modes of expression because the voice’s link to human spirituality is generally assumed in this approach.⁶⁰ Jonathan Rée’s description of the opening of an oral school in 1867 is typical and relevant here:

In 1867, the Reverend Thomas Arnold opened a pure oral school in Northampton, England. He believed that spiritual and intellectual development depended on spoken language, and considered that gestures could express only the ‘commonest physical wants.’ The voice, after all, made use of air and sound—‘the former necessary to life and the latter the least material of qualities’—and consequently it had ‘more than a chance relation to thought.’⁶¹

Bell's 'melocentric' hobby, his passion for music, may also have some bearing on his adoption of the oralist stance. The young Graham was something of a Romantic musical genius:

Music could flood his mind like wine, keeping him sleepless and intoxicated through the night and leaving him with a headache in the morning. Snatches of melody would ring in his mind for days. His mother came to call such seizures his 'musical fever.'⁶²

He was an accomplished pianist, desiring to become a professional musician and having lessons with a leading pianist of the day. His enthusiasm for music and piano no doubt contributed to his later explorations of acoustics, harmonic telegraph, telephone, phonograph.

Graham Bell and Aural-Oral Devices:

Teaching the Deaf-Mute, and Metal, To Speak

In Graham Bell, the 'melocentric' teaching of speech for the deaf, as well as the 'melocentric' phonetic spelling and his musicality, is therefore connected with his experimenting in pre-phonographic voice-related machines. In 'Prehistoric Telephone Days,' he continues thus:

In connection with this work [the teaching of speech to the deaf], I took up the study of the nature of the vibrations going on in the air during the utterance of speech with the object of developing an apparatus that would enable my deaf pupils to see and recognize the forms of vibration

characteristic of the various elements of speech. Various instruments were devised employing loaded stretched membranes, all based upon the well-known phonautograph of Leon Scott; and these experiments paved the way for the appearance of the first membrane telephone, the ancestor of all the telephones of today.⁶³

Notably, the phonautograph, which uses a membrane to turn sound into visible forms, is one of the immediate ancestors of the phonograph, which, using a diaphragm, employs a very similar method in inscribing sound. Graham Bell's involvement with his father's phonetic symbols thus directed him in more than way towards the invention of phonograph.

Melville Bell's 'visible speech' influenced his son in yet another way. The young Graham's joint attempt with his brother to make a speaking automaton was fondly remembered in the essay. His early interest in it reminds one of the fact that the phonograph in its very early days had little to distinguish itself from popular entertainment such as speaking dolls. The device was demonstrated and was received by the audience as if it were a form of popular entertainment. Curiously, the young Graham's interest in speaking automata was first aroused by a historically famous speaking doll, Baron von Kempelen's automaton. Charles Wheatstone, the authority on telegraphy and an experimenter in the transmission of sound, recreated the automaton based on Kempelen's book upon 'The Mechanism of Human Speech.' Graham Bell was taken by his father to a demonstration of this doll,

and was greatly impressed. He, then, started, with his brother, an attempt to construct a speaking automaton himself.

It is significant that Melville Bell encouraged his sons to make a reproduction of the human vocal organs, instead of a mere speaking toy. This advice of his is important because it is closely related to the nature of his phonetic notation system; visible speech is a system of phonetic symbols based on the knowledge of the physical mechanism of human speech, that is, of the vocal organs. His son succinctly explains that the 'letters' of visible speech are 'symbolic representations of the organs of speech and of the way in which they were put together.'⁶⁴ What the symbols of visible speech do, therefore, is to give directions as to how to move your vocal organs. In other words, it makes its user act like an automaton that speaks as intended, like a phonograph that talks according to its inscribed markings. And Graham Bell taught the deaf students how to speak, using his father's phonetic symbols. The making of the talking machine and the oralist education of the deaf converge here. Naturally, he said: 'If I can make a deaf-mute talk, I can make metal talk.'⁶⁵

Phonograph, *The Phonograph*, 'Phonography'

In concluding the discussion of phonograph and 'phonography,' let us look at yet another episode, which sheds a further light on the relationship between them. Two years after the invention of the phonograph, a journal titled *The Phonograph* was started. It was, however, a journal of shorthand, written throughout in shorthand,

except the title and the contents. That the editors of the journal were highly aware of the recent aural-oral invention by Edison is indicated not only by the title but also by an illustration of Edison's phonograph on the title page. As well as showing the impact of the invention, it points to a wide contemporary recognition of a structural similarity between phonograph and 'phonography.'

The title of the last article of each issue is suggestive: 'Scratching on the Tinfoil.' Early books on the phonograph are often attentive to those mysterious markings on the tinfoil wrapped around the cylinder, and occasionally give an illustration of them.⁶⁶ The shorthand symbols in the journal, unintelligible to the reader not versed in the art, look somewhat like real scratchings on the tinfoil. At least, there is a parallelism in structure between the two media: in both, sound is registered in markings unintelligible to ordinary people. The recorded sound is retrieved by the machine in the phonograph and by the man in 'phonography'; that is the only difference.

As has been shown, the connections between phonograph and 'phonography' are manifold. They both comprise part of the large nineteenth-century movement of aural-oral science and technology, with much part of it underpinned by the 'melocentric' aesthetico-linguistic assumption; their interrelationship are particularly evident in the contemporary movement of phonetic spelling and symbols. That is the context in which the phono-texts are juxtaposed in Bram Stoker's novel.

Mina's Telepathic Voice

The other mysterious voice, Mina's telepathic voice, appears late in the novel. The exchange of blood that Dracula has forced on Mina during his raid upon the mental hospital, called by Van Helsing 'The Vampire's baptism of blood,' has given Mina a special ability to read Dracula's mind by means of telepathy. This is how it is done: Van Helsing hypnotizes Mina and puts questions to her; in answering them, the subconscious and telepathic Mina describes what Dracula is experiencing. Mina's answers come in a voice of aurally distinctive character. Importantly, that voice is similar to the tone in which she reads shorthand notes, indicating their 'melocentric' connection. The information given, too, is predominantly aural-oral:

On the instant the Professor spoke again:—

'Where are you now?' The answer came dreamily, but with intention; it were as though she were interpreting something. I have heard her use the same tone when reading her shorthand notes.

'I do not know. It is all strange to me!'

'What do you see?'

'I can see nothing; it is all dark.'

'What do you hear?' I could detect the strain in the Professor's patient voice.

'The lapping of water. It is gurgling by, and little waves leap. I can hear them on the outside.'

'Then you are on a ship?' We all looked at each other, trying to glean

something each from the other. We were afraid to think. The answer came quick:—

‘Oh, yes!’

‘What else do you hear?’

‘The sound of men stamping overhead as they run about. There is the creaking of a chain, and the loud tinkle as the check of the capstan falls into the ratchet.’

‘What are you doing?’

‘I’m still—oh, so still. It is like death!’ The voice faded away into a deep breath as of one sleeping, and the open eyes closed again. (370-371)

It is also notable that Mina’s telepathic voice appears after the destruction of the phono-texts. Given the continuity between Mina’s shorthand and her telepathic voice indicated in the quoted passage, the voice of telepathy can be seen as taking the place of the earlier phono-texts.

The telepathic voice also takes over one vitally important element from the phono-texts: the information war centring on aural-oral knowledge. The initial aim of the exchange of blood between Dracula and Mina is for the vampire to gain the ability to control Mina by means of telepathy. As Mina reads Dracula’s mind, so does Dracula read hers. Based upon the information thus acquired about the location of his enemies, the vampire tries to escape them by changing the port of disembarkation. However, he is outdone by Mina. She reads the record of her own telepathic voice and, helped by aural clues in it—the

lowing of cows, the creaking of wood and the swirling of water level with her ears—rightly guesses the route Dracula takes in the journey back to his castle. This leads to the victory of the anti-vampiric group. It is the side which wins the aural-oral information war that finally wins the battle.

In view of Stoker's enthusiasm about new technological devices (apart from the phonograph and the typewriter, Kodak is also mentioned; Stoker is one of the first writers to have written on a typewriter), the significance of Mina's telepathic voice can also be related to ~~the~~ contemporary technological history, specifically to the pre-history of wireless. The idea of the vampire novel was first conceived by the author in 1890; the corrected proofs were submitted to the publisher in May 1897; the book was published the next month.

The 1890s is also the period of the gestation of wireless transmission. Although attempts to transmit information without wires were made throughout the century, the modern form of wireless using electromagnetic waves is based on the successful experiment in the production of such waves by Heinrich Hertz in the late 1880s. In the early 1890s, the possibility of electromagnetic wireless transmission was talked about and attempts were made for its realization.

An 1892 article in *The Fortnightly Review*, 'Some Possibilities of Electricity,' by a noted scientist, William Crookes, one of the first writings to predict the future of wireless telecommunication, demonstrates an interesting convergence of the occult and the

technological. It is true that, be it telephone, phonograph or other inventions, instances of the convergence of this sort abound in this period; but this example is particularly interesting because the theory of electromagnetic waves is applied by a renowned physicist to the possibility of thought transference, in an article meant for the general readership. In the article, Crookes first mentions his successful, though in a limited degree, experiment in wireless transmission, and then moves on to discuss the telepathic implications of it:

In some parts of the human brain may lurk an organ capable of transmitting and receiving other electrical rays of wave-lengths hitherto undetected by instrumental means. These may be instrumental in transmitting thought from one brain to another. In such a way the recognised cases of thought transference, and the many instances of 'coincidence' would be explicable.⁶⁷

Mina's telepathic communication in the techno-conscious vampiric novel can be considered as part of these expectations regarding wireless evident in the early 90s. Stoker could have gone further, drawing upon an article like Crookes' and creating some fictional wireless machine in *Dracula*; but he did not. This was perhaps because he was not a writer of scientific romance like H.G.Wells who drew upon, and developed, the potentiality of the latest knowledge, but the kind of writer who, as illustrated by the vampire novel, took an interest in, and made use of, technological devices that had already come into being and were, at least, to some extent, known to the public.

Important in this connection is the fact that wireless appeared to the eye of the public simultaneously with *Dracula*. In other words, the actual writing of the novel slightly precedes the public recognition of the Marconi apparatus. The period around 1897, the year of the completion and publication of *Dracula*, is vitally important in the history of wireless in a number of ways. On 12 December 1896, less than three weeks before the start of 1897, the lecture on, and the demonstration of, wireless by William Preece and Guglielmo Marconi made 'something of a sensation and the next day Marconi awoke to find himself headline news.'⁶⁸ J.J.Fahie, a contemporary witness of the development of wireless and the author of what is probably the first substantial history of wireless, sees the early part of 1897 as a crucial period when it started drawing wide attention. He cites two instances: a lecture on Submarine Telegraphy by Professor Ayrton of the Imperial Institute (15 February), in which the birth and growth of wireless telecommunication is predicted; and a debate in the House of Commons (2 April) concerning the government's policy on the telephone, in which, to quote from *the Times* of the next day, 'Mr. E. Lawrence (Cornwall, Truro) said the Post Office would not be justified in undertaking a large expenditure in the direction indicated [the improvement of telephone], because there would be soon before the public a new system of telephony without any connecting wires whatever.'⁶⁹

There are other instances indicating the rise to fame of the young Irish-Italian who had just arrived in Britain the year before. The patent on his wireless was accepted on 2 July and a company with the

aim of commercially developing Marconi's wireless was founded on the twentieth of the same month. At the turn of the same year, Oliver Lodge gave a Christmas course of lectures for a juvenile audience; the subject was 'The Principles of the Electric Telegraph.' Lodge was one of the scientists who had resented, with some justice, the Press' coverage of Marconi as the inventor of wireless. But even he, in the last lecture in the series (8 January 1898), though briefly and rather dismissively, had to mention Marconi and wireless; this also points to the beginning of the public acceptance of the Irish-Italian inventor and his apparatus.

Fahie, in his history of wireless, mentions various terms then given to the invention. However, it seems that the term 'wireless' was gaining acceptance around 1897. The first instance of the word in the *O.E.D.* dates from 1894; but the second one, 1897. And it is in the latter half of the year that the word started appearing in *The Times*. For instance, the subject of William Preece and Marconi's joint lecture and demonstration on 10 June of the year was still called 'telegraphy without wires.'⁷⁰

In view of the aural-oral continuity in the novel running from 'phonography' to phonograph to the telepathic voice, if Stoker had written *Dracula* a few years later, he might have incorporated into it some elements from the now widely known state-of-the-art technology of wireless. The task, however, was left to another writer and technology enthusiast, Rudyard Kipling, who was to write one of his most intriguing stories, "Wireless", a few years later.

Conclusion

The most significant difference between the disembodied voice in *Dracula* and its counterparts in *Heart of Darkness* and *Salomé* is the presence of the new technology of the phonograph in the former, where it, in combination with Pitman's 'phonography,' functions as a tool for Stoker's complex narrative strategy. His voice-related strategy, like that of Wilde, is concerned with the intimation of homosexuality, and is affected by the homosexual panic caused by the Wilde scandal. Like that of Conrad, the voice in Stoker's narrative also connects with the *fin-de-siècle* imperial situation. Stoker's relation to the British Empire is complex, owing to his Anglo-Irish identity; still, it is possible to see in the vampire novel a reflection of the significance of the aural-oral knowledge in the international information war. As in Conrad and Wilde, we have also looked at traces of the 'melocentric' tradition that underpins Stoker's concern with the disembodied voice. What distinguishes Stoker's 'melocentric' trait from those of the other two contemporaries is the greater prominence of the linguistic-philological side of the proto-Romantic aesthetico-linguistic valorization of the aural-oral. All of these factors recur in Kipling's fiction, but our focus in the next chapter will be on the technological and the political implications, and on the question of an alternative subjectivity related to the question of voice.

NOTES

-
- ¹ Johanna Drucker, *The Alphabetic Labyrinth: The Letters in History and Imagination* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1995), p.249.
- ² Quoted in Alfred Baker, *The Life of Sir Isaac Pitman* (n.p.: Sir I. Pitman & Sons, 1930), p.52.
- ³ Bram Stoker, *Dracula*, in *The Essential Dracula*, ed. by Leonard Wolf (London: Plume, 1993), pp.1-445 (p.96). Further references to this edition are given in the text.
- ⁴ Bram Stoker, 'The Crystal Cup,' in *Shades of Dracula: Bram Stoker's Uncollected Stories*, ed. by Peter Haining (London: William Kimber, 1982), pp.14-28 (pp.24 and 27).
- ⁵ Barbara Belford, *Bram Stoker: A Biography of the Author of Dracula* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1996), p.220.
- ⁶ Quoted in Peter Haining and Peter Tremayne, *The Un-Dead: the Legend of Bram Stoker and Dracula* (London: Constable, 1997), p.33.
- ⁷ Bram Stoker, 'Bram Stoker's Correspondence with Walt Whitman,' in his *Dracula*, ed. by Maurice Hindle (London: Penguin, 1993), pp.487-497 (p.490).
- ⁸ Stoker, 'Bram Stoker's Correspondence with Walt Whitman,' p.492.
- ⁹ Stoker, 'Bram Stoker's Correspondence with Walt Whitman,' p.490.
- ¹⁰ Talia Schaffer, "A Wilde Desire Took Me": The Homoerotic History of *Dracula*, *ELH*, 61 (1994), 381-425 (p.383).
- ¹¹ Stoker, 'Bram Stoker's Correspondence with Walt Whitman,' p.496.
- ¹² Stoker, 'Bram Stoker's Correspondence with Walt Whitman,' p.491.
- ¹³ Bram Stoker, *Personal Reminiscences of Henry Irving*, 2 vols (London: Heinemann, 1906), I, 30-33.
- ¹⁴ Stoker, *Reminiscences*, I, 30.
- ¹⁵ Stoker, *Reminiscences*, I, 31 and 33.

¹⁶ Thomas Hood, 'The Dream of Eugene Aram,' in *The Works of Thomas Hood*, ed. by His Son and Daughter, 11 vols (London: Ward, Lock & Co., n.d.), VI, 435-456 (pp.452 and 455).

¹⁷ Hood, p.449.

¹⁸ Belford, p.77.

¹⁹ Harry Ludlam, *A Biography of Dracula: The Life Story of Bram Stoker* (London: Foulsham, 1962), p.14.

²⁰ Belford, p.16.

²¹ Haining and Tremayne, pp.60 and 68-79.

²² See Schaffer; Paul Hammond, *Love Between Men in English Literature* (London: Macmillan, 1996), pp.131-133; and Christopher Craft, *Another Kind of Love: Male Homosexual Desire in English Discourse 1850-1920* (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1994), pp.71-105.

²³ Quoted in Christopher Frayling, *Vampyres: Lord Byron to Count Dracula* (London: Faber & Faber, 1991), p.301.

²⁴ Frayling, p.301.

²⁵ Stoker, *Reminiscences*, I, 200, 219, 352 and 359.

²⁶ Invisibility is also relevant to the way in which Dracula appears in the scene of the female vampiric attack: the Count comes onto the scene invisible to Harker because the latter's eyes are closed then. *vampires were reflecting* }

²⁷ Bram Stoker, *The Snake's Pass* (Dingle: Brandon, 1990), pp.45-46.

Further references to this edition are given in the text.

²⁸ Stoker, *Reminiscences*, I, 30

²⁹ Stoker, 'Correspondence with Walt Whitman,' p.492.

³⁰ Schaffer, p.398.

³¹ The political implication of oral information in Kipling will be discussed in the next chapter

³² Burton Hatlen, 'The Return of the Repressed/Oppressed in Bram Stoker's *Dracula*, in *Dracula: The Vampire and the Critics*, ed. by Margaret L. Carter (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1988), pp.117-136. The studies of this type are these: Richard Wasson, 'The Politics of *Dracula*,' *English Literature in Transition*, 9 (1966), 24-27; and Carol A. Senf, '*Dracula*: The Unseen Face in the Mirror,' in *Dracula: The Vampire and the Critics*, pp.93-104.

³³ The studies of this type are these: Stephen D. Arata, 'The Occidental Tourist: *Dracula* and the Anxiety of Reverse Colonization,' *Victorian Studies*, 33 (1990), 621-645; Hiromasa Yachida, 'Kyofu no Shujigaku (Part I),' *Gendai Shiso*, 22-8 (1994), 232-248; Hiromasa Yachida, 'Kyofu no Shujigaku (Part II),' *Gendai Shiso*, 22-9 (1994), 247-255; Hiromasa Yachida, 'Kyofu no Shujigaku (Part III),' *Gendai Shiso*, 22-10 (1994), 330-345; and Ai Tanji, *Dracula no Seikimatsu* (Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku, 1997). These studies by Yachida and Tanji discuss the question of *fin-de-siècle* xenophobia in Britain, particularly of the late nineteenth-century Jewish immigration from the Eastern Europe.

³⁴ The one thing that seems to have been neglected is the significance of a German city, Munich, mentioned in Stoker's working notes for the novel: Harker's experience in and around the city was to have been detailed in the novel but was later excised. In the original plan for the novel, it was in Germany that Harker had the first encounter with a vampire. It is possible to note in it the threat of the rising political and military power on the continent.

³⁵ Arata, 640.

³⁶ Arata, 634.

³⁷ This is yet another instance suggesting the closeness between voice and biting in Stoker.

³⁸ Unlike Harker, both Kurtz and Kim have complete command of the vernaculars, which make them figures of particular significance for the Western colonial imagination.

³⁹ Arata, 633.

⁴⁰ Arata, 634.

⁴¹ Haining and Tremayne, pp.145-159.

⁴² Haining and Tremayne, p.71.

⁴³ Steven Connor, 'The Modern Auditory I,' in *Rewriting the Self*, ed. by Roy Porter (London: Routledge, 1997), pp.203-223.

⁴⁴ Richard W. Bailey, *Images of English: A Cultural History of the Language* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1992), p.180.

⁴⁵ Baily, p.199.

⁴⁶ A.H.Sayce, 'A Word on Spelling Reform,' *The Spelling Reformer*, 1 (1880-1881), 7-8 (p.8). Interestingly, Ellis had edited a different journal of the same title before.

⁴⁷ J.A.H.Murray, 'Ninth Annual Address of the President to the Philological Society,' in *Transactions of the Philological Society 1880-1* (London: Trübner, 1881), pp.117-176 (p.140).

⁴⁸ Alexander J. Ellis, 'Tenth Annual Address of the President to the Philological Society,' in *Transactions of the Philological Society 1880-1* (London: Trübner, 1881), pp.252-321.

⁴⁹ See Baily, p.199; and Kenneth Cmiel, *Democratic Eloquence: The Fight over Popular Speech in Nineteenth-Century America* (New York: William Morrow, 1990), pp. 158 and 304.

⁵⁰ Quoted in Robert V. Bruce, *Bell: Alexander Graham Bell and the Conquest of Solitude* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1973), p.252. Bell's father-in-law, Gardiner G. Hubbard was one of the original stockholders in the Edison Speaking Phonograph Company.

-
- ⁵¹ Matthew Josephson, *Edison* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1959), pp.146, 149 and 152; and Roland Gelatt, *The Fabulous Phonograph: The Story of the Gramophone from Tin Foil to High Fidelity* (London: Cassell, 1956), p.15
- ⁵² See Gelatt, pp.14-17 and 235.
- ⁵³ Alexander Graham Bell, 'Prehistoric Telephone Days,' *The National Geographic Magazine*, 41-3 (March 1922), 223-241 (p.223).
- ⁵⁴ Drucker, pp.257-258.
- ⁵⁵ K. M. Elisabeth Murray, *Caught in the Web of Words: James Murray and the Oxford English Dictionary* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1977), pp.49-50 and 73-74.
- ⁵⁶ Graham Bell, p.232. Ellis later translated Helmholtz's *On the Sensations of Tone As a Physiological Basis for the Theory of Music*.
- ⁵⁷ Graham Bell, pp.228-229.
- ⁵⁸ See Steven Connor, *Dumbstruck: A Cultural History of Ventriloquism* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2000), p.349; I have also noted the parallelism between the young Bell and a phonograph in my earlier article: see Hiroshi Muto, 'Dracula to Koe no Seikimatsu,' *Eigo Seinen*, 144-10 (January 1999), 600-604 (p.604).
- ⁵⁹ Graham Bell, p.229.
- ⁶⁰ Avital Ronell, *The Telephone Book: Technology, Schizophrenia, Electric Speech* (Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1989), pp.445-446; and Jonathan Rée, *I See A Voice: A Philosophical History of Language, Deafness and the Senses* (London: Harper Collins, 1999), p.10.
- ⁶¹ Rée, p.225.
- ⁶² Bruce, p.22.
- ⁶³ Graham Bell, p.229.
- ⁶⁴ Graham Bell, p.228. Bell then gives an example of visible speech,

which helps us understand how it works:

For example, let me give you an illustration. The symbol for what we would call the letter M consisted of a curve forming the outline of a human lip, combined with another symbol meaning that the two lips were shut together. Then there was a third symbol, indicating the vibration of the vocal chords in forming voice; and still a fourth, showing that the soft palate was depressed so as to open the entrance into the nasal passages.

These four symbols were combined into a single character reminding one of some strange letter in a foreign language; but, unlike any such letter, it was not necessary for you to hear the sound in order to reproduce it.

The symbol could be analyzed into a direction to do something to do with the mouth, and if you followed the direction you uttered the sound, even though you had never heard it before.

The symbol for M could thus be translated into a direction to 'shut your lips and pass voice through the nose.' Now you will see, if you shut your lips and pass voice through the nose, you get one sound only, the sound of the letter M. (228)

⁶⁵ Quoted in Alvin F. Harlow, *Old Wires and New Waves: The History of the Telegraph, Telephone, and Wireless* (New York: D.Appleton-Century, 1936), p.353. A genealogy of the telephone is told by Avital Ronell in a way somewhat similar to our genealogy of the phonograph; see Ronell, pp.302-349 and 389-402.

⁶⁶ Count Du Moncel, *The Telephone, the Microphone & the Phonograph* (London: Kegan Paul, 1879), pp.329-332; George B. Prescott, *The Speaking Telephone, Talking Phonograph and Other Novelties* (New York: D.Appleton, 1878), pp.294-303; *All About the Telephone and Phonograph* (London: Ward, Lock and Co., n.d.), pp.91-95.

⁶⁷ William Crookes, 'Some Possibilities of Electricity,' *The Fortnightly Review*, 51 (Jan-June 1892), 173-181 (p.176).

⁶⁸ W.J.Baker, *A History of the Marconi Company* (London: Methuen,

1970), p.29.

⁶⁹ J.J.Fahie, *A History of Wireless Telegraphy* (Edinburgh; Blackwood, 1899), pp.vii-viii; 'The Telephone Service,' *The Times*, 3 April 1897, p.9, col.f.

⁷⁰ 'Telegraphy Without Wires,' *The Times*, 11 June 1897, p.6, col.c.

Two Techno-Gothic Voices:
Kipling's Art of Concealment

Kipling's Techno-Voice and the Concealment of the Political

In this chapter, we will consider the two kinds of technological bodiless voices, phonographic and wireless. We will start by looking at disembodied voices including the phonographic one in *Kim*, and then scrutinize the 'wireless' voice in the story entitled "Wireless." It will be shown that, as in Bram Stoker's vampiric novel, political, sexual and technological factors are involved with the disembodied voice in Kipling, but in different ways. It is the homosexuality that is the most concealed, or the most obliquely expressed, in *Dracula*, whereas, in *Kim* and "Wireless," the political is the most hidden or underplayed factor in relation to the technological disembodied voice. Kipling's tendency to conceal or de-emphasize the potential political danger involved in voice and technology plays a decisive role in his works. Also important is his inclination in these works to displace the political element onto the sexual and the occult-private planes. Because of Kiplingesque subterfuges, obfuscations and concealments, we will need to explore the political implications of the technological disembodied voice in a rather roundabout way.

The Occult, the Sexual, and the Question
Of the Alternative Aural-Oral Subjectivity

However, we are not saying that all the sexual and occult elements

are a mere disguise for contemporary political factors in Kipling. Rather, the sexual and the occult need to be considered in themselves as well as in immediately political terms. Consequently, after we have puzzled out the *fin-de-siècle* political significance of the technological disembodied voice, we will examine the Kiplingesque bodiless voice in relation to the anti-rational alternative subjectivity in Western modernity, as well as briefly looking at its counterparts in the other *fin-de-siècle* writers considered here.

Before moving on to a close examination of Kipling's two works, it is important to note how they can be taken as belonging to the *fin de siècle*. In terms of publication date, *Kim* mostly belongs to the twentieth century, although its serialization started in the last month of the nineteenth century. "Wireless", too, was first published in 1902 and, in book form, in 1904. However, both *Kim* and "Wireless" are *fin-de-siècle* works by virtue of their late nineteenth-century settings, and we will show, by the end of the chapter, how "Wireless" is in fact a transitional work bridging the two centuries in its treatment of technological disembodied voice.¹

The Phonographic Disembodied Voice in *Kim*

In the chapter on Conrad, we have already discussed *Kim*, though briefly, in examining the dual nature of Kurtz's 'complete knowledge,' that is, the secular knowledge of the non-West, conducive to the maintenance of the Empire, and the ultimate knowledge, or wisdom, imagined to be found outside the West. Disembodied voices in

chapters nine and ten of *Kim* are likewise concerned with the two kinds of knowledge: secular-political knowledge and knowledge of a more private and occult nature.

In chapter nine, Kim goes to the place of Lurgan Sahib, a merchant of a mysterious origin in Simla, who tests and trains him as a prospective spy. The importance of aurality and invisibility is already discernible in the beginning of this chapter, when Kim walks through 'the mysterious dusk, full of the noises of a city.' The first trial Lurgan gives Kim involves a phonographic disembodied voice. Upon meeting him, Lurgan abruptly leaves Kim in a dark room where he is expected to spend the first night with a Hindu boy. The puzzled Kim first hears a mysterious voice from behind. Then, a phonographic voice annoys him throughout the night:

That was no cheerful night; the room being overfull of voices and music. Kim was waked twice by someone calling his name. The second time he set out in search, and ended by bruising his nose against a box that certainly spoke with a human tongue, but in no sort of human accent. It seemed to end in a tin trumpet and to be joined by wires to a smaller box on the floor—so far, at least, as he could judge by touch. And the voice, very hard and whirring, came out of the trumpet. [...] The trumpet-box was pouring out a string of the most elaborate abuse that even Kim had ever heard, in a high uninterested voice, that for a moment lifted the short hairs of his neck. When the vile thing drew breath, Kim was reassured by the soft, sewing-machine-like whirr.

'*Chûp!* [Be still]' he cried, and again he heard a chuckle that decided him.
'*Chûp*—or I break your neck.'

The box took no heed. Kim wrenched at the tin trumpet and something lifted with a click. He had evidently raised a lid. If there were a devil inside, now was its time, for—he sniffed—thus did the sewing-machines of the bazar smell. He would clean that *shaitan*. He slipped off his jacket, and plunged it into the box's mouth. Something long and round bent under the pressure, there was a whirr and the voice stopped—as voices must if you ram a thrice-doubled coat on to the wax cylinder and into the works of an expensive phonograph. Kim finished his slumbers with a serene mind.²

Perhaps 'the most elaborate abuse that even Kim had ever heard' is a sign that something normally unutterable, beyond the scope of the discourse of reason and decency, is at stake here. But what this something is would remain a mystery as long as the passage is examined in itself. In order to explore the apparently obscure function of the phonographic voice, we need to consider the context in which the passage above is placed; several points deserve mentioning in this connection. First, as it comprises part of the spy test and training, the passage with the disembodied techno-voice happens in a basically political context. Secondly, since Kim grows into manhood through the experiences that are described in chapters nine and ten, the voice can also be construed as part of a mysterious means of his initiation into the condition of a grown man, with Lurgan acting as a father-figure. Thirdly, latent homosexuality is suggested in the

depiction in the chapter of the relationships between Kim, Lurgan and the Hindu boy, in which the Hindu boy becomes madly jealous of Lurgan and Kim, who has newly arrived. In short, the sexual and the private-occult factors are placed in an essentially political context, but with little explanation. The meaning of this combination of the sexual, the private-occult and the political is part of what we will aim to clarify in this chapter.

Other Disembodied Voices That Follow (1): Lurgan's Voice

This phonographic trial is followed by another, hypnotic one, the central episode of the chapter. The next day, Lurgan tries to hypnotize Kim to make him hallucinate, in order to see the strength of Kim's resistance to hypnosis; here, again, the sexual (homosexual feeling between Lurgan and Kim) and the occult (Lurgan's hypnotism and Kipling's hallucination) are placed in the political framework of the British Empire:

Lurgan Sahib laid one hand gently on the nape of his [Kim's] neck, stroked it twice or thrice, and whispered: 'Look! It [a broken jar] shall come to life again, piece by piece. First the big piece shall join itself to two others on the right and the left--on the right and left. Look!'

To save his life, Kim could not have turned his head. The light touch held him as in a vice, and his blood tingled pleasantly through him.' (206-207)

In spite of Lurgan's power, however, Kim in the end succeeded in resisting the hypnotism, which demonstrates Kim's aptitude as a spy.

Significantly, it is Lurgan's disembodied voice, the voice Kim hears from behind, together with the man's stroking, that exerts a magical power on the boy. We have seen instances of the combination of bodiless voice and touch implying homosexuality in Wilde and Stoker, and the voice and the touch in the scene can be taken in this vein. The way Kim's pleasure is depicted in the passage above is redolent of some of the descriptions of blood-sucking in *Dracula*. A similar homosexual suggestion can also be detected in Mahbub the Afghan horse dealer's physical handling of Kim in another sexually charged ritual in the following chapter.³

Also significant is the way Kim resists these vocal and tactile forces: by switching the language mode in his mind from Hindi to English and repeating the multiplication-table in English. The contest that occurs in the scene is, therefore, between the magical East, represented by the hypnotic voice and touch along with the vernacular language, and the rational West, represented by arithmetic and English. Later in the novel, Kim is to be highly valued for showing his inborn strong Western rationality in the trial (233). Still, elements of ambiguity and ambivalence abound in the scene. Kim is torn between resistance, and attraction, to the hypnotic voice and touch: 'his blood tingled pleasantly through him.' Lurgan is an enigmatic boundary figure, a sahib who yet does not speak like a sahib. Relatedly, Simla was then both the summer capital of British India and a mecca of

theosophy, the wisdom of the East.⁴ And Kim, even when he has established his identity as a British spy, continues to be drawn to the Tibetan lama. The Eastern voice uttered by the Anglo-Indian spy-trainer turns Kim into a pro-British subject politically, yet at the same time draws him to the esoteric Eastern knowledge of the individual. The split in him eventually leads Kim to an identity crisis in the part immediately after chapters nine and ten. In the beginning of chapter eleven, Kim is suddenly thrown into a doubt about his identity: "Now am I alone—all alone," he thought. "In all India is no one so alone as I! [...] Who is Kim—Kim—Kim?" (250-1). This crisis recurs through the rest of the novel. We can thus discern the Easternness of the voice and the text's ambivalent attitude toward it.

Other Disembodied Voices That Follow (2): Huneefa's Voice

In the chapter following that of the test and training of Lurgan Sahib, the disembodied voice is related to the description of Kim's sexuality in an occult atmosphere. In it, Kim is taken by Mahbub, a pro-British Afghan spy, to a seedy place, probably an opium den and brothel, and is helped by a shamanic woman there to disguise himself. Since Kim's disguises are inseparable from his intelligence activities, incidents in this chapter, both sexual and occult, as in the preceding one, can be said to take place in an essentially political framework. Yet it is not the political act of disguising but an occult, sexual ritual performed by the woman for Kim's sake that is minutely delineated here.

Kim's sexual growth is first indicated by 'the moustache that was just beginning,' then by the first remark made by the shamanic woman: 'He is very good to look upon' (231 and 240). And the place is significantly described as 'full of whisperings and whistlings and chirrupings' (240). At the start of the ritual, Kim is bowed to the floor by the hand of Mahbub, so Kim keeps hearing the shaman's bodiless voice for some time. Then, he collapses: 'Huneefa, [the shamanic woman] now whispering in his ear, now talking as from an immense distance, touched him with horrible soft fingers, but Mahbub's grip never shifted from his neck till, relaxing with a sigh, the boy lost his senses' (242). The only possible causes for his fainting are the hearing of the disembodied voice, sometimes ventriloquial, and the implicitly sexual handling of him by Huneefa and Mahbub. Furthermore, as the ritual goes on, the description comes even closer to that of intercourse: 'Huneefa's crisis passed, as these things must, in a paroxysm of howling, with a touch of froth at the lips. She lay spent and motionless beside Kim, and the crazy voices ceased' (243). As for Kim, 'about third *cockcrow* (my italics),' he wakes after a sleep of thousands of years (244): he is thus symbolically initiated into manhood, sexually, and by an occult means.

The Phonograph in *Kim*; the Phonograph in *Dracula*

The two chapters in question deal with Kim's growth as a British spy on the political level, but, as we have seen, the events in these chapters are mostly described in sexual and occult terms. And, even

compared with its counterpart in *Dracula*, the significance of the phonographic voice in *Kim* requires careful teasing out. For instance, we were able to link the phonographic voice in *Dracula* to contemporary political factors, such as the Eastern and the Irish questions. Likewise, we have shown that the same voice relates to *fin-de-siècle* gay culture. By contrast, *Kim* does not allow such a reading of the technological voice as a reflection of the age. It is true that, both in *Dracula* and *Kim*, the war between the East and the West is self-consciously an information war. But while the phonograph plays a key role as the container of secret and vital information in the war in Stoker's Gothic novel, the political function of the phonograph in Kipling's imperial novel is much less clear. Of course, it is possible to note some minor reflections of the period in the treatment of the phonograph in *Kim*. The difference in the representation of the phonograph between the two novels may partly be due to a shift in the use of the phonograph between 1897 (the year of the publication of *Dracula*) and 1901 (that of *Kim*) from the dictating machine to the instrument of musical reproduction, in spite of the fact that 1898 saw a development of a new type of phonographic dictating machine: Dr. Seward keeps a journal with it, while Lurgan sahib sells phonographs to rajahs as a curiosity.⁵ Also of possible relevance is a way Kipling had of juxtaposing modern Western and ancient Indian elements since his earliest works; the mixture, as David Faulkner suggests, is a symptom of the newly developed global space of the imperial period.⁶ Yet it still remains unclear why Kipling places the phonograph as a

conspicuous item in that scene of political significance in *Kim*; and its specific role will remain obscure, as long as one persists with an approach based on Lukacsean reflection theory.⁷ In order to puzzle out the hidden significance of *Kim*'s phonographic voice, we, therefore, need to make a detour by scrutinizing his "Wireless" and other technologically-related and voice-related writings.

The Concealment of the Political in "Wireless"

The treatment of the phonograph in *Kim* is similar to that of the technology of "Wireless" in the sense that its political significance is obscured while the esoteric-sexual element is foregrounded. "Wireless" is the story of a mysterious incident that occurs in a chemist's shop where an early experiment with wireless communication is being made. While the experiment goes on in an adjoining room, Mr. Shaynor, a young assistant at the apothecary's shop, falls into a trance and unconsciously starts reenacting what seems like the process of creating John Keats' 'The Eve of St. Agnes.' (Later, he moves on to reenact the making of another poem, 'Ode to an Nightingale.') The assistant is in a circumstance strikingly similar to that of the poet at the time of the composition of the poem. Like Keats, he is tubercular, and works at a chemist's; he is also obsessed with a sweetheart with a name similar to that of the girl Keats loved; and the bitter cold winter night when the incident occurs parallels the setting of the poem. Kipling's story leaves the real cause of the mystery unexplained, but a 'wireless' communication from the dead and a parallelism between two

forms of wireless communication, occult and technological, are suggested. As we will soon see, the wireless of Kipling's story is more aural-oral than textual. The story suggests that the wireless voice precedes the wireless text in order and importance. It is worth noting, in this connection, that the late nineteenth-century investigation into wireless communication is aural-oral in origin: it was accidental transmissions of voice between parallel telephone lines which started it. An attempt to transmit voice by means of electromagnetic waves was made as early as 1900.

Like the phonographic scene of *Kim*, "Wireless" highlights the occult-private and the sexual aspects in describing how what D. H. Lawrence calls 'the old stable ego' is shaken apart. On the other hand, the then political significance of wireless is played down: it is only briefly near the end of the story that a wireless experiment between two men-of-war simultaneously taking place is mentioned. Historically, however, the imperial-political aspect, in which the Royal Navy played a central part, was the most important element in the early history of wireless. As Rowland F. Pocock summarizes, 'the new system of radio telegraphy was adopted to meet the Empire-wide communications needs of the Royal Navy.'⁸ The men-of-war, marginalized in Kipling's story, therefore, represent the vital part of the development of wireless in Britain.⁹

In its 1887 and 1888 manoeuvres, the Royal Navy came to recognize the need for the development of a more efficient ship-to-ship communication system to replace flag signals and their electric version,

flashing light signals. Significantly, the problem emerged as a consequence of British imperial expansion and the increasing rivalry of other European Powers, which required good ship-to-ship communication in a large navy. The Franco-Russian alliance, represented by their 1894 signing of a formal military convention, posed a threat and helped create a call for a stronger navy in Britain. It is also important that British imperial supremacy was, in the mind of many Britons, associated with the strength of the Royal Navy.¹⁰

Notably, it was the captain of a torpedo boat which participated in the 1888 annual manoeuvres, a certain Henry Jackson, who would pioneer wireless experiments in Britain using electromagnetic waves. In about 1891, a few years after the recognition of the communication problem during these manoeuvres, he started to conceive the idea of using electromagnetic waves for signals. Perhaps, he read Alexander Pelham Trotter's suggestion for the use of Hertzian waves for wireless communication, published in the same year's *The Electrician*. Four years later, Jackson actually started experimenting, this time inspired by an essay on the coherer principle, published in the December 1895 issue of *The Electrician*. On 20 August the next year, he first succeeded in exchanging radio signals. On 31 August, he met Marconi, and recognized the superiority of the latter's apparatus. They 'thereafter co-operated closely in their researches.'¹¹ Eventually, on the advice of Jackson, the Royal Navy recognized Marconi's system as a solution to their communication problem in the period of imperial expansion. Although considerably delayed by the bureaucracy of the

civil service, the Marconi apparatuses which were loaned in the 1899 annual manoeuvres achieved great success, and the following year saw his wireless sets being delivered to the Royal Navy. There was an urgent need for them around the world; 'the world-wide commitments of the Fleet had increased considerably during 1899 and 1900, [...and] the new sets delivered from Marconi were immediately sent to ships and shore establishments throughout the Empire.'¹²

Kipling, known both for his interests in new technologies and in the Royal Navy, must have been aware of the political significance of wireless in the 1890s. Charles Carrington observes that Kipling's attention was first engaged by the radio communication system in his cruise with the Channel Fleet in 1898.¹³ Perhaps Kipling by then had already read of Marconi's sensational success in a public demonstration of his equipment in December 1896. He met Marconi in 1899 and talked about wireless, which later influenced his writing of "Wireless".¹⁴ Being a committed supporter of the Navy League, the most powerful pressure group for the expansion of the Royal Navy, Kipling was also part of the then influential movement for naval reinforcement. His reportage of the 1897 and 1898 manoeuvres, *A Fleet in Being*, contributed to the establishment in the mind of many Britons of the vital importance of the Royal Navy. Notably, the book, as well as being a eulogy of the Royal Navy and the bravery of its mariners, recognizes the importance of the signal system. In view of the significance of wireless for the expanding Empire and Kipling's awareness of it, it is clear that the political aspect of wireless is

underplayed in his "Wireless".'

The Foregrounding of the Occult and the Sexual

Foregrounded instead are topics of a more private nature, both occult and sexual. The occult side has some bearing on the history of wireless, too. Interestingly, as both Pocock and Jeffrey Sconce differently show, scientists involved in the development of radio communication tended also to concern themselves with psychic researches. We looked in the previous chapter at William Crookes' 1892 article on electromagnetic waves, which refers to the possibility of spiritual wireless communication. Among other well-known scientists deeply involved in wireless *and* spiritualism were Oliver Lodge, Nikola Tesla and Guglielmo Marconi.¹⁵ As was said in the chapter on Conrad, the then influential concept of ether, often supposed to be not only the medium for electromagnetic waves but the basis for matter, was also frequently considered to be endued with spiritual qualities. Clearly, a combination of the *fin-de-siècle* spiritualist vogue with the newly discovered Hertzian waves and the attractive concept of ether led these scientists to the grand ethereal hypothesis embracing both spirit and matter. That Kipling's wireless story comprises part of this trend is obvious.

The obliquely expressed yet intense sexuality in the story is also characteristic of the period around 1900, as is demonstrated also by Stoker's Gothic novel. For instance, the sexual charge suggested in the way Mr. Shaynor, the assistant, suddenly utters a passage from

Keats's poem in a state of trance is very similar to the implicit sexuality of some passages from *Dracula*. The following quotation shows how his ejaculation of the passage is, at the same time, a sexual ejaculation:

'And threw—and threw—and threw,' he [Shaynor] repeated, his face all sharp with some inexplicable agony.

I moved forward astonished. But it was then he found words—delivered roundly and clearly. These:—

'And threw warm gules on Madeleine's young breast.'

The trouble passed off his countenance, and he returned lightly to his place, rubbing his hands.¹⁶

Related to it is an emphasis on aural-orality, which is again shared by Kipling and Stoker. The young assistant's girl, who is a typical seductive *femme fatale* of the period, is described as having 'a singularly rich' voice and a 'significantly cut mouth.' That the teeth of the girl in a poster which enthralls Shaynor are emphasized also suggests the motif of the aural-oral vampiric *femme fatale*. In 1897, the year of the publication of *Dracula*, Kipling, too, wrote 'The Vampire,' a poem about *la belle dame sans merci*. Coughs heard throughout the story are also relevant here in terms of aural-orality. Besides, the reason why 'The Eve of St. Agnes' and 'Ode to a

Nightingale' of all Keats' poems are chosen for Kipling's story is probably that they are respectively the most sensual and the most aural of Keats' poems. *Fin-de-siècle* sexuality, linked to the motif of aural-oral, thus characterizes "Wireless".

The Phantasmagoric Spectacle
Of *Fin-de-siècle* Consumer Society

The most important of *fin-de-siècle* elements forming the background against which the story of the young assistant at the apothecary evolves is the spectacle of the visually-oriented consumer society, where the phantasmagoric inversion of reality by the modern form of advertisement using electric illumination and posters predominates.

The setting of the story, the apothecary's shop, plays an important role in creating the phantasmagoria of the *fin-de-siècle* art of advertisement. The wireless apparatus, with which a nephew of the chemist, Old Cashell, makes an experiment, is not the only technological device of the day at the shop, which is decorated with the newest method of display, electric light. The chemist believes in this technological means of attracting customers. And the importance of publicity is suggested from the first page of the story. In explaining about the previous experiment at a hotel where ladies in their baths were electrified, as well as the present one, Shaynor the assistant says: "The hotel wouldn't exactly advertise it, would it? [...] But, you see, he being the guvnor's nephew and all that (and it [the present

experiment] will be in the papers too), it doesn't matter how they electrify things in this house" (219).

Most important is the fact that the scene of the story is pervaded by the phantasmagoric sense of the pseudo-reality created by electric lights:

The shop, by the light of the many electrics, looked like a Paris-diamond mine, for Mr. Cashell believed in all the ritual of his craft. Three superb glass jars—red, green, and blue—of the sort that led Rosamund to parting with her shoes—blazed in the broad plate-glass windows. [...] Our electric lights, set low down in the windows before the tun-bellied Rosamund jars [the three glass jars], flung inward three monstrous daubs of red, blue, and green, that broke into kaleidoscopic lights on the faceted knobs of the drug-drawers, the cut-glass scent flacons, and the bulbs of the sparklet bottles. They flushed the white-tiled floor in gorgeous patches: splashed along the nickel-silver counter-rails, and turned the polished mahogany counter-panels to the likeness of intricate grained marbles—slabs of porphyry and malachite. (222 and 227)

The central item in this magic of illuminated illusions is a 'gold-framed toilet-water advertisement' (226), on which a seductive-looking girl in corset simpers with a string of pearl around her neck. Her charms, again, are 'unholily heightened' by the electric lights, by 'the glare from the red bottle [the red glass jar] in the window' (226). The assistant is obsessed with this girl in the advertisement, who distantly

resembles a girl he is in love with, though, to him, they are the one and same. Everything he sees seems to relate in his mind to the poster girl: even the bubbles of a drink the narrator has concocted reminds him of the pearls the picture girl wears (228). It is implied that he falls in love with the girl in the flesh because of his obsession with the picture girl on the ad. What happens is the precedence of the picture girl over the girl in the flesh, that is, the inversion of reality and its substitute. Significantly, this mock reality is created by two major elements of *fin-de-siècle* culture, electric lights and a modern form of advertisement of strongly visual orientation. There is also mention of pamphlets for patent medicines, which were being much promoted by this form of advertising at the time.

The olfactory element adds to the atmosphere of the apothecary's shop, although, in the final analysis, the olfactory serves the visual in the form of a pseudo-ritualistic application of incense for the advertisement. The smell of various items pervades the place, such as 'a confused smell of orris, Kodak films, vulcanite, tooth-powder, sachets, and almond-cream' (222). Or, 'the flavours of cardamoms and chloric-ether dispute those of the pastilles and a score of drugs and perfume and soap scents' (227).

The most important of those olfactory articles is 'Blaudett's Cathedral Pastilles.' The mystic alchemical sense is strong in the place. The chemist considers the compounder as a 'medicine-man' and believes in 'all the ritual of his craft,' that is, the kaleidoscopic effect produced by the electric illumination. The narrator concocts a 'new

and wildish drink' out of drugs. The assistant speaks about the romance of drugs, the Pharmaceutical Formulary, and Nicholas Culpepper, the seventeenth-century apothecary. In this atmosphere, the narrator sets light to the pastilles that smell 'very like incense,' for the sake of the consumptive assistant with a harrowing cough. Significantly, the narrator places the 'brown, gummy cones of benzoin' under the toilet-water advertisement and thus performs a mock mass for the picture girl. It is suggested that the same ritual is frequently carried out by the assistant himself for the girl who enthralls him. At the chemist's shop, modern forms of technology and advertisement merge with the quasi-mystical atmosphere of the place, thus creating the phantasmagoric, alchemical scene of inverted reality, where the picture precedes the original and the mock ritual with the mock incense is dedicated to that picture.

The sense of inversion is also reflected in the name of the eponymous device of the story itself; it, being 'wireless,' represents something lacking. The lack, in turn, represents reality and power, in this story. The lack being reality and power gives rise to the sense of the marvellous and mysterious. The experimenter, operating the transmitter, gives a shout: 'Grand, isn't it? *That's* the Power—our unknown Power—kicking and fighting to be let loose' (232). He also explains to the narrator thus: 'It's just It—what we call Electricity, but the magic—the manifestations—the Hertzian waves—are all revealed by *this*. The coherer [the vital part of the receiver], we call it' (224). The 'manifestations,' as well as the 'magic,' suggests the occult. The

smallness of the coherer is emphasized with descriptions of it being 'not much thicker than a thermometer in which, almost touching, were two tiny silver plugs, and between them an infinitesimal pinch of metallic dust' (224-5). The experimenter says: "That is the thing that will reveal to us the Powers" (225). Again, a lack (a lack of size, in this case) represents the real and powerful.

The Fragmenting of the Subject

Under the Laws of Influence and Correspondence

The inversion of reality destroys the validity of certain concepts. The precedence of the picture over the original, which we have just seen, annuls the pair of concepts, the original and the derivative/substitute. The logic of cause and effect is likewise replaced by the laws of influence and correspondence. Most importantly, the idea of the unified rational subject is nullified in the phantasmagoria of the story. In other words, against the background of the visual consumer society, the text's focus on the private-occult aspect leads to the fragmenting of the subject. The motif of the disembodied voice is also involved in the process.

In the alchemical atmosphere of the scene, the boundaries between persons and between persons and objects become blurred and their identities intermingle with each other. The following is a typical example.

'Hsh!' said Mr. Cashell [the experimenter] guardedly from the inner office.

as though in the presence of spirits. 'There's something coming through from somewhere; but it isn't Poole.' I heard the crackle of sparks as he depressed the keys of the transmitter. In my brain, too, something crackled, or it might have been the hair on my head. Then I heard my own voice, in a harsh whisper: 'Mr. Cashell, there is something coming through here, too. Leave me alone till I tell you. (233-4)

Three contexts (those of wireless, the narrator, and the assistant) intermingle here. Before this passage, the assistant's reenactment of Keats, which the narrator is witnessing, has already begun, and the narrator's remark in the final part of the quotation, 'there is something coming through here, too,' refers to that mysterious enactment which has the appearance of the manifestation of Keats' spirit. The words and the description of the experimenter at the outset, therefore, fuse the context of the wireless experiment and that of the séance-like reenactment (the resemblance between the experiment and the séance is noted at the end of the story.).

Then the narrator hears a crackle from the wireless equipment, followed by a 'crackle' in his own brain. That is, the narrator is now an apparatus for wireless communication. The sound of a crackle has appeared several times, describing the noise of the wireless transmission. The most significant moment is when the crackle leads to the reenactment of Keats, which starts aural-orally with Shaynor's mumbling of "and threw—and threw—and threw", a variation on the preceding depiction of the noise of the wireless equipment, "kick—

kick—kick” and ‘*kiss—kiss—kiss*,’ the latter of which also shares connotations of sexuality with the assistant’s first muttering. The crackle of the wireless leading to a crackle in one’s brain is, therefore, the pattern that applies to the assistant as well as the narrator. The boundary of identity between the narrator and the wireless device becomes blurred, as it has done earlier between the assistant and the wireless equipment. What is implied here, therefore, amounts to the intermingling of all the three, the wireless device, the narrator and the assistant.

Intriguingly, the passage allows of two different readings, depending on whether one takes it in itself or in the context of the whole story. The ‘something’ that the narrator says is ‘coming through,’ when taken realistically as part of the whole plot, refers to the assistant’s reenactment of Keats. However, if read independently, the passage suggests that it is to the narrator, instead of the assistant, that ‘something’ has come: the narrator hears a crackle in his brain, and says that ‘there is something coming through here.’ In other words, the above-quoted passage is written in a way that blurs the boundary between the assistant and the narrator, as well as that between the wireless equipment and the narrator.

Also worth attention as an indication of one of the correspondences between the two characters is the splitting of the narrator into two selves, which is suggested by the phrase ‘I heard my own voice’ here and is to be emphasized later in the story, when he consciously talks to his other self (234-5). The split selves are evident in the assistant, too.

He is not only split between his conscious and unconscious parts, the latter of which reenacts Keats (241), but also has trained himself to practise a kind of dual thinking so that he can study while serving customers:

'There's a way you get into,' he told me, 'of serving them carefully, and I hope, politely, without stopping your own thinking. I've been reading Christy's *New Commercial Plants* all this autumn, and that needs keeping your mind on it, I can tell you. So long as it isn't a prescription, of course, I can carry as much as half a page of Christy in my head, and at the same time I could sell out all that window twice over.' (221)

The assistant is both consciously and unconsciously a man of duality, as is the narrator.

The identities of four characters (the assistant, the narrator, the chemist, and the experimenter) intermingle in a variety of ways, with the assistant in a pivotal position. Attention to the idea of influence and the motif of coughing provides one way of looking at this question. The importance of the concept of influence in the story is obvious. The assistant is, apparently, under some influence when he reenacts Keats. The influence of the toilet-water advertisement upon him has already been mentioned; moreover, advertisement is essentially an art of influencing. Under the influence of electric lights, objects are transformed into something other than themselves, for example, the poster girl into reality, the mahogany counter-panels' into 'slabs of

porphyry and malachite' (227). The principle of wireless communication is also congenial to the concept of influence, in the sense that the term 'influence,' particularly in its astrological sense, implies some invisible flowing power that travels long distance. (The definition of the astrological 'influence,' which is etymologically central to the meaning of the word, in the *O.E.D.* is: 'The supposed flowing or streaming from the stars or heavens of an ethereal fluid acting upon the character and destiny of men.')

What is more, when considered together with the motif of coughing, the further implications of the idea of influence becomes clear.

The story begins in this way: "It's a funny thing, this Marconi business, isn't it?" said Mr. Shaynor, coughing heavily' (219). References to the wireless and the cough should be noted. The cough of the tubercular assistant is mentioned repeatedly and is important as a symptom of his disease, but he is not the only person in the story to cough. The chemist is heard to cough from a bed (228) because he is down with an influenza, which is prevalent in town; his nephew, the experimenter, coughs to attract attention (225); the crackles of the wireless transmitter can also be taken to be the mechanical counterpart of coughing, which, in turn, translates itself into a crackle in the narrator's brain in the above-quoted passage. The comparison made by the narrator of the tubercular bacillus in the assistant to the Hertzian wave used for wireless (236) corroborates such a reading. As the germ produces coughs in him, the Hertzian wave makes the instruments crackle. One can, therefore, also see, in the juxtaposition

of wireless and coughing in the description of Shaynor which starts the story, the correspondence between the wireless instruments and the assistant.

All the coughs are related to the idea of influence. The influences upon the assistant have been already mentioned. As for the chemist, who is down with a flu, the term 'influenza,' originally Italian, shares a common root with 'influence'; and it came to mean an epidemic because it was thought to be caused by the influence from the stars. Shaynor says that 'there's a great deal of influenza in town.' Considering the alchemical association of the chemist with a 'medicine-man,' who makes the shop a site of phantasmagoric mock ritual, using electric lights, the word 'influenza' in the assistant's remark should be read in the medieval, astrological sense of the word, as well as on a realistic level: a large amount of ethereal emanation from the stars is, to say the least, compatible with the mystery that happens. That another, related word in the story, 'ether,' also encourages such a dual reading further justifies our argument. It appears as 'chloric-ether,' the ingredient of the drink that is supposed to affect the assistant, but other meanings of the word are also relevant: 'the medium through which radio waves and electromagnetic radiations generally are propagated' (the *O.E.D.*, 5.a.); and 'wireless' (the *O.E.D.*, 5.c.).

The experimenter refers to the principle of induction as something central to wireless communication. The *O.E.D.* defines this technical meaning of the word 'induction' thus: 'the action of inducing or bringing about an electric or magnetic state in a body by the proximity (without

actual contact) of an electrified or magnetized body.' The experimenter explains: 'when a current of electricity passes through a wire there's a lot of magnetism present round that wire; and if you put another wire parallel to, and within what we call its magnetic field—why, then the second wire will also become charged with electricity' (229). An element of influence from one body to another is implied in these definitions. Moreover, 'influence' is simply another word, technically, for this meaning of 'induction': "Influence," 7. *Electri.=Induction 10'* (the *O.E.D.*). Importantly, the narrator, later in the story, also uses the law of induction/influence as a metaphor to explain to himself the cause of the mysterious reenactment of Keats. He also fears that his unconscious thought might be influencing the assistant in his reenactment of Keats (239).

Influences and correspondences pervade and control the story. Personality or individual identity is secondary to them. Their predominance indicates the primacy of relationality as the reigning logic in the narrative. The relationality as found in the story, however, is not of clear and straightforward character, but a nebulous multiple network of influences and correspondences intimated in the occult atmosphere. There, the demarcation between individual identities becomes blurred, and the concept of the unified subject nullified; persons and things intermingle and, as a result, get dispersed.

An inquiry into the nature of the mysterious reenactment would help one to understand another characteristic resulting from such a narrative structure: the lack of, or the failure to state, clear causal

relations. The cause of the mystery is left concealed or unstated: it is lost in the multiple, multi-layered network of possible influences and correspondences.

There are seven possible causes for the occurrence of the reenactment: (1) the similar circumstances in which Keats and the assistant find themselves: tuberculosis, being a druggist, a girlfriend with a similar name, the same weather; (2) the alluringly illuminated advertisement, which is the assistant's obsession; (3) the wireless experiment, which, at least symbolically, induces the reenactment; (4) the 'wildish' drink the narrator concocts and the assistant drinks, which causes the latter to fall unconscious; (5) the pastilles that the narrator burns under the advertisement for the assistant, transforming it into a sort of ritual dedicated to the poster girl; (6) electricity, which makes possible both the wireless communication and the phantasmagoric illumination, and to which an occult power was then often attributed, as by William Crookes; (7) the unconscious thought of the narrator who knows Keats' poems by heart, a knowledge which may be influencing the assistant's mind.

The narrator's interpretations of the event are not necessarily reliable. He, at one place in the story, wavers between (1) and (4): he thinks that, if Shaynor has read Keats, (4) is the cause; if not, it is (1). Later, he finds that the assistant does not know Keats. However, that does not necessarily lead to the exclusion of (4) as a possible cause, because it is not certain whether the narrator's premise is to be trusted or not. His reasoning is, in fact, clearly faulty on one occasion, when

using the law of induction as a metaphor to puzzle out the cause of the reenactment. He thinks to himself: 'If he [Shaynor] had read Keats it's the chloric-ether [in the drink]. If he hasn't, it's the identical bacillus, or Hertzian wave of tuberculosis, *plus* Fanny Brand [his girlfriend] and the professional status which, in conjunction with the main-stream of subconscious thought common to all mankind, has thrown up temporarily an induced Keats' (235-6). The point of this theory is that the same circumstances produce the same results. However, 'induction' is, in short, primarily about the influence of an electrically charged object upon an uncharged one. It is only secondarily about the relationship between a magnetic field and an object in it. Therefore, the 'induced Keats' should refer to the influence of Keats upon the assistant, not to the similarity of the influences acting upon them. The mistake is not a minor question because the law of induction is central to the story. In the tale where phantasmagoria reigns and the unified rational subject is replaced by fragmented identities and personalities, a character's, even the narrator's, thoughts cannot always be trusted.

Later, the narrator suspects that his knowledge of Keats' poems might be unwittingly exerting an influence upon the assistant, and, in order to avoid it, tries to think of a passage from 'Kubla Khan.' However, the assistant keeps on working on 'Ode to a Nightingale.' Yet, this does not necessarily negate the possibility of his influence on Shaynor, because his success in not thinking of Keats' work is doubtful. The passage in question runs: 'But though I believed my brain thus

occupied [with Coleridge's poem], my every sense hung upon the writing under the dry, bony hand [of Shaynor]' (239-40).

'Wireless' Voice on the Move

It is against such a background of the *fin-de-siècle* phantasmagoria of electric illumination and advertisement² and in relation to the dispersed subject that the disembodied voice in "Wireless" occurs. The following is how Shaynor starts the reenactment of the production of Keats' poems:

He [young Cashell, the experimenter] pressed a key [on the transmitter] in the semi-darkness, and with a rending crackle there leaped between two brass knobs a spark, streams of sparks, and sparks again.

'Grand, isn't it? *That's* the Power—our unknown Power—kicking and fighting to be let loose,' said young Mr. Cashell. 'There she goes—kick—kick—kick into space. I never get over the strangeness of it when I work a sending-machine—waves going into space, you know. T.R. is our call. Poole ought to answer with L.L.L.'

We waited two, three, five minutes. In that silence, of which the boom of the tide was an orderly part, I caught the clear '*kiss—kiss—kiss*' of the halliards on the roof, as they were blown against the installation-pole. [...]

I returned to the shop, and set down my glass on a marble slab with a careless clink. As I did so, Shaynor rose to his feet, his eyes fixed once more on the advertisement, where the young woman bathed in the light from the red jar simpered pinkly over her pearls. His lips moved without

cessation. I stepped nearer to listen. 'And threw—and threw—and threw,' he repeated, his face all sharp with some inexplicable agony.

I moved forward astonished. But it was then he found words—delivered roundly and clearly. These:—

'And threw warm gules on Madeleine's young breast.' (232)

As the girl in the picture precedes the actual girl in Shaynor's imagination, a voice from a machine precedes a human one here. 'A rending crackle' leads to the experimenter's onomatopoeic use of the word 'kick,' which in turn connects with the narrator's similar aural use of the word 'kiss' in describing the noise made by the halliards on the roof. The anthropomorphic and sexual implications of the word 'kiss' anticipates Shaynor's ejaculation, explicitly verbal but implicitly sexual as well.

The next sound one hears is the 'clink' with which the narrator puts his glass of the wildish drink on a 'marble slab.' One should note that the 'marble slab' is really a counter of mahogany transformed into the stone by the trick of illumination. The clink, as it were, introduces the passage describing the phantasmagoria of the electric lights and the modern advertisement. Most of the major elements in the story so far discussed are thus gathered here, when the voice shifts from these objects to the man. It begins as an almost inaudible mutter with lips incessantly moving and grows into a clear enunciation.

Then the voice translates itself into writing: 'He [Shaynor] sat

down again and wrote swiftly on his villainous note-paper, his lips quivering' (233). There are two points worth noting: that it is written with 'his lips quivering'; and that it is written on a piece of 'villainous' paper. The writing here is still marginal, non-public, and closely related to speech. Here, the voice gradually emerges out of the private and mainly aural-oral sphere of one's psyche and finds expression in writing of a still private kind. To summarize, the voice in "Wireless" first floats around from one object to another in the *fin-de-siècle* phantasmagoria and then settles in the assistant for a while, where it mingles with writing.

In the part that follows, the voice moves to the narrator via the wireless transmitter, while the interaction of voice and writing in the assistant's reenactment of Keatsian textual production continues for most of the rest of the story. Following the crackle of the instruments, the narrator hears a crackle in his brain and also his own voice saying something in a 'harsh whisper.' As the assistant has done, he splits into two selves, and then his talk to his other self begins: 'I was whispering encouragement, evidently to my other self, sounding sentences, such as men pronounce in dreams' (235). Like the muttering of the assistant when his reenactment begins, the narrator's whispering voice here is of a private and occult nature.

When the assistant has awakened from the trance in which he enacted Keats, the narrator recites a part of 'The Eve of St. Agnes' (Stanza 30) to draw his attention to the poem: 'I repeated the verse he had twice spoken and once written not ten minutes ago' (241). That

the passage recited by the narrator has been '*twice spoken and once written*' (my emphasis) by Shaynor is of great significance, because the suggested precedence of the aural-oral over the written is, furthermore, a characteristic of Kipling's own method of writing. The same degree of emphasis on the oral rather than the written is found in a passage on his own writing method from *Something of Myself*, Kipling's autobiography, which is very self-conscious about his writerly self:

I made my own experiments in the weights, colours, perfumes, and attributes of words in relation to other words, either as read aloud so that they may hold the ear, or, scattered over the page, draw the eye. There is no line of my verse or prose which has not been mouthed till the tongue has made all smooth, and memory, after many recitals, has mechanically skipped the grosser superfluities.¹⁷

As in "Wireless", more emphasis is laid on the aural-oral than the visual-textual, pointing to the former's primacy underlying Kipling's creative self.

Voices in Other Texts

Now a consideration of voices in other texts by Kipling which share some characteristics with "Wireless" and *Kim* will help clarify the meanings of the techno-Gothic voices in the latter two works. We will, therefore, now look at four kinds of texts in which voice plays an important role: firstly, works, like "Wireless", about the creation of

art; secondly, works, like *Kim*, featuring the Anglo-Indian child-hero with the aural-oral knowledge of the Indian vernacular; thirdly, texts, like both "Wireless" and *Kim*, that contain the Gothic voice; lastly, two science fiction stories which, like "Wireless," feature aural-oral wireless communications.

"The Finest Story in the World" resembles "Wireless" in the sense that it is concerned with the making of literary works and contains a motif of information apparently coming from the other world. It revolves around a young ignorant bank clerk who unwittingly tells the narrator stories of his own previous lives. Both of them try to put the clerk's stories of metempsychosis into texts, in vain; the mysterious oral tales resist the attempt to textualize them to the end. The whispering voice of the clerk in a hypnotic state and that of the narrator trying to induce the clerk to go on with his stories are also to be noted for their similarity to the whispering hypnotic voices of Lurgan and Huneefa in *Kim*.

The opposition between voice and text parallels a contrast between India and Britain. India, for Kipling, is a predominantly oral culture, as indicated, among others, in the Preface to *Life's Handicap*, where an ancient Indian storyteller who owns 'a voice most like the rumbling of heavy guns over a wooden bridge' is contrasted with the English writer-narrator. The same contrast applies in "The Finest Story in the World." An Indian friend of the narrator shows a special understanding of the mystery. And it is he who prophesies that the oral story of the clerk the narrator is striving to put into text 'will

never be written.' Notably, too, when they start talking about it, Grish the Indian friend switches the conversation from English into the Indian vernacular and the narrator follows his lead. The Indian vernacular is referred to as the language suitable for the discussion of such a mystery. The connection between voice and India is thus clear.

The opposition of voice and Britain is a shared characteristic of "The Finest Story" and 'The Brushwood Boy,' the latter of which is a story of the dual growth of a boy as secret storyteller and model imperial boy. The story opens with his shriek as an infant. He soon grows into a child who secretly indulges in making stories. His pre-literate, mostly aural-oral grasp of language is indicated by the use of irregular, somewhat phonographic spellings in the text. He makes a character pronounced *Annieanlouise* out of two names, Annie and Louise; the passage on his visit to Oxford contains spellings which reflect the aural understanding of phrases on the part of the child, such as *Oxford-on-a-visit*, *provostoforiel*, and *auditale*. The last one, *auditale*, which normally means 'ale of special quality brewed at certain university colleges, originally for drinking on the day of audit,' is perhaps one of the story's key words with a hidden meaning. Considering the aural-oral primacy in his artistic self, the secret-loving author of this story of the artist in the closet might well have meant it as 'audi-tale' (aural story).¹⁸

The secret storymaking self in the hero is opposed to his other self as model imperial boy. For the hero as imperial boy, voice is, by contrast, something not to indulge in but to be kept in control: at

Sandhurst, when the role of a leader is assigned to him, he is described as sitting 'in authority over mixed peoples with all the voices of men and boys combined.'¹⁹ Pleasure in voice and the need to exercise control over voice are thus opposed in his dual selves. Voice, an essential part of the storyteller's grasp of language, is at the same time suggested as an element dangerous to the British Empire.

Voice, however, is not simply anti-British. While voice represents India and can thus pose a threat to the Empire, it also signifies the aural-oral, genuine knowledge of India that can be conducive to the maintenance of the Empire.²⁰ Hence, just as the aural-oral knowledge of Britain is needed by Dracula for his conquest of the country, the real vocal knowledge of India is sought after by Britons. Voice's ambiguity in relation to the British Empire becomes clearer, when we move on to the second group of stories. It is not *Kim* alone, of Kipling's works, that features a child-hero whose aural-oral knowledge of the Indian vernacular contributes to the Empire. 'Tod's Amendment' (*Plain Tales from the Hills*), for example, has such a hero, whose intimate knowledge of the vernacular enables him to pick up information vital to the Anglo-Indian by listening to indigenous people's talk. Tod's acquisition of this information by aural means is contrasted to the failure of the British adult and his writings to grasp the Indian reality. It is suggested in the story that the Western rationality, which is still undeveloped in the child, can be a hindrance to the upkeep of the Empire.

Once it is understood by Britons, the voice of India is good for the

Empire. It, however, turns into a fearful Gothic voice, when they fail to grasp its meaning. In *Letters of Marque*, the young Kipling's travelogue of a northwestern part of India, a politically important region in the post-mutiny India, mysterious voices in ancient ruined palaces in the region frighten the author, significantly called the Englishman.²¹ They sound like the utterances of the spirit of the place. The region covered is suggested to be the real India escaping the attention of globe-trotters and the place of hidden cruelties and intrigues. The Englishman, whose scant knowledge of the local language often baffles his attempt to see the place, is haunted by a sense of being watched and by enigmatic voices he hears at key moments of his travel at Chitor and Boondi.

The connection between the inability to understand voice and the failure to govern India is also shown in another early text by Kipling, which features another kind of voice characteristic of Gothic fiction, the voice of the garrulous servant impervious to reason. 'The Tragedy of Crusoe, C.S.,' is a tale that describes a battle between the English master and the Indian servant in an Anglo-Indian household. In spite of the master's occasional use of beating, he loses the battle simply because he fails to understand and manage the servant. His defeat by the Indian voice is also represented by the damage done to his English books by Indian rain.²² The double-edgedness of voice in Kipling in relation to the Empire should by now be clear.

Technology's relation to the Empire is also ambiguous. In spite of Kipling's strong interest in new technologies in both his life and his

writings, the negative implications for the British Empire of new technologies as well as of the garrulous voice of the populace can be detected in two science fiction stories containing vocal radio communications: 'With the Night Mail' (*Actions and Reactions*) and its sequel, 'As Easy as A.B.C' (*A Diversity of Creatures*). The future world described in these tales is dominated by aerial transportation and wireless communication, and is under the control of a small but virtually omnipotent organization called A.B.C., an abbreviation for the Aerial Board of Control. Since the Board is located in London, and most of the places mentioned are important locales for the British Empire around 1900, such as Quebec, India, South Africa and Ireland, the two fictions can be taken as a portrayal of the future hi-tech British Empire. Although they are, at one level, stories of Pax Britannica maintained by a few select brave men, still they are not simply a eulogy of the courageous keepers of the Empire. The stories, at the same time, describe how a majority of people have been enervated and degenerated by the advancement of technology. Residents in the future society, who enjoy greater longevity but suffer a lower birth-rate and 'nerves,' consist of two types. One group is formed by the large number of people who have lost all curiosity and complacently put privacy before everything else, that is, intellectually and reproductively enervated individualists. The other is the small number of people who believe in democratic ideas. They, therefore, respectively represent the types Kipling loathed: the affluent metropolitan middle class and liberals and workers calling for democracy. Significantly, the latter are

portrayed as garrulous in 'As Easy As A.B.C.' That is, Kipling imagined the future British Empire as endangered both by technology and the popular voice. The statuses of technology and of voice in relation to the Empire are thus doubly ambiguous.

The Political Threat of Voice and Kiplingesque Concealment

What deserves mention now is an inclination in Kipling to conceal or de-emphasize, in a variety of ways, the threat to the empire involved in such ambiguities or dualities. Of course, the factor of subterfuge in writing is not limited to Kipling, but what distinguishes him from the other *fin-de-siècle* writers in our discussion is the degree to which the element of concealment is central to his art, which makes it necessary for us to look for what is suppressed in his texts.

Typically, 'The Brushwood Boy' de-emphasizes the suggested conflict between the anti-imperial aural-oral self and the pro-imperial self by dissolving it into a happy ending, where the protagonist meets the girl he has known in his dream, thus annulling the opposition of his dual selves.²³ What is suppressed in *Kim* is the potential anti-imperial danger of the hybrid child-hero with his mixed Irish and possibly Asian blood and genuine aural-oral knowledge of India and its local language.²⁴ The novel also obscures the political by turning the perilous and serious activities of imperial espionage into an innocent-looking form of play for the boys of the empire, called 'the Great Game.' *Letters of Marque* conceals the dangerous aspect in yet another way: by transforming the latently political voices of India into the mysterious

voices of a Gothic type.

The Disembodied Voices in *Kim*

Having clarified the political significance of voice in other texts, and having mentioned Kipling's inclination for concealment, we are now in a position to understand what was not clear when we first considered the disembodied voices in chapters nine and ten of *Kim*; why they had to be politically mystified or played down. The reason is this: it is because of the political danger inherent in the ambiguous nature of voice that these voices, even though placed in the essentially political context of Kim's espionage training, must be de-politicized.

The narrative of Lurgan's imperial training of Kim in chapter nine is de-politicized in three ways. First, it is displaced onto the sexual plane, with its sexual innuendoes. Secondly, it is displaced onto the occult plane, with its use of Gothic devices, such as hypnotism and hallucination, in a setting of mysterious atmosphere. Thirdly, later in the chapter, it is also turned into children's games: 'the Jewel Game' and the game of disguises. Notable in this connection is the fact that, immediately before chapter nine, the last sentence of the previous chapter announces the start of the Great Game: 'Here begins the Great Game' (195).

As the reader moves on to chapter ten, which for the most part describes Huneefa's ritual for Kim, the latently political nature of her disembodied voice is likewise displaced onto the sexual and the occult planes, whose details we have already examined.

The Technological Disembodied Voice in *Kim*'

As has been shown, both technology and voice contain an element of politically dangerous ambiguity. Hence, the techno-voice is, potentially, doubly threatening to the Empire. And that is why the enigmatic voice of the phonograph in darkness in chapter nine has to be de-politicized: the mystification of that disembodied voice is derived from the need to prevent the reader from obtaining a full view of the dangerous duality of voice and technology.

There is an additional reason why the phonographic voice is made mysterious: the Anglo-Indian fear of hybridity, which is associated with the phonograph in Kipling's texts. In chapter nine, phonographs are also mentioned, along with mechanical toys, as luxury items purchased by rajahs. This reference should be considered in connection with descriptions of rajahs' shopping in some of Kipling's early writings. Both in *Letters of Marque* and 'The Viceroy at Patiala,' the author looks, with some condescension, at rajahs' huge collections of Western commodities, including expensive mechanical gadgets such as musical boxes.²⁵ Suggested in the descriptions is Kipling's feeling of discomfort that products of Western technology destroy the traditional harmony of the Indian culture and are, at the same time, contaminated by the native acquisition of them: in short, it is the feeling that the racial boundary is infringed by the Indian purchase of products of the Western advanced technology. The depiction of the phonograph as a luxury toy in *Kim* can thus be related to the Anglo-Indian anxiety about

the erosion of the boundary between the East and the West. Hence, the anxiety has to be allayed by the concealment of the problematic racial ambiguity involved with the phonograph. The multiple threat of the techno-voice to the British Empire in *Kim* thus needs to be suppressed by mystifying its significance.

The Technological Disembodied Voice in "Wireless":

Its Political and Genealogical Implications

What has been said of the disembodied voice in *Kim* can also be said of its counterpart in "Wireless." The latently political disembodied voice in the techno-occult story is likewise displaced onto the sexual and the esoteric planes, represented by Shaynor's passion for the seductive girl and his mysterious enactment of Keats' creative process. And, consciously or unconsciously, the author uses this displacement to de-emphasize the connection between the emergence of wireless and the imperial role of the Royal Navy, and to conceal both the threats deriving from the colonial ambiguity of voice and from the fear of the degeneration by technology, the latter of which is suggested in 'With the Night Mail' and 'As Easy As A.B.C.'

Regarding the technological bodiless voice, there is another important parallelism between *Kim* and "Wireless." In the former, the phonographic voice disturbing Kim at the beginning of chapter nine leads to Lurgan's hypnotic attempt by voice and touch to make Kim hallucinate; it is then fought by Kim resorting to the English language and the multiplication table, the symbols of Western rationality. By

the same token, as our examination of the story has shown, the opposition occurs in “Wireless” between the unified rational subject of the modern West and the eerie ‘wireless’ voice. In the end, the former is broken up by the latter; the ‘wireless’ voice keeps moving among characters and objects, destroying the boundaries between individuals and between humans and things.

What emerges instead is the alternative aural-oral subject, which, however, is fragmented, pointing in two different directions. In one sense, the Kiplingesque ‘wireless’ voice relates to the disembodied voice of the pre-modern self, characteristic of Gothic-Romantic literature. As Terry Castle observes, Gothic-Romantic culture of late eighteenth-century origin embodies the reverse side of the contemporary cult of reason, often equated with sight; in other words, it is a product of the Freudian return of what is repressed by the Enlightenment. The Gothic-Romantic disembodied voice, therefore, represents the alternative, shadow self paradoxically spawned by the belief of Western modernity in rational subjectivity. We have already shown ample instances of this in the early part of Chapter Two.

We have also focused on Conrad as the representative inheritor of the Gothic tradition in the latter part of the same chapter. But, of course, the *fin-de-siècle* disembodied voices of Gothic inheritance are not limited to Conrad.²⁶ The two voices from darkness in *Salomé* shake one from the position of the rational bourgeois subject: Jokanaan’s underground voice shocks one out of the phantasmagoria of the late-capitalist spectacular consumer society, while Salomé’s

bodiless voice at the climax of the play evokes a (homo)sexuality which transgresses the rationalist ethical code that underlies the late nineteenth-century social purity campaign. Similarly, in *Dracula*, Mina's astonishment at Seward's phonographic voice and her association of it with the soul denote the shaking of the 'old stable ego' of bourgeois individualism by the disembodied techno-voice, which, as we have shown, also functions as the oblique, post-Wilde-trial expression of the forbidden homosexuality. The geographical factor is also important here. It is non-Western locations, such as Africa, the Levant, Transylvania, which the alternative vocal subject tends to connect itself with.

Kipling's 'wireless' voice certainly comprises part of this tradition. Beside the destruction of the 'old stable ego,' it is heard against the phantasmagoric background of late nineteenth-century consumer society, and, like Jokanaan's and Marlow's voices, concerns the dangerous deceptiveness inherent in the vision-dominated age. Like its counterparts in *Salomé* and *Dracula*, the disembodied voice in "Wireless" is also concerned with transgressive sexuality. And the non-Western location associated with voice in Kipling is, as has been shown, India.

Moreover, the techno-occult story relates to the tradition of the Gothic-Romantic culture with its aural-oral primacy, through its references to Keats' 'The Eve of St. Agnes' and 'Ode to a Nightingale,' and to Coleridge's 'Kubla Khan.' The first is the most Gothic and sensual of Keats' poems, with its medieval setting, where sensuality is

combined with pre-modernity. The latter two are predominantly aural-conscious, 'melocentric' poems, also accompanied by an acute nostalgia for the pre-modern. In 'Kubla Khan,' moreover, voice is associated with non-Western places, such as Xanadu and Abyssinia. Taken together, these poetic references are also an indication of the alternative vocal subject, free from the rationalist repression of the senses and tyranny of the eye.

Kipling's 'wireless' voice, however, points in another direction, which is the direction of the twentieth-century. Perhaps, it can best be described as the boundary voice between the Gothic-Romantic and Modernist traditions. It not only looks back to the uncanny voice of the deeper old self suppressed by Western modernity, but also points forward to the emptiness or disappearance of the self in a global network of modern communication. It is important here that, as we have noted, there are several possible causes for Shaynor's reenactment of the making of Keats' poems, and that the real cause remains unidentified to the end. One of the possible causes, the return of Keats' spirit from the other world, points to the Gothic past and the deeper, old self represented by the Gothic voice. But some others, the new wireless technology and the vision-dominated *fin-de-siècle* society, are certainly related to the burgeoning world system dominated by the modern form of advertisement and the wireless telecommunication, where radio technology is prioritized over man and threatens, with its potential for global networking, to annul the idea of the self itself.

It also deserves mention that Kipling liked to employ technological metaphors in describing his non-rational, non-individual, creative self. Kipling told his fellow writer, Rider Haggard: 'We are telephone wires.'²⁷ Referring to the nature of literary inspiration, he resorted to the metaphor of electric induction in his autobiography.²⁸ Since induction is important for early wireless technology, it is also mentioned in the story under consideration, "Wireless," which is a tale of literary production as well. The death of the self is implied by these non-human technological metaphors, too.

We can now see the significance of the fact that, although the publication of "Wireless" belongs to the early twentieth century, the story was set in *fin-de-siècle* England. This fact is symbolic because, while Kipling's 'wireless' voice looks back at the Gothic-Romantic tradition, it simultaneously foretells the twentieth-century technological disembodied voice of the global network and its related empty subjectivity.

NOTES

¹ *Kim* is set in the 1870s and 1880s India; see Norman Page, *A Kipling Companion* (London: Macmillan, 1984), pp.151-152.

An incident in “Wireless”, a failed attempt at radio communication between two men-of-war owing to a mixed-up transmission among more than two parties suggests the dating of the story’s setting from the late 1890s. This sort of confusion in transmission was typically a late-nineties technical problem, to be solved by a patent filed in 1900. *The Readers’ Guide to Rudyard Kipling’s Work* also observes that the story is ‘descriptive of events occurring in 1897-98’. See R.E.Harbord ed., *The Readers’ Guide to Rudyard Kipling’s Work* (Canterbury: Gibbs, 1965-6), p.1902.

² Rudyard Kipling, *Kim*, The Sussex Edition of The Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1938), XXI, 202-203. Further references to this novel are given after quotations in the text.

³ Much attention is paid to Kipling’s suspected homosexuality in Martin Seymour-Smith’s biography. See his *Rudyard Kipling* (New York: St. Martin, 1989), pp.4, 47-51, 74, 82, 157-61, 174, 177-81 and 283.

⁴ Andrew Lycett, *Rudyard Kipling* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 1999), p.111.

⁵ Gelatt, pp.69-79; Brian Winston, *Media, Technology and Society: A History: From the Telegraph to the Internet* (London: Routledge, 1998), pp.62-3.

⁶ David Faulkner, ‘Broken English: Dickens, Kipling, Conrad and Woolf in Global Space (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Princeton University, 1995), pp.123-126.

⁷ By Lukacsean reflection theory, we mean the Hungarian Marxist

critic's assumption that the language of the novel mirrors historical realities in a straightforward manner. It is criticized by Fredric Jameson for its failure to take account of language's symbolic nature. See his *The Political Unconscious: Narrative as a Socially Symbolic Act* (London: Routledge, 1989), chapter I. We are, however, not to be understood as saying, with Jameson, that the approach based on the reflection theory is always wrong. Our point here is more modest: a careful consideration of language's capability for subterfuge is necessary in the case of Kipling's disembodied techno-voice.

⁸ Rowland F. Pocock, *The Early British Radio Industry* (Manchester: Manchester Univ. Press, 1988), p.13. Pocock's book, the best of early histories of wireless, is particularly strong in its analysis of the technology's relation to the contemporary imperial situation involving the Royal Navy.

⁹ In view of Kipling's suspected homosexuality, the failed attempt at wireless communication between the two men-of-war may also be taken as an oblique, marginalized expression of homosexual frustration.

¹⁰ See Pocock, pp.26-27 and 29-34.

¹¹ Pocock, p.91.

¹² Pocock, pp.156-7. The Royal Navy's attitude toward the new technology forms a sharp contrast with that of the General Post Office, symbolized by the behaviour of Willam Preece, assistant Engineer-in-Chief to GPO, who was dismissive of the use of Marconi's system in his departmental reports, though expressing his support for the Italian inventor in public.

¹³ Charles Carrington, *Rudyard Kipling: His Life and Work* (London: Macmillan, 1955; repr. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1986), p.440.

¹⁴ Harold Orel ed., *Kipling: Interviews and Recollections*, 2 vols

(London: Macmillan, 1983), I, 239-244 (p.241): Kipling told Cyril Clemens: 'I got Marconi to talk about wireless. [...] During the talk I consciously or unconsciously was gathering much material for my story, "Wireless", in which I carried the idea of etheric vibrations into the possibilities of thought transference.'

¹⁵ Pocock, pp.71-85; Jeffrey Sconce, 'The Voice from the Void: Wireless, Modernity and the Distant Dead,' *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 1 (1998), 211-232 (p.212). Sconce also refers to Edison's attempt to communicate with the dead.

¹⁶ Rudyard Kipling, "Wireless," in his *Traffics and Discoveries*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1937), VII, 215-243 (p.232). Further references to this story are given after quotations in the text.

¹⁷ Rudyard Kipling, *Something of Myself and Other Autobiographical Writings*, ed. Thomas Pinney (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1991), pp.43-44.

¹⁸ Rudyard Kipling, *The Day's Work* (London: Penguin, 1988), notes, pp.317-330 (p.329).

¹⁹ Rudyard Kipling, 'The Brushwood Boy,' in his *The Day's Work*, The Sussex Edition of The Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1937), VI, 379-423 (p.386).

²⁰ For a historical account of the vital importance of the working knowledge of the Indian local languages for the British Empire, see Bernard S. Cohn's *Colonialism and Its Forms of Knowledge: The British In India* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1996), pp.16-56.

²¹ Rudyard Kipling, *Letters of Marque*, in his *From Sea to Sea and Other Sketches I*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1938), XXII,

3-191.

²² 'The Tragedy of Crusoe, C.S.' is contained in Rudyard Kipling, *Kipling's India: Uncollected Sketches 1884-88*, ed. by Thomas Pinney (New York: Schocken, 1986), pp. 45-51.

²³ In another story, 'The Bridge-Builders' (*The Day's Work*), the threat of the aural-oral India, rendered in the voices of ancient Indian gods, is similarly dissolved by a somewhat forced happy ending.

²⁴ That Kim's mother is possibly a Eurasian is pointed out in Norman Page, *A Kipling Companion*, p. 153.

²⁵ 'The Viceroy at Patiala' is contained in Rudyard Kipling's *Kipling's India*, 26-31 (p. 28).

²⁶ Nancy Armstrong, in her *Fiction in the Age of Photography: The Legacy of British Realism* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1999), traces the history of the dominance of the image from the craze of the picturesque to the Victorian realism. Interestingly, she also notes the anti-ocular counter-tradition in nineteenth-century fantasy and romance literature. Two of the three representative works of that tradition cited by her are of strongly Gothic character, Emily Brontë's *Wuthering Heights* and Rider Haggard's *King Solomon's Mines*. Since these two works contain memorable scenes of disembodied voice, her argument can be cited as corroborating our genealogy of the Gothic-Romantic disembodied voice by providing one hypothetical link between the late eighteenth and late nineteenth centuries..

²⁷ Rudyard Kipling and Rider Haggard, *Rudyard Kipling to Rider Haggard: The Record of a Friendship*, ed. by Morton Cohen (London: Hutchinson, 1965), p. 100.

²⁸ Rudyard Kipling, *Something of Myself*, p. 68.

The Disembodied Voice in the Age of Modernism:

Voices, Ethereal and Otherwise,

in D.H. Lawrence's *Lady Chatterley's Lover*

The focus of this chapter will be what happens to the disembodied voice after the *fin de siècle*. Here, however, instead of aiming at comprehensiveness by providing an overview of the twentieth-century disembodied voice, we will confine ourselves to an examination of continuities and discontinuities between *fin-de-siècle* writings and one important fiction of the Modernist period, D. H. Lawrence's *Lady Chatterley's Lover*.

As in the cases of Stoker and Kipling, it is the technological disembodied voice in Lawrence's last novel that will receive the most attention: the wireless voice that enthralls Clifford Chatterley. The unequivocal emptiness of the self, associated with his obsession with radio broadcast, makes a sharp contrast with the wavering between the assumption of the deep self and the suspicion of the emptiness of the self in Kipling's "Wireless". We will examine how Lawrence's attitude toward wireless changed in and before the writing of *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, and how the rapid spread of radio broadcast in the twenties affected him. We will also consider what is opposed to the disembodied wireless voice in the novel: the dialect voice of the gamekeeper. At the end of the chapter, we will attempt to show what this resort to the dialect voice as an antidote to the mechanization of modern society looks back to.

Other Voices I: The Voice of the African Darkness

Before delving into the techno-voice of Lawrence's last novel, however, we will look at other voices in Lawrence, which share characteristics with the *fin-de-siècle* bodiless voice.

In *The Rainbow*, upon returning home from the Boer War, Anton Skrebensky turns into the disembodied voice of the African darkness, which shows a strong resemblance to its counterpart in Joseph Conrad's *Heart of Darkness*.

"I am not afraid of the darkness in England," he [Skrebensky] said. "It is soft, and natural to me, it is my medium, especially when you are here. But in Africa it seems massive and fluid with terror—not fear of anything—just fear. One breathes it, like a smell of blood. The blacks know it. They worship it, really, the darkness. One almost likes it—the fear—something sensual."

She [Ursula Brangwen] thrilled again to him. He was to her a voice out of the darkness. He talked to her all the while, in low tones, about Africa, conveying something strange and sensual to her: the negro, with his loose, soft passion that could envelop one like a bath. Gradually he transferred to her the hot, fecund darkness that possessed his own blood. He was strangely secret. The whole world must be abolished. He maddened her with his soft, cajoling, vibrating tones. He wanted her to answer, to understand. A turgid, teeming night, heavy with fecundity in which every molecule of matter grew big with increase, secretly urgent with fecund desire, seemed to come to pass. She quivered, taut and vibrating, almost pained.¹

The terror and fascination of Africa conveyed through a voice out of the darkness in the passage is an element shared by *Heart of Darkness*. The voice of Skrebensky is clearly to be traced back to the final cry of 'the horror' by the man fascinated by the Dark Continent and the voice of Marlow with his well-known phrase, 'the fascination of abomination.' They are both typical examples of colonial fear and desire.²

Also important is the overlapping of the sexual and the political factors. Although the sensual is more to the foreground in the passage of Skrebensky's African voice, both works sexualize colonial Africa in a way typical of the imperial fantasies of the late nineteenth century. Kurtz finds the sexualized Africa in his native mistress; while Skrebensky brings the sexual Africa home, providing sensual thrills to Ursula. The Lawrence of this passage can thus be described as a descendant of the *fin-de-siècle* culture of the British Empire.

Other Voices II: The Voice of the Underground Working Men

In the sequel to *The Rainbow*, *Women in Love*, Ursula's sister, Gudrun, is sensually drawn to the local colliers:

They [the Brangwen sisters] were passing between blocks of miners' dwellings. In the back yards of several dwellings, a miner could be seen washing himself in the open on this hot evening, naked down to the loins, his great trousers of moleskin slipping almost away. Miners already cleaned were sitting on their heels, with their backs near the walls, talking and

silent in pure physical well-being, tired, and taking physical rest. Their voices sounded out with strong intonation, and the broad dialect was curiously caressing to the blood. It seemed to envelop Gudrun in a laborer's caress, there was in the whole atmosphere a resonance of physical men. [...] Now she realised that this was the world of powerful, underworld men who spent most of their time in the darkness. In their voices she could hear the voluptuous resonance of darkness, the strong, dangerous underworld, mindless, inhuman. [...] The sense of talk [...] vibrated in the air like discordant machinery. And it was these voices which affected Gudrun almost to swooning. They aroused a strange, nostalgic ache of desire.³

Three characteristics of the miners should be noted in relation to their sexual attraction for Gudrun: their physicality, their dialect voice, and their belonging to the underground darkness. These are important for two reasons here. They look forward to Mellors the miner's son's dialect voice in *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, which we will consider soon. And they also look back to the *fin-de-siècle* working-class voice from the abyss, represented in this thesis by Jokanaan's underground voice in Oscar Wilde's *Salomé*. As was earlier shown, the eponymous heroine is attracted to the disembodied voice of Jokanaan from the underground attacking bourgeois complacency, and then is drawn to his body when he is brought up above the ground.

Traces of such a working-class voice can be noted in *The Rainbow*, too. When, near the end of the novel, Ursula begins to doubt her relationship with Skrebensky, she wonders about the kinds of men who

can replace him. One possibility that occurs to her is working men. Relatedly, when she later has a potentially sexual encounter with the colliers, their voices are described as 'sounding out' (454). The novel ends with the vision of the regeneration of the society as human body, of which, it is suggested, working men comprise the major part.

Wireless Voice in *Lady Chatterley's Lover*

Probably it is James Joyce who is the most known, among major Modernist writers, for his interest in new technologies. He established the first cinema in Dublin, incorporated phonograph and telephone in *Ulysses*, and radio and TV broadcasts in *Finnegans Wake*. But it is D. H. Lawrence who has left a more substantial description of the early cinema in *The Lost Girl* and a perceptive reference to the 1920's wireless boom in *Lady Chatterley's Lover*.

The importance of Clifford Chatterley's addiction to wireless seems to have grown for Lawrence as he wrote the three versions of the novel. In the first version of *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, the reference to wireless came late in the unfolding of the story. Perhaps because he noticed its importance while he wrote the passage, the first reference to wireless in the second version, which Lawrence produced immediately after the first, occurred as early as the opening paragraph. The wireless in the novel was, then, in the final and published version, moved to an even more important location: the beginning of chapter X. The chapter is central both in position and importance: it is the central of a total of nineteen chapters in the novel; it is also the most

important of all chapters, in that it describes how Lady Chatterley and the gamekeeper make love for the first time. As if to show its importance, chapter X is the longest in the novel, about twice as long as the average chapter. What is more, the mention of the domination of the global network of wireless as symbolic of the completed mechanization of the modern world is added in the third and final version.

Also added in that version is a new element that helps highlight the start of the era of the wireless media: Clifford as writer. He is early presented as a successful Modernist writer in this final *Lady Chatterley* novel, but then, as his attention is drawn to wireless and coal-mining, Clifford's interest in writing ceases, marking a shift from the age of literacy to that of the aural-oral medium. And, in chapter X, at the beginning of which Clifford changes from a writing machine to a wireless enthusiast, Connie goes to the wood with desperation and has the first intercourse with the gamekeeper.

This is how chapter X opens in the final version of *Lady Chatterley's Lover*:

Connie was a good deal alone now, fewer people came to Wragby. Clifford no longer wanted them. He had turned against even the cronies. He was queer. He preferred the radio, which he had installed at some expense, with a good deal of success at last. He could sometimes get Madrid, or Frankfurt, even there in the uneasy Midlands.

And he would sit alone for hours listening to the loud-speaker bellowing

forth. It amazed and stunned Connie. But there he would sit, with a blank, entranced expression on his face, like a person losing his mind, and listen, or seem to listen, to the unspeakable thing.

Was he really listening? Or was it a sort of soporific he took, while something else worked on underneath in him? Connie did not know. She fled up to her room: or out of doors, to the wood. A kind of terror filled her sometimes: a terror of the incipient insanity of the whole civilised species.⁴

It is this addiction of Clifford to the radio, representing the beginning of the final insanity of mankind, that drives Connie to seek shelter in the wood and, eventually, in a sexual relationship with the gamekeeper. Wireless and what it represents is thus opposed to the gamekeeper and what he represents. In other words, the disembodied voice of wireless is put in opposition to the gamekeeper's dialect voice. Later in the novel, desiring to escape from the mechanized modern world, Connie finds that there is no way of escape because of the world-wide network of wireless:

Couldn't one go right away, to the far ends of the earth, and be free from it all?

One could not. The far ends of the earth are not five minutes from Charing Cross, nowadays. While the wireless is active, there are no far ends of the earth. Kings of Dahomey and Lamas of Thibet listen in to London and New York. (281)

Wireless and the Emptiness of the Self

Unlike Kipling's techno-occult story, Lawrence's novel unequivocally links Clifford's obsession with wireless to the emptiness of the self. The description of the Clifford's wireless-dominated self is filled with metaphors of nothingness. His wireless enthusiasm develops simultaneously with his renewed interest in the mining industry, and both activities are presented as 'a soporific' to conceal from himself his own emptiness and that of his life. For instance, in the second version of the novel, Clifford listening to the radio for hours is compared to 'an empty shell, with the noise of the thing [wireless] rattling through him.'⁵ The first version also has a passage explicit about this:

He seemed no more like a human being to her. He was really interested in nothing but these two things: business, and the radio. [...] It was as if his soul had suddenly flown away from him, and sat, perhaps, in the boughs of some tree somewhere, within call. And if there was a noise going on outside him, that he could listen to—listen in, as they say—he felt as if his soul was perched inside him again. (174-5)

Likewise, in the final version, when Clifford 'was not braced up to work, and so full of energy: or when he was not listening-in, and so utterly neuter: then he was haunted by anxiety and a sense of dangerous, impending void' (139). Elsewhere, the radio-crazy Clifford is likened to a crustacean with a body of steel outside and little substance inside

(110). His addiction to wireless thus reveals the emptiness of his self, with the global network of radio broadcast taking the place of the self in him. In such a world, as Connie notes, everything is 'like the simulacrum of reality' (18).

A Shift in Lawrence's View of Wireless

And the Radio Broadcast in 1920s

However, Lawrence had not always negatively associated wireless with the emptiness of the self. The image of wireless had been more often than not linked to the idea of the deep self. His attitude toward it changed before and during the writing of the first version of *Lady Chatterley's Lover*. With the rise of the wireless broadcast in 1920s, his view of wireless became unequivocally negative. His occasional use of wireless as a metaphor for the reception of inspiration, or for hypersensitivity or perceptiveness disappeared and wireless came to mean the wireless broadcast.

Wireless and its closely-related notion, ether, became frequent topics in the writings of D.H. Lawrence in the late 1910s. In his famous essays on American writers, wireless was one of the most important metaphors for the gift of an extraordinary person or a hidden special human ability. In *The Symbolic Meaning* (the collection of the first and second versions, written in 1917-18 and 1920, of *Studies in Classical American Literature*), Melville, one of the authors discussed, is compared to a wireless-station: 'In sheer physical, vibrational sensitiveness, like a marvellous wireless-station, he registers the

effects of the outer world.’⁶

It is true that his earliest essay on Hawthorne contains a negative example of wireless, in which one of Hawthorne’s female characters is criticized for being a transmitter of ‘the great *natural-mechanical* vibrations in the ether’ (156). But, whether the associations are good or not, wireless remains an important metaphor of a special human ability beyond reason’s comprehension.

At the outset of the series of American essays, Lawrence also states that the moving force of world history is the vibrations of vital-magnetic messages carried through the ether; according to him, the reception of them by the different races, which can be compared to intercontinental wireless communication, decides the course of history. In these essays, Lawrence sees man as essentially a wireless station.

A chapter in the 1922-3 final version (*Studies in Classic American Literature*) contains a reference to wireless: ‘Apart even from telepathy, the apparatus of human consciousness is the most wonderful message-receiver in existence. Beats a wireless station to nothing.’⁷ However, for Lawrence, the conscious self is only secondary to the deeper self as the ‘wireless’ receiver: ‘Only the soul, or the under-consciousness, deals with these messages in the dark, in the under-conscious. Which is the natural course of events’ (116). The ‘real human soul [...] with its own deep prescience’ is, capable, as the ‘apparatus of consciousness’ is not, of receiving genuine messages from the universe (117 & 115). There exists an important connection between the receiving of ‘wireless’ messages and one’s deeper self in the Lawrence of this period.

In one of his psychoanalytic works, *Fantasia of the Unconscious*, which belongs to the same period, it is human relations that are described in terms of wireless communication. The relationship between mother and child is likened to wireless communication: 'the child in the womb must be dynamically conscious of the mother. [...] This consciousness, however, is non-mental, purely dynamic, a matter of dynamic polarized intercourse of vital vibrations, as an exchange of wireless messages which are never translated from the pulse-rhythm into speech.'⁸ The disembodied voice, too, is involved in it, because the child, as Lawrence says, 'cannot see her,' but 'can hear her' (70).

The sexual relationship between man and woman, which *Fantasia* states as happening at the level of the deeper self, i.e. 'the deep and massive, swaying consciousness of the dark, living blood' (184), is also electromagnetic, vibrational, and wireless:

The powerful magnetic current vibrates from the hypogastric plexus in the female, vibrating on to the air like some intense wireless message. And there is immediate response from the sacral ganglion in some male. [...] Every wireless station can only receive those messages which are in its own vibration key. So with sex in specialized individuals. From the powerful dynamic centre the female sends out her dark summons, the intense dark vibration of sex. And according to her nature, she receives her responses from the males. The male enters the magnetic field of the female. He vibrates helplessly in response. [...] There is one electric flow which encompasses one male and one female, or one male and one particular group

of females all polarized in the same key of vibration. (186)

A novel of that period, *Kangaroo*, also contains both of the wireless images presented in his American essays and in his psychoanalytic book: wireless station as a metaphor for human extraordinary sensitivity and wireless communication as a symbol of human relations respectively.⁹

A related concept of ether appears in *Women in Love*, when Gudrun shows Gerald a scar she has obtained from a violent rabbit, giving him some ultimate shock: 'She lifted her arm and showed a deep red score down the silken white flesh. [...] The long, shallow red rip seemed torn across his own brain, tearing the surface of his ultimate consciousness, letting through the forever unconscious, unthinkable red ether of the beyond, the obscene beyond' (242). It is possible to see a complex of multiple meanings of the word 'ether' here. The editors of the Cambridge edition of the novel, in an explanatory note, observe the influence of John Burnet's *Early Greek Philosophy*, citing Anaxagoras's use of the word as the upper region of space and fire (559). But the more prominent meanings here would be that of the ether as in the nerve and that of the ether as the medium for light, electromagnetic waves and other things. And probably the most important point is that ether is associated with beyondness, ultimateness, transcendence in the passage.

That Lawrence is aware of, and ambiguous about, the significance of ether as the ultimate medium and substance is clear from his 1923

essay 'The Proper Study,' in which, although he criticizes the idea of the sea of the divine ether as the ultimate model for the universe, he retains an Oceanic image for the living cosmos.¹⁰ As Gillian Beer observes, the then popular wave model of cosmic processes, which provides the basis for Lawrence's metaphor of the sea of the divine ether, is inseparable from the concept of ether.¹¹ The Oceanic image, therefore, is essentially ethereal in the contemporary context.

Lawrence is still ambiguous about ether-cum-wireless in his 1925 essay 'Why the Novel Matters.' In this piece, written in defense of the use of novel, the impact of a novel is likened to a tremulation upon the ether, 'like a radio message.' And the ethereal metaphor is here given both positive and negative implications. At one place, it is dismissed as lifeless in itself, but, at another, the tremulation upon the ether sent by a novel is praised for its capacity to set a whole man trembling with life.¹²

The wireless-ethereal metaphor for a certain kind of extraordinary human perception and communication happening at the level of the deep self is last seen in the first version of *Lady Chatterley's Lover*. In it, Clifford's uncannily hypersensitive awareness of, and telepathic communication with, Connie is described with an ethereal metaphor: 'if she herself were out, she could simply feel him groping after her through the ether' (175). And the site in which it occurs is one's deeper self, since 'there was so complete a rift between what he knew psychically, perhaps by telepathy, and his rational mind' (175). This passage is to disappear in Lawrence's subsequent rewritings of the

novel.

Interestingly, the passage on Clifford's virtually supernatural ability is adjacent to the one on his addiction to wireless broadcasts. In contrast to the former, however, the passage on Clifford's enthusiasm about radio is to remain in the later versions of the novel and, as was shown, gains in importance as Lawrence rewrites it. A significant shift, therefore, can be said to occur at this point in the first version of the novel, where the wireless as perception and communication at the level of the deep self is being replaced by the wireless as broadcast, linked to the loss of the self. Lawrence, consciously or unconsciously, seems to have known this because only in the first of all versions is Clifford described as first despising radio broadcast but then becoming a wireless enthusiast, suggesting that some change is taking place there.

There are two possible causes for this shift: the decline of the status of ether and the start of radio broadcasting. It is generally assumed that the early twentieth century saw the privileged concept of ether as the medium for light and electromagnetism and as the possible basis for matter being displaced by Einstein's theory of relativity. In June 1921, when Lawrence received a copy of Einstein's *Relativity: The Special and the General Theory: A Popular Exposition* (1920), he almost simultaneously started writing *Fantasia of the Unconscious*, which contained a reference to the then Einstein craze as well as Lawrence's idiosyncratic interpretation of the concept of relativity. This shows that Lawrence was well aware of the impact of Einstein's work. The

replacement of the privileged concept of ether by that of relativity in the early twentieth century, therefore, might well have affected Lawrence in discarding the ethereal-wireless metaphor for the extraordinary human perceptive and communicative capabilities. At the same time, however, Britain had had a strong tradition of ether-based thinking since the late nineteenth century, the intellectually formative years of the novelist in question. Because of that, scientists in the U.K. resisted Einstein's theory for longer than in other countries; moreover, Einstein's relativity did not entirely replace ether.¹³ As late as 1933, Oliver Lodge published his 'magnum opus,' *My Philosophy: Representing My Views on the Many Functions of the Ether of Space*.¹⁴ For that reason, the extent to which the declining status of ether influenced Lawrence's shift in attitude toward ether and wireless may well be less than could be inferred from the general, but somewhat mistaken, assumption that ether was then decisively replaced by relativity.

A more important cause for the shift is the huge success of radio broadcasting around that time. The 1920s can be epitomized as the age of the wireless craze. After the first regular broadcast in 1922, the radio was received 'with prodigious enthusiasm' in Britain: 'in 1924 1 million licences were issued, but up to 5 million sets were in use [...]. In three more years, the number of licences doubled. [...] By 1928 radio audiences were never less than 1 million and often as high as 15 million.'¹⁵ The following figures are taken from Asa Briggs' standard history of British broadcasting, showing the immense rate at which the

early radio broadcast grew, as compared to the much slower rate of the spread of early TV¹⁶:

Year (31 December)	Number of wireless licenses	Number of wireless and television licenses	Year (31 March)
1922	35,744*	14,560	1947
1923	595,496	45,564	1948
1924	1,129,578	126,567	1949
1925	1,645,207	343,882	1950
1926	2,178,259	763,941	1951

*This figure is not strictly comparable with the rest

This rate of growth is also much higher than that of telephone in the previous century.¹⁷

Clifford as the Wireless Enthusiast of His Time

The description of Clifford's addiction to wireless in Lawrence's novel reflects the way people were swept up in the radio boom at that time, illustrating the author's awareness of the contemporary popularity of wireless. The following two passages are taken respectively from Versions III and II of *Lady Chatterley's Lover*:

Connie was a good deal alone now, fewer people came to Wragby. Clifford no longer wanted them. He had turned against even the cronies. He was queer. He preferred the radio. [...] And he would sit alone for hours listening to the loud-speaker bellowing forth. It amazed and stunned

Connie. But there he would sit, with a blank, entranced expression on his face, like a person losing his mind, and listen, or seem to listen, to the unspeakable thing.

Was he really listening? Or was it a sort of soporific he took [...]?

Connie did not know. (III; 110)

And when Clifford's energy fell, and "business" went out of him, then he would sit for hours, vacant as an empty whelk-shell, listening to the radio.

With a blank, absorbed face, almost like a cretin who might have been a prophet, he would sit motionless, listening to the loud speaker. Connie refused to have the thing going at meal-times. So he would rush through his meal, no longer noticing what he ate, no longer anxious about "nourishment", bolting his food in a blank absorption, to get back to the radio. And there he would sit, like an empty shell, with the noise of the thing rattling through him. (II; 537)

Two characteristics of Clifford as radio listener can be pointed out. Firstly, his irrational and uncontrollable infatuation with the radio, ignoring everything else including essential human relations. Secondly, the suggestion, made long before Marshall McLuhan, that what matters is the contact with the medium itself rather than its content. In his book on the relationship between literature and the media, Keith Williams offers three examples from the prose of the twenties and the thirties, in which (the) people referred to share Clifford's way of listening-in. Both Henry Green's 1929 *Living* and

Walter Greenwood's 1934 *His Worship the Mayor* contain descriptions of a man addicted to wireless at the expense of people around him, whereas Arthur Calder-Marshall's essay looks at housewives' 'background listening' as infantile and likens it to sucking at dummies. Thus Clifford Chatterley can be seen as typical of a large group of wireless listeners.

Clifford's eager searching for distant, foreign stations, as rendered in the first and final versions of *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, is also typical of the age of the radio craze.

He was always looking blindly and abstractedly at his watch, to see what time it was, which station would be calling. It became a passion with him, to get the distant or difficult calls. Constance heard weird noises in the small hours, and sat up in bed in terror. Then she remembered, he was trying to get New York, which would be calling at half-past two in the morning. (I; 174)

This search was then called 'DX [distant station] fishing' and was popular among wireless enthusiasts.¹⁸ And in the same year that Lawrence began work on *Lady Chatterley's Lover* (Version I), *World Radio*, a magazine carrying foreign programmes, aimed at DX fishers, was first published in Britain.¹⁹ According to Jeffrey Sconce, 'most accounts of DX fishing lauded radio's miraculous ability to bring the vast expanses of the world into the cozy domestic space of the home.'²⁰ Lawrence's is a reverse, dystopian version of the same wireless 'global

village': for him, wireless turns the world into a claustrophobic space, from which the lovers in the novel try to escape, in vain. Connie laments that, because of wireless, 'the far ends of the earth are not five minutes from Charing Cross' (III; 281).

The BBC and *Lady Chatterley's Lover*

Perhaps the role the BBC played in the 1926 class war also helped draw Lawrence's attention to the growing importance of radio. His concern over the General Strike of May that year is repeatedly expressed in his letters, including those addressed to his two sisters. And the novel has been conceived as the consequence of the author's last visit to the mining district of the Midlands in the autumn of the same year. There, he witnessed a still ongoing coal strike, the cause and aftermath of the General Strike. He saw it as the beginning of an even more serious social upheaval and the shock he received from it started him writing the novel. *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, therefore, can be thought to have indirectly resulted from the nationwide strike of May.

The radio broadcasting of the BBC played a vital role in it, helping the establishment to its victory, and thereby demonstrating the media's growing importance and great promise for the future. During the strike, virtually all the other media stopped and the radio became by far the most influential provider of information, so the whole nation listened to the BBC news. The BBC's stance and behaviour was unequivocally pro-government, releasing news biased against the

strikers, using the government source for its news bulletins, putting speakers against the strike on the air but preventing those with neutral or pro-strike attitudes from being heard.²¹ For its bias, the BBC was then called BFC (British Falsehood Company).²² Mark Pegg classifies listeners during the strike into three kinds, one being 'the strikers and labour supporters' who treated the broadcasts 'with suspicion and hostility.'²³ Lawrence might have heard about the broadcasts during the strike from his sisters. He also might have heard BBC news bulletins against the coal strike during his stay in England and noted its pro-capitalist stance.²⁴

Also important is that the broadcast English of that time sounded obnoxious to the British working class. The accent of the so-called BBC English purported to be classless, but was in fact based on that of the ruling class; and, thanks to the enormous popularity of the radio in the decade, that standardized, snooty English was diffused all over the country for the first time in history, to the disgust of the workers.²⁵ It is likely that this situation is reflected in the opposition of wireless English on the side of Clifford and the genuine Derbyshire dialect the gamekeeper chooses to speak.

Broadcast Wireless Voice and the Emptying of the Self

How the broadcast voice is related to the emptying of the self will be explored now. As said before, we will not aim at a comprehensive picture of the aural-oral technological culture of the period here, but will offer the section of the history of the techno-voice that concerns D.

H. Lawrence. In doing so, we will resort to the works of two excellent though somewhat idiosyncratic critics of the media and literature, Friedrich Kittler and Walter Benjamin, modifying their ideas when necessary. In his several books, Kittler discusses a shift brought about by the late nineteenth-century arrival of the phonograph.²⁶ According to him, the relationship between voice and literature radically changed when it was invented. In the pre-phonographic days from around 1800, the period dominated by printed words and increasing literacy, the voice of the soul, of the deep self, was imagined in the text by people engaged in silent reading. In one of the books, *Discourse Networks: 1800/1900*, for example, a quotation of Friedrich Schlegel's remark that 'one seems to hear what one is merely reading' is followed by Kittler's comment that 'a voice, as pure as it is transcendental, rises from between the lines.'²⁷ This voice is elsewhere described as 'unembellished accents from the profoundest region of the soul' reproduced by writing.²⁸ Kittler's periodization agrees with ours: those earlier-discussed instances of the disembodied voice in the writings of Radcliffe and Wordsworth indicates something happened to the voice in the text around 1800. We could also add another, English instance in support of Kittler's argument, a famed passage from one of Keats' odes: 'Heard melodies are sweet, but those unheard / Are sweeter; therefore, ye soft pipes, play on; / Not to the sensual ear, but, more endear'd, / Pipe to the spirit ditties of no tone.'²⁹ The poem's indication that the imagined voice has stronger appeal and more closely relates to one's soul reinforces Kittler's hypothesis.

However, the reason given by Kittler for the pre-phonographic imagining of voice in text is interesting but limited in scope. He ascribes it to the mother's increased role in teaching reading to children. According to him, the mother's voice, inseparable from the experience of acquiring literacy, returns to one's imagination when reading silently, and is taken for the voice of Nature. This could be part of the reason, but, as we have already observed, the primary cause for the prominence of voice in the Romantic culture is the process of modernization marginalizing the pre-modern oral culture, which has, in turn, given birth to the nostalgia for it. The education of literacy by mothers certainly comprises part of that same modernizing process. As was shown, the voice representing the oral culture frequents texts of around 1800. In other words, the voice, banished from the modernizing society, returns in the way the repressed does in the Freudian psychoanalysis.

According to Kittler, this situation surrounding the voice imagined in text changed with the invention of phonograph. When the aural technology of recording made it possible to reproduce it physically, voice ceased to be something imagined in reading. Instead, it became real through this mode of mechanical reproduction, which deprived voice of depth, aura, its connection with the soul. Kittler contrasts Charles Cros's poetic dream of the preservation of voice and Ernst von Wildenbruch's phonographic poem. Cros, the French Symbolist poet and Edison's rival inventor of ^{the} phonograph, left the following verse 'under the significant title *Inscription*': 'Like the faces in cameos / I

wanted beloved voices / To be a fortune which one keeps forever, / And which can repeat the musical / Dream of the too short hour; / Time would flee, I subdue it.'³⁰ The poem, however, was not meant for the phonographic recording, and Cros did not record it. By contrast, the Wilhelmine poet laureate, Ernst von Wildenbruch, wrote a poem for the phonograph and has left a recording of it:

We may model the human visage, and hold the eye fast in an image, but the bodiless voice, borne by air, must fade away and disappear. / The fawning face can deceive the eye, the sound of the voice can never lie; thus it seems to me the phonograph is the soul's true photograph, / Which brings to light what is suppressed and makes the past speak at our behest. So listen to the sound of what I declare, and Ernst von Wildenbruch's soul will be laid bare.³¹

In spite of the text's emphasis on the connection between voice and soul, says Kittler, Wildenbruch's recorded voice turned out to be 'nothing but noise.' Made real by the phonograph, the voice, which Wildenbruch had imagined as belonging to the soul, ceased to function as 'pure poetic breath'; in short, it lost its aura. It is 'one thing to write proudly about the phonographic recording of all voices, as Charles Cros did; it is another thing to write, as Wildenbruch did, "For the Phonographic Recording of His Voice" and then to have to speak it.'³² The advent of phonograph has made it clear that the unheard voice in imagination is sweeter than the one phonographically reproduced.

By reading his remarks as also applicable to wireless, Kittler's

argument can be related to our observation about the relationship between the aural technology and the emptying of the self. The wireless voice in *Lady Chatterley's Lover* is certainly an instance of the deprivation of the aural aura by the technology exposing the public to a then unprecedented amount of voice.³³ By contrast, the aural aura of the wireless, combined with the experience of the war, is discernible in Virginia Woolf's pre-broadcast 'Kew Gardens' (started in 1917), where a man speaks of listening to the voice of the spirits of the dead with a wireless set. Such a mystical treatment of wireless voice in the story is also in tune with Lawrence's contemporary, pre-broadcast attitude toward the media, both corroborating Jeffrey Sconce's emphasis on the occult implications of the early twentieth-century wireless.³⁴

Kittler's linear historical view that the advent of the phonograph changed our attitude toward voice and self irrevocably is, in the long term, also in agreement with what is shown by a comparison of the treatments of phonograph by *fin-de-siècle* writers, such as Stoker, Machen, Kipling, with their Modernist counterparts, those by Joyce, Huxley, Woolf, Eliot, Lawrence. The voice of the phonograph in Stoker's *Dracula* is likened to 'a soul crying out' (271); the mysterious phonograph in Machen's story 'The Autophone' resurrects the voice of the hidden self of the deep past; even the less eerie phonographic voice in Kipling's *Kim* retains something of an enigma that suggests its link to a secret self. The voice's association with the deep self is felt in all these instances. It also corresponds to what Charles Grivel has found out about the phonographic voice of the French *fin-de-siècle* writers:

Literature thinks beyond the phonograph. It imposes on the machine supplementary demands for which, perhaps, the latter was conceived, but which its engineers are very careful not to reveal: the phonograph finds itself *literarily* charged with reproducing not only the sounds of the voice or of song but also those of the soul, the very intonation of identity—self. I do not only want it to repeat me, but more than this, to capture me and find me—invention within repetition.³⁵

On the other hand, in Modernist texts, either the element of noise resisting the aura of voice and music is more to the fore, or the phonograph is represented as an aspect of vulgar modern life. In the Hades chapter of *Ulysses*, Leopold Bloom dreams of reproducing the voice of the deceased by gramophone for those who are left. This is how he imagines it would be: 'After dinner on a Sunday. Put on poor old greatgrandfather. Kraahraark! Hellohellohello Amawfullyglad Kraark awfullygladaseeagain hellohello amawf krpthsth.'³⁶ The voice from the other world being sandwiched by the noise of the machine, the occasion turns out rather comical. In Woolf's *Between the Acts*, the pageant, for which a gramophone in the bush provides the accompanying voice and music, is also accompanied frequently by the noise made by the needle on the disc. Since the voice from the bush has a biblical association of God's speech, the mechanical noise, in place of the divine voice, creates bathos.³⁷ Yet another relevant scene is in Aldous Huxley's *Point Counter Point*, in which a spiritually

exalted movement from one of Beethoven's late string quartets is played on the phonograph. Its power is almost overwhelming, but even that music eventually fails to save its listeners and also ends with the anti-climactic 'scratching of the needle on the revolving disc.'³⁸

One of the characters in Huxley's novel, Mark Rampion, is modeled on D.H. Lawrence. Rampion denounces the cinema and the radio as the rotten fruits of the modern civilization. He is almost overwhelmed by the phonographic Beethoven, but resists succumbing to it. Likewise, the real Lawrence criticizes 'cinema, radio and gramophone' as evils of the modern world.³⁹ The playing of a record is also symptomatic of the barrenness of the life of the typist in *The Waste Land*.⁴⁰

However, Kittler's linear view of techno-literary history is not without its problems: Because of its somewhat simplistic picture governed by technological determinism, it is bound to contain short-term inaccuracies. The advent of a technology does not necessarily change the socio-literary situation overnight and for good. The shift from the deep self to the emptiness of the self with regard to the modern aural technologies was much more gradual, with occasional backward glances, than suggested by Kittler. That there were writers referring to the power of the mechanically reproduced or transmitted voice and music should not be disregarded. In *The Magic Mountain*, Thomas Mann describes how the profoundly transcendent force of the phonographic voice and music captures the heart and the ear of the young hero. The disembodiedness of singers' voices on the phonograph is presented as essential part of its charm.⁴¹ The enchantment of the

bodiless voice and music enabled by the modern aural-oral technology is also focused on by a German critic, Frank Warschauer, in his 1926 article on music and broadcasting. He considered the radio as the ideal medium for music, because of its capability of eliminating the player's body from music. He found in the medium the realization of Goethe's dream of purified, disembodied music.⁴²

Instances of oscillation and ambiguity concerning aural technology's relation to the self abound. Beside the cases of Kipling, Joyce and Huxley we have seen, Villiers de l'Isle-Adam's *Tomorrow's Eve*, for example, features a phonographic female android who is of relevance here: whether she has a soul or not remains a mystery up to the end. As regards telephone, the narrator of Proust's *Remembrance of Things Past* recalls the early days of telephone, when telephone was a magic apparatus that enabled miraculous, almost supernatural communions between two souls. However, he also makes reference to bathetic scenes of the wrong number and the interrupted communication.⁴³

Kittler's work might be described as a post-McLuhan, Lacanian variation on Walter Benjamin's illustrious essay, 'The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction.' Benjamin's insight is truly original, but the essay also suffers from technological determinism, suppressing the possibility of alternative views of the cinema. Rather, it is another essay by him, 'Little History of Photography,' that, as a supplement to Kittler's work, provides a useful hint for placing Lawrence in context.⁴⁴

The essay can be considered as a precursor of 'The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction,' in the sense that it is an earlier attempt to see the history of the modern technology of reproduction, here represented by photography, as that of the disappearance of aura. Importantly, however, it differs from the later, better-known essay, in that it also examines the *early* history of photography. According to Benjamin, this early period, that between the invention of the technology and the commercialization of it, was the golden era of photography.⁴⁵ Some early photographs, such as those by David Octavius Hill and Karl Dauthenday, were able to convey the aura, or deep selfhood, of those photographed, with the technology's groundbreaking capability to faithfully represent reality that gave 'its products a magical value.'⁴⁶ The new experience of being photographed was also conducive to the conveyance of the aura: 'Hill's subjects [...] were probably not far from the truth when they described "the phenomenon of photography" as still being "a great and mysterious experience".'⁴⁷ However, when it became part of people's daily life with the success of 'the visiting-card picture' and the use of photography in journalism, Benjamin says, the photographic art went into decline.⁴⁸ It became cheap and lost the ability to convey aura. Benjamin gives several reasons for the change, such as 'the deepening degeneration of the imperialist bourgeoisie' and the expulsion of darkness due to technical improvement, but these reasons are either not persuasive enough or limited in scope.⁴⁹ A conclusion more generally applicable to emerging technologies and relevant to our

discussion of Lawrence can be drawn from Benjamin's observation on the early history of photography.

Based on his remarks as well as Kittler's, we can now conclude thus: the aura conveyed by a new technology of communication and reproduction, the magical indication of the deep self by that medium, tends to be at its strongest, at least for those like Lawrence, in the period between the birth of the technology and the familiarization of it to laymen. As their exposure to it grows, its association with aura, or deep self, weakens, for the reason provided by Kittler.⁵⁰ With regard to the modern aural-oral technology, the aura was strongly felt by *fin-de-siècle* writers, as shown by the way they refer to phonographic and wireless voices. It seems that the aura gradually lessened during the pre-broadcasting period of the twentieth century, until an explosive and unprecedented spreading of disembodied voice by broadcast brought about a decisive change toward the disappearance of the aural technological aura. Because of the overwhelming scale and speed of its growth, compared to the other two aural-oral technologies, phonograph and telephone, that decisive shift occurred at the time of radio broadcasting. Clifford's infatuation with wireless broadcasting and his related loss of self reflect such a historical moment.⁵¹

The Gamekeeper's Dialect Voice, Embodied and Virile:

The Sexual-Somatic and the Socio-Political Contexts

Lady Chatterley's Lover, however, contains another conspicuous voice, which opposes Clifford Chatterley's bodiless wireless voice:

Oliver Mellors' dialect voice. This latter voice closely relates to sex and body. When Connie is not satisfied with her sexual experience with Mellors, she resents the broad dialect the gamekeeper speaks (173). In contrast, after a satisfying intercourse, Connie even imitates his speech:

"Tha mun come one naight ter th' cottage, afore tha goos—sholl ter?" he asked, lifting his eyebrows as he looked at her, his hands dangling between his knees.

"Sholl ter?" she echoed, teasing.

He smiled.

"Ay, sholl ter?" he repeated.

"Ay!" she said, imitating the dialect sound.

"Yi!" he said.

"Yi!" she repeated.

"An' slaip wi' me," he said. "It needs that. When sholt come?"

"When sholl I?" she said. (177)

The conversation thus goes on. It is to be noted that this playful exchange of the dialect is about making plans for their next assignation. And the conversation leads to Mellors' use of 'cunt' and 'fuck,' both introduced as dialect *and* sexually taboo words.

If we also add the body-spirit dichotomy represented by Mellors and Clifford, we can say this: the triumvirate of dialect, sex and physicality is opposed to another, corresponding, negative triumvirate

of standard English, impotence and Platonic spirituality. In the sexual-somatic vein, the wireless disembodied voice in *Lady Chatterley's Lover* is to be understood as the opposite of the gamekeeper's embodied dialect voice.

The sexual-somatic aspect is linked with the socio-political one. As was said, the novel is socio-political in origin: the author witnessed the 1926 miners' strike. But more than the class question is involved in it. Some clichés of Western colonial representation have crept into Lawrence's description of miners and their community. Many of the typically *fin-de-siècle* representations can be found in his last novel, among which are the equations of the African with the working class and with the Irish, and the attribution of sensuality to the African. Both of them are present in the description of Mrs. Bolton's gossip of the miners' village: it 'sounded really more like a central African jungle than an English village' (102). The text suggests that it is the hidden but intense sexuality of an elderly couple in the village that makes the comparison possible. The attribution of lasciviousness to the African also appears in the gamekeeper's remark on the sexuality of the African woman: 'I thought there was no real sex left: never a woman who'd really "come" naturally with a man: except black women' (204). The interlinking of Michaelis's Irishness and Africa is, again, typical of the British imperial description of these colonies (51).⁵² And Connie's fear of, and fascination with, the miners in the novel is redolent of the Western ambivalence about the dark continent, as seen in Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* and Lawrence's *The Rainbow*.⁵³ The connection

between class and race, or between the question of class and that of the Empire, in the novel is thus evident. And, by also considering in this vein our earlier discussion of the sexual implications of the African and the working class voices in *The Rainbow* and of the sensual fascination with the workmen's dialect voice in *Women in Love*, the class and race implications of voice in *Lady Chatterley's Lover* will also become clear. Mellors' virile dialect voice of English working-class origin is secretly linked to the colonial and sexual voice of Africa we have seen in the chapter on Conrad.

It is also possible to see the novel's focus on the dialect voice in the context of the tradition of the de-politicizing voice from Radcliffe and Wordsworth through to Symons, Conrad, and others. The adoption of the working-class dialect voice by Mellors is not accompanied by a whole-hearted sympathy for the miners. Mellors' view of them is ambivalent: although he has a secret wish to create a utopian community with them, he is, at the same time, highly critical of their lifestyle and indifferent to the practical solution of their current plights. In addition, the novel represents the miners as if they were the racial other, repellent and fascinating at once. The gamekeeper's decision to use the dialect in spite of his ability to speak standard English, therefore, does not simply signify his support for what the dialect represents: the people. It is as if Lawrence wanted to save their language, but not the miners, at least, not in the conventionally political sense. In other words, he is verbally, but perhaps not humanly, sympathetic with the working class. Indeed, there is a

tendency in Lawrence to focus on voice at the expense of realistic attention to the world, which often results in the obfuscation of socio-political elements. We have seen the instance of the Conradian African voice in *The Rainbow*, whose foregrounding of the sensual conceals rather than divulges the colonial situation. The voluptuous dialect voice of the miners in *Women in Love*, too, can be considered as another instance of the downplaying of the socio-political by emphasizing the sexual.

The same pattern recurs in his Mexican novel, *The Plumed Serpent*. The attention of its heroine, Kate Leslie, is first drawn to a religio-political movement, central to this novel about the revival of an ancient indigenous religion in Mexico, because she is attracted by the unfamiliar-sounding name of its central god, Quetzalcoatl (61-2). Another character also contrasts the magical sounds of its other gods to the unattractive sound of Jesus Christ (62). And, although at once attracted and disgusted by the country, Kate eventually decides to stay in Mexico, because of the various Mexican voices that fascinate her: the voice of the natives, the singing in the revived community ritual, the voice of the movement's leader, Don Ramón. For example, when she feels she has had enough of the country, she thinks again in the following way: 'But yet! But yet! The gentle voices of the natives. The voices of the boys like birds twittering among the trees of the plaza of Tehuacán!' (80). It seems that the real Mexico is represented by voice in the novel. This obsessive equation of voice and the nation results in the obscuring of the socio-political condition of the country

and the upholding of a reactionary political view as well as the typically Western colonial representation of the natives as terrifying and fascinating barbarians. The focus on voice in *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, with the consequent split in Lawrence's attitude towards the working class, leading in part to his disregard for the miners' plight, is a continuation of this tendency.

Back to the Old Pattern,

Or to the Nostalgia for the Working-Class Voice,

In the Age of Broadcasting

That the dialect voice is chosen as the antidote of the wireless voice in D. H. Lawrence's last novel can also be explained in terms of the changing relation of the modern aural-oral technology to the self, which can be divided into three periods. The first period is the time before the birth of modern aural-oral technology, the days when the voice either encountered or imagined in silent reading is related to the deep self, owing to a nostalgia for the pre-modern oral culture and society in the age of growing literacy as part of the modernizing process. The second period comprises the early days of telephone, phonograph and wireless, when the aura conveyed by the new aural technologies is still strongly felt and the disembodied techno-voice is taken as the mystic voice of the soul. It is then followed by the third period, when that voice is secularized by wireless broadcasting. And it is the resultant disappearance of the aura from the aural technology that turns Lawrence away from the pre-broadcast image of wireless, as

embodied in Kipling's and Woolf's fictions as well as his earlier references to it, and induces him to return to the old pattern of looking for one's deep self in the working-class dialect voice representing the pre-modern, pre-literate culture and society. For that reason, nostalgia for the genuine working-class voice is particularly strong and prominent in *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, compared to his earlier novels. No other novels of his foreground the dialect in the same way and to the same degree it does. Even the following criticism in the novel of the spurious working-class voice reproduced by wireless inversely indicates the author's concern with the *genuine* speech of the people: 'she [Connie] heard the loud-speaker begin to bellow, in an idiotically velveteen-genteel sort of voice, something about a series of street-cries, the very cream of genteel affectation imitating old criers' (122).

Conclusion: Continuities and Discontinuities

The disembodied voice Lawrence most evidently shares with the *fin-de-siècle* writers is the voice of the African darkness in *The Rainbow*, which, imperial and sexual, is markedly similar to the disembodied voices in Conrad's *Heart of Darkness*. The sensual voice of the miners' dialect in *Women in Love* is not literally bodiless, but its association with the underground connects it with the disembodied voice of Jokanaan from the abyss in Wilde's *Salomé*.

In *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, the working-class dialect voice, with its sexual and political implications, reappears, but with differences: it is highlighted as a major motif; and is placed in opposition to the

disembodied wireless voice of the dominant class. A new dichotomy is thus brought into being by the radio broadcasting: that of the disembodied techno-voice and the embodied dialect voice, respectively representing the dominant and the working classes. The deep self is related to the latter voice, owing to the murder of the aura by broadcasting and the resurfacing of the Romantic search for the soul in the pre-modern, pre-literate culture.

NOTES

¹ D.H.Lawrence, *The Rainbow*, ed. by Mark Kinkead-Weekes (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1989), p.413. Further references to this edition are given after quotations in the text.

² While admitting a similarity between Kurtz and Skrebensky, Michael Bell ends up in highlighting their difference, claiming that 'Conrad was still inside the colonial order as Lawrence was not.' See Michael Bell, *Literature, Modernism and Myth: Belief and Responsibility in the Twentieth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1997), p.154. Our concern here is, however, different and perhaps more confined, focusing on the cluster of metaphors surrounding that of the disembodied voice in the description of Africa. We therefore would claim that, though Skrebensky is admittedly a negative character in *The Rainbow*, in contrast with the ambivalent charisma Kurtz is invested with, the stereotyped metaphors including that of the voice of darkness employed for the description of Africa are shared by the two novels; and that, in that respect, both of them belong to the same tradition of the Western colonial imagination.

³ D.H.Lawrence, *Women in Love*, ed. by David Farmer, Lindeth Vasey and John Worthen (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1987), pp.115 and 117. Further references to this edition are given after quotations in the text.

⁴ D.H.Lawrence, *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, ed. by Michael Squires (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1993), p.110. Further references to this edition are given after quotations in the text.

⁵ D.H.Lawrence, *The First and Second Lady Chatterley Novels*, ed. by Dieter Mehl and Christa Jansohn (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1999), p.537. Further references to this edition are given after

quotations in the text.

⁶ D.H.Lawrence, *The Symbolic Meaning: The Uncollected Versions of Studies in Classic American Literature*, ed. by Armin Arnold (Fontwell: Centaur, 1962), p.238. Further references to this edition are given after quotations in the text.

⁷ D.H.Lawrence, *Studies in Classic American Literature* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1971), p.115. Further references to this edition are given after quotations in the text.

⁸ D.H.Lawrence, *Fantasia of the Unconscious*, in his *Fantasia of the Unconscious & Psychoanalysis and the Unconscious* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1971), p.70. Further references to this edition are given after quotations in the text.

⁹ See D.H.Lawrence's *Kangaroo*, ed. by Bruce Steele (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1994), pp.296-302.

¹⁰ D.H.Lawrence, 'The Proper Study,' in his *Reflections on the Death of a Porcupine and Other Essays*, ed. by Michael Herbert (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1988), pp.167-173.

¹¹ Gillian Beer, 'Wave Theory and the Rise of Literary Modernism,' in her *Open Fields: Science in Cultural Encounter* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1996), pp.295-318.

¹² D.H.Lawrence, 'Why the Novel Matters,' in his *Phoenix: The Posthumous Papers by D.H.Lawrence*, ed. by Edward D. McDonald (New York: Viking, 1936), pp.533-538.

¹³ See Stanley Goldberg, 'In Defense of Ether: The British Response to Einstein's Special Theory of Relativity, 1905-1911,' *Historical Studies in Physical Sciences*, 2 (1970), 89-125. See also G.N.Cantor and M.J.S.Hodge eds., *Conceptions of Ether*, pp.53-54.

¹⁴ David B.Wilson, 'The Thought of Late Victorian Physicists: Oliver

Lodge's Ethereal Body,' *Victorian Studies*, 15 (1971-2), 29-48 (p.31).

¹⁵ Andrew Crisell, *Understanding Radio*, 2nd edn. (London: Routledge, 1994), p.19.

¹⁶ Asa Briggs, *The History of Broadcasting in the United Kingdom*, 5 vols (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1995), I: *The Birth of Broadcasting*, 17. Mark Pegg's study is the most detailed in terms of figures concerning the early history of radio: Mark Pegg, *Broadcasting and Society 1918-1939* (London: Croom Helm, 1983).

¹⁷ See Charles R. Perry, 'The British Experience 1876-1912: The Impact of the Telephone During the Years of Delay,' in *The Social Impact of the Telephone*, ed. by Ithiel de Sola Pool (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1977), pp.69-96 (p.91).

¹⁸ See Jeffrey Sconce, 'The Voice from the Void: Wireless, Modernity and the Distant Dead,' *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 1 (1998), 211-232 (pp.216-7).

¹⁹ Pegg, 106.

²⁰ Sconce, p.217.

²¹ For instance, the 9 P.M. news bulletins of 9 May reported a Cardinal Bourne's speech against the strike and the assurance by the government that it will take effective measures to prevent 'the victimisation by Trade Unions of any man who remains at work or who may return to work' (BBC Written Archives Centre, News Bulletin, 9 p.m. 9 May 1926, pp.5 and 8). See also Paddy Scannell and David Cardiff, *A Social History of British Broadcasting: Volume One 1922-1939: Serving the Nation* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1991), pp.108-9; Keith Labourn, *The General Strike of 1926* (Manchester: Manchester Univ. Press, 1993), pp.79-80 and 135; and Briggs, p.331.

²² Scannell and Cardiff, pp.111-2; Pegg, p.180

²³ Pegg, p.178.

²⁴ Unfortunately, no record of the contents of BBC news bulletins during Lawrence's stay in the U.K. from 30 July to 28 September is left in BBC Written Archives Centre. But it can be easily surmised from BBC's stance during the General Strike.

²⁵ For the BBC English and its class implications, see Scannell and Cardiff, pp.176-8; Briggs, pp.221 and 267-8; Pegg, p.98; Raymond Williams, *Television: Technology and Cultural Form* (London: Wesleyan Univ. Press, 1992), p.41; Valentine Cunningham, *British Writers of the Thirties* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1988), pp.317-8. For the impression BBC English gave to workers; see also George Orwell, *A Patriot After All: 1940-1941*, ed. by Peter Davison, *The Complete Works of George Orwell*, 20 vols (London: Secker & Warburg, 1986-1998), XII (1998), 197; George Orwell, *I Have Tried to Tell the Truth: 1943-1944*, ed. by Peter Davison, *The Complete Works of George Orwell*, 20 vols (London: Secker & Warburg, 1986-1998), XVI (1998), 315.

²⁶ See Friedrich A. Kittler, *Discourse Networks 1800/1900*, trans. by Michael Metter and Chris Cullens (Stanford: Stanford Univ. Press, 1990); *Gramophone, Film, Typewriter*, trans. by Geoffrey Winthrop-Young and Michael Wutz (Stanford: Stanford Univ. Press, 1999); and *Literature, Media, Information Systems*, ed. by John Johnston (Amsterdam: G+B Arts, 1997).

²⁷ Kittler, *Discourse Networks*, p.65. See also Kittler, *Gramophone, Film, Typewriter*, pp.9 and 69; and Kittler, *Literature, Media, Information Systems*, p.39.

²⁸ Kittler, *Discourse Networks*, p.64.

²⁹ John Keats, 'Ode on a Grecian Urn,' in his *Complete Poems*, ed. by Jack Stillinger (Cambridge, MA: Belknap, 1982), pp.282-3 (p.282).

³⁰ Quoted in Kittler, *Discourse Networks*, p.231.

³¹ Quoted in Kittler, *Gramophone, Film, Typewriter*, p.79. A different translation of the same poem in Kittler's *Discourse Networks*, pp.235-236.

³² Kittler, *Gramophone, Film, Typewriter*, p.83; and Kittler, *Discourse Networks*, p.236.

³³ Applying Benjamin's analysis of the film to the broadcasting, Kate Lacey mentions the potentials of the radio for the destruction of aura, from a viewpoint slightly different from ours; see Kate Lacey, 'Towards a Periodization of Listening: Radio and Modern Life,' *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 3 (2000), 279-288 (p.285).

³⁴ Virginia Woolf, 'Kew Gardens,' in her *The Complete Shorter Fiction*, ed. by Susan Dick (London: Triad Grafton, 1991), pp. 90-95 (p.92); Jeffrey Sconce, 'The Voice from the Void.'

³⁵ Charles Grivel, 'The Phonograph's Horned Mouth,' in *Wireless Imagination: Sound, Radio, and the Avant-Garde*, ed. by Douglas Kahn and Gregory Whitehead (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1992), pp.31-61 (p.41).

³⁶ James Joyce, *Ulysses*, ed. by Hans Walter Gabler, with Wolfhard Steppe and Claus Melchior (London: Penguin, 1986), p.93.

³⁷ See Virginia Woolf, *Between the Acts* (San Diego: Harvest/Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1969), pp.149, 157, 174 and 195.

³⁸ Aldous Huxley, *Point Counter Point* (New York: Modern Library, 1928), p.512.

³⁹ D.H.Lawrence, 'Let the Dead Bury Their Dead,' in his *The Complete Poems of D.H.Lawrence*, ed. by Vivian de Sola Pinto and Warrant Roberts, 2 vols (London: Heinemann, 1964), I, 440-2 (p.441).

⁴⁰ T.S.Eliot, *The Waste Land*, l.256, in his *The Complete Poems and*

Plays: 1909-1950 (London: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1971), pp.37-55 (p.44).

It would be also interesting in this context to compare Agatha Christie's 1926 *The Murder of Roger Ackroyd* and Stoker's *fin-de-siècle Dracula*. They are similar, in that the aural-oral technology provides the clue to the central secret in the work. However, the phonographic voice relates to one's deeper self in *Dracula*, whereas, together with the wireless and the telephone voices, it conveys no sense of aura in Christie's novel.

⁴¹ Thomas Mann, *The Magic Mountain*, trans. by John E. Woods (New York: Vintage, 1995), p.633. A chapter called 'Fullness of Harmony' in the novel fully describes the protagonists' enthusiasm about the gramophone.

⁴² We are indebted to Hiroshi Watanabe for our discussion of Frank Warschauer's work. See Watanabe, *Ongaku Kikai Gekijo* (Tokyo: Shinshokan, 1997), pp.214-6. See also Frank Warchauer, 'Musik im Rundfunk,' *Musikblätter des Anbruch*, Jg.8 Heft 8/9 (1926), 65-66; and Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship*, ed. and trans. by Eric A. Blackall (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1995), pp.332-333.

⁴³ Marcel Proust, *Remembrance of Things Past*, trans. by C.K.Scott Moncrieff and Terence Kilmartin, 3 vols (New York: Vintage, 1982), II: *The Guermantes Way & Cities of the Plain*, pp.133-139.

⁴⁴ See Walter Benjamin, 'The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction,' in his *Illuminations*, ed. and intro. by Hannah Arendt (London: Fontana, 1992), pp.211-244; and Walter Benjamin, 'Little History of Photography,' in *Walter Benjamin: Selected Writings*, 3 vols (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1996-), II: 1927-1934, trans. by

Rodney Livingstone and others, ed. by Michael W. Jennings, Howard Eiland, and Gary Smith (1999), 507-530.

⁴⁵ Benjamin, 'Little History of Photography,' p.507.

⁴⁶ Benjamin, 'Little History of Photography,' p.510.

⁴⁷ Benjamin, 'Little History of Photography,' p.512.

⁴⁸ Benjamin, 'Little History of Photography,' p.507.

A similar remark was made about phonographs by Theodor W. Adorno in 1927:

Talking machines and phonograph records seem to have suffered the same historical fate as that which once befell photographs: the transition from artisanal to industrial production transforms not only the technology of distribution but also that which is distributed. As the recordings become more perfect in terms of plasticity and volume, the subtlety of color and the authenticity of vocal sound declines as if the singer were being distanced more and more from the apparatus.

Theodor W. Adorno, 'The Curves of the Needle,' trans. by Thomas Y. Levin, *October*, 55 (1990), 49-55 (p.49).

⁴⁹ Benjamin, 'Little History of Photography,' p.517.

⁵⁰ Later, as it gets outmoded and becomes an object of nostalgia, the technology tends to regain the power of conveying aura. Benjamin counts distance as one of the characteristics of aura, and it seems possible to apply it to the relation of the technology to aura. Apart from traits specific to the technology, its distance from people's daily life is essential to the creation of aura.

⁵¹ Since our aim here is confined to an examination of the relation of some literary writers to the contemporary technology in the British society, we are not to be understood here as offering this rather simple linear model of the techno-history as comprehensive.

⁵² A similar comparison of the Irish and 'the dark races' is also made in

his Mexican novel, *The Plumed Serpent*. See D.H.Lawrence, *The Plumed Serpent*, ed. by L.D.Clark (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1987), p.148. Further references to this edition are given after quotations in the text.

⁵³ The Western ambivalence about its colonies, of course, is not limited to Africa. The same simultaneous fear and fascination can be observed both in Lawrence's other works and other writers' writings, such as his Mexican and Kipling's Indian fictions.

Conclusion

The disembodied voice is connected with one's early, forgotten, prespecular self, and hence often evokes a sense of nostalgia, fear, or desire. But it is also entangled with various historical factors, the exploration of which has been our main concern. After puzzling out the four major sets of implications in Arthur Symons' aesthetic ideal of the disembodied voice of a soul, we have examined various aspects of the *fin-de-siècle* disembodied voice in Conrad, Wilde, Stoker and Kipling. By including discussions of the Gothic-Romantic culture and of D.H. Lawrence, we have also added a diachronic-genealogical approach to the synchronic one.

The *fin-de-siècle* disembodied voice is based on the modern 'melocentricism' of late eighteenth century origin, characterized by the Romantic premise of aesthetics and language study prioritizing music and voice, and linked to the nostalgia for pre-modern, oral culture and to the corresponding descriptions of the disembodied voice in literature. We have also shown that this 'melocentric' voice points to an alternative aural-oral subjectivity in the ocularcentric modern age.

Underpinned by the 'melocentric' Gothic-Romantic tradition, the disembodied voice in Conrad's *Heart of Darkness*, first and foremost, relates to the dual faces of the contemporary imperial system, the hyper-visual consumer society within Britain and the colonial situation abroad. To a lesser degree, it is also concerned with the scientific concept of ether as well as the sexual-cum-political aspect. In Wilde's

Salomé, too, aesthetic 'melocentricism' and the socio-political critique of phantasmagoric *fin-de-siècle* consumerism are prominent in Jokanaan's underground voice. On the other hand, the princess's disembodied voice on the momentarily darkened stage, combining with the motif of touch, implies the communal longing, simultaneously aesthetic and political; moreover, it secretly expresses homosexual desire as well.

By contrast, in Stoker's *Dracula* and Kipling's "Wireless" and *Kim*, the technological voice is to the fore. The *Dracula* chapter has shown how the phonographic disembodied voice is involved with both the *fin-de-siècle* British imperial imagination and the post-Wilde-trial homosexual situation; and also how the pre-history of the phonograph is connected with the history of aesthetico-linguistic 'melocentricism.' Much of the Kipling chapter is devoted to an exploration of displacements in his enigmatic narrative, to tease out the concealed political dimension in the wireless and the phonographic voices. The oscillation between the *fin-de-siècle* alternative vocal subjectivity, both Romantic and technological, and the twentieth-century model of the techno-vocal empty self is also intimated in the description of the mysterious 'wireless' voice in his tale.

The shift to the twentieth-century model is denoted by Clifford Chatterley's addiction to wireless in D.H. Lawrence's last novel, a reflection of the birth and subsequent huge success of radio broadcasting in the 1920s. How the rise of the radio effects a change in Lawrence's attitude toward wireless and gives rise to his critique of

Clifford's wireless-vocal empty self has been shown in the previous chapter. The change also causes Lawrence to return to the old pattern of looking for one's deep self in the voice of the people, the dialect voice of the gamekeeper. And yet, there exists a difference between the old pattern and Lawrence's: the voice of one's true self is now embodied.

Although it is not part of our aim to present a comprehensive outlook on the twentieth-century disembodied voice, we would like to end by giving two additional sketches of it, supplementary to the Lawrence chapter.

After Lawrence

The Lawrentian nostalgia for the dialect, embodied voice of the people recurs in George Orwell's *Nineteen Eighty-Four*, suggesting a direction in which this voice goes after Lawrence. The novel shows a marked resemblance to *Lady Chatterley's Lover* in its nostalgia for the working-class embodied voice, involving all the questions that appear in Lawrence's novel of class, technology, sex and dialect. The suggested dichotomy in Orwell's novel of the anti-sex dominant class with its dependence on a technological voice as opposed to the child-bearing, full-bodied working class with a dialect voice is similar to that in Lawrence's work. The governing of the superstate in Orwell's dystopian novel largely relies on the effective functioning of the 'telescreen,' which works often as a radio-like, aural-oral medium, and occasionally as an audio-visual apparatus of surveillance. The blaring voice of news bulletins pervades the novel, which significantly starts

and ends with the radio-like voice. On the other hand, the working-class people, called 'the proles' in the novel, on whom Winston Smith lays his hope as the potential site of resistance to the oligarchy, are often associated with voices different in kind from that of the 'telescreen.' The most important of them is the singing voice of a fertile, full-fleshed working-class woman with a working-class accent, and is closely related to Winston's hope for the 'proles', with their warmth and spontaneity. Her delightful singing marks a sharp contrast to the lifestyle of the ruling class: 'It struck him [Winston] as a curious fact that he had never heard a member of the Party singing alone and spontaneously.'¹ The lives of the 'proles' are also described as having little to do with the 'telescreen.'

Interestingly, as in *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, the BBC is connected with this dichotomy of the two opposing voices. While the 'telescreen' voice derives from the censorship and information control Orwell had experienced as a producer at the BBC during the war, the woman's voice, as Bernard Crick observes, originates in the singing of charwomen in the BBC that the author heard and made a note of in his diary²:

10.6.42: The only time when one hears people singing in the BBC is in the early morning, between 6 and 8. That is the time when the charwomen are at work. [...] They have wonderful choruses, all singing together as they sweep the passages. The place has a quite different atmosphere at this time from what it has later in the day.³

What becomes dominant 'later in the day' is, by contrast, the voice of broadcasts whose scripts have gone through censorship before being aired, a voice which is to be turned into the voice of 'telescreen' news bulletins in *Nineteen Eighty-Four*.

Beside and Against Lawrence

However, we should not be understood as saying that the *fin-de-siècle* tradition of the techno-vocal soul was totally replaced by the Lawrence-Orwell critique of the wireless voice. Rather, they co-existed in the early twentieth century.

Scrutiny of Benjamin's famous essay on the destruction of aura by technology reveals what it is against: the existence of the opposite view of the cinema as the supreme art of the esoteric, spiritual Symbolist tradition. The way Benjamin tries to refute the eulogy of the cinema by writers such as Abel Gance, Séverin-Mars, Alexandre Arnoux, and Franz Werfel, conversely suggests the wide influence of such an aesthetic view of the film.⁴

The same can be said of Lawrence's view of the wireless. Theodor Adorno responded to radio broadcasting in a way similar to Lawrence. Although his important essay, 'On the Fetish Character in Music and the Regression of Listening,' was written in opposition to Benjamin, Adorno agreed with him on the death of aura resulting from modern media and applied Benjamin's analysis of the cinema to his own discussion of the wireless music. However, as was shown in the previous chapter, Frank Warschaur's 1926 eulogy of radio music

indicates the existence of an alternative view of the modern aural-oral technology as the culmination of the 'melocentric' aesthetics.⁵ As both Steven Connor and Susan Douglas observe, there exists an affinity between wireless and spiritualism in the early twentieth century.⁶ All this indicates a continuation of the *fin-de-siècle* mysterious technovocal tradition into the twentieth century in the form of wireless mysticism and 'melocentricism.'⁷

Part of the interest of the techno-'melocentricism' originating in the *fin-de-siècle* is connected with the impact of our recent auditory experience with the Walkman. R. Murray Schafer likens headphone listening to an encounter with one's deep self:

In the head-space of earphone listening, the sounds not only circulate around the listener, they literally seem to emanate from points in the cranium itself, as if the archetypes of the unconscious were in conversation. There is a clear resemblance here to the functioning of Nada Yoga in which interiorized sound (vibration) removes the individual from this world and elevates him toward higher spheres of existence. When the yogi recites his mantra, he *feels* the sound surge through his body. His nose rattles. He vibrates with dark, narcotic powers. Similarly, when sound is conducted directly through the skull of the headphone listener, he is no longer regarding events on the acoustic horizon; no longer is he surrounded by a sphere of moving elements. He *is* the sphere. He is the universe.⁸

Whether to see the Walkman experience as the culmination of the technological 'disembodied voice of a human soul,' or the ultimate target of the Lawrentian critique of the modern autistic self is an intriguing question. However, it is a question that lies outside the scope of this thesis, and one that must be left to a future study.

NOTES

-
- ¹ George Orwell, *Nineteen Eighty-Four*, ed. by Peter Davison, *The Complete Works of George Orwell*, 20 vols (London: Secker & Warburg, 1986-1998), IX (1987), 148.
- ² Bernard Crick, *George Orwell: A Life*, 3rd edn. (London: Penguin, 1992), p.421. There is a still earlier instance of the implied opposition of wireless and communal singing in a 1943 review. See George Orwell, *Keeping Our Little Corner Clean: 1942-1943*, ed. by Peter Davison, *The Complete Works of George Orwell*, 20 vols (London: Secker & Warburg, 1986-1998), XIV (1998), 321.
- ³ George Orwell, *All Propaganda Is Lies: 1941-1942*, ed. by Peter Davison, *The Complete Works of George Orwell*, 20 vols (London: Secker & Warburg, 1986-1998), XIII (1986), 354.
- ⁴ See also Erik Barnouw, *The Magician and the Cinema* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1981), which focuses on the early cinema's close relationship with the magical, the esoteric, and the spiritual.
- ⁵ Frank A. Biocca mentions the divided response among composers of the 1920s to the radio, in his 'The Pursuit of Sound: Radio, Perception and Utopia in the Early Twentieth Century,' *Media, Culture and Society*, 10 (1988), 61-79 (p.67).
- ⁶ Steven Connor, *Dumbstruck: A Cultural History of Ventriloquism* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2000), pp.362-393; and Susan J. Douglas, *Listening In: Radio and the American Imagination* (New York: Times, 1999), pp.40-54.
- ⁷ The same is also true of the phonograph. The protagonist's enthusiasm with the phonographic singing voice in Mann's *The Magic Mountain* was noted in the previous chapter.
- ⁸ R. Murray Schafer, *The Tuning of the World* (Toronto: McClelland and
-

Stewart, 1977), p.119

Bibliography

- Aarsleff, Hans, *The Study of Language in England: 1780-1860* (London: Athlone, 1983)
- Abrams, M.H., 'The Correspondent Breeze: A Romantic Metaphor,' in his *The Correspondent Breeze: Essays on English Romanticism* (New York: Norton, 1984), pp.25-43.
- , *Natural Supernaturalism: Tradition and Revolution in Romantic Literature* (London: Norton, 1971)
- Adburgham, Alison, *Liberty's: A Biography of A Shop* (London: Unwin Hyman, 1990)
- , *Shopping in Style: London from the Restoration to Edwardian Elegance* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1979)
- , *Shops and Shopping 1800-1914*, 2nd edn. (London: Allen and Unwin, 1981)
- Adorno, Theodor W., 'The Curves of the Needle,' trans. by Thomas Y. Levin, *October*, 55 (1990), 49-55
- , 'On the Fetish Character in Music and the Regression of Listening,' in *The Culture Industry: Selected Essays on Mass Culture*, ed. and intro. by J.M.Bernstein (London: Routledge, 1991), pp.26-52
- Agnew, Jean-Christophe, 'Coming Up for Air,' in *Consumption and the World of Goods*, ed. by John Brewer and Roy Porter (London: Longman, 1994)
- All About the Telephone and Phonograph* (London: Ward, Lock and Co.,

n.d.)

Altick, Richard, *The Shows of London* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap, 1978)

Anzieu, Didier, *The Skin Ego*, trans. by Chris Turner (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1989)

Arata, Stephen D., 'The Occidental Tourist: *Dracula* and the Anxiety of Reverse Colonization,' *Victorian Studies*, 33 (1990), 621-645

Armstrong, Nancy, *Fiction in the Age of Photography: The Legacy of British Realism* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1999)

Baily, Richard W., *Images of English: A Cultural History of the Language* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1992)

Baker, Alfred, *The Life of Sir Isaac Pitman* (n.p.: Sir I. Pitman & Sons, 1930)

Baker, W.J., *A History of the Marconi Company* (London: Methuen, 1970)

Baldick, Chris, *In Frankenstein's Shadow: Myth, Monstrosity, and Nineteenth-Century Writing* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1987)

Barnouw, Erik, *The Magician and the Cinema* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1981)

Baudelaire, Charles, *Le Spleen de Paris: Petits poèmes en prose*, in his *Œuvres complètes*, ed. by Claude Pichois (Paris: Gallimard, 1975), pp.273-374

-----, 'Richard Wagner and *Tannhäuser* in Paris,' trans. by P.E.Charvet, in his *Baudelaire: Selected Writings on Art and Literature* (London: Penguin, 1972), pp.325-357

Baylen, J.O., 'W.T.Stead,' *The Times Literary Supplement*, 5 June 1998,

p.17

BBC Written Archives Centre, News Bulletin, 9 p.m. 9 May 1926

Beckson, Karl, *Arthur Symons: A Life* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1987)

Beer, Gilian, *Open Fields: Science in Cultural Encounter* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1996)

Belford, Barbara, *Bram Stoker: A Biography of the Author of Dracula* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1996)

Bell, Alexander Graham, 'Prehistoric Telephone Days,' *The National Geographic Magazine*, 41-3 (March 1922), 223-241

Bell, Michael, *Literature, Modernism and Myth: Belief and Responsibility in the Twentieth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1997)

Benjamin, Walter, *Charles Baudelaire: A Lyric Poet in the Era of High Capitalism*, trans. by Harry Zohn (London: Verso, 1983)

-----, 'Little History of Photograph,' in *Walter Benjamin: Selected Writings*, 3 vols (Cambridge, MA: Belknap, 1996-), II: 1927-1934, trans. by Rodney Livingstone and Others, ed. by Michael W. Jennings, Howard Eiland, and Gary Smith (1999), pp.507-530

-----, 'The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction,' in his *Illuminations*, ed. and intro. by Hannah Arendt (London: Fontana, 1992)

Benson, Donald R., "'Catching Light": Physics and Art in Walter Pater's Cultural Context', George Levine ed. *One Culture: Essays in Science and Literature* (Madison: Univ. of Michigan Press, 1987),

pp.143-163

-----, 'The Crisis of Space: Ether, Atmosphere, and the Solidarity of Men and Nature in *Heart of Darkness*', in *Beyond the Two Cultures: Essays on Science, Technology, and Literature*, ed. by Joseph W. Slade and Judith Yaross Lee (Ames: Iowa State Univ. Press, 1990), pp.161-175

-----, 'Facts and Fictions In Scientific Discourse: The Case of Ether', *Georgia Review*, 38 (1984), 825-837

-----, 'Impressionist Painting and the Problem of Conrad's Atmosphere', *Mosaic*, 22-1 (Winter 1989), 29-40

Benson, John, *The Rise of Consumer Society in Britain 1880-1980* (London: Longman, 1994)

Bhabha, Homi K., *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994)

Biocca, Frank A., 'The Pursuit of Sound: Radio, Perception and Utopia in the Early Twentieth Century,' *Media, Culture and Society*, 10 (1988), 61-79

Bird, Alan, *The Plays of Oscar Wilde* (London: Vision, 1977)

Birkhead, Edtih, *The Tale of Terror: A Study of the Gothic Romance* (New York: Russell & Russell, 1921; repr. 1963)

Bonney, William W., *Thorns and Arabesques: Contexts for Conrad's Fiction* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1980)

Booth, General, *In Darkest England and The Way Out* (London: Salvation Army, 1890)

Bork, Alfred M., 'The Fourth Dimension in Nineteenth-Century Physics', *Isis*, 53-3 (1964), 326-338

- Bowlby, Rachel, *Just Looking: Consumer Culture in Dreiser, Gissing and Zola* (London: Methuen, 1985)
- , *Shopping With Freud* (London: Routledge, 1993)
- Brantlinger, Patrick, *Rule of Darkness: British Literature and Imperialism, 1830-1914* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1988)
- Bresson, François, 'La lecture et ses difficultés,' in Roger Chartier ed., *Pratiques de la lecture* (Paris: Rivages, 1985), pp.12-21
- Brewer, John, and Roy Porter eds., *Consumption and the World of Goods* (London: Routledge, 1993)
- Briggs, Asa, *The History of Broadcasting in the United Kingdom*, 5 vols (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1995), I: *The Birth of Broadcasting*
- Bruce, Robert V., *Bell: Alexander Graham Bell and the Conquest of Solitude* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1973)
- Buchan, John, 'Prester John', *Chambers's Journal*, 5 June 1897, pp.362-5
- , *Prester John*, ed. and intro. by David Daniell (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1994)
- Buck-Morss, Susan, *The Dialectics of Seeing: Walter Benjamin and the Arcades Project* (London: MIT Press, 1991)
- Bulwer-Lytton, Edward, *The Coming Race*, in his *The Coming Race, Falkland, Zicci, & Pausanias the Spartan* (London: Routledge, 1875), pp.7-144
- Burke, Edmund, *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*, ed. and intro. by Adam Phillips (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1990)

Burke, Peter, *Popular Culture in Early Modern Europe*, 2nd edn. (Aldershot: Scolar, 1994)

Carrington, Charles, *Rudyard Kipling: His Life and Work* (London: Macmillan, 1955; repr. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1986)

Castle, Terry, *The Female Thermometer: Eighteenth-Century Culture and the Invention of the Uncanny* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1995)

Cantor, G.N., and M.J.S.Hodge eds., *Conceptions of Ether: Studies in the History of Ether Theories 1740-1900* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1981)

Chadwick, Charles, *Symbolism* (London: Muthuen, 1971)

Chanan, Michael, *Repeated Takes: A Short History of Recording and Its Effects on Music* (London: Verso, 1995)

Christie, J.R.R., 'Ether and the Science of Chemistry: 1740-1790', in *Conceptions of Ether: Studies in the History of Ether Theories 1740-1900*, ed. by G.N.Cantor and M.J.S.Hodge (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1981), pp.85-110

Clifford, James, *The Predicament of Culture: Twentieth-Century Ethnography, Literature, and Art* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1988)

Cmiel, Kenneth, *Democratic Eloquence: The Fight over Popular Speech in Nineteenth-Century America* (New York: William Morrow, 1990)

Cohn, Bernard S., *Colonialism and Its Form of Knowledge: The British In India* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1996)

- Collins, Wilkie, *The Woman in White*, ed. and intro. by Harvey Peter Sucksmith (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1973)
- Connor, Steven, *Dumbstruck: A Cultural History of Ventriloquism* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2000)
- , 'Echo's Bones: Myth, Modernity and the Vocalic Uncanny,' in *Myth and the Making of Modernity: The Problem of Grounding in Early Twentieth-Century Literature*, ed. by Michael Bell and Peter Poellner (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1998), pp.213-235
- , 'The Modern Auditory I,' in Roy Porter ed., *Rewriting the Self: Histories from the Renaissance to the Present* (London: Routledge, 1997), pp.203-223
- Conrad, Joseph, *Almayer's Folly: A Story of An Eastern River*, ed. by Floyd Eugene Eddleman and David Leon Higdon, intro. by Ian Watt (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1994)
- , *The Collected Letters of Joseph Conrad*, vol.I, 1861-1897, ed. by Frederick R.Karl & Laurence Davies (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1983)
- , *The Collected Letters of Joseph Conrad*, vol.II, 1898-1902, ed. by Frederick R.Karl & Laurence Davies (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1986)
- , 'Freya of the Seven Isles: A Story of Shallow Waters', in his *'Twiixt Land and Sea*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1947), pp.147-238
- , *Heart of Darkness*, in his *Youth, Heart of Darkness, The End of the Tether*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London:

Dent, 1946), pp.43-162

-----, *Heart of Darkness: An Authoritative Text, Backgrounds and Sources, Criticism*, 3rd edn, ed. by Robert Kimbrough (New York: Norton, 1988)

-----, *Joseph Conrad's Letters to R.B.Cunninghame Graham*, ed. by C.T.Watts (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1969)

-----, 'Karain', in his *Almayer's Folly and Tales of Unrest*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1947), pp.3-55

-----, 'The Lagoon', in his *Almayer's Folly and Tales of Unrest*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1947), pp.187-204

-----, *Last Essays*, in his *Tales of Hearsay and Last Essays*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1955), pp.1-171

-----, *The Nigger of the 'Narcissus'*, in his *The Nigger of the 'Narcissus' and Typhoon & Other Stories*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1950), pp.vii-173

-----, *Nostromo*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1947)

-----, *Notes on Life and Letters*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1949)

-----, *Tales of Hearsay*, in his *Tales of Hearsay and Last Essays*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1955), pp.1-120

-----, *Within the Tides*, in his *The Shadow Line and Within the Tides*, Dent's New Collected Edition, 21 vols (London: Dent, 1950),

pp.3-211

Conrad, Joseph, and Ford Madox Ford, *The Inheritors* (Stroud: Alan Sutton, 1991)

Conrad, Joseph, and Ford Madox Hueffer [Ford], *The Nature of A Crime* (London: Duckworth, 1924)

Craft, Christopher, *Another Kind of Love: Male Homosexual Desire in English Discourse 1850-1920* (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1994)

Crary, Jonathan, *Techniques of the Observer: On Vision and Modernity in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1990)

Crawford, Robert, *Devolving English Literature* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1992)

Crick, Bernard, *George Orwell*, 3rd edn. (London: Penguin, 1992)

Crisell, Andrew, *Understanding Radio*, 2nd edn. (London: Routledge, 1994)

Crookes, William, 'The 1898 Presidential Address', in *Report of the Sixty-Eighth Meeting of the British Association for the Advancement of Science* (London: Murray, 1899), pp.3-38

-----, *Researches in the Phenomena of Spiritualism* (London: J.Burns, 1874)

-----, 'Some Possibilities of Electricity', *The Fortnightly Review*, 51 (January-June 1892), 173-181

Cunningham, Valentine, *British Writers of the Thirties* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1988)

-----, *In the Reading Gaol: Postmodernity, Texts, and History*

(Oxford: Blackwell, 1994)

Daniell, David, Introduction to *Prester John* by John Buchan (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press), pp.vii-xxvi

Darnton, Robert, *Mesmerism and the End of the Enlightenment in France* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1968)

Day, William Patrick, *In the Circles of Fear and Desire: A Study of Gothic Fantasy* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1985)

Debord, Guy, *Society of the Spectacle* (Detroit: Black & Red, 1983)

De l'Isle-Adam, Villiers, *Tomorrow's Eve*, trans. by Robert Martin Adams (Urbana: Univ. of Illinois Press, 1982)

Dellamora, Richard, 'Traversing the Feminine in Oscar Wilde's *Salomé*,' in *Oscar Wilde: A Collection of Critical Essays*, ed. by Jonathan Freedman, pp.99-113

De Man, Paul, *Allegories of Reading: Figural Language in Rousseau, Nietzsche, Rilke, and Proust* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1979)

Derrida, Jacques, *Of Grammatology*, trans. by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ., 1976)

-----, *Speech and Phenomena and Other Essays on Husserl's Theory of Signs*, trans. and intro. by David B.Allison (Evanston: Northwestern Univ. Press, 1973)

Dijkstra, Bram, *Idols of Perversity: Fantasia of Feminine Evil in Fin-de-siècle Culture* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1986)

Dolto, François, *L'image inconsciente du corps* (Paris: Seuil, 1984)

Donohue, Joseph, 'Distance, Death and Desire in *Salome*,' in *The*

Cambridge Companion to Oscar Wilde, ed. by Peter Raby
(Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1997), pp.118-142

Douglas, Susan J., *Listening In: Radio and the American Imagination*
(New York: Times, 1999)

Dowling, Linda, *Hellenism and Homosexuality in Victorian Oxford*
(Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1994)

-----, *Language and Decadence in the Victorian Fin de Siècle*
(Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1986)

Drucker, Johanna, *The Alphabetic Labyrinth: The Letters in History
and Imagination* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1995)

Du Moncel, Count, *The Telephone, the Microphone & the Phonograph*
(London: Kegan Paul, 1879)

Eliot, T.S., 'Marie Lloyd,' in *Selected Prose of T.S.Eliot*, ed. and intro.
by Frank Kermode (London: Faber & Faber, 1975), pp.172-174

-----, *The Waste Land*, in his *The Complete Poems: 1909-1950*
(London: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1971), pp.37-55

Elliott, Dorice Williams, 'Hearing the Darkness: The Narrative Chain
in Conrad's *Heart of Darkness*', *English Literature in Transition
1880-1920*, 28-2 (1985), pp.162-181

Ellis, Alexander J., 'Tenth Annual Address of the President to the
Philological Society,' in *Transactions of the Philological Society
1880-1* (London: Trübner, 1881), pp.252-321

Ellman, Richard, *Oscar Wilde* (London: Penguin, 1988)

-----, 'Overtures to *Salome*,' in *Oscar Wilde: A Collection of Critical
Essays*, ed by Richard Ellmann (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-

Hall, 1969), pp.73-91

Eng, Barbara, 'Adorno and the Sirens: tele-phono-graphic bodies,' in *Embodied Voices: Representing Female Vocality in Western Culture*, ed. by Leslie C. Dunn and Nancy A. Jones (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1994)

Fahie, J.J., *A History of Wireless Telegraphy* (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1899)

Faulkner, David, 'Broken English: Dickens, Kipling, Conrad and Woolf in Global Space (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Princeton University, 1995)

Flaubert, Gustave, 'Herodias,' in his *Three Tales*, trans. by A.J.Krailsheimer (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1991), pp.71-105

Foster, John Wilson, 'Against Nature?: Science and Oscar Wilde', *University of Toronto Quarterly*, 63-2 (Winter 1993/4), 328-46

Frayling, Christopher, *Vampyres: Lord Byron to Count Dracula* (London: Faber & Faber, 1991)

Freud, Sigmund, 'The Uncanny,' in *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud*, trans. by James Strachey, 24 vols (London: Hogarth, 1953-1974), XVII: *An Infantile Neurosis and Other Works* (1955), 217-252

Gagnier, Regenia, *Idylls of the Marketplace: Oscar Wilde and the Victorian Public* (Aldershot: Scholar, 1986)

Galsworthy, John, 'Reminiscences of Conrad: 1924', in his *Castles in Spain & Other Screeds* (London: Heinemann, 1927), pp.74-95

Gelatt, Roland, *The Fabulous Phonograph: The Story of the*

- Gramophone from Tin Foil to High Fidelity* (London: Cassell, 1956)
- Gilbert, Helen, 'De-Scribing Orality: Performance and the Recuperation of Voice', *De-Scribing Empire: Post-Colonialism and Textuality*, ed. by Chris Tiffin and Alan Lawson (London: Routledge, 1994), pp.98-111
- Gilman, Sander L., *Difference and Pathology: Stereotypes of Sexuality, Race, and Madness* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1985)
- Gilpin, William, *Observations, Relative Chiefly to Picturesque Beauty, Made in the Year 1772, on Several Parts of England; Particularly the Mountains, and Lakes of Cumberland, and Westmoreland* (London: Blamire, 1786; repr. Poole: Woodstock, 1996)
- Glover, David, *Vampires, Mummies, and Liberals: Bram Stoker and the Politics of Popular Fiction* (Durham: Duke Univ. Press, 1996)
- Goethe, Johann Wolfgang von, *Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship*, ed. and trans. by Eric A. Blackall in cooperation with Victor Lange (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1995)
- Goldberg, Stanley, 'In Defense of Ether: The British Response to Einstein's Special Theory of Relativity, 1905-1911,' *Historical Studies in Physical Sciences*, 2 (1970), 89-125
- Grivel, Charles, 'The Phonograph's Horned Mouth,' in *Wireless Imagination: Sound, Radio, and the Avant-Garde*, ed. by Douglas Kahn and Gregory Whitehead (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1992), pp.31-61
- Haggard, H.Rider, *Allan Quatermain*, ed. and intro. by Dennis Butts

- (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1995)
- , *Ayesha: The Return of 'She'*, (New York: Dover, 1978)
- , *King Solomon's Mines*, ed. and intro. by Dennis Butts (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1989)
- , *She*, ed. and intro. by Daniel Karlin (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1991)
- Haining, Peter, and Peter Tremayne, *The Un-Dead: the Legend of Bram Stoker and Dracula* (London: Constable, 1997)
- Hammond, Paul, *Love Between Men in English Literature* (London: Macmillan, 1996)
- Harbord, R.E. ed., *The Readers' Guide to Rudyard Kipling's Work* (Canterbury: Gibbs, 1965-66)
- Harlow, Alvin F., *Old Wires and New Waves: The History of the Telegraph, Telephone, and Wireless* (New York: D.Appleton-Century, 1936)
- Harris, Roy, ed., *The Origin of Language* (Bristol: Thoemmes, 1996)
- Hartman, Elwood, *French Literary Wagnerism* (London: Garland, 1988)
- Hatlen, Burton, 'The Return of the Repressed/Oppressed in Bram Stoker's *Dracula*, in *Dracula: The Vampire and the Critics*, ed. by Margaret L. Carter (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1988), pp.117-136
- Hawthorn, Jeremy, *Joseph Conrad: Language and Fictional Self-Consciousness* (London: Edward Arnold, 1979)
- Henricksen, Bruce, *Nomadic Voices: Conrad and the Subject of Narrative* (Urbana: Univ. of Illinois Press, 1992)

Herder, Johann Gottfried, 'An Excerpt from *Kalligone* (1800): Part II Section 2 Chapter IV: On Music,' in Edward A. Lippman ed., *Musical Aesthetics: A Historical Reader*, 3 vols (Stuyvesant: Pendragon, 1986), II: The Nineteenth Century, 33-43.

-----, 'Auch eine Philosophie der Geschichte zur Bildung der Menschheit,' in *Johann Gottfried Herder Werke*, 10 vols (München: Carl Hauser, 1984), I: *Herder und der Sturm und Drang 1764-1774*, ed. by Wolfgang Pross, 589-689

-----, 'Auszug aus einem Briefwechsel über Ossian und die Lieder alter Völker,' in his *Schriften zur Ästhetik und Literatur 1767-1781*, ed. by Gunter E. Grimm (Frankfurt: Deutscher Klassiker, 1993), pp.447-497

-----, *On the Origin of Language*, in *On the Origin of Language* by Jean-Jacques Rousseau and Johann Gottfried Herder, trans. by John H. Moran and Alexander Gode (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1966), pp.85-176

-----, 'Von Ähnlichkeit der mittlern englischen und deutschen Dichtkunst, nebst Verschiednem, das daraus folget,' in his *Schriften zur Ästhetik und Literatur 1767-1781*, ed. by Gunter E. Grimm (Frankfurt: Deutscher Klassiker, 1993), pp.550-562

Hertz, David Michael, *The Tuning of the Word: The Musico-Literary Poetics of the Symbolist Movement* (Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois Univ. Press, 1987)

Hindley, Diana, and Geoffrey Hindley, *Advertising in Victorian England 1837-1901* (London: Wayland, 1972)

- Hood, Thomas, 'The Dream of Eugene Aram,' in *The Works of Thomas Hood*, ed. by His Son and Daughter, 11 vols (London: Ward, Lock & Co., n.d.), VI, 435-456
- Hurley, Kelly, *The Gothic Body: Sexuality, Materialism, and Degeneration at the Fin de siècle* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1996)
- Huxley, Aldous, *Point Counter Point* (New York: Modern Library, 1928)
- Huysmans, J.-K., *Against Nature (À Rebours)*, trans. by Robert Baldick (London: Penguin, 1959)
- Hyam, Ronald, *Empire and Sexuality: The British Experience* (Manchester: Manchester Univ. Press, 1990)
- Hyde, H. Montgomery, *The Trials of Oscar Wilde* (New York: Dover, 1973)
- Jackson, Holbrook, *The Eighteen Nineties: A Review of Art and Ideas at the Close of the Nineteenth Century* (1913; repr. London: Cresset, 1988)
- Jameson, Fredric, *The Political Unconscious: Narrative as a Socially Symbolic Act* (London: Routledge, 1989)
- Jay, Martin, *Downcast Eyes: The Denigration of Vision in Twentieth-Century French Thought* (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1994)
- , *Force Fields: Between Intellectual History and Cultural Critique* (London: Routledge, 1993)
- Jolly, Roslyn, Introduction to Robert Louis Stevenson, *South Sea Tales* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1996), pp.ix-xxxiii

Johnson, Bruce, *Conrad's Models of Mind* (Minneapolis: Univ. of Minnesota Press, 1971)

Josephson, Matthew, *Edison* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1959)

Joyce, James, *Ulysses*, ed. by Hans Walter Gabler, with Wolfhard Steppe and Claus Melchior (London: Penguin, 1986)

Keats, John, *Complete Poems*, ed. by Jack Stillinger (Cambridge, MA: Belknap, 1978)

Kermode, Frank, 'Poet and Dancer Before Diaghilev,' in his *Modern Essays*, 2nd edn. (Glasgow: Fontana, 1990), pp.11-38

Kipling, Rudyard, 'As Easy As A.B.C.,' in his *A Diversity of Creatures*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1937), IX, 1-44

-----, "'The Finest Story in the World",' in his *Many Inventions*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1937), V, 185-226

-----, 'The Brushwood Boy,' in his *The Day's Work*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1937), VI, 379-423

-----, *Kim*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1938),

XXI

-----, *Letters of Marque*, in his *From Sea to Sea and Other Sketches I*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1938), XXII, 3-

- , Preface to *Life's Handicap*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1937), IV, pp.ix-xv
- , *Something of Myself and Other Autobiographical Writings*, ed. by Thomas Pinney (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1991)
- , 'Tod's Amendment,' in his *Plain Tales from the Hills*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1937), I, 263-272
- , 'The Tragedy of Crusoe, C.S.,' in *Kipling's India: Uncollected Sketches 1884-88*, ed. by Thomas Pinney (New York: Schocken, 1986), pp.45-51
- , 'The Viceroy at Patiala,' in *Kipling's India: Uncollected Sketches 1884-88*, ed. by Thomas Pinney (New York: Schocken, 1986), pp.26-31
- , "Wireless",' in his *Traffics and Discoveries*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1937), VII, 215-243
- , 'With the Night Mail,' in his *Actions and Reactions*, The Sussex Edition of the Complete Works in Prose and Verse of Rudyard Kipling, 34 vols (London: Macmillan, 1937), VIII, 105-163
- Kipling, Rudyard, and H. Rider Haggard, *Rudyard Kipling to Rider Haggard: The Record of a Friendship*, ed. by Morton Cohen
- Kirschner, Paul, *Conrad: The Psychologist as Artist* (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1968)

- Kittler, Friedrich A., *Discourse Networks 1800/1900*, trans. by Michael Metteer, with Chris Cullens (Stanford: Stanford Univ. Press, 1990)
- , *Gramophone, Film, Typewriter*, trans. by Geoffrey Winthrop-Young and Michael Wutz (Stanford: Stanford Univ. Press, 1999)
- , *Literature Media Information Systems*, ed. and intro. by John Johnston (Amsterdam: G+B Arts International, 1997)
- Knowles, Owen, "Who's Afraid of Arthur Schopenhauer?": A New Context for Conrad's *Heart of Darkness*, *Nineteenth-Century Literature*, 49-1 (1994), 75-106
- Kohl, Norbert, *Oscar Wilde: The Works of a Conformist Rebel*, trans. by David Henry Wilson (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1980)
- Kreilkamp, Ivan, 'A Voice Without A Body: The Phonographic Logic of *Heart of Darkness*', *Victorian Studies*, 40-2 (Winter 1997), 211-44
- Labourn, Keith, *The General Strike of 1926* (Manchester: Manchester Univ. Press, 1993)
- Lacan, Jacques, *The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psycho-Analysis*, ed. by Jacques-Alain Miller, trans. by Alan Sheridan (London: Penguin, 1979)
- , 'The Subversion of the Subject and Dialectic of Desire in the Freudian Unconscious,' in his *Écrits: A Selection*, trans. by Alan Sheridan (New York: Norton, 1977), pp.292-325
- Lacey, Kate, 'Towards a Periodization of Listening: Radio and Modern Life,' *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 3 (2000), 279-

- Lacoue-Labarthe, Philippe, 'The Echo of the Subject,' in his *Typography: Mimesis, Philosophy, Politics*, ed. by Christopher Fynsk (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1989), pp.43-138
- Land, Stephen K., *Conrad and the Paradox of Plot* (London: Macmillan, 1984)
- Lang, Andrew, *Adventures Among Books* (London: Longmans Green and Co., 1905)
- Lant, Antonia, 'The Curse of the Pharaoh, or How Cinema Contracted Egyptmania', *October*, 59 (Winter 1992), 86-112
- Lauxtermann, P.F.H., 'Five Decisive Years: Schopenhauer's Epistemology As Reflected in His Theory of Colour', *Studies in the History and Philosophy of Science*, 18-3 (1987), 271-91
- Lawrence, D.H., *The Complete Poems of D.H. Lawrence*, ed. and intro. by Vivian de Sola Pinto and Warren Roberts, 2 vols (London: Heineman, 1964)
- , *Fantasia of the Unconscious*, in his *Fantasia of the Unconscious & Psychoanalysis and the Unconscious* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1971), pp.7-195
- , *The First and Second Lady Chatterley Novels*, ed. by Dieter Mehl and Christa Jansohn (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1999)
- , *Kangaroo*, ed. by Bruce Steele (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1994)
- , *Lady Chatterley's Lover & A Propos of 'Lady Chatterley's Lover'*, ed. by Michael Squires (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ.

Press, 1993)

-----, *The Plumed Serpent*, ed. by L.D. Clark (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1987)

-----, 'The Proper Study,' in his *Reflections on the Death of a Porcupine and Other Essays*, ed. by Michael Herbert (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1988)

-----, *The Rainbow*, ed. by Mark Kinkead-Weekes (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1989)

-----, *Studies in Classic American Literature* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1971)

-----, *The Symbolic Meaning: The Uncollected Versions of Studies in Classic American Literature*, ed. by Armin Arnold (Fontwell: Centaur, 1962)

-----, 'Why the Novel Matters,' in *Phoenix: The Posthumous Papers by D.H. Lawrence*, ed. by Edward D. McDonald (New York: Viking, 1936), pp.533-538

-----, *Women in Love*, ed. by David Farmer, Lindeth Vasey and John Worthen (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1987)

Le Gallienne, Richard, 'Considerations Suggested by Mr. Churton Collins' "Illustrations of Tennyson",' *The Century Guild Hobby Horse*, 27 (July 1892), 77-83

-----, *English Poems* (London: Elkin Matthews and John Lane, 1892)

-----, 'Mr. Oscar Wilde's "Salomé",' *The Star*, 22 February 1893, p.2

-----, *The Religion of a Literary Man* (London: Elkin Mathews and John Lane, 1893)

- Lippman, Edward A., *A History of Western Musical Aesthetics* (Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1992)
- , ed, *Musical Aesthetics: A Historical Reader*, 3 vols (Stuyvesant: Pendragon, 1986), II
- Logan, Peter Melville, *Nerves and Narratives: A Cultural History of Hysteria in Nineteenth-Century British Prose* (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press)
- London, Bette, *The Appropriated Voice: Narrative Authority in Conrad, Forster, and Woolf* (Ann Arbor: Univ. of Michigan Press, 1990)
- Ludlam, Harry, *A Biography of Dracula: The Life Story of Bram Stoker* (London: Foulsham, 1962)
- Lukács, Georg, 'Reification and the Consciousness of the Proletariat,' in his *History and Class Consciousness: Studies in Marxist Dialectics*, trans. by Rodney Livingstone (London: Merlin, 1971), pp.83-222
- Lycett, Andrew, *Rudyard Kipling* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 1999)
- Machen, Arthur, 'The Autophone,' in his *Ritual and Other Stories* (Lewes: Tartarus, 1992), pp.25-29
- , 'The Great God Pan,' in *The Caerleon Edition of the Works of Arthur Machen*, 9 vols (London: Martin Secker, 1923), I, 3-88
- , 'The Inmost Light,' in *The Caerleon Edition of the Works of Arthur Machen*, 9 vols (London: Martin Secker, 1923), I, 91-136
- McClintock, Anne, *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest* (London: Routledge, 1995)

- McGrath, F.C., *The Sensible Spirit: Walter Pater and the Modernist Paradigm* (Tampa: Univ. of South Florida Press, 1986)
- McKendrick, Neil, Johan Brewer and J.H.Plumb, *The Birth of a Consumer Society: The Commercialization of Eighteenth-Century England* (London: Europa, 1982)
- MacLuhan, Marshall, *The Gutenberg Galaxy: The Making of Typographic Man* (Toronto: Univ. of Toronto Press, 1962)
- , *Understanding Media: The Extension of Man* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1964)
- Macpherson, James, *The Poems of Ossian and Related Works*, ed. by Howard Gaskill, intro. by Fiona Stafford (Edinburgh: Edinburgh Univ. Press, 1996)
- Maeterlinck, Maurice, Préface to *The Plays of Maurice Maeterlinck*, Second Series, trans. by Richard Hovey (New York: Duffield, 1908), pp.ix-xv
- Magee, Bryan, *Aspects of Wagner*, 2nd edn. (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1988)
- Mallarmé, Stéphane, 'Crisis in Poetry,' in *Mallarmé: Selected Prose Poems, Essays, & Letters*, trans. and intro. by Bradford Cook (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1956), pp.34-43
- , *Les Mots Anglais: Petite Philologie*, in *Œuvres Complètes de Stéphane Mallarmé*, ed. by Henri Mondor and G.Jean-Aubry (Paris: Gallimard, 1945), pp.857-1059
- Mandelbaum, Maurice, 'The Physiological Orientation of Schopenhauer's Epistemology', in Michael Fox ed. *Schopenhauer*

(Brighton: Harvester, 1980), pp.50-67

Mann, Thomas, *The Magic Mountain*, trans. by John E. Woods (New York: Vintage, 1995)

Marx, Karl, *Capital: A Critique of Political Economy*, 3 vols, trans. by Ben Fowlkes, (London: Penguin, 1976), I

-----, *Das Kapital: Kritik der politischen Ökonomie*, Erster Band, Karl Marx Friedrich Engels Gesamtausgabe II/6 (Berlin: Dietz, 1987)

-----, *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts*, in his *Early Writings*, trans. by Rodney Livingstone and Gregor Benton, intro. by Lucio Colletti (London: Penguin, 1992), pp.279-400

Masterman, C.F.G., *From the Ayss: Of Its Inhabitants by One of Them* (London: R. Brimley Johnson, 1902)

Maturin, Charles, *Melmoth the Wanderer*, ed. by Douglas Grant (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1989)

Mearns, Andrew, *The Bitter Cry of Outcast London: An Inquiry into the Condition of the Abject Poor* (London: n.pub., 1883; repr. London: Frank Cass, 1970)

Meyer, Bernard C., *Joseph Conrad: A Psychoanalytic Biography* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1967)

Meynell, Alice, 'Decivilised', Appendix to *Almayer's Folly: A Story of an Eastern River* by Joseph Conrad, ed. by Owen Knowles and Cedric Watts (London: Dent, 1995), pp.190-2

Milbank, Alison, Introduction to *The Castles of Athlin and Dunbayne* by Ann Radcliffe (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1995), pp.vii-xxiv

- , Introduction to *A Sicilian Romance* by Ann Radcliffe (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1993), pp.ix-xxix.
- Millet, Kate, *Sexual Politics* (London: Sphere, 1971)
- Mongia, Padmini, "Ghosts of the Gothic": Spectral Women and Colonized Spaces in *Lord Jim*, in Andrew Michael Roberts ed. *Conrad and Gender* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1993), pp.1-16
- Moore, George, *Confessions of a Young Man*, The Collected Works of George Moore (The Carra Edition), 21 vols (New York: Boni and Liveright, 1923), IX: *Confessions of a Young Man and Avowals*, 297-489
- Müller, Max, *The Lectures of the Science of Language*, 3rd edn. (London: Longman, Green, Longman, and Roberts, 1962)
- Murray, J.A.H., 'Ninth Annual Address of the President to the Philological Society,' in *Transactions of the Philological Society 1880-1* (London: Trübner, 1881), pp.117-176
- Murray, K.M.Elizabeth, *Caught in the Web of Words: James Murray and the Oxford English Dictionary* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1977)
- Muto, Hiroshi, 'Dracula to Koe no Seikimatsu,' *Eigo-seinen*, 144 (January 1999), 600-4
- Myers, F.W.H., *Human Personality and Its Survival of Bodily Death*, ed. by Susy Smith (New Hyde Park: University Books, 1961)
- Najder, Zdzislaw, *Joseph Conrad: A Chronicle*, trans. by Halina Carroll-Najder (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1983)
- Navarette, Susan J., *The Shape of Fear: Horror and the Fin de Siècle*

- Culture of Decadence* (Lexington: Univ. of Kentucky Press, 1988)
- Neubauer, John, *The Emancipation of Music from Language: Departure from Mimesis in Eighteenth-Century Aesthetics* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1986)
- North, Michael, *The Dialect of Modernism: Race, Language, and Twentieth-Century Literature* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1994)
- Norton, Robert E., *Herder's Aesthetics and the European Enlightenment* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1991)
- Ong, Walter J., *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word* (London: Methuen, 1982)
- Orel, Harold, ed., *Kipling: Interviews and Recollections*, 2 vols (London: Macmillan, 1983)
- Orwell, George, *Nineteen Eighty-Four*, The Complete Works of George Orwell, ed. by Peter Davison, 20 vols (London: Secker & Warburg, 1986-1998), IX (1987)
- , *A Patriot After All: 1940-1941*, The Complete Works of George Orwell, ed. by Peter Davison, 20 vols (London: Secker & Warburg, 1986-1998), XII (1998)
- , *All Propaganda Is Lies: 1941-1942*, The Complete Works of George Orwell, ed. by Peter Davison, 20 vols (London: Secker & Warburg, 1986-1998), XIII (1998)
- , *Keeping Our Little Corner Clean: 1942-1943*, The Complete Works of George Orwell, ed. by Peter Davison, 20 vols (London: Secker & Warburg, 1986-1998), XIV (1998)
- , *I Have Tried to Tell the Truth: 1943-1944*, The Complete Works

of George Orwell, ed. by Peter Davison, 20 vols (London: Secker & Warburg, 1986-1998), XVI (1998)

Page, Norman, *A Kipling Companion* (London: Macmillan, 1984)

Papagopoulos, Nic, *The Fiction of Joseph Conrad: The Influence of Schopenhauer and Nietzsche* (Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 1998)

Park, David, *The Fire Within the Eye: A Historical Essay on the Nature and Meaning of Light* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1997)

Pater, Walter, *Marius the Epicurean: His Sensations and Ideas*, ed. and intro. by Ian Small (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1986)

-----, *The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry*, ed. and intro. by Adam Phillips (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1986)

Pecora, Vincent, 'Heart of Darkness and the Phenomenology of Voice', *ELH*, 52 (1985), 993-1015

Pegg, Mark, *Broadcasting and Society 1918-1939* (London: Croom Helm, 1983)

Percy, Thomas, 'An Essay on the Ancient Minstrels in England,' in his *Reliques of Ancient English Poetry*, ed. by Henry B. Wheatley, 3 vols (London: Bickers, 1876), I, 345-381

Perry, Charles R., 'The British Experience 1876-1912: The Impact of the Telephone During the Years of Delay,' in *The Social Impact of the Telephone*, ed. by Ithiel de Sola Pool (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1977)

Phipps, Constantine, Notes on *The Day's Work* by Rudyard Kipling (London: Penguin, 1988), pp.317-330

Pocock, Rowland F., *The Early British Radio Industry* (Manchester:

Manchester Univ. Press, 1988)

Prescott, George B. *The Speaking Telephone, Talking Phonograph and Other Novelties* (New York: D.Appleton, 1878)

Proust, Marcel, *Remembrance of Things Past*, trans. by C.K.Scott Moncrieff and Terence Kilmartin, 3 vols (New York: Vintage, 1982), II: *The Guermites Way & Cities of the Plain*

Radcliffe, Ann, *The Castles of Athlin and Dunbayne*, ed. and intro. by Alison Milbank (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1995)

-----, *The Italian, or the Confessional of the Black Penitents: A Romance*, ed. and intro. by Frederick Garber (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1981)

-----, *The Mysteries of Udolpho*, ed. and intro. by Bonamy Dobrée (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1980)

-----, *A Sicilian Romance*, ed. and intro. by Alison Milbank (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1993)

Rèe, Jonathan, *I See A Voice: Language, Deafness and the Senses* (London: Harper Collins, 1999)

Richards, Thomas, *The Commodity Culture of Victorian England: Advertising and Spectacle, 1851-1914* (London: Verso, 1991)

-----, *The Imperial Archive: Knowledge and the Fantasy of Empire* (London: Verso, 1993)

Richardson, Maurice, 'The Psychoanalysis of Ghost Stories,' *The Twentieth Century*, 166 (December 1959), 419-431

Ricketts, Charles, *Pages on Art* (London: Constable, 1913)

Rivlin, Robert, and Karen Gravelle, *Deciphering the Senses: The*

Expanding World of Human Perception (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1984)

Robertson, W. Graham, *Time Was: The Reminiscence of W. Graham Robertson* (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1931)

Ronell, Avital, *The Telephone Book: Technology, Schizophrenia, Electric Speech* (Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1989)

Ruppel, Richard, 'Heart of Darkness and the Popular Exotic Stories of the 1890s,' *Conradiana*, 21-1 (1989), 3-14

Sage, Victor, *Horror Fiction in the Protestant Tradition* (New York: St. Martin's, 1988)

Said, Edward W., 'Conrad and Nietzsche', in Norman Sherry ed. *Joseph Conrad: A Commemoration* (London: Macmillan, 1979), pp.65-76

-----, *Orientalism* (London: Penguin, 1991)

Salisbury, Lord, 'The Presidential Address,' in *Report of the Sixty-Fourth Meeting of the British Association for the Advancement of Science* (London: Murray, 1894), pp.3-15

Sayce, A.H., 'A Word on Spelling Reform,' *The Spelling Reformer*, 1 (1880-1881), 7-8

Scannell, Paddy, and David Cardiff, *A Social History of British Broadcasting: Volume One 1922-1939: Serving the Nation* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1991)

Schafer, R. Murray, *The Tuning of the World* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1977)

Schaffer, Talia, "A Wilde Desire Took Me": The Homoerotic History of *Dracula*, *ELH*, 61 (1994), 381-425

- Scheick, William J., *Fictional Structure and Ethics: The Turn-of-the-Century English Novel* (Athens: Univ. of Georgia Press, 1990)
- Schivelbusch, Wolfgang, *Hikari to Kage no Doramaturugi (Licht Schein und Wahn: Auftritte der elektrischen Beleuchtung im 20. Jahrhundert)*, trans. by Sakue Ogawa (Tokyo: Hosei Daigaku Shuppankai, 1997)
- Schopenhauer, Arthur, *The World as Will and Representation*, trans. E.F.J. Payne, 2 vols (New York: Dover, 1969)
- Sconce, Jeffrey, 'The Voice from the Void: Wireless, Modernity and the Distant Dead,' *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 1 (1998), 211-232
- Scott, Walter, 'Essay on Imitations of the Ancient Ballad,' in his *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*, rev. and ed. by T.F. Henderson, 4 vols (Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1932), IV, 1-52
- , Introduction to *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*, rev. and ed. by T.F. Henderson, 4 vols (Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1932), I, 55-176
- , *Rob Roy*, ed. by John Sutherland (London: Dent, 1995)
- , *Waverley*, ed. and intro. by Andrew Hook (London: Penguin, 1972)
- Senf, Carol A., 'Dracula: The Unseen Face in the Mirror,' in *Dracula: The Vampire and the Critics*, ed. by Margaret L. Carter, pp.93-104
- Sessa, Anne Dzamba, *Richard Wagner and the English* (London: Associated Univ. Press, 1979)

- Seymour-Smith, Martin, *Rudyard Kipling* (New York: St. Martin, 1989)
- Shaw, George Bernard, *The Perfect Wagnerite: A Commentary on the Niblung's Ring* (New York: Dover, 1967)
- Sims, George R., *How the Poor Live and Horrible London* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1889; repr. New York: Garland, 1984)
- Small, Ian, Explanatory Notes, in Ian Small ed. *Marius the Epicurean: His Sensations and Ideas* by Walter Pater (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1986), pp.268-92
- Stafford, Barbara Maria, *Body Criticism: Imaging the Unseen in Enlightenment Art and Medicine* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1991)
- Steiner, Joan Elizabeth, 'Joseph Conrad and the Tradition of the Gothic Romance' (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan, 1971)
- Stevenson, Robert Louis, 'A Gossip on Romance', in his *Memories and Portraits & Memoir of Fleeming Jenkin*, The Works of Robert Louis Stevenson, 25 vols (London: Chatto and Windus, 1911), IX, 134-147
- , 'A Humble Remonstrance', in his *Memories and Portraits & Memoir of Fleeming Jenkin*, The Works of Robert Louis Stevenson, 25 vols (London: Chatto and Windus, 1911), IX, 148-160
- , 'The Isle of Voices', in his *South Sea Tales*, ed. and intro. by Roslyn Jolly (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1996), pp.103-22
- , *Treasure Island*, in his *Treasure Island, Will O'The Mill, The*

Treasure of Franchard, The Works of Robert Louis Stevenson, 25 vols (London: Chatto and Windus, 1911), VI, 9-231

Stewart, B. [Balfour], and P.G. [Peter Guthrie] Tate, *The Unseen Universe: or Physical Speculations on a Future State* (London: Macmillan, 1886)

Stoker, Bram, 'Bram Stoker's Correspondence with Walt Whitman,' in his *Dracula*, ed. by Maurice Hindle (London: Penguin, 1993), pp.487-497

-----, 'The Crystal Cup,' in *Shades of Dracula: Bram Stoker's Uncollected Stories*, ed. by Peter Haining (London: William Kimber, 1982), pp.14-28

-----, *Dracula*, in *The Essential Dracula*, ed. by Leonard Wolf (New York: Plume, 1993), pp.1-445

-----, *The Duties of Clerks of Petty Sessions in Ireland* (Dublin: John Falconer, 1879)

-----, *The Jewel of Seven Stars*, intro. by David Glover (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1996)

-----, *Personal Reminiscences of Henry Irving*, 2 vols (London: Heinemann, 1906)

-----, *The Snake's Pass* (Dingle: Brandon, 1990)

Stokes, John, *Resistible Theatres: Enterprise and Experiment in the Late Nineteenth Century* (London: Paul Elek, 1972)

Styles, John, 'Manufacturing, Consumption and Design in Eighteenth-Century England', in John Brewer and Roy Porter eds., *Consumption and the World of Goods* (London: Routledge, 1993),

pp.527-54

Symonds, John Addington, *The Letters of John Addington Symonds*, ed. by Herbert M. Schueller and Robert L. Peters, 3 vols (Detroit: Wayne State Univ. Press, 1969)

-----, *The Memoirs of John Addington Symonds: The Secret Homosexual Life of a Leading Nineteenth-Century Man of Letters*, ed. and intro. by Phyllis Grosskurth (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1986)

-----, *Studies in Sexual Inversion Embodying: A Study in Greek Ethics and A Study in Modern Ethics* (n.p.: privately printed, 1928; repr. New York: AMS, 1975)

Symons, Arthur, "Acrobatics" at the Empire,' *The Star*, 6 February 1892, p.4

-----, 'An Artist in Serio-Comedy: Something Different from the Pinafore-and-Buckle-Shoe Variety,' *The Star*, 26 March 1892, p.4

-----, 'The Decadent Movement in Literature,' *Harper's New Monthly Magazine*, November 1893, pp.858-867

[------], 'Essays from the Alps,' *St. James's Gazette*, 17 May 1892, p.6

-----, 'An Original Dancer: A New Artistic Creation by a Dancer Who, Poet-like, Was Born, Not Made,' *The Star*, 20 February 1892, p.4

-----, 'Pantomime and the Poetic Drama,' in his *Studies in Seven Arts* (London: Archibald Constable, 1906), pp.381-384

-----, 'Paul Verlaine,' *The National Review*, 19 (1892), 501-515

-----, 'She Walks on Her Hands: The Most Astonishing Contortionist the World Has Ever Seen,' *The Star*, 5 March 1892, p.4

- , 'A Study of John Addington Symonds,' *The Fortnightly Review*,
121(January-June 1924), 228-239
- , 'A Symbolist Farce,' in his *Studies in Seven Arts* (London:
Archibald Constable, 1906), pp.371-377
- , *The Symbolist Movement in Literature* (London: Heinemann,
1899)
- , 'The World as Ballet,' in his *Studies in Seven Arts* (London:
Archibald Constable, 1906), pp.387-391
- Takeuchi, Nobuo, 'Kodai no Kamigami,' in *Mallarmé Zenshu III*
Bessatsu: Kaidai, Chushaku (Tokyo: Chikuma, 1998), pp.119-170
- Tatar, Maria M., *Spellbound: Studies on Mesmerism and Literature*
(Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1978)
- Tanji, Ai, *Dracula no Seikimatsu* (Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku, 1997)
- Taylor, Jenny Bourne, and Sally Shuttleworth, *Embodied Selves: An*
Anthology of Psychological Texts 1830-1890 (Oxford: Clarendon,
1998)
- 'Telegraphy Without Wires,' *The Times*, 11 June 1897, p.6, col.c
- 'The Telephone Service,' *The Times*, 3 April 1897, p.9, col.f
- Thirsk, Joan, *Economic Policy and Projects: The Development of a*
Consumer Society in Early Modern England (Oxford: Clarendon,
1978)
- Thomas, Sue, 'Modernity, Voice, and Window-Breaking: Jean Rhys's
"Let Them Call It Jazz"', in *De-Scribing Empire: Post-*
Colonialism and Textuality, ed. by Chris Tiffin and Alan Lawson
(London: Routledge, 1994), pp.185-200

- Thornton, R.K.R., "Decadence" in Later Nineteenth-Century England,'
in *Decadence and the 1890s*, ed. by Ian Fletcher (London: Edward
Arnold, 1979), pp.15-30
- Tiffin, Chris, and Alan Lawson, *De-Scribing Empire: Post-Colonialism
and Textuality* (London: Routledge, 1994)
- Torgovnick, Marianna, *Gone Primitive: Savage Intellectuals, Modern Lives*
(Chicago, Univ. of Chicago Press, 1990)
- Turner, E.S., *The Shocking History of Advertising* (London: Michael
Joseph, 1952)
- Tydeman, William, and Steven Price, *Wilde: Salome* (Cambridge:
Cambridge Univ. Press, 1996)
- Tyndall, John, *Scientific Use of the Imagination*, in his *Essays on the
Use and Limit of the Imagination in Science* (London: Longmans,
Green, and Co., 1870), pp.13-51
- , 'On Radiant Heat in Relation to the Colour and Chemical
Constitution of Bodies', in his *Fragments of Science: A Series of
Detached Essays, Addresses, and Reviews*, 6th edn. 2 vols
(London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1879), I, 74-95
- , 'Radiation', in his *Fragments of Science: A Series of Detached
Essays, Addresses, and Reviews*, 6th edn. 2 vols (London:
Longmans, Green, and Co., 1879), I, 28-73
- Verlaine, Paul, *Selected Poems*, trans. by C.F.MacIntyre, bilingual
edition (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1948)
- Vincent, David, 'The Decline of the Oral Tradition in Popular Culture',
in *Popular Culture and Custom in Nineteenth-Century England*,

- ed. by Robert D. Storch (London: Croom Helm, 1982), pp.20-47
- Wagner, Richard, 'Art and Revolution,' in his *The Art-Work of the Future and Other Works*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1895; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1993), pp.21-65
- , 'The Art-Work of the Future,' in his *The Art-Work of the Future and Other Works*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1895; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1993), pp.69-213
- , 'Bayreuth,' in his *Actors and Singers*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1896; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1995), pp.307-340
- , 'Beethoven,' in his *Actors and Singers*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1896; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1995), pp.57-126
- , *Opera and Drama*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1893; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1995)
- , 'A Pilgrimage to Beethoven,' in his *Pilgrimage to Beethoven*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1898; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1994), pp.21-45
- , "'Zukunftsmusik",' in his *Judaism in Music and Other Essays*, trans. by William Ashton Ellis (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1894; repr. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 1995),

pp.293-345

Warschauer, 'Musik im Rundfunk,' *Musikblätter des Anbruch*, Jg.8 Heft
8/9 (1926), 65-66

Wasson, Richard, 'The Politics of Dracula,' *English Literature in
Transition*, 9 (1966), 24-27

Watanabe, Hiroshi, *Ongaku Kikai Gekijo* (Tokyo: Shinshokan, 1997)

Watt, Ian, *Conrad in the Nineteenth Century* (London: Chatto & Windus,
1980)

Watts, Cedric, Commentary, in Cedric Watts ed. *The Nigger of the
'Narcissus'* by Joseph Conrad (London: Penguin, 1988)

-----, *A Preface to Conrad*, 2nd edn. (London: Longman, 1993)

Welch, Wlater L. and Leah Brodbeck Stenzel Burt, *From Tinfoil to
Stereo: The Acoustic Years of the Recording Industry 1877-1929*
(Gainesville: Univ. Press of Florida, 1994)

Wells, H.G. *The Invisible Man*, in his *The Invisible Man, The War of
the Worlds, A Dream of Armageddon*, The Works of H.G.Wells
Atlantic Edition, 28 vols (New York: Scribner, 1924), III, 3-205

-----, *The Time Machine*, in his *The Time Machine, The Wonderful
Visit and Other Stories*, The Works of H.G.Wells Atlantic Edition,
28 vols (New York: Scribner, 1924), I, 3-118

Wilde, Oscar, 'The Birthday of the Infanta,' in *The Complete Works of
Oscar Wilde*, 3rd edn. (Glasgow: Harper Collins, 1994), pp.223-
235

-----, *The Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, 3rd edn. (Glasgow:
Harper Collins, 1994)

- , 'The Critic As Artist,' in *The Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, 3rd edn. (Glasgow: Harper Collins, 1994), pp.1108-1155
- , 'The Happy Prince,' in *The Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, 3rd edn. (Glasgow: Harper Collins, 1994), pp.271-277
- , *More Letters of Oscar Wilde*, ed. by Rupert Hart-Davis (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1987)
- , *Oscar Wilde's Oxford Notebooks: A Portrait of Mind in the Making*, ed. by Philip E. Smith and Michael S. Helfand (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1989)
- , *The Picture of Dorian Gray*, in *The Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, 3rd edn. (Glasgow: Harper Collins, 1994), pp.17-159
- , *Salomé*, in *The Complete Works of Oscar Wilde*, 3rd edn. (Glasgow: Harper Collins, 1994), pp.583-605
- Wiley, Paul L., *Conrad's Measure of Man* (New York: Gordian, 1966)
- Williams, Raymond, *Television: Technology and Cultural Form* (London: Wesleyan Univ. Press, 1992)
- Williams, Rosalind, *Dream Worlds: Mass Consumption in Late Nineteenth-Century France* (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1982)
- Wilson, David B., 'The Thought of Late Victorian Physicists: Oliver Lodge's Ethereal Body,' *Victorian Studies*, 15 (1971-2), 29-48
- Winston, Brian, *Media, Technology and Society: A History: From the Telegraph to the Internet* (London: Routledge, 1998)
- Winter, Alison, *Mesmerized: Powers of Mind in Victorian Britain* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1998)

- Wollaeger, Mark A., *Joseph Conrad and the Fictions of Skepticism*
(Stanford: Stanford Univ. Press, 1990)
- Woolf, Virginia, *Between the Acts* (San Diego: Harvest/Harcourt Brace
Jovanovich, 1969)
- , 'Kew Gardens', in her *The Complete Shorter Fiction*, ed. by
Susan Dick (London: Grafton, 1991), pp.90-5
- Wordsworth, Jonathan, Introduction to David Hartley, *Observations on
Man 1791 (Observation on Man, His Frame, His Duty, And His
Expectations)* (London: J. Johnson, 1791; repr. Poole: Woodstock,
1998)
- Wordsworth, William, *The Prelude: 1799, 1805, 1850*, ed. by Jonathan
Wordsworth, M.H. Abrams, and Stephen Gill (London: Norton,
1979)
- Worth, Katherine, *Oscar Wilde* (London: Macmillan, 1983)
- Yachida, Hiromasa, 'Kyofu no Shujigaku (Part I),' *Gendai Shiso*, 22-8
(1994), 232-248
- , 'Kyofu no Shujigaku (Part II),' *Gendai Shiso*, 22-9 (1994),
247-255
- , 'Kyofu no Shujigaku (Part III),' *Gendai Shiso*, 22-10 (1994),
330-345
- Young, Robert J.C., *Colonial Desire: Hybridity in Theory, Culture and
Race* (London: Routledge, 1995)